

APPENDIX TO “DIVERSITY IN PARTY LEADERSHIP IN STATE LEGISLATURES”

Figure A1: Parity between Membership and Leadership by Group



Notes: The maps depict the ratio of Percent Leaders divided by Percent Members for each group, averaged across both chambers in each state for the observed years of 2003-2014. A value of 1 indicates parity. Generally, more darkly shaded states are where a given group has a consistently stronger presence in leadership than membership, while more lightly shaded states are where each group has a consistently stronger presence in membership than in leadership.

Table A1: Summary Statistics

	Mean	Std. Dev	Min.	Max.
Pct. Women Leaders	22.37	17.11	0	100
Pct. Black Leaders	7.96	10.05	0	50
Pct. Latino Leaders	3.52	11.33	0	100
Pct. Worker Leaders	3.06	6.15	0	33.33
Number of Positions	14.04	11.02	1	72
Leadership Elections	0.73	--	0	1
Legislative Professionalism	0.21	0.12	0.05	0.63
Term Limits	0.20	--	0	1
Pct. Women in Legislature	23.41	6.88	8.2	41.0
Pct. Black in Legislature	8.34	6.89	0	23.73
Pct. Latino in Legislature	4.05	5.67	0	24.17
Pct. Worker in Legislature	2.45	3.94	0	25
Democratic Control	0.43	--	0	1
South	0.21	--	0	1

Table A2: Correlation Matrix for Dependent Variables

	Pct. Women	Pct. Black	Pct. Latino	Pct. Worker
Pct. Women	1.00			
Pct. Black	0.11	1.00		
Pct. Latino	0.08	-0.08	1.00	
Pct. Workers	-0.10	-0.18	-0.09	1.00

Table A3: Women’s and Black Legislative Caucuses and Leadership Diversity

	<i>Pct. of Leadership</i>			
	<i>Women</i>	<i>Black</i>	<i>Latino</i>	<i>Worker</i>
Number of Positions	0.28* (0.09)	0.02 (0.05)	0.10 (0.06)	-0.02 (0.03)
Leadership Elections	3.60 (2.35)	-5.54* (1.10)	4.47* (1.34)	-0.11 (0.83)
Legislative Professionalism	8.17 (7.69)	-0.40 (3.96)	-4.60 (4.75)	-2.34 (2.82)
Term Limits	-3.24 (2.28)	1.73 (1.06)	-1.28 (1.40)	-0.68 (0.82)
Pct. Women in Legislature	0.95* (0.14)			
Pct. Black in Legislature		0.81* (0.09)		
Pct. Latino in Legislature			1.32* (0.11)	
Pct. Worker in Legislature				0.47* (0.09)
Democratic Control	-2.41 (2.17)	0.13 (0.96)	-0.87 (1.13)	-0.21 (0.71)
South	2.17 (2.41)	1.89 (1.48)	-0.32 (1.33)	-2.47* (0.84)
Women’s Caucus	-1.77 (2.06)			
Black Caucus		-1.87 (1.28)		
Term FE	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Constant	-6.61	5.89*	-3.19	3.14*

	(5.29)	(1.97)	(2.31)	(1.45)
<i>N</i>	331	331	331	331
<i>R</i> ²	0.18	0.45	0.36	0.15

Notes: Standard errors in parentheses. * $p < 0.05$.

Table A4: Group Representation under Democratic Control

	<i>Pct. of Leadership</i>			
	<i>Women</i>	<i>Black</i>	<i>Latino</i>	<i>Worker</i>
Democratic Control	-12.73 (7.08)	-3.55* (1.41)	1.09 (1.38)	1.29 (0.80)
Pct. Women in Legislature	0.80* (0.18)			
Pct. Women X Dem. Control	0.40 (0.28)			
Pct. Black in Legislature		0.51* (0.11)		
Pct. Black X Dem. Control		0.45* (0.13)		
Pct. Latino in Legislature			1.42* (0.12)	
Pct. Latino X Dem. Control			-0.49* (0.21)	
Pct. Worker in Legislature				0.67* (0.10)
Pct. Worker X Dem. Control				-0.63* (0.17)

Notes: Table A4 replicates Table 1 adding interaction terms between the Democratic control variable and each membership variable, but only reports the coefficient estimates and standard errors from the component variables and the interaction terms. Full results are available using the replication code or upon request from the authors. Standard errors in parentheses. * p<0.05.

