Journal of Ecclesiastical History, *Vol. 50*, *No. 2*, *April 1999* Printed in the United Kingdom

Reviews

Jahrbuch für Antike und Christentum, *40 – 1997*. Edited by Ernst Dassmann and others. Pp. 251 incl. 13 ills + 1 pull-out plan and 2 plates. Münster Westfalen: Aschendorff, 1997. DM 100. 3 402 08131 8; 0075 2541

The present volume of the *Jahrbuch für Antike und Christentum* provides an insight into the recovery of the study of late antiquity and historical theology after the war as a combined discipline, and its continued vigour on the continent under the leadership of Ernst Dassmann at Bonn. Two chapters are devoted to the origins of the publication of the first volume of the *Reallexikon für Antike und Christentum* in 1950, overcoming appalling difficulties, and the lively correspondence between its first editor, Theodor Klauser, and Jan Waszink that preceded this event. Today their successors have amply justified their vision. On the historical side, Georg Schöllgen seeks to correct what he sees as neglect by scholars of the church constitutions of the second, third and fourth centuries, such as the *Didaché* and the Apostolic Constitutions. Cannot these throw light on actual conditions prevailing in their Churches or regions of origin at least, on some of the problems that exercised them? Klaus Rosen's lecture at the annual meeting of the Franz Dölger Institute traces the religious development of the Emperor Julian from childhood wonder at the brilliance of the sun's rays to devoted worshipper of King Helios. His second contribution, however, on the *Acta* of the martyr Crispina, executed at Theveste on 5 December 304, adds little to Paul Monceaux's views in *Histoire littéraire de l'Afrique chrétienne*, iii. 159–61 (Paris 1905). The second part of the *Acta* are almost certainly a Donatist compilation, not surprisingly in view of the importance of Theveste and its great pilgrimage church in the life of that movement. Elsewhere, Ulrich Eigler examines evidence for stylistic borrowing in Sidonius Apollinaris's account of his journey to Rome from the poet Horace's report of a similar journey to the capital more than four centuries before. Karin Alt devotes a lengthy study to Hippolytus of Rome's first and sixth books of the *Refutatio* in which he blames, without due understanding, Plato and Pythagoras as the inspiration of all existing heresies. Archaeology is represented by Sebastian Ristow's detailed examination of the evidence for an early episcopal complex below Cologne cathedral. He concludes, however, that nothing of that nature can be established with certainty before the mid sixth century, though a baptismal church and associated Christian structures may have existed nearby. Detailed scholarly reviews, not least Winrich Löhr's assessment of Gerd Lüdemann's *Ketzer: die andere Seite des frühen Christentums* conclude a volume which, as usual, maintains the highest standards of production and illustration.

Gonville and Caius College, W. H. C. Frend
Cambridge

Theologische Realenzyklopädie, XXVIII: *Pürstinger – Religionsphilosophie*. Edited by Gerhard Müller. Pp. iv + 804 + 18 plates. Berlin–New York: Walter de Gruyter, 1997. DM 394. 3 11 015580 X

A volume with *Religion* in it, together with all the Religion-ands – art, socialism (which runs not from F. D. Maurice but from Kutter and Ragaz), ethnology, freedom, geography, history and several others up to philosophy of religion – is bound to be weighty. Historians may particularly value the articles on the religious history of early Christianity, on the Wars of Religion, on religious freedom, and on the reunion conversations especially of the Reformation epoch. We are also given *Reformation* by G. Seebass (only allowed 18 pages) and Reformed Churches. Collinson gives Puritanism in Britain, van den Berg Puritanism outside Britain. There are only two big treatises – one on Law (*Recht*) followed by canon law, and the second on justification (*Rechtfertigung*). Of the English we get *Pusey* (Sheridan Gilley) and the *Quakers* (W. A. Cooper) and *Rashdall* (Brian Hebblethwaite). *Qmran* will help many. *Raphael* is illustrated with eighteen pictures. Robert Markus gives *Ravenna*. The brief treatments of *Pürstinger* and *Pupper von Goch* throw an unusual light on the early Reformation. Historians will value *Ranke*. *Rassismus* surveys the long debates even before social Darwinianism. The scientific theories were unusual in that they passed into popular consciousness. Everything was changed by a vague acceptance of the theory of natural selection. The word itself started to be used in the Nazi years; and then the Black Power movement in America made the word powerful socially, sometimes accompanied by faith that it was impossible for a black person to be racist. The word has no equivalent in non-European languages; but the idea passed eastwards, to China versus Tibet, or Croats versus Serbs, or Tutsi versus Hutu. This very cogent article (by Michael Banton) describes the way theologians and church committees responded to the modern theories.

Selwyn College, Cambridge — Owen Chadwick

The Oxford dictionary of the Christian Church. 3rd edn. Edited by F. L. Cross and E. A. Livingstone. Pp. xxxvii + 1786. Oxford–New York: Oxford University Press, 1997 (first publ. 1957, 1974, 1983 [reprint]). £70. 0 19 211655 X

The Oxford dictionary of world religions. Edited by John Bowker. Pp. xxiv + 1111. Oxford–New York: Oxford University Press, 1997. £30. 0 19 213965 7

The reviewer approaches these two enormous volumes with a sense of awe. Each aims at comprehensiveness in a vast field, and in each case the editor's personal perspective lends coherence to what could otherwise easily dissolve in fragments. These two views of religion could hardly be more different from one another; yet each commands the respect and gratitude of humbler mortals, both for the efforts of dozens of collaborators, and for the guiding visions of the two editors.

In the four decades since she contributed to the first *Oxford dictionary of the Christian Church*, Elizabeth Livingstone has continued to maintain an integral vision of Christian history, to which this third edition is her lasting tribute. There is an analogy with the great Bede, both in the vastness of the undertaking (250 more pages even than the 1974 edition) and in its steady grasp of a particular

ideal. Not that this version is untouched by the late twentieth century; on the contrary, it is a sustained response to a changing world. The user will find new entries for 'women, ordination of', 'feminist theology' and 'homosexuality' (albeit chiefly with reference to the Church of England); reference to 'contraception' is rewarded with a solid article instead of the second edition's coy injunction to 'see *Humanae Vitae*'; and Balthasar and Schillebeeckx are admitted to the canon of theologians.

What impresses, repeatedly, is the evenness of treatment achieved across a staggering range of subjects. In every case, dates, publications and bibliography anchor the subject. Even the account of Savonarola is as controlled as a law report. Hagiographical entries likewise leave to other publications the more sensational and unauthorised historical matter of posthumous popular veneration. Passion and polemic are scrupulously excluded from the measured prose. For almost comprehensive historical information on the evolution of the Christian Churches (and especially the western), presented in a traditional manner which has none the less a great value, the researcher may turn to Cross and Livingstone with confidence and thanks.

If this Christian world is still marked by the Anglican and Oxonian loyalties of the first edition ('Christ Church' receives exactly the same length of treatment as 'Christ') its horizons now extend to such recent developments as the Charismatic Revival Movement. Admittedly, the nineteen lines accorded to this subject, representing probably 300 million charismatic Christians, seem brief alongside the fifteen lines still given to 'Malmesbury'. But it would be harsh to grumble, when the larger vision has been embraced. Liberation theology arrives, although only in South America; indigenous Christianity in Africa suffers a little from a slightly patchy, country-by-country treatment (David Livingstone gets a separate entry, but not Desmond Tutu), and Ethiopianism, African Zionism and Rastafarianism are absent. It is at what the *Dictionary* defines as the margins of Christianity that it most clearly reveals its core solidity of purpose. Treated with judicious reserve are visions (no Medgegorje), charismatics (no Padre Pio), and controversial cults (no Moonies or Children of God). Music, in general, is not discussed, although 'plainsong' is there. The Christianity of the *Dictionary* is a religion of the word, rather than the eye. There is an archaeological entry for 'iconography' but none for 'art'; we are given biographical notices of a few Renaissance painters, but not, say, of Chagall. Eric Gill is here, however, and the image chosen for the cover to represent the whole enterprise is a medieval stained glass window at Ely. In the end it would be churlish to complain about what is omitted from a work so rich, and one of whose very strengths, indeed, lies in the tangible sense of purpose of its editor. As a dictionary of Christian history it is hard to see how it could be surpassed.

John Bowker's achievement is hardly less extraordinary. A work which attempts to define the salient aspects of all major world religions inevitably has a dizzying effect at times. Yet individual entries, often thumbnail sketches of highly complex issues, are written with a marvellous combination of intelligence, clarity and vividness. Even a little article, less than a column in length, on 'evil' contrives to stimulate fresh thoughts. There are cross-references, *inter alia*, to Hannah Arendt, Nietzsche and Māra, the Hindu god of pestilence, and the entry concludes with a beautifully chosen extract from a novel by Graham Greene. In

fact, a particular feature of the *Dictionary* is the inclusion of quotations, which frequently bring the hardest concepts to life. Cross-referencing is encouraged by a thematic index, and the user is enticed into active engagement with a book which moves sensitively and creatively across religious boundaries. Amongst publications of this kind, Bowker's sets an exceptionally high standard. Its market is perhaps not obvious; but the student who turns to this will certainly be drawn beyond the subject of initial enquiry, to think further and comparatively about religious experience.

The distinctive characters of these two admirable books may be seen in their respective treatments of 'secularism'. The *Oxford dictionary of the Christian Church* explains briefly: 'the modern tendency to ignore, if not to deny, the principles of supernatural religion'. The *Dictionary of world religions*, in the course of a relatively lengthy essay, notes that the basic mistake of 'the myth of secularization' is 'to tie religion to the institutional forms it has happened to take, and then to measure religion by the fortunes (or misfortunes) of those institutions'.

ST CATHERINE'S COLLEGE, GERVASE ROSSER
OXFORD

Toward the origins of Christmas. By Susan K. Roll. (Liturgia Condenda, 5.) Pp. 296. Kampen: Kok Pharos, 1995. B.Fr. 1,452 (paper). 90 390 0531 1; 1381 2041

The origins of the celebration of the Christian feast of Epiphany. An ideological, cultural and historical study. By Merja Merras. (University of Joensuu Publications in the Humanities, 16.) Pp. x+219+5 ills. Joensuu: Joensuu University Press, 1995. Fin.Mk 155. 952 9800 14 2; 0781 0396

The two major winter festivals of the western and eastern Churches – Christmas and Epiphany – find extensive treatment in these two recent publications, though readers may be disappointed that the original relationship of one to the other is not resolved by either author.

Susan Roll's treatment of Christmas is an ambitious attempt to combine a concern for anthropological insights with liturgical history and pastoral reflection. In fact the combination is not entirely successful, and the book gives the impression of three separate studies. Roll begins the anthropological section with a discussion of Eliade's discussion of 'festival' and includes Cullman's rather dated discussion of Christ and time, Dix's equally dated view of eschatology versus anamnesis, and a discussion on whether Aion, the personification of time, influenced Epiphany. This section concludes with a discussion of time in modern society.

It is in the second part of the book that Roll begins to engage specifically with Christmas as a liturgical feast, and the problems of interpreting the testimony of the historical documents concerning its origin. Building on the magisterial work of Talley more than she admits, Roll reviews the use of lunar and solar calendars in the ancient world, and the religious observances associated with this. The Egyptian pre-Christian solar feast identified by Norden, and Talley's masterful exposition of Norden's basic mathematical error in projecting the Julian Calendar back 2,000 years is given full discussion. Roll gives fair weight to the two approaches in explaining the origin of the feast – the Calculation theory (espoused by Duchesne, Engberding, Bainton and Talley) and the History of

Religions theory (Holl, Dolger, Casel, Botte and Frank). Roll herself inclines towards finding the latter on firmer ground, with sun worship influencing the adaptation of a feast for the birth of the Son of God. A further chapter explores the spread of the feast, and here Roll draws on the possible implications of doctrinal development, noting, for example, the introduction of the feast at Constantinople after the defeat of the Arians in 381, and as reflecting the Christological convictions of Chrysostom and the Cappadocians. This is one of the more interesting chapters, though it does not resolve the question of the origin of the festival.

The final section of the book seems a misguided attempt to make the study 'relevant', and reflects on the present observance of Christmas in a secular world.

At various points in her work, Roll discusses the relationship between Christmas and Epiphany, and whether the former is simply a western counterpart to the eastern Epiphany. Merja Marras looks at the question from the other side – being the wife of an Orthodox priest, it is Epiphany which interests her. The stated purpose of the study – rather more modest than Roll's – is to determine why Epiphany is celebrated on 6 January. However, the answer given has been coloured considerably by the author's apparent *a priori* conviction that since Easter and Pentecost reflect two of the three major Jewish festivals, Epiphany must in some sense be connected with the feast of Tabernacles. Thus a considerable amount of space is devoted to examining that festival, and references to it in the New Testament. Merras implies that although this festival of pilgrimage ended with the fall of Jerusalem, it was carried to Egypt by Alexandrian Jews, and also to Syria. The themes of divine revelation and living water were bequeathed to the Christian feast of Epiphany. The proof of such connection is the words *ta phota*, which Josephus uses for the feast of Hanukkah, the derivate from the feast of Tabernacles, and which also occurs in the writings of St Gregory of Nazianzus, meaning 'Lights' of Epiphany. The split between Synagogue and Church caused the difference in dates. Subsequently Constantine introduced 25 December as the feast of the Nativity, resulting in two feasts in the east, the Nativity and Epiphany.

Interesting as this study is – and there is much helpful discussion – the concern to establish at all costs a link between Tabernacles and Epiphany has resulted in some rough handling of the evidence. Providing the reader is aware of this, both books are welcome additions to discussion on the history of these liturgical feasts.

INSTITUTE OF SACRED MUSIC, BRYAN D. SPINKS
YALE UNIVERSITY

The Armenian people. From ancient to modern times, I: *The dynastic periods. From antiquity to the fourteenth century*; II: *Foreign dominion to statehood. The fifteenth century to the twentieth century*. Edited by Richard G. Hovannisian. Pp. xii + 372 incl. 10 maps and 4 dynastic tables; xii + 493 incl. 6 maps. Basingstoke: Macmillan, 1997. £33.50 each. 0 333 61973 0; 0 333 61974 9

These well-edited and organised volumes provide a comprehensive yet accessible history of Armenia. Neither elementary nor stuffed with references, they will be the place where readers with a genuine interest will want to start. Unfortunately for readers of this JOURNAL, they do not provide a history of the Armenian

Church, though most elements can be pieced together from the discussions of history and culture.

A long series of historical chapters by Nina Garsoian form the core of the first volume that treats antiquity and the Middle Ages. They are flanked by introductions to geography and ancient traditions, and by discussions of literature and medieval history. A series of maps fitfully illustrates these complicated developments, but incomprehensibly omits any indication of the relief so essential for understanding Armenia.

The historical chapters make it possible to follow the fate of a nation buffeted between more powerful neighbours and to appreciate the varying extent of their influence. Iranised for a millenium, Armenia opened to Roman influence with the introduction of Christianity in the fourth century. Despite Byzantine and Sassanian efforts to assimilate them, the Armenians survived under Arab domination and prospered as the caliphate weakened. Curiously, the Arabs dominated trade and urban life while the locals withdrew to their castles and valleys. Byzantine annexations and Turkish invasions brought disasters in the eleventh century that only grew worse under the onslaught of Mongols and Tamurlane. Armenian independence survived in Cilicia, but in a strangely western guise.

In all this, the Church stands out as the essential defender of Armenian culture and identity. Patriarchs, priests and monks are always present, especially in Robert Thomson's clear and broadly conceived chapter on literature and culture, and in its continuation through the seventeenth century by Peter Cowe. Although these chapters and that on Cilicia facilitate study of the Church, the core chapters pose a problem. Their comprehensive learning leads to an extremely dense treatment, constantly interrupted by citations and scholarly disputes (for some reason, these volumes have no footnotes). Although they offer some summary of ecclesiastical history and of culture, they essentially consist of a political history often so overwhelmed with detail that the general picture is hard to follow.

The longer volume on modern history, written by the best-known experts in the field, offers some valuable novelties: a surprisingly full treatment of the darkest period, the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries, recreated largely through manuscript colophons by Dickran Kouymjian; detailed treatment of the Armenian diaspora in eastern Europe, the United States and elsewhere; and careful attention to the Armenians under Tsarist and Soviet rule. These chapters present material that is usually inaccessible. The history of Armenian literature is brought up to 1915 in a chapter perhaps too replete with unfamiliar names for the general reader, but valuable in conjunction with the earlier discussions of literature.

The central part of the volume deals with the Armenian Question, the Genocide, and the Armenian republic, all in suitably clear yet comprehensive terms. Christopher Walker's discussion of the events of 1915 is especially valuable at a time when the genocide is often denied or minimised, because he carefully presents the sources that leave no doubt about what happened and how. Curiously, though, he does not really try to explain why the Armenians were slaughtered. A discussion of the different levels of Turkish and Kurdish motivation would have been helpful.

In this largely secular period, the role of the Church is not stressed, but it is always present. The rise of nationalism and political organisation in the nineteenth century shifted leadership of the community away from the rich amiras and the patriarchate they dominated, and secular literature came to overshadow the ecclesiastical. But the Church never lost its role as spiritual core of the nation – especially in the diaspora – despite persecution and division. Here, too, the attentive reader can piece together the history of the Church.

These volumes will be used and valued, but they have a couple of serious problems. One, as noted, is the lack of systematic treatment of ecclesiastical history. By omitting this and deliberately excluding art and architecture (on the grounds that works on these subjects are readily available), the volumes hardly do justice to the wealth of Armenian culture, especially in antiquity and the Middle Ages. Perhaps more serious is their level. They constitute neither an introductory handbook nor a work of reference. Their lengthy and often highly detailed treatment would make them difficult for beginners (except for the surveys of literature), yet their lack of footnotes, abridged scholarly discussions and very brief references keep them from being the final arbiter of the subject. For modern times, beginners might prefer Christopher Walker's attractive narrative, *Armenia: the survival of a nation* (London 1980). Specialists will find more detailed treatments of most subjects in the bibliography. But no one will be able to find such a convenient, up-to-date and surprisingly broad treatment of all of Armenian history as these volumes offer.

UNIVERSITY OF MASSACHUSETTS CLIVE FOSS

Constructing early Christian families. Family as social reality and metaphor. Edited by Halvor Moxnes. Pp. xvi + 267 incl. 6 figs and 1 table. London–New York: Routledge, 1997. £45 (cloth), £14.99 (paper). 0 415 14638 0; 0 415 14639 9

This collection of thirteen essays, mostly revised papers from the 1995 Oslo conference on 'Family as social reality and metaphor', sets out 'to combine the study of the family as a social institution in early Christianity with a study of Christian communities as examples of "fictive kinship"'. The material is grouped in three sections: social context, family as metaphor and family and its relation to the understanding of sexuality and asceticism. The work begins with a comprehensive introduction and an essay by the editor. This first contribution sets the context for the rest, but strays too often into material covered elsewhere and is overlong. After a difficult start there are essays on the likely framework of life in first-century Galilee (Guijarro), the relationship between family and religion in Judaism and early Christianity (Barclay) and the parallels between Jesus' call to subordinate family ties to the service of God and Jewish and Graeco-Roman traditions (Barton). The second section begins with a carefully dated and well-documented exposition of the background to a Roman understanding of Christian family metaphors (Lassen). This is followed by 'Family imagery and Christian identity in Galatians 5: 13 to 6: 10' (Esler), the breadth of interest, academic rigour and clarity of which is particularly enjoyable. The emergence of egalitarian relationships from superior–subordinate ones within a household on

conversion to Christianity occupies the next contributor (Sandnes), and this part concludes with a refreshing examination of the use of 'philadelphia' in Plutarch and Paul (Aasgaard) and a feminist reading of 1 Thessalonians (Fatum). The third section comprises a piece on Paul's understanding of the polluting effect of desire, even in marriage, and its relation to medical and philosophical thinking of the time (Martin), potentially interesting, but spoilt by polemical concerns, a thought-provoking discussion of asceticism and anti-familial language in the Gospel of Thomas (Uro), and an essay dealing with family structures in Gnostic myths, especially Sethian ones, and resulting insights into Gnostic family life (Gilhus). Although in some cases suffering from being revisions of papers which were already adaptations of previous work, and although more interesting in their detail than in their main thrust, these essays nevertheless provide a convenient resource for study of the period, and particularly so since a number are well annotated and have excellent bibliographies.

KING'S COLLEGE, MAXINE WEST
LONDON

Irenaeus of Lyons. By Robert M. Grant. (The Early Church Fathers.) Pp. vi + 214. London–New York: Routledge, 1997. £45 (cloth), £14.99 (paper). 0 415 11837 9; 0 415 11838 4

This book is the second in a series intended to make available 'translations of key selected texts by the major Fathers to all students of the early Church'. The texts are abridged because the Fathers are 'often unapproachable because of the sheer volume of their writings'. An exception might have been made for Irenaeus. Grant offers 125 pages of text from all five books of *Adversus haereses*, and fifty-three pages of introduction. The selection of material is rather curious, and the principles governing it are not explained. More than half is drawn from the first two books of *Adversus haereses*, and the great bulk of that from bk 1 (forty-eight pages). The fourth book, Irenaeus' longest, is allocated only eighteen pages: nothing is sampled from its final six chapters. It may be wondered if this gives an altogether balanced view of Irenaeus. Selection obviously means that sacrifices have to be made, but it is a pity that some of the richest and most interesting parts of *Adversus haereses* have been passed over in favour of such a generous treatment of bk 1. Grant's explanation for not including here any selections from Irenaeus' *Epideixis* might suggest a reason for this bias: the shorter work 'is more exegetical than theological' (p. 10). This is an unusual distinction to apply to Irenaeus, for his theology emerges at its best when he is explaining what he thinks a text of Scripture means. Another reason may be that Grant has been guided by his interests in Gnosticism, Greek education and rhetoric. One of the introductory chapters is entitled 'Rhetoric in theology' and contains very useful discussions of how Irenaeus has taken over the rhetorical terms 'hypothesis', 'oikonomia' and 'anakephalaiôsis' and put them to use in his theology. An overview of Irenaeus' theology is not attempted. Other chapters are entitled 'The life of Irenaeus', 'Gnostic origins', 'Against the Valentinians', 'Christian books and traditions', and 'Greek education against Gnosticism'. Despite their brevity, these chapters, and the notes to the text, are rich in information and insight. The translation is accurate and clear, and based on the best contemporary scholarship. The book

should be recommended to students with enthusiasm, and a sigh that we still lack a translation of this quality of *Adversus haereses* as a whole.

Mannix College, Victoria, Australia — Denis Minns

Christiana Respublica. Éléments d'une enquête sur le Christianisme antique. 3 vols. By Charles Piétri. (Collection de l'École française de Rome, 234.) Pp. iv + 767 incl. 7 ills; v + 771–1403 incl. 6 ills; v + 1407–1684. Rome: École française de Rome, 1997. 2 7283 0385 5; 2 7283 0384 3; 2 7283 0385 1; 2 7283 0382 7 (set); 0223 5099

Out of the extensive written work of the late French scholar Charles Piétri, who died unexpectedly on 7 August 1991, his disciples have compiled a substantial collection of anastatic reprints. In the first section, the three volumes contain those articles with which Charles Piétri had prepared the third part of his work *Roma Christiana* (*Recherches sur l'Église de Rome*, *son organisation*, *sa politique*, *son idéologie de Miltiade à Sixte III* (*311–440*), BEFAR 244, Rome 1976), which was to cover the years 440–96, and also preparatory articles for the same piece of work. The articles of the remaining four sections 'Empire et église' (pp. 253–628), 'Patristique et écclesiologie' (pp. 631–767), 'Société chrétienne' (pp. 771–1081), 'Hagiographie' (pp. 1085–403) and 'Épigraphie chrétienne' (pp. 1407–602) clearly confirm what André Mandouze says in his preface (p. 4), that Piétri was not only a scholar of patristics, but also made important contributions to the prosopography of late antiquity and to epigraphy.

The volumes open with a bibliography of Piétri's work (pp. 7–19). This reviewer takes the liberty of pointing to his own detailed revision and supplementing of Piétri's contributions in the German translation of the *Histoire du Christianisme*, II: *Naissance d'une chrétienté* (Paris 1995), which came out in the second volume of the *Geschichte des Christentums* under the title *Das Entstehen der einen Christenheit* (*250–430*) (Freiburg u.a. 1996), mainly at pp. 55–117, 271–344. The collection of reprints close with a detailed list of contemporary (pp. 1605–27) and ancient persons (pp. 1629–76).

Jena — Christoph Markschies

God and gold in late antiquity. By Dominic Janes. Pp. xii + 211 incl. frontispiece and 13 ills. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998. £37.50. 0 521 59403 0

This study addresses itself to a paradox, one that is more apparent to the Protestant than to the Roman Catholic or Orthodox way of thinking: how was it that the Church triumphant clothed herself in opulence when Christ had enjoined poverty on his followers? If paradox there is, it can be explained quite simply. Christ's message was addressed to individuals, and many individual Christians did embrace poverty. St Anthony on his way to the desert spurned a silver platter that the devil had laid in his path. By contrast, the Church as an institution had to function in the world and so adopted a public image best suited

to express her majesty and transcendence. Not content with the obvious, the author embarks on a wide-ranging journey that takes him from Roman attitudes to costly display to the symbolism of precious metals, the exegesis of the Song of Songs and the book of Revelation (why not Solomon's Temple?), early Christian wall mosaics, which have so much gold in them, perceptions of colour by the ancients and even by the Ndembu people of Zambia (whoever they may be), all of this with generous ladlings of social anthropology and an overwhelming bibliography of secondary literature that fills thirty-three closely-packed pages. I cannot say that I have been greatly enlightened by this laborious exercise. The reader's patience is further tried by the pervasive misspelling of Latin terms and sentences such as, 'The symbolic understanding of Scripture constructed paradise as like the best things of this world but better.'

