## Appendix A

Table 1. Coding and categorization of private members’ bills by issue area

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Issue Areas** | **Examples for Types of Bills Categorized** |
| **Women’s Rights and Equality**  | Increasing the penalties for sexual assault and domestic violence, increasing women shelters, having women quota for the Constitutional Court, relaxing dress code for women in the public offices and parliament, enabling women to pass their surname to their children, increasing the duration for paid and unpaid maternity leave, increasing breastfeeding breaks, nursery and breastfeeding rooms in workplace, enabling domestic workers to get national insurance. |
| **Children and Family** | Increasing penalties for crimes against children (sexual abuse, violence abduction), measures for preventing child marriage (child brides), juvenile crime and justice system, protection of convicted parents’ children, regulation of orphanages, children’s health/welfare, protection of minors from drug and substance abuse, restrictions for child labor, education assistance programs for children with special needs, family assistance programs, leave permission for family matters such as marriage, death and terminally ill in family, financial support to families, elderly education, children/elderly offices of the Ministry of Family and Social Policies. |
| **Education** | Amendments in the public education curriculum, funding of public schools, opening new schools and universities, stationery and financial assistance to students, quotas for disadvantage groups (disabled, minorities, child of a martyr etc.) in higher education institutions, promotion of the right to education, issues related to education personnel.  |
| **Health and Social Affairs** | Issues related to provision and financing of national health care service system including short/long-term welfare benefits and universal health insurance provided by Social Security Institution, health cards for low income people, increasing the range of health care services, community health care, contagious diseases, personnel in health care system. |
| **Economy** | Economic development, incentives and regulations for increasing employment, investments, and exports, industrial policies, domestic commerce, regulation of banking system, regulations related to various sectors and professions, regulations related to labor and labor unions.  |
| **Agriculture** | Issues of rural areas and agriculture, use of public lands for agriculture, forest law, financial assistance to farmers, restructuring nonperforming loans of farmers, water wells, tax-free agricultural equipment.  |
| **Fiscal Affairs** | Income and expenditure issues of public institutions, tax system, value-added tax, income tax, special consumption tax, motor vehicle tax, reregulating taxed services and goods, tax exemption for workers and pensioners in various sectors, tax-free natural gas in some provinces, appointment and employment of public officials. |
| **Defense** | Fight against terrorism, domestic security, national defense, military and security personnel, compulsory military service, paid military service, military courts, village guard system, use of force by the police, benefits martyrs’ families, associations for military personnel. |

