On holiday. A history of vacationing. **By Orvar Löfgren. Berkeley: University of California Press. 1999. 320 pp. ISBN 0 520 21767 5.**

This is a solid, clever and very well written essay on modern tourism and vacationing, and a very personal one at that. Swedish anthropologist Orvar Löfgren undertakes to 'use the historical perspective as an analytical tool to problematise the present [of tourism], comparing very different eras and arenas of vacationing'. More precisely, and more modestly, the eras under study cover the last two centuries and the arenas are 'some European and North American vacation worlds', among which Sweden and the USA figure prominently. Löfgren uses the polarised categorisation proposed by Jean Didier Urbain (1994) between the 'Phineas Foggs' and the 'Robinson Crusoes' of the tourist world. In one section of the book he explores the 'landscapes and mindscapes' of tourism that are seen as the central aspects of the kind of short-term and comfortable tourist experience sought by the former. In another section, the 'Getaways', he considers the quest of the Crusoes' for 'elsewherelands'. The last section, entitled 'Between the local and the global' focuses on the beach and the resort locations most commonly frequented by tourists in which the norms of western vacationing have historically been established.

The author is visibly at ease in the worlds of landscape, leisure and consumption studies. He provides and refers to a convincing blend of ideas and authors whose theses, however, he does not always fully engage with. Consequently, the extent to which he achieves his goal of using an historical approach to tourism to 'problematise the present' is questionable. From a tourism studies point of view, while important yet rarely cited texts such as Urbain's *L'idiot du voyage* and *Sur la plage* are nicely used, some widely available works intimately related to the arguments of the author are absent. For example, and most surprisingly, the rich vein of material within the *Annals of Tourism Research* is left virtually unexploited. His consideration of tourism through history could have benefited from Maxine Feifer's *Tourism in history from imperial rome to the present* (1986). His discussion of the tourists' mindset, oscillating between the familiar and the exotic, could have been further supported using, among others, Nelson Graburn's 'Tourism, the sacred journey' (1989). Dean MacCannel's *The Tourist* (1976) is brought into the exposé, though rather briefly and not to full effect. Summaries of the main debates on tourism and anthropology provided by Crick (1989) and Nash (1981; 1996) would definitely have deserved a mention too. Finally, what should also be noted is that a large number of the works quoted in the endnotes are not found in the (very) 'Selected Bibliography', making consultation of these scattered references a rather time-consuming exercise.

If additional references would have helped the non-specialist reader better to situate Löfgren's work in a genealogy of related studies on tourism, their absence does not undermine the value of his essay for the specialist reader. Well-read academics familiar with the anthropological and sociological treatment of tourism and leisure will find the book useful as well as intellectually stimulating. It is full of thoughtful insights and sharp observations on daily life. *On holiday* definitely constitutes a scholarly addition to the growing body of anthropological studies on tourism.

JEAN MICHAUD
Hull University

References

Crick, M. 1989. 'Representations of international tourism in the social sciences: sun, sex, sights, savings and servility', *Annual Review of Anthropology* 18: 307–44.
Feifer, M. 1986. *Tourism in history from*

Imperial Rome to the present. New York: Stein and Day.
Graburn, N. 1989. 'Tourism, the sacred journey', in Valene H. Smith (ed.), *Hosts and guests. The anthropology of tourism*, second edition, 171–186. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
MacCannell, D. 1976. *The tourist. A new theory of leisure class*. New York: Schocken Books.
Nash, D. 1996. *Anthropology of tourism*. New York: Pergamon.
1981. 'Tourism as an anthropological subject', *Current Anthropology* 22: 461-81.
Urbain, J. 1991. *L'idiot du voyage. Histoires de touristes*. Paris: Payot.
1994. *Sur la plage*. Paris: Payot.

***Migration and ethnicity in Chinese history. Hakkas, Pengmin and their neighbours.* By Sow-Theng Leong. Edited by Tim Wright. Introduction by G. William Skinner. Stanford: Stanford University Press. xix + 234 pp. 11 maps. Hb.: $46.00. ISBN 0 804 728577.**

This book is based on three papers edited into the present format after Leong's death. It is a detailed discussion of the complex history of the Hakka, a group which is known outside of China but perhaps little understood. By tracing the migrations of the Hakka and their relations with more orthodox Chinese, it probes questions of Chinese ethnicity in South China and, by implication, broader questions of ethnic difference. Discussion of the Hakka necessarily calls into question assumptions about the cultural or ethnic unity of the Han Chinese. Though most scholars on China, like the Hakka themselves, assert that the Hakka are Han Chinese, they have long been treated as an ethnic other by surrounding populations. Leong analyses this in the context of Skinner's regional systems model, which holds that Chinese allegiances and identity owe more to marketing and trading relations than to the administrative hierarchy. Thus he discusses Hakka migrations in terms of core areas, the densely populated river valleys, rather than in terms of provinces.

