# Appendices: Table of Contents

# Appendix 1. Codebook

# Appendix 2. Intercoder Reliability

# Appendix Table 2.1. Intercoder reliability per code.

# Appendix 3: Descriptive Sample

# Appendix Table 3.1. Descriptive statistics of sample.

# Appendix Table 3.2. Co-occurrence of ethnicity codes.

# Appendix 4: Full Models

Appendix Table 4.1. Full models for Figure 1.

Appendix Table 4.2. Full models for Figure 2.

Appendix Table 4.3. Full models for Figure 3.

Appendix Table 4.4. Full models for Figure 4.

# Appendix 5: Robustness Checks

Appendix Table 5.1. Negative binomial models alternative to Figure 1.

Appendix Table 5.2. Negative binomial models alternative to Figure 2.

Appendix Table 5.3. Negative binomial models alternative to Figure 3.

Appendix Table 5.4. Negative binomial models alternative to Figure 4.

# Appendix 1: Codebook

# Code system

### Origin and national identity markers

## Dutch (Nederlands)

Applied when terms referred to:

* Dutch nationality or citizenship
* Being culturally Dutch

Example:

* "Ik ben een *geboren Nederlander*" (I am a Dutch born)
* ‘Zij is een *Marokkaans-Nederlands politica*” (She is a Moroccan-Dutch politician)
* ‘ALBAYRAK heeft altijd gezegd *zich honderd procent Nederlands te voelen*’ (ALBAYRAK has always said that she feels one hundred percent Dutch)
* ‘Ik ben er trots op *Nederlands staatsburger* te zijn’ (I am proud to be a Dutch citizen)
* ‘Zij is *vernederlandst*’ (She is Dutchized)

Note: when a double nationality was described as being one-half Dutch, both codes 'Dutch' and 'double nationality' were applied.

## Regional Dutch identity (regionale Nederlandse identiteit)

Regions might be (but not limited to): Zeeland, Roermond, Limburg, Bergen op Zoom, Brabant, Rosendaal, Haarlem, Breda, Gouda, Amersfoort, Maassluis, Amsterdam, Deventer, Vlissingen, Apeldoorn, Friesland, Rotterdam.

For example:

* “Harbers is *geboren en getogen Amsterdammer*” (Harbers was born and raised in Amsterdam)
* “Door zijn Friese achtergrond heeft hij binding met de regio” (Because of his Frisian background he has a bond with the region)

## Dual citizenship (dubbele nationaliteit)

Applied when terms referred to:

* Double nationality (another nationality besides the Dutch nationality)
* Double passports

Example:

* "(...) die ook een *Marokkaans en Nederlands paspoort* heeft" ((...) who also has a Moroccan and Dutch passport)
* “Zij heeft een *dubbele nationaliteit*” (She has dual nationality)

Note: when a double nationality was described as being one-half Dutch, both codes 'Dutch' and 'double nationality' were applied.

## Non-Dutch (niet-Nederlands)

Applied when one or more terms referring to being non-Dutch or having a non-Dutch origin occurred:

* met een *niet-Nederlandse achtergrond* (with a non-Dutch background)
* “Hij komt *niet uit Nederland*” (He is not from the Netherlands)
* “Hij is een *buitenlander*” (He is a foreigner)

## Non-Western (niet-Westers)

Applied when one or more of terms referring to being non-Western or having a non-Western background occurred:

* met een *niet Westerse achtergrond* (with a non-Western background)

Note: This code can be used when there is no specific country mentioned.

Example:

* "Bij de overige Amsterdamse kandidaten vallen vooral die met een *niet-westerse achtergrond* op" (In the case of the other Amsterdam candidates, those with a non-Western background particularly stand out)

## Western (westers)

Applied when one or more terms referring to being Western or having a Western background (explicit mentions) occurred:

Example:

* “Alle kandidaten hebben een *Westerse achtergrond*” (All candidates have a Western background)

## Background / country of birth non-western (niet-westers geboorteland of afkomst)

Applied when country of origin or birth is mentioned:

Examples:

* "Karabulut, net als Erdal *Koerdisch*, reageert gebeten (...)". (Karabulut, like Erdal Kurdish, reacts bitten)
* "De *in Suriname geboren* CDA-politica's (...)" (The CDA politicians born in Suriname)
* "Ik ben in armoede *geboren in Somalië* (...)" (I was born in poverty in Somalia)
* "De *uit Frans Guyana afkomstige* Hindoestaanse is ernstig ziek(...)" (The Hindustani from French Guiana is seriously ill)
* "(...) *geboren in een dorpje in het zuiden van Marokko*". (born in a village in the south of Morocco)
* "Sadet Karabulut, zelf van Turks-Koerdische komaf, zegt dat (...)" (Sadet Karabulut, herself of Turkish-Kurdish descent, says that (…))
* "Tweede Kamerlid van Afghaanse afkomst" (Member of Parliament of Afghan origin)
* Ik ben trots *Turkse* (I am proud Turkish)

## Background / country of birth western (westers geboorteland of afkomst)

Applied if western country of origin or birth, other than the Netherlands, is mentioned.

Example:

* " *Geboren in Portugal*" (Born in Portugal)
* “*Zij komt van origine uit Groot-Brittannië*” (She is originally from Great Britain)
* “Hij is van *Franse komaf*” (He is of French descent)

## Refugee (Vluchteling)

Applied when one or more of the following terms occurred:

* Vluchteling(e) (Refugee)
* X vluchtte uit... (X fled from….)
* Op de vlucht (On refuge)
* Economisch vluchteling(e) (Economic refugee)
* Politiek vluchteling(e) (Political refugee)
* X ontvluchte ... (X fled…)

Or applied when other terms related to the status of refugee occurred.

Example:

* "Telkens vertel ik dat ik een *politiek vluchteling* uit Iran ben." (Every time I tell that I am a political refugee from Iran)

## Allochtoon

Applied when one or more of the following terms occurred:

* allochtoon (allochthonous)
* allochtoonse
* allochtone
* allochtoonse komaf (allochthonous descent)
* allochtoonse origine (allochthonous origin)
* allochtoonse achtergrond (allochthonous background)

Example:

* "(...) de enige vrouwelijke én *allochtone* kandidaat-leider" (the only female and allochthonous leader candidate)

## Autochtoon

Applied when one or more of the following terms occurred:

* Autochtoon (autochthonous)
* Autochtoonse
* Autochtone
* Autochtone komaf (autochthonous descent)
* Autochtone origine (autochthonous origin)
* Autochtone achtergrond (autochthonous background)

Example:

* ‘Hij is een van de *autochtone Kamerleden* uit de Randstad’ (He is one of the autochthonous MPs from the Randstad)

## Migrant

Applied when one or more of the following terms occurred:

* Migrant (migrant)
* (…) migreerde (migrated)
* (…) is gemigreerd (has migrated)
* Migrantenkind (child of migrants)
* Migrantenachtergrond (migrant background)
* Migrantenvrouwen (migrant women)
* Immigrantenmeisje (immigrant girl)
* Migrantenzoon (son of migrants)
* Migrantendochter (daughter of migrants)
* afkomstig uit migrantengemeenschap (from the migrant community)
* christenmigrant (Christian migrant)
* gastarbeider (guest worker)
* kind van gastarbeiders (child of guest workers)

Or applied when other terms related to the status of migrant occurred. Also applies to references to second generation migrants.

## Ethnicity (etniciteit)

Applied when terms referred to belonging to an ethnic group, is mentioned. Not considered ethnic groups are nationalities that coincide with existing countries, such as Turkish and Turkey.

Examples:

* "Lazrak *komt uit Alhoceima, een zogenaamde riffie*". (Lazrak comes from Alhoceima, a so-called riffie)
* *Berbers* (Berber)
* *Vlaams* (Flemish)
* *Koerdisch* (Kurdish)
* *Perzisch* (Persian)

## Dutch language skills (Nederlandse taalbeheersing)

Applied when terms referred to Dutch language proficiency or accent.

Example:

* "Daar heb je haar weer, denk ik als ik haar weer *met zwaar allochtonenaccent (...) hoor hakkelen."* (There you have her again, I think when I hear her stammering again with a heavy immigrant accent)
* “*Hij spreekt tegenwoordig erg goed Nederlands*” (Nowadays he speaks very good Dutch)

### Marital status, gender and sexuality markers

## Divorced (gescheiden)

Applied when one or more of the following terms occurred:

* ex-vrouw (ex-wife)
* ex-man (ex-husband)
* zijn/haar scheiding (his/her divorce)
* gescheiden (divorced)

Or applied when other terms related to divorce where prominently present.

Example:

* "(...) zijn worsteling met identiteit *en zijn scheiding*" (his struggle with identity and his divorce)

## Married (getrouwd)

Applied when one or more of the following terms occurred:

* Huwelijk (marriage)
* getrouwd (married)
* zijn/haar man/vrouw (his/her husband/wife)
* zijn/haar echtgenoot/echtgenote (his/her spouse)

Or applied when other terms related to marriage where prominently present.

