**Table A1. Frame detail marriage equality debate in *New York Times* and *USA Today* 1994–2004**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **PRO** |  |  |
|  | **NYT** | **USA Today** |
|  |  |  |
|  | **1. all kinds of families (339)** | **1. about equality (210)** |
|  | biography (123) | equal access argument (144) |
|  | emotionally charged (35) | civil rights invocation (50) |
|  | just regular people (69) | interracial marriage analogy (13) |
|  | love makes a family (22) | writing discrimination...constitution (4) |
|  | not a threat (34) |  |
|  | stability and monogamy (44) | **2. shifting attitudes (113)** |
|  | symbolism of marriage (30) | shifting attitudes (59) |
|  |  | battle for public opinion (41) |
|  | **2. about equality (690)** | progress is American (22) |
|  | gay rights (300) |  |
|  | equal access argument (230) | **3. love makes a family (56)** |
|  | civil rights invocation (157) | adoption and gay marriage (31) |
|  | interracial marriage analogy (27) | love makes a family (13) |
|  | writing discrimination...constitution (21) | not a threat (14) |
|  |  |  |
|  | **3. progress is American (175)** | **4. all kinds of families (91)** |
|  | progress is American (42) | biography (74) |
|  | gay marriage is inevitable (50) | symbolism of marriage (17) |
|  | battle for public opinion (46) |  |
|  | shifting attitudes (45) | **5. benefits of alternative families (53)** |
|  |  | benefits of alternative families (36) |
|  | **4. rights, not marriage (is not enough) (125)** | gay rights(17) |
|  | rights, not marriage (81) |  |
|  | hypocrisy/bigotry (46) | **6. hypocrisy/bigorty (43)** |
|  |  | hypocrisy/bigotry (26) |
|  | **5. economic aspects of gay marriage (141)** | gay marriage is inevitable (17) |
|  | economic aspects of gay marriage (84) | |
|  | rights for gay couples (61) |  |
|  |  |  |
| **ANTI** |  |  |
|  | **NYT** | **USA Today** |
|  |  |  |
|  | **1. social conservatism/ family values (423)** | **1. social conservatism/ family values (289)** |
|  | children best raised (38) | children best raised (30) |
|  | civilization at stake (39) | civilization at stake(19) |
|  | clergy opinions (100) | clergy opinions (56) |
|  | definitional argument (149) | definitional argument (110) |
|  | natural law (38) | natural law (11) |
|  | preserving traditional marriage (99) | preserving traditional marriage (85) |
|  |  |  |
|  | **2. political conservatism (351)** | **2. political conservatism (115)** |
|  | courts not the place to decide (96) | courts not the place to decide (37) |
|  | culture war (96) | culture war (38) |
|  | divided/divisive (44) | not about equal access (27) |
|  | inappropriate recognition (57) | state's rights (14) |
|  | not about equal rights (37) |  |
|  | state's rights (34) |  |
|  |  |  |
|  | **3. queer critique (176)** | **3. tolerance, not approval (57)** |
|  | benefits of alternative families (10) | tolerance (31) |
|  | challenging gender (8) | redefinition of marriage/family (18) |
|  | dispute among advocates (36) | slippery slope (9) |
|  | questions of political strategy (108) | |
|  | specter of AIDS (17) |  |
|  |  | **4. hetero marriage breakdown (47)** |
|  | **4. cultural backlash (85)** | abortion and gay marriage (32) |
|  | backlash (34) | problems with hetero marriage (15) |
|  | homosexual agenda (12) |  |
|  | sexual perversion (17) |  |
|  | slippery slope (22) | **5. civil unions (96)** |
|  |  | inappropriate recognition (45) |
|  | **5. hetero marriage breakdown (61)** | rights, not marriage (30) |
|  | marriage movement (13) | marriage v. civil unions (24) |
|  | abortion and gay marriage (18) |  |
|  | problems with hetero marriage (30) | **6. cultural backlash (62)** |
|  |  | backlash (48) |
|  | **6. not bigots, fair-minded (73)** | sexual perversion (14) |
|  |  |  |
|  | fair-minded Americans (27) |  |
|  | political overreaction (20) |  |
|  | redefinition of marriage/family (28) | |
|  |  |  |
|  | **7. non-discrimination, not marriage (54)** | |
|  | marriage v. civil unions (43) |  |
|  | non discrimination (11) |  |
|  |  |  |
| **NEITHER** | |  |
|  | **NYT** | **USA Today** |
|  |  |  |
|  | **1. political impact (334)** | **1. political impact (357)** |
|  | campaign issue (84) | campaign issue (103) |
|  | constitutional ban (172) | constitutional ban (121) |
|  | demonstrations (18) | national debate (22) |
|  | national debate (26) | politics of state bans (131) |
|  | politics of state bans (42) |  |
|  |  | **2. legal arguments (78)** |
|  | **2. legal arguments (81)** | civil-state; marriage-church (22) |
|  | full faith and credit/DOMA (50) | full faith and credit/DOMA (53) |
|  | legal opinion v. public opinion (31) | legal opinion v. public opinion (3) |
|  |  |  |
|  | **3. upholding the law (32)** | **3. overreaction (24)** |
|  | upholding the law (13) | political overreaction (13) |
|  | civil-state; marriage-church (19) | non-discrimination (11) |

