**APPENDIX A**

**Study 1: Chicago Area Study Observational Data**

***Antonio Smith’s Death***

Antonio Smith was nine years old when he was shot on the afternoon of August 20 on Chicago’s Southside. He was at home with his brother when he made a call to his mother who was on her way home from work, asking her if he could have a cupcake, and when his mother said no he ran out of the apartment with his brother giving chase. When his mother came home, she found the brother but Antonio was missing and she called the police. When police arrived they asked her to come to University of Chicago’s Comer Children’s Hospital where Antonio had been taken after being shot multiple times in the chest, arms, and hands shortly after 4:00 pm. Antonio was pronounced dead at 5:13 pm.

The media reports that followed described a grieving family and a community in shock. The framing was clearly sympathetic to the victim. Smith’s cousin was quoted as saying, “he was just a child, just a baby, still had a whole life ahead of him.” Speaking to the press, she pleaded, “I want whoever did this to turn himself in because he (Antonio) is an innocent baby. He didn’t deserve it.” Neighbors who were interviewed expressed grief and fear of living in a neighborhood that was no stranger to gunfire. Some reports shared that Father Michael Pfleger, pastor of St. Sabina parish, was organizing a prayer rally and offering a $5,000 reward for anyone providing information leading to the arrest of Smith’s shooter. He said that Antonio’s death “could not be tolerated...especially a nine-year old child...it’s just ridiculous.”

Antonio Smith’s death is highly sympathetic. However, in order to validate this relative to coverage of other homicides in Chicago, we conducted a content analysis of a random sample of reports of all homicides in our dataset. We then extracted the full sentences of each transcript that referred to the homicide victim. We then conducted and manually validated a Wordfish analysis to scale the media coverage from the most sympathetic narrative to the least sympathetic narrative. The most sympathetic articles about the homicide victims described the death of young people (ages nine, sixteen, and twenty). These articles described the personalities of the victims, accentuating their youth and scholastic performance. Less sympathetic articles described people whose deaths featured some outstanding detail, such as refusing to cooperate with police while being treated in the hospital before succumbing to their wounds or being shot in one’s home with the victim’s body found with marijuana. The least sympathetic articles described the shooting as either gang-related, identified the victim as a gang member, or described the victim as the aggressor of a confrontation. This analysis validated that Antonio Smith’s death was characterized in sympathetic terms. Moreover, it validated that his death was a highly salient media event approaching a real-world treatment.

**Survey Items**

*Gun 1*. Next, we have a few questions about policy issues. First, what do you think is more important: to protect the right of Americans to own guns OR to control gun ownership?   
Protect the right of Americans to own guns (0); Control gun ownership (1)

*Gun 2*. There should be a federal database of all gun sales.   
Strongly support (4), Somewhat support (3), Somewhat oppose (2), Strongly oppose (1)

*Gun 3*. There should be a ban on all handguns.   
Strongly support (4), Somewhat support (3), Somewhat oppose (2), Strongly oppose (1)

*Gun 4*. People should be allowed to carry concealed weapons with a permit.   
Strongly support (1), Somewhat support (2), Somewhat oppose (3), Strongly oppose (4)

*Gun 5*. Some people say that stricter gun laws would give more power to government over average people. How strongly do you agree or disagree with this statement?   
Strongly agree (1), Somewhat agree (2), Somewhat disagree (3), Strongly disagree (4)

*Party Identification*. Do you consider yourself a Democrat (1=yes, 0=else), a Republican (1=yes, 0=else), an Independent or something else (1=yes, 0=else)? (Independent is comparison group)

*Blacks Violent*. How would you rate African Americans on this scale: Peaceful (1) - Violent (7)

*Whites Violent*. How would you rate Whites on this scale: Peaceful (1) - Violent (7)

*Racial Resentment* *1*. Irish, Italians, Jewish and many other minorities overcame prejudice and worked their way up. Blacks should do the same without any special favors.   
Strongly agree (4), Somewhat agree (3), Somewhat disagree (2), Strongly disagree (1)

