Substantive Divergence: The Meaning of Public Opinion on Government Spending in Red and Blue

Supplemental Information (SI)

Katherine Krimmel Assistant Professor Department of Political Science Barnard College kkrimmel@barnard.edu

Kelly Rader Associate Professor Department of Political Science Yale University kelly.rader@yale.edu

A.1 Sample Details



Figure A.1: *Sample Details*. This graph displays demographic information for our full sample, compared to the 2013 American Community Survey (ACS). The ACS does not collect information on partisan identification, but our sample is close to the 2012 CCES on this measure. 40.4% of our sample identified as Democrats and 24.1% identified as Republicans. In comparison, 37.1% of respondents in the 2012 CCES identified as Democrats and 26.6% identified as Republicans.



Figure A.2: Associations with government spending, unweighted and weighted. This graph displays the unweighted (light gray) and weighted (dark gray) percentages of our sample that mentioned each category of spending. Raked weights were created using the Survey package in R. They range from 0.36 to 2.3. Our sample was weighted to the 2013 ACS using using sex, race, income, region, and age. All differences are negligible. The maximum difference between unweighted and weighted mentions is 0.44 percentage points for mean-tested programs.

A.2 Coding for Open-Ended Questions

DOMESTIC SPENDING

- <u>Businesses</u>. Includes corporations, small businesses, government contractors, defense contractors, and references to the Temporary Asset Relief Program (TARP) by name, acronym, or nickname (e.g., "bailout"). Examples include: "To [sic] much help on big business", "CONTRACTS WITH COMPANIES THAT OVERCHARGE...FOR EXAMPLE...50.00 FOR A 10 CENT SCREW", "corporate welfare", "subsidies to companies", "special favors to big businesses."
- **Education**. Includes schools of all levels, from pre-k through college, student loans, and teachers. Examples include: "education", "schools", "I think the us pays teachers too little", "Improvements towards Education funding so college graduates don't carry so much debt after completing college".
- <u>General domestic</u>. Includes general references to domestic spending or grants, spending money to help people here (in U.S.) if no group or type is specified, spending to better society. Examples include: "They need to focus on spending for our country not others", "grants and transfers to state and local governments", "The spending is mainly for the betterment of the society," "spending on programs or things that help the people", "domestic issues".
- <u>Healthcare</u>. Excludes Medicare, Medicaid, and research. Examples include: "Obamacare," "healthcare", "health insurance".

- <u>Immigrants</u>. Includes references to immigrants or immigration, legal or illegal. Examples include: "benefits to illegal immigrants", "Too much is being spent to support illegal immigrants", "cost of illegal immigration", "illegals", "immigration", "border control".
- <u>Infrastructure</u>. Includes general references to infrastructure as well as parks and recreation, public transportation, roads, highways, bridges, waterways, and sanitation. Examples include: "infrastructure", "unnecessary buildings", "roads and bridges," "national parks".
- <u>Other domestic</u>. Includes agriculture, arts, churches/religious, disaster relief (domestic), environment, law enforcement (including first responders, security, jails, courts), libraries, post office, and stimulus. Examples include: "subsidies for farmers", "arts and culture", "Hurricane Sandy relief", "renewable energy sources", "environmental regulations and enforcement", "prisons", "to build the economy".
- <u>Research</u>. Examples include: "stupid studies", "frivolous studies", "NIH/med research",
 "Waste spending on unnecessary research such as, how a shrimp runs on a treadmill",
 "cancer research, and HIV/AIDS research and finding a cure for these chronic diseases",
 "studying sex lives of insects and such", "scientific research", "researching catfish in
 Louisiana for \$3 milliion [sic] (last I heard)".
- <u>Social Security and Medicare</u>. Includes references to these specific programs. Examples include: "Social Security", "SS", "SSI,", "SSDI", "Medicare".
- <u>Social services</u>. Includes general references to social services or social spending, social welfare, and references to helping specific groups of people like children, the elderly, homeless, veterans, and people with disabilities. Excludes aid to the poor. Examples include: "social programs", "government aid programs," "We need the government to

spend our money on the Veterans coming home. Giving them everything we can.", "child hunger and shelter problems like decent housing for people".

