

## Reviews

---

*A history of preaching.* By O. C. Edwards, Jr. Pp. xxviii + 879 + CD ROM. Nashville: Abingdon Press, 2004. £46.99. o 687 03864 2  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905215324

To meet a large book on the history of preaching is inclined at first to bring a depression of spirits to the historian. God and the love of God hardly go into words; yet every Sunday words are poured out and we feel like Samuel Johnson, who loved the English language and despite being a devout worshipper preferred to go to services which would not include sermons, lest the prose which could be beautiful should be mangled from the pulpit. (Yet he willingly wrote excellent sermons for other people to preach.) Historians who felt this have taken a way out – to make a ‘history’ of preaching by selecting only the preachers who were masters of words as well as of religious thought – an Andrewes or a Donne, a Bossuet or a Fenelon, an Augustine or a Chrysostom – and leaving the multitude of dryasdusts and bores and manglers in outer darkness.

There are two other difficulties of the task which help to make its fascination. By the nature of the experience it needs to be a communication from person to persons, which is why listening people were suspicious of a reading of someone’s else’s sermon however noble, for this is not a reading but a talking from the heart. Yet speaking to an audience can be made magnetic by attention to rules, though the rules need not go back to Cicero or Quintilian. So a historian of preaching needs to place these utterances in a context, not only of religious thought but of changing axioms of ‘rhetoric’ and changing moral situations. Some rhetoric does not easily marry sincerity.

Those whose memory goes back to Winston Churchill orating during the Second World War were gripped and grateful. When their grandchildren read the texts they cannot understand the electricity which was felt. In the early seventeenth century Launcelot Andrewes held large audiences captive by his sermons. Near contemporaries called him the Star of Preachers. Edwards is right to allot liberal space to him. Only twenty-five years after his death hardly anyone could understand why the words were regarded as great utterances. Of course these differences are in part the gulf between the effect of speaking and that of reading. But not only. A new generation has different axioms to which speakers must direct their message. Edwards makes this clear in a charming passage on John Tillotson, described by Charles Smyth as the only Primate of All England to be the greatest preacher of his day. Because of his audiences in the last years of the seventeenth century, and through his own inclination, he had to avoid every expression that was dramatic or poetic. He wanted to be coherent, clear, even

obvious. Sermons which were all prose could not possibly hold more than a generation.

The book is long because its author gives extracts, not too short for understanding but not so long that they bore, from many of his preachers' sermons. The book is accompanied by a CD-ROM which extends the examples. There are moving moments in this book, like the sermon delivered by Archbishop Laud on the scaffold.

Edwards limits the field by defining a sermon as an utterance within the context of Christian worship by a person authorised by that community. He agrees with many authorities that 2 Clement is the oldest surviving Christian sermon and is of the second century; and that the next survival is Melito's Homily on the Passover. For the first time we find a text where the speaker plainly used skill, even artifice, in speaking to attract his hearers.

Edwards asks pertinent questions. Can a preacher disclose himself in a sermon, is he allowed to use the words I and me? The consensus of opinion is severely to limit the ego. Can a sermon be invective, other than against a general sin? Can the preacher parade learning to impress? What does a preacher do if a language (say Latin) is necessary in church but no longer understood by most of the audience? Is colloquial talk permissible? Martin Luther said 'Yes' decisively, Robert South was accused of 'levity'. Can one preacher speak against another preacher if he thinks him or her misleading the people – for example the famous contest between Richard Hooker and Travers?

Edwards comes down through the east till John Chrysostom, then from Ambrose and Augustine down the western tradition to the Reformation, and then through the English from Latimer to Spurgeon and so to the Americans from the Awakening onwards to Billy Graham, and in later times the African Americans. There is a fascinating chapter on modern women preachers in America, and whether an analyst can detect psychological or emotional differences between men and women in a pulpit. The book is confessedly selective, and the reader will respect the author's purpose even though it is odd to confine to one line the classics in French preaching like Bossuet and Bourdaloue. For the book is an achievement, underneath it there is scholarship and understanding. Of the studies which seem to illuminate most, then apart from Origen and Augustine a reader might choose Calvin, and John Wesley, and Newman, and Martin Luther King. But something is to be gained from many of the individual portraits. This is a book of sympathy yet never hagiographical.

SELWYN COLLEGE,  
CAMBRIDGE

OWEN CHADWICK

*Daily liturgical prayer. Origins and theology.* By Gregory W. Woolfenden. (Liturgy, Worship and Society.) Pp. xii + 326. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2004. £55 (cloth), £16.99 (paper). o 7546 1600 2; o 7546 1601 0  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905225320

Daily liturgical prayer does not claim the attention in purely historical studies that befits its importance, something not helped by the variety of terms used to refer to

it: daily office, divine office, breviary, liturgy of the hours and so on. For something so integral to daily life in significant periods of Christian history this is surprising. Much research remains to be done outside the purely liturgical field. In fourth-century Jerusalem, Byzantine Constantinople, medieval western parishes and even Georgian England, for instance, the offices were daily public events. Woolfenden's book takes up the baton from Robert Taft's *The liturgy of the hours in east and west* and seeks to take it forward. He keeps a weather eye on two questions: (a) the notion of the liturgical day as beginning in Jewish fashion in the evening; and (b) the constant appearance in texts and ceremonies of the themes of darkness and light. Like Taft before him he relies on the research of such scholars as Mateos, Arranz and Winkler, and he confirms Baumstark's identification of the two strands of 'cathedral' and 'monastic' forms. What this book will give the church historian is an expansion of the work done by previous scholars, particularly in relation to eastern offices, generous reproduction and analysis of actual texts said and sung, and some fruits of the author's special research into Spanish Mozarabic liturgy on which he has already published. His foray into the still-flourishing Ambrosian liturgy of the Milan archdiocese, if slightly uncertain on some minor points, is a worthy introduction to the 'Ambrosian' liturgical tradition. Any book on this subject will impress on the reader the immense variety of forms of daily liturgical prayer, both geographically and through time; but just as surprising are the continuities. Woolfenden shows that while the daily offices are by nature public acts of worship, in the west from the Renaissance they came to be seen more as inculcation of Scripture. A further volume is promised to examine that question and encourage a return to first principles. There is a good basic bibliography and indices.

COMMUNITY OF THE RESURRECTION,  
MIRFIELD

GEORGE GUIVER

*Religiöse Autonomie der Stadt im imperium romanum. Öffentliche Religionen im Kontext römischer Rechts- und Verwaltungspraxis.* By Christa Frateantonio. (Studies and Texts in Antiquity and Christianity, 19.) Pp. xi + 262. Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr (Paul Siebeck), 2003. €54. 3 16 148200 X; 1436 3003  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905235327

This study of the religious autonomy of cities in the Roman empire is a revised PhD thesis, accepted at the University of Tübingen in 1998. Frateantonio approaches the subject using a combination of methods employed in the study of religions and cultural history. She also builds on historic analysis of the role of cities in the political and administrative sphere, and analyses the role of religion in the contexts of communal arrangements and liberties with the help of elements of systems theory (Luhmann/Müller). Analogous to the two-tier arrangement of Roman imperial administration, central and local, the religious 'systems' similarly work out the interaction of central policies and local, city-based, responsibilities. This complex approach is used to good effect to explain phenomena of religious change. Of particular interest in this respect are the final chapters, dealing with the 'Christianisation' of the empire (pp. 163ff.). Decius and Diocletian had employed city authorities to carry out their policies of persecution. At a time when the religious policies of emperors coincided with the interests of Christian communities and

their leaders, bishops frequently executed imperial legislation, or took the initiative, for example in closing down and destroying pagan temples, clear in the understanding that they enjoyed imperial support and the (new) legality of such acts. In either case, the city proves to be the main geographical, administrative and social unit providing religious activity and the battleground, fought over by rival religious groups. In this vein, Frateantonio describes the initial ‘depaganising’ of public city life, followed by its ‘Christianisation’, and takes account of the many examples of civic unrest and conflict in the process. While the close integration of pagan cults and the social structures of city life accounted for much of their vitality, once the social and physical infrastructure of traditional cults were removed, their religious attraction declined accordingly. This important study must be commended first of all for its considered, methodical approach. The expressed aim is to counter models, still popular, which explain developments either in terms of the antagonism of Christianity and ‘Paganism’ as of two clearly defined ‘religions’, or which highlight the superior attractiveness of the Christian ‘offer’ of salvation over the alleged spiritual emptiness of pagan cults. The model suggested here, based on ‘systems theory’, seeks to explain the phenomena in the context of the social functioning and administrative arrangements of the Roman cities. It deserves serious consideration and will significantly enhance scholarly debate.

FACULTY OF DIVINITY,  
CAMBRIDGE

THOMAS GRAUMANN

*Prelude to Constantine. The Abgar tradition in early Christianity.* By Alexander Mirkovic. (Arbeiten zur Religion und Geschichte des Urchristentums. Studies in the Religion and History of Early Christianity, 15.) Pp. xv + 184. Frankfurt-am-Main–New York: Peter Lang, 2004. £26 (paper). 3 631 52382 3; 0 8204 6585 2; 0949 3069

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905245323

The subtitle (not on the front cover) indicates the actual topic of the book. Instead of following most earlier scholars who concentrate their attention on the historicity, or otherwise, of the Abgar legend in book 1 of Eusebius’ *Ecclesiastical history* and in its more developed Syriac form in the Teaching of Addai, Mirkovic sensibly opts for a different approach, examining instead the early reception history of the legend and, in particular, the motivation that led to the production of these two main tradents of the legend. For the Teaching of Addai he suggests that the compiler who hides behind the name ‘Labubna’ (the alleged author of the work) ‘had a clear goal in mind, the unification of the church under the banner of apostolic succession and under the protective hand of the Roman Empire’. In the case of the text in Eusebius, Mirkovic is certainly right in seeking to interpret it in the light of other royal conversion stories of the time. He goes on to suggest that these should be seen as ‘training tools for Christians aspiring toward the upper echelons of Byzantine/Late Roman society’, offering ‘to the Christian leadership a variety of examples to learn from and to apply if a favourable situation arose’. Mirkovic puts forward a number of interesting ideas. In the case of the text in Eusebius, a certain amount will depend on the dating of book 1. As for the Teaching of Addai, local Edessene church politics

of the latter part of the first quarter of the fifth century are also likely to have played an influential role.

WOLFSON COLLEGE,  
OXFORD

SEBASTIAN BROCK

*Augustus to Constantine. The rise and triumph of Christianity in the Roman world.* By Robert McQueen Grant (foreword Margaret M. Mitchell). Pp. xlii + 350 incl. 2 frontispieces and 9 ills. Louisville–London: Westminster John Knox Press, 2004 (first publ. Harper & Row, 1970, 1990). \$29.95 (paper). 0 664 22772 4

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S002204690525532X

Robert M. Grant, emeritus of the University of Chicago, long ago established himself as one of the foremost interpreters of the first three centuries of Christian history. His works range widely from detailed expositions of texts to synthetic works of a general and wide-ranging nature. The work under review falls squarely into the latter category. In essence it is a careful and considered guide to the history of Christianity from the time of Jesus to the death of Constantine. As the title indicates, Grant makes certain that his narrative takes adequate account of the broader historical setting within which Christianity arose, that is, the setting of the Roman empire, both east and west, something which might be said to distinguish his work from some others which are more parochially Christian in their feel. The book is notable for its mastery of both primary and secondary literature and for its sober and sometimes witty tone. It is a reprint of the original publication of 1970 and comes with a new preface by the distinguished New Testament scholar, Margaret Mitchell, like Grant also of the University of Chicago. In a substantial and erudite essay, Mitchell, amongst other things, notes the many qualities of Grant's scholarship, drawing particular attention to its mastery of primary material in the original language, its range, its clear recognition of the difficulties encountered when working with the fragmentary and tendentious sources of early Christianity, and its strong appreciation of the wider canvas against which Christianity emerged. Mitchell also attempts to show how Grant's work continues to dovetail with some of the present concerns of scholarship on early Christianity. The book also comes with a helpfully updated bibliography. After reading *Augustus to Constantine* at one sitting, the decision to reprint it seems fully justified. The text still has a freshness about it, helped in particular by its felicitous use of sometimes hidden away, yet highly pertinent, nuggets from primary material (in this respect it is interesting to note that Grant's *Second-century Christianity: a collection of fragments* was reprinted by Westminster John Knox in 2003). Aspects of the work seem now to be a little inadequate (Grant's somewhat fleeting discussion of the separation of Judaism and Christianity, which has been a veritable storm centre of debate since 1970, is but one case in point). But it provides scholar and research student alike with an excellent and above all else, sensible, vantage point from which to view the tangled complexities of this seminal period in Christian history. All those interested in the period should be grateful to Westminster John Knox Press and Professor Mitchell for this timely reprinting of a notable piece of scholarship.

PETERHOUSE,  
CAMBRIDGE

JAMES CARLETON PAGET

*Atti del colloquio internazionale Il Liber pontificalis e la storia materiale (Roma, 21–22 febbraio 2002)*. By Herman Geertman. (Mededelingen van het Nederlands Instituut te Rome, Antiquity [2001–2002], 60–61.) Pp. vi + 389 incl. 10 tables, 11 figs and colour plates + pull-out map. Assen: van Gorcum, 2003. €59 (paper). 90 232 3969 5; 0169 6572

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905265326

Five of the contributions to this volume are by H. Geertman, the editor. The remainder are taken up with his own perspective on the *Liber pontificalis* as a source of material culture. Special attention, here because of their interdisciplinary significance, should be drawn to the articles of M. Andaloro, ‘Immagine e immagini nel *Liber pontificalis* da Adriano I a Pasquale’ (pp. 45–103); D. Bellardine and P. Delogou, ‘*Liber pontificalis* e altri fonti: la topografia di Roma nell’VIII secolo’ (pp. 203–23); R. Santangeli Valenzani, ‘Il paesaggio urbano altomedievale nei testi del *Liber pontificalis*’ (pp. 225–34); and P. Carmassi, ‘La prima redazione del *Liber pontificalis* nel quadro delle fonti contemporanee: osservazioni in margine alla vita Simmaco’ (pp. 235–66). At the end of the volume, Geertman attempts for the text of papal biographies covering the period from 311 to 535 AD to make clear different strands of transmission from a typographical perspective. It is expressly stated that the present volume is not intended to replace Louis Duchesne’s 1886 edition, nor even that of Theodore Mommsen (1898). The volume comes with a bibliography in which no mention is made of some works of considerable importance in the study of the history of the *Liber pontificalis*: E. Caspar, *Die aelteste roemische Bischofsliste* (1926); G. B. Ladner, *Die Papstbildnisse* (1941); A. Lapotre, *De Anastasio Bibliothecario* (1885); H. Mann, *The Lives of the popes*, i (1925); and H. Stern, *Le Calendrier de 354* (1953). There is no index.