Example:

* "(...) zegt de onlangs *getrouwde* Mohandis" (says the recently married Mohandis)

## Single (vrijgezel)

Applied when one or more of the following terms occurred:

* single
* vrijgezel(le) (single)
* alleenstaand(e) (single)
* ongetrouwd (unmarried)
* ongehuwd (unmarried)

Or applied when other terms related to single status where prominently present.

Example:

* "En nog steeds *ongetrouwd*, vertelt ze met een grote grijns." (And still unmarried, she says with a big grin)
* “Ze is aan het *daten*” (They are dating)

## Relationship other (andere relatie)

Applied when the partner or the presence of a (romantic) relationship of the MP is discussed, without explicit reference to being married, divorced or single.

Example:

* “Toen *zijn partner* vroeg wat hij ervan vond” (When his partner asked what he thought about it)
* “[..] heeft *een relatie* met [..]” (Is in a relationship with (…))
* “Hij was aanwezig met *zijn vriendin*” (He was present with his girlfriend)
* “Ze zegt over *haar geliefde* Henk” (She says about her lover Henk)

## Heterosexuality (heteroseksualiteit)

Applied when one or more terms referred to heterosexuality.

Example:

* "Hij ijvert, *als hetero*, (...)" (He strives, being straight)

## Bi or homosexuality (bi- of homoseksualiteit)

Applied when one or more terms referred to homosexuality.

Example:

* “*Ik ben lesbisch*, ik ben half-Marokkaans, maar ik ben ook vrouw, mens, Amsterdammer, wereldburger." (I'm a lesbian, I'm half-Moroccan, but I'm also a woman, a human being, Amsterdammer, a citizen of the world)
* “*Ik ben biseksueel”* (I am bisexual)

## Man

Applied when terms referred to being male or masculine.

Example:

* "Ik ben *man*, Kamerlid, Marokkaans, Amsterdams enzovoort." (I am a man, MP, Moroccan, Amsterdammer, etcetera)
* “Hij is een *man* van de toekomst” (He is a man of the future)
* “Hij is onze *golden boy*” (He is our golden boy)
* “Hij is nog een *jongetje*” (He is still a boy)
* “*Zijn mannelijkheid* komt daardoor niet in het geding” (His masculinity is therefore not in jeopardy)
* “Hij was een *topman*” (He was a top male executive)

## Woman (vrouw)

Applied when terms referred to being female.

Example:

* "Is het een voordeel dat u *vrouw* bent?" (Is it an advantage that you are a woman)
* “Zij was een *topvrouw*” (She was a top female executive)

## Motherhood (moederschap)

Applied when terms referred to being a mother.

Example:

* "Kathleen Ferrier is *zo'n moeder* als het gaat om het succes (...)." (Kathleen Ferrier is such a mother when it comes to success)

## Fatherhood (vaderschap)

Applied when terms referred to being a father.

Example:

* 'Ik ben een *trotse vader*.' (I am a proud father)
* “Jesse Klaver heeft *pappa-dag*” (Jesse Klaver has a daddy day)

## Parenthood (ouderschap)

Applied when terms referred to being a parent, or not being a parent.

Example:

* "sinds hij *ouder* is geworden (...)." (Since he became a parent)
* “Zij heeft *geen kinderen*” (She does not have children)

Note: Use this code only when ‘motherhood’ or ‘fatherhood’ are not used.

### Race

## Race (ras)

Applied when terms referred to race or skin color.

Example:

* "Ik was er de enige *zwarte* jongen" (I was the only black boy)
* ‘Er zijn niet veel vrouwen *van kleur*, zoals ik, in de Kamer” (There are not many women of colour, like me, in the parliament)

### Age (leeftijd)

## Young (jong)

Applied when terms referred to the MP being young in age:

Example:

* "(...) dat hij nu *de jongste fractieleider* in de Tweede Kamer ooit is" (that he is now the youngest party leader in the House of Representatives ever)
* “Hij is *een jonge hond”* (He is a young dog)

## Old (oud)

Applied when terms referred to the MP being old in age:

Example:

* "(...) dat hij nu *de oudste fractieleider* in de Tweede Kamer ooit is" (that he is now the oldest party leader in the House of Representatives ever)
* “Hij is, net als het grootste gedeelte van de Kamerleden, inmiddels *behoorlijk op leeftijd*” (Like most of the MPs, he is now quite old)

## Other age (overig leeftijd)

Applied when terms referred to the age of the MP in general:

Example:

* "(...) Henk Kamp *(54)*"
* "(...) Henk Kamp *(geb. 1947)*" (Henk Kamp (born 1947))

### Social class

## Social class (sociale klasse)

Applied when terms referred to social class:

Example:

* “Zij komt uit een *arbeidersmilieu”* (She comes from a working class background)
* “Hij is geboren met een *zilveren lepel in de mond*” (He was born with a silver spoon in his mouth)
* “Zijn vader is leraar, hij *groeide op in een gezin uit de middenklasse”* (His father is a teacher, he grew up in a middle-class family)

## Background or occupation of parents

Applied when terms referred to the occupation of parents:

* “Zijn *vader was postbezorger”* (His father was a postman)
* “Hij ging rechten studeren net als *zijn vader, die advocaat is*” (He went to law school just like his father, who is a lawyer)

## Other family background (overige familieachtergrond)

* “Zelf kokketeerde het jonge Kamerlid graag met zijn afkomst uit een rood nest - zijn moeder stemt GroenLinks”. (The young Member of Parliament liked to flirt with his descent from a red nest - his mother votes GroenLinks)

Note: use this code for references to the family background of the MP that do not fall under the codes ‘social class’ or ‘background or occupation of parents’.

## Former occupation (voormalig beroep)

Applied when terms referred to the (former) occupation of an MP:

* “Hij was *melkveehouder* in Drenthe” (He was a dairy farmer in Drenthe)
* “Door haar ervaring als *gevangenisdirecteur* (…)” (Because of her experience as a prison director)
* “Voor zijn intrede in de Tweede Kamer was hij *advocaat-generaal* (…)” (Before his entry into the House of Representatives, he was Advocate General)
* “Zij was een *topvrouw*” (She was a top female executive)

## Education (opleiding)

Applied when terms referred to education of an MP:

* “Hij is *opgeleid als planoloog*” (He was trained as an urban planner)
* “Arib behaalde *een universitaire graad*” (Arib obtained a university degree)
* “Na zijn *studie politicologie* (…)” (After his studies of political science)
* “Hij had slechts een aantal *colleges gevolgd*” (He had only attended a few lectures)

### Religious identity markers

## Christian (Christen)

Applied when terms referred to a Christian background or identity:

Example:

* "Jesse Klaver heeft *christelijke wortels* en Mark Rutte heeft *christelijke wortels*". (Jesse Klaver has Christian roots and Mark Rutte has Christian roots)
* "Het nieuwe Kamerlid is zelf *hervormd* (..)" (The new Member of Parliament is Reformed himself)
* "Hij beschouwt zich als *katholiek*" (He considers himself Catholic)
* “Zij maakt zelf onderdeel uit van de *gereformeerde* gemeente” (She herself is part of the Reformed congregation)

## Atheist

Applied when terms referred to being an atheist:

Example:

* "De zelfverklaarde *atheïste* (...)" (The self-proclaimed atheist)
* “Zij is *niet langer gelovig* (…)” (She is no longer a believer)

Note: this code is also applied when MPs are identified as no longer believing, e.g. an ex-Christian or ex-Muslim.

## Secular (seculier)

Applied when terms referred to identifying as secular.

Example:

* "Cherribi omschrijft zichzelf als *'seculiere* moslim'." (Cherribi describes himself as 'secular Muslim')

## Muslim (Moslim)

Applied when terms referred to identifying as Muslim or identifying with an Islamic background.

Example:

* "(...) omdat ze als *matig gelovige moslima* zowel de aantrekkingskracht als het bloedige demasque van de politieke islam heeft ondervonden." (because as a moderately religious Muslim, she has experienced both the pull and the bloody demasque of political Islam)
* "Cherribi omschrijft zichzelf als *'seculiere moslim'*." (Cherribi describes himself as 'secular Muslim')

## Jewish (Joods)

Applied when terms referred to a Jewish background or identity. May also refer to Judaism as an ethnicity.

Example:

* "Het enige *Joodse* Kamerlid (...)" (The only Jewish Member of Parliament)

## Hindu (Hindoe)

Applied when terms referred to a Hindu background or identity.

Example:

* "Het *hindoestaanse* Kamerlid (...)" (The Hindu Member of Parliament)

## Other religions (overige geloven)

Applied when terms referred to any other religious background or identity.