## Appendix B

Table 1A. Determinants of bill sponsorship by MPs in various issue areas, 2011-2015 (Generalized Linear Models)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Variables** | **Women’s Rights & Equality** | **Children & Family** | **Education** | **Health & Social Affairs** | **Economy** | **Agriculture** | **Fiscal Affairs** | **Defense** |
| Women | 1.551\*\*\* | 0.698\*\*\* | 0.154 | 0.077 | 0.068 | 0.001 | -0.342 | -0.446\*\* |
|  | (0.276) | (0.201) | (0.196) | (0.143) | (0.149) | (0.199) | (0.221) | (0.180) |
| Ideology | -0.474\*\*\* | 0.127\*\*\* | 0.078\* | -0.230\*\*\* | 0.113\*\*\* | -0.072\* | -0.086\* | -0.198\*\*\* |
|  | (0.070) | (0.033) | (0.041) | (0.029) | (0.028) | (0.041) | (0.044) | (0.040) |
| Relevant Committee Membership | 0.158 | 0.309 | 0.618\*\* | 0.166 | 0.560\*\*\* | 0.840\*\*\* | 0.590\*\*\* | 0.252 |
|  | (0.335) | (0.247) | (0.256) | (0.257) | (0.137) | (0.207) | (0.160) | (0.253) |
| Legislative Experience  | 0.051 | -0.011 | 0.206\*\*\* | -0.173\*\* | -0.185\*\* | 0.065 | -0.152\*\* | -0.019 |
|  | (0.142) | (0.100) | (0.080) | (0.070) | (0.078) | (0.081) | (0.073) | (0.103) |
| Province Level Life Index | 1.088 | 0.845 | 2.225\*\*\* | 1.493\*\* | 0.015 | 2.197\*\*\* | -0.291 | 0.903 |
|  | (1.018) | (0.900) | (0.736) | (0.617) | (0.585) | (0.746) | (0.778) | (0.818) |
| Role in Party Organization  | -0.385 | -0.017 | -0.108 | -0.125 | 0.036 | 0.068 | -0.277\* | -0.124 |
|  | (0.310) | (0.206) | (0.157) | (0.111) | (0.138) | (0.145) | (0.149) | (0.157) |
| CSO Membership | 0.117 | -0.090 | -0.062 | 0.101 | 0.290\*\* | -0.006 | -0.085 | 0.280\* |
|  | (0.298) | (0.181) | (0.141) | (0.102) | (0.122) | (0.139) | (0.129) | (0.150) |
| Relevant Occupation  |  |  | 0.581\* | 0.731\*\*\* | -0.281\*\* |  | 0.367\*\*\* |  |
|  |  |  | (0.338) | (0.246) | (0.119) |  | (0.136) |  |
| Age  | -0.095 | 0.005 | 0.069 | 0.023 | 0.023 | 0.143\* | 0.010 | -0.073 |
|  | (0.116) | (0.095) | (0.081) | (0.048) | (0.053) | (0.073) | (0.072) | (0.067) |
| Age2 | 0.086 | -0.010 | -0.063 | -0.013 | -0.019 | -0.141\* | -0.013 | 0.074 |
|  | (0.115) | (0.096) | (0.080) | (0.048) | (0.054) | (0.073) | (0.067) | (0.067) |
| Bachelor’s Degree | -0.424 | 0.731 | -0.075 | 0.117 | -0.320 | 0.065 | -0.220 | 0.267 |
|  | (0.594) | (0.548) | (0.312) | (0.275) | (0.278) | (0.322) | (0.289) | (0.320) |
| Master’s Degree and Higher | -0.202 | 0.634 | 0.077 | 0.137 | -0.537\* | -0.071 | -0.443 | 0.402 |
|  | (0.545) | (0.573) | (0.316) | (0.287) | (0.280) | (0.343) | (0.285) | (0.338) |
| Total Proportion of Bills Sponsored by MP | 21.357\*\*\* | 2.028 | 15.133\*\*\* | 11.332 | 0.724 | 8.721 | 14.431\*\* | 13.604\*\* |
| (6.013) | (5.121) | (5.504) | (7.136) | (4.596) | (6.071) | (5.808) | (6.746) |
| Constant | -0.294 | -5.738\*\* | -6.613\*\*\* | -2.892\*\* | -3.562\*\* | -7.716\*\*\* | -1.887 | -1.428 |
|  | (2.834) | (2.370) | (2.105) | (1.287) | (1.451) | (1.927) | (2.334) | (1.771) |
| Observations | 530 | 530 | 530 | 530 | 530 | 530 | 530 | 530 |
| Log Likelihood | -29.16 | -47.10 | -90.65 | -117.4 | -104.3 | -70.10 | -96.39 | -62.35 |
| Chi-square | 205.5 | 47.76 | 38.59 | 242.5 | 60.60 | 45.39 | 82.32 | 57.29 |

GLM coefficient estimates with robust standard errors in parentheses, \*\*\* p<0.01, \*\* p<0.05, \* p<0.1.