The Hakka, like many South Chinese Han, claim their origin from the north. What distinguished them from other South Chinese Han was their initial settlement in highland areas. Unable to practise wet rice cultivation, population pressure resulted in further migrations to the peripheries of the river valleys, the great centres of Han Chinese wet-rice cultivation, where they provided goods such as charcoal, indigo and minerals to the rice-growing Han natives. Their non-dependence on rice cultivation, alongside their mobile way of life and their relative gender equality resulted in discrimination from the Han natives. In the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, this resulted in the rise of an ethnic movement led by the Hakka elite. Throughout, the Hakka asserted that they were Han Chinese and, as Leong describes, many early twentieth-century Republican nationalists were themselves Hakka.

In general, the use of Skinner's model is convincing and Leong shows how an upsurge of Hakka migration took place at times when river-valley core areas were flourishing and there was a demand for the goods. Conversely, a downturn would lead to increased discrimination against Hakka settlers. However, the strong emphasis on economic factors, both by Leong and by Skinner and Wright, draws attention away from other factors that impacted on Hakka experience. Elsewhere we learn of variations in administrative policy between regions and over time, and of the lawless conditions at the boundaries of provinces. We also learn of mutual assimilation with the (non-Han) She during their initial settlement in South China. This may have had a significant influence on Hakka mobility and gender equality. These factors could have been further explored and their importance set against economic factors.

The separate discussions of Hakka and Pengmin (a distinction that appears to be mainly retrospective, in the light of twentieth-century ethnic movements) and of migrations to different river valleys are presumably a result of the book's origin as separate papers. The effect is somewhat repetitive but overall it is a rewarding discussion of the complexities of ethnic identifications.

MARY RACK
Durham University

Down to earth. The territorial bond in South China. **Edited by David Faure and Helen Siu. Stanford: Stanford University Press. xii + 286 pp. Hb.: £35.00. ISBN: 0 804 72434 2. Pb.: £12.95. ISBN 0 804 72435 0.**

This volume looks at the historical construction of place in the South China coastal region. One of its aims, as described in Faure and Siu's introduction, is to take further Skinner's regional systems model by showing that a sense of the local is found not just in the context of marketing communities but also through the structures of lineages and through assertions of ethnic difference. In doing so, drawing as they do on detailed ethnographic and historical material, they challenge some oversimplified views of lineage and Han Chinese ethnicity. Rather than being shown as a means through which elite groups re-enacted agendas of imperial power, the establishment of lineages is shown to be at once a bid for orthodox respectability and for locally based power.

Lineages are shown therefore to be historically constructed in ways that are adaptive and strategic. This is discussed both with reference to the Qing dynasty (Liu) and to the Republican period (Siu). Rights to land by powerful families were based on retrospective claims of ancestral settlement and once claimed, lineage rights to territory could be reinforced through administration (education, local militia and dispute management) and ritual. Often the influence of lineage reached beyond that of the surname group concerned. Luo's paper shows how the worship of Beidi, organised by the lineage elite, became a unifying factor within a wider marketing area.

In addition to pursuing these themes of inclusiveness, the book considers the setting-up of ethnic boundaries. Several papers point out the important role the Tanka ('boat people') play as an excluded group in the context of land claims by powerful lineages. Here, too, one of the strengths of the book is its diachronic perspective. Whereas during the Qing and early twentieth century the Tanka were literally excluded from settling on land (Liu, Ye), in contemporary Hong Kong they are excluded from residence associations (Hayes) and the symbolic claims to territory expressed through temple festivals (Choi). Oversimplified assumptions of ethnic distinction are challenged when we consider that the Tanka are generally regarded as a Han people.

The book makes a useful contribution, using recently available historical and ethnographic material in a way that challenges popular views of the Han Chinese as a homogeneous people enmeshed in a bureaucratic hierarchy. With its theme of constructions of the local and its refutation of simple state–local dichotomies it could be read in the wider anthropological context of work on localisation. In addition, the material on land reclamation and river management serve as a useful reminder of the actuality of terrain, as well as the socially constructed nature of locality. However, while these themes are present in the subject matter discussed in the papers, they are not always clearly addressed. The overall coherence of the book is greatly enhanced by the introduction and the conclusion, but would have been improved by a more overt treatment of these themes in the papers themselves.

