# Appendix A: Supplementary Models

Chi Square Analysis of Confederate Monument Meaning Among Whites & Blacks Nationally

### Social Meaning Chi-Square Results

*∗∗∗ p <* 0*.*01, *∗∗ p <* 0*.*05, *∗ p <* 0*.*1,

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Percent | Chi-Square Value | *P*-Value | Sig. |
| **Injustice** |  | 30*.*01 | 0*.*00 | \*\*\* |
| *Racial Injustice/Slavery* White | 19*.*9 |  |  |  |
| Black | 45*.*7 |  |  |  |
| **Heritage** |  | 8*.*18 | 0*.*00 | \*\*\* |
| *Southern Heritage/Pride* White | 31*.*7 |  |  |  |
| Black | 18*.*1 |  |  |  |
| **Lost Cause** |  | 11*.*29 | 0*.*00 | \*\*\* |
| *Those who sacrificed themselves* White | 37*.*2 |  |  |  |
| *for a cause they believed in* Black | 20*.*7 |  |  |  |
| **History** |  | 8*.*73 | 0*.*00 | \*\*\* |
| *History that we cannot change/* White | 42*.*6 |  |  |  |
| *is not reflective of today* Black | 27*.*6 |  |  |  |
| **Learn** |  | 10*.*28 | 0*.*00 | \*\*\* |
| *Past events to be learned from* White | 41*.*2 |  |  |  |
| Black | 25*.*0 |  |  |  |

Note: Percents indicate the percent of Whites and Blacks that indicated Confederate monuments meant each of the five social meanings. Percents do not add to 100. Whites (N=687). Blacks (N=116).

Logistic Regression Model Predicting Perception of Meaning of Confederate Monuments Among Whites Nationally

Injustice Heritage Lost Cause History Learn

Model 1 Model 2 Model 3 Model 4 Model 5 Intercept 1*.*38*∗∗* 0*.*97*∗* 1*.*12*∗∗* 1*.*96*∗∗∗* 1*.*60*∗∗∗*

*− − − −*

(0*.*64) (0*.*54) (0*.*52) (0*.*50) (0*.*50)

Age 0*.*79*∗* 0*.*47 0*.*63 0*.*79*∗∗* 1*.*14*∗∗∗*

*−*

(0*.*46) (0*.*40) (0*.*39) (0*.*36) (0*.*37)

Female 0*.*19 0*.*58*∗∗∗* 0*.*07 0*.*20 0*.*23

*− − −*

(0*.*23) (0*.*19) (0*.*18) (0*.*17) (0*.*17)

Education 0*.*21 0*.*81 1*.*20*∗∗* 0*.*40 0*.*00

*− − −*

(0*.*68) (0*.*57) (0*.*55) (0*.*52) (0*.*52)

Income 0*.*45 0*.*49 0*.*58 0*.*19 0*.*11

*− − −*

(0*.*46) (0*.*40) (0*.*38) (0*.*36) (0*.*36)

Ideology 1*.*64*∗∗∗* 0*.*23 0*.*43 0*.*80*∗∗* 0*.*89*∗∗*

*−*

(0*.*49) (0*.*42) (0*.*40) (0*.*39) (0*.*39)

Partisanship 0*.*07 0*.*00 0*.*03 0*.*02 0*.*02

*− − −*

(0*.*06) (0*.*05) (0*.*05) (0*.*05) (0*.*05)

South 0*.*09 0*.*54*∗∗∗* 0*.*18 0*.*04 0*.*21

*−*

(0*.*26) (0*.*20) (0*.*19) (0*.*19) (0*.*19)

Racial Resentment 2*.*49*∗∗∗* 2*.*06*∗∗∗* 1*.*45*∗∗∗* 0*.*31 0*.*03

*− −*

(0*.*52) (0*.*43) (0*.*41) (0*.*38) (0*.*38)

AIC 549.27 736.96 792.09 853.49 851.59

BIC 589.23 776.93 832.06 893.45 891.56

Log Likelihood -265.63 -359.48 -387.04 -417.74 -416.79

Deviance 531.27 718.96 774.09 835.49 833.59

Num. obs. 627 627 627 627 627

Results include logistic regression coefficients and standard errors in parentheses.*∗∗∗ p <* 0*.*01, *∗∗ p <* 0*.*05, *∗ p <* 0*.*1