Example:

* "Het enige *Zoroaster-aanhangend* Kamerlid (...)" (The only Zoroaster adherent MP)

### Ideological identity markers

## Ideology (ideologie)

Applied when one or more of the following terms occurred:

* Als republikein (as republican)
* de republikeinse (...) (republican)
* Als liberal (as liberal)
* De liberale (…) (the liberal)
* Liberaal (liberal)
* Als socialist (as socialist)
* De socialistische (…) (the socialist)
* Socialist (socialist)
* Als feminist (as feminist)
* De feministische (…) (the feminist)
* Feministisch (feminist)

Examples:

* "De SP-Kamerleden Farshad Bashir en Sadet Karabulut zeggen *republikein te zijn* en daarom willen zij geen trouw aan de koning zweren" (SP MPs Farshad Bashir and Sadet Karabulut say they are republicans and therefore they do not want to swear allegiance to the king)
* "De bekendste Nederlandse *feministe* (...)" (The most famous Dutch feminist)

# Code list

### [Origin and national identity markers](#_Toc27402536)

[Dutch (Nederlands)](#_Toc27402537)

[Regional Dutch identity (regionale Nederlandse identiteit)](#_Toc27402538)

[Dual citizenship (dubbele nationaliteit)](#_Toc27402539)

[Non-Dutch (niet-Nederlands)](#_Toc27402540)

[Non-Western (niet-Westers)](#_Toc27402541)

[Western (westers)](#_Toc27402542)

[Country of birth non-western (niet-westers geboorteland en afkomst)](#_Toc27402543)

[Country of birth western (westers geboorteland)](#_Toc27402544)

[Refugee (Vluchteling)](#_Toc27402545)

[Allochtoon](#_Toc27402546)

[Autochtoon](#_Toc27402547)

[Migrant](#_Toc27402548)

[Ethnicity (etniciteit)](#_Toc27402549)

[Dutch language skills (Nederlandse taalbeheersing)](#_Toc27402550)

### [Marital status, gender and sexuality markers](#_Toc27402551)

[Divorced (gescheiden)](#_Toc27402552)

[Married (getrouwd)](#_Toc27402553)

[Single (vrijgezel)](#_Toc27402554)

[Heterosexuality (heteroseksualiteit)](#_Toc27402555)

[Bi or homosexuality (bi- of homoseksualiteit)](#_Toc27402556)

[Man](#_Toc27402557)

[Woman (vrouw)](#_Toc27402558)

[Motherhood (moederschap)](#_Toc27402559)

[Fatherhood (vaderschap)](#_Toc27402560)

[Parenthood (ouderschap)](#_Toc27402561)

### [Race](#_Toc27402562)

[Race (ras)](#_Toc27402563)

### [Age (leeftijd)](#_Toc27402564)

[Young (jong)](#_Toc27402565)

[Old (oud)](#_Toc27402566)

[Other age (overig leeftijd)](#_Toc27402567)

### [Social class](#_Toc27402568)

[Social class (sociale klasse)](#_Toc27402569)

[Background or occupation of parents](#_Toc27402570)

[Other family background (overige familieachtergrond)](#_Toc27402571)

[Former occupation (vorig werk)](#_Toc27402572)

[Education (opleiding)](#_Toc27402573)

### [Religious identity markers](#_Toc27402574)

[Christian (Christen)](#_Toc27402575)

[Atheist](#_Toc27402576)

[Secular (seculier)](#_Toc27402577)

[Muslim (Moslim)](#_Toc27402578)

[Jewish (Joods)](#_Toc27402579)

[Hindu (Hindoe)](#_Toc27402580)

[Other religions (overige geloven)](#_Toc27402581)

### [Ideological identity markers](#_Toc27402582)

[Ideology (ideologie)](#_Toc27402583)

# Appendix 2: Intercoder Reliability

Intercoder reliability was assessed on 200 articles coded by all four coders: 100 articles immediately following training, and 100 randomly distributed in the coding material. As the frequencies distribution differs over the codes and some codes are rare, we calculated the Brennan-Prediger coefficient and Gwet’s AC2. Compared to Fleiss’s kappa, Conger’s kappa, and Krippendorff’s alpha, these measures are less influenced by the frequency distribution of the coded units (Quarfoot and Levine, 2016). As can be seen in the table below, all reliability scores are good to excellent, and the percentage of agreement between coders is high. Eight codes—Autochtoon, heterosexuality, fatherhood, old, atheist, secular, Jewish, other religions—were so rare that they did not occur at all in the 200 articles of the reliability set. We were thus unable to ascertain intercoder reliability for these codes. As we consider these codes of interest, sometimes particularly because they are rare, we did not exclude them from our analyses in the results section. They nevertheless need to be interpreted with caution.

# Appendix Table 2.1. Intercoder reliability per code

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Frequency in coded data (2,784 articles)** |  | **Reliability (200 articles)** |
| **Code** | **# articles**  | **# occurrences**  | **% articles** | **occurrences / 100 articles** |  | **Percent agreement** | **Brennan & Prediger** | **Gwet's AC** |
| Dutch  | 32 | 39 | 1.11 | 1.35 |   | 0.97 | 0.96 | 0.97 |
| Regional Dutch identity  | 171 | 223 | 5.91 | 7.71 |   | 0.97 | 0.96 | 0.97 |
| Dual citizenship  | 11 | 19 | 0.38 | 0.66 |   | 1.00 | 0.99 | 0.99 |
| Non-Dutch  | 11 | 18 | 0.38 | 0.62 |   | 0.99 | 0.98 | 0.99 |
| Background / country of birth non-western  | 134 | 189 | 4.64 | 6.54 |   | 0.95 | 0.94 | 0.95 |
| Background / country of birth western  | 2 | 2 | 0.07 | 0.07 |   | 1.00 | 1.00 | 1.00 |
| Refugee  | 16 | 18 | 0.55 | 0.62 |   | 0.99 | 0.99 | 0.99 |
| Allochtoon | 31 | 38 | 1.07 | 1.31 |   | 0.99 | 0.98 | 0.99 |
| Autochtoon | 0 | 0 | 0.00 | 0.00 |   | - | - | - |
| Migrant | 39 | 47 | 1.35 | 1.63 |   | 0.98 | 0.97 | 0.98 |
| Ethnicity  | 11 | 18 | 0.38 | 0.62 |   | 0.99 | 0.99 | 0.99 |
| Dutch language skills  | 10 | 10 | 0.35 | 0.35 |   | 0.99 | 0.98 | 0.99 |
| Divorced  | 7 | 8 | 0.24 | 0.28 |   | 1.00 | 0.99 | 0.99 |
| Married  | 63 | 84 | 2.18 | 2.91 |   | 0.98 | 0.97 | 0.98 |
| Single  | 2 | 2 | 0.07 | 0.07 |   | 1.00 | 1.00 | 1.00 |
| Relationship other  | 68 | 119 | 2.35 | 4.12 |   | 0.98 | 0.97 | 0.98 |
| Heterosexuality  | 1 | 1 | 0.03 | 0.03 |   | - | - | - |
| Bi or homosexuality  | 2 | 2 | 0.07 | 0.07 |   | 1.00 | 0.99 | 1.00 |
| Man | 47 | 48 | 1.63 | 1.66 |   | 0.98 | 0.97 | 0.98 |
| Woman  | 148 | 216 | 5.12 | 7.47 |   | 0.98 | 0.96 | 0.97 |
| Motherhood  | 18 | 23 | 0.62 | 0.80 |   | 1.00 | 1.00 | 1.00 |
| Fatherhood  | 4 | 8 | 0.14 | 0.28 |   | - | - | - |
| Parenthood  | 75 | 133 | 2.59 | 4.60 |   | 0.97 | 0.97 | 0.97 |
| Race | 19 | 26 | 0.66 | 0.90 |   | 0.99 | 0.99 | 0.99 |
| Young  | 45 | 62 | 1.56 | 2.14 |   | 0.98 | 0.98 | 0.98 |
| Old  | 1 | 1 | 0.03 | 0.03 |   | - | - | - |
| Other age  | 235 | 280 | 8.13 | 9.69 |   | 0.97 | 0.95 | 0.97 |
| Social class  | 7 | 9 | 0.24 | 0.31 |   | 1.00 | 0.99 | 0.99 |
| Background or occupation of parents | 50 | 83 | 1.73 | 2.87 |   | 0.98 | 0.98 | 0.98 |
| Other family background  | 13 | 15 | 0.45 | 0.52 |   | 1.00 | 1.00 | 1.00 |
| Former occupation  | 399 | 650 | 13.80 | 22.48 |   | 0.85 | 0.83 | 0.85 |
| Education  | 132 | 232 | 4.57 | 8.02 |   | 0.93 | 0.92 | 0.93 |
| Christian  | 9 | 11 | 0.31 | 0.38 |   | 1.00 | 1.00 | 1.00 |
| Atheist | 1 | 1 | 0.03 | 0.03 |   | - | - | - |
| Secular  | 3 | 3 | 0.10 | 0.10 |   | - | - | - |
| Muslim  | 25 | 36 | 0.86 | 1.25 |   | 0.98 | 0.98 | 0.98 |
| Jewish  | 1 | 1 | 0.03 | 0.03 |   | - | - | - |
| Hindu  | 1 | 1 | 0.03 | 0.03 |   | 1.00 | 1.00 | 1.00 |
| Other religions  | 0 | 0 | 0.00 | 0.00 |   | - | - | - |
| Ideological identity | 89 | 103 | 3.08 | 3.56 |   | 0.96 | 0.95 | 0.96 |