MARY RACK
University of Durham

Buddhism in contemporary Tibet. Religious revival and cultural identity. **Edited by Melvyn C. Goldstein and Matthew T. Kapstein. Berkeley: University of California Press. 1998. 235 pp. Hb.: US $40.00. ISBN 0 520 211308. Pb.: US $15.95. ISBN 0 520 211316.**

The gap between the output of academic and non-academic writings on Tibet is conspicuous. In this scenario, this book makes an important contribution by providing ethnographic case studies on the so-called religious revival witnessed in Tibet since the 1980s. All the essays investigate the complimentarity as well as the tensions between this religious revival and the assertion of cultural (and sometimes political) identity by the Tibetans.

The introduction by Goldstein puts the studies in historical perspective and points out that one key issue affecting the revival is the conflicting opinions on the question of the political status of Tibet vis-à-vis China. In the

next chapter he examines the conflict between religious loyalty and advocacy of Tibetan nationalism as experienced by the monks of Drepung monastery. Germano discusses innovations within a *gter ma* – treasure (visionary) movement – in eastern Tibet and argues that it has allowed creative negotiations with modernity. By focusing on a twelve yearly festival in the area of Terdom, Kapstein explores the integral role played by pilgrimage in the construction of self and society in Tibet. Based on a study of a regional ritual tradition in the area of Repong, Epstein and Wengbin tease out the basic paradox faced by the Chinese religious policy makers in Tibet. While the Chinese desire to promote a vision of a multinational state has led them to allow localised discourses to emerge, this has also resulted in Tibetans reclaiming, in part, a heterodox vision of history in which separateness and Tibetanness are highlighted and valorised (p. 138).

In the final chapter there is a sophisticated discussion on the role played by the religious revival in the construction of contemporary Tibetan cultural identity and nationalism. Often the Tibetans adopt a 'dimorphism of values' (pp. 144–5) since they have to negotiate their identity between competing and hostile alternatives in a public culture where there is no free expression. Kapstein concludes that Tibetan nationalism has not grown out of traditional religion but is a result of antipathy to Chinese domination combined with positive ideals of Tibetan autonomy and freedom embodied, for many, in the figure of Dalai Lama.

Though on the whole the essays are based on solid case studies, a Tibetophile may find unsubstantiated some assertions regarding Dharamsala-based government-in-exile's policies, such as those made by Goldstein. Pursuit of 'objective' history does not preclude an outright condemnation of human rights abuses committed by the Chinese. These problems notwithstanding, the book should be read by all those interested in the sociology and politics of ethnicity and nationalism. The highly politicised subject matter of Tibetan identity requires rigorous ethnographic studies and the contributors of the book have provided the ways in which they can be pursued.

DIBYESH ANAND
University of Bristol

***Vigilant citizens. Vigilantism and the state.* By Ray Abrahams. Cambridge: Polity Press. 1998. vii + 192 pp. Hb: £45. ISBN 0 7456 1637 2.**

Early on in this book the author explains why he has ambivalent feelings about people who take rights into their own hands. Although vigilantism clearly undermines the rule of law and may entail oppressive and sometimes violent social control, it should also be understood as one of the ways in which people try to make sense of their lives and maintain a semblance of order in their world. This view allows the author even to sympathise with some forms of vigilantism, especially when the vigilantes are 'ordinary' people who suffer from crimes that receive scant attention from the ruling political elite.

History shows, however, that the human desire to survive in the face of such abandonment has only been one among many other driving forces for vigilante movements. The aim of this book is to provide a comparative and coherent picture of vigilantism through an examination of these forces. Because of the wide distribution and variety of its forms, vigilantism is conceptually treated as an ideal type. It presupposes the existence of a state that is perceived as corrupt or inefficient in dealing with crime, and it typically emerges in 'frontier zones' as a form of (group) self-help with varying degrees of violence. Although the frontier is usually a spatial one (of centre and periphery), it can also be a 'no-go area' (inner cities) or have a temporal quality (night/day).

Most of the cases examined are of the centre-periphery variety. They include, among others, two classic cases from the American West – the San Francisco Vigilance Committees of the 1850s and the Montana vigilantes of the 1860s. Review of the historical literature on these movements reveals that these vigilantes were no ordinary citizens. They were the 'best and the brightest' in a supposedly democratic society, who used the vigilante claim for action (in the face of crime and an inefficient criminal justice system) to pursue a host of other political and economic goals, as well as to act on nativist hostilities towards Australian and Irish immigrants.

