**Appendix A. House “Placebo Test” Results**

To address possible alterative explanations for our findings, we conduct a placebo test on the U.S. House of Representatives.[[1]](#footnote-1) The House is a useful comparison for our theory because its members have been directly elected since the institution’s inception. Thus, the shift to the direct election of senators should have had no effect on House member vote choices. If our results are spurious and the true relationship is driven by rival explanations that are collinear with our argument but not specific to direct election or the Senate, this would be revealed by a positive, significant result in the House placebo test.

One challenge, however, is that the House did not take many votes on exactly the same issues—tariffs and treaties—that we use in our Senate test.[[2]](#footnote-2) As a next best option, we consider votes on presidential discretion on a broader range of foreign-affairs topics including hosting and designating attendees for international conferences and peace-time military improvements.[[3]](#footnote-3) Otherwise, our coding and analysis are the same as those we conduct for the Senate.

Table A1 replicates the model specifications from Table 1 in the main analysis but for the U.S. House. We include representative and roll call fixed effects in Models 1 and 2, and state and roll call fixed effects in Models 3 and 4. A House member’s vote is considered to be treated with “direct election” if the senators from that state were elected by a direct primary at that point in time.

**Table A1.** Direct Election and Support for Presidential Autonomy, House Placebo

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Model 1  (OLS) | Model 2  (Cond. Logit) | Model 3  (OLS) | Model 4  (Cond. Logit) |
| Direct Election | -0.24  (0.12) | -1.19\*\*  (0.47) | -0.14  (0.08) | -0.85\*  (0.41) |
| President Co-partisan | 0.27\*\*  (0.03) | 1.32\*\*  (0.15) | 0.25\*\*  (0.02) | 1.34\*\*  (0.08) |
| Fixed Effects | Rep., Vote | Rep., Vote | State, Vote | State, Vote |
| N | 3,843 | 2,219 | 3,843 | 3,843 |
| Clustering Level | Representative | Representative | State | State |
| Clusters | 1,721 | 650 | 48 | 48 |
| R2 | 0.58 | 0.34 | 0.29 | 0.24 |

*Note: Each model contains state-specific time trends. \*=p<0.05, \*\*=p<0.01; two-tailed tests*

In contrast to the Table 1 findings, there is a negative relationship with mixed statistical significance in the House models. Figure A1 (derived from Table 1 Model 3 in the main manuscript and Table A1 Model 3) indicates that while there is a strong positive relationship between direct election and delegation in the Senate, there is a negative (overlapping with zero) effect in the House. These effects—in the Senate and in the House—are statistically distinguishable from one another.

**Figure A1.** Comparison of Senate and House (Placebo) Results for Direct Primary Election Effect



Taken together, these results suggest that the Table 1 findings in the main manuscript are not driven by rival explanations equally applicable to the House and Senate. Our core findings are, at a minimum, Senate specific.

We also produce a placebo test equivalent to the interactive models (Table 2) in the main analysis. We present these results in Table A2. As with Table A1, we find no matching results in our House placebo tests. While our main test found a strong positive effect for the treatment, especially among counter-partisans, the House test finds a negative effect, either insignificantly (among contra-partisans) or significantly (among co-partisans). In neither case does the result match what we observe in the Senate tests.

It is worth noting that we do find some significant (negative) results in our placebo tests. All of these go in the opposite direction of our expectations (and the results in the Senate models). This implies that while the House does not here serve as a perfect null placebo, it also does not show similar patterns occurring in the House, which would undermine our causal explanation. The House’s lack of a pure null result is not evidence against our arguments, but should caution us in our interpretation of its strength in vindicating our arguments.