*Note: See codebook.*

# Appendix 3: Descriptive Sample

# Appendix Table 3.1. Descriptive statistics for a sample of politicians.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  |  | **Ethnic minority men** | **Ethnic majority men** | **Ethnic minority women** | **Ethnic majority** **women** |
| **Age (mean)** | 46 | 44 | 45 | 44 |
| **Year first elected (mean)** | 2000 | 2002 | 2002 | 2001 |
| **List position (mean)** | 13 | 16 | 12 | 12 |
| **Terms** |  |  |  |  |
|  | 1994-1998 | 27% | 27% | 11% | 12% |
|  | 1998-2002 | 20% | 28% | 38% | 44% |
|  | 2002-2003 | 16% | 54% | 42% | 52% |
|  | 2003-2006 | 30% | 62% | 64% | 71% |
|  | 2006-2010 | 37% | 47% | 66% | 62% |
|  | 2010-2012 | 58% | 50% | 57% | 63% |
| **Education** |  |  |  |  |
|  | Lower secondary | 5% | 0% | 4% | 2% |
|  | (Upper) secondary | 5% | 13% | 0% | 6% |
|  | Post-secondary non-tertiary | 0% | 3% | 4% | 2% |
|  | First stage of tertiary | 90% | 75% | 80% | 81% |
|  | Second stage of tertiary | 0% | 10% | 12% | 8% |
| **Religion** |  |  |  |  |
|  | Christian | 10% | 20% | 19% | 21% |
|  | Atheist | 0% | 5% | 0% | 8% |
|  | Muslim | 40% | 0% | 27% | 0% |
|  | Hindu | 0% | 0% | 12% | 0% |
|  | Other religions | 0% | 0% | 4% | 2% |
|  | Not known | 50% | 75% | 38% | 69% |
| **Number of politicians**  | 40 | 20 | 48 | 26 |
| **Total number of identity markers** | 620 | 469 | 844 | 845 |
| **Total number of articles** | 909 | 336 | 1114 | 520 |

# Appendix Table 3.2. Co-occurrence of ethnicity codes.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|   | Dutch  | Regional Dutch identity  | Dual citizenship  | Non-Dutch  | non-western  | western  | Refugee  | Allochtoon | Migrant | Ethnicity  | Dutch language skills  | Race | Total articles |
| Dutch  |  | 6 | 5 | 4 | 17 | 0 | 0 | 3 | 7 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 32 |
| Regional Dutch identity  | 6 |  | 1 | 2 | 24 | 1 | 2 | 4 | 13 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 171 |
| Dual citizenship  | 5 | 1 |  | 0 | 6 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 11 |
| Non-Dutch  | 4 | 2 | 0 |  | 3 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 11 |
| Background / country of birth non-western  | 17 | 24 | 6 | 3 |  | 1 | 9 | 15 | 30 | 5 | 5 | 11 | 134 |
| Background / country of birth western  | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |  | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 2 |
| Refugee  | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 | 9 | 0 |  | 0 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 16 |
| Allochtoon | 3 | 4 | 2 | 1 | 15 | 0 | 0 |  | 7 | 0 | 2 | 5 | 31 |
| Migrant | 7 | 13 | 2 | 1 | 30 | 0 | 1 | 7 |  | 1 | 4 | 4 | 39 |
| Ethnicity  | 1 | 2 | 0 | 0 | 5 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 1 |  | 0 | 5 | 11 |
| Dutch language skills  | 1 | 4 | 0 | 0 | 5 | 0 | 1 | 2 | 4 | 0 |  | 1 | 10 |
| Race | 0 | 4 | 0 | 0 | 11 | 1 | 1 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 1 |   | 19 |

*Note: Number of articles in which both the code of the row and column occurs at least once.*

# Appendix 4: Full Models

**Appendix Table 4.1. Full models for Figure 1.**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|   |   | Ethnicity and nationality markers | Gender and relationship markers | Age markers | Social class markers | Religion markers | Ideology markers |
| Ethnic minority | 0.445 | -0.104 | 0.013 | 0.133 | 0.078 | -0.026 |
|  |  | (0.110) | (0.067) | (0.045) | (0.100) | (0.024) | (0.016) |
| Woman | 0.004 | 0.058 | 0.027 | -0.014 | -0.005 | -0.022 |
|  |  | (0.048) | (0.047) | (0.028) | (0.065) | (0.006) | (0.010) |
| Ethnic minority # Woman | 0.032 | 0.303 | -0.032 | 0.037 | -0.054 | 0.014 |
|  |  | (0.174) | (0.186) | (0.060) | (0.145) | (0.025) | (0.021) |
| Term (ref=1994-1998) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Term 1998-2002 | 0.206 | -0.024 | 0.031 | 0.154 | 0.063 | 0.011 |
|  |  | (0.156) | (0.094) | (0.068) | (0.215) | (0.027) | (0.033) |
|  | Term 2002-2003 | 0.214 | 0.139 | 0.044 | 0.189 | 0.002 | -0.077 |
|  |  | (0.177) | (0.169) | (0.081) | (0.285) | (0.038) | (0.037) |
|  | Term 2003-2006 | 0.085 | 0.052 | 0.054 | 0.165 | -0.003 | -0.057 |
|  |  | (0.197) | (0.183) | (0.112) | (0.332) | (0.054) | (0.048) |
|  | Term 2006-2010 | 0.063 | 0.024 | 0.099 | 0.343 | -0.017 | -0.071 |
|  |  | (0.235) | (0.255) | (0.141) | (0.434) | (0.072) | (0.059) |
|  | Term 2010-2012 | 0.079 | 0.205 | 0.128 | 0.604 | -0.044 | -0.066 |
|  |  | (0.294) | (0.318) | (0.171) | (0.531) | (0.091) | (0.070) |
| Age |  | 0.000 | -0.007 | -0.008 | 0.006 | 0.000 | -0.001 |
|  |  | (0.004) | (0.003) | (0.002) | (0.003) | (0.001) | (0.001) |
| Education (ref=Lower secondary) |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | (Upper) secondary | 0.084 | -0.319 | 0.079 | 0.163 | 0.070 | -0.037 |
|  |  | (0.261) | (0.146) | (0.084) | (0.274) | (0.030) | (0.024) |
|  | Post-secondary non-tertiary | 0.651 | 0.212 | 0.168 | 0.711 | 0.086 | -0.046 |
|  |  | (0.284) | (0.197) | (0.078) | (0.274) | (0.033) | (0.026) |
|  | First stage of tertiary | 0.188 | -0.238 | 0.039 | 0.312 | 0.082 | -0.019 |
|  |  | (0.251) | (0.130) | (0.080) | (0.262) | (0.032) | (0.019) |
|  | Second stage of tertiary | 0.023 | -0.279 | -0.002 | 0.154 | 0.069 | -0.031 |
|  |  | (0.269) | (0.133) | (0.082) | (0.273) | (0.031) | (0.020) |
| Year of first election | -0.001 | -0.010 | -0.003 | 0.030 | -0.000 | -0.002 |
|  |  | (0.007) | (0.005) | (0.004) | (0.009) | (0.001) | (0.001) |
| Position on election list | 0.002 | -0.002 | -0.000 | -0.004 | -0.001 | 0.001 |
|  |  | (0.004) | (0.003) | (0.001) | (0.004) | (0.000) | (0.001) |
| Year |  | -0.020 | -0.007 | -0.010 | -0.085 | 0.004 | 0.006 |
|  |  | (0.020) | (0.020) | (0.010) | (0.032) | (0.006) | (0.004) |
| Party (ref=CDA) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | CU | -0.003 | -0.114 | 0.075 | -0.410 | -0.014 | -0.002 |
|  |  | (0.172) | (0.140) | (0.066) | (0.159) | (0.025) | (0.017) |
|  | D66 | 0.119 | 0.046 | 0.065 | -0.124 | -0.006 | 0.005 |
|  |  | (0.152) | (0.121) | (0.053) | (0.158) | (0.023) | (0.018) |
|  | GL | -0.007 | 0.159 | 0.013 | -0.032 | -0.010 | 0.020 |
|  |  | (0.153) | (0.159) | (0.040) | (0.134) | (0.019) | (0.016) |
|  | LPF | -0.059 | -0.014 | -0.039 | -0.236 | -0.017 | 0.052 |
|  |  | (0.103) | (0.120) | (0.039) | (0.113) | (0.016) | (0.019) |
|  | PVV | 0.004 | 0.609 | 0.236 | 0.143 | 0.057 | -0.026 |
|  |  | (0.222) | (0.246) | (0.092) | (0.226) | (0.069) | (0.018) |
|  | PvdA | 0.176 | 0.130 | 0.103 | 0.170 | 0.004 | 0.007 |
|  |  | (0.134) | (0.086) | (0.043) | (0.105) | (0.017) | (0.011) |
|  | SP | 0.091 | -0.008 | 0.143 | -0.052 | -0.004 | -0.003 |
|  |  | (0.137) | (0.102) | (0.083) | (0.136) | (0.017) | (0.016) |
|  | VVD | 0.096 | 0.096 | 0.062 | 0.024 | -0.000 | 0.069 |
|  |  | (0.138) | (0.121) | (0.056) | (0.149) | (0.021) | (0.026) |
| Constant | 42.098 | 33.525 | 26.101 | 109.416 | -6.620 | -7.265 |
|  |  | (40.851) | (39.908) | (22.388) | (64.791) | (11.898) | (8.899) |
| N |   | 2819 | 2819 | 2819 | 2819 | 2819 | 2819 |
| r2 |   | 0.10 | 0.03 | 0.03 | 0.04 | 0.02 | 0.02 |

Note: Ordinary Least Squares regression coefficients with standard errors in parentheses. Dependent variable is the number of social markers, multiplied by 100 for readability. The models in this table are used to produce Figure 1.