There is ample discussion of other

material from North and South America, the Philippines, Russia, South Africa and, despite one authority's assertion that it lacks a vigilante tradition, Great Britain. Partly because of his first-hand acquaintance with the area, Abraham's most interesting case does, however, come from East Africa – the Tanzanian village vigilante groups known as *Sungusungu.* This movement began in the early 1980s as a local response to armed cattle theft and brigandage, but quickly broadened to address concerns about witchcraft, women who had left their husbands and younger men who were disrespectful of their elders. Although criticised by bureaucrats and government officials, the *Sungusungu* received praise from President Nyerere and the Socialist Party, partly because the groups appeared to have been successful in reducing violent crime.

The fuzzy boundaries between the categories of 'police', 'criminal' and 'vigilante' are explored in a discussion of death squads in various countries, including Brazil, where police and 'respectable' citizens acquiesce in the killing of thousands of poor teenage males every year. In another chapter the author argues cautiously that with the strides women have made in economic, political and legal life, the traditionally limited role of women in vigilante activity may well become a thing of the past.

In the final chapter Abrahams reformulates his ambivalent attitude to vigilantism into a legal question: How can vigilantes claim to respect the law by breaking it? He examines the underlying issue of the legitimacy of this paradox through an illuminating discussion of law as a dual system of first- and second-order rules. Equally valuable is his attempt to further clarify the concept of vigilantism by comparing and contrasting it to 'other dwellers in the twilight zone' of state law and authority, in particular social bandits and *mafiosi*. Like vigilantes, social bandits attempt to right wrongs; but whereas the first seek justice in retribution, the latter seek it in redistribution. Like vigilantism, mafia offers protection to members of an established order. But whereas mafia protects only business interests, if necessary through enforcement of informal civil law, vigilantism claims to offer an informal substitute for the criminal justice system to all members of the established order.

Although rich in ethnographic detail, Abrahams' treatise pays little attention to a few recent popular responses to crime. One is the interesting phenomenon of 'cyber-vigilantism', which is dismissed by the author for its figurative use of the term 'vigilante'. In view of the rapidly increasing, popular use of the frontier-less internet, however, we may well wonder what it must take for the moral crusaders of virtual reality to become 'vigilantes' in the literal sense. Also, the 'Neighborhood Watch' movement is only dealt with cursorily because Abrahams accepts the police claim that it contains no traces of vigilantism. This may be true for Britain, but I am not so sure about the USA, where Neighborhood Watch and other self-help, community-policing programs can be socially exclusive and carry strong Republican overtones. But these are minor criticisms of an otherwise impressive piece of work that goes a long way to filling a gap in the literature on social protest movements.

H. A. TAATGEN
Chapman University

De jóvenes, bandas y tribus. Antropología de la juventud (On young people, gangs and tribes. The anthropology of youth). **By Carles Feixa. Barcelona: Ariel. 1998. 287 pp. Pb.: 1800 pts. ISBN 84 344 1176 8.**

During the late 1970s and early 1980s, the presence of local versions of British and American spectacular youth subcultures like 'rockers' and 'mods' in Catalonia and Spain was important enough to provoke the emergence of a label to identify them: 'urban tribes'. At first, Carles Feixa did not consider the phenomenon particularly relevant because it only involved a minority of young people and tended to mix the imaginary and the real in confusing ideological constructions. While collecting life stories in Lleida (Catalonia), however, new findings made him change his mind. Firstly, there was the relevance of the labels that the actors

used to identify themselves and other young people: some of them referred to old class or ethnic elements, but others to the categories of youth cultures – 'hippies', 'mods', 'punks', and 'postmoderns'. For the interviewees, these labels and the idea of 'urban tribes' were important in defining their generation's identity. The second finding that made Carles Feixa change his mind was the fact that although many of the urban tribes' models had originated in a different time and place, they acquired local idiosyncrasies when transferred to Lleida.

Fifteen years later, *De jóvenes, bandas y tribus* (*On young people, gangs and tribes*) revisits the results of his bibliographical and empirical research on the topic. In the first half of the book Feixa develops a general theoretical framework. First he establishes and analyses five broad models of 'youth', matching different types of social organisations, from the 'primitive tribes' of stateless societies to the current 'modern postindustrial society'. Second, he reviews the study of youth cultures, going not only through classic authors like Frederick Trasher, William Foote Whyte, Talcott Parsons, James S. Coleman and the so-called Birmingham School, but also through others mainly ignored by English readers, like Ernesto de Martino in Italy and Jean Monod in France. Finally, he ends this general part of the book with a systematisation of the notions of 'cultures', 'subcultures' and 'styles' and their relationship with structural variables like class, gender, ethnicity, generation and territory.