 <u>Means-tested programs</u>. Includes references to specific means-tested programs (e.g., Temporary Assistance to Needy Families, Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Programs) as well as vaguer references to aid to the poor, and colloquialisms (e.g., entitlements, the dole). Examples include: "entitlement programs", "too much money being given to those individuals who are 'on the dole'", "government handouts", "welfare benifits [sic] and free give aways".

FOREIGN SPENDING

- **Defense**. Includes general references to the military and military conflict, defense, military training, giving weapons to other countries, cyber security. Excludes goods and services for veterans. Examples include: "wars", "Cost of wars, iraq [sic]", "national security", "spending on the fight against terrorism", "weapons of mass destruction".
- Foreign aid. Excludes giving weapons and/or military training to other countries.
 Examples include: "overseas spending- in terms of aid", "they send to much to other countys [sic] to help", "other countries", "foreign aid".

OTHER SPENDING

<u>Debt</u>. Includes specific mention of debt and deficit, as well as allusions to the notion that we spend more than we have. Examples include: "we are in the trillions of dollars in debt", "interest on loans", "budget deficit, just keeps growing", "I know that I don't spend money that I don't have and think our government needs to scale down until our economy gets better".

- <u>Government employees</u>. Includes references to elected and non-elected government officials, their salaries, other support, money they spend on themselves, pensions. Excludes vague statements of disapproval of politicians' behavior, first responders, and teachers. Examples include: " travel expense & accomadation [sic] for elected officials as well as government workers", "Travel for the President personal time; paying the supreme court for holding sessions over time that they should not be judging on (gay marriage)", "government officials make entirely to much money".
- <u>**Taxes</u>**. Includes references to IRS, tax system, taxpayers, tax rebates. Examples include: "if we could ever get people elected who could reform our tax system, we could save a lot there also", "IRS employees don't even pay taxes showing the level of respiect that government employees have to the IRA and other agencies", "increasing taxes", "rich people not paying enough", "tax return checks".</u>
- <u>Waste</u>. Includes pork, pet projects, references to corruption or special interests (without a particular interest specified). Excludes references to specific kinds of waste (e.g., "unnecessary buildings"), which can be filed in specific categories. Examples include: "there is TOO much waste caused by spending on programs that duplicate each other", "the Federal Government is a criminal organization that steals our money", "Paying off people", "pork barrel projects", "excess bloat to get bills passed-tacked on items".

GENERAL

There were a few different types of answers that we categorized as "general." Many people wrote "no" or "none" or "NA", indicating that they were not thinking about any particular type of spending in answering our first question. Others explicitly indicated that they were thinking broadly, through answers like "nothing specific", "nothing in particular", "just general

spending," "across the board," "a lot of things", "programs" or "everything". Some respondents used vague language that did not exactly answer the question, but suggested that they were not thinking about anything in particular. For example, someone wrote "I think we need to shift the TYPE of spending, not the amount." Other examples of this type of response include, "yeah the government spending my money" and "Too Much. We are writing checks our bodies can't cash." Still others made general anti-government statements, like "all spending is overspending" and "we the people need to terminate the government." All of these types of answers were categorized as "general".

UNCATEGORIZABLE

Includes unintelligible responses, answers too vague or unclear to categorize, answers not clearly tied to a category of government spending (e.g., personal expenses), and other types of responses that cannot be clearly categorized. E.g., "lots", "propaganda about the Confederate flag", "supporting behavior styles", "Spending by cash or check", "groceries", "emotional spending." Approximately 8.5% of respondents mentioned at least one thing that was uncategorizable, but fewer (approximately 6%) gave only uncategorizable answers. Some responses contained categorizable elements along with the uncategorizable element.

A.3 Additional Coefficient Plots



Figure A.3: *Partisan Differences in Associations with Spending, Logit Models.* This figure plots coefficients on *Republican*, which represent the difference between Republicans and Democrats, from 2 sets of 18 logit models in which the dependent variable was an indicator for whether or not the respondent thought about each particular type of spending. Coefficients from models that included only party indicators are represented by black dots, and coefficients from models with additional controls are represented by gray dots. Lines indicate 95% confidence intervals.



Republican vs. Democratic Respondents, Logit Too Much

Figure A.4: *Partisan Differences in Associations with Spending, by Response to General Spending Question, Logit Models.* These figures replicate the models shown in FIGURE A.2 for separate subsets of respondents who said that government spends too much on the whole.



