**Supplementary materials**

Supplementary material ‘Policy entrepreneurship across boundaries: a systematic literature review’

**1. Selected key words and search terms**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| *Policy entrepreneur* | AND | *Strategies* | AND | *Policy* | AND NOT | *Business* |
| “entrepreneur\*” | “strateg\*”  “activit\*”  “action\*”  “approach\*”  “skill\*”  “role\*” | “policy”  “policies” | "association\*" "business\*" "commercial\*" "compan\*"  "corporat\*"  "credit\*"  "econom\*"  "enterpris\*"  "financ\*"  "firm\*"  "franchis\*"  "industr\*"  "start-up\*"  "technolog\*"  "venture\*" |

**2. search string**

( ( TITLE-ABS-KEY ( "entrepreneur\*" ) ) AND ( TITLE-ABS-KEY ( "strateg\*" OR "activit\*" OR "action\*" OR "approach\*" OR "skill\*" OR "role\*" ) ) AND ( ( TITLE-ABS-KEY ( "policy\*" ) OR TITLE-ABS-KEY ( "policies" ) ) ) ) AND NOT ( ( TITLE-ABS-KEY ( "association\*" ) OR TITLE-ABS-KEY ( "business\*" ) OR TITLE-ABS-KEY ( "commercial\*" ) OR TITLE-ABS-KEY ( "compan\*" ) OR TITLE-ABS-KEY ( "corporat\*" ) OR TITLE-ABS-KEY ( "credit\*" ) OR TITLE-ABS-KEY ( "econom\*" ) OR TITLE-ABS-KEY ( "enterpris\*" ) OR TITLE-ABS-KEY ( "financ\*" ) OR TITLE-ABS-KEY ( "firm\*" ) OR TITLE-ABS-KEY ( "franchis\*" ) OR TITLE-ABS-KEY ( "industr\*" ) OR TITLE-ABS-KEY ( "start-up\*" ) OR TITLE-ABS-KEY ( "technolog\*" ) OR TITLE-ABS-KEY ( "venture\*" ) ) ) AND (LIMIT-TO (DOCTYPE , “ar”))}

**3. Coding instructions**

**Bibliographic information**

1. Document number
2. Document title
3. Year of publication
4. Journal

**Entrepreneur as actor**

1. Adjective entrepreneur (e.g. policy, norm, institutional)
2. Entity
   * Individual
   * Institution
   * Joint
3. Type of actor
   * inside government
     1. political (president, presidential staff, political appointees)
     2. administration (bureaucrats, non-elected staff)
   * outside government
     1. NGO (non-profit organizations operating independently of government, whose objective is to address social or political issue)
     2. private (under no state control, seeking profit)
     3. research (academics, researchers, consultants)
     4. CSO (local organization that manifests and represents interest and will citizens)
     5. Citizen (non-organized local, not representative of larger group)
4. Type of actor – specific [open coding] (e.g. EU Trade Commissioner Lamy, NGO Friends of the Earth)

**Focus and locus study**

1. Focus of the study [open coding] (e.g. EU, Israel, USA, Vietnam)
2. Locus of the study
   * Global
   * Supranational
   * National
   * Subnational
3. Topic [open coding]
4. Discipline journal – based on ISI Web of Knowledge *Journal Citation Report*

**Cross-boundary strategies**

1. Conditions, [open coding] *“a premise upon which the appearance, occurrence and/or manifestation of the cross-boundary strategizing depends”*
2. Type of strategy, *“(a set of)* *activities, manoeuvres*, *or actions of a particular kind and for a particular purpose, available to the actor”* to be recognized by an active verb (to undertake, to do, to go etc)
   * ‘Issue promotion’, *actions of policy entrepreneurs that contribute to issue visibility, including publishing papers, giving speeches, voicing ideas in discussions, and advising other stakeholders across boundaries*
   * ‘Coalition building’, *identifying contacts, building teams and points for cooperation and forming coalitions across the boundaries of levels and/or domains*
   * ‘Transforming institutions’, *the actions of policy entrepreneurs to alter the distribution of authority and power and/or transform existing institutions*
   * ‘Issue framing’, *the use of narratives and stories to make sense of an issue by selecting particular relevant aspects, connecting them into a sensible whole, and delineating issue boundaries*
   * ‘Leading by example’, *the undertaking of pilot programs, the using of exemplar policy, or the testing of preferred policy change*
3. Directions of cross-boundary strategies
   * ‘Vertical’, *crosscutting the boundaries between different policy levels*
   * ‘Horizontal’, *crosscutting the boundaries between different policy domains*
   * ‘Diagonal’, *crosscutting the boundaries of policy domains and levels simultaneously*
4. Functions of cross-boundary strategies
   * ‘Expanding’ the issue arena, *involving an additional level and/or domain*
   * ‘Shifting’ the issue arena, *moving the issue from the traditional arena in which it was discussed to a different level/domain. Also referred to as venue-shopping*
   * ‘Integrating’ issue arenas, *including additional domains/levels into original issue arena or into a new institution*
5. Implications, [open coding], *“apart from increase in resources or successful policy change, the consequences following from and directly dependent on the cross-boundary strategies of the entrepreneur”.*

**4. PRISMA-P checklist** (Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic review and Meta-Analysis Protocols) (based on Moher et al. 2009, de Vries et al 2015)

*NOTE: some checks are not applicable as they are meant for meta-analysis or more quantitative systematic reviews*

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **TITLE** | | | |
| Title |  | Identify the research as systematic review | p. 1 |
| **ABSTRACT** | | | |
| Structured summary |  | Provide a structured summary including (as applicable): background; objectives; data sources; study eligibility criteria, participants, and interventions; study appraisal and synthesis methods; results; limitations; conclusions and implications of key findings; systematic review registration number. | p. 1 |
| **INTRODUCTION** | | | |
| Rationale |  | Describe the rationale for the review in the context of what is already known. | p. 1-4 |
| Objectives |  | Provide an explicit statement of questions being addressed with reference to participants, interventions, comparisons, outcomes and study design. | p. 3-4 |
| **METHODS** | | | |
| Protocol and registration |  | Indicate if a review protocol exists, if and where it can be accessed (e.g. Web address) and, if available, provide registration information including registration number. | Annex |
| Eligibility criteria |  | Specify study characteristics and report characteristics (e.g. years considered, language, publication status) used as criteria for eligibility, giving rationale. |  |
| Information sources |  | Describe all information sources (e.g. databases with dates of coverage, contact with study authors to identify additional studies) in the search and date last searched. | p. 5 |
| Search strategy |  | Present full electronic search strategy for at least one database, including any limits used, such that it could be repeated. | p. 5 + annex |
| Study selection |  | State the process for selecting studies (i.e. screening, eligibility, included in systematic review, and, if applicable, included in the meta-analysis). | p. 4-5 |
| Data collection process |  | Describe method of data extraction from reports (e.g. piloted forms, independently, in duplicate) and any processes for obtaining and confirming data from investigators. | p. 5-6 |
| Data items |  | List and define all variables/categories for which data were sought (e.g. PICOS, funding sources) and any assumptions and simplifications made. | p. 7 |
| Risk of bias in individual studies |  | Describe methods used for assessing risk of bias in individual studies (including specification of whether this was done at the study or outcome level), and how this information is to be used in any data synthesis. | N/A |
| Summary measures |  | State the principal summary measures (e.g. risk ratio, difference in means). | N/A |
| Synthesis results |  | Describe the methods for handling data and combining results of studies, if done, including measures of consistency (e.g. I) for each meta-analysis. | p. 7-8 |
| Risk of bias across studies |  | Specify any assessment of risk of bias that may affect the cumulative evidence (e.g. publication bias, selective reporting within studies). | p. 8 |
| Additional analyses |  | Describe methods of additional analyses (e.g. sensitivity or subgroup analyses, meta-regression), if done, indicating which were pre-specified. | N/A |
| **RESULTS** | | | |
| Study selection |  | Give numbers of studies screened, assessed for eligibility and included in the review, with reasons for exclusions at each stage, ideally with a flow diagram. | p. 4-7 |
| Study characteristics |  | For each study, present characteristics for which data were extracted (e.g. study size, PICOS, follow-up period) and provide the citations. | p. 9-10 |
| Synthesis results |  | Present the main results of the review. If meta-analyses are done, include for each, confidence intervals and measures of consistency | p. 9-20 |
| Risk of bias across studies |  | Present results of any assessment of risk of bias across studies (see item 15) | N/A |
| Additional analysis |  | Give results of additional analyses, if done (e.g. sensitivity or subgroup analyses, meta-regression [see Item 16]). | N/A |
| **DISCUSSION** | | | |
| Summary of evidence |  | Summarize the main findings including the strength of evidence for each main outcome; consider their relevance to key groups (e.g. healthcare providers, users, and policy makers). | p. 21-25 |
| Limitations |  | Discuss limitations at study and outcome level (e.g. risk of bias), and at review-level (e.g., incomplete retrieval of identified research, reporting bias). | p. 25 |
| Conclusions |  | Provide a general interpretation of the results in context of other evidence, and implications for future research | p. 23-26 |
| **FUNDING** | | | |
| Funding |  | Describe sources of funding for the systematic review and other support (e.g., supply of data); role of funders for the systematic review | N/A |

**References**

Moher, D., A. Liberati, J. Tetzlaff and D.G. Altman. 2009. ‘Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses: The PRISMA Statement’, *Annals of Internal Medicine*, 151, 4, 264–69.

De Vries, H., V. Bekkers and L. Tummers. 2015. ‘Innovation in the Public Sector: a Systematic Review and Future Research Agenda’, *Public Administration* 94, 1, 146-166.