**Table A2.** Direct Election (Conditional on Co-partisanship) and Support for Presidential Autonomy, House Placebo Test

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Model 1  (OLS) | Model 2  (Cond. Logit) | Model 3  (OLS) | Model 4  (Cond. Logit) |
| Direct Election | -0.14  (0.13) | -0.43  (0.50) | -0.02  (0.09) | -0.19  (0.47) |
| President Co-partisan | 0.39  (0.04) | 2.37\*\*  (0.27) | 0.32\*\*  (0.03) | 1.77\*\*  (0.17) |
| Direct Election X Pres. Co-partisan | -0.25\*\*  (0.06) | -1.90\*\*  (0.35) | -0.23\*\*  (0.05) | -1.36\*\*  (0.26) |
| Fixed Effects | Member, Vote | Member, Vote | State, Vote | State, Vote |
| N | 3,843 | 2,219 | 3,843 | 3,843 |
| Clustering Level | Member | Member | State | State |
| Clusters | 1,721 | 650 | 48 | 48 |
| R2 | 0.43 | 0.35 | 0.30 | 0.25 |

*Note: Each model contains state-specific time trends. \*=p<0.05, \*\*=p<0.01; two-tailed tests*

**References**

Lowande, Kenneth, and Justin Peck. 2017. “Congressional Investigations and the Electoral Connection.” *Journal of Law, Economics, and Organization* 33(1): 1-17.

**Appendix B. List of Senate Roll-Call Votes Analyzed**

Congress – Roll-Call Number – Vote Breakdown (yea-nay)

Description

48 – 335 – 35-21

To amend H.R. 7970, (app. March 3, 1885), (23 stat. L. 302) making appropriations for current and contingent expenses of the Indian Department and for fulfilling treaty stipulations with the various Indian tribes for fiscal 1886, which amendment eliminates the section authorizing the president to negotiate with various Indian tribes for opening to settlement under the homestead laws the unassigned land in ceded Indian territory for which purpose $5,000 is appropriated, and to report to Congress what action he takes. (p. 1746-2)

49 – 346 – 6-42

To amend S. 3173, a bill regarding the fishing rights of the U.S., by inserting as follows, “whenever the president shall be satisfied that American vessels or fishermen are obstructed by Canadian authority in their free use of such easements and rights in Canadian waters as belong to them by ancient ownership sanctioned by treaty”.

51 – 345 – 30-34

To amend H.R. 9416, eliminating the effective date of exemption from duty of July 1, 1891, and eliminating the provision giving the president authority to proclaim suspension both of schedule of duties, and of provisions relating to duty free importation of sugar, molasses, coffee, tea and hides; and in lieu thereof declaring that exemptions are made to encourage reciprocal trade, and providing that Congress be informed by the president when countries producing above articles impose duty on U.S. products, and that Congress then revive whatever duties it may determine on same.

51 – 346 – 7-59

To amend H.R. 9416, by eliminating the president’s authority to proclaim suspension of provisions relating to duty free importation of sugar, molasses, coffee, tea and hides, eliminating July 1, 1891, as date when duty exemptions begin; and instead authorizing the president to proclaim remission of duties collected on above articles if satisfied that countries exporting same have abolished duties and taxes on principal U.S. Agricultural products.

51 – 347 – 30-35

To amend H.R. 9416, by authorizing the president to suspend the provisions of the act relating to the free introduction of sugar, coffee, tea, molasses, and hides, any time after passage of that act rather than on or after July 1, 1891, should he decide that a country is imposing an unreasonable tax against producers of the U.S. (p.9907)

51 – 348 – 19-39

To amend H.R. 9416, by including wool with sugar, coffee, tea, molasses and hides as being exempt from duty for the purpose of enabling the president to secure reciprocal trade with countries producing these articles, and authorizing the president to suspend, after July 1, 1891, the free introduction of above articles, should any country impose unreasonable or unequal duties against products of the U.S. (p.9906)

51 – 350 – 39-28

To amend H.R. 9416, by exempting from duty sugar, molasses, coffee, tea and hides, with a view to securing reciprocal trade with countries producing these articles, and empowering the president to suspend said exemption, and stipulating duties on above articles in case of suspension. (p.9906)

51 – 355 – 31-31

To amend H.R. 9416, by providing for the establishment of a custom commission composed of 5 disinterested persons appointed by the president, to consider importations and their effects.

