# Supplementary materials

**Table 1S: Step-by-step progression of WK network for temporal analysis of paradigm identification, quantification, and change evaluation**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Network** | **Description** | **Purpose** |
| $$WK$$ | Original writings-to-words 2-mode network, produced by WoS2Pajek, where one mode are writings (W), and the other mode are words (K): keywords (ID and DE fields) and words of writings’ titles (TI field). |  |
| $$WKr$$ | Writings-to-words 2-mode network, obtained by reducing WK. We removed multiple lines and cited-only writings.  | Cited-only writings have no information about keywords and titles. With multiple lines removal, we deleted similar (same title, keywords, and publication year) publications by the same authors. |
| $$WKry$$ | Writings-to-words 2-mode network, obtained by reducing WKr. We removed writings without publication year, and writings published in 2019. | To trace time-series dynamics. Writings from 2019 were removed due to delay in WoS indexing. |
| $$WKryx$$ | Writings-to-words 2-mode network, obtained by reducing WKry. We removed writings without authorship information, and writings without keywords and titles. | Writings without both words and titles cannot be analyzed. |
| $$nWKryx$$ | Normalized writings-to-words 2-mode network (WKryx). | To remedy the effect of writings with many words on the analysis. Used to construct WKins networks for temporal analysis. |
| $$WKins$$ | Resulting writings-to-words 2-mode network, obtained from nWKryx. | Research objective: temporal analysis of paradigms evaluation in political science. First research question is focused on whether it is possible to empirically identify paradigms in political science, quantify them, and evaluate their change. |

**Table 2S: Step-by-step progression of WK2 network for identification of subdisciplines or topics**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Network** | **Description** | **Purpose** |
| $$WK\_{2}r$$ | Writings-to-keywords 2-mode network, obtained by reducing WK2. We removed multiple lines and cited-only writings.  | Cited-only writings have no information about keywords. With multiple lines removal, we deleted similar (same title, keywords and publication year) publications by the same authors. |
| $$WK\_{2}ry$$ | Writings-to-keywords 2-mode network, obtained by reducing WK2r. We removed writings older than 1990 and writings from 2019. | Writings from 2019 were removed due to delay in WoS indexing. Writings before 1990 were removed because modern political science is largely shaped by geopolitical events of late 1980s-early 1990s. |
| $$WK\_{2}ryx$$ | Writings-to-keywords 2-mode network, obtained by reducing WK2ry. We removed writings without authorship information, and writings without keywords and titles. We also removed senseless and misleading keywords.  | Writings without both words and titles cannot be analyzed. Senseless and misleading keywords, like numbers, abbreviations etc., were not indicative of any topic.  |
| $$nWK\_{2}ryx$$ | Normalized writings-to-keywords 2-mode network (WK2ryx). | To remedy the effect of writings with many words on the analysis.  |
| $$nWK^{'}\_{2}ryx$$ | Normalized writings-to-keywords 2-mode network, obtained by reducing nWK2ryx. We removed keywords with weighted indegree less than 1.  | Keywords with weighted indegree substantially less than 1 were either not related to political science or contained combination of letters that were, perhaps, some uncommon abbreviations. Used to construct $nK^{'}K^{'}$ for cross-sectional subdiscipline discovery. |
