Javier Corrales, Can Anyone Stop the President? Power Asymmetries and Term Limits in Latin America, 1984–2016

*Latin American Politics and Society* vol. 58, no. 2 (Summer 2016)

Appendix 1: Coding for Ideology Perception and Sources

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Case | Ideology(statist = -1, moderate = 0, mkt-oriented = 1) | Sources |
| Argentina 1994 (Menem) | 1 | Corrales (2002); Levistsky and Roberts (2011:14); Echenique, Ozollo, and Vivares (2011:196).  |
| Argentina 1998 (Menem) | 1 | Corrales (2002); Levistsky and Roberts (2011:14); Echenique, Ozollo, and Vivares (2011:196). |
| Argentina 2013 (Fernández de Kirchner) | -1 | Queirolo (2013:152); Madrid, Hunter, and Weyland (2010: 168); Durand (2011:98); Etchemendy and Garay. |
| Bolivia 2009 (Morales) | -1 | Queirolo (2013:152); Etchemendy and Garay (2011:300); Weyland (2010:24); Anria (2010:101). |
| Bolivia 2015 (Morales) | -1 | Queirolo (2013:152); Etchemendy and Garay (2011:300); Weyland (2010:24); Anria (2010:101). |
| Brazil 1988 (Sarney) | 0 | [Kingstone and Ponce (2010: 102); *LatinNews* http://www.latinnews.com/search/80.html?archive=3600&search=Tancredo+Neves; *The New York Times* http://www.nytimes.com/1985/01/16/world/opposition-leader-wins-brazil-vote.html; *Nueva Sociedad* http://nuso.org/articulo/brasil-salida-al-fondo-a-la-derecha/](file://C:\Users\elahn\AppData\Local\Microsoft\Windows\Temporary%20Internet%20Files\Content.Outlook\B33E9L41\Kingstone%20and%20Ponce%20(2010:%20102);%20LatinNews%20http:\www.latinnews.com\search\80.html?archive=3600&search=Tancredo+Neves;%20The%20New%20York%20Times%20http:\\www.nytimes.com\1985\01\16\world\opposition-leader-wins-brazil-vote.html;%20Nueva%20Sociedad%20http:\\nuso.org\articulo\brasil-salida-al-fondo-a-la-derecha\) |
| Brazil 1997 (Cardoso) | 1 | Queirolo (2013:152); Weyland (2011:85); Burton (2011:18). |
| Chile 2005 (Lagos) | 0 | Levistsky and Roberts (2011:1); Huber, Pribble, and Stephens (2011:82). |
| Colombia 1991 (Gaviria) | 1 | *LatinNews* (http://www.latinnews.com/search/80.html?archive=52972&search=gaviria); *The Economist* http://www.economist.com/node/170563 |
| Colombia 2004/05 (Uribe) | 1 | Burton (2011:16); Levistsky and Roberts (2011:6). |
| Colombia 2010 (Uribe)  | 1 | Burton (2011: 16); Levistsky and Roberts (2011: 6); Rodríguez (2014). |
| Colombia2015(Santos) | 1 | Wills-Otero (2014); Rodríguez (2014); *The Economist* http://www.economist.com/node/21552204  |
| Costa Rica 2000 (Rodríguez) | 0 | [*LatinNews* http://www.latinnews.com/search/80.html?archive=79815&search=rodriguez; *The New York Times* http://www.nytimes.com/1998/02/02/world/costa-rica-elects-an-economist-as-president.html; *The Economist* http://www.economist.com/node/1070219](file://C:\Users\elahn\AppData\Local\Microsoft\Windows\Temporary%20Internet%20Files\Content.Outlook\B33E9L41\LatinNews%20http:\www.latinnews.com\search\80.html?archive=79815&search=rodriguez;%20The%20New%20York%20Times%20http:\\www.nytimes.com\1998\02\02\world\costa-rica-elects-an-economist-as-president.html;%20The%20Economist%20http:\\www.economist.com\node\1070219)  |
| Costa Rica 2003 (Pacheco) | 0 | *LatinNews* (http://www.latinnews.com/search/80.html?archive=91443&search=pacheco); *The Economist* http://www.economist.com/node/1070219 |
| Dom. Rep. 1994 (Balaguer) | 1 | [*The Economist* http://www.economist.com/node/1259119; *The New York Times* http://www.nytimes.com/1986/05/05/world/dominican-elections-many-see-a-close-race.html; *LatinNews* http://www.latinnews.com/search/80.html?archive=115915&search=Joaquin+Balaguer](file://C:\Users\elahn\AppData\Local\Microsoft\Windows\Temporary%20Internet%20Files\Content.Outlook\B33E9L41\The%20Economist%20http:\www.economist.com\node\1259119;%20The%20New%20York%20Times%20http:\www.nytimes.com\1986\05\05\world\dominican-elections-many-see-a-close-race.html;%20LatinNews%20http:\www.latinnews.com\search\80.html?archive=115915&search=Joaquin+Balaguer) |