53 – 303 – 19-26

To amend H.R. 4864 by providing to empower the president to take retaliatory measures where foreign governments impose prohibitory duties or other exactions upon grain or other agricultural products of the U.S. by having the secretary of the treasury levy and collect additional and discriminating duties on articles and products exported from such foreign country into the U.S., equal to 50% of the duties provided for in this act, in order to secure for the producers of grain and the products of grain in this country some portion of the market of the continental countries of Europe. (p. 6058-1)

53 – 375 – 23-40

To amend H.R. 4864 by providing that the president appoint three commissioners to meet the commissioners of Canada and Newfoundland to consider the most desirable manner in which to accomplish a larger exchange of the products and manufactures of the two countries and possibility of reducing duties now existing between the countries. (p. 8323-2)

53 – 479 – 34-35

To amend S. 1481, a bill to incorporate the maritime canal company of Nicaragua, by eliminating from section 4 the provision that prior to the first day of July, 1897, no bonds indorsed shall be issued from the treasury in excess of $30,000,000 and so that it will read, that the president may at any time suspend the issue of said indorsed bonds until Congress being informed by him of the reasons for such suspension shall otherwise direct. (p. 1556-1)

53 – 485 – 30-31

To amend S. 1481, by striking out all after the enacting clause and inserting as a substitute authorizing the president to appoint three persons (2 U.S. Army civil engineers and one citizen) to make a general survey of route, to submit plans, cost, and to employ necessary assistants and to appropriate money necessary for this investigation, (p. 1566-2)

53 – 486 – 14-32

To amend S. 1481 by offering a substitute bill giving the president authority to negotiate with the Nicaraguan and Costa Rican governments for a canal as anticipated by the company, and to take over, finance and build this canal. (p. 1561-1)

55 – 19 – 23-33

To table the amendment to treaty, which amendment strikes out in article viii the provision that in cases where question involved is one which concerns a particular state or territory of the U.S., the president can appoint a judicial officer to be one of the arbitrators under articles 3,5, or 6 and likewise in similar cases involving a British colony or possession her Britanna majesty may also appoint a similar arbitration.

55 -164 – 32-22

To amend H.R. 379, by authorizing the president subject to the consent of the Senate, to make reciprocal trade agreements with foreign nations within 2 years from the passage of this act and to reduce the duties under the act 20% and to retain imports on the free list for a period of not more than 5 years. (p. 2227-1)

56 – 3 – 42-24

To table for the purpose of defeating an amendment to a Senate resolution requesting the president to communicate to the Senate all communications received by him, or by any department, of people in arms against the U.S. in the Philippines, if to do so is, in his judgment, not incompatible with the public interest, which amendment proposes to request the president to furnish the Senate with all instructions given to the commissioner who negotiated the treaty of peace with Spain, on the ground that this would be a matter pertaining to executive business. (p.853-2)

56 – 103 – 33-24

To table the amendment to bill S. 4300, which amendment seeks to end military occupation of the Philippines, until the president first proclaims amnesty for all political offenses against the U.S. In the islands, agrees on an armistice with the hostile elements there, and invites not less than 10 leaders of the hostile peoples to come to the U.S. and state their grievances, expenses paid. (p.853-2)

57 – 87 – 56-23

To amend H.R. 3110 (32 stat l. 481, 6/28/02), a bill making provision for construction of a canal connecting the Atlantic and Pacific Oceans, by seeking to create an isthmian canal commission of seven members, appointed by the president with Senate advice, their salaries to be fixed by the president until Congress orders otherwise, and authorizing the use of army engineers, their official salaries to be deducted from whatever salary is fixed for such services.

57 – 88 – 45-32

To table an amendment to H.R. 3110, said amendment imposing a definite time limit of six months on authorization of the president to acquire possession of the new Panama Canal Company and the perpetual control of the necessary land to build same from the Republic of Columbia. (p. 7069, p. 7071)

57 – 89 – 35-39

To amend H.R. 3110 by imposing a definite time limit of twelve months in which the president must obtain for the U.S., title to the property of the new Panama Canal Company, to obtain control and jurisdiction over the necessary territory of the Republic of Colombia, including the right to operate the Panama Railroad Company.

57 – 90 – 42-33

To table an amendment to H.R. 3110 which amendment gives the president authority to change the route of the canal, if he deems it advisable, from its proposed course through the Isthmus of Panama, to what is known as the Nicaragua route, between Greytown in the Caribbean Sea, and Brito, on the Pacific, via San Juan River and Lake Nicaragua.