EXETER COLLEGE, CYRIL MANGO
OXFORD

Alexandria in late antiquity. Topography and social conflict. By Christopher Haas. (Ancient Society and History.) Pp. xviii + 495. Baltimore, MD–London: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1997. £37. 0 8018 5377 X

This detailed and valuable study of the Egyptian metropolis, covering the period from Diocletian to the seventh century, is centred on the description and analysis of three 'communities' based in religion, namely Jews, pagans and Christians, and of their history of conflict. Throughout Haas seeks to show this history taking place in the physical realities of Alexandria, often along the long east–west axis of the Via Canopica. Although aware (p. 334) of the risks of 'merely parroting the literature produced after the fact', he argues that inter-communal competition and topography are the two most rewarding approaches to 'mapping out the contours of social life in late antique cities'. That Christians formed a community is in some sense true, although as Christianisation proceeded that statement probably meant no more than that Alexandria was a community. That Jews did is undeniable, but Haas does not persuade me that this community was substantial in the fourth century. That pagans eventually did (from *c.* 350), Haas thinks is a late result of Christianity; they hardly did before. Overall, it remains unclear that the centrality of the sharp divides of religion is as great as the Christian sources make it seem. The evidence is drawn from a great range of materials, and Haas's writing is often vivid. The treatment of the evidence, however, is often uncritical or careless (perhaps worst on 'Jewish' papyri, where *CPJ*'s inclusions – solely on the basis of names – are taken at face value), and press editing was desultory. As a result, although the book is well worth reading, users are advised to proceed with caution.

COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY ROGER S. BAGNALL

Optatus. Against the Donatists. Translated and edited by Mark Edwards. (Translated Texts for Historians, 27.) Pp. xxxi + 222 incl. 2 maps. Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 1997. £12.50 (paper). 0 85323 752 2

The inclusion of Optatus of Milevis's tract against the north African Donatists

among translated texts for students of ancient and medieval history is welcome. The existing translation into English by O. R. Vassall-Phillips (1917) was partisan and imbued with the controversies of the time between the Anglican and Rome Catholic communions in Britain. The present editor also has little time for the Donatists whom he regards as 'sectarians' and their martyrs, such as Bishop Marculus, as 'false martyrs'. He has none the less provided an adequate translation of the text, intentionally 'leaden' as he says, to do justice to the style of the original, and also, even more usefully, a translation of the ten documents relating to the origins of the schism appended to Optatus' text.

The editor's work however, suffers under two disadvantages. It has appeared too soon after the comprehensive study of Optatus' tract by Mireille Labrousse (*Sources Chrétiennes*, 412, 413, Paris 1995, 1996). This has apparently inhibited him from discussing and perhaps disputing her views regarding bk VII of Optatus' work. The obvious shifts of emphasis between bks I–VI and VII, in favour of a less abrasive view of Donatism, deserved more than a brief reference in the introduction and subsequent footnote treatment. Second, and more serious, is the editor's apparent lack of knowledge of the area about which Optatus is writing. Rural eastern Algeria, the heartland of Donatism, has been out of bounds for archaeological research since 1940. A great deal of work, however, had been done there in the previous decade, especially among the ruins of the Romano-Berber villages. The correct translation of 'et basilicas fecerunt (Donatisti) non necessarias' (Optatus, iii. 1) is 'and they built unnecessary churches', not 'and formed unnecessary churches'. A glance at the map of Numidian village sites in André Berthier and colleagues' 'Les Vestiges antiques du Christianisme dans la Numidie centrale' (Algiers 1942) would have shown how every village had two or more churches, and some, such as Oued R'zel as many as half a dozen. These were chapels dedicated to Donatist martyrs and saints to which Optatus took exception. The editor's map should have been far more inclusive, and his bibliography should also have found room for at least some of the more important articles by scholars from the École française de Rome, who worked on these sites between 1930 and 1940.

These are failings in an otherwise useful and scholarly edition intended mainly for students of history, and it is to be hoped that they will be corrected in a second edition. The initiative of Liverpool University Press in sponsoring these translations is warmly to be welcomed.

GONVILLE AND CAIUS COLLEGE, CAMBRIDGE W. H. C. FREND

Sacred fictions. Holy women and hagiography in late antiquity. By Lynda L. Coon. (The Middle Ages Series.) Pp. xxiii + 228 incl. 5 ills. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1997. $39.95. 0 8122 3371 9

Linda Coon's clearly expressed and carefully argued book has three introductory chapters: on late antique hagiography and its models of sanctity, on representations of gender in the Bible and their reflection in *Vitae*, and on the messages conveyed by male clothing (including vestments). There follow three studies of familiar types of female saint: the eastern harlot (Pelagia, Mary of

Egypt), the Roman aristocrat (Helena, Paula, Melania) and the Merovingian queen (Monegund, Radegund, Balthild). All three types reject wealth, especially jewels and fine clothing, and mortify the female body, which becomes an instrument of salvation instead of corruption; but whereas penitent harlots opt for seclusion, aristocrats do menial tasks for the sick or for fellow-ascetics. Gender-reversal is kept within limits. Female saints may live or travel independently, even cross-dressing when necessary, but they are usually enclosed; they may reject marriage, but they recognise the authority of bishops and abbots and their own spiritual authority is exercised over women. The characteristics which most influenced later hagiography of women are summarised (p. 150) as 'domesticity, philanthropy and claustration'. Much work has been done on late antique (or early medieval) hagiography of women, but Coon's approach to the themes of gender, rhetoric and history is distinctive in that she takes as central the moral and theological purpose of the hagiographer in a particular context. Instead of reading the stories as sources for social history or as rhetorical instruments of gender politics, she interprets them through the biblical models which shaped the patterns of female piety. This might lead to conflation of times and places, but since her examples, unlike many *Vitae*, have reasonably precise contexts within the fourth to the seventh centuries, she is often able to comment on the social significance of a saint's behaviour and especially of her or his appearance and clothing (the 'theology of the cosmetic'). To end with a suitably domestic question on symbolism and social context: if a Gallic saint makes bread with barley-flour, water and ashes (p. 124), does this symbolise penance, or does wood-ash (alkaline) affect the baking process?

University of Liverpool Gillian Clark

Gregory von Nyssa, Briefe. Edited and translated with an introduction by Dörte Teske. (Bibliothek der Griechischen Literatur, 43.) Pp. vii + 152. Stuttgart: Anton Hiersemann, 1997. DM 168. 3 7772 9701 1; 0340 7853

The letters of Gregory of Nyssa were definitively edited by Pasquali in the Leiden edition of Gregory's works (*Gregorii Nysseni Opera*, VIII, 2). The translation noticed here is a valuable companion to Pasquali's text, and indeed constitutes a useful addition to the literature on Gregory. Only thirty letters of Gregory survive, but the narrow chronological limits within which most of them fall suggest that they are merely the remnants of a much larger corpus. With the possible exception of no. 17, letters 4–30 all relate to a dramatic year or so of Gregory's life, during which he took part in an important council in support of Bishop Meletius at Antioch, suffered the death of his sister Macrina, and was summoned to the episcopate of Sebaste to spend an unhappy few months there before returning to Nyssa to resume the theological study which resulted in the writing of the first book of the *Contra Eunomium*. Teske accepts Maraval's dating of these events to 378–9, and composes an impressive commentary on Gregory's movements and views of the situations in which he found himself. The remaining three letters, including Gregory's best-known epistle, on pilgrimages (no. 2), date from *c*. 381–2. As well as the introduction and notes to each letter, Teske provides a useful appendix listing all of Gregory's known works with indications of date.

A relatively brief bibliography of studies of the letters completes this highly workmanlike and commendable, though expensive, book.

KING'S COLLEGE, LONDON GRAHAM GOULD

Augustinus-Lexikon, II, Fasc. 1/2: *Cor – Deus*. Edited by Cornelius Mayer and others. Pp. i–xlviii incl. frontispiece + 320 cols. Basle: Schwabe, 1996. DM 78. 3 7965 0854 5; 3 7965 1007 8

This splendid and authoritative guide to a prince among western theologians auspiciously begins volume ii with a double fascicle containing more than fifty articles by eminent scholars, and also with K. H. Chelius' list of Augustine's works, including the lost, and the best editions, letters and sermons (including Dolbeau's find) being treated individually. Articles in German, French or English include Cor and Deus (Madec), Corpus (Miles), Daemon (den Boeft), De correptione et gratia (Zumkeller), credere (TeSelle), Cresconius (Moreau), Creatio and Delectatio (Mayer), Defensor (Lancel), Deificare (Bonner), Dea Caelestis (Lepelley), Desiderium (Doignon), Demetrias (Wermelinger) and much more. Bibliographies are a goldmine.

OXFORD HENRY CHADWICK

The Church retrospective. Papers read at the 1995 summer meeting and the 1996 winter meeting of the Ecclesiastical History Society. Edited by R. N. Swanson. (Studies in Church History, 33.) Pp. xxii + 587 incl. 30 plates + colour plate frontispiece. Woodbridge: Boydell Press (for the Ecclesiastical History Society), 1997. £40. 0 9529733 0 8; 0424 2084

This volume now represents the Ecclesiastical History Society's commemoration of its president-elect, Andrew Martindale, who died before he could take up his year of office. Professor Martindale chose the theme of the papers, which might at first sight seem overly broad: all Christian theology and devotion represents a meditation on the past, as well as a claim to discern pattern in the future. However, the particular concern here is to explore the ways in which the Church has exploited, altered or argued about its past. Besides those papers which discuss individual historians, like Marjorie Chibnall's magisterial summary treatment of Orderic Vitalis, the thirty-one papers cluster around three distinct Christian strategies towards the past: the creation of history where there is little or nothing, the rewriting of history in the interests of the present, and the rediscovery of a genuine past in an effort to reshape the present. Dealing with the creation of the past, Frances Andrewes discusses the initial failure of the *Humiliati* to take much interest in their origins, while in later years, facing changed circumstances and internal problems, they filled the vacuum with a respectable origin myth which predated and diverted attention away from their murky past close to the world of twelfth-century heterodoxy. Colin Morris looks at S. Stefano in Bologna as exemplifying two varieties of creating the past: one is the way in which medieval architects assumed that the building's idiosyncratic rotunda was an imitation of the Church of the Holy Sepulchre in Jerusalem, and went on to create a

Jerusalem theme park around it. The other is the disastrous 'restoration' which S. Stefano suffered during the last century in an effort to reimagine its Romanesque splendours at the expense of everything else: destroying much of the genuine past in the process.

Rewriting history was a basic component of the sixteenth-century Reformation, often aiming to re-envision some previously honoured institution in a new and hostile light. So Helen Parish describes the Protestant version of the development of clerical celibacy: the Reformers' aim was to identify it as the main component in AntiChrist's plot against God. Rewriting the past happened literally in the case of James Bainham, the Henrician martyr whom John Foxe treated in subtly different ways in successive editions of the *Book of martyrs*, an historiographical minuet analysed in depth by Thomas Freeman. It was Foxe's turn for revisionism in the 1630s: Damien Nussbaum unravels the tangled tale of how the status of the great martyrology became an ideological contest between Archbishop Laud and his opponents, and a commentary on current Arminian policies. Andrew Pettegree's superb paper emphasises a new fascination with the past history of martyrdom, as an essential element in the dynamism which led Calvinism to save the Reformation from stagnation in the 1560s. Less apocalyptically, Arthur Burns tells how the Church of England rediscovered the value of rural deans in the nineteenth century, in an antiquarian adventure which produced a highly useful structural revival owing little to either Anglo-Catholics or Evangelicals. Sometimes the discovery of the past brought as many problems as it solved: the bicentennial commemoration of the ministers ejected by the Anglicans in 1662 caused as many internecine arguments among different Victorian Free Churches as it brought annoyed mutterings in the Established Church. The final paper, however, provides a much more positive example: a rather touchingly committed description by Paul Gerrard of how the Poor Clares have rediscovered their foundress in the wake of Vatican II, in order to transform their communal life and work.

Sometimes the Christian past is so baffling that nothing meaningful can be made of it at all: once allegory has spoken in vain, the surviving remnant is simply to be contemplated in all its oddity. No-one, Andrew Martindale commented, seems to know the purpose of Monza Cathedral's *chioccia*, a quirkily realistic silver model of a hen with her chicks. In the *quattrocento* fresco of the Lombard Queen Theodolinda presenting it to the bishop of Monza eight centuries before, both donor and recipients look pleased if slightly puzzled by the object. The splendid reproduction of this fresco as a frontispiece to *The Church retrospective* is a poignant memorial to the loss which art-historical scholarship and church history have sustained by Martindale's death.

St Cross College, Diarmaid MacCulloch
Oxford

Socrates of Constantinople. Historian of Church and State. By Theresa Urbainczyk. Pp. xi+215. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1997. $39.50. 0 472 10737 2

The appearance in 1995 of a new critical edition of the *Ecclesiastical history* of Socrates (fifth century AD) by G. C. Hansen in the GCS series, together with this

book by Theresa Urbainczyk will, one hopes, act as a stimulus to further work on the ecclesiastical historians who followed Eusebius of Caesarea, and whose work, as Urbainczyk says, has been strangely neglected. Eusebius' work was translated into Latin and continued at the end of the fourth century, and used by the church historians who followed, yet the main surviving fifth-century Greek writers, Socrates, Sozomen and Theodoret, and especially the two former, tend to be rather lumped together without full awareness of their individuality. Perhaps this was not surprising when Socrates and Sozomen are so close in date (Socrates's work ends in AD 439 and he probably finished writing it soon after that date, while Sozomen wrote before 450 and used Socrates) and both were writing in Constantinople under Theodosius II, but Urbainczyk makes a good case for Socrates's claim to separate treatment, and indeed for further studies of the other church historians. One of her particular aims is to show that too many assumptions have been made about church history as a genre, without adequate recognition of the variety of practice among individual examples.

In the case of Socrates, a number of important observations emerge from Urbainczyk's study. First, though he is commonly called a lawyer on the strength of the appearance of the epithet Scholasticus in later manuscripts, the evidence is uncertain, and Photius, for example, calls him only Socrates. Next, despite writing ecclesiastical history, he is neither opposed to classical education, having himself studied under Helladius and Ammonius, both pagans, nor averse to deriving information from heterodox Christian sources including Novations and Arians. He used Athanasius' writings and had done a fair amount of research; he criticises Eusebius' *Vita Constantini* for its incomplete information. His reason for writing is to trace the history of divisions within the Church, and the attempts to settle them, and – understandably, perhaps – he views bishops largely in terms of their personal role in these disputes. He believes that church affairs and state affairs run together in a process of *sympatheia*, and, more surprisingly to modern eyes, he praises Theodosius I for his toleration of division and his desire for the peace of the Church. Conversely, because of the intimate connection between Church and State, usurpers are seen as threatening the former no less than the latter.

The book ends rather abruptly, and the author does not go on to compare Socrates in more detail with the other church historians, or to return to the ways in which he diverges from Eusebius' model. But Urbainczyk succeeds in demonstrating that Socrates and his history deserves this closer attention, and her work should encourage a more nuanced approach to ecclesiastical history in general.

KEBLE COLLEGE, AVERIL CAMERON
OXFORD

The finding of the True Cross. The Judas Kyriakos legend in Syriac. Introduction, text and translation. By Han J. W. Drijvers and Jan Willem Drijvers. (Corpus Scriptorum Christianorum Orientalium, 565. Subsidia, 93.) Pp. 99 incl. 21 ills. Louvain: Peeters, 1997. B.Fr. 1,400 (paper). 90 6831 891 8; 2 87723 313 8; 0070 0444

Few tales from late antiquity aroused the fascination of subsequent centuries as

much as the story of the discovery of the True Cross in Jerusalem at the hands of Helena, mother of Constantine. From its fourth-century Holy Land origins it spread rapidly west and east, spawning significantly different versions and a bewildering variety of texts in Latin, Greek and Syriac (to name only the principal variants). Of these it is the Syriac tradition which boasts the earliest surviving manuscripts and the promulgation of influential alternative strands of the legend: in the *Doctrina Addai* transplanting the story to the first century and transforming Helena into a fictitious wife ('Protonice') of the Emperor Claudius, and in the version under consideration in this new volume casting the main character not as Helena but as a Jewish leader by the name of Judas who is converted to Christianity (and renamed 'Kyriakos') and made bishop of Jerusalem through the revelation of the Cross. The oldest published text of this 'Judas Kyriakos' legend had previously been the late fifth-/early sixth-century BL, MS Add.14644 (E. Nestle, *De Sancta Cruce*, 1889), which is now reproduced here with a new English translation alongside the first publication of an even older fifth-century text of the same story preserved in a St Petersburg manuscript (Petersburg/Leningrad N.S. 4). Both these Syriac manuscripts reflect the concerns of the increasingly important church of Edessa, stressing its connections with the holy city of Jerusalem and the wider Christian empire. A family affair from the University of Groningen, in which father and son nicely combine their respective expertise in Syriac Christianity and in the Helena material, this useful little book will serve to make accessible to modern readers the version of the Helena story which in fact was destined to become the most widespread and popular of the variants, supplanting the canonical version enshrined in the church histories of late antiquity (Sozomen was already aware of a rival tradition which attributed the discovery of the cross to Jewish sources). The Judas Kyriakos story was the one known to Gregory of Tours, for example, and is represented in more than 200 surviving manuscripts in Latin alone. Both the medieval west and Byzantine Christendom strikingly chose to favour an account of the discovery of the True Cross which turned the story into a proclamation of the discomfiture of the Jews and a blueprint for their conversion.

UNIVERSITY OF DURHAM E. D. HUNT

The medieval Gospel of Nicodemus. *Texts, intertexts, and contexts in western Europe*. Edited by Zbigniew Izydorczyk. (Medieval & Renaissance Texts & Studies, 158.) Pp. xv+573. Tempe, Az: Medieval & Renaissance Texts & Studies, 1997. $45. 0 86698 198 5

The *Gospel of Nicodemus* is the generic name of the tripartite apocryphal narrative of the Passion, Joseph of Arimathea's imprisonment, and the Descent into Hell (including the Harrowing) as it was known in the medieval west, where it was very widely disseminated. In his seminal edition of the main New Testament apocrypha Tischendorf treated the first two parts as one item and the third as a second item, so that some will know the work by his two titles, *Gesta Salvatoris* and *Descensus Christi ad inferos* respectively. All three parts made a significant contribution to medieval understandings of the Passion and Resurrection,

personalising and popularising various figures from the canonical Gospels and, above all, through the third part, providing a full account of Christ's salvific activity between the Crucifixion and the Resurrection, on which they are virtually silent. The Pilate apocrypha which underlie the Passion narrative were in existence from at least the fourth century, but the evolution of the whole evidently took place over some time: the Descent narrative appears in ninth-century Latin manuscripts. The first two parts of the work were evidently composed in Greek and then translated into Latin, but it seems more likely (though not certain) that the Descent was actually composed in Latin. Both the Latin and the Greek survive in manuscripts representing three main versions distinguished as A, B and C. Scholars of medieval history, religion and art, no less than scholars of medieval literature, will be grateful to Zbigniew Izydorczyk for putting together this copious but coherent account both of the complex textual history of the work itself and of its re-presentation in a vast array of western vernacular literature, material brought together on this scale for the first time. As well as editing the volume, Izydorczyk contributes an introduction explaining the range of titles in use, summarising the contents of the *Gospel*, and indicating the state of scholarship and the scope of the present book; with Jean-Daniel Dubois the chapter on the early history of the work; and the pivotal chapter on the medieval Latin work (distinguished as *Evangelium Nicodemi*). The other chapters deal with medieval French texts (Richard O'Gorman), Catalan and Occitan (Josep Izquierdo), Italian (Amilcare A. Iannucci), Old and Middle English (C. W. Marx), Norse (Kirsten Wolf), High German and Dutch and Low German (Werner J. Hoffmann, in two chapters), Irish (Ann Dooley) and Welsh (David N. Klausner). The book gives extensive documentation throughout, and concludes with a massive bibliography of primary and secondary work, compiled by Izydorczyk and Rémi Gounelle, supporting the material of the book itself and establishing a basis for further research into areas not fully discussed.

University of Sydney, Australia — Diane Speed

Admonitio und Praedicatio. Zur religiös-pastoralen Dimention von Kapitularien und kapitulariennahen Texten (507–814). By Thomas Martin Buck. (Freiburger Beiträge zur mittelalterlichen Geschichte. Studien und Texte, 9). Pp. xlv + 427. Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang, 1997. £48. 3 631 31293 8

The capitularies had long been recognised by historians as an indispensable source for the study and understanding of Frankish society. However, while they are a rich and most extended mine of information about Frankish government and administration, ecclesiastical and secular reforms, theological issues and so on, the uncertainty about their function and the effectiveness of their distribution vitiates much of the scholarly assessment of their status and significance. Some of the mist surrounding the capitularies, their formation and transmission has been cleared by the recent publication of Hubert Mordek's invaluable *Bibliotheca capitularium regum Francorum manuscripta*, and scholars will be on a safer ground once the new edition of the *Capitularia regum Francorum*, promised by the

Monumenta Germaniae Historica, is published. Buck's book, which is based on his 1996 dissertation, is an interesting offshoot of Mordek's monumental editorial project, and it is a rare combination of far-ranging historical inquiry and detailed manuscript studies. Buck's *Admonitio und Praedicatio* examines the 'religious–pastoral dimension' of the Frankish capitularies, and concludes that beyond the level of their evident administrative and legislative function, the capitularies have some deeper metaphysical–religious foundation. This, of course, is not a new idea, but Buck presents the argument very convincingly indeed.

After three introductory chapters (i–iii), in which Buck gives a brief historical survey on the research, explains the limitations and the problems in studying the capitularies, and introduces his aims, he turns to a discussion of Charlemagne's self-awareness and perception of rulership (chapter iv), which, according to him, should not be under-estimated in the evolution and evaluation of the capitularies and their role in society. However, the core of Buck's book is chapter v, which is by far the longest and the most stimulating. In the first section of this chapter Buck analyses three capitularies which illustrate some of the religious–pastoral dimensions of the genre: the *Capitulare episcoporum* (MGH cap. i, no. 21), the famous *Admonitio generalis* (MGH cap. i, no. 22), and the *Missi cuiusdam admonitio* (MGH cap. i, no. 121). The second section of chapter v is a synthesis which gives a diachronic outline of the relations between the legal and the religious aspects of the capitularies. Buck's analysis offers some fresh thoughts and many interesting ideas regarding the way we should understand the Frankish capitularies.

University of Haifa, Israel — Yitzhak Hen

Lives of the Visigothic fathers. Edited and translated by A. T. Fear. (Translated Texts for Historians, 26.) Pp. xxxix + 167 incl. 1 map. Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 1997. £9.95 (paper). 0 85323 582 1

Translated texts are a boon, if only as helpful staging-posts *en route* to the originals, and this addition to Liverpool's excellent series is most welcome, despite its many blemishes (which include the title, where 'Visigothic' is unjustified). The translations themselves are generally accurate and accessible renderings of five texts: Sisebut's *Vita Desiderii*, Braulio's *Vita S. Emiliani*, the *Vitae sanctorum patrum emeretensium*, Ildefonsus's *De viris illustribus* and the *Vita S. Fructuosi*. The notes are particularly valuable in identifying parallels and sources, but often bland, with many unsupported assertions on contentious issues. Translational problems merit remarkably few notes. The introduction, offering a brief historical sketch and comments on hagiography and the texts' purposes, subjects and authors, is usually sound (though there are errors, for example in nn. 18, 19) but is uneven. Presentational weaknesses, sadly, are legion. The notes – whose line-spacing changes on p. 72 – refer to works not in the bibliography. Capitalisation is both eccentric and inconsistent: 'father', 'holy', 'invasion', 'monks', 'period' 'see' and numerous other words appear now capitalised, now not. Constant, by contrast is 'Orthodox' to signify 'orthodox' There are basic

errors of punctuation and several spelling mistakes, some typographical but others (like 'practicing', 'provenence' and 'Carcassone') not. Words are sometimes omitted, sometimes wrongly inserted, sometimes misused (for example, 'in nowise'), sometimes unhelpfully esoteric ('aretology', 'Senaric'). Among other syntactical blunders are 'the lees … is gathered' and 'which he … spent [time] working on it'. Such sloppiness reflects badly on both the author and his editor.

University of Lancaster P. D. King

Monks of England. The Benedictines in England from Augustine to the present day. Edited by Daniel Rees. Pp. xii + 259. London: SPCK, 1997. £27.50. 0 281 05074 0

This volume of essays was designed to present an accessible account of the Benedictine contribution to English religion and society from its 'prehistory' to the wake of the Second Vatican Council. That eleven of the fifteen contributors are professed religious is testimony to that tradition of Benedictine scholarship which runs from Bede to Knowles, but the main theme of this book is the missionary impulse which, in its various manifestations, has coexisted, albeit sometimes uneasily, with commitment to the communal liturgical life of the monastery.

All the crucial episodes of the medieval period are treated in readable papers which take account of recent scholarship: the conversion, the repayment of the debt through missionary activity in eighth-century Germany, the tenth-century monastic revival which contributed so much to the nature of the newly united English kingdom, the Norman regeneration of a Church which was hardly corrupt, but which lagged behind the latest continental developments, and the radical reforming impulse of the early Cistercians, determined to restore what was perceived as the pristine purity of the Rule. Perhaps the most significant chapter is that treating the late medieval monasteries, which questions the traditional and still widely accepted view of stagnation and decline. This is a subject demanding extended reassessment, which it has not received in recent positive studies of the pre-Reformation Church at parochial level.