| Dom. Rep. 2002 (Mejia) | 0 | Levistsky and Roberts (2011:27n1); *The Economist* http://www.economist.com/node/2673679 |
| Dom. Rep. 2015 (Medina) | 0 | *The Economist* <http://www.economist.com/blogs/americasview/2012/05/dominican-republics-presidential-election>;*The Huffington Post* http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2012/05/21/dominican-republic-elections-danilo-medina-wins\_n\_1533781.html |
| Dom. Rep. 2010 (Fernández) | 1 | *LatinNews* http://www.latinnews.com/component/k2/item/1320.html?period=+&archive=33&search=leonel+fern%E1ndez&cat\_id=4194%3Adominican-republic%3A-early-unveiling-of-new-economic-cabinet); *The New York Times* http://www.nytimes.com/2004/08/17/world/dominican-resumes-presidency-on-stern-note.html |
| Ecuador 1998 (Alarcón)  | 0 | Coppedge (1997). |
| Ecuador 2008 (Correa) | -1 | Queirolo (2013:152); Conaghan (2011:265); Weyland (2010:4). |
| Guatamala 2011 (Torres) | -1 | Queirolo (2013:152); Levistsky and Roberts (2011:27n1, 195-196).  |
| Honduras 2009(Zelaya) | -1 | [Murillo, Oliveros, and Vaishnav (2011:65); *The New York Times* http://www.nytimes.com/2015/06/26/opinion/why-hondurass-judiciary-is-its-most-dangerous-branch.html?\_r=0.](file://C:\Users\elahn\AppData\Local\Microsoft\Windows\Temporary%20Internet%20Files\Content.Outlook\B33E9L41\Murillo,%20Oliveros,%20and%20Vaishnav%20(2011:65);%20The%20New%20York%20Times%20http:\www.nytimes.com\2015\06\26\opinion\why-hondurass-judiciary-is-its-most-dangerous-branch.html?_r=0.) |
| Honduras 2015 (Hernández) | 1 | *LatinNews* (http://www.latinnews.com/component/k2/item/59338.html?period=+&archive=3&search=juan+orlando+hern%E1ndez&cat\_id=793856%3Ahern%E1ndez-takes-over-in-honduras); *The Economist* http://www.economist.com/blogs/americasview/2013/11/elections-honduras |
| Nicaragua 1995(Chamorro) | 1 | *LatinNews* http://www.latinnews.com/search/80.html?archive=55016&search=chamorro; *The New York Times* http://www.nytimes.com/1990/03/03/opinion/foreign-affairs-now-for-election-groupies.html |
| Nicaragua 2009 (Ortega) | -1 | Queirolo (2013:152); Murillo, Oliveros, and Vaishnav (2011:52). |
| Panama 1998 (Balladares) | 1 | [*The New York Times* http://www.nytimes.com/1994/07/21/world/washington-talk-a-panama-enemy-becomes-an-ally.html; *The New York Times* http://www.nytimes.com/1994/11/03/world/panama-chief-seeks-to-prod-the-economy.html; *LatinNews* http://www.latinnews.com/search/80.html?archive=65317&search=balladares](file://C:\Users\elahn\AppData\Local\Microsoft\Windows\Temporary%20Internet%20Files\Content.Outlook\B33E9L41\The%20New%20York%20Times%20http:\www.nytimes.com\1994\07\21\world\washington-talk-a-panama-enemy-becomes-an-ally.html;%20The%20New%20York%20Times%20http:\www.nytimes.com\1994\11\03\world\panama-chief-seeks-to-prod-the-economy.html;%20LatinNews%20http:\www.latinnews.com\search\80.html?archive=65317&search=balladares) |
| Paraguay 1992 (Rodríguez) | 0 | Lambert (2011:178); *The New York Times* http://www.nytimes.com/1993/01/14/opinion/l-in-paraguay-little-has-really-changed-866093.html; *The New York Times* http://www.nytimes.com/1989/10/01/opinion/topics-of-the-times-paraguay-s-progress.html. |
| Paraguay 2007 (Duarte) | 0 | Lambert (2011:181); *The Economist* http://www.economist.com/node/2337652 |
| Paraguay 2011 (Lugo) | -1 | Queirolo (2013:152); Levistsky and Roberts (2011:15); Beasley-Murray (2010:127). |
| Peru 1993 (Fujimori) | 1 | Burton (2011:18); Levistsky and Roberts (2011:6). |
| Peru 2000 (Fujimori) | 1 | Burton (2011:18); Levistsky and Roberts (2011:6). |
| Peru 2002 (Toledo) | 0 | Cameron (2011:379); Durand (2011:105). |
| Peru 2014 (Humala) | -1 | Cameron (2011: 385); Durand (2011: 106). |
| Venezuela 1999 (Chávez)  | -1 | Corrales (2002); Queirolo (2013:152); Etchemendy and Garay (2011:301). Beasley-Murray (2010) |
| Venezuela 2007(Chávez) | -1 | Corrales and Penfold (2015); Queirolo (2013: 152); Etchemendy and Garay (2011: 301). |
| Venezuela 2009 (Chávez) | -1 | Corrales and Penfold (2015); Queirolo (2013:152); Etchemendy and Garay (2011:301). |