This review results in Feixa delineating his own metaphor of the 'hourglass', in which macro-social elements are filtered – through 'style' – to youth macro- and micro-cultures. The virtue of this metaphor lies in the way that it connects spectacular styles and structural conditions, but its weakness is that it is insufficiently developed to provide insights on this relationship further than the few already existing in the literature. His approach is strongly indebted to the former Birmingham School represented in *Resistance through rituals* and the idea of spectacular subcultures as social metaphors. This leads him, from my point of view, to make some unjustified interpretations, such as the assumption that the relevance of 'urban tribes' (spectacular subcultures) in generational consciousness is a metaphor for the economic crisis of the late 1970s and early 1980s.

When dealing with empirical data in the second part of the book, however, this danger of over-interpretation does not affect the rigorously ethnographic study of young people's practices and beliefs. The empirical part of the book is based on his qualitative research in Lleida (Catalonia, Spain) and Mexico. Through interviews and life-stories, he first develops the recent history of youth cultures in both places, and then analyses in depth the life of two individual punks, one in Lleida and another in Mexico. This section is the most important and valuable contribution of the book in two respects.

The first valuable set of findings to emerge from the empirical research concerns the personal and local appropriation of global – British and North American – youth cultures in different localities: Lleida (Catalonia, Spain) and Nezahualcóyotl (Mexico). Feixa's account shows the intermingling of global and local elements in youth culture's social space. When dealing with the life stories of the two punks, the reader is faced with the strength of a spectacular youth style (punk). Punk not only strongly affects their identity but also their practice – for instance, their involvement in community and cultural organisations or their broader use of the city.

The book is full of details that help us to understand the process of local appropriation of international styles. We learn, for example, that in Mexico punk was firstly appropriated by middle-class youngsters, and that it was only afterwards that it became mainly working class. We also discover that the global/local relationship works not only in respect of flows from Britain and the United States to Mexico and Spain, but also from Spain to Mexico – where some Catalan and Basque punk bands are well known.

The second element that makes *De jóvenes, bandas y tribus* a valuable contribution is that it shows the links between two 'spectacular' young men and their families, their partners, their transitions to adulthood and their communities. The scarcity of this type of information in the literature on spectacular youth subcultures

makes this contribution especially groundbreaking. Feixa, indeed, succeeds in showing us the more human side of these two punks, far away from the stereotyped portrait constructed by the media and some academic accounts.

He uses life stories consistently to describe the lives of two individuals and their social milieu rather than attempting to elaborate any original theoretical point or to develop his metaphor of the 'hourglass'. The detailed ethnographic description and the broad use of quotes, however, enables the reader to make a personal reading of the text. The book, moreover, is full of gems, such as the author's account of the difference between youth (punk) gangs in Mexico and 'urban tribes' in Spain, the general description of youth cultures' social space in both places, and the individual experience of 'spectacularness' and attitudes towards 'ordinariness'.

In conclusion, *De jóvenes, bandas y tribus* is a valuable contribution to the growing literature in the field of youth cultures. It provides interesting new data on Spain and Mexico, a social reality broadly unknown to the English reader, and on themes usually absent in the literature, such as the relationship between spectacular young people, their families and sentimental partners. The book may lack theoretical originality, since it does not use the empirical evidence presented in the second part of the book either to develop its basic point – spectacular styles as social metaphors – or to elaborate more specific and original theoretical ideas. Nevertheless, the richness of (new) empirical information which is consistently well-used makes for a good contribution.

ROGER MARTINEZ
Barcelona

The object of memory. Arab and Jew narrate the Palestinian village. **By Susan Slymovics. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press. 1998. xxv + 294 pp. Pb.: $19.95. ISBN 0 8122 1525 7.**

Slymovics describes this book as '*Arab and Jew narrate the Palestinian village*' but it is in fact an almost exclusively Arab narrative, which is worth keeping in mind when considering the book's powerful message of Israeli gain at the cost of Arab loss.

The book tells the story of Ein Houd – one of four hundred villages evacuated by the Palestinian Arabs during the 1948 Arab–Israeli war. Ein Houd was resettled by a group of Jewish Israeli artists and renamed Ein Hod in 1953. The group was led by the Romanian artist, Marcel Janco, who came to prominence as co-founder of the Dada movement. Yet only one of the book's six chapters is dedicated to founding or present artists' stories, and its title, 'Sequence and simultaneity. Dada colonialism in Ein Houd' reveals as much about the slant of the book as it does about the content of the chapter.

