*Appendix 2* Budgetary Welfare Effort (BWE): pre-crisis levels (2000-08) and post-crisis change (2009-14).

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Austria | | Belgium | | Bulgaria | | Cyprus | | Czech Rep. | | Germany | | Denmark | | Estonia | | Greece | |
| 2000-08 | | **09-14** | 00-08 | **09-14** | 00-08 | **09-14** | 00-08 | **09-14** | 00-08 | **09-14** | 00-08 | **09-14** | 00-08 | **09-14** | 00-08 | **09-14** | 00-08 | **09-14** |
| GDP growth | 2.3% | **0.4%** | 2.1% | **0.6%** | 5.9% | **-0.3%** | 4.1% | **-1.8%** | 4.3% | **0.2%** | 1.6% | **0.8%** | 1.6% | **0.2%** | 6.5% | **0.6%** | 3.6% | **-4.8%** |
| Unempl. rate | 4.7% | **5.1%** | 7.7% | **8.0%** | 12.4% | **10.9%** | 4.3% | **10.6%** | 7.2% | **6.8%** | 9.1% | **6.0%** | 4.5% | **7.0%** | 9.2% | **11.4%** | 9.7% | **19.8%** |
|  | *SD* | ***∆*** | *SD* | ***∆*** | *SD* | ***∆*** | *SD* | ***∆*** | *SD* | ***∆*** | *SD* | ***∆*** | *SD* | ***∆*** | *SD* | ***∆*** | *SD* | ***∆*** |
| Social protection | 1.2 | **-0.0** | 0.3 | **+0.1** | -1.1 | **+0.2** | -0.1 | **+0.1** | -0.5 | **+0.1** | 0.5 | **+0.1** | 0.6 | **-0.2** | -0.9 | **+0.2** | -0.5 | **+0.1** |
| Working age | 0.7 | **-0.1** | 0.3 | **+0.0** | -0.9 | **+0.0** | -0.1 | **-0.3** | -0.6 | **+0.0** | -0.3 | **+0.2** | 1.5 | **-0.8** | -0.8 | **+0.1** | -0.7 | **-0.1** |
| Children | 1.6 | **-0.1** | 0.3 | **+0.0** | -0.9 | **+0.2** | -0.3 | **+0.0** | -0.1 | **+0.1** | 1.3 | **+0.2** | -0.0 | **+0.1** | -0.5 | **+0.2** | -0.6 | **+0.1** |
| old age | 1.5 | **+0.1** | 0.4 | **+0.2** | -1.6 | **+0.2** | -0.1 | **+0.6** | -0.7 | **+0.3** | 0.6 | **-0.2** | 0.4 | **+0.2** | -1.4 | **+0.3** | -0.2 | **+0.3** |
| Social investment | 0.4 | **+0.5** | -0.1 | **+0.2** | -1.0 | **+0.2** | -0.6 | **+0.2** | -0.6 | **+0.1** | 0.2 | **+0.5** | 1.7 | **+0.1** | -0.8 | **+0.2** | -0.8 | **+0.1** |
| Working age | 0.2 | **+0.3** | 0.0 | **+0.0** | -0.8 | **-0.0** | -0.7 | **-0.0** | -0.7 | **+0.0** | 0.1 | **+0.3** | 2.1 | **-0.7** | -0.8 | **+0.1** | -0.8 | **-0.0** |
| Children | 0.1 | **+0.6** | -0.3 | **+0.0** | -0.8 | **+0.4** | -0.7 | **+0.0** | -0.7 | **-0.1** | 0.7 | **+0.9** | 2.5 | **+0.5** | -0.9 | **-0.0** | -0.9 | **-0.1** |
| Old age | -0.1 | **+0.2** | -0.5 | **+0.2** | -0.7 | **+0.0** | -0.6 | **-0.0** | -0.3 | **-0.1** | -0.7 | **+0.0** | 2.1 | **+0.2** | -0.6 | **-0.0** | -0.7 | **-0.0** |
| Education | 0.5 | **+0.3** | 0.5 | **+0.4** | -1.5 | **+0.3** | -0.1 | **+0.5** | -0.9 | **+0.3** | 0.0 | **+0.6** | 1.1 | **+0.0** | -0.9 | **+0.4** | -0.8 | **+0.2** |
| R&D | 1.2 | **+1.0** | -0.1 | **+0.5** | -1.3 | **+0.0** | -1.0 | **+0.2** | -0.3 | **+0.4** | 0.8 | **+0.6** | 0.6 | **+0.6** | -0.8 | **+0.7** | -0.8 | **+0.1** |

*Appendix 2 - continued* Budgetary Welfare Effort (BWE): pre-crisis levels (2000-08) and post-crisis change (2009-14).