**List of Sources**

Anria, Santiago. “Bolivia’s MAS: Between Party and Movement.” From *Latin America’s Left Turns: Politics, Policies & Trajectories of Change*. Edited by Maxwell A. Cameron & Eric Hershberg. Boulder: Lynne Rienner, 2010.

Beasley-Murray, John. “Constituent Power and the Caracazo: The Exemplary Case of Venezuela.” From *Latin America’s Left Turns: Politics, Policies & Trajectories of Change*. Edited by Maxwell A. Cameron & Eric Hershberg. Boulder: Lynne Rienner, 2010.

Burton, Guy. “The South American right after ‘the end of history’”. From *Right-Wing Politics in the New Latin America: Reaction and Revolt*. Edited by Francisco Dominguez, Gerladine Lievesley, Steve Ludlam. London: Zed Books, 2011.

Cameron, Maxwell A. “Peru: The Left Turn That Wasn’t. From *The Resurgence of the Latin American Left.* Edited by Steven Levitsky & Kenneth M. Roberts. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2011.

Conaghan, Catherine M. “Ecuador. Rafael Correa and the Citizens’ Revolution.” From *The Resurgence of the Latin American Left.* Edited by Steven Levitsky & Kenneth M. Roberts. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2011.

Coppedge, Michael. A Classification of Latin American Political Parties. Kellogg Institute Working Papers 244. Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame, 1997.

Corrales, Javier. *Presidents without Parties: Economic Reforms in Argentina and Venezuela*. Penn State University Press, 2002.

Corrales, Javier and Michael Penfold. Dragon in the Tropics: Venezuela and the Legacy of Hugo Chávez, 2nd edition, Brookings Institution Press, 2015.

Durand, Francisco. “A right for all seasons? Right-wing politics in contemporary Peru.” From *Right-Wing Politics in the New Latin America: Reaction and Revolt*. Edited by Francisco Dominguez, Gerladine Lievesley, Steve Ludlam. London: Zed Books, 2011.