Historians of medieval monasticism will read with interest the five chapters devoted to the post-Dissolution English Benedictine houses on the continent. Constitutional and jurisdictional disputes reminiscent of medieval England were balanced by determined missionary activity in the homeland conducted by monks operating singly and often in great danger, sustained by their profession although isolated from the communal life. The efforts of such individuals were crucial to the survival of English Catholicism. After Emancipation, however, the autonomy of monastic missionaries was seen by some as an obstacle to the re-establishment in England of the stable communities sanctioned by a far older tradition. The final chapter reveals how in the twentieth century a balance has been struck between the *opus Dei* of the choir, parochial responsibilities, often in industrial cities, and the educational mission discharged in English public schools. This, overall, is a history of constant adaptation to changing circumstances, and of the fine balance achieved between the life of the cloister

and responsibility to a wider community, embracing an era of monastic triumphalism in the central Middle Ages, but beginning and ending in a society in which the hold of Christianity appears tenuous. Few students of any period of English church history will fail to benefit from this wider view.

University of East Anglia Christopher Harper-Bill

Die Konzilsordines des Früh- und Hochmittelalters. Edited by Herbert Schneider. (Monumenta Germaniae Historica. Ordines de celebrando concilio.) Pp. xxviii + 654. Hanover: Hahnsche Buchhandlung, 1996. DM 248. 3 7752 5149 9

The gathering described in Acts xv may or may not be the first Christian 'council', but assemblies of church leaders to deal with problems did occur in the course of the second century. Knowledge of these meetings is scanty, and how they operated is unknown. Much more information is at hand about the councils and synods – terms which can be used as synonyms – of late antiquity, but even for the great ecclesiastical assemblies of the imperial Church what survives is a collection of snapshots of individual elements. A written formulary (*ordo*) for the general operation of a council is known only from the Visigothic Church early in the seventh century. Schneider puts this slightly differently when he writes (p. 1), that according to what is presently known, it was the Visigothic Church which first created such an order.

Synods were legislative assemblies, judicial courts, political conventions and, following the *ordines*, liturgical events. The first extant formulary (*Ordo 1*), unique among those known to Schneider in that it can be dated exactly, stems from the fourth Council of Toledo (whose acts carry the date 5 December 633), which met under the presidency of Archbishop Isidore of Seville. Transmitted as canon 4 among the synodal legislation, this relatively short set of rules perhaps reaches back to the second Council of Seville (619), where Isidore also presided, and describes itself as a 'Formula secundum quam debeat sancta synodus in Dei nomine fierí'. At the end of the seventh century this order was expanded, primarily by the texts of prayers, instructions for recitation at the beginning of the council of specific canons from earlier synods, a sermon to be delivered by the presiding metropolitan, and a concluding benediction. The resulting text (*Ordo 2*), affirms its cultic nature by opening with an invocation, 'In nomine domini nostri Iesu Christi incipit ordo de celebrando concilio'.

This volume comprises editions and detailed discussions of forty-three such *ordines*. They are transmitted basically in two ways – in canon law collections and in liturgical books – although they can be found elsewhere too. *Ordo 1* circulated widely through its inclusion among the Toledan councils in the canonical *Collectio Hispana*, and *Ordo 2* – which Schneider notes was the most frequently transmitted conciliar formulary of the early and high Middle Ages (p. 142) – was included in the *Collectio Hispana Gallica*, and thence reached a wider audience through the *Pseudo-Isidorian Decretals*. Other *ordines* too travelled in widely diffused canonical collections. *Ordo 5*, for a provincial synod, appears in Italian manuscripts of the early eleventh-century *Decretum* of Bishop Burchard of Worms, from there making its way at the end of that century into the less popular but none the less important

Decretum of Bishop Ivo of Chartres. On the other hand, a Carolingian order for provincial synods (*Ordo 7*), which is innovative in prescribing specific procedural formulations for different days of a council, is found almost exclusively in liturgical books, particularly the influential tenth-century *Pontificale Romano-Germanicum* from Mainz, which became established in Rome in the second half of the eleventh century.

The preface to the Pseudo-Isidorian *Decretals* noted the presence of its synodal *ordo*: 'At the beginning of this volume we have set out how a council is celebrated among us, so that those who wish to follow our order know how to do it. But whoever would choose to do this better, should carry out what by a just, canonical, and most wise determination they decided.' (quoted by Schneider at p. 20). The diversity of procedures implied in this statement is borne out by the fact that Schneider's volume comprises forty-three *ordines*, ranging from the products of the Visigothic Church already noted, down to a formulary from the second half of the twelfth century, perhaps from Chartres (*Ordo 5E*), and the *Ordo Romanus qualiter concilium agatur* (*7A*), of the twelfth-century *Pontificale Romanum*. Some of these orders were for provincial synods, others for diocesan gatherings, and adapting an *ordo* meant for one situation to another – even to a larger regional gathering or 'Nationalkonzil' – was not especially complicated (see p. 2 n.7). The choice of the end of the twelfth century as a *terminus ad quem* is explained in two ways. In the first place, Gratian's *Decretum*, published *c.* 1140, gradually displaced older canon law books which contained *ordines*, even though it lacked one. Secondly, from the time of Pope Innocent III the afore-noted *Ordo Romanus* (based on the *ordo* of the *Pontificale Romano-Germanicum*), was widely diffused in the *Pontificale Romanum*, seemingly with little variation, and came to exert an influence on conciliar practice in the Roman Catholic Church up to the present day.

Schneider's work began as a dissertation submitted at Regensburg in 1987, and after a decade of revision, amplification and further work on the manuscripts, it now stands as the unique volume in a special series in MGH. For those who work on canon law and liturgy through the twelfth century the result offers a mine of information about collections, manuscripts and the relationship among the *ordines* edited. The volume concludes with the expected array of indices, including an index of the incipits for prayers, sermons, biblical passages and canons found in the *ordines*, a six-page, double column, index of manuscripts used, and a lengthy *index verborum*. But this impressive work can also be valuable in more general ways. While it is not consistently easy to determine with confidence which *ordo* or variation of an *ordo* was used for a given synod – see, for example, the remarks (p. 92) about Anselm of St-Rémi's description of Pope Leo IX's Council of Reims in 1049 – the proceedings delineated in these formularies offers the environment, and it is a liturgical environment, in which synods operated. The variety of conciliar acts, including the canons, which are familiar aspects of medieval ecclesiastical life, were generated in assemblies structured around a regimen of prayers and responses. The famous *Ordo 2*, for example, indicates that on the last day of the synod the canons which were enacted should be read publicly, after which the 'Amen' should be sung (p. 183). The widespread *Ordo 5*, to take another example, provides an intricate juxtaposition of liturgical, theological, canonical and pastoral elements on the synod's first day, including a series of inquiries directed at the attendant clergy (pp. 250ff.) We would like to know how

accurately these detailed prescriptions were adhered to, and what conciliar participants thought of them. That information is unavailable, but historians of liturgy, canon law, church councils and of ceremonies in general, can thank Herbert Schneider and MGH for placing this treasury of information at their disposal.

COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY ROBERT SOMERVILLE

Images of faith in English literature, 700–1500. An introduction. By Dee Dyas. (Longman Medieval and Renaissance Library.) Pp. xii + 332. London–New York: Longman, 1997. £38. 0 582 30192 0; 0 582 30191 2

This book is most obviously one for university teachers of early English literature to put on student reading-list, but it may also prove useful to students in other areas of medieval studies and to any general reader seeking guidance on the history of Christian thought and institutions. It may also help to draw the attention of students of church history and historical theology to the importance of medieval vernacular literature as a witness to the reception of Christian teaching and its transmission from early days to modern times. The academic canon of Old and Middle English texts as encountered by students of the period, from *Beowulf* to *The Canterbury tales* and the mystery plays, is read here in relation to the religious and ecclesiastical background, which is explained clearly yet succinctly for the benefit of the many whose knowledge of such matters is minimal or patchy. Drawing on existing studies of individual English texts, Dyas gives an historically structured, coherent and readable account of their backgrounds and concerns, locating a vast amount of detail in an authoritative overview. The book is, however, designed to function more as a reference tool than as a discursive survey, and various aids to this end are provided at the back of the book: a thumbnail sketch of the early history of the Church, a list of key figures in that history, brief outlines of the Bible and the way it was read and of doctrinal matters, worship and ecclesiastical organisation, and a glossary of terminology, followed by a substantial bibliography. Items treated in this back section are helpfully put in bold print in the body of the work. This is not, and is clearly not intended to be, a scholar's research tool: non-English primary sources, for instance, are listed only under translations in the bibliography, many statements are not fully documented, and complex issues are presented in a very simple way that would demand qualification at a scholarly level. The work is, nevertheless, respectably enough researched for what it aspires to. The distilling of information is judicious, and in these days, when even a basic knowledge of the Christian traditions at the heart of western civilization can no longer be taken for granted, this book will fill a distinct gap on undergraduate shelves. No doubt every teacher who picks it up will wish that something had been handled differently, but it is difficult to see how the result could have been much more informative or reliable in a user-friendly single volume

UNIVERSITY OF SYDNEY, AUSTRALIA DIANE SPEED

The homilies of the Emperor Leo VI. By Theodora Antonopoulou. (The Medieval Mediterranean, Peoples, Economies and Cultures, 400–1453, 14.) Pp. x + 310. Leiden–New York–Cologne: Brill, 1997. Nlg 187.5. 90 04 10814 9; 0928 5520

There are two good reasons for welcoming this book, apart from the fact that it is by a promising young scholar who studied under Cyril Mango at Oxford and now teaches at the University of Cyprus. First, it is part of a growing awareness of the importance of the rich Byzantine homiletic tradition, on which there have hitherto been few easily accessible publications or works of synthesis, and secondly, it is the first major study of the homilies composed by the Emperor Leo VI (886–912), the son of Basil I and one of the more controversial of Byzantine emperors, for it was this Leo who caused a scandal in Church and State by marrying a fourth wife, his mistress Zoe Karbounopsina, the mother of his son and heir Constantine. The same Leo is known as 'Leo the Wise', on the strength of his scholarship and literary output, and was later reinvented as a sage and credited with prophetic oracles about the future of Constantinople. Leo's reign coincided with a literary and scholarly revival in Byzantium, and he was himself the author of many different kinds of work, including military treatises, liturgical and other poetry, a work on the ascetic life, a funeral oration for his parents and many laws or 'Novels'. Over forty high-style homilies are ascribed to him, which Antonopoulou believes were written and delivered by Leo himself between 882 and 904, mainly in the church of St Sophia in Constantinople; they were probably also collected by himself or under his guidance. The subjects range over the major liturgical feasts and saints' days in the church calendar, and a number of the homilies contain allusions to the various vicissitudes of Leo's reign. This book is a preliminary study to a projected critical edition, and provides in itself a lucid and well-written introduction to the homiletic tradition of Byzantium at a particularly interesting stage in its development, after the ending of Iconoclasm in 843. This is achieved by means of very readable discussions of the groups of homilies themselves, a chapter on the development of the tradition, and (particularly welcome) by discussion of style and metre. Theodora Antonopoulou has produced a fascinating and attractive book; even without the critical edition which is still to follow it makes an important contribution to a better understanding of Byzantine culture.

Keble College, Averil Cameron
Oxford

Libellus de Nativitate Sanctae Mariae. Textus et commentarius. Edited and translated, with intro. and comm., by Rita Beyers. (Corpus Christianorum, Series Apocryphorum, 10.) Pp. 456. Turnhout: Brepols, 1997. B.Fr. 7,000. 2 503 41101 X; 2 503 41102 9; 2 503 41000 6

A major motive behind many of the writings gathered together into collections of Christian apocrypha seems to have been the plugging of perceived gaps in the earlier stories that were eventually to be found in the canonical New Testament. Curiosity about Jesus' birth and ancestry was one area that led to expansions

from the second century onwards, beginning with the *Protevangelium* of James. The present book is a developed form of a Latin adaptation of the *Protevangelium*. The *De nativitate Mariae* concentrates on Mary's parents, her birth and upbringing as a ward of the Temple, and her betrothal to Joseph; it ends with the Annunciation and the conception of Jesus. An earlier form of the story is found in the seventh-century *Gospel of Pseudo-Matthew*. The *De nativitate*, a rewriting of parts of the *Pseudo-Matthew*, probably originated in the ninth/tenth centuries. In this study Beyers compares the *De nativitate* with *Pseudo-Matthew* and the *Protevangelium* and shows the subtle changes introduced in the retelling of the story of Mary's early years, and the ways in which these legends both reflected and encouraged Marian devotion in the Church. The *De nativitate* was a powerful influence disseminating these traditions in the Latin west, particularly in medieval France, England and Germany, and more widely once it was made use of in the thirteenth century in Jacob of Voragine's *Golden legend*. Beyers has been assiduous in collating over 100 manuscripts containing the *De nativitate* and the bulk of the monograph is a description of the manuscript heritage. Her edition is a careful, reconstructed text based on these collations. The text and its French translation are accompanied by a rich *apparatus criticus* with explanatory footnotes. The volume is the tenth in the series *Corpus Christianorum Series Apocryphorum* and should be read in conjunction with the previous volume, on the text of the *Pseudo-Matthew*, edited by Jan Gijsel. The introductory chapter to vol. ix (also by Beyers) serves as an introduction to both the *Pseudo-Matthew* and the *De nativitate*. The indices to vol. x cover both volumes and include concordances to the Latin vocabulary in both texts. Beyers's impressive work on the *De nativitate* will give a long overdue and much needed boost to an apocryphon all too often neglected nowadays.

University of Leeds J. K. Elliott

Trinity and incarnation in Anglo-Saxon art and thought. By Barbara C. Raw. (Cambridge Studies in Anglo-Saxon England, 21.) Pp. x + 221 + 23 plates. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997. £37.50. 0 521 55371 7

Cambridge Studies in Anglo-Saxon England comes of age, so (opportunistically) to speak, with volume xxi; and, leaving far behind Cambridge's once-influential Chadwickian Heroic Age preoccupation, it monumentally testifies to the reappraisal of the intellectual legacy of pre-Conquest England achieved by Anglo-Saxonists in this second half of the century. A readiness to link literature with art, liturgy with both, to address the theology informing them, to analyse and appreciate the spirituality cultivated through them, is winning rich harvest from the monastically-sifted seed-corn comprising much of the legacy. Insularities, discontinuities loom less large. Eve-of-Conquest Anglo-Saxon religious culture, learned and popular (the role of the vernacular language, the genres of homily and religious poetry are crucial here), is perceived as an onward-looking development of the accomplishments of the Carolingian period in Europe (to which England had signally contributed) – a culture independent but not insular, orthodox but not devoid of originality. Barbara Raw, with enviable

versatility in this interdisciplinary field, here contributes again to the series. Judicious chapters surveying the history of the theology and imagising of Trinity and of Son, and the sustained theme of the image (of the Trinity in the soul, of the unseen Godhead in the incarnate Christ, of God's own likeness restored in redeemed humankind) endorse the title – which otherwise proves a rather capacious hold-all: but the chapters on prayer and contemplation and on signs and images, if not single-mindedly contributory to a thesis on Trinity and Incarnation, are valuable accounts of the landscape of Anglo-Saxon spirituality. In these latter chapters on inward registration of truth from image, the rationalism of Augustine on memory is preferred to the mysticism of Gregory on *compunctio cordis* (even though the Anglo-Saxons knew Ephraim's Trinity-aligned dictum, that *compunctio* is in accord with God, attracts to itself the Holy Spirit and causes Christ the only-begotten to dwell within it) – that is a study, at the heart of this territory, still waiting to be written. A strength of the book is its copious reference to and iconographic analysis of specific Anglo-Saxon pictorial images. The twenty-three reproductions are useful notwithstanding loss of definition through monochrome printing and size reduction. The book is generously footnoted. Scholarly propriety may give non-linguists a tough time: Old English and Latin quotations are in the main text, translations in the footnotes. The value of this learned, lucid and attractively designed book is as an historical and iconographic overview rather than a theological critique, even less an apologia for the medieval world-view whose relics modern commentators like to blame for the outmoded image of the Church in contemporary society. It is the work of one thoroughly at home in early medieval religious thought and expression. Ecclesiastical historians and theologians who have the Christian Anglo-Saxons cut and dried in terms of such as Rock, Deanesly and Knowles will find here that things have been going on since which should renew their interest in and estimation of pre-Conquest religious culture.

University of York S. A. J. Bradley

Medieval stereotypes and modern antisemitism. By Robert Chazan. Pp. xiii + 189. Berkeley–Los Angeles–London: University of California Press, 1997. £24.95. 0 520 20394 1

In 1990, Gavin Langmuir produced two substantial volumes, the first being a collection of his major articles entitled *Toward a definition of antisemitism*, and the second consisting of a distillation of a lifetime's scholarship on the subject of *History, religion and antisemitism*. Up to now, the equally distinguished work of Robert Chazan has consisted of studies with a more specific focus, including, in addition to numerous learned articles, four valuable and stimulating books on specific aspects of medieval Jewish history: *Medieval Jewry in northern France: a political and social history* (1973); *European Jewry and the First Crusade* (1987); *Daggers of faith: thirteenth-century Christian missionizing and Jewish response* (1989); *In the year 1096: the First Crusade and the Jews* (1996). In his latest book, Professor Chazan has ventured onto the wider ground of the supposed medieval origins of modern antisemitism, which has up to now been largely occupied by Langmuir, and by

two other contemporary scholars, R. I. Moore, in his seminal study *The formation of a persecuting society: power and deviance in western Europe, 950–1250* (1987), and Jeremy Cohen, in his earlier and equally stimulating work, *The friars and the Jews: the evolution of medieval anti-Judaism* (1982). The result is a short book on an extremely large and ambitious theme, nothing less than the origin of twentieth-century assaults on Europe's Jewish communities, culminating in Hitler's attempt at their complete elimination.

Chazan does not claim that more recent events can be entirely explained by what happened in England, France and Germany in the eleventh to thirteenth centuries, but he does set out to show that the horrors of the twentieth century would not have occurred in the same form had it not been for ideas and stereotypes concerning Jews, which were first placed in the minds of the majority Christian population in those countries and in that period. Thus he stands back, somewhat, from the meticulous and detailed scholarship which he has produced up to now, in order to place his researches more explicitly in the domain of those whose concern is to understand more recent events. Perhaps inevitably, given this purpose, Chazan rejects the attempt by Cohen, and others, to distinguish medieval anti-Jewish belief and feeling from their modern successors by describing them as 'anti-Judaism' rather than 'antisemitism', on the grounds that their well-springs were religious, rather than scientific and racial: for Chazan, it is all antisemitism. Having set out on the path which he believes to lead directly from the First Crusade to Auschwitz, Chazan provides a series of short and densely-argued chapters, which aim to substantiate his main thesis. They rehearse known material, partly made familiar by his own work, on the violent attacks made by Emicho of Leiningen's followers on Jews in the Rhineland, at the beginning of the First Crusade in 1096, and the 'blood libel' accusations that Jews murdered Christian children (generally boys) in order to re-enact Christ's Passion, which seem to have begun in Norwich in 1144. Chazan thus surveys the outline of legislation and action against Jews up to the latter part of the thirteenth century, at least in so far as the communities of England, France and the Holy Roman Empire were thus affected. He is perhaps rather too inclined to disregard Jeremy Cohen's book, and its highly stimulating, if not uncontested, thesis that the real deterioration in Jewish conditions in western Europe came about in the thirteenth century, as a result of the activities of the newly-founded orders of friars, and their papal backers, but there are other problems, too, with Chazan's contention that the crucial developments took place in the previous century. The first of these concerns the book's geographical scope. While it may be reasonable to exclude Slav Europe, because of the limited scale and significance of its Jewish communities in this earlier period, it seems odd to ignore Italy, whence so many Jews came to form the Ashkenazi communities, and the omission of Iberia seems perverse, and has an unfortunate effect on the balance of the book, and hence on the credibility of its main thesis. Although he rightly criticises Mark Cohen for failing to compare like with like, in his study, *Under crescent and cross: the Jews in the Middle Ages* (1994), where that author uses, as his ill-matched comparative examples, Jewish communities in Muslim lands and recent immigrants into Christian northern Europe, Chazan falls into the same trap of ignoring 'Reconquest' Spain, which is strange, given that his earlier book, *Daggers of faith*, surveys some of the crucial developments, both theoretical and practical, in

Jewish–Christian relations, which began in Spain but had important effects beyond the Pyrenees as well. Lack of attention to the Iberian situation leads him, notably, into a curiously distorted assessment of Peter the Venerable, abbot of Cluny in the twelfth century, of whom he states that, 'When authority figures like Peter the Venerable did play a role in fostering anti-Jewish attitudes, they do not seem to have been moved by the yen for power' (pp. 83–4). Rather nearer the mark is Bernard Reilly's stress in *The contest of Christian and Muslim Spain, 1031–1157* (1992), for example, pp. 256–7, on the immense political and economic interests of Peter, and his abbey, in the Peninsula, and his primary role as a polemicist against Islam, rather than Judaism.

It is perhaps inevitable that, given his determination to link eleventh- and twelfth-century events directly to twentieth-century antisemitism, Chazan should not be able, or willing, to accept Moore's thesis that anti-Jewish measures should not be considered in isolation from similar, or more severe, attacks on other minorities, such as Christian 'heretics', lepers and homosexuals. It might be questioned whether Nazi policies themselves were so very different from medieval ones in this respect, but, in any case, Chazan is apparently determined to maintain the uniqueness of the Jewish experience, both medieval and modern. Langmuir's views on Jewish and Christian 'religiosity' are also subjected to critical scrutiny, and Chazan is inclined, in particular, to diminish that author's stress on doubt as a contributory cause of religious intolerance, and hence persecution. It seems, none the less, that Christian fears, whether as a group or as individuals, were indeed a crucial factor in action by Church and State against Jews in this period, and the inclusion of some consideration of Islam would surely have rendered such a conclusion inescapable. In short, *Medieval stereotypes* is always thoughtful and always stimulating, but, like a stimulating set of lectures, it raises as many questions as it answers. Chazan has made a useful contribution to our understanding of this terrible and long drawn-out blemish on European history, but there is still room for many more interventions, from this author and others.

OXFORD JOHN EDWARDS

Otto III. By Gerd Althoff. Pp. x + 243 + 1 black-and-white and 7 colour plates and genealogical table. Darmstadt: Primus, 1997. DM 58. 3 89678 021 2

Otto III is hard to pin down. Into his short life (he was not yet twenty-two when he died) he crammed a range of experiences which most people would take decades to acquire. Conversations with scholars, missionaries and hermits were as much a part of his life as the feasts and military expeditions which were the normal activities of medieval rulers. Otto's partly Byzantine parentage and his lengthy residences in Italy have traditionally made him seem exotic to German historians, and indeed also to German writers, notably Thomas Mann. Perhaps because of this, interpretations of Otto have until quite recently all too often been swayed by extremes of disapproval or of *Schwärmerei*. Althoff's book is an attempt to cut away these accretions and to explain, first, what the authors of late tenth- and early eleventh-century descriptions of Otto were trying to achieve and, secondly, what contemporary expectations of appropriate behaviour for a ruler

would have been. Although Althoff is writing for a fairly general audience, unlike, for example, the authors of two recent monographs on Otto, Johannes Fried (*Otto III. und Boleslaw Chrobry*, 1989) and Knut Görich (*Otto III. Romanus Saxonicus et Italicus*, 1993), his analysis of sources is not by any means a simplistic one, and difficulties posed by conflicting evidence or by *lacunae* in our knowledge are never ducked. Althoff begins by looking at nineteenth- and twentieth-century interpretations of Otto III, from Wilhelm von Giesebrecht to Carlrichard Brühl (1990), excluding the works of Fried and Görich, which are discussed elsewhere in the book. The survey of views over a century or more gives an absorbing and very funny insight into the subconscious mind of German historians (it might be worthwhile to undertake a similar exercise with English historians and their treatment of, for example, Richard I). Following this, Althoff recounts the events of Otto's reign, using major events as pegs on which to hang fuller discussions of particular aspects of imperial rule. The idea that rulers pursued 'policies' in the way that nineteenth-century statesmen did is rejected; as a result the female regents are given credit for negotiating and networking, rather than being seen as purely submissive to powerful clerics. Instead, the importance of convention and careful observance of ritual are stressed, and some of Otto's apparently bizarre actions are thus seen to conform to contemporary norms. Otto's harsh treatment of Crescentius in 998 becomes easier to understand if we note that, according to conventions for dealing with rebels, only one act of repentance on the part of the latter was allowed. Further acts of rebellion were punished with the punishment meted out to lapsed heretics. Otto's meeting with Boleslaw in the year 1000 is seen as a statement of political friendship (Althoff disagrees with Fried's view that Boleslaw was actually crowned king). Otto's piety, which was displayed in actions such as his penitential pilgrimage to Monte Gargano in 999 and in his pilgrimage to Gniezno the following year to pray at Adalbert's tomb, can also be explained as appropriate behaviour for a medieval ruler, though the precise ways in which it was manifested may well reflect Otto's own personal decisions. One of these was the opening of Charlemagne's grave at Aachen, which, following Görich, Althoff is happy to see as an *elevatio* and thus as the opening gambit in an attempt to have Charlemagne canonised. Althoff's final judgement on his subject is that Otto III was an innovative ruler, but within the conventions of behaviour which prevailed in the late tenth century: it is up to us to learn what these were and then to interpret them correctly.