**5. Data extraction table 1: general description literature**

| **#** | **Doc #** | **Article** | **Year** | **Methods** | **Entrepreneur** | **type** | **Level** | **Locus** | **Topic** | **Condition** | **Strategy** | **Implications** | **Type** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | P1 | Ackrill | 2011 | 1 sentence in intro collection: ‘elite interviews’ | EU Trade Commissioner Trade Lamy | Political | supranational, global | EU | Sugar reform | Ambiguous hierarchical structure of authority between different DGs, some policy issues occupy policy arena of different DGs, such as sugar – policy issue located across multiple institutionally connected EU arenas.  He wanted to put pressure on DG-AGRI | Trade commissioner Lamy proposed duty-free quota-free policy for Least Developed Countries, EBA, to include sugar. Unrestricted sugar exports would undermine protected, high-priced, EU market regime. Lamy was fully aware of this and used it to put pressure on DG-AGRI | Policy subject (sugar) subject to decision-making in one area may affect causally decisions on that issue in other arenas | Policy entrepreneur |
|  | P7 | Arieli | 2013 | Paragraph in intro: collection: systematic review literature (?), 28 interviews, using snowball sampling | Aqaba-Eilat municipal cooperative committees | Administration | subnational, national | Israel-Jordan | Post-conflict cross-border cooperation | General lack of trust, authority and support among communities at different sides of the border | Therefore entrepreneurs engage in coalition building on two spheres: horizontal and vertical. Horizontal: identify cross-border contacts for cooperation in parallel organizations and functions to serve personal and/or organizational interests. Vertically: seek authorization and support from higher level politicians and bureaucrats for cross-border aspects of their local activity.  Organized initiative to facilitate communication between mayors of neighbouring communities and local public. Participated in seminars and outings to indicate needs | Resulted in cooperation and increased levels of trust | Policy entrepreneur |
|  | P18 | Black | 2012 | No | Chinese and Japanese policymakers | Political | global, national | China, Japan, global | Anti-piracy responses | Piracy in Gulf provides space for powers to demonstrate their power – as issue is new and authority is unclear | Both China and Japan took opportunity to spread certain idea about them as great powers, with different frames |  | Norm entrepreneur |
|  | P20 | Blavoukos | 2012 | No | prime minister C. Simitis, foreign affairs minister G.A. Papandreou | Political | Supranational | EU | Greek-Turkish rapprochment (and Greek foreign policy shift towards Turkish inclusion in EU) | Level of entry barriers facilitates or frustrates entrepreneurs in any given policy arena. This dictates the amount of resources needed to realize policy change. at same time, too low barriers may discourage activities, as any return may well be rapidly decreased by competition from future newcomers (curvilinear relationship).  Turmoil in Balkan posed security challenges to Greece. Plus end of bipolarity loosened NATO constraints over Turkey. Greece for security reasons felt it should change its stance. Also EU-enlargement policy became more welcoming towards Turkey | Papandreou gave speech in september 1999 in UN General Assembly to enhance Greek-Turkish relations, because of underlying assumptions that closer entanglement within EU would bring forward series of reforms in Turkey that would eventually necessitate abandonment of aggression in bilateral relationship |  |  |
|  | P23 | Boasson | 2014 | Half section. Collection: Document review, 26 interviews. Analysis: nothing | EU DGs for environment, research | Administration | Supranational | EU | EU adoption of Carbon Capture and Storage policy with NER300 funding | Signing of Kyoto protocol required coming up with climate measures.  Commission also shifted attitude in reaction to growing concern over energy security. | Approaching Copenhagen summit and energy security issue used by entrepreneurs to create sense of urgency and frame CCS as solution to these problems.  Linking CCS to renewable energy in the funding mechanism, in order to gain support from CCS sceptics  Touring capitals of EU member states to promote the parliaments amendments to the CCS to create leverage for ideas |  |  |
|  | P24 | Boekhorst | 2010 | No | World Wildlife Fund for Nature China (international NGO, subdivision in China, but not registered as Chinese NGO) | NGO | subnational, National, global | China, Yangtze River Basin | Integrated river basin management | Difficult to collaborate with national government and place issues on the agenda, as in China agenda-setting is limited mainly to the central government.  1998 flood created attention to river management, and created room for WWF to act again. | WWF used its national and international network to stimulate acceptance and application of IRBM.  Built coalition with Chinese Academy of Sciences and State Forestry Administration. Led to staff training and site listing for protection, but not much impact.  Built coalitions as well with local stakeholders and governments in the river basin. Led to discovery of experts and funding necessary for launching the Living River Program.  Moreover, WWF also established networks internationally by linking up with the CCICED. WWF provided secretariat for IRBM Task Force (which was jointly established with CCICED) WWF managed to incorporate their approach in CCICED recommendations. Also, WWF through its coalition could deliver recommendations to the premier of the state council (without having to pass through ministerial levels).  In parallel, it held close contacts with academic field, led to media coverage in form of special issue in National Chinese Geographic, and articles in China Daily Newspaper, creating awareness in and outside of China.  Informed politicians at all levels through field visits, conferences, lectures etcetera to create support and inform stakeholders.  Started pilot projects in local areas who were willing to get along with WWF (because it raised living conditions local inhabitants). WWF organized meetings with local people to explain them about functioning river system (awareness sessions). Organized workshops to come up with alternative income generating activities. Created public support (especially because average household income rose exponentially).  China Council for International Cooperation on Environment and Development (CCICED) devoted special taskforce to IRBM, WWF linked up with institution to include recommendations.  Site visits, international conference, publications created visibility and impact | Led to successful policy change | Policy entrepreneur |
|  | P27 | Bourblanc | 2014 | No. | Environmental Movement Organization, ERB (d'eau et rivieres de bretagne) | NGO | Subnational, national | Brittany, France | Water pollution (from intensive agriculture) | Initially, agriculture perceived as very important sector for regional development, therefore ERB was hesitant to point to the source for water pollution (intensive agriculture) and instead focused primarily on consequence of water pollution.  But after 1980s changed and ERB started opposing intensive agriculture system. | First brought it to higher administrative levels by bringing criminal charges against leaders of intensive agriculture (and not smaller agriculture actors), and subsequently involving the Dept of Agriculture. DoA drew up first programme to deal with pollution caused by agriculture. but since program did not challenge intensive mode of production, further protest from ERB.  ERB started a juridical battle to try to force the French administration to transpose European legislation into French law.  To keep problem on agenda, ERB started to frame water pollution in terms of nitrate concentration in drinking water and the impact on human health (e.g. in its columns).  ERB appealed to EU authorities to have France’s failure to implement binding European legislation (European Directive on to regulate use drinking water from surface water courses in which nitrates exceed certain percentage) condemned. French government convicted in 2001 and 2007, resulting in major pressure from EU to implement substantial changes in agricultural practices.  Since ERB wanted to place blame on Agriculture sector it did not support other local NGO collective (CEP) in their campaign to protest against water delivery services re. nitrates in drinking water, as this would shift attention away from ag sector (as focus on drinking water, not water resources), and towards water service authorities and municipal authorities. |  | Policy entrepreneur |
|  | P31 | Buhr | 2012 | Section: type (single case study) time span, data collection: document and interviews. Sequence events, use of sources, triangulation | European (particularly British) actors from aviation industry, NGOs, consultants and think tanks, and government and EU representatives | Private  Ngo  Research  Administration | Supranational | EU | Inclusion aviation in EU emissions trading scheme | Change in administration: rotating Presidency of EU (UK) provided opportunity, public mood within UK forced government to consider solutions. UN body dealing with aviation, ICAO, did not take much responsibility or action, frustration grew with EU level. At some point EU felt it could take up issue. Review of ETS phase 1. Different groups of actors (aviation industry, NGOs, consultants, think tanks, governmental and EU representatives) all wanting (or not opposing) similar thing, for various reasons. Aviation needed environmental sound image to grow, british government to achieve something in their presidency.  Used existing associations for promoting emissions trading as platforms | British institutional entrepreneurs used rotating presidency of EU to come up with policy proposal, and emissions trading was also something the aviation industry could live with.  Entrepreneurs behind proposal linked arguments about emissions trading to norms and values in institutional context to promote preferred policy proposal.  Checked with different actors and felt little/no resistance to plan of emissions trading scheme.  Aviation industry, also as entrepreneur, initially developed proposal for ETS. This was initially developed at UK level and then brought to EU level. Used EU level to gain broader support from wider industry (their growth prospects were partly dependent on environmentally responsible image) |  | Institutional entrepreneur |
|  | P34 | Carter | 2014 | Paragraph: collection: document analysis, ‘set’ of interviews | NGO Friends of the Earth. Ministers as PEs as well. Prime Minister Blair | NGO  Political | National, | UK | Climate change and energy policy adoption, and placing it high on priority list | Competitive consensus in which parties tried to out-green their rivals.    Various contextual factors: papers and conferences about CC impacts, release Inconvenient truth, Stern Report (which argued that stronger action to limit emissions was justified).  Realization that government policies couldn’t realize emission cuts.  Businesses did not want to oppose and lose political influence | FotE identified the government’s failure to deliver emissions reduction targets, defined a solution in the form of a climate change bill, took Cameron for visit to Arctic to see impacts of climate change, and eventually won cross-party political support for it.  Tony Blair pushed climate change onto international agenda already before FoE took it up. (G8 and EU presidencies). through Stern report other parties began promoting and framing low carbo economy as opportunity for business.  David Miliband (Secretary of State at DEFRA) created new government institution, Inter Departmental office for Climate Change (OCC) that represented all main departments affecting GHG emissions, including environment, energy, transport, business, overseas development, foreign office, cabinet office, treasury. Was given responsibility for developing and passing climate change bill (which would normally have been undertaken by internal DEFRA team). As such different (conflicting) interests together to generate consensus. Effect was noticeable undermining of treasury’s formerly influence  David Miliband took issue of EU ETS cap and turned it into major symbolic battle within cabinet on governments environmental credentials  The third venue shift was the creation of a new ministry, the Department for Energy and  Climate Change (DECC), in October 2008. It combined the energy and climate portfolios  previously split between the DTI (renamed the Department for Business, Enterprise and  Regulatory Reform (BERR)) and DEFRA, with the aim of institutionalizing a coordinated  approach to CCEP. Under an energetic Secretary of State, Ed Miliband, DECC quickly  adopted ambitious emissions reductions at home and abroad as its main priority and  began to develop the policies required by the EU and CCA targets. | Institutional entrepreneurs |  |
|  | P62 | Diez | 2010 | Paragraph in intro: interviews, type, number | Advocates of sexual minority rights. 3 individuals in 2 federal agencies. Saavedra, director National Center Prevention Control HIV/AIDS (part ministry health), Frenk, Minister of Health. Frend and Saveedra knew each other well. Betancourt, Espindola were recruited into senior positions council. | CSO  Administration | National, global | Mexico | National Anti-homophobia Campaign | Public mood: broader, structural social changes (secularization). Other (non-elected) political party brought up issue of sexual minorities in public debate. also human rights part of the broader issue of human rights, central to elections.  Also opening up to civil society actors through democratization.  Presidency of Fox, and resulting opening-up of policy-making process. Policy entrepreneurs (who were from civil society previously) assumed important positions in 2 federal agencies. | Official launch of campaign at UN office Mexico, with presence various NGOs, IOs, CSOs by government (promoting)  As a reaction to the debate and to counter opposition to their campaign, entrepreneurs decided to pursue 2 strategies: first, expand alliance they had formed in favour of campaign, by integrating international actors (PHO and UNAIDS). Asked them to sign onto the initiative to allow them to present the campaign as a collective initiative. 2 orgs started stating that Mexico had to abide by international recommendations to fight homophobia. (networking, institution)  Assembly held series of consultations, regional fora, and meetings with experts and members of civil society at large. After consultations published report in which members presented antidiscrimination draft bill and recommended establishment of national council tasked with 2 main objectives: ensuring that such law be implemented and promoting more generally a culture of tolerance in the country.  Report was taken over by Fox and sent to Congress without changes  Alliance developed arguments counter opposition and convince government actors and public at large of need campaign, based on 2 frames: 1) homophobia as obstacle to fight aids (based on scientific data) thus involving public health; 2) human rights: prohibited discrimination against homosexuals | Fierce opposition in first instance from several actors, including US conservative NGO and Catholic Church. |  |
|  | P71 | Font | 2010 | Paragraph: qualitative design, based on document analysis and interviews (types interviewees). | Greenpeace, WWF-Spain, SEO/BirdLife, and the Confederation of Organizations for Environmental Protection (CODA), which was in turn integrated into the New Water Culture Foundation, the  Association of People Affected by Large Dams (COAGRET), and territorially-based social movements such as the Association for the Defense of the Ebro River. | NGO | National | Spain | Water policy change | Government turnover gave way to new policy proposals. Water Framework Directive requirements (at EU level) and need to comply with them.  Persistence has been central in putting forward alternative ideas.  Multiple venues allows for shopping as way of amplifying concerns and finding institutional alliances. EU has provided WFD requirements and complaints system, regularly used by PEs in water sector.  Different PEs pooled resources in order to maximize their efforts | Entrepreneurs participated in technical meeting hosted by European Commission.  Group of entrepreneurs also frequently provided info and lodged complaints to the European Commission. Also presented petitions and questions to European Parliament, all of which alleged that National Water Plan went against several EU environmental directives (Environmental groups considered that the large-scale infrastructure proposed in the Plan, in particular the Ebro diversion, had negative effects on Special Areas of Conservation and Special Protection Areas that constituted the Natura 2000 Network, and that it would have severe consequences for most water ecosystems).  Variety of social organizations launched intensive networking campaign in Brussels in order to sell ideas opposed to EU financing of the work that was projected in the National Water Plan. These activities led to European Commission contacting Spain’s Ministry of Environment to obtain information to decide on its own position. Thereafter send a letter to ministry to express their concern. Thereafter recommended it to produce strategic impact assessment  In 2001 entrepreneurs participated in Blue March to Brussels, where they lodged complaints about the NWP to the European Commission and European Parliament 🡪 gained media attention 🡪 to activate resources and gain support  To put pressure on the government of Spain to withdraw the 2001 National Water Plan, different entrepreneurs, Greenpeace, WWF-Spain, SEO/Birdlife, and social movements, launched national and supra-national campaigns that condemned social, economic, and environmental consequences of the plan  Scientific actors as entrepreneurs undertook studies that questioned the Plan, and adviced the European Commission on the plan, including strategic impact assessment, and socio-economic assessment of transfer projects included in plan, to transform dominant policy image. WWF Spain for instance produced environmental assessment for impact projected dams and water transfers and their impact on Natura 2000 sites. | However PEs have not demonstrated sufficient capacities to significantly advance completion water transition. With subsuming ministry environment into ministry ag, other water schemes were introduced and this initiative overshadowed | Policy entrepreneurs |
|  | P72 | Forbes | 2012 | Section: qualitative methodology, document analysis, interviews. Analysis: iterative coding. | senior managers, chairs directors of NHS and CHSCP in Scotland | Administration | National | Scotland | Health and social care partnerships | Devolution and institutional redesign led to creation multilevel institutions that have provided the opportunity for local actors to influence policy | Conceptual: spanning levels is required to realise change. ‘boundary bridging’ as adjacent fields influencing each other through alternative viewpoints and practices. Need for actors to pass on these ideas – entrepreneurs.  1) microlevel institutional work: opportunity recognition: reframing of health issues as stemming from socio-economic inequalities, making it a social issue as well. As such, integration was encouraged and current policy framed as failure. Entrepreneurs were also within institutions (NHS board, city council). agreed that integration would address problems, only however not sure what it should look like.  2) mesolevel inst work: designing new inst field: design to make NHS and city council work on an equal basis.  3) macro-level inst work: legitimizing new institutional field: at 2 levels, locally w/ city NHS members and professions, and nationally w/ executive civil servants and ministers. had to negotiate and discuss a lot to convince people of added value | Creation new institution, the CHSCP which crossed both institutions, which at first was difficult due to competition and leadership issues but was overcome through legitimating CHSCP with executive ministers | Institutional entrepreneurship |
|  | P75 | Gorton | 2005 | Footnote: collection: interviews, documentation, learning workshop and for what data. Reference to other publication with more info. | selected number of actors from Ministries, NGOs, and academia became part of elite int. networks. Almonas Gukauskas from agriculture ministry. professor Sapek in Poland. | Political, NGO, research, administration | National, supranational | CEEC: Lithuania (Northern Lithuanian Karst region), Poland (Ostroleka county), Slovakia (Corn Island) | Strategic realignment of environmental policy systems (agriculture induced water pollution) |  | Gutkauskas (Lithuania) worked for min ag and dept land use and reclamation, and brought together scientists to prepare programme on groundwater protection and sustainable agriculture, program accepted and funded by government in 1993.  Also founded NGO Tatula Fund, which he used to address conferences and meetings, also internationally, and in EU-context. This internationalized local problems.  In Poland, research carried out by Institute for Land Reclamation and Grassland Farming (IMUZ), funded by US Environmental Protection Agency, under leadership of PE Sapek. Findings were framed as threat to human health, requiring investments for improvement animal waste management. This led to many funds coming in |  | Policy entrepreneur |