Republican vs. Democratic Respondents **Right Amount**

Figure A.5: Partisan Differences in Associations with Spending, by Response to General Spending Question ("About the Right Amount"). This figure replicates the models shown in FIGURE 3 for the subset of respondents who said that government spends about the right amount.

A.4 Regression Tables

Covariate details.

Age, the respondent's age in years, and education, a six-category variable, are both standardized in all models. For income, we created five indicators that correspond roughly to income quintiles: less than \$20,000; 20,000-39,000; 40,000-69,000; 70,000-119,999; and 120,000 or more. Full models include indicators for the top four quintiles. Our original sex variable allowed respondents to choose one of three categories: male, female, or other. We used this to create an indicator for male, coded 1 if the respondent chose this answer and 0 otherwise. For race, we created indicators for black (coded 1 if the respondent identified as black), Latino (coded 1 if the respondent identified as Latino, but not black), and other (coded 1 if the respondent identified as Asian or Asian-American, Middle Eastern, Native American, or other, but not white, black or Latino). All full models include these three indicators, the base category for which is white.

	Model 1	Model 2
Intercept	0.30 *	0.32 *
-	(0.02)	(0.03)
Republican	0.00	0.01
	(0.02)	(0.03)
Independent	0.08 *	0.08 *
	(0.03)	(0.03)
Age		-0.02
		(0.01)
Income Quintile 5		-0.02
		(0.04)
Income Quintile 4		-0.00
		(0.03)
Income Quintile 3		0.01
		(0.03)
Income Quintile 2		-0.01
		(0.03)
Black		0.01
		(0.03)
Latino		-0.06
		(0.04)
Other Non-white		-0.03
		(0.04)
Education		-0.02
		(0.01)
Male		-0.03
		(0.02)
Ν	1952	1952
	0.00	0.01
adj.	0.00	0.01
Resid. sd	0.47	0.47

Table A.1: Dependent Variable: Mentioned General

	Model 1	Model 2
Intercept	0.27 *	0.26 *
-	(0.01)	(0.02)
Republican	-0.16 *	-0.17 *
-	(0.02)	(0.02)
Independent	-0.12 *	-0.12 *
-	(0.02)	(0.02)
Age		-0.01
-		(0.01)
Income Quintile 5		0.04
		(0.03)
Income Quintile 4		-0.00
		(0.03)
Income Quintile 3		0.05
		(0.03)
Income Quintile 2		0.02
		(0.03)
Black		-0.07 *
		(0.03)
Latino		-0.03
		(0.03)
Other Non-white		0.07
		(0.04)
Education		0.03 *
		(0.01)
Male		0.03
		(0.02)
Ν	1952	1952
	0.03	0.05
adj.	0.03	0.05
Resid. sd	0.40	0.39

Table A.2: Dependent Variable: Mentioned Defense

	Model 1	Model 2	
Intercept	0.07 *	0.09 *	
-	(0.01)	(0.02)	
Republican	0.07 *	0.06 *	
Republican	(0.02)	(0.02)	
Independent	0.05 *	0.04 *	
	(0.02)	(0.02)	
Age	(***=)	0.01	
8-		(0.01)	
Income Ouintile 5		0.01	
		(0.03)	
Income Quintile 4		-0.01	
-		(0.02)	
Income Quintile 3		-0.02	
		(0.02)	
Income Quintile 2		-0.01	
		(0.02)	
Black		-0.02	
		(0.02)	
Latino		-0.01	
		(0.02)	
Other Non-white		-0.00	
		(0.02)	
Education		-0.02 *	
		(0.01)	
Male		-0.01	
		(0.01)	
N	1952	1952	
	0.01	0.02	
adj.	0.01	0.01	
Resid. sd	0.30	0.30	

Table A.3: Dependent Variable: Mentioned Foreign a	aid

	Model 1	Model 2	
Intercept	0.04 *	0.03 *	
-	(0.01)	(0.02)	
Republican	0.14 *	0.12 *	
	(0.02)	(0.02)	
Independent	0.04 *	0.04 *	
	(0.01)	(0.02)	
Age		0.03 *	
		(0.01)	
Income Quintile 5		0.05 *	
		(0.03)	
Income Quintile 4		0.02	
		(0.02)	
Income Quintile 3		0.04	
		(0.02)	
Income Quintile 2		0.02	
		(0.02)	
Black		-0.03 *	
		(0.01)	
Latino		-0.01	
		(0.02)	
Other Non-white		-0.00	
		(0.02)	
Education		0.01 *	
		(0.01)	
Male		-0.01	
		(0.01)	
N	1952	1952	
	0.05	0.07	
adj.	0.05	0.07	
Resid. sd	0.28	0.28	

