**Kuhlmann/Vogeler: United against precarious working conditions? Explaining the role of trade unions in improving migrants’ working conditions in the British and German meat-processing industries**

*Supplementary material*

|  |
| --- |
| **Table 1: Analysis of Trade Union Congress material (UK)** |
|  | **Source** | **Date** | **Title** | **Relevant Content**  |
| TUC1 | <https://www.tuc.org.uk/research-analysis/reports/general-council-statement-european-migration> | 2006-09-07 | General Council statement on European migration | TUC clearly opposes the exploitation of migrant workers; concrete example of union action at meat processing company |
| TUC2 | <https://www.tuc.org.uk/sites/default/files/extras/covebriefing.pdf> | 2007-05-23 | Commission on Vulnerable Employment | workers in the meat processing industry are identified as vulnerable group |
| TUC3 | https://www.tuc.org.uk/sites/default/files/safetymw.pdf | 2007-06 | Safety and migrant workers. A practical guide for safety representatives | safety deficits in the meat-processing industry |
| TUC4 | <https://www.tuc.org.uk/sites/default/files/extras/strategicresearch.pdf> | 2009-07 | What kind of company are you keeping? | Every Worker Counts-campaign against Tesco |
| TUC5 | <https://www.tuc.org.uk/sites/default/files/extras/agencyworkerssubmission.pdf> | 2009-12-21 | Delivering equal treatment for agency workers | Unite's campaign for improving working conditions for agency workers in the white meat industry |
| TUC6 | <https://www.tuc.org.uk/research-analysis/reports/vulnerable-meat-workers-exploited> | 2010-03-19 | Vulnerable meat workers 'exploited' | EHRC report |
| TUC7 | <https://www.tuc.org.uk/research-analysis/reports/inquiry-recruitment-and-employment-meat-and-poultry-processing-sector> | 2010-04-29 | Inquiry in to recruitment and employment in the meat and poultry processing sector | EHRC report |
| TUC8 | <https://www.tuc.org.uk/sites/default/files/GC%20report%20complete%20all%20together.pdf> | 2011-08 | Congress 2011. General Council report | several successful initiativestraces EHRC report back to Unite |
| TUC9 | <https://www.tuc.org.uk/sites/default/files/Agency-Workers-Bargaining-Guide.pdf> | 2011-12 | Delivering equal treatment for agency workers | successful examples of union mobilisation |
| TUC10 | <https://www.tuc.org.uk/research-analysis/reports/tuc-response-gla-application-and-inspections-consultation> | 2013-07-09 | TUC response to the GLA application and inspections consultation | TUC is worried that GLA will have less competences |
| TUC11 | <https://www.tuc.org.uk/news/risks-633-30-november-2013> | 2013-11-30 | TUC calls for action on vulnerable workers | TUC has called for a strengthening of the Gangmasters Licensing Authority (extension to other areas) |
| TUC12 | https://www.tuc.org.uk/sites/default/files/Migrant%20workers%202015.pdf  | 2015-06 | Safety and migrant Workers. A TUC guide for trade union activists | safety deficits in the meat-processing industry |
| TUC13 | <https://touchstoneblog.org.uk/2016/04/41752/> | 2016-04-08 | NIESR report shows need to end race to the bottom on jobs | improvements following union action  |
| TUC14 | <https://strongerunions.org/2016/05/05/promoting-workers-rights-and-solidarity-in-the-debate-on-eu-migration/> | 2016-05-05 | Promoting workers’ rights and solidarity in the debate on EU migration | progress made by unions in organizing the meat-processing industry |

|  |
| --- |
| **Table 2: Analysis of NGG material (Germany)** |
|  | **Source** | **Date** | **Title** | **Relevant Content**  |
| NGG1 | https://www.ngg.net/artikel/2013/12/nicht-um-jeden-preis/ | 2013-12-18 | „Nicht um jeden Preis“ | Difficult negotiations regarding sectoral minimum wage |
| NGG2 | https://www.ngg.net/pressemitteilungen/2014/1quartal/14-1-chg/  | 2014-01-14 | Güster: "Wir haben Fakten geschaffen" | details of sectoral minimum wage |