Slymovics recounts Janco's dream of setting up a Jewish artists' collective to pioneer the foundations of 'real' Israeli art. As the first generation to do this, the artists saw themselves as the 'generation of the desert' from whom something new and unique was sure to emerge. Janco and his comtemporaries describe the founding of Ein Hod as a journey of personal 'discovery and salvage'. Yet their accounts pale into insignificance when set alongside the sheer quantity of Palestinian tales interpreting the event as the 'relinquishment' of Ein Houd through expulsion and destruction.

From memorial book to photograph, from poetry to prose, Ein Houd is mourned by the Palestinians and its memory kept sacred. Once an Arab village of immense beauty, present day Ein Hod is derided by the poet Hanna Abu Hanna as 'a living museum to the denied but not effaced Palestinian past, an accusing witness to Israeli and architectural pretensions and appropriations'.

Evacuation is presented by Slymovics unrelentingly as a tale of loss – loss of home, loss of homeland and loss of cultural and personal identity. Starting with the pre-1948 Palestinian village, she eloquently draws the reader into the story with the help of personalised tales of life before and after the 1948 war. During the long years of exile, memories are rekindled through Arab pilgimages to Ein Hod, where Palestinians pay homage to former homes, their ruins or the bare patches of arid land which have

come to represent a previous, glorified lifestyle. One cannot help but be moved by the emotive descriptions of bewilderment and helplessness in the face of such tangible loss. Writing with candour, Slymovics takes the reader on a journey from Ein Houd into an exile where the various Arab clans dispersed; some to the Jenin refugee camp, others to Jordan and still others to a new village, 'Ein Hourd al-Jadidah'. Built at the crest of a hill in the Carmel mountains, it holds a prominent position with a view of the former village. Inhabitants of ein Houd al-Jadidah recount their golden past while watching their homes take on a new Jewish identity, tantalisingly beyond their reach.

Seen as either 'communities of resistance' or as 'absent present' Palestinians, Slymovics explains how the Palestinian Arabs continue to associate with their past through the use of material structures such as the guesthouse or 'Madafah'. Encouraged by their elders to preserve cultural artefacts within the guesthouse, social relationships within its confines explore fantasies of 'escape … and return to a past that is beyond recovery'. Other means are utilised to bring back memories of loss with poetry and literature playing a central role in the collective memory. Described as 'poetic witness', the language of exile emphasises the power of words, seen by such Palestinian writers as Mahmud Darwish as 'universal weapons against forgetting'.

As the book progresses, the wider story remains captivating but the details become encumbering. Messages are repeated and unnecessarily drawn out, and the read becomes somewhat turgid. Overall, however, Slymovics has written a recommendable ethnography. It is intelligent in style, a fascinating tale and, though lacking in balance, an important memorial to a people displaced.

FRANCES MAGGS-RAPPORT
DeMontfort University

Cultural diversity and social discontent. Anthropological studies on contemporary India. **By R. S. Khare. London: Sage Publications. 1998. 282 pp. Hb.: £27.50. ISBN 0 7619 9250 2.**

As the title suggests, this book is an inquiry into anthropology's engagement with contemporary India's cultural diversity and growing social discontent. R. S. Khare is primarily concerned with the everyday strategies that ordinary Indians ('Hindus and non-Hindus') use in responding to, and negotiating with, the diversifying flux of social forces which have spawned increasing religious tensions and social divisiveness. Social divisions have generated a multiplicity of Indian Others, and Khare looks at the kinds of behaviours and cultural conceptions which ordinary people employ to cope with the what he calls the 'diversifying self-other dialectic' (p. 17).

The way in which the ordinary Indian negotiates and represents important national issues such as the rise of the Hindu right, Muslim minority cultural politics and Dalit political solidarity is primary in Khare's attempt ethnographically and conceptually to interrelate the local and the national. Khare is particularly interested in how anthropology has evolved from functionalist depictions and grand theories to an understanding of people 'as they are' (p. 14). Related to this is how today's anthropology in/of India is situated within a wider (regional/global) disciplinary paradigm. Here, Khare is concerned with the need for a 'genuinely multi-centred' anthropological discourse (p. 30). While acknowledging that such an aim is far from being realised, Khare nonetheless raises familiar questions about contemporary anthropological discourse, including the interrelationships between the anthropologist's work and the informants' interest, the anthropologist's personal self and his professional agenda, and local and global accountability in anthropological representation.