UNIVERSITY OF NOTTINGHAM JULIA BARROW

Monastic revival and regional identity in early Normandy. By Cassandra Potts. (Studies in the History of Medieval Religion, 11.) Pp. xvi+170 incl. 5 maps. Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 1997. £40. 0 85115 702 5; 0955 2480

At 137 pages of text (the final thirty of so pages consist mainly of bibliography), this book is not long, especially as much of the page-length is accounted for by examples and footnotes. Yet its publication as a monograph rather than a long article is clearly justified by its scope. From the foundation of Normandy by a pagan, Scandinavian elite, through the first century of ducal government, the book charts the expansion of ducal authority from Rouen towards the south and

west, all from the perspective of relations between the dukes, and their kinsmen and followers, and the regular Church. Dr Potts does not gloss over the thorny question of Viking origins, but engages with it, arguing that Frankish feuding contributed greatly to the destruction of Carolingian Neustria. Evidence of the preservation of knowledge of pre-Norman ecclesiastical estates is adduced in support of the argument that the destruction was, in any event, exaggerated by contemporary (monastic) writers. The more subtle model of early Norman history presented here is that, while church lands were seized by early Norman lords, when monasteries were founded or refounded, the lands with which they were endowed 'from the ducal domain' often were none other than the lands seized from the Church (sometimes from the same monastery) a few decades before. At its core, the book is more conventional, describing how the Norman dukes used the Church to legitimise their regime by placing themselves at the forefront of the reform movement in the eleventh century, founding and refounding monasteries with the aid of reforming abbots, and thereby winning the approval and sanction of the influential churchmen of the day, and using the same policy to extend ducal authority to the south and west. As such, it represents an extremely valuable synthesis of numerous studies of individual monasteries, which have all pointed to this conclusion. Not only does this book condense much work published in France (and therefore often inaccessible to British and American readers), Dr Potts also marshalls an abundance of new evidence from unpublished charters, evidently the fruits of painstaking archival research. This book is a welcome addition to the historiography of Normandy before 1066, and also on the process and the progress of the ecclesiastical reform movement in western France.

Fitzwilliam College, J. A. Everard
Cambridge

Church reform and social change in eleventh-century Italy. Dominic of Sora and his patrons. By John Howe. (The Middle Ages Series.) Pp. xxiii + 220. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1997. £35. 0 8122 3412 X

John Howe argues that the life of Dominic of Sora (d. 1032) is an important and largely ignored waymarker in the history of church reform. This bold claim is backed up by the number of previous analyses which have successfully used *microstoria* to illuminate wider social and political questions. Howe then challenges the Franco–German hegemony over the study of church reform (in particular the work of Tellenbach), claiming that Italian developments in the half-century before the investiture contest effectively erase the historiographical division between monastic and clerical reformers (following the views of H. E. J. Cowdrey, whose work on Montecassino seems to have been very influential). How well does this obscure saint fulfil Howe's aspirations? Dominic's life is analysed via his relationship with the Marsican family of the Abruzzo region; his monastic foundations, replacing nuns with monks (a stock reformist *topos* which perhaps says more about the hagiographers than about Dominic); and the parallels which can be drawn with the lives of contemporary Greek saints (the weakest part of the book and an aspect which would have repaid closer scrutiny). Dominic founded,

and acted as spiritual leader of, a cluster of Apennine and Abruzzese houses, but on his death this monastic mini-empire was swallowed up by Farfa and Montecassino , the latter entering its greatest phase of influence and pulling the Marsicani into ties of dependency and dominance. (The *Registrum* of Peter the Deacon is cited here and in other parts of the book with little discussion about its obvious problems as a source of information about Montecassino's patronage network.) Dominic's own position was ambiguous: true reformist credentials could never be achieved whilst much of his work was for wealthy patrons, and the cult of his personality was clearly the driving force behind the survival of small houses on marginal lands. Overall, Dominic's life reads as this, a minor saint in a small and parochial world. The evidence does not quite support Howe's ambitious thesis, and indeed he calls for further work to be done on Italy in this period. If microhistory is about challenging traditional paradigms by shifting focus, then this work goes some way toward fulfilling that aim; but Dominic's life and those of his patrons are unlikely, on their own, to persuade historians to radically alter their views on a period of dramatic change in western European political and religious life.

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON PATRICIA SKINNER

Königsherrschaft im Streit. Konfliktaustragung in der Regierungszeit Heinrichs IV. zwischen Gewalt, Gespräch und Schriftlichkeit. By Monika Suchan. (Monographien zur Geschichte des Mittelatters, 42.) Pp. xix + 337. Stuttgart: Hiersemann, 1997. DM 258. 3 7772 9721 6

This densely argued and highly rewarding book is essential reading for all concerned with the conflicts in Germany that vexed the German monarchy under Henry IV as well as the wider conflicts between the king and successive popes, particularly Gregory VII, during the so-called 'Investiture Controversy' – a title that Suchan dismisses as inadequate and misleading. As her subtitle foreshadows, Suchan's approach is that of the Münster school of German historians like Gerd Althoff and Hagen Keller, whose emphasis is upon the role of medieval kings who operated within a complex pattern of rule and power (*Herrschaftsordnung*). It was sustained mainly by oral rather than by written means of communication. Conflicts were best settled through customary 'rules of the game' (*Spielregeln*) which were unwritten but well known to all concerned. They are not easily recoverable to modern historians, who may, however, be helped by social-anthropological comparisons. Henry IV's besetting mistake was that, having in the early years of his long reign taken too little account of his major subjects when exercising his lordship as king, he persisted in his ways and in the final crisis of 1105 and 1106 provoked the princes, this time decisively, to restore the situation by removing the disruptive element (*Störfaktor*) that such a king represented. Suchan's first major topic is the protracted conflicts with his German opponents, especially in Saxony and Swabia; she considers the fault-lines in the social structure that led to conflict, the opponents who confronted Henry at the various stages of the conflict, and the manner in which disputes were dealt with. With a wealth of detailed and incisive comment, she reviews each stage and crisis of the *causa regis* from Henry's minority to his tragic end. Especially under

Gregory VII, the papacy was drawn in and again Suchan's approach is illuminating. Especially noteworthy is her study of how Gregory's position changed from that of would-be arbiter between 1077 and 1080 to that of protagonist after 1080, so that the *causa regis* now had as its counterpart the *causa papae*. The involvement of the papacy and the issues which its involvement raised inevitably increased the role of literacy in the conflicts between Henry IV and his opponents. Secondly, therefore, Suchan turns to the place and value of literacy; she makes clear the care that must be taken to establish the relation between the written material that served to help and instruct those who took leading parts in articulating conflicts and the still largely oral manner of debate. She reviews the main forms of written material – canonical collections, controversial tracts, letters, histories and *Vitae* – with deep insight. There are gaps in the discussion; there is little about royal diplomata or about the development of *Landfrieden*, with the result that the more successful sides of Henry's bid to establish and communicate his regality are, perhaps, somewhat underplayed. But this is a small criticism of a very fine study indeed.

St Edmund Hall, H. E. J. Cowdrey
Oxford

Church and polity in pre-Norman Ireland. The case of Glendalough. By Ailbhe Séamus Mac Shamhráin. (Maynooth Monographs, 7.) Pp. xxv + 274 incl. 28 figs and maps. Maynooth: An Sagart, 1996. £24. 1 870684 68 0; 0790 8806

The aim of this book is to examine the relationship between a major Irish church, Glendalough, and the dynastic politics of pre-Norman Ireland. Since Glendalough had a whole range of associations with other churches, the scope of the discussion is much wider than one might initially expect. A rough chronological division is made in the tenth century, approximately when Brian Boru changed the balance of power between the major provincial kingdoms. This was accompanied by the decline of the Uí Dúnlainge dynasty that had dominated Leinster since the early eighth century. The strength of the book lies in the richness of its detail: Mac Shamhráin is at his best in a crucial task of an historian, hunting for connections between individuals and institutions. He has made good use of the rich genealogical collections, of martyrologies and litanies to build up an impression of the community of Glendalough. Some sources, such as the annals, only make very occasional reference to Glendalough before the eighth century, but close attention has been paid to what evidence survives. The geographical position of Glendalough within Leinster was marginal: in the northern half of the province there was a major divide between the fertile lands of the Liffey plain, including the major church of Kildare, and the less desirable region in and to the east of the Dublin and Wicklow Mountains. The latter was the refuge of failed dynasties, of 'external peoples', who were external not because they were considered aliens, but because they were excluded from political leadership. Major churches situated among minor dynasties were subject to two tendencies: on the one hand, they might become outposts of the major powers, such as the Uí Dúnlainge of the Liffey plain, offering an instrument through which overlordship could be made more immediately present among the

'external peoples'; on the other, they might be controlled by families from within the lesser dynasties, who gained in the headship of a great church compensation for diminished secular power. In the case of Glendalough, Mac Shamráin gives good reason to think that both these tendencies were at work. The founder and patron-saint, Cóemgen (Kevin), was of a declining group called Dál Messin-Corb; on the other hand, the Uí Máil, who held the kingship of Leinster at intervals up to 715, claimed a role, if not in the foundation, then at least in an early relocation of the monastery. Later the Uí Dúnlainge, dominant in Leinster from 715 until the eleventh century, acquired influence over Glendalough from about 800. Since great churches supported a number of officials, it was possible for more than one dynasty to have its representative in position at one and the same time. Mac Shamhráin also has important arguments to offer on the broader political history of Leinster and its neighbours. In particular, for the period up to the seventh century, he argues that there are clear signs in the surviving evidence of a Leinster whose influence extended far into what became the province of Munster. The evidence is varied in character and weight and will need much sifting. A possibility is that in the fourth and early fifth century Leinster (still controlling most of the midlands) was the leader of a political federation to which the Romans gave the name Scotti (a term only attested from the late Roman period); this federation was similar to other constellations of political power across the Roman frontier, such as the Franks, Alamans and Picts. The interesting and significant evidence assembled by Mac Shamhráin may represent the detritus of this early federation before it was destroyed by the Uí Néill and their allies, the Éoganachta.

Jesus College, T. M. Charles-Edwards
Oxford

Die Verteidigung der Priesterehe in der Reformzeit. By Erwin Frauenknecht. (Monumenta Germaniae Historica. Studien und Texte, 16) Pp. xix + 332. Hannover: Hahnsche Buchhandlung, 1997. DM 80. 3 7752 5415 3; 0938 6432

The church reform of the eleventh century and its significance for the history of the Middle Ages have been dealt with frequently, but rarely from the perspective of Frauenknecht's Regensburg PhD thesis, defended 1994/5. The thesis examines ecclesiastical opposition to papal legislation attacking 'married' clergy, primarily by way of the critical edition of five treatises written on behalf of such clergy, including priests. They date from the later eleventh and the first half of the twelfth century. For the tract known as Pseudo-Udalric, the *Apologia contra eos qui calumpniantur missas coniugatorum sacerdotum* of Sigebert of Gembloux, the letters of the clergy of Cambrai and Noyon and the *Tractatus pro clericorum conubio* Frauenknecht's publication now replaces the editions found in the *Libelli de lite* of the MGH; the youngest treatise, *Cum sub liberi arbitrii potestate creati simus* (after 1119), has also been published before, but here too Frauenknecht skilfully expands the textual basis with the help of additional manuscripts and early printed books. The commentary is thoughtful and detailed, and by no means limited to the texts critically edited. His arguments in favour of Rupert of Deutz

as author of *Contra litteras cuiusdam presbyterorum coniugatorum causam defendentis*, based on an analysis of the sources used, are persuasive. It is clear that the letters of the clerics of Cambrai and the response from Noyon, as well as the *Tractatus pro clericorum conubio*, constitute a reaction to the decrees of the Council of Poitiers of 1078 held by Hugh of Die, the legate of Pope Gregory VII (p. 166), nor can the twelfth-century date of *Cum liberi arbitrii potestate creati simus* be disputed. However, it is not nearly as certain that the *Epistola Pseudo-Udalrici* was composed no earlier than 1075 in reaction to Gregory's Roman council of 1075, or for that matter to the council of 1074. Gregory's reliance on the laity to coerce the clergy to observe celibacy as decreed indeed provoked much opposition at the time, but it should not be forgotten that he was not the first to call upon lay support for this purpose. The legislation of the Lateran council of 1059 under Nicolas II provided the antecedent. Frauenknecht's cautious arguments for 1075 as a date (p. 70) should not, therefore, be considered final as they seemingly are in the conclusion (p. 165), whatever one might think of the hypothess of Fliche – and whatever we know about the struggles at Constance in the 1070s, especially since Frauenknecht's critical editions indicate clearly the loss of additional texts. Frauenknecht's editorial comments and proofs that the transmission of the famous legend of Paphnutius at the Council of Nicaea, a stock in trade for defenders of clerical marriage, owes nothing to the influence of the *Epistola Udalrici* only serves to reinforce this point.

Catholic University of America, Washington, DC

Uta-Renate Blumenthal

The aristocracy of Norman England. By Judith A. Green, Pp. xv + 497 incl. 14 ills, 1 map and 1 table. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997. £45. 0 521 33509 4

This is an extremely useful book, providing a wide-ranging survey of the composition, power and practices of the aristocracy. It is divided into four sections, covering 'Conquest and settlement', 'Wealth and power', 'The aristocracy and the crown', and 'Aristocratic society'. It is based both on the author's own extensive research and a thorough coverage of modern literature on the subject. It develops the themes explored in Stenton's classic *First century of English feudalism 1066–1166* (Oxford 1932), but also moves beyond them, for example in dealing with religious patronage. With its lucid style, it is thoroughly accessible both to academics and to students; both groups will learn much in terms of information and of interpretation. There is, for example, a particularly interesting discussion of the role of Odo of Bayeux in the process of land settlement after 1066. Inevitably in a book of this scale and scope there are some slips. Some are minor. Litulf was *not* the lover of Hugh de Moreville's mother; she contrived his death because he had spurned her advances. (p. 14; cf. *English lawsuits from William I to Richard I*, ed. R. C. van Caenegem [Selden Society cvi, 1990], no. 330; for comments on the identity of those involved see R. Dahood in *Speculum* xlix [1994], 40–56.) Some are more significant. Whereas Green states (p. 341 – no footnote reference) that 'by the time that Glanvill was writing, it was

established that lords should not alienate more than one-third of their inheritance', such specification of a proportion is perhaps more characteristic of the custom of Normandy as presented in the later portion of the *Très ancien coutumier*; more typical of *Glanvill* is the statement that 'it is generally permitted to anyone in his life-time to give freely to anyone he wishes according to his will *a reasonable part of his land*' (*Glanvill*, ed. G. D. G. Hall, London 1965, 70). The book also raises some complex questions of interpretation. For example, Green's excellent study of royal administration (*The government of England under Henry I*, Cambridge 1986) has been criticised, notably by T. Bisson, for equating government with administration, thereby omitting the elements of lordship within Anglo-Norman kingship. One reading of the book under review is as a response to such criticism. Not just 'king-lordship' (Bisson's phrase) but 'lord-lordship' was heavily reliant on administration and the exploitation of lands. Chapter vii is introduced by the statement that 'Lordship was pervasive, a bond which, in a society of orders, ran from top to bottom, and it was ultimately coercive' (p. 194). Yet there is fairly little about coercion in the section on 'Wealth and power'; perhaps Green is implying that coercion should be seen only as an 'ultimate' resort, not as an integral and regular part of lordship in a world of Jolliffean lords. Green, probably to the relief of many, side-steps debate about 'feudalism'. It is to be hoped that this important book stimulates a fertile debate on the nature of aristocratic power, in England and beyond.

ST ANDREWS JOHN HUDSON

Monasteries and landscape in north east England. The medieval colonisation of the North York Moors. By Bryan Waites. Pp. x+214 incl. frontispiece and 47 ills. Oakham: Multum in Parvo Press, 1997. £15.95 (paper) plus £1.50 post and packing. 0 9524544 3 2

The publication of this volume by Bryan Waites is to be welcomed as an important contribution to the growing number of items dealing with monasteries and their impact on local landscapes in the Middle Ages. It is a collection of essays published elsewhere over many years and now here gathered together for the first time. There seems little reason for a limited print run (number not stated) as there are many who will find the papers useful. Also the opportunity to update the bibliography should have been taken – a few additional secondary sources have been added (p. 206) but even these miss out key recent books and authors. The maps which are one of the most useful features of the book are *very* poorly produced. This reviewer has no inherent aversion to the typed or manuscript labels on maps which many of these have, but the author here has been poorly served by the publisher. The maps should have been allocated at least a page each (giving them double the space). As it is, the key information on lands and granges is often too small or over-inked to be read easily. This is a pity for this is one of the great attributes of the book – we can see which lands, granges, churches and so on, were held by the great houses of Whitby, Rievaulx, Guisborough and others.

Nevertheless, this is a very useful volume and one that should be acquired by all those interested in the impact of monasteries on their locality and how they

organised the landscapes around them in the Middle Ages. Important for Yorkshire, it probably provides useful comparative material for similar studies, as yet to be undertaken, in other parts of Europe.

University of Bristol Mick Aston

A distinct voice. Medieval studies in honor of Leonard E. Boyle, O.P. Edited by Jaqueline Brown and William P. Stoneman. Pp. xiii + 668 incl frontispiece, numerous figs and tables. Notre Dame, South Bend, Ind: University of Notre Dame Press, 1997. £55.95. 0 268 00883 3

This weighty volume celebrates Leonard Boyle, not as prefect of the Vatican Library (1984–97), but as teacher of paleography to more than 500 students at Toronto (1961–84). Had the former been the case, his friends and admirers are so many that the work might well have exceeded the six-plus volumes accorded by *Studi e testi* to earlier prefects Ehrle, Mercati and Tisserant. As it is, his former students have assembled a magnificent tribute that reflects not only the skill and acumen he inculcated but also his enthusiasm and good humour.

The collection is remarkable both for the high quality of the contributions and for their unequal length, which varies from six to sixty-five pages. The twenty-five articles (not counting a eulogy in Latin verse and Boyle's bibliography) are arranged under eight heads that summarise the interests of the honoree in his Toronto days: 'Scribes and scholars'; 'Manuscripts in their settings'; 'Libraries'; 'Education'; 'Law' and 'Diplomatics'. Moreover, the Dominican order and the papacy are recurrent themes. Every century from the twelfth through the sixteenth is represented at least twice, although the thirteenth and fourteenth claim the lion's share; articles on Boethius and John the Scot are distinguished exceptions. Geographically, the scope includes England, France and Italy. Beyond these vague generalisations, this review can only single out several *notabilia* of general interest, while alerting the specialist to certain topics that might otherwise escape notice.

Anyone who thinks scholarship is dull should read Robert Brentano's affectionate reminiscences, 'The pleasures of provincial archives'. Richard and Mary Rouse provide a wholly unexpected diversion with the story of Raulinus of Devon, a wandering scribe who interpolated personal notes into the text of an elegant Bible he copied in Bologna (saec. xiii 3/4), ranging from 'Go to supper' through 'O you whore Meldrina…' to a twenty-line autobiographical *envoi*.

Each of the editors contributes a substantial work of reference. Stoneman provides a summary catalogue of the Bergendal collection in Toronto (106 manuscripts, mostly medieval), which Fr Boyle selected, mostly in the 1980s; its strengths are liturgy, law and theology. Jacqueline Brown (alias Tarrant) adds another detailed chapter to her studies of the formation of the *Corpus iuris canonici*, in this case the *Extravagantes communes*. Equally meaty is Michael Gervers's report of a veritable breakthrough in diplomatics, 'The dating of medieval English private charters of the twelfth and thirteenth centuries', which can be determined by computer-assisted comparisons.

For the rest, the scope and interest of the collection can best be communicated by listing a few of the subjects treated: Bishop Grosseteste's relations with the

papacy; the education of ordinary Dominicans and parish priests; the libraries of St Victor of Marseilles and of parish churches; the relation of the biblical *Glossa ordinaria* to Peter Lombard and to anti-Judaism; how Wyclif confronted popular views of transubstantiation; and how a Beguine 'voice' can be heard in the works of Thomas of Cantimpré, Dominican admirer.

Similarly, the 'distinct voice' of this Festschrift's enigmatic title must be that of Leonard Boyle himself, which is heard here played, as it were, on many diverse instruments *distinte*, *id est utiliter* (cf. I Cor. xiv. 7–9, and Aquinas ad loc.).

University of Kansas Richard Kay

Die Kanzlei der lateinischen Könige von Jerusalem. 2 vols. By Hans Eberhard Mayer. (Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Schriften, 40.) Pp. lxxii + 906; ix + 1027. Hanover: Hahnsche Buchhandlung, 1996. DM 360. 3 7752 5740 3; 3 7752 5741 1; 3 7752 5440 4 (set); 0080 6951

It has been recognised for a long time that the documentary materials for the history of the Latin settlements need detailed treatment. There are in them problems relating to transliteration and nomenclature which are peculiar to western settlements in Islamic territory, with parallels in Sicily and Spain. The charters which survive relate only to those institutions – merchant communities, religious houses and orders – which had depots in the west where their archives could be stored before the last beachheads in Palestine and Syria were overwhelmed by the Muslims in the late thirteenth century. And not all of these survive: the Templars must have shipped their central records across the Mediterranean but they have been almost entirely lost. We have no royal archives or registers and only one incomplete collection of deeds for a short-lived secular lordship, which exist today only because they passed with the property into the hands of the Teutonic knights. Documents are sometimes scattered, sometimes mutilated and sometimes so poorly copied that they are almost incomprehensible. Contemporary forgers were enthusiastically at work in the east: one of Professor Hans Mayer's most important books disentangled the story behind a group of charters constructed on behalf of merchants from Marseilles in the middle of the thirteenth century with the intention of fooling the papacy, which they did. The decision of King Louis-Philippe to open *Salles des Croisades* at Versailles where French families with crusading ancestors could display their coats of arms generated many spurious charters, some of which still flit in and out of modern histories.

The two volumes under review are the results of over thirty years' work by Mayer on the charters of the kingdom of Jerusalem with a view to producing a critical edition of them. So this massive study is in the way of being a preliminary to an edition. In the first volume Mayer considers the chancery's origins and its history to 1225, when the crown passed to the western emperors and the office's regular history ended. He identifies, examines the careers and analyses the styles of the chancellors, vice-chancellors, notaries and scribes who worked in it; and he goes on to describe their less established successors in the later thirteenth century. In the second volume he considers in detail a number of specific problems relating to the working practices of his individuals, all with reference to the charters

themselves. He includes editions of nineteen unedited or badly edited charters. The indexes are a joy, including one in which the charters are listed under their various editors as well as by the numbers given to them in Reinhold Röhricht's *Regesta regni Hierosolymitani*.

The chancery seems to have been definitively established in 1115. From that year until 1131 it was under Norman influence. There followed a short Angevin period, associated with the government of Fulk of Anjou, before, after one or two false starts, the Englishman Ralph 'of Bethlehem' embarked on his long career, from 1146 to 1174. Ralph, who came to Palestine after probable service between 1137 and 1141 as the chancellor of Mathilda of Boulogne, the wife of King Stephen of England, was to be caught up in the disputes between Queen Melisende of Jerusalem and her son King Baldwin III and does not seem to have been firmly in place until 1152. He was followed by the historian William of Tyre, and then by a succession of Frenchmen: Peter of Lydda (Angoulême), Joscius of Tyre and Ralph of Merencourt. But the real power always lay with the *dictatores*, the chancery notaries who were, according to Mayer, the real '*Macher*'; his analysis of the style of documents issued under Ralph of Bethlehem and his conjectures as to the actual *dictatores* are among the finest and most subtle analyses of charters I have ever read. It is not surprising that both chancellors and notaries tended to be chosen personally by the kings and when the rulers were from the west were often their compatriots.

These two volumes are certainly the most important studies of the palaeography and diplomatic of the kingdom of Jerusalem ever to appear and when taken together with Mayer's other work in this field, particularly *Bistümer*, *Klöster und Stifte im Königreich Jerusalem*, *Das Siegelwesen in den Kreuzfahrerstaaten* and *Marseilles Levantehandel und ein Akkonensisches Fälscheratelier des 13. Jahrhunderts*, constitute a really valuable achievement. No serious historian can afford to ignore Mayer's close analysis of individual charters which reveals so much more about them than appears on the surface. The history of the kingdom of Jerusalem will never be the same again and we must wait eagerly for the edition of the *Urkunden* which will follow.

Emmanuel College, Jonathan Riley-Smith
Cambridge

The Latin Church in Cyprus, 1195–1312. By Nicholas Coureas. Pp. xiv + 361 incl. 3 maps. Aldershot: Ashgate, 1997. £45. 1 85928 447 7

This book will replace the older works, particularly those of Count Louis de Mas Latrie and Sir George Hill, and also the recent multi-author surveys in Greek in the *History of Cyprus*, iv, edited by Theodore Papadopoullos (1995), as the standard work on its subject. It covers the installation of the Latin Church, its internal organisation and problems, the religious orders, and relations with the Greek Orthodox Church. The sources are limited; there is only one surviving cartulary, that of the Cathedral of Santa Sophia at Nicosia, re-edited in 1997 by Nicholas Coureas and Christopher Schabel (reviewed below, p. 352). Cyprus was part of Byzantium and its population was never won over to Rome. The Latin Church represented a dominant minority; it quarrelled with itself, especially over

money; and sometimes it oppressed the Greeks who were reluctant to accept their technical dependence as Uniates who recognised the supremacy of the pope while retaining their Greek rites and liturgical language. The book provides an interesting example, illustrated from many papal letters, of how Rome could try to manage a new ecclesiastical colony. It is especially useful to have the secular Church and the religious orders integrated into a single account, with the military-religious orders, naturally important on an island so close to the crusading front line, given full treatment. It seems scarcely credible, however that the acts of the Templars' trial were correct in stating that there were 400 Templars on Cyprus in 1291 (p. 131). There would be room for a broader approach with comparisons, perhaps with Syria and Crete or, further afield, with Sicily or Valencia. On the military orders after the fall of Acre in 1291 Coureas effectively uses Genoese and other notarial records, but the treatment of the Templars and their downfall after 1307, though rather detailed, is perhaps not entirely satisfactory; various works have not been used, in some cases, including articles by the author himself, because they appeared too recently.

