**Online Supplementary Material 1: Search strategy for PubMed**

("Anxiety Disorders"[Mesh] OR anxiety OR "Agoraphobia"[Mesh] OR agoraphobia\* OR "Neurocirculatory Asthenia"[Mesh] OR neurocirculatory asthenia\* OR “effort syndrome” OR “cardiac neurosis” OR “cardiac neuroses” OR “hyperkinetic heart syndrome” OR "Obsessive-Compulsive Disorder"[Mesh] OR “obsessive-compulsive” OR “obsessive compulsive” OR "Panic Disorder"[Mesh] OR panic OR "Phobic Disorders"[Mesh] OR phobi\* OR "Stress Disorders, Traumatic"[Mesh] OR Traumatic Stress Disorder\* OR "Stress Disorders, Post-Traumatic"[Mesh] OR Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder\* OR Post Traumatic Stress Disorder\* OR Posttraumatic Stress Disorder\* OR PTSD OR Post-Traumatic Neuros\* OR Post Traumatic Neuros\* OR Posttraumatic Neuros\* OR "Stress Disorders, Traumatic, Acute"[Mesh] OR Acute Stress Disorder\*) **AND** ("Relaxation"[Mesh] OR "Relaxation Therapy"[Mesh] OR "Muscle Relaxation"[Mesh] OR relax\* OR "Autogenic Training"[Mesh] OR Autogenic Training\* OR "Mind-Body Therapies"[Mesh] OR mind-body OR “mind body” OR "Spiritual Therapies"[Mesh] OR  Spiritual Therap\* OR “spiritual healing” OR "Breathing Exercises"[Mesh] OR breathing exercise\* OR “respiratory muscle training” OR "Qigong"[Mesh] OR qigong OR “Ch'i Kung” OR “Qi Gong” OR  "Imagery (Psychotherapy)"[Mesh] OR imager\* OR directed reverie therap\* OR "Tai Ji"[Mesh] OR “Tai Ji” OR “Tai-ji” OR “Tai Chi” OR Taiji OR Taijiquan OR "Meditation"[Mesh] OR meditat\* OR "Yoga"[Mesh] OR yoga) **AND** ((clinical[TIAB] AND trial[TIAB]) OR “clinical trials as topic”[MH] OR “clinical trial”[PT] OR random\*[TIAB] OR “random allocation”[MH] OR "therapeutic use"[Subheading])