Table A5: Group Representation under Democratic Control by Party

	<i>Democratic Leadership</i>				<i>Republican Leadership</i>			
	<i>Women</i>	<i>Black</i>	<i>Latino</i>	<i>Worker</i>	<i>Women</i>	<i>Black</i>	<i>Latino</i>	<i>Worker</i>
Democratic Control	-10.12 (8.84)	-7.42* (2.87)	2.44 (1.73)	0.64 (1.37)	4.28 (6.90)	-0.05 (0.30)	-0.30 (0.43)	0.68 (1.01)
Pct. Women in Legislature	1.46* (0.23)				0.64* (0.18)			
Pct. Women X Dem. Control	0.17 (0.35)				-0.11 (0.27)			
Pct. Black in Legislature		1.11 (0.22)				0.04 (0.02)		
Pct. Black X Dem. Control		0.36 (0.26)				-0.04 (0.03)		
Pct. Latino in Legislature			2.83* (0.16)				-0.02 (0.04)	
Pct. Latino X Dem. Control			-1.17* (0.25)				-0.10 (0.06)	
Pct. Worker in Legislature				0.83* (0.16)				0.51* (0.13)
Pct. Worker X Dem. Control				-0.80* (0.28)				-0.47* (0.21)

Notes: Table A5 replicates Table 2 adding interaction terms between the Democratic control variable and each membership variable, but only reports the coefficient estimates and standard errors from the component variables and the interaction terms. Full results are available using the replication code or upon request from the authors. Standard errors in parentheses. * p<0.05.

Table A6: Multilevel Models

	<i>Pct. of Leadership</i>			
	<i>Women</i>	<i>Black</i>	<i>Latino</i>	<i>Worker</i>
Number of Positions	0.25* (0.10)	0.01 (0.06)	0.08 (0.05)	-0.00 (0.03)
Leadership Elections	3.82 (3.40)	-6.06* (2.57)	4.20 (2.99)	-0.03 (1.13)
Legislative Professionalism	4.33 (17.30)	2.32 (4.23)	-4.07 (3.12)	-3.79 (3.71)
Term Limits	-2.55 (3.48)	0.68 (1.04)	-0.70 (1.04)	-0.62 (0.77)
Pct. Women in Legislature	0.81* (0.23)			
Pct. Black in Legislature		0.64* (0.16)		
Pct. Latino in Legislature			1.26* (0.14)	
Pct. Worker in Legislature				0.42 (0.24)
Democratic Control	-1.08 (1.98)	-0.07 (1.17)	-0.35 (0.49)	-0.68 (1.07)
South	0.90 (3.27)	3.07 (3.04)	-0.19 (0.82)	-2.73* (1.08)
Chamber RE	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
State RE	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Constant	-3.00 (6.74)	5.63 (3.06)	-4.51 (3.30)	3.92* (1.91)
<i>N</i>	331	331	331	331
<i>BIC</i>	2757.13	2272.90	2451.55	2054.05

Notes: Robust clustered standard errors in parentheses. * p<0.05.

Table A7: Multilevel Model by Party

	<i>Democratic Leadership</i>				<i>Republican Leadership</i>			
	<i>Women</i>	<i>Black</i>	<i>Latino</i>	<i>Worker</i>	<i>Women</i>	<i>Black</i>	<i>Latino</i>	<i>Worker</i>
Number of Positions	0.20 (0.26)	-0.08 (0.17)	0.10 (0.09)	0.02 (0.11)	0.70* (0.16)	0.01 (0.01)	-0.02 (0.03)	-0.18 (0.13)
Leadership Elections	4.75 (4.15)	-12.41* (5.75)	9.12 (4.97)	-0.06 (1.66)	0.14 (2.62)	-0.15 (0.17)	-1.57 (0.99)	-0.73 (1.68)
Legislative Professionalism	-13.62 (18.01)	12.17 (8.73)	-6.05 (8.34)	0.07 (7.77)	-14.82 (9.38)	-0.55 (0.43)	1.82 (1.41)	-2.95 (3.53)
Term Limits	-3.38 (5.44)	0.21 (1.97)	-1.69 (2.11)	0.92 (1.45)	-1.17 (3.06)	0.51* (0.21)	2.03 (1.34)	-2.07 (1.26)
Pct. Women in Legislature	1.32* (0.37)				0.53* (0.13)			
Pct. Black in Legislature		1.14* (0.28)				0.02 (0.02)		
Pct. Latino in Legislature			2.40* (0.32)				-0.07 (0.06)	
Pct. Worker in Legislature				0.82* (0.22)				0.14 (0.24)
Democratic Control	-5.96 (4.23)	-3.35 (2.34)	0.19 (0.73)	-1.22 (1.22)	2.66 (1.85)	-0.36 (0.20)	-0.15 (0.19)	-1.23 (1.30)
South	-4.58 (4.77)	11.65* (5.38)	-2.47 (2.77)	-2.69 (1.43)	4.14 (2.63)	-0.20 (0.41)	2.15 (1.50)	-2.94 (1.55)
Chamber RE	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
State RE	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Constant	-0.02 (11.41)	12.46 (6.56)	-8.73 (5.05)	2.97 (3.00)	-0.22 (4.84)	0.22 (0.22)	0.90 (0.88)	5.73 (3.01)
<i>N</i>	319	319	319	319	321	321	321	321
<i>BIC</i>	2824.69	2629.35	2401.68	2293.06	2687.53	1260.40	1590.40	2137.13

Notes: Standard errors in parentheses. * p<0.05.