| $$nK'K'$$ | Normalized keywords-to-keywords 1-mode network, obtained by multiplication of nWK2$'$ryx by it’s transpose. The weight of an edge between 2 keywords is equal to the normalized number of writings in which a pair of keywords were mentioned together (fractional co-occurrence of the 2 keywords). | Research objective: to identify the subdisciplines or topics within the field. A corresponding research question is focused on whether it is possible to empirically identify ten subdisciplines in political science, and if not – how many of them can be identified. |

**Table 3S. WKryx net indegree: the most used words. Bolded are words present only in top-60 of the non-normalized network. Underlined are words present only in top-60 of normalized network.**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Keyword** | **WKryx Rank by value** | **nWKryx Rank by fractional values** | **Value** | **Fractional Value** | **Keyword** | **WKryx Rank by value** | **nWKryx Rank by fractional values** | **Value** | **Fractional Value** |
| political | 1 | 2 | 54302 | 6875.80 | national | 34 | 43 | 12120 | 1491.87 |
| politics | 2 | 1 | 50946 | 6945.41 | analysis | 35 | 51 | 12045 | 1295.42 |
| State | 3 | 3 | 46952 | 5741.67 | reform | 36 | 40 | 11993 | 1584.52 |
| Policy | 4 | 4 | 46649 | 5512.11 | security | 37 | 41 | 11957 | 1563.94 |
| democracy | 5 | 7 | 26147 | 3563.39 | society | 38 | 37 | 11924 | 1616.98 |
| War | 6 | 5 | 25555 | 3857.67 | rights | 39 | 42 | 11517 | 1553.10 |
| Social | 7 | 8 | 25241 | 3105.54 | case | 40 | 44 | 11498 | 1488.09 |
| New | 8 | 6 | 25130 | 3828.52 | crisis | 41 | 32 | 11420 | 1666.05 |
| Public | 9 | 12 | 22524 | 2655.28 | model | 42 | 71 | 11095 | 1061.16 |
| international | 10 | 13 | 20911 | 2648.60 | china | 43 | 31 | 10706 | 1676.75 |
| American | 11 | 9 | 20738 | 3030.65 | governance | 44 | 61 | 10531 | 1119.32 |
| Party | 12 | 15 | 20606 | 2534.99 | introduction | 45 | 30 | 10484 | 1703.36 |
| Power | 13 | 11 | 19967 | 2663.62 | soviet | 46 | 36 | 10423 | 1640.82 |
| World | 14 | 10 | 19620 | 2942.58 | make | 47 | 49 | 10421 | 1319.59 |
| economic | 15 | 16 | 18820 | 2402.92 | Africa | 48 | 45 | 9708 | 1433.37 |
| European | 16 | 17 | 18762 | 2310.28 | global | 49 | 52 | 9616 | 1282.82 |
| government | 17 | 18 | 18212 | 2307.84 | perspective | 50 | 56 | 9572 | 1248.39 |
| Unit | 18 | 26 | 17985 | 2107.61 | civil | 51 | 64 | 9304 | 1108.10 |
| German | 19 | 14 | 17861 | 2538.58 | woman | 52 | 48 | 9205 | 1338.19 |
| election | 20 | 21 | 17137 | 2228.82 | human | 53 | 60 | 8566 | 1145.68 |
| Europe | 21 | 19 | 16720 | 2298.47 | democratic | 54 | 62 | 8539 | 1119.13 |
| change | 22 | 22 | 16659 | 2187.64 | science | 55 | 55 | 8529 | 1254.72 |
| Theory | 23 | 23 | 16124 | 2185.60 | institution | 56 | 101 | 8372 | 786.80 |
| development | 24 | 24 | 15859 | 2164.12 | problem | 57 | 47 | 8314 | 1381.49 |
| Study | 25 | 27 | 14958 | 1876.64 | revolution | 58 | 46 | 8270 | 1383.02 |
| America | 26 | 25 | 14165 | 2112.84 | community | 59 | 67 | 8182 | 1091.51 |
| conflict | 27 | 35 | 14156 | 1641.95 | nation | 60 | 53 | 8161 | 1274.89 |
| history | 28 | 20 | 14152 | 2245.22 | **peace** | 61 | 57 | 8149 | 1235.05 |
| Union | 29 | 34 | 13719 | 1651.19 | **life** | 67 | 50 | 7682 | 1318.30 |
