**Supplementary Materials**

**Appendix 1:** ESS Asylum Responses (2002 and 2014)

Table A1: *Percentage of ESS respondents who agree or strongly agree that their government should take a generous approach to applications for refugee status and the 'open' immigration opinion stated, 2002 & 2014.*

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Germany** | | **UK** | |
|  | **2002** | **2014** | **2002** | **2014** |
| **allow many from...**  *poorer non-*  *European countries* |  |  |  |  |
| 87% | 82% | 68% | 63% |
| *majority and non-majority racial group* | 78% | 88% | 66% | 73% |
| **immigration...**  *benefits culture*  *and economics* |  |  |  |  |
| 81% | 81% | 69% | 69% |
| *makes country*  *better place to live* | 88% | 87% | 80% | 79% |

The ESS core questions provide a biennial measure of preferences on immigration, which somewhat align with preferences on asylum as measured by ESS questions from 2002 and 2014. Appendix 1 includes all respondents who agreed or strongly agreed with the statement "Governments should be generous when judging applications for refugee status" in the 2002 and 2014 surveys. The table shows the percentage of this group which also gave a response classed as 'open' (i.e. not selective or restrictive) to the core ESS questions on immigration.

A majority of respondents who favour a 'generous approach' to applications for refugee status also give 'open' responses to the ESS core questions on immigration, and this majority is consistently slightly larger for German respondents. The alignment between refugee and immigration preferences is relatively stable from 2002 to 2014, although there is a slight increase in the share of 'generous approach' respondents favouring more open policies for immigrants from both the majority and non-majority German or UK racial groups.

**Appendix 2**

Table A2: *ARDL Models of UK Asylum Recognition Rates by Decision Type: Grants of Refugee Status vs Grants of Subsisidiary Protection, 2002-2019*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Grants of Refugee**  **Status** | **Grants of Subsidiary Protection** |
|  | | |
| Constant | 0.402 | -0.195 |
|  | (0.291) | (0.239) |
|  |  |  |
| Salience (t-1) | -0.160+ | -0.036 |
|  | (0.095) | (0.080) |
|  |  |  |
| ARR (t-1) | 0.478\*\*\* | 0.376\*\* |
|  | (0.116) | (0.116) |
|  |  |  |
| ARR (t-2) | -0.331\*\* | -0.340\*\* |
|  | (0.117) | (0.118) |
|  |  |  |
|  | | |
| Observations | 68 | 68 |
| R2 | 0.258 | 0.196 |
| Adjusted R2 | 0.223 | 0.158 |
| Residual Std. Error | 2.339 | 1.949 |
|  | | |
| +p<0.1; \*p<0.05; \*\*p<0.01; \*\*\*p<0.001 | | |

**Appendix 3:** Robustness Checks for German and UK ARDL Models

Table A3: *Robustness checks of German ARDL Models excluding ten most common countries of origin, 2002-2019*

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | w/o Syria | w/o Iraq | w/o Afgh. | **w/o Serbia** | **w/o Albania** | **w/o Iran** | **w/o Russia** | **w/o Turkey** | **w/o Eritrea** | **w/o Kosovo** |
|  | | | | | | | | | | |
| Constant | 3.791 | -0.354 | 3.764 | 4.375 | 3.771 | 3.563 | 3.825 | 4.213 | 3.730 | 3.937 |
|  | (3.027) | (2.821) | (3.643) | (3.456) | (3.674) | (3.576) | (3.470) | (3.587) | (3.486) | (3.505) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Salience (t-1) | -2.281\*\* | -2.428\*\* | -2.825\*\* | -2.169\* | -2.016+ | -2.584\* | -2.592\*\* | -2.560\* | -2.579\* | -2.433\* |
|  | (0.837) | (0.790) | (1.017) | (0.966) | (1.019) | (1.000) | (0.969) | (1.001) | (0.974) | (0.979) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Open Preference Class (t-1) | -0.077 | 0.022 | -0.071 | -0.085 | -0.070 | -0.066 | -0.071 | -0.080 | -0.070 | -0.074 |
|  | (0.065) | (0.061) | (0.078) | (0.074) | (0.079) | (0.077) | (0.074) | (0.077) | (0.075) | (0.075) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Salience\* Preference | 0.046\*\* | 0.056\*\*\* | 0.063\*\* | 0.048\* | 0.048\* | 0.058\*\* | 0.058\*\* | 0.057\*\* | 0.057\*\* | 0.055\*\* |
| Interaction (t-1) | (0.016) | (0.016) | (0.020) | (0.019) | (0.020) | (0.020) | (0.019) | (0.020) | (0.019) | (0.019) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| ARR (t-1) | 0.325\*\* | 0.087 | 0.195+ | 0.313\*\* | 0.215+ | 0.194+ | 0.195+ | 0.200+ | 0.212+ | 0.156 |
|  | (0.112) | (0.099) | (0.108) | (0.113) | (0.111) | (0.108) | (0.106) | (0.108) | (0.107) | (0.107) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| ARR (t-2) | -0.390\*\*\* | -0.495\*\*\* | -0.429\*\*\* | -0.394\*\*\* | -0.462\*\*\* | -0.440\*\*\* | -0.463\*\*\* | -0.438\*\*\* | -0.439\*\*\* | -0.427\*\*\* |
|  | (0.111) | (0.095) | (0.105) | (0.110) | (0.105) | (0.105) | (0.104) | (0.106) | (0.105) | (0.106) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | | | | | | | | | | |
| Observations | 68 | 68 | 68 | 68 | 68 | 68 | 68 | 68 | 68 | 68 |
| R2 | 0.280 | 0.454 | 0.348 | 0.323 | 0.357 | 0.347 | 0.363 | 0.342 | 0.351 | 0.334 |
| Adjusted R2 | 0.221 | 0.410 | 0.295 | 0.268 | 0.305 | 0.294 | 0.311 | 0.289 | 0.299 | 0.280 |
| Residual Std. Error (df = 62) | 4.348 | 4.102 | 5.266 | 4.967 | 5.306 | 5.170 | 5.011 | 5.172 | 5.035 | 5.058 |
|  | | | | | | | | | | |
|  | +p<0.1; \*p<0.05; \*\*p<0.01; \*\*\*p<0.001 | | | | | | | | | |