*Racial Resentment* *2*. Generations of slavery and discrimination have created conditions that make it difficult for Blacks to work their way out of the lower class.   
Strongly agree (1), Somewhat agree (2), Somewhat disagree (3), Strongly disagree (4)

*Racial Resentment* *3*. Over the past few years, Blacks have gotten less than they deserve. Strongly agree (1), Somewhat agree (2), Somewhat disagree (3), Strongly disagree (4)

*Racial Resentment* *4*. It’s really a matter of some people not trying hard enough; if Blacks would only try harder they could be just as well off as Whites.   
Strongly agree (1), Somewhat agree (2), Somewhat disagree (3), Strongly disagree (4)

*Worry of Crime*. How worried are you that you or a family member may become a victim of a serious crime? Would you say you are:   
Extremely worried (4), Very worried (3), Not very worried (2), Not at all worried (1)

*Local News Consumption*. On TV, do you watch local (1), network (0) or cable news (0)?

*Gun ownership*. Do you currently have a firearm in your home, basement or garage? By firearm, we mean a rifle, shotgun, revolver, or any other weapon that takes bullets. Yes (1), No (0).

Age, sex, education, political interest, activism provided in data but not question wording in survey.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Table 1**: Correlation matrix of dependent variable scale items | | | | | |
|  | Gun Control | Fed Database | Ban Handgun | Conceal Permit | Strict Gun Laws |
| Gun Control | *1.00* | 0.43 | 0.59 | 0.62 | 0.51 |
| Fed Database | 0.43 | *1.00* | 0.42 | 0.42 | 0.41 |
| Ban Handgun | 0.59 | 0.42 | *1.00* | 0.67 | 0.44 |
| Conceal Permit | 0.62 | 0.42 | 0.67 | *1.00* | 0.51 |
| Strict Gun Laws | 0.51 | 0.41 | 0.44 | 0.51 | *1.00* |

**Table 2**: Interview by day for White respondents indicate a relatively unbalanced interview scheme by race.

Date White

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| 2014-08-15 | 14 |
| 2014-08-16 | 21 |
| 2014-08-17 | 10 |
| 2014-08-18 | 10 |
| 2014-08-19 | 182 |
| 2014-08-20 | 74 |
| 2014-08-21 | 18 |
| 2014-08-22 | 55 |
| 2014-08-23 | 26 |
| 2014-08-24 | 17 |
| 2014-08-25 | 27 |
| 2014-08-26 | 17 |
| 2014-08-27 | 22 |
| 2014-08-28 | 117 |
| 2014-08-29 | 22 |
| 2014-08-30 | 3 |
| 2014-08-31 | 1 |
| 2014-09-01 | 4 |
| 2014-09-02 | 2 |
| 2014-09-03 | 3 |
| 2014-09-04 | 13 |
| 2014-09-05 | 6 |
| 2014-09-06 | 4 |
| 2014-09-07 | 2 |

2014-09-08 4

**Table 3**: Discontinuity Balance Table for key demographic indicators

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | mean of x | mean of y | Difference | statistic | p.value |
| Democrat | 0.31 | 0.31 | 0.00 | -0.07 | 0.94 |
| Republican | 0.26 | 0.33 | 0.08 | -1.27 | 0.20 |
| Age | 56.07 | 55.88 | -0.18 | 0.10 | 0.92 |
| Female | 0.54 | 0.53 | -0.01 | 0.18 | 0.86 |
| Education | 3.51 | 3.37 | -0.15 | 1.58 | 0.12 |
| Racial Resentment | 11.05 | 10.69 | -0.36 | 0.92 | 0.36 |

A screenshot of a cell phone

Description automatically generated

**Fig. 1**: Bandwidth Sensitivity Plot: White Sample

**Table 4**: Regression Discontinuity, White sample only.

DV: Gun policy preferences and attitudes scale. Models control for the following covariates: Party identification, age, sex, education, crime worry, Blacks violent, Whites violent, individualism scale, small government scale, racial resentment scale, and gun ownership. (Local news viewers)