| foreign | 30 | 39 | 12899 | 1604.43 | **French** | 71 | 58 | 7574 | 1217.19 |
| economy | 31 | 33 | 12882 | 1657.99 | **Russia** | 73 | 59 | 7478 | 1168.64 |
| relation | 32 | 38 | 12570 | 1605.04 | **future** | 81 | 54 | 7037 | 1258.35 |
| Law | 33 | 29 | 12350 | 1723.81 | **reply** | 101 | 28 | 5973 | 1798.92 |

**Table 4S. nK’K’ and nWK’2ryx net degree: the most used keywords**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Keyword** | **nK'K' Rank** | **nWK'2ryx Rank** | **nK'K' Degree** | **nWK'2ryx Indegree** | **Keyword** | **nK'K' Rank** | **nWK'2ryx Rank** | **nK'K' Degree** | **nWK2'ryx Indegree** |
| political | 1 | 2 | 4817 | 14614 | participation | 35 | 22 | 2928 | 4064 |
| state | 2 | 3 | 4704 | 14527 | behavior | 36 | 31 | 2924 | 3484 |
| politics | 3 | 4 | 4644 | 13699 | development | 37 | 51 | 2888 | 2766 |
| policy | 4 | 1 | 4595 | 16261 | reform | 38 | 32 | 2885 | 3463 |
| social | 5 | 9 | 4272 | 7775 | impact | 39 | 50 | 2873 | 2772 |
| public | 6 | 8 | 4049 | 7909 | information | 40 | 41 | 2836 | 3013 |
| democracy | 7 | 5 | 3966 | 10278 | foreign | 41 | 34 | 2835 | 3428 |
| power | 8 | 13 | 3756 | 5860 | Europe | 42 | 26 | 2828 | 3745 |
| theory | 9 | 23 | 3751 | 3997 | network | 43 | 57 | 2816 | 2501 |
| model | 10 | 10 | 3707 | 6433 | gender | 44 | 36 | 2803 | 3217 |
| unit | 11 | 19 | 3535 | 4779 | crisis | 45 | 44 | 2794 | 2947 |
| international | 12 | 15 | 3497 | 5472 | human | 46 | 61 | 2769 | 2433 |
| war | 13 | 12 | 3444 | 5973 | community | 47 | 63 | 2760 | 2393 |
| government | 14 | 11 | 3436 | 6354 | management | 48 | 46 | 2748 | 2881 |
| conflict | 15 | 17 | 3415 | 5369 | society | 49 | 52 | 2746 | 2749 |
| party | 16 | 7 | 3389 | 8130 | strategy | 50 | 78 | 2732 | 2059 |
| economic | 17 | 21 | 3337 | 4496 | market | 51 | 55 | 2724 | 2661 |
| law | 18 | 28 | 3314 | 3688 | opinion | 52 | 33 | 2693 | 3460 |
| analysis | 19 | 38 | 3302 | 3119 | decision | 53 | 67 | 2666 | 2288 |
| election | 20 | 6 | 3213 | 8197 | culture | 54 | 83 | 2637 | 1915 |
| rights | 21 | 24 | 3208 | 3941 | attitude | 55 | 35 | 2634 | 3350 |
| governance | 22 | 14 | 3191 | 5546 | choice | 56 | 59 | 2624 | 2468 |
| European | 23 | 16 | 3169 | 5399 | justice | 57 | 62 | 2611 | 2433 |
| identity | 24 | 30 | 3133 | 3497 | American | 59 | 66 | 2595 | 2309 |
| institution | 25 | 20 | 3118 | 4716 | media | 58 | 43 | 2595 | 2964 |
| economy | 26 | 25 | 3085 | 3799 | new | 60 | 101 | 2592 | 1651 |
| union | 27 | 18 | 3080 | 4959 | **representation** | 66 | 42 | 2514 | 3000 |
| relation | 28 | 39 | 3031 | 3019 | **competition** | 67 | 53 | 2510 | 2699 |
| national | 29 | 56 | 3023 | 2597 | **integration** | 68 | 37 | 2508 | 3123 |
| change | 30 | 48 | 3015 | 2805 | **voting** | 75 | 54 | 2451 | 2693 |
| security | 31 | 27 | 3003 | 3699 | **trade** | 77 | 58 | 2413 | 2499 |
| civil | 32 | 29 | 2995 | 3631 | **electoral** | 83 | 47 | 2361 | 2855 |
| world | 33 | 40 | 2959 | 3017 | **EU** | 84 | 49 | 2346 | 2780 |
| organization | 34 | 45 | 2944 | 2931 | **growth** | 91 | 60 | 2305 | 2435 |

**Table 5S. Islands: first partitions by 10 clusters (9 small islands)**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Information about islands** | **Information about the representative work of the islands** |
| **#** | **Island Keywords** | **Total size of island** | **Number of articles in island** | **Author** | **Title** | **Journal** | **Year** | **Cited in WoS** |