Table A.4: Dependent Variable: Mentioned Means-tested programs

	Model 1	Model 2	
Intercept	0.10 *	0.10 *	
-	(0.01)	(0.02)	
Republican	-0.01	-0.02	
	(0.02)	(0.02)	
Independent	-0.02	-0.02	
	(0.02)	(0.02)	
Age		0.04 *	
		(0.01)	
Income Quintile 5		-0.01	
		(0.03)	
Income Quintile 4		-0.00	
		(0.02)	
Income Quintile 3		-0.00	
		(0.02)	
Income Quintile 2		0.01	
		(0.02)	
Black		-0.00	
		(0.02)	
Latino		0.03	
		(0.02)	
Other Non-white		0.05	
		(0.03)	
Education		0.02 *	
		(0.01)	
Male		-0.01	
		(0.01)	
Ν	1952	1952	
	0.00	0.02	
adj.	0.00	0.02	
Resid. sd	0.29	0.28	

Table A.5: Dependent Variable: Mentioned Social services

	Model 1	Model 2
Intercept	0.05 *	0.06 *
-	(0.01)	(0.02)
Republican	0.07 *	0.06 *
	(0.02)	(0.02)
Independent	0.05 *	0.05 *
	(0.02)	(0.02)
Age		0.03 *
		(0.01)
Income Quintile 5		0.02
		(0.02)
Income Quintile 4		0.01
		(0.02)
Income Quintile 3		0.01
		(0.02)
Income Quintile 2		-0.01
		(0.02)
Black		-0.01
		(0.02)
Latino		0.03
		(0.02)
Other Non-white		-0.00
		(0.02)
Education		-0.00
		(0.01)
Male		-0.02
		(0.01)
Ν	1952	1952
	0.01	0.02
adj.	0.01	0.02
Resid. sd	0.28	0.28

Table A.6: Dependent Variable: Mentioned Waste

	Model 1	Model 2
Intercept	0.04 *	0.06 *
-	(0.01)	(0.02)
Republican	0.06 *	0.06 *
	(0.01)	(0.01)
Independent	0.05 *	0.05 *
	(0.02)	(0.02)
Age		0.02 *
		(0.01)
Income Quintile 5		-0.03
		(0.02)
Income Quintile 4		-0.01
		(0.02)
Income Quintile 3		-0.01
		(0.02)
Income Quintile 2		-0.01
		(0.02)
Black		0.02
		(0.02)
Latino		0.02
		(0.02)
Other Non-white		-0.02
		(0.02)
Education		0.00
		(0.01)
Male		-0.04 *
		(0.01)
Ν	1952	1952
	0.01	0.03
adj.	0.01	0.02
Resid. sd	0.25	0.25

Table A.7: Dependent Variable: Mentioned Government employees

	Model 1	Model 2
Intercept	0.07 *	0.08 *
	(0.01)	(0.02)
Republican	0.00	-0.00
	(0.01)	(0.01)
Independent	-0.03 *	-0.03 *
	(0.01)	(0.01)
Age		0.01
		(0.01)
Income Quintile 5		-0.05 *
		(0.02)
Income Quintile 4		0.00
		(0.02)
Income Quintile 3		0.00
		(0.02)
Income Quintile 2		0.01
		(0.02)
Black		-0.02
		(0.02)
Latino		0.00
		(0.02)
Other Non-white		0.03
		(0.02)
Education		0.01
		(0.01)
Male		-0.01
		(0.01)
N	1952	1952
	0.00	0.01
adj.	0.00	0.00
Resid. sd	0.25	0.25