Echenique, Leonardo, Javier Ozollo, and Ernesto Vivares. “The new Argentine right and the Cristina Fernández Administration.” From *Right-Wing Politics in the New Latin America: Reaction and Revolt*. Edited by Francisco Dominguez, Gerladine Lievesley, Steve Ludlam. London: Zed Books, 2011.

Etchemendy, Sebastián and Candelaria Garay. “Argentina: Left Populism in Comparative Perspective, 2003-2009.” From *Right-Wing Politics in the New Latin America: Reaction and Revolt*. Edited by Francisco Dominguez, Gerladine Lievesley, Steve Ludlam. London: Zed Books, 2011.

Huber, Evelyne, Jennifer Pribble and John D. Stephens. “The Chilean Left in Power.” From *Leftist Governments in Latin America.* Edited by Kurt Weyland, Raúl L. Madrid, Wendy Hunter. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011.

Kingstone, Peter R and Aldo F. Ponce. “From Cardoso to Lula.” From *Leftist Governments in Latin America.* Edited by Kurt Weyland, Raúl L. Madrid, Wendy Hunter. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011.

Lambert, Peter. “Undermining the new dawn: opposition to Lugo in Paraguay.” From *Right-Wing Politics in the New Latin America: Reaction and Revolt*. Edited by Francisco Dominguez, Gerladine Lievesley, Steve Ludlam. London: Zed Books, 2011.

Levistky, Steven and Kenneth M. Roberts. “Introduction: Latin America’s Left Turn.” From *The Resurgence of the Latin American Left.* Edited by Steven Levitsky and Kenneth M. Roberts. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2011.

Madrid, Raúl L, Wendy Hunter, and Kurt Weyland. “The Policies and Performance of the Contestatory and Moderate Left.” From *Leftist Governments in Latin America.* Edited by Kurt Weyland, Raúl L. Madrid, Wendy Hunter. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011.

Murillo, María Victoria, Virginia Oliveros, and Milan Vaishnav. “Economic Constraints and Presidential Agency.” From *The Resurgence of the Latin American Left.* Edited by Steven Levitsky & Kenneth M. Roberts. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2011.

Queirolo, Rosario. *The Success of the Left in Latin America: Untainted Parties, Market Reforms, and Voting Behavior*. Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press, 2013.

Rodríguez, Gina Paola. "Álvaro Uribe y Juan Manual Santos: ¿una misma derecha?" *Nueva Sociedad* 254 (2014): 84-99.

Weyland, Kurt. “The Left: Destroyer or Savior of the Market Model?” From *The Resurgence of the Latin American Left.* Edited by Steven Levitsky & Kenneth M. Roberts. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2011.

Weyland, Kurt. “The Performance of Leftist Governments in Latin America.” From *Leftist Governments in Latin America.* Edited by Kurt Weyland, Raúl L. Madrid, Wendy Hunter. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010.

Wills-Otero, Laura. “Colombia.” From *Resilience of the Latin American Right.* Edited by Juan Pablo Luna & Cristobal Rovira Kaltwasser. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2014.