**Appendix Table 4.2. Full models for Figure 2.**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|   |   | Relationship | Sexuality | Gender | Parenthood |
| Ethnic minority | -0.052 | 0.004 | -0.007 | -0.048 |
|  |  | (0.057) | (0.003) | (0.019) | (0.029) |
| Woman | 0.006 | 0.000 | 0.057 | -0.006 |
|  |  | (0.028) | (0.001) | (0.020) | (0.028) |
| Ethnic minority # Woman | 0.247 | -0.002 | 0.038 | 0.020 |
|  |  | (0.181) | (0.004) | (0.048) | (0.052) |
| Term (ref=1994-1998) |  |  |  |  |
|  | Term 1998-2002 | -0.090 | 0.004 | 0.019 | 0.043 |
|  |  | (0.069) | (0.003) | (0.052) | (0.056) |
|  | Term 2002-2003 | -0.052 | 0.007 | 0.044 | 0.140 |
|  |  | (0.087) | (0.005) | (0.093) | (0.085) |
|  | Term 2003-2006 | -0.074 | 0.008 | -0.026 | 0.145 |
|  |  | (0.090) | (0.006) | (0.095) | (0.103) |
|  | Term 2006-2010 | -0.052 | 0.009 | -0.097 | 0.164 |
|  |  | (0.120) | (0.007) | (0.122) | (0.143) |
|  | Term 2010-2012 | 0.053 | 0.014 | -0.067 | 0.204 |
|  |  | (0.173) | (0.010) | (0.140) | (0.173) |
| Age |  | -0.002 | 0.000 | -0.003 | -0.002 |
|  |  | (0.002) | (0.000) | (0.001) | (0.002) |
| Education (ref=Lower secondary) |  |  |  |
|  | (Upper) secondary | -0.150 | 0.002 | -0.099 | -0.072 |
|  |  | (0.101) | (0.002) | (0.074) | (0.050) |
|  | Post-secondary non-tertiary | -0.054 | 0.005 | 0.082 | 0.179 |
|  |  | (0.105) | (0.004) | (0.083) | (0.129) |
|  | First stage of tertiary | -0.126 | 0.003 | -0.064 | -0.051 |
|  |  | (0.089) | (0.003) | (0.065) | (0.038) |
|  | Second stage of tertiary | -0.112 | 0.003 | -0.089 | -0.081 |
|  |  | (0.087) | (0.002) | (0.073) | (0.049) |
| Year of first election | 0.001 | -0.000 | -0.005 | -0.006 |
|  |  | (0.004) | (0.000) | (0.003) | (0.002) |
| Position on election list | 0.002 | -0.000 | -0.004 | -0.000 |
|  |  | (0.002) | (0.000) | (0.002) | (0.002) |
| Year |  | -0.005 | -0.000 | 0.007 | -0.008 |
|  |  | (0.011) | (0.001) | (0.010) | (0.010) |
| Party (ref=CDA) |  |  |  |  |
|  | CU | -0.054 | 0.003 | -0.107 | 0.044 |
|  |  | (0.083) | (0.003) | (0.049) | (0.064) |
|  | D66 | 0.025 | 0.003 | 0.026 | -0.008 |
|  |  | (0.079) | (0.003) | (0.050) | (0.055) |
|  | GL | 0.183 | 0.002 | -0.062 | 0.035 |
|  |  | (0.138) | (0.003) | (0.041) | (0.050) |
|  | LPF | 0.087 | 0.003 | -0.043 | -0.061 |
|  |  | (0.082) | (0.003) | (0.046) | (0.058) |
|  | PVV | 0.239 | 0.000 | 0.078 | 0.291 |
|  |  | (0.148) | (0.003) | (0.052) | (0.110) |
|  | PvdA | 0.022 | 0.003 | 0.055 | 0.049 |
|  |  | (0.059) | (0.002) | (0.046) | (0.028) |
|  | SP | 0.041 | 0.001 | -0.035 | -0.015 |
|  |  | (0.068) | (0.002) | (0.050) | (0.045) |
|  | VVD | 0.007 | 0.002 | 0.033 | 0.054 |
|  |  | (0.067) | (0.002) | (0.050) | (0.050) |
| Constant | 7.169 | 1.475 | -3.054 | 27.935 |
|  |  | (18.505) | (1.168) | (17.964) | (21.785) |
| N |   | 2819 | 2819 | 2819 | 2819 |
| r2 |   | 0.07 | 0.00 | 0.03 | 0.02 |

Note: Ordinary Least Squares regression coefficients with standard errors in parentheses. Dependent variable is the number of social markers, multiplied by 100 for readability. The models in this table are used to produce Figure 2.

