

Reviews

Dizionario degli Istituti di Perfezione, IX: *Spiritualità – Vézelay*. Edited by Guerrino Pelliccia and Giancarlo Rocca. Pp. xxvi + 1959 cols incl. numerous ills. Rome: Edizioni Paoline, 1997

The basic article here is the history of spirituality, a notorious theme for historians who still depend on the good volumes by Louis Bouyer and others and the *Dictionnaire de spiritualité*. The editor, Giancarlo Rocca, has taken a good part for himself and whatever he chooses to write on is worth reading. The bibliographies to the main articles are important and not too overloaded with minor material. Some articles, not to be missed, are where a reader might not expect – for example under *Stati* we reasonably look for States of Perfection, and United States, but not naturally for Scandinavia under *Stati del Nord-Europa*. In the end of the next volume we shall need a very good index, to discover where in the ten volumes of this *Dizionario* we may find what we seek, so much of value is hidden where we would not think first of looking. Among such geographical articles *Sudamerica* is full. *Studi* contains good information also on monastic libraries. Welfare work by religious has a long treatment under the title *Storia della carità*. *Terz'Ordine* and neighbouring articles help about the various third orders. Among the unusual studies is *Vegetarianismo*. Among eminent individuals there are Thomas Aquinas and Teresa of Avila and Theodore the Studite. In non-Roman spirituality *Starets* is too short for so great a theme, but it is pleasant to see Taizé. The illustrations in the volume are of exceptional quality both in reproduction and in selection, and teach much, especially about the habits worn by less well-known orders. That future index should certainly contain a guide to the pictures.

SELWYN COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

OWEN CHADWICK

Prophecy. The power of inspired language in history, 1300–2000. Edited by Bertrand Taithe and Tim Thornton. (Themes in History.) Pp. viii + 216. Stroud: Sutton Publishing, 1997. £40 (cloth), £12.99 (paper). 0 7509 1331 2; 0 7509 1332 0

Prophecy is a slippery word and the collection of twelve essays which appear under this single word title covers a wide range of meanings. But although chronologically the book claims to cover the period from 1300 its balance is heavily on the side of post-Reformation prophecy, whilst geographically six of the essays are focused on Britain. The opening editorial essay – ‘The language of

history: past and future in prophecy' – maps out three phases, the Middle Ages, the Reformation period and the eighteenth to twentieth centuries. It identifies the main themes running through all the papers as 'prophecy as a political language, attempts to manage prophecy and the relationship between power and prophecy' (p. 3). This introduction ranges over a number of examples but, strangely, ignores the main currents of medieval prophetic thought – Joachim of Fiore makes one brief appearance apropos the discovery of the New World – and of Renaissance prophecy in western Europe. It is, perhaps, this lack of perspective which leads to the misleading statement (p. 9) that in medieval and early modern thought time was perceived as circular. Although there was always a certain circular element, the main thrust of medieval prophecy was linear, while Renaissance thinkers sought to combine the two concepts in fascinating ways.

Part I is headed 'Language of elites, symbols of power'. The first essay, by L. Coote, studies prophecies of kingship and empire in 'later medieval England'. The elite holding the manuscripts was largely monastic but gradually extended to the rising lay professional class. There is interesting material here but the essay is by no means a comprehensive treatment of prophecy in England during the period covered: Kathryn Kerbey Fulton's work on reformist apocalyptic receives no mention nor do prophetic aspects of Lollardy, apart from one brief mention (p. 25). A. McLaren's essay on 'Prophecy and providentialism in the reign of Elizabeth I' focuses mainly on Elizabeth as 'Deborah to the English Israelites' (p. 31). She makes interesting new points on the marriage question but her feminist framework limits her perspective. Elizabeth was also the new Zorobabel or Constantine. The great outburst of prophetic acclamation in the debate after 1588 receives no mention here. T. Thornton deals with the political influence of two local seventeenth-century prophets, Nixon of Cheshire and Mother Shipton in Yorkshire.

Part II has the general heading, 'Prophecies in the age of the Beast: reforming prophecy'. Here K. Gibson tracks the path of two 'lone prophets', Philip Ziegler and Ludwig Gifftheil, who wandered across Europe proclaiming the Protestant apocalyptic in the early seventeenth century. The resurrection of two almost unknown preachers forms a valuable study of the interchange of apocalyptic influences between England and the continent, but, again, the broader background of radical Protestantism is passed over while, in England, Mede and Brightman alone receive bare mentions. The next essay, by G. Games, takes us to early New England and the prophetic role of its ministers. With S. Barnett's analysis of the 'Prophetic thought of Sir Isaac Newton' we reach what, in this reviewer's judgement, is the most valuable essay in the collection. From a time when Newton's writings on prophecy were brushed under the carpet as an embarrassment, it is now conceded that early scientific thinkers were often equally interested in occult forms of knowledge, but here Barnett goes one stage further in tackling head on 'the *relationship* in Newton's mind between the study of science and the study of God' (p. 101) [my italics]. This meets a real need and the short essay really illuminates a question which lies at the centre of early modern thought.

In a separate bridge section (Part III) N. Hitelin, in a comprehensive and well-based essay, shows that respectable Georgian theologians still saw prophecy as central to their biblical culture. This forms a useful counterbalance to the

conventional Age of Enlightenment concept. The author, with some disregard for chronology, makes some surprising points on John Locke's biblical thought. In Part iv, headed 'The ends of prophecy', the nineteenth and twentieth centuries are covered by a curious mix: first the mid nineteenth-century Taiping rebellion in China, treated as a millenarian movement, and then the Welsh revival of 1904-5, described as 'the last truly popular prophetic movement to surface in the British Isles' (p. 161). This latter essay, by R. Hayward, leads into a fascinating exploration of how the Society for Psychical Research, newly formed by Henry Sidgwick, was prompted to study such phenomena and other types of divination, reaching a conclusion which reversed the previous understanding of prophecy: 'It was no longer seen as a revelation of the future, but as... the eruption of a forgotten [subconscious] past' (p. 175). Nevertheless, 'Saviour figures and would-be Gods' will not die: the final chapter of this part, by P. Davies, puts together in an original essay the prophetic visions of Joseph de Maistre, Charles Maurras and Le Pen, all representing the extreme French Right. This is an original collection but one could not claim that Part iv in any sense covers the extraordinary revival of prophetic aspiration across Europe which the nineteenth century witnessed.

As a set of specialist papers this book certainly opens up fascinating new examples and perspectives, although often wandering into by-ways. But it claims to be one of a series of Themes of History 'suitable for students and the general reader' in which 'the essays are accessible to an undergraduate readership without assuming previous specific knowledge'. What sort of view will the average undergraduate have of this great theme after reading this text? The comments made above *seriatim* indicate only some of the gaps in a book which claims to cover the subject from 1300-2000. It is true that the end-notes mostly supply good references and the final bibliographical essay is excellent, partly making up for the deficiencies in the text. There are also good indices. But the general impression is of a great and intricately woven cloth, stretching over centuries, from which little snippets have been cut at random here and there. The book is an interesting, but somewhat irritating ragbag.

ST ANNE'S COLLEGE,
OXFORD

MARJORIE REEVES

Christmas in America. A history. By Penne L. Restad. Pp. x+219+12 ills. New York-Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1995. £9.99. 0 19 509300 3; 0 19 510980 5

The stations of the sun. A history of the ritual year in Britain. By Ronald Hutton. Pp. xx+542 incl. 5 maps and 1 fig. +30 plates. Oxford-New York: Oxford University Press, 1996. £17.99. 0 19 820570 8

Restad's *Christmas in America* is snappy, readable and immensely stimulating. It concentrates heavily on the nineteenth century (despite the all-encompassing title), and provides an impressive account of the development of everything that modern Americans associate with Christmas. Restad surveys the colonial scene, drawing attention to the uncluttered nature of the American calendar, and to the sheer variety of Christmas customs amongst the many breeds of settlers. After the

War of Independence, it is argued, Christmas was gradually transformed and reshaped by Americans looking for a festival that would meet their changing needs. A new nation needed a distinctive Christmas. During the nineteenth century, socio-economic changes (urbanisation, industrialisation and immigration) added several layers to this sense of need, and simultaneously provided the means to meet it. Steadily, the thoroughly commercial Christmas which we all know and love/hate evolved, complete with decorated trees, a Santa in every store and printed greeting cards. Christmas served a variety of functions: it bound together individuals and social groups whose interests were diverging under the pressure of change; it gave the urban middle classes a focus for the development of ideas concerning domesticity and morality; and it offered rich pickings for the entrepreneurial elite (Restad remarks that the evolving image of Santa Claus, 'a successful factory owner', bore some resemblance to that of the American captain of industry). In the twentieth century, most of these trends accelerated, though the meaning of Christmas was encoded in new cultural forms (notably movies such as *Miracle on 34th Street*). Christmas survives as 'the last widely celebrated public recognition of the miraculous'. Restad emphasises the way in which Americans have remodelled Christmas successively in order to suit a complex and constantly changing society. At all points, the paradoxes within this new Christmas story are laid bare. Of these, the most significant juxtaposes spiritual and material priorities (or religion and commerce). Rather than taking up a position in this debate, the author tells us that it is this very paradox 'that animates America's Christmas, engaging us in a tension of opposites'. Santa Claus, who steals the show, embraces the paradox, simultaneously promoting materialism and criticising it by operating without regard for his profit margin. Santa, like Christmas itself, 'reveals the nature of American life'. It is of course possible to question certain aspects of Restad's account. I put the book down with the feeling that I had learnt a great deal about Santa Claus but comparatively little about Jesus Christ (except in so far as He resembled that 'generous and genial American saint'). The spiritual and theological meaning of Christmas for devoted American Christians is not ignored, but neither is it emphasised. The pre nineteenth-century phase of the story (chapter i) is dealt with rather hurriedly, producing a feeling in the reader not unlike that of watching the first hour of a video with the fast-forward button down. Chapters ii–xi, however, provide more than adequate compensation. This is a concise, thought-provoking and accessible piece of historical writing.

Ronald Hutton's *The stations of the sun* is far more wide-ranging, and claims to be 'a complete survey of what is known of the history of the communal rituals and customs which have marked the year in Britain from the earliest recorded time until the present'. The author leads us through his material, station by station, providing descriptive accounts of the festivals associated with Christmas, Candlemas, Valentine's Day, Easter and so on. He draws principally upon material collected by eighteenth- and nineteenth-century antiquarians, towards whom he adopts an appropriately critical attitude. Hutton's attractively produced book will undoubtedly become a standard work of reference on its subject, and deserves an audience beyond the academic community. It has many strengths, one of which is the sheer range of material covered. There are also some interesting reflections, concentrated in the conclusion, on the historiography of

calendar customs as it has developed during the last two centuries, and on the nature of the English Reformation. On this last point, Hutton argues that, in the long term, the Reformation succeeded not by seeking to eradicate completely the popular rituals associated with Candlemas, Good Friday and other traditional festivals, but by allowing them to survive in more secular and private settings. This migration of holy customs 'was not so much an episode in the history of resistance to the Reformation as a part of the process of acceptance of it' (p. 418). This is an interesting and persuasive line of argument. Hutton also participates in a stimulating dialogue with Britain's folklore experts, and the tone adopted suggests a mixture of mutual respect and mutual suspicion. Hutton remains an historian rather than a folklorist, though there are moments when he seems to be adopting the quaint and eccentric attitude of a Victorian collector: 'At Ottery in 1990, assisting a laughing "barrel girl" whose hair, coat, and gloves were all on fire, I asked her why she took part'. Her reply, under the circumstances, was remarkably thoughtful and restrained. Despite these strengths, Hutton's book also has significant shortcomings, which are mainly the result of its structure and wide time-frame. There is, for example, a sometimes frustrating lack of analysis, and a curious refusal to delve into the deeper meanings of all these rituals. The author tells us he will not discuss concepts such as 'community' or 'religion', and refers us to an earlier work for the reasons why. He includes fascinating material on a range of disturbing animal sports ('threshing the cock', for example), but never seeks to de-code these in the way that Robert Darnton did so famously. To Hutton's credit, he is aware of these and other problems, and he explains his reasons for proceeding as he has done. Nevertheless, those who read this book cover-to-cover may be forgiven for feeling that the author has stopped at a great many 'stations', but never got out for a really good look around.

THE QUEEN'S UNIVERSITY OF BELFAST

CHRISTOPHER MARSH

The Cambridge illustrated history of the Middle Ages, I: 350–950; II: 950–1250; III: 1250–1520. Edited by Robert Fossier; translated by: I: Janet Sondheimer; II: Stuart Airlie and Robyn Marsack; III: Sarah Hanbury Tenison. (Trans. of *Le Moyen Age*, Paris: Armand Colin, 1982–3). Pp. xxiii + 556 incl. numerous ills + 24 colour plates; xxvi + 544 incl. numerous ills and 20 maps + 28 colour plates; xviii + 554 incl. numerous ills + 20 colour plates. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997 (first publ. in English as *The Middle Ages. An illustrated history*, Cambridge University Press, 1986–9). £100 (boxed set). 0 521 26644 0; 0 521 26645 9; 0 521 26646 7; 0 521 59078 7 (set)

The French original of this collaborative work came out in 1982–3; though the English version of vol. iii appeared in 1986 and of vol. i in 1988, only with the publication of vol. ii, is the translation complete. With roughly 500 illustrations in the text and seventy-two coloured plates, the volumes provide ample visual material, though this has not been made integral to the texts. The work is held together rather by the idea of tracing the development of western Europe in parallel with its neighbours, Greek and Muslim, in order to explain how the west

eventually pulled ahead and was ready by the early sixteenth century to take a leading place on the world stage. Accordingly the volumes allow about two-fifths of the whole work, written by eight specialists, to the histories of Byzantium and Islam. Understandably, however, these chapters often pay only glancing attention to the west, the Islamic ones in particular not easily fitting into the scheme. For the history of western Europe there are five contributors, but Fossier himself dominates since he has written nearly two-thirds of the material relating to the period after 950. As in the French, none of the changes carries annotation and in place of the original French lists of additional reading, topically arranged, have been substituted books in English, so students may extend their understanding but cannot follow up the sources used by the authors. Some historians, like André Vauchez (church, culture) and Alain Ducellier (Byzantium), offer stimulating essays which take a comprehensive view of their topics. Fossier himself is more concerned to arouse enthusiasm for the achievements of the Middle Ages in its great leap forward and, as might have been expected, gives prominence to its social and technological aspects, though his excessively detailed information weakens the effectiveness of the argument. He is notably cavalier in his attitude to topics like the medieval German empire that clearly do not interest him. In the English version, more perhaps than in the French, it is obvious too that his interest in English history is superficial, despite his recognition of the importance of English evidence, particularly for social questions. A surprising number of purely factual errors detracts from its value for a general public. It is difficult to discern what specific English readers the publishers have in mind for this translation. The illustrations, however, make these heavy books attractive to handle and will probably stimulate readers to dip into the texts.

UNIVERSITY OF READING

D. J. A. MATTHEW

Ambroise de Milan. By Hervé Savon. Pp. 382 incl. 2 maps. Paris–Tournai: Desclée, 1997. Fr. 138. 2 7189 0687 1

Already known for his work on the chronology of Ambrose's writings, his exegetical methods, and his intention in the *De officiis*, Hervé Savon now presents a biography of the great bishop of Milan. He first gives a background to the importance of Milan as an administrative centre in the Roman empire, and a description of the empire's constitutional structures. The constitution of the Church was the exact opposite – a federation of churches under a bishop which took the role of a great institution of assistance and aid. From the internal evidence of the letters Savon argues that 340 is the most likely date of Ambrose's birth. His election to the episcopate was contrary to the second canon of Nicaea, but it gave Milan an able diplomat and administrator. His theological formation was undertaken by Simplicianus, who was not, as has been maintained by some, sent by Damasus. Ambrose's own method of exegesis was to paraphrase, and he regarded Philo's methodology as too cosmic, too vague, and too close to Arianism. This assumes, against D. H. Williams, that even at the time of his election as bishop, Ambrose was committed to an anti-Arian stance. Savon notes that Ambrose had great difficulty with the concept of a suffering God; he

acknowledges his anti-Jewish trait; and his lack of realism (in contrast to Damasus) over Eastern Councils. This is a valuable study, though perhaps understating the political acumen which Ambrose brought to the role of bishop of Milan.