Appendix 2: Sources for Figure 1

**Argentina 94**: *The Economist*: April, 1994: 45%. **Argentina 98:** *New York Times*: July, 1998: 20%. **Argentina 13:** IPSOS-Mora y Araujo in *Infolatam* (2013): May, 2013: 48%; Management and Fit in *The Huffington Post* (2013): April, 2013: 29%; and Consulta Mitofsky: February, 2013: 32%. **Bolivia 09**: Angus Reid: January, 2009: 56%; and Consulta Mitofsky: December, 2008: 56%. **Bolivia 13**: IPSOS in *AFP*: May, 2013: 60%; and Consulta Mitofsky: April, 2013: 59%. **Bolivia 15**: Consulta Mitofsky: July 2015: 75%; IPSOS in Diario Las Américas: June 2015: 75%; IPSOS, in La Razón, January 2015: 75%; Tal Cual Comunicación Estratégica, July 2015: 66% **Brazil 88**: *Latin American Weekly Report*, March 1988 (Sao Paulo only): 36%; November 1987 (Sao Paulo only): 46%. **Brazil 97**: *Los Angeles Times*: April, 1997: 70%; and *Washington Post*: December, 1996: 60%. **Colombia 91:** *New York Times*: December, 1990: 75%; *New York Times*: October, 1991: 75%; and *Washington Post*: May, 1990: 70%. Note: The *Washington Post* does not state a specific rating, “hovered around 70%”. **Colombia 04**: *Bloomberg Businessweek*: December, 2004: 70%; Angus Reid: August, 2004: 64.8%; *BBC News*: April, 2004: 80%. Note: Angus Reid figure is percentage of respondents characterizing Uribe’s performance as “good;” versus 28.1% responding “average,” and 4.8% responding “bad.” **Colombia 10:** CMI & The Colombian National Consultancy Center in*Colombia Reports*: February, 2010: 46%; *The Daily Beast*, December, 2009: 69%; Invamer-Gallup in *Reuters* (2009): November, 2009: 64%; and Consulta Mitofksy, September, 2009: 70% and *Reuters* refers to president’s popularity rating. **Colombia 15**: Centro Nacional Consultoría: April 8, 2015: 54%; Gallup: April 29, 2015: 29%. IPSOS-Napoleón Franco, May 2, 2015: 22%. **Costa Rica 00**: *La Nación*: February 99: 13.6%; Latinnews, May 99: 22.7%, and La Nación (Unimer), May 2000: 29.5%. **Costa Rica 03**: Angus Reid: January, 2003: 46%; and Angus Reid: October, 2002: 64%. **Dom. Rep 94**: Not included in Figure because approval ratings are not available and electoral figures are deemed unreliable due to allegations of fraud. **Dom. Rep. 02**: Economist Intelligence Unit: January 2002: 47%. **Dom. Rep. 10:** CID Gallup: August 2009: 47% (respondents who feel the president’s performance is “good” or “very good”); CID Gallup: February 2009: 38% (president’s favorability rating); Mitofsky: November, 2008: 38%. **Dom Rep 15**: Mitofsky, August 2014: 89%; CID-Latinoamerica: February 2015: 90%; Penn, Schoen and Berland: May 2015, 91%. **Ecuador 98**: Economist Intelligence Unit: August, 1997: 68.4%. **Ecuador 08:**Angus Reid: September, 2008: 73.9%; and Angus Reid: July, 2008: 54%. **Guatemala 11:** CID-Gallup in *Central American Politics* (2011): October-November, 2011: 17%; and CID-Gallup in *Central America Data* (2011): April-June, 2011: 49%. **Honduras 09:** Consulta Mitofsky in *Merco Press* (2009): October, 2008: 25%; and CID-Gallup in *La Prensa/Angus Reid Public Opinion*: October, 2008: 25%. *La Prensa* consists of 25% of respondents characterizing Zelaya’s performance as “good/very good;” versus 39% responding “average”, and 36% responding “bad/very bad.” **Nicaragua 95:** The Latin American Public Opinion Project: July, 1995: 15.51%. **Nicaragua 09**: CID-Gallup in *El Financiero*: August, 2009: 42%. **Panama 98:** Dichter & Neira in *La Prensa/Nueva Sociedad*: November/December, 1998: 33-38%. **Paraguay 92:** Nohlen, Dieter: *Elections in the Americas* (2005). Approval ratings are unavailable. Instead, data is based on the share of seats of the president’s party at the constituent assembly in 1991. **Paraguay 07:** ConsultaMitofsky: April, 2007: 54%; and COIN in *Ultima Hora/Angus Reid Public Opinion* (2007): February, 2007: 18%. *Angus Reid* reports percent of respondents characterizing Duarte’s performance as “excellent/good”. **Paraguay 11:** Consulta Mitofsky: January, 2011: 43.9%; and ConsultaMitofsky: August, 2010: 31%. **Peru 93**: *Boston Globe*: June, 1993: 66%; and *Miami Herald*: April, 1993: 62%. Note: the *Miami Herald* cautions that the 62% figure is based on “polls whose methodology should be subjected to greater scrutiny.”**Peru 00**: *Newsweek International*: April, 2000: 55%; and *Bloomberg BusinessWeek*: February, 2000: 45%. Note: the *Newsweek International* article does not state a specific approval rating; it simply states, “mid-50s.” **Peru 02:** Apoyo Opinión y Mercado in *EFE World News* (2002): March, 2002: 28%; Apoyo & University of Lima in *Los Angeles Times* (2002): March, 2002: 30%; and Apoyo in *Miami Herald* (2001): November, 2001: 32%. **Peru 14:** Ipsos: July 2014: 25%; GFK: July 2014: 22%; Encuestas, July 2014: 27%; Mitofsky, March 2014: 24%. **Venezuela 99**: Consultores21: April, 1999: 84%. **Venezuela 07:** *Boston Globe*: November, 2007: 57%; Hinterlaces Institute in *Latin Newsletters* (2007): July, 2007: 39%; Hinterlaces Institute in *Latin Newsletters*: June, 2007: 31%; andConsulta Mitofsky: March, 2007: 65%. **Venezuela 09**: *Tampa Bay Times* (2009): February 2009: 60%; Luis Vicente León in *McClatchy Newspapers* (2008): 57%; and Datanálisis in *Real Clear Politics* (2008): November, 2008: 58%.