57 – 91 – 44-37

To amend H.R. 3110 by giving the president authority to build a canal by the Nicaragua route, instead of the Isthmus of Panama, if for any reason he deems it advisable. (p. 7072-2)

57 – 92 – 14-63

To agree to an amendment offered as a substitute to H.R. 3110, said amendment giving the president authority to construct a canal from the Atlantic to the Pacific Oceans, by such route as he may select, together with the construction or improvement of harbors as he shall deem necessary and also giving him free authority to employ such agencies and to obtain such advice as he shall find necessary and to employ such officers of the army and navy for engineering assistance as he thinks fit and to appropriate $10,000,000 toward this work, whose total cost shall not exceed $180,000,000. (p. 7073-1)

57 – 95 – 41-23

To table an amendment to H.R. 3110 which would authorize the president to conclude agreements with the Republic of Costa Rica and Nicaragua for land to build a canal on the Nicaragua routes. (p. 7074-1)

58 – 2 – 41-23

To amend a resolution that the president be requested to inform the Senate whether all the correspondence and notes between the Department of State and the legation of the U.S. at Bogota, and between either of these and the government of Columbia, for the construction of an isthmian canal, and all the correspondence and notes between the U.S. and any of its officials or representatives or government of Panama concerning the separation of Panama from Columbia, have been sent to the Senate, and if not, that he be requested to send the remaining correspondence and notes to the Senate in executive session; amendment being to add to the end of the resolution the words-- “if not, in his judgment, incompatible with the public interest.”

59 – 58 – 21-40

To amend S.J. Res. 60, (6-25-06, 34 stat. L. 835), providing for the purchase of material and equipment for the construction of Panama Canal, which amendment authorizes the rejection of bids or tenders, if deemed unreasonable by the president. (p. 7717)

61 – 104 – 21-41

To amend H.R. 1438, by giving president power to reduce duties on certain goods, wares, and merchandise, (deemed to be to the best interests of U.S.), for a period not exceeding 5 years, to the extent of not more than 20% thereof, with a view to securing reciprocal trade with foreign countries. (p.4085-1)

61 – 105 – 25-28

To amend an amendment to H.R. 1438, by establishing a “customs commission”, composed of 5 members appointed by the president by and with consent of the Senate, no more than 3 to be of the same political party at a salary of $7,500 per year, and instructing same to inquire into the effect of the tariff rates on production, and prices, also on the enlargement of our commerce in other countries. (p. 4088-1)

61 – 106 – 40-25

To agree to the amendment to H.R. 1438, which amendment; provides for additional duties on imported goods and the control of reciprocal trade activities by authorizing the president to adjust duties in accordance with actions taken by foreign countries, thereby protecting the American industries. (p.4068-1,2)

62 – 35 – 20-41

To amend H.R. 4412, by granting power to the president to remove from the Canadian tariff free list articles specified in proclamation. (p. 2789-1)

62 – 36 -13-48

To amend H.R. 4412, by eliminating the provision giving the president the right to admit, free of duty, certain enumerated articles from Canada, by proclamation, upon evidence that Canada admits free of duty certain articles from the U.S., and to revoke such proclamation upon proof that such admission no longer prevail in Canada. (p. 2784-2 2785-1)

62 – 241 – 47-15

To amend, in the nature of a substitute H.R. 21969, (37 Stat. L. 560, 8-24-12), a bill to provide for the opening, maintenance, protection and operation of the Panama Canal and the sanitation and government of the canal zone, by authorizing the president to execute orders discontinuing the Isthmian Canal Commission and to appoint a governor of the Panama Canal by consent of the Senate, for four years at a salary of $10,000 per annum, (subject to removal). (p. 10294-2,10295-1)

**Appendix C. List of House Roll-Call Votes Analyzed**

Congress – Roll-Call Number – Vote Breakdown (yea-nay)

Description

45 – 88 – 199-74

To amend H.R. 1093 by providing that the president shall arrange within 6 months from passage of bill, a conference with other nations to adopt a common ratio between gold and silver in order to establish bimetallism and appoint three commissioners to attend said conference at $2,500 yearly plus expenses.

