

Appendix A. List of Study Groups and Discussion Groups Held by the CFR, 1955-1972.

| Year | Title | Director | Group Type |
|-------------|--|--|-----------------------|
| 1954-55 | U.S.-Soviet Relations | Henry L. Roberts | Study group (SG) |
| | Indian-American Relations | Phillips Talbot, Marina S. Finkelstein | SG |
| | Germany's Position in Western Europe | Perry Laukhuff, Basil Karp | SG |
| | U.S. Policy in Southeast Asia | John Kerry King, William J. Klausner | SG |
| | What the Tariff Means to American Industries | Percy W. Bidwell, Helena L. Stalson, John R. Petty | SG |
| | Sterling Area | Judd Polk, Walter Sedwitz | SG |
| | Nuclear Weapons and Foreign Policy | | Discussion group (DG) |
| | Western Europe | | DG |
| | Communist China | | DG |
| | The Defense of the Middle East | | DG |
| | Canadian-American Relations | | DG |
| | | | |
| 1955-56 | Nuclear Weapons and Foreign Policy | Carroll L. Wilson, Henry A. Kissinger | SG |
| | Defense of the Middle East | John C. Campbell | SG |
| | Sino-Soviet Relations | Philip E. Mosely | SG |
| | Indian-American Relations | Phillips Talbot, Marina S. Finkelstein | SG |
| | The Atlantic Alliance | Ben T. Moore | SG |
| | What the Tariff Means to American Industries | Percy W. Bidwell, Helena L. Stalson | SG |
| | Japan Between East and West | | DG |
| | Social Change in Latin America | | DG |
| | Economic Development in Africa | | DG |
| | The U.S. and the Issue of Colonialism | | Special Groups (SP.G) |
| | Foreign Service Training | | SP.G |
| | | | |
| 1956-57 | U.S. Policy and Problems of Colonialism | Robert R. Robbins (Frm. Deputy Dir., Office of Dependent Areas Affairs, State Dept., Carnegie Research Fellow) | SG |
| | The New Soviet Foreign Economic Policy | Joseph S. Berliner | SG |
| | U.S. Foreign Economic Policy | William Diebold, Jr. | SG |
| | U.S. Policy in Indo-China | William Henderson | SG |
| | National Policy on Raw Materials | Percy W. Bidwell | SG |
| | Economic Development in Africa | | DG |
| | European and American Capitalism | | DG |
| | U.S. Security Policy in the Far East | | DG |
| | U.S. Relations with Latin America | | DG |
| | U.S. Policy and the Soviet European Satellites | | DG |
| | Social Change in Latin America | | DG |
| | | | |

| | | | |
|---------|--|--|----|
| 1957-58 | The U.S. and Germany | Gerald Freund | SG |
| | France and the U.S. | Edgar S. Furniss, Jr. (Assoc. Prof. of Politics, Princeton) | SG |
| | Yugoslavia and Eastern Europe | John C. Campbell | SG |
| | Human Factors in Economic Development | Edwin J. Cohn | SG |
| | Peaceful Uses of Atomic Energy | Arnold Kramish | SG |
| | The Role of the Military in Latin America | Edwin Lieuwen (Chair, Dept. of History, University of New Mexico) | SG |
| | Argentine National Interest and the Inter-American System | John J. Kennedy (Assoc. Prof. of Political Science, Notre Dame) | SG |
| | The Philippines and the U.S. | George E. Taylor (Prof, University of Washington, Council Research Fellow) | SG |
| | Burma and the U.S. | Frank N. Trager (Prof, NYU) | SG |
| | U.S. Policy in Indo-China | William Henderson | SG |
| | U.S. Policy and the U.N. | | DG |
| | Strategic Bases and Alliances | | DG |
| | Western European Integration | | DG |
| | Canada and the U.S. | | DG |
| | Neutralism in Asia | | DG |
| | European and American Capitalism | | DG |
| | | | |
| 1958-59 | Communist China and U.S. Policy in Asia | A. Doak Barnett | SG |
| | Yugoslavia and Eastern Europe | John C. Campbell | SG |
| | France and the U.S. | Edgar S. Furniss, Jr. (Assoc. Prof. Politics, Princeton) | SG |
| | Spain and the U.S. | Arthur P. Whitaker | SG |
| | Argentine National Interest and the Inter-American System | John J. Kennedy | SG |
| | Peaceful Uses of Atomic Energy | Arnold Kramish | SG |
| | Japanese-American Economic Relations | Warren S. Hunsberger | SG |
| | U.S. Foreign Economic Policy | William Diebold, Jr. | SG |
| | Soviet Policy Toward Underdeveloped Countries | Philip E. Mosely | SG |
| | The Middle East and Modern Islam | | DG |
| | Africa South of the Sahara | | DG |
| | Military Strategy and U.S. Foreign Policy | | DG |
| | Political and Strategic Problems of Deterrence | | DG |
| | U.S. Policy and the U.N. | | DG |
| | U.S. Propaganda | | DG |
| | | | |
| 1959-60 | Strategic Deterrence and Foreign Policy | Albert Wohlstetter | SG |
| | U.S. Policy in Southeast Asia | Russell H. Fifield (Prof, Political Science, Univ. of Michigan) | SG |
| | U.S. Aid Policies and Programs in Vietnam and Southeast Asia | John D. Montgomery | SG |
| | U.S. Foreign Financial Policy | Henry G. Aubrey | SG |
| | The European Common Market and the U.S. | Randall Hinshaw | SG |
| | Iran and the U.S. | T. Cuyler Young | SG |

