

Appendix

Replication of Tables in Paper, OLS

The following section reports three tables that estimate the same coefficients as in the text, but uses OLS instead of SUR. These tables show both the need for SUR in the text – there are small differences in the estimated coefficients as well as the estimated standard errors – as well as the relative stability of the finding. While SUR and OLS do report small differences for some estimated coefficients and standard errors, they report very similar findings. We can be confident in the robustness of the SUR models to OLS as an alternative model specification.

[Table 1 about here.]

[Table 2 about here.]

[Table 3 about here.]

Removal of Circulation Variable to Increase Sample Size

The following table reports coefficients from models using OLS instead of SUR. Circulation variables are removed from this model due to restrictions on sample size (circulation is from 2006-2014), but their inclusion does not change the associated between endorsements and “no” votes.

[Table 4 about here.]

The following table includes models where we interact newspaper endorsements with dichotomous year variables. Circulation variables are omitted from this analysis due to the small temporal dimension available (circulation is only available from 2006-2014). We cannot identify any temporal relationship between endorsements and time. This indicates that

[Table 5 about here.]

The following three tables replicate the main tables of the paper. However, they do not include the circulation variable, and as such include all elections from 1994-2014. Omitting circulation creates a major source of omitted variable bias, but does increase the sample size and adds more commission- and legislature- sponsored amendments into the sample.

[Table 6 about here.]

[Table 7 about here.]

[Table 8 about here.]

The following table reports OLS estimates that account for campaign expenditures. Campaign expenditures have a statistically-significant effect on the percentage of “no” votes. For every \$1 million spent by the supporters of an initiative, the amount of “no” votes declined by two percentage points. The mean amount of spending is \$7.75 million, so there is the potential for advertising to persuade voters. However, the effect of endorsements on “no” votes remains. Furthermore, this sample does not account for endorsement type as Florida does not collect campaign expenditure information on behalf of commission- or legislature-sponsored amendments. Nor do these data reflect campaign spending by opponents of measured amendments.

[Table 9 about here.]

Table 1: OLS Regression: Predictors of Inducement to Vote and Voter Persuasion on Constitutional Amendment Ballot Initiatives

	<i>Dependent variable:</i>	
	Rolloff	% No Vote
% No Vote	-0.002 (0.040)	
Rolloff		-0.001 (0.013)
Newspaper Endorsement	-0.005 (0.012)	-0.044*** (0.008)
Saliency	-0.043 (0.027)	0.089*** (0.017)
Legislature Sponsor	0.025* (0.015)	-0.051*** (0.010)
Commission Sponsor	0.052* (0.029)	0.001 (0.022)
% County Turnout	-0.296*** (0.069)	0.130*** (0.047)
% College Educated	-0.001 (0.0005)	-0.001** (0.0003)
Ballot Position	0.001 (0.002)	-0.001 (0.001)
Total Amendments	-0.006 (0.005)	0.023*** (0.004)
Word Counts (100s)	0.001 (0.001)	0.001*** (0.0003)
Circulation	-0.00000*** (0.00000)	-0.00000** (0.00000)
Midterm Election	-0.075*** (0.025)	0.016 (0.020)
Intercept	0.352*** (0.074)	0.238*** (0.057)
Observations	1,760	1,760
Adjusted R ²	0.024	0.217
F Statistic	4.640***	41.700***

Note:

*p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01

Table 2: Interactions of Endorsement and Other Covariates, OLS Regression: Predictors of Inducement to Vote and Voter Persuasion on Constitutional Amendment Ballot Initiatives