Table A4: *Robustness checks of UK ARDL Models excluding ten most common countries of origin, 2002-2019*

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | **w/o Iran** | **w/o Pakistan** | **w/o Iraq** | **w/o Afgh.** | **w/o Zimb.** | **w/o Somalia** | **w/o Eritrea** | **w/o China** | **w/o Sri Lanka** | **w/o Nigeria** |
|  | | | | | | | | | | |
| Constant | 0.221 | 0.234 | 0.352 | 0.218 | 0.213 | 0.247 | 0.204 | 0.225 | 0.233 | 0.234 |
|  | (0.295) | (0.299) | (0.284) | (0.294) | (0.247) | (0.290) | (0.279) | (0.289) | (0.292) | (0.288) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Salience (t-1) | -0.202\* | -0.231\* | -0.165+ | -0.219\* | -0.130+ | -0.222\* | -0.243\* | -0.225\* | -0.220\* | -0.217\* |
|  | (0.100) | (0.101) | (0.094) | (0.099) | (0.080) | (0.098) | (0.095) | (0.097) | (0.099) | (0.097) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| ARR (t-1) | 0.621\*\*\* | 0.635\*\*\* | 0.587\*\*\* | 0.677\*\*\* | 0.668\*\*\* | 0.647\*\*\* | 0.636\*\*\* | 0.654\*\*\* | 0.649\*\*\* | 0.664\*\*\* |
|  | (0.114) | (0.115) | (0.116) | (0.117) | (0.119) | (0.115) | (0.114) | (0.115) | (0.114) | (0.115) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| ARR (t-2) | -0.500\*\*\* | -0.476\*\*\* | -0.466\*\*\* | -0.505\*\*\* | -0.351\* | -0.495\*\*\* | -0.458\*\*\* | -0.478\*\*\* | -0.497\*\*\* | -0.493\*\*\* |
|  | (0.123) | (0.127) | (0.125) | (0.129) | (0.141) | (0.127) | (0.127) | (0.128) | (0.126) | (0.128) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| ARR (t-3) | 0.386\*\* | 0.333\*\* | 0.345\*\* | 0.313\*\* | 0.309\* | 0.353\*\* | 0.343\*\* | 0.348\*\* | 0.361\*\* | 0.353\*\* |
|  | (0.114) | (0.115) | (0.116) | (0.118) | (0.120) | (0.115) | (0.114) | (0.115) | (0.114) | (0.115) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | | | | | | | | | | |
| Observations | 67 | 67 | 67 | 67 | 67 | 67 | 67 | 67 | 67 | 67 |
| R2 | 0.408 | 0.412 | 0.364 | 0.420 | 0.419 | 0.422 | 0.433 | 0.425 | 0.424 | 0.429 |
| Adjusted R2 | 0.369 | 0.374 | 0.323 | 0.383 | 0.381 | 0.385 | 0.397 | 0.388 | 0.387 | 0.392 |
| Residual  Std. Error | 2.396 | 2.429 | 2.271 | 2.383 | 2.002 | 2.348 | 2.272 | 2.344 | 2.373 | 2.337 |
|  | | | | | | | | | | |
|  | +p<0.1; \*p<0.05; \*\*p<0.01; \*\*\*p<0.001 | | | | | | | | | |