Table 1B. Marginal effects on the proportion of bills sponsored on issue areas

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Variables**  | **Women’s Rights & Equality** | **Children & Family** | **Education** | **Health & Social Affairs** | **Economy** | **Agriculture** | **Fiscal Affairs** | **Defense** |
| Women | 0.0329\*\*\* | 0.0199\*\*\* | 0.0088 | 0.0064 | 0.0046 | 0.00002 | -0.0185\* | -0.0131\*\*\* |
|  | (0.0094) | (0.0071) | (0.0117) | (0.0122) | (0.0102) | (0.0077) | (0.0108) | (0.0047) |
| Ideology | -0.00715\*\*\* | 0.0029\*\*\* | 0.0042\* | -0.0189\*\*\* | 0.0075\*\*\* | -0.00278\* | -0.0052\* | -0.0067\*\*\* |
|  | (0.0013) | (0.0008) | (0.0023) | (0.0024) | (0.0019) | (0.00157) | (0.0028) | (0.0013) |
| Relevant Committee Membership | 0.00250 | 0.0080 | 0.0419\* | 0.0143 | 0.0445\*\*\* | 0.0456\*\*\* | 0.0429\*\*\* | 0.0094 |
|  | (0.0055) | (0.0071) | (0.0215) | (0.0232) | (0.0127) | (0.0150) | (0.0138) | (0.0104) |
| Legislative Experience | 0.0008 | -0.0003 | 0.0112\*\* | -0.0143\*\* | -0.0122\*\* | 0.00252 | -0.0091\*\* | -0.0007 |
|  | (0.0022) | (0.0023) | (0.0044) | (0.0057) | (0.0050) | (0.00317) | (0.0043) | (0.0035) |
| Province Level Life Index | 0.0164 | 0.0193 | 0.121\*\*\* | 0.123\*\* | 0.0010 | 0.0849\*\*\* | -0.0175 | 0.0306 |
|  | (0.0148) | (0.0205) | (0.0407) | (0.0503) | (0.0386) | (0.0294) | (0.0470) | (0.0276) |
| Role in Party Organization | -0.0056 | -0.0004 | -0.0058 | -0.0101 | 0.0024 | 0.00265 | -0.0160\* | -0.0041 |
|  | (0.0046) | (0.0047) | (0.0083) | (0.0088) | (0.0093) | (0.00572) | (0.0084) | (0.0052) |
| CSO Membership | 0.00175 | -0.0021 | -0.0034 | 0.00830 | 0.0190\*\* | -0.000249 | -0.0051 | 0.0094\* |
|  | (0.0044) | (0.0042) | (0.0077) | (0.0083) | (0.0081) | (0.00536) | (0.0079) | (0.0050) |
| Relevant Occupation |  |  | 0.0399 | 0.0729\*\* | -0.0179\*\* |  | 0.0243\*\* |  |
|  |  |  | (0.0285) | (0.0299) | (0.0074) |  | (0.0096) |  |
| Age  | -0.0001 | -0.0001 | 0.0002 | 0.0008 | 0.0003 | 0.00003 | -0.0002 | 0.0001 |
|  | (0.0002) | (0.0002) | (0.0004) | (0.0005) | (0.0005) | (0.0003) | (0.0006) | (0.0003) |
| Bachelor’s Degree  | -0.0069 | 0.0128\* | -0.0039 | 0.0092 | -0.0256 | 0.0026 | -0.0154 | 0.00774 |
|  | (0.0112) | (0.0070) | (0.016) | (0.0208) | (0.0248) | (0.0124) | (0.0215) | (0.0084) |
| Master’s Degree and Higher | -0.0036 | 0.0106 | 0.0043 | 0.0109 | -0.0395 | -0.0027 | -0.0283 | 0.0124 |
|  | (0.0105) | (0.0077) | (0.0174) | (0.0219) | (0.0246) | (0.0130) | (0.0208) | (0.0092) |
| Total Proportion of Bills Sponsored by MP | 0.322\*\*\* | 0.0463 | 0.821\*\*\* | 0.931 | 0.0478 | 0.337 | 0.867\*\* | 0.460\*\* |
|  | (0.0980) | (0.115) | (0.296) | (0.587) | (0.302) | (0.234) | (0.344) | (0.231) |
| Observations | 530 | 530 | 530 | 530 | 530 | 530 | 530 | 530 |

Marginal effects of each independent variable on bill sponsorship are calculated from GLM in Table 1A, holding other variables at their mean values. Robust standard errors are in parentheses, \*\*\* p<0.01, \*\* p<0.05, \* p<0.1.

Table 2A. Determinants of bill sponsorship on women’s domain issues, 2011-2015 (Generalized Linear Models)