	<i>Dependent variable:</i>					
		Rolloff			% No Vote	
% No Vote	-0.011 (0.040)	-0.004 (0.040)	-0.004 (0.040)			
Rolloff				-0.003 (0.013)	-0.001 (0.013)	-0.001 (0.013)
Newspaper Endorsement	-0.0001 (0.012)	-0.016 (0.019)	-0.016 (0.019)	-0.029*** (0.008)	-0.077*** (0.014)	-0.077*** (0.014)
Saliency	-0.020 (0.029)	-0.037 (0.027)	-0.037 (0.027)	0.148*** (0.018)	0.108*** (0.017)	0.108*** (0.017)
Legislature Sponsor	0.021 (0.015)	0.016 (0.020)	0.016 (0.020)	-0.061*** (0.010)	-0.077*** (0.014)	-0.077*** (0.014)
Commission Sponsor	0.048* (0.029)	0.059** (0.030)	0.059** (0.030)	-0.008 (0.022)	0.025 (0.023)	0.025 (0.023)
% County Turnout	-0.293*** (0.069)	-0.291*** (0.068)	-0.291*** (0.068)	0.134*** (0.046)	0.147*** (0.047)	0.147*** (0.047)
% College Educated	-0.001 (0.0005)	-0.001 (0.0005)	-0.001 (0.0005)	-0.001*** (0.0003)	-0.001*** (0.0003)	-0.001*** (0.0003)
Ballot Position	0.0004 (0.002)	0.001 (0.002)	0.001 (0.002)	-0.001 (0.001)	-0.001 (0.001)	-0.001 (0.001)
Total Amendments	-0.005 (0.005)	-0.004 (0.005)	-0.004 (0.005)	0.025*** (0.004)	0.027*** (0.004)	0.027*** (0.004)
Word Counts (100s)	0.001 (0.001)	0.001 (0.001)	0.001 (0.001)	0.001*** (0.0003)	0.001*** (0.0003)	0.001*** (0.0003)
Circulation	-0.00000*** (0.00000)	-0.00000*** (0.00000)	-0.00000*** (0.00000)	-0.00000** (0.00000)	-0.00000* (0.00000)	-0.00000* (0.00000)
Midterm Election	-0.075*** (0.025)	-0.070*** (0.025)	-0.070*** (0.025)	0.016 (0.020)	0.032 (0.022)	0.032 (0.022)
Endorse x Saliency	-0.051 (0.040)			-0.134*** (0.018)		
Endorse x Leg. Sponsor		0.018 (0.023)	0.018 (0.023)		0.055*** (0.016)	0.055*** (0.016)
Endorse x Cmsn. Sponsor	0.348*** (0.073)	0.342*** (0.073)	0.342*** (0.073)	0.223*** (0.056)	0.203*** (0.058)	0.203*** (0.058)
Observations	1,760	1,760	1,760	1,760	1,760	1,760
Adjusted R ²	0.025	0.024	0.024	0.236	0.223	0.223
F Statistic	4.430***	4.320***	4.320***	42.700***	39.900***	39.900***

Note:

*p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01

Table 3: Like-Mindedness, OLS Regression: Predictors of Inducement to Vote and Voter Persuasion on Constitutional Amendment Ballot Initiatives

	<i>Dependent variable:</i>			
	Rolloff		% No Vote	
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
% No Vote	-0.019 (0.041)	-0.016 (0.041)		
Rolloff			-0.006 (0.013)	-0.005 (0.013)
Newspaper Endorsement	-0.008 (0.012)	0.013 (0.014)	-0.046*** (0.008)	-0.053*** (0.010)
Salience	-0.044* (0.026)	-0.046* (0.027)	0.086*** (0.017)	0.086*** (0.017)
Legislature Sponsor	0.028* (0.015)	0.029* (0.015)	-0.047*** (0.010)	-0.047*** (0.010)
Commission Sponsor	0.048* (0.029)	0.048* (0.029)	-0.003 (0.022)	-0.003 (0.022)
% County Turnout	-0.297*** (0.071)	-0.314*** (0.072)	0.126*** (0.047)	0.132*** (0.047)
% College Educated	-0.001 (0.0005)	-0.0004 (0.0005)	-0.001** (0.0003)	-0.001** (0.0003)
Ballot Position	0.001 (0.002)	0.001 (0.002)	-0.0003 (0.001)	-0.0004 (0.001)
Total Amendments	-0.006 (0.005)	-0.007 (0.005)	0.022*** (0.004)	0.022*** (0.004)
Word Counts (100s)	0.001 (0.001)	0.001 (0.001)	0.001*** (0.0003)	0.001*** (0.0003)
Circulation	-0.00000*** (0.00000)	-0.00000*** (0.00000)	-0.00000*** (0.00000)	-0.00000*** (0.00000)
Midterm Election	-0.083*** (0.025)	-0.089*** (0.026)	0.007 (0.020)	0.010 (0.021)
Like-Mindedness	-0.032** (0.013)	-0.015 (0.017)	-0.034*** (0.006)	-0.040*** (0.008)
Endorse x Like-Mindedness		-0.041* (0.022)		0.014 (0.012)
Intercept	0.384*** (0.077)	0.390*** (0.077)	0.269*** (0.057)	0.267*** (0.057)
Observations	1,760	1,760	1,760	1,760
Adjusted R ²	0.029	0.030	0.231	0.231
F Statistic	5.000***	4.920***	41.600***	38.800***