UNIVERSITY OF HEIDELBERG

WALTER BERSCHIN

*Augustinus afer. Saint Augustin. Africanité et universalité. Actes du colloque international Alger-Annaba, 1–7 avril 2001*. 2 vols. Edited by Pierre-Yves Fux, Jean-Michel Roessli and Otto Wermelinger. (Paradosis. Études de littérature et de théologie anciennes, 45/1, 45/2.) Pp. iv + 347; vii + 349–660 incl. numerous colour and black-and-white plates. Freiburg: Éditions Universitaires Fribourg Suisse, 2003. €65.50. 2 8271 0943 3; 1422 4402

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905275322

In 1954 the congress volumes entitled *Augustinus magister* marked a fresh advance and, in many cases, a breakthrough in Augustinian scholarship. Almost fifty years on, the collection *Augustinus afer*, containing some forty-three papers and addresses from a conference in Algeria, shows the wide range of approaches and diversity of interest to which Augustinian studies have since moved. As is evident by the title, the collection places particular emphasis on the African background and context of Augustine’s life and thought, pairing it, in the subtitle, with his universal outreach and heritage. While the latter is in keeping with well-established views on Augustine’s pivotal role in the subsequent history of ideas and the formation of western civilisation, medieval and beyond, the focus on a particularly ‘African’ element to Augustine’s work maps less familiar territory. To spell out Augustine’s universal appeal, many of the traditional theological, philosophical and historical

themes are introduced in, for the most part, rather brief papers: providence and grace (J. Burns Patout), faith and reason (G. Madec), the liberal arts (M. Zelzer), society (R. Dodaro), his 'philosophy' (A. Ziki), biblical hermeneutic (K. Pollmann) to name but a few. They may all serve as brief summaries of, or open exemplary alleys into, their authors' often extensive research on such themes. Already closer to the main theme of the conference, R. A. Markus presents the question of Donatist 'rebaptism' as a litmus test for the discussion of universality versus traditional 'African' practice. J. Van Oort investigates north African Manichaeism. And O. Wermelinger revisits the interplay between north Africa and Rome in the condemnation of Pelagianism. Some address 'African' motifs even more explicitly and cover less well-known ground: C. Bouamrane introduces the concepts of predestination and free will in Islam, sadly without contrasting it in any detail with Augustine. The Algerian Archbishop H. Teissier follows concepts that resemble the idea of a 'city of god' in some later authors, including the Arab philosopher Al Farabi (Avennasar), and A. E. H. Ben Mansour searches for vestiges of Augustine in the seventeenth-century Maghreb. While such contributions provide evidence of the regional flavour and the main interest of the conference, what accounts for the distinctly African element in Augustine's views and activities is not altogether apparent from the outset. S. Lancel ('Entre africanité et romanité') charts the ambiguities in Augustine's life and heritage, the undoubtedly 'African' background of his family and the local flavours of his schooling (cf. K. Voessing for a fuller assessment of the educational system), identifiable even later in his Latin pronunciation, or how returning to his native country after his conversion seemed a matter of course. At the same time, as a man of learning, Augustine was almost exclusively imbued in the Latin language and the Roman cultural heritage, even his perspective on African history was always that of the empire. In examining what being African might mean in ecclesial terms ('The self-identity of north African Christians'), J. K. Coyle points out how its history helped to create a unique organisational, liturgical and theological blend of African Christianity, mostly shared, not disputed, between 'Donatists' and 'Catholics'. In other contributions, it is of interest to see how opponents specifically identify Augustine as 'African' for polemical purposes. D. Weber demonstrates the literary background of Julian of Ecclanum's polemic use of Augustine's alleged 'Punic' descent, and, by contrast, M. Lamberights interprets Julian's own proud display of a classical education and the social circles he moves in, as a distinctly Italian attitude. It is in response to these that Augustine might be seen to display not only elements of local pride, but perhaps also a sense of regional 'cultural identity' (Lancel). As might be expected, Augustine's complex relations with Donatism further exemplify the African theme: A. Mandouze juxtaposes Augustine and Donat – a brief introduction to his wide ranging research on the matter. M. A. Tilley revisits the question of Augustine's debt to Tyconius and Donatist thinking more widely. A. Schindler discusses a collection of homilies recently suggested to be of Donatist origin. Further contributions portray the bishop of Hippo at work, his pastoral struggles with astrology and divination, his concerns for the everyday needs of his flock, and also his role in the ecclesiastical and imperial legislation, thus providing us with many illustrative details of social life at the time (F. Dolbeau, C. Lepelley, C. Munier). Certainly not the least important contributions to the understanding of Augustine's African context is the archaeological documentation and discussion of Augustinian sites. M. B. Lemeé

interprets a mosaic and provides aerial photographs of Hippo/Anaba. M. de Vos gives a brief topographical and archaeological survey and outlines the task of further research. N. Benseddik introduces the local history of Tagaste/Souk Ahras. Extensive documentation takes up most of the remainder of the second volume (pp. 485–656). It opens with a collection of Augustine's sayings in five languages, Latin, French, English, German and Arabic. I am not aware of translations of Augustine's work into Arabic except for the Confessions. Hence, it may be for the first time that some of his words reach out to the present-day inhabitants of the places where he spent most of his life, and a wider Arab audience, in their own language. A series of beautifully reproduced photographs shows the Augustinian sites visited; they display archaeological remains as well as the landscape, scenes of contemporary life and encounters with local people. They suggest some continuity, for example in the use of the land, food and drink and even in aspects of social life. There are further pictures of congress participants, of diplomats and political leaders involved, and of an exhibition in the Algerian National Library that accompanied the colloquium. It was organised jointly by the Swiss Department of Foreign Affairs and the Patristic Department of the University of Fribourg on the one hand, and the Algerian Haute Conseil Islamique on the other. All this not only adds to the regional flavour, but also reminds us of the diplomatic and political dimensions of the enterprise. Several addresses pay their debt of gratitude to the Algerian President Bouteflika in particular. However, the editors must be congratulated for being able, for the most part, to avoid too firm an embrace of political interest.

The conference presents us with a first sketch for an unfamiliar portrait of the 'Algerian philosopher' Augustine (O. Wermelinger in his conclusion at p. 437) – a man who apparently, and understandably, came as something of a surprise to the Algerian people learning about the congress. On a scholarly level, the theme resonates with the advances in Mediterranean studies in recent years. However, the colloquium first of all ties in with the United Nations-designated year of a 'dialogue of civilisations' in 2001. With their constant playing on the African theme, these volumes are of cultural and political importance as much as, if not more than, they are a testimony to Augustinian scholarship. Whether the colloquium was able to start such a dialogue and raise interest in the pre-Islamic past in Algeria and other North African nations, or whether a small window of opportunity may already be closing again, only time will tell.

FACULTY OF DIVINITY,  
CAMBRIDGE

THOMAS GRAUMANN

*Prayer and spirituality in the early Church, III: Liturgy and life.* Edited by Bronwen Neil, Geoffrey D. Dunn and Lawrence Cross. Pp. x + 412 + 13 plates. Virginia, QLD: Centre for Early Christian Studies, Australian Catholic University, 2003. A\$38.50 (paper) 0 9577483 8 8  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905285329

This is the third collection of papers from the triennial conference on 'Prayer and spirituality in the Early Church' hosted by the Centre for Early Christian Studies at Australian Catholic University. This conference is becoming something of a fixture in early Church circles and serves as a welcome sign of the vitality of the field in the

acific rim. The papers here collected revolve around the broad themes of liturgy and life. Within that wide compass, however, one major subtheme emerges: that of the links between Christian and Jewish traditions. The paper very deliberately chosen to open the volume is particularly apposite in this respect. Charles Kannengiesser's 'Scripture and spirituality in ancient Christianity' puts forward a powerful argument that the key issue facing Christians today is the imperative of reconciliation with the Jews, their 'elder brothers' in the same covenant. This reconciliation is seen to require a rethinking and reappropriation of the Christian inheritance – most particularly of the early Church and of Scripture. Such a process will, he concludes, impose, 'in ways we cannot yet imagine, a creative re-enactment of the cultural achievement proper to ancient Christianity'. This is indeed an unusually thought-provoking article. A good number of other articles take up Kannengiesser's charge to a greater or lesser extent – and these are by no means restricted to those in the fascinating 'Jewish influences' section. While it is never easy nor entirely fair to highlight individual articles in rich collections such as this, I will none the less mention some which seemed to this reviewer to be of particular interest. Youssef's paper on 'Severus of Antioch in the Coptic Troparia' is very revealing on the patristic roots of Coptic hymnography. It also reminds us of another great rift that needs to be overcome – that between the non- (or pre-) Chalcedonian and Chalcedonian Churches. Di Berardino gives us a precise and intriguing account of the ways in which the development of the liturgical calendar was bound up with the changing conceptualisation of space and time brought about by the Christianisation of the empire. Dupuche is stimulating on the relation between Sufism and Hesychasm while Ginsburg offers some fascinating observations on prayer within the Jewish mystical tradition. Lastly, Neil's article on vice and virtue in Augustine and Maximus makes a very helpful association between two authors who have substantially more in common than is often appreciated, thereby opening up yet another ecumenical dimension. The volume is well edited with a number of useful indices. It is also generally well presented, its one major failing being the near absence of any left gutter. Overall, an excellent collection that bears eloquent testimony to what must have been a remarkable conference.

FACULTY OF DIVINITY,  
CAMBRIDGE

MARCUS PLESTED

*L'eloquenza del silenzio nelle fonti mediolatine. Il caso di Leoba, dilecta di Bonifacio Vinfrido.*

By I. Deug-Su. (Millennio Medievale, 47. Strumenti e Studi, 7.) Pp. vii + 216. Florence: SISMEL/Edizioni del Galluzzo, 2004. €52. 88 8450 113 X

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905295325

Leoba, one of the Anglo-Saxon women associated with Boniface's mission to the continent, died around 782. There are a few brief letters between her and Boniface and Lull, another member of the missionary group, and Leoba's name is mentioned in one of the *Lives* of Boniface. The principal source for Leoba, however, is a *vita* written by Rudolf, a monk of Fulda, around 836. Rudolf's account is well-known, but has not been studied in detail. I. Deug-Su's meticulous study focuses on one of Rudolf's most singular revelations – Boniface's express instruction to his monks

before heading off on the mission on which he was killed (754) that Leoba's remains be placed with his in the tomb. By Rudolf's account, based to some extent on an earlier monk's interviews with some of her disciples, Leoba was remarkable for her learning. About a quarter of the biography, thanks to Deug-Su's detailed source analysis, also draws from earlier hagiography, especially from Anastasius' *Life of Antony*, Constantius of Lyon's *Life of Germanus* and Sulpicius Severus's *Life of Martin*. Rudolf mined these texts for words to describe Leoba's spirituality. But it is the affective relationship with Boniface that occupies the book's centre stage. Here, Deug-Su explores other spiritual bonds between men and women, most famously between the brother-sister pairs of Ambrose of Milan and Marcella, Benedict of Nursia and Scholastica, Caesarius of Arles and Caesaria. It was from Gregory the Great's account of Benedict's wish that his sister's remains would share his tomb that Rudolf would draw his explanation for Boniface's similar request – since their eagerness to serve Christ was equally strong, it was appropriate that they await the resurrection together. In the event, the monks of Fulda did not share Rudolf's astounding equation of Boniface and Leoba. She was granted special privileges to visit Boniface's tomb during the twenty-eight years she outlived him. Deug-Su senses resentment on the part of the monks at the access a woman had to the inner precincts of their monastery. When she died, rather than placing her in Boniface's tomb, they consigned her to another tomb on the other side of the church's altar. A few years later, her remains were translated to yet another spot, this time in the west porch of Fulda's church. Finally, shortly after Rudolf completed his account, Leoba was moved again, to a new church at Petersberg, some distance from Fulda, where the monks intended to collect their relics of holy women. Later writers might see in the relationship of Boniface and Leoba the elements of a love story, but the Fulda monks would have nothing of it. Deug-Su's fine essay opens new perspectives on Rudolf's text and on the early medieval phenomenon of paired affective spirituality.

PURDUE UNIVERSITY

JOHN J. CONTRENI

*Ritual und Inszenierung. Geistliches und weltliches Drama des Mittelalters und der Frühen Neuzeit.* By Hans-Joachim Ziegeler. Pp. xxviii + 374. Tübingen: Niemeyer, 2004. €86. 3 484 64026 X

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S002204690530532X

The very fact that medieval religious plays are neither modelled on ancient Greek drama nor do they prefigure the modern, secular stage, make them *sui generis*; and, as such, their isolation calls for an explanation. The most obvious gloss on these plays is that they are an extension of the Church's liturgy. But how exactly does the liturgical script relate to the play? No fewer than twenty-two contributions to *Ritual und Inszenierung* comment directly or indirectly on this issue. Although unfortunately placed at the end of the book, the paper by Walter Haug serves as an excellent introduction, for it not only sketches the history of scholarly approaches to medieval plays, but also offers an appreciation of the work of Rainer Warning to whom we owe the most recent comprehensive interpretation. Warning himself in this volume presents a reaffirmation of his well-known (though rarely discussed) theory of the repaganisation of the Christian drama of salvation in the religious plays: while in the

liturgy the dramatic element is tempered by the symbolic code, the plays use the freer imaginative code to dramatise the myth, giving it cosmic dimensions by reviving a devil–God dualism characteristic of a pre-Christian substratum (see Rainer Warning, *The ambivalences of medieval religious drama*, Palo Alto 2001, a translation of Warning's 1974 German monograph). While no contributor to the debate goes as far as fully endorsing Warning's thesis, some actually come close to doing so, including Walter Haug and Jan-Dirk Müller. The latter, who promises to develop further his own view in a forthcoming monograph, suggests that in the liturgy, dramatic elements remain consistently subordinated to the religious purpose, while in the drama they are enhanced and elaborated to assume centre stage – a thesis recently supported by one of Müller's students (Christoph Petersen, *Ritual und Theater: Messallegorese, Osterfeier und Osterspiel im Mittelalter*, Tübingen 2004). Also relevant at this point is Bruno Quast's monograph (*Vom Kult zur Kunst: Öffnungen des rituellen Textes in Mittelalter und Früher Neuzeit*, Tübingen 2005) in which he comes close to Warning's interpretation by suggesting that drama and liturgy complement each other: while the symbolic nature of the liturgy is a response to the demands of the clerical elite, the mythopoetic quality of the plays satisfies the common, illiterate folks' need for a mythological understanding of human existence. Two other papers deserve to be singled out, for they illuminate important aspects of the discussion. The paper by Bernd Neumann and Dieter Trauden presents evidence for an urban, rather than ecclesiastical, setting for the sacred plays, advancing further the argument for differentiating between liturgy and drama. Yet, as Renate Amstutz's contribution demonstrates, we should beware of making the distinction too rigid, as if no inter-relationship existed. While, in the past, scholars have regularly pointed out the liturgical echoes found in the religious plays, Amstutz shows that the influence may also work in the opposite direction – from religious play to liturgy; thus the late thirteenth-century liturgy of the consecration of virgins (the reception of young women into a convent), a ritual complete with the giving of an engagement ring, includes a number of features that reflect the medieval plays of the Ten Virgins. By way of conclusion, another collective volume may be mentioned, dedicated to the same subject and demonstrating the depth of current interest in it: Christel Meier, Heinz Meyer and Claudia Spanily (eds), *Das Theater des Mittelalters und der frühen Neuzeit als Ort und Medium sozialer und symbolischer Kommunikation*, Münster 2004. I would recommend both volumes to all scholars interested in this fascinating field.