| NGG3 | https://www.ngg.net/artikel/2014/01/anfang-vom-ende-des-lohndumpings/ | 2014-01-15 | "Anfang vom Ende des Lohndumpings" | introduction of sectoral minimum wage |
| NGG4 | https://www.ngg.net/pressemitteilungen/2014/1quartal/26-2-chg/ | 2014-02-26 | Güster: "Das ist ein Meilenstein für die Branche" | Meat-processing industry will be incorporated in Posted Workers Act |
| NGG5 | <https://www.ngg.net/pressemitteilungen/2014/1quartal/19-3-mr/> | 2014-03-19 | Rosenberger: "Mindestlohn stärkt Tarifautonomie" | introduction of sectoral minimum wage |
| NGG6 | <https://www.ngg.net/artikel/2014/04/mindestlohn-fuer-die-fleischwirtschaft-kommt/>  | 2014-04-12 | Fleischwirtschaft: Mindestlohn kommt | introduction of sectoral minimum wage |
| NGG7 | <https://www.ngg.net/pressemitteilungen/2014/2quartal/26-6-chg/>  | 2014-06-26 | "Güster: Arbeitgeber sind in der Pflicht" | introduction of sectoral minimum wage |
| NGG8 | <https://www.ngg.net/pressemitteilungen/2014/3quartal/30-7-chg/>  | 2014-07-30 | "Eine engmaschige Kontrolle ist unerlässlich" | introduction of sectoral minimum wage |
| NGG9 | <https://www.ngg.net/artikel/2015/09/werkvertraege-schlachter-fest-anstellen/>  | 2015-09-22 | "Ein Schritt in die richtige Richtung" | voluntary agreement on improving working conditions in meat-processing industry |
| NGG10 | <https://www.ngg.net/pressemitteilungen/2016/1-quartal/02-01-chg/>  | 2016-02-01 | Güster: "Ein wichtiger Schritt für gute Arbeit in der Fleischindustrie" | information about new counselling centre “Faire Mobilität” |
| NGG11 | <https://www.ngg.net/pressemitteilungen/2016/2-quartal/04-11-chg/>  | 2016-04-11 | Güster: "Faire Arbeit muss anders aussehen!" | NGG initiative "Faire Arbeit. Gutes Leben." |
| NGG12 | <https://www.ngg.net/pressemitteilungen/2016/3-quartal/28-09-chg/>  | 2016-09-28 | Güster: „Verlässlich und verbindlich sind nur Tarifverträge“ | assessment of voluntary agreement after one year |
| NGG13 | <https://www.ngg.net/artikel/2016/10/internationale-fleischkonferenz/>  | 2016-10-19 | "Riesiger Handlungsbedarf" | report on international meat conference |
| NGG14 | <https://www.ngg.net/pressemitteilungen/2016/4-quartal/19-10-chg/>  | 2016-10-19 | Sozialdumping beenden - Arbeit in der Schlachtbranche neu ordnen | Bad working conditions remain despite recent legal improvements |
| NGG15 | <https://www.ngg.net/pressemitteilungen/2017/2-quartal/rosenberger-fleisch-ist-keine-ramschware/>  | 2017-06-01 | Rosenberg: Fleisch ist keine Ramschware | NGG asks for a moral debate on meat prices |
| NGG16 | <https://www.ngg.net/pressemitteilungen/2017/2-quartal/01-06-chg/>  | 2017-06-01 | Güster: „Nun kann Fleischwirtschaft endlich zu gesitteten Verhältnissen zurückkehren | Law on strengthening workers‘ rights in the meat-processing industry |
| NGG17 | <https://www.ngg.net/pressemitteilungen/2017/2-quartal/02-06-chg/>  | 2017-06-02 | Güster: "Gesetz ist richtungsweisend" | Law on strengthening workers‘ rights in the meat-processing industry |
| NGG18 | <https://www.ngg.net/pressemitteilungen/2017/2-quartal/gewerkschaft-ngg-begruesst-staerkung-der-arbeitnehmerrechte/>  | 2017-07-07 | Gewerkschaft NGG begrüßt Stärkung der Arbeitnehmerrechte | Law on strengthening workers‘ rights in the meat-processing industry |
| NGG19 | <https://www.ngg.net/artikel/2017/7/mindestlohn-fleisch-eine-erfolgsgeschichte/>  | 2017-08-04 | Mindestlohn Fleisch: Eine Erfolgsgeschichte? | bad image in the meat-processing industry despite recent improvements |
| NGG20 | <https://www.ngg.net/pressemitteilungen/2017/3-quartal/die-fleischwirtschaft-muss-aus-den-negativschlagzeilen/>  | 2017-08-30 | „Fleischwirtschaft muss endlich raus aus den Negativschlagzeilen“ | continuing bad image of meat-processing industry |
| NGG21 | <https://www.ngg.net/pressemitteilungen/2017/4-quartal/1-tarifverhandlung-fleisch-mindestlohn-ohne-ergebnis/>  | 2017-09-05 | „Ermutigende Zeichen“ | no results in negotiations about new sectoral minimum wage |
