**Supplementary table** Socratic approach versus alternative approaches and methods for the same health technologies

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Technology** | **Topic** | **Socratic approach** | **Alternatives** |
| Human papillomavirus vaccination  | Prevention | **Title:** Ethical challenges with implementing prophylactic vaccines against human papilloma virus (HPV) [1]**Institution:** NOKC (2008) | Human papillomavirus (HPV) vaccination for the prevention of HPV 16/18 induced cervical cancer and its precursors [2].**Institution:** DAHTA@DIMDI (2009)**Approach:** Narrative analysis without methodological approachGeneral childhood vaccination against HPV 16 and 18 aimed at preventing cervical cancer [3]. **Institution:** SBU (2008)**Approach:** Hermeren’s acteur modelHPV vaccination for the prevention of cervical cancer in Belgium [4]. **Institution:** KCE (2007)**Approach:** Principles ApproachReduction in the risk of cervical cancer by vaccination against human papillomavirus (HPV) - a health technology assessment [5]. **Institution:** DACEHTA (2007) **Approach:** Principles Approach***Related technologies (HPV screening)***Cervical cancer screening and Human Papillomavirus (HPV) testing [6]. **Institution:** KCE (2006)**Approach:** unknown, purposive literature analysis was doneHuman papillomavirus testing in primary cervical cancer screening - early assessment briefs [7]. **Institution:** SBU (2000)**Approach:** unknown / not stated |
| Neonatal screening for inborn errors of metabolism | Screening | **Title:** Effectiveness of neonatal screening for inborn errors of metabolism [8].**Institution:** NOKC (2007) | Évaluation a priori de l’extension du dépistage neonatal à une ou plusieurs erreurs innées du métabolisme par la technique de spectrométrie de masse en tandem en population générale en France. 1er volet : dépistage du déficit en MCAD [9]**Institution:** HAS (2011)**Approach:** Principles ApproachClinical effectiveness of neonatal screening for inborn errors of metabolism using tandem mass spectrometry [10]. **Institution:** AVALIA-T (2007)**Approach:** Principles Approach (WHO Guideline)Screening for rare metabolic disease in newborn infants [11]. **Institution:** FinOHTA (2004)**Approach:** Eclectic ApproachTandem mass spectrometry and neonatal blood screening in Quebec [12].**Institution:** AETMIS (2007)**Approach:** Integrated ApproachNeonatal screening of inborn errors of metabolism using tandem mass spectrometer: an evidence-based analysis [13].**Institution:** MAS (2003)**Approach:** Principles Approach (WHO Guideline)Clinical and cost-effectiveness of screening newborns for Medium chain acyl~CoA dehydrogenase deficiency using tandem mass spectrometry [14]. **Institution:** CCOHTA (2006)**Approach:** unknown / not statedExpanding Newborn Screening: Process, Policy, and Priorities [15].**Institution**: The Hastings Center (2008)**Approach**: unknown / not stated |
| Stem cell transplantation | Treatment | Ethical issues in autologous stem cell transplantation (ASCT) in advanced breast cancer: A systematic literature review [16]. **Institution:** IQWiG (2009)Therapeutic use of haematopoietic stem cells from cord blood [17].**Institution:** SMM (2003) | Bone marrow and peripheral blood stem cell transplantation for malignancy [18].**Institution**: NCCHTA (1998)**Approach**: unknown / not statedAllogeneic stem cell transplantation methods [19]. **Institution:** AHFMR (2000)**Approach:** Principles approach |
| Routine ultrasound in pregnancy | Screening | Routine ultrasound in pregnancy [20]. **Institution:** NOKC (2008)Early ultrasound in routine pregnancy care [21].**Institution:** NOKC (2012)Ethical issues in routine prenatal ultrasound [22].**Institution:** IQWiG (2010) (unpublished) | Routine ultrasound scanning before 24 weeks of pregnancy [23]. **Institution:** NHS Quality Improvement Scotland (2004)**Approach:** literature review and focus groups on patient issuesPrenatal screening: Down syndrome, neural tube defects, routine ultrasound. [24]. **Institution:** GR (2001)**Approach:** Principles approachRoutine ultrasound in pregnancy [25]. **Institution:** SBU (1998)**Approach:** Principles approachMethods of Early Prenatal Diagnosis [26].**Institution:** SBU (2006)**Approach:** Principles approachPsychological aspects, women's views, and expectations regarding ultrasound during pregnancy [27]. **Institution**: DACEHTA (2006)**Approach**: literature review and survey on patent issues***Related technologies (Biochemical screening):***Biochemical Screening on fetal anomalies and neural tube defects [28]. **Institution:** DAHTA@DIMDI (2001) **Approach:** Principles approach |