BATH ANTHONY LUTTRELL

The first universities. Studium Generale *and the origins of university education in Europe*. By Olaf Pedersen, translated by Richard North. Pp. xvi + 310. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997. £40. 0 521 59431 6

Claiming, incorrectly, that there has been no general book on medieval universities since Hastings Rashdall, Olaf Pedersen offers an introductory, and thoroughly derivative, survey of education from its classical and early medieval roots (chs i–v) through the high medieval universities (chs vi–ix), ending (ch. x) with a superficial and shaky sketch of what universities actually taught. He emphasises the organisation, not the content, of education. Further, the secondary literature he reprises is often outdated, leading him to repeat or compound factual errors more recently given the decent burials they deserve. Thus, for Pedersen, the House of Wisdom ceased to function in Baghdad in 1258, not at the end of the ninth century; Gilbert of Poitiers wrote the *Liber de sex principiis*; Pope Alexander III was the Roland who authored a *Summa* commenting on Gratian; Peter of Poitiers and Peter the Chanter produced commentaries on the Lombard's *Sentences*, a work for which Robert Pullen was the chief model; the mendicants in mid thirteenth-century Paris had no organised programmes of study; and so on. In short, beginners interested in the history of medieval education should stick to reliable authorities, such as H. I. Marrou, P. Riché, M. L. W. Laistner, J. J. Contreni, and E. S. Duckett for the pre-university story, and C. H. Haskins, A. B. Cobban, and H. de Ridder-Symoens for the universities, along with D. Wagner and his collaborators for the teaching of the liberal arts across the Middle Ages and the standard scholarship on the disciplines in the higher faculties of universities.

OBERLIN COLLEGE, OHIO MARCIA L. COLISH

The aristocracy in twelfth-century León and Castile. By Simon Barton. (Cambridge Studies in Medieval Life and Thought, 4th Ser., 34.) Pp. xvi + 368 incl. 6 maps and 8 tables. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997. £45. 0521 49727 2

This study is based on a wide-ranging examination of primary sources, both published and unpublished, and it seeks to provide a comprehensive investigation of the twelfth-century aristocracy of León and Castile; the childhood and old age of nobles are considered as well as more predictable topics such as military activities and relations with the Crown and the Church. Good use is made of charter evidence to trace the attendance of nobles at the royal *curia* and to assess the extent of their participation in some of Alfonso VI's campaigns; and in an appendix information is given about the careers of forty-eight nobles who held comital rank in the twelfth century. The book also has the merit of relating what was happening in the Iberian peninsula to trends elsewhere in Europe: it is thus argued that, although the beginnings of a sense of lineage are apparent in the twelfth century, this developed more slowly in León and Castile than in France and Germany. But at many points the author is hampered by the lack of adequate evidence: information about the aristocracy has to be derived mainly from materials in ecclesiastical archives. The result is that in some sections the points made are either speculative or rather familiar. Yet, although a dearth of evidence occasionally leads the author to stray a little from his main theme, he has produced a sound and thorough book.

DURHAM A. J. FOREY

Roger II. von Sizilien. Herrscher zwischen Orient und Okzident. By Hubert Houben. Pp. x + 235 incl. 10 ills + 2 tables and maps. Darmstadt: Primus, 1997. DM 58. 3 89678 024 7

Though there have been studies of a number of important aspects of medieval southern Italy in recent years, there has been no book devoted specifically to the life and reign of King Roger, the founder of the kingdom of Sicily, since those of Erich Caspar (1904) and Edmund Curtis (1913). For that reason alone Hubert Houben's new work would be welcome. It provides a clear, scholarly and up-to-date introduction which, if available in English translation, would be ideal for students. About two-thirds of the book give an intelligent narrative of the reign, closely based on the primary sources; the last third provides an analysis of its culture and of the development of the royal government. The author illustrates his account throughout by plentiful quotation from a wide range of contemporary texts. Given the format of the series in which the book appears there must be an element of compression and synthesis, especially in the analytical sections, but the author's own judgements are for the most part shrewd and sensible, as for example in his treatment of King Roger's coronation in 1130, of the so-called 'Assizes of Ariano', and of the question of whether or not the twelfth-century kings of Sicily deliberately favoured north Italian merchants to the detriment of their own entrepreneurs. He also displays a good knowledge of Islamic affairs and sources, and rightly comments on the political problems still outstanding when the king died in 1154. There are however two important aspects which might

have received more attention than they do here. While relations between the king and the papacy are treated at some length and very competently, very little is said about the Church within the kingdom or of the king's own ecclesiastical patronage. Study of the latter is certainly not helped by the high proportion of later forgeries among the surviving charters ascribed to King Roger, but some discussion was needed, and the omission is a surprising one from the author of an excellent book on south Italian monasticism in this period. Secondly, and particularly in the light of Houben's comment about 'the latent opposition of the nobles and towns against Roger' (p. 170) even after the king's military victory against the mainland opponents in 1139, the lack of more than incidental discussion of the nobility is unfortunate. Some attention was surely needed to the quite extensive changes to both the personnel of the upper class and to the structure of the mainland counties after 1139, especially since the consequences of these changes played an important part in the problems on the south Italian mainland after 1154. None the less, this book is a very useful overview of a crucial period in south Italian history.

University of Leeds G. A. Loud

The cartulary of the cathedral of Holy Wisdom of Nicosia. Edited by Nicholas Coureas and Christopher Schabel. (Texts and Studies in the History of Cyprus, 25.) Pp. 347 incl. 12 notarial signs. Nicosia: Cyprus Research Centre, 1997. 9963 0 8036 7

This important cartulary consists of 140 documents, covering the period 1195 to 1564. As the editors state, eighty have been published before and another seventeen duplicate material which can be derived from those already published. Nevertheless, the provision of a modern edition which brings all these charters together, whether previously published or not, is fully justified. Although La Monte assembled a register in 1930, the documents themselves were mostly scattered in various nineteenth-century publications, deriving mainly from Mas-Latrie's copy in the Bibliothèque Nationale rather than from the cartulary preserved in Venice. One of several advantages of assembling them in this way is that it enables the cartulary to be studied as a whole. Thus, at least until the end of the thirteenth century, a thematic pattern can be discerned which offers some idea of the motives of the compilers, an issue which has become an increasingly important concern to historians. What emerges is a fascinating case history of the problems faced by a governing Latin minority on a predominantly Greek Orthodox island, where ecclesiastical and social relations were complicated by the presence of members of the Maronite, Jacobite and Nestorian communities, as well as by refugees from the increasingly beleaguered settlements on the mainland. Here the cartulary provides an invaluable resource for those studying the twin themes of frontier society and acculturation, again central preoccupations of historians in recent years. Relations between the Latin archbishops of Nicosia and the Greek Church were seldom harmonious; indeed, they were never likely to be given the draconian restrictions placed upon the Greeks in 1220 and 1222 which, among other things, reduced the number of

Orthodox bishoprics on Cyprus from fourteen to four. However, they reached a new low during the pontificate of Gregory IX. In 1231 thirteen Greek monks from the monastery of Kantariotissa were burnt to death as heretics because of their refusal to accept the Latin view on the validity of unleavened bread in the communion, an action which was the direct result of papal encouragement to invoke the secular arm. Nine years later, the issue provoked the entire Greek hierarchy to leave the island, soon to be followed by the rest of their clergy, expelled on papal orders. The rigidity of the Latin hierarchy in Cyprus in many ways reflects its insecurity. Two mid fourteenth-century documents encapsulate the situation. In 1348 Clement VI confirmed the marriages of various Latin nobles although they were related within the prohibited degrees without requiring them to make the customary journey to Rome for dispensations, since the archbishop of Nicosia, Philip of Chamberlhac, had pointed out to him the problems the Latins faced as a minority trying to preserve their identity when they were surrounded by what he described as infidel nations and peoples. The reasons behind the archbishop's concerns were evident twenty years later when his successor complained to Urban V that 'a large proportion of both noble and plebeian women of the city verbally profess themselves adherents of the Catholic faith but contradict this in their customs and actions by frequenting the churches of Greeks and schismatics'. Little more than a century and a half after Richard I's conquest, the archbishops give the impression of men vainly struggling to counteract an inevitable tendency towards assimilation. There is a need for a history of the Latin Church on the island to complement Peter Edbury's political account; these charters provide some of the fundamental raw material for such a project.

University of Reading Malcolm Barber

Klerikale Karrieren. Das ländliche Chorherrenstift Embrach und seine Mitglieder im Mittelalter. By Béatrice Wiggenhauser. Pp. 649. Zürich: Chronos, 1997. 3 905312 45 X

This work, a PhD dissertation from the University of Zürich, consists of a list of the identifiable canons and petitioners for prebends at the collegiate church of Embrach, near Zürich, prefaced by a lengthy introductory survey of the church, its prebendaries and their career-patterns. Embrach was a relatively small foundation with only modest endowments. Not surprisingly, it was overshadowed by larger institutions like Zürich's Grossmünster, and its recruitment remained largely local. Beyond its interest for historians of German-speaking Switzerland, the usefulness of this prosopographical examination of Embrach's canons lies in rounding out our knowledge of patronage and career structures for clerics of middling social rank. Embrach was probably founded in the eleventh century, though the earliest evidence for its existence is not trustworthy, and its continuous history can be traced only from *c*. 1200. Few canons can be identified before the late thirteenth century and most of the 253 entries (of which seventy-two refer to unsuccessful petitioners) are from the two centuries preceding the chapter's dissolution in 1524. Recruitment throughout the period came overwhelmingly

from the (admittedly very large) diocese of Constance, and, within that area, chiefly from around Embrach and from Zürich, except during the first half of the fourteenth century, when there was an influx of canons from around Lake Constance. In the second half of the fifteenth century the town of Zürich gained control of the church of Embrach and from then on most canons came from well-to-do Zürich families. Slightly under a third of canons, and rather more than a third of petitioners, had studied at university, Bologna being the preferred place of study until the foundation of Vienna in the fourteenth century, and Basle overtaking Vienna after its foundation in the fifteenth. However, those clerics who wished to study civil law often proceeded to Italian universities after arts courses elsewhere. Embrach canons not infrequently held prebends in other churches in the diocese of Constance, particularly at Zürich's Grossmünster and Fraumünster; about a fifth of the total had prebends or benefices in other dioceses, usually Basle, Chur or Strasbourg. Further-flung contacts were much rarer, but students of the late medieval English Church might note the career of Thomas Hoppe, originally from the diocese of Worms, whose career at the Curia frequently involved acting as proctor for English prelates or as ambassador on missions to Edward IV. He twice sought a prebend at Embrach but was more successful elsewhere, including York Minster and Wells Cathedral (the compiler should have made use of the new edition of Le Neve for this entry).

UNIVERSITY OF NOTTINGHAM JULIA BARROW

Miracula sancti Dominici mandato magistri Berengarii collecta. Petri Calo legendae sancti Dominici. Edited by Simon Tugwell OP (Monumenta Ordinis Fratrum Praedicatorum Historica, 26. Corpus Hagiographicum Sancti Dominici.) Pp. 339. Rome: Istituto Storico Domenicano, 1997. L. 60,000.

With this volume the noble series of MOPH is relaunched after an interval of thirty years. This is the first of a series which promises to set the early hagiographical literature on St Dominic on entirely new foundations. Simon Tugwell, who has already shed a flood of light on Dominic himself through his translations and his 'Notes' (*Archivum Fratrum Praedicatorum* lxv [1997], 5–169; lxvi [1996], 5–200), now has in hand a new edition of all the early *legendae* and collections of miracles: he is already able to check his findings by his own provisional editions. The sources are closely related one to another, and he recognises that the effect of piecemeal editing will inevitably be that some revision is needed when all the texts have been studied with equal attention:

> But the need for a new edition of the primary sources is urgent, MOPH XVI having been long out of print, and there is in any case no such thing as a definitive edition of a text. So, rather than tempt providence by proposing to wait until all the work is done on the whole tradition, I intend to publish texts as my work on them comes to maturity. (p. 9)

One can only applaud this decision. The present volume comprises a collection of miracles put together in response to the appeal for material by the Master General Berenger in the Chapter of 1314, and a much larger life and miracles of the second quarter of the fourteenth century by brother Petrus Calò – with an

appendix of *testimonia*, texts making use of Calò. These works are not the earliest or the most important sources for Dominic or his *miracula*, but they are interesting and valuable, and the two-thirds or so of the book taken up by introduction and commentary comprise a monument of learning of deep interest not only to students of Dominic and the Dominicans but to all who wish to understand the early friars and the growth of the cults of their saints. In matters Dominican, everything Tugwell handles seems to turn to gold. The commentary deploys a wealth of learning and information illuminating these interesting texts, and very much more.

Clare Hall, Rosalind B. Brooke
Cambridge

Thomas de Chobham, *Summa de commendatione virtutum et extirpatione vitiorum* Edited by Franco Morenzoni). (Corpus Christianorum, Continuatio Mediaevalis, 82 B.) Pp. xviii + 309. Turnhout: Brepols, 1997. B.Fr. 5,000 (paper). 2 503 03825 5; 0 503 03826 3; 0 503 03000 9

Thomas of Chobham has emerged from relative obscurity in the last thirty years. Palémon Glorieux in 1933 knew only one of his major works as extant, his *Poenitentiale* (also known as *Summa confessorum*), along with a brief commentary on Baruch and a short treatise on the priesthood, and placed Chobham's career as regent master at Paris between 1211 and 1229. Since then Chobham's *Summa confessorum* (Louvain–Paris 1968), his *Summa de arte praedicandi* (Turnhout 1988), and his *Sermones* (Turnhout 1993), have been critically edited, the last two of these by Franco Morenzoni. John Baldwin devoted a section to Chobham in his *Masters, princes and merchants: the social views of Peter the Chanter and his circle* (Princeton 1970), and recently Morenzoni has published the first full study of Chobham: *Des écoles aux parioisses: Thomas de Chobham et la promotion de la prédication au début du XIIIe siècle* (Paris 1995).

As the title of this last work suggests, Chobham reflects the strong interest in preaching and pastoral care among Paris masters in the opening years of the thirteenth century. He was influenced by Peter the Chanter and no doubt studied under him. Chobham was a student at Paris in the late twelfth century and combined his teaching at Paris with an active ecclesiastical career at Salisbury. His years of teaching at Paris are now placed during the Great Interdict of 1208–13 and between 1217 and 1228.

In the brief introduction to the text, Morenzoni places Chobham's *Summa de commendatione virtutum* in the context of the reorientation of theological teaching in the direction of practical, pastoral instruction, away from a purely speculative approach that employed methods borrowed from philosophy as taught in the Faculty of Arts. This *Summa* dates to Chobham's second period of Parisian teaching, around 1220, and is heavily indebted to the Chanter's *Verbum abbreviatum*. After a section commending the study of the Word of God, Chobham reviews the role of preachers or those who expound Scripture, the role of theologians (to teach, dispute and preach), his commendation of the theological virtues (charity, faith and hope) and the cardinal virtues (prudence, justice,

temperance and fortitude), and finally, the removal of vices (lust, gluttony, anger, avarice, envy, sloth and pride).

Morenzoni's edition is based primarily on the only manuscript that contains the entire work: Munich, Staatsbibl. Clm 14062. The edition is well done, using the form of apparatus adopted by the *Corpus Christianorum*. Chobham's sources are given in the first level of the apparatus, and since the edition is based on one manuscript, the reading preferred by the editor is given in the text and the manuscript reading is indicated in the apparatus at the bottom of each page. The volume concludes with a scriptural index and an index of sources.

The text will be of interest to several groups of scholars. Its primary importance will be for the understanding of preaching and pastoral theology in the early thirteenth century, especially in connection with the circle of Peter the Chanter and the School of St Victor. It will also be an important text for understanding a major current of thought within the theological faculty at Paris in this period, one that has not received its due recognition alongside the speculative scholastic current evident in the work of Peter of Poitiers, Prepositinus, Stephen Langton and William of Auxerre.

UNIVERSITY OF WISCONSIN, MADISON — WILLIAM J. COURTENAY

Santità, culti, agiografia. Temi e prospettive. Atti del I Convegno di studio dell'Associazione italiana per lo studio della santità, dei culti e dell'agiografia. Roma, 24–26 ottobre 1996. Edited by Sofia Boesch Gajano. Pp. 382 incl. 22 figs. Rome: Viella, 1997. L.75,000 88 85669 662

This volume is the product of the first conference of the AISSCA (Italian Society for the Study of Hagiography, Saints and Cults), but almost two decades of concerted scholarly effort underpin its findings. The editor, Sofia Boesch Gajano, has mobilised a group of scholars who have met and interacted informally for many years, and whose interests span the very long Middle Ages, often reaching into the Counter-Reformation. The volume includes contributions by distinguished experts and by beginning scholars. Its twenty-one papers address not only extremely well-known themes in the history of cults' saints and the writings which they produced, but also subjects and approaches less frequently addressed, such as methodology and historiographical trends and traditions. Simon Ditchfield addresses the intellectual context of some twentieth-century debates on the significance of the cult of saints, while Giacomo Martina SJ authoritatively reflects on Catholic historiographies emanating from the papacy and the religious orders. Important comparative dimensions are introduced in the articles by Denise Aigle, on miracles in the medieval Islamic tradition, and by Krassimir Stantchev, on the Slavic Orthodox hagiographical tradition. A familiar and well-studied saint such as Hildegard of Bingen receives novel historical meaning when the vernacular hagiography in Picard dialect is studied: Laurence Moulinier shows that the vernacular *Vita* of the thirteenth century had already inserted Hildegard into a series of authoritative prophetic mystics alongside such popular figures as Mary of Oignies. Important insights into the process of saint-making

are offered by the articles in the section 'Carismi, Canonizzazioni, Devozioni', as some of the suggestions of André Vauchez's *La Sainteté au moyen-âge* are explored. Dominique Rigaux examines through three examples (Bavo, Panacea and Little Simon of Trent) the crucial role of imaging as part of the process of canonisation; and Jean-Michel Sallmann, an expert on early modern Neapolitan cults, reflects on the methodologies which might transcend the case-studies which have dominated so much work on saints. There is much more of interest in this volume, in which the French and Italian scholarly traditions predominate (these are the languages of the contributions, too); but many more questions clearly remain on the fruitful agenda of the AISSCA.

Pembroke College, Miri Rubin
Oxford

The Cathars and the Albigensian Crusade. By Michael Costen. Pp. x + 229 incl. 26 figs. Manchester–New York: Manchester University Press, 1997. £40 (cloth), £14.99 (paper). 0 7190 4331 X; 0 7190 4332 8

Crusaders and heretics, 12th–14th centuries. By Malcolm Barber. (Collected Studies, 498.) Pp. x + 289 incl. frontispiece. Aldershot: Variorum, 1995. £42.50. 0 86078 476 2

Both these books are primarily concerned with the history of France. Barber's volume of thirteen reprinted essays fans out from his classic work on the trial of the Templars, and includes accounts of the origins of the order, of the last Grand Master James of Molay, the social context of the Templars (especially illuminating on motivation and on the working of Templar houses at Provins), and the world picture of Philip the Fair, based on analysis of the high-level justifications for the king's actions against the Templars, put over by his chancery. To these should be added his exposé of the flaws in hypotheses linking the Templars to the Turin Shroud and two others concerned with Catharism in Languedoc and its patrons, an analysis of the role of women, using Doat, and an account of the pro-Cathar nobility of the mountains in the lordships of Cabaret, Minerve and Termes, stressing with the aid of illustrations the geographic factors which enabled them to sustain their independence in religion and politics, and ending with a wise and characteristic rejection of reach-me-down, universalist explanations for Cathar success in Languedoc. He suggests that 'dualist belief had a latent existence in most medieval minds' but was able to make such headway 'in the fractured society in the south' because of the absence of effective repression. Neither the urban nor the rural context was decisive. Three more articles, on the leper order of St Lazarus, the Templars' role in supplying the Crusader States and western attitudes to Frankish Greece in the thirteenth century are more directly concerned with crusades; another three on the shepherds' crusade, the Pastoureaux, and the 1321 plot of lepers, Jews and Moslems touch on the fringe of crusading, disturbances within France, and hysteria created by supposed internal and external threats to Christendom, and in the case of the fourteenth-century disorders, the effects of the great famine of 1315–17 and failures of political and clerical leadership. Three pages note books

and articles correcting or updating the essays. The corrections show the author's sustained capacity for deflating overblown hypotheses with methodical scholarship, and his feel for *mentalités* and the assumptions of chroniclers, conveyed in a sober, understated style, the more effective when, for example, narrating the pathetic fate of James of Molay, a not very intelligent leader, frightened and confused in face of a ruthless professional royal machine.

Costen's aim is to provide a survey of the context of the Albigensian Crusade, to the events of which he devotes somewhat less than three chapters out of nine, capable, and welcome in its awareness of the degree to which elements in the south backed Crusade and orthodoxy. His natural field is politics and economics, and his gift is for clear, forthright exposition, sustained by an unusually rich series of maps and diagrams, and a feel for the geography of Languedoc. His best chapter is his last, 'The Languedoc as part of France', where he summarises the effects of the long Cathar crisis. The whole is a very helpful introduction to subtle French scholarship. A fresh impression will need to correct misspellings and the neglect of accents, the misnaming of Henry the Monk as Henry the Petrobrusian, the curious use of 'interdiction' (p. 107), and to iron out the occasional careless phrase, as when he says that Catharism was 'a response to the need to reassert control by ordinary people to their surroundings' (p. 76), neglecting the implications of M. Roquebert's seminal work on the role of personal and political loyalty in establishing the Cathar adherence of the rank and file in society. He is not as much at ease on heresy and the Church as on politics and power, and this may account for a certain lack of focus in his final decisions on what made Languedoc Cathar; but he succeeds in his aim, of providing a succinct and agreeable account of research.

EASTCOMBE, M. D. LAMBERT
STROUD

Philip Augustus. King of France, 1180–1223. By Jim Bradbury. (The Medieval World.) Pp. xxiv + 376. London–New York: Longman, 1998 [1997]. £42 (cloth), £15.99 (paper). 0 582 06058 3; 0 582 06059 1

This is the third book-length study of Philip Augustus to have appeared in the last decade, coming after my own *Government of Philip Augustus* (1986) and Gérard Sivéry's *Philippe Auguste* (1993). This flurry of activity follows Alexander Cartellieri's magisterial *Philipp II. August* (1899–1922) by more than a half century. Cartellieri wrote his history from chronicles, mine was written from administrative documents, and Sivéry offered a brief synthesis based largely on chronicles. Now Jim Bradbury's new *Philip Augustus* shares Sivéry's goal of an 'overall view', although the latter's work apparently came too late to be taken into account. Not proposing original research, Bradbury has written a good survey of the king and his reign in 300 pages. He offers comprehensive coverage of Philip's military campaigns, of his collaboration with the Church and papacy, and of his fundamental reforms of government. In sum, he proposes a marriage between Cartellieri's narrative of events and my analysis of institutions. What, then, are Bradbury's own contributions to our understanding of this important

monarch? Following Cartellieri, he gives a perceptive and close rereading of the Anglo-Norman chroniclers from the original texts. (In contrast, the French chroniclers are largely accessed through secondary sources.) But unlike previous English readers Bradbury refuses to accept the hostile bias towards Philip of these Anglo-Norman writers and seeks to redress the balance. Like Sivéry he portrays Philip as an admirable king whose triumphs were due to his personal genius. As a young man Philip got off to an early start, even before the crusade, fought capably against Richard, and was an ardent and successful crusader. Innocent III met his match in Philip; the king stamped his personality on his government; and it was he who was responsible for the astounding victory at Bouvines. Since no new material is advanced, the historical data is not questioned but rather reassessed – somewhat like the proverbial glass of water which Bradbury finds half full rather than half empty. Richard's victories are not convincing (p. 116); Philip's defeats not serious (p. 124); his grants to the Church were modest, but not unimportant (p. 156). 'Philip was a tough-minded individual, he would not otherwise have been such a great king' (p. 221). Basically Bradbury's study is written to correct the prejudices of a British audience usually disposed to favour Richard. 'Philip was not the king we in England have come to think him. ... [He] was the sort of man the modern world should admire' (p. 333). With Sivéry and Bradbury once again historiography has quaintly returned to *une affaire des grands hommes*.

Johns Hopkins University John W. Baldwin

Paolo Marangon. Ad cognitionem scientiae festinare. Gli studi nell'università e nei conventi di Padova nei secoli XIII e XIV. Edited by Tiziana Pesenti (Centro per la Storia dell'Università di Padova, 31.) Pp. xxxi + 531. Trieste: Edizioni Lint, 1997. L.82,500. 88 86179 57 X

Paola Marangon died in 1984 at the age of thirty-six. His achievement as a scholar of the intellectual tradition of medieval Padua was immense; best known perhaps for his part in the great edition of the sermons of St Anthony of Padua and his work on the origins of Paduan Aristotelianism, he explored in numerous papers the cultural world of St Antony and Roland of Cremona, the Franciscan penitential movement of north-eastern Italy, the development of Scotism at Padua and the local intellectual background of the city's controversial luminary Marsilius. Many of the twenty papers gathered in this volume were first published in Paduan periodicals and collective volumes of limited circulation, and will not be as well-known generally as they should be. Their first focus is the intellectual culture associated with St Anthony, the originator of Franciscan learning, and that of the Convento del Santo in which his memory was preserved; his cult and the development of the university were closely intertwined. But Marangon went on to explore later Paduan characteristics, especially in his paper on its powerful Scotist school in the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries in a brilliant paper reprinted here, which demonstrates the standing of the Franciscan convent in an international network. Franciscan interest in the natural world was fuelled here by the medical studies of the university, where there flourished a

concentration on natural philosophy which in Paris would be condemned as Averroist. Two papers of great general interest are on the background of Marsilius: 'Marsilio tra preumanesimo e cultura delle arti', and 'Principi di teoria politica nell marca trevigiana: clero e comune a Padova al tempo di Marsilio'; Marangon points to the role of the mechanistic principle of *medietas*, or balance, as the justification of his view of the clergy as merely one working part of a social body; it was a principle developed in the medical ambience of Padua and then taken as a model for political theory. Underlying Marangon's scholarship was his detailed familiarity with the manuscript legacy of Paduan thought, in the Antoniana and elsewhere: besides enabling him to refer to some unpublished and little known treatises, this material has given solid authority to his account of Paduan Aristotelianism and Scotism as represented by the periodical accretions of texts. His early death has deprived us of the full fruits of his abundant and splendidly deployed learning. It is good to have his legacy collected together in this volume.