**Appendix Table 4.3. Full models for Figure 3.**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|   |   | Dutch | Regional Dutch | Dual Citizenship | Non-Dutch | Non-western | Western | Refugee | Allochtoon | Migrant | Ethnicity | Dutch language | Race |
| Ethnic minority | 0.029 | 0.001 | 0.009 | 0.014 | 0.232 | -0.002 | 0.009 | 0.057 | 0.062 | 0.004 | 0.011 | 0.019 |
|  |  | (0.015) | (0.038) | (0.008) | (0.016) | (0.054) | (0.001) | (0.009) | (0.018) | (0.022) | (0.004) | (0.005) | (0.010) |
| Woman | -0.001 | 0.012 | -0.001 | 0.000 | -0.007 | -0.001 | -0.000 | 0.003 | -0.003 | -0.000 | 0.005 | -0.003 |
|  |  | (0.005) | (0.021) | (0.005) | (0.005) | (0.019) | (0.001) | (0.004) | (0.006) | (0.006) | (0.001) | (0.003) | (0.003) |
| Ethnic minority # Woman | 0.017 | 0.007 | 0.033 | 0.009 | -0.012 | 0.002 | 0.019 | -0.023 | -0.018 | 0.001 | -0.008 | 0.005 |
|  |  | (0.023) | (0.047) | (0.022) | (0.025) | (0.080) | (0.001) | (0.024) | (0.024) | (0.027) | (0.006) | (0.007) | (0.015) |
| Term (ref=1994-1998) |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Term 1998-2002 | -0.008 | -0.090 | 0.026 | -0.037 | 0.196 | 0.006 | 0.012 | 0.040 | 0.077 | -0.011 | 0.007 | -0.012 |
|  |  | (0.030) | (0.064) | (0.029) | (0.030) | (0.073) | (0.005) | (0.023) | (0.035) | (0.030) | (0.008) | (0.007) | (0.014) |
|  | Term 2002-2003 | -0.013 | -0.063 | 0.042 | -0.033 | 0.208 | 0.000 | 0.004 | -0.007 | 0.078 | -0.002 | 0.014 | -0.013 |
|  |  | (0.034) | (0.081) | (0.041) | (0.036) | (0.079) | (0.001) | (0.021) | (0.030) | (0.048) | (0.012) | (0.011) | (0.013) |
|  | Term 2003-2006 | -0.006 | -0.135 | 0.054 | -0.034 | 0.188 | -0.000 | -0.001 | -0.017 | 0.069 | -0.017 | 0.001 | -0.017 |
|  |  | (0.045) | (0.092) | (0.051) | (0.049) | (0.082) | (0.002) | (0.022) | (0.037) | (0.055) | (0.011) | (0.008) | (0.016) |
|  | Term 2006-2010 | -0.001 | -0.161 | 0.075 | -0.048 | 0.195 | 0.000 | -0.010 | -0.025 | 0.082 | -0.022 | 0.003 | -0.026 |
|  |  | (0.070) | (0.113) | (0.075) | (0.075) | (0.095) | (0.002) | (0.025) | (0.045) | (0.067) | (0.014) | (0.010) | (0.023) |
|  | Term 2010-2012 | -0.013 | -0.179 | 0.092 | -0.060 | 0.224 | 0.001 | -0.015 | -0.028 | 0.107 | -0.027 | 0.005 | -0.027 |
|  |  | (0.085) | (0.142) | (0.098) | (0.098) | (0.117) | (0.002) | (0.031) | (0.055) | (0.088) | (0.017) | (0.014) | (0.030) |
| Age |  | -0.001 | 0.001 | -0.001 | -0.000 | 0.000 | -0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | -0.000 | 0.000 |
|  |  | (0.000) | (0.001) | (0.000) | (0.000) | (0.001) | (0.000) | (0.000) | (0.000) | (0.000) | (0.000) | (0.000) | (0.000) |
| Education (ref=Lower secondary) |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | (Upper) secondary | 0.007 | -0.025 | -0.008 | 0.014 | 0.065 | 0.004 | 0.013 | 0.004 | 0.014 | -0.015 | -0.009 | 0.020 |
|  |  | (0.022) | (0.153) | (0.016) | (0.015) | (0.070) | (0.002) | (0.013) | (0.020) | (0.024) | (0.007) | (0.007) | (0.010) |
|  | Post-secondary non-tertiary | 0.031 | 0.347 | 0.024 | 0.008 | 0.156 | 0.005 | 0.017 | 0.027 | 0.042 | -0.014 | -0.014 | 0.023 |
|  |  | (0.027) | (0.203) | (0.023) | (0.020) | (0.069) | (0.003) | (0.012) | (0.023) | (0.027) | (0.005) | (0.007) | (0.013) |
|  | First stage of tertiary | 0.015 | -0.052 | -0.004 | 0.012 | 0.138 | 0.005 | 0.019 | 0.026 | 0.032 | -0.014 | -0.009 | 0.020 |
|  |  | (0.022) | (0.149) | (0.013) | (0.017) | (0.067) | (0.003) | (0.012) | (0.020) | (0.025) | (0.005) | (0.005) | (0.011) |
|  | Second stage of tertiary | 0.003 | -0.106 | -0.009 | 0.006 | 0.084 | 0.004 | 0.019 | 0.011 | 0.020 | -0.016 | -0.011 | 0.018 |
|  |  | (0.022) | (0.154) | (0.016) | (0.012) | (0.076) | (0.002) | (0.012) | (0.020) | (0.024) | (0.005) | (0.006) | (0.011) |
| Year of first election | 0.000 | 0.005 | -0.003 | 0.001 | -0.004 | 0.000 | 0.000 | -0.000 | -0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | -0.000 |
|  |  | (0.001) | (0.002) | (0.002) | (0.001) | (0.003) | (0.000) | (0.000) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.000) | (0.000) | (0.001) |
| Position on election list | -0.000 | 0.004 | -0.001 | 0.000 | -0.000 | -0.000 | 0.000 | -0.001 | -0.000 | 0.000 | -0.000 | 0.000 |
|  |  | (0.000) | (0.002) | (0.001) | (0.000) | (0.002) | (0.000) | (0.000) | (0.001) | (0.000) | (0.000) | (0.000) | (0.000) |
| Year |  | -0.001 | 0.004 | -0.003 | 0.002 | -0.017 | -0.000 | -0.000 | 0.000 | -0.008 | 0.001 | -0.001 | 0.002 |
|  |  | (0.006) | (0.008) | (0.004) | (0.007) | (0.007) | (0.000) | (0.002) | (0.003) | (0.005) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.002) |
| Party (ref=CDA) |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | CU | -0.018 | 0.002 | 0.008 | -0.005 | 0.023 | -0.001 | 0.001 | -0.015 | 0.003 | 0.001 | -0.010 | 0.009 |
|  |  | (0.016) | (0.059) | (0.017) | (0.009) | (0.092) | (0.002) | (0.012) | (0.025) | (0.024) | (0.002) | (0.008) | (0.011) |
|  | D66 | -0.006 | 0.019 | 0.016 | -0.009 | 0.099 | -0.000 | -0.003 | -0.018 | 0.010 | -0.002 | -0.010 | 0.022 |
|  |  | (0.012) | (0.051) | (0.020) | (0.009) | (0.075) | (0.001) | (0.009) | (0.022) | (0.018) | (0.002) | (0.007) | (0.019) |
|  | GL | -0.007 | 0.023 | 0.008 | -0.003 | -0.006 | -0.001 | 0.017 | -0.023 | -0.008 | -0.000 | -0.008 | 0.002 |
|  |  | (0.014) | (0.028) | (0.013) | (0.008) | (0.068) | (0.001) | (0.017) | (0.021) | (0.017) | (0.002) | (0.007) | (0.007) |
|  | LPF | -0.002 | -0.061 | 0.019 | -0.006 | -0.002 | -0.001 | -0.004 | -0.004 | -0.002 | -0.003 | 0.001 | 0.008 |
|  |  | (0.012) | (0.044) | (0.019) | (0.006) | (0.049) | (0.001) | (0.006) | (0.016) | (0.015) | (0.005) | (0.007) | (0.008) |
|  | PVV | 0.002 | -0.039 | 0.037 | 0.001 | 0.024 | -0.000 | 0.004 | -0.012 | -0.007 | -0.001 | -0.005 | 0.001 |
|  |  | (0.015) | (0.059) | (0.027) | (0.008) | (0.093) | (0.001) | (0.010) | (0.026) | (0.025) | (0.002) | (0.007) | (0.008) |
|  | PvdA | 0.006 | 0.023 | 0.030 | 0.004 | 0.081 | -0.000 | 0.001 | 0.004 | 0.021 | 0.002 | -0.004 | 0.009 |
|  |  | (0.012) | (0.030) | (0.023) | (0.005) | (0.058) | (0.001) | (0.008) | (0.019) | (0.015) | (0.002) | (0.006) | (0.007) |
|  | SP | 0.012 | 0.010 | 0.013 | -0.000 | 0.037 | 0.006 | 0.011 | -0.016 | 0.012 | 0.002 | -0.005 | 0.008 |
|  |  | (0.021) | (0.044) | (0.013) | (0.007) | (0.058) | (0.003) | (0.010) | (0.018) | (0.017) | (0.002) | (0.006) | (0.006) |
|  | VVD | 0.007 | 0.019 | 0.007 | 0.025 | 0.015 | -0.001 | 0.002 | -0.009 | 0.010 | 0.002 | -0.004 | 0.023 |
|  |  | (0.018) | (0.032) | (0.016) | (0.022) | (0.066) | (0.001) | (0.009) | (0.022) | (0.020) | (0.003) | (0.007) | (0.015) |
| Constant | 1.324 | -19.297 | 12.035 | -4.789 | 41.595 | 0.137 | -0.220 | -0.027 | 15.507 | -3.035 | 1.521 | -2.652 |
|  |  | (11.616) | (17.360) | (12.547) | (14.030) | (16.608) | (0.185) | (3.393) | (6.794) | (11.430) | (1.837) | (2.014) | (3.536) |
| N |   | 2819 | 2819 | 2819 | 2819 | 2819 | 2819 | 2819 | 2819 | 2819 | 2819 | 2819 | 2819 |
| r2 |   | 0.03 | 0.04 | 0.03 | 0.02 | 0.12 | 0.01 | 0.03 | 0.04 | 0.04 | 0.01 | 0.01 | 0.02 |

Note: Ordinary Least Squares regression coefficients with standard errors in parentheses. Dependent variable is the number of social markers, multiplied by 100 for readability. The models in this table are used to produce Figure 3.

**Appendix Table 4.4. Full models for Figure 4.**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|   |   | Religiosity markers |
| Ethnic minority | -0.672 |
|  |  | (0.710) |
| Muslim | 11.546 |
|  |  | (1.951) |
| Other religions | 2.130 |
|  |  | (1.565) |
| Religion unknown | 0.665 |
|  |  | (1.170) |
| Ethnic minority # Other religions | -1.258 |
|  |  | (1.413) |
| Ethnic minority # Religion unknown | 1.901 |
|  |  | (1.272) |
| Term (ref=1994-1998) |  |
|  | Term 1998-2002 | 3.864 |
|  |  | (2.382) |
|  | Term 2002-2003 | -2.328 |
|  |  | (3.489) |
|  | Term 2003-2006 | -1.821 |
|  |  | (4.971) |
|  | Term 2006-2010 | -3.905 |
|  |  | (7.079) |
|  | Term 2010-2012 | -6.411 |
|  |  | (8.675) |
| Age |  | 0.090 |
|  |  | (0.046) |
| Education (ref=Lower secondary) |  |
|  | (Upper) secondary | 3.484 |
|  |  | (2.021) |
|  | Post-secondary non-tertiary | 2.218 |
|  |  | (2.117) |
|  | First stage of tertiary | 4.650 |
|  |  | (1.821) |
|  | Second stage of tertiary | 3.444 |
|  |  | (1.807) |
| Year of first election | 0.127 |
|  |  | (0.107) |
| Position on election list | -0.033 |
|  |  | (0.036) |
| Year |  | 0.275 |
|  |  | (0.583) |
| Party (ref=CDA) |  |
|  | CU | -1.710 |
|  |  | (1.708) |
|  | D66 | -3.898 |
|  |  | (2.486) |
|  | GL | -2.176 |
|  |  | (2.271) |
|  | LPF | -2.476 |
|  |  | (1.636) |
|  | PVV | 4.458 |
|  |  | (5.663) |
|  | PvdA | -1.940 |
|  |  | (2.081) |
|  | SP | -0.813 |
|  |  | (1.927) |
|  | VVD | -2.155 |
|  |  | (2.447) |
| Constant | -809.756 |
|  |  | (1160.782) |
| N |   | 2819 |
| r2 |   | 0.03 |

Note: Ordinary Least Squares regression coefficients with standard errors in parentheses. Dependent variable is the number of social markers, multiplied by 100 for readability. The models in this table are used to produce Figure 4.