| 1 | partido, national | 2 | 25 | Wuhs, ST | Inclusion and its moderating effects on ideas, interests and institutions: Mexico's Partido Accion Nacional | PARTY POLIT | 2013 | 4 |
| 2 | manuel, juan | 2 | 32 | Wills-Otero, L | From Uribe to Santos: Changes and continuities in 2011 Colombian politics | REV CIENC POLIT-SANT | 2012 | 8 |
| 3 | triple, helix | 2 | 24 | Addie, JPD | Beyond Town and Gown: Universities, Territoriality and the Mobilization of New Urban Structures in Canada | TERRIT POLIT GOV | 2015 | 15 |
| 4 | garde, avant | 2 | 11 | Roberts, J | Art After Deskilling | HIST MATER | 2010 | 7 |
| 5 | door, revolve | 2 | 30 | LaPira, TM | Revolving door lobbyists and interest representation | INTEREST GROUPS ADVO | 2014 | 21 |
| 6 | laissez, faire | 2 | 15 | Whelan, DJ | The west, economic and social rights, and the global human rights regime: Setting the record straight | HUM RIGHTS QUART | 2007 | 53 |
| 7 | enrichment, uranium | 2 | 16 | Sagan, SD | The Causes of Nuclear Weapons Proliferation | ANNU REV POLIT SCI | 2011 | 51 |
| 8 | imitation, gesture | 2 | 22 | McGeer, V | The art of good hope | ANN AM ACAD POLIT SS | 2004 | 64 |
| 9 | trader, maghribi | 2 | 15 | Powell, B | Public choice and the economic analysis of anarchy: a survey | PUBLIC CHOICE | 2009 | 65 |

**Table 6S. Islands: second partitions by 10 clusters (9 small islands)**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Information about islands** | **Information about the representative work of the islands** |
| **#** | **Island Keywords** | **Total size of island** | **Number of articles in island** | **Author** | **Title** | **Journal** | **Year** | **Cited in WoS** |
| 1 | genetically, modify, organism | 3 | 39 | Falkner, R | The political economy of 'normative power' Europe: EU environmental leadership in international biotechnology regulation | J EUR PUBLIC POLICY | 2007 | 75 |
| 2 | aerial, unmanned, vehicle | 3 | 43 | Smith, M | Do Drone Strikes Degrade Al Qaeda? Evidence From Propaganda Output | TERROR POLIT VIOLENC | 2013 | 21 |
| 3 | deleuze, gille, guattari | 3 | 36 | Scott-Cato, M | How could we study climate-related social innovation? Applying Deleuzean philosophy to Transition Towns | ENVIRON POLIT | 2010 | 66 |
| 4 | cortex, neuroscience, prefrontal | 3 | 55 | Lieberman, MD | Is political cognition like riding a bicycle? How cognitive neuroscience can inform research on political thinking | POLIT PSYCHOL | 2003 | 62 |
| 5 | cote, divoire, ivoire | 3 | 29 | Boone, C | Decentralization as political strategy in West Africa | COMP POLIT STUD | 2003 | 64 |
| 6 | immunodeficiency, october, sar, virus | 4 | 72 | Elbe, S | Our epidemiological footprint: The circulation of avian flu, SARS, and HIV/AIDS in the world economy | REV INT POLIT ECON | 2008 | 13 |
| 7 | armenia, azerbaijan, karabakh, nagorno | 4 | 71 | Berg, E | Who is entitled to 'earn sovereignty'? Legitimacy and regime support in Abkhazia and Nagorno-Karabakh | NATIONS NATL | 2012 | 17 |
| 8 | editor, introduction, writer | 3 | 47 | Swedlow, B | Advancing Policy Theory with Cultural Theory: An Introduction to the Special Issue | POLICY STUD J | 2014 | 21 |
| 9 | cascade, fad, informational | 3 | 85 | Farrell, H | The Consequences of the Internet for Politics | ANNU REV POLIT SCI | 2012 | 125 |

**Table 7S. Islands: third partitions by 18 clusters (17 small islands)**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Information about islands** | **Information about the representative work of the islands** |
| **Subdiscipline** | **#** | **Island Keywords** | **Size of Island** | **# of articles** | **Author** | **Title** | **Journal** | **Year** | **WoS Cited** |