| NGG22 | <https://www.ngg.net/pressemitteilungen/2017/4-quartal/2-tarifverhandlung-branchenmindestlohn-fleisch/>  | 2017-10-12 | Gewerkschaft NGG lehnt Magerangebot ab und fordert mindestens 10 Euro | no results in negotiations about new sectoral minimum wage |

|  |
| --- |
| **Table 3: Media Analysis Selection Procedure**  |
| **Time Frame 2004-2017** |
| **UK**  |
| **Newspapers: The Guardian (London), Daily Telegraph, Daily Mail** |
| Keywords | meat *AND* working condition | meat *AND* labour condition | slaughter *AND* working condition | slaughter *AND* labour condition  | abattoir *AND* working condition | SUM |
| Matches total | 80 | 15 | 14 | 2 | 8 | 119 |
| Selection after Headlines | 26 | 4 | 8 | 2 | 8 | 48 |
| Selection excluding overlap | 26 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 27 |
| Selection after detailed analysis | 11 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 12 |
|   |  |  |  |  |  |   |
| **Germany** |
| **Newspapers: Die Zeit, Die Welt, Sueddeutsche Zeitung** |
| Keywords | fleisch *AND* arbeits-bedingungen | schlacht *AND* arbeits-bedingungen |  -  |  -  |  -  | SUM |
| Matches total | 78 | 24 |   |   |   | 102 |
| Selection after Headlines | 23 | 5 |   |   |   | 28 |
| Selection excluding overlap | 23 | 2 |   |   |   | 25 |
| Selection after detailed analysis | 12 | 0 |   |   |   | 12 |

|  |
| --- |
| **Table 4: Results of the Media Analysis (UK & Germany)** |
|
| **UK**  |
| **Article No.** | **Newspaper** | **Date** | **Title** | **Relevant Content**  |
| UK1 | The Guardian | 2009-07-03 | Tesco picketed by unions alarmed by treatment of migrant workers | Unite has tabled a resolution that accuses Britain's biggest supermarket chain of exploiting the foreign workers employed at its UK meat supply chains, claiming they suffer harsh and divisive conditions and are paid less |
| UK2 | The Guardian | 2010-03-13 | National: Food investigation: 'I'm not a slave, I just can't speak English' - life in the meat industry: Equality report reveals toll of abuse in food factories: Migrants treated worse than others, inquiry finds | EHRC report, mistreatment of especially migrants in the meat processing industry |
| UK3 | The Guardian | 2010-03-13 | Violence and abuse rife in food factories: One in 5 staff pushed or hit - report: Supermarket suppliers under fire  | mistreatment of workers in food industry, EHRC report |
| UK4 | The Guardian | 2010-05-24 | Saturday: Meat packers united: Scandalous working conditions in industrial chicken sheds have led to a revolution. In Britain's poultry sector the labour movement has come back to life - and forced supermarkets to act | EHRC report, widespread abuse of migrant workers in the UK meat sector, union agreement shortly before the report |
| UK5 | The Guardian | 2011-02-04 | Front: Expert view A dirty business | CCTV in slaughterhouses |
| UK6 | The Guardian | 2011-05-04 | Comment: It's not just our communities they kill, but free markets too: Across the country local shops have been wiped out by supermarkets. This is an issue for the right as much as the left | free markets, effect on food chain |
| UK7 | The Guardian | 2013-05-24 | Horsemeat company regularly mixed horse in with beef, say Polish workers | horse meat scandal, Netherlands |
| UK8 | The Guardian | 2013-05-25 | National: Horsemeat scandal: Workers describe how horse mixed with beef allegedly got into Europe's food chain: Trucks from UK 'brought horses to Dutch factory': Firm denies relabelling meat as owner arrested | horse meat scandal, reports of workers in Netherlands |
| UK9 | The Guardian | 2013-11-21 | For workers in Newport on the minimum wage, life is about making do | report on minimum wages, example of meat preparation |
| UK10 | The Guardian | 2015-12-22 | UK chicken farming puts workers and food safety at risk; A climate of fear and often appalling conditions grip workers in the UK's chicken abattoirs and processing plants | investigations on working conditions in the poultry industry |