Note:

*p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01

Table 4: OLS Regression With Fixed Effects: Predictors of Voter Persuasion and Inducement to Vote on Constitutional Amendment Ballot Initiatives, 1994-2014

	<i>Dependent variable:</i>	
	Roll-Off	% No Vote
	(1)	(2)
% No Vote	0.042*** (0.008)	
Roll-Off		0.176*** (0.039)
endorsement	0.007*** (0.002)	-0.045*** (0.004)
TBT.Mention	-0.027*** (0.005)	0.053*** (0.008)
legspns	0.032*** (0.003)	-0.033*** (0.006)
cmsnspons	0.048*** (0.004)	-0.027*** (0.011)
pctturnout	0.144*** (0.040)	-0.187*** (0.053)
pctcollege	0.001 (0.001)	0.003* (0.002)
racecode	-0.0001 (0.0003)	0.005*** (0.001)
totamends	0.294*** (0.005)	-0.039*** (0.015)
wordcountamend	0.001*** (0.0001)	0.002*** (0.0002)
midterms	2.394*** (0.043)	-0.441*** (0.120)
Constant	-3.357*** (0.089)	0.924*** (0.214)
Observations	4,058	4,058
Adjusted R ²	0.939	0.297
F Statistic (df = 76; 3981)	827.700***	23.550***

Note: *p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01

Table 5: OLS Regression With Year Interactions: Predictors of Voter Persuasion and Inducement to Vote on Constitutional Amendment Ballot Initiatives, 1994-2014

	<i>Dependent variable:</i>	
	Roll-Off	% No Vote
% No Vote	0.005 (0.025)	
Roll-Off		0.002 (0.009)
endorsement	0.002 (0.015)	-0.157*** (0.021)
TBT.Mention	-0.024** (0.012)	0.055*** (0.008)
legspsons	0.031*** (0.010)	-0.042*** (0.006)
cmsnspons	0.056*** (0.016)	-0.047*** (0.011)
pctturnout	-0.160*** (0.039)	-0.036 (0.030)
pctcollege	-0.002*** (0.0003)	-0.002*** (0.0002)
racecode	-0.0004 (0.001)	0.005*** (0.001)
totamends	0.260*** (0.011)	0.008 (0.008)
wordcountamend	0.001** (0.0003)	0.001*** (0.0002)
midterms	2.077*** (0.071)	-0.022 (0.056)
1996	1.366*** (0.056)	-0.111*** (0.040)
1998	-2.597*** (0.091)	-0.107 (0.070)
2000	2.145*** (0.091)	0.045 (0.066)
2002	-1.800*** (0.061)	-0.096** (0.047)
2004	0.793*** (0.038)	-0.164*** (0.027)
2006	-0.794*** (0.025)	-0.105*** (0.017)
2008	1.345*** (0.060)	-0.101** (0.044)
2010	-1.088*** (0.034)	0.095*** (0.027)
endorsement:1996	0.002 (0.023)	0.189*** (0.027)
endorsement:1998	-0.040* (0.020)	0.168*** (0.022)
endorsement:2002	-0.012 (0.023)	0.096*** (0.022)
endorsement:2004	0.013 (0.022)	0.145*** (0.023)
endorsement:2006	0.002 (0.026)	0.124*** (0.023)
endorsement:2008	-0.029 (0.028)	0.248*** (0.028)
endorsement:2010	0.028 (0.031)	-0.014 (0.026)
endorsement:2012	0.051 (0.025)	0.080*** (0.025)
endorsement:2014	-0.030 (0.039)	0.022 (0.026)
Constant	-2.694*** (0.129)	0.469*** (0.096)
Observations	4,058	4,058
Adjusted R ²	0.280	0.305
F Statistic (df = 28; 4029)	57.430***	64.610***