UNIVERSITY OF PADERBORN,  
GERMANY

BERNHARD LANG

*The dependent priories of medieval English monasteries.* By Martin Heale. (Studies in the History of Medieval Religion, 22.) Pp. xx+380 incl. 8 figs and 7 tables. Woodbridge: Boydell, 2004. £50. 1 84383 054 X; 0955 2480  
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905315326

Dependent monasteries as a class have had a bad press for centuries; David Knowles condemned them as the worst agents of spiritual decay in monastic life. The dependent priories of English (as opposed to alien) monasteries are 'the least studied' of all types of religious houses, a neglect which this book magnificently rectifies. Every aspect of their existence is examined: foundations, constitutions,

relations with mother houses, their monastic quality of life, relations with their lay neighbours, economic history, dissolution. The bases of this study are the cells of St Albans, Norwich and Durham, which are by far the best documented of the class, but Heale has assembled an impressively diverse range of evidence to present the fullest possible examination of his subject. The picture that emerges is both more positive and of greater significance than has previously been the case. True, there were problems, which he acknowledges – of discipline, jurisdiction, isolation and sheer logistics – but the evidence tells us that these cells were founded as places of intercession or as guardians of holy sites, that they were greatly valued by their mother houses and, at every point at which it can be tested, presents a picture less gloomy than was previously thought. Not only better documented but better endowed than other small houses, the quality of their spiritual life depended upon the quality of the mother house, which despatched a constantly-rotating supply of religious, and though sometimes a dumping-ground for trouble-makers, dependent cells were more usually staffed by sound men in middle life, and offered them opportunity to gain administrative experience. The text is full, careful and detailed, the conclusions are sober and judicious. The story is supplemented with maps, appendices and numerous graphs and tables. This is scholarship of a very high order, and a rare example of a doctoral dissertation which makes for a highly successful book.

UNIVERSITY OF NOTTINGHAM

ALISON MCHARDY

*The profession and practice of medieval canon law.* By James A. Brundage. (Collected Studies, 797.) Pp. xii + 336. Aldershot–Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2004. £57.50. o 86078 927 6

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905325322

For more than thirty years, James Brundage has devoted a portion of his energy to examining the training and careers of the lawyers who practised in courts of the medieval Church. His steady aim has been to produce a book dealing with this part of the legal profession. This is not that book. It is a collection of eighteen articles he has written along the way. They deal with many different aspects of the larger subject. There is some repetition, but not much. We learn, for example, about the education of professional advocates and proctors, the ethical problems they faced and the oaths they were obliged to take. The fees taken by lawyers, the taxation of costs in litigation and the availability of legal aid for the poor all come under Brundage's scrutiny. The problems created by monks acting as lawyers and lawyers acting for the crusading orders are brought to light. The result is a disparate, informative and believable picture. If there is a unifying theme, it is the gradual professionalisation of the men who served in the ecclesiastical courts over the course of the later Middle Ages. The process happened gradually and was accepted reluctantly by many. To suggest that the University of Cambridge was founded where it was because of its proximity to the courts of the diocese of Ely – the theme of one article – may put the progress of this movement, which led to the establishment of permanent ecclesiastical courts, a few years too early. But there is no essay here from which readers will not profit. Brundage has an eye for the good anecdote. He must have assembled every

telling example involving lawyers available from the medieval sources, and he has made good use of them. Together with the evidence drawn from the writing of learned canonists, they enlarge our understanding of the Church and the history of the legal profession.

UNIVERSITY OF CHICAGO

R. H. HELMHOLZ

*Power and property in medieval Germany. Economic and social change c. 900–1300.* By Benjamin Arnold. Pp. xi + 210. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004. £45.00 19 927221 2

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905335329

Benjamin Arnold is the leading English-speaking authority on the history of medieval Germany. During the past twenty years he has published three monographs on German knighthood, princes and territories, and counts and bishops, and a more general study on medieval Germany. The present work concentrates on economic and social history but also deals with politics and the Church. In addition to an introductory chapter and a brief conclusion, it has four chapters on ‘Peasants, lords, and their resources’, ‘The German crown and its assets’ (largely a specialised study on the *Tafelgüter-verzeichnis*), ‘The urban milieu and civic status’ and ‘Property, piety and castles’, which is the section of particular interest to readers of this *JOURNAL* and includes interesting material on the ‘recycling’ of castles into religious houses and on the religious attitudes of the aristocracy in the late Middle Ages. The work is extensively annotated and solidly based on the sources and on recent secondary works, mostly in German and English. I noticed only four French titles in the bibliography (plus some translations) and none in Italian. Indeed, the relative neglect of the Italian aspects of the policy and resources of the German kings is one of the few weaknesses of this work. It is filled with perceptive and sometime striking comments, like ‘the wistful expectation of all medieval landlords’ (p. 46), whose violence and rapacity were not the only side of lord–peasant relations. ‘The peasants developed a culture of resistance of their own’ (p. 62), often based on a sense of lost former rights, and ‘by means of associations, agitation, and negotiation peasants were able to play upon their lords’ needs for financial and military support’ (p. 54). There is no extended discussion, however, of the differences between ecclesiastical and secular landlords, nor of how the peasants raised the money to pay their rents. There is much interesting material on social mobility and the relations between different economic and social groups. ‘There were functional links after 1070 or 1100 between the rise of knighthood, the expansion of urban life, changes in social rank, and the meaning of personal liberty’ (p. 139). ‘Commerce was not incompatible with ministerial status’ (p. 134), though more might have been said about how the ministerials rose in status and in some areas actually replaced the free aristocracy and also about the importance of advocacy. The work of Hans Hirsch is not mentioned. The bibliography is in some respects hard to use. Primary sources are cited under the name of the editor and translator, not the author, so that the works of Otto of Freising appear under Hofmeister, Waitz and Mierow. Ficker is listed with the date of the reprint, without the original date of publication. These and a very few misprints are the only defects in an otherwise learned and readable study.

INSTITUTE FOR ADVANCED STUDY,  
PRINCETON

GILES CONSTABLE

*The new Cambridge medieval history, IV: c. 1024–c. 1198.* Edited by David Luscombe and Jonathan Riley-Smith. Pp. xxi + 917 + colour frontispiece and 43 plates; xix + 959 + 18 maps and 8 genealogical tables. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004. £95 each. 0 521 41410 5; 0 521 41411 3  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905345325

As this is the period of Gregory VII, the crusades and St Bernard, there is plenty here for ecclesiastical historians. The forty-two well rounded articles, supported by footnotes and extensive bibliographies, by an international team of senior historians, make this an authoritative reference book and resource for students and specialists alike. Part I treats the period thematically, starting with the rural economy and towns and concluding with art and architecture; half of these chapters concern ecclesiastical history in one way or another. Part II does a regional survey of territories and states, with two chapters each (divided chronologically) on the German empire, the Byzantine empire, Italy, France, Spain and England; and single chapters on Russia, Poland, Scandinavia, Hungary, the kingdom of Jerusalem, the Fatimids, the Seljuqs and (in one chapter) Scotland, Wales and Ireland. Because the papacy is treated as a state, it likewise gets two chronological chapters. Despite the regional spread of part II to Russia, Turkey and Egypt, the bias of the volume as a whole is towards the west. In addition to the two chapters on the papacy in part II, six chapters in part I concern the western Church – by contrast with a single chapter on the eastern Churches. In the six ecclesiastical chapters in part I the development of papal authority is the main theme: with contributions by H. E. J. Cowdrey, I. S. Robinson and Ernst-Dieter Hehl (on war and the Christian order). Giles Constable addresses wider questions (the status of women for example) in his chapter on religious communities, as does Bernard Hamilton in his on the laity and heresy (particularly the Cathars). Taken together, these six chapters constitute what must be the best introduction in English to the institutions of the medieval Church. They are further reinforced by David Luscombe's chapter on thought and learning, Peter Landau's on law and Peter Kidson's on art. Should a volume about the Middle Ages have given such emphasis to church history? In particular should five chapters (three in part I and two in part II), which are by far the longest in the book, have focused on the papacy? In this latter context what is the purpose of the splendid colour frontispiece showing the throne in the church of St Maria in Cosmedin in Rome? Is it intended to display papal authority? By reusing ancient marble and porphyry, this throne endorses Hobbes's maxim that 'the papacy is not other than the ghost of the deceased Roman empire, sitting crowned upon the grave thereof'. If the medieval Church was the successor of Roman power, there are good reasons for giving it pride of place in this volume.

UNIVERSITY OF LONDON

M. T. CLANCHY

*The English and the Normans. Ethnic hostility, assimilation, and identity, 1066–c. 1220.*  
 By Hugh M. Thomas. Pp. xii + 462. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2003.  
 £65. 0 19 925123 1  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905355321

This is a substantial, ambitious and important but often frustrating and ultimately flawed book. The material is arranged around – in fact dominated by the author's

commitment to the concepts of ethnicity and assimilation as the keys to understanding evolving relationships between the English and their Norman ruling elites in the century and half after the battle of Hastings. The remarkable feature of this relationship, according to Thomas, was the willingness of the conquering elites so swiftly (by the end of Henry II's reign), and, despite initial ethnic hostilities, to assimilate to the English identity of those they conquered.

Thomas's impressive familiarity with modern theories, comparative case studies and medieval historiographies of ethnicity provide him with a three-level model of ethnic formation based upon the personal interactions of individuals and groups, the role that shared cultural resources played in the formation of ethnic identities and ethnicity as a series of constructs. The result is a book of two dozen frustratingly short chapters, each approaching the subject often from angles only minutely distinguishable from one another, in ways that create much overlap and repetition. This relentless pursuit of 'ethnicity' from all directions, for example, through discussions of intermarriage and family and its lines of descent, naming practices, forms of official discrimination, issues of class, social groupings such as aristocrats, women, religious, townsmen and peasants, structures of governance, and ideas of England explored through landscape, history, saints' cults and language and literature, leaves one struggling to hold onto all the different subject threads, and increasingly suspicious that everything is about ethnicity and nothing is about ethnicity. This is a shame because much of the value of Thomas's work, for instance, on native English families of the twelfth century, on English women, on the peasantry, and on changing English identity, is hidden from view by the book's governing theme of ethnicity.

Are there any grounds for talking about ethnicity in this period? Despite the author's admission of an 'absence of theory' and a 'lack of any strong ideology concerning ethnicity in the period' (p. 92), I would say yes, provided, that is, that we define it as a form of rhetoric, susceptible to contextualised readings, and seen as serving the interests of individuals, groups and institutions, for whom appeals to ethnicity were means to diverse ends, rather than ends in themselves. Thomas acknowledges as much in his mention of the polyvalent and rhetorical qualities of instances of ethnic language use, but largely rejects their interpretive potential, opting for an exhaustively substantive, empirical approach that generates lots of 'on the one hand but then on the other' fence-sitting explanations of the sources. Thus, he rejects John Gillingham's point that the speech attributed in the *Chronicle of Battle Abbey* to Richard de Lucy, who appeals before Henry II to 'we Normans' as particularly obliged to glorify the abbey, is about court politics and factionalism rather than ethnicity, and sees it instead as evidence of 'surviving division', as late as 1180, between the English and the Normans. It appears later in the chapter as 'positive evidence' (p. 78), balanced against other evidence suggesting the opposite, that assimilation had nearly but not quite been completed during the reign of Henry II. Similarly, his mild chastisement of those English aristocratic families who survived the Conquest, but failed to keep themselves apart, 'in some sort of separatist English community, as many modern people would think the honourable thing to do' (p. 128), implicitly concedes the anachronistic value of ethnic purity when applied to this period.

Thomas should be thanked for introducing issues of ethnicity to this period of history, and admired for the scale and rigour of his work. There remains some way

to go however in the task of relating ethnicity to its contemporary terms, concepts and uses, and to increasingly contentious current debates about English national identity. It remains a suspicion that ethnicity is primarily a language of political formation and representation that operates most frequently in post-colonial contexts (such as the late Roman empire, post-Soviet Russia or late twentieth-century Africa) in which overarching structures of government are being replaced by new political networks and processes, each of them seeking legitimisation. Despite the undoubted ruptures across the divide of 1066, perhaps the most powerful force for assimilation, and one that made ethnicity only a marginal aspect of it, was William I's early realisation that the key to rule in England was the enabling power of the English crown and the continuity in terms of political networks and processes of patronage that it provided. William's lack of imperial ambition, and the fact that England and Normandy broadly shared common political and cultural characteristics, made hard feelings (however often they occasionally resurfaced) quickly give way to a practical consensus. Ultimately, the most conspicuous struggle for reconciliation and assimilation in the book exists between the author's essentially empirical approach to the subject and his reading of theory, large as it is, but many of whose insights still require fuller application.

UNIVERSITY OF BIRMINGHAM

SIMON YARROW

*Notre-Dame de Paris. Un manifeste chrétien, 1160–1230. Actes du colloque organisé à l'Institut de France le vendredi 12 décembre 2003.* Edited by Michel Lemoine. (Rencontres Médiévales Européennes, 4.) Pp. 151. Turnhout: Brepols, 2004. €28. 2 503 51632 7  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905365328

This is the fourth in a series using an interdisciplinary approach to examine the relationship between gothic architecture and contemporary spirituality and liturgy. The theme of the first *colloque* was Abbot Suger, the gothic style at St Denis and Victorine thought; it was obvious that before long it would be followed by a meeting devoted to Notre-Dame. The opening paper by Alain Michel on liturgy and theology in the Middle Ages sensitively discusses the beauty, striking colour and above all dramatic space of the great gothic cathedral whose purpose was to bring together large numbers of people. Music is left for O. Cullin. J. Longère and A. Erlande-Brandenburg write on Bishop Maurice de Sully, respectively as preacher, and as builder of the cathedral. The extraordinarily rich contribution of the abbey of St Victor to western culture and spirituality at this time is not neglected (M. Lemoine and F. Gasparri). Some interesting points were made in the discussions that followed the papers (printed here); for example, how far the laity would have been able to see the elaborate ceremonies and, most important, the celebration of the mass. Two matters need correction – Eudes de Sully introduced the practice of the elevation of the host (not Maurice de Sully, as stated on the back cover), and Durand's book on the liturgy dates from 1290, not 1590 (p. 23).

UNIVERSITY COLLEGE,  
 LONDON

JANE SAYERS

*Die Register Innocenz' III, IX: Pontifikatsjahr, 1206/1207. Texte and Indices.* Edited by Andrea Sommerlechner (with Othmar Hageneder, Christoph Egger, Rainer Murauer and Herwig Weigl). (Publikationen des Historischen Instituts beim Österreichischen Kulturforum in Rom. Section 2, Ser. 1.) Pp. xc + 542 + 6 colour plates. Vienna: Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, 2004. €150 (paper). 3 7001 3276 X

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905375324

The ninth year of Pope Innocent III represents the half-way mark of the pontificate, so it is something of a landmark in the lengthy task of the publication of the complete text of the registers by the Austrian Institute. The most important registered business which was brought to the pope from England during this year concerns the churches of Glastonbury and Bath and the election to the see of Canterbury on the death of Hubert Walter. The Canterbury election, resulting in the pope's postulation of Stephen Langton as archbishop, was to lead to the great conflict between the pope and King John and to the sorry state of relations between the English Church and Rome during the years of the papal interdict from 1208 to 1214. The other registered material is made up of the usual run of petitions, most of them small beer but important to the individuals involved. These are instances where the applicants could not rest happily without some reassurance, concession or protection from the apostolic see itself. An Augustinian canon from Norton was worried that as at profession he had been given the name of Augustine, replacing his baptismal name of Henry, prayers on his behalf under his new name might not be effective; he was assured that just as the pope has two names, being given a new one at his accession, he need not be troubled on this issue. A Durham monk was frustrated by his prior who was resisting his wish to join the Cistercians; only the pope could satisfactorily come to his aid and direct the prior to give permission. Emma de Bendeville had been put in a nunnery as a child but had later left the convent, married and had children. Some persons, however, questioned the validity of her marriage, alleging that she had made profession and taken the habit, charges she denied. If her marriage was invalid, the rights of her children to inherit would be at risk. Help came from the papal curia; judges delegate were appointed and instructed that if the facts as she presented them were correct, they were to see to the protection of her and her children. I have concentrated on certain English business, but, of course, there is much, much more from all over Europe. The final pages of the volume consist of a short list of corrections to vol. viii, and addenda to the present volume of material published after the book went to press – in themselves tributes to the high standards of research and editing shown in these volumes – and of plates illustrating the work of the two hands involved in the writing of the register for this pontifical year. It is quite remarkable that the scribe L wrote all the letters save one.