| Public policy | 1 | automobile, boom, bust | 3 | 66 | Alessi, L | Quasi real time early warning indicators for costly asset price boom/bust cycles: A role for global liquidity | EUR J POLIT ECON | 2011 | 82 |
| Public policy | 2 | crowd, fatality, traffic | 3 | 113 | Aguirre, BE | Normative Collective Behavior in The Station Building Fire | SOC SCI QUART | 2011 | 31 |
| Public policy | 3 | fetal, pain, sympathy | 3 | 63 | Forman-Barzilai, F | Sympathy in space(s) - Adam Smith on proximity | POLIT THEORY | 2005 | 26 |
| Political theory | 4 | amartya, entitlement, sen | 3 | 59 | Robeyns, I | The capability approach in practice | J POLIT PHILOS | 2006 | 223 |
| Political theory | 5 | collectivism, individualism, methodological | 3 | 182 | Scheufele, DA | Twenty-five years of the spiral of silence: A conceptual review and empirical outlook | INT J PUBLIC OPIN R | 2000 | 126 |
| International relations | 6 | belt, road, silk | 3 | 133 | McNally, CA | SINO-CAPITALISM China's Reemergence and the International Political Economy | WORLD POLIT | 2012 | 86 |
| Public policy | 7 | motivate, reasoning, skepticism | 3 | 195 | Nyhan, B | When Corrections Fail: The Persistence of Political Misperceptions | POLIT BEHAV | 2010 | 476 |
| Public policy | 8 | disorder, posttraumatic, stress | 3 | 268 | Fletcher, LE | Violence and social repair: Rethinking the contribution of justice to reconciliation | HUM RIGHTS QUART | 2002 | 225 |
| International relations | 9 | colonialism, japanese, settler | 3 | 385 | Welch, CB | Colonial violence and the rhetoric of evasion - Tocqueville on Algeria | POLIT THEORY | 2003 | 45 |
| Public policy | 10 | football, professional, sport, team | 4 | 459 | Baimbridge, M | Satellite television and the demand for football: A whole new ball game? | SCOT J POLIT ECON | 1996 | 112 |
| Public policy | 11 | code, conduct, operational | 3 | 284 | O'Rourke, D | Outsourcing regulation: Analyzing nongovernmental systems of labor standards and monitoring | POLICY STUD J | 2003 | 292 |
| Political theory | 12 | condorcet, jury, theorem | 3 | 217 | Althaus, SL | Information effects in collective preferences | AM POLIT SCI REV | 1998 | 164 |
| Methodological studies | 13 | causal, inference, mechanism | 3 | 812 | Imai, K | Unpacking the Black Box of Causality: Learning about Causal Mechanisms from Experimental and Observational Studies | AM POLIT SCI REV | 2011 | 337 |
| Political theory | 14 | efficient, rent, seek | 3 | 516 | Esteban, J | Collective action and the group size paradox | AM POLIT SCI REV | 2001 | 124 |
| Public policy | 15 | indigenous, people, young | 3 | 1104 | Amna, E | Standby citizens: diverse faces of political passivity | EUR POLIT SCI REV | 2014 | 65 |
| Methodological studies | 16 | exchange, rate, response, survey, telephone | 5 | 2313 | Groves, RM | Nonresponse rates and nonresponse bias in household surveys | PUBLIC OPIN QUART | 2006 | 1103 |
| International relations | 17 | curse, natural, resource | 3 | 1647 | Le Billon, P | The political ecology of war: natural resources and armed conflicts | POLIT GEOGR | 2001 | 515 |

**Table 8S. Islands: fourth partitions by 31 small islands from main island**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Information about islands** | **Information about the representative work of the islands** |
| **Subdiscipline** | **#** | **Island Keywords** | **Size of Island** | **# of articles** | **Author** | **Title** | **Journal** | **Year** | **WoS Cited** |