Note: * p<0.1; ** p<0.05; *** p<0.01

Table 6: Seemingly-Unrelated Regression: Predictors of Inducement to Vote and Voter Persuasion on Constitutional Amendment Ballot Initiatives

	Roll-Off	% No Vote
% No Vote	0.018 (0.027)	
Roll-Off		0.006 (0.009)
Newspaper Endorsement	-0.026*** (0.007)	-0.044*** (0.004)
Salience (TBT)	-0.008 (0.011)	0.058*** (0.006)
Legislature Sponsor	0.025** (0.009)	-0.002 (0.005)
Commission Sponsor	0.042*** (0.012)	-0.005 (0.007)
% County Turnout	-0.642*** (0.050)	-0.112*** (0.030)
% College Educated	-0.003*** (0.000)	-0.001*** (0.000)
Ballot Position	-0.000 (0.001)	0.006*** (0.001)
Total Amendments	-0.012*** (0.001)	0.002* (0.001)
Amendment Word Count (100s)	0.001 (0.000)	0.003*** (0.000)
Midterm Elections	-0.083*** (0.013)	-0.048*** (0.007)
Intercept	0.666*** (0.040)	0.474*** (0.023)
Adj. R ²	0.083	0.136
N	4058	4058

*** $p < 0.001$, ** $p < 0.01$, * $p < 0.05$

Table 7: Seemingly-Unrelated Regression: Predictors of Inducement to Vote and Voter Persuasion on Constitutional Amendment Ballot Initiatives

	Roll-Off			% No Votes		
% No Votes	0.018 (0.027)	0.021 (0.027)	0.023 (0.027)			
Roll-Off				0.006	0.007	0.008
	(0.009)	(0.009)	(0.009)			
Newspaper Endorsement	-0.027*** (0.008)	-0.041*** (0.010)	-0.020* (0.008)	-0.041*** (0.005)	-0.038*** (0.006)	-0.050*** (0.005)
Saliency (TBT)	-0.011 (0.013)	-0.006 (0.011)	-0.009 (0.011)	0.064*** (0.008)	0.058*** (0.006)	0.059*** (0.006)
Legislature Sponsor	0.025** (0.009)	0.012 (0.011)	0.025** (0.009)	-0.003 (0.005)	0.002 (0.006)	-0.003 (0.005)
Commission Sponsor	0.042*** (0.013)	0.045*** (0.013)	0.064*** (0.018)	-0.006 (0.007)	-0.006 (0.007)	-0.029** (0.010)
% County Turnout	-0.642*** (0.050)	-0.637*** (0.050)	-0.638*** (0.050)	-0.111*** (0.030)	-0.113*** (0.030)	-0.114*** (0.030)
% College Educated	-0.003*** (0.000)	-0.003*** (0.000)	-0.003*** (0.000)	-0.001*** (0.000)	-0.001*** (0.000)	-0.001*** (0.000)
Ballot Position	-0.000 (0.001)	-0.000 (0.001)	-0.000 (0.001)	0.006*** (0.001)	0.006*** (0.001)	0.006*** (0.001)
Total Amendments	-0.012*** (0.001)	-0.012*** (0.001)	-0.012*** (0.001)	0.002* (0.001)	0.002* (0.001)	0.002* (0.001)
Amendment Word Count (100s)	0.001 (0.000)	0.001* (0.000)	0.001* (0.000)	0.003*** (0.000)	0.003*** (0.000)	0.003*** (0.000)
Midterm Election	-0.082*** (0.013)	-0.082*** (0.013)	-0.083*** (0.013)	-0.049*** (0.007)	-0.048*** (0.007)	-0.048*** (0.007)
Endorse x Saliency	0.006 (0.018)			-0.013 (0.011)		
Endorse x Leg. Sponsor		0.034* (0.014)			-0.013 (0.008)	
Endorse x Cmsn. Sponsor			-0.035 (0.019)			0.038*** (0.011)
Intercept	0.666*** (0.040)	0.665*** (0.040)	0.660*** (0.040)	0.472*** (0.023)	0.473*** (0.023)	0.476*** (0.023)
Adj. R ²	0.086	0.084	0.083	0.141	0.136	0.138
Num. obs. (total)	4058	4058	4058	4058	4058	4058