Table A5: *Robustness checks of German ARDL Models excluding age groups, male applicants, and female applicants, 2008-2019*

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | **w/o**  **under 18s** | **w/o**  **18-34 y.o.s** | **w/o**  **35-64 y.o.s** | **w/o**  **over 65s** | **w/o**  **women** | **w/o**  **men** |
|  | | | | | | |
| Constant | -3.590 | -11.076 | -9.160 | -8.459 | -5.847 | -12.226 |
|  | (8.330) | (8.979) | (8.627) | (8.465) | (8.474) | (9.200) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Salience (t-1) | -2.103\* | -2.980\* | -2.340\* | -2.407\* | -1.882+ | -3.366\*\* |
|  | (1.034) | (1.099) | (1.059) | (1.040) | (1.043) | (1.130) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Open Preference Class (t-1) | 0.058 | 0.218 | 0.176 | 0.161 | 0.108 | 0.237 |
|  | (0.163) | (0.176) | (0.169) | (0.166) | (0.166) | (0.180) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Salience\* Preference | 0.051\* | 0.065\*\* | 0.055\* | 0.056\*\* | 0.046\* | 0.072\*\* |
| Interaction (t-1) | (0.020) | (0.022) | (0.021) | (0.020) | (0.020) | (0.022) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| ARR (t-1) | 0.191 | 0.044 | 0.121 | 0.111 | 0.193 | 0.049 |
|  | (0.142) | (0.120) | (0.131) | (0.130) | (0.140) | (0.120) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| ARR (t-2) | -0.392\*\* | -0.531\*\*\* | -0.455\*\*\* | -0.462\*\*\* | -0.401\*\* | -0.524\*\*\* |
|  | (0.130) | (0.118) | (0.123) | (0.122) | (0.129) | (0.118) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | | | | | | |
| Observations | 44 | 44 | 44 | 44 | 44 | 44 |
| R2 | 0.430 | 0.478 | 0.447 | 0.455 | 0.418 | 0.481 |
| Adjusted R2 | 0.355 | 0.409 | 0.375 | 0.383 | 0.341 | 0.413 |
| Residual Std. Error (df = 38) | 4.859 | 5.214 | 5.008 | 4.919 | 4.933 | 5.335 |
|  | | | | | | |
|  | +p<0.1; \*p<0.05; \*\*p<0.01; \*\*\*p<0.001 | | | | | |

Table A6: *Robustness checks of UK ARDL Models excluding age groups, male applicants, and female applicants, 2008-2019*

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | **w/o**  **under 18s** | **w/o**  **18-29 y.o.s** | **w/o**  **30-49 y.o.s** | **w/o**  **over 50s** | **w/o**  **women** | **w/o**  **men** |
|  | | | | | | |
| Constant | 0.326 | 0.384 | 0.440 | 0.380 | 0.515 | 0.303 |
|  | (0.317) | (0.334) | (0.341) | (0.314) | (0.376) | (0.327) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Salience (t-1) | -0.223+ | -0.223+ | -0.260+ | -0.236+ | -0.288+ | -0.231+ |
|  | (0.121) | (0.128) | (0.131) | (0.120) | (0.148) | (0.126) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| ARR (t-1) | 0.751\*\*\* | 0.504\*\* | 0.562\*\*\* | 0.613\*\*\* | 0.526\*\* | 0.708\*\*\* |
|  | (0.152) | (0.156) | (0.155) | (0.154) | (0.154) | (0.154) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| ARR (t-2) | -0.228+ | -0.126 | -0.221+ | -0.166 | -0.216+ | -0.223 |
|  | (0.129) | (0.116) | (0.127) | (0.123) | (0.117) | (0.133) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | | | | | | |
| Observations | 40 | 40 | 40 | 40 | 40 | 40 |
| R2 | 0.454 | 0.287 | 0.314 | 0.368 | 0.335 | 0.408 |
| Adjusted R2 | 0.409 | 0.228 | 0.257 | 0.315 | 0.279 | 0.358 |
| Residual Std. Error (df = 36) | 1.904 | 2.014 | 2.050 | 1.878 | 2.264 | 1.974 |
|  | | | | | | |
|  | +p<0.1; \*p<0.05; \*\*p<0.01; \*\*\*p<0.001 | | | | | |
|  |  | | | | | |