YALE UNIVERSITY

BRYAN D. SPINKS

Christo vivere. Studien zum literarischen Christusbild des Paulinus von Nola, By Matthias Skeb. (Hereditas. Studien zur Alten Kirchengeschichte, 11.) Pp. xxix + 298.

Bonn: Borengässer, 1997. DM 62. 3 923946 32 5

In this study Skeb presents 'Paulinus's literary image of Christ'. He begins by discussing the current state of research into the sources, chronology and biography of Paulinus (pp. 3–20). Then he proceeds in three stages. First, he reflects on the process of Paulinus' conversion in relation to Christology (pp. 21–85). This part also contains an interesting discussion of the religion of Ausonius of Bordeaux (pp. 23–60). Then he shows how literary theory, mainly on the right use (*usus iustus*) of classical elements in Christian literature, along with conversion to Christianity and (increasingly monastic) asceticism – Paulinus needed the latter especially, according to Skeb, as a defence against 'conventional Christians' like Ausonius – is at the heart of Paulinus' intention to make Christ's image visible in his work (pp. 86–196). In this part Skeb focuses on *carmina* vi, x, xv, xxii, and *epistula* xvi. Finally Skeb depicts that image of Christ, as it emerges from salvation-historical narrative, allegory, asceticism and the veneration of saints in Paulinus' work. All of these aspects, are, according to Skeb, 'loci of christological reflection' (pp. 197–280).

Theological studies in patristic poetry require a rare competence in two disciplines difficult to relate. Skeb excels in both. His book is well worth reading. Much can be learnt in particular from his simple but convincing method of breaking down apparently complex poetic patterns into comprehensible theological concepts in their respective historical and literary contexts without neglecting the literary theory behind their use. Paulinus' work has sometimes been conceived as diffuse and lacking focus (cf. pp. 86f.). Maybe it was for lack of a study like this.

KING'S COLLEGE,
LONDON

JOSEF LÖSSL

Isidore de Péluse. *Lettres*, I: *Lettres 1214–1413*. Edited by Pierre Éviéux. (Sources Chrétiennes, 422.) Pp. 563 incl. 2 maps. Paris: Éditions du Cerf, 1997.

Fr. 245 (paper). 2 204 05557 3; 0750 1978

Isidore of Pelusium was an Egyptian holy man in the early fifth century, who was actively involved in spiritual direction and mediation. 2,000 of his letters survive, varying in length from a few lines to several pages. This volume, containing letters 1,214–1,413, is the first new edition of any of the corpus since Morel's careless edition of 1638 (which Migne reprinted). The long introduction of 176 pages summarises the arguments of Éviéux's monograph on Isidore of 1995,

which argued convincingly for the authenticity of the letters; it also includes useful discussion of the career of Isidore, his monastic ideals (which owed more to Basil than to Pachomius), and the ecclesiastical and economic state of Pelusium and the surrounding region. Évieux notes that in Christology Isidore, a moderate Cyrillian, anticipated by twenty years the Chalcedonian formula of union in one prosopon and one hypostasis – which helps confirm the Cyrillian character of this formula. Isidore's letters avoid concrete details and often plagiarise from earlier Fathers. Their most striking features are the frankness with which Isidore rebukes malpractice, as he exercises the *parrhesia* expected of the holy man, and the range of matters on which his intervention was sought. His letters reveal a society in which checks and balances against misuse of authority were provided by the right of individuals to protest and petition, even over matters where they had no responsibility and no personal involvement.

HEYTHROP COLLEGE,
UNIVERSITY OF LONDON

R. M. PRICE

Saint Patrick's world. The Christian culture of Ireland's apostolic age. Translations and commentary by Liam De Paor. Pp. x+335 incl. numerous ills. Notre Dame–London: University of Notre Dame Press, 1996 (first publ. 1993). £15.95 (paper). 0 268 01757 3

This is an unaltered paperback reprint of a book first published in 1993 to mark the 1500th anniversary of the second death of St Patrick. It contains an introductory essay (pp. 1–50) which offers a helpful discussion of the broad background to the saint's mission in Ireland but which becomes highly speculative once the focus is on Ireland itself. On pp. 51–113 we have useful translations of texts (or extracts of texts) of the fourth and fifth centuries. De Paor provides some introductory remarks on most of the texts featured here. However, the remainder of the body of the book (pp. 115–294) consists of 'extracts from later writings' ranging in date from the seventh century to the seventeenth which can hardly be said to illuminate 'Saint Patrick's world', although some of them do obfuscate it rather effectively. None the less for the student of other aspects of medieval Ireland these translations are helpful. Footnotes are banished to the end (pp. 299–309). Indices are extensive (pp. 315–35). A good deal of care has gone into all aspects of the creation of this volume save perhaps one: it is not clear that the author decided what its purpose might be or to whom it would be directed.

GIRTON COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

DAVID N. DUMVILLE

Medieval Latin. An introduction and bibliographical guide. Edited by F. A. C. Mantello and A. G. Rigg. Pp. xiv+774. Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 1996. £43.95 (cloth), £31.95 (paper). 0 8132 0841 6; 0 8132 0842 4

This fat and handsome book 'has been designed as an aid for the graduate student who is beginning to work with Medieval Latin texts and documents. The

editors will be very pleased if other readers also find it useful' (p. 6). Surely they will. Karl Strecker's then invaluable *Introduction to medieval Latin* (translated by R. B. Palmer in 1957) guided my own infant footsteps; but Mantello and Rigg have produced something of much wider scope on a vastly larger scale. That the book was published in the United States and relies so heavily on the learning of American and Canadian scholars is not surprising; the sketch of the present state of medieval Latin on p. 4 tactfully does not underline its comparative neglect in British universities, where classicists apparently feel inhibitions about moving into later Latin that are not felt across the Atlantic. At least such faint-hearts can no longer plead the excuse that the field is uncharted. We are given here sections on 'General reference and research tools' (including computing resources, though it is 'impossible to keep pace with developments' in this area; the editors hope, incidentally, that a projected anthology of medieval Latin, forming a sequel to their book, will be put on to the World-Wide Web); 'Medieval Latin philology'; 'Varieties of medieval Latinity'; and 'Varieties of medieval Latin literature'. Under each of these headings expert hands have supplied a large number of specialist accounts, with associated bibliography, on topics ranging from Metrics to Mills and from Ships to Satire. Not least useful are the sections that give systematic detail of the vocabulary of fields with which one is not oneself particularly familiar, in my case, for example, the liturgy (Daniel Sheerin). Few accounts are particularly discursive (editorial standardisation has been fairly tight), but one welcomes the extended news from the cutting edge of lexicography and diplomatic contained in three remarkable contributions by Richard Sharpe. It would be ungrateful to make any complaints in the face of all these riches. But readers should be warned that little of the large amount of Latin quoted is translated, and that there is no (could be no) Index Verborum, hugely useful though that would be. The book is a remarkable achievement, and no one interested in medieval Latin can afford to be without it.

CORPUS CHRISTI COLLEGE,
OXFORD

MICHAEL WINTERBOTTOM

Govan and its early medieval sculpture. Edited by Anna Ritchie. Pp. xiv + 168 incl. 67
ills. Stroud: Alan Sutton, 1994. £25. 0 7509 0717 7

'Govan Old', as the parish church at Govan in Glasgow is known in Scotland, has many claims to fame, cultural and social, not least of which is its remarkable collection of early medieval sculpture comprising a carved sarcophagus, two cross-shafts, five uniquely massive hogbacks and twenty-three cross-slabs. Govan presents the not unusual problem of a lot of sculpture at a wholly undocumented site. The church, with its large curvilinear cemetery, is located on the southern bank of the River Clyde, within the powerful kingdom of the Strathclyde Britons, whose craggy stronghold, *Alcluith*, Clyde Rock, is impressively sited down river on the estuary. An expert team covers all aspects of the site and its monuments. All are agreed that, contrary to local tradition, there was no church at Govan earlier than the ninth century – a date arrived at through stylistic analysis of the sculpture. Equally unanimous is the view that the site was not monastic but more

probably episcopal. The cemetery, it is argued, would have provided a burial place for lay aristocrats of the ninth and tenth centuries who wished to be buried proximate to a local saint. It is allowed that the saint may have been called Constantine, the name attested in the later dedication, and that the association belongs to the earliest period of the foundation. A significant number of kings in the pre-1000 Scottish king-lists bore the name Constantine. The carved sarcophagus may indeed be the surviving physical remnant of the cult. The lack of 'theological' imagery on the sculpture, the somewhat stereotypical nature of the cross-slabs, and the fact that the Constantine in question was probably a sanctified king, gives a decidedly secular feel to the site. Alan Macquarrie, whose task it was to provide a hypothetical context for such a site, suggests that the Govan cult of Constantine is an aspect of the gradual penetration, from the ninth century, into southern Scotland of the Irish in the west, similar to their re-establishment of the cult of Columba, at a slightly earlier period, in central Scotland. The artistic connections of the sculpture can support this view although, as other contributors show, there is clearly a wider regional context for the art that includes Galloway and Cumbria. Sculptural sites in Eastern Scotland are referred to in passing but more could have been made of the similarity of the sculptural ensembles at Govan and St Andrews. The apparent unanimity depends to some extent on the disabling lack of evidence. The disagreement on the matter of the significance of the hogbacks – whether or not they provide evidence of significant Scandinavian settlement and route-ways is refreshing, and will no doubt attract further discussion. Rosemary Cramp's summing up shows her awareness of some of the fundamental difficulties left unresolved, even, for example, such a fundamental matter as the relative chronologies of the different types of monument. None the less the volume is a model of its kind, impeccably edited and produced. It has new photographs of all the monuments, a hand-list of sculpture in the Glasgow area with individual bibliographies, and a geological assessment. Local knowledge is usefully documented by the present incumbent, the Revd T. A. Davidson Kelly, whose enthusiasm and informed interest lay behind the enterprise. Antiquarian records are evaluated, and local museum curators were able to locate 'lost' sculpture. This comprehensive treatment of a neglected collection provides an excellent case-history, that demonstrates both the intractable nature of this kind of evidence and current trends in its interpretation. Govan Old is easily accessible via the Glasgow underground, and a visit is strongly recommended.

NEWNHAM COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

ISABEL HENDERSON

Two Old English apocrypha and their manuscript source. The 'Gospel of Nichodemus' and the 'Avenging of the Saviour'. Edited by J. E. Cross with contributions by Denis Brearley, Julia Crick, Thomas N. Hall and Andy Orchard. (Cambridge Studies in Anglo-Saxon England, 19.) Pp. xi + 307 + 4 plates. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996. £40. 0 521 56194 9

This volume presents a much needed edition of the Old English prose *Gospel of Nichodemus* and its companion text or continuation, the *Vindicta Salvatoris*. The

edition is the product of a team effort, each member contributing special expertise, but the late Professor James Cross was the chief editor of the Anglo-Saxon text and no doubt prime-mover and guiding light of the project as a whole. The volume offers more than a critical edition of the two Old English texts. What prompted the project was the discovery that a manuscript of the third quarter of the ninth century (possibly later) from Saint-Bertin in Flanders, now Saint-Omer, Bibliothèque municipale, 202, containing Latin texts of the *Gospel of Nicodemus* and the *Vindicta Salvatoris* is, almost without question, the one used by the Old English translator. The evidence that makes this conclusion convincing is dealt with in different ways by all of the contributors to the edition, and it provides an opportunity, almost unprecedented in Anglo-Saxon scholarship, to study at close hand the strategies and techniques of an Anglo-Saxon translator, and to draw out implications concerning manuscript transmission and copying. Each of the scholars who worked with Professor Cross has made important contributions: Julia Crick on the Latin manuscript, Thomas N. Hall on the development and transmission of the two source texts, Denis Brearley on the Latin texts, and Andy Orchard on the special features of the Latin and the strategies and style of the Anglo-Saxon translator. The translator did not face an easy task, owing to the eccentric nature of the Latin, errors and omissions in copying, and physical damage to the manuscript, mostly notably the loss of a bifolium in the first quire. But the Old English translator rose to the challenge and has left his distinctive stylistic 'fingerprint' on a text that the editors rightly describe as a composition. The Latin text from the Saint-Omer manuscript and the Old English from CUL, ms li.2.11 (with variants from other manuscripts) are printed in parallel, and the edition includes modern English translations of both the Latin and the Old English. Altogether this is a highly commendable volume; it is engaging, and offers much valuable insight into the transmission and production of texts in the late Anglo-Saxon period.

UNIVERSITY OF WALES,
LAMPETER

C. W. MARX

The Old English Lives of St Margaret. By Mary Clayton and Hugh Magennis. (Cambridge Studies in Anglo-Saxon England, 9.) Pp. xi + 239 incl. 2 plates. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994. £37.50. 0 521 43382 7

The two Old English *Lives* of St Margaret edited here are independent of each other, and illustrate different ways in which the legend was received and reconceived in the vernacular in Anglo-Saxon England. The editors have carried out painstaking and thorough research, and their efforts have yielded important results, only some of which can be mentioned here. They are able to demonstrate that the Old English text in BL, ms Cotton Tiberius A. iii of around the middle of the eleventh century is witness to a lost Latin version of the *Life* of Margaret. Distinctive features of the Old English that are not found in surviving Latin sources appear in the Greek tradition, and indicate a lost Latin version that preserved details of the Greek; it was this version that was used by the Old English translator. The editors argue that this lost Latin version circulated in

Anglo-Saxon England and is probably the one used for the Old English *Martyrology* of the mid to late ninth century. No evidence for the existence of this particular Latin version emerges from the surviving Latin texts, so the editors' conclusions have wider significance for the Margaret legend. The Tiberius text is interesting for other reasons. It shows the work of three scribes, the original copyist and two Anglo-Saxon correctors or editors. Our modern editors have taken the bold step of giving priority to the Old English text as edited by the Anglo-Saxon scribes and assigning the A-version to an appendix. They are slightly apologetic about this decision, but it is entirely justified, and their discussion of the evidence opens up a fascinating picture of how Anglo-Saxon editors were prepared to treat vernacular texts. My one suggestion here is that it would have made comparisons easier for the reader if the two versions of the Tiberius text had been printed in parallel. The other Old English *Life* of Margaret edited here comes from that important late Anglo-Saxon manuscript, Cambridge, Corpus Christi College ms 303, of the first half of the twelfth century. Here the evidence of revision presents different problems. The source was a standard version of the *Life*, and the editors acknowledge the difficulty in separating Latin and Old English revisions and additions, but they make a plausible case that some of the distinctive variations and additions can be attributed to an Anglo-Saxon writer. One of these is the prominence given to the saint's intense personal love for God. This theme is not found in the Latin texts, and the editors see in it the influence of Norman, particularly Anselmian, spirituality. There is much of interest in this edition from the presentation of the texts themselves to the broader contextualizing of the legend in Anglo-Saxon and European traditions. This volume will be the first point of reference for any future work on the Margaret legend.

