# Appendix B: Robustness checks

**Figures B1-B7**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | **USA** | **SPAIN** | **GERMANY** |
| **A** | **C:\Users\boehl\polybox\Shared\SNF Climate Policy Project\SNF Thomas Lena Bianca copy\Paper Political Claims Dataset\Submission Material Policy Studies Journal\fig2.eps** | Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig2_RR_ESP.pdf | Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig2_RR_GER.pdf |
| **B** | **C:\Users\boehl\polybox\Shared\SNF Climate Policy Project\SNF Thomas Lena Bianca copy\Paper Political Claims Dataset\Submission Material Policy Studies Journal\fig3.eps** | Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig3_ESP.pdf | Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig3_GER.pdf |
| **C** | Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig4_RR.pdf | Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig4_RR_ESP.pdf | Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig4_RR_GER.pdf |

FIGURE B1

**Panel A:** Media salience of the climate change issue, 1995 – 2010, monthly data

*Note:* Measured as the number of climate change relevant articles as a proportion of all articles published within a given month in the two newspapers in each country. Scale: 0…1, where 1 is the empirical maximum of the variable (occurs in the US in 2009m12).

**Panel B**: Published opinion (ratio of pro and con climate protection claims over total claims), 1995-2010, 5-month moving average

*Note:* Measured as pro minus con climate protection claims divided by the sum of positive and negative (total) claims per month. Scale = -1 … 1; where "-1" means that only negative claims were made and "1"that only positive claims were made. Using 5-months moving averages makes it easier to visually compare the two series.

**Panel C:** Intensity of the public climate change discourse, 1995-2010, monthly data

*Note:* Measured by total number of claims per month (sum of pro and con claims) divided by the number of climate change-relevant articles in the respective newspapers in the US, Spain and Germany (monthly). Scale: 0…1, where "1" is the empirical maximum on the variable (e.g. in the US, this occurs in 1999m7).

***Events:*** A: AR2 (1995m12); B: COP Kyoto (1997m12); C: AR3 and US resigns of Kyoto

(2001m3); D: COP Bonn (2001m7); E: Kyoto Protocol in force (2005m2); F: AR4 (2007m2); G: COP Bali

(2007m12); H: COP Copenhagen (2009m12).

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **USA** | **SPAIN** | **GERMANY** |
| Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig5_2.pdf | Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig5_2_ESP.pdf | Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig5_2_GER.pdf |
| Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig5-2_USA.pdf | Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig5-2_ESP.pdf | Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig5-2_GER.pdf |

FIGURE B2. Comparison and cross-correlations of saliency data with survey datain three countries

*Note:* Top row: Comparison of the relative frequency of media reporting on climate change by two US, Spanish and German newspapers with different MIP survey questions. Scale: Normalized with mean=0 and standard deviation=1. Events: A: AR2 (1995q4); B: COP Kyoto (1997q4); C: AR3 & US resigns of Kyoto (2001q1); D: COP Bonn (2001q3); E: Kyoto Protocol in force (2005q1); F: AR4 (2007q1); G: COP Bali (2007q4); H: COP Copenhagen (2009q4). Bottom row: Cross-correlation coefficient plus 95% confidence intervals between Gallup MIP and our salience measure (lags in quarters (USA and Germany) or months (Spain): 10).

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **USA** | **SPAIN** | **GERMANY** |
| Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig5_3_RR.pdf | Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig5_3_ESP.pdf | Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig5_3_GER.pdf |
| Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig5-3_USAccf.pdf | Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig5-3_ESPccf.pdf | Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig5-3_GERccf.pdf |

FIGURE B3. Comparison and cross-correlations of saliency data with internet search data in three countries

*Note:* Top row: Comparison of the relative frequency of media reporting on climate change by two US, Spanish and German newspapers with Google Trends data. Scale: Normalized with mean=0 and standard deviation=1. Events: A: AR2 (1995q4); B: COP Kyoto (1997q4); C: AR3 & US resigns of Kyoto (2001q1); D: COP Bonn (2001q3); E: Kyoto Protocol in force (2005q1); F: AR4 (2007q1); G: COP Bali (2007q4); H: COP Copenhagen (2009q4). Bottom row: Cross-correlation coefficient plus 95% confidence intervals between Google Trends and our salience measure (lags in month: 15 (Google Trends)).