**Online Supplementary Material 2: Characteristics of the included studies**

| **Study** | **Disorder** | **Age** | **Female** | **(C)BT groups** | **Relaxation groups** | **Setting** | **Who delivered** | **Waves** | **CR** | **Outcomes** |  | **St** | **In** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Al-Kubaisy, 1992  UK | PHOB: agora, social, specific phobias | Mn: 35.0  SD: 11.0 | 63.7% | **BT(a): Exposure** (n=30)  -In vivo, flooding  -Self-exposure  -6 weeks: 1.0 hours/week  **BT(b): Exposure** (n=31)  -Therapist-accompanied, in vivo, flooding self-exposure  -6 weeks: 2,5 hours/week | **PR** (n=29)  -Muscle relaxation  -Self-applied (audio)  -6 weeks: 1.0 hours/week | -IMMs behavioural unit  -Individual application | Experienced behaviour therapists | Post  6 weeks | BT(a): 86.7%  BT(b): 87.1%  PR: 93.1% | -Fear Questionnaire  -Spontaneous panics  -Free-floating anxiety  -Beck Depression Inventory  -Hamilton Depression | -Work and Social Adjustment Scale  -Global improvement  -Global severity | +  +  -  - | +  -  - |
| Park, 2001  UK |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 96 weeks |  | -Fear Questionnaire  -Beck Depression Inventory | -Work and Social Adjustment Scale |  |  |
| Arntz,1996  Netherlands | PANIC  (no or mild agoraphobia) | Mn: 34.1  Rg: 21-52 | 38.9% | **CT: Cog. restructuring** (n=18) -Exploration cognitions + change thoughts + behavioral experiments  -Therapist-accompanied  -12 weeks: 1 hour/week | **AR** (n=18)  -Muscle relaxation + relaxation skills during daily activities  -Therapist-accompanied  -12 weeks: 1 hour/week | -Community Mental Health Center  -Individual application | Experienced behaviour therapists | Post  4 weeks  26 weeks | CT: 100%  AR: 94.4% | -Panic frequency  -Panic-free  -Composite: Fear of Fear Questionnaire, Fear Questionnaire, State-Trait | Anxiety Inventory, Beck  Depression Inventory, Depressive Symptoms Inventory, Symptom Checklist | +  -  -  - | +  +  + |
| Arntz, 2003  Netherlands | GAD | Mn: 35.9  Rg: 20-60 | 66,7% | **CT: Cog. Restructuring** (n=25)  -Exploration cognitions + change thoughts + behavioral experiments  -Therapist- accompanied  -12 weeks: 1 hour/week | **AR** (n=20)  -Muscle relaxation + relaxation skills during daily activities  -Therapist- accompanied  -12 weeks: 1 hour/week | -Community Mental Health Center  -Individual application | Trained therapist | Post  4 weeks  26 weeks | CT: 80.0%  AR: 85.0% | -State-Trait Anxiety Inventory  -Symptom Checklist  -Composite: Fear of Fear Questionnaire, Fear  Questionnaire, State-Trait | Anxiety Inventory, Bouman Depression Inventory | +  -  -  + | +  +  + |
| Barlow, 1989  USA | PANIC  (no or mild agoraphobia) | AR:  Mn: 38.0  SD: 22.8  CBT:  Mn: 36.1  SD: 6.8 | 68.0% | **CBT: Cog. Restructuring + Exposure** (n=16)  -Exploration cognitions + change thoughts + behavioral experiments  + in vivo, interoceptive, graduated exposure  -Therapist- accompanied  -15 weeks:1 hour/week | **AR** (n=15)  -Muscle relaxation + discrimination + recall + cue-control + relaxation skills during daily activities  -Therapist + self-applied  -15 weeks: 1 hour/week | -Phobia and Anxiety Disorders Clinic  -Individual application | Trained senior graduate students and psychologists | Post | CBT: 93.8%  AR: 66.7% | -Treatment responder and end-state functioning  -Clinical severity  -Hamilton Anxiety and Depression Scales  -State-Trait Anxiety Inventory  -Cognitive-Somatic Anxiety Questionnaire | -Subjective Symptom Scale  -Fear Questionnaire  -Beck Depression Inventory  -Psychosomatic Rating Scale  -Self monitoring | +  +  -  - | +  +  + |
| Craske, 1991  USA |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 26 weeks  104 weeks |  |  |  |  |  |
| Barlow, 1992  USA | GAD | AR:  Mn: 40.2    CT:  Mn: 39.5 | AR:  33.3%  CT:  46.2% | **CT: Cog. Restructuring** (n=17)  -Exploration cognitions + change thoughts + behavioral experiments  -Therapist- accompanied  -6 weeks: 1 hour/week | **AR** (n=16)  -Muscle relaxation + discrimination + recall + cue-control + relaxation skills during daily activities  -Therapist + self-applied  -6 weeks: 1 hour/week | -Phobia and Anxiety Disorders Clinic  -Individual application | Trained senior doctoral students and psychologists | Post | CT: 76.5%  AR: 62.5% | -Treatment responder and end-state functioning  -Clinical severity  -Percent of day worrying  -Fear Questionnaire  -Beck Depression Inventory  -Self monitoring | -Cognitive-Somatic Anxiety Questionnaire  -Subjective Symptoms Scale  -State-Trait Anxiety Inventory  -Eysenck Personality Inventory  -Hamilton Anxiety and Depression Scales | +  +  ?  - | +  +  + |
| Beck, 1994  USA | PANIC  (no or mild agoraphobia) | Mn: 37.5  SD: 9.7 | 76,3% | **CT: Cog. Restructuring** (n=22)  -Exploration cognitions + change dysfunctional thoughts  -Therapist- accompanied  -10 weeks: 1.5 hour/week | **PR** (n=20)  -Muscle relaxation + breathing + discrimination + relaxation by recall + cue-control  -Therapist + self-applied  -10 weeks: 1.5 hour/week | -Unrep.  -Group application | Advanced students under the supervision of psychologists | Post  4 weeks  26 weeks | CT: 77.3%  PR: 95.0% | -Panic Symptoms  -Clinical severity  -Treatment response  -Anxiety Sensitivity Inventory  -Agoraphobic Cognitions Questionnaire  -State-Trait Anxiety Inventory | -Fear Questionnaire  -Hamilton Anxiety and Depression Scales  -Symptom Checklist-90  -Recognition memory  -Skin conductance | +  -  -  - | +  +  + |
| Bedell, 1979  USA | PHOB: snake **(a)** and social **(b)** phobia | Unrep | 50.0% | **BT: Desensitization** (n=11)  -2 sessions of relaxation + Imaging, graduated exposure  -Therapist- accompanied  -6 weeks: 1 hour/week | **PR** (n=11)  -Muscle relaxation + breathing + imagery  -Therapist- accompanied  -6 weeks: 1 hour/week | -Unrep.  -Individual application | Graduate students enrolled in an advanced seminar on behavioral therapies | Post | BT: 100%  PR: 100%. | -Achievement Anxiety Test  -Fear Survey Schedule  -Behavioural Approach Test  -Performance measure for Test anxious |  | ?  +  -  - | +  +  + |
| Borkovec, 1993  USA | GAD | Mn: 37.5  SD: 13.1 | 65.5% | **CBT: Desensitization + Cog. Restructuring** (n=23)  -Relaxation + imaging, graduated exposure + exploration cognitions + change thoughts + behavioural experiments + decatastrophizing  -Therapist- accompanied  -6 weeks: 2.3 hour/week | **PR** (n=23)  -Muscle relaxation + cue-controlled + breathing + differential relaxation + Imagery  -Therapist + self-applied  -6 weeks: 2.3 hour/week | -Unrep.  -Unrep. | Two experienced therapist and two advanced clinical graduate students | Post  26 weeks  52 weeks | CBT: 82.6%  PR: 78.3% | -Clinical Severity  -Hamilton Anxiety and Depression Scales  -State-Trait Anxiety Inventory  -Zung self-rating of anxiety scale  -Reactions to Relaxation and Arousal Questionnaire  -Self monitoring | -Penn State Worry Questionnaire  -Medication  -Beck Depression Inventory | +  +  -  + | *+*  *+*  *+* |
| Clark, 1994  UK | PANIC (no, mild or moderate agoraphobia) | Mn: 34.6  SD: 9.2 | 78.0% | **CBT: Cog. Restructuring + Exposure** (n=21)  -Exploration cognitions + change misinterpretations + restructuring images + behavioral experiments + stopping safety behaviours + in vivo, interoceptive, graduated exposure.  -Therapist + self-applied  -12 weeks: 1 hour/week | **AR** (n=21)  -Muscle relaxation + relaxation skills during daily activities with a behavioural approach  -Therapist + self-applied  -12 weeks: 1 hour/week | -Unrep.  -Individual application | Two clinical Psychologists | Post  13 weeks  52 weeks | CBT: 95.2%  AR: 95.2% | -Panic composite  -Panic frequency, disability and end-state functioning  -Beck Anxiety Inventory  -Hamilton Anxiety Scale  -Fear Questionnaire  -Situational fear  -Bodily Sensations Questionnaire | -Bodily Sensations Interpretation Questionnaire  -Agoraphobic Cognitions Questionnaire  -Beck Depression Inventory | +  +  -  - | *+*  *+*  *+* |
| Deffenbacher, 1981  USA | PHOB: (social) | Unrep. | 66.0% | **CT: Cognitive coping skills** (n=13)  -Exploration cognitions + change dysfunctional self-instructional patterns + writing self-instructions + practice with standardized tests  -Therapist + self-applied  **-**2 weeks: 1.7 hour/week | **AR** (n=10)  -Relaxation coping skills + arousal awareness + cue-controlled + self-instructions -Therapist + self-applied -2 weeks: 1.7 hour/week | -Unrep.  -Group application | The authors | Post  5 weeks | CT: 100%  AR: 100% | -Achievement Anxiety Test  -Debilitating trait test anxiety  -Wonderlic Personnel Test  -Facilitating trait test anxiety  -State test anxiety  -Digit Symbol Test  -Exam scores |  | +  -  -  - | *-*  *-*  *-* |
| Dugas, 2010  Canada | GAD | CBT:  Mn: 40.4  SD: 12.8  Other:  Mn: 36.4  SD: 12.0 | CBT:  64.5%  MIX:  69.2% | **CBT:** **Exposure + Problem solving + Cog. Restructuring** (n=33)  **-**Psychoeducation+ reevaluation of worry + problem solving + imaging and in vivo exposure  -Therapist + self-applied  -12 weeks: 1 hour/week | **Other** (n=31)  -Psychoeducation + muscle relaxation + relaxation by recall + relaxation by counting + conditioned relaxation  -Therapist + self-applied -12 weeks: 1 hour/week | -Anxiety Disorders Clinic  -Individual application | Trained clinical psychologists | Post  26 weeks  52 weeks  104 weeks | CBT: 93.9%  Other: 83.9% | -Clinician severity rating  -Penn State Worry Questionnaire  -Worry and Anxiety Questionnaire somatic  -State-Trait Anxiety Inventory  -Diagnostic remission | -Beck Depression Inventory  -Clinical Global Impression Improvement scale | +  +  -  + | *+*  *+*  *+* |
| Donegan, 2012  Canada |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | Post |  | -Panic-free |  |  |  |
| Echeburúa, 1997  Spain | PTSD | Mn: 20.0  SD: 7.1 | 100% | **CBT:** **Exposure + Cog. Restructuring** (n=10)  -Imaging, graduated exposure + change thoughts + coping strategies  -Therapist + self-exposure  -6 weeks: 1.2 hour/week | **PR** (n=10)  -Muscle relaxation  -Therapist + self-applied  -6 weeks: 0.7 hour/week | -Psychological Counseling Centers for Women  -Individual application | Experienced clinical psychologist | Post  4 weeks  13 weeks  26 weeks  52 weeks | CBT: 100%  PR: 100% | -Severity of Posttraumatic Stress Disorder Symptoms  -Modified Fears Survey  -State-Trait Anxiety Inventory  -Beck Depression Inventory  -Scale of Adaptation |  | +  -  -  - | *+*  *-*  *-* |
| Fals-Stewar, 1992  USA | OCD (dually diagnosed) | Mn: 32.8  SD: 6.9 | 25.8% | **BT: Exposure (+ sustance abuse treatment)** (n=20)  -Imaging / in vivo and graduated / flooding + response prevention  -Therapist + self-exposure  -6 weeks: 3 hours/week | **PR: (+ sustance abuse treatment)** (n=20)  -Muscle relaxation  -Therapist-applied  -6 weeks: 3 hour/week | -Therapeutic community  -Mixed application | Experienced Therapist | Post  52 weeks | BT: 95.0%  PR: 90.0% | -NIMH Obsessive Compulsive Rating Scale  -Intake interview |  | +  -  -  - | *-*  *-*  *-* |
| Fals-Stewar, 1993  USA | OCD | Mn: 30.5  SD: 7.9 | 55.0% | **BT(a): Exposure + response prevention (group)** (n=31)  -Imaginal / in vivo, graduated / flooding + response prevention  -Therapist + self-exposure  -12 weeks: 4 hours/week  **BT(b): Exposure + response prevention (individual)** (n=34)  -Imaginal / in vivo, graduated / flooding + response prevention  -Therapist + self-exposure  -12 weeks: 2 hours/week | **PR** (n=32)  -Muscle relaxation  -Therapist-applied  -12 weeks: length unrep. | -Unrep.  -Group (a), and Individual (b) application | Experienced psychiatric social workers | Post | BT(a): 96.8%  BT(b): 91.2%  PR: 100% | -Self-Rating Anxiety Scale |  | +  -  -  - | *-*  *-*  *-* |
| Feldman, 2016  USA | PANIC (with or without agoraphobia + asthma) | Other:  Mn: 42.6  SD: 12.9  CBT:  Mn: 43.8  SD: 11.8 | 93.8% | **CBT: CBPT** (n=27)  -Emotional reactions to asthma + distinguishing between asthma and panic + adaptive/maladaptive behaviors + psycho-education + activation and empowerment  -Therapist + self-applied  **-**8 weeks: unrep. hour/week | **Other** (n=26)  -Non-directive counselling + relaxing music + paced breathing + skills to relax -Therapist + self-applied -8 weeks: unrep. hour/week | -Albert Einstein College of Medicine  -Unrep. | A clinical psychology post-doctoral fellow and advanced graduate students | Post  13 weeks | CBT: 59.3%  Other: 61.5% | -Panic Disorder Severity Scale  -Clinical Global Impression  -Anxiety Sensitivity Index  -Body Sensations Questionnaire  -Agoraphobia Cognitions Questionnaire  -Beck Depression Inventory  -Medication Adherence Report | -Asthma Control Questionnaire -Pulmonary Function  -Mini Asthma Quality of Life Questionnaire  -Use of rescue medication  -Heart rate (HR)  -HR variability  -Respiration rate  -End-tidal carbon dioxide | +  +  -  + | *+*  *+*  *+* |
| Greist, 2002  USA | OCD | Mn: 39.0  SD: 12.0 | 42.0% | **BT(a):** **Exposure + response prevention** (n=74)  -In vivo computer-guided self-exposure + response prevention  -9 modules (Mn: 140.5 ± 222.4 min.)  **BT(b): Exposure + response prevention** (n=69)  -In vivo therapist-guided self-exposure + response prevention  -11 weeks: 1 hour/week | **PR** (n=75)  -Muscle relaxation  -Manual + Audio + self-applied  -10 weeks: 7 hour/week. | -Unrep.  -Individual application | Experienced clinicians | Post | BT(a): 74.3%  BT(b): 79.7%  PR: 88.0% | -Yale-Brown Obsessive Compulsive Scale  -Hamilton Depression Scale  -Work and Social Adjustment Scale  -Self monitoring  -Patient and Clinical Global Impressions Scales |  | +  +  ?  + | *+*  *-*  *+* |