| Bariatric surgery  | Treatment | Stuck in the Middle: The Many Moral Challenges With Bariatric Surgery [29]. **Institution:** NOKC (2010)The Encompassing Ethics of Bariatric Surgery [30].**Instituion:** NOKC (2010) | Bariatric treatments for adult obesity [31]**Institution:** IHE (2012)**Approach:** Social Shaping?Different methods for ethical analysis in health technology assessment [32]. **Institution:** international joint project (Finland, Australia, Norway, The Netherlands) (2011)**Approach:** Casuistry, Principles approach, EUnetHTA Core Model, Socratic approachSurgical treatment of morbid obesity [33]. **Institution:** FinOHTA (2008)**Approach:** EUnetHTA Core ModelEthical Issues of Obesity Surgery [34].**Institution:** FinOHTA (2011) **Approach:** EUnetHTA Core ModelObesity - problems and interventions [35]. **Institution**: SBU (2002) **Approach**: Principles approach |
| Intracyto-plasmic sperm injection (ICSI) | Treatment | Male infertility: Intracytoplasmic sperm injection (ICSI) using surgically retrieved sperm from the testis or the epididymis [36]. **Institution:** NOKC (2007) | Social and ethical aspects of in vitro fertilization [37]. **Institution:** University of Texas–Houston School of Public Health**Approach:** unknown / not stated |
| Institutions acronyms: AETMIS (today INESSS)AHFMR (today IHE)AVALIA-T Galician Agency for Health Technology Assessment, Santiago de Compostela, SpainCADTH Canadian Agency for Drugs and Technologies in Health , Ottawa, Canada CCOHTA (today CADTH)DACEHTA Danish Centre for Health Technology Assessment, Copenhagen, DanmarkDAHTA@DIMDI German Agency for HTA at the German Institute for Medical Documentation and Information, Cologne, GermanyFinOHTA Finnish Office for Health Technology Assessment, Helsinki, FinlandGR Gezondheidsraad, The Hague, The NetherlandsHAS Haute Autorité de Santé; Paris, FranceIHE Institute of Health Economics, Edmonton, CanadaINESSS Institut national d'excellence en santé et en services, Montreal, CanadaIQWiG Institute for Quality and Efficiency in Health Care, Cologne, GermanyKCE Belgian Health Care Knowledge Centre, Brussels, BelgiumMAS Medical Advisory Secretariat, Ontario Ministry of Health and Long-Term Care, Toronto, CanadaNOKC Norwegian Knowledge Centre for the Health Services, Oslo, NorwaySBU Swedish Council on Technology Assessment in Health Care, Stockholm, SwedenSMM (today NOKC) |

**References**

1. Nasjonalt kunnskapssenter for helsetjenesten. Vaksiner mot humant papillomavirus (HPV). Etiske aspekter ved innføring av profylaktiske HPVvaksiner. Oslo: NOKC; 2008.
2. Damm O; Nocon M; Roll S; Vauth C; Willich SN; Greiner W. Impfung gegen humane Papillomaviren (HPV) zur Prävention HPV 16/18 induzierter Zervixkarzinome und derer Vorstufen. Köln: DIMDI; 2009.
3. Statens beredning för medicinsk utvärdering. Allmän barnvaccination mot HPV 16 och 18 i syfte att förebygga livmoderhalscancer. Stockholm: SBU; 2008.
4. Federaal Kenniscentrum voor de Gezondheidszorg. HPV vaccination for the prevention of cervical cancer in Belgium: Health Technology Assessment. Brussels: KCE, 2007.
5. National Board of Health, Danish Centre for Health Technology Assessment. Reduction in the risk of cervical cancer by vaccination against human papillomavirus (HPV) – a health technology assessment. Copenhagen: DACEHTA; 2007.
6. Federaal Kenniscentrum voor de Gezondheidszorg. Cervical cancer screening and Human Papillomavirus (HPV) testing. Brussels: KCE, 2006.
7. Statens beredning för medicinsk utvärdering. Human papillomvirus-test vid primär screening för cellförändringar på livmoderhalsen: Alert. Stockholm: SBU; 2000.
8. Nasjonalt kunnskapssenter for helsetjenesten. Helseeffekt av nyfødtscreening for medfødte stoffskiftesykdommer. Oslo: NOKC; 2007.
9. Haute Autorité de Santé. Évaluation a priori de l’extension du dépistage neonatal à une ou plusieurs erreurs innées du métabolisme par la technique de spectrométrie de masse en tandem en population générale en France. 1er volet: dépistage du déficit en MCAD. Paris: HAS; 2011.
10. Galician Agency for Health Technology Assessment. Efectividad clínica del cribado neonatal de los errores congénitos del metabolismo mediante espectrometría de masas en tándem. Revisión sistemática. Santiago de Compostela: AVALIA-T; 2007.
11. Autti-Rämö I, Laajalahti L, Koskinen H, Sintonen H, Mäkelä M. Vastasyntyneiden harvinaisten aineenvaihduntatautien seulonta. Helsinki: FinOHTA; 2004.
12. Agence d’évaluation des technologies et des modes d’intervention en santé.Tandem mass spectrometry and neonatal blood screening in Quebec. Montréal: AETMIS, 2007.