UNIVERSITY OF WALES,
LAMPETER

C. W. MARX

Biographical register of the English cathedral priories of the province of Canterbury c. 1066 to 1540. By Joan Greatrex. Pp. xxiv + 954. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1997. £95. 0 19 820424 8

Joan Greatrex's massive book divides into eight sections, one for each of the cathedral priories of the province of Canterbury. Each section begins with a short survey of the priory's history. This is followed by a seemingly exhaustive list of the sources consulted – printed and unprinted episcopal registers, priory registers, cartularies, other archives and editions of chronicles, besides a wide range of secondary sources, including unpublished theses. The biographies of those of the priory's monks whom Greatrex has traced follow. Although the information on each monk is presented as a succinct list of the monk's offices, acts and the like, in many cases Greatrex has been able to record his gifts to the convent, books inscribed with his name, unusual features of his career, and other noteworthy information. We learn, for example, that William Gillingham, monk of Canterbury cathedral priory (d. 1410/11) was buried 'in the crypt under a stone which he himself had prepared', and that John Grove, another Canterbury

monk, died (in 1425) because he fell from the west tower then being constructed. Again, in 1260 Robert de Dureville, monk of Winchester cathedral priory, was transferred to Ramsey abbey, to stay until such time as the priory was sufficiently recovered to be able to support all its community, and early in the fifteenth century, a villein, John Mascall, paid £13 6s. 8d. to the priory for the manumission of his son, Ralph – who subsequently became a monk there. In total, Greatrex includes biographies of about 5,000 monks. Unsurprisingly, information about monks of the fourteenth, fifteenth and sixteenth centuries is much more plentiful than that about monks who lived in the earlier period. Moreover, the nature of the sources of information available for each priory determines the nature of the biographies. For instance, the records of Canterbury cathedral priory reveal what some of the fifteenth-century monks died of; plague is the cause most frequently given but deaths from asthma, dysentery, ulcerated piles, madness (*frenesis*) and wasting disease (*consumptio*) are also mentioned. On the other hand, records of Norwich cathedral priory are especially informative about contributions made by the obedientiaries to pay the expenses of monk students at Oxford, and also about some of the monks' contributions towards the priory's building costs. Altogether, Greatrex has assembled data revealing the lives not only of priors and other monks of importance in their day, but also of the cloister monks, who formed the majority of a monastic community. Since individual cloister monks are little mentioned in monastic records and chronicles, information about their lives is especially welcome. Greatrex's book is of value not only to the historian of medieval English monasticism but also to those studying other aspects of medieval history, for example illness, life expectancy, cultural and intellectual history (including homiletics), the history of Oxford university and of England's relations with the papacy.

In a factual book of this size there will inevitably be errors and omissions. But the only obvious bad mistake I noticed is the description of the chronicler, Thomas Walsingham, as a monk of Bury St Edmunds, in error for St Albans. And not all relevant information in *Documents illustrating the activities of the general and provincial chapters of the English black monks 1215–1540*, ed. W. A. Pantin (Camden 3rd ser. xlv, xlvii, xlviv, 1931–7) is included. For instance, it is omitted that in 1390 the General Chapter appointed Alexander de Totyngton, prior of Norwich, visitor to the abbey of Bury St Edmunds, and that in 1411 Robert de Burnham, prior of Norwich, was likewise appointed to visit the same abbey (*English black monks*, iii. 227, 236, 238). Some readers may think that occasionally Greatrex is too lenient in her judgement of the monks. For instance, her generalisation that monks 'used' or 'borrowed' books, rather than 'owned' them, 'since private property was forbidden by the Rule' (p. 759 n. 36) is surely wrong. The General Chapter frequently had to legislate against property-owning by individual monks. Inscriptions in many fifteenth- and early sixteenth-century monastic books indicate that they were owned by individual monks and are accompanied by no signs that they ever belonged to the conventual library or were used by fellow monks. Such inscriptions may read 'Liber _ _ monachi _', 'Iste liber pertinet ad _ _', 'libellus ego sum _ _', 'Sum codex _ _'. Greatrex herself cites many such examples as does N. R. Ker (*Medieval libraries of Great Britain*, 2nd edn, London 1900, 225–321 *passim*). However, the only serious criticism that can be made of Greatrex's admirable book is its lack of subject

index. There are chronological lists of the archbishops of Canterbury, the bishops of the eight southern provinces and of the priors, but otherwise only an index combining the monks in each of the eight sections. (Medieval spellings are retained and derivations of the toponymics not included.) Since most of the monks are of generic rather than individual interest, many readers will wish to use the book in order to pursue information about subjects rather than about individuals. For example, they may want to discover the proportion of priors holding office by papal provision, the incidence of plague, the nature of monks' other illnesses and ailments, whether they often transferred to other monasteries or to other orders, or took flight, and so on. In the absence of a subject index it is necessary to read the whole volume in order to run such matters to earth. Nevertheless, the book is a monument to the author's scholarship and industry, and a valuable contribution to medieval studies.

CLARE HALL,
CAMBRIDGE

ANTONIA GRANDSEN

The bishops and monks of Rochester, 1076–1214. By Colin Flight. (Monograph Series of the Kent Archaeological Society, 6.) Pp. xii + 320 incl. 29 figs. + 16 plates. Stroud: Sutton Publishing (for Kent Archaeological Society), 1997. £30. 0 906746 20 5

The purpose of this study of the cathedral church of St Andrew of Rochester is to bring together the historical, palaeographical and architectural evidence of its history. Although the reader may experience some initial alarm at the forms of personal name favoured by the author (Kings Willelm, Henric, Stephan, Ricard and Johan, Archbishop Radulf etc.), and citations of manuscripts do not always take the most familiar forms, the plan of the book is straightforward. The first part deals with the written evidence, beginning with an examination, physical and textual, of the *Textus Roffensis*. This expands on the analysis provided by P. H. Sawyer in his two-volume facsimile edition, to suggest a detailed reconstruction of the cartulary which forms its second section, the *Privilegia*. There follow discussions of the *Vita Gundulfi*, which is seen to be a hagiographical rather than an historical source, and of the miracles of St Paulinus and St Ithamar. Moving from the twelfth to the thirteenth century, the author discusses BL, mss Cotton Vespasian A xxii and Domitian x, analysing the heterogeneous contents of the first, and noting that much of it is the work of a single scribe who also contributed to Domitian x. In the latter, a straightforward monastic cartulary, he identifies four further hands, and reconstructs an original leaf later supplanted by a forgery; he also suggests that a section in the fourteenth-century Rochester *Registrum temporalium* may have been intended as a preface to Domitian. A chapter is devoted to the forgeries which abound in the Rochester archives. The author then provides an account of the archaeological investigations of the cathedral church and monastic buildings from the second half of the nineteenth century to the present day, well illustrated with plans and plates. The growth in understanding of the sequence of construction is traced through the writings (not all of them published) of Ashpitel, Willis, Irvine, W. H. St John

Hope and Livett; in general the trend is towards the 'degundulphisation' of both cathedral and castle keep. In summarising current knowledge, the author gives his own reconstruction of the likely course of building up to the new work initiated by Bishop Gilbert de Glanville at the end of the twelfth century. The final section of the book is a synthesis of written and architectural evidence, and suggests revisions to the 'Fasti' (Appendix 1), and to accepted opinions on the effects of the fires of 1137 and 1179. Appendices 2 and 3 give a preliminary list of episcopal *acta*, and a list of papal, archiepiscopal, royal and other documents, and are separately indexed. An extensive bibliography, numerous plans and diagrams, and sixteen plates, including examples of scribal hands, complete an excellently produced volume.

LEWES,
EAST SUSSEX

MARGARET BLOUNT

Notre-Dame-en-Vaux. Studien zur Baugeschichte des 12. Jahrhunderts in Châlons-sur-Marne. By Katharina Corsepius. (Forschungen zur Kunstgeschichte und Christlichen Archäologie, 18.) Pp. 251 + 355 black-and-white plates + 51 figs. Stuttgart: Franz Steiner, 1997. DM 198. 3 515 06602 0

The collegiate church of Notre-Dame-en-Vaux in Champagne was in existence by 1114, and had seen extensive building by the middle of the twelfth century. In 1157 parts of the new church collapsed, and the programme of redevelopment was well under way by the time of a rededication in 1183. The church is notable as an early instance, outside the Ile-de-France, of the development of a style of Gothic architecture marked by a four-storey elevation. In this it is aligned with near-contemporary work at two other major churches in the region, St-Remi at Reims and Soissons Cathedral. Its motif of 'linkage' between the clerestory and triforium is linked most closely to St-Remi and, ultimately, Reims Cathedral; and in keeping with High Gothic developments, the church has double-tier flying buttresses. The cloister sculptures, probably complete by 1183 and dispersed in the eighteenth century, are significant examples of the range of themes and idioms emerging in contemporary French portal sculpture, and echoes of them have been sensed as far afield as St Mary's Abbey, York, before 1200. In keeping with the high theological tone of much sculpture and metalwork in the period, strong emphasis was placed in the cloister programme on typological and christological material. Aside from the remnants from the cloister at St-Denis, these beautiful fragments remind us of the devastating losses in France of a form of cloister decoration now better represented in southern France and Spain. But at Châlons the style and general tone is more classical, reminiscent of metal-working styles in the Mosan region. In her generously produced and judiciously written analysis, Katharine Corsepius has provided a model exposition of the history of the church, its restorations (ch. iv), the development of its planning and portals (chs v–vii), building chronology and patronage. Regrettably the book devotes little time to the cloister, its principal concerns being with the architectural sculpture of the main church. Nevertheless, as a work primarily of architectural history, the volume is extensively illustrated and

includes good fold-out plans, and will be an invaluable research tool for students of north-eastern French Gothic architecture.

UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE

PAUL BINSKI

L'œuvre de Hugues de Saint-Victor, I: De institutione novitiorum; De virtute orandi; De laude caritatis; De arrha animae. Edited and translated by P. Sicard, H. B. Feiss, D. Poirel and H. Rochais. (Sous la Règle de Saint Augustin.) Pp. 335 + 1 colour plate. Turnhout: Brepols, 1997. B.Fr. 1,700. 2 503 50561 9

The existence of a market for texts among the 'public curieux ou cultivé, mais non spécialiste' is something which we in the Anglophone world might well envy our Francophone and Italian colleagues. This selection of texts with facing-page translation is part of a series – *Sous la Règle de Saint Augustin* – which seeks to present the work of canons down the centuries to such an audience. In a number of ways the present volume goes beyond this, and offers a useful introduction to Hugh of St Victor for students and scholars as well. The separate introductions to each text (there is no overall introduction) are concise and lucid, offering clear but not simplistic guidance to the general reader while providing ample references to the scholarly literature behind the discussion. They include useful synopses of each text, but are strongest in their discussions of recent scholarly interpretations: these are brief but informative, extending, in the case of that on the *De arrha animae*, into an interesting discursus on spiritual love, the individual and the personal in the Middle Ages. The generous endnotes provide an informative commentary. Beyond this, an attempt is made to present this selection both as a coherent entity and as a contribution to our view of the author, illustrating a less well-known side of his work. Thus, the editors offer a justification for the choice of *De institutione novitiorum*, a text 'qui pourrait d'abord paraître marginale dans l'œuvre de Hugues' (p. 7), to stand first – in effect that it reflects an integral aspect of Hugh's vision of 'éducation intellectuelle et morale' (p. 11), a practical complement to the *Didascalicon*. The other texts are then presented as bearing on different aspects of a related concern to set education, prayer and spirituality in the context of community life, which becomes the uniting theme (see p. 223). The translations combine readability with sufficient closeness to the text to make them a useful guide to the Latin. However, it is with the texts themselves that the limitations of the enterprise are evident. What is presented is a sort of interim version of work in progress on a critical edition of the *Opera omnia* of Hugh, to be produced by the Hugo-von-Sankt-Viktor-Institut (Frankfurt) for *Corpus Christianorum* (see p. 16). The editions of *De institutione novitiorum* and *De arrha animae* are each based on a single ms, with a few emendations listed at the beginning but no apparatus given in the text. The notes on the texts in the introduction do not explain the choice of these mss, or make clear the precise relationship of the present volume to the work in preparation for the critical edition. Thus while we have, as the editors state, a text superior to *Patrologia Latina* and other printed editions, it is hard to know, in advance of the critical edition, what exactly we do have here, or to what extent

it will be superseded by that work. For the *De virtute orandi* and the *De laude caritatis* we are only told how many mss were consulted, and into how many families and branches they were divided (again, it is not made clear exactly how this work is related to the critical edition project, and when and in what context these details and apparatus will be published). Nevertheless, this is a volume which succeeds in the goals which it sets itself and provides much useful context for a reading of Hugh of St Victor.

UNIVERSITY OF SHEFFIELD

JULIAN HASELDINE

The Buildwas books. Book production, acquisition and use at an English Cistercian monastery, 1165–c. 1400. By Jennifer M. Sheppard. (Oxford Bibliographical Society Publications, 3rd Ser., 2.) Pp. lx + 277 incl. 36 figs. Oxford: Oxford Bibliographical Society, 1997. £36. 0 901420 53 0

The forty-nine manuscripts from Buildwas (several identified here for the first time) are the most to have survived from any English Cistercian house. A succinct introduction arranges the manuscripts into chronological groups from the evidence of their script and scribes (most are either s.xii² or s.xiii in.) and distinguishes locally-made books from imports. Twenty glossed books (mostly French-made) given by one Robert Amiclas towards the end of the twelfth century account for a large proportion of the surviving library. Robert annotated his books extensively and appears to have been a master in Paris (s.xii med.) before retiring to Buildwas. In their number and for the evidence of their use for teaching, these manuscripts are of considerable importance, including (probably) the unique manuscript of a commentary on the Pauline Epistles attributable to a pupil of Abelard. Most of the other manuscripts contain either patristic works or contemporary theology and there are a few manuscripts of either contemporary history or typical miscellaneous collections. There are a few rare texts and some which probably enjoyed limited circulation. There is evidence from annotations and notes that the books were used for preaching purposes or university study.

The catalogue of the manuscripts which occupies most of the book gives as much attention to a post-medieval paper flyleaf as the pricked holes for ruling lines. If the physical descriptions are minute, the identification or discussion of the texts is basic, but all incipits and explicits are quoted extensively and references to *Patrologia Latina* or *Corpus Christianorum* provided where known. There are cross references from one description to another, but the recording of observations was usually perceived as more important than offering explanations of what has been seen. The informative captions to the thirty-six plates are an integral part of the book and the quality of the plates (whose degree of reduction is carefully noted) is quite good. There are three indices. The first is of known authors (sometimes following medieval attributions which modern scholarship has rejected), the second is of anonymous works arranged by incipits (some are easily identifiable works by known authors), and the third index is of the Buildwas manuscripts themselves.

This work was clearly planned as a starting point for studies of Buildwas manuscripts. The best way to use the book is to read the descriptions of every manuscript, or skip from the relevant part of one description to another, for there

is no synthesis of much of the information in the catalogue in the introduction. Reticence in a cataloguer of medieval manuscripts is always to be applauded but I cannot help wishing that Sheppard had been more forthcoming. She clearly knows the Buildwas books intimately and could have easily distinguished facts from speculations and extended her work to include a little more about how and why the manuscripts were made and how they were used.

THE RED GULL PRESS

MICHAEL GULLICK

The western mediterranean kingdoms 1200–1500. The struggle for dominion. By David Abulafia (The Medieval World.) Pp. xix+300 incl. 4 maps and 4 genealogical tables. Longman: London–New York, 1997. £14.99 (paper), 0 582 07821 0; 0 582 07820 2

David Abulafia's ambitious study of the western Mediterranean in the late Middle Ages is welcome on several counts. In the first place, it provides us with the first ever general survey in English of this region at this time. The kingdoms of the title are those of Aragon and Sicily, whose political fortunes were interlocked for more than two centuries after their rulers became engaged in dynastic conflict in the thirteenth century. While focused on the island of Sicily, the incessant rivalry between the houses of Barcelona and Anjou had much wider repercussions. It shaped not just the history of the two kingdoms, but that of the rest of Spain and Italy, as well as the islands situated between. The story of this rivalry therefore serves Abulafia as a central theme, one of unquestionable importance and fascination, around which he wraps a broader treatment of the western Mediterranean as a whole. Since he has previously written about virtually every part of this region, his judgements here command great respect. Moreover, he is no less at home with religious and cultural affairs than with political or economic matters: there are illuminating pages on Ramon Llull and his contemporary, Abraham Abulafia. Of course a survey which addresses as many issues as this one does is bound to be breathless at times, but the author allows himself to be reasonably expansive on the key episodes. This applies particularly to the causality and characteristics of the Sicilian revolt in 1282, which have received a lot of revisionist treatment in recent years. Indeed, Abulafia charts his route with admirable finesse through a veritable minefield of scholarly disagreement about the economic and social condition of Sicily in the late medieval period. The book is well-structured and each chapter has a handy conclusion summing up its main arguments. In fact, my only quibble with this volume is that it is written in a rather tired prose style. Too often Abulafia reaches for a stale phrase to encapsulate a development: repeatedly there are accretions of power, ambition is overweening, prices are paid, and roots are put down. At the end of the preface the author describes first his family and, a paragraph later, his former tutor as 'eminently agreeable' company. But this does not seriously detract from the value of a survey which teachers and scholars alike will appreciate for its wealth of information, interpretation and insight.