# Appendix 5: Robustness Checks

**Appendix Table 5.1.** Negative binomial models alternative to Figure 1.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|   | Ethnicity and nationality markers | Gender and relationship markers | Age markers | Social class markers | Religion markers | Ideology markers |
| Ethnic minority | 1.769 | -0.451 | 0.073 | 0.073 | 3.246 | -0.736 |
|  | (0.324) | (0.328) | (0.265) | (0.265) | (0.692) | (0.491) |
| Woman | 0.341 | 0.571 | 0.176 | 0.062 | -0.034 | -0.597 |
|  | (0.289) | (0.213) | (0.175) | (0.198) | (0.735) | (0.296) |
| Ethnic minority # Woman | 0.133 | 0.888 | -0.180 | 0.464 | -1.748 | 0.439 |
|  | (0.413) | (0.475) | (0.414) | (0.362) | (0.895) | (0.673) |
| Term 1998-2002 | 0.202 | -0.251 | 0.108 | 0.380 | 3.027 | 0.157 |
|  | (0.497) | (0.500) | (0.495) | (0.436) | (1.624) | (0.737) |
| Term 2002-2003 | 0.508 | 0.769 | 0.426 | 0.513 | -12.222 | -15.835 |
|  | (0.733) | (0.879) | (0.643) | (0.666) | (1.972) | (1.067) |
| Term 2003-2006 | -0.412 | 0.061 | 0.371 | 0.282 | 2.576 | -1.137 |
|  | (0.822) | (0.826) | (0.803) | (0.794) | (2.710) | (1.305) |
| Term 2006-2010 | -0.695 | -0.108 | 0.557 | 0.697 | 2.140 | -1.604 |
|  | (0.967) | (1.151) | (1.054) | (1.085) | (3.382) | (1.680) |
| Term 2010-2012 | -0.746 | 0.821 | 0.866 | 1.420 | 1.325 | -1.378 |
|  | (1.193) | (1.403) | (1.300) | (1.326) | (4.002) | (1.962) |
| Age | 0.010 | -0.042 | -0.059 | 0.013 | 0.003 | -0.018 |
|  | (0.015) | (0.013) | (0.011) | (0.011) | (0.040) | (0.018) |
| (Upper) secondary | 0.123 | -1.820 | 0.402 | 0.256 | 17.546 | 12.668 |
|  | (1.262) | (0.679) | (0.536) | (0.912) | (1.831) | (1.150) |
| Post-secondary non-tertiary | 2.657 | 1.192 | 1.817 | 1.997 | 7.103 | 12.760 |
|  | (1.241) | (0.881) | (0.493) | (0.914) | (2.600) | (1.275) |
| First stage of tertiary | 0.184 | -1.206 | 0.388 | 0.589 | 17.986 | 13.228 |
|  | (1.129) | (0.571) | (0.450) | (0.840) | (1.533) | (0.983) |
| Second stage of tertiary | -0.822 | -1.462 | 0.087 | 0.177 | 2.813 | 12.820 |
|  | (1.265) | (0.606) | (0.481) | (0.863) | (1.640) | (1.024) |
| Year of first election | 0.046 | -0.064 | -0.024 | 0.094 | -0.047 | -0.051 |
|  | (0.033) | (0.025) | (0.027) | (0.024) | (0.088) | (0.041) |
| Position on election list | 0.011 | -0.013 | -0.002 | -0.010 | -0.088 | 0.010 |
|  | (0.014) | (0.012) | (0.010) | (0.008) | (0.034) | (0.016) |
| Year | -0.055 | -0.030 | -0.074 | -0.230 | 0.016 | 0.122 |
|  | (0.071) | (0.091) | (0.078) | (0.086) | (0.222) | (0.121) |
| CU | -0.630 | -0.864 | 1.063 | -18.851 | -15.695 | -14.269 |
|  | (0.735) | (0.970) | (0.466) | (0.714) | (1.232) | (0.868) |
| D66 | 0.684 | 0.208 | 0.929 | -0.235 | -0.763 | -0.476 |
|  | (0.680) | (0.501) | (0.396) | (0.509) | (1.062) | (1.194) |
| GL | 0.294 | 0.526 | 0.554 | 0.065 | -0.428 | 0.607 |
|  | (0.664) | (0.518) | (0.379) | (0.397) | (0.722) | (0.540) |
| LPF | -0.559 | -0.260 | -0.032 | -0.906 | -15.183 | 1.055 |
|  | (0.561) | (0.633) | (0.356) | (0.333) | (1.051) | (0.515) |
| PVV | 0.196 | 2.791 | 2.356 | 0.574 | 4.408 | -14.763 |
|  | (1.348) | (0.598) | (0.587) | (0.440) | (1.726) | (0.883) |
| PvdA | 1.022 | 0.717 | 1.226 | 0.649 | 0.940 | 0.344 |
|  | (0.535) | (0.381) | (0.267) | (0.340) | (0.753) | (0.435) |
| SP | 0.818 | -0.138 | 1.357 | 0.098 | 0.570 | -0.126 |
|  | (0.701) | (0.454) | (0.431) | (0.505) | (0.797) | (0.636) |
| VVD | 0.643 | 0.598 | 0.979 | 0.186 | 0.316 | 1.504 |
|  | (0.542) | (0.508) | (0.405) | (0.469) | (0.812) | (0.524) |
| Constant | 13.667 | 188.294 | 196.651 | 271.875 | 35.838 | -157.794 |
|  | (150.412) | (187.420) | (169.027) | (174.442) | (520.313) | (257.337) |
| lnalpha | 1.170 | 1.830 | 1.333 | 1.734 | 2.841 | 1.624 |
|  | (0.167) | (0.238) | (0.149) | (0.199) | (0.460) | (0.398) |
| N | 2819 | 2819 | 2819 | 2819 | 2819 | 2819 |
| Note: Negative binomial regression coefficients and their standard errors. |
|  |

**Appendix Table 5.2.** Negative binomial models alternative to Figure 2.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|   | Relationship | Sexuality | Gender |
| Ethnic minority | -0.086 | -0.329 | -1.089 |
|  | (0.566) | (0.470) | (0.638) |
| Woman | 0.307 | 0.969 | 0.156 |
|  | (0.407) | (0.224) | (0.367) |
| Ethnic minority # Woman | 1.395 | 0.349 | 0.547 |
|  | (0.947) | (0.508) | (0.805) |
| Term 1998-2002 | -1.071 | -0.024 | 0.942 |
|  | (0.918) | (0.776) | (0.814) |
| Term 2002-2003 | 0.145 | 0.425 | 3.393 |
|  | (1.503) | (0.975) | (1.811) |
| Term 2003-2006 | -1.276 | -0.230 | 2.685 |
|  | (1.491) | (1.050) | (1.360) |
| Term 2006-2010 | -1.136 | -1.129 | 2.929 |
|  | (1.908) | (1.359) | (1.703) |
| Term 2010-2012 | 0.120 | -0.320 | 3.923 |
|  | (2.252) | (1.603) | (2.268) |
| Age | -0.023 | -0.038 | -0.056 |
|  | (0.019) | (0.014) | (0.026) |
| (Upper) secondary | -2.149 | -1.718 | -2.600 |
|  | (1.263) | (0.683) | (1.100) |
| Post-secondary non-tertiary | 0.322 | 0.167 | 1.726 |
|  | (1.595) | (0.737) | (1.426) |
| First stage of tertiary | -1.454 | -1.116 | -1.452 |
|  | (1.112) | (0.582) | (0.844) |
| Second stage of tertiary | -1.287 | -1.256 | -2.260 |
|  | (1.167) | (0.649) | (0.948) |
| Year of first election | -0.030 | -0.076 | -0.161 |
|  | (0.049) | (0.027) | (0.051) |
| Position on election list | 0.017 | -0.039 | -0.016 |
|  | (0.023) | (0.016) | (0.025) |
| Year | -0.023 | 0.047 | -0.142 |
|  | (0.154) | (0.102) | (0.129) |
| CU | -13.606 | -17.492 | 1.314 |
|  | (0.879) | (0.795) | (0.976) |
| D66 | 0.466 | 0.118 | -0.833 |
|  | (0.790) | (0.510) | (0.802) |
| GL | 1.728 | -0.894 | 0.971 |
|  | (0.848) | (0.449) | (0.695) |
| LPF | 0.943 | -0.309 | -1.407 |
|  | (1.112) | (0.499) | (1.174) |
| PVV | 2.898 | 0.839 | 4.562 |
|  | (0.921) | (1.005) | (0.724) |
| PvdA | 0.618 | 0.539 | 1.432 |
|  | (0.603) | (0.404) | (0.496) |
| SP | 0.549 | -0.499 | -0.079 |
|  | (0.789) | (0.665) | (0.609) |
| VVD | 0.595 | 0.295 | 1.071 |
|  | (0.727) | (0.466) | (0.810) |
| Constant | 105.369 | 58.494 | 606.107 |
|  | (296.413) | (200.679) | (300.424) |
| lnalpha | 1.906 | 1.383 | 3.273 |
|  | (1.112) | (0.271) | (0.208) |
| N | 2819 | 2819 | 2819 |
| Note: Negative binomial regression coefficients and their standard errors. No model for sexuality markers is displayed, as it did not converge. |
|  |
|  |