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **USA** | **SPAIN** | **GERMANY** |
| Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig7_2.pdf | Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig7_2_ESP.pdf | Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig7_2_GER.pdf |
| Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig7-2_USA.pdf | Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig7-2_ESP.pdf | Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig7-2_GER.pdf |

FIGURE B4 Comparison and cross-correlations of published opinion (ratio of pro and con climate protection claims over total claims) data with survey data in three countries

*Note:* Top row: compares the ratio of positive to negative claims in media reporting on climate change by two US, Spanish and German newspapers with different MIP survey questions. Scale: Normalized with mean=0 and standard deviation=1. Events: A: AR2 (1995q4); B: COP Kyoto (1997q4); C: AR3 & US resigns of Kyoto (2001q1); D: COP Bonn (2001q3); E: Kyoto Protocol in force (2005q1); F: AR4 (2007q1); G: COP Bali (2007q4); H: COP Copenhagen (2009q4). Bottom row: Cross-correlation coefficient plus 95% confidence intervals between Gallup MIP and our published opinion measure (lags in quarters (USA and Germany) or months (Spain): 10).

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **USA** | **SPAIN** | **GERMANY** |
| Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig7_3.pdf | Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig7_3_ESP.pdf | Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig7_3_esp_GER.pdf |
| Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig7-3_USAccf.pdf | Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig7-3_ESPccf.pdf | Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig7-3_GERccf.pdf |

FIGURE B5. Comparison and cross-correlations of published opinion (ratio of pro and con climate protection claims over total claims) data with internet search data in three countries

*Note:* Top row: compares the ratio of positive to negative claims in media reporting on climate change by two US, Spanish and German newspapers with Google Trends data. Scale: Normalized with mean=0 and standard deviation=1. Events: A: AR2 (1995q4); B: COP Kyoto (1997q4); C: AR3 & US resigns of Kyoto (2001q1); D: COP Bonn (2001q3); E: Kyoto Protocol in force (2005q1); F: AR4 (2007q1); G: COP Bali (2007q4); H: COP Copenhagen (2009q4). Bottom row: Cross-correlation coefficient plus 95% confidence intervals between Google Trends and our salience measure (lags in month: 15 (Google Trends)).

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **USA** | **SPAIN** | **GERMANY** |
| Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig9_2.pdf | Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig9_2_ESP.pdf | Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig9_2_GER_q.eps |
| Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig9-2_USA.pdf | Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig9-2_ESP.pdf | Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig9-2_GER.pdf |

FIGURE B6. Comparison and cross-correlations of politicization of public debate measure with survey data in three countries

*Note:* Top row: The panels compare the ratio of total claims (positive and negative) to total climate change-relevant articles in two US, Spanish and German newspapers with different MIP survey questions. Scale: Normalized with mean=0 and standard deviation=1. Events: A: AR2 (1995q4); B: COP Kyoto (1997q4); C: AR3 & US resigns of Kyoto (2001q1); D: COP Bonn (2001q3); E: Kyoto Protocol in force (2005q1); F: AR4 (2007q1); G: COP Bali (2007q4); H: COP Copenhagen (2009q4). Bottom row: Cross-correlation coefficient plus 95% confidence intervals between Gallup MIP and our published opinion measure (lags in quarters (USA and Germany) or months (Spain): 10).

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **USA** | **SPAIN** | **GERMANY** |
| Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig9_3.pdf | Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig9_3_ESP.pdf | Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig9_3_esp_GER.pdf |
| Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig9-3_USAccf.pdf | Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig9-3ESPccf.pdf | Macintosh HD:Users:lenaschaffer:Dropbox:snf:paper 2 datapaper:SNF Thomas Lena Bianca:Paper Political Claims Dataset:Data:fig9-3_GERccf.pdf |

FIGURE B7. Comparison and cross-correlations of our politicization of public debate measure with internet search data in three countries

*Note:* Top row: The panels compare the ratio of total claims (positive and negative) to total climate change-relevant articles in two US, Spanish and German newspapers with Google Trends data. Scale: Normalized with mean=0 and standard deviation=1. Events: A: AR2 (1995q4); B: COP Kyoto (1997q4); C: AR3 & US resigns of Kyoto (2001q1); D: COP Bonn (2001q3); E: Kyoto Protocol in force (2005q1); F: AR4 (2007q1); G: COP Bali (2007q4); H: COP Copenhagen (2009q4). Bottom row: Cross-correlation coefficient plus 95% confidence intervals between Google Trends and our salience measure (lags in month: 15 (Google Trends)).