| Gross, 1982  USA | PHOB: (social) | Unrep. | 73.0% | **CT: Cog. Restructuring** (n=23)  -Therapist-applied  -2 weeks: 2.5 hour/week | **PR** (n=26)  -Muscle relaxation  -Therapist-applied  -2 weeks: 2.5 hour/week | -Unrep.  -Unrep. | Advanced graduate student | Post | 93.7% | -Behavior Checklist for Performance Anxiety  -Overall Rating of Anxiety  -Self-Reported Behavior  -Heart rate and skin conductance  -Social Avoidance and Distress Scale | -Autonomic Perception Questionnaire  -State Anxiety Scale  -Personal Report of Confidence as a Speaker  -Fear of Negative Evaluation Scale | +  -  -  - | *-*  *-*  *-* |
| Hayes Skelton, 2013  USA | GAD | AR:  Mn: 32.6  SD: 12.1  CBT:  Mn: 33.3  SD: 12.4 | AR:  70.7%    CBT:  60.0% | **CBT: ABBT** (n=40)  -Acceptance + values exercises + mindfulness + applying skills  -Therapist-applied  -16 weeks: 1.13 hour/week | **AR** (n=41)  -Muscle relaxation + cue-controlled, differential, rapid relaxation + diaphragmatic breathing + application skills  -Therapist-applied  -16 weeks: 1.13 hour/week | -Unrep.  -Unrep. | Post-doctoral or advanced doctoral students | Post  26 weeks | CBT: 75.0%  AR: 78.1% | -Diagnostic status, responder status, and end-state functioning  -Hamilton Anxiety Scale  -Penn State Worry Questionnaire  -State-Trait Anxiety Inventory | -Depression Anxiety Stress Scale (stress)  -Beck Depression Inventory  -Quality of Life Inventory  -Number of additional diagnoses | +  +  -  + | *+*  *+*  *+* |
| Millstein, 2015  USA |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | Post  26 weeks  52 weeks |  | -Clinician’s severity rating  -Inventory of Interpersonal Problems Circumplex Scales | -Five Facet Mindfulness Questionnaire |  |  |
| Eustis, 2016  USA |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | Post |  | -Acceptance and Action Questionnaire |  |  |  |
| Howard, 1983  Australia | PHOB(flying) | Mn: 44.6 | 80.4%. | **BT(a): Desensitization** (n=11)  -Progressive muscle relaxation + imaging graduated exposure  -Therapist-applied  -8 weeks: 1 hour/week  **BT(b): Flooding** (n=11)  -Imaging flooding exposure  -Therapist-applied  -8 weeks: 1 hour/week  **BT(c): Implosion** (n=11)  -Imaging flooding exposure incorporating catastrophic consequences  -Therapist-applied  -8 weeks: 1 hour/week | **Other** (n=13)  -Muscle relaxation + meditation  -Therapist + Self-applied  -8 weeks: 1 hour/week | -Unrep.  -Group application | One doctoral student with clinical experience, and one senior undergraduate with limited experience | Post | BT(a): 81.8%  BT(b): 90.9%  BT(c): 90.9%  Other: 92.3% | -Behavioural test (subjects who flew in a half hour flight one week after treatment) |  | +  -  -  - | +  -  + |
| Hoyer, 2009  Germany | GAD | Mn: 45.4  SD: 12.5 | 52.7% | **BT:** **Exposure** (n=36)  -Psychoeducation + self-monitoring of worry + avoidance reduction  -Therapist + self-exposure  -15 weeks: length unreported | **AR** (n=32)  -Muscle relaxation + differential, rapid relaxation + relaxation skills during daily activities  -Therapist + self-applied  -15 weeks: length unreported | -Dresden University  -Unrep. | Clinical psychologists in postgraduate psychotherapy training | Post  26 weeks  52 weeks | BT: 80.6%  AR: 87.5% | -Hamilton anxiety rating scale  -State-trait anxiety scale  -Penn state worry questionnaire  -White bear suppression inventory  -Brief Symptom Inventory | -Beck depression inventory  -Clinical global impression of Improvement  -Hamilton depression scale  -Metacognition questionnaire  -Treatment Response and End-State Functioning | +  +  -  + | *+*  *+*  *+* |
| Korrelboom, 2014  Netherlands | PANIC (with or without agoraphobia) | Mn: 36.1  SD: 11.9 | 64.0% | **CBT:** **COMET** (n=70)  -Imaging control situations + formulating positive self-statements + graduated interoceptive exposure  -Therapist-applied  -7 weeks: 1.5 hour/week | **AR** (n=73)  -Muscle relaxation + cue-controlled + differential, rapid relaxation + applied relaxation  -Therapist-applied  -7 weeks:1.5 hour/week | -Department of Anxiety Disorders  -Group application | Trained psychologist and nurses | Post | CBT: 84.3%  AR: 82.2% | -Panic Appraisal Inventory  -Mobility Inventory |  | +  -  -  + | *+*  *+*  *+* |
| Kushner, 2013  USA | MIXED: (social, GAD, panic) + alcohol use disorder | Mn: 39.8  SD: 10.5 | 40.9% | **CBT:** **Exposure + cognitive restructuring** (n=171)  -Psychoeducation + modifying catastrophic thinking + breaking the drinking/anxiety connection  -Therapist-applied  -6 weeks: 1 hour/week | **PR** (n=173)  -Muscle relaxation  -Therapist-applied  -6 weeks: 1 hour/week | -Community-based residential treatment program  -Individual application | Doctoral-level psychologists | Post  17 weeks | CBT: 94.2%  PR: 96.0% | -Time line follow-back interview  -State-Trait Anxiety Inventory |  | +  +  -  - | *+*  *+*  *-* |
| Marks, 1993  UK | PANIC (with agoraphobia) | Mn: 35.0  SD: Unrep. | 81.0% | **BT: Exposure + Plc.** (n=38)  -Self-exposure + placebo  -In vivo and graduated  -Therapist-applied  -8 weeks: 3.6 hour/week | **PR + Plc.** (n=39)  -Muscle relaxation + placebo  -Therapist + self-applied  -8 weeks: 1 hour/week | -Unrep.  -Individual application | Experienced behavior therapist (psychiatrist, nurse or other) | Post  10 weeks  15 weeks  35 weeks | BT: 82.0%  PR: 87.0% | -Four phobic targets  -PQ Agoraphobia  -Number of major panics  -Spontaneous major panics  -Hamilton Depression | -Work/social disability  -Clinician's Global impression of Improvement | +  +  +  - | *+*  *-*  *+* |
| Curran, 1994  UK |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | Post  16 weeks |  | -Subjective Assessment of memory | -News Bulletin Recall |  |  |
| Marks, 1998  UK | PTSD | CT:  Mn: 39.0  SD: 9.0  BT:  Mn: 39.0  SD: 11.0  CBT:  Mn: 38.0  SD: 9.0  PR:  Mn: 36.0  SD: 10.0 | 36.0% | **CT(a): Cog. restructuring** (n=19)  -Modifying catastrophic thinking + appraise belief about themselves  -10 weeks: 1.5 hour/week  **BT(b): Exposure** (n=23)  -Imagination + in vivo and graduated therapist + self-exposure by audio  -10 weeks: 1.5 hour/week  **CBT(c):** **Exposure + cog. restructuring** (n=24)  -Imagination + in vivo + modifying thoughts emerged during exposure  -10 weeks: 1.75 hour/week | **PR** (n=21)  -Muscle relaxation  -Therapist + self-applied (audio)  -10 weeks: 1.5 hour/week | -Unrep.  -Individual application | A nurse and a clinical psychologist experienced in CBT | Post  4 weeks  13 weeks | CT: 94.7%  BT: 87.0%  CBT: 79.2%  PR: 95.2% | -Clinician-Administered PTSD Scale (CAPS2)  -Work/Social Adjustment  -Clinician's Global Impression  -Patient's Global Impression  -Problems and Targets  -Impact of Events Scale  -Beck Depression Inventory  -PTSD Symptoms Scale  -State-Trait Anxiety Inventory |  | +  +  -  + | *+*  *+*  *+* |
| McNamee, 1989  UK | PANIC (with agoraphobia) | Mn: 45.0 Rg: 29-60 | 88.9% | **BT: Exposure** (n=13)  -In vivo and graduated  -Self-exposure (phone)  -12 weeks: 8 hour/week | **PR** (n=10)  -Muscle relaxation  -Self-applied (audio)  -12 weeks: 7 hour/week | -Telephoned guidance  -Individual application | Therapist | Post  20 weeks | BT: 69.2%  PR: 90.0% | -4 Phobic targets  -Global Impression  -Global phobia  -Beck Depression Inventory | -Weekly diaries  -Social adjustment | +  +  +  - | *+*  *-*  *-* |
| Meuret, 2017  USA | PHOB (blood) | BT:  Mn: 26.0  BT:  Mn: 30.0  Other:  Mn: 27.9 | 81.7% | **BT(a): HRT** (n=20)  -Psychoeducation + regulating breathing to reduce hyperventilation  -Therapist-applied  -1 week: 0.30 hours/week  **BT(b): SAT** (n=20)  -Psychoeducation + tensing muscles + release (not relaxation)  -Therapist-applied  -1 week: 0.30 hours/week | **Other** (n=20)  -Education about fear and muscle tension + muscle relaxation without the initial tensing that is typical of progressive muscle relaxation  -Therapist-applied  -1 week: 0.30 hours/week | -Southern Methodist University, Dallas  -Group application | A novice ﬁrst-year graduate student | Post | BT(a): 100%  BT(b): 100%  Other: 100% | -Application success  -Perceived helpfulness  -Perceived Anxiety  -Heart Rate  -End-tidal carbon-dioxide partial pressure |  | +  -  -  - | *+*  *-*  *-* |
| Michelson, 1985  USA | PANIC (with agoraphobia) | Mn: 40.0 SD: 10.4 | 87.1% | **CT(a): Paradox. Intention** (n=11)  -Welcome/exaggerate fear + humor  -Therapist + self-applied  -12 weeks: 2 hours/week  **BT(b): Exposure** (n=16)  -In vivo and graduated  -Therapist + self-applied  -12 weeks: 2 hours/week | **AR** (n=12)  -Muscle + cue-controlled + differential + breathing + imagery + coping skills  -Therapist + self-applied  -12 weeks: 2 hours/week | -Psychiatric Institute and Clinic of the University of Pittsburgh  -Group application | Four licensed clinical psychologists | Post  13 weeks | CT(a): 90.9%  BT(b): 68.8%  AR: 83.3% | -Global Severity Assessor  -Self-Rating Severity  -Fear Survey Schedule  -Fear Questionnaire  -Phobic Anxiety Avoidance  -Taylor Manifest Anxiety Scale  -Panic Scale  -Beck Depression Inventory | -Locus of Control  -Assertiveness Scale  -Heart Rate  -Subjective Discomfort  -Behavioral Avoidance  -Spontaneous Panic Attacks  -End-state functioning and Improvement | +  -  +  - | *-*  *-*  *+* |
| Michelson, 1988  USA | PANIC (with agoraphobia) | Mn: 37.0 SD: 9.4 | 78.0% | **CT(a): Paradox. Intention** (n=31)  -Welcome/exaggerate fear + humor  -Therapist + self-applied  -12 weeks: 2 hours/week  **BT(b): Exposure** (n=28)  -In vivo and graduated  -Therapist + self-applied  -12 weeks: 2 hours/week | **AR** (n=29)  -Muscle + cue-controlled + differential + breathing + imagery + coping skills  -Therapist + self-applied  -12 weeks: 2 hours/week | -Psychiatric Institute and Clinic of the University of Pittsburgh  -Group application | Three licensed clinical psychologists | Post  13 weeks | CT(a): 83.9%  BT(b): 78.6%  AR: 86.2% | -Global Severity Assessor  -Self-Rating Severity  -Phobic Anxiety Avoidance  -Fear Questionnaire  -Fear Survey Schedule  -Taylor Manifest Anxiety Scale  -Zung Anxiety/Depression  -Beck Depression Inventory  -Hopkins Symptom Checklist | -Panic severity and symptoms  -Assertiveness Scale  -Locus of Control  -Marital Adjustment scale  -Behavioral Avoidance  -Subjective Discomfort  -Spontaneous Panic Attacks  -End-state functioning and Improvement | +  -  +  - | *-*  *-*  *+* |
| Michelson,1990  USA |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | Post  13 weeks |  | -Heart Rate |  |  |  |
| Milrod, 2015  USA | PANIC(with or without agoraphobia) | Mn: 38.8  SD: 13.2 | 68.0% | **CBT: Exposure + Cog. restructuring** (n=81)  -Interoceptive + in vivo + psycho-education + modifying catastrophic thinking + diaphragmatic breathing  -Therapist + self-applied  -12 weeks: 1.5 hours/week | **AR** (n=39)  -Muscle + discrimination training + generalization + relaxation by recall + cue-controlled relaxation  -Therapist + self-applied  -12 weeks: 1.5 hours/week | -Medical College and University of Pennsylvania  -Individual application | Thirty Therapist with a mean of 13 years of post-degree experience (SD=8.1) | Post | CBT: 75.3%  AR: 59.0% | -Panic Disorder Severity Scale  -Serious adverse events |  | +  +  +  + | *+*  *+*  *+* | |
| Mühlberger, 2001  Germany | PHOB(flying) | BT:  Mn: 43.9 SD: 10.6  PR:  Mn: 42.2  SD: 9.1 | 86.7% | **BT: Exposure** (n=15)-Virtual reality + graduated -Therapist -1 week: 1.1 hours/week | **PR** (n=15)  -Muscle relaxation  -Self applied (audio)  -1 week: 1.1 hours/week | -Institute of Graphic Data-Processing  -Group application | Two advanced graduate clinical psychology students | Post | BT: 100%  PR: 86.7% | -Subjective Units of Discomfort  -Hear Rate  -Skin Conductance  -Fear of Flying Scale  -Fear of flying rating  -Avoidance of flying rating  -Anxiety Expectancy Scale | -Danger Expectancy Scale  -Anxiety Sensitivity Index | +  -  -  - | *+*  *-*  *-* | |
| Norton, 2012  USA | MIXED:  social, panic with/without agora, GAD, specific phobia, OCD | Mn: 33.0 SD: 10.7 | 62.1% | **CBT: Transdiagnostic** (n=65)  -Psychoeducation + self-monitoring + Cog. restruct. + exposure (in vivo, role-played, imaging, interoceptive, graduated) + beliefs of control  -Therapist + self-applied  -12 weeks: 2 hours/week | **Other** (n=22)  -Muscle + cue-control + imagery + breathing retraining  -Therapist + self-applied (audio)  -12 weeks: 2 hours/week | -University of Houston Anxiety Disorder Clinic  -Group application | Doctoral level graduate students under the supervision of a PhD clinical psychologist | Post | CBT: 98.5%  Other: 95.5% | -Anxiety Disorder Diagnostic Questionnaire  -Panic Disorder Severity Scale  -Social Phobia Diagnostic Questionnaire  -Generalized Anxiety Disorder Questionnaire | -Beck Anxiety Inventory | +  +  +  + | *+*  *+*  *+* | |
| Öst, 1981  Sweden | PHOB: (social) (behav. and physiol. reactors) | Mn: 34.4 Rg: 21-51 | 59.4% | **BT: Social skills** (n=16)  -Psychoeducation + rank of situations + role-playing  -Therapist + self-applied  -12 weeks: 1 hour/week | **AR** (n=16)  -Muscle + cue-control + differential + coping skills  -Therapist + self-applied  -12 weeks: 1 hour/week | -Ulleraker Mental Hospital  -Individual application | Two graduate students with 4 years clinical experience | Post | Unrep. | -Fear Survey Schedule-III  -Social Situations Questionnaire (frequency)  -Five Individual situations  -Frequency Social activities  -Frequency Social Contacts | -Fear thermometer  -Social Interaction test  -Overall change score | +  +  -  - | *+*  *-*  *-* | |