**\*Number in parenthesis is frequency of frame occurrence or, number of argument occurrence**

**Table A2 Frame detail marriage equality debate *New York Times* and *USA Today* 2005–2014**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **PRO** |  |  |
|  | **NYT** | **USA Today** |
|  |  |  |
|  | **1. making history (228)** | **1. winning state by state (847)** |
|  | Making history (16)  Evolution of opinion (46)  Marriage equality (47)  Religious freedom (54)  Battle for public opinion (65) | Wrong side of history (5)  Gay marriage for the children (7)  Counting states (129)  Litigation details(25)  Same sex marriage (681) |
|  |  |  |
|  | **2. shifting attitudes (168)** | **2. inevitable (456)** |
|  | Shifting attitudes (121)  No compelling state interest (4)  Freedom to marry (11)  Gay marriage is inevitable (25)  Human rights (7) | Legal win (95)  Supreme court (276)  Will of the people (41)  Interracial marriage analogy (13)  Gay marriage is inevitable (31) |
|  |  |  |
|  | **3. about equality (269)** | **3. gay friendly/ democratic position (408)** |
|  | Love makes a family (25)  Equal access (218)  Normalization of civil unions (13)  “gay baiting” (9)  Challenging gender (4) | Adoption and gay marriage (21)  Democrats (367)  Gay friendly (20) |
|  |  |  |
|  | **4. regular people (281)** |  |
|  | Biography (80)  Civil rights invocation (62)  Gay weddings (100)  Normal people (29)  Benefits of alternative families (10) |  |
|  |  |  |
|  | **5. economics of gay marriage (159)** |  |
|  | Wrong side of history (8)  Economic aspects (139)  Gay friendly (12) | |
|  | **6. civil unions are not enough (282)**  Marriage v. civil unions (61)  Civil unions (148)  Discrimination (73)  **7. hypocrisy (157)**  Hypocrisy/bigotry (47)  Civil rights (62)  Gay conservatives/republicans (48)  **8. pop culture (138)**  Adoption and gay marriage (26)  Divided/divisive (14)  Separate is not equal (7)  Pop culture (91) |  |
|  |  |  |
| **ANTI** |  |  |
|  | **NYT** | ***USA Today*** |
|  |  |  |
|  | **1. rights, not marriage/ republican position (830)** | **1. social conservative/ family values (58)** |
|  | constitutional ban (96)  rights, not marriage (20)  stalking horse (5)  fair minded Americans (7)  domestic partnership (37)  republican (665) | Gay conservative/republican (15)  Leviticus (7)  Slippery slope (18)  Take the state out of marriage (18) |
|  |  |  |
|  | **2. queer critique (119)** | **2. marriage by definition (69)** |
|  | Aids (39)  Divorce (75)  Queer critique (5) | Definitional argument (65)  Litmus test (2)  Stalking horse (2) |
|  |  |  |
|  | **3. cultural backlash (19)** | **3. defending traditional marriage (74)** |
|  | backlash (11)  civilization at stake (8) | Civilization at stake (13)  Full faith and credit (34)  Problems with cohabitation (13)  Stability/monogamy (14) |
|  |  | |
|  | **4. marriage, by definition (43)** | **4. courts not the place (394)** |
|  | Definitional argument (31)  Resisting gay marriage laws (12) | Courts not the place (39)  Natural law (23)  Shifting attitudes (56)  Supreme court (276) |
|  |  | |
|  |  | **5. cultural backlash (122)**  Backlash (17)  Religious/clergy opinions (87)  Marriage movement (18) |
| **NEITHER** | |  |
|  | **NYT** | ***USA Today*** |
|  |  |  |
|  | **1. legislative action (132)** | **1. challenging norms (151)** |
|  | Legislative action (95)  Culture war (21)  Stability/monogamy (9)  Tolerance (7) | Challenging gender roles (5)  DOMA (39)  Gay rights (103)  Queer critique (4) |
|  | **2. for the children (51)** | **2. political strategy (53)** |
|  | Upholding the law (10)  Symbolism of marriage (16)  Children best raised (15)  GM for the children (10) | “homosexual agenda” (7)  Human rights (33)  Political strategy (13) |

**\*Number in parenthesis is frequency of frame occurrence or, number of argument occurrence**