The Effect of State Protection of Confederate Monuments on Belonging Among Whites and Blacks in the South including State Fixed Effects

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | Model 1(with controls) | Model 2(without controls) |
| (Intercept) | 0*.*25*∗∗∗* | 0*.*67*∗∗∗* |
|  | (0*.*09) | (0*.*07) |
| Treatment | 0*.*03 | 0*.*03 |
|  | (0*.*04) | (0*.*05) |
| Black | 0*.*03(0*.*05) | *−*0*.*03(0*.*05) |
| Racial Resentment | 0*.*08 |  |
| Ideology | 0*.*21*∗∗∗* |  |
| Southern | 0*.*27*∗∗∗* |  |
| Treatment x Black | *−*0*.*12*∗* | *−*0*.*13*∗*(0*.*07) |
| State Fixed Effects | yes | yes |
| R2 | 0.27 | 0.07 |
| Adj. R2 | 0.22 | 0.02 |
| Num. obs. | 236 | 238 |
| RMSE | 0.25 | 0.28 |
| *∗∗∗ p <* 0*.*01, *∗∗ p <* 0*.*05, *∗ p <* 0*.*1 |  |  |

(0*.*07)

(0*.*07)

(0*.*05)

(0*.*07)

# Appendix B: Descriptive Statistics

Study 1 Sample (Whites Only)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Variable** | Min | Max | Median | Mean | SD |
| Age | 0 | 1 | 0.49 | 0.46 | 0.24 |
| Female | 1 | 2 | 2.00 | 1.60 | 0.49 |
| Education | 0 | 1 | 0.50 | 0.53 | 0.18 |
| Income | 0 | 1 | 0.42 | 0.45 | 0.25 |
| Ideology | 0 | 1 | 0.50 | 0.55 | 0.31 |
| Partisanship | 0 | 7 | 4.00 | 4.14 | 2.34 |
| Racial Resentment | 0 | 1 | 0.58 | 0.59 | 0.26 |
| **Social meanings** |  |  |  |  |  |
| Southern Heritage | 0 | 1 | 0.00 | 0.32 | 0.47 |
| Racial Injustice | 0 | 1 | 0.00 | 0.20 | 0.40 |
| Lost Cause | 0 | 1 | 0.00 | 0.37 | 0.48 |
| History | 0 | 1 | 0.00 | 0.43 | 0.49 |
| Learn | 0 | 1 | 0.00 | 0.41 | 0.49 |

Study 1 Sample (Blacks Only)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Variable** | Min | Max | Median | Mean | SD |
| Age | 0 | 0.70 | 0.27 | 0.30 | 0.20 |
| Female | 1 | 2.00 | 2.00 | 1.60 | 0.49 |
| Education | 0 | 0.80 | 0.50 | 0.49 | 0.15 |
| Income | 0 | 1.00 | 0.47 | 0.44 | 0.23 |
| Ideology | 0 | 1.00 | 0.50 | 0.41 | 0.28 |
| Partisanship | 0 | 7.00 | 2.00 | 2.38 | 1.82 |
| Racial Resentment | 0 | 1.00 | 0.42 | 0.35 | 0.24 |
| **Social meanings** |  |  |  |  |  |
| Southern Heritage | 0 | 1.00 | 0.00 | 0.18 | 0.39 |
| Racial Injustice | 0 | 1.00 | 0.00 | 0.46 | 0.50 |
| Lost Cause | 0 | 1.00 | 0.00 | 0.21 | 0.41 |
| History | 0 | 1.00 | 0.00 | 0.28 | 0.45 |
| Learn | 0 | 1.00 | 0.00 | 0.25 | 0.43 |

Study 2 Sample (Whites Only)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Variable** | Min | Max | Median | Mean | SD |
| Ideology | 0 | 1 | 0.50 | 0.48 | 0.31 |
| Southern | 0 | 1 | 0.75 | 0.58 | 0.38 |
| Belonging | 0 | 1 | 0.67 | 0.64 | 0.27 |
| Racial Resentment | 0 | 1 | 0.50 | 0.49 | 0.35 |

Study 2 Sample (Blacks Only)

**Variable** Min Max Median Mean SD

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Ideology | 0 | 1 | 0.33 | 0.36 | 0.27 |
| Southern | 0 | 1 | 0.75 | 0.63 | 0.37 |
| Belonging | 0 | 1 | 0.62 | 0.59 | 0.27 |
| Racial Resentment | 0 | 1 | 0.17 | 0.27 | 0.30 |

# Appendix C: Survey Question Wording

## Study 1, Wave 1

### Gender

Please indicate your gender.