13. Medical Advisory Secretariat, Ontario Ministry of Health and Long-Term Care. Neonatal screening of inborn errors of metabolism using tandem mass spectrometer: an evidence-based analysis. Toronto: MAS; 2003.
14. Tran K, Banerjee S, Li H, Noorani H, Mensinkai S, Dooley K. Clinical and cost-effectiveness of screening newborns for Medium chain acyl~CoA dehydrogenase deficiency using tandem mass spectrometry**.** Ottawa: CCOHTA; 2006.
15. Moyer VA, Calonge N, Teutsch SM, Botkin JR. Expanding newborn screening: Process, policy, and priorities. Hastings Cent Rep 2008; 38(3): 32-9.
16. Droste S, Herrmann-Frank A, Scheibler F, Krones T. Ethical issues in autologous stem cell transplantation (ASCT) in advanced breast cancer: A systematic literature review. BMC Medical Ethics 2011, 12:6.
17. Brinch L, Husebekk A, Funderud S, Lyngstadaas A.Terapeutisk bruk av hematopoietiske stamceller fra navlestrengsblod**.** Oslo: SMM; 2003.
18. Johnson PW, Simnett SJ, Sweetenham JW, Morgan GJ, Stewart LA.Bone marrow and peripheral blood stem cell transplantation for malignancy. Health Technology Assessment 1998; 2(8): 1-187.
19. Jacobs P, Hailey D, MacLean N.Allogeneic stem cell transplantation methods. Edmonton: AHFMR; 2000.
20. Nasjonalt kunnskapssenter for helsetjenesten. Rutinemessig ultralydundersøkelse i svangerskapet. Oslo: NOKC; 2008.
21. Nasjonalt kunnskapssenter for helsetjenesten. Tidlig ultralyd i svangerskapsomsorgen. Oslo: NOKC; 2012.
22. Droste S. Ethical issues in routine prenatal ultrasound. Cologne: IQWiG; 2010 (unpublished).
23. Ritchie K, Boynton J, Bradbury I, Foster L, Iqbal K, Kohli H, et al. Routine ultrasound scanning before 24 weeks of pregnancy. Edinburgh: NHS Quality Improvement Scotland; 2004.
24. Gezondheidsraad. Prenatale screening. Downsyndroom, neuralebuisdefecten, routine-echoscopie. The Hague: GR; 2001.
25. Hagenfeldt K, Alton Lundberg V, Axelsson O, Blennow M, Boj F, Bygdemann M, et al. Rutinmässig ultraljudsundersökning under graviditet**.** Stockholm: SBU; 1998.
26. Statens beredning för medicinsk utvärdering. Metoder för tidig fosterdiagnostik: En systematisk litteraturöversikt. Stockholm: SBU; 2006.
27. Center for Evaluering og Medicinsk Teknologivurdering. Psykologiske aspekter, brugerholdninger og -forventninger i forbindelse med ultralydskanning i graviditeten. Copenhagen: DACEHTA; 2006.
28. Droste S, Brand A. Biochemisches Screening für fetale Chromosomenanomalien und Neuralrohrdefekte - eine Verfahrensbewertung. Cologne: DIMDI; 2001.
29. Hofmann B. Stuck in the Middle: The Many Moral Challenges With Bariatric Surgery. Am J Bioethics 2010; 10 (12): 3-11.
30. Hofmann B. The Encompassing Ethics of Bariatric Surgery. Am J Bioethics 2010; 10 (12): W1-W2.
31. Institute of Health Economics. Bariatric treatments for adult obesity. Edmonton: IHE; 2012.
32. Saarni SI, Braunack-Mayer A, Hofmann B, van der Wilt GJ. Different methods for ethical analysis in health technology assessment. Int J Technol Assess Health Care 2011; 27(4): 305-12.
33. Ikonen T, Anttila H, Gylling H, Isojarvi J, Koivukangas V, Kumpulainen T, et al. Sairaalloisen lihavuuden nleikkaushoito. Helsinki: FinOHTA; 2008.
34. Saarni SI, Anttila H, Saarni SE, Mustajoki P, Koivukangas V, Ikonen TS, Malmivaara A. Ethical Issues of Obesity Surgery: A Health Technology Assessment. Obes Surg 2011; 21(9): 1469-76.
35. Asp N G, Bjorntorp P, Britton M, Carlsson P, Kjellstrom T, Marcus C, et al. Fetma: Problem och åtgärder. Stockholm: SBU; 2002.
36. Nasjonalt kunnskapssenter for helsetjenesten. Mannlig infertilitet: Intracytoplasmatisk spermieinjeksjon (ICSI) med spermier uthentet fra bitestikkel eller testikkel. Oslo: NOKC; 2007.
37. Heitman E. Social and ethical aspects of in vitro fertilization**.** Int J Technol Assess Health Care 1999; 15(1): 22-35.