UNIVERSITY COLLEGE,  
LONDON

JANE SAYERS

*The medieval mystical tradition in England. Exeter Symposium VII. Papers read at Charney Manor, July 2004.* Edited by E. A. Jones. Pp. xiv + 212. Cambridge: D.S. Brewer, 2004. £45. 1 84384 007 3; 0950 7299

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905385320

This is the seventh volume in a long-running series (a quarter of a century old) of papers dedicated to vernacular mystical writing in England during the last three

hundred years of the Middle Ages. The series has from the beginning been instrumental in sustaining this field of study, and the present volume is especially to be welcomed as representing the successful passing of the baton from the founder of the series, Marion Glasscoe, to its new editor, and thus the hope of more to come. Libraries and interested individuals continue to need these books for their scholarship and the chronological portrait they provide of the development of the field. The present volume contains thirteen papers by scholars at all stages of their careers: two on the *Ancrene Wisse* group; one each on *The cloud of unknowing* and *The book of Margery Kempe*; four on English adaptations of continental mysticism (one, by David Griffiths, the series's first venture into art history), a topic of growing interest to scholars; three on Julian of Norwich; and one each on a vernacular adaptation of the Carmelite *Book of the first monks* and the Syon brethren. All the essays are worth reading and most constitute new contributions to knowledge. Notable in this particular volume is an increasing trend towards the study of anonymous and lesser-known texts, and a growing appreciation of works written at the end of the period, in the decades immediately before the Reformation. The first trend is exemplified in Marleen Cré's fine study of English adaptations of Jan van Ruusbroec, especially *The chastising of God's children*, and in Valerie Edden's interesting account of fourteenth-century Cambridge Carmelite spirituality; the second by the cluster of essays concerned with the Bridgettine convent of Syon by Ann M. Hutchison, C. Annette Grisé and Vincent Gillespie. These essays are historical in focus, whereas the essays concerned with the mystics as traditionally conceived are critical or theological, concerned with generating new readings of the text in question. Outstanding here are Denise N. Baker's enquiry into Julian of Norwich's concept of the 'Godly wille' and Karl Heinz Steinmetz's reading of *The cloud*, both of which show elements of conventionalism in texts which tend to be presented as *sui generis*; Jones's inspired juxtaposition of Steinmetz's essay with Naoë Kukita Yoshikawa's study of *discretio spirituum* in *The book of Margery Kempe* allows one to imagine these two texts as contemporaneous as though for the first time. The other Julian essays, by Annie Sutherland and Alexandra Barratt, throw light on Julian's use of the Bible and her metaphoric indebtedness to 'bastard feudalism' respectively; while the *Ancrene Wisse* group pieces, by Liz Herbert McAvoy and Susannah Mary Chewning, constitute the volume's most theoretically oriented essays, one focusing on the 'monstrous', the other on the relation between mysticism and the dream vision. All in all, this is a rich collection, one that gives grounds for hope that the next twenty-five years' worth of volumes will have as much to contribute as have their predecessors.

HARVARD UNIVERSITY

NICHOLAS WATSON

*Documentos de Gregorio IX (1227–1241) referentes a España.* By Santiago Domínguez Sánchez. (Monumenta Hispaniae Pontificiae, I.) Pp. 811. León: Universidad de León, 2004. €60. 84 9773 160 3  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905395327

Even in Spain the process of publication of letters of the medieval popes still has some way to go. After Mansilla's volumes on the period down to Innocent III and on the pontificate of Honorius III (1955, 1965), the *Monumenta Hispaniae Vaticana* series of letters included in the papal registers seems to have come to a full stop, and in view of

the volumes in that series which followed Mansilla that may be as well. Earlier, there had been those in Spain liable to prove touchy when the editors of the *École française* series of letters in the papal registers failed to print Spanish items *in extenso* – ‘as they usually do with all documents referring to Spain, thereby depriving them of all importance’, evidently because they were French. Thus the distinguished Benedictine scholar Dom Luciano Serrano in 1940 regarding an item from the pontificate of Gregory IX (*Hispania*, i. 8n.). But 1940 was the first Year of Victory, of course, when even the abbot of Silos was expected to be lavish with expressions of nationalist fervour. The item in question, a papal confirmation of a significant royal instrument, is printed as no. 205 in the exemplary collection of Dr Domínguez Sánchez, a work which combines complete transcriptions not only of the registered letters in volumes XIV–XX of the Vatican registers but also of originals and copies recovered from seventy-odd archives and collections in Spain and elsewhere which, because the registered letters represent only a fraction of those issued, remain a source of essential information for an understanding of the period. (I am delighted to see that the indefatigable author has even got the better of the authorities at Lleida, which is more than I was able to do forty years ago when the cathedral archivist had been in bed for sixteen years.) Following Domínguez’s earlier volumes of the Spanish letters of Clement IV, Gregory X and Nicholas III, this work of patient and unremitting scholarship is deserving of the highest praise. In those volumes originals were not taken account of. Here they are, and with some of their diplomatic features noted. In all, no fewer than 999 items are printed in full in a volume destined to prove of substantial and permanent importance for a crucial period of both papal and Spanish history.

ST JOHN’S COLLEGE,  
CAMBRIDGE

PETER LINEHAN

James I of Aragon, *The book of deeds of James I of Aragon. A translation of the medieval Catalan Libre dels fets*. Trans. Damian Smith and Helen Buffery. (Crusade Texts in Translation, 10.) Pp. xvii + 405 incl. 5 maps. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2003. £42.50. 0 7546 0359 8  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905405321

Strike where you may, royal memoirs are likelier to be more interested in playing to the gallery of history than in serving history’s own agenda. Whether in the twenty-first century or the thirteenth, they are probably not the first place to look for a veridical account of the protagonist’s record of matrimonial fidelity, for example. Not that this diminishes the value and interest of a work such as this, the translation from the Catalan of the autobiographical *Libre dels fets* of that rumbustious adulterer, James I of Aragon, ruler of his kingdom for all but five of his sixty-eight years and impresario of its affairs in the years in which the ‘Corona de Aragón’ was exploring fresh possibilities in the western Mediterranean. The *Libre*’s coverage of the events of the reign is uneven, and tails off after 1258 when the king still had eighteen years to go and his Castilian son-in-law Alfonso X was flexing his imperial muscles – much to James’s alarm, as we know from diplomatic correspondence of that year. But this leaves much to be grateful for, even within a studiously partisan and self-interested narrative. Albeit through the medium of a sometimes clumsy translation, the

accounts of the conquests of Mallorca and Valencia (1229, 1237–8) retain their vividness still. By such feats, the authority of the adolescent king, only recently held in such contempt in his confrontation with Pedro de Ahones [cc. 25–7], was raised to a higher plane, though not in the estimation of don Pedro's perennially factious Aragonese successors. The translators are to be congratulated for having provided a no-frills text fit for historians, replete with references to the huge cast of characters engaged by the player-king. They pay handsome and proper tribute to their predecessor John Forster, sometime MP for Berwick, on whose posthumously published 1883 translation Anglophone students of the period have rather depended. On most occasions Smith and Buffery are able to improve on Forster, though they ought not to have allowed themselves to be persuaded by Fr R. I. Burns that the bishop of Cuenca in c. 339 was 'Gonzalo Ibarra Ibañez' (he was the formidable Gonzalo Juanes Palomeque). And then there is the content of the political advice that James claimed to have given Alfonso x in 1269: 'that if he was to retain any [of the people under his lordship], he should at least retain two parts (...): the Church, the poor and the towns of the country, because God loves these people more than the knights' [c. 408]. Here as elsewhere, the translators are rendering Bruguera's transcription of the 1343 Poblet manuscript. Rather than of 'the poor and the towns of the country', Forster spoke of its 'peoples and cities'. And he was surely right. For whatever the significance of 'pobres' in the 1343 manuscript (and there had been ample time by then for orthographic distortion of the lost original), it is inconceivable that any king addressing another in 1269, even an Aragonese addressing a Castilian, would have advised him to entrust his fortunes to 'the poor'.

ST JOHN'S COLLEGE,  
CAMBRIDGE

PETER LINEHAN

*Conflict and coexistence. Archbishop Rodrigo and the Muslims and Jews of medieval Spain.* By

Lucy K. Pick. (History, Languages, and Cultures of the Spanish and Portuguese Worlds.) Pp. xx + 239 incl. 8 ills. Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan Press, 2004. \$65. 0 472 11387 9

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905415328

Lucy Pick's study of that archbishop of Toledo of many parts, Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada (✠1247), will be warmly welcomed by all who have ever encountered him in any of the guises – warrior, politician, papal legate, chronicler, author – the multifarious variety of which has sometimes caused it to be wondered whether he may not actually have been something of a syndicate. But Pick will have none of this, and her critical reading of the *Breviarium historie catholice* (his paraphrase of biblical history and Peter Comestor's *Historia scholastica*), and above all of the *Dialogus libri vite* with its Jewish interlocutor, as well as enabling her to correct the CCCM edition of the unique Salamanca manuscript at at least one crucial point (p. 96 n. 79), entitles her view to be treated with respect. Here is a work full of interest and surprises: on the 'theology of Unity', so called, in the cosmological assumptions of the Toledo school of translators which on arriving in his see in 1209 the Paris-trained Navarrese prelate found fully functional; on the 'unmistakable' influence on his thought of Alan of Lille; on the extent and probable origin of his knowledge of Hebrew; on the relevance to the *Dialogus* of the contemporary challenge to Jewish eschatological

orthodoxy and the absence from that work of any strategy of conversion. Central to Pick's thesis is the contention that 'polemic, far from necessarily breaking down the preconditions of *convivencia*, could actually help preserve a certain equilibrium between different religious groups' (p. 127). In this cause we observe the shades of Beryl Smalley peering gingerly into Toledo's narrow *adarbes*, and if the author sometimes fails quite to clinch her argument she is nevertheless never less than suggestive. It was not Castilian peninsular hegemony that the archbishop was promoting in his chronicle, she insists, but rather '[peninsular] unity under God in the person of archbishop of Toledo'. The subtlety of the implications of the parallels observed in ch. v between the three peninsular kings prominent in Rodrigo's account of the battle of Las Navas de Tolosa and the Three Wise Men in the vernacular play, the *Auto de los Reyes Magos*, deserves better than brutal abbreviation here, though it is observable in this case that the author is handling evidences deriving from the very extremes of the archbishop's public career, and that the same thirty-year gap separates the *Breviarium* and the *Dialogus* from the *De rebus Hispanie*. It is unfortunate that Pick was unable to benefit from the volume on the historical and historiographical aspects of her subject during those years published in *Cahiers de linguistique et de civilisation hispaniques médiévales* xxvi (2003), and in particular from the evidence presented there to the effect that by the 1240s, when he came to write his History, the archbishop may have been politically marginalised. And it is surprising to find no mention of G. Martin's analysis of his ideological orientation (*Les Juges de Castille*, 1992) or of the near contemporary but very different anti-Jewish polemic of Martino de León. Finally, in view of the care with which her argument is constructed, it is maddening for the reader constantly to be referred, presumably by some deranged giver of universal commands temporarily in control of the levers, to 'the preceding' without any explanation of whether it is to the preceding pages, section or chapter that he is being directed.

ST JOHN'S COLLEGE,  
CAMBRIDGE

PETER LINEHAN

*Medieval religious women in the Low Countries. The modern devotion, the canonesses of Windesheim and their writings.* By Wybren Scheepsma. (Trans. by David F. Johnson of *Deemoeden devotie: de koorvrouwen van Windesheim en hun geschriften*, Amsterdam: Prometheus, 1997.) Pp. xii + 280. Woodbridge: Boydell, 2004. £55. 1 84383 048 5  
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905425324

This work is a most welcome addition to the extensive scholarship already available on the *devotio moderna*. Scholars have hitherto tended to concentrate on the men of the order, even though the establishment of a religious house for women in 1374 was one of the founder Geert Grote's first acts after his conversion. It is therefore especially valuable to have the women of the order the focus of attention. The texts produced by these women have also largely been ignored. Scheepsma suggests that the establishment has ignored the work of these women for two related reasons: (1) the texts were written by women; (2) the women wrote religious prose, a *genre* the establishment has always thought to be second-rate. Scheepsma discusses a number of texts and the contexts in which they were written. The *devotio moderna* was not in

favour of spirituality or mysticism, especially as practised by women, and this is clear from the contents of the women's libraries as well as from their texts. The mystical works of Sister Bertken are not included in this book as they were written after she had left the Windesheim convent of Jerusalem to become an anchoress. The book does, however, include a discussion of Alijt Bake, another of the Modern Devout known for her mystic experiences. The theoretical framework of Scheepsma's book is historical-functional. The first chapters discuss the historical reality of life in the convent, the pattern of religious ritual and the way the spiritual life of the individual was ordered. The rest of the book is devoted to a discussion of the texts and their authors. The final chapters discuss the place literature held in the lives of the Windesheim nuns and the place of these authors in the larger context of medieval women's movements. Throughout the book, meticulous footnotes direct the interested reader to sources of additional information. This book is not only itself a contribution to our knowledge of these women, but is valuable as a research tool providing leads into new avenues of enquiry.

ROBINSON COLLEGE,  
CAMBRIDGE

SASKIA MURK-JANSEN

*Landgemeinde und Kirche im Zeitalter der Konfessionen.* Edited by Beat Kümin. Pp. 205 incl. 1 map, 5 ills and 2 graphs. Zürich: Chronos, 2004. €24.80 (paper).  
3 0340 0677 2  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905435320

A foreword by Peter Blickle sets the tone for this collection: the significance of rural communities in the religious history of late medieval and Reformation Europe. Blickle's own work on rural estates (*Landschaften*) in Swabia and on the communal reformation in south Germany and Switzerland opened up an agenda of research that has inspired younger scholars following in his footsteps. Over the last twenty years, studies on rural chapel endowments, peasant reformation, the history of the rural parish and other themes offer an alternate perspective to a vision of reformations and discipline imposed by the state. As the editor puts it 'universal explanative concepts such as the paradigm of confessionalization have lost persuasive power ... it is no longer a question of a pure implementation of the Reformation, but the negotiation between central and local instances'. The six essays in this collection set out to explore precisely the significance of the parish and rural community for the ecclesiastical and religious history of Europe between 1400 and 1600.