| | | | |
|---------|---|--|--------------------------------|
| | Atomic Energy and Foreign Policy | Arnold Kramish | SG |
| | British Images of America | F. Bowen Evans | SG |
| | Basic Aims of U.S. Foreign Policy | John C. Campbell | SG |
| | Problems of Government in Newly Independent Countries | | DG |
| | Africa South of the Sahara | | DG |
| | Directors' Policy Group | | DG |
| | | | |
| 1960-61 | Arab Nationalism and Foreign Policy | Charles D. Cremeans | SG |
| | Economic Integration in Latin America | Walter J. Sedwitz (Fed. Reserve Bank of NY, Council Research Fellow) | SG |
| | Iran and the U.S. | T. Cuyler Young | SG |
| | U.S. Foreign Financial Policy | Henry G. Aubrey | SG |
| | British Images of America | F. Bowen Evans | SG |
| | Strategic Deterrence and Foreign Policy | Albert Wohlstetter (RAND) | SG |
| | Diplomacy and the Developing Countries | | DG |
| | The Western Alliance | | DG |
| | The Cuban Revolution and Latin America | | DG |
| | U.S. Policy toward Africa | | DG |
| | Soviet Strategy in the Uncommitted Countries | Philip E. Mosely | SG |
| | | | |
| 1961-62 | NATO in the Sixties: The Strategic Choices | Timothy W. Stanley | SG |
| | Economic Integration in Latin America | Walter J. Sedwitz (Fed. Reserve Bank of NY, Council Research Fellow) | SG |
| | U.S. Foreign Financial Policy | Henry G. Aubrey | SG |
| | South Asia and the U.S. | Norman D. Palmer | SG |
| | New Groupings in Africa | | DG |
| | Population Problems and Foreign Policy | | DG |
| | U.S. Foreign Trade Policy | | DG |
| | Political Aspects of Unconventional Warfare | | DG |
| | | | |
| 1962-63 | Power and Policy | | SG |
| | The Future of NATO: The Strategic choices | Timothy W. Stanley | SG |
| | The Impact of the Cuban Revolution on Latin America | David D. Burks | SG |
| | South Asia and the U.S. | Norman D. Palmer | SG |
| | Political Communication | W. Phillips Davison | SG |
| | U.S. Policy Toward China | | Special Project on China (SPC) |
| | China and the Security of Southeast Asia | | SPC |
| | Taiwan and the Nationalist Government | | SPC |
| | Communist China's Economic Development | | SPC |
| | U.S. Security and Alliance Policies in Asia | | SPC |
| | Communist China's Military Policies and Capabilities | | SPC |

| | | | |
|---------|--|------------------|-----|
| | The Implications for the U.S. of Communist China's Acquisition of a Nuclear Capability | | SPC |
| | Communist China's Foreign Policy | | SPC |
| | The China Policies of Other Countries | | SPC |
| | American Public Attitudes Toward China | | SPC |
| | The Atlantic Assembly | | DG |
| | New Developments in Soviet Society | | DG |
| | Science and Foreign Policy | | DG |
| | The Congress and Foreign Policy | | DG |
| | | | |
| 1963-64 | Transatlantic Economic Cooperation | Henry G. Aubrey | SG |
| | Western Policy toward Eastern Europe | John C. Campbell | SG |
| | U.S.-Asian Communications | John Hohenberg | SG |
| | | | |
| | U.S. Policy Toward China | | SPC |
| | China and the Security of Southeast Asia | | SPC |
| | Taiwan and the Nationalist Government | | SPC |
| | | | |
| | Communist China's Economic Development | | SPC |
| | U.S. Security and Alliance Policies in Asia | | SPC |
| | Communist China's Military Policies and Capabilities | | SPC |
| | | | |
| | The Implications for the U.S. of Communist China's Acquisition of a Nuclear Capability | | SPC |
| | Communist China's Foreign Policy | | SPC |
| | The China Policies of Other Countries | | SPC |
| | American Public Attitudes Toward China | | SPC |
| | | | |
| | American Business Abroad | | DG |
| | The Role of the American Ambassador | | DG |
| | | | |
| | U.S. Policy and Racial Conflict in Southern Africa | | DG |
| | The Alliance for Progress (Latin America) | | DG |
| | The Role of the Military in the Middle East | | DG |
| | Science and Foreign Policy | | DG |
| | | | |
| 1964-65 | U.S. Policy Toward China | | SPC |
| | Taiwan and the Nationalist Government | | SPC |
| | | | |
| | Communist China's Economic Development | | SPC |
| | U.S. Security and Alliance Policies in Asia | | SPC |
| | Communist China's Military Policies and Capabilities | | SPC |
| | Communist China's Foreign Policy | | SPC |
| | American Public Attitudes Toward China | | SPC |
| | U.S. Negotiations with Communist China | | SPC |
| | Overseas Chinese | | SPC |
| | | | |
| | Prospects for Soviet Society | Allen Kassof | SG |