|  | P77 | Grinstein | 2009 | Section. Case study approach. (?) Interviews and survey. Use of sources. Analysis: iterative process, descriptive statistics. | Michael Sherraden, author; Robert Friedman, founder Corporation for Enterprise Development (CFED), Ray Boshara, crafter original legislation IDA | Administration, private | National | USA | Individual Development Accounts (IDA) – to promote social and economic development among economically disadvantaged populations |  | Entrepreneurs started short-term demonstration project in 3 states, to overcome reluctance from public welfare policy (demonstrating, support)  Efforts of non-profit orgs were critical in moving IDA policy dialogue to national level, by using national platforms at conferences, web sites, networking expertise to disseminate pivotal research findings emerging from American Dream Policy Demonstration (ADD), a large-scale multi-site IDA demonstration project. (networking/promoting, support) |  | Policy entrepreneur |
|  | P82 | Hammond | 2013 | Section. Single case study. Collection: document and interviews. Identification interviewees, 21 interviews, 100 docs. Analysis: coding (deductive, but iterative) | Minister Duoji Cairan from Civil Affairs | Political | Subnational, national | China | Minimum livelihood guarantee system | As Minister Duoji was not in position to provide legislative or fiscal support, hence had to stimulate other institutions to do so.  Chinese system is fragmented which provides opportunities for bureaucracy at different levels, to influence policy | Meanwhile, he also intervened in the development of the policy in the province. He suggested the city of Dalian establish an MLG system to provide an example – which happened. Dalian served as an example for other cities throughout China. Through example served to expand the experience, methods and support that could be drawn upon.  Duoji shifted policy onto national agenda and pushed for implementation, by mentioning it in speech at Tenth National Civil Affairs Congress (because, according to the author, he as a minister was unable to provide legislative or fiscal support for the policy) | Would it have stayed a local experiment, MLG would have never become widespread acknowledged |  |
|  | P95 | Iusmen | 2012 | Several sentences: qualitative interviews, documentary analysis, analysis policy instruments | Franco Frattini, then EU Commissioner for Justice, Freedom and Security. | Political | Supranational | EU | Children’s rights | Vacuum in EU internal dimension on children’s rights, applied it to Romanian level. This feedbacked on EU level, causing an incremental and slow-moving policy evolution of children’s rights at EU-level. Which was promoted by Commissioner for Justice.  PE learned from Romania, and used that for EU | Commission officials in DG ELARG highlighted how the Romanian case has provided them with knowledge and expertise in key principles and implementation mechanisms underlying the UNCRC (demonstrate – resources)  Frattini used the example of Romania and its child-rights policy (which provided knowledge and expertise) to find support for an EU-wide policy on children’s rights (demonstrating – support) |  | Policy entrepreneurs |
|  | P105 | Kugelberg | 2012 | Section: Qualitative: collection: 18 interviews, scientific docs, policy docs. Analysis: coding. Triangulation and validation | Any |  | National | Slovenia | Food and nutrition policy |  | Aileen Robertson, (state secretary for public health) individual responsible for advising countries within WHO European Region on public health and national nutrition policy, proposed to undertake Health Impact Assessment from the CAP (EU) to convince the Ministry of Agriculture, Food and Forestry to support the food and nutrition plan, and eventually brought together ministry health and ministry agriculture, food, forestry because their objectives were met and CAP could fund (resources – institution/networking) |  |  |
|  | P117 | Maltby | 2013 | Several sentences: collection: scientific docs, 16 interviews, policy docs. | EU European Commission | Administration | Supranational | EU | EU energy security policy (integration) | (1) a trend of increasing energy import dependence;  (2) increasing prices; (3) EU enlargement and (a) historical relations with Russia/USSR and, (b) relatively higher energy import dependence;  (4) gas supply disruptions, leading to undermining of EU energy security, possibilities for European Commission  Conceptual: while each Commission DG has own ovvrlapping, but distinct purview within Council’s often general aims and direction, in this case there are synergies between DGs trade, External Relations, Energy, and Climate on interlinking issues related to energy. Strategically minded actors frame initiatives to fit with certain institutional venues. Different venues may have different priorities and perceive EU concern differently, yet solutions need not be mutually exclusive.  Commission is on path-dependent pro-integration mission | Conceptual: while each Commission DG has own overlapping, but distinct purview within Council’s often general aims and direction, in this case there are synergies between DGs trade, External Relations, Energy, and Climate on interlinking issues related to energy. Strategically minded actors frame initiatives to fit with certain institutional venues. Different venues may have different priorities and perceive EU concern differently, yet solutions need not be mutually exclusive.  In its communications the Commission increasingly referred to energy security as supranational issue to be solved at Commission level  UK’s EU presidency study concluded that stronger EU energy policy cooperation was necessary to improve security of supplies. This was to secure national gas security, as UK had always been exporter but then became net importer of gas (resources) – whereas UK had been one of most important opposers of joint policy  Commission has created multiple different policy frames to make energy legislation at supranational level viable and enhance support for a common energy policy: security, environmental protection (framing – institution/support)  Identification surpranational scale of energy governance as necessary solution to policy problem is one which is socially constructed.  Commission utilized expert studies to establish knowledge-based authority on the issue of energy |  | Policy entrepreneur |
|  | P122 | Meijerink | 2010 | Some sentences: comparative case study, document analysis and interviews | Various | Various | Various | Various | Water policy transitions | Complex decision-making processes in which many different parties and levels of government are involved usually feature a wide range of venues where change agents may place their issue on the agenda or seek support for their ideas. Institutional complexity and redundancy is not dysfunctional. Provides alternative platforms for deliberation and policy influence at multiple levels. More centralized and less democratic government systems offer other opportunities. Once PEs have managed to gain access to and support from central decision-makers, they may be quite effective realizing policy change in such systems. | Example smaller scale implementation to gain experience with the proposed policy and demonstrate feasibility and benefits of newly proposed approaches (such as Plan Stork in the Netherlands or floodplain restoration in Bodrogköz area before it was adopted at the national level)  a minister in Indonesia purposefully moved a specific department from one ministry to another in order to minimize the influence of the conservative old guard to enable smoother processes.  Donor organizations are in position to impose change through formulation of conditions to funding.  WWF in China managed to gain support for ecosystem restoration projects by addressing economic needs of the local population at the same time.  Manipulating venues to have their own ideas or their coalition represented where policy-relevant issues are discussed, and bypass those who resist the change proposed.  Venue-shopping: for local initiatives to be scaled up, they need to be linked to higher level |  | Policy entrepreneurs |
|  | P131 | Mintrom | 1997 | Section: collection, analysis. Event history analysis, survey and statistics | 6 policy think tank, 3 business, 5 teaching, 2 grassroots groups, 3 governors, 7 state legislators | Research  Private  Political  Administration  NGO | National | USA | state legislative consideration and approval of school choice (educational reform). |  | Networking across state lines for 1) learning about details of innovations elsewhere (and gain expertise) this can increase the credibility of the entrepreneur, because they can more readily give authoritative-sounding responses to questions or objections raised concerning proposed policy innovation; 2) draw upon experts from other states to give testimony on earlier experiences with policy innovation; 3) what strategies are successful in other states for selling particular innovation |  | Policy entrepreneurs |
|  | P134 | Miskel | 2004 | Section. Collection, Interviews, archival docs. Analysis: social network analysis, content analysis | National Research Council, Learning First Alliance, American federation Teachers, National Reading Panel. | powerful representatives Lyon, chief in National Institute for Child Health and Human Development, Congressman Goodling. | Administration | National | USA | Reading First initiative in the US in 2001, to raise reading achievement | New staff is new opportunities for new policies. What enabled the promotion of reading policies was that traditional interests granted the new government a so-called ‘honeymoon period’; moreover, president and staff already had experience, commitment and success with the initiative by running trial in Texas; strong desire by congressional leaders to reverse their failures and actually reauthorize ESEA.  However possible downside is that ideas developed in small leadership arena violates expectations for involvement and undermines implementation efforts of new policy | Bush and his team used their experience from implementing a reading first initiative in Texas to claim the attention of Congress, with well-developed ideas for education | Involving multiple arenas in large networks sometimes may be too cumbersome and overloaded for collective policy actions. Small leadership arenas or circles within larger networks may attain desired policy objectives in a more effective and efficient manner |  |
|  | P136 | Mukhtarov | 2013 | Subsection: case study. Collection: 64 qualitative interviews, secondary sources. | 4 major groups: 1) local communities; 2) government agencie; 3) transnational actors; 4) regional and national level civil society orgs. UNDP. GEF, IUCN. | CSO  Citizens  administration | Subnational | Vietnam, Ba Be and Na Hang areas | neoliberal discourses of water management, integration Ba BE and Na Hang into single nature conservation complex. |  | Conceptual: identify (1) scale-based strategies, emphasize importance to target narratives at multiple venues across scales of governance, construct problems and solutions as pertinent to certain geographical scale, engage in networking and coalition-building that span scales of governance. (2) meaning-based strategies, underline importance of developing ideas and linking them to narratives and dominant ideas in policy setting in quest for legitimacy, and presenting them in politically palatable way. (3) context-based strategies, imply necessity to understand context n which narratives are advanced and may involve enrolling some actors in coalitions while excluding others, and keeping alert to opportunities to advance opportunities at particular time and place  Managing director of PARC project Fernando Potess established links with government agencies, provincial departments, as well as international NGOs (IUCN) to secure a broad base of supporters for the project 🡪 resulted in establishment of management board for BA BE and Na Hang, and 🡪 numerous pilot projects introducing agro-forestry, community-based resource planning and the basic PA infrastructure investment.  (framing) PARC proposed to approach the 2 protected sites as an integrated national park, however this was met with reluctance from the provincial authorities who did not want to share authority. Also competition between which level would get authority over certain jurisdiction (thus not successful!)  Link with IUCN 🡪 recommend implementation at UNESCO World Heritage (support) | Working in a different arena, such as implementing PES in Vietnam local area, provides constraints because different context gives different understanding to concept. The accountability of the coalition of transnational policy entrepreneurs and the national government may raise questions, and neither international nor Vietnamese civil society organizations provide sufﬁcient scrutiny to their work.  Trust  The proposal to integrate two different protected sites into one was met with reluctance and fear of losing turf. Hence did not make it.  Linking together 2 government agencies involved with responsibilities environmental protection and forestry respectively created institutional confusion in joint management.  Implementing international approach in local context means adapting it to local specificities. In the context of Vietnam this meant that the program was tailored to fit. That is, where PES is considered voluntary mechanism, it was presented as mandatory instrument to raise additional finances. Moreover, level of payment was prescribed by government, whereas it should be determined by market | Policy entrepreneurs |
|  | P143 | Newman | 2008 | No. Process-tracing mentioned. | National data privacy authorities (created by earlier domestic legislation) | Administration | Supranational, national | EU | EU manage transnational civil liberties by adopting data privacy directive 1995 (and how issue transferred from domestic to supranational level) | Fear with national privacy authorities that transnational data flows would harm privacy citizens. If subset of EU countries did not pass data privacy rules, underregulated nations could potentially become data havens, with firms circumventing national stricter rules.  Lack of knowledge with the EU (and member states), due to severe budget constraints, provided opportunity for transnational actors to jump in and influence the debate.  Authority within the European Union is distributed simultaneously across a number of overlapping institutional jurisdictions. Power relations among levels are not necessarily discrete or subordinate. This structure of the European Union opens up access points for policy entrepreneurs.  Network power derived from patterns of information flows and delegated authority within network, as well as from legitimacy network enjoys by creating ties to constituencies and other organizations.    Moreover, horizontal networks amplify effect both information asymmetries and domestic delegation. Much larger framing effect in european network of commissions than e.g. commission of spain.  Vertical ties solidify importance of particular information advantage. Enhance ability transgovernmental actors to make their preferences known and control agenda formation.  Level of issue complexity will affect the ability of well-resourced transgovernmental actors to play an active role in agenda setting and policy mediation – when issue highly complex, transgovernmental actors well-positioned to use their expertise and information advantage to define and frame terms of the policy agenda. In less technical fields, policymakers less willing to listen to transgovernmental actors. | National privacy experts lobbied European Commission, little success.  Only when they became institutionalized groups of sub-state actors with domestic authority  German data privacy agency organized conference for data privacy commissioners in Europe 🡪 debating pressing issues, share information, discuss best practices, release joint resolutions 🡪 establish working groups 🡪 develop collaborative policy initiatives; formulated proposal for EU reform  Trans-governmental network of data privacy authorities framed issue of supranational data privacy protection as prerequisite for further market and administrative integration in Europe to get their support (and making it transnational instead of domestic issue). They played on symbolic importance of the single market to both Commission and single member states  Data authorities threatened to block trans-border data flows, changing the regulatory reversion point (that is, changing regulatory status-quo that would exist in absence supranational legislation, altering cost-benefit to other policymakers of inaction) to create support for their proposals | Trans-governmental actors rarely have formal power in supranational decision-making process. They must rely on informal tools to shape agendas, mediate disputes, mobilize support for their interests. Use expertise, domestically delegated authority, network ties  Trust | Policy entrepreneurs |
|  | P148 | Palmer | 2015 | Subsection: collection: 33 interviews | Policy official X | Administration | Supranational | EU | EU transport biofuels policy (Biofuels Directive 2003 and Renewable Energy Directive 2009) |  | European Commission encouraged use of biofuels by linking it to existing problems within European Union, in tripod style approach: said that biofuels production may be of particular interest under CAP for creating new economic resources and preserving employment in agricultural community; in addition to mitigating GHGs and enhance energy security.  Depicted biofuels as only readily available means of reducing road transport GHG emissions, and depicting reduction of road transport GHG emissions extremely difficult without biofuels (whereas in reality alternative means were available).  Official X criticized studies that showed effects on land-use as poor quality | Biofuels have proven attractive at eu level through their purported ability to reduce GHGs, enhance energy security, and stimulate rural development.  But then realization that biofuels had negative side effects, for instance in indirect land use change (ILUC). |  |
|  | P149 | Perkmann | 2007 | Section. Case study, collection: 23 interviews, historic accounts, policy documentation. Analysis: narrative account, coding, periodization technique. | Euroregions. (for coordinating policies with counterparts across the borders). | Administration | supranational, national | EU | Establishing Euregions | Emerging fields offer scope for institutional entrepreneurship (transnational, CoE, EU). Maturing fields place limits on PEship.  They engaged in cross-border collaboration to improve their advocacy impact on central government and european agencies.  Findings suggest that emerging fields offer considerable scope for institutional entrepreneurship, therefore entrepreneurs shifted focus from intergove, to CoE to EU as a new emerging field would occur. Field switching as solution | EUREGIO actors engaged in various strategies: (1) interactional projects aimed at bringing together actors previously not connected, from different municipalities, with objective of mobilizing resources from external agencies such as national governments.  (2) AEBR presented its case of cross-border collaboration to politicians in the European Parliament by framing Euregions within wider discourse of European integration: euregions as constituting integration on small scale and building europe from below 🡪 border regions explicitly mentioned in European Constitutional Treaty.  (3) also target local politicians and civil servants. Installed ‘observatory’ with branches at various european locations, and sought out speaking and consulting engagements actoss europe: 80 workshops held, 60 reports published – all framing euregion as european integration.  Thus addressed 3 different fields: intergovernmental relationships: germany – netherlands; CoE and EU. All have different characteristics |  | Institutional entrepreneur |