| International relations  | 1 | determination, self | 2 | 1547 | WENDT, A | COLLECTIVE IDENTITY FORMATION AND THE INTERNATIONAL STATE | AM POLIT SCI REV | 1994 | 546 |
| Contextual political analysis & Comparative politics | 2 | asia, east, middle, southeast | 4 | 2099 | Acharya, A | How ideas spread: Whose norms matter? Norm localization and institutional change in Asian regionalism | INT ORGAN | 2004 | 642 |
| Political economy | 3 | business, cycle | 2 | 1419 | Franzese, RJ | Electoral and partisan cycles in economic policies and outcomes | ANNU REV POLIT SCI | 2002 | 166 |
| - | 4 | new, zealand | 2 | 1658 | Banducci, SA | Proportional representation and attitudes about politics: results from New Zealand | ELECT STUD | 1999 | 53 |
| Public policy | 5 | civic, education, higher | 3 | 2357 | Galston, WA | Political knowledge, political engagement,and civic education | ANNU REV POLIT SCI | 2001 | 433 |
| International relations & Law and politics | 6 | court, justice, supreme, transitional | 4 | 3621 | Gibson, JL | On the legitimacy of national high courts | AM POLIT SCI REV | 1998 | 239 |
| Political methodology | 7 | series, time | 2 | 1449 | Berry, WD | Measuring citizen and government ideology in the American states, 1960-93 | AM J POLIT SCI | 1998 | 749 |
| Public policy | 8 | care, health | 2 | 1898 | Lawrence, RG | Framing obesity - The evolution of news discourse on a public health issue | HARV INT J PRESS-POL | 2004 | 197 |
| Public policy | 9 | income, inequality | 2 | 2356 | Uslaner, EM | Inequality, trust, and civic engagement | AM POLIT RES | 2005 | 258 |
| Political economy | 10 | labor, market | 2 | 3777 | Hainmueller, J | Attitudes toward Highly Skilled and Low-skilled Immigration: Evidence from a Survey Experiment | AM POLIT SCI REV | 2010 | 257 |
| Political economy | 11 | crisis, financial | 2 | 3435 | Lapavitsas, C | Financialised Capitalism: Crisis and Financial Expropriation | HIST MATER | 2009 | 165 |
| Political behavior | 12 | action, collective | 2 | 1878 | Ostrom, E | How types of goods and property rights jointly affect collective action | J THEOR POLIT | 2003 | 182 |
| - | 13 | media, news | 2 | 3605 | Mazzoleni, G |  ""Mediatization"" of politics: A challenge for democracy? | POLIT COMMUN | 1999 | 510 |
| Contextual political analysis & Comparative politics | 14 | country, develop | 2 | 2451 | Korpi, W | New politics and class politics in the context of austerity and globalization: Welfare state regress in 18 countries, 1975-95 | AM POLIT SCI REV | 2003 | 447 |
| Political economy | 15 | development, economic, growth | 3 | 7842 | Henderson, J | Global production networks and the analysis of economic development | REV INT POLIT ECON | 2002 | 837 |
| Contextual political analysis & Comparative politics | 16 | eastern, europe | 2 | 3896 | Schimmelfennig, F | Governance by conditionality: EU rule transfer to the candidate countries of Central and Eastern Europe | J EUR PUBLIC POLICY | 2004 | 416 |
| Contextual political analysis & Comparative politics | 17 | africa, south | 2 | 2707 | Alexander, P | Rebellion of the poor: South Africa's service delivery protests - a preliminary analysis | REV AFR POLIT ECON | 2010 | 198 |
| Public policy | 18 | gender, woman | 2 | 4516 | HUDDY, L | GENDER STEREOTYPES AND THE PERCEPTION OF MALE AND FEMALE CANDIDATES | AM J POLIT SCI | 1993 | 454 |