Excepting the last two chapters, this book is a compilation of previously published essays that have been revised for this collection. This book is divided into two main parts of four chapters each. There is very little connection between the two parts, and the reader is left wondering at the intended integration. The first part is centred on the various approaches and perspectives which have defined Indian sociology from the mid-1950s onwards. In Chapter 1, Khare emphasises the point that the contemporary

picture of Indian sociology has been made vastly complex since Dumont's days by the 'ever-multiplying, conflicting cultural other, and outlines the challenges facing anthropological representation of this other. A short synopsis of structural–functional sociology, Dumontian sociology and Marriott's ethnosociological approach is also presented. All are simultaneously lauded for their contributions to Indian sociology, and criticised for being grounded in 'grand theories' modelled after 'modern western philosophies' and for muting 'people's own voices and reasoning' (p. 59). In Chapter 2, the 'idealised essentialist principles' of Dumont and Marriott (p. 81) are compared with the 'careful context-guided description and analysis … for understanding the diverse Indian social past and present' of M. N. Srinivas (p. 88). While the latter anticipates certain aspects of recent critical discussions going on between ethnography and modernity, his work has failed to address the increasingly unmanageable subject of Indian cultural diversity (p. 91).

Drawing on recent trends in interpretive anthropological models, Khare calls for an increased role for reciprocal ethnographic accounts and dialogical fieldwork, where both the anthropologist and the informant's 'discussions of each other' are included (p. 93). Chapter 3 is a critique of recent contributions by Heesterman (1993), Gellner (1992) and Fuller (1992), and its primary purpose for inclusion in this particular book is to highlight the shortcomings of contemporary sociological/anthropological accounts in 'explaining the social reality that people face in life' (p. 108). The last chapter in Part 1 asks whether 'genuinely reciprocal representations are possible even within a discipline devoted to studying cultural others' (p. 121). In this rather abstruse chapter, which revolves around the anthropologist's 'bracketed self' as the 'Other's double', Khare reiterates his call for a reciprocal anthropology 'between the self (or us) and the Other (or them)' (p. 137).

Part 2 is a collection of four chapters which conceptually and ethnographically interrelates the local, regional and national. Here, the reader is given a more vivid illustration of cultural diversity and social discontent. He tries to answer the question of how his informants use their bodies, sensoria, symbolic gestures and social memories to respond to the challenges of exploitation and powerlessness, and to reconstitute their sense of self-worth and identity. In Chapter 6, Khare discusses how these same women strive to attain social justice for themselves and their families, and shows how their sense of justice and injustice is inextricably related to their understanding of *karma* and *dharma*. The author calls for an anthropological approach that aims to unravel the causes of social discontent and that looks toward understanding wider problems of social injustice and human rights.

In Chapter 7, the cultural politics of increasing social violence and 'violence narratives' (p. 18) are considered. Here, Khare makes the argument for a 'much needed cultural account of contemporary violence, which is crucial for issues of social justice and any grassroots acceptance of the human rights movement' (p. 201). He refers to a diverse range of recent violence in India, including the Ayodhya conflict, *sati*, female infanticide and the Bhopal disaster, and rightly argues that victim's narratives often get distorted or pushed aside by government and media interests as the perpetrators' and spectators' accounts take centre stage. Finally, Chapter 8 is a commentary on the challenges that cultural diversity and social conflicts have created for what Khare calls 'socio-cultural sharing' among Hindus (p. 227). He focuses particularly on challenges to Hindus posed by Dalit and Muslim 'cultural reasoning' as he paints a rather bleak picture of the increasing divisiveness between the ideological positions of these groups (p. 234). Khare ends with a caution to anthropologists, journalists and other commentators on how sensitively to approach and engage with such an internally conflicted society.

Throughout this book, Khare has been preoccupied with how Indians reconstitute their identities in view of local, regional and national conflict, and with how anthropology might study an India enmeshed in its own cultural 'otherness, particularly in contexts of increasing social diversity and discontent. He has emphasised the need for anthropologists to establish

collaboration with Indian peoples and cultures under a blanket of mutual trust and responsibility, and believes that this collaboration can only take place by becoming more 'self aware' and creating a dialogue between anthropology and Indian reasoning and experiences.

The reader will find that although some chapters (i.e. the introduction and chapter 4) are perplexing and require more than one reading, most are lucid and engaging. Khare draws upon a wide range of anthropological literature, which readers will find straightforward and most useful. Overall, the book raises provocative questions and highlights important issues which, the reader will agree, merit further attention.