|  | P150 | Pralle | 2006 | Few sentences. Case study, scientific literature, examination media coverage, government docs, interviews | No definition nor description |  | National, subnational | Canada, Hudson, Quebec | passing bylaw to restrict the nonessential use of lawn and garden pesticides as precautionary principle in Hudson, Canada | Mistakes of one side may create opportunities for others.  Venue shopping not always rational, some also do not see opportunities or do not want to go into certain policy arenas.  Different political systems offer different opportunities for venue shopping. Canada, with mixed system of parliamentary government and federa structure has limited opportunities to shop venues horizontally, because of dominance executive branch and relatively weak judiciary.  Might provide opportunities for vertical venue shopping, play different levels of government. Schattsneider: one of most remarkable developments in recent american politics is extent to which federal, state and local governments have become involved in doing same kinds of things in large areas of public policy, so that it is possible for contestants to move freely from one level of government to another in an attempt to find level at which they might try most advantageously to get what they want | Conceptual: Issue redefinition: shifting not only image of issue but also the basis for considering those issues – what I call policy principles: core values, beliefs, or guidelines attached to policies that help direct decision-making.  Venue shopping searching for alternative policy arenas and efforts to move decision-making authority to new venues. Keeping issues out of venues they would rather not participate in as well as move decision-making to new arenas. Successful entrepreneurs may force opponents to compete in arenas where opponents are at disadvantage or to expend resources waging battles in multiple venues when they would prefer to concentrate on just one.  Issue definition and venue shopping often go hand in hand.  PEs might try and redefine an issue to move consideration of it into new policy venue, where decisions, rules, norms, procedures differ. Moving seemingly local issue to international policy arena, for example, requires redefining issue to emphasize global implications and importance.  Cities are sensitive to what other cities do. Advocacy groups in cities must form national networks to take advantage of openness provided by federal structures; sharing of info and campaign expertise among cities facilitates diffusion of progressive policies.  Different environmental organizations, both regional and national united and launched Campaign for Pesticides Reduction (CPR). Shared resources and info about campaigns through internet, email and person.  Also environmental, labour and health organizations linked up to map the various risks of the use of pesticides.  Redefined use of lawn and garden pesticides in 3 ways: (1) challenged ideal of entirely weed-free near-perfect lawn – “dandelions are your friend”. (2) argument about negative impact of lawn chemicals on children’s health sparked chord with general public and were key factor gaining attention to issue; focusing on children to mobilize large segments of population, and because children are positively constructed target populations policymakers often feel pressure to direct policy to them. Trade-off children;’s health and weed-free lawn became powerful frame for rallying public behind bylaws.  (3) involving precautionary principle in debate: policymakers should act to protect human health and environment even in the face of scientific uncertainty.  Hudson, town in Canada, first to assert its jurisdiction over issue of pesticides, functioned as example for activists, who subsequently put issue on other municipal agendas, in addition to the national venue where they were pushing (venue adding instead of venue shopping) pro was that companies were not prepared to fight battle at hundreds of city councils around Canada (and because multiple-level coalition was also at local, this was easy for activists, also they had better access to local politicians) | Changing definition issue requires mobilization of previously uninterested, something which is difficult for small or resource-poor interest groups. Savvy groups will suffer  Court confirmed authority of local governments to pass laws to secure peace, order, good government, health and general welfare in territory municipality, based on idea that policymakers should act to protect human health and environment even in face of scientific uncertainty. This encouraged spread of pesticides bylaws to other municipalities by giving localities green light to regulate in area.  Shifting venues may sometimes backfire on entrepreneurs, e.g. increasing opposition, trigger effective counter mobilization, leading to stalemate and stability.  Sometimes 1 frame does not replace but complements other, so that mood swings from one to another: e.g. pesticides as threat to health vs pesticides as necessary tool in agricultural production. When new principles are introduced to guide policymaking chance of success is bigger.  Linking of different organizations through network helped to create benefit of broader knowledge, experience and expertise sharing, without which movement would have remained fragmented and small. | Policy entrepreneurs |
|  | P170 | Verger | 2012 | Subsection. Collection: Case study, document analysis reports, 10 interviews, observation. | transnational policy network of education experts strategically placed in influential organizations (international orgs, think tanks, universities, consultancy firms - at interstices business-govment-academia). located at interstices range int. orgs such as WB, ADB, IFC, CfBT. came together in WB Economics of Education Thematic Group. | NGO  Research  Private | Global | Global | promotion public-private-partnerships for education in low income countries | (institutional explanation) multi-scalar approach is required as in globalization era, agenda setting happens more frequently at supranational scale, whereas final decisions re adoption and translation new agendas in particular contexts are usually taken at national or subnational scale | Coalition/network of policy entrepreneurs, strategically placed in influential international organizations, advocate for privatization and ePPP through scientific and technical style.  Policy prescriptions, beyond blueprints, need to inform policymakers about necessary conditions (contextual, material, regulatory etc). this is certainly most challenging aspect for policy entrepreneurs who aspire to prescribe policies aimed at fitting in a broad range of time-place situations |  | Policy entrepreneur |
|  | P171 | Von Heland | 2014 | Section. Case study. Collection: 50 interviews. Observation. | 1 entrepreneur highlighted (because identified as being instrumental in changes by all interviewees), locally elected politician and community leader Adhi. also IE found in WWF, TNC, USAID. | Political | Subnational, national global | Wakatobi national park, Southeast Sulawesi, Indonesia | Coastal and marine resources stewardship in Wakatobi National Park in Eastern Indonesia. At district government level | New decentralization act created vacuum that NGOs could fill. Their support was critical to district’s ability to pursue strategies.  Yet, sensitivity to context means that the strategies of institutional entrepreneurs must be culturally  embedded and address emotional and spiritual aspects of people’s lives.  Citizens were not responsive to idea of MPA management, hence there was a need to convince them of pride to be taken in marine resources, and receive economic benefits in return for protecting marine resources.  Moreover, little tourism, which Adhi wanted to increase | Establishment school for marine conservation, collaborative investment between district government and Ministry of Marine Affairs and Fisheries (again, example of teaming up entrepreneurs for different purposes: whereas the national government used this as a strategy to overcome lack of trained staff to deal with MPAs, for Adhi this was a strategy to ensure the long-term perspective, beyond the electoral interests of politicians. Moreover, school also was a long-term strategy to promote cultural change among not only government institutions but also coastal communities. On top, from national perspective school links to broader national strategy to position Indonesia as leader in ocean issues (president Yudhoyono to initiate CTI, hosting world ocean conference 2009, world coral reef conference 2013)  Adhi and colleagues worked with “Hoga marine research centre” (co-managed by essex university and Operation Wallacea – british ecosystem eco-tourism operator) 🡪 to push for ecosystem stewardship from above by organizations that can inspire and put pressure on local authorities.  Together applied for UNESCO Biosphere Reserves 🡪 for the use of future conservation and fund raising activities, and also help institutionalize MPA management and ensure that marine environment remains prioritized by politicians 🡪 and hope that will attract more researchers and improve collaboration with central government.  Adhi from district government partnered with two major NGOs (WWF and TNC) not only to improve park management but also to promote dive tourism, which would be a strong tool to enhance the government’s and the public’s appreciation of marine biodiversity. Partnership 🡪 also led to investment of money by NGOs in the site | Cosidering Wakatobi’s remote location and little political significance in national context, relationship between district and central government is of vital importance for potential to go to scale and influence financial flows and political priorities beyond local. The strategy to form the School for Marine Conservation helped in this regard. | Institutional entrepreneur |
|  | P172 | Wejs | 2014 | Section. Comparative case study. interviews, document study. | In one instance this was environmental officer (who saw strategy as solution to harsh climate), in other this was employee in development and business unit (who saw CC in terms of business strategy) | Administration | Subnational, | Norway Denmark | local strategies for adaptation to climate change in Denmark and Norway | In Denmark, municipal councils in charge of spatial planning and sector plans, many opportunities for CCA. In Norway also power for municipal government to address CCA.  Local governments operate in an institutional void, as they are not supported or backed by central government (vertical networks) for CCA measures. Therefore they call in expertise from other institutions such as research centres, universities etc. opening up possibilities for PEs.  In both municipalities A and C, the importance of network engagement and,  through these, accessing knowledge and resources is clear. When the hierarchical  structure is weak, horizontal networks become increasingly important.  Search for adaptation solutions required additional financial and/or human resources. therefore entrepreneurs went looking for external support. | Necessary for entrepreneurs to build legitimacy for adaptation plans. Used vulnerability as frame to do so  Recruit external expertise and secure funding for work towards climate-change adaptation in municipality, through externally funded research projects and networks, which provided direct contact to climate researchers, whom PE could ask for downscaled scenarios on issues considered important in local context. Also access to northern coastal municipalities with engagement in international network for downscaling solutions (network, contacts 🡪 expertise and funding)  Sought access to regional development funding from EU and Danish regional authority, to create large projects, which gather knowledge resources from different partners worldwide (universities, research institutes, large companies)  Recruit external expertise and secure funding for work towards climate-change adaptation in municipality, through externally funded research projects and networks, which provided direct contact to climate researchers, whom PE could ask for downscaled scenarios on issues considered important in local context. Also access to northern coastal municipalities with engagement in international network for downscaling solutions (network, contacts 🡪 expertise and funding) |  | Institutional entrepreneur |
|  | P173 | Wigell | 2013 | Few sentences: interviews | Aland, Finland | Political | Subnational, national, global | Finland, Aland | Security, solutions to ethno-territorial disputes, demilitarization, neutralization | Strategy to gain influence in international society often used by actors with limited traditional power resources; ‘niche diplomacy’ whereby small powers, unable to exercise influence across the board, make themselves relevant on international stage by concentrating their efforts in certain key areas.  International promotion of Aland case is also to preserve and maintain semi-sovereign and autonomous status, and thus serves self-interest | Aland lobbied with national government finland to establish co-operative forum between aland and ministry foreign affairs. Contact group started working: mapping out conflict zones where aland could serve as example, international study visits and research about Aland. Group discusses current developments affecting Aland and initiatives regarding promotion Aland  Aland (island) upholds interstate contacts with various states and has representation in Nordic council to promote itself as an example.  Aland Islands Peace Institute (AIPI) an NGO has been active in disseminating idea about Aland Example by organizing events and hosting number of foreign groups (among whom Armenia, Nagorno-Karabakh, Azerbaijan) who came together for peace talks. This all to influence its domestic relations with Finnish government.  Finland (MoFA) organized and sponsored seminars and panels in places such as New York, Brussels, Geneva with aim of bringing Aland under attention of key orgs such as UN as well as broader diplomatic community. And brings Aland up in several other activities such as Ireland Peace talks, OSCE Parliamentary Assembly Team on Moldova etc. talked about as inspiration for constructive discussions and resource for Finnish public diplomacy and brand-building |  |  |
|  | P178 | Zhu | 2012 | Some sentences. Interviews, government docs, newspaper articles | Government officials as policy entrepreneurs. Guo Shuqing, the main designer of the Guizhou housing model as vice governor in charge of housing reform | Political | Subnational, national | Guizhou province, China | local policy innovations in housing monetarization reform in Guizhou province, China at two levels: provincial and prefectural. From heavily subsidized state housing provision system into a market oriented one | Introduction housing monetarization reform by central government provided Window of Opportunity for provincial level.  Given authoritarian nature China’s political regime, key figures within government still exercise crucial influence over policymaking  PEs increased role in the policy process has been  recognised as the Chinese political system has  become more pluralistic or transformed into  a so-called ‘fragmented authoritarianism 2.0’  (Mertha 2009). Barriers to political participation have been lowered and previously excluded actors have successfully penetrated the  system and exerted an increasingly influential  role in the policy process.  Setting example to reduce political opposition and demonstrate soundness of the plan and market ideas amongst potential supporters.  As the reform plan concerned or even harmed interests of many cadres (harde kern) but favoured ordinary employees, policy entrepreneurs strived to mobilize ordinary citizens to become involved and strengthen legitimacy and popularity of reform process | To reduce the perception of risk among decision-makers: conducting pilot reforms or leading by example can reduce political opposition and demonstrate the soundness of the plan and also market the ideas amongst potential supporters. In Guizhou, provincial guiding program set prototype for process of innovation. Guiyang Municipal Housing Reform Office together with provincial and municipal housing authorities worked together and implemented reform. Reported success helped silence opposition in Guizhou and drew positive attention from all over the country. Demonstrated by Guiyang city, approach extended to entire province, and then nationwide. Example 🡪 silence opposition  Created support among local community through media coverage and informing them and seeking their input. Thereby the provincial government did not dare to change the policy direction that was set in, and had to continue after the PE left the province.  To increase legitimacy and support, and given the significance of work units in the implementation of housing reform, dozens of consultation meetings were held in different government depts, research institutes and enterprises to get feedback and support from employees across wide range of social strata. | Wide engagement led to wide support as well, and pressed provincial government to continue after Guo left Guizhou. Even losers accepted reform as they saw how many benefited | Policy entrepreneurs |
|  | P179 | Zito | 2001 | No. | epistemic community as network of professionals sharing common worldview | Research | Supranational | EU | EU acid rain policy adoption | Lack of strong EU-wide political parties, existence of numerous access points into institutional process, large number of officials and organizations that have role in the process, many policy options, all suggest EU-process open to agenda change.  But EU also constrains entrepreneurs’ ability to alter status quo: EU as chain of institutions, each institution within chain acts as veto point, with its actors potentially blocking any agreement on proposal. System’s intricacy and fragmentation hinders entrepreneurship as it gives multiple opportunities for opposing perspectives to exert influence and requires consensus within and across institutions. Hence, to succeed within daily EU decision-making, must persuade coalitions of actors across all potential EU veto points. Thus: collective entrepreneurship  When issues are complex, new or involve issue uncertainty, epistemic community entrepreneurship will be more effective. | Scandinavian experts defined problem of acid rain as transnational, product of long-range air pollution emissions from other European countries, strove to get issue identified as serious in European Community and other IOs. UN Economic Commission for Europe (UN/ECE) was interested, created Convention on Long-Range Transboundary Air Pollution (LTRAP) which provided policy framework for exchanging technical info between member states. |  | Collective entrepreneurship |
|  | P182 | Bjorkdahl | 2014 | No. | Sweden (country) | Political | Supranational, global | EU, UN | inclusion of conflict prevention in security approach UN and EU | Shared core values among EU partially explain success norm entrepreneurship.  Prevention fitted well with normative power image EU and UN.  Small states particularly rely on international institutions for the promotion of their norms, and Sweden believed their norm would resonate with normative contexts of both UN and EU.  When Sweden was elected as non-permanent member of UN security Council it made attempts to include conflict prevention on agenda Council, but with little success | When selected as non-permanent member of Security Council, Sweden draw the Presidential conclusions wherein it linked conflict prevention and peacekeeping. Worked to keep conflict prevention on UN agenda, by linking it to R2P, because this was UN adopted doctrine  Sweden attempted to build support by approaching likeminded countries bilaterally for informal meetings and interpersonal and argumentative persuasion  Established ‘Group of Friends for Conflict prevention’ and various ad hoc coalitions with members of security council, to mobilize support for their ideas.  Diplomatic tactics and persuasion kept conﬂict prevention on the  EU agenda in times when support for crisis management grew strong.  By occupying the rotating presidency of the EU in 2001, Sweden enjoyed privileged control over procedures, and normative influence was enhanced.  Norm entrepreneurship is about building winning coalitions. Swedish representatives  attempted to mobilise support for the idea of conﬂict prevention within the UN as well as in the EU, using informal meetings for interpersonal and argumentative persuasion.  Countries identiﬁed as likeminded or crucial to the success of the norm entrepreneurial activities were approached bilaterally to build a critical mass (Bjorkdahl 2002a). |  | Norm entrepreneurship |