**Table 8S. Islands: fourth partitions by 31 small islands from main island (continued)**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Information about islands** | **Information about the representative work of the islands** |
| **Discipline** | **#** | **Island Keywords** | **Size of Island** | **# of articles** | **Author** | **Title** | **Journal** | **Year** | **WoS Cited** |
| International relations | 19 | international, law, relation | 3 | 10104 | WENDT, A | ANARCHY IS WHAT STATES MAKE OF IT - THE SOCIAL CONSTRUCTION OF POWER-POLITICS | INT ORGAN | 1992 | 1650 |
| International relations | 20 | civil, conflict, peace, society, war | 5 | 13784 | Gleditsch, NP | Armed conflict 1946-2001: A new dataset | J PEACE RES | 2002 | 1316 |
| Public policy | 21 | decision, make | 2 | 2884 | Ansell, C | Collaborative governance in theory and practice | J PUBL ADM RES THEOR | 2008 | 1164 |
| Political behavior | 22 | turnout, voter | 2 | 2801 | Lijphart, A | Unequal participation: Democracy's unresolved dilemma - Presidential Address, American Political Science Association, 1996 | AM POLIT SCI REV | 1997 | 618 |
| Public policy | 23 | government, local | 2 | 7282 | Cox, KR | Spaces of dependence, spaces of engagement and the politics of scale, or: looking for local politics | POLIT GEOGR | 1998 | 476 |
| Public policy | 24 | change, climate | 2 | 3126 | Bulkeley, H | Reconfiguring environmental governance: Towards a politics of scales and networks | POLIT GEOGR | 2005 | 481 |
| Contextual political analysis & Comparative politics | 25 | european, integration, union | 3 | 8519 | Hooghe, L | A Postfunctionalist Theory of European Integration: From Permissive Consensus to Constraining Dissensus | BRIT J POLIT SCI | 2009 | 663 |
| Political behavior | 26 | movement, social | 2 | 8933 | Tarrow, S | New Transnational Activism  | CAMB STUD CONTENT | 2005 | 1081 |
| Political institutions | 27 | democracy, economy, election, party, political | 5 | 32199 | Przeworski, A | Modernization - Theories and facts | WORLD POLIT | 1997 | 592 |
| Contextual political analysis & Comparative politics | 28 | america, latin | 2 | 2404 | Fornos, CA | Explaining voter turnout in latin America, 1980 to 2000 | COMP POLIT STUD | 2004 | 141 |
| Political behavior | 29 | opinion, public | 2 | 8691 | STIMSON, JA | DYNAMIC REPRESENTATION | AM POLIT SCI REV | 1995 | 573 |
| Law and politics | 30 | human, rights | 2 | 4596 | Davenport, C | State repression and political order | ANNU REV POLIT SCI | 2007 | 350 |
| - | 31 | foreign, policy, politics, state, unit | 5 | 37136 | HAAS, PM | EPISTEMIC COMMUNITIES AND INTERNATIONAL-POLICY COORDINATION - INTRODUCTION | INT ORGAN | 1992 | 2684 |

**Table 9S. Robustness check: statistics**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Partition | Criteria | Link islands method | Hierarchical cluster analysis method |
| 1st partition | Number of clusters | 10 | 10 |
| Minimum size of clusters | 2 | 1 (only one) |
| Maximum size of clusters | 5000 | 5521 |
| 2nd partition | Number of clusters | 10 | 10 |
| Minimum size of clusters | 3 | 1 (only one) |
| Maximum size of clusters | 3100 | 5395 |
| 3rd partition | Number of clusters | 18 | 18 |
| Minimum size of clusters | 3 | 4 |
| Maximum size of clusters | 300 | 5054 |
| 4th partition | Number of clusters | 31 | 75 |
| Minimum size of clusters | 2 | 1 (one cluster) |
| Maximum size of clusters | 5 | 548 |