UNIVERSITY OF LEICESTER

NORMAN HOUSLEY

Studio e scuola in Arezzo durante il Medioevo e il Rinascimento. I documenti d'archivio fino al 1530. Edited by Robert Black. Pp. 873. Rome: Herder, 1996. L. 150,000. 88 86830 00 99

This is a book of great value to the small but important band of scholars dedicated to the institutional history of education in the later Middle Ages and Renaissance: 1,284 archival documents illustrating the history of Arezzo's university and its schools from 1241 to 1530, prefaced by a calendar of all the documents and a useful introduction by its editor, who is an expert both on Arezzo and on Italian education in this period. As Black says, the precocity of Arezzo as a centre of education in the thirteenth century is well known from the classic work of H       Wieruszowski. What is novel is to be told that, despite its growing poverty and powerlessness after being subjected to Florentine overlordship in 1384, Arezzo's university was briefly resurrected in 1456 (though more for political than educational reasons) and the teaching of grammar in its schools was maintained against the odds – after 1493, however, perhaps due to Savonarola's influence, it was more decisively in the hands of clerics than lay teachers. Interestingly, the poorer the commune, the greater was the importance attributed to the teaching of Latin (rather than the less elitist, more vocational abacus, whose teachers by far outpassed grammar teachers in the richer city of Florence by the 1480s): for towns that lacked economic resources had to 'grease themselves by other extraordinary means' to keep themselves alive (p. 167). In view of the imbalance between part I (161 documents relating to Arezzo's university) and part II (1,123 documents relating to its schools, including, for instance, well over a hundred repeatedly-renewed contracts for Francesco di ser Feo di Nigi), some cutting might have been in order – perhaps an abbreviated table of dates and payments to teachers like Francesco di ser Feo, on the model of those in Armando Verde's magisterial study of the Florentine Studio. But far be it from me to complain of a superabundance of documents, especially in view of the scale of other comparable studies. Instead we must congratulate the editor of the Accademia Petrarca of Arezzo for providing us with such an exceptional body of material. It will provide a firm foundation for all future work not only on education in late medieval Italian communes but also on their social life and practices.

ROYAL HOLLOWAY,
UNIVERSITY OF LONDON

ALISON BROWN

Stories of the rose. The making of the rosary in the Middle Ages. By Anne Winston-Allen. Pp. xiv + 210 incl. frontispiece and 40 ills. University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University, 1997. £25.50 (\$28.50). 0 271 01631 0

The traditional legend that the rosary was invented by St Dominic was laid to rest by two Jesuits: the Bollandist scholar Thomas Esser writing in the 1880s and the Englishman Herbert Thurston some years later. Subsequently a date as late as sometime in the fifteenth century became the accepted orthodoxy for the beginning of this devotion, until in 1977 Andreas Heinz discovered a collection of meditations on the rosary used around 1300 by Cistercian nuns in German. Winston-Allen in this excellent survey shows how the various elements came

together to form what became an exceptionally popular devotion in the late Middle Ages and subsequently in the Roman Catholic Church. Beads had been used for counting in a variety of prayers much earlier, including by Lady Godiva of Coventry (died 1041) who bequeathed to the Benedictine priory she founded a set of gems threaded on a cord that she used to recite her prayers (p. 14). The 'Hail Mary' prayer evolved from the eleventh century onwards and the fifteen 'mysteries' gradually came to be established as material for meditation while the decades of Hail Marys and an Our Father were being recited. The result was a brilliantly successful form of piety especially adapted to the illiterate. Christian and scriptural in inspiration, yet it cleverly linked into various secular themes, notably the rose as a symbol of love, the rose garden and even the hunt of the unicorn (ch. iv). The great popularity of the devotion in the late Middle Ages revealed itself in the numerous rosary confraternities: the one founded in Cologne in 1472, for example, enrolled over 100,000 members in its first seven years (p. 4); and of the fifty-five volumes of medieval Latin religious lyrics collected in the *Analecta hymnica*, rosaries and Marian psalters take up the better part of three volumes (p. 13). Even if St Dominic was not the inventor of the rosary, fifteenth-century Dominicans, especially of the Observant reform, were greatly influential in spreading the devotion. While generally appreciative, Winston-Allen keeps her critical sense. The rosary could lead to a mechanical and by-rote approach to prayer, an excessive interest in the indulgences attached to its recitation by various ecclesiastical authorities: both points emphasised by Martin Luther. This carefully researched and very well-illustrated study is much recommended.

CAMPION HALL,
OXFORD

NORMAN TANNER

Katharismus im Untergrund. Die Reorganisation durch Petrus Auterii 1300–1310. By Hans Christoph Stoodt. (Spätmittelalter und Reformation. Neue Reihe, 5.) Pp. ix + 373 incl. 1 fig. + 1 pull-out map. Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr (Paul Siebeck), 1996. DM 198. 3 16 146156 8

This book, sister to M. Benad's *Domus und Religion in Montailou*, uses the registers of d'Ablis, Gui and Fournier for a detailed analysis of the career of Pierre Autier, prime mover in the Cathar revival in the highlands of Foix in the first decade of the fourteenth century. It takes its origin from a doctoral thesis of 1988 in the faculty of evangelical theology at Frankfurt am Main: inordinate delay means that the author has not been able to use G. Rottenwöhler on doctrine, which outpaces his own chapter on Pierre's teaching, or Anne Brenon on Cathar women or M. Hanssler's statistical analysis, which would have added a needful perspective. Stoodt exaggerates Autier's originality: what are grandly described as hospices, the framework for the revival, were simply safe houses, where the perfect could lie up securely, and meet supporters. They were a pragmatic response to change, as he notes (pp. 203–4), and they were surely not a novel expedient, for the collapse of the old territorial system and the emergence of the mobile perfect had taken effect a generation earlier, as the careers of Guillaume Prunel and Guillaume Pagès show. There is cogent criticism of historians, but it is not always on target. Raimond Issaurat's evidence, not cited, is weighty in favour of Duvernoy's belief that the Autiers used the camouflage of being pedlars

of knives. There is a shaky interpretation of the *melioramentum*, which was surely not normally regarded as a binding commitment to receive the *consolamentum* at death. But the book also has a bulk of interesting information, scattered in footnotes as well as text, makes thorough use of Gui's Register, commonly underused, and brings up valuable nuggets, such as the strange episode in which Pierre, for all his rigour, consoled a two-year-old. Many safe houses are listed and set in context (a good section, pp. 148–210). The background to the flight to Lombardy is well studied, and rightly throws up Pierre's credit swindle. There are intriguing passages, drawn from Stoodt's theological background, on Manichaeism and Gnosticism. This is a book to browse in with profit.

EASTCOMBE,
STROUD

M. D. LAMBERT

Omne bonum. A fourteenth-century encyclopedia of universal knowledge. British Library MSS Royal 6 E VI–6 E VII, I: Text; II: Illustrated catalogue. By Lucy Freeman Sandler. Pp. 208 + 118 ills; 272 incl. 760 ills. London: Harvey Miller, 1996. £120. 1 872501 75 3

The universalising outlook of the Middle Ages, the attempt to capture 'a moment in medieval thought' in some vast encyclopaedic compilation, found several literary expressions in fourteenth-century England. One remarkable example is the *Omne bonum*, a type of universal encyclopaedia whose contents are examined and catalogued in the present publication. The *Omne bonum*, so called because 'all good things are contained in it in some manner', survives in a single manuscript of almost 1,100 folios, written between 1360 and 1375. Not surprisingly the encyclopaedia was never completed. Its entries, concerned predominantly with medieval learning, were drawn from a wide variety of sources including collections of canon law, theological treatises and works such as the *De proprietatibus rerum* of Bartholomeus Anglicus. Part of its interest lies in the alphabetical arrangement of its entries, which under the letter A, for example, contains items as varied as Abbess, Abstinence and Africa. As a statement of 'universal knowledge' the *Omne bonum* is perhaps strongest on the teachings of the Church, geography and natural history. Its anonymous author, described simply as James in the preface of his work, has for some time engaged the attention of scholars. Although Pantin and others considered the encyclopaedia to be the work of a Cistercian monk with a pronounced anti-Franciscan bias, Sandler argues convincingly that the author was James le Palmer, a king's clerk who from 1368 occupied the position of Engrosser in the Exchequer. Among the clues to his identity his highly distinctive script in the *Omne bonum* is perhaps the most significant. The same script is found in a copy of the Gospel Commentary of William of Nottingham, where the scribe and owner is named as James le Palmer. The *Omne bonum* is interesting for a variety of reasons. It shows that the encyclopaedic works of fourteenth-century England could take several forms. It reveals again that a compilation of this nature often associated with monastic ownership and the resources of a monastic library could be written outside a great religious centre. The *Omne bonum* is also of interest for its indication of the intellectual pursuits, 'out of office hours', of one fourteenth-century government administrator. Among his contemporaries James le Palmer was perhaps

exceptional. His work is not the type of literary activity usually associated with government clerks during the final decades of Edward III's reign. He appears also to have possessed sufficient financial resources to employ a number of artists and craftsmen to illustrate many of the individual entries in his work. Their outstanding workmanship would alone make his encyclopaedia of more than usual interest. Altogether, if only by reason of his dedication to this formidable enterprise, undertaken, it would seem, purely for his own satisfaction, James le Palmer is worthy of notice. Professor Sandler is to be congratulated on bringing his work to the attention of a modern audience in a publication which is splendidly produced, highly readable and meticulous in its scholarship.

UNIVERSITY OF LEEDS

JOHN TAYLOR

Carnevale e Quaresima. Comportamenti sociali e cultura a Firenze nel Rinascimento. By Giovanni Ciappelli. (Temi e Testi. Nuova Serie, 37.) Pp. 376. Rome: Edizioni di Storia e Letteratura, 1997. L. 75,000 (paper). 88 900138 7 7

The thesis of this richly researched book is that carnival and Lent defined the Florentine calendar from 1300 to c. 1500, from events as intimate as sexual intercourse to 'public' feasts, jousts and rites of violence, whether they were the stone-throwing battles of adolescents or state executions. Ciappelli has expertly quarried both the printed and archival riches of late-medieval Florence. While making use of well-trodden sources such as the letters of Datini and Alessandra Strozzi for new purposes, he has found almanacs extending back to the fourteenth century and has used tax records to determine whether commoners ate meat during Lent. Some may object to Ciappelli's division of public and private. What public officials ate in the Palazzo Vecchio (or Pubblico as it was called in other city-states) is defined as 'private' as is the devotional calendar of the religious confraternities. Some may quarrel with his statistics: public executions show a decline not a rise during carnival. (Only 8 per cent of executions occurred within these sixty-nine days from 1 January to 10 March; a random distribution would produce a figure of 19 per cent). Moreover, does a fall in conceptions of 20 per cent during Lent show such a sweeping sexual abstinence as Ciappelli maintains? No comparative figures are supplied for other times or places. More troublesome for this reader, however, is Ciappelli's failure to deliver on his promise – to establish through comparative research the specificity of Florentine society c. 1300 to 1500. Instead, the rhythm of carnival and Lent in Florence seems much of a sameness throughout this long period. The only punctuation mark is Savonarola's short-lived attempt 'to Christianise carnival', which, according to the author, was no revolution but only a return to the days of San Bernardino.

UNIVERSITY OF GLASGOW

SAMUEL COHN

The chronicle of Adam Usk, 1377–1421. Edited and translated by C. Given-Wilson. (Oxford Medieval Texts.) Pp. xciv + 290. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1997. £45. 0 19 820483 3

Adam Usk was born c. 1360 and died early in 1430. He was Welsh, of gentle birth, largely but not wholly assimilated to Englishry. Though *litteratus*, he

probably spoke Welsh more readily than he wrote it, and the same may be true of his English and Italian. He was an Oxford civilian and canonist, whom Henry Chichele succeeded in his chair of civil law. He was grateful for the patronage of the earl of March, and subsequently served Thomas Arundel, archbishop of Canterbury, whom he greatly esteemed, Henry iv, several popes, one anti-pope, and not improbably Owen Glendower, though he returned eventually to the allegiance and patronage of the English crown. He narrowly missed two bishoprics in Wales, and was cheated of the archdeaconry of Buckingham by the tattle of malicious tongues. It was an eventful and sometimes over-exciting career, and he also wrote a chronicle, in his own copy of the *Polychronicon* (BL, ms Add. 10104). The work was identified and twice edited by Edward Maunde Thompson, the first time in 1876, in an incomplete state, and the second in 1906 after the fortuitous discovery of the final quire amongst the duke of Rutland's manuscripts at Belvoir. Thompson was an exact scholar and a learned palaeographer, and it is a trepidatious thing to follow him, and even more to disagree with him. Given-Wilson does, however, disagree with him, and in a convincing fashion. Thompson's conclusion was that the chronicle was the work of Usk's retirement, and that it was copied well after his death. Given-Wilson argues that it was in large part written close to events, over several decades, and that some of it is in Usk's own hand. His assessment does not wholly undo Thompson's judgement that the chief interest of the work lies in its personal qualities, because it is an intensely personal document. It nevertheless adds weight to some particular passages, such as Usk's account of Bolingbroke's usurpation, which is probably based upon a journal which Usk kept for the purpose, or of his renewed disillusionment with Henry iv when he returned through Wales to England after some years of exile in Rome and tentative conspiracy in Flanders. His comments on Henry v's triumphs and exactions are also significant, and, while his description of Henry iv's sickness remains as enigmatic as ever, his reference to Henry v's deteriorating health has a strong claim to attention. The text is altogether lively. Usk was very Welsh. He enjoyed hearing and retailing a good story, and he had a ready affinity with the mystical and the supernatural. He had dreams and visions, and gave them serious attention. That he also took himself seriously is merely human, but it lends a distinct flavour to his work. Given-Wilson has captured all those nuances in his learned introduction and his felicitous translation of a difficult but rewarding text. His edition is a valuable acquisition.

UNIVERSITY OF ESSEX

G. H. MARTIN

Kardinal Jean Jouffroy (†1473). *Leben und Werk*. By Claudia Märkl. (Beiträge zur Geschichte und Quellenkunde des Mittelalters, 18.) Pp. 400. Sigmaringen: Thorbecke, 1996. DM 108. 3 7995 5718 0

The career of Jean Jouffroy is not unknown to specialists in fifteenth-century history, as an ecclesiastic widely involved in the politics and diplomacy of Burgundy and France. He was the subject of a solid monograph by Fierville in 1874. The present study, however, far excels this in scope and depth. It is an exemplary work of exceptional thoroughness, based on prodigious industry and

exploration of a very wide range of archives not only at the Vatican but in the localities where Jouffroy held benefices. Many documents, such as the despatches of the envoys of various Italian states at the Roman Curia, are extensively transcribed and cited in the text and notes. As well as surveying his activity at the Curia, especially under Pius II and Paul II, for example his involvement in various famous ecclesiastical ceremonies such as the reception of the head of St Andrew in Rome, the canonisation of St Catherine of Siena or the Corpus Christi celebrations in Viterbo in 1462, there is further discussion of his particular part as 'procurateur du roy en cour de Rome' from 1462. His part in the Guerre du Bien Public under Louis XI and his two embassies to Castile (1469–70) are fully documented. There is new information on his contacts with, and income from, his various benefices such as the abbacies of Luxeuil and of St Denis (1464–73) and his periods as bishop of Arras (1453–62) and of Albi (1462–73). Perhaps the central question of 'vocation' is never fully debated: how did Jouffroy view his ecclesiastical offices and his obligations to them? Was he simply a 'political' cardinal? How concerned was he about the pastoral health of the Church in his day? While much of the material for answering these questions is provided there is a reluctance by the author to expand on such larger questions. Apart from the ecclesiastical aspects of this study there is much here for the cultural historian. His new palace at Pienza is fully discussed in the light of a good deal of recent literature. And while Jouffroy's book collection has had considerable attention from previous scholars, the depth of this study is remarkable. An important chapter (pp. 285–97) includes transcripts of some of his marginalia in various manuscripts. A list of his works or those attributed to him is given and again new precision is added to our knowledge here, chiefly on sermons or orations. A list of manuscripts of the 'obedience' orations on behalf of Philip the Good of Burgundy to Nicholas V on 2 March 1448 and to Pius II in March 1459 is of special interest – a major study of this genre of speeches is still lacking. The author demonstrates the indebtedness of Pius II's *Commentaries* to Jouffroy's own chronicle on Philip the Good of Burgundy. All in all, a most welcome addition to the growing list of serious monographs on Renaissance cardinals, and one that will be useful to scholars of many areas of fifteenth-century studies. It might inspire others to tackle the many other fifteenth-century cardinals who similarly lack serious biographies.