Table A7: *Robustness checks of German and UK ARDL Models by year*

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Germany** | | **UK** | |
|  | **2002-2014** | **2015-2019** | **2002-2013** | **2014-2019** |
|  | | |  |  |
| Constant | 8.436+ | -93.069+ | 0.122 | 0.064 |
|  | (4.740) | (44.038) | (0.437) | (0.410) |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| Salience (t-1) | -0.704\*\* | -1.488\* | -0.220 | -0.160 |
|  | -0.29 | (0.646) | (0.134) | (0.148) |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| Open Preference Class (t-1) | -0.189+ | 1.692+ | - | - |
|  | (0.112) | (0.807) |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| Salience\* Preference Interaction (t-1) | 0.163\*\*  (0.053) | 0.034\*  (0.012) | - | - |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| ARR (t-1) | 0.162 | 0.451\* | 0.529\*\* | 0.529\* |
|  | (0.123) | (0.170) | (0.153) | (0.204) |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| ARR (t-2) | -0.526\*\*\* | -0.115 | -0.328\* | -0.256 |
|  | (0.124) | (0.149) | (0.151) | (0.242) |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  | | |  |  |
| Observations | 48 | 16 | 40 | 25 |
| R2 | 0.376 | 0.747 | 0.340 | 0.279 |
| Adjusted R2 | 0.302 | 0.620 | 0.285 | 0.176 |
| Residual Std. Error | 5.225 (df = 42) | 2.472 (df = 10) | 2.755 (df = 36) | 2.041 (df = 21) |
|  | | |  |  |
|  | +p<0.1; \*p<0.05; \*\*p<0.01; \*\*\*p<0.001 | | | |
|  |

**Appendix 4:** Robustness Checks for German and UK ARDL Models

The robustness tests are run on the fully specified German and UK models (3 and 6), and the UK appeals model containing a significant interaction coefficient (model 8).

Table A8: *Robustness Checks for German and UK ARDL Models*

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Germany** | **UK** | |
|  | **(3)** | **(6)** | **(8)** |
| ACF Test: lag 1 | 0.217 | 0.465 | 0.524 |
| lag 2 | -0.304 | 0.002 | 0.059 |
| lag 3 | 0.173 | 0.138 | -0.093 |
| lag 4 | 0.239 | 0.146 | -0.292 |
| lag 5 | -0.183 | 0.014 | -0.311 |
| lag 6 | -0.249 | -0.041 | -0.127 |
| Durbin-Watson D statistic | 0.036 | 1.952 | 1.817 |
| Ljung-Box Q statistic | 0.534 | 0.771 | 0.697 |
| Jarque-Bera test statistic | 103.660\*\*\* | 8.120\* | 0.872 |
| Skewness test statistic | 1.425 | -0.784 | 0.321 |
| Kurtosis test statistic | 8.386 | 3.658 | 3.411 |

**Appendix 5:** Supplement to Table 3 appeal recognition rate models

Table A9: *ARDL models for main effects of salience and immigration preferences on UK first-tier tribunal appeal recognition rates.*

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | **t-2** | **t-3** | **t-4** | **t-5** |
|  | | | | |
| Constant | 0.005 | 1.193 | -0.701 | -0.787 |
|  | (1.472) | (1.427) | (1.459) | (1.545) |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| Salience | 0.072 | 0.178 | -0.193 | -0.176 |
| (t-2/ t-3/ t-4/ t-5) | (0.124) | (0.122) | (0.119) | (0.118) |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| Restrictive Preference Class | 0.007 | -0.013 | 0.016 | 0.019 |
| (t-2/ t-3/ t-4/ t-5) | (0.025) | (0.024) | (0.025) | (0.026) |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| Appeal Recognition Rate (t-1) | 0.717\*\*\* | 0.695\*\*\* | 0.821\*\*\* | 0.657\*\* |
|  | (0.180) | (0.177) | (0.183) | (0.184) |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| Appeal Recognition Rate (t-2) | -0.504\* | -0.465\* | -0.537\* | -0.368 |
|  | (0.214) | (0.204) | (0.208) | (0.217) |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| Appeal Recognition Rate (t-3) | 0.124 | 0.011 | 0.222 | 0.075 |
|  | (0.184) | (0.191) | (0.191) | (0.184) |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  | | | | |
| Observations | 36 | 36 | 35 | 34 |
| R2 | 0.385 | 0.410 | 0.424 | 0.413 |
| Adjusted R2 | 0.282 | 0.312 | 0.325 | 0.308 |
| Residual Std. Error | 1.387 (df = 30) | 1.358 (df = 30) | 1.362 (df = 29) | 1.383 (df = 28) |
|  | | | | |
|  | +p<0.1; \*p<0.05; \*\*p<0.01; | | | |