**Appendix Table 5.3.** Negative binomial models alternative to Figure 3.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|   | Dutch | Regional Dutch | Dual Citizenship | Non-Dutch | Non-western | Western | Refugee |
| Ethnic minority | 2.985 | 0.263 | 17.267 | 19.560 | 19.793 | 5.021 | 20.034 |
|  | (0.716) | (0.367) | (1.524) | (0.502) | (0.930) | (1.090) | (1.293) |
| Woman | -1.298 | 0.543 | 14.315 | 13.275 | 0.752 | 0.090 | 16.758 |
|  | (0.904) | (0.257) | (2.537) | (1.166) | (1.031) | (1.357) | (0.797) |
| Ethnic minority # Woman | 1.244 | -0.079 | -13.784 | -14.085 | -1.383 | -0.710 | -17.281 |
|  | (0.897) | (0.499) | (2.141) | (1.114) | (1.334) | (1.407) | (0.979) |
| Term 1998-2002 | -1.455 | -1.461 | -27.454 | 2.265 | 0.417 | 2.888 | 1.697 |
|  | (1.906) | (0.656) | (7.242) | (0.633) | (1.861) | (1.126) | (0.933) |
| Term 2002-2003 | -18.453 | -1.118 | -27.478 | 3.806 | -1.492 | 4.349 | 0.731 |
|  | (3.181) | (0.837) | (7.671) | (1.073) | (2.445) | (2.237) | (2.703) |
| Term 2003-2006 | -1.549 | -2.245 | -14.694 | 3.430 | -1.996 | 3.299 | 1.122 |
|  | (3.022) | (1.093) | (10.281) | (1.243) | (2.782) | (2.708) | (2.961) |
| Term 2006-2010 | -1.282 | -2.724 | -17.149 | 3.302 | -3.208 | 3.347 | -22.041 |
|  | (4.163) | (1.291) | (12.281) | (1.215) | (3.422) | (2.796) | (3.368) |
| Term 2010-2012 | -2.604 | -3.064 | -38.149 | 3.646 | -2.722 | 4.949 | 1.992 |
|  | (5.021) | (1.730) | (16.169) | (1.562) | (4.184) | (3.833) | (3.267) |
| Age | -0.115 | 0.009 | -0.094 | -0.081 | -0.035 | 0.002 | -0.056 |
|  | (0.035) | (0.015) | (0.289) | (0.021) | (0.040) | (0.037) | (0.047) |
| (Upper) secondary | -17.309 | -0.115 | -1.799 | -16.873 | -16.714 | 3.088 | -11.400 |
|  | (1.863) | (1.200) | (3.988) | (1.618) | (2.224) | (2.344) | (2.601) |
| Post-secondary non-tertiary | 3.045 | 1.779 | 16.999 | -15.092 | -16.955 | -8.659 | -30.085 |
|  | (1.777) | (1.219) | (8.671) | (1.548) | (1.813) | (2.194) | (2.692) |
| First stage of tertiary | -0.801 | -0.528 | 16.089 | 0.673 | -1.176 | 2.924 | -13.145 |
|  | (0.950) | (1.130) | (1.895) | (0.870) | (0.924) | (1.334) | (2.428) |
| Second stage of tertiary | -15.623 | -1.238 | 0.581 | 0.777 | -15.792 | 3.808 | -27.492 |
|  | (1.127) | (1.196) | (2.457) | (1.608) | (1.627) | (1.923) | (2.324) |
| Year of first election | -0.106 | 0.086 | 0.394 | -0.174 | -0.086 | -0.012 | 0.259 |
|  | (0.105) | (0.032) | (0.357) | (0.047) | (0.094) | (0.075) | (0.161) |
| Position on election list | -0.063 | 0.026 | -0.150 | -0.028 | -0.103 | -0.056 | -0.096 |
|  | (0.041) | (0.013) | (0.122) | (0.019) | (0.042) | (0.033) | (0.092) |
| Year | 0.084 | 0.082 | 0.733 | -0.201 | 0.047 | -0.385 | -0.547 |
|  | (0.314) | (0.101) | (0.669) | (0.086) | (0.218) | (0.203) | (0.234) |
| CU | -16.234 | 0.024 | -7.015 | -16.475 | -17.346 | -12.644 | -16.650 |
|  | (1.184) | (0.938) | (2.969) | (1.215) | (1.495) | (1.467) | (1.282) |
| D66 | -1.943 | 0.265 | -5.911 | 0.556 | -18.530 | 0.063 | -25.557 |
|  | (1.019) | (0.626) | (2.800) | (0.541) | (1.237) | (1.127) | (2.708) |
| GL | -1.445 | 0.416 | -5.768 | -0.430 | -2.257 | -1.088 | -2.686 |
|  | (1.243) | (0.384) | (4.370) | (0.688) | (0.991) | (1.401) | (2.015) |
| LPF | -1.050 | -0.734 | -3.535 | -1.322 | 0.877 | -0.600 | 0.226 |
|  | (1.532) | (0.545) | (6.728) | (0.813) | (1.688) | (1.736) | (1.568) |
| PVV | -14.516 | 0.244 | 13.015 | -16.036 | -16.204 | -12.814 | -16.831 |
|  | (1.332) | (0.756) | (2.137) | (1.195) | (1.406) | (1.366) | (1.590) |
| PvdA | -0.600 | 0.736 | 14.959 | 0.309 | 0.966 | 1.541 | -0.746 |
|  | (0.983) | (0.324) | (2.430) | (0.590) | (0.977) | (0.889) | (1.138) |
| SP | -1.191 | 0.434 | -4.104 | -0.209 | -2.094 | 2.031 | -13.779 |
|  | (1.361) | (0.557) | (6.841) | (0.678) | (1.452) | (1.167) | (1.292) |
| VVD | -0.718 | 0.472 | 14.324 | -0.582 | 0.203 | 0.831 | -0.628 |
|  | (0.855) | (0.390) | (2.682) | (0.655) | (1.023) | (1.027) | (1.942) |
| Constant | 46.234 | -337.009 | -2.3e+03 | 731.238 | 61.985 | 781.999 | 570.799 |
|  | (623.972) | (217.104) | (1812.790) | (188.682) | (494.918) | (498.998) | (470.855) |
| lnalpha | 1.639 | 1.483 | 2.376 | 0.012 | 1.471 | 1.233 | -32.953 |
|  | (0.636) | (0.360) | (1.344) | (0.310) | (0.489) | (0.618) | (.) |
| N | 2819 | 2819 | 2819 | 2819 | 2819 | 2819 | 2819 |
| Note: Negative binomial regression coefficients and their standard errors. The models for dual citizenship, western background, ethnicity, and race did not converge. |
|  |

**Appendix Table 5.4.** Negative binomial models alternative to Figure 4.

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|   | Religiosity markers |
| Ethnic minority | 1.426 |
|  | (0.652) |
| Muslim | 0.836 |
|  | (0.812) |
| Other religions | 0.453 |
|  | (0.708) |
| Religion unknown | -0.936 |
|  | (0.797) |
| Ethnic minority # Other religions | 0.000 |
|  | (.) |
| Ethnic minority # Religion unknown | 0.000 |
|  | (.) |
| Term 1998-2002 | 2.146 |
|  | (1.488) |
| Term 2002-2003 | 0.000 |
|  | (.) |
| Term 2003-2006 | 2.925 |
|  | (2.359) |
| Term 2006-2010 | 2.952 |
|  | (3.060) |
| Term 2010-2012 | 2.847 |
|  | (3.606) |
| Age | -0.009 |
|  | (0.027) |
| (Upper) secondary | -0.628 |
|  | (0.759) |
| Post-secondary non-tertiary | 0.000 |
|  | (.) |
| First stage of tertiary | 0.000 |
|  | (.) |
| Second stage of tertiary | 0.000 |
|  | (.) |
| Year of first election | -0.016 |
|  | (0.089) |
| Position on election list | -0.007 |
|  | (0.019) |
| Year | -0.151 |
|  | (0.215) |
| CU | 0.000 |
|  | (.) |
| D66 | -0.877 |
|  | (0.692) |
| GL | 0.264 |
|  | (0.779) |
| LPF | 0.000 |
|  | (.) |
| PVV | 2.123 |
|  | (1.455) |
| PvdA | -0.337 |
|  | (0.602) |
| SP | 0.660 |
|  | (0.678) |
| VVD | 0.347 |
|  | (0.653) |
| Constant | 328.026 |
|  | (418.926) |
| N | 2089 |
| Note: Logistic regression coefficients and their standard errors. The dependent variable is a dummy indicating whether a religious identity marker was used in the newspaper article. Negative binomial models on the number of religiosity markers per article did not converge. |
|  |
|  |
|  |