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Coeff | St. Error | P-value |
| **Base Model** |  |  |  |
| Conventional | -1.07 | 0.06 | 0.00 |
| Bias-Corrected | -1.42 | 0.06 | 0.00 |
| Robust | -1.42 | 0.03 | 0.00 |
| **Covariate Model** |  |  |  |
| Conventional | -1.21 | 0.06 | 0.00 |
| Bias-Corrected | -1.41 | 0.06 | 0.00 |

Robust -1.41 0.03 0.00

**APPENDIX B**

**Study 2: MTurk Convenience Sample**

**Table 1**: Mturk, CCES sample comparisons on key demographics. Results indicate sample differences on education, income, and age, consistent with extant findings.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | MTurk Freq | MTurk N | CCES Freq | CCES N | t-stat | p-val |
| Male | 0.48 | 71 | 0.47 | 21074 | -0.285 | 0.776 |
| Female | 0.52 | 76 | 0.53 | 23650 |  |  |
| Grades 1-8 / Some high school | 0.01 | 1 | 0.03 | 1313 | 6.414 | 0 |
| High school graduate | 0.10 | 15 | 0.28 | 12360 |  |  |
| Some college/Technical school | 0.19 | 28 | 0.23 | 10352 |  |  |
| Community College/Associates | 0.14 | 20 | 0.11 | 4737 |  |  |
| College graduate | 0.43 | 63 | 0.22 | 9769 |  |  |
| Post graduate | 0.14 | 20 | 0.14 | 6193 |  |  |
| Democrat | 0.32 | 47 | 0.32 | 14190 | 0.005 | 0.996 |
| Republican | 0.33 | 49 | 0.32 | 14190 | 0.353 | 0.725 |
| Independent | 0.35 | 52 | 0.39 | 17534 | -1.035 | 0.302 |
| Less than 20,000 | 0.12 | 18 | 0.11 | 4543 | -3.024 | 0.003 |
| 20,000 to less than 40,000 | 0.26 | 38 | 0.22 | 8780 |  |  |
| 40,000 to less than 60,000 | 0.30 | 44 | 0.20 | 7990 |  |  |
| 60,000 to less than 80,000 | 0.11 | 16 | 0.16 | 6492 |  |  |
| 80,000 to less than 100,000 | 0.10 | 15 | 0.10 | 4163 |  |  |
| 100,000+ | 0.11 | 17 | 0.20 | 8121 |  |  |
| 18-35 | 0.37 | 55 | 0.26 | 11834 | -4.606 | 0 |
| 36-50 | 0.31 | 46 | 0.21 | 9374 |  |  |
| 51+ | 0.32 | 47 | 0.53 | 23516 |  |  |

**Table 2:** Wave one and wave two demographic comparisons, as measured in wave one. No statistically significant differences in attrition.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Treatment Mean | Control Mean | T\_Stat | P\_Value |
| Racial Resentment | 10.03 | 10.12 | -0.22 | 0.83 |
| Female | 0.51 | 0.52 | -0.21 | 0.83 |
| Education | 4.20 | 4.29 | -0.64 | 0.52 |
| Democrat | 0.32 | 0.32 | -0.01 | 0.99 |
| Republican | 0.33 | 0.33 | 0.04 | 0.97 |
| Independent/Other | 0.35 | 0.35 | -0.10 | 0.92 |
| Religious Attendance | 1.72 | 2.18 | -0.81 | 0.42 |
| Income | 2.55 | 3.15 | -1.05 | 0.30 |
| Age | 42.69 | 43.36 | -0.46 | 0.65 |

**Table 3**: Difference of means t-tests on child attributes.

Findings reveal no meaningful statistical differences across the two pictures on attributes: trustworthy, honest, attends school regularly, likely to get into trouble, gets good grades, and from a good family. The White kid is seen as slightly older but the mean differences are within 3/4 of a year (White Respondents, n=60).