UNIVERSITY OF BRISTOL

TONY ANTONOVICS

Rechtsentscheide mittelalterlicher englischer Rabbinen. Aus dem Hebräischen und Aramäischen. Translation and notes by Hans-Georg von Mutius. (Judentum und Umwelt. Realms of Judaism, 60.) Pp. x + 149. Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang, 1995. 3 631 48493 3; 0721 3131

This is the latest volume in a series devoted to the publication of medieval *Responsa*, most of which were previously available only in Hebrew or Aramaic. The *Responsa*, 'queries and replies', embody the rulings of eminent rabbis on *Halakhic* issues, especially the interpretation of family and commercial law. As a primary source for the history of the medieval Anglo-Jewry, where all differences not concerning the pleas of the crown were to be judged 'by themselves according to their own law', they are of particular value. They throw light on aspects of the

internal life of the community not found in state records: on family and marital affairs, notably diet and divorce, as well as commercial relations such as the lending of money and transfer of debt between Jews. The volume is welcome not only for providing the first comprehensive collection of English medieval *Responsa* but also because, through earlier works in the series, von Mutius enables us to place them in the wider context of interpretations by Rhenish, Moorish and Provençal rabbis.

UNIVERSITY OF BRISTOL

JOE HILLABY

Reformations old and new. Essays on the socio-economic impact of religious change, c. 1470–1630. Edited by Beat Kümin. (St Andrews Studies in Reformation History.) Pp. xiv + 272 incl. 5 tables, 5 figs and 2 maps. Aldershot: Scolar Press, 1996. £45. 1 85928 220 2

The culture of English Puritanism, 1560–1700. Edited by Christopher Durston and Jacqueline Eales. (Themes in Focus.) Pp. viii + 332. Basingstoke–London: Macmillan, 1996. £40 (cloth), £13.99 (paper). 0 333 59745 1; 0 333 59746 X

It is easy for reviewers to gauge their standing with editors. The most favoured are sent hefty monographs which everyone wants to read but no-one can afford. The least favoured are sent collections of essays. To be sent two collections for a single review is a sign of deep disapproval. One is forced into spurious comparisons and contrasts, in a dutiful search for some half-convincing themes. Well.... The Kumin collection has fourteen research-pieces by younger historians, mainly on local aspects of the Reformation in Europe. The Durston–Eales volume has nine surveys by well-established scholars of themes in post-Reformation England. The two sets are very different, therefore, but they are both, in their ways, useful.

Dr Kumin asked his authors to examine three issues – continuity and change, religious and secular motives, and winners and losers – and then shuffled their responses into five groups of essays. On the state of the clergy, Arnoud-Jan Bijsterveld charts the rise in university education and residence in north Brabant, Peter Dykema looks at the influence of the University of Tübingen and the Brethren of the Common Life in fifteenth-century Württemberg, and David Newcombe demonstrates that in 1551 Bishop Hooper found moderate achievement and not total ignorance among Gloucester priests. On finance, Richard Cahill shows that the sequestrated revenues of Hessian monasteries were mainly devoted to education and to hospitals, and Patrick Carter suggests that the laity supported their priests in opposition to Henry VIII's clerical taxation. On patronage, Per Ingesman considers that the end of episcopal patronage in Denmark brought a reduction in social mobility, Peter Marshall demonstrates that the dispersal of monastic patronage in East Yorkshire made little difference to appointees, and Trevor Johnson argues that Lutheran nobles resisted the reCatholicisation of the Upper Palatinate by appealing to their rights as patrons. On education, Markus Wriedt examines the medieval precedents for Luther's educational programme, William Naphy looks at the disruption of education in Geneva between 1502 and 1558, and Karin Maag recounts how the revenues of Grossmunster benefices were used for the Zurich academy and for travel

bursaries. Finally, on poor relief, Timothy Fehler shows how the pressure of immigration at Emden forced reform of social provision, and Andrew Spicer studies the well-organised systems of collection and relief among exile communities in England. The editor's innocuous themes do not figure prominently, and the essays are brisk reports of local investigations. In an international batch of contributors, it is noticeable that the Anglo-Saxons were determinedly empirical, but some others struggled to hitch their studies to grand themes – modernisation, confessionalisation, social polarisation.

In the main, the Durston–Eales team look down from Olympian heights rather than up from the coal-face. The editors examine 'the Puritan ethos', eschew semantic games, and conclude that what was usually 'an oppositional, agitational movement' had 'a common spiritual and cultural outlook'. Patrick Collinson considers the negative and positive aspects of Puritan religious culture – hostility to dancing, games and plays, encouragement of exercises, fasts and sermon-gadding. Martin Ingram mines the rich records of the dean of Salisbury's peculiar to reveal the cultural clash between Puritan clergy and their parishioners, and suggests that after 1604–5 ministers adopted a less confrontational approach. Margaret Aston tells some interesting tales of Puritan iconoclasm, and Peter Lake contrasts the Puritan self-image as the only real Christians with their enemies' accusations of hypocrisy and singularity. Ralph Houlbrooke uses funeral sermons and spiritual biographies to distinguish the Puritan way of death advocated by Becon and Perkins, with a death-bed profession of faith, from the way of Andrewes and Taylor, by confession and communion. Jacqueline Eales argues for a continuity of Puritanism on 'a road to revolution' from 1559 to 1642, with common techniques of opposition through books, lectures, petitions and surveys. Christopher Durston shows Puritans failing to impose their cultural agenda when in power between 1645 and 1660, and John Spurr traces the Puritan fragmentation after 1660. These essays vary in significance and sophistication, but they are all business-like and well-presented (though the index is terrible).

The two volumes reflect their origins. Despite the best efforts of the editor to draw out themes and issues, *Reformations old and new* is a haphazard compilation which arose from a meeting of young scholars, the European Reformation Research Group. The second volume is a well-planned collection with firm editorial control, and commissioned essays from professionals who know how to write. But both are encouraging. It is good to know that there is new research-life in old subjects, and reassuring to be reminded that historians get better with age.

CHRIST CHURCH,
OXFORD

CHRISTOPHER HAIGH

Nuns as artists. The visual culture of a medieval convent. By Jeffrey F. Hamburger. (California Studies in the History of Art, 37.) Pp. xxvi + 318 incl.

frontispiece, 1 map and 117 figs + 12 colour plates. Berkeley–Los Angeles–

London: University of California Press, 1997. £40. 0 520 20386 0

Despite the proliferation of scholarly works on the topic of medieval religious women, this book is a rare example devoted to the study of their material culture.

Jeffrey Hamburger considers the visual culture of the Benedictine nunnery of St Walburg, Eichstätt, Bavaria, presenting a theoretically ambitious and closely argued contextual study. He aims to dispel the art-historical myth that women's creative products were few or unimportant, a view that has exiled their work to the realms of folk art. He reviews the categories of *Nonnenarbeiten*, works produced by nuns without formal artistic training, and *Kleines Andachtsbild*, small devotional works and textiles; both loose categories which he classes as 'dumping grounds for images, often made by and for women, with which art history would rather not be bothered'. This study not only reclaims and redefines *Nonnenarbeiten*, but explores the way in which images were central to the piety and devotional routines of religious women. Hamburger focuses on a group of twelve drawings produced by one hand, c. 1500, in the convent of Walburg. His discovery of the drawings and tracing of their provenance is a compelling tale worthy of A. S. Byatt's fictional *Possession*. He observes that the drawings themselves are of marginal aesthetic quality, although they certainly possess a charming naivety. The main body of the book examines the iconographic context of themes found in the Walburg group, including Crucifixions, the Agony in the Garden, the Adoration of the Magi, the Eucharistic Banquet and the Consecration of Virgins. A number of the Walburg images exhibit the predilections of medieval female religiosity that were first noted by Caroline Walker Bynum. Developing this theme, Hamburger explores the eucharistic and mystical concerns evident in blood-soaked crucifixions, depictions of Christ's body turned inside out on the cross, the wounded heart, and the heart as house. He proposes that such images can be viewed from the nun's perspective, from 'the inside out, rather than from the outside in', and argues convincingly that they express a sense of interiority that was experienced by medieval religious women. Hamburger contends that the Walburg images are evidence of an institutionalised mysticism, and that they allow us to glimpse an 'experimental practice of prayer in which the viewing of images complements the reading of texts as both the means and ends of devotional activity'. He presents a strong contextual study, its only omission perhaps being the lack of a broader, comparative canvas. It would be useful, for example, to have some indication of the wider corpus and potential of surviving works produced by nuns. How did such images function within the more expansive visual culture of the convent, including wall-paintings and more formal devotional works? Did the nuns' sense of interiority extend to the form and character of convent architecture? Hamburger's thought-provoking book is a landmark in the study of female spirituality. It will encourage us to formulate new questions for the interrogation of the material culture of religious women.

UNIVERSITY OF READING

ROBERTA GILCHRIST

Church art and architecture in the Low Countries before 1566. By Jeremy Dupertuis Bangs. (Sixteenth Century Essays & Studies, 37.) Pp. xii + 244 incl. 222 ills. Kirksville, Mo: Sixteenth Century Journal Publishers, 1997. \$65. 0 940474

39 5

This well-illustrated book admirably focuses on a significant moment in the history of European art, particularly medieval architecture, and adds to the

scholarship in English about the Low Countries more specifically. The author maps out church architecture and decoration in the Hapsburg territories of Charles v and Philip II before iconoclasm in 1566. He precisely delineates the cultural landscape that was devastated and explains what remained – often more than we imagine. He begins with the often paradoxical nature of definitions of iconoclasm (summarising J. Scheerder and D. Freedberg), which contemporaries perceived by turns as heresy and purification; he then proceeds to the example of Leiden's Pieterskerk. We are able to reconstruct the material church before and after 1566, and thereby to place that year's more famous events within the context both of Calvinist actions over four centuries and the devastations of war. In the second of three compact parts ('Destruction', 'Inside the churches' and 'Medieval and Renaissance churches and gothic design') Bangs furnishes the pre-Reformation interior, from fonts and pulpits to textiles (including vestments) and ritual articles. He makes a careful inventory of the kinds of objects (stained glass, tabernacles, paintings and altars) that were less likely to survive. The concise formal analyses and reproductions of examples according to types are particularly valuable. This discussion especially renders the study a major resource since the author casts a wide net over religious foundations through the sixteenth century, inserting church building in the Low Countries into the panorama of cross-cultural artistic exchange and liturgical practice in Europe from 1350 onwards. We are able, by implication, to compare northern and southern European interiors, both in morphology (for example the *sacramentshuis*) and in iconography (how did Protestants view Catholic images?), before the Reformation and after. This study allows us, then, to separate the seeming verisimilitude of depictions of Netherlandish interiors (from Van Eyck to Saenredam) from the spirituality and symbolism that were artistic languages in their own right, and to recreate more realistically the attitudes of both the iconoclasts and Netherlandish congregations in the physical settings of their communion with God.

UNIVERSITY OF MARYLAND

MEREDITH J. GILL

Biblical interpretation in the era of the Reformation. Essays presented to David C. Steinmetz in honor of his sixtieth birthday. Edited by Richard A. Muller and John L. Thompson. Pp. xvi + 351 incl. frontispiece. Grand Rapids, Mich.–Cambridge: Eerdmans, 1996. \$35. 0 8028 3819 7

David Steinmetz has made his mark on a number of areas of sixteenth-century scholarship, as outlined by Heiko Oberman in his introductory tribute at the beginning of this volume. Perhaps the most significant of these is the history of biblical exegesis. Steinmetz has been an important pioneer in the move towards viewing the exegesis of the Reformers not in splendid isolation but as part of an ongoing tradition. In pursuing that aim the present volume is a fitting tribute to his work.

In the opening chapter, 'Biblical interpretation in the era of the Reformation: the view from the Middle Ages', Richard Muller begins by surveying the progress of scholarship in the last two decades towards placing Reformation exegesis in its diachronic context. He then points in turn to the elements both of continuity and

of discontinuity between medieval and Reformation exegesis. Finally, in a 'prologue to the present volume' he offers a useful survey of the conclusions of most of the following chapters. Earlier in the chapter he also touches on another aspect of the work of David Steinmetz – his well-known article on 'The superiority of pre-critical exegesis' and the Ten Theses that preceded it. This theme is picked up by both editors in the penultimate chapter which again argues for the value of 'pre-critical' exegesis, though not to the exclusion of historical criticism.

The final chapter is a chronological bibliography of Steinmetz's writings, listing ten books, about fifty articles and a number of other items. This could have been more useful if the listing of articles had indicated which have been reproduced in the author's *Luther in context* and *Calvin in context*, information that is of significance to those who might be stimulated not merely to admire the breadth of Steinmetz's scholarship but actually to avail themselves more fully of it. Also one of the book titles is given incorrectly and an article is listed twice, with different volume numbers for the periodical in which it appears. But despite these blemishes the bibliography is a useful checklist for spotting which gems one might have overlooked.

The remaining fourteen chapters examine specific aspects of the exegesis of early modern figures (mostly Protestant Reformers), setting this in its historical context. Most chapters helpfully refer to the biographical and bibliographical resources available on the figure concerned. These chapters all make a worthwhile contribution to the theme of the volume, but some are especially interesting as they at the same time shed light on other topics of interest. Space permits mention only of a few which, in the (totally objective) judgement of the reviewer, are the most interesting.

In the second chapter, which for some reason is twice as long as the average, Karlfried Froehlich outlines Trithemius' *Tractatus de inuestigatione Sacrae Scripturae*, an unoriginal work which therefore 'allows us to catch a glimpse of late medieval hermeneutics in its most normal, most traditional, and most trivial form'. Froehlich shows which works Trithemius is plagiarising at each stage of his treatise. Those Reformation scholars who feel the need to learn more about late medieval exegesis will find this chapter especially illuminating.

Carl Leth compares Balthasar Hubmaier's exegesis of Matthew xvi.18–19 with that of Luther, Zwingli and Erasmus. He finds that Hubmaier on this text stands much closer to the Catholic tradition than to Luther and Zwingli, being in broad agreement with Erasmus. He is not to be seen as following in the footsteps of Luther and Zwingli but 'emerges as a thinker in critical dialogue – and significant continuity – with Catholic sources'.

Peter Stephens discusses Zwingli's treatment of John vi.63, setting this in the context of the eucharistic debates and showing how Zwingli's thought develops. In so doing he examines the Seeberg–Gollwitzer interpretation of Zwingli, which traces the difference between Luther and Zwingli back to their different understandings of flesh and spirit. He concludes that while there is some truth in this interpretation, it is at best a half-truth which ultimately misinterprets Zwingli.

Joel Kok compares Bullinger's and Calvin's commentaries on Romans. His purpose is to test the claim of Fritz Büsser that Bullinger was 'Calvin's model in

biblical exposition'. He finds that the two Reformers agree on the need for clarity and brevity, but also detects important differences. 'It is more accurate to see Bullinger and Calvin as sharing important exegetical standards and theological positions, with Calvin seeking to improve on the effort of his evangelical ally by offering a more doctrinally precise commentary.'

Lyle Bierma analyses Ursinus' exposition of the sabbath commandment, relating it to both Aquinas and Calvin. He finds elements of truth both in the claim that Ursinus followed Calvin and that he introduced a more scholastic element. In addition to these two influences, Ursinus was also more greatly indebted to Wittenberg and Zurich than is often realised.

John Farthing bravely examines Zanchi's exposition of Hosea i–iii in the light of contemporary feminist criticism. He finds Zanchi largely innocent of 'the arguably misogynistic rhetoric and stereotyping that are so pervasive in ancient, medieval, and early modern Christianity'. 'For Zanchi – perhaps even more than for Hosea – human history before God and with God is also in some sense the story of a feminine experience.'