PEGGY FROERER
London School of Economics

***Marketing and modernity.* By Marianne Elisabeth Lien. Oxford and New York: Berg. 1997. 204 pp. Hb.: $55. ISBN 1 85973 991 1. Pb.: $19.50. ISBN 1 85973 996 2.**

Marketing and modernity is an ethnographic study of the marketing department of 'Viking Foods' (not its real name), a Norwegian food manufacturer. The study is framed by a critical approach to the 'acultural' and 'historically confined' characterisations of modernity presented in the work of Giddens and Bauman. Critiques of Giddens' theories of modernity are not exactly unusual, and in a way Lien's approach is predictable because, as she points out, sociological theory often *does* fail to base its definitions 'on empirical enquiry or comparison'. Lien's analysis is grounded in an excellent ethnographic study and explores the cultural configurations of modernity through a focus on the everyday practices of modern men and women. She also aims to 'contribute to a better understanding of the interaction between the material and the social dimension of material artefacts' by drawing on the work of Latour and a constructionist approach to science and technology studies (STS). She examines how product managers negotiate with various human (e.g. consumers) and non-human (e.g. sausages) 'allies', to produce 'stable alliances', 'close controversies' and, ultimately order. This theoretical introduction is at the heart of Chapter 1.

Chapters 2 and 3 introduce the empirical and marketing contexts, exploring methodological issues related to anthropology at home and also explaining the world of Norwegian marketing to the uninitiated. Chapter 4 describes the social organisation of the marketing department and the identities of product managers, people largely at a 'stepping stone' career-stage who are 'engaged' and committed to a role that involves 'total' responsibility for product success. The career path described is clearly gendered and incompatible with motherhood. In Chapter 5 Lien discusses metaphors and discourses used in marketing by analysing her informants' uses of terminology and the texts and concepts of marketing as a discipline, showing, for example, how 'the market' becomes a living entity and products become 'weapons' among other metaphors of warfare. Chapters 6–8 present case studies of three marketing projects, showing how these relationships, responsibilities and metaphors come into play in the work of product managers. These chapters provide fascinating examples of decision-making, dilemmas, individual product managers' strategies and experiences and what Lien calls a 'common pool of knowledge' that is used in the marketing department.

Chapters 9 and 10 return to the theoretical issues introduced in Chapter 1 and discuss them in the light of the ethnography reported in the chapters that follow. Here Lien compares her own findings with the claims of theorists of modernity and argues that while some aspects of marketing and the activities of product managers are clearly modern in character, there are also parallels between the marketing department and 'traditional' cultures. For instance, Lien shows that while marketing discourse tends to be expressed in metaphors of warfare, there is 'discontinuity between discursive images and everyday action'. The actual day-to-day activities of product managers can be more aptly described by terms like uncertainty, contingency and doubt, and can also be regarded as reflecting a preoccupation with authenticity and a constant striving to

create order. Therefore 'we may conceive the product managers' struggles and considerations as truly modern in Giddens' sense of the term'; they are 'critical and self reflexive'. Lien draws from classical anthropology to compare 'modern' marketing with 'traditional' practices. Following Sahlins, she argues that the 'modern consumption of manufactured goods represents totemism of a modern kind'. However, rather than pertaining to a 'natural order', manufactured items are 'unstable totems'. The most important difference is that in modern manufacture the 'totemic emblems' have already been shaped by a particular group of professionals to adapt to their image of consumer preferences. Through a comparative analysis with the Kula exchange system she argues that the key difference between 'modern' and 'traditional' contexts rests in the pervasive uncertainty and doubt of product managers. She concludes that 'the characteristic feature of modernity is not ambivalence in itself, but rather the specific ways in which ambivalence is dealt with'.

Chapters 4 to 8 provide excellent anthropologically informed reading. Relatively unfettered by theory, they are also accessible to a wider readership. Because these chapters are largely descriptive and only implicitly interweave the ethnography with Lien's wider analysis, they invite readers to engage in their own thoughts about how the work should be theorised. A positive effect of this is its making the material's wider relevance apparent. Lien's study is undoubtedly important, well developed and a useful interdisciplinary project. Moreover, it fulfils all its aims and is written in a convincing and engaging style. Personally, I found myself wishing that the critique of theories of modernity was a sub-theme of a book. I longed instead for a book that more closely theorised product managers' identities and their agency and creativity, that focused on the *differences* among product managers and that made gender more of a salient issue.

The book is problematic in other less personal ways. Lien does not explicitly critique the assumptions that inform consumer research or the way that it is applied in marketing departments. However, her insights into how marketing knowledge is produced and used indicate how little product managers know about consumers. While it might sound self-promoting to say anthropologists could probably do it better, the book also signifies the potential of anthropologically informed approaches to consumer research.

SARAH PINK
Loughborough University