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Black Kid | White Kid | t-stat | p-value |
| Trustworthy | 5.47 | 5.57 | -0.26 | 0.80 |
| Honest | 5.65 | 5.60 | 0.13 | 0.90 |
| Attends school regularly | 6.20 | 6.47 | -0.64 | 0.52 |
| Likely to get in trouble | 5.50 | 5.67 | -0.42 | 0.67 |
| Gets good grades | 5.63 | 5.67 | -0.09 | 0.93 |
| From a good family | 5.81 | 6.18 | -1.03 | 0.30 |
| Age | 12.98 | 13.68 | -2.56 | 0.01 |

**Treatments and Controls**

[Sympathetic] “Outraged public and community leaders were offering a reward Thursday for information leading to the arrest of a suspect in the death of a thirteen-year-old, in what has almost become a ritual in Chicago. Darren Jones was shot at least twice and killed Wednesday afternoon, not far from where he lived in the Grand Crossing neighborhood on the city’s South Side. The boy is the latest of at least eleven children under eighteen years of age who have been shot to death this summer in Chicago, several of them by stray bullets. Darren’s mother, Tiffany Jones, said her son left home after she answered ‘no’ when he asked for a cupcake. About an hour later, he was being taken to the University of Chicago Comer Children’s Hospital, with gunshots to the chest. Police responding to a report of shots fired found Darren in the backyard of an apartment building. When she arrived home and found Darren gone, Jones said she called police to report him missing and they arrived five minutes later. ‘They asked me to show a picture of him. Once I did that, they told me to come to the hospital,’ she was quoted as saying on local media.

As of Thursday evening, police had no one in custody in the shooting, said spokesman Officer Charles Green. Darren’s parents said they know of no reason anyone would target their son. Cousin Victoria Johnson said the family was struggling to make sense of the shooting, adding, ‘he was just a child, just a baby, still had a whole life ahead of him.”’

[Unsympathetic] “A thirteen-year-old is dead after he was shot twice in the North Side Uptown neighborhood early Friday. Police were called to the 4800-block of N. Kenmore at 1:36 a.m. Friday. The victim, later identified as Darren Jones, was taken to Illinois Masonic Hospital where he died. Police say the victim was approached from behind by a gunman who shot him and fled. No one is in custody, and police say it appears to be a gang-related shooting. Jones was no stranger to street violence and run-ins with the law. Last year, Jones was sentenced to youth detention for the maximum sentence of one year on charges for unlawful possession of a weapon, according to court records. He also had numerous previous charges for misdemeanors, most recently for possession of marijuana, according to court records. Police confirmed that Jones ‘had been a party to other gang-related gun violence in Edgewater and Rogers Park.’ Two such instances lead to the death of innocent bystanders Charles Green and Tasha Johnson. Jones’ death capped a day of violence in Chicago that saw at least fifteen people shot. At least fourteen people were shot across Chicago between noon and 10:30 p.m. Thursday. The last shooting left five people wounded in the West Englewood neighborhood on the South Side.”

[Control] “Your Bottle Means Jobs (YBMJ) is a campaign message recently used by the Chicago Plastics Recycling Council (CPRC) to stimulate more recycling by connecting that activity with job creation. The goal of the campaign is to get more bottles in recycling bins across the Chicago metropolitan area. The campaign completed its successful debut, fueling a two percent increase in tons of all types of plastic bottles sold by local recycling processors during March through May 2017 when compared to the same period in 2016. Area recycling programs reported no other major changes during that time period, so campaign leaders say the outreach campaign had considerable regional impact. The YBMJ campaign was financed by a unique partnership of industry, recycling-oriented trade associations, and local governments including the City of Chicago, and Cook, DuPage, and Lake counties. Using billboards, radio, online ads, social marketing pledges, and events, the campaign’s call to action for the region is that if each household in the Chicago metropolitan area increased its plastic bottle recycling by just two bottles a week, that simple act could yield 30,000 tons of additional bottles, avoiding over 1.3 million dollars in landfill disposal costs and creating local jobs in the process.”

**Pictures used in the experimental treatment**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| A person wearing a hat  Description automatically generated | |
| **Fig. 1.** White boy. | |
| A person wearing a hat  Description automatically generated | |

**Fig. 2.** Black boy.

**Attention Check**

“Research in decision making shows that people, when making decisions and answering questions, prefer not to pay attention and minimize their effort as much as possible. Some studies show that over fifty percent of people don’t carefully read questions. If you are reading this question and have read all the other questions, please select the box marked ‘other’ and type ‘Decision Making’ in the box below. Do not select predictions of ‘your own behavior.’ Thank you for participating and taking the time to read through the questions carefully!”