1. Male
2. Female
3. Other (specify)

### Social Meaning

There has been a lot of talk recently about Confederate monuments or memorials in the United States. What do you think Confederate monuments or memorials symbolize? That is, what do you think they are really about? (open-ended)

### Race

How would you describe your race?

1. White
2. Black or African American
3. American Indian or Alaska Native
4. Asian
5. Native Hawaiian or Pacific Islander
6. Other

### Ideology

We hear a lot of talk these days about liberals and conservatives. Here is a seven-point scale on which the political views that people might hold are arranged from extremely liberal to extremely conservative. Where would you place yourself on this scale, or haven’t you thought much about this?

1. Extremely liberal
2. Liberal
3. Slightly liberal
4. Moderate, middle of the road
5. Slightly conservative
6. Conservative
7. Extremely conservative

### Partisanship

Generally speaking, do you usually think of yourself as a Democrat, a Republican, an Independent, or what?

1. Democrat
2. Republican
3. Independent
4. Other party (specify)

For Democrats: Would you call yourself a STRONG Democrat or a NOT VERY STRONG Demo- crat?

1. Strong
2. Not very strong

For Republicans: Would you call yourself a STRONG Republican or a NOT VERY STRONG Republican?

1. Strong
2. Not very strong

For Independents: Do you think of yourself as CLOSER to the Republican Party or the Democratic Party?

1. Closer to Republican
2. Closer to Democratic
3. Neither

### Education

What is the highest level of education you have completed?

1. 9th Grade or less
2. 10th Grade
3. 11th Grade
4. 12th Grade, but no diploma
5. High school diploma or equivalent (GED)
6. Some college but no degree
7. Two-year/Associate’s degree
8. Four-year/Bachelor’s degree
9. Master’s degree
10. Professional degree (JD, MD, MPH)Doctoral degree (Ph.D.)

### Income

Please indicate your yearly household income.

1. Less than $5,000 2. $5,000 - $9,999

3. $10,000 - $14,999

4. $15,000 - $19,999

5. $20,000 - $24,999

6. $25,000 - $29,999

7. $30,000 - $34,999

8. $35,000 - $39,999

9. $40,000 - $49,999

10. $50,000 - $59,999

11. $60,000 - $69,000

12. $70,000 - $79,999

13. $80,000 - $89,999

14. $90,000 - $99,999

15. $100,000 - $124,999

16. $125,000 - $149,000

17. $150,000 - $174,999

18. $175,000 - $200,000

19. $200,000 or more

20. Don’t know

### Age

In what year were you born?

### Racial Resentment

The Irish, Italians, Jews and many other minorities overcame prejudice and worked their way up. Blacks should do the same without any special favors.

1. Strongly agree
2. Somewhat agree
3. Somewhat disagree
4. Strongly disagree

It is really a matter of not trying hard enough; if Blacks would only try harder they could be just as well off as Whites.

1. Strongly agree
2. Somewhat agree
3. Somewhat disagree
4. Strongly disagree

Generations of slavery and discrimination have created conditions that make it difficult for Blacks to work their way out of the lower class.

1. Strongly agree
2. Somewhat agree
3. Somewhat disagree
4. Strongly disagree

Over the past few years, Blacks have gotten less than they deserve.

1. Strongly agree
2. Somewhat agree
3. Somewhat disagree
4. Strongly disagree

### Region

Which region of the United States do you consider yourself to be from?

1. The Southeast
2. The Midwest
3. The West
4. The Northeast
5. I do not consider myself to be from the United States

### Region Important

How important to you is being a (Southerner, Midwesterner, Westerner, Northerner)?