ORIEL COLLEGE, JEREMY CATTO
OXFORD

A history of Merton College, Oxford. By G. H. Martin and J. R. L. Highfield. Pp. xxii + 436 incl. 2 figs. + frontispiece, 47 black-and-white plates and 8 colour plates. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997. £45. 0 19 920183 8

This is an outstandingly successful college history, at once perceptive, generous, critical, witty and moving – and beautifully illustrated. The plates include Wim Swaan's vision of Mob Quad over the pattern of roofs, a sumptuously decorated Duns, Max Beerbohm's Max and the lime avenue in the garden. But it is not just a college history; for Merton is the mother of all the colleges of Oxford and Cambridge. University and Balliol may have an earlier pre-history, but the idea of a college as it flourished in these two places – and the need to understand it if the history of the two ancient English universities is to be grasped at all – were inspired by the fertile imaginations of Walter de Merton and his advisers in the 1260s and 1270s. Not all his ideas have lasted. He deliberately settled his students beside the parish church of St John the Baptist and planned for the church a future as college chapel and parish church combined – a model followed in three Cambridge colleges at least, most conspicuously in Michaelhouse whose founder entirely rebuilt St Michael's church in the 1320s for the purpose. This link is pursued behind Merton to 'the College's delicate connections with the Augustinian canons' which were 'complemented by the fact that part of its church, as in almost every Augustinian house in England, served the parish in which it stood' (pp. 39–40). One could go further, and say that it seems very likely that the founders of Merton in Oxford and Peterhouse, Michaelhouse and Corpus in Cambridge – perhaps others too – saw the link as a major feature of the college's function, to provide pastoral care for the parishioners and pastoral training for the Fellows. The relation of Fellows and Oxford churches lasted into the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries in various forms, a reminder of the element of continuity in the history of that strange medieval institution, the academic chantry, which we can see slowly transformed in the late nineteenth

and twentieth centuries into a distinguished home of education and secular learning. The learning of contemporary Merton is brilliantly reflected in the book itself. The preface explains that the medieval chapters – and Anthony Wood – are the work of Professor Martin, those which take the story from Bodley and Savile to the admission of women as students, Fellows and Warden, are Dr Highfield's. Readers of *The early rolls of Merton College* (1964) will expect to find Roger Highfield's learning underpinning the whole structure. There are many delicious as well as thought-provoking passages. Geoffrey Martin observes – following the sale by an early sixteenth-century Warden (who was sacked for his pains) of the site of the chapel's nave-to-be to the founder of Corpus in exchange for a peppercorn rent – 'Mertonians who pass by [the neighbouring college] rejoice that scholarship has been so signally and economically maintained there' (p. 147). Among the most memorable passages is Roger Highfield's account of Sir Henry Savile, courtier, scholar, don, eccentric, talent-spotter – he was believed to find talent especially among men who were tall (p. 190). 'What one College ever yeelded two such Heroical Spirits?' as Bodley and Savile – as a younger contemporary observed. Under the shadow of the vast *History of the University of Oxford*, the history of one college may seem a modest vessel. But the *History*'s most obvious weakness, at least in some of its later volumes, has been the lack of an adequate sense of the individuality of the colleges: and books such as this provide a much-needed scholarly corrective.

Gonville and Caius College, Cambridge C. N. L. Brooke

Fra Nicola da Milano. Collationes de beata virgine. A cycle of preaching in the Dominican congregation of the Blessed Virgin Mary at Imola, 1286–1287. Edited from Firenze, Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale, MS. Conv. soppr. G.7.1464. Edited by M. Michèle Mulchahey. (Toronto Medieval Latin Texts, 24.) Pp. viii + 119. Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies (for the Centre for Medieval Studies), 1997. $89 (paper). 0 88844 474 5

The *laudesi* and *disciplinati* societies of fourteenth- and fifteenth-century Italy mark a significant trend in medieval lay piety. Fostered by the incipient *fratres praedicatores* as means of promoting orthodoxy, these bodies continued to flourish even when the threat of heresy was no longer acute. Of particular interest in the light of Dominican spirituality are *laudesi* societies, Marian confraternities committed to a regular schedule of meetings, sermons, vernacular hymnody to the Virgin and, at times, also engaged in various works of mercy. The schedule of one such confraternity, the Congregation of the Blessed Virgin Mary at Imola, may be reconstructed from a cycle of collations by Fra Nicola da Milano, spiritual director of the Congregation from 1286 to 1287.

Edited from a fourteenth-century copy of Nicola's notebook, the collations offer valuable indications as to the teachings and fundamental nature of a Marian confraternity. The edition itself is both scholarly and thoroughly useable. Most textual references are traced and specified in the footnotes. Students with limited exposure to religious history will welcome the concise explanations of literary allusions, liturgical practices and specific terminology provided in the

notes; yet in their own right, the carefully-edited collations hold considerable interest for the historian as well.

UNIVERSITY COLLEGE, LONDON
RUTH HORIE

'*Songes of Rechelesnesse*'. *Langland and the Franciscans*. By Lawrence M. Clopper. (Studies in Medieval and Early Modern Civilization.) Pp. xviii + 368 incl. frontispiece. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1997. £39.50 ($52.50). 0 472 10744 5

Piers Plowman has a patent and urgent concern with the status and duties of clerics, and two influential recent studies link it with anti-fraternalism (Szittya) or a 'new anti-clericalism' (Scase). Lawrence Clopper contends that *Piers* in fact expresses a reformist Franciscan view, and that its attacks on contemporary mendicancy are precisely those to be found in internal critiques. Though the charges are often the same as those in anti-fraternal polemic, the poem's spirituality and mentality are, he argues, Franciscan. John XXII's ruling against the Spirituals in the early fourteenth century did not extinguish knowledge of their position: it was implicit in the *Rule* itself, and in writings of such respected figures as Bonaventure. Yet it is noteworthy that successive sections of the chapter on 'Mendicant debate and antifraternal critiques' are headed 'Internal debate up to Clement V's *Exivi de Paradiso* (1312)', and 'External antifraternal critiques': little is said of internal critique from reformist Franciscans in Langland's own day. The vagueness of the contemporary context is particularly plain when Clopper proposes, 'As the poem moves from its most intimate audience, the mendicant coterie I have projected, to secular clerics and even scribes for the London book trade, the text inevitably and understandably begins to be read differently' (p. 333). Our knowledge of the development and circulation of this work is uniquely detailed, yet Clopper's scenario is thus presented as a hypothetical anterior stage. That all surviving manuscript evidence testifies to stages when the work had already left the mendicant coterie, and 'was being misread' (p. 333) is conceivable but unsatisfying; the contrast with Wendy Scase's close attention to manuscripts and marginalia is striking. On the other hand, Clopper adduces extensive internal evidence. In particular, he argues that the rhetoric, structure and thought of *Piers* are profoundly influenced by an 'exemplarism', derived from Bonaventurean spirituality, which 'posits a universal analogy between the Persons of the Trinity and every individual thing in this world' (p. 105); and this analogy is a key to its distinctive version of the three estates, whereby the commons are aligned with the Holy Spirit. Further, the sense that reform of mendicants is a key to reform of Church as whole comes most convincingly from a member of the order, and while acknowledging that proof that the author was ever in actuality a Franciscan is not available, he contends that the strongest thrust of the work is directed against the Dreamer/Narrator himself, as a mendicant. Accordingly, 'Wille is not a literary convention; he is an anguished voice of conscience' (p. 332). The 'Rechelesness' of the title can express the Franciscan ideal, the perfect absence of solicitude; yet the figure of that name chooses the reckless pursuit of fortune, a failure of the ideal. In arguing that the poem's combination of intensity and ambivalence arises

fundamentally from mendicant self-criticism, Clopper has reoriented the study of *Piers Plowman*.

KEIO UNIVERSITY, TOKYO JOHN SCAHILL

Secretaries of God. Women prophets in late medieval and early modern England. By Diane Watt. Pp. ix + 198 incl. 7 ills. Woodbridge: D. S. Brewer, 1997. £35. 0 85991 524 7

After a brief discussion of continuities and discontinuities between women who took it upon themselves to exercise a prophetic role in England between the late fourteenth and mid seventeenth centuries, this literary study concentrates in successive, relatively short, chapters upon the 'voices' of the medieval visionary, Margery Kempe, of the 'Holy Maid of Kent', Elizabeth Barton, of Anne Askew, the Henrician Protestant martyr, and of the prolific early Stuart pamphleteer, Lady Eleanor Davies. All of them, albeit in very dissimilar ways, felt moved to comment adversely upon the conditions of their age, some venturing into even more hazardous territory by foretelling the future. In the account of her spiritual experiences dictated to her priestly amanuenses the exceedingly pious but essentially orthodox Margery Kempe denounced the inadequacies of the Church of her day. Edward Bocking, confessor to the very traditional early Tudor servant girl and subsequent nun, Elizabeth Barton, collected her revelations and miracles into a 'great book' destroyed by the state on her execution for treason in 1534 for daring to question the royal divorce. Much more highly educated and so freed from dependence on clerical assistance, the gentlewoman, Anne Askew, both wrote and smuggled out of prison descriptions of her examinations by conservative churchmen before her death at the stake for her Protestant principles in 1546. Most impenetrable by far, the high born Eleanor Davies in the following century composed innumerable broadsides in which amongst much else she attacked the insufficiently reformed English Church. (Dr Watt plausibly suggests that she may not have been nearly 'so mad a ladie' as her adversaries maintained, but she requires a book rather than a chapter to elucidate fully her exceptionally opaque effusions.) The author does not claim that there existed a historical tradition linking these women of often diametrically opposed beliefs from very diverse sections of society and from very different ages. Her book, nevertheless, supplies a helpful introduction to four English women whose opinions can be pursued further by means of the exceptionally detailed bibliography.

UNIVERSITY OF YORK CLAIRE CROSS

Royal writs addressed to John Buckingham, bishop of Lincoln, 1363–1398. Lincoln Register 12B. A calendar. Edited by A. K. McHardy. (Canterbury and York Society, 86.) Pp. xxix + 197. Woodbridge: Boydell Press (for The Canterbury and York Society and The Lincoln Record Society), 1997. £30. 0 907239 58 7; 0 901503 63 0; 0262 995X

Royal writs have not infrequently either disappeared from Lincoln episcopal registers or been misplaced. Dr Kathleen Major 'discovered' those for Gynwell

(1347–62) – Register 9B, for Repingdon (1405–19) – 15B, and also, in 9C, a misplaced quire of Buckingham writs for 1371–4, as well as the register now calendared, the existence of which has been obscured by its omission from Dr Smith's *Guide to bishops' registers* (1981). The calendar reincorporates the displaced material and in Appendix A adds further Buckingham writs from chancery documents in the Public Record Office (C.269), while Appendix B lists those copied into the bishop's other registers. The introduction is instructive, but whether one can infer 'that the decline in the standard of ecc[l]esiastical record-keeping was the result of the loosening of the links between the clergy and royal government' (p. xv) is debatable – only one factor perhaps. Of particular interest is the suggestion that changes in registration policy entailed the omission of writs concerning criminal cases – provided they lacked a pecuniary element, as well as those involving recovery of private debts (p. xvi). Embedded in routine material are rewarding glimpses of medieval practices; for instance, marriage in the church porch followed by nuptial mass, or the use of the bastardy writ to impune rights to property. The text has excellent footnotes, prompting few caveats. The close underlining of headings looks amateurish; why not in bold? On p. 5 'Cilite' should be 'Cilice', and 'Quatuor Coronati' is preferable to 'Crowns of the Four Saints'. The cardinal priest of that title was Pietro Iterii, who became cardinal bishop of Albano in 1364. For Gaillard de la Mothe and the Milton prebend see also Wright, *The Church and the English crown*, 327 n. 47. Overall this is a welcome addition to the Lincoln series.

CLARE HALL, ROY MARTIN HAINES
CAMBRIDGE

Entre dieu et satan. Les visions d'Ermine de Reims (†1396). Edited by Claude Arnaud-Gillet with Jean Le Graveur. (Millenio Medievale, 3. La tradizione profetica. 1.) Pp. 295. Firenze: SISMEL, 1997. L. 80,000. 88 87027 07 2

In 1401 Gerson, as chancellor of the University of Paris gave a *Judicium* on the visions of Ermine of Rheims, as recorded by her confessor, Jean le Graveur, and submitted by Jean Morel, canon of the abbey of St Denis at Rheims. Although this document has survived, together with five manuscripts of the visions themselves, three in French and two in Latin, the visionary herself is virtually unknown today. The text is here edited and translated for the first time in the series *La Tradizione Profetica*, directed by Professor Vauchez, who provides a preface to this volume. Ermine and her husband came to Rheims from the Vermandois in 1384, settling near the regular canons of Val-des-Écoliers where Jean Le Graveur was sub-prior. This was a dark period of endemic warfare, recurrent plague and schism in the Church: the editor calls Ermine 'une visionnaire au temps des Crises'. Widowed in 1393, she gave herself to religious devotions. During her last days, over a period of about ten months, she suffered continuous visionary attacks by the devil, only reaching some sort of spiritual tranquillity just before she died of plague in 1396. The visions, then, constitute an almost unrelieved narrative of horrific trials of faith, as in this instance: 'si vit devant lui … ung homme plus noir que charbon, tres horriblement hideux … [she swears to her confessor] qui n'estoit tourment sur terre qu'elle n'eust plus chier

a souffrir que de voir telle hideuse vision et eust esté hors de son sens, se Dieu ne l'eust garder de grace especialle' (p. 56). Recent studies have restored to us full records of the striking number of women in this period who were known for their mystical experiences, visions or exceptional lives of devotion. Ermine stands alone in this company – though perhaps closest to Margery Kempe. She had no vision of the future, no message of 'reformist apocalypticism'. She stands as a model of how simple souls met tribulation in a dark age through spiritual devotions and the faith of the Church. This edition is impeccable both in its presentation and its textual analysis.

St Anne's College, Marjorie Reeves
Oxford

Die Kirche des heiligen Andreas an der Treska. Geschichte, Architektur und Malerei einer palaiologenzeitlichen Stiftung des serbischen Prinzen Andreas. By Jadranka Prolović. (Österreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften Philosophisch-Historische Klasse Denkschriften, 253. Veröffentlichungen der Kommission für Byzantinistik, 7.) Pp. 308 + 22 colour plates and 144 black-and-white plates. Vienna: Österreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften, 1997. öS 1,250 (paper). 3 7001 2471 6

The church of Sv Andreas near Skopje in modern Macedonia was founded in 1388–9 by Prince Andreaš, the second son of King Vukašin of Serbia. It is now the subject of an exemplary old-style monograph. The church is a small single-nave, domed church (the interior measures only 7×5 m) in which a high percentage of the frescoes survive, now in good condition after a restoration in 1982. The book provides a very thorough and clear account of all aspects of the church's architecture and fresco decoration, as well as about its patron and its artists, who are named in one inscription as the monk Grigorije and the Metropolitan Jovan. These men, and the donor, are known from other monuments and Dr Prolović is able to discuss their relative input in some detail. The book begins with a succinct historical background to the period from 1350 on: the period of the collapse of central Serbian rule and the growing domination of the Turks, especially after the battle of Kosovo. After a brief but lucid account of the architecture of the church, the majority of the book is taken up with an iconographic analysis of the fresco cycle. The church has an extended passion cycle for such a small building, and this and the liturgical meanings of the apse frescoes are well described. There are extensive accounts of the many individual saints on the walls of the church. The author uses a wide variety of contemporary late Palaiologan monuments, drawing on material from Mount Athos to Mistra and Russia to provide a broader context for the decoration. The book is well illustrated with line drawings and many black-and-white photographs, which are (with a few exceptions) clear and well printed. It is now possible to come to a far more sophisticated view of the church, its political and cultural context than its traditional consignment to the 'Morava School' of Serbian art has previously allowed. This is a welcome addition to the publication of late Byzantine monuments and allows a fuller and more complex picture of the nature and development of Palaiologan art to be established. An additional chapter discusses

the later sixteenth-century painting of the narthex, and the continuance of Christian art under Turkish rule.

UNIVERSITY OF WARWICK ANTONY EASTMOND

The reformations in Ireland. Tradition and confessionalism, 1400–1690. By Samantha A. Meigs. (Early Modern History: Society and Culture.) Pp. xii + 209 incl. 2 maps. Basingstoke: Macmillan/New York: St Martin's Press, 1997. £45. 0 333 67825 7; 0 333 71194 7; 0 312 17582 5.

The study of religious change in early modern Ireland has undergone something of a renaissance in recent years. What has characterised that renaissance, however, has been a concern with the political and institutional manifestations in Ireland of those processes known as Reformation and Counter-Reformation. Samantha Meigs's book runs counter to that trend. This is a book which deals with religion as a social and cultural phenomenon rather than as a proxy for political allegiance. This is a position which potentially poses considerable problems for the historian since it reduces the usefulness of the records of central government for such an analysis. This challenge is met by the second innovative feature of this book; a willingness to deal with Irish language sources and to analyse the course and consequences of change not from the perspective of Dublin but from that of provincial Ireland.

The result of this daunting task is a wide-ranging book which begins in the fifteenth century and moves to the eighteenth tackling, in a general way, all the major issues of early modern Irish history along the way. The first part of the book deals with the traditional religion of late medieval Ireland. Here Meigs demonstrates the integration of religious belief and social order which gave traditional religion in Ireland much of its exotic appearance to outside observers. While the end product may have seemed curious to outsiders Meigs demonstrates that this was not some exotic set of pre-Christian beliefs with a vague Christianised veneer but rather a set of local adaptations of the ideas of western Christendom. Key to this process of adaptation were the learned classes, what Meigs terms the 'aes dana' (although the term is rather anachronistic), and specifically the bardic elite although the lawyers, potentially a very significant group in bridging cultural worlds, get little discussion.

The second part of the book deals with the consequences for that traditional social and religious world of the changes brought about by the Council of Trent and the Reformation. Here Meigs sees continuity as the key to understanding the failure of the Reformation to make significant progress in early modern Ireland. Thus, as she observes, 'Catholicism endured in Ireland because the clergy survived, and because the outlook of the Irish people remained fixed on their Gaelic, Catholic traditions' (p. 142). The key figures in this process are seen not as the secular clergy but the poets who moved into the Franciscan order and so transformed themselves from 'bards to missionaries', taking with them the values of traditional native Irish society.

In an Irish context these are interesting suggestions but they are not without problems. The position of the poets as lynch-pin figures spanning the traditional and Tridentine worlds, for instance, is at best a problematic one. Only two

examples of this process are produced and there were a great number of other bards who failed to make this transition. Moreover the impact on Ireland of the Franciscan activity at Louvain in producing Irish language texts and codifying hagiographical works is even more difficult to assess. On the hagiographical front the work of John Colgan, on which the argument for the rise of a 'Catholic nationalism' relies, was probably intended more for European consumption than for the Irish market. Moreover, the evidence that the devotional works composed in Louvain actually circulated in Ireland in the seventeenth century is slim. There is some evidence to suggest that they were published for use in the Irish-speaking regiments which served in the Spanish Netherlands and only made their way into the Irish tradition very late in the seventeenth century. However a more detailed examination than is undertaken here of the manuscript tradition of these works is required to resolve this question.

The question of who actually used such devotional works raises the wider question of the extent to which the Tridentine reforms penetrated Ireland in the seventeenth century. Here the book is at its weakest. The assessment of the geography and scale of the work of the continentally trained clergy is rather thin. The evidence offered in the chapter on the transformation of traditional religion suggests that rather than the triumph of Trent the seventeenth century in Ireland saw a very gradual accommodation of Trent to local circumstances or simply survivalist Catholicism.

Overall this is an interesting book which synthesises much of the secondary literature, provokes new questions and gathers together some of the scattered fragments of evidence from native Irish sources. It offers new perspectives on the age-old question of the apparent failure of Ireland to adopt the European norm of 'cuius regio, eius religio' but it indicates also the vast territory which is still to be covered in the quest for a solution to the conundrum.

National University of Ireland, Maynooth

Raymond Gillespie

The imitation of Christ. The first English translation of the 'Imitatio Christi'. Edited by B. J. H. Biggs. (Early English Text Society, 309.) Pp. lxxxix + 249 + frontispiece and 3 plates. Oxford: Oxford University Press (for the Early English Text Society), 1997. £30. 0 19 722312 5

Dr Biggs's new edition of the earliest English translation of the *Imitatio Christi* is a most welcome replacement for its predecessor, edited by J. K. Ingram and published by the same society more than a hundred years ago. Where Ingram published essentially a transcription of only one manuscript, with variants from another recorded in his footnotes, Dr Biggs has based his edition on all four versions known to have survived, choosing the Cambridge University Library manuscripts as his base text and supplementing this with the Trinity College, Dublin, version where the Cambridge text is defective. The manuscripts themselves are fully described (and even – happily – reproduced), their relationship with each other carefully delineated and a *stemma* constructed. The translator himself would seem to have worked from a Latin original, perhaps of Carthusian origin, but characteristic of texts known to have circulated in Austria,

Germany and the Low Countries. Dr Biggs is on more certain ground in suggesting, on the basis of the language of the manuscripts, their script and their known provenance that the translation itself originated in an English Charterhouse and was in all likelihood produced in the mid fifteenth century by an anonymous monk of Sheen. His work did not reach a wide audience. The four surviving manuscripts are closely related and can be shown to have circulated only within a geographically restricted and spiritually exclusive milieu. The translation may even, as Dr Biggs suggests, have originally been produced simply as a private devotional exercise, or perhaps by a monk of Sheen for a Bridgettine sister at the nearby community of Syon. There is no sign that the work was known far outside this circle. Equally, although the translation itself is clear and effective, such literary merits as it possesses arise more from its proximity to its original than from its own qualities. Rather the interest of this edition lies in another direction. Contrary to the stereotypical image of the careless scribe promulgated by those as distinguished as Roger Bacon or Chaucer himself, the scribes of these four manuscripts reveal a remarkably scrupulous attitude towards their work. When the scribe of the Glasgow manuscript noticed a *lacuna* in his exemplar he went so far as to return to a text of the Latin original and produce his own English version of the missing passage. Furthermore the Dublin manuscript was not only subject to correction by another hand over a considerable period of time, but this corrector also worked with regular reference to a text of the Latin original. The striking concern of some members of the Carthusian order (to say nothing also of the English Lollards) to produce carefully corrected texts of their books has frequently been stressed in recent years, and it is no accident that the most remarkable late medieval treatise on textual emendation should have been produced by a monk of the order, Oswald de Corda. Not the least of the merits of this edition is that it provides us with a particularly well-documented illustration of this concern at work.

PETERHOUSE, CAMBRIDGE

ROGER LOVATT

Toward the Inquisition. Essays on Jewish and Converso history in late medieval Spain. By B. Netanyahu. Pp. xiii + 269. Ithaca–London: Cornell University Press, 1997. £25.95. 0 8014 3410 6

Faith and fanaticism. Religious fervour in early modern Spain. Edited by Lesley Twomey, Pp viii + 181. Aldershot–Vermont: Ashgate, 1997. £39.50. 0 86078 665 X

Both these volumes deal with important aspects of the religion of two of the major faiths of the Iberian peninsula in early modern times. Professor Netanyahu's volume is a collection of seven major articles originally published between the years 1976 and 1997. They illustrate his seminal contribution to key issues in the history of the Spanish *marranos* in the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries, the theme to which he has devoted a life-time of research and which forms the subject of his substantial book published in 1995. All Netanyahu's work is based on a profound consciousness of Jewish cultural development across the centuries, and on a solid acquaintance with the relevant scholarship in several languages. He

has a gift for piecing together the few fragments of information available and building up a highly convincing argument. This can be seen here, for example, in his ingenious essay on the apparently voluntary conversion to Christianity in the fourteenth-century of Samuel Abravanel; and in his examination of a near-mythical document cited by officials and chroniclers in Toledo in the mid fifteenth century. One can often pick holes in parts of his exposition, but when Netanyahu wishes to do battle it is difficult not to be convinced by his lucid and penetrating logic. His powerful rebuttal ('The historical significance of the Hebrew sources') of those who criticised his views on the religion of the fifteenth-century *marranos*, is the best summary of the controversy on that theme. In brief, these are essays by a master scholar at his best; they were originally printed in very diverse places and it is a pleasure to have them available together.

Under a broad-ranging title, Twomey's volume brings together nine conference papers, most of them by specialists in literature, on aspects of the religious experience of early modern Spain. Ronald Cueto looks at female visionaries and reports the general hostility shown to them in the writings of male religious chroniclers. Lesley Twomey summarises Spanish attitudes to the doctrine of the Immaculate Conception up to the fifteenth century, as reflected in works submitted for poetry competitions at that time in Valencia (though it is puzzling that she describes the texts as fanatical, when they show no sign of being so). The late Gordon Kinder is represented by an excellent piece on Spanish Protestants that summarises the life-time's research he dedicated to the subject. Michael Alpert considers cases of alleged image desecration tried by the Inquisition in the seventeenth century, but curiously describes the accused as 'Spanish' in his title when his text states explicitly that they were 'poor Portuguese migrants'. For my money, the outstanding article in this volume is the examination by Nicholas Griffiths of 'popular religious scepticism' (based on examples from fifteenth-century Cuenca), which is notable for its wide reading, acute analysis and careful definition of categories. One may criticise, however, its excessive faith in the reliability of inquisitorial documents; and it is important to point out that the research done on the subject does not justify his claim that 'inquisitorial sources offer a complete cross-section of Spanish society', nor is it in any way true that 'literacy levels among the mass of the population were high'. Encarnación Sánchez gives a close and most informative textual analysis of the dialogue *Viaje de Turquía*, and John Jones summarises Pedro de Valencia's famous 1606 report on the *moriscos* of Spain. The volume offers a good, well-informed range of essays, and early modernists of all disciplines will pick up much that is new.