• Predictions of your own behavior (1)

• Lions (2)

• Tigers (3)

• Other (4)

**Table 4**: ANOVA F-test comparisons across key demographic indicators by treatment condition

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | F-value | P-value |
| Female | 0.11 | 0.98 |
| Education | 1.22 | 0.30 |
| Democrat | 0.68 | 0.61 |
| Republican | 0.88 | 0.48 |
| Independent/Other | 0.29 | 0.89 |
| Religious Attendance | 0.56 | 0.69 |
| Income  Age | 0.16  1.16 | 0.96  0.33 |

**Survey Items**

***Dependent Variable (Wave two): Gun-policy battery items***

A required 5-day waiting period to purchase a firearm

Strongly agree (4), Somewhat agree (3), Somewhat oppose (2), Strongly oppose (1)

An assault style weapons ban

Strongly agree (4), Somewhat agree (3), Somewhat oppose (2), Strongly oppose (1)

Create a federal database of all gun sales

Strongly agree (4), Somewhat agree (3), Somewhat oppose (2), Strongly oppose (1)

Require gun manufacturers to produce only ‘smart guns’

Strongly agree (4), Somewhat agree (3), Somewhat oppose (2), Strongly oppose (1)

A ban on high capacity ammunition magazines

Strongly agree (4), Somewhat agree (3), Somewhat oppose (2), Strongly oppose (1)

Require trigger locks that can only be released by the gun owner

Strongly agree (4), Somewhat agree (3), Somewhat oppose (2), Strongly oppose (1)

A ban on all handguns

Strongly agree (4), Somewhat agree (3), Somewhat oppose (2), Strongly oppose (1)

Allow people to carry concealed weapons with a permit

Strongly agree (1), Somewhat agree (2), Somewhat oppose (3), Strongly oppose (4)

Impose a higher sales tax on guns

Strongly agree (4), Somewhat agree (3), Somewhat oppose (2), Strongly oppose (1)

Require that gun owners carry liability insurance for their guns

Strongly agree (4), Somewhat agree (3), Somewhat oppose (2), Strongly oppose (1)

***Racial Resentment Scale***

Irish, Italians, Jewish, and many other minorities overcame prejudice and worked their way up. Blacks should do the same without any special favors.

Strongly Agree (4); Somewhat Agree (3); Somewhat Disagree (2); Strongly Disagree (1)

Generations of slavery and discrimination have created conditions that make it difficult for Blacks to work their way out of the lower class.

Strongly Agree (1); Somewhat Agree (2); Somewhat Disagree (3); Strongly Disagree (4)

Over the past few years, Blacks have gotten less than they deserve.

Strongly Agree (1); Somewhat Agree (2); Somewhat Disagree (3); Strongly Disagree (4)

It’s really a matter of people not trying hard enough; if Blacks would try harder they could be just as well off as Whites.

Strongly Agree (4); Somewhat Agree (3); Somewhat Disagree (2); Strongly Disagree (1)

***Demographics (Wave one)***

What is your gender? (Female = 1, Male =0)

What is the highest level of education you completed?

Grades 1-8 / Some high school (1); High school graduate (2); Some college/Technical school (3); Community college/Associate’s Degree (4); 4-year college graduate/Bachelor’s Degree (5); Post graduate (Master’s Degree, Professional Degree, Ph.D, etc.) (6)

Generally speaking, do you think of yourself as a Democrat (1=yes, 0=no), a Republican (1=yes, 0=no), or an independent (1=yes, 0=no)?

Aside from weddings and funerals, how often do you attend religious services?

More than once a week (6); Once a week (5); Once or twice a month (4); A few times a year (3); Less often than a few times a year (2); Never (1)

What was your total combined household income in 2012 before taxes. This question is com- pletely confidential and just used to help classify the responses.

Less than 20,000 (1); 20,000 to less than 40,000 (2); 40,000 to less than 60,000 (3); 60,000 to less than 80,000 (4); 80,000 to less

than 100,000 (5); 100,000 to less than 200,000 (6)

In what year were you born? 2017 - [ANSWER]