Geographically, Germanophone Switzerland still forms the heartland of this vision of rural reformation: three of the six essays study the Grison, Bern and Luzern. The other essays, on Germany, England and Russia, add a comparative perspective to the analysis of rural communities. Four of the essays take an institutional and social approach, working from the ground up as it were, while two essays tackle cultural aspects of the problem.

The most successful attempts are the two contributions by Randolph Head and Beat Kümin. The longest essay in the volume, Head draws upon his previous work on the Grison to argue for the enduring strength of the rural commune in the increasingly polarised confessional landscape of the sixteenth and seventeenth

centuries. A strong tradition of communal autonomy ensured lay control of clerical appointment and church properties in the late medieval period, one that extended to the determination of doctrine when the communes chose to side with the new Reformed Church or to stay with the traditional Roman Church. In spite of the stronger intervention of supralocal institutions in the seventeenth century, communalism remained a strong force in the political and religious life of the Grison. Adhering in general to Blickle's thesis of a strong communalism in early modern Europe, Head none the less rejects the proposal that communalism necessarily predisposed rural communities to choose the side of reformed Christianity. In the case of Switzerland, it seemed, the sociological prevailed over the ecclesiological.

Kümin's contribution is based on the analysis of churchwardens' accounts in the parishes of Boxford, Suffolk and Yatton, Somerset, between 1530 and 1560. Situating his local studies in the larger context of English Reformation historiography, Kümin shows how a detailed analysis of his sources reflects a rich and vibrant parish life on the eve of the Reformation, the shock of the iconoclastic reforms after 1547 and the long-term resilience of parish autonomy in the long run. Despite the absence of a communal reformation in England, the parish communities, by assuming an increasing responsibility for secular matters such as poor relief, retained a good measure of their autonomy and identity in the confusing religious changes brought about by the larger forces in state and society.

The interplay between parish and the state in the context of large religious changes is also the topic of Petr Stefanovitch's survey of Russian parishes in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries. The paucity of sources prevent as detailed an analysis as in the case of Tudor England, but the fragmentary sources do allow Stefanovitch to conclude that parish life and structure in Muscovite Russia shared broad similarities with those in western and central Europe.

The last study of local communities is the case study of the countryside around Erfurt in Thuringia. Ulman Weiss, author of a monograph on the Reformation in that episcopal city, lays out in great detail the constitutional development of local communities and their share in religious life. He concludes that both the urban and rural communities of Erfurt shared fundamental values of communalism that distinguished them from the rural communities in territorial states under autocratic princes.

The 'peasant dance', condemned in late medieval and Reformation sermons, is the subject of Walter Salmen's fine study of Bern. Drawing on the writings of reformers – here, Calvin and Zwingli strike a harsh posture compared to Luther – and consistorial and city council ordinances, Salmen demonstrates the ineffectiveness of prohibitions. Although the authorities banned the dance from peasant weddings, the strength of communal traditions was reflected in massive illicit dances organised by the peasants in meadows and on mountain tops. The eventual triumph of carnival over Lent symbolises the successful resistance of rural communes to the moral and social discipline imposed by the state.

Peter Hersche's essay on baroque churches in Bern and Luzern argues for distinct Catholic and Protestant styles of cultural consumption. Linking his examples in material culture to proto-industrialisation and the Weber thesis, Hersche has written an interesting essay, even though it fails to address the central theme of the volume.

Even though all the essays in this slim volume do not address the same focus, they offer interesting case studies that may point to new ways of thinking about the impact of the Reformation on the rural society of early modern Europe.

PENNSYLVANIA STATE UNIVERSITY

R. PO-CHIA HSIA

*Macht und Herrschaft im Johanniterorden des 15. Jahrhunderts. Verfassung und Verwaltung der Johanniter auf Rhodos (1421–1522).* By Jürgen Sarnowsky. (Vita Regularis. Ordnungen und Deutungen religiösen Lebens im Mittelalter, 14.) Pp. x + 750. Münster–Hamburg–London: LIT, 2001. DM 99.80 (cloth). 3 8258 5481 7  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905445327

This is an important scholarly book but with a narrow focus, namely the administrative and financial structures of the Order of the Knights of St John (the Hospitallers) in the last century of its presence on the island of Rhodes, before its capture by the Ottomans in 1522. It is meticulously based on the surviving archives of the order, mainly at the National Library of Malta at Valletta, but with further documents drawn from the Vatican Archives and Vatican Library, the Bibliothèque Nationale, Paris, and the British Library, to indicate but a part of the prodigious research involved. A book that emphasises the international scope of the order calls for wide linguistic and other skills, which the author displays, while at the same time generously acknowledging the pioneering work of others. For example, in a masterly chapter on the records of the order and its historiography he pays tribute to the work of Anthony Luttrell. The book contains an appendix of transcribed documents, elaborate lists of the order's officials, an excellent bibliography and an English *précis* of its contents. A number of major points are made amidst a dense account of the various statutes of the order, the meetings of its chapters-general and its financial transactions. The repeated Ottoman attacks on Rhodes in the century before its capture, together with the order's wider involvement in withstanding the Mamelukes of Egypt, as well as participating in various papal crusading schemes of the period, put unprecedented strain on the order's administrative structures and revenues. The grand masters sought to mobilise the help of all the various scattered *langues* (or groupings of brethren from the various areas of Europe) of the order. At least twenty-two chapters were held between 1421 and 1522, most of them at Rhodes, apart from two in Rome in 1446 and 1466. They all proved troubled occasions, with increasing pressure on the houses of the west to make additional payments for the defence of Rhodes. Inevitably the delays in payments meant increasing reliance on loans and other desperate improvisations by way of repaying the debts. Some of these transactions (for example, did the profits of piracy by the order have any role in maintaining solvency?) remain obscure. An elaborate hierarchy of officials, headed by the grand receptor, developed to collect, disburse and audit these accounts. A receiver-general in Avignon organised the transfer of the money to the east and paid out sums to merchants and other creditors of the order. But at various times the grand master took over the direct control of the treasury, a situation that seems to have been regularised from the period of Pierre d'Aubusson's rule from 1478 to his death in 1503. The details of all these administrative and financial arrangements are traced in detail

in this book, which does not make for easy reading, but will form a solid basis for a future historian to write the fuller narrative story.

CHEWTON MENDIP,  
SOMERSET

A. V. ANTONOVICS

*Die römische Kurie und die europäischen Länder am Vorabend der Reformation.* By Götz-Rüdiger Tewes. (Bibliothek des Deutschen Historischen Instituts in Rom, 95.) Pp. x + 470. Tübingen: Niemeyer, 2001. DM 136. 3 484 82095 0; 0070 4156 *JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905455323

The quantitative study of papal documents, as well as their listing, has been largely a German and Austrian enterprise, associated with their academic institutes in Rome, and pioneered above all by scholars of the medieval popes, such as Paul Kehr, Walther Holtzmann and Leo Santifaller. French scholars have made some notable contributions, especially with regard to the Avignon popes. A pioneer article such as R. Gaignard's 'Le Gouvernement pontifical au travail: l'exemple des dernières années du règne de Clément V: 1er août 1311–20 avril 1314', *Annales du Midi* lxxii (1960), 169–214, seeking to work out the geographical scope of papal intervention in Europe and to classify the nature of that activity, in some ways anticipates on a smaller scale the aims of the work under review: a truly monumental, technically difficult but important contribution to this genre of papal studies, the significance and originality of which is that it deals with the period from the later fifteenth century to the eve of the Reformation. By that period the volume of papal documentation (and its different forms) has vastly expanded even over the previous century and the author has sought to work out a complex methodology to overcome this difficulty and yet to produce some convincing arguments despite the selection involved. Inevitably this has involved some dipping (what the French happily call 'sondages') into the various categories of papal documents, at various chronological intervals. The validity of these procedures is bound to provoke some debate and the first part of the book, setting out this material in a number of elaborate graphs, is far from easy reading, but none the less suggestive and interesting. The first chapter looks at the chancery registers of Calixtus III (1455–8) and quantifies the number of bulls issued by country and ecclesiastical province. A further table breaks it down by country or equivalent region. Another graph (p. 28) registers the orders of difference. Further tabulations on pp. 361–93 expand on the same figures. Other tables (pp. 32–3) relate to the grants of benefices. Chapters ii and iii follow the same pattern covering later pontificates, those of Innocent VIII (1484–92) and Leo X (1513–21). From papal register material the study moves on to some of the financial records, especially the registers of annates and the annate entries in the *Introitus et Exitus* series. Once again the material is tabulated in some detail. Thereafter (from chapter vi), perhaps to the relief of some readers, the graphs cease and we get a series of micro-studies, for example of the activities of particular proctors and bankers, chiefly from the pontificate of Leo X. The careers of Domenico de Attavantis and Leonardo Bartolini, for example, are charted in detail, to establish what the author terms the emergence of a French–Florentine–Roman axis of benefice dealings, involving the major papal banks of the time, such as the Medici, and the Altoviti. These sections include a great deal of important archival material and comments on the procedures of papal provisions and annate payments: for example, on the neglected role of

cameral notaries. They also have observations on the work of other scholars of these topics, for example Melissa Bullard's essays on the *appaltus spiritualium* under Innocent VIII. One major conclusion to emerge is the centrality of France to papal activity and finance in the period covered by this book. The French crown, it seems, with exceptions such as the period of conflict between Louis XII and Julius II (discussed at pp. 284–9), was able to arrive at some working compromise on the disposal of French benefices and church revenue, due to patronage networks of one kind or another at the papal court. The German empire, by contrast, appears to have been more and more marginalised in terms of any benefits from papal action and this, it is at least hinted, may help to explain some features of German anti-papalism in the early sixteenth century. Lastly, not the least contribution of this study is to provide a rich bibliography on recent research on papal finance and administration.

CHEWTON MENDIP,  
SOMERSET

A. V. ANTONOVICS

*Gender, Kabbalah and the Reformation. The mystical theology of Guillaume Postel (1510–1581).*

By Yvonne Petry. (Studies in Medieval and Reformation Thought, 98.)

Pp. ix + 196. Leiden–Boston: Brill, 2004. €89. 90 04 13801 3; 0585 6914

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S002204690546532X

Guillaume Postel has generally been regarded as a marginal figure in sixteenth-century Europe. Though he possessed immense erudition, he was derided by his contemporaries, chiefly because of his consuming interest in the Kabbalah. This book seeks to understand this enigmatic individual by placing him within the context of the Renaissance and the Reformation. The first chapter is an introductory one which discusses the various approaches adopted by scholars to Postel's message and his mystical teachings. The formation of his theology is the topic of the second chapter. Postel argued that Jews, Muslims and Christians were seeking the same person, Jesus. For if Christianity were correctly understood, it would appeal to everyone. Accordingly, he used his theology as a tool to reform the Roman Catholic Church and make it attractive to Protestants. After his expulsion from the Jesuit order, he began to study the Kabbalah in earnest. He studied the writings of the Jewish mystics in Cardinal Egidio's library in Rome and in that of Daniel Bomberg in Venice. It was in Venice that he met Joanna whose knowledge of the Kabbalah impressed him greatly. He regarded her as the New Eve, the female messiah, sent to earth to repair the damage done by the first. Though his heretical views were condemned unsparingly, he never broke away from the Church. The third chapter examines his political views, and in particular his contribution to the debate over the validity of female rulers – a topic of great interest in the sixteenth century. The contribution of prominent Christian Kabbalists is examined in chapter iv. It was this mystical tradition which was 'the single most important influence on Postel's use of gender symbolism'. He used it to support his notions of Mary and his understanding of her place in Christianity, as the following chapter demonstrates. In chapter vi, entitled 'Body, soul and the sacraments', Postel reveals his asceticism. Despite his reliance on the Kabbalah, his views on celibacy, self-control and virginity were far more Christian than Jewish. The final two chapters examine the relationship

between the literature of the *querelle des femmes* and the Reformation. Postel's views on women have more in common with medieval thought than with the Renaissance. He was a conservative participant in the debate. Yvonne Petry succeeds admirably in her declared aim of attempting 'to fill in some of the neglected areas of Postel scholarship'. Her monograph is a significant contribution to learning and a welcome addition to *Studies in Medieval and Reformation Thought*. It will be appreciated by historians and theologians alike.

UNIVERSITY OF WALES,  
BANGOR

GARETH LLOYD JONES

*Religione, cultura e politica nell'Europa dell'età moderna. Studi offerti a Mario Rosa dagli amici.*

Edited by Carlo Ossola, Marcello Verga and Maria Antonietta Visceglia.

(Accademia Toscana di Scienze e Lettere. La Colombaria. Studi, 212.)

Pp. vi + 714. Firenze: Olschki, 2003. €55 (paper). 88 222 5268 3

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905475326

Thirty-eight scholarly friends of Mario Rosa have combined to honour a genial and prolific historian whose bibliography occupies sixteen pages of this book. As certain essays remind us, his career began fifty years ago with a thesis on an eighteenth-century journalist and *savant*, Giovanni Lami, whose collaboration was much courted by nascent provincial academies aspiring to join the republic of letters. At about the same time Rosa joined the editorial team of the Italian dictionary of national biography, which had been germinating since 1926 and would begin to appear, after much acrimonious infighting, in 1960. This may not be the most tightly organised or sharply focused of celebratory volumes. But its range and variety testify to the scope of Rosa's interests, developed by teaching early modern history in several Italian universities, and draws attention to his sharp eye for a promising subject, for several articles develop themes which he opened up.

Clerics, nuns, scholars and controversialists, pious biographers of the Virgin Mary, accompanied by a few courtiers, judges and administrators and one or two enlightened absolutists, people these essays. Periods between the late fifteenth and the late eighteenth centuries receive the most intensive treatment, but one or two contributions cut deep into the nineteenth, discussing, for example, French debates on the iconography of the Sacred Heart, and the alliance formed between liberal-progressive Catholics in the United States (exponents of the 'Americanism' deeply distrusted by conservatives) and Italian conciliationists anxious to make Catholicism compatible with patriotism. Most essays relate to central and northern Italy, ranging from Rome to Piedmont, but making a few excursions to Naples, Palermo and even Apulia; Rome, Tuscany and the Papal States are favoured, but not unduly. Outside Italy the collection alights on Portugal, discussing the reactions of the higher and lower clergy to the Spanish occupation in the 1580s, and ventures across the Atlantic to Brazil in search of Jesuit missionaries. Outriders head north to revolutionary Paris, bent on examining the fate of relics, reliquaries and royal tombs and monuments, and to England, to consider the heterodox, post-Lockean opinions of William Coward on the mortality of the soul, which got his books on the subject burned at the hands of the common hangman in 1704.

The arrangement of the contributions into sections and categories is not altogether successful; chronological ordering would have given the book more coherence, though it is probably true that only editors, proof-readers and reviewers will attempt to read it continuously. Most readers, dipping here and there, will find juicy plums to extract from a rich pie, for most contributors deal precisely with well-defined subjects in the light of little-known material. A subject index – in accordance with convention there is only an index of proper names, which deals neither with places nor with concepts nor with institutions – would have helped readers to make connections which may easily be missed. A historian of charity and poor relief, for example, will descend eagerly on the account of a new beggars' hospital in eighteenth-century Lucca (perhaps hoping to test the fading Foucault myth of the great internment of the poor). But he or she may not notice the incidental allusions in other pieces to the almsgiving habits of a Pratese judge, or the description of the efforts of Roman cardinals, drawing up their wills or ridding themselves of superfluous wealth, to reconcile the claims of their families with their duty to the poor.