|  | P199 | Rosen | 2013 | Section. Case study. Collection: interviews. | IEs from inside and outside region and primarily from conservation NGOs with long history f lobbying for marine conservation. long experience with transboundary resource dilemmas or with bringing government and non-state actors together | NGO | Supranational, global | Coral Triangle, Asia | international agreement to radically transform management of coastal and marine resources in the Coral Triangle Iitiative (CTI) | This situation [of marine environmental degradation] calls for a fundamental shift in institutions. New  integrated management approaches like ecosystem-based management, which recognize the full array of interactions within an ecosystem, are needed to promote active stewards and restore the resilience of the Earth’s ecosystems [6,7]. Integrated approaches are especially important since many marine resources and ecological processes supporting human wellbeing know no political boundaries, and the drivers of their degradation often transcend both policy sectors and nation-states. Yet marine governance is often fragmented and poorly coordinated to deal with dynamic ecosystems and cross-scale drivers of change [8,9]. There is also  a lack of institutional support for integrated approaches for  managing and governing marine resources at the regional and  international level [2,10–12]. Such piecemeal governance and the tendency to apply simple solutions to complex problems seriously threaten the ability of the oceans to continue to support  humans with critical ecosystem services  Number of factors triggering action. These include demands for social and economic development, concerns about political stability and national security, and rapid loss of biodiversity (especially of commercially important species). Together they created opportunity context for emergence ecosystem-based management.  Introduction CTI coincided with increasing interest in assisting small island states in protecting marine ecosystems.  Moreover, institutions had been working with each other before, hence there was quite some social capital to draw on. | First step for NGO-entrepreneurs was to get president Indonesia, Yudhoyono on board (as Indonesia would host COP), therefore they had to liaison with individuals who could provide access, away from public attention and behind closed doors.  To do so they first looked into what ongoing processes of environmental policy making CTI could be linked to to prove its relevance (such as Yudhoyono’s push for impact of climate change on food security)  Established CTI coordination committee, senior officials meetings, national coordination committees, CTI secretariat; to provide opportunity to engage in both domestic and international policymaking; and to raise human, financial resources and institutional capacity (thus targeting international level)  Institutional entrepreneurs (engaged in organizational issues) provided technical support and actively facilitated multilateral negotiations to develop RPOA, develop national agendas, legal and financial arrangements. PEs mobilized travel funds, distributing information, delivering logistical support, drafted documents with right diplomatic wording.  Lack of institutional capacity and resource asymmetries between the 6 countries constituted barrier to change and called for careful facilitation, both in meetings and between meetings, to avoid deadlock  When the idea had been anchored at highest political level in Indonesia, it was critical to communicate about CTI in ways that could secure sufficient outreach and international recognition. Had to seize opportunity provided by string of scheduled international events (COP 8 and APEC meeting) to introduce CTI to international community. Decided to have parallel activities from the side of NGOs at the same time as well. (thus targeting national levels\_)  After 9?11 and Bali bombings there was interest from US to invest in Indonesia and reach muslim population, stability in southeast Asia, CTI provided good opportunity to increase political presence in region for USA.  Before the Manado meeting (where CTI would be signed) there was daily contact with entrepreneurs and countries to discuss and prepare for the event.  The impact of institutional entrepreneurship was reinforced by the appointment of a number of ‘CTI ofﬁcials’ within the six governments. Simultaneously, with NGO support a person from UN was recruited strengthen the CTI secretariat and regional coordination, and the US government set up the US CTISP to deliver support to the countries and galvanize regional collaboration | Targeting many different countries and levels simultaneously was difficult and agendas individual leaders profoundly influenced what countries hoped to get out of it (entrepreneurs had therefore demonstrate links between national interests and ecosystem-based management, or links between local resource availability and transboundary socio-ecological processes.  Entrepreneurs could only succeed with help of other leaders, such as president Indonesia | Institutional entrepreneurship |
|  | P200 | Alimi | 2015 | Few sentences. Observation, interviews, | Global Commission on Drug Policy | Administration | Supranational, global | Latin America | War on drugs | Went from regional to global to bypass traditional decision-making authorities which favoured a different (and in their view less successful) approach; namely the war on drugs.  Unlocking new and additional resources.  Allowing for new strategies | Framing –  Widespread social media coverage, outreach campaigns, partnerships.  Joining up with wider community of global drug policy reformers, to enhance legitimacy.  Playing within multiple arenas to link its message to wide range of authorities.  Linking global discourse and local (or regional) implementation by organizing tailor-made local programmes and activities | More resources needed.  Tailoring different messages to differing audiences.  Issues of legitimacy with other actors not recognizing the local actors moving to global scale | Policy entrepreneurs |
|  | P202 | Brinkerhof | 2015 | No. | Newai Gebre (chief economic advisor); Gabre-Madhin (diasporan and expert); Diwan, WB; Legesse (deputy prime-minister and later AgMin) | Administration  CSO | National | Ethiopia | Commodities exchange market: agriculture, economy | Due to a lack of resources, diasporan and expert involved ‘relevant donors’ to persuade them to participate in a conference. | Involvement of the right stakeholders (international donors, different ministers) provided a demonstration effect and moral authority for broadening persuasion efforts and acceptance.  Taskforce under head of Gabre-Madhin included study tours to Chicago and India for inspiration.  Legesse convinced donors to pool resources to support the ECX.  In reaction to opposition from buyers, the prime minister organized meeting with entire coffee industry.  Different tactics for different stakeholders at different levels: local smaller traders persuaded, but international buyers eventually with compulsory power: adoption law to manage transaction costs | The ECX rose attention from international coffee buyers and roasters, who opposed the trading scheme. | Institutional entrepreneurs |
|  | P203 | Budabin | 2015 | No. | Mia Farrow | Citizen | Global, national | China, Darfur-Sudan | Conflict, genocide, diplomacy | To receive critical support, one might want to move issue onto international agenda. | Mia Farrow published op-ed in wall street journal (ad other media subsequently) criticising China for hosting Sudan. Her actions raised global membership of 130 million | To reach international politics, one needs suitable vehicle for amassing critical support, e.g. UNSG has UN platform, celebrities might use NGO's, IGOs, or building own platform. Or one needs global media event.  But if global attention, this raises global support and membership and funding for campaign | Norm entrepreneur |
|  | P207 | Davidson | 2016 | Section. Longitudinal mixed-method single in-depth case-study approach. Collection: policy documentation, media releases, interviews, survey. Analysis UCINET (no specification analysis). | ENGOs and individuals within – Rescue Lake Simcoe Coalition (RLSC), Campaign Lake Simcoe (CLS), staff members and president of RLSC, Ladies of the Lake (LofL), co-founder LofL | NGO  CSO | Subnational, | Lake Simcoe Region, Ontario, Canada | Governance for water | Local ENGO targeted national level. But national level irresponsive to local issues. Thereto the ENGO collected local info to share with subnational and national level, thereby contributing to building a conducive environment for change. | ENGOs link different kinds of knowledge across scales, translating between citizens, experts and politicians.  Entrepreneurs can thereby act as conduits of info across scales, serving as bridge between actors, and breaking down barriers across scales and between different types of knowledge. Various activities needed to resonate with different levels of government.  RLSC joined forces with Environmental Defense (ED) national actor, and Ontario Nature (ON).  ENGOs lobbied with different levels of government.  NGO's called for a shift in authority from local governance to the provincial level, to a – to be established – Conservation Authority | Through the bridging of entrepreneurs, they are making the governance process more inclusive of diverse voices and contexts. | Institutional entrepreneurs |
|  | P208 | De Franco | 2015 | Footnote: interviews, workshop, policy documents and NGO reports. | previous two UN Secretary-Generals, the UN secretariat and the two Special Advisers  for R2P and Genocide Prevention | Administration | Global, supranational | EU, international fora | Responsibility to Protect (R2P) | First NEs would not target EU, as regional orgs were not addressees; second, EU would not be likely to experience core crimes; third, did not fit with their scepticism towards R2P. but when voted with NATO action in Libya, there was dissension within EU and UN wanted to involve supporting states | UN special advisor for genocide prevention met in Brussels with EU key figures to persuade them that EU should prioritize R2P.  Then appoint special advisor for R2P, who was based in EU. She made case for more active role regional organizations | Hardly led to greater EU involvement, bcoz vagueness concept leaves wiggle room for interpretation | Norm entrepreneur |
|  | P209 | DeRynck | 2016 | No. | ECB (actors) | Administration | Supranational (and national) | EU and EU-member states | EU Banking Union | There was a long standing preference for a more centralized supervision and a shift in crisis role from guarantor of price stability to guardian of sustainability of EMU as such: 1) change in governor and board members, bringing in new thinking; 2) scale of LTRO (Long Term Refinancing Operations) increased chances of moral hazard behaviour by national supervisors | This change in governor and board members, brought in new thinking. German member who came aboard took charge of banking union issues and liaised informally with Germany. | Increased support and eventual adoption and acceptance of transferring authority from national to EU-level |  |
|  | P210 | DiRuggiero | 2015 | No. | International Labour Organization (ILO) as institution | Administration | Global | Global, WB, WHO, ILO | Decent Work Agenda | 2008-2009 global economic crisis provided momentous opportunity for ILO to reframe DWA with focus on jobs and mobilize attention to unhealthy working conditions, which previously had limited agenda access | Following crisis ILO collaborated with G20 to promote policy coherence for decent work in direct response to global economic crisis. | But complex set of macroeconomic, labour, social and education policies that must be coordinated to promote workers’ well-being globally is formidable challenge for ILO in contested policy space.  Moreover complicated bcoz institutions ILO and WB do not operate in same multilateral system.  Global level also difficult due to many global actors that could influence agenda and lack of explicit legal authority to implement agenda through enactment legislation or laws  Bcoz different institutions have different claims, valuesm ideologies, different interpretations of decent work. Mandates institutions and dominance disciplinary orientation explain these differences partly | Policy entrepreneur |
|  | P211 | Douglas | 2015 | Section. Embedded multiple case study. Data collection: Interviews, documentation. | Early adopters of drug courts | Administration | Subnational, national | US states | Drug courts | Too little local funding  Little awareness of the idea of drug courts | Janet Reno, newly established Attorney General took idea to Washington and began pushing for federal funding  Individuals involved with original drug courts founded National Association of Drug Court Professionals (NADCP) to promote drug court concept, share info and develop guiding principles, support research and lobby Congress. Holding annual conferences for promote drug courts and enable the exchange of info, encouraged local officials to promote reform further in their home states by establishing own state associations, and provide model for how structure courts themselves. Establish National Drug Court Institute to promote research.  Chief Justice (federal gov) created New York State Commission on Drugs and Courts to study and assess reform. Found wide support, but also concern courts would not be realized unless support from state. Thereto created Office of Court Drug Treatment Programs (OCDTP) for supporting establishment courts across every judicial jurisdiction in NY. Provided trainings, and secured 9 million from federal level for financing courts | Realising funding for ideas from federal to local level.  Spreading idea to other counties. | Policy entrepreneurs |
|  | 215 | Hartmann | 2015 | Comparative case-study. Collection: interviews | Not defined |  | Subnational, supranational | Netherlands, Nijmegen and Amsterdam | Water policy | Because cities suffer increasingly from limited financial means, and because climate adaptation suffers from low political priority, strategy to search for links with existing or planned initiatives to strengthen adaptive capacity in cities |  | Time constraints limited the possibility for policy entrepreneurs to step in and link with other cities | Policy entrepreneurs |
|  | 216 | Heinze | 2016 | Section. Inductive qualitative case study. Collection: interviews (selection also justified), observation. Analysis: grounded theory approach through coding. | Conversion organizations | NGO | Subnational | USA | Health conversion foundations |  | Conversion foundations built groundwork for effective collaboration by bringing together individuals and groups from across organizations, sectors, and demographic groups in the community. They discovered gaps, realized synergies, and creatively integrated acticities of existing actors. as such they were able to define the social problem locally, develop social capital in their communities and educate potential partners.  Partnerships for educational opportunities. County gvment to learn from experts (local and national experts) about effective management and strategy.  conversion foundations from different states worked together to pool information, support, resources. together they can prioritize, share best practicesm pool resources to secure information and promote their interests to state government. | Collaboration fostered trust and legitimacy of the conversion foundations. Moreover, it created enhanced knowledge and expertise in dealing with health issues.  By grouping tgether different conversion foundations make a stronger statement to state government. |  |
|  | P217 | Hermansen | 2015 | No. | ENGOs, the Rainforest Foundation Norway (RFN)  and The Norwegian Society for the Conservation of Nature/Friends of the Earth  (FEN) | NGO | National | Norway | Emergence of Norway’s International  Climate and Forest Initiative (NICFI) | Both climate and rainforests were high on the international agenda at the time.  Letter ENGOs was 3 days after UN climate summit bcoz entrepreneurs saw opportunities there: climate perceived as serious issue, link it to solution of tropical rainforest. | 2 PEs write letter to Prime Minister, and Ministers Finance, Foreign Affairs, International Development: climate action urgent, deforestation as driver GHG; and ask for 1 billion $. Letter is based on Stern Review and IPCC report.  On the side organize hearings in parliament, meetings with political parties and ministers. Flew in Brazilian NGO to strengthen case, and give example of deal in Brazil.  Organize meeting w/ Brazilian MinEnv | Bcoz climate issue, rainforest seen as attractive solution  Norwegian Government announces huge project NICFI, worth 500 million $ | Issue entrepreneur |
|  | P225 | Mostly-tello | 2015 | No. | Interest groups | NGO  CSO | national | Usa | Labour rights | Due to limited interest for and attention to labour rights | Therefore activists link labour rights to arguments of trade agreements (competition and export markets) |  | Moral entrepreneur |
|  | P229 | Occhipinti | 2015 | No. | European Commission, secretariats of EP and Council |  | supranational, national | European Union | Supranationalism in EU police cooperation | Fear for cross-border terrorism and crime, but also for losing national authority | PEs make normative claims to convince member states of their ideas. Present cross-border crime as transnational in nature |  | Transnational policy entrepreneur |
|  | P230 | Orchard | 2015 | No. | Presidents Franklin Roosevelt and Harry Truman | Political | National, global | USA, global | Influencing global views on refugee protection | President has unique advantage over most norm entrepreneurs, can operate at both international and domestic levels simultaneously. Bcoz president has clear authority (though predominantly through domestic legitimacy), leadership and legitimacy, can use resources to move between domestic and international levels 🡪 can use authority, leadership, creativity to induce change at one level, and then use this change as leverage at other level. Can also use it to sidestep opposition, but carries risk – e.g. exposed to other states’ interests and constraints that may limit change.  Roosevelt called international conference to bypass reluctance from Congress; and to try and find institutional solution outside of League and agreement by states that would allow for action without change in American policy. Also Roosevelt had limited willingness to challenge Congress’ immigration policies.  After WWII recognition plight refugee population. Truman considered shift in Congress necessary for post-war stability. Thus international action first required altering domestic immigration policy | (conceptual) Gaining support of states frequently requires norm entrepreneurs to operate at domestic level, either by persuading domestic actors of relevance new norm by discursively linking it to national interests or by overcoming opposition from domestic veto players or gatekeepers whose agreement is required for change in status quo. this can be done in 2 ways: (1) NE possess own sources of authority or legitimacy to exercise power across borders (however avtions must be seen as to accord with whatever authorizes them to act, and must interact with other global governors, with similar forms of authority at int level). (2) can possess direct connections wit domestic institutions or other ways to be able to mobilize domestic support (requires NE to be empowered by domestic agent).  Roosevelt was long silent on the issue (overstaffed and opposing) but after Austrian Anschluss in 1938 took action: domestically ordered State Dept to combine Austrian and German quotas. Internationally called conference to address refugee problem.  Truman urged Congress to find ways whereby US could fulfil responsibilities towards refugees. Actions led to Displaced Persons Act 1948, which distinguished for first time between migrants and DPs.  To persuade Congress Truman reframed issue of refugee protection as security issue, in line with increasing tensions from CW.  Meanwhile at the int. level Truman used creation new IOs – International Refugee Organization (IRO) and UNHCR and Refugee Convention to transmit norm to international norm and institutionalize it as common state practice. | Roles that both presidents played at international level were moderated by constraints at domestic level as support for global and internal changes to refugee protection required considerable amount of negotiation.  Raising issue at international level to sidestep opposition at domestic level might expose to range of other states’ interests and constraints that might limit his ability to pursue normative change.  If successful internationally, can use success as way to reframe issue and mobilize new domestic constituencies to support change domestically.  Due to international and domestic constraints only outcome of conference was IO Inter-Governmental Committee on Refugees, with limited mandate to negotiate with german govment.  However with framing refugees as security issue in light of CW, this led raised security concerns and consequently act was adopted to screen aliens and exclude subversives, making immigration more restrictive again | Norm entrepreneur |
|  | P237 | Shearer | 2015 | Section. Collection: document review, interviews, survey (selection justified). Analysis: social network analysis, coding | INGOs: Partnership for Maternal, Newborn and Child Health and Melinda Gates Foundation | NGO | National, global | Burkina Faso | Integrated community case management of childhood illness |  | 2 NGO's used their financial and normative influence to strategically define policy problem and to boost its importance on decision-making agenda.  Ensured representation in policy proposal development (which they did not naturally had) through UNICEF. This restructuring ultimately favoured funders interests.  After refusal from funders gridlock. Until UNICEF organized int. meeting on iCCM and invited MoH stakeholders. One MoH actor at least convinced of pneumonia, and became entrepreneur back home. Then govment resubmitted proposal including pneumonia treatment | Representation of UNICEF secured their say and led to the favouring of their interests. However initially this did not lead to inclusion of pneumonia treatment in proposal. | Policy entrepreneur |
|  | P240 | Uittenbroek | 2016 | Section. Explorative case study. Collection: interviews, policy documents, newspaper articles, online material (no justification selection). | People within the Philadelphia Water Department | Administration | Subnational | Philadelphia, USA | Climate adaptation policy (green stormwater infrastructure (GSI).) | Too little finance within water department, and for implementation collaboration with other departments was needed. | Water department sent people from their department from different levels to meetings of the Parks and Recreation dept.  Water Dept. placed water managers in other depts to learn about the routines of the depts, to learn how to integrate GSI there.  Their framing if GSI focused not solely on climate adaptation, but addressed other challenges in the city in order to gain support for implementation from other depts and the public.  Established pilot projects to convince other depts | Need for collaboration between departments, but other department were reluctant to collaborate. | Institutional entrepreneurs |
|  | P248 | Rietig | 2016 | No. | International environmental NGO's |  | Global | UNFCCC, COP climate negotiations | Climate negotiations | At the international level, when negotiations taking plae, different parties have already decided on their positions and can hardly be influenced | INGOs target national countries at the domestic level, when they are forming their positions for the negotiations. or NGO's influence during large international conferences, but an impact will only occur after some time, and not in that particular conference/meeting |  | Policy entrepreneurs |