There will be few Reformation scholars whose knowledge of sixteenth-century exegesis is so broad that it will not be significantly improved by reading this book. This volume is to be welcomed not just as a fitting tribute to a widely-respected scholar but also as a significant contribution to the field that is close to his heart.

LONDON BIBLE COLLEGE

ANTHONY N. S. LANE

Art and spirituality in Counter-Reformation Rome. The Sistine and Pauline chapels in S. Maria Maggiore. By Steven F. Ostrow. (Monuments of Papal Rome.) Pp. xxi + 385 incl. 160 ills + 10 colour plates. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996. £55 (\$85). 0 521 47031 5

Art and faith in Tridentine Spain (1545–1690). By Alain Saint-Saëns. (Ibérica, 14.) Pp. xii + 225. New York: Peter Lang, 1995. £22 (paper). 0 8204 2644 X; 1056 5000

Off the nave aisles of Santa Maria Maggiore in Rome are two balancing baroque chapels, one called 'Sistine' after Sixtus v and the other 'Pauline' after Paul v: each pope being buried, along with a predecessor, in the chapel which is a visual manifesto of his piety and beliefs in the form of a shrine made to display the church's two most venerable possessions more grandly than before and with more pointed significance. The Sistine Chapel contains the *Presepio*, a virtual recreation of the shrine of the Nativity in Bethlehem. Sixtus, stimulated by his Franciscan devotion to the crib, had the whole thing (a masterpiece by Arnolfo di Cambio of extraordinary beauty and power) crated and then lowered into the middle of the floor of his new chapel by means of a formidable array of pulleys powered by horses, and surmounted by a huge tabernacle or *tempietto*, supported with easy grace by four bronze angels by Torrigiani. The Pauline Chapel contains the miraculous icon of the Virgin and Child, known as *Salus Populi Romani* and attributed to St Luke, with help from angels. It became the altarpiece of the new chapel, held aloft by five large gilt-bronze angels on a sky of lapis lazuli. Steven Ostrow's book consists of four essays: a pair on the Sistine Chapel and a pair on the Pauline. Like their subject, they are symmetrical and deal with the focus of each chapel, *Presepio* or icon, and the pictorial schemes which surround and

expound them. So the book is not exactly a monograph nor an exhaustive treatment of its twin subjects, as Ostrow explains. But it is very well made, rich and rewarding all the same. Ostrow has mastered the literature which both these chapels have stimulated from the start, mixed in some plausible and original ideas of his own (though some more argument for the document printed in Appendix III as indubitably being *Bozio's* programme for the Pauline frescoes would have been reassuring) and produced a book which speaks volumes about the Counter-Reformation in Rome by the visual and social means of architecture, art, devotion and liturgy which were so important to the whole movement. He is particularly interesting on the literal/historical character of the fresco scheme in Sixtus' chapel, that pope being a productive scholar of the Vulgate, and on the bid to reclaim the Epistle to the Romans from Protestant heretics in the Pauline chapel – along with aggressive emphasis on miracles and the conquest of heresy. Counter-Reformation polemics are well understood as being grounded in Marian interpretation of the Incarnation. Why then does the result of it – lavishly, deliberately and resourcefully deployed as it is in these two chapels – not bear comparison with what remains of Arnolfo di Cambio's thirteenth-century crib after Sixtus' rehousing, nor with Rubens's Chiesa Nuova altarpiece which, Ostrow persuasively suggests, drew on the Pauline setting of the miraculous icon for the solution of problems set by its first version (now in Grenoble)? The notoriously ephemeral nature of polemic, not least when it comes from the top with a big budget, is one possible reason. Another is that the painters employed, apart from Guido Reni, were not distinguished. Ostrow stops short of such speculation, but his book gives the reader reason to ponder it and resources for doing so. Alain Saint-Saëns is also a lively and sympathetic historian, but the fruits of his labours are not so handsomely presented (no pictures, crude typography) and are sometimes oddly expressed. His enjoyments are infectious and the generous provision of notes and bibliographies will surely prove a mine to future readers and historians of the religion of Spain's Golden Age.

CHRIST CHURCH,
OXFORD

JOHN DRURY

The freedom of spirit, social privilege, and religious dissent. Caspar Schwenckfeld and the Schwenckfelders. By R. Emmet McLaughlin. (Bibliotheca Dissidentium. Scripta et Studia, 6.) Pp. 271 incl. frontispiece. Baden-Baden–Bouxwiller: Éditions Valentin Koerner, 1996. DM 220. 3 87320 886 5

Emmet McLaughlin's new book is the latest in the series, *Bibliotheca Dissidentium: Scripta et Studia*, described in this JOURNAL¹ as the most significant contribution to Radical Reformation studies since the *Mennonite encyclopedia*. Apart from a lengthy introduction, all the material in this book has already appeared over a period stretching from 1979 to 1994. Chapters treat issues such as the different world-views and legacies of Caspar Schwenckfeld and Sebastian Franck, Schwenckfeld's views on Scripture, the genesis of Schwenckfeld's eucharistic doctrine and his role in the south German eucharistic controversy, the location and social background

¹ Christopher J. Burchill, 'Review Article: Spiritualism and the dissident mind', this JOURNAL xxxviii (1981), 437–45.

of Schwenckfelders throughout south Germany, and the clash between Schwenckfeld and Martin Bucer. Coming from the leading Schwenckfeld scholar of our day, this book complements McLaughlin's 1986 monograph on Schwenckfeld by filling in the picture of Schwenckfeld's efforts throughout Silesia and southern Germany. McLaughlin's work belongs to the new historiography of spiritualist reform encouraged by completion of the *Corpus Schwenckfeldianorum* in 1961, one that includes earlier contributions by Ed Furcha, Peter Erb, Horst Weigelt and this reviewer's recent work on Schwenckfeld's colleague Valentin Crautwald.²

Two chapters deal with Schwenckfeld's place within the eucharistic debates in southern Germany and constitute an impressive effort to wade through the mire of conflicting alignments and views. Deserving further study is McLaughlin's argument that there were two major reforming groups opposing Luther: those who followed Zwingli, and one independent of Zwingli that included Schwenckfeld, Crautwald, Oecolampadius, Bucer, Capito and eventually Calvin. Equally significant is the chapter on the Schwenckfelders in south Germany and Schwenckfeld's travels during 1533–6, establishing a network of friends, patrons and disciples. The appeal of Schwenckfeld's teachings is attributed to his promotion of the spiritualist form of religion typical of the early Luther and Zwingli, and to his anti-clericalism, both of which attracted women to his movement. 'The politics of dissent' portrays Martin Bucer as a 'sly and versatile politician' in his dealings with the Schwenckfelders.

The most original contribution in this collection is the introduction, where McLaughlin interacts with recent historiography on key issues related to Schwenckfeld's career. McLaughlin appears to draw back significantly from some positions found in his 1986 book. He no longer features Luther as the reigning early influence on Schwenckfeld, but speaks of 'late medieval roots', and notes that 'it is difficult to sort out Schwenckfeld's guides'. And McLaughlin now grants that Valentin Crautwald 'remained the most valued colleague and resource for Schwenckfeld even after the latter's departure from Silesia' in 1529; no longer is Crautwald the linguistic expert who fades more and more into the background after 1527.

McLaughlin's introduction interacts extensively with the present reviewer's work on Crautwald, acknowledging 'some important insights' into Crautwald's thought, context and relationship with Schwenckfeld. In discussing the intellectual context that shaped Schwenckfeld (did it include Zwingli?), McLaughlin seems hesitant to acknowledge certain basic agreements between Zwingli and Schwenckfeld, such as the way in which the 'real presence' doctrine of Luther and the Catholics detracted from Christ's glory and honour as the only source of salvation, and the importance of faith as the only means of receiving God's grace. Schwenckfeld and Zwingli were part of a larger Augustinian sacramentarian movement that included Cornelius Hoen, Erasmus and Karsltadt. It seems strange to leave Zwingli 'out of the loop' as McLaughlin does. McLaughlin fails to take into account my book's evidence of agreement among the two reformers, evidence which depends on the original 1525 text of the

² *Crautwald and Erasmus: a study in humanism and radical reform in sixteenth-century Silesia*, Baden-Baden 1992.

'Twelve Questions' and on Schwenckfeld's letter of June 1525 in praise of Zwingli, *not* on later additions to the 'Twelve Questions' which Weigelt and Walter Köhler mistakenly appealed to.

On Crautwald's significance to Schwenckfeld and the larger movement, McLaughlin finds an incompatibility between Crautwald's 'ivory tower' humanist scholarship and a role of wide-ranging influence and importance within the movement. However, McLaughlin ignores the evidence for Schwenckfeld's pattern of deference to and dependence upon Crautwald, and for Schwenckfeld's ceaseless promotion, circulation and publication of Crautwald's works, from which he regularly borrowed excerpts in his own writings.

McLaughlin's introduction concludes with hints of a theme he plans to develop in a forthcoming book on the 'spiritualistic trajectory', a cultural shift that can be traced from the twelfth to the twentieth centuries and which, along with secularisation, produced the modern world. Meanwhile, this excellent work under review is worthy of attention by all Reformation scholars. It is marred, unfortunately, by numerous typos and has no index.

TRINITY WESTERN UNIVERSITY,
CANADA

DOUGLAS H. SHANTZ

The examinations of Anne Askew. Edited by Elaine V. Beilin. (Women Writers in English, 1350–1850.) Pp. lxi + 198 incl. 3 ills. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1996. £25 (cloth), £12.99 (paper). 0 19 510848 5; 0 19 510849 3. Before her execution as a heretic in 1546, the English gentlewoman Anne Askew wrote an account of her interrogations which has become one of the classic texts of the early English Reformation: it is at once terse, earnest, vivid and shot through with a wicked humour. Modern readers will particularly enjoy Askew's ability to manipulate contemporary assumptions about women for her own ends. Elaine Beilin's edition of Askew's work for Brown University's Women Project is to be welcomed. She includes the full text of the *Examinations* as first published in 1546–7, and also the version which appeared in John Foxe's *Acts and monuments* in 1563. Askew's bare text may be read in the latter; the earlier edition is padded with the verbose 'elucidations' of John Bale, which are of considerable interest to the historian, however questionable their literary merit. Professor Beilin's introduction contains a detailed bibliographic history and a valuable discussion of the various Askew apocrypha; she also argues persuasively that Askew's first examination should be re-dated to 1545. She is less sure-footed on Askew's broader historical context, seeming unaware of the fluidity of the religious politics of the mid 1540s, or of the importance of Askew's links with the court. The lack of an index is to be regretted, and Bale's marginalia lose much of their immediacy through being relegated to footnotes. Quibbles aside, however, this is a scholarly edition which makes a compelling and distinctive early modern voice accessible to a new audience.

ST CROSS COLLEGE,
OXFORD

ALEC RYRIE

Robert Ferrar, Yorkshire monk, Reformation bishop, and martyr in Wales (c. 1500–1555).

By Andrew J. Brown. Pp. 351. London: Inscriptor Imprints, 1997. £25.

0 9528271 1 5

Andrew J. Brown has previously shed new light on William Tyndale's early career, and his full-length study of Ferrar is likewise a meticulously-documented reconstruction. Ferrar has often been seen as a failure among reforming Tudor bishops, depressingly dogged by litigation under Edward VI, and even in his cruelly-protracted death at the stake in Carmarthen under Mary, upstaged by the Oxford martyrs. Brown is sympathetic to his subject's predicament as bishop of St David's: facing not a straight fight between traditional religion and evangelical reform, but a wide-ranging vexatious coalition of local men, several of whom had reforming credentials as good as his own. It was particularly curious that Ferrar's enemies included associates of the previous bishop, William Barlow, since Barlow was his erstwhile colleague in Henrician diplomacy, and a fellow-evangelical client of Thomas Cromwell. Brown's account is unlikely to be supplanted in its careful sifting of fact from error or supposition. Much confusion derives from John Foxe, who was blessed with a wealth of documentary evidence about Ferrar to write up in *Acts and monuments*, but who also had a nasty suspicion that it contributed little to edification. Much material in his pile of Ferrar papers cast an unsavoury light on senior Elizabethan churchmen, including a bishop of Bangor and an archbishop of York. Although Foxe was not averse to pointing out the imperfections of the 1559 Settlement which they personified, from edition to edition he wavered about what he would reveal about the murky affairs of Edwardian St David's. He also perpetrated a major error, subsequently much-repeated, in claiming that Ferrar was imprisoned under Edward VI. Brown convincingly disposes of this canard, thus removing a serious apparent anomaly in Edwardian church policy. His appendices tackling various prosopographical cruces, notably around William Barlow (whose name is otherwise Legion) enrich a volume which will be invaluable for the Reformation specialist.

ST CROSS COLLEGE,
OXFORD

DIARMAID MACCULLOCH

Devoted people. Belief and religion in early modern Ireland. By Raymond Gillespie. (Social and Cultural Values in Early Modern Europe.) Pp. x+198.

Manchester–New York: Manchester University Press, 1997. £40.

0 1790 4200 3

Though the study of religious belief from below is hardly a new field in early modern European history – it is now more than twenty-five years since the publication of Keith Thomas's classic study, *Religion and the decline of magic* – this is the first serious attempt to analyse the nature of popular religion during this period in Ireland. Fortunately, the wait has been worthwhile. Ray Gillespie's book covers the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries in impressive fashion, providing a comprehensive overview of the attitudes of the various components of Irish society. Writing clearly and fluently, he arranges his material thematically, beginning with the pervasive role of religion in general and providence in particular, then moving on to examine the significance of symbol

and ritual, the nature of the sacred as embodied in time and place, the world of supernatural events, wonders and prophecy, before concluding with an assessment of the efforts made to control and direct lay piety along more orthodox Reformation and Counter-Reformation lines. This achievement is all the more remarkable when its sources are considered. Given the lack of a significant corpus of secondary work on the subject, Gillespie has had to go back to the primary material, both printed and in manuscript. More than that, he has, by a remarkably thorough trawl of archives from Maynooth to Montreal, brought a wide range of hitherto unexplored material into the historical domain, thereby expanding the remit of religious history in Ireland considerably beyond its previous rather narrow confessional and institutional constraints. The result is a study which unerringly picks out the interesting and the bizarre, but which also engages in some more routine, but no less rewarding, research into parochial records and churchwardens' accounts in order to produce new insights into issues such as the frequency and elaborateness of communion.

Inevitably, of course, such a pioneering work is not without its weaknesses. Though Gillespie is clearly familiar with, and uses adeptly, sociological and anthropological approaches to popular religion, one thing he has not absorbed from the social sciences is their methodological or hermeneutic angst. There is little sign of struggle with the definition of magic or popular religion, no sense of the slipperiness of meaning and belief over time, of the difficulty of handling evidence contaminated by the cultural and religious biases of literate observers, nor of the problem of the assumptions brought to the task by the writer himself. Gillespie is an historian who trusts his sources to mean what they say and say what they mean. More than that, when faced with that classic historical choice between splitting and lumping, he most decidedly opts for the latter. To put it less crudely, his synthetic and synchronic approach gives the impression that the messy reality of early modern Irish belief is being constrained in an overly-neat straitjacket. Evidence is plucked confidently from across the decades, even centuries, to prove a general point, without exploring the possibility of change and development during the intervening years. Thus the discussion of the official attitudes and theology of the Church of Ireland has a timelessness which ignores the dramatic shifts from incoherence in the sixteenth century, to Calvinist theology in the first three decades of the seventeenth century, to Laudianism in the 1630s and finally to Restoration Anglicanism after the 1660s. Hence he fails to spot the very different tenor of the Calvinist Church and the implications this had for popular attitudes to fasting, feast days and Sabbath observance. For instance, he manages (p. 94) to link Archbishop Ussher's view of the Sabbath at the start of the seventeenth century to that of Archbishop William King at the end only by turning on its head Ussher's attitude to the Book of Sports. Nor does he look at perhaps the most important driving force behind popular Protestant prophecy, the presentist interpretation of the Book of Revelation, or explore the changing role of apocalyptic in the popular imagination over the century. Indeed, for all its distinctions between clerical and lay religion, between Protestant and Catholic, Gillespie's work leaves one with a distinct impression of homogeneity, of the sameness of popular religious assumptions over these two centuries. This is, it must be admitted, a useful corrective to the assumption by previous historians of a rigidly differentiated sectarian religious culture. But

Gillespie, it might be argued, goes too far in the opposite direction. There is no room here for anti-popery as a distinguishing feature of popular Protestantism, or for the development of distinct religious identities – indeed, in a curious way, this is a deeply ecumenical book, exploring the shared popular religiosity underneath the confessional divide. This is to a certain extent the product of its methodology. Given the thematic way in which the work is constructed and the achronological way in which the evidence is handled, the conclusions have a sense of inevitability. Of course people had largely similar attitudes, of course there is a wide body of shared opinions, when one gathers evidence syncretically from across two centuries and places it under pre-ordained headings. What seems to be missing is the willingness to admit when the sources are inadequate to answer specific questions, accepting that lacunae and omissions may prevent confident generalisation. The generalisation in this book is sometimes so confident that it leaves this reviewer at least unhappy that complexity is being smoothed over, that neat dialectic has replaced the bald ‘I don’t know’ which every historian is so deeply reluctant to utter.