| Öst, 1982  Sweden | PHOB (claustro) (behav. and physiol. reactors) | Mn: 36.4 Rg: 20-60 | 88.2% | **BT: Exposure** (n=17)  -In vivo + graduated + modeling + prompting + social reinforcement  -Therapist + self-applied  -10 weeks: 1 hour/week | **AR** (n=17)  -Muscle + cue-control + differential + coping skills  -Therapist + self-applied  -10 weeks: 1 hour/week | -Ulleraker Mental Hospital  -Individual application | Two graduate students with 5 years clinical experience | Post  60 weeks | BT: 100%  AR: 100% | -Behavioural test  -Fear thermometer  -Five Individual situations  -Claustrophobia Scale  -Fear Survey Schedule-III | -Autonomic Perception Questionnaire  -Heart rate  -Overall change score  -Clinical significance | +  +  -  - | *-*  *-*  *-* | |
| Öst, 1984 (a)  Sweden | PHOB (agora) (behav. and physiol. reactors) | Mn: 36.2 Rg: 25-52 | 95.0% | **BT: Exposure** (n=20)  -In vivo + graduated  -Therapist + self-applied  -12 weeks: 1 hour/week | **AR** (n=20)  -Muscle + release + differential + cue-controlled + coping skills  -Therapist + self-applied  -12 weeks: 1 hour/week | -Ulleraker Mental Hospital  -Individual application | Two graduate students with 5 years clinical experience | Post | BT: 85.0%  AR: 95.0% | -Agoraphobia Scale  -Agoraphobia Questionnaire  -Individual Hierarchy  -Acute Panic Inventory  -Fear Survey Schedule-III  -Beck Depression Inventory  -Maudsley Marital Questionnaire | -Autonomic Perception Questionnaire  -Specific Negative Thoughts  -Behavioural test  -Heart rate  -Self rating on anxiety  -Overall change score  -Clinical significance | +  +  -  - | *-*  *-*  *-* | |
| Öst, 1984 (b)  Sweden | PHOB (blood) | Mn: 31.0  Rg: 21-44 | 66.7% | **BT: Exposure** (n=9)  -In vivo + graduated + modeling + prompting + social reinforcement  -Therapist + self-applied  -9 weeks: 1 hour/week | **Other** (n=9)  -Muscle + release + cue-controlled + differential + applied tension + coping skills  -Therapist + self-applied  -9 weeks: 1 hour/week | -Ulleraker Mental Hospital  -Individual application | Two undergraduate students I-year clinical experience | Post  26 weeks | BT: 100%  Other: 77.8% | -Mutilation Questionnaire  -Fear Survey Schedule-III  -Self-Rating of Anxiety  -Rating of fainting behavior -Time watching the film  -Adverse reactions | -Diastolic pressure  -Overall change score  -Blood donor | +  +  -  - | *-*  *-*  *-* | |
| Öst, 1989  Sweden | PHOB (blood) | Mn: 31.7  Rg: 18-51 | 63.3% | **BT: SAT** (n=10)  -Tensing the muscles of the arms, the chest, and the legs, until a feeling of warmth is rising in the face  -Therapist + self-applied  -5 weeks: 1 hour/week | **AR** (n=10)  -Muscle + tension-release + release only + cue-controlled + differential + coping skills  -Therapist-applied  -9 weeks: 1 hour/week | -Ulleraker Mental Hospital  -Individual application | Two graduate students, 3-year clinical experience | Post  26 weeks | BT: 90.0%  AR: 90.0% | -Self-rating of anxiety  -Thought index and ratio  -Mutilation Questionnaire  -Fear Survey Schedule-III  -Time watching the film  -Rating of fainting behavior | -ΔHR (hear rate)  -Clinically significant improvement | +  -  -  - | *+*  *+*  *-* | |
| Öst, 1993  Sweden | PANIC (with agoraphobia) | Mn: 37.4 SD: 8.4 | 66.7% | **CT(a): Cog. restructuring + self-instructions** (n=15)  -Cognitive restructuring + positive self-instructions + cognitive coping  -Therapist + self-applied -12 weeks: 1 hour/week  **BT(b): Exposure** (n=16)-In vivo and graduated -Therapist + self-applied  -12 weeks: 1 hour/week | **AR** (n=15)  -Muscle + release + cue-controlled + differential + rapid + coping skills relaxation  -Therapist + self-applied  -12 weeks: 1 hour/week | -Ulleraker Mental Hospital  -Individual application | Two graduate students with 3 years clinical experience | Post  52 weeks | CT(a): 100%  BT(b): 93.3%  AR: 100% | -Agoraphobia Scale  -Mobility Inventory  -Fear Questionnaire  -Agoraphobic Cognitions Questionnaire  -Body Sensations Questionnaire  -Blood/Injury Scale  -Social Phobia Scale  -State Trait Anxiety Inventory | -Beck Depression Inventory  -Self-defeating statements  -Positive coping statements  -Clinical significance | +  +  -  - | *+*  *+*  *-* | |
| Öst, 1995  Sweden | PANIC (with no or mild agoraphobia) | Mn: 32.6 SD: 7.1 | 68.4% | **CBT: Cog. restructuring + behavioral experiments** (n=19)  -Identifying misinterpretations + generating non catastrophic thoughts + behavioral experiments  -Therapist + self-applied  -12 weeks: 1 hour/week | **AR** (n=19)  -Muscle + release + cue-controlled + differential + rapid + coping skills relaxation  -Therapist + self-applied  -12 weeks: 1hour/week | -University Hospital of Uppsala  -Individual application | Four therapist with 5-13 year clinical experience | Post  52 weeks | CBT: 100%  AR: 89.5% | -Hamilton Anxiety Scale  -Beck Anxiety Inventory  -State-trait Anxiety Inventory  -Self-report Anxiety Scale  -Body Sensations Questionnaire  -Hamilton Depression Scale | -Beck Depression Inventory  -Panic free  -End-state functioning  -Medication | +  +  -  - | *+*  *+*  *-* | |
| Öst, 2000  Sweden | GAD | Mn:41.1  SD: 9.7 | 72.2% | **CT: Cog. restructuring** (n=18)  -Identifying + questioning thoughts + alternative assumptions + behavioral experiments + coping skills  -Therapist + self-applied  -12 weeks: 1 hour/week | **AR** (n=18)  -Muscle + release + cue-controlled + differential + rapid + coping skills relaxation  -Therapist + self-applied  -12 weeks: 1hour/week | -Unrep.  -Individual application | Two therapists with 8/16 year clinical experience | Post  52 weeks | CT: 94.4%  AR: 88.9% | -Hamilton Anxiety Scale  -Hamilton Depression Scale  -Severity  -Number of worries  -Beck Anxiety Inventory  -Beck Depression Inventory | -Penn State Worry Questionnaire  -Cognitive Somatic Anxiety Questionnaire  -State-Trait Anxiety Inventory  -Clinical significance | +  +  -  - | *+*  *-*  *-* | |
| Peal, 1981  USA | PHOB: (death) | BT:  Mn: 19.5  PR:  Mn: 20.6 | 61.5% | **BT: Desensitization** (n=13)  -Relaxation + Imaging + graduated exposure  -Therapist-accompanied  -8 weeks: 0.5 hour/week | **PR** (n=13)  -Muscle relaxation  -Therapist-accompanied  -8 weeks: 0.5 hour/week | -Unrep.  -Individual application | Unrep. | Post | Unrep. | -Templer Death Anxiety Scale  -Revised Livingston and Zimet Death Anxiety Scale  -Feifel and Branscomb’s color-word interference test |  | +  -  -  - | +  -  - |
| Pendleton, 1983  USA | PHOB: (acro) | Mn: 23.1  SD: 5.4 | 74.2% | **BT(a): Desensitization** (n=15)  -Breathing + imaging + graduated exposure + relax skills  -Therapist-accompanied (audio)  -6 weeks: 0.75 hour/week  **BT(b): Exposure** (n=15)  -Graduated interoceptive exposure  -Therapist-accompanied (audio)  -6 weeks: 0.75 hour/week | **Other** (n=15)  -Muscle + breathing + imagery  -Therapist-accompanied (audio)  -6 weeks: 0.75 hour/week | -University of Kansas  -Individual application | Two female therapists extensively trained | Post | BT(a): 100%  BT(b): 86.7%  Other: 86.7% | -Acrophobia questionnaire (anxiety and avoidance)  -Acrophobia behavioural test  -Acrophobia fear thermometer  -Improvement rating |  | +  +  +  - | +  +  + |
| Russell, 1976  USA | PHOB: (social)  (test) | Unrep. | Unrep. | **BT: Desensitization** (n=7)  -Imaging + graduated exposure  -Therapist + self-applied  -5 weeks: 0.75 hour/week | **Other** (n=9)  -Breathing + cue-controlled  -Therapist + self-applied  -5 weeks: 0.50 hour/week | -Unrep.  -Individual application | The authors, who had prior experience with both treatments | Post | BT: 71.4%  Other: 77.8% | -Test Anxiety Scale  -S-R Inventory of Anxiousness  -State-Trait Anxiety Inventory (Trait form) | -Anxiety Differential | ?  +  -  - | +  +  - |
| Taylor, 2003  Canada | PTSD | Mn: 37.0  SD: 10.0 | 75.0%. | **BT: Exposure** (n=22)  -Imaging + in vivo + graduated exposure  -Therapist + self-applied (audio)  -8 weeks: 1.5 hour/week | **Other** (n=19)  -Three different relaxation exercises to choose  -Therapist + self-applied (audio)  -8 weeks: 1.5 hour/week | -Unrep.  -Individual application | Two therapist under the supervision of a doctoral-level psychologist | Post  13 weeks | BT: 68.2%  Other: 79.0% | -Remission  -Sustained remission |  | +  +  +  + | +  +  + |
| Stapleton, 2006  Canada |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | -Trauma-related anger  -Trauma-related guilt  -Guilt Inventory | -Trait Anger Expression Inventory  -Worsening of Anger and Guilt |  |  |
| Thompson, 1999  Australia | GAD | Mn: 21.6 | 84.9% | **CT: Counterfact. reasoning** (n=12) -Generating alternative, optimistic, predictions for future events -Therapist + self-applied -4 weeks: 0.5 hour/week | **Other** (n=12)  -Muscle + breathing + concentration techniques  -Therapist + self-applied (audio)  -4 weeks: 0.5 hour/week | -University of Tasmania  -Group application | Unrep. | Post | CT: 83.3%  Other: 91.7% | -Penn State Worry Questionnaire  -Worry Domains Questionnaire  -DP/SO Strategy Prototypes Questionnaire  -Optimism-Pessimism Questionnaire  -Percentage of Day worrying | -Intrusiveness of worries  -Likelihood of worries occurring  -Intrusiveness  -Likelihood of general worries  -Homework motivation  -Homework effectiveness  -Number of days practice | +  +  -  - | *+*  *-*  *-* | |
| Vaughan, 1994  Australia | PTSD | Mn: 32.0  SD: 14.7 | 63.9% | **BT: Exposure** (n=13)  -Imaging + listening to audiotaped descriptions of the trauma  -Therapist + self-applied (audio)  -2 weeks: 1.67 hour/week | **AR** (n=11)  -Muscle + release + cue-controlled + differential + rapid  -Therapist + self-applied  -2 weeks: 1.67 hour/week | -PTSD Clinic  -Individual application | Trained Therapist | Post  13 weeks | Unrep. | -PTSD Structured Interview  -Hamilton Rating  Scale for Depression  -State-Trait Anxiety Inventory  -Beck Depression Inventory | -Impact of Events Scale | +  +  +  - | *+*  *+*  *-* | |
| Wells, 2010  UK | GAD | Mn: 49.1  Rg: 25-78 | 60.0% | **CT: Metacognitive therapy** (n=10)  -Believes about worry + verbal strategies + behavioral experiments + mindfulness to cope with intrusive thoughts + worry postponement + challenging believes  -Therapist + self-applied  -10 weeks: 1 hour/week | **AR** (n=10)  -Muscle + release + cue-controlled + differential + rapid + coping skills relaxation  -Therapist + self-applied  -10 weeks: 1 hour/week | -Unrep.  -Individual application | Trained Therapist | Post  26 weeks  52 weeks | CT: 100%  AR: 90.0% | -State-Trait anxiety inventory  -Penn-State Worry Questionnaire  -Beck Anxiety Inventory  -Metacognitions Questionnaire  -Recovery and clinically significant change  -SCID Diagnosis |  | +  +  +  - | *+*  *+*  *+* | |
| White, 1983  USA | PHOB: (death) | BT:  Mn: 19.3  PR:  Mn: 20.7 | 93.3% | **BT: Desensitization** (n=8)  -Muscle relaxation + imaging + graduated exposure  -Therapist-applied  -10 weeks: 0.58 hour/week | **PR** (n=8)  -Muscle relaxation  -Therapist-applied  -10 weeks: 0.58 hour/week | -University School of Nursing  -Group application | Unrep. | Post  22 weeks | CT: 100%  PR: 87.5% | -Templer DAS  -Revised Livingston and Zimet DAS  -Feifel CWlT |  | +  -  -  - | *+*  *-*  *-* | |
| Willumsen, 2001  Norway | PHOB: (dental) | CBT:  Mn: 32.5  SD: 9.8  AR:  Mn: 36.4  SD: 10.2 | 64.0% | **CBT: Cog. restructuring + exposure** (n=21)  -Identifying, challenging and substituting misinterpretations + exposure of feared situations + testing negative thoughts  -Therapist + self-applied  -10 weeks: unrep. hour/week | **AR** (n=23)  -Muscle relaxation + to learn to recognize early signs of anxiety + to cope with this anxiety by initiating relaxation  -Therapist + self-applied (audio)  -10 weeks: unrep. hour/week | -Dental Faculty, University of Oslo  -Group application | Trained psychologists | Post | CBT: 100%  AR: 91.3% | -Sessions before first injection  -Sessions before first use of dental drill  -Filled tooth surfaces during treatment  -Patient’s assessments of Specific treatment method  -Predictability | -Control  -Pain control  -Increased self-efficacy  -Dental Anxiety Scale  -Dental Belief Scale  -Dental Fear Scale (arousal and situations) | +  -  -  - | *+*  *+*  *+* | |
| Willumsen, 2001  Norway |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 52 weeks |  | -Dental treatment sessions attended, non-attended and percentage of non-attended | -Difficulties changing clinic  -Evaluation of the treatment |  |  | |
| Wolitzi-Taylor, 2010  USA | GAD (academic worry) | Unrep. | 75.2% | **BT: Exposure** (n=33)  -Imaging + graduate exposure of worry-provoking loop tape  -Self-applied (online)  -4 weeks: 0.75 hour/week | **Other** (n=29)  -Pulsed audio-photic stimulation (brain-wave entrainment)  -Self-applied (online)  -4 weeks: 1 hour/week | -Online home practice  -Unrep. | Web-based | Post  13 weeks | BT: 69.7%  Other: 82.8% | -Academic Worry Questionnaire  -Penn State Worry Questionnaire  -Perceived Stress Scale | -Health care utilization  -Semester Grade  -Reliable change  -Maintenance of gains | +  -  -  + | *+*  *-*  *-* | |
| Zargar, 2013  Iran | GAD | AP:  Mn: 42.7  SD: 9.4  CBT:  Mn: 34.5  SD: 7.2 | 100% | **CBT: ABBT** (n=11)  -Awareness of patterns of anxious responding, emotions, experiential avoidance + formal and informal mindfulness + values  -Therapist + self-applied  -12 weeks: 1.5 hour/week | **AR** (n=11)  -Muscle + rapid relaxation + recognizing signs of anxiety + applying relaxation skills  -Therapist + self-applied  -12 weeks: 1 hour/week | -Isfahan University of Medical Sciences  -Unrep. |  | Post | CBT: 82.0%  AR: 82.0% | -Valued Living Questionnaire  -Action, and Acceptance Questionnaire  -Short‑Form Health Survey‑12 revised Version (SF‑12V2) |  | +  -  -  - | *+*  *-*  *-* | |

