On-Line Appendix

Making Embedded Knowledge Transparent: How the V-Dem Opens New Vistas in Civil Society Research

Table A-1: Pairwise Correlations between the Civil Society Participatory Environment, the Core Civil Society Index, and Civil Society Participation Index Indicators

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | v2csprtcpt | v2xcs\_ccsi | v2x\_cspart |
| v2csprtcpt | 1.0000 |  |  |
| v2xcs\_ccsi | 0.8468  | 1.0000 |  |
| v2x\_cspart | 0.8876  | 0.9068  | 1.0000 |

Table A-2: Factor analysis scores for CSPI components

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| *Variable* | *Loading* | *Uniqueness* |
| v2cscnsult | 0.84 | 0.24 |
| v2csprtcpt | 0.81 | 0.31 |
| v2csgender | 0.62 | 0.58 |
| v2pscnslnl | 0.66 | 0.54 |

*10,000 MCMC iterations with 5,000 iterations as burn-in. Chains = 1, thin = 10. Examination of trace and posterior density plots provide evidence that the MCMC chain has reached its stationary distribution.*

Table A-3: Factor analysis scores for CCSI components

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| *Variable* | *Loading* | *Uniqueness* |
| v2cseeorgs | 0.96 | 0.07 |
| v2csreprss | 0.89 | 0.19 |
| v2csprtcpt | 0.81 | 0.32 |

*15,000 MCMC iterations with 10,000 iterations as burn-in. Chains = 1, thin = 10. Examination of trace and posterior density plots provide evidence that the MCMC chain has reached its stationary distribution.*

Table A-4: Relative Strength of Civil Society Participatory Environment Using Random Effects TSCS Regressions

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Model | 4.1 | 4.2 | 4.3 | 4.4 | 4.5 | 4.6 | 4.7 | 4.8 |
| Reference Category | Postcommunist | Fomer Eastern Bloc |
| Lagged DV |  0.903 | \*\*\* |  0.893 | \*\*\* |  0.922 | \*\*\* |  0.910 | \*\*\* |  0.909 | \*\*\* |  0.894 | \*\*\* |  0.923 | \*\*\* |  0.908 | \*\*\* |
| 　 | (0.017) | 　 | (0.017) | 　 | (0.015) | 　 | (0.016) | 　 | (0.015) | 　 | (0.017) | 　 | (0.015) | 　 | (0.016) | 　 |
| Logged GDP/capita  | -18.745 | \*\* | -1.969 | 　 | -11.403 | 　 |  13.424 | 　 | -20.626 | \*\* | -1.112 | 　 | -16.882 | \* | 12.432 | 　 |
|  (Divided by 1000) | (9.215) | 　 | (12.429) | 　 | (10.060) | 　 | (12.992) | 　 | (8.781) | 　 | (11.976) | 　 | (9.162) | 　 | (12.438) | 　 |
| Clean Election Index |  0.181 | \*\*\* |  0.166 | \*\*\* | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 |  0.167 | \*\*\* |  0.148 | \*\*\* | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 |
| 　 | (0.040) | 　 | (0.042) | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.039) | 　 | (0.039) | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 |
| Decades of Democracy |  | 　 | 　 | 　 |  0.011 | \*\*\* |  0.005 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 |  0.013 | \*\*\* |  0.004 | 　 |
| 　 |  | 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.004) | 　 | (0.004) | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.004) | 　 | (0.004) | 　 |
| *Regions* |  | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 |
| Postcommunist Eurasia | -0.027 |   | 　 | 　 |  0.005 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 |  |  | 　 | 　 |
|  | (0.022) |  | 　 | 　 | (0.024) | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 |  |  | 　 | 　 |
|  Former Soviet Union |  |  | 　 |  | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | -0.111 | \*\*\* | 　 | 　 | -0.135 | \*\*\* |
|  |  |  | 　 |  | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.034) | 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.035) | 　 |
|  Former East Bloc |  |  | 　 |  | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 |  0.035 | 　 |  | 　 |  0.081 | \*\*\* | 　 | 　 |
| 　 |  |  | 　 |  | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.022) | 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.022) | 　 | 　 | 　 |
|  Western Europe |  | 　 |  0.067 | \*\* | 　 | 　 |  0.049 | 　 | 　 | 　 |  0.014 |  | 　 | 　 | -0.015 | 　 |
| 　 |  | 　 | (0.034) | 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.033) | 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.035) | 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.035) | 　 |
|  Asia |  | 　 | -0.013 | 　 | 　 | 　 | -0.029 | 　 | 　 | 　 | -0.073 | \* | 　 | 　 | -0.101 | \*\*\*  |
| 　 |  | 　 | (0.037) | 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.037) | 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.038) | 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.037) | 　 |
|  Oceania |  | 　 |  0.018 | 　 | 　 | 　 | -0.006 | 　 | 　 | 　 | -0.035 | 　 | 　 | 　 | -0.070 | 　 |
| 　 |  | 　 | (0.041) |   | 　 | 　 | (0.046) |   | 　 | 　 | (0.042) |   | 　 | 　 | (0.048) |   |
|  Sub-Saharan Africa |  | 　 |  0.091 | \*\*\* | 　 | 　 |  0.070 | \*\* | 　 | 　 |  0.029 | 　 | 　 | 　 | -0.002 | 　 |
| 　 |  | 　 | (0.034) | 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.033) | 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.035) | 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.033) | 　 |
|  Middle East/North Africa |  | 　 | -0.042 | 　 | 　 | 　 | -0.087 | \*\* | 　 | 　 | -0.105 | \*\*\* | 　 | 　 | -0.160 | \*\*\* |
| 　 |  | 　 | (0.034) | 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.039) | 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.037) | 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.042) | 　 |
|  North America |  | 　 |  0.073 | 　 | 　 | 　 |  0.047 | 　 | 　 | 　 |  0.017 | 　 | 　 | 　 | -0.019 | 　 |
| 　 |  | 　 | (0.062) | 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.047) | 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.063) | 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.050) | 　 |
|  Latin America |  | 　 |  0.017 | 　 | 　 | 　 |  0.021 | 　 | 　 | 　 | -0.039 | 　 | 　 | 　 | -0.049 | 　 |
| 　 |  | 　 | (0.029) | 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.030) | 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.030) | 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.030) | 　 |
| Constant |  0.176 | \*\*\* |  0.018 | 　 |  0.177 | \*\* | -0.023 | 　 |  0.187 | \*\*\* |  0.079 | 　 |  0.211 | \*\*\* |  0.057 | 　 |
| 　 | (0.065) | 　 | (0.105) | 　 | (0.077) | 　 | (0.113) | 　 | (0.063) | 　 | (0.102) | 　 | (0.072) | 　 | (0.108) | 　 |
| Number of Observations | 3038 | 3038 | 3011 | 3011 | 3038 | 3038 | 3011 | 3011 |
| Number of Countries | 152 | 152 | 151 | 151 | 152 | 152 | 151 | 151 |
| Within R-Square | 0.69 | 0.69 | 0.685 | 0.686 | 0.689 | 0.690  | 0.685 | 0.686 |
| Between R-Square | 0.995 | 0.995 | 0.996 | 0.995 | 0.996 | 0.995 | 0.996 | 0.995 |
| Overall R-Square | 0.956 | 0.956 | 0.956 | 0.956 | 0.956 | 0.957 | 0.956 | 0.956 |
| Two-tailed tests with robust standard errors in parentheses; \*\*\* p<.01, \*\* p<.05, \* p<.1 |