*** $p < 0.001$, ** $p < 0.01$, * $p < 0.05$

Table 8: Seemingly-Unrelated Regression: Predictors of Inducement to Vote and Voter Persuasion on Constitutional Amendment Ballot Initiatives

	Roll-Off		% No Votes	
Intercept	0.669***	0.669***	0.475***	0.469***
	(0.040)	(0.040)	(0.023)	(0.023)
% No Vote	0.016	0.017		
	(0.027)	(0.027)		
Roll-Off			0.006	0.006
			(0.007)	(0.010)
Newspaper Endorsement	-0.025***	-0.027**	-0.043***	-0.028***
	(0.009)	(0.009)	(0.004)	(0.006)
Salience (TBT)	-0.007	-0.007	0.059***	0.059***
	(0.011)	(0.011)	(0.006)	(0.006)
Legislature Sponsor	0.026**	0.026**	-0.002	-0.002
	(0.009)	(0.009)	(0.005)	(0.005)
Commission Sponsor	0.042***	0.042***	-0.005	-0.001
	(0.012)	(0.013)	(0.007)	(0.007)
% County Turnout	-0.642***	-0.641***	-0.112***	-0.114***
	(0.050)	(0.050)	(0.030)	(0.030)
% College Educated	-0.003***	-0.003***	-0.001***	-0.001***
	(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)
Ballot Position	-0.000	-0.000	0.006***	0.006***
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)
Total Amendments	-0.012***	-0.012***	0.002*	0.002*
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)
Amendment Word Count (100s)	0.001*	0.001*	0.003***	0.003***
	(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)
Midterm Elections	-0.084***	-0.084***	-0.049***	-0.049***
	(0.013)	(0.013)	(0.007)	(0.007)
Like-Mindedness	-0.011	-0.012	-0.004	0.011*
	(0.007)	(0.009)	(0.004)	(0.005)
Endorse x Like-Minded		0.003		-0.032***
		(0.014)		(0.008)
Adj. R ²	0.083	0.083	0.136	0.139
Num. obs. (total)	4058	4058	4058	4058

*** $p < 0.001$, ** $p < 0.01$, * $p < 0.05$

Table 9: Campaign Spending on Ballot Initiatives

	<i>Dependent variable:</i>	
	Roll-Off	% No Votes
% No Votes	-0.193*** (0.043)	
Roll-Off		-0.069*** (0.016)
Newspaper Endorsement	-0.052*** (0.012)	-0.061*** (0.007)
Campaign Spending (\$100000s)	-0.001 (0.0001)	-0.0002*** (0.0001)
Salience	-0.019 (0.012)	0.031*** (0.007)
% County Turnout	-0.879*** (0.081)	-0.181*** (0.057)
% College Educated	-0.004 (0.001)	-0.002*** (0.0004)
Ballot Position	0.031*** (0.004)	0.015*** (0.002)
Total Amendments	-0.044** (0.005)	-0.018*** (0.003)
Amendmend Word Count (100s)	-0.001*** (0.003)	-0.009*** (0.001)
Midterm Election	-0.137 (0.020)	0.032** (0.015)
Intercept	1.078*** (0.065)	0.670*** (0.038)
Observations	1,391	1,391
Adjusted R ²	0.219	0.201
F Statistic (39.920***	35.880***

Note: *p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01