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Variables** | **Women's Rights & Equality** | **Children & Family** | **Education** | **Health & Social Affairs** |
| Women from Left Parties | 3.011\*\*\* | -1.166\*\*\* | 0.288 | 1.343\*\*\* |
|  | (0.609) | (0.349) | (0.317) | (0.278) |
| Men from Right Parties | -0.814 | -0.787\*\*\* | -0.0446 | -0.0574 |
|  | (0.646) | (0.227) | (0.296) | (0.262) |
| Men from Left Parties | 1.199\* | -1.487\*\*\* | 0.0987 | 1.212\*\*\* |
|  | (0.617) | (0.261) | (0.298) | (0.263) |
| Relevant Committee Membership | 0.185 | 0.271 | 0.637\*\*\* | 0.262 |
|  | (0.371) | (0.249) | (0.246) | (0.257) |
| Legislative Experience | 0.0631 | -0.0194 | 0.252\*\*\* | -0.147\*\* |
|  | (0.145) | (0.0994) | (0.0807) | (0.0681) |
| Province Level Life Index | -0.967 | 0.974 | 2.380\*\*\* | 0.964 |
|  | (1.052) | (0.882) | (0.722) | (0.596) |
| Role in Party Organization | -0.341 | -0.0175 | -0.125 | -0.122 |
|  | (0.335) | (0.204) | (0.157) | (0.106) |
| CSO Membership | 0.0317 | -0.0889 | -0.0990 | 0.0822 |
|  | (0.312) | (0.178) | (0.144) | (0.0972) |
| Relevant Occupation |  |  | 0.592\* | 0.659\*\*\* |
|  |  |  | (0.331) | (0.246) |
| Age | -0.127 | 0.0138 | 0.0779 | 0.0137 |
|  | (0.116) | (0.0967) | (0.0818) | (0.0453) |
| Age2 | 0.0011 | -0.0002 | -0.0008 | -0.0001 |
|  | (0.0012) | (0.0001) | (0.0008) | (0.0005) |
| Bachelor’s Degree | -0.457 | 0.629 | 0.0439 | 0.121 |
|  | (0.621) | (0.545) | (0.327) | (0.249) |
| Master’s Degree and Higher | -0.324 | 0.533 | 0.260 | 0.165 |
|  | (0.568) | (0.565) | (0.329) | (0.260) |
| Total Proportion of Bills Sponsored by MP | 20.28\*\*\* | 7.562\* | 10.86\*\* | 5.958 |
| (5.460) | (4.244) | (5.305) | (5.744) |
| Constant | -0.631 | -4.302\* | -6.437\*\*\* | -3.954\*\*\* |
|  | (2.693) | (2.392) | (2.064) | (1.255) |
| Observations | 530 | 530 | 530 | 530 |
| Log Likelihood | -28.57 | -46.82 | -90.85 | -114.9 |
| Chi-square | 261.4 | 62.43 | 47.27 | 330.5 |
| GLM coefficient estimates with robust standard errors in parentheses, \*\*\* p<0.01, \*\* p<0.05, \* p<0.1. |

Table 2B. Marginal effects on the proportion of bills sponsored on women’s domain issues

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Variables** | **Women's Rights & Equality** | **Children & Family** | **Education** | **Health & Social Affairs** |
| Women from Left Parties | 0.127\*\* | -0.0172\*\*\* | 0.0175 | 0.161\*\*\* |
|  | (0.0550) | (0.0035) | (0.0213) | (0.0440) |
| Men from Right Parties | -0.0100 | -0.0213\*\*\* | -0.0024 | -0.0047 |
|  | (0.0070) | (0.0074) | (0.0162) | (0.0212) |
| Men from Left Parties | 0.0212\* | -0.0258\*\*\* | 0.0055 | 0.118\*\*\* |
|  | (0.0128) | (0.0044) | (0.0168) | (0.0304) |
| Relevant Committee Membership | 0.0029 | 0.0069 | 0.0436\*\* | 0.0230 |
|  | (0.0062) | (0.0069) | (0.0210) | (0.0241) |
| Legislative Experience | 0.00095 | -0.0004 | 0.0137\*\*\* | -0.0119\*\* |
|  | (0.0022) | (0.0023) | (0.0045) | (0.0054) |
| Province Level Life Index | -0.0145 | 0.0222 | 0.129\*\*\* | 0.0783 |
|  | (0.0164) | (0.0200) | (0.0406) | (0.0481) |
| Role in Party Organization | -0.0049 | -0.0004 | -0.0067 | -0.0098 |
|  | (0.0049) | (0.0046) | (0.0083) | (0.0084) |
| CSO Membership | 0.00047 | -0.0020 | -0.0054 | 0.0067 |
|  | (0.0047) | (0.0041) | (0.0079) | (0.0079) |
| Relevant Occupation |  |  | 0.0409 | 0.0636\*\* |
|  |  |  | (0.0282) | (0.0284) |
| Age | -0.0003 | 0.00003 | 0.00007 | 0.0003 |
|  | (0.0002) | (0.0002) | (0.0004) | (0.0005) |
| Bachelor’s Degree | -0.0076 | 0.0115 | 0.0022 | 0.0094 |
|  | (0.0121) | (0.0074) | (0.0159) | (0.0185) |
| Master’s Degree and Higher | -0.0057 | 0.0092 | 0.0141 | 0.0130 |
|  | (0.0113) | (0.0081) | (0.0164) | (0.0195) |
| Total Proportion of Bills Sponsored by MP | 0.304\*\*\* | 0.172\* | 0.590\*\* | 0.484 |
| (0.0874) | (0.0906) | (0.285) | (0.466) |
| Observations | 530 | 530 | 530 | 530 |

Marginal effects of each independent variable on bill sponsorship are calculated from GLM in Table 2A, holding other variables at their mean values. Robust standard errors are in parentheses \*\*\* p<0.01, \*\* p<0.05, \* p<0.1.