Table A-4: Relative Strength of Civil Society Participatory Environment Using Random Effects TSCS Regressions (continued)

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Model | 4.9 | 4.10  | 4.11 | 4.12 |
| Reference Category | Former Soviet Union |
| Lagged DV |  0.899 | \*\*\* |  0.894 | \*\*\* |  0.917 | \*\*\* |  0.908 | \*\*\* |
| 　 | (0.017) | 　 | (0.017) | 　 | (0.016) | 　 | (0.016) | 　 |
| Logged GDP/capita  | -16.272 | \* | -1.112 | 　 | -5.514 | 　 |  12.432 | 　 |
|  (Divided by 1000) | (9.479) | 　 | (11.976) | 　 | (9.815) | 　 | (12.438) | 　 |
| Clean Election Index |  0.176 | \*\*\* |  0.148 | \*\*\* | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 |
| 　 | (0.039) | 　 | (0.039) | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 |
| Decades of Democracy | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 |  0.009 | \*\* |  0.004 | 　 |
| 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.004) | 　 | (0.004) | 　 |
| *Regions* | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 |
| Postcommunist Eurasia | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 |
|  | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 | 　 |
|  Former Soviet Union | -0.080 | \*\*\* | 　 | 　 | -0.070 | \*\* | 　 | 　 |
|  | (0.029) | 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.030) | 　 | 　 | 　 |
|  Former East Bloc | 　 | 　 |  0.111 | \*\*\* | 　 | 　 |  0.135 | \*\*\* |
| 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.034) | 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.035) | 　 |
|  Western Europe | 　 | 　 |  0.124 | \*\*\* |   | 　 |  0.120 | \*\*\* |
| 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.042) | 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.043) | 　 |
|  Asia | 　 | 　 |  0.038 | 　 | 　 | 　 |  0.034 | 　 |
| 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.041) | 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.040) | 　 |
|  Oceania | 　 | 　 |  0.075 | 　 | 　 | 　 |  0.065 | 　 |
| 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.047) |   | 　 | 　 | (0.051) |   |
|  Sub-Saharan Africa | 　 | 　 |  0.140 | \*\*\* | 　 | 　 |  0.133 | \*\*\* |
| 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.037) | 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.036) | 　 |
|  Middle East/North Africa | 　 | 　 | 0.006 | 　 | 　 | 　 | -0.025 | 　 |
| 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.036) | 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.039) | 　 |
|  North America | 　 | 　 |  0.128 | \*  | 　 | 　 |  0.116 | \*\* |
| 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.066) | 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.054) | 　 |
|  Latin America | 　 | 　 |  0.072 | \*\* | 　 | 　 |  0.086 | \*\* |
| 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.035) | 　 | 　 | 　 | (0.036) | 　 |
| Constant |  0.164 | \*\* | -0.031 | 　 |  0.140 | \* | -0.078 | 　 |
| 　 | (0.067) | 　 | (0.102) | 　 | (0.076) | 　 | (0.106) | 　 |
| Number of Observations | 3038 | 3038 | 3011 | 3011 |
| Number of Countries | 152 | 152 | 151 | 151 |
| Within R-Square | 0.690  | 0.690  | 0.685 | 0.686 |
| Between R-Square | 0.995 | 0.995 | 0.995 | 0.995 |
| Overall R-Square | 0.956 | 0.957 | 0.956 | 0.956 |

Two-tailed tests with robust standard errors in parentheses; \*\*\* p<.01, \*\* p<.05, \* p<.1