Table A8: Critical Mass and Representation in Leadership

	<i>Pct. of Leadership</i>			
	<i>Women</i>	<i>Black</i>	<i>Latino</i>	<i>Worker</i>
Pct. Women in Legislature	0.78 (0.75)			
Pct. Women in Legislature ²	0.00 (0.02)			
Pct. Black in Legislature		0.87* (0.26)		
Pct. Black in Legislature ²		-0.00 (0.01)		
Pct. Latino in Legislature			1.18* (0.33)	
Pct. Latino in Legislature ²			0.01 (0.02)	
Pct. Worker in Legislature				1.61* (0.23)
Pct. Worker in Legislature ²				-0.06* (0.01)

Notes: Table A8 replicates Table 1 adding a squared term for the membership variables, but reports only the coefficients and standard errors from each component variable and its squared term. Full results are available using the replication code or upon request from the authors. Standard errors in parentheses. * p<0.05.

Table A9: Critical Mass and Representation in Leadership by Party

	<i>Democratic Leadership</i>				<i>Republican Leadership</i>			
	<i>Women</i>	<i>Black</i>	<i>Latino</i>	<i>Worker</i>	<i>Women</i>	<i>Black</i>	<i>Latino</i>	<i>Worker</i>
Pct. Women in Legislature	2.49* (0.94)				1.59* (0.73)			
Pct. Women in Legislature ²	-0.02 (0.02)				-0.02 (0.02)			
Pct. Black in Legislature		1.50* (0.50)				0.12* (0.05)		
Pct. Black in Legislature ²		-0.01 (0.02)				-0.004* (0.002)		
Pct. Latino in Legislature			1.43* (0.41)				0.38* (0.10)	
Pct. Latino in Legislature ²			0.06* (0.02)				-0.02* (0.00)	
Pct. Worker in Legislature				1.92* (0.38)				1.50* (0.29)
Pct. Worker in Legislature ²				-0.07* (0.02)				-0.06* (0.01)

Notes: Table A9 replicates Table 2 adding a squared term for the membership variables, but reports only the coefficients and standard errors from each component variable and its squared term. Full results are available using the replication code or upon request from the authors. Standard errors in parentheses. * p<0.05.

Table A10: Group Presence and Leadership Elections

	<i>Pct. of Leadership</i>			
	<i>Women</i>	<i>Black</i>	<i>Latino</i>	<i>Worker</i>
Leadership Election	-4.16 (9.18)	0.10 (2.0)	-3.48* (1.72)	-0.20 (1.11)
Pct. Women in Legislature	0.69* (0.34)			
Pct. Women X Election	0.34 (0.36)			
Pct. Black in Legislature		1.05* (0.13)		
Pct. Black X Election		-0.51* (0.16)		
Pct. Latino in Legislature			0.19 (0.20)	
Pct. Latino X Election			1.44* (0.22)	
Pct. Worker in Legislature				0.39 (0.67)
Pct. Worker X Election				0.08 (0.68)

Notes: Table A10 replicates Table 1 adding interaction terms between the leadership election variable and each membership variable, but only reports the coefficient estimates and standard errors from the component variables and the interaction terms. Full results are available using the replication code or upon request from the authors. Standard errors in parentheses. * p<0.05.

Table A11: Critical Mass and Representation in Leadership by Party

	<i>Democratic Leadership</i>				<i>Republican Leadership</i>			
	<i>Women</i>	<i>Black</i>	<i>Latino</i>	<i>Worker</i>	<i>Women</i>	<i>Black</i>	<i>Latino</i>	<i>Worker</i>
Leadership Election	-12.59 (11.55)	-3.53 (4.00)	-4.32* (2.04)	-1.46 (1.84)	-1.32 (9.23)	-0.37 (0.42)	-1.16* (0.56)	0.29 (1.38)
Pct. Women in Legislature	0.95* (0.42)				0.55 (0.33)			
Pct. Women X Election	0.74 (0.46)				0.05 (0.36)			
Pct. Black in Legislature		1.59* (0.25)				0.01 (0.03)		
Pct. Black X Election		-0.66* (0.32)				0.02 (0.03)		
Pct. Latino in Legislature			0.48 (0.25)				0.08 (0.07)	
Pct. Latino X Election			2.58* (0.28)				-0.18* (0.07)	
Pct. Worker in Legislature				-1.44 (1.12)				1.83* (0.80)
Pct. Worker X Election				2.06* (1.13)				-1.48 (0.80)

Notes: Table A11 replicates Table 2 adding interaction terms between the leadership election variable and each membership variable, but only reports the coefficient estimates and standard errors from the component variables and the interaction terms. Full results are available using the replication code or upon request from the authors. Standard errors in parentheses. * p<0.05.