Certain important themes are well treated and save the collection from becoming too much of a miscellany. Several essays contribute to a more subtle and nuanced view of Catholic reform and its progress after 1600, for example by discussing the interplay between rigorous disciplinarians from outside the local community trying to impose order upon nunneries (including aristocratic ones) and cautious, conservative locals, fearful lest the demands of convent life become too rigorous for their daughters. It seems clear that if some dioceses, such as Pistoia, began to impose the Tridentine reforms only in the early seventeenth century, others, at first quicker off the mark, were beginning to lapse, and episcopal residence was no longer being strictly demanded. Interestingly explored are the delights and disappointments of pursuing careers as prelates, soldiers or corrupt and indiscreet officials at the Roman curia. This was a court, certainly, in being 'a company of men in the service of one or more lords with an ambition to advance themselves'; but it was, as wise commentators remarked, a court where you could enter as a servant and emerge as a prince, one in which there was no hereditary dynasty and special insurance was needed against the reshuffles and upheavals which would follow the death of every pope. Due credit goes to the 'età innocenziana' of the late seventeenth century, in which, under Jesuit exhortation, Popes Innocent XI and XII sought to enhance the moral authority of a papacy which could no longer rely on Spanish power and was now in open conflict with the king of France. Missionary campaigns and conversionist techniques – those applied to Brazilian Indians, to sinners in Rome, Naples and their rural hinterlands, to Jews in Rome, Mantua and Urbino – receive close attention in studies of the Jesuits, of the Pii Operai (noted for their nocturnal preaching and catchy songs) and of the opinions of Prospero Lambertini, the future Pope Benedict XIV.

Especially compelling are some of the studies of 'enlightened piety' in the eighteenth century – of criticisms levelled and action taken against such excesses as indiscriminate almsgiving, impulsive engagements destined to lead to unstable marriages, materialistic and unduly physical devotional practices, and the luxuriant growth of confraternities at the expense of parochial authority. Some of these targets found vigorous defenders. The efforts of the Grand Duke Pietro Leopoldo to reduce the Florentine confraternities and deprive them of

most of the things that made them attractive resulted in ingenious attempts to evade the law. Carlo Denina's polemics in Piedmont against idle monks and cloister misfits, his pleas for an 'ergonomic' society in which clerics and nobles must manifestly contribute to the public weal, shared the fate of William Coward's heretical pieces: defenders of orthodoxy condemned them to the flames.

UNIVERSITY OF MANCHESTER

BRIAN PULLAN

*Reformed theology and visual culture. The Protestant imagination from Calvin to Edwards.*

By William A. Dyrness. Pp. xv + 339 incl. 43 figs. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004. £55 (cloth), £19.99 (paper). 0 521 83323 X; 0 521 54073 9

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905485322

The assumption that Protestant ideology has served to stifle and impede the development of the artistic imagination continues to shape scholarly assessments of the cultural impact of the Reformation. In this wide-ranging and thoughtful work of historical theology, William Dyrness contests the claim that the Swiss reformed tradition was inimical to visual forms, arguing instead that the thinking of John Calvin, William Ames, John Cotton and Jonathan Edwards engendered a new aesthetic of simplicity, purity and interior truth – a new series of mental habits and cultural practices that left a powerful mark on English, Dutch and early American society in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries. Dyrness gives due and detailed attention to Calvinism's iconoclastic temperament: its deep-seated distrust of images as inducements to false belief and its perception that the human mind was a perpetual forge of idols. But he is equally concerned to emphasise the positive culture of the visual to which the advent of zealous Protestantism gave rise: a culture that denied men and women the right to picture the divine but which, by forcing faith inward, simultaneously and somewhat paradoxically stimulated the imagination. It encouraged it to imagine not what was absent, but what had never existed (p. 113). This was a religion that destroyed externally wrought images in order that the internal, typological image of God's creation in mankind and the natural world might be more fully visible. Building on a series of careful re-readings of key theological texts, Dyrness proceeds to apply this subtle and complex argument to the analysis of a wide variety of contemporary cultural forms – poetry, architecture, town-planning, funeral monuments, garden design, cheap print, landscape painting and portraiture. His book further refines and qualifies suggestions that the Reformation inaugurated a transition from a 'visual' to an 'aural spirituality', effecting a shift from a religious culture of the eye to one of the ear, though it does still posit a movement from an objective piety to a subjective one. But it does not always satisfactorily reconcile the multiple threads that comprise it, or the ideas that it derives from the eclectic body of secondary literature on which, at times, it seems a little too reliant. Dyrness's recognition that medieval Catholicism nurtured its own concerns about the dangers of sight and fostered mystical impulses towards inner contemplation sits somewhat uneasily, for instance, alongside his continued insistence that the Reformation represented an aesthetic watershed. Some of the more sweeping and suggestive insights that emerge are unsubstantiated, including

the remark that Protestant meditation on nature as a mirror of God's glory was 'one of the stepping stones that led to the development of scientific method' (p. 309) and that the Calvinist longing for purity may have laid the foundations for modern abstract art (p. 308). Other questions remain unanswered: why did an England exposed to the same Calvinist ethos as the Dutch Republic fail to develop a comparably rich tradition of naturalistic painting? Finally it may be remarked that Dyrness seems less at ease in dealing with popular culture than he does with fine art and high theology. Nevertheless, his book remains a persuasive and stimulating reassessment of the relationship between Protestantism and the realm of the visual that will have significant implications for cultural historians and literary and art critics alike.

UNIVERSITY OF EXETER

ALEXANDRA WALSHAM

*Jesuit political thought. The Society of Jesus and the state, c. 1540–1630.* By Harro Höpfl. (Ideas in Context, 70.) Pp. xii + 413. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004. £55. 0 521 83779 0  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905495329

To write a history of Jesuit political thought for the years 1540 to 1630, when according to the author 'giants' (p. 376) flourished among Jesuit political thinkers, is an ambitious undertaking. The result is impressive though not without its flaws. After his introduction the author continues with chapters on the character and the organisational structure of the Society. Then, following a chapter on the Society's involvement in politics, five chapters treat facets of its political writers' attitude towards heresy and reason of state; particularly judicious is the chapter on *fides*, that is, deceit, deception and fidelity to one's word and agreements. The last five chapters, the strongest in my opinion, turn to more abstract issues, the theory of political authority and the nature of government and law, the relationship of the common good to individual rights, the volatile issue of tyrannicide along with the related Oath of Allegiance controversy, and the indirect power of the pope in temporal affairs. The author displays an admirable knowledge of a wide range of Jesuit and other political writers, both well-known like Francis Suarez and Robert Bellarmine and obscure, and he shows that positions often attributed to Jesuits, for example on tyrannicide, were frequently held by many other writers too. He neglects to discuss the efforts of Jesuit authors to develop a theory of international relations, in particular their views on the just war and the role of the Iberian monarchies as colonial powers across the seas. This surprises since Suarez is often considered to be a father of international law. To have developed this topic would also have given the author more opportunity to explain why the Jesuits often showed such rigour toward heretics and flexibility toward non-Christians. It would also perhaps have made a long and often turgid book too lengthy. Höpfl dismisses out of hand the charge that the Jesuits attempted to implement a wide-ranging political strategy and so much the more the idea that they developed their political thought to serve such a strategy. Jesuit writers, he concludes convincingly, did not present a single comprehensive political doctrine. But they did exhibit 'an overall homogeneity of thought' (p. 366), which emphasised above all the hierarchical relationship of command to obedience and of superiority to inferiority. This intellectual framework he traces back, less

convincingly, to the character and organisational structure of the Society itself where he underestimates the representative features of the regularly scheduled provincial and procurators' congregations and the irregular general congregations. Certainly Jesuit writers did represent the desire for order and system that characterised the late sixteenth and the seventeenth centuries and was found in Descartes and Hobbes as well as many others. The thematic development of the book means that we frequently do not see the authors discussed in a context which would help explain their thought; but this is a choice understandably made by Höpfl for the benefit of synthesis. A section with brief biographies of the many authors cited would have been helpful. One important area where the author loses sight of the forest for the trees appears in his treatment of reason of state. Machiavelli had written in *The Prince* (c. 15) that it was not possible to be successful in politics, that is, to create and maintain a powerful state, without abandoning at least at times moral principles in any traditional sense of the term. In their antiMachiavellian writings the Jesuits were determined to show that the sincere, consistently moral Christian could be successful in politics and, by extension, in the world; this was a salient feature of Jesuit spirituality and casuistry that the author misses. He also twice (pp. 60, 136) wrongly attributes to the Jesuit superior general, Muzio Vitelleschi, an extensive list of questions to be put to Emperor Ferdinand II by his Jesuit confessor. Many years ago Bernhard Duhr showed this document to have been an eighteenth-century Latin translation of a document drawn up by the French bishop Fénelon. Furthermore, such an action would not have accorded with Vitelleschi's general method of proceeding.

LOYOLA UNIVERSITY,  
CHICAGO

ROBERT BIRELEY

*The duke of Alba.* By Henry Kamen. Pp. x + 204 incl. genealogical table, 3 maps and 10 ills. New Haven–London: Yale University Press, 2004. \$30. 0 300 10283 6  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905505323

Critics of Henry Kamen have sometimes accused him of whitewashing the misdemeanours of the Spanish crown in the sixteenth century, yet Kamen's judgement on Fernando Álvarez de Toledo, third duke of Alba, is as harsh as that of the duke's contemporaries. Nevertheless Kamen wants 'to explain rather than simply to condemn' the behaviour of the duke. Alba had already served Charles V in many different capacities before he became the adviser of Philip II, and was eventually given the command in the Netherlands that was to wreck his reputation forever, but the two chapters in which Kamen covers this earlier part of Alba's career, spanning the first fifty years of his life, are descriptive and rather lacklustre. This study comes to life from chapter III, which discusses Alba's role in the factional struggle at the Spanish court, before it moves to its central topic, Alba's involvement in the Netherlands. Fundamentally, Kamen argues, Alba's instincts were those of the soldier. The best way of dealing with the rebels and iconoclasts in the Netherlands, especially in view of the dangerous precedents that the Huguenot nobles in France had set, was 'to cut off a few heads'. Yet Kamen's account seems undecided on what Alba thought he was trying to achieve in the Netherlands, and why. To some extent this may be because the duke himself had to make this up as he went along. His

initial brief had been to prepare the way for a visit by the king and to assist the regent, Margaret of Parma; soon he was put in sole charge of the Low Countries and involved in an ill-defined operation to punish the culprits of the 'troubles' that had in effect already ended when he arrived. Yet while Kamen suggests that Alba thought that he was there primarily to punish political disobedience, he does little to resolve or explain Alba's own conflicting statements about the relationship between religion and rebellion in the Netherlands. Had Kamen's command of the literature on the Dutch revolt been more extensive, he might have been able to resolve this by a further examination of Alba's policies. Kamen is more decisive in his emphasis on the importance of the situation in France for explaining the duke's decisions in the Netherlands. Both in 1568 and in 1571–2 it was at least as much with a view to the Huguenot position in France as in considering the Netherlands that the duke took his decisions. Had it not been for this second agenda, there would have been less pressure on him to extend his army, and raise the taxes to finance it, regardless of the resistance in the Low Countries. The renewed outbreak of revolt in 1572, to which he responded with great ruthlessness, could not ultimately be curbed by cutting off heads. It was his failure to prevent or quell this second revolt, that cost Alba his reputation in Castile, where, despite a successful spell as commander of the army that conquered Portugal, he never really recovered his earlier influence. This biography brings out some interesting features, like Alba's interest in humanism and his attachment to his (rather useless) sons, but all in all Maltby's biography of 1983 is likely to remain our first port of call.

SOMERVILLE COLLEGE,  
OXFORD

JUDITH POLLMANN

*John Foxe at home and abroad.* Edited by David Loades. Pp. xx + 297 incl. 1 map, 4 plates and 5 figs. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2004. £47.50. 0 7546 3239 3

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S002204690551532X

Over the past eight years, several volumes of essays generated by the conferences organised by the British Academy's *John Foxe Project* have contributed a great deal to our understanding of the aims and methods of the great martyrologist and his collaborators, and of the religious, political and cultural contexts in which he worked. The present volume represents the fruits of the fourth such conference, held in Foxe's home town of Boston, Lincolnshire, in 2001. Unfortunately, neither this gesture of familial piety, nor the dedication of the volume to the leading historian of Foxe's world, Patrick Collinson (who stepped down as chairman of the project in 2001), have succeeded in supplying much of a sense of focus or direction. The sixteen essays (plus an appendix on 'The internet connection') are a very mixed bag, though David Loades's introduction makes a valiant attempt at identifying commonalities and connections, in particular driving further nails into the coffin of William Haller's now widely discredited 'elect nation' thesis. Foxe was no theological Eurosceptic, rather an eschatological internationalist.

Several of the essays, however, have a firmly local, English focus. David Marcombe explores the varying fortunes over the sixteenth century of the hospital foundation at Spital-in-the-Street, Lincolnshire; Claire Cross examines the ministry of the irascible Melchior Smith in early Elizabethan Boston; Brett Usher illuminates the Edwardian

evangelical circle in Essex around the unlikely figure of Richard, Lord Rich; Magnus Williamson traces an intriguing set of connections between the musicians employed by Boston's Lady Guild and Henrician evangelical circles at Oxford and Windsor. All of these serve to showcase impeccable empirical research, though the connections with Foxe are tenuous at best, and important questions are sometimes side-stepped. (Just why was it, for example, that evangelicalism seems to have exercised a disproportionate appeal among those who drew their livelihood from the rich polyphonic tradition of late medieval sacred music?) Foxe is effectively absent too from Anne Overell's examination of the exile experiences of Edward Courtenay in Mary's reign, though her chapter paints a fascinating and moving picture of Nicodemite uncertainties at a time when confessional identities were hardening across Europe.

Other contributors do address Foxean themes directly, though often in a rather 'notes-and-queries' kind of way. Victor Houlston deduces from marginalia in the copy of the *Actes and monumentes* preserved at St Botolph's, Boston, that a seventeenth-century reader had been seriously stung by the criticisms levelled at the book by Robert Persons. Nicholas Heveley supplies a detailed dissection of how Dante's critique of preachers who 'fed their flock with wind' made its way into Foxe and other Protestant sources. Elizabeth Evenden highlights the contribution made by Dutch *émigrés* to the Aldersgate print shop of Foxe's printer, John Day, while Paul Arblaster and Guido Latré consider respectively the long-term influence of Foxe in the Low Countries (significant, but slow to get going) and the direct influence on Foxe of van Haemstede (for which the evidence is uncertain). Ramona Garcia's admittedly somewhat unnuanced discussion of Foxe's contribution to the tradition of anti-Catholic polemic prompts a rather bizarre appended editor's note: 'This pejorative use of language was not a one way traffic. Catholics developed a similar rhetoric for the denunciation of heretics.' We have been warned!