| | | | |
|---------|--|--|----|
| | The Role of the Military in the Middle East | J. C. Hurewitz | SG |
| | The International Flow of News | John Hohenberg | SG |
| | Transatlantic Economic Cooperation | Henry G. Aubrey | SG |
| | South Africa | | DG |
| | The Newly Independent Nations of North Africa | | DG |
| | Japan's Role in the World | | DG |
| | | | |
| 1965-66 | A Re-examination of American Foreign Policy | Hans J. Morgenthau (Council Senior Fellow) | SG |
| | Prospects for Soviet Society | Allen Kassof | SG |
| | Science and the National Interest | | DG |
| | Critical World Problems and the UN | | DG |
| | Change and Leadership in Latin America | | DG |
| | Issues in U.S. Foreign Economic Policy | | DG |
| | | | |
| 1966-67 | A Re-examination of American Foreign Policy | Hans J. Morgenthau (Council Senior Fellow) | |
| | South Asia in World Politics | William J. Barnds | |
| | Military Stability and Political Evolution in Europe | | DG |
| | The Politics of Private Investment | | DG |
| | Southern Africa and the U.S. | | DG |
| | Foreign Aid Policy | | DG |
| | | | |
| 1967-68 | The International Role of the Dollar | Robert V. Roosa | SG |
| | A Re-examination of American Foreign Policy | Hans J. Morgenthau (Council Senior Fellow) | SG |
| | South Asia in World Politics | William J. Barnds | SG |
| | U.S. Policy in the Caribbean | Robert D. Crassweller | SG |
| | Trade Policy after the Kennedy Round | | DG |
| | American Foreign Policy | | DG |
| | Intelligence and Foreign Policy | | DG |
| | Arms Developments and Arms Control | | DG |
| | Viet Nam Settlement | | DG |
| | Germany as a Focus for East-West Relations | | DG |
| | African Issues | | DG |
| | American Policy toward Africa | | DG |
| | The Middle East in the Aftermath of the Third Round | | DG |
| | | | |
| 1968-69 | Strategy and Policy in the Middle East | John C. Campbell | SG |
| | A Reappraisal of American Foreign Aid | Willard L. Thorp | SG |
| | The International Role of the Dollar | Robert V. Roosa | SG |
| | U.S. Policy in the Caribbean | Robert D. Crassweller | SG |
| | Color in International Affairs | | DG |
| | Deployment and Control of Arms | | DG |
| | Non-Nuclear Military Force in a Nuclear Age | | DG |

| | | | |
|---------|--|--------------------------|----|
| | Multinational Enterprise in International Affairs | | DG |
| | East-West Economic Relations | | DG |
| | Japan's Role in Asia | | DG |
| | Change in Latin America and Problems of U.S. Policy | | DG |
| | | | |
| 1969-70 | U.S. Policy in the Middle East | John C. Campbell | SG |
| | American Aid Policy in the Seventies | Paul C. Clark | SG |
| | U.S.-Soviet Relations | | DG |
| | Atlantic Alliance in the 1970s | | DG |
| | U.S. Policy in East Asia: The 1930s and 1960s | | DG |
| | New Forces in World Politics | | DG |
| | Changing Domestic Base of American Policy | | DG |
| | The Media and American Foreign Policy | | DG |
| | Multilateral Economic Development Issues | | DG |
| | Arms Control Issues | | DG |
| | International Financial Problems | | DG |
| | Japanese-American Relations | | DG |
| | | | |
| 1970-71 | East Germany and the European Future | Robert Gerald Livingston | SG |
| | U.S. Policy in Southeast and East Asia in the 1970s | Kenneth T. Young, Jr. | SG |
| | Law and Politics in U.S. Decisions on the Settlement of International Disputes | Philip C. Jessup | SG |
| | International Production | | DG |
| | Relations Among the Industrialized Countries of the Non-Communist World | | DG |
| | U.S.-Soviet Relations | | DG |
| | U.S. Policy in Latin America | | DG |
| | The Political Role of Military Force | | DG |
| | The Future Role of the Joint Chiefs of Staff | Morton H. Halperin | DG |
| | | | |
| 1971-72 | Soviet-American Relations | | DG |
| | Conference on American and Soviet Defense Expenditures | | SG |
| | Political Role of Military Force: America's Global Engagement | | SG |
| | East Asia and the Great Powers | | SG |
| | Relations Among the Industrialized Countries of the Non-Communist World | | SG |
| | International Role of the Dollar | | SG |
| | Foreign Economic Policy | | SG |
| | Conference on Canada and the U.S. in the Seventies | | SG |