But the fact that the work can stimulate such fundamental questions is in itself a tribute to its timeliness. Gillespie challenges established thinking in a number of very important ways: by shifting the focus in the study of early time confessional boundaries; by constructing an horizontal rather than a vertical analysis of Irish religiosity; by adopting the insights and methods of sociological and anthropological enquiry and applying them to Irish history; and finally by exposing the laziness of historians who have claimed that insufficient sources exist for the study of popular religious beliefs. In other words, this is a landmark study which opens up new territory in early modern Irish religious history and will, I hope, like Keith Thomas’s seminal work, stimulate a lively debate both about methodology and about the precise development over time of early modern religious attitudes and beliefs.

DURHAM UNIVERSITY

ALAN FORD

Civic agendas and religious passion. Châlons-sur-Marne during the French wars of religion, 1560–1594. By Mark W. Konnert. (Sixteenth Century Essays & Studies, 35.) Pp. x + 182 incl. 7 figs. Kirksville, Mo: Sixteenth Century Journal Publishers, 1997. \$40. 0 940474

This book seeks to explore the reasons why a small town theoretically under the control of the militantly Catholic Guise family rejected the Catholic League and recognised the Huguenot Henry of Navarre as king. In short, the authors asks why this particular town seemingly swam against all the political currents to foster a civic agenda of royalist politics and religious toleration. His answer is a simple one: civic bonds of community that had been forged prior to the outbreak of the civil wars. These bonds, he claims, allowed Châlonnais Protestants and Catholics to develop ‘a measure of confidence in each another, and as they overcame each incident and each crisis together, the bond of confidence was only reinforced’ (p. 168). Thus, a collective civic identity united all Châlons’ citizens despite their religious differences and led to a more stable and harmonious relationship than in other French cities with significant Catholic and Huguenot

communities. The evidence for such a startling claim comes from Châlons' city council records, where, Konnert insists, 'we have the record of what the council actually did rather than what individual councillors said We have, therefore, a truer picture of the councillors' concerns than we would if we relied simply on their words. It is fundamental to the approach adopted here that actions really do speak louder than words' (pp. 20–1). Of course, the author is forced to rely 'simply on their words', despite his denials to the contrary. The minutes of the council's meetings are not so much a record of what the council did as they are a record of the councillors' own spin and interpretation of what they did. These sources do not simply speak for themselves, and that Konnert appears to have taken them at face value as an objective account of what 'actions' were taken in Châlons may partly explain his conclusions. This is particularly true when it comes to an analysis of Châlons response to Protestantism. As Konnert candidly and honestly admits, his 'focus is always squarely on the council rather than on the Huguenots' (p. 19). But if religious coexistence was achieved between the Protestant and Catholic communities in Châlons – and surely coexistence rather than toleration is what best describes this relationship – then the dynamic between the two must be analysed, not just Catholic reactions to it. It cannot just be assumed that the Huguenots in Châlons were motivated by the civic agenda and communal bonds so heavily promoted by the city council, whose job, after all, was to maintain order. Thus I find Konnert's argument more suggestive than persuasive. Much can be learned from this book, however, and the author rightly stresses the local factors at work. Although it could have been more theoretically sophisticated, this book is nevertheless a good place to start for Anglophone readers who desire to learn about the experience of the religious wars in Châlons-sur-Marne.

GEORGE MASON UNIVERSITY

MACK P. HOLT

The first chapter act book of Christ Church cathedral, Dublin, 1574–1634. Edited by Raymond Gillespie. (A History of Christ Church, Dublin. Documents, 3.) Pp. 252 incl. frontispiece and 2 plates. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 1997. £25. 1 85182 247 X

Anyone who has followed the debate on religious change in early modern Ireland over the past twenty or so years can testify to the large distances that have separated one interpreter from another. There has been, at least, one shared sentiment, a *desideratum* really, that of the necessity for detailed scrutiny of regions, dioceses, institutions or individual figures. Given the holocaust of records in 1922 this has proved to be no easy task but there have been signs in recent years that a move from overarching syntheses to a host of local studies is on the cards. The Chapter Act Book is bound to prove indispensable in the labours that lie ahead. Dublin was the capital of a realm which was, by and large, to reject the religious settlement arrived at in the names of two of its kings and one of its queens. Not only did the Gaelic Irish come to choose the pope, so did the crown's 'ancient subjects' the Old English. The Chapter Act Book provides poignant confirmation of this fundamental fact of Irish history. As the volume filled up over a space of sixty years the lessees of cathedral land and tenants of cathedral property

remained the Old English patriciate and citizens of Dublin. Most of them became recusants. The names of the chapter clergy, by contrast, become those of English and Welsh newcomers. It is tempting to see in the replacement of James Walshe as precentor by Robert Richardson in December 1587 by virtue of the former having 'departed this realm (licence not obtained) beyond the seas' an example of the many clergy who voted for Tridentine Catholicism with their feet. While Ireland slid into what proved to be deep confessional division cathedral life wagged on without much change. The dean and chapter granted long leases of sixty-one years, they made endless efforts to stamp out clerical absenteeism from services, they tried to improve sanitary arrangements in the acutely noisome environs of the cathedral and they collected their rents every six months at Strongbow's tomb. Yet Christ Church was humming more and more with secular business (the crown was granted a lease of a thousand years from 1627 for the rooms which housed the Four Courts) and less and less with the murmur of Dubliners at prayer. One sombre sign of this parting of the ways was the attempt of the chapter to restrict long-standing rights of burial in the body of the cathedral. The real shock to cathedral life came in the 1630s at the instigation of rising stars John Atherton and John Bramhall. Leases were cut back to twenty-one years. Lay vicars choral were to take orders or leave. Surplices and hoods were no longer optional. Frequent communion was to be enforced as part of a general liturgical reordering. If Christ Church had failed to be, in the words of the editor, 'a dynamo for religious change', the opening years of Wentworth's viceroyalty witnessed a serious attempt to charge it up. This is an excellent edition and a welcome third volume in an ambitious project of publication of the history of one of Dublin's two great cathedrals.

UNIVERSITY COLLEGE,
DUBLIN

JOHN MCCAFFERTY

Church and culture in seventeenth-century France. By Henry Phillips. Pp. ix + 334.

Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997. £40. 0 521 57023 9

Henry Phillips here examines the attempts of the Catholic Church in France to extend its spiritual and moral influence throughout the kingdom. It is certainly not a tale of success. First the Church had its internal divisions, as rigorists, *dévots*, Molinists, Jansenists, Jesuits, Oratorians, Trappists, Maurists and others argued about the interpretation of the Scriptures, the Fathers and the liturgy. Even within those various groups there were different shades of opinion. Orthodoxy was therefore an elusive concept, as some sincere Catholics discovered when they sought to glorify their faith in art and literature, only to be condemned as pagan or profane by purist clerics. Then there were jurisdictional disputes with the civil authorities and with Rome, as well as the continuing tensions between the regular orders and the secular clergy. Outside the Church, the Protestants were never totally suppressed, and new challenges were being mounted by deists and *libertins*. Far from achieving dominance over the intellectual life of France, much of the Church found itself unable to accommodate Cartesianism and the new science, thereby ensuring that the scientific world would be a secular one. Nor were the theologians able to retain their monopoly of censorship, at a time when book

production was expanding. The only sphere where the Church was successful in maintaining control was in education, although here too different Catholic groups disagreed on the content of the curriculum. Phillips tells his story clearly, summarising much recent work by American, English and French historians and adding examples from his own literary researches. Yet it could be wished that he had been more critical, especially of controversial writers whose views he summarises at length, such as Marc Fumaroli. Only in his rather breathless conclusion does he voice reservations about some of his secondary sources, and these could have been included more helpfully in the body of his text. The focus of the book is largely upon the makers of religious policy, the theorists and the theologians. There are some references to popular taste, but it would have been interesting to know more about the extent to which the divisions among the leaders of clerical opinion seemed relevant or disturbing to the ordinary believer at parish level. The one aspect of the book which may irritate some readers is that Phillips has presented his argument in terms of a series of 'spaces', a word which appears in the title of each chapter. This conceit can become distracting, as he reveals spaces within spaces or overlapping with other spaces. There is no point at which this device adds greater clarity to the argument. Nevertheless, there is much to praise in these pages, and someone new to the topic will be most grateful that so much complex material has been explained so clearly and coherently within a compact format.

QUEEN MARY AND WESTFIELD COLLEGE,
UNIVERSITY OF LONDON

ROGER METTAM

Pursuing the muses. Female education and nonconformist culture, 1700–1900. By Marjorie Reeves. Pp. viii + 216 incl. 10 figs, 1 map and 1 family tree. London–Washington: Leicester University Press, 1997. £45. 0 7185 0105 5

Evangelical faith and public zeal. Evangelicals and society in Britain, 1780–1980. Edited by John Wolffe. Pp. viii + 221. London: SPCK, 1995. £10.99 (paper). 0 281 04782 0

Pursuing the muses is an engaging and charming study of the lives and writings of a network of Wiltshire Dissenting families across several generations. The voices of the women of these families are clearly heard in the rich collections of their poems and letters which deservedly gave rise to this work. Poetry, for many of these women in the eighteenth century, was a language which they used to communicate everything from religious awe to friendly banter. They gave each other classical pen names and even bestowed them on some of the men in their circles, including Dissenting ministers. The high value these women placed on the life of the mind is readily apparent. Marianna Attwater announces in her poem 'Reading' that she has chosen a more reflective life: 'Whilst others of my age and sex delight / In noisy mirth to spend each day and Night / ... Insipid, Trifling, Empty, Joys depart / Unworthy to engross the smallest part / Of any Elevated thinking heart'. Marjorie Reeves argues convincingly that these women had a wider access to literature than one might have expected to find in provincial Dissenting life and that their real education did not come from their schooling, but informally, not least through the sympathetic men in their lives.

This is thoroughly a work of local history and potential readers should not be looking for a general survey of Dissenting female education or an engagement with broader studies of educational, religious or gender history. The heart of this book is liberal extracts from the poetry and prose of these fascinating figures. Indeed, one almost gains the impression that Dr Reeves – a former Vice-Principal of St Anne's College, Oxford – was so enchanted by her primary sources that she sometimes wished she could have published an edited volume of them. This temptation, however, is based in a valid sense of their significance: these sources do illuminate wider issues. Evangelicalism was the kind of spirituality which these families embraced – their network even brought them into contact with such well-known Evangelicals as Hannah More and William Jay – and their Dissent found its expression in Baptist chapels. Therefore, one valuable reward of this research is that it uncovers a mass of local details which challenge the stereotype of Evangelical Dissenters as narrow, humourless Philistines. The love of learning possessed by these women which overflows in their writings in classical, Romantic and pastoral effusions (to name but three influences) is the animating passion at the centre of this study. What it reveals serves to alter some existing perceptions of eighteenth-century women, religion and education whilst simultaneously introducing the reader to an endearing and captivating world.

Reading *Evangelical faith and public zeal* is an ideal way to place the characters Reeves has drawn onto a wider canvas. Not only does this collection contain a chapter by Jocelyn Murray on gender and one by Edward Royle on education but, taken as a whole, it provides a valuable exploration of two centuries of Evangelical activism. John Wolffe has brought together a solid group of scholars, including David Hempton, a leading authority on Methodism, and David Bebbington, whose definition of Evangelicalism has become the standard one. They adopt a sympathetic – but by no means uncritical – approach. Taking their work here as a whole, the evidence presented invites the judgements that Evangelicals have an often noble heritage of social concern from the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, but a too often ignoble one of social apathy for much of the twentieth. In an afterword, Clive Calver, the Director-General of the Evangelical Alliance at the time of this project, heralds a recovery of the older tradition of engagement.

One important way in which this volume advances our understanding of this narrative of loss is the original insights it offers into the reasons for the twentieth-century retreat from public zeal. K. D. Brown's contribution is on 'Non-conformist Evangelicals and national politics in the late nineteenth century' and Bebbington covers Evangelical social concern, 1918–80. A weakness of Brown's chapter is that it does not adequately answer the objection that its central characters might have been motivated by their Nonconformity rather than their Evangelicalism. Nevertheless, Brown and Bebbington together develop the seminal analysis that Evangelicals did not merely jump out of the public arena, but rather they were pushed by their own declining influence. Some of the theological factors involved are explored in Ian Randall's chapter on the 'Social Gospel' which focuses on the life of F. B. Meyer. This Baptist minister made a brave effort in the early decades of this century to create a ministry that was socially relevant in an inner city context, defying the trend of respectable

congregations who had 'gone to either heaven or the suburbs'. Nevertheless, Evangelicalism found itself in a more alien and hostile environment and too often responded by withdrawing from the fight to create a better society.

Hempton's essay incorporates a survey of the historiography of Evangelicalism, including evaluations of the Halévy thesis and Marxist perspectives. Brian Dickey makes a spirited defence of nineteenth-century Evangelical poor relief, implying that their efforts in a *laissez-faire* political context could have fresh resonance in societies toying with the dismantling of the welfare state. Jane Garnett contributes an interesting discussion of the nature and limits of a mid Victorian Evangelical conscience in the realm of business practices. Brian Stanley presents an impressive sweep of 150 years of British Evangelical attitudes toward overseas concerns.

Portions of this book, especially the chapter on gender and the ones which cover twentieth-century developments, will undoubtedly be eagerly used by students and academics who will welcome easily accessible, scholarly essays on these issues. The other chapters offer up-to-date treatments of more established themes, admirably summarising these areas of study and infusing them with original perspectives and research. This volume will be useful to students of a wide range of subjects from business history to educational studies and essential to anyone who is interested in Evangelicalism or the interaction between religion and socio-political action in modern Britain.

COVENANT COLLEGE,
COVENTRY

TIMOTHY LARSEN

Retelling US religious history. Edited by Thomas A. Tweed. Pp. xii + 302.