Table A12: Intersections of Race and Gender

	<i>Pct. of Leadership</i>				
	<i>White Women</i>	<i>Black Men</i>	<i>Black Women</i>	<i>Latino</i>	<i>Worker</i>
Number of Positions	-0.00 (0.00)	-0.00 (0.00)	-0.00 (0.00)	0.08 (0.06)	-0.02 (0.03)
Leadership Elections	-0.03 (0.02)	-0.02 (0.02)	-0.02* (0.01)	3.90* (1.34)	-0.12 (0.83)
Legislative Professionalism	-0.19* (0.07)	0.04 (0.05)	-0.06* (0.02)	-1.49 (4.73)	-2.35 (2.82)
Term Limits	-0.03 (0.02)	0.01 (0.02)	-0.00 (0.01)	-0.16 (1.39)	-0.68 (0.82)
Pct. Women in Legislature	0.01* (0.00)		0.00* (0.00)		
Pct. Black in Legislature		0.00* (0.00)	0.00* (0.00)		
Pct. Latino in Legislature				1.11* (0.10)	
Pct. Worker in Legislature					0.48* (0.09)
Democratic Control	0.04* (0.02)	0.01 (0.01)	-0.02* (0.01)	-0.73 (1.13)	-0.21 (0.71)
South	-0.04* (0.02)	0.04* (0.02)	-0.01 (0.01)	0.29 (1.33)	-2.46* (0.84)
Term FE	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Constant	0.00 (0.05)	0.02 (0.03)	-0.01 (0.01)	-2.65 (2.31)	3.12* (1.45)
<i>N</i>	331	331	331	331	331
<i>R</i> ²	0.25	0.15	0.29	0.35	0.15

Notes: Standard errors in parentheses. * p<0.05.

Table A13: Party and Gender of Legislative Leaders by Race/Ethnicity

	White	Black	Latinx
Democratic Men	588 (31.0%)	115 (61.2%)	51 (61.4%)
Democratic Women	229 (12.1%)	70 (37.2%)	22 (26.5%)
Republican Men	886 (46.8%)	2 (1.1%)	9 (10.8%)
Republican Women	191 (10.1%)	1 (0.5%)	1 (1.2%)
<i>Column Total</i>	<i>1894</i> <i>(100.0%)</i>	<i>188</i> <i>(100.0%)</i>	<i>83</i> <i>(100.0%)</i>

Notes: Count of legislative leaders in 30 states from 2003-2014 by group. Column percentages in parentheses. Percentages may not sum to 100 due to rounding.

Table A14: Year-to-Year Changes in Membership and Leadership Diversity

	<i>ΔPct. of Leadership</i>			
	<i>Women</i>	<i>Black</i>	<i>Latino</i>	<i>Worker</i>
Number of Positions	0.00 (0.11)	0.04 (0.04)	0.00 (0.08)	0.02 (0.03)
Leadership Elections	-0.68 (2.58)	0.15 (1.03)	-0.22 (2.01)	0.35 (0.71)
Legislative Professionalism	7.98 (8.85)	0.79 (3.54)	-2.04 (6.97)	0.27 (2.43)
Term Limits	-2.04 (2.53)	-0.01 (1.01)	0.08 (1.97)	-0.48 (0.70)
ΔPct. Women Legislature	-0.08 (0.34)			
ΔPct. Black in Legislature		0.14 (0.27)		
ΔPct. Latino in Legislature			0.64 (0.57)	
ΔPct. Worker Legislature				0.18 (0.21)
Democratic Control	-0.29 (2.22)	0.02 (0.88)	0.84 (1.73)	-0.26 (0.61)
South	2.42 (2.56)	1.04 (1.02)	0.11 (2.00)	-0.44 (0.71)
Term FE	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Constant	2.60 (4.29)	1.20 (1.74)	-1.47 (3.36)	-0.09 (1.19)
<i>N</i>	284	284	284	284
<i>BIC</i>	0.02	0.06	0.02	0.02

Notes: Standard errors in parentheses. * p<0.05.