**5. Data extraction table II: strategies**

| **Article** | **How** | **Type** | **Issue arena** | **Strategy** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Ackrill | Trade commissioner Lamy proposed duty-free quota-free policy for Least Developed Countries, EBA, to include sugar. Unrestricted sugar exports would undermine protected, high-priced, EU market regime. Lamy was fully aware of this and used it to put pressure on DG-AGRI | Hori | Shift ? | Institutional manipulation |
| Arieli | Therefore entrepreneurs engage in coalition building on two spheres: horizontal and vertical. Horizontal: identify cross-border contacts for cooperation in parallel organizations and functions to serve personal and/or organizational interests. Vertically: seek authorization and support from higher level politicians and bureaucrats for cross-border aspects of their local activity. | Hori  Verti –  BU | Enlarge | Coalition building |
| Organized initiative to facilitate communication between mayors of neighbouring communities and local public. Participated in seminars and outings to indicate needs | Verti  TD | Enlarge | Promote |
| Black | Both China and Japan took opportunity to spread certain idea about them as great powers, with different frames | Verti  BU | Enlarge | promote |
| Blavoukos | Papandreou gave speech in september 1999 in UN General Assembly to enhance Greek-Turkish relations, because of underlying assumptions that closer entanglement within EU would bring forward series of reforms in Turkey that would eventually necessitate abandonment of aggression in bilateral relationship | Verti  BU | Enlarge | promote |
| Boasson | Approaching Copenhagen summit and energy security issue used by entrepreneurs to create sense of urgency and frame CCS as solution to these problems. | Verti hori diago  BU | Enlarge | frame |
| Linking CCS to renewable energy in the funding mechanism, in order to gain support from CCS sceptics | Hori | Integrate (CCS in NER funding) | Frame/manipulate |
| Touring capitals of EU member states to promote the parliaments amendments to the CCS to create leverage for ideas | Verti  TD | integrate | Venue shop?  Promote |
| Boekhorst | WWF used its national and international network to stimulate acceptance and application of IRBM. | Verti  BU, TD | Enlarge | Coalition, promote, shop |
| Built coalition with Chinese Academy of Sciences and State Forestry Administration. Led to staff training and site listing for protection, but not much impact. | Verti  TD | Enlarge | coalition |
| Built coalitions as well with local stakeholders and governments in the river basin. Led to discovery of experts and funding necessary for launching the Living River Program. | Verti  TD | Enlarge | Coalition |
| Moreover, WWF also established networks internationally by linking up with the CCICED. WWF provided secretariat for IRBM Task Force (which was jointly established with CCICED) WWF managed to incorporate their approach in CCICED recommendations. Also, WWF through its coalition could deliver recommendations to the premier of the state council (without having to pass through ministerial levels). | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Coalition |
| In parallel, it held close contacts with academic field, led to media coverage in form of special issue in National Chinese Geographic, and articles in China Daily Newspaper, creating awareness in and outside of China. | Verti  TD | Enlarge | Promote |
| Informed politicians at all levels through field visits, conferences, lectures etcetera to create support and inform stakeholders. | Verti  TD | Enlarge | Awreness/promotion |
| Started pilot projects in local areas who were willing to get along with WWF (because it raised living conditions local inhabitants). WWF organized meetings with local people to explain them about functioning river system (awareness sessions). Organized workshops to come up with alternative income generating activities. Created public support (especially because average household income rose exponentially). | Verti  TD | Enlarge | Leading by example |
| China Council for International Cooperation on Environment and Development (CCICED) devoted special taskforce to IRBM, WWF linked up with institution to include recommendations. | Verti  TD | Enlarge | Manipulate institutions |
| Site visits, international conference, publications created visibility and impact | Verti  TD | Enlarge | Awareness/promotion |
| Bourblanc | First brought it to higher administrative levels by bringing criminal charges against leaders of intensive agriculture (and not smaller agriculture actors), and subsequently involving the Dept of Agriculture. DoA drew up first programme to deal with pollution caused by agriculture. but since program did not challenge intensive mode of production, further protest from ERB. | Verti  BU | Shift | Manipulating inst |
| ERB started a juridical battle to try to force the French administration to transpose European legislation into French law. | Verti  BU | Integrate | manipulate |
| To keep problem on agenda, ERB started to frame water pollution in terms of nitrate concentration in drinking water and the impact on human health (e.g. in its columns). | Hori | Enlarge | frame |
| ERB appealed to EU authorities to have France’s failure to implement binding European legislation (European Directive on to regulate use drinking water from surface water courses in which nitrates exceed certain percentage) condemned. French government convicted in 2001 and 2007, resulting in major pressure from EU to implement substantial changes in agricultural practices. | Verti  BU | Integrate | manipulate |
| Since ERB wanted to place blame on Agriculture sector it did not support other local NGO collective (CEP) in their campaign to protest against water delivery services re. nitrates in drinking water, as this would shift attention away from ag sector (as focus on drinking water, not water resources), and towards water service authorities and municipal authorities. | Hori |  | Frame |
| Buhr | British institutional entrepreneurs used rotating presidency of EU to come up with policy proposal, and emissions trading was also something the aviation industry could live with. | Diago | Enlarge | Manipulate |
| Entrepreneurs behind proposal linked arguments about emissions trading to norms and values in institutional context to promote preferred policy proposal. | Verti  BU | Enlarge | frame |
| Checked with different actors and felt little/no resistance to plan of emissions trading scheme. |  |  |  |
| Aviation industry, also as entrepreneur, initially developed proposal for ETS. This was initially developed at UK level and then brought to EU level. Used EU level to gain broader support from wider industry (their growth prospects were partly dependent on environmentally responsible image) | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Promote |
| Carter | FotE identified the government’s failure to deliver emissions reduction targets, defined a solution in the form of a climate change bill, took Cameron for visit to Arctic to see impacts of climate change, and eventually won cross-party political support for it. | Verti  TD | Enlarge | Promote |
| Tony Blair pushed climate change onto international agenda already before FoE took it up. (G8 and EU presidencies). through Stern report other parties began promoting and framing low carbo economy as opportunity for business. | Verti  BU | Enlarge | promote |
| David Miliband (Secretary of State at DEFRA) created new government institution, Inter Departmental office for Climate Change (OCC) that represented all main departments affecting GHG emissions, including environment, energy, transport, business, overseas development, foreign office, cabinet office, treasury. Was given responsibility for developing and passing climate change bill (which would normally have been undertaken by internal DEFRA team). As such different (conflicting) interests together to generate consensus. Effect was noticeable undermining of treasury’s formerly influence | Hori | Enlarge | Manipulate |
| David Miliband took issue of EU ETS cap and turned it into major symbolic battle within cabinet on governments environmental credentials | Verti (diago)  TD | Enlarge? | promote |
| The third venue shift was the creation of a new ministry, the Department for Energy and Climate Change (DECC), in October 2008. It combined the energy and climate portfolios previously split between the DTI (renamed the Department for Business, Enterprise and Regulatory Reform (BERR)) and DEFRA, with the aim of institutionalizing a coordinated approach to CCEP. Under an energetic Secretary of State, Ed Miliband, DECC quickly  adopted ambitious emissions reductions at home and abroad as its main priority and began to develop the policies required by the EU and CCA targets. | Hori | Integrate | Manipulate |
| Diez | Official launch of campaign at UN office Mexico, with presence various NGOs, IOs, CSOs by government (promoting) | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Promote |
| As a reaction to the debate and to counter opposition to their campaign, entrepreneurs decided to pursue 2 strategies: first, expand alliance they had formed in favour of campaign, by integrating international actors (PHO and UNAIDS). Asked them to sign onto the initiative to allow them to present the campaign as a collective initiative. 2 orgs started stating that Mexico had to abide by international recommendations to fight homophobia. (networking, institution) | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Coalition, manipulate |
| Assembly held series of consultations, regional fora, and meetings with experts and members of civil society at large. After consultations published report in which members presented antidiscrimination draft bill and recommended establishment of national council tasked with 2 main objectives: ensuring that such law be implemented and promoting more generally a culture of tolerance in the country. | Verti  BU | Enlarge | coalition |
| Report (in which members presented antidiscrimination draft bill and recommended establishment of national council tasked with 2 main objectives: ensuring that such law be implemented and promoting more generally a culture of tolerance in the country) was taken over by Fox and sent to Congress without changes | Verti  BU | Enlarge | manipulate |
| Alliance developed arguments counter opposition and convince government actors and public at large of need campaign, based on 2 frames: 1) homophobia as obstacle to fight aids (based on scientific data) thus involving public health; 2) human rights: prohibited discrimination against homosexuals | Hori | Enlarge | frame |
| Font | Entrepreneurs participated in technical meeting hosted by European Commission. | Verti  BU | Enlarge | coalition |
| Group of entrepreneurs also frequently provided info and lodged complaints to the European Commission. Also presented petitions and questions to European Parliament, all of which alleged that National Water Plan went against several EU environmental directives (Environmental groups considered that the large-scale infrastructure proposed in the Plan, in particular the Ebro diversion, had negative effects on Special Areas of Conservation and Special Protection Areas that constituted the Natura 2000 Network, and that it would have severe consequences for most water ecosystems). | Verti  BU | Integrate | manipulate |
| Variety of social organizations launched intensive networking campaign in Brussels in order to sell ideas opposed to EU financing of the work that was projected in the National Water Plan. These activities led to European Commission contacting Spain’s Ministry of Environment to obtain information to decide on its own position. Thereafter send a letter to ministry to express their concern. Thereafter recommended it to produce strategic impact assessment | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Manipulate, coalition |
| In 2001 entrepreneurs participated in Blue March to Brussels, where they lodged complaints about the NWP to the European Commission and European Parliament  gained media attention  to activate resources and gain support | Verti  BU | Shift | manipulate |
| To put pressure on the government of Spain to withdraw the 2001 National Water Plan, different entrepreneurs, Greenpeace, WWF-Spain, SEO/Birdlife, and social movements, launched national and supra-national campaigns that condemned social, economic, and environmental consequences of the plan | Verti  BU | Enlarge | promote |
| Scientific actors as entrepreneurs undertook studies that questioned the Plan, and adviced the European Commission on the plan, including strategic impact assessment, and socio-economic assessment of transfer projects included in plan, to transform dominant policy image. WWF Spain for instance produced environmental assessment for impact projected dams and water transfers and their impact on Natura 2000 sites. | Verti  BU | enlarge | Promote |
| Forbes | Conceptual: spanning levels is required to realise change. ‘boundary bridging’ as adjacent fields influencing each other through alternative viewpoints and practices. Need for actors to pass on these ideas – entrepreneurs. |  |  |  |
| 1) microlevel institutional work: opportunity recognition: reframing of health issues as stemming from socio-economic inequalities, making it a social issue as well. As such, integration was encouraged and current policy framed as failure. Entrepreneurs were also within institutions (NHS board, city council). agreed that integration would address problems, only however not sure what it should look like. | Hori | Enlarge, integrate | frame |
| 2) mesolevel inst work: designing new inst field: design to make NHS and city council work on an equal basis. | Hori | Integrate | Manipulate |
| 3) macro-level inst work: legitimizing new institutional field: at 2 levels, locally w/ city NHS members and professions, and nationally w/ executive civil servants and ministers. had to negotiate and discuss a lot to convince people of added value | Verti  TD | Enlarge | promote |
| Gorton | Gutkauskas (Lithuania) worked for min ag and dept land use and reclamation, and brought together scientists to prepare programme on groundwater protection and sustainable agriculture, program accepted and funded by government in 1993. | Hori | Enlarge | Coalbuil |
| Also founded NGO Tatula Fund, which he used to address conferences and meetings, also internationally, and in EU-context. This internationalized local problems. | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Manipulate, promote |
| In Poland, research carried out by Institute for Land Reclamation and Grassland Farming (IMUZ), funded by US Environmental Protection Agency, under leadership of PE Sapek. Findings were framed as threat to human health, requiring investments for improvement animal waste management. This led to many funds coming in | Diago  Hori  Verti  BU | Enlarge | Promote  Frame |
| Grinstein | Entrepreneurs started short-term demonstration project in 3 states, to overcome reluctance from public welfare policy (demonstrating, support) | Verti  TD | Enlarge | Leading by example |
| Efforts of non-profit orgs were critical in moving IDA policy dialogue to national level, by using national platforms at conferences, web sites, networking expertise to disseminate pivotal research findings emerging from American Dream Policy Demonstration (ADD), a large-scale multi-site IDA demonstration project. (networking/promoting, support) | Verti  BU | Shift | Promote |
| Hammond | Meanwhile, he also intervened in the development of the policy in the province. He suggested the city of Dalian establish an MLG system to provide an example – which happened. Dalian served as an example for other cities throughout China. Through example served to expand the experience, methods and support that could be drawn upon. | Verti  TD | Enlarge | Leading by example |
| Duoji shifted policy onto national agenda and pushed for implementation, by mentioning it in speech at Tenth National Civil Affairs Congress (because, according to the author, he as a minister was unable to provide legislative or fiscal support for the policy) | Verti  BU | Shift | promote |
| Iusmen | Commission officials in DG ELARG highlighted how the Romanian case has provided them with knowledge and expertise in key principles and implementation mechanisms underlying the UNCRC (demonstrate – resources) | Verti  TD | Shift | Leading by example |
| Frattini used the example of Romania and its child-rights policy (which provided knowledge and expertise) to find support for an EU-wide policy on children’s rights (demonstrating – support) | Verti  TD | Shift | Leading by example |