Table A.8: Dependent Variable: Mentioned Healthcare

	Model 1	Model 2
Intercept	0.08 *	0.08 *
-	(0.01)	(0.01)
Republican	-0.06 *	-0.06 *
-	(0.01)	(0.01)
Independent	-0.05 *	-0.05 *
	(0.01)	(0.01)
Age		-0.01
-		(0.01)
Income Quintile 5		0.00
		(0.02)
Income Quintile 4		-0.01
		(0.01)
Income Quintile 3		-0.01
		(0.01)
Income Quintile 2		0.04 *
		(0.02)
Black		-0.00
		(0.02)
Latino		-0.01
		(0.02)
Other Non-white		-0.01
		(0.02)
Education		0.02 *
		(0.01)
Male		-0.00
		(0.01)
Ν	1952	1952
	0.02	0.03
adj.	0.01	0.02
Resid. sd	0.23	0.23

Table A.9: Dependent Variable: Mentioned Education

	Model 1	Model 2
Intercept	0.04 *	0.07 *
-	(0.01)	(0.01)
Republican	-0.01	-0.00
	(0.01)	(0.01)
Independent	-0.00	-0.00
	(0.01)	(0.01)
Age		-0.01
		(0.01)
Income Quintile 5		-0.01
		(0.02)
Income Quintile 4		-0.01
		(0.02)
Income Quintile 3		-0.02
		(0.01)
Income Quintile 2		-0.02
		(0.01)
Black		-0.01
		(0.01)
Latino		-0.01
		(0.01)
Other Non-white		-0.02
		(0.01)
Education		-0.00
		(0.01)
Male		-0.02 *
		(0.01)
Ν	1952	1952
	0.00	0.01
adj.	-0.00	-0.00
Resid. sd	0.19	0.19

Table A.10: Dependent Variable: Mentioned General domestic

	Model 1	Model 2
Intercept	0.06 *	0.06 *
-	(0.01)	(0.01)
Republican	-0.05 *	-0.06 *
	(0.01)	(0.01)
Independent	-0.04 *	-0.04 *
	(0.01)	(0.01)
Age		0.00
		(0.00)
Income Quintile 5		0.02
		(0.02)
Income Quintile 4		0.01
		(0.01)
Income Quintile 3		0.00
		(0.01)
Income Quintile 2		-0.00
		(0.01)
Black		-0.02
		(0.01)
Latino		-0.02
		(0.01)
Other Non-white		-0.01
		(0.02)
Education		0.01
		(0.00)
Male		0.02 *
		(0.01)
N	1952	1952
	0.01	0.03
adj.	0.01	0.02
Resid. sd	0.19	0.19

Table A.11: Dependent Variable: Mentioned Infrastructure

	Model 1	Model 2
Intercept	0.02 *	0.03 *
-	(0.00)	(0.01)
Republican	0.03 *	0.03 *
	(0.01)	(0.01)
Independent	0.02 *	0.02
-	(0.01)	(0.01)
Age		0.00
		(0.00)
Income Quintile 5		-0.03 *
		(0.01)
Income Quintile 4		0.00
		(0.01)
Income Quintile 3		0.01
		(0.01)
Income Quintile 2		-0.01
		(0.01)
Black		-0.01
		(0.01)
Latino		-0.02 *
		(0.01)
Other Non-white		-0.00
		(0.02)
Education		-0.00
		(0.00)
Male		-0.01
		(0.01)
N	1952	1952
	0.01	0.01
adj.	0.01	0.01
Resid. sd	0.18	0.18

Table A.12: Dependent Variable: Mentioned Debt

	Model 1	Model 2
Intercept	0.04 *	0.04 *
-	(0.01)	(0.01)
Republican	-0.02	-0.02 *
1	(0.01)	(0.01)
Independent	-0.01	-0.01
	(0.01)	(0.01)
Age		0.01
C		(0.00)
Income Quintile 5		-0.02
		(0.01)
Income Quintile 4		-0.01
		(0.01)
Income Quintile 3		-0.01
		(0.01)
Income Quintile 2		0.02
		(0.02)
Black		-0.02
		(0.01)
Latino		0.02
		(0.02)
Other Non-white		-0.01
		(0.01)
Education		0.01
		(0.01)
Male		0.00
		(0.01)
Ν	1952	1952
	0.00	0.01
adj.	0.00	0.00
Resid. sd	0.18	0.18

