|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Arguments comparing groups A and B (Scenario 1) | Percentage scoring the  argument 5-7 (persuasive) | | Diff(V1-V2)  (95% CI) |
| V1 (*n* = 34) | V2 (*n* = 32) |
| *Arguments in favour of group A* |  |  |  |
| (a) They will benefit more from treatment in terms of their quality of life. | 0.47 | 0.34 | 0.1268  (-0.1263 to 0.359) |
| (b) Treating people in group A will do more to increase health overall. | 0.59 | 0.59 | 0.0055  (-0.2401 to 0.249) |
| (c) In all likelihood they will be able to contribute more to society economically. | 0.59 | 0.66 | 0.068  (-0.1796 to 0.3036) |
| (d) In all likelihood they will be able to contribute more to their family and friends. | 0.27 | 0.48 | 0.204  (-0.0474 to 0.4266) |
| (e) The more people in group A that are treated the fewer disabled people there will be. | 0.21 | 0.28 | 0.0754  (-0.1496 to 0.2949) |
| (f) It is fair to give most of the budget to group A, because they have the most to lose if not treated: the  prospect of full health. | 0.3 | 0.34 | 0.0496  (-0.188 to 0.2827) |
| *Arguments in favour of group B* |  |  |  |
| (g) It is fair to give most of the budget to group B to make up for the poor health they have experienced  in the past. | 0.23 | 0.25 | 0.0147  (-0.2069 to 0.2381) |
| (h) It is fair to give most of the budget to group B so that the amount of health the two groups experience  over the course of their lifetime is more equal. | 0.11 | 0.34 | 0.2261  (0.0008 to 0.4306) |
| (i) The people in Group B are members of the disability community and deserve special consideration. | 0.23 | 0.37 | 0.1397  (-0.1003 to 0.3631) |
| *Arguments in favour of equal division* |  |  |  |
| (j) Fairness requires treating both groups equally. Therefore the budget should be divided equally. | 0.71 | 0.41 | 0.2996  (0.0391 to 0.5134) |
| (k) Returning the people in group B to 55% of full health is just as important to them as returning the  people in group A to full health. Therefore the budget should be divided equally. | 0.82 | 0.81 | 0.011  (-0.1953 to 0.2208) |
| (l) It is wrong to discriminate against the disabled. Therefore the budget should be divided equally. | 0.73 | 0.59 | 0.1415  (-0.1033 to 0.3682) |
| (m) No one should be abandoned by the health system. Therefore the budget should be divided equally. | 0.67 | 0.69 | 0.011  (-0.2263 to 0.2443) |
| (n) No one should play God. Therefore the budget should be divided equally. | 0.65 | 0.40 | 0.2408  (-0.0196 to 0.463) |
| (o) Everyone deserves treatment. Therefore the budget should be divided equally. | 0.73 | 0.47 | 0.2665  (0.0101 to 0.4832) |
| (p) Everyone has a right to treatment. Therefore the budget should be divided equally. | 0.76 | 0.59 | 0.171  (-0.0729 to 0.393) |
| (q) It is too difficult to choose. Therefore the budget should be divided equally. | 0.35 | 0.09 | 0.2592  (0.0341 to 0.4542) |

**Supplementary Table 5.** Arguments in support of health maximisation (group A), potential to benefit (group B), and equal division of the budget, by questionnaire version: Percentage agreeing and 95% confidence intervals.