| Kugelberg | Aileen Robertson, (state secretary for public health) individual responsible for advising countries within WHO European Region on public health and national nutrition policy, proposed to undertake Health Impact Assessment from the CAP (EU) to convince the Ministry of Agriculture, Food and Forestry to support the food and nutrition plan, and eventually brought together ministry health and ministry agriculture, food, forestry because their objectives were met and CAP could fund (resources – institution/networking) | Diago | Integrate | Frame, manipulate |
| Maltby | Conceptual: while each Commission DG has own overlapping, but distinct purview within Council’s often general aims and direction, in this case there are synergies between DGs trade, External Relations, Energy, and Climate on interlinking issues related to energy. Strategically minded actors frame initiatives to fit with certain institutional venues. Different venues may have different priorities and perceive EU concern differently, yet solutions need not be mutually exclusive. |  |  |  |
| In its communications the Commission increasingly referred to energy security as supranational issue to be solved at Commission level | Verti | Shift | Manipulate, promote |
| UK’s EU presidency study concluded that stronger EU energy policy cooperation was necessary to improve security of supplies. This was to secure national gas security, as UK had always been exporter but then became net importer of gas (resources) – whereas UK had been one of most important opposers of joint policy | Verti  BU | Shift | Promote |
| Commission has created multiple different policy frames to make energy legislation at supranational level viable and enhance support for a common energy policy: security, environmental protection (framing – institution/support) | Diago | Shift | Frame |
| Identification surpranational scale of energy governance as necessary solution to policy problem is one which is socially constructed. |  |  |  |
| Commission utilized expert studies to establish knowledge-based authority on the issue of energy | Verti  BU | Shift | ? |
| Meijerink | Example smaller scale implementation to gain experience with the proposed policy and demonstrate feasibility and benefits of newly proposed approaches (such as Plan Stork in the Netherlands or floodplain restoration in Bodrogköz area before it was adopted at the national level) | Verti  TD | Enlarge | Leading by example |
| a minister in Indonesia purposefully moved a specific department from one ministry to another in order to minimize the influence of the conservative old guard to enable smoother processes. | Hori | Shift | Manipulate |
| Donor organizations are in position to impose change through formulation of conditions to funding. |  |  |  |
| WWF in China managed to gain support for ecosystem restoration projects by addressing economic needs of the local population at the same time. | Verti  TD | Enlarge | promote |
| Manipulating venues to have their own ideas or their coalition represented where policy-relevant issues are discussed, and bypass those who resist the change proposed. |  |  | Manipulate |
| Venue-shopping: for local initiatives to be scaled up, they need to be linked to higher level | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Promote |
| Mintrom | Networking across state lines for 1) learning about details of innovations elsewhere (and gain expertise) this can increase the credibility of the entrepreneur, because they can more readily give authoritative-sounding responses to questions or objections raised concerning proposed policy innovation; 2) draw upon experts from other states to give testimony on earlier experiences with policy innovation; 3) what strategies are successful in other states for selling particular innovation | Hori | Enlarge/diversify | Coalition |
| Miskel | Bush and his team used their experience from implementing a reading first initiative in Texas to claim the attention of Congress, with well-developed ideas for education | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Leading by example |
| Mukhtarov | Conceptual: identify (1) scale-based strategies, emphasize importance to target narratives at multiple venues across scales of governance, construct problems and solutions as pertinent to certain geographical scale, engage in networking and coalition-building that span scales of governance. (2) meaning-based strategies, underline importance of developing ideas and linking them to narratives and dominant ideas in policy setting in quest for legitimacy, and presenting them in politically palatable way. (3) context-based strategies, imply necessity to understand context in which narratives are advanced and may involve enrolling some actors in coalitions while excluding others, and keeping alert to opportunities to advance opportunities at particular time and place |  |  |  |
| (framing) PARC proposed to approach the 2 protected sites as an integrated national park, however this was met with reluctance from the provincial authorities who did not want to share authority. Also competition between which level would get authority over certain jurisdiction (thus not successful!) | Verti  TD | Integrate | framing |
| Link with IUCN  recommend implementation at UNESCO World Heritage (support) | Verti  BU | Enlarge | coalition |
| Newman | National privacy experts lobbied European Commission, little success. | Verti/hori  BU | Shift | Promote |
| Only when they became institutionalized groups of sub-state actors with domestic authority | Hori | Shift | Coalition, manipulation |
| German data privacy agency organized conference for data privacy commissioners in Europe  debating pressing issues, share information, discuss best practices, release joint resolutions  establish working groups  develop collaborative policy initiatives; formulated proposal for EU reform | Verti  BU | Shift | Coalition |
| Trans-governmental network of data privacy authorities framed issue of supranational data privacy protection as prerequisite for further market and administrative integration in Europe to get their support (and making it transnational instead of domestic issue). They played on symbolic importance of the single market to both Commission and single member states | Verti  BU | Shift | Frame |
| Data authorities threatened to block trans-border data flows, changing the regulatory reversion point (that is, changing regulatory status-quo that would exist in absence supranational legislation, altering cost-benefit to other policymakers of inaction) to create support for their proposals | Verti (55)  BU | Shift | Manipulate |
| Palmer | European Commission encouraged use of biofuels by linking it to existing problems within European Union, in tripod style approach: said that biofuels production may be of particular interest under CAP for creating new economic resources and preserving employment in agricultural community; in addition to mitigating GHGs and enhance energy security. | Hori | Enlarge | Frame |
| Depicted biofuels as only readily available means of reducing road transport GHG emissions, and depicting reduction of road transport GHG emissions extremely difficult without biofuels (whereas in reality alternative means were available). |  |  |  |
| Official X criticized studies that showed effects on land-use as poor quality |  |  |  |
| Perkmann | EUREGIO actors engaged in various strategies: (1) interactional projects aimed at bringing together actors previously not connected, from different municipalities, with objective of mobilizing resources from external agencies such as national governments. | Hori | Shift | coalition |
| (2) AEBR presented its case of cross-border collaboration to politicians in the European Parliament by framing Euregions within wider discourse of European integration: euregions as constituting integration on small scale and building europe from below  border regions explicitly mentioned in European Constitutional Treaty. | Verti  BU | Shift | Promote |
| (3) also target local politicians and civil servants. Installed ‘observatory’ with branches at various european locations, and sought out speaking and consulting engagements actoss europe: 80 workshops held, 60 reports published – all framing euregion as european integration. | Verti  TD | Shift | Promote |
| Thus addressed 3 different fields: intergovernmental relationships: germany – netherlands; CoE and EU. All have different characteristics |  |  |  |
| Pralle | Conceptual: Issue redefinition: shifting not only image of issue but also the basis for considering those issues – what I call policy principles: core values, beliefs, or guidelines attached to policies that help direct decision-making. |  |  |  |
| Venue shopping searching for alternative policy arenas and efforts to move decision-making authority to new venues. Keeping issues out of venues they would rather not participate in as well as move decision-making to new arenas. Successful entrepreneurs may force opponents to compete in arenas where opponents are at disadvantage or to expend resources waging battles in multiple venues when they would prefer to concentrate on just one. |  |  |  |
| Issue definition and venue shopping often go hand in hand. |  |  |  |
| PEs might try and redefine an issue to move consideration of it into new policy venue, where decisions, rules, norms, procedures differ. Moving seemingly local issue to international policy arena, for example, requires redefining issue to emphasize global implications and importance. | Verti  BU | Shift | Manipulate |
| Cities are sensitive to what other cities do. Advocacy groups in cities must form national networks to take advantage of openness provided by federal structures; sharing of info and campaign expertise among cities facilitates diffusion of progressive policies. | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Coalition |
| Different environmental organizations, both regional and national united and launched Campaign for Pesticides Reduction (CPR). Shared resources and info about campaigns through internet, email and person. | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Coalition |
| Also environmental, labour and health organizations linked up to map the various risks of the use of pesticides. | Hori | Enlarge | Coalition |
| Redefined use of lawn and garden pesticides in 3 ways: (1) challenged ideal of entirely weed-free near-perfect lawn – “dandelions are your friend”. (2) argument about negative impact of lawn chemicals on children’s health sparked chord with general public and were key factor gaining attention to issue; focusing on children to mobilize large segments of population, and because children are positively constructed target populations policymakers often feel pressure to direct policy to them. Trade-off children;’s health and weed-free lawn became powerful frame for rallying public behind bylaws. | Hori | Enlarge | Frame |
| (3) involving precautionary principle in debate: policymakers should act to protect human health and environment even in the face of scientific uncertainty. |  |  |  |
| Hudson, town in Canada, first to assert its jurisdiction over issue of pesticides, functioned as example for activists, who subsequently put issue on other municipal agendas, in addition to the national venue where they were pushing (venue adding instead of venue shopping) pro was that companies were not prepared to fight battle at hundreds of city councils around Canada (and because multiple-level coalition was also at local, this was easy for activists, also they had better access to local politicians) | Verti  TD, BU | Enlarge | Promote |
| Verger | Coalition/network of policy entrepreneurs, strategically placed in influential international organizations, advocate for privatization and ePPP through scientific and technical style. | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Coalition |
| Policy prescriptions, beyond blueprints, need to inform policymakers about necessary conditions (contextual, material, regulatory etc). this is certainly most challenging aspect for policy entrepreneurs who aspire to prescribe policies aimed at fitting in a broad range of time-place situations |  |  |  |
| Von Heland | Establishment school for marine conservation, collaborative investment between district government and Ministry of Marine Affairs and Fisheries (again, example of teaming up entrepreneurs for different purposes: whereas the national government used this as a strategy to overcome lack of trained staff to deal with MPAs, for Adhi this was a strategy to ensure the long-term perspective, beyond the electoral interests of politicians. Moreover, school also was a long-term strategy to promote cultural change among not only government institutions but also coastal communities. On top, from national perspective school links to broader national strategy to position Indonesia as leader in ocean issues (president Yudhoyono to initiate CTI, hosting world ocean conference 2009, world coral reef conference 2013) | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Manipulate, coalition |
| Adhi and colleagues worked with “Hoga marine research centre” (co-managed by essex university and Operation Wallacea – british ecosystem eco-tourism operator)  to push for ecosystem stewardship from above by organizations that can inspire and put pressure on local authorities. | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Coalition |
| Together applied for UNESCO Biosphere Reserves  for the use of future conservation and fund raising activities, and also help institutionalize MPA management and ensure that marine environment remains prioritized by politicians  and hope that will attract more researchers and improve collaboration with central government. | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Coalition |
| Adhi from district government partnered with two major NGOs (WWF and TNC) not only to improve park management but also to promote dive tourism, which would be a strong tool to enhance the government’s and the public’s appreciation of marine biodiversity. Partnership  also led to investment of money by NGOs in the site | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Coalition |
| Wejs | Necessary for entrepreneurs to build legitimacy for adaptation plans. Used vulnerability as frame to do so |  |  |  |
| Recruit external expertise and secure funding for work towards climate-change adaptation in municipality, through externally funded research projects and networks, which provided direct contact to climate researchers, whom PE could ask for downscaled scenarios on issues considered important in local context. Also access to northern coastal municipalities with engagement in international network for downscaling solutions (network, contacts  expertise and funding) | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Coalition |
| Sought access to regional development funding from EU and Danish regional authority, to create large projects, which gather knowledge resources from different partners worldwide (universities, research institutes, large companies) | Verti  BU | Enlarge |  |
| Recruit external expertise and secure funding for work towards climate-change adaptation in municipality, through externally funded research projects and networks, which provided direct contact to climate researchers, whom PE could ask for downscaled scenarios on issues considered important in local context. Also access to northern coastal municipalities with engagement in international network for downscaling solutions (network, contacts  expertise and funding) | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Coalition |
| Wigell | Aland lobbied with national government finland to establish co-operative forum between aland and ministry foreign affairs. Contact group started working: mapping out conflict zones where aland could serve as example, international study visits and research about Aland. Group discusses current developments affecting Aland and initiatives regarding promotion Aland | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Promote |
| Aland (island) upholds interstate contacts with various states and has representation in Nordic council to promote itself as an example. | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Lead by example |
| Aland Islands Peace Institute (AIPI) an NGO has been active in disseminating idea about Aland Example by organizing events and hosting number of foreign groups (among whom Armenia, Nagorno-Karabakh, Azerbaijan) who came together for peace talks. This all to influence its domestic relations with Finnish government. | Verti | Enlarge | promotion |