GAD: generalized anxiety disorder. PANIC: panic disorder. PHOB: any phobia. PTSD: posttraumatic stress disorder. OCD: obsessive-compulsive disorder. MIXED: mixed disorders. Dashed lines separates the same study analysed by different articles (reporting distinct time measures, outcomes, parameters, etc). (a), (b), and (c), are different comparisons belonging to the same study. CR: completion rate. St: study quality (Higgins et al., 2011): low (-) / high (+) / unclear (?), from top to down: adequate generation of allocation sequence, concealment of allocation to conditions, prevention of knowledge of the allocated intervention, and dealing with incomplete outcome data. In: intervention quality (Chambless, 1998): low (-) / high (+) / unclear (?), from top to down: the study referred to the use of a treatment manual; the therapists who conducted the therapy were trained; treatment integrity was checked during the study. Mn: mean. SD: standard deviation. Rg: range. BT: behavioural therapy. CT: cognitive therapy. CBT: cognitive-behavioural therapy. PR: progressive relaxation. AP: applied relaxation. Other: other different relaxation technique. Unrep.: unreported data. CBPT: cognitive behaviour psychophysiological therapy. ABBT: Acceptance-Based Behaviour Therapy. COMET: Competitive Memory Training. HRT: Hypoventilation Respiratory Training. SAT: Symptom-Associated Tension. Cog. restructuring: cognitive restructuring. Paradox. Intention: Paradoxical intention. Counterfact. reasoning: counterfactual reasoning. Plc: placebo. Behav. and physiol. reactors: behavioural and physiological reactors.

