# Supplementary material

## Search terms

1. Computer\* OR internet\* OR online OR Web\* OR e?health
2. Treatment\* OR intervention\* OR program\* OR prevention OR self-help OR self-guided OR self-directed OR unguided
3. “controlled trial” OR RCT OR “randomi?ed trial” OR Systematic Review\* OR meta-analysis
4. resilience OR well?being OR "mental health" OR socio?emotional OR psych\* OR CBT OR”cognitive?behavio\* therapy” OR “cognitive therapy” OR anxiety OR panic OR mood OR depressi\* OR dysthymi\* OR bipolar OR stress OR eating OR anorex\* OR bulimi\* OR binge\* OR “body dysmorphi\*” OR "body dissatisfaction" OR insomnia OR sleep OR “personality disorder” OR schizo\* OR “obsessive?compulsive disorder” OR OCD or post\*traumatic or PTSD
5. (1) AND (2) AND (3) AND (4)

## Supplementary tables

Table S1: Existing systematic review and meta-analyses on guidance on adherence

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Study | # studies (guided vs. unguided) | Disorders of interest | Main conclusion | Limitations |
| Baumeister, Reichler, Munzinger, & Lin (2014) | 7 | Any mental disorder meeting criteria of classification | Average number of completed modules and completer rate higher for guided vs. unguided interventions  | * Small number of identified studies
* Age of review
* No definition of guidance
 |
| Beatty & Binnion (2016) | 4 | Any mental or physical health condition (intervention targets psychological outcomes) | Increased adherence for guided vs. unguided interventions | * Small number of identified studies
* Inclusion of physical health problems
* Guidance not focus of review
* Narrative synthesis
 |
| Shim, Mahaffey, Bleidistel, & Gonzalez (2017) | 9 | Depression, anxiety | Majority of studies showed no significant difference in adherence | * Inclusion of automated guidance (e.g. reminders)
* Narrative synthesis
 |
| Domhardt, Geßlein, von Rezori, & Baumeister (2018) | 4 | Anxiety disorder | Average number of completed modules and completer rate higher for guided vs. unguided interventions  | * Small number of identified studies
* Guidance not focus of review
 |

Table S2: Risk of bias for included studies

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Author/year | Randomization process | Deviations from the intended interventions  | Deviations from the intended interventions  | Missing outcome data | Measurement of the outcome | Selection of the reported result | Overall |
| Berger, 2011a | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Some concerns | Some concerns |
| Berger, 2011b | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Some concerns | Some concerns |
| Campos, 2019 | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk |
| Dear, 2015 | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk |
| Dear, 2016 | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk |
| Dear, 2018 | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Some concerns | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk |
| Farrer, 2011 | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | High risk | Low risk | Some concerns | High risk |
| Fogliati, 2016 | Some concerns | Low risk | Low risk | Some concerns | Low risk | Low risk | Some concerns |
| Gershkovich, 2017 | Some concerns | Low risk | Low risk | Some concerns | Low risk | Some concerns | High risk |
| Gilbody, 2017 | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk |
| Hedman, 2018 | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk |
| Ho, 2014 | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk |
| Ivanova, 2016 | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk |
| Kleiboer, 2015 | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Some concerns | Low risk | Low risk | Some concerns |
| Lancee, 2013 | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk |
| Montero-Marin, 2016 | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk |
| Proudfoot, 2012 | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk |
| Puolakanaho, 2019 | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Some concerns | Some concerns |
| Titov, 2008 | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk |
| Titov, 2009 | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk |
| Titov, 2015 | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk |
| Titov, 2016 | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk | Low risk |

## STATA code

\* load file

use "MA\_Data\_formatted\_binary.dta"

\* compute variable for 2x2 table

gen unguidedincompleten = unguidedgroupn - unguidedfullcompletionn

gen guidedincompleten = guidedgroupn - guidedfullcompletionn

\* calculate effect sizes

meta esize guidedfullcompletionn guidedincompleten unguidedfullcompletionn unguidedincompleten, studylabel(authoryear)

\* make forest plot with basic options, suppress heterogeneity display, as in text

meta forestplot \_id \_data \_esci \_weight \_plot, nullrefline(favorsleft("Favours unguided") favorsright("Favours guided")) columnopts(\_data1, supertitle("Guided" "completed")) columnopts(\_data2, supertitle("Unguided" "completed")) columnopts(\_a \_c, title("Yes")) columnopts(\_b \_d, title("No")) noohetstats noosigtest noohomtest

\*funnel plot

meta funnelplot, random

\* aggregate completion rates for both guided and unguided

metaprop unguidedfullcompletionn unguidedgroupn, random ftt cimethod(exact)

metaprop guidedfullcompletionn guidedgroupn, random ftt cimethod(exact)

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\* continuous data

\*load file

use "MA\_Data\_formatted\_contin.dta"

\*calculate effect sizes

meta esize gn scaled\_gm scaled\_gsd ugn scaled\_ugm scaled\_ugsd, studylabel(authoryear)

\* make forest plot with basic settings

meta forestplot \_id \_data \_esci \_weight \_plot, nullrefline(favorsleft("Favours unguided") favorsright("Favours guided")) columnopts(\_data1, supertitle("Guided")) columnopts(\_data2, supertitle("Unguided")) columnopts(\_mean1 \_sd1 \_mean2 \_sd2, format(%7.1f)) noohetstats noosigtest noohomtest

meta bias, egger

meta funnelplot, random