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Spain | | Finland | | France | | Hungary | | Ireland | | Italy | | Lithuania | | Luxembourg | | Latvia | |
| 2000-08 | | **09-14** | 00-08 | **09-14** | 00-08 | **09-14** | 00-08 | **09-14** | 00-08 | **09-14** | 00-08 | **09-14** | 00-08 | **09-14** | 00-08 | **09-14** | 00-08 | **09-14** |
| GDP growth | 3.5% | **-1.3%** | 3.2% | **-0.9%** | 1.9% | **0.4%** | 3.4% | **0.1%** | 4.8% | **1.0%** | 1.2% | **-1.3%** | 7.0% | **0.6%** | 3.9% | **2.0%** | 7.2% | **-0.5%** |
| Unempl. rate | 10.4% | **22.4%** | 8.4% | **8.2%** | 8.3% | **9.7%** | 6.6% | **10.2%** | 4.6% | **13.3%** | 7.9% | **10.0%** | 10.6% | **13.8%** | 3.8% | **5.3%** | 10.5% | **15.1%** |
|  | *SD* | ***∆*** | *SD* | ***∆*** | *SD* | ***∆*** | *SD* | ***∆*** | *SD* | ***∆*** | *SD* | ***∆*** | *SD* | ***∆*** | *SD* | ***∆*** | *SD* | ***∆*** |
| Social protection | -0.6 | **+0.1** | 0.0 | **+0.1** | 0.4 | **+0.1** | -0.5 | **+0.0** | 0.1 | **+0.1** | -0.1 | **+0.0** | -1.0 | **+0.2** | 2.9 | **+0.2** | -1.0 | **+0.1** |
| Working age | -0.5 | **-0.2** | 0.1 | **+0.1** | 0.1 | **-0.0** | -0.5 | **-0.3** | 0.1 | **-0.4** | -0.5 | **+0.1** | -0.8 | **+0.0** | 2.6 | **-1.2** | -0.9 | **-0.0** |
| Children | -0.9 | **+0.1** | 0.1 | **-0.0** | 0.1 | **-0.1** | -0.2 | **+0.1** | 0.5 | **+0.2** | -0.5 | **+0.1** | -0.8 | **+0.3** | 3.6 | **+0.9** | -0.8 | **+0.0** |
| old age | -0.4 | **+0.3** | -0.1 | **+0.3** | 0.9 | **+0.4** | -1.0 | **+0.2** | -0.4 | **+0.5** | 0.8 | **-0.1** | -1.4 | **+0.2** | 2.3 | **+1.0** | -1.5 | **+0.3** |
| Social investment | -0.2 | **+0.1** | 0.6 | **+0.3** | 0.2 | **+0.1** | -0.6 | **0.0** | -0.1 | **+0.2** | -0.3 | **-0.1** | -0.8 | **+0.1** | 1.1 | **+0.7** | -0.9 | **+0.1** |
| Working age | -0.5 | **-0.2** | 0.1 | **+0.3** | 0.1 | **+0.0** | -0.6 | **-0.0** | 0.2 | **-0.7** | -0.5 | **-0.2** | -0.7 | **-0.0** | 2.7 | **-0.2** | -0.8 | **-0.0** |
| Children | 0.2 | **+0.1** | 1.2 | **+0.5** | -0.1 | **+0.4** | -0.3 | **+0.0** | -0.6 | **+0.1** | -0.6 | **+0.1** | -0.6 | **+0.1** | 0.7 | **+1.0** | -0.8 | **+0.0** |
| Old age | -0.3 | **+0.2** | 0.5 | **+0.2** | -0.2 | **+0.1** | -0.3 | **+0.0** | 0.1 | **+0.3** | -0.6 | **+0.0** | -0.6 | **+0.0** | -0.7 | **-0.0** | -0.6 | **+0.1** |
| Education | -0.3 | **+0.1** | 0.2 | **+0.3** | 0.1 | **+0.1** | -1.0 | **+0.0** | 0.2 | **+0.8** | 0.3 | **-0.3** | -1.2 | **+0.3** | 2.6 | **+0.2** | -1.1 | **+0.3** |
| R&D | -0.3 | **+0.3** | 1.0 | **+0.2** | 1.0 | **+0.1** | -0.8 | **+0.0** | -0.2 | **+0.3** | 0.0 | **-0.1** | -0.9 | **+0.1** | -0.1 | **+2.3** | -1.2 | **-0.0** |

*Appendix 2 - continued* Budgetary Welfare Effort (BWE): pre-crisis levels (2000-08) and post-crisis change (2009-14).