Appendix 3: Regression (multinomial; reference category: failed attempts)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | model1 | model2 | model3 | model4 | model5 | model6 | model7 |   |
| **Relaxation** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |
| Share of Seats | 1.010 |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |
|  | (0.033) |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |
| Approval Rate |  | 0.911\*\* |  |  |  |  | 0.923 |   |
|  |  | (0.029) |  |  |  |  | (0.040) |   |
| Ruling party  |  |  | 2.000 |  |  |  | 2.32e+08 |   |
| Veto |  |  | (1.592) |  |  |  | (4.22e+09) |   |
| Ideology is |  |  |  | 4.666 |  |  |  |   |
| Statist |  |  |  | (5.827) |  |  |  |   |
| Ideology is  |  |  |  | 3.199 |  |  |  |   |
| pro-market |  |  |  | (4.171) |  |  |  |   |
| Policy Move |  |  |  |  | 0.994 |  |  |   |
|  |  |  |  |  | (0.076) |  |  |   |
| Policy Move |  |  |  |  |  | 0.985 |  |   |
| (abs) |  |  |  |  |  | (0.102) |  |   |
| Approval Rate |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.595 |   |
| X Veto |  |  |  |  |  |  | (0.295) |   |
| Constant | 0.488 | 77.043\*\* | 0.600 | 0.250 | 0.916 | 0.972 | 47.824 |   |
|  | (0.797) | (123.409) | (0.310) | (0.280) | (0.375) | (0.522) | (113.183) |   |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Restriction** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |
| Share of Seats | 1.029 |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |
|  | (0.038) |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |
| Approval Rate |  | 0.931\* |  |  |  |  | 0.834\* |   |
|  |  | (0.029) |  |  |  |  | (0.069) |   |
| Ruling party veto |  |  | 2.500 |  |  |  | 0.002 |   |
|  |  |  | (2.165) |  |  |  | (0.009) |   |
| Ideology is |  |  |  | 0.000 |  |  |  |   |
| Statist |  |  |  | (0.000) |  |  |  |   |
| Ideology is  |  |  |  | 1.000 |  |  |  |   |
| pro-market |  |  |  | (0.949) |  |  |  |   |
| Policy Move |  |  |  |  | 1.126 |  |  |   |
|  |  |  |  |  | (0.135) |  |  |   |
| Policy Move  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.999 |  |   |
| (abs) |  |  |  |  |  | (0.132) |  |   |
| Approval Rate  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.173 |   |
| X Veto |  |  |  |  |  |  | (0.108) |   |
| Constant | 0.145 | 21.526 | 0.400 | 1.000 | 0.368 | 0.386 | 1297.904\* |   |
|  | (0.277) | (35.112) | (0.237) | (0.707) | (0.204) | (0.274) | (4354.473) |   |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| R-squared | 0.008 | 0.191 | 0.018 | 0.150 | 0.021 | 0.000 | 0.382 |   |
| N | 36 | 35 | 36 | 36 | 30 | 30 | 35 |   |