**Online Supplementary Material 3: References of the included studies**

**Al-Kubaisy T, Marks IM, Logsdail S, Marks MP, Lovell K, Sungur M**, **Araya R** (1992). Role of exposure homework in phobia reduction: a controlled study. ***Behavior Therapy* 23**, 599-621.

**Arntz A, Van den Hout M** (1996). Psychological treatments of panic disorder without agoraphobia: cognitive therapy versus applied relaxation. *Behavior Research and Therapy***34**, 113-121.

**Arntz, A** (2003). Cognitive therapy versus applied relaxation as treatment of generalized anxiety disorder. *Behavior Research and Therapy* **41**, 633-646.

**Barlow DH, Craske MG, Cerny JA, Klosko JS** (1989). Behavioral treatment of panic disorder. ***Behavior Therapy* 20**, 261-282.

**Barlow DH, Rapee RM, Brown TA** (1992). Behavioral treatment of generalized anxiety disorder. ***Behavior Therapy* 23**, 551-570.

**Beck J G, Stanley MA, Baldwin LE, Deagle EA, Averill PM** (1994). Comparison of cognitive therapy and relaxation training for panic disorder. *Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology* **62**, 818-826.

**Bedell JR, Robert PA, Michael R** (1979). Relaxation therapy, desensitization, and the treatment of anxiety‐based disorders. *Journal of Clinical Psychology* **35**, 840-843.

**Borkovec TD, Costello E** (1993). Efficacy of applied relaxation and cognitive-behavioral therapy in the treatment of generalized anxiety disorder. *Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology* **61**, 611-619.

**Clark DM, Salkovskis PM, Hackmann A, Middleton H, Anastasiades P, Gelder MA** (1994). Comparison of cognitive therapy, applied relaxation and imipramine in the treatment of panic disorder. *British Journal of Psychiatry* **164**, 759-769.

**Craske MG, Brown TA, Barlow DH** (1991). Behavioral treatment of panic disorder: A two-year follow-up. ***Behavior Therapy*** **22**, 289-304.

**Curran HV, Bond A, O'Sullivan G, Bruce M, Marks I, Lelliot P, Shine P, Lader M** (1994). Memory functions, alprazolam and exposure therapy: a controlled longitudinal study of agoraphobia with panic disorder. *Psychological Medicine* **24**, 969-976.

**Deffenbacher JL, Rudolf MH** (1981). Cognitive and relaxation coping skills in stress inoculation. *Cognitive Therapy and Research* **5**, 211-215.

**Donegan E, Dugas MJ** (2012). Generalized anxiety disorder: A comparison of symptom change in adults receiving cognitive-behavioral therapy or applied relaxation. *Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology* **80**, 490-496.

**Dugas M J, Brillon P, Savard P, Turcotte J, Gaudet A, Ladouceur R,** **Leblanc R, Gervais NJ** (2010). A randomized clinical trial of cognitive-behavioral therapy and applied relaxation for adults with generalized anxiety disorder. ***Behavior Therapy*** **41**, 46-58.

**Echeburua E, De Corral P, Zubizarreta I, Sarasua B** (1997). Psychological treatment of chronic posttraumatic stress disorder in victims of sexual aggression. *Behavior Modification* **21**, 433-456.

**Eustis EH, Hayes-Skelton SA, Roemer L, Orsillo SM** (2016). Reductions in experiential avoidance as a mediator of change in symptom outcome and quality of life in acceptance-based behavior therapy and applied relaxation for generalized anxiety disorder. *Behaviour Research and Therapy* **87**, 188-195.

**Fals-Stewart W, Marks AP, Schafer J** (1993). A comparison of behavioral group therapy and individual behavior therapy in treating obsessive-compulsive disorder. *Journal of Nervous and Mental Disease* **181**, 189-193.

**Fals-Stewart W, Schafer J** (1992). The treatment of substance abusers diagnosed with obsessive-compulsive disorder: an outcome study. *Journal of Substance Abuse Treatment* **9**, 365-370.

**Feldman J M, Matte L, Interian A, Lehrer PM, Lu SE, Scheckner B, Steinberg DM, Oken T, Kotay A, Sinha S, Shim C** (2016). Psychological treatment of comorbid asthma and panic disorder in Latino adults: results from a randomized controlled trial. *Behavior Research and Therapy* **87**, 142-154.

**Greist JH, Marks IM, Baer L, Kobak KA, Wenzel KW, Hirsch MJ**, **Mantle JM, Clary C** (2002). Behavior therapy for obsessive-compulsive disorder guided by a computer or by a clinician compared with relaxation as a control. *Journal of Clinical*Psychiatry **63**, 138-145.

**Gross RT, William JF** (1982). Cognitive restructuring and progressive relaxation for treatment of empirical subtypes of speech-anxious subjects. *Cognitive Therapy and Research* **6**, 429-436.

**Hayes-Skelton SA, Roemer L, Orsillo SM** (2013). A randomized clinical trial comparing an acceptance-based behavior therapy to applied relaxation for generalized anxiety disorder. *Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology* **81**, 761-773.