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Malta | | Netherlands | | Poland | | Portugal | | Romania | | Sweden | | Slovenia | | Slovakia | | UK | |
| 2000-08 | | **09-14** | 00-08 | **09-14** | 00-08 | **09-14** | 00-08 | **09-14** | 00-08 | **09-14** | 00-08 | **09-14** | 00-08 | **09-14** | 00-08 | **09-14** | 00-08 | **09-14** |
| GDP growth | 2.4% | **3.0%** | 2.2% | **-0.1%** | 4.2% | **3.0%** | 1.4% | **-1.2%** | 6.1% | **0.1%** | 2.8% | **1.2%** | 4.2% | **-1.1%** | 5.7% | **1.4%** | 2.5% | **0.9%** |
| Unempl. rate | 7.0% | **6.4%** | 4.4% | **5.8%** | 15.8% | **9.5%** | 7.5% | **13.6%** | 7.3% | **6.9%** | 6.5% | **8.1%** | 6.0% | **8.4%** | 16.%0 | **13.6%** | 5.1% | **7.5%** |
|  | *SD* | ***∆*** | *SD* | ***∆*** | *SD* | ***∆*** | *SD* | ***∆*** | *SD* | ***∆*** | *SD* | ***∆*** | *SD* | ***∆*** | *SD* | ***∆*** | *SD* | ***∆*** |
| Social protection | -0.5 | **+0.0** | 1.0 | **-0.3** | -0.7 | **+0.1** | -0.5 | **+0.0** | -1.1 | **+0.2** | 0.3 | **-0.1** | -0.3 | **+0.0** | -0.7 | **+0.2** | 0.4 | **+0.1** |
| Working age | -0.5 | **-0.1** | 2.8 | **-1.3** | -0.8 | **+0.0** | -0.2 | **-0.4** | -0.8 | **+0.1** | 0.6 | **-0.6** | -0.5 | **-0.1** | -0.8 | **+0.0** | 0.6 | **-0.5** |
| Children | -0.5 | **+0.1** | -0.6 | **+0.1** | -0.9 | **+0.0** | -0.8 | **+0.2** | -1.0 | **+0.2** | 0.2 | **-0.1** | -0.2 | **+0.0** | -0.5 | **+0.2** | 0.1 | **+0.5** |
| old age | -0.4 | **+0.1** | 1.2 | **+0.1** | -0.6 | **+0.3** | -0.5 | **+0.3** | -1.6 | **+0.4** | 0.1 | **+0.3** | -0.2 | **+0.1** | -0.9 | **+0.3** | 0.4 | **+0.2** |
| Social investment | -0.6 | **+0.3** | 0.8 | **-0.1** | -0.9 | **+0.3** | -0.4 | **+0.1** | -1.0 | **+0.1** | 1.5 | **+0.1** | -0.4 | **+0.1** | -0.8 | **+0.1** | -0.1 | **+0.1** |
| Working age | -0.6 | **-0.0** | 1.9 | **-1.2** | -0.8 | **+0.1** | -0.4 | **-0.2** | -0.8 | **-0.0** | 1.6 | **-0.3** | -0.6 | **+0.0** | -0.8 | **+0.0** | -0.1 | **-0.2** |
| Children | -0.8 | **+0.1** | 0.0 | **-0.1** | -0.9 | **+0.6** | -0.3 | **-0.1** | -0.6 | **+0.0** | 1.5 | **+0.4** | -0.1 | **-0.1** | -0.8 | **+0.0** | -0.4 | **+0.4** |
| Old age | -0.0 | **+0.1** | 0.7 | **+0.2** | -0.6 | **+0.0** | -0.3 | **-0.0** | -0.7 | **+0.0** | 2.4 | **-0.1** | -0.6 | **+0.1** | -0.2 | **+0.0** | -0.0 | **-0.1** |
| Education | -0.6 | **+1.2** | 0.4 | **+0.5** | -1.2 | **+0.4** | -0.3 | **+0.2** | -1.7 | **+0.2** | 0.8 | **+0.2** | -0.2 | **+0.3** | -1.3 | **+0.5** | 0.1 | **+0.5** |
| R&D | -1.2 | **+0.2** | 1.1 | **-0.0** | -1.0 | **+0.3** | -0.5 | **+0.4** | -1.3 | **+0.1** | 1.3 | **+0.4** | -0.4 | **+0.5** | -1.1 | **+0.2** | -0.0 | **+0.0** |

*Note*: First two rows report contextual factors: annual real GDP growth and unemployment rates (mean for before and after the crisis). Other rows include Budgetary Welfare Effort (BWE) data: pre-crisis (2000-08) BWE scores for Social protection and Social investment are the mean of the standardised scores (*SD*) in the corresponding constituent welfare functions, reported immediately below each category. Details on the aggregation of welfare functions into the Social protection and Social investment categories are found in Appendix 1. 09-14 columns report the absolute changes (***∆***) from 2000-08 starting levels to post-crisis levels (2009-14). All values are rounded to the first decimal place.

*Source*: Social Investment Welfare Expenditure (SIWE) dataset (Ronchi, 2016).