Berkeley-Los Angeles-London: University of California Press, 1997. £32 (\$50) (cloth), £10.95 (\$17) (paper). 0 520 20569 3; 0 520 20570 7

Thomas Tweed, Associate Professor of Religious Studies at the University of North Carolina, has edited a very smart collection of revisionist essays about religion in the United States. Tweed's collection, which brings together essays by nine religious historians (including himself) focuses on the much-debated problem of how American religious history – until recently largely narrated by and about white Anglo-Saxon male Protestants on the east coast of the United States – might be 'retold' in ways that would do justice to the rich religious pluralism that has captured the attention of both the media and academics in the past several decades. Both the religious landscape of the United States and scholars' understanding of it have changed dramatically since 1960, making the 'grand old narratives' of consensus and progress in American culture and religion deeply problematic. And, as Tweed himself observes, while all historical narratives are arbitrary and partial, none the less the 'stories that fill history textbooks are important because they negotiate power and construct identity. They situate us in society and tell us *who* we are. Historical narratives, then, are never *just* history' (p. 2). He thus offers eight 'sightings' from various niches in the ecology of American religion to re-situate our understanding of the American religious past from different geographical and social positions. In pt 1 of the collection, entitled 'Meaning and power at social sites', four scholars consider the retelling of the American religious narrative from largely-overlooked social

spaces – mission fields, revival tents, museums and bedrooms. Thus the first essay in this section, ‘Sexuality in American religious history’ by Ann Taves, takes as its starting point for rethinking American religion history its discourse about the body, and more especially discourse about the legitimacy and illegitimacy of the ‘sexual body’ offered by various religious traditions. Ann Frankiel takes her cue from recent literature in ritual studies to divide US religious history into four chronological periods dominated by different patterns of ‘ritualisation’ – independent ritual communities in interaction (1600–1730); enthusiasm and the ritualisation of passion (1730–1850); national conformity and diversity (1850–1950); and experiments in embodiment (1950–present). In what is perhaps the most satisfying essay of an impressive group, Ann Braude argues that ‘Women’s history *is* American religious history’ (ch. iii). Braude argues that since women now and always have constituted the majority of participants in religious activities and institutions in the US, why not organise a narrative around that reality? As a result – precisely *because* ‘in America, women go to church’ (p. 87) – three influential motifs that shaped the older narratives (declension, feminisation, and secularisation) have to be put to rest. In the second part of Tweed’s collection, ‘Contact and exchange at geographical sites’, American religion is retold from the geographic and cultural ‘margins’ of the culture: Laurie Maffly-Kipp sketches an account of America’s religious past from the standpoint of California and the Pacific Rim (‘Eastward Ho!’), borrowing the idea of the human perception of space from the discipline of cultural geography to reconsider who, exactly, constituted ‘insiders’ and ‘outsiders’ in the nineteenth-century rough-and-tumble world of the America’s west coast. Likewise, William Westfall offers a view of US religion from the northern borders of Canada (‘Voices from the attic’) to reconsider the national quest for a ‘Christian America’. His retelling of the tale is organised around the insight that if the Christian religion is understood as an attempt to reconcile freedom and order, ‘the Canadian vision of the Christian commonwealth has tended to privilege the latter’, while the tendency of the US vision has been ‘to privilege freedom over restraint’ (pp. 195–6). This is a fine collection of provocative and creative essays that should strangely warm the heart of every student of American culture and religion.

FORDHAM UNIVERSITY,
NEW YORK CITY

MARK S. MASSA

Glorious battle. The cultural politics of Victorian Anglo-Catholicism. By John Shelton Reed. Pp. xxiv + 359 + 27 plates. Nashville–London: Vanderbilt University Press, 1996. \$34.95. 0 8265 1274 7

Whereas the Oxford Movement up to 1845 has received a great deal of attention from historians, studies of the Anglo-Catholic movement as a whole are not numerous and there are many gaps in our knowledge. What has long been needed is a study of Victorian Anglo-Catholicism that raises new and bold questions and that examines it, as a movement, in its social, political and cultural contexts. Professor Reed is well placed to undertake this investigation. As an American Episcopalian, he has an insider’s knowledge of Anglicanism while

standing at some distance from the English Anglo-Catholic mythology tradition. And as a sociologist, the author of major works on the American South, he has approached the sources with questions that sociologists habitually ask of any social movement but which are less familiar to conventional church historians – ‘What kinds of people took it up, who opposed it, and why?’ (p. xxii).

This book, impressively researched, provides a lucid and illuminating analysis of Victorian Anglo-Catholicism. Its central thesis is that Anglo-Catholicism, before it achieved a place within the Church of England as a tolerated and respectable party, was essentially a counter-cultural movement that contradicted and even subverted many of the dominant values of nineteenth-century England, as represented by the Protestant-minded and patriarchal commercial class. Anglo-Catholicism thrived on opposition and, in its first generation, had a particular appeal to groups and individuals who for various reasons were indifferent to or alienated from the central values of Victorian middle-class culture. The early chapters cover fairly familiar territory but with new sources and fresh illustrative material: the beginnings and spread of Ritualism; the emergence of a new type of parish clergyman – clean-shaven and ascetic-looking, trained in theological colleges; the various social and structural factors that enabled the movement to grow; the division that emerged between its moderate and extreme wings; and the reasons why so many young clergymen were drawn to Anglo-Catholicism, with its lofty view of the obligations and rights of the priesthood. The core of the book comprises four chapters that successively explore the relationship between Anglo-Catholicism and the urban working class (with a balanced reassessment of the cherished myth of the Anglo-Catholic ‘slum priest’), the social composition of the Anglo-Catholic laity, the appeal of Ritualism and Anglo-Catholic sisterhoods to Victorian women, and the attraction of the Anglo-Catholic subculture to young men who, contemporaries observed, were ‘not conspicuously virile’. Reed shows that some middle-class women and ‘unmanly’ young men gravitated to Anglo-Catholicism because it offered a challenge to patriarchal authority and ‘muscular Christianity’ and gave them a space of their own. The final chapters deal with the various unsuccessful attempts by Protestant opponents to suppress Ritualism and the changing shape of Anglo-Catholicism in the latter decades of the nineteenth century, as its innovations became more widely accepted and it gained support among the middle classes.

Reed’s interpretation is convincing; it explains much. Moreover, although his study does not extend beyond the 1890s, the idea of Anglo-Catholicism as a counter-cultural movement retains some force in later periods, even in its heyday in the 1920s and 1930s. ‘Extreme’ Anglo-Catholicism, as then represented by the Anglo-Catholic congresses and the restored shrine of Our Lady of Walsingham, was never respectable in the majority of English dioceses, and that was always part of its appeal.

A book such as this, which brings together so much material and covers so many issues, inevitably leaves the reader with questions. Several areas deserve fuller exploration. Firstly, there were other streams in Victorian religion, within Evangelicalism, that also challenged the dominant values of the age. There is work here for a future scholar: to examine Anglo-Catholicism in relation to other movements for the renewal of Christianity that emerged in the 1830s and 1840s.

Secondly, we need to know more about those wealthy lay people, including members of the nobility, who were patrons of Ritualist clergy and benefactors of Anglo-Catholic churches and institutions. Thirdly, there is more to be said about the subtle differences in style and emphasis among Anglo-Catholics, and especially between those who looked to post-Tridentine Rome (the 'Western Rite') for their inspiration and those who expounded the idea of a distinctive English national Catholicism, rooted in 1,500 years of English history, and who regarded the Roman Church ('the Italian Mission') as an unjustified intruder into English religious life. The difference in outlook and self-understanding between these two wings was profound; Reed's observation that the division between them was 'more or less amiable' (p. 182) is an understatement.

Professor Reed presents his scholarship with a light touch and a sense of humour. Anglo-Catholics were always rather inclined to lose their sense of proportion, so there is no lack of material to illustrate the sillier side of the movement, and of its opponents. A valuable feature of this book is that it conveys so much of the distinctive culture and ethos of Victorian Anglo-Catholicism, not only through theological and biographical works but also through the evidence of church furnishings, advertisements, cartoons, novels, pamphlets and churchy gossip.

FLINDERS UNIVERSITY,
ADELAIDE

DAVID HILLIARD

What will Dr Newman do? John Henry Newman and papal infallibility, 1865-1875. By John R. Page. Pp. vi + 458. Collegeville, Minn.: Liturgical Press-Michael Glazier, 1994. \$24.95 (paper). 0 8146 5027 9

Page acknowledges that Newman's biographers 'have treated in some detail' the story of Newman's involvement in the events surrounding the First Vatican Council's definition of papal infallibility. But he feels that 'More perhaps than in any other area of his life', Newman's carefully nuanced approach to the controversy over papal infallibility 'defies swift, bold strokes, calling instead for sifting and winnowing, for pausing to consider some small detail, some secondary passage or letter, some casual or hurried aside'. The result is an unusual kind of biography of more than 400 pages dealing with only one aspect of Newman's life over a period of ten years. There are no new discoveries and Page bases his account almost entirely on the published Newman letters. There is no serious theological examination of either papal infallibility or of conscience, with which Newman's *Letter to the duke of Norfolk* (1875) deals.

CAMPION HALL,
OXFORD

IAN KER

Religion im Kaiserreich. Milieus – Mentalitäten – Krisen. Edited by Olaf Blaschke and Frank-Michael Kuhlemann. (Religiöse Kulturen der Moderne, 2.) Pp. 542.

Gütersloh: Chr. Kaiser/Gütersloher Verlagshaus, 1996. 3 579 02601 1

Until very recently the social history of modern German religion was a neglected field, though Catholic religion has received more attention than that of

Protestants, Jews or Freethinkers. This excellent collection, the product mainly of scholars born in the 1950s and 1960s, shows how far the situation has changed. Apart from the generally high level of the contributions, the volume is notable in several other ways. First; its comprehensiveness. While Catholicism still receives the most space, there is a substantial section on Protestantism, a shorter section on Judaism, and a concluding section on 'Transformations of Religion', which covers Freethought and such issues as the degree to which nationalism might in itself be regarded as a religion. Secondly, the authors are well aware of the weaknesses of some of the pioneering work in this field, including an exaggerated conception of the speed and extent of secularisation, and a one-sided emphasis on religion as an instrument of social control. By contrast the editors of this volume, and many of the contributors, stress that religion is central to any adequate understanding of nineteenth-century German society, and they are at pains to explore the meanings of religious belief and practice to the ordinary believers and the interaction between elites and masses. Third, most of the contributions are written in an admirably clear and direct prose. An exception to this is the otherwise valuable piece on Protestant *Vereine* by Jochen-Christoph Kaiser, which is written in what is almost a parody of academic prose, with long and complex sentences, numerous passages in parentheses, and excessive use of italics and phrases in quotation marks. Above all the volume achieves a degree of coherence often absent from collective volumes by its central focus on the 'milieu'. This much debated concept was first advanced by M. R. Lepsius in the 1960s as a way of explaining the relative stability of the German party-system between the beginnings of the *Kaiserreich* and the latter years of the Weimar Republic. He argued that each party had its roots in one of four such milieux – Socialist, Catholic, liberal Protestant and conservative Protestant – held together by shared rituals, symbols and moral values, as well as by a common political outlook. Each party recruited from within its own milieu and had difficulty attracting voters from elsewhere. This argument is more evidently applicable to the Catholics and Socialists than to the highly heterogeneous and politically divided Protestants – though the tendency of recent research has been to emphasise that the Catholics too were more deeply divided than the impressive array of clerically-directed Catholic institutions might suggest. Some of the contributors throw new light on the ways in which these milieux maintained a powerful hold on those within them. For instance Norbert Busch provides a many-sided analysis of the cult of the Sacred Heart and its dual role in strengthening the inner unity of the Church while separating Catholics more sharply from a hostile world. Olaf Blaschke, investigating the role of the parish priest as 'milieu manager', emphasises both the authoritarian style of clerical leadership, and the fact that this was made possible by the respect and trust which most clergy enjoyed. Frank-Michael Kuhlemann, in his study of Protestantism in Baden, notes the many internal differences, but concludes that the biggest factor uniting Protestants was their fervent nationalism, reflected, for instance, in the growing number of special church services with a nationalist significance. Similar points are made by Peter Walkenhorst in a discussion of the relationship between religion and nationalism, which notes the familiar point that nationalism could become a substitute focus of faith for those who had rejected the Church, but places more stress on the strongly Protestant character

of official nationalism, and on the interplay between traditional Christian ideas and the cult of the nation. However, the other study of local Protestantism, that by Dietmar von Reeken on Oldenburg, reaches a rather different conclusion. Here too nationalism was common to Protestants of every stripe, but a Protestant milieu failed to develop. This was partly, it seems, because the dominant liberals related well to the more general bourgeois culture, and objected to anything that smacked of exclusiveness, and partly because the weakness both of Catholicism and of Socialism meant that there was no threatening 'Other' against which Protestants could define themselves. And Till van Rahden, in a comparison between the Jewish and Catholic minorities in Germany, stresses the openness of most Jews to a wide variety of non-Jewish influences and loyalties, and concludes that the Jews did not constitute a milieu in the sense that the Catholics did. Meanwhile, Karl Heinrich Pohl indicates that in certain cases even the two most apparently exclusive milieux could overlap. Noting that Munich was a stronghold both of Catholicism and of Social Democracy, he shows that, contrary to most assumptions, some of the leading Social Democrats were practising Catholics. Overall this is a volume of great richness. Every contribution contains stimulating ideas and is based on thorough research. Any reservations must be very minor. One relates to Blaschke's paper. While the volume is in general mercifully free from the *Kulturkampf* mentality and terminology which occurs all too frequently in writing on German Catholicism, his resort to military metaphors, whereby any territory 'conquered' by the one must be 'lost' by the other seems to me too crude a way of envisaging relations between clergy and laity. Finally, a more general comment. Several of the contributors introduce the terms 'modern', 'anti-modern', 'modernity' and 'modernisation' at an important stage in their argument. These have become so much historical clichés that their usefulness may be taken for granted. Certainly, there is no doubt as to the importance of 'modernity' for the self-understanding of many Europeans of the later nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, and their varying perceptions of the 'modern' need to be explored. But so varied were these understandings that it seems questionable for historians to use these terms as if they had any objective meaning.

UNIVERSITY OF BIRMINGHAM

HUGH McLEOD

Achille Ratti, Pape Pie XI. Actes du colloque organisé par l'École française de Rome en collaboration avec l'Université de Lille III – Greco no. 2 du CNRS, l'Università degli studi di Milano, l'Università degli studi di Roma – 'La Sapienza', la Biblioteca Ambrosiana (Rome, 15–18 mars 1989). Edited by Philippe Levillain. (Collection de l'École française de Rome, 223.) Pp. iv + 972. Rome: École française de Rome, 1996. Fr. 750. 2 7283 0225 8; 0223 5099

Pius XI is a hugely important figure for twentieth-century Church history, but he has been studied a great deal less than his successors, Pius XII, John XXIII and Paul VI. In English there is indeed sadly little. He remains a strangely enigmatic figure, for some almost a hero, the only figure of stature in the western world of the 1930s who challenged the policies of the dictators, for others a pontiff of excessive prudence who missed most of the available opportunities for influencing events

for the better. While in French historiography he is generally the 'liberal' who condemned *Action française* and much improved church relations with the Republic, in Italian historiography he is the man who abandoned the Partito Popolare, made a treaty with Mussolini and failed to condemn the wanton invasion of Ethiopia. This volume will certainly not provide a definitive picture of Papa Ratti, for all its size. While its articles are mostly in French or Italian, with one each in English (G. Fogarty on the United States) and Spanish, it is best on Franco-Vatican relations. It includes next to nothing on Mexico, Ethiopia, the Lateran Treaty, the betrayal of Sturzo, or relations with Hitler – rather a long list of gaps. The best chapters are those of Morozzo della Rocca on Ratti's three years in Poland and Lithuania (1918–21), Prévotat on *Action française*, Hermet on the Spanish Civil War and a final piece by Fouilloux on the near unanimity with which the world in 1939 lamented his death and acknowledged his greatness. Whether it was right to do so remains an open question.

UNIVERSITY OF LEEDS

ADRIAN HASTINGS

Mexico's hidden revolution. The Catholic Church in law and politics since 1929. By Peter Lester Reich. (A title from the Helen Kellogg Institute for International Studies.) Pp. x+193. Notre Dame–London: University of Notre Dame Press, 1995. \$28.95. 0 268 01418 3

Church–State relations in Latin America are always a fascinating subject for study, not least because (as often elsewhere) they operate on various levels: the drama played out in public, to a script based on press releases and published correspondence, will often reflect very dimly, if at all, events and manoeuvres going on backstage. Rummaging or eavesdropping behind the scenes is not always possible, of course, but Reich demonstrates vividly how different our perception of events can be when it is. Reich's concern is that students of post-revolutionary Mexico have all too readily swallowed the 'official' line and assumed that the tension which appeared to characterise Church–State relations in the wake of the 1917 Constitution was both real and uniform across the country, whereas his own close examination of primary sources, and interviews with key actors, reveals a 'previously obscured' level of accommodation between the parties, a 'hidden revolution' or 'ecclesiastical–secular conciliation', beneath the 'formal anticlericalism of the "official" Revolution', which varied in degree from region to region. In some places the detail Reich offers may hold the attention only of the specialist reader, but his survey of the role of popular movements, like Acción Católica, in furthering the Church's political goals, and examination of why both Church and State preferred to flout the Constitution rather than remove its anticlerical provisions, will – like the broader findings of his book – interest those concerned about the Church's role in politics in contexts beyond the borders of Mexico and even Latin America.

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON NEW COLLEGE

ANDREW BRADSTOCK