Higher Council for Scientific Research, Barcelona

Henry Kamen

Ioannis Pici Mirandulae Expositiones in psalmos. Edited by Antonino Raspanti, translated by Antonino Raspanti and Giacomo Raspanti. (Centro Internazionale di Cultura. 'Giovanni Pico Della Mirandola'. Studi Pichiani, 4.) Pp. 267. Florence: Olschki, 1997. L. 59,000. 88 222 4464 8

The *Centro Internazionale di Cultura* '*Giovanni Pico della Mirandola*' has recently published the first complete edition of Pico's *Expositiones in psalmos*, edited by

Antonino Raspanti. It was known that Giovanni Pico della Mirandola (1463–94), the Italian Renaissance scholar who wrote the *Heptaplus*, a cabalistic interpretation of Genesis, also commented on the psalms during the years 1488–94, but only the commentary on Psalm xv was included in the fifteenth-century edition of his works. In 1895 Felice Ceretti published the commentary on Psalm xlvii and in 1961 Eugenio Garin presented other unpublished material. This recent edition of all Pico's known commentaries – i.e. those on Psalms vi, x, xi, xv, xvii, xviii, xlvii, l – now affords us a new perspective on his exegetical activity. Pico shows both a depth of interpretation and remarkable philological learning: his comments on the psalms include a discussion of the merits of earlier translations (Pico knew Hebrew), an analysis of the text with reference to the circumstances of its redaction, and, in the footsteps of tradition, an explanation of the literal, allegorical, moral and anagogical meanings. Antonino Raspanti, author of a comprehensive study on Pico's philosophy and theology (*Filosofia, teologia, religione: l'unità della visione in Giovanni Pico della Mirandola*, Palermo 1991), introduces Pico's biblical exegesis and, in particular, traces the sources of his commentary. This new Italian translation, the teamwork of Antonino Raspanti and Giacomo Raspanti, seeks to adhere as much as possible to the original Latin text, but sometimes at the expense of stylistic fluency.

The Warburg Institute Alessandro Scafi

Prierias. The life and works of Silvestro Mazzolini da Prierio, 1465–1527. By Michael Tavuzzi. (Duke Monographs in Medieval and Renaissance Studies, 160.) Pp. viii + 189 incl. frontispiece. Durham, NC–London: Duke University Press, 1997. £37.95. 0 8223 1976 4

Long under-rated by Protestant and Catholic historians alike, Luther's conservative literary opponents have received more favourable verdicts from recent scholarship. but even their stoutest champions must have quaked at the thought of rehabilitating Prierias, the Dominican curial theologian whose *Dialogus* against the Ninety-five Theses was so bad that Pope Leo x reportedly dismissed its author as a filthy swine. Tavuzzi does a remarkable job in this well-written and beautifully produced biography, which suggests that philosophers should be encouraged to turn their hands to history more often. A compiler rather than an original thinker, motivated by jealousy in his dealings with Cajetan, for example, this Prierias is no plaster-saint; but neither is he the obscurantist buffoon of humanist legend. His interest in preaching is evidenced by his published volumes of sermons. He wrote derivative but popular works of hagiography and spiritual reflection. He also proved to be a strict reformer, and not of conventual Dominicans only: Tavuzzi argues that the *Consilium super reformatione ecclesiae*, usually ascribed to Cajetan, was Prierias's memorandum for the reforming Pope Adrian vi. His life-long concern for teaching was signalled by his first textbook, a work on astronomy in the form of a commentary on Sacrobosco (cited by Prierias throughout as Sacrobusto). The picture which emerges is of a conscientious churchman rather than a timeserver. Even the shortcomings of the *Dialogus*, blatant as they were, are here attributed more to tactical maladroitness on Prierias's part than to theological incompetence.

Tavuzzi's book offers many welcome correctives, not least a catalogue of Prierias's publications which replaces the flawed entry in Klaiber (1978).

University of Hull David Bagchi

Conversing with God. Prayer in Erasmus' pastoral writings. By Hilmar M. Pabel. (Erasmus Studies, 13.) Pp. ix + 264 incl. frontispiece. Toronto–Buffalo–London: University of Toronto Press, 1997. £45. 1 8020 4101 9; 0318 3319

Specialists and non-specialists alike will welcome this handsomely produced volume on Erasmus' spirituality. Pabel, who is an assistant professor of history at Simon Fraser University, Canada, offers us a perceptive synthesis of late twentieth-century scholarship on Erasmus' contributions to prayer in the sixteenth century. Since all of humanity is called to spiritual perfection, Erasmus views prayer as an intimate conversation with God. The subject of Erasmus' spirituality has mushroomed since the quincentennial celebration of his birth in 1969. Pabel's work is indebted to the ground-breaking studies of Léon-E. Halkin of Liége – even though he accuses him of certain excesses (p. 205 n. 23). The one flaw in this useful volume is its distorted view of Erasmus' contribution to prayer. In my opinion, Pabel attributes too much originality to the ideas of the Dutch priest-scholar when he insists that Erasmus owed little if anything to the *Devotio Moderna*. For a more tenable position see A. G. Dickens and Whitney R. D. Jones, *Erasmus: the reformer* (London 1994), where we read: '... the aim of [Thomas] à Kempis and his assistants was to "interiorize" the Christian life, even that of lay men and women. Exactly this process was to become the chief religious objective of Erasmus' (p. 10). Moreover, James D. Tracy of the University of Minnesota links Erasmus' thought to the influence of the *Devotio Moderna* in his *Erasmus of the Low Countries* (Berkeley 1996), 20–1. Tracy observes that 'even though the works of Erasmus and [Jacobus] de Vocht are very different in genre – the one addressed to "worldly" persons willing to think about a cloister, the other to zealous companions who had long since forsaken the ways of the world – they come from the same spiritual milieu, that of the ... *devotio moderna*, associated with the Brethren'. In conclusion, Erasmus directed his *Enchiridion* and other pastoral works to a lay audience in order to satisfy their particular palate. Erasmus was aware that there is more than one way to converse with God.

Our Lady of the Snows, Richard L. DeMolen
Reno

Wolfgang Musculus (1497–1563) und die oberdeutsche Reformation. Edited by Rudolf Dellsperger, Rudolf Freudenberger and Wolfgang Weber. (Institut für Europäische Kulturgeschichte der Universität Augsburg. Colloquia Augustana, 6.) Pp. 434 incl. frontispiece. Berlin: Akademie Verlag, 1997. DM 78. 3 05 003204 9; 0946 9044

Wolfgang Musculus was a second-generation reformer in Strasbourg (1527–31), Augsburg (1531–48) and Bern 1549–63, broadly in the Bucerian stream. His

considerable reputation among contemporaries as preacher, exegete and translator of the Fathers is attested by the bibliography compiled by Marc van Wijnkoop; his *Loci communes*, for example, ran to five editions and was translated into English; his works continued to appear in French and Dutch versions, as well as in Latin and German, well into the seventeenth century. This volume, based on a 1996 conference in Augsburg, is of sadly uneven quality. Those looking for a coherent analysis of his theology and churchmanship or for a reliable biography will be disappointed. Gottried Seebass, however, offers a characteristically suggestive comparison of patriarchal Nuremberg with the more pluralistic Augsburg. James Thomas Ford portrays Musculus as a doughty and effective advocate of Upper German liturgy and polity. Rolf Kiesling traces the intricate interplay of *Realpolitik* and religious benevolence in Augsburg's relations with its surrounding territories. His view that the popular preacher was 'instrumentalised' by the Council for its secular purposes is in intriguing counterpoint to Heribert Smolensky's judgement that the Catholic controversialist Cochlaeus 'instrumentalised' the political situation for this theological polemic against Musculus. The latter's concern for intra-Protestant unity, so painfully won in the Wittenberg Concord, explains for Horst Weigelt much of his animus against Schwenckfeld's spiritualism. Craig Farmer offers a thoughtful account of his varying attitudes to the ambiguous language of 'exhibition' for the eucharistic elements, which he abandoned on his arrival in Bern. Lüthi points to some of the mysteries about his Bernese period, where Musculus was such a prolific writer. Why did the courageous exile, spurning the Interim, attract Calvin's criticism as somewhat dormant: 'Et boni fratres nostri Bernenses quiescunt?' His solid, biblical, unpolemical, somewhat erastian *Loci*, designed as a textbook for theological students, epitomise the strengths and weaknesses of this useful, if not notably exciting Reformer.

Ormond College, Victoria, Australia — Peter Matheson

Philipp Melanchthon 1497–1997. Drei Reden, vorgetragen am Melanchthon-Dies der Theologischen Fakultät in der Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin. 23. April 1997. By Kurt-Victor Selge, Reimer Hansen and Christof Gestrich. (Öffentliche Vorlesungen, 87.) Pp. 71 incl. frontispiece. Berlin: Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin, Theologische Fakultät, 1997

The year 1997 saw several celebrations to mark the quincentenary of the birth of Philip Melanchthon, humanist, reformer and the 'Praeceptor' of Germany. In the coming years, we shall no doubt witness further fruits of such celebrations in print. This volume is one such result, directed to the general public. It records three public orations, given on 23 April 1997 at the 'Melanchthon-Dies' of the Theology Faculty of the Humbold University, Berlin. Kurt-Victor Selge summarises Melanchthon's achievement as an educational reformer: Melanchthon systematised Luther's doctrine of justification and pursued the possibility of appealing to reason, and thus philosophy, in combatting the forces of the devil. Thus Melanchthon made learning an important foundation for true

believers. Reimer Hansen spells out the 'irenic' side of Melanchthon, who believed that worldly order had to be obeyed, but who also sought dialogue with the Catholic, as well as the Greek Orthodox Churches. Christof Gestrich then highlights how Melanchthon suffered a negative reputation amongst theologians of the nineteenth and early twentieth century, largely due to what they considered to be proper theology or genuine Lutheranism. In Gestrich's view, Melanchthon's 'Christian humanism' is a particularly appealing position for late twentieth-century ecumenism. Taken together, the three orations represent an admirable and welcome effort to restore the reputation and significance of Melanchthon's achievements to the general public. There is a useful bibliography at the back which is strong in German and theological material related to Melanchthon.

TRINITY COLLEGE, CAMBRIDGE SACHIKO KUSUKAWA

England's long Reformation, 1500–1800. Edited by Nicholas Tyacke. (The Neale Colloquium in British History.) Pp. xii + 347 incl. frontispiece. London: UCL Press, 1998 [1997]. £40. 1 85728 756 8

This collection comprises papers from a colloquium held on the theme at UCL in January 1996. The key-note address (and opening chapter here) came from Eamon Duffy, who wrong-footed participants expecting a reprise of the arguments of his *Stripping of the altars* by enumerating the considerable pastoral achievements of Richard Baxter and his circle in the Interregnum. Indeed, a predominant theme of these essays is the increasingly familiar 'post-revisionist' insight that the Reformation was far from being inimical to popular culture, and that reformers (Protestant and Catholic) were quite capable of meeting the people half-way. In the sights of many of the contributors is the influential interpretation of Christopher Haigh (who performs much the same role here as A. G. Dickens did for Haigh's *English Reformation revised*.) In a stimulating discussion of Elizabethan prisons and scaffolds, Peter Lake and Michael Questier argue that these ostensible instruments of repression functioned in fact as contested ideological arenas, from which both Puritans and Jesuits launched popular evangelistic strategies. David Hickman interprets discernible continuities across the Reformation in testamentary provisions among London elites as evidence of the success of Protestantism in appropriating and colonising traditional practice. Christopher Marsh traces encounters between the Elizabethan authorities and Cambridgeshire familists, suggesting that the turning of blind eyes may have been a more normal (and effective) response to religious deviance than we have often supposed. The theme is echoed in a slightly less nuanced piece by Muriel McClendon on the 'toleration' evinced by magistrates in sixteenth-century Norwich. Ann Hughes makes a pitch for that over-looked phenomenon of the 1640s and 1650s, 'popular Presbyterianism', arguing that Thomas Edwards's *Gangraena* displays many characteristics of the contemporary popular press. Pieces by Joy Rowe (on Suffolk Catholicism) and W. R. Ward (on eighteenth-century Methodism) engage less explicitly with an editorial agenda, but have interesting things to say to their respective audiences. More problematic

are those questions of periodisation which supply the volume's main *raison d'être*. As Patrick Collinson recognises in a comment on Duffy, the Reformation seems to have got longer in one direction only: the revisionist assessment of the late medieval Church is accepted as a new orthodoxy and little interest is shown in origins. The objection is to some extent answered in Nicholas Tyacke's introduction, a spirited assertion (against the revisionists) of the importance of ideas and theology in the early Reformation. At the other end, we are offered various terminal dates. Does the Reformation draw to an end with the Restoration (Duffy), the Glorious Revolution (Collinson) or with the Enlightenment (Tyacke, and Jonathon Barry in a lively piece on 'Bristol as a Reformation city' 1640–1780.) The cynic might be tempted to ask questions about the length of a piece of string, despite (or because of) Jeremy Gregory's engaging Indian rope trick, which portrays a historical process called the Long Reformation still underway in the mid Victorian period. Inevitably, the effect of this collection is to pose rather than answer such conceptual questions, but all students of the Reformation will find much in it to engage and challenge them.

University of Warwick Peter Marshall

Organum deitatis. Die Christologie des Thomas de Vio Cajetan. By Marcel Nieden. (Studies in Medieval and Reformation Thought, 62.) Pp. xiii + 247. Leiden–New York: Brill, 1997. Nlg 160. 90 04 10801 7; 0585-6914

In 1522 Cardinal Cajetan completed his commentary on book III of the *Summa theologiae* of Aquinas, treating Christology and basic sacramental doctrine. Thereafter, until he died in 1534, he wrote Scripture commentaries rigorously concentrated on the literal sense. The present study, an Erlangen dissertation under Professor B. Hamm, competently sets forth Cajetan's metaphysically-based account of the Incarnation and the constitution of the Word made flesh in Jesus Christ, as found in the *Summa* commentary and biblical works. Cajetan was reasserting Thomist doctrine against Duns Scotus and Durandus of Saint-Pourçain (d. 1334), but in so doing he radicalised the view that the assumed human nature, taken from our sinful stock, receives its act of existence from the Logos. The human nature has its full range of operations, but it carries these out as the free and living organ and instrument of the divine Word, which is working thus 'for us and for our salvation'. The author finds that Cajetan does not do full justice to Chalcedon's 'consubstantial with us in humanity', since the assumed humanity lacks its own *esse*. But Nieden also sees how as a consequence of the supreme *gratia unionis* of assumption God then radiates into Christ a *gratia habitualis* inclusive of the beatific vision, and a *gratia capitalis* making Christ in his humanity the mediator of all saving graces to humankind – graces which are ultimately unitive. Thus full justice *is* done to human salvation being *solo Christo*. Seen from 'below' the entry of the assumed human nature into union with the Logos displays the anthropological truth that our perfection as humans does not culminate in an I–Thou dialogue with God, but in what follows, namely, entering a true communion of life with Christ, in the Spirit, to the glory of the Father. Cajetan's Christology thus grounds a soteriology of conformity to the image of the Son extending far beyond moral imitation. His thought is anti-

Nestorian, fully 'katabatic' in a manner alien to Anselm, and so analogous (different in content but structurally similar) with Luther's view of God alone working out human salvation in Christ.

GREGORIAN UNIVERSITY, ROME
JARED WICKS

The religion of the poor. Rural missions in Europe and the formation of modern Catholicism, c. 1500–1800. By Louis Châtellier. (Trans. by Brian Pearce of *La religion des pauvres. Les missions rurales en Europe et la formation du catholicisme moderne xvi-ème–xix-ème siècles*, Paris: Aubier, 1993.) Pp. xiii + 246 incl. 14 maps and 3 figs. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press/Paris: Éditions de la Maison des Sciences de l'Homme, 1997. £35. 0 521 56201 5

Châtellier's potent book fills a glaring gap in our understanding of Christian mission: apostolic campaigns to revive (or even convert) the Catholic countryside between Vincent Ferrer and Alphonso Liguori. Trent's focus on the parish clergy as the instrument of renewal is well known. So too is the very long delay in creating diocesan seminaries and synods. At last we have here a careful study of the missions which sought to fill that gap. Within the opulent theatre of processions and magnificent celebrations of mass, teams of missioners did more than preach, teach catechism and hear confessions. They focused parishes on the holy within their community, juxtaposing Baroque devotions like the Sacred Heart with medieval cortèges of flagellants, rooting a physical presence of the divine in existing sanctuaries and at newly-planted calvaries. Sacred landscapes were being created.

How did the poor react? In making plain their various and contradictory responses, Châtellier is forced to consider whether for 'all their talent and all their zeal, (the missioners) had not yet perhaps found the real language of the poor' (p. 59)? In a particularly fascinating section investigating French mission after the Revocation of the Edict of Nantes, he brings us face to face with the alien nature of much missionary work. Thereafter, he proceeds to illuminate Enlightenment uncertainties about the very purpose of mission and doubts about their long-term effectiveness (as well as Jansenist attacks on their superficial theology). That all-important impact Châtellier locates in their approach: correcting, adapting and sanctifying (rather than suppressing) ancestral traditions, festivals and beliefs. Indeed, because they offered a spirituality in fresh shape, they may well have become 'the favourite form chosen by the people in which to experience their religion' (p. 88).

The book's gaze is set firmly on devotion, and we hear much of revivals of sacramental piety and Marian devotion. Yet as the missioners laboured to teach people to live as Christians, they aimed equally to transform social and moral behaviour. Châtellier tells us next to nothing of this. Given his theme, it is surprising that there is no discussion of the cult of the Holy Family, the rehabilitation of St Joseph and the attempt through them both to reshape domestic morality. Châtellier's other limitation is geographical. Contrary to the claim (p. xii) that the book embraces 'a wide area of Western, Southern and Central Europe', the text in reality concentrates on Bavaria and Brittany – with

some reference to Hungary, Transylvania and Poland. While a stress on *Bavaria sancta* is quite right, a book which investigates 'the formation of modern Catholicism' with the barest reference to Italy and Iberia is extraordinary. Less crucial, but certainly a pity, is the trifling space given to Eudists and Oratorians; Capuchins do not fare much better for this is a study devoted overwhelmingly to Jesuits. Such cavils must not detract from Châtellier's impressive achievement. If not the last word on the subject, this book will perform long service as a mine for students and researchers alike.

BRIGHTON COLLEGE MARTIN D. W. JONES

Christopher Plantin's books of hours. Illustration and production. By Karen Lee Bowen. (Bibliotheca Bibliographica Neerlandica, 32.) Pp. xxxi + 301 + 156 figs. Nieuwkoop: De Graaf, 1997. Nlg. 250. 90 6004 427 4

Karen Lee Bowen's *Christopher Plantin's books of hours: illustration and production* is presumably based on her dissertation (Brown University, Providence, RI, 1995), although she has also written extensively on the illustrative material found in books published by the Moretuses, the successors of the Antwerp printer-publisher, Christopher Plantin (*c.* 1520–89). Here, she has produced what amounts to a meticulously researched bibliography of books of hours published by Plantin himself in the latter half of the sixteenth century. Tables give details of early books of hours published in France, a chronological list of Plantin's books with a guide to their illustrations, and 156 plates showing the development of Plantin's books of hours from 1557 until 1580. These appendices are preceded by a lengthy introductory survey which charts the development of printed books of hours published first in Paris and then in the Low Countries. Bowen's central argument is that Plantin's publications maintained the medieval manuscript tradition whilst acknowledging the 1571 decree of the Council of Trent. Trent demanded the revision of the liturgical books but made no mention of books of hours, whose contents were also nevertheless reformed. Thus, the *Officium Beatae Mariae Virginis* was developed from the medieval *Horae B.M.V.* Plantin published both: twenty-six editions of *Horae* between 1558 and 1570, and thirty-seven editions of *Officia* between 1572 and 1589. In 1572, despite firm papal control over liturgical publication, Plantin was granted permission by the pope to print the new *Officium*. Bowen carefully compares the various editions of this *Officium*, attempting to demonstrate Plantin's sensitivity to the variety of its readers: cheaper editions re-used old woodcuts, whilst engravings and etchings were introduced into the more *de luxe* books sold, for instance, to the Spanish Court. The author suggests the introduction of lavish illustration in the 1570 edition of *Horae* might have represented a (successful) bid by Plantin to find favour with the pope and to capture the Spanish monopoly, although she admits that engravings were already beginning to supersede woodcuts by the second half of the sixteenth century. The introduction of such costly engraved illustrations shows Plantin to be an innovator, according to Bowen, but the two-tier production of expensive and less costly books was also adopted by other publishers of the time. Her bibliographical approach allows the author to uncover something of the workings of the Plantin printing house, the *Officina Plantiniana*, and for general readers, this

will be of great interest. The remarkably well-preserved archive in the Plantin-Moretus Museum in Antwerp, which includes runs of accounts as well as collections of engraved plates, has allowed the author to know the markets, the associated costs and to trace the re-use of decorative elements. The evidence also reveals Plantin, often depicted as the most famous Flemish publisher of Catholic liturgical and devotional works, to be more nuanced in his religious attitudes. He trimmed his publishing to suit prevailing winds, supporting the heretical 'Family of Love' in the late 1560s and during the late 1570s he became the official publisher to the rebel city council in Antwerp, before briefly sojourning in Calvinist Leiden between 1583 and 1585. Plantin was welcomed back to Antwerp after its surrender to the Spanish in 1585, without any questions being asked. It was the Spanish Court which was to be his principal patron, and it was the monopoly for printing the new missal and breviary in all the lands under Spanish rule granted to Plantin by Philip II in 1571, practically coinciding with his publication of the new *Officium*, which established the reputation of his printing house for the next two centuries. The large number of Plantin books in today's English Catholic libraries is evidence of their popularity among English Catholic refugees domiciled in the Low Countries, especially during the penal years. Plantin's publications for the English market during the time covered by Bowen's work were, however, mostly apologetical works in Latin, the earliest being 1564. The first English *Office* did not appear until 1599, published not by Plantin, but by a later Antwerpian, Arnold Conings. It was not until 1658 that the Plantin press published its only English book, an *Office B.M.V.* However, English Catholics knew of Plantin's books through John Fowler, the English exile and Leuven publisher and bookseller. In deepening our understanding of Plantin and his work, the author acknowledges her debt to Leon Voet, whose work she has been able to supplement with her own research, and her debt to Marie Mauquoy-Hendrickx's recent survey of the Wierix brothers on whom Plantin relied for some of his finest religious engravings. Her book is a further example of that interest in the history of engraving which we have come to associate particularly with the Netherlands and Belgium.

Douai Abbey Dom Geoffrey Scott

A social history of the domestic chaplain, 1530–1840. By William Gibson. Pp. vi + 250. London: Leicester University Press, 1997. £49.95. 0 7185 0093 8

A spiritual adviser revered by the household in which he served, a clerical retainer occupying a position not unlike that of a Victorian governess, neither a domestic servant nor a member of the family, a beneficed cleric who sought a chaplaincy solely to qualify to hold more than one living at a time, an episcopal protegé on an upward path of promotion, a chaplain might be performing a multiplicity of functions or none at all in the early modern period. In this study William Gibson investigates the duties and opportunities of these different and sometimes overlapping types of chaplains in some depth. The act of parliament of 1530, designed to curb pluralism, permitted members of the peerage to appoint a number of chaplains commensurate with their rank, archbishops being allowed eight, bishops six, dukes six, marquises and earls five, viscounts four, barons three

and widows of peers only two. Whereas throughout the sixteenth, seventeenth and eighteenth centuries bishops understandably continued to require an array of chaplains to aid them in the performance of their episcopal duties, the author suggests that secular noblemen regularly employed chaplains to conduct worship in their household chapels only in the earlier part of the period and that by the age of enlightenment they regarded the appointment of chaplains as little more than a part of the patronage system. Fewer and fewer noblemen were in fact exercising their privilege to dispense their chaplains for pluralism before the right was taken away by the act of 1838. At its most interesting when drawing upon eighteenth-century letters and diaries, this monograph contains much detailed information which could well act as a spur for further work on the changing roles of chaplains in the history of the Church of England.

UNIVERSITY OF YORK CLAIRE CROSS

Proceedings in the parliaments of Elizabeth I, II: *1584–1589*; III: *1593–1601*. Edited by T. E. Hartley. Pp. xi+508; xxxi+507. London–New York: Leicester University Press, 1995. £85 each. 0 7185 1890 X; 0 7185 2246 X

The first volume of *Proceedings in the parliaments of Elizabeth I*, covering the years 1558 to 1581, appeared in 1981. With the publication of these two further volumes, covering the sessions between 1581 and the end of the reign, Dr Hartley brings a major editorial venture to an impressive conclusion. Sir John Neale originally intended to assemble in print the raw materials used in his three books devoted to Elizabethan parliaments, but never found time to do so. Now that body of evidence has been handsomely and straightforwardly produced with scholarly footnoting, but, in an act of deliberate self-effacement, a minimum of intrusive editorial comment.

The quantity of material available for the study of Elizabethan parliaments rises sharply after 1571, and grows steadily more voluminous as the reign progresses. The journals increasingly kept by those summoned to Westminster illustrate the often very different perspectives brought by contemporaries to parliamentary business. Hartley does not delve into complex questions of individual authorship, but notes that members' reasons for compiling their accounts seem both mysterious and multifarious. The private journals should not necessarily be assumed to be quasi-official documents written for powerful privy councillors such as Burghley or Mildmay. They may reasonably be taken as evidence of personal interests and attitudes.