| Finland (MoFA) organized and sponsored seminars and panels in places such as New York, Brussels, Geneva with aim of bringing Aland under attention of key orgs such as UN as well as broader diplomatic community. And brings Aland up in several other activities such as Ireland Peace talks, OSCE Parliamentary Assembly Team on Moldova etc. talked about as inspiration for constructive discussions and resource for Finnish public diplomacy and brand-building | Verti  BU | Enlarge | promote |
| Zhu | To reduce the perception of risk among decision-makers: conducting pilot reforms or leading by example can reduce political opposition and demonstrate the soundness of the plan and also market the ideas amongst potential supporters. In Guizhou, provincial guiding program set prototype for process of innovation. Guiyang Municipal Housing Reform Office together with provincial and municipal housing authorities worked together and implemented reform. Reported success helped silence opposition in Guizhou and drew positive attention from all over the country. Demonstrated by Guiyang city, approach extended to entire province, and then nationwide. Example 🡪 silence opposition | Verti  TD, BU | Enlarge | Leading by example |
| Created support among local community through media coverage and informing them and seeking their input. Thereby the provincial government did not dare to change the policy direction that was set in, and had to continue after the PE left the province. | Verti  TD | Enlarge | Promote |
| To increase legitimacy and support, and given the significance of work units in the implementation of housing reform, dozens of consultation meetings were held in different government depts, research institutes and enterprises to get feedback and support from employees across wide range of social strata. | Verti | Enlarge | Promote |
| Zito | Scandinavian experts defined problem of acid rain as transnational, product of long-range air pollution emissions from other European countries, strove to get issue identified as serious in European Community and other IOs. UN Economic Commission for Europe (UN/ECE) was interested, created Convention on Long-Range Transboundary Air Pollution (LTRAP) which provided policy framework for exchanging technical info between member states. | Verti  BU | Shift | Frame |
| Bjorkdahl | When selected as non-permanent member of Security Council, Sweden draw the Presidential conclusions wherein it linked conflict prevention and peacekeeping. Worked to keep conflict prevention on UN agenda, by linking it to R2P, because this was UN adopted doctrine | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Frame |
| Sweden attempted to build support by approaching likeminded countries bilaterally for informal meetings and interpersonal and argumentative persuasion | Hori | Enlarge | Promote |
| Established ‘Group of Friends for Conflict prevention’ and various ad hoc coalitions with members of security council, to mobilize support for their ideas. | Hori | Enlarge | Coalition |
| Diplomatic tactics and persuasion kept conﬂict prevention on the EU agenda in times when support for crisis management grew strong. | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Promote |
| By occupying the rotating presidency of the EU in 2001, Sweden enjoyed privileged control over procedures, and normative influence was enhanced. | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Manipulate |
| Norm entrepreneurship is about building winning coalitions. Swedish representatives attempted to mobilise support for the idea of conﬂict prevention within the UN as well as in the EU, using informal meetings for interpersonal and argumentative persuasion. | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Coalition |
| Countries identiﬁed as likeminded or crucial to the success of the norm entrepreneurial activities were approached bilaterally to build a critical mass (Bjorkdahl 2002a). | Hori | Enlarge | Coalition |
| Rosen | First step for NGO-entrepreneurs was to get president Indonesia, Yudhoyono on board (as Indonesia would host COP), therefore they had to liaison with individuals who could provide access, away from public attention and behind closed doors. | Verti | Shift | Coalition |
| To do so they first looked into what ongoing processes of environmental policy making CTI could be linked to to prove its relevance (such as Yudhoyono’s push for impact of climate change on food security) | Diago | Shift | Frame, promote |
| Established CTI coordination committee, senior officials meetings, national coordination committees, CTI secretariat; to provide opportunity to engage in both domestic and international policymaking; and to raise human, financial resources and institutional capacity (thus targeting international level) | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Manipulate, coalition |
| Institutional entrepreneurs (engaged in organizational issues) provided technical support and actively facilitated multilateral negotiations to develop RPOA, develop national agendas, legal and financial arrangements. PEs mobilized travel funds, distributing information, delivering logistical support, drafted documents with right diplomatic wording. | Verti | Shift | Promote, network |
| Lack of institutional capacity and resource asymmetries between the 6 countries constituted barrier to change and called for careful facilitation, both in meetings and between meetings, to avoid deadlock |  |  |  |
| When the idea had been anchored at highest political level in Indonesia, it was critical to communicate about CTI in ways that could secure sufficient outreach and international recognition. Had to seize opportunity provided by string of scheduled international events (COP 8 and APEC meeting) to introduce CTI to international community. Decided to have parallel activities from the side of NGOs at the same time as well. (thus targeting national levels\_) | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Promote |
| After 9?11 and Bali bombings there was interest from US to invest in Indonesia and reach muslim population, stability in southeast Asia, CTI provided good opportunity to increase political presence in region for USA. | Verti | Enlarge | Promote |
| Before the Manado meeting (where CTI would be signed) there was daily contact with entrepreneurs and countries to discuss and prepare for the event. | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Coalition |
| The impact of institutional entrepreneurship was reinforced by the appointment of a number of ‘CTI ofﬁcials’ within the six governments. Simultaneously, with NGO support a person from UN was recruited strengthen the CTI secretariat and regional coordination, and the US government set up the US CTISP to deliver support to the countries and galvanize regional collaboration | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Manipulate |
| Alimi | Widespread social media coverage, outreach campaigns, partnerships. | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Promote, coalition |
| Joining up with wider community of global drug policy reformers, to enhance legitimacy. | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Promote, coalition |
| Playing within multiple arenas to link its message to wide range of authorities. |  |  |  |
| Linking global discourse and local (or regional) implementation by organizing tailor-made local programmes and activities | Verti  BU, TD | Enlarge |  |
| Brinkerhof | Involvement of the right stakeholders (international donors, different ministers) provided a demonstration effect and moral authority for broadening persuasion efforts and acceptance. | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Coalition, network |
| Taskforce under head of Gabre-Madhin included study tours to Chicago and India for inspiration. |  |  |  |
| Legesse convinced donors to pool resources to support the ECX. |  |  |  |
| In reaction to opposition from buyers, the prime minister organized meeting with entire coffee industry. |  |  |  |
| Different tactics for different stakeholders at different levels: local smaller traders persuaded, but international buyers eventually with compulsory power: adoption law to manage transaction costs | Verti  BU |  |  |
| Budabin | Mia Farrow published op-ed in wall street journal (ad other media subsequently) criticising China for hosting Sudan. Her actions raised global membership of 130 million | Verti  BU | Enlarge | promote |
| Davidson | ENGOs link different kinds of knowledge across scales, translating between citizens, experts and politicians. |  |  |  |
| Entrepreneurs can thereby act as conduits of info across scales, serving as bridge between actors, and breaking down barriers across scales and between different types of knowledge. Various activities needed to resonate with different levels of government. |  |  |  |
| RLSC joined forces with Environmental Defense (ED) national actor, and Ontario Nature (ON). | Verti  BU |  | Coalition |
| ENGOs lobbied with different levels of government. | Verti  BU |  | Promote |
| NGO's called for a shift in authority from local governance to the provincial level, to a – to be established – Conservation Authority | Verti  BU | Shift | Manipulate, coalition |
| De Franco | UN special advisor for genocide prevention met in Brussels with EU key figures to persuade them that EU should prioritize R2P. | Verti  TD | Enlarge | Promote |
| Then appoint special advisor for R2P, who was based in EU. She made case for more active role regional organizations | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Manipulate |
| DeRynck | This change in governor and board members, brought in new thinking. German member who came aboard took charge of banking union issues and liaised informally with Germany. | Verti |  | Network, coalition |
| DiRuggiero | Following crisis ILO collaborated with G20 to promote policy coherence for decent work in direct response to global economic crisis. | Verti | Enlarge | coalition |
| Douglas | Janet Reno, newly established Attorney General took idea to Washington and began pushing for federal funding | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Promote |
| Individuals involved with original drug courts founded National Association of Drug Court Professionals (NADCP) to promote drug court concept, share info and develop guiding principles, support research and lobby Congress. Holding annual conferences for promote drug courts and enable the exchange of info, encouraged local officials to promote reform further in their home states by establishing own state associations, and provide model for how structure courts themselves. Establish National Drug Court Institute to promote research. | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Coalition, promote |
| Chief Justice (federal gov) created New York State Commission on Drugs and Courts to study and assess reform. Found wide support, but also concern courts would not be realized unless support from state. Thereto created Office of Court Drug Treatment Programs (OCDTP) for supporting establishment courts across every judicial jurisdiction in NY. Provided trainings, and secured 9 million from federal level for financing courts | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Manipulate |
| Hartmann |  |  |  |  |
| Heinze | Conversion foundations built groundwork for effective collaboration by bringing together individuals and groups from across organizations, sectors, and demographic groups in the community. They discovered gaps, realized synergies, and creatively integrated activities of existing actors. as such they were able to define the social problem locally, develop social capital in their communities and educate potential partners. |  |  |  |
| Partnerships for educational opportunities. County gvment to learn from experts (local and national experts) about effective management and strategy. | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Network coalition |
| conversion foundations from different states worked together to pool information, support, resources. together they can prioritize, share best practices, pool resources to secure information and promote their interests to state government. | Hori |  | Coalition |
| Hermansen | 2 PEs – ENGOs Rainforest Foundation Norway (FRN) and Norwegian Society for the Conservation of Nature/Friends of the Earth (FEN) write letter to Prime Minister, and Ministers Finance, Foreign Affairs, International Development: (redefine issue of rainforests as solution to climate) climate action urgent, deforestation as driver GHG; and ask for 1 billion $. Letter is based on Stern Review and IPCC report. | Hori | Integration | Frame, promote |
| On the side organize hearings in parliament, meetings with political parties and ministers. Flew in Brazilian NGO to strengthen case, and give example of deal in Brazil. | Verti | Integration, enlarge | Leading by example, promote |
| Organize meeting w/ Brazilian MinEnv |  |  |  |
| Mostly-tello | Therefore activists link labour rights to arguments of trade agreements (competition and export markets) | Hori |  | Frame |
| Occhipinti | PEs make normative claims to convince member states of their ideas. Present cross-border crime as transnational in nature | Verti | Shift | Frame |
| Orchard | (conceptual) Gaining support of states frequently requires norm entrepreneurs to operate at domestic level, either by persuading domestic actors of relevance new norm by discursively linking it to national interests or by overcoming opposition from domestic veto players or gatekeepers whose agreement is required for change in status quo. this can be done in 2 ways: (1) NE possess own sources of authority or legitimacy to exercise power across borders (however actions must be seen as to accord with whatever authorizes them to act, and must interact with other global governors, with similar forms of authority at int level). (2) can possess direct connections with domestic institutions or other ways to be able to mobilize domestic support (requires NE to be empowered by domestic agent). |  |  |  |
| Roosevelt was long silent on the issue (overstaffed and opposing) but after Austrian Anschluss in 1938 took action: domestically ordered State Dept to combine Austrian and German quotas. Internationally called conference to address refugee problem. | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Promote |
| Truman urged Congress to find ways whereby US could fulfil responsibilities towards refugees. Actions led to Displaced Persons Act 1948, which distinguished for first time between migrants and DPs. | Verti | Enlarge | Manipulate |
| To persuade Congress Truman reframed issue of refugee protection as security issue, in line with increasing tensions from CW. | Hori | Enlarge | Frame |
| Meanwhile at the int. level Truman used creation new IOs – International Refugee Organization (IRO) and UNHCR and Refugee Convention to transmit norm to international norm and institutionalize it as common state practice. | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Manipulate |
| Shearer | 2 NGO's used their financial and normative influence to strategically define policy problem and to boost its importance on decision-making agenda | Verti |  | Promote |
| Ensured representation in policy proposal development (which they did not naturally had) through UNICEF. This restructuring ultimately favoured funders interests. | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Manipulate, coalition |
| After refusal from funders gridlock. Until UNICEF organized int. meeting on iCCM and invited MoH stakeholders. One MoH actor at least convinced of pneumonia, and became entrepreneur back home. Then govment resubmitted proposal including pneumonia treatment | Verti  BU | Enlarge | Coalition, promote |
| Uittenbroek | Water department sent people from their department from different levels to meetings of the Parks and Recreation dept. | Hori | Integrate | Learn, coalition |
| Water Dept. placed water managers in other depts to learn about the routines of the depts, to learn how to integrate GSI there. | Hori | Integrate |  |
| Their framing if GSI focused not solely on climate adaptation, but addressed other challenges in the city in order to gain support for implementation from other depts and the public. | Hori | Enlarge, integrate | framing |
| Established pilot projects to convince other depts | Hori/vevertirti | Enlarge, integrate | Leading by example |
| Rietig | INGOs target national countries at the domestic level, when they are forming their positions for the negotiations. or NGO's influence during large international conferences, but an impact will only occur after some time, and not in that particular conference/meeting | Verti  TD | Enlarge | Promote, coalition |