| | | | |
|--|---|--|----|
| | The U.S. and Latin America | | SG |
| | South Asia | | SG |
| | International Aspects of National Policies for Science and Technology | | SG |
| | Law and Politics | | SG |
| | Congress and National Security | | SG |
| | International Order and International Institutions | | SG |

Appendix B. Coding Decisions.

Content

Codes for content were developed inductively based on the cases and included economic, political, military, political and economic, political and military, demographic, public opinion, science, social, culture, religion, and multiple topics. These codes were collapsed into six dummy variables: economic or business-related, political, military, other (including demographic, public opinion, science, social, normative), and mixed or unspecified.

Eighteen regions or types of countries were identified in the initial coding, and these were reduced to nine codes: Europe and North America, Latin America/Caribbean, Africa and “Undeveloped” countries, Asia, Communist countries (USSR and the Soviet Bloc), the Middle East, Southeast Asia, Other (the Arctic and Antarctic, Space, Ocean, Australia/Oceania, the “non-west”), and None. I also coded each case for the types of actors involved in the topic (e.g. the USSR or “the West”) but these variables did not improve the fit of the model so they were excluded from the reported models.

These six content codes and nine region codes were further reduced to the four dummy variables discussed above. I attempted to code for the breadth of a topic, as staff discuss in their memos, but inter-coder reliability on this measure was very low, so I did not include this variable.

Proposal Length

I used a dummy variable for proposal length because of the difficulty in comparing exact length across the multiple forms of proposals in the archives. I look at whether a proposal is over one page, compared to proposals that were less than a page or those that included only a topic title without further explanation.

CFR Affiliation

All proposals from individual staff members were coded as from CFR staff. When information on a proposer’s CFR affiliation was not available from the CFR archives, I used the online database “Who’s Who” and other resources, including newspaper obituaries and publically available curricula vitae, to fill in the information. I used CFR lists of members published in their yearly reports to verify membership.

Recommendations

I first developed a code for whether a proposer received a recommendation. Of these cases, I coded strength of recommendations based on the content as strong, neutral, or mixed. I combined neutral and mixed recommendations so each case was recorded as having either strong recommendations, neutral/mixed recommendations, or no recommendations.

When recommendations were directly from CFR staff, directors, or from prominent people close to the CFR staff, I created a binary variable to indicate a recommendation from a close associate. This binary variable was coded as present if a recommendation came from a member of the CFR staff, a member of the Board of Directors of the CFR (for example, Philip Mosely Director of Studies; George S. Franklin, Executive Director of the CFR; Henry Wriston, member of the Board of

Directors; John McCloy, member of the Board of Directors), or from prominent CFR members, many of whom had participated in CFR research programs at some point, who appeared repeatedly in the archives as a source of recommendations (e.g. Henry Kissinger; Professor Raymond Vernon of Harvard Business School and Kennedy School of Government; August Maffry, an economist and international banker; or C. Fred Bergsten, an economist and senior fellow at the CFR who later served as assistant to Kissinger at the National Security Council and who worked in the U.S. Treasury Department under Carter). The list of prominent individuals with close ties to CFR staff included in this code was derived inductively from the records in the archive.

New York Times Citations

In order to assess whether topics that received more media attention were more likely to be selected for study or discussion groups, I generated a list of keywords associated with each proposed topic, as well as key phrases (combinations of keywords). A research assistant then searched the archives of the *New York Times* for the number of times those keywords or key phrases occurred in the three years prior to when the topic was proposed, to the month. The search erred on the side of overinclusion. If no results were returned, the research assistant searched for results based on a smaller set of the search terms. The overriding principle was consistency in the use of search terms so that, even if the scale was incorrect, the relative numbers of citations by proposed topic was meaningful.