**Howard WA, Shane MM, Clarke JC** (1983). The nature and treatment of fear of flying: A controlled investigation. ***Behavior Therapy*** **14**, 557-567.

**Hoyer J, Beesdo K, Gloster AT, Runge J, Höfler M, Becker ES** (2009). Worry exposure versus applied relaxation in the treatment of generalized anxiety disorder. *Psychotherapy Psychosomatics* **78**, 106-115.

**Korrelboom K, Peeters S, Blom S, Huijbrechts I** (2014). Competitive memory training COMET for panic and applied relaxation AR are equally effective in the treatment of panic in panic-disordered patients. *Journal of Contemporary Psychotherapy* **44**, 183-190.

**Kushner MG, Maurer EW, Thuras P, Donahue C, Frye B, Menary KR, Hobbs J, Haeny AM, Van Demark J** (2013). Hybrid cognitive behavioral therapy versus relaxation training for co-occurring anxiety and alcohol disorder: A randomized clinical trial. *Journal of Consulting Clinical Psychology***81**, 429-442.

**Marks I, Lovell K, Noshirvani H, Livanou M, Thrasher S** (1998). Treatment of posttraumatic stress disorder by exposure and/or cognitive restructuring: A controlled study. *Archives of General Psychiatry* **55**, 317-325.

**Marks IM, Swinson RP, Ba M, Kuch K, Noshirvani H, O'Sullivan G, Lelliot PT, Kirby M, McNamee G, Sengun S** (1993). Alprazolam and exposure alone and combined in panic disorder with agoraphobia. A controlled study in London and Toronto. *The British Journal of*Psychiatry **162**, 776-787.

**McNamee G, O'Sullivan G, Lelliott P, Marks I** (1989). Telephone-guided treatment for housebound agoraphobics with panic disorder: Exposure vs. relaxation. ***Behavior Therapy*** **20**, 491-497.

**Meuret AE, Simon E, Bhaskara L, Ritz T** (2017). Ultra‐brief behavioral skills trainings for blood injection injury phobia. *Depression and Anxiety*, 1-10.

**Michelson L, Mavissakalian M, Marchione K** (1985). Cognitive and behavioral treatments of agoraphobia: clinical, behavioral, and psychophysiological outcomes*. Journal of Consulting Clinical Psychology* **53**, 913-925.

**Michelson L, Mavissakalian M, Marchione K** (1988). Cognitive, behavioral, and psychophysiological treatments of agoraphobia: A comparative outcome investigation. *Behavior Therapy* **19**, 97-120.

**Michelson L, Mavissakalian M, Marchione K, Ulrich RF, Marchione N, Testa S** (1990). Psychophysiological outcome of cognitive, behavioral and psychophysiologically-based treatments of agoraphobia. *Behavior Research Therapy* **28**, 127-139.

**Millstein DJ, Orsillo SM, Hayes-Skelton SA, Roemer L** (2015). Interpersonal problems, mindfulness, and therapy outcome in an acceptance-based behavior therapy for generalized anxiety disorder. *Cognitive Behavior Therapy* **44**, 491-501.

**Milrod B, Chambless DL, Gallop R, Busch FN, Schwalberg M, McCarthy KS,** [**Gross C**](http://europepmc.org/search;jsessionid=F0AA272A4E06DAADC524BE420AB48E17?query=AUTH:%22Gross+C%22&page=1)**, [Sharpless BA](http://europepmc.org/search;jsessionid=F0AA272A4E06DAADC524BE420AB48E17?query=AUTH:%22Sharpless+BA%22&page=1),** [**Leon AC**](http://europepmc.org/search;jsessionid=F0AA272A4E06DAADC524BE420AB48E17?query=AUTH:%22Leon+AC%22&page=1)**,**[**Barber JP**](http://europepmc.org/search;jsessionid=F0AA272A4E06DAADC524BE420AB48E17?query=AUTH:%22Barber+JP%22&page=1) (2015). Psychotherapies for panic disorder: a tale of two sites. *Journal of Clinical*Psychiatry **76**, 1-9.

**Mühlberger A, Herrmann MJ, Wiedemann G, Ellgring H, Pauli P** (2001). Repeated exposure of flight phobics to flights in virtual reality. *Behavior Research and Therapy* **399**, 1033-1050.

**Norton PJ** (2012). A randomized clinical trial of transdiagnostic cognitve-behavioral treatments for anxiety disorder by comparison to relaxation training. *Behavior Therapy* **43**, 506-517.

**Öst LG, Breitholtz E** (2000). Applied relaxation vs. cognitive therapy in the treatment of generalized anxiety disorder. *Behavior Research and Therapy* **38**, 777-790.

**Öst LG, Jerremalm A, Jansson L** (1984). Individual response patterns and the effects of different behavioral methods in the treatment of agoraphobia. *Behavior Research and Therapy* **22**, 697-707.

**Ost LG, Jerremalm A, Johansson J** (1981). Individual response patterns and the effects of different behavioral methods in the treatment of social phobia. *Behavior Research and Therapy* **19**, 1-16.

**Öst LG, Johansson J, Jerremalm A** (1982). Individual response patterns and the effects of different behavioral methods in the treatment of claustrophobia. *Behavior Research and Therapy* **20**, 445-460.

**Öst LG, Sterner U, Fellenius J** (1989). Applied tension, applied relaxation, and the combination in the treatment of blood phobia. *Behavior Research and Therapy* **27**, 109-121.

**Öst LG, Westling BE** (1995). Applied relaxation vs cognitive behavior therapy in the treatment of panic disorder. *Behavior Research and Therapy* **33**, 145-158.

**Öst LG, Westling BE, Hellström K** (1993). Applied relaxation, exposure in vivo and cognitive methods in the treatment of panic disorder with agoraphobia. *Behavior Research and Therapy* **31**, 383-394.

**Öst, LG, Lindahl, I. L, Sterner U, Jerremalm A** (1984). Exposure in vivo vs applied relaxation in the treatment of blood phobia. *Behavior Research and Therapy* **223**, 205-216.

**Park JM, Mataix-Cols D, Marks IM, Ngamthipwatthana T, Marks M, Araya R, Al-Kubaisy T** (2001). Two-year follow-up after a randomised controlled trial of self-and clinician-accompanied exposure for phobia/panic disorders. *British Journal of Psychiatry* **178**, 543-548.

**Peal RL, Handal PJ, Gilner FH** (1982). A group desensitization procedure for the reduction of death anxiety. *Omega-Journal of Death and Dying* **12**, 61-70.

**Pendleton MG, Higgins RL** (1983). A comparison of negative practice and systematic desensitization in the treatment of acrophobia. *Journal of behavior therapy and experimental psychiatry* **147**, 317-323.

**Russell RK, Wise F, Stratoudakis JP** (1976). Treatment of test anxiety by cue-controlled relaxation and systematic desensitization. *Journal of Counseling Psychology* **23**, 563-566.

**Stapleton J A, Taylor S, Asmundson GJ** (2006). Effects of three PTSD treatments on anger and guilt: exposure therapy, eye movement desensitization and reprocessing, and relaxation training. Journal of Traumatic Stress **19**, 19-28.

**Taylor S, Thordarson DS, Maxfield L, Fedoroff IC, Lovell K, Ogrodniczuk J** (2003). Comparative efficacy, speed, and adverse effects of three PTSD treatments: exposure therapy, EMDR, and relaxation training. ‎*Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology***712**, 330-338.

**Thompson T, Mason B, Montgomery I** (1999). Worry and defensive pessimism: A test of two intervention strategies. *Behaviour Change* **16**, 246-258.

**Vaughan K, Armstrong MS, Gold R, O'Connor N, Jenneke W, Tarrier N** (1994). A trial of eye movement desensitization compared to image habituation training and applied muscle relaxation in post-traumatic stress disorder. *Journal of Behavior Therapy and Experimental Psychiatry* **254**, 283-291.

**Wells A, Welford M, King P, Papageorgiou C, Wisely J, Mendel E** (2010). A pilot randomized trial of metacognitive therapy vs applied relaxation in the treatment of adults with generalized anxiety disorder. *Behavior Research and Therapy* **485**, 429-434.

**White PD, Gilner FH, Handal PJ, Napoli JG** (1984). A behavioral intervention for death anxiety in nurses. *Omega-Journal of Death and Dying* **141**, 33-42.

**Willumsen T, Vassend O, Hoffart A** (2001). A comparison of cognitive therapy, applied relaxation, and nitrous oxide sedation in the treatment of dental fear. *Acta Odontologica Scandinavica* **59**, 290-296.

**Willumsen T, Vassend O, Hoffart A** (2001). One-year follow-up of patients treated for dental fear: effects of cognitive therapy, applied relaxation, and nitrous oxide sedation. *Acta Odontologica Scandinavica* **59**, 335-340.

**Wolitzky-Taylor KB, Telch MJ** (2010). Efficacy of self-administered treatments for pathological academic worry: A randomized controlled trial. *Behavior Research and Therapy* **48**, 840-850.

**Zargar F, Farid AA, Atef-Vahid MK, Afshar H, Omidi A** (2013). Comparing the effectiveness of acceptance-based behavior therapy and applied relaxation on acceptance of internal experiences, engagement in valued actions and quality of life in generalized anxiety disorder.*Journal of research in medical sciences: the official journal of Isfahan University of Medical Sciences* **182**, 118-122.