No such public information service is required for Francis Bremer's illuminating discussion of 'Foxe in the wilderness', an attempt to gauge the influence of the text in seventeenth-century New England. Bremer finds surprisingly few instances of either extensive citation or attested possession of copies, yet paradoxically he is able to conclude (p. 115) that the *Actes and monumentes* was 'so much a part of the culture that it did not have to be written about or discussed'. Another highlight – indeed, arguably the main attraction of the volume – is John Wade's admirable edition and translation of, and commentary upon, a hitherto largely inaccessible text, Foxe's *Germaniae ad Angliam de restituta euangelii luce gratulatio* ('Thanksgiving from Germany to England on the Restoration of the Light of the Gospel') of 1559. This shows Foxe to have shared the high expectations widespread among English Protestants consequent upon the accession of Elizabeth, but at the same time manifesting an insistence on the employment of wise (male) counsel, and employing classical sources to warn against the dangers of tyranny and demagogy. There are also several fascinating asides, such as 'Germany's' congratulation of Scotland for beginning to receive the Gospel light, 'which has finally reached the furthest bounds of the Ocean and the Orkneys themselves' (p. 215). Wade is inclined to regard such effusions as 'prophetic' or 'premature' in 1559, though it may in fact reflect just how firmly Foxe had his finger on the pulse of international affairs: was he aware of the 1558 death in Dieppe of Bishop Reid of Orkney, and the appointment of the reform-leaning Adam Bothwell to replace him?

The final section of the volume, ‘Message and methodology’, steers us away from such sixteenth-century particularities. Margaret Dean, incongruously but interestingly, applies the template of Foxean Protestant martyrology to the death of Uncle Tom in Harriet Beecher Stowe’s novel. Mark Greengrass, Joy Lloyd and Sue Smith provide an update on the progress and format of the electronic edition. Janice Devereux surveys appearances of the *Actes and monuments* on the internet without managing to tell us very much about its potency for modern religious discourse. Devorah Greenberg’s reading of “‘Foxe’ as a methodological response to epistemic challenges’ is a meditation on the implications ‘for our practices when we put our subjects in ironic quotation marks’ (p. 250) which did not leave this reviewer much enlightened. In the wake of recent legislation, would-be fox-hunters in England and Wales are reduced to riding aimlessly across the landscape; their scholarly homonyms must strive to avoid the same fate.

UNIVERSITY OF WARWICK

PETER MARSHALL

*Neither saints nor sinners. Writing the lives of women in Spanish America.* By Kathleen Ann Myers. Pp. xiii + 273 incl. 15 ills. New York–Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2003. £37.50. 0 19 515722 2  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S002204690525326

In the last decade historians and literary critics have striven to recover the texts – printed and archival – of sacred female biographies. The intention is to restore the historical memory of women and to demonstrate the vital role they played in the construction of a New World Christian identity. K. A. Myers gathers the lives of five women, some of whom fit the pattern of holy women within and outside the Church, and some of whom rejected it. All of them were well known in their own times. Some wrote their own autobiographies; others were written about. The variety of their experiences challenges any interpretive pattern and makes fascinating reading. Myers has adroitly synthesised the historical and literary role of each of the following: Rose of Lima, now a saint in the Catholic Church; Catarina de san Juan, an Oriental slave in seventeenth-century Mexico, and the object of much veneration although she remained a lay woman; Sor Maria de San José, an Augustinian nun from Puebla, Mexico, and author of several autobiographies; Sor Juana Inés de la Cruz, best known as the Tenth Muse and an outstanding woman of letters professed in a Hieronymite convent in Mexico City; Sor Ursula Suárez, a Chilean Franciscan nun who left a witty and amusing autobiography; and Catalina de Erauso, a Spanish woman who escaped conventual life in Spain and spent her life as a transvestite soldier in South America and as a muleteer in Mexico. This selection is a sampler of the choices open to women as well as the difference in the nature of their lives. Myers follows each of her subjects in lively prose interspersed with contemporaneous quotations. An appendix furnishes translations of several chosen documents related to each one of the women. For those interested in the academic underpinnings of this study there are copious notes and a good bibliography. This book should open a window to re-examine the female experience in the seventeenth and early eighteenth centuries, as well revive interest in such women in our own times.

ARIZONA STATE UNIVERSITY

ASUNCIÓN LAVRIN

*The march of the libertines. Spinozists and the Dutch Reformed Church (1660–1750)*. By Michiel Wielema. (ReLiC. Studies in Dutch Religious History, 2.) Pp. 221 incl. 10 ills. Hilversum: Verloren, 2004. €20 (paper). 90 6550 777 9  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905535322

In the last decennium a rich harvest of new studies has appeared on the early reception of Spinoza's heritage. In particular, Spinoza's immediate background and context has provided a fruitful soil for a great many new and interesting facts and highlights, which opened fresh perspectives on European ecclesiastical as well as philosophical history in the seventeenth and early eighteenth century. In his well-structured and readable book, Michiel Wielema investigates the tough struggle of Spinozist and other exponents of free thought for greater intellectual freedom within the Dutch Reformed Church. It provides a stunning example of the unwillingness of an ecclesiastical institution to understand the signs of the times, its arrogant refusal to change and its obstinate clinging to its own established position in Dutch society. As such it demonstrates the extraordinary courage needed when attempting to change orthodox religious views and their socio-political contexts. Many victims paid a high price. Extraordinary effort was needed to create a free and tolerant society; their activities appeal to our imagination, and contribute to our understanding, not only of that historical period, but also to our view of our contemporary world in chaos. Moderate liberal ministers who tried to offer a better understanding of Scripture, advocating the typical Protestant view that people may decide for themselves what they do not believe, were regarded as crypto-Spinozists or of unconsciously being Spinozists. This is one of the interesting aspects of this investigation: it shows that a liberal society searches constantly for an enemy since it is in extreme fear of fundamental change. Reading this study brings to light the striking disparity between the negative and defensive role of the Church and a society with a reputation for its liberal attitude towards religious pluralism and freedom. Spinozists – the radicals as well as the latitudinarians – failed to make their point and to bring change to the Church they loved so intensely. Apart from its historical relevance, this study is in my view also a fine tribute to contemporary debate on tolerance and freedom of speech, in that it implicitly discloses the necessary conditions for doing justice to different religious and intellectual worldviews in a liberal and democratic society.

UTRECHT/ODIJK,  
 THE NETHERLANDS

HEINE SIEBRAND

*Crown, Church, and episcopate under Louis XIV*. By Joseph Bergin. Pp. xii + 526 incl. 7 maps. New Haven–London: Yale University Press, 2004. £40. 0 300 10356 5  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905545329

This splendid – and beautifully produced and reasonably priced – study is a sequel to Joseph Bergin's *The making of the French episcopate, 1589–1661* (1996). It principally examines the men who became bishops during Louis XIV's personal rule, their qualities and experience, and the processes whereby they were elevated to the episcopate by the king. The book's title perhaps suggests a wider perspective than this; but, in fact, the investigation of these themes sheds an immense amount of light on the Church, and indeed on French society, generally between 1661 and 1715. *Crown, Church, and episcopate under Louis XIV* is split into two parts: an introduction,

nine thematic chapters and a conclusion (pp. 1–353); and a biographical dictionary of the bishops nominated by the Sun King (pp. 365–489).

This intricate book is grounded on a massive amount of research. Aside from work in the Archives Nationales, the Bibliothèque Nationale and other archives and libraries in Paris, Bergin has studied manuscript sources in a range of French departmental archives and provincial libraries, and, of course, in the Vatican Archives in Rome. But it is not only the marshalling of so many sources which is tremendously impressive. Throughout the book, Bergin alerts the reader to the deficiencies of, or *lacunae* in, the sources – one notable example is, naturally, the ‘quasi-confidentiality of the decision-making’ (p. 179) – but he also wrestles patiently with the evidence, such as it is in these cases, in order to produce convincing explanations for particular choices. Indeed, one of the incidental pleasures of the study comes from following so skilful a historian weighing and interpreting his sources. Another is provided by Bergin’s careful evaluation of the judgements of contemporaries – notably Saint-Simon and Mme de Sévigné – or modern historians on Louis’s ecclesiastical decisions.

Another problem arises from the book’s subject matter: in ecclesiastical affairs, the period of the personal rule was not a unity. As a result of the reign’s wars, the French Church gained new dioceses (though Tournai and Ypres were lost in 1713). Relations between the crown and Rome were variable, their nadir being the deadlock between Louis and Innocent XI over the *régale* and the pope’s refusal to confirm the king’s episcopal nominees. The problems produced by the Huguenot minority and Jansenism fluctuated; old patrons of aspiring clerics died, and were replaced by new ones. Most notable among the latter, in the later years of the reign, was, of course, Mme de Maintenon: in ecclesiastical matters, she once informed Louis-Antoine Noailles, ‘it is sometimes necessary to deceive the king in order to serve him’ (p. 271). One feature remained constant throughout, however: the unattractiveness of the diocese of Digne in episcopal eyes (Louis reportedly complained that, at one point, five of its ex-bishops were still alive). No wonder Victor Hugo later placed his saintly Monseigneur Bienvenu there.

Similarly constant was the king’s concern to make correct episcopal nominations. Patrons who could make or break ambitious clerics’ careers could be intimidating. François de Harlay, archbishop of Paris, once told Fénelon, ‘you want to be overlooked? Well, just wait and see, you will be overlooked’ (p. 263). But the most formidable figure in these matters was naturally Louis XIV himself. He once abruptly instructed the royal confessor La Chaize to ‘tell all those young *abbés* that they would do far better to go and reside in their benefices, conduct missions, and instruct the poor rather than to stay here [at court], and that I shall remember them all the better for not seeing them’. He added ominously, ‘I have a very good memory’ (p. 248). What overall, then, did Louis expect in a bishop?

Bergin’s researches produce an Identikit picture which answers this question. Louis XIV’s episcopate contained scarcely any foreigners. Bishops overwhelmingly came from families who, in some capacity, served the monarchy and 78 per cent were from noble families. They were increasingly theology graduates – theologians displaced lawyers. The book’s cover shows a somewhat self-satisfied Vintimille du Luc, holding his bonnet as a doctor of the Paris theology faculty: the bishops aimed to be champions of the faith, besides pastoral overseers, under Louis XIV. As his forceful instruction to La Chaize illustrates, the king favoured men with experience and pastoral commitment – diocesan administrators, grand vicars, preachers, for a

time men who undertook missionary work in areas of Huguenot strength – and, consequently, the average age at which bishops were nominated rose. Bergin describes the intricate patronage and kinship networks so important for the securing of a mitre. Louis chose archbishops from able bishops, but disliked sideways translations from ‘undesirable’ dioceses to wealthier or more prestigious sees. Gradually, as a result of all this, a marked episcopal character evolved. More was expected of bishops than hitherto; Bergin’s myriad of examples shows that they were very busy men. Collectively, it was a ‘theologically literate and experienced episcopate which came to the fore in the second part of Louis XIV’s personal rule’ (pp. 352–3).

Sir Lewis Namier, perhaps Bergin’s most illustrious predecessor at the University of Manchester, prefaced *The structure of politics at the accession of George III* with lines from Aeschylus:

I took pains to determine the flight of crook-taloned birds, marking which were of the right by nature, and which of the left, and what were their ways of living, each after his kind, and the enmities and affections that were between them, and how they consorted together.

These words would not have been inappropriate at the start of Joseph Bergin’s study of Louis XIV’s episcopate.

UNIVERSITY COLLEGE,  
WINCHESTER

COLIN HAYDON

*Science and dissent in England, 1688–1945.* By Paul Wood. (Science, Technology and Culture, 1700–1945.) Pp. xiii + 274 incl. 4 ills. Aldershot: Ashgate, £47.50.  
0 7546 3718 2

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S002204690555325

This is a superb collection of essays which will surely reward repeated reading. Its excellence resides not simply in the fact that each of the essays is packed with information and judicious historical and historiographical guidance, but also in the fact that collectively they inspire serious contemplation on the relationship between those two most noble cognitive systems, science and religion. After a useful introduction by the editor, providing an overview of the historical theme and a summary of the chapters, the ten articles fall neatly into two broad types. Five articles take a sweeping view, studying the theme as an important aspect of the social history of modern England. Broadest of all are John Hedley Brooke’s survey of the previous historiography of science and dissent, and John Money’s study of the situation in provincial culture from what he calls the ‘Newtonian transformation’ at the beginning of the eighteenth century to the ‘agnostic incarnation’ of the late nineteenth. Larry Stewart’s article includes much useful information about the provinces too, although it professes to be concerned with public lecturing on experimental philosophy in eighteenth-century London. Narrowing the focus even further, Geoffrey Cantor’s study of Quaker schools as ‘Nurseries’ of science includes a detailed example, Bootham School in York. Trevor Levere draws his conclusions on the relationship between religious dissent and experimental science (especially on the chemistry of gases) from a study of the activities of the Coffee House Philosophical Society, which met in various coffee houses in London from 1780 to 1787. Although the remaining five chapters are also fully contextualised in the

religious and scientific milieus of their respective periods, each is chiefly concerned with a single dissenting thinker. Stephen Snobelen demonstrates beyond dispute the unity of Newton's scientific and religious thinking, while Alan H. Batten makes a powerful case for a similar unity of thought in the work of the Quaker astronomer and cosmologist, Arthur Stanley Eddington (1882–1944). Bernard Lightman luminously revisits the suggestion that Thomas Henry Huxley's agnosticism owes much to the traditions of dissent, while Richard Helmstadter and Hannah Gay focus respectively on the congregationalist geologist, John Pye Smith (1774–1851), and the Quaker experimental physicist, Silvanus Phillips Thompson (1851–1916). The standard of these papers is uniformly very high and strike this reader as important contributions to our understanding of the relations between science and religion not just collectively (which is undeniable) but also individually. It is a pity that the editor, Paul Wood, did not allow himself to make his own contribution to the theme, but he is to be congratulated for bringing together such distinguished contributors.

UNIVERSITY OF EDINBURGH

JOHN HENRY

*Russia's lost reformation. Peasants, millennialism, and radical sects in southern Russia and Ukraine, 1830–1917.* By Sergei I. Zhuk. Pp. xx + 357 incl. map and 29 figs. Washington, DC: Woodrow Wilson Center Press/Baltimore–London: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 2004. £43. 0 8018 7915 9  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905565321

Sergei Zhuk is a Ukrainian scholar now living in the USA. Originally in Ukraine a specialist in American religious history, he has in this study turned his attention to part of the religious history of his native Ukraine. Zhuk is able to draw interesting comparisons between the development of religion in frontier situations in the USA and in the territories of Ukraine and southern Russia colonised in the nineteenth century by Cossacks, peasants from central Russia and settlers from Germany. He describes the interaction between these various 'charter groups', each of which brought their own traditions to a region that had not yet developed any tradition of its own. It was an ideal situation for new religious movements to emerge. Zhuk firstly describes the Russian dissident sects found among the peasants who settled in southern Russia – what we now know as Ukraine, Moldova and the north Caucasus. The story of sects such as the Molokans, Khlysty and Skoptsy (Milk drinkers, Flagellants and Castrati) is well known, but Zhuk demonstrates convincingly that while these sects maintained links with their coreligionists in the Russian provinces to the north of Ukraine, they also interacted with one another and a new movement emerged as a synthesis of the older sects. Adherents of this new movement were nicknamed 'Shalaputs' meaning those who took a sinful path. These religious dissenters practised charismatic forms of worship in their private meetings, but often appeared to be the most fervent parishioners in the Orthodox Church. A very different movement that emerged a little later in Ukraine was evangelical in character. The 'Stundists' received their name from the German Pietist colonists' *Bibelstunde* (Bible hour), where many of the movement's pioneers first met evangelical Christianity. Zhuk presents evidence that these two movements had unexpected links and influenced each other over the course of the second half of the century. In particular the Stundists developed a charismatic wing that drew on the

Shalapat tradition. Zhuk goes on to describe how the sects increasingly found themselves in opposition to the Orthodox Church and to the tsarist regime, both of which persecuted them, and in some places took on a revolutionary character. In these ways they followed the pattern of the Reformation in western Europe. Zhuk argues that religious developments in Ukraine were a genuine Reformation, which has largely been ignored by historians who have emphasised the mystical side of the traditional Russian sects and the German roots of the evangelicals. Zhuk paints a picture of religious and social ferment made possible by the frontier situation and the interaction of the various dissident movements. His book is extensively footnoted to contemporary published sources, both hostile and sympathetic to the dissidents, and to Russian and Ukrainian archive materials. It is a very valuable contribution to Russian and especially Ukrainian religious history.

