Appendix 3

Table A3.1 includes a robustness check in which I control for religiosity. I measured religiosity aggregating the item “How religious you are?”, from the European Social Survey, by country. The variable “religiosity” can assume a value between 0 and 10 and a higher value represents a higher average religiosity of individuals living in that country. Religiosity is a significant factor affecting the development of childcare services: A unit increase in religiosity reduces the expenditure for childcare by 0.025/0.029 percentage point, probably because more religious contexts favour familial caring rather than public childcare. However, the introduction of religiosity in the analysis does not change the overall results of the analysis, which remain substantially the same.

Table A3.1 Robustness check controlling for religiosity

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) |
| VARIABLES | Model 1 | Model 2 | Model 3 | Model 4 | Model 5 | Model 6 |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Childcare expendituret-1 | **0.858\*\*\*** | **0.842\*\*\*** | **0.840\*\*\*** | **0.838\*\*\*** | **0.801\*\*\*** | **0.798\*\*\*** |
|  | (0.026) | (0.028) | (0.028) | (0.027) | (0.030) | (0.030) |
| Log GDP per capita t-1 | **0.039\*\*** | **0.032\*** | **0.053\*\*** | 0.035 | 0.005 | 0.008 |
|  | (0.019) | (0.018) | (0.023) | (0.023) | (0.025) | (0.025) |
| Female labour force t-1 | 0.001 | 0.001 | 0.001 | 0.001 | 0.001 | 0.001 |
|  | (0.002) | (0.002) | (0.002) | (0.002) | (0.002) | (0.002) |
| GDP growth t-1 | -0.000 | -0.001 | -0.001 | -0.000 | 0.000 | -0.000 |
|  | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) |
| Total fertility rate t-1 | **0.075\*\*** | **0.071\*\*** | **0.070\*\*** | **0.090\*\*** | **0.075\*\*** | **0.078\*\*** |
|  | (0.035) | (0.035) | (0.035) | (0.036) | (0.035) | (0.036) |
| Female MPs t-1 | -0.000 | -0.000 | -0.000 | -0.000 | -0.001 | -0.000 |
|  | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) |
| Social security transfers t-1 | **-0.008\*\*\*** | **-0.008\*\*\*** | **-0.007\*\*\*** | **-0.007\*\*\*** | **-0.010\*\*\*** | **-0.009\*\*\*** |
|  | (0.003) | (0.003) | (0.003) | (0.003) | (0.003) | (0.003) |
| Religiosity | **-0.029\*\*** | **-0.028\*\*** | **-0.031\*\*** | **-0.030\*\*** | **-0.029\*\*** | **-0.025\*** |
|  | (0.013) | (0.013) | (0.013) | (0.013) | (0.013) | (0.013) |
| Left-Right t-1 | -0.002 | -0.003 | -0.002 | -0.003 | **-0.004\*\*** | 0.003 |
|  | (0.002) | (0.002) | (0.002) | (0.002) | (0.002) | (0.008) |
| Production workers (PW) | 0.162 |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | (0.118) |  |  |  |  |  |
| Sociocultural professionals (SCP) | 0.632\*\*\* |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | (0.202) |  |  |  |  |  |
| SCP-to-PW ratio |  | **0.077\*\*\*** | **0.073\*\*\*** | **0.071\*\*\*** | **0.067\*\*\*** | **0.194\*\*** |
|  |  | (0.025) | (0.025) | (0.025) | (0.025) | (0.081) |
|  |  |  | -0.074 | -0.072 | **-0.133\*\*\*** | **-0.136\*\*\*** |
|  |  |  | (0.045) | (0.045) | (0.048) | (0.048) |
|  |  |  |  | 0.008 | 0.012 | 0.013 |
|  |  |  |  | (0.010) | (0.010) | (0.010) |
|  |  |  |  | **-0.040\*\*\*** | **-0.039\*\*\*** | 0.078 |
|  |  |  |  | (0.012) | (0.012) | (0.083) |
|  |  |  |  |  | **0.299\*\*\*** | **0.281\*\*\*** |
|  |  |  |  |  | (0.096) | (0.096) |
| Losing t-1 x Ratio |  |  |  |  |  | **-0.305\*\*** |
|  |  |  |  |  |  | (0.145) |
| Ratio x Left-Right t-1 |  |  |  |  |  | -0.020 |
|  |  |  |  |  |  | (0.014) |
| Losingt-1 x Left-Right t-1 |  |  |  |  |  | -0.018 |
|  |  |  |  |  |  | (0.015) |
| Losing t-1 x Ratio x Left-Right t-1 |  |  |  |  |  | **0.050\*** |
|  |  |  |  |  |  | (0.027) |
| Constant | -0.290 | -0.130 | -0.309 | -0.150 | 0.079 | -0.002 |
|  | (0.213) | (0.189) | (0.218) | (0.221) | (0.230) | (0.239) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Observations | 345 | 345 | 345 | 345 | 345 | 345 |
| R-squared | 0.864 | 0.864 | 0.865 | 0.869 | 0.873 | 0.876 |
| Number of groups | 23 | 23 | 23 | 23 | 23 | 23 |

Standard errors in parentheses

\*\*\* p<0.01, \*\* p<0.05, \* p<0.1