45 – 200 – 119-108

To amend S. 1016 (20-Stat-144, 6/18/78), a bill providing for the distribution of awards made under the convention between the U.S. and the Republic of Mexico, by striking out the 5th sec. of the Senate bill, giving the president 6 months to consider the ward made in the cases of Benjamin Well and La Abra Silver Company and inserting in lieu thereof the fifth section of the House bill on the same subject, providing that the president may consider any claims filed by or given against Mexico in negotiations.

48 – 151 – 91-147

To recede and concur in a Senate amendment to H.R. 4716 providing a $2,500,000 appropriation for the president authorizing him to build ten warships of various types. (p. 5857-2)

48 – 184 – 111-76

To recede and concur in a Senate amendment to H.R. 6770 authorizing the president to appoint three commissioners at $7,500 each and a secretary at $3,000 to tour South American and Central American countries for the purposes of transmitting to Congress a report on best modes of promoting more intimate international and commercial relations with them.

50 – 195 – 192-4

To pass bill H.R. 11309, a bill authorizing the president to protect and defend the rights of American fishing vessels, fisherman, and trading and other vessels in certain cases and for other purposes. (p. 8439-2)

53 – 107 – 93-159

To pass a resolution declaring it to be the sense of the House that it will condemn any intervention by the president or by civil or military authorities without congressional authority, to disturb or overthrow a friendly government and to aid in the substitution or restoration of a monarchy.

55 – 48 – 148-104

To table the resolution requesting the president, if not incompatible with the public service, to transmit to the House information disclosing by what authority he has undertaken to bind the U.S. to pay $4,000,000, to the bond creditors of the Hawaiian government, in the treaty of annexation negotiated with that government.

56 – 69 – 100-132

To agree to the report of the committee of whole on bill S. 1939, authorizing the president to appoint a commission to study and make a full report upon the commercial and industrial conditions of China and Japan.

57 – 65 – 81-98

To recede from disagreement to Senate amendment 91 and agree to same, relating to H.R. 14046 (32 Stat 662, 7/1/02), a bill making appropriations for the naval service for fiscal year ending June 30, 1903, which substitute amendment authorizes the president to increase the naval establishment by building certain battleships, cruisers and gunboats, fixing expenditures and rules for awarding contracts, etc

61 – 187 – 90-131

To recommit the bill H.R. 32909 (36 Stat, 3/4/1911), making appropriations for sundry civil expenses of the government for fiscal year ending June 1912, to the committee on appropriations with instructions, "that no part of this sum shall be available for expenditures until the president shall have determined that he is unable to negotiate and conclude a treaty with the majority of the leading maritime nations of the world joining the U.S.”

62 – 139 – 161-137

To amend section 5 of H.R. 21969 (37 Stat. 560, app. 8/24/1912), a bill providing for opening, maintaining, protecting, and operating the Panama Canal, and the sanitation and government of the canal zone, by authorizing the president to prescribe, and from time to time change, the tolls, which may be based upon gross or net registered tonnage, exempting from tolls vessels engaged in coastwise trade of the U.S.

62 – 187 – 88-159

To concur in Senate amendment 102, H.R. 24565 (37 Stat. 328 app. 8/22/1912), a bill making naval appropriations for 1913, which amendment authorizes the president to have constructed 2 first-class battleships at a cost of $7,425,000 each. (p.11172-1, 1177-2, 11178-1)

63 – 69 – 319-14

To pass H. Res. 298, authorizing the president to co-operate with the United Kingdom of Great Britain to the end that naval construction may be suspended for the period of one year. (p.479-2)

63 – 114 – 338-37

To pass H.J. Res. 251 (38 stat. 770, 4/22/1914), justifying the employment by the president of the armed forces of the U.S. in enforcing certain demands made upon Victoriano Huerta to satisfy U.S. for affronts and indignities committed against the U.S. government.

63 – 116 – 120-217

To recommit the 1915 naval appropriations bill H.R. 14034 (38 Stat. 392, 6/30/1914), to the committee on naval affairs with instructions to report same back with amendment authorizing the president to construct one battleship instead of two as provided in the bill.

1. For a Senate study that uses the House as a placebo, see Lowande and Peck (2017). [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. As a consequence, our test is not a placebo test by the strictest definition and might be better thought of as a “pseudo placebo test.” [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. The full list and description of the roll calls appear in Appendix C. [↑](#footnote-ref-3)