**Online Supplementary Material 4: Acceptability of relaxation compared with (C)BT for anxiety disorders**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Ncomp** | **RR** | **pa** | **95% CI** | **I2** | **95% CI** | **RD** | **NNTb** | **pc** |
| **Overall** | 52 | 1.13 | 0.200 | 0.94 ‒ 1.37 | 0 | 0 ‒ 32 | 0.01 | ‒ |  |
| **Anxiety disorder** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| *PTSD* | 4 | 1.90 | 0.130 | 0.83 ‒ 4.33 | 0 | 0 ‒ 85 | 0.07 | ‒ | 0.182 |
| *OCD* | 5 | 1.89 | 0.013 | 1.14 ‒ 3.12 | 0 | 0 ‒ 79 | 0.06 | 16.67 |  |
| *PHOBd* | 15 | 1.14 | 0.664 | 0.63 ‒ 2.06 | 0 | 0 ‒ 54 | -0.01 | ‒ |  |
| *PANIC* | 15 | 0.93 | 0.606 | 0.69 ‒ 1.24 | 0 | 0 ‒ 54 | -0.01 | ‒ |  |
| *GAD* | 11 | 1.04 | 0.842 | 0.71 ‒ 1.52 | 0 | 0 ‒ 60 | -0.01 | ‒ |  |
| *MIX* | 2 | 1.24 | 0.638 | 0.51 ‒ 3.02 | 0 | ‒g | 0.01 | ‒ |  |
| **Relaxation technique** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| *PMR* | 17 | 1.65 | 0.004 | 1.18 ‒ 2.32 | 0 | 0 ‒ 51 | 0.04 | 25.00 | 0.019 |
| *AR* | 22 | 0.89 | 0.381 | 0.67 ‒ 1.16 | 0 | 0 ‒ 46 | -0.02 | ‒ |  |
| *othere* | 13 | 1.12 | 0.576 | 0.75 ‒ 1.68 | 0 | 0 ‒ 57 | -0.01 | ‒ |  |
| **(C)BT technique** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| *cognitive restructuring* | 6 | 0.95 | 0.979 | 0.48 ‒ 1.88 | 0 | 0 ‒ 75 | -0.01 | ‒ | 0.018 |
| *exposure* | 25 | 1.52 | 0.002 | 1.16 ‒ 1.99 | 0 | 0 ‒ 44 | 0.05 | 20.00 |  |
| *cog. restruct. + exposure* | 10 | 0.70 | 0.095 | 0.46 ‒ 1.07 | 5 | 0 ‒ 64 | -0.04 | ‒ |  |
| *otherf* | 11 | 1.05 | 0.825 | 0.69 ‒ 1.60 | 0 | 0 ‒ 60 | -0.01 | ‒ |  |

Ncomp: number of comparisons. RR: risk ratio. a: p-value related to the RR according to the random effects model. 95% CI: 95% conﬁdence interval. I2: heterogeneity. RD: risk difference. NNT: numbers-needed-to-treat. b: NNT for non-significant results are not reported. c: the p-values in this column indicate whether the difference among the ESs in the subgroups is signiﬁcant. d: any phobia. PMR: progressive muscle relaxation. AR: applied relaxation. e: this category includes relaxation techniques such as pulsed audio-photic stimulation, cue-controlled relaxation, relaxing without initial muscle tensing, music relaxation, or mixed techniques. f: this category includes (C)BT techniques such as paradoxical intention, counterfactual reasoning, metacognitive techniques, activation techniques, coping skills, social skills, or acceptance-based behaviour techniques. g: The 95% CI of I2 cannot be calculated when the number of studies is two or smaller.

**Online Supplementary Material 5: Effects of relaxation compared with (C)BT for anxiety disorders: subgroup analyses only using high quality studies (meeting three or four study quality criteria)**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Ncomp** | **g** | **pa** | **95% CI** | **I2** | **pb** | **NNTc** |
| **Anxiety disorder** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| *GAD* | 5 | -0.07 | 0.587 | -0.34 ‒ 0.19 | 0 | <0.001 | ‒ |
| *PANIC* | 5 | -0.16 | 0.574 | -0.71 ‒ 0.39 | 66\* |  | ‒ |
| *PHOB* | 2 | -0.34 | 0.178 | -0.84 ‒ 0.16 | 0 |  | ‒ |
| *OCD* | 2 | -0.69 | <0.001 | -0.93 ‒ -0.46 | 0 |  | 2.66 |
| *PTSD* | 5 | -0.52 | 0.004 | -0.88 ‒ -0.16 | 0 |  | 3.48 |
| *MIX* | 1 | -1.85 | <0.001 | -2.40 ‒ -1.29 | 0 |  | 1.24 |

Ncomp: number of comparisons. g: Hedges’s g ES measure. 95% CI: 95% conﬁdence interval. a: p-value according to the random effects model. I2: heterogeneity. NNT: numbers-needed-to-treat. b: the p-values in this column indicate whether the difference between the effect sizes in the subgroups is signiﬁcant. C: NNT for non-significant results are not reported. \*p<0.05

**Online Supplementary Material 6: Effects of relaxation compared with (C)BT for anxiety disorders: time-point effects**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Ncomp** | **g** | **pa** | **95% CI** | **I2** | **95% CI** | **pb** | **NNTc** |
| **All disorders** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| *Post-test* | 65 | -0.23 | 0.001 | -0.36 ‒ -0.10 | 59 | 46 ‒ 69 |  | 7.71 |
| *3-months* | 20 | -0.30 | 0.008 | -0.53 ‒ -0.08 | 51 | 17 ‒ 70 |  | 5.91 |
| *12-months* | 23 | -0.25 | 0.004 | -0.41 ‒ -0.08 | 27 | 0 ‒ 56 |  | 7.24 |
| *>12-months* | 6 | -0.16 | 0.309 | -0.46 ‒ 0.15 | 0 | 0 ‒ 75 |  | ‒ |
| **Post-test** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| *PTSD* | 6 | -0.62 | <0.001 | -0.95 ‒ -0.29 | 0 | 0 ‒ 75 | 0.002 | 2.95 |
| *OCD* | 5 | -0.60 | <0.001 | -0.94 ‒ -0.27 | 65 | 9 ‒ 87 |  | 3.04 |
| *PHOBd* | 26 | -0.23 | 0.023 | -0.42 ‒ -0.03 | 30 | 0 ‒ 57 |  | 7.81 |
| *PANIC* | 16 | -0.04 | 0.755 | -0.27 ‒ 0.19 | 52 | 16 ‒ 73 |  | ‒ |
| *GAD* | 10 | 0.02 | 0.834 | -0.18 ‒ 0.22 | 0 | 0 ‒ 62 |  | ‒ |
| *MIX* | 2 | -0.90 | 0.338 | -2.73 ‒ 0.94 | 97 | ‒ g |  | ‒ |
| **3-months** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| *PTSD* | 6 | -0.56 | 0.001 | -0.90 ‒ -0.22 | 0 | 0 ‒ 75 | <0.001 | 3.25 |
| *OCD* | 0 | ‒ | ‒ | ‒ | ‒ | ‒g |  | ‒ |
| *PHOBe* | 3 | -0.79 | <0.001 | -1.16 ‒ -0.43 | 0 | 0 ‒ 90 |  | 3.35 |
| *PANIC* | 9 | -0.17 | 0.236 | -0.45 ‒ 0.11 | 35 | 0 ‒ 70 |  | ‒ |
| *GAD* | 2 | 0.37 | 0.089 | -0.06 ‒ 0.80 | 0 | ‒g |  | ‒ |
| *MIX* | 0 | ‒ | ‒ | ‒ | ‒ | ‒g |  | ‒ |
| **12-months** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| *PTSD* | 1 | -1.36 | 0.005 | -2.30 ‒ -0.41 | 0 | ‒g | 0.007 | 1.51 |
| *OCD* | 1 | -1.16 | 0.001 | -1.85 ‒ -0.48 | 0 | ‒g |  | 1.70 |
| *PHOBf* | 4 | 0.02 | 0.927 | -0.41 ‒ 0.45 | 0 | 0 ‒ 85 |  | ‒ |
| *PANIC* | 9 | -0.31 | 0.017 | -0.56 ‒ -0.06 | 0 | 0 ‒ 65 |  | 5.76 |
| *GAD* | 7 | -0.07 | 0.544 | -0.30 ‒ 0.16 | 0 | 0 ‒ 71 |  | ‒ |
| *MIX* | 1 | -0.20 | 0.132 | -0.47 ‒ 0.06 | 0 | ‒g |  | ‒ |
| **>12-months** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| *PTSD* | 0 | ‒ | ‒ | ‒ | ‒ | ‒g | 0.838 | ‒ |
| *OCD* | 0 | ‒ | ‒ | ‒ | ‒ | ‒g |  | ‒ |
| *PHOBf* | 4 | -0.10 | 0.663 | -0.53 ‒ 0.34 | 0 | 0 ‒ 85 |  | ‒ |
| *PANIC* | 1 | -0.38 | 0.373 | -1.23 ‒ 0.46 | 0 | ‒g |  | ‒ |
| *GAD* | 1 | -0.16 | 0.523 | -0.66 ‒ 0.92 | 0 | ‒g |  | ‒ |
| *MIX* | 0 | ‒ | ‒ | ‒ | ‒ | ‒g |  | ‒ |

Ncomp: number of comparisons. g: Hedges’s g ES measure. a: p-value according to the random effects model. 95% CI: 95% conﬁdence interval. I2: heterogeneity. b: the p-values in this column indicate whether the difference among the ESs in the subgroups is signiﬁcant. NNT: numbers-needed-to-treat. c: NNT for non-significant results are not reported. d: any phobia comparisons. f: specific phobia comparisons. g: The 95% CI of I2 cannot be calculated when the number of studies is two or smaller.