| UK11 | The Guardian | 2016-09-28 | FSA: 4,000 breaches of animal welfare laws at UK abattoirs in two years; Data released by the food watchdog reveals thousands of animals are being subjected to avoidable suffering at slaughterhouses | investigation by the FSA, problems with animal welfare at abattoirs, mistreatment by workers |
| UK12 | The Guardian | 2017-06-26 | Why Brexit will be a watershed for the UK's food and farming industry; Leaving the EU is a chance to reform the biggest sector of Britain's economy. But is Michael Gove up to the job, or will he be hamstrung by free-market dogma? | Brexit consequences (freedom of movement) for food processors and manufacturers that rely on foreign workers  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Germany**  |
| **Article No.** | **Newspaper** | **Date** | **Title** | **Relevant Content**  |
| GER1 | Die Welt | 2005-02-22 | Das Billiglohnland: Was Skeptiker der EU-Osterweiterung prophezeit hatten, ist in Schlachthöfen im Oldenburger Land bereits Realität: Tausende von Fleischarbeitern wurden bisher entlassen und durch billige Arbeitskräfte aus den Beitrittsländern ersetzt. Der Grund ist eine Lücke im EU-Recht  | precarious working conditions in slaughterhouses in Northern Germany, Germans replaced by EU citizens, NGG and German authorities powerless, companies from Denmark coming to produce in Germany due to cheaper labour |
| GER2 | Die Welt | 2007-06-20 | Müntefering will den Mindestlohn gegen die Union durchsetzen: Vize-Kanzler gehen die Beschlüsse der Koalition nicht weit genug - Ausweitung des Entsendegesetzes auf weitere Branchen beschlossen;  | Minister Müntefering wants to extend the minimum wage, one of the first branches that should profit from minimum wage is the meat processing industry, *Entsendegesetz* |
| GER3 | Die Welt | 2009-02-13 | Im Reich des Herrn Wesjohann; Der Wiesenhof-Besitzer lässt nicht gerne Besucher in seine Firma - Für die WELT macht er eine Ausnahme | inside report and interview with Wiesenhof CEO |
| GER4 | Die Zeit | 2009-07-09 | Rabiater Preiskampf bei Lebensmitteln | aggressive price politics of retail results in precarious working conditions (not explicitly addressing meat industry) |
| GER5 | Süddeutsche Zeitung | 2013-06-24 | Sklaven in Deutschland | human trafficking and organised crime in the German meat-processing industry |
| GER6 | Die Zeit | 2014-12-11 | Die Schlachtordnung | description of working conditions and the (EU) regulation that enabled the current system |
| GER7 | Süddeutsche Zeitung | 2014-01-15 | Die Ehre der Fleischhändler | description of introduction of sectoral minimum wage |
| GER8 | Die Zeit | 2015-02-05 | Gabriel für bessere Arbeitsbedingungen | Minister Gabriel wants to improve working conditions for agency workers, especially in the meat processing industry: More regulation and collaboration with slaughterhouses |
| GER9 | Die Zeit | 2015-12-14 | Der König der Schweine | description of working conditions at Tönnies |
| GER10 | Die Zeit | 2016-01-28 | Dem Kotelett zuliebe? Warum es gut ist, dass ein Volksbegehren in Brandenburg die Massentierhaltung abschaffen will | petition against lifestock farming in Brandenburg. |
| GER11 | Die Zeit | 2016-06-29 | Fleischindustrie: Immer noch viele Werkverträge | voluntary obligation in the meat processing industry for improving working conditions is presented as a reaction to a Zeit article in 2015. It was signed by 18 businesses. However, a current report sees little improvement. More than half of employees still subcontracted |
| GER12 | Süddeutsche Zeitung | 2017-07-25 | Ausgenommen | exploitative working conditions in the meat-processing industry, fear prevents actors from changing the conditions, 2017 law passed secretly in order to prevent the industry from exerting pressure on politicians and to protect those involved. Sceptical view on regulation: Implementation problems due to low control mechanisms |