Table A.13: Dependent Variable: Mentioned Other domestic

	Model 1	Model 2
Intercept	0.01 *	0.02
-	(0.00)	(0.01)
Republican	0.04 *	0.03 *
	(0.01)	(0.01)
Independent	0.00	0.00
	(0.01)	(0.01)
Age		0.01 *
-		(0.00)
Income Quintile 5		-0.01
		(0.01)
Income Quintile 4		-0.01
		(0.01)
Income Quintile 3		0.01
		(0.01)
Income Quintile 2		-0.00
		(0.01)
Black		-0.01
		(0.01)
Latino		-0.01
		(0.01)
Other Non-white		0.00
		(0.01)
Education		-0.00
		(0.00)
Male		0.00
		(0.01)
N	1952	1952
	0.01	0.02
adj.	0.01	0.02
Resid. sd	0.16	0.16

Table A.14: Dependent Variable: Mentioned Immigrants

	Model 1	Model 2
Intercept	0.03 *	0.03 *
-	(0.01)	(0.01)
Republican	-0.01 *	-0.01
	(0.01)	(0.01)
Independent	-0.00	-0.00
-	(0.01)	(0.01)
Age		-0.00
2		(0.00)
Income Quintile 5		-0.02
		(0.01)
Income Quintile 4		-0.01
		(0.01)
Income Quintile 3		-0.01
		(0.01)
Income Quintile 2		-0.02 *
		(0.01)
Black		0.01
		(0.01)
Latino		-0.00
		(0.01)
Other Non-white		-0.00
		(0.01)
Education		0.01 *
		(0.00)
Male		-0.00
		(0.01)
Ν	1952	1952
	0.00	0.01
adj.	0.00	0.01
Resid. sd	0.15	0.15

Table A.15: Dependent Variable: Mentioned Businesses

	Model 1	Model 2
Intercept	0.03 *	0.05 *
-	(0.01)	(0.01)
Republican	-0.02 *	-0.02 *
	(0.01)	(0.01)
Independent	-0.01	-0.01
-	(0.01)	(0.01)
Age		0.01 *
C		(0.00)
Income Quintile 5		-0.02
		(0.01)
Income Quintile 4		-0.01
		(0.01)
Income Quintile 3		-0.02 *
		(0.01)
Income Quintile 2		-0.02
		(0.01)
Black		0.00
		(0.01)
Latino		0.00
		(0.01)
Other Non-white		-0.01
		(0.01)
Education		0.01 *
		(0.00)
Male		-0.00
		(0.01)
Ν	1952	1952
	0.00	0.01
adj.	0.00	0.01
Resid. sd	0.14	0.14

Table A.16: Dependent Variable: Mentioned Social Security and Medicare

	Model 1	Model 2
Intercept	0.02 *	0.03 *
-	(0.00)	(0.01)
Republican	0.00	0.00
	(0.01)	(0.01)
Independent	0.00	0.00
-	(0.01)	(0.01)
Age		0.01
C .		(0.00)
Income Quintile 5		-0.00
		(0.01)
Income Quintile 4		-0.01
		(0.01)
Income Quintile 3		-0.01
		(0.01)
Income Quintile 2		0.01
		(0.01)
Black		-0.01
		(0.01)
Latino		0.01
		(0.01)
Other Non-white		-0.01
		(0.01)
Education		0.00
		(0.00)
Male		-0.01 *
		(0.01)
N	1952	1952
	0.00	0.01
adj.	-0.00	0.00
Resid. sd	0.14	0.14

Table A.17: Dependent Variable: Mentioned Research

	Model 1	Model 2
Intercept	0.01 *	0.02
	(0.00)	(0.01)
Republican	0.02 *	0.02
-	(0.01)	(0.01)
Independent	0.00	0.00
	(0.01)	(0.01)
Age		0.00
		(0.00)
Income Quintile 5		-0.01
		(0.01)
Income Quintile 4		0.01
		(0.01)
Income Quintile 3		0.01
		(0.01)
Income Quintile 2		0.01
		(0.01)
Black		-0.01
		(0.01)
Latino		0.01
		(0.01)
Other Non-white		-0.00
		(0.01)
Education		0.00
		(0.00)
Male		-0.01
		(0.01)
Ν	1952	1952
	0.00	0.01
adj.	0.00	0.00
Resid. sd	0.14	0.14

Table A.18: Dependent Variable: Mentioned Taxes