1. Extremely Important
2. Very Important
3. Moderately important
4. Slightly important
5. Not at all important

## Study 1, Wave 2

### Social Meaning

There has been a lot of talk recently about Confederate monuments or memorials in the United States. What do Confederate monuments or memorials symbolize to you personally? That is, what do you think they are really about? (Check one or more)

1. Southern heritage and pride
2. Racial injustice and/or slavery
3. Those who sacrificed themselves for a cause they believed in
4. History that we cannot change/is not reflective of today
5. Past events to be learned from
6. Not sure
7. Other (please fill in)

## Study 2

### State

In which state do you currently reside? [All U.S. states plus Puerto Rico, Washington, D.C., and I do not reside in the United States]

### Treatment

Please read the following clipping from a newspaper article from your state. [Treatment and control newspaper clippings shown in Figure 2. State and state capitol name varied by state of residence indicated by respondent.]

Using the sliding scale, please indicate the extent to which you agree or disagree with each of the following statements. 0 = strongly disagree, 7 = strongly agree

### Belonging

1. I feel as though people like me don’t really fit in to my state
2. IâA˘ Z´ m sometimes ashamed to admit that IâA˘ Z´ m from my state
3. I feel like I am a part of my state

### Racial Resentment

I disapprove of any special considerations that racial minorities like African Americans and Hispanics receive, such as in college admissions or in the workplace, because itâA˘ Z´ s unfair to other Americans.

1. Disagree strongly
2. Disagree
3. Disagree somewhat
4. Neither agree nor disagree
5. Agree somewhat
6. Agree
7. Agree Strongly

Racial minorities like African Americans and Hispanics bring up race only when they need to make an excuse for their failure.

1. Disagree strongly
2. Disagree
3. Disagree somewhat
4. Neither agree nor disagree
5. Agree somewhat
6. Agree
7. Agree Strongly

### Southern

Do you consider yourself to be a Southerner?

1. Definitely yes
2. Probably yes
3. Might or might not
4. Probably not
5. Definitely not

### Ideology

When it comes to politics, which term best describes how you think about yourself?

1. Extremely liberal
2. Liberal
3. Slightly liberal
4. Moderate
5. Slightly conservative
6. Conservative
7. Extremely conservative

# Appendix D: Study 1 Open-Ended Meaning Coding Scheme

To identify the meanings Americans ascribe to Confederate monuments, in Wave 1 of the panel survey they were asked: “There has been a lot of talk recently about Confederate monuments or memorials in the United States. What do you think Confederate monuments or memorials symbol- ize? That is, what do you think they are really about?” From respondents’ open-ended responses, we identified five of the most prominent themes: Southern heritage/pride, racial injustice/slavery, those who sacrificed themselves for a cause they believed in, history that we cannot change/is not reflective of today, and past events or mistakes to be learned from.

Our coding scheme is illustrated in the table below, where on the left-hand side of the table we have one of the five substantive meanings (as well as categories for “don’t know” and “uncodeable”), with examples of real meanings that subjects provided on the right-hand side. We had two inde- pendent coders code all open-ended responses. The inter-rater reliability score was strong, with a Cronbach’s alpha equal to .80.

Study 1 (Wave 1) Coding Scheme for Open-Ended Meaning of Confederate Monuments

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Social Meaning | Label | Examples |
| Racial injustice/ oppression | Injustice | “slavery”, “white supremacy,” “racism,” “in-equality” |
| Southern Heritage and Pride | Heritage | “the south,” “southern pride,” “southern states’history,” “southern tradition” |
| Those who sacrificed them- selves for a cause they be- lieved in | Lost Cause | “I think they represent a group of people whofought in the civil war,” “the brave has fought for us,” “They represent the heroes of the Con- federacy who bravely fought in the war between the states,” “Patriot!” |
| History that we cannot change/is not reflective of today | History | “History of our country,” “American Historyand Heritage,” “I think they are about history,” “history that is in the past,” ”I think they are a symbol of a horrible time in our history.” |
| Past events or mistakes to be learned from | Learn | “Facts as to what happened! A reminder of hownot to be stupid!”, “History the we must learn from,” “Remembering the past so we don’t make the same mistakes” |
| Don’t know / No idea | DK | “Not sure,” “Don’t know,” “No clue” |
| Uncodeable | NA | “Things” |