ORPINGTON

MICHAEL ROWE

*Tractarians and the Condition of England. The social and political thought of the Oxford Movement.* By S. A. Skinner. (Oxford Historical Monographs.) Pp. x + 330.

Oxford: Clarendon, 2004. £55. 0 19 927323 5

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905575328

Simon Skinner's thesis is a simple one. It 'challenges the conventional construction of Tractarianism as an episode in church history and the attendant historiographical commonplace that tractarians had little interest in social questions' (p. 1). In fact there is perhaps less originality in the argument than the author claims though he puts forward his case in a way that has not been done before, and he does so by returning to some of the evidence used by earlier historians of the Oxford Movement, such as the pages of the *British Critic* and the novels of William Gresley and F. E. Paget, generally disregarded by most recent scholars, but interpreting them in a more interesting way than people like Ollard ever did. It is true, as Skinner suggests in the literature review of his opening chapter, that the social and political implications of Tractarian theology have not been a major interest for those writing about the Oxford Movement over much of the last century, but he tends to push the criticism somewhat too far by selective, and sometimes misleading, quotation. His findings, that Tractarians espoused generally conservative and paternalistic opinions, though with a genuine concern for the evils of the day, or that they tended to feel that these could best be rectified by returning to a more theocratic form of government, will not come as much of a surprise. He does, however, have some interesting things to say about the political and social dimension of the Tractarian concept of the parish as 'the locus of clerical government ... whose functional autonomy was an antidote to the growth and pluralization of the state' (p. 139), and the implications this has for such Tractarian innovations as daily services and auricular confession which put them in a new light. On the whole his case is clearly presented and well documented. However, his discussion of the Tractarian role in the abolition of box pews and seat rents, and their support for free and open seating (pp. 167–82), overlooks the fact that this was not really a Tractarian innovation at all, but that the Tractarians had simply adopted policies that had been pioneered two decades earlier by bodies such as the Incorporated Church Building Society, which Skinner does not even mention. By relying almost exclusively on

contemporary literature as his source, Skinner says very little about Tractarianism in action on the ground, and one is left wondering whether Tractarian thought was backed up by much in the way of practical application. Nevertheless, despite some questionable debating points and a tendency to claim slightly more than he actually delivers, this is an important research monograph which certainly deserves a place in every theological library and on the personal bookshelves of all those with an interest in nineteenth-century ecclesiastical history.

UNIVERSITY OF WALES,  
LAMPETER

NIGEL YATES

*Christianity in modern China. The making of the first native Protestant Church.* By David Cheung (Chen Yiqiang). (Studies in Christian Mission, 28.) Pp. xv + 414. Leiden–Boston: Brill, 2004. €99. 90 04 13143 4; 0924 9389  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905585324

David Cheung's lengthy and detailed study examines Protestant missions in South Fujian (Banlam), from the date of the arrival of Protestantism in the region in 1842 to the indigenisation of Chinese Churches in 1863. It is based on a deep analysis of primary sources, especially previously untapped church records, as well as a broad survey of literature in the different fields of history of Christianity, history of Christian missions in China and history of modern China, as is shown by its long bibliography. Using a wide range of archival material it demonstrates the most advanced achievement of Protestant missions at the time – the evolution of those churches that pioneered indigenisation and ecclesiastical union in China during the nineteenth century.

This book is a welcome contribution to the discourse on many details of a story hitherto largely untold. It provides an in-depth analysis of the first example of the indigenisation of Protestantism in China, as well as a larger picture of Chinese mission and church history. In China, South Fujian region owned the first Protestant church building, the first organic union of churches and the first presbytery. The Chinese Church in the region was also the first in China to gain autonomy 'for a fairly large group of Christians' (p. 1). The author's objective in tracing the evolution of the Churches is clearly outlined in the introduction: 'to look into the historical causes and circumstances which allowed certain Protestant churches in Banlam to undertake the first "successful" indigenization–union experiment in nineteenth century China' (p. 2).

The author pays particular attention to the ecclesiastical devolution of foreign missions to indigenous churches in the context of the complex ecclesiastical and political circumstances of mid nineteenth-century China, rather than to the cultural or theological recasting of the Christian message in Chinese terms or forms. Throughout the book the indigenisation of Protestantism in South Fujian is seen as an integrated experience of pursuing and realising a vision of Chinese mission by both missionaries and Chinese Christians. Making much use of missionaries' correspondence and displaying a detailed knowledge of South Fujian's social and cultural scene in the mid-nineteenth century, Cheung succeeds in showing how the 'Talmage ideal' of a native, self-governing, self-supporting and self-propagating Church guided Protestant missionary operations in South Fujian from the very beginning of their work and

eventually led to the realisation of indigenising Christianity in South Fujian; how the inner life of Chinese Churches provided a favourable environment for the transference of missionaries' power to Chinese Christians; and what role the Chinese Christians played in facilitating the process of the indigenisation. As one of the earliest Protestant missionaries to South Fujian, John Talmage had a clear vision of Protestant mission to China: the long-term task of evangelisation and church work was to be done by the Chinese Church. In other words, the essential features of the Three-self ideal were already contained in the Talmage ideal as early as 1848 even though his actual terminology was somewhat different. Cheung presents very detailed evidence to show that from the start the missionaries shared the Talmage ideal which became standard missionary doctrine and the guiding principle of missionary operations. Inspired by that ideal, the missionaries' aim was to establish a Chinese Church characterised by self-government, self-support and self-propagation; indigenisation was the theoretical motivation behind the evangelisation programme in South Fujian. The indigenisation of the Churches in South Fujian, Cheung further argues, was not the negative result of aspects of missionary operations such as language barriers, lack of missionary workforce, or the hostile response to the missions from natives; rather, it can only be explained by positing some form of significant motivation on the part of the missionaries, specific methodological features, the nature and dynamics of 'native' religious work and the general social environment in the region. The strongest parts of this study are its detailed discussions of why devolution happened in South Fujian and what exactly happened in the Chinese Churches. Talmage's vision for the mission laid the foundation for missionary operations in the region. The general friendliness of South Fujian toward foreigners significantly affected the strategy of missionary work, which helped to ensure the pursuit and realisation of the Talmage ideal. Other political and ecclesiastical conditions peculiar to South Fujian helped pave the way for missionary co-operation, which facilitated the expansion of Protestant enterprise in the region. One particularly fascinating discussion is on Chinese participation in missionary work in South Fujian. It focuses on how this less powerful element in the missionary workforce, the one traditionally ignored in the study of missionary history, boosted missionary confidence in the 'natives' and brought about a shift in missionary thinking. Cheung argues that the quality of the Chinese converts, and their impressive religious labour, won the high regard of the missionaries, who came to believe, after only a short period of hesitation, that church leadership could be transferred to Chinese Christians.

The conclusion to this book emphasises that devolution in South Fujian involved a real transfer of power, which, although it was purely ecclesiastical and political in nature, was more progressive than experienced by any other Chinese mission in the mid-nineteenth century. Although the analysis could at times be more penetrating, Cheung has clearly laid out the contours of a historical development that is characterised by quite unique factors that still await a final settlement.

The interdisciplinary nature of this book will undoubtedly make it of interest to sociologists, social and church historians, missiologists and political scientists. The use of models and illustrations are major assets which serve to reinforce arguments and clarify themes.

*Citizenship, community, and the Church of England. Liberal Anglican theories of the state between the wars.* By Matthew Grimley. (Oxford Historical Monographs.) Pp. ix + 257. Oxford: Clarendon, 2004. £50. 0 19 927089 9  
*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905595320

This is an astute and incisive thesis which has become a valuable monograph. Matthew Grimley sets himself the task of drawing together many of the philosophical strands in the intellectual life that ran through the broad world of the Church of England in the first half of the twentieth century. Then he sees what they came to across thirty-odd years of often difficult and unpredictable public life. This religious dimension of British public life has been, as he so rightly says, poorly dealt with by political historians. This book gives them still more reason to mend their ways. The term 'liberal Anglican' obviously begs a question, and here it is well answered at the outset. This is the world of the moderates. The intellectual contributions which emerge clearly are often Oxford names (and it is a book which wears an Oxford gown openly and happily enough). The structure is clearly framed, mixing philosophical labels that are perhaps less familiar with the more obviously recognisable contours of the public life of the Church in the interwar period. So: an introductory chapter on Church and nation after 1918; a general exploration of liberal Anglican theories of the state; 'Group versus community: the pluralists'; 'Class versus community: the General Strike'; 'Church versus State: the Prayer Book crisis'; 'Church, king and country: the 1930s'; 'The Second World War and after'; a final conclusion bearing the title 'Cultural defence and civil religion'. The first four parts are superbly done: the argument is focused and hard-edged, the material mined fully and offered tellingly. Theories of the individual, the group, the community, the nation and the state chase each other around earnestly, weighing the rights of one against those of another in a steadfast search for justice and harmony. There are backward glances to Coleridge and Arnold and the Christian Socialists of the later nineteenth century, but the foreground is soon claimed by the Oxford Idealists of the early twentieth century (reports of whose demise Grimley finds greatly exaggerated). What is said of Green, Caird and Bousanquet is sure-footed and sensitive. Then on comes a philosophical reaction, at least in varying degrees, in the shape of A. D. Lindsay, Ernest Barker, Tawney and Hastings Rashdall. Temple is, of course, a great and uniting presence: an Oxford philosopher and a bishop and archbishop in turn. Thereafter it is the turn of a raft of 'pluralists' like J. N. Figgis and, strikingly, Harold Laski, whose thought referred to Anglicanism a good deal. What follows pushes far further into the province of public life and it shows the awkwardness of exposing the theoretical to the hurly-burly of active social politics. The chapters on the General Strike and the 1927 Prayer Book crisis are surely the most thoughtful and impressive treatment of the place of the Churches in these matters that we now have. On the allure of Baldwin Grimley is particularly effective. At the same time, there are a few appearances by the not-so-liberal: Grimley makes much of Bishop Henson (it is hard not to – he wrote so much, after all, and did it so well) and Dean Inge, though he identifies them both as men on the fringe. When it comes to the 1930s the themes and material are more dispersed. 'The Second World War and after' moves very quickly indeed from the post-war consensus (there is little indeed on the Cold War and the response to Communism) and towards the new 'communitarianism' of the Blair governments. This is (in the best sense) provocatively done, but perhaps this chapter would feel less of a sketch if

the preceding chapters had not been so very successful? The cumulative argument of the book is assembled sharply in conclusion. All of these figures in their way maintained a civil religion which might encompass and express the mind of a Christian nation. When, after 1945, it was no longer possible to think that this would do, the logic of the enterprise faded very quickly. We almost end up with the ideas of Figgis, who was never very comfortable in any landscape, hopelessly and cruelly stranded in this new world and looking very out of place indeed. It is an important exercise to trace a line through this lively world of liberal endeavour, and Grimley does so elegantly. How widely felt was much of this thought in the ongoing life of the Church? Although he properly takes the present reviewer to task for over-egging a particular pudding (that church leaders in the international crisis of 1938 more or less made their views up as they went along) it is difficult to sense that the material which is invoked against this suspicion quite bears the weight of a complete contradiction. A book which commits itself to the intellectual face of a tradition will necessarily emphasise the place of its most literary, expressive voices. What of the rest? A figure left rather stranded by this approach need not be secondary or remote. Archbishop Lang, for example, seldom appears here. This matters, not merely when one is trying to place these different figures beside each other, but when one seeks to measure the influence of a highly articulate intellectual tradition in the ongoing life of a wider public culture. Clarendon have published the book nicely, but the price of £50 (for 244 pages) begs a question of its own. For whom are we now writing? Will any dedicated private reader pay so much – even for a fine study by a historian as impressive as Matthew Grimley?

GEORGE BELL INSTITUTE,  
BIRMINGHAM

ANDREW CHANDLER

*Der Heilige Stuhl und Hitler-Deutschland. Die Faszination des Totalitären.* By Gerhard Besier (with Francesca Piombo). Pp. 415. Munich: Deutsche Verlags-Anstalt, 2004. €24.90. 3 421 05814 8

*JEH* (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905605325

Gerhard Besier, world-renowned for getting to the documents of contemporary history first, and much reviled in the German Protestant Churches for not sparing their leadership defects in either the Third Reich or the DDR, has now turned, with all the resources of the Hannah-Arendt-Institut at Dresden behind him, to the Holy See. How does the new work measure up to his blockbusters of recent years? His promise is for a few surprises rather than any shocks, and this notwithstanding his acknowledgement of generous access to the Vatican secret archives and the Faulhaber archive in Germany. But his ability to say new things is limited on the one hand by the huge amount which has appeared in print already from both Catholic and non-Catholic sources, and, on the other by the dilatoriness of the Vatican in making available the correspondence of the Nunciatures outside Germany. This is clearly a loss to the author, for one of the great merits of the book is his international viewpoint, the way he shows that Rome's relations with Germany were affected by its knowledge that from an early date both the German and the Russian governments were determined to butcher the new Poland at the first opportunity, by the Spanish civil war, by the campaign in Abyssinia, by anticlericalism in Mexico.

This constant stress on the fact that the Vatican always had many irons in the fire amounts for much of the book almost to an *apologia* for papal policy; yet in the end an incisive judgement is pronounced. The book is mainly about Pacelli and his diplomacy as nuncio, secretary of state and pope up to 1939; and it is difficult to represent this story as anything but a failure. Pacelli was bred to the great labour of canon law reform, and his reputation as a diplomat was based on his effort to put the interests of the Church on a legal basis in a long series of concordats with European governments. This frame of mind was almost useless when it came to dealing with governments which made a virtue of having no respect for law or contract, and was worse than useless when the Vatican was under great temptation to trust such governments beyond any prudential limit by its own delusion that such trust could lead to an effective alliance between the Church and powers willing to sustain a conservative social order. Well aware of the dangers of revolution from the Left, the Vatican was purblind to the horrors of conservative revolution. It represented not so much establishment in blinkers as establishment blindfold. Since it believed that liberal constitutional government was government without principles, and believed until too late that the principles of totalitarian governments of the right were more malleable than they ever were, the Vatican had left itself nowhere to go. Besier forbears to sum up as bluntly as this, but this is the conclusion to which his narrative leads; and it will not be easy to shake.

PETERSFIELD

W. R. WARD