The information amassed here focuses largely on individual speeches and accounts of debates, thereby tending to marginalise the legislative functions of parliament, powerfully emphasised in recent years by Sir Geoffrey Elton and Professor David Dean. However, there is plenty to indicate that aspect of business, with notable lists of bills kept by the diarist Thomas Cromwell, among others. There is also much that Neale himself did not use, and the volumes thereby throw light on the notorious selectivity of his narrative. One problem seems virtually unsurmountable; Neale was rightly criticised for ignoring the essentially bicameral nature of the English parliament and equating the institution with the House of Commons, but the survival of evidence has not

favoured the upper house. We still lack substantial accounts of debates among peers, and as a result the influence of the Lords remains like the dimly-discerned mass of the iceberg below water.

For ecclesiastical historians, the value of this edition lies in the material for the crucial debates on religion. The first volume highlighted the extraordinary anti-popery of the sessions of 1563 and 1566, never adequately explained and, as Patrick Collinson has pointed out, steadily harder to account for as recent research increasingly emphasises the religious conservatism of most of the population in the first decade of the reign. The second volume covers the great debates of 1584–5, dominated by the campaign for the queen's safety (following on from the organised lynch-law of the Bond of Association) and the bill to rid the country of priests and Jesuits. This led to the famous outburst of the intelligencer Dr William Parry, himself shortly to be executed for treason, that the legislation was deeply repressive: 'Nothinge therein but bloode, nothing but confiscation of owr goodes, not to the Qweene but to others; nothing but dispeyer and terror to us all.' Parry caused uproar, but it is clear from the volumes of the History of Parliament Trust which run alongside these debates (*The Commons 1558–1603*, ed. P. W. Hasler, London 1981), that there were many members with Catholic wives and families who must silently have echoed his *cri de cœur*. In the same session the Commons' petition on the ministry provoked Whitgift's hostile and bitterly resented answer (here given in his own version), and finally the queen's inhibition of further proceedings on religion. In her closing speech in March 1585 Elizabeth noted wearily, 'I see many ovarbold with God almighty.' The session of 1586–7 was even more turbulent, with a small group of radicals presenting the Presbyterian 'bill and book', which led to five of their leaders being committed to the Tower and a sustained rebuttal by the Privy Council. Elizabeth found it more difficult to deal with the escalating pressure on her to execute Mary Queen of Scots. The superb oratory of Job Throckmorton, tracing the international Catholic conspiracy that he discerned behind Spain's policy in the Netherlands, in which the Scottish queen was a central figure, stands here as a classic statement of the Puritan view that in both foreign and domestic policy there was no choice. Mary must be executed and the 'honourable and Christian defence' of the Low Countries undertaken, come what may: 'Well, but yf wee goe with this action wee shall sure pull Spayne on our headdes, yow will say. And so hadde wee better doe I take yt (yf there bee no remedye) then to pull the wrath of God on our heades.'

The third and final volume, covering 1593 to 1601, contains less striking material, but it includes James Morice's explosive attack of 1593 on Whitgift's harrying of the non-conforming clergy as contrary to Magna Carta; Bishop Westphaling's support in December 1597 for the act of subsidy, a rare example of an episcopal speech in the Lords; and three versions of the Golden Speech from the throne of 30 November 1601, which reveal the queen's profoundly providential belief that she had been guided throughout by God: 'We thinke our selves most fortunately borne under such a starre, as we have bene enabled by Gode's power to have saved you under our raygne, from forreyne foes, from tirantes' rule, and from your owne ruine.' The parliament of England, depicted here as never before in the words of those who participated in it, was not only crucial to the formation of the 1559 settlement of the Church of England. It

continued to spend much time, effort and emotion on matters of religion. These invaluable volumes should alert historians to the many unsolved issues which demand further research and fresh thinking before we can reassemble the jigsaw of confessional attitudes to politics and allegiance in Elizabethan England.

ROYAL HOLLOWAY, PAULINE CROFT
UNIVERSITY OF LONDON

Unity in multiformity. The minutes of the Coetus of London, 1575 and the consistory minutes of the Italian Church of London, 1570–1591. Edited by O. Boersma and A. J. Jelsma. (Publications of the Huguenot Society of Great Britain and Ireland, Quarto Ser., 59.) Pp. x + 278. London: Huguenot Society of Great Britain and Ireland, 1997. £12. 0 906100 25 9

This publication makes available several interesting sources for the historian of the London exile communities. The Coetus was the monthly meeting of the ministers and elders of the French, Dutch and Italian communities in London; its purpose was to hear appeals from individual churches as well as to discuss matters of mutual concern. The minutes comprise ninety-seven entries between 1575 to 1598 but often months could go by without an entry. Ten appeals were heard but, coming at the end of the disciplinary process, these can provide only a partial record of the cases; however they are placed in context through footnotes. More interesting are the minutes of the Italian Church. The church attracted a diverse membership: Dutchmen alienated by their own church's attitude towards violence (several of them played an important role in the Dutch Revolt), Marranos, Englishmen keen to practise their Italian; 'real Italians' made up only a quarter of the congregation in 1568. This membership is analysed in a useful prosopography. Although established in 1565 the Italian Church was reformed by Joannes Baptista Aurellius who inserted Nicholas des Gallars's *Discipline* for the London–French Church (the Latin text is also published here) into the Italian Church's minute book. The minutes reveal the difficulty that the church had in exercising discipline in a small congregation whose disaffected members could approach the other exile churches or even their parish churches. This is an important addition to the published records of the exile churches.

STONYHURST COLLEGE, ANDREW SPICER
LANCS

Nuntiaturberichte aus Deutschland. Nebst ergänzenden Aktenstücken. Dritte Abteilung. 1572–1585, VIII: *Nuntiatur Giovanni Dolfins (1575–1576)*. Edited by Daniela Neri. Pp. li + 795 incl. frontispiece. Tübingen: Niemeyer (for the Deutsches Historisches Institut in Rom), 1997. DM 238. 3 484 80149 2

Impressively edited by Daniela Neri, this latest addition to the multi-volume collection of reports by papal nuncios from sixteenth-century Germany presents the entire extant correspondence between the Curia and the nuncio to the imperial court, Bishop Giovanni Dolfino (1529–84), over the period from 1 January 1575 to 29 December 1576. This is the fourth volume of Dolfino's correspondence to be published and leaves only that of the last two years of his

1571–8 Viennese nunciature still to be edited. Transcribed from originals in the Vatican archives, the present volume reproduces 237 dispatches from Dolfino to the secretary of state, Cardinal Ptolomeo Gallio, and the latter's 124 replies and instructions. All the documents are in Italian. In the post-Tridentine period, the Viennese nunciature was, as Neri points out in her introduction, the 'nodal point' of papal diplomacy, a status reflected in the range of subjects treated by Dolfino, from the reform of local ecclesiastical institutions to broader Church–State relations, Habsburg dynastic strategies and political and constitutional matters within the Hereditary Lands and the empire as a whole. During 1575 and 1576, the nuncio's reports were dominated by the restiveness of the Bohemian Estates, Habsburg attempts to secure the Polish crown against competition from Stefan Báthory of Transylvania, disputes between pope and emperor over the elevation of the Medici to the grand dukedom of Tuscany and the twin elections of Rudolph of Habsburg as king of the Romans and emperor, in addition to growing confessional tensions within the empire and the ever-present Ottoman threat without. Dolfino's dispatches underline Gregory XIII's suspicion of Maximilian II's religious convictions (the nuncio reported that the dying emperor had refused the sacraments), the papacy's consequent cultivation of German princes, especially the Bavarian Wittelsbachs, and its hopes for a more vigorous defence of Catholic interests under Rudolf, said to evince 'singular piety and religion'. The range of subject matter at times compelled Dolfino to be cursory in his descriptions, yet his reports are an extremely useful source, revealing not only of the diplomatic priorities of the Holy See and the imperial court, but also of Habsburg aulic culture (with lengthy descriptions of imperial coronations and exequies, as well as *Reichstag* ceremonial), of the fluidity of contemporary confessional identities and of the material and moral condition of the *Reichskirche*.

University of the West of England — Trevor Johnson

Die Hauptinstruktionen Gregors XV für die Nuntien und Gesandten an den europäischen Fürstenhöfen, 1621–1623. Im Auftrag des Deutschen Historischen Instituts in Rom. 2 vols. Edited by Klaus Jaitner. (Instructiones Pontificum Romanorum.) Pp. vii + 516 incl. 8 genealogical tables + 3 plates; xi + 517–1302. Tübingen: Niemeyer, 1997. DM 374. 3 484 80147 7; 3 484 80148 4; 3 484 80146 8

As part of a significant project promoted by the German Historical Institute at Rome, K. Jaitner presents these two rich volumes that are a useful instrument for scholars dealing with the political and social history of the papacy in the baroque age. The author has previously published the instructions for nuncios under Clement VIII and we can now examine a wealth of information on the social context of the Roman court and even go beyond what Jaitner intends to offer. These sources outline careers of the 'pope's' men, the building of their family wealth, the marriage strategies promoting social growth, especially for aristocratic families coming from other cities, for instance from Bologna. The first volume delineates the European political context characterised by the Bohemian war, and in Italy, by the problem of Valtellina, that set Rome against France and

Spain. During these crucial years papal policy was always directed at ensuring the balance of power in Italy. The metaphor of balance endorsed by the 'universal father' returns frequently not only in baroque political treatises but also in the instructions for papal diplomats. From his election Gregory XV – of the Ludovisi family, one of the most prominent of the Bolognese patriciate – showed a serious desire to involve the papacy in the most crucial political problems in Europe. This commitment meant for Rome a demanding financial effort, justified by the coherent project of reCatholicisation of Europe and by the fight against heresy. The author examines with particular attention the early career of Alessandro Ludovisi, a 'creature' of the Aldobrandini and a constant enemy of the Borghese. He also stresses the role of the pope's nephew, Cardinal Ludovico Ludovisi, the real director of papal policy and master of the family's fortune. A letter by Gregory XV to his nephew, actually written by the secretary of state, G. B. Agucchi, is treated as the political testament of the pope in which he stressed the spiritual and temporal aims of his nephew: good government in the papal state and the restoration of Catholicism in Europe. Jaitner focuses his attention on Agucchi, not only as the author of this letter and of the instructions for nuncios, but especially as a leading figure of Roman culture. His relationship with Galileo and with Roman academies like the Accademia dei Virtuosi, and his artistic patronage, suggest that the cultural atmosphere of Counter-Reformation Rome was less bleak than generally assumed. The last chapter is entirely devoted to the court and to illustrating the structure of the Curia and includes a long list of the offices and a useful list of their holders in the years of the Ludovisi pontificate. The author defines the court according to Norbert Elias's theory and he stresses 'Verflechtung' as a powerful category to explain relationships in the courtier world. But no attention is dedicated to the new researches and interpretations of such prominent Italian historians as G. Fragnito, C. Mozzarelli or M. A. Visceglia. This failing is also evident in the rich bibliography contained in the second volume, wholly dedicated to the publication of the instructions.

Università 'La Sapienza', Irene Fosi
Rome

The 'divine' Guido. Religion, sex, money and art in the world of Guido Reni. By Richard E. Spear. Pp. vi+430 incl. 173 black-and-white and colour plates. New Haven–London: Yale University Press, 1997. £40. 0 300 07035 7

Justification through devotional works alone is enough to guarantee the 'divine' Guido his place in heaven as well as among the artistic gods in the pantheon of art history. Admired and praised in his own lifetime for his sublime and graceful figures, the ecstatic forms of suffering saints and martyrs and the silvery light that pervades his last works, few important works appear in major British public collections. His reputation, however, has continued to shine in the eyes of a few private collectors, for example Sir Denis Mahon, and it is in no small way due to the scholarship of Mahon and the author of this book, Richard Spear, that the reputation of the Bolognese artists is deservedly being re-evaluated and restored. Guido Reni is, arguably, perhaps the greatest of these seventeenth-century painters.

In his approach to Guido, underlined by the eye-catching subtitle, Spear argues, quite rightly, that there has been no consistent and thematic treatment of this great artist by modern art historians. Unsatisfactory monographs and selective exhibitions have prevented us from appreciating the larger picture of Guido Reni and Spear attempts, both cautiously and quite brilliantly in my view, to establish the relationship of the painter's sublime art to his biography. For example, when we read of his gambling mania, his pathological fear of women (other than his mother) and his obsession with single images of suffering and suicidal women – the Cleopatras and Lucretias – Spear treads carefully on the thorny path of psycho-biography, but is aided by Reni's contemporary biographer, Malvasia. Both these critics noted not just the painter's horror of women, but also the bond between visual and spiritual grace in Reni's religious works, where notably 20 per cent of his output were Marian images (his other important Mother) and the influential role that the Capuchins played in the painter's life and death. Guido Reni as creative artist, workshop manager, entrepreneur, manipulator, compulsive gambler, collector and 'inventor' of some of the most ineffable images of religious grace is here displayed to critical and informed gaze.

Fortunately, Spear's book is also much more than a catalogue. Rather, it functions as a series of essays on seicento painting and its practice by the painter of the most profound spiritual visions. The impact of mundane matters such as economics, the artist's debts, multiple versions of the same subject which may or may not have been touched by the artist's own hand provide fascinating reading. Similarly, in chapters analysing Reni's influential images of Christ, the Virgin, Sebastian and Mary Magdalene, Spear not only sets them in the context of contemporary religious thought and prayer but also responds to their affective power, apparent in later and contemporary versions by other artists.

In a fitting epitaph, when deleting encomia that honoured the artist and not his work, Reni himself said of his work, 'Praises are given to God, not to men, but that they might however, be applied to his paintings inasmuch as they depicted through his saints his sanctity.'

STOWE SCHOOL, CRISPIN ROBINSON
BUCKINGHAM

The Churches in England from Elizabeth I to Elizabeth II, II: *1689–1833*. By Kenneth Hylson-Smith. Pp. xvii + 398. London: SCM Press, 1997. £40 (cloth), £19.95 (paper). 0 334 02667 9; 0 334 02668 7

This second volume of an ambitious programme is organised around six themes; the growth of, and response to, religious pluralism, the impact of increasing industrialisation, the effect of the evangelical revival, the role of religion in the emergence of a British identity, the beginnings of overseas missions, and the challenge to orthodox Christianity from rationalism and other movements, most notably in the text, Unitarianism. Inevitably with such a wide-ranging remit some issues are dealt with more fully than others, and the author sticks to the parameters of his title by concentrating on the impact of these influences on the institutional framework of the varying Churches and denominations; thus the

political and the biographical are given more space than the social. This has its advantages in sustaining a clear narrative, and thumb-nail sketches of individuals like John Hutchinson and Samuel Johnson are an effective way of introducing the general reader to the sort of tensions facing the mid eighteenth-century Church, but there are also disadvantages in this scheme, most notably when dealing with the central topic of pastoral provision, about which there has been so much debate. Here the discussion concentrates on the contributions of reforming bishops and other notables but makes no real attempt to produce a synthesis of what may or may not have been taking place in the parishes by reference to the extensive primary materials from visitation which are now available in print. In fact there is little sense of familiarity with primary sources which, except for printed contributions to intellectual debate, are rarely cited, though the author is widely read in the secondary literature, from which he often quotes at length, sometimes in such a way as to leave the reader uncertain as to where the author's own position lies. As part of a larger project the narrative is sustained, but as an introduction to the Churches during the long eighteenth century this volume does not supersede the work of Rupp and others.

UNIVERSITY OF YORK W. J. SHEILS

The Anglican crisis. A brief survey of the origin and development of independent Anglican churches. By G. H. Thomann. Pp. 108 incl. 11 ills. London: Günther Thomann, 1997. £15 from Günther Thomann, Kesslerstr. 18, 90489 Nürnberg, Germany

For a mere £15, readers of this JOURNAL can acquire this slender volume of 108 pages, produced on a typewriter which apparently lacks the keys for the numbers one or zero. The author, who declares that he has a doctorate from 'the Central School of Religion' (and dedicates the pamphlet to them in thanks for the conferring of the degree) offers an overview of the various splits, schisms, spats and separations which have been Anglicanism's lot since the nineteenth century. Thomann, who is no friend to 'priestesses' or even 'bishopesses' (*sic*) does have the grace to admit that the Anglican Communion's troubles predate the woman problem:

> But what is the background to the current crisis? Is it just the ordination of women as an isolated factor? Hardly. Within the last two decades Anglicanism went through a dramatic change of all its accepted theological opinions, liturgical practices and attitudes (p. 18).

And what is true Anglicanism? Apparently it developed in the seventeenth century as a commitment to three theological principles: 'Scripture, antiquity and reason' (p. 19). The transformation by Thomann of the dynamic concept of 'tradition' into the static concept of 'antiquity' in this honoured Anglican formula, is telling.

After some analysis, the rest of the book (pp. 38–108) is largely a gazetteer of these many various breakaway groups and potted biographies of some of their leaders, which may provide future researchers with some data. This reviewer was struck to learn that her own childhood bishop, Chambers of Springfield, Illinois, illegally consecrated a number of individuals to the episcopate assisted by a

bishop of the Philippine Independent Church as part of an attempt to set up an alternative succession in 1978 (p. 68). His attempts to bring various dissident groups together were spurned by those very groups who enjoy fighting each other as much as the Mother Church. In the end, after Chambers' death in a Florida nursing home in 1993, it was the old, compromised, women-ordaining, 'trendy' Episcopal Church which celebrated his requiem mass. Perhaps there never will be complete concord about what is really good about Anglicanism, but I think that is not a bad example.

CORPUS CHRISTI COLLEGE, JUDITH MALTBY
OXFORD

The enthusiastical concerns of Dr Henry More. Religious meaning and the psychology of delusion. By Daniel C. Fouke. (Brill's Studies in Intellectual History, 71.) Pp. xi + 260. Leiden–New York–Cologne: Brill, 1997. Nlg. 130. 90 04 10600 6; 0920 8607

Pagan religion. A translation of De religione gentilium. By Edward Herbert, edited and translated by John Anthony Butler. (Medieval & Renaissance Texts & Studies, 152.) Pp. 379. Ottawa: Dovehouse Editions/Binghamton, NY: Medieval & Renaissance Texts & Studies, 1996. $30. 0 86698 193 4

These two works illustrate some of the riches and diversity of seventeenth-century thought about religion. Fouke's interesting investigation focuses on the relationship between Henry More's interpretation of his own religious experiences and his critical responses to the 'enthusiastical' claims of some of his contemporaries. The complexity of More's attitude to and attacks on enthusiasm make it difficult to characterise his position. On the one hand he begins *Enthusiasmus triumphatus* by asserting that in spite of superficial appearances 'Atheism and Enthusiasm … in many things … do very nearly agree' because their rejection of the insights of 'the calm and cautious insinuations of free *Reason*' (according to what More and the other Cambridge Platonists consider is meant by right reason) leads them to conspire 'against the true knowledge of God and Religion' (experience indicates that references to this work need to make it clear to students that 'triumphatus' does not mean 'triumphant' but its opposite!). On the other hand, he reports that disillusionment with education (four years of study of philosophy 'ended in nothing … but mere Scepticism') led him, after taking his degree, to adopt an experiential approach to religious understanding that was importantly influenced by the works of Ficinus, Plotinus and Hermes Trismegistus, and by the *Theologia Germanica*. More consequently both came to hold that authentic spiritual perception was reached through purging oneself of self-will and purifying the mind, and corroborated in his own experience 'that Faith that is plainly propounded to us by Scripture'. This, when combined with More's awareness of his emotional temperament and of a 'Natural touche of Enthusiasme in his Complexion', led him to claim without too much unwarranted exaggeration that 'no Person better understood the extent of Phansy, and the Nature of Enthusiasme' then he did.

Fouke considers the resulting ambivalence in this aspect of More's thought, providing illuminating studies of his philosophical poems, his vituperative dispute with Thomas Vaughan, his views on alchemy and the nature of philosophical

enthusiasm, his response to the Quakers and other religious radicals, and his assessment of Descartes and notions of the nature of reality. In doing so, he makes it clear that while More's apprehension of his experiences was central to his understanding of religious matters, he was strongly elitist in his attitude towards such references. His attacks on enthusiasm, furthermore, seem to have been partly, maybe largely, inspired by fear of the political and social disruption that could follow from unbridled enthusiasm. One result was that while More's works are rich in metaphor, he sought to keep firm control over how such language is to be interpreted. As, however, with many such studies, past arguments have relevance to today's situation. For instance, More's comment that there is more hope for atheists who will argue the point than for enthusiasts who, 'under pretence of Inspiration', disclaim 'the use of Reason, and imperiously' dictate 'their own willful Imaginations to the World for certain and undisputable Revelations' while 'haughtily and superciliously' denying 'a Truth … without rendering a Reason' (*Grand mystery of godliness*, bk VI, ch. iii, § 3) might be a proper subject for reflection by those today who are addicted to charismatic approaches or to self-defined radical orthodoxy.

With the support of the earl of Powis, Butler spells Edward Herbert's barony as that of 'Chirbury' (p. 11 n. 1). Whether or not this will catch on is a moot point but it will cause problems for cataloguers, indexers and copy-editors as Herbert is generally known as Lord Herbert of Cherbury. Be that as it may, a new translation of Herbert's *De religione gentilium*, together with an introductory essay and extensive, informative notes, is in principle to be greatly welcomed. The previous translation by William Lewis appeared in 1705 and has not been reprinted, the original Latin version having been published by Gerardus Vossius in 1663. In this work Herbert seeks to show that the evidence of other religions can be interpreted as being consistent with his claim in *De veritate* that all rationally competent people recognise as true the five common notions of religion. Apparent contradictory evidence is dismissed as being due either to misunderstanding of the terms involved (especially when they are used metaphorically or symbolically) or to the perversions of priestcraft. The result is one of the earliest works in the modern study of comparative religion and a work that reveals the extent both of Herbert's reading and of his sympathies as he attempts to make sense of his understanding of the proper universality of divine providence.

In practice, however, this translation and the notes to the text must be used with some caution. The following points illustrate the reasons for this reservation. Butler states, for example, that *De veritate* was 'the product of a young man' (p. 11) but Herbert was over forty-years-old in 1624; Herbert's conception of God is arguably not 'impersonal' nor is it to be distinguished from 'Providence' (p. 21) since he presents God as personally aware and providentially responsive to those who seek divine assistance; Herbert's remains do not lie 'buried in the parish church at Montgomery' (p. 26) for he was buried on the day he died in St-Giles-in-the-Fields in London; when Herbert's text provides a reference to his source, Butler's translation often omits details given in it (for example p. 59 has 'as Vossius observes' when the original has 'Vossius ex Sanhedrin: c. 7. § 10.' – which may not be all that a modern editor would demand but is more helpful than just 'Vossius'); the report that 'the term' magi 'is not reserved only for the

Three Wise Men of Bethlehem' (p. 100 n. 10) seems frivolous in a scholarly work (and similarly cf. p. 195 n. 30 on 'Aborigines'); 'anima' in '*De anima mundi*' (p. 150) should be 'harmonia'; on p. 151 nearly four lines of the Latin text seem not to be translated; 'so that it might drive away men or hang them by the neck' (p. 160) should be something like 'that, when hung round their neck, it might drive away witchcraft from children' ('ut fascinum pueris depelleret, ubi collo eorum appenderetur'); 'Lewis gives no translation of this passage at all' (p. 161 n. 51) is wrong since Lewis's translation does include a translation of this passage on pp. 121–3 *and* includes four lines at the start and two lines of poetry and two of prose from the end that are given by Herbert and omitted by Butler; 'Cicero does not mention Thales by name' (p. 165 n. 56) is incorrect since he does mention him (cf. bk I, p. 80 of the translation of *The nature of the gods* published by Penguin); 'I can find no mention of this in Herodotus' (p. 175 n. 85) may accurately report what Butler found but it should be noted that in Herodotus, VII, ch. cxcii, it is reported that the Greeks 'returned thanks to Neptune the Saviour and poured libations in his honour'; 'quasi dii agentes' (p. 193 n. 18) should be transcribed as 'quasi in Diis agentes' which then makes sense of why Lewis translates the phrase as 'as if they prevail'd upon the *Gods*' (or, perhaps, as if they influenced the gods); 'the Elephantine Books' (p. 215 and n. 10) – 'in libris Elephantinis vocatis' – need not allude to the island in the Nile for the adjective can be used to describe books bound in ivory or to books made up of ivory plates; 'who perished on Nysa' (p. 245 and n. 119) should be 'who is said to have killed Nisa' (qui Nisam interemisse dicitur) – hence Herbert does not misquote Cicero; 'Dionysius' on the bottom line of p. 246 should be 'Diodorus', while three lines up the description of 'the traveller' as 'incomprehensibilis' is missing (the Greek which Herbert also gives apparently contains a misprint from 1663 since ἀχιχητος should presumably be ἀκιχητος); 'insufficient wisdom and judgment' (p. 278) should be 'highest wisdom and best judgment' ('summa sapientia consilioque optimo'). Furthermore on p. 259 Butler, as he notes, corrects Herbert's text so that it reads 'vacated' when Herbert wrote 'entered' (inibant): even though Herbert was mistaken, it would be preferable to present in the translation of his text what he wrote and then note what actually happened in a footnote. Individually items such as these may only indicate the need for 'minor corrections' but overall they spoil a much needed translation and raise niggling doubts about the appended comments. Students who wish to use this translation should be warned to check what they wish to cite from it against the original Latin text.

University of Manchester David A. Pailin

Godly clergy in early Stuart England. The Caroline Puritan movement, c. 1620–1643. By Tom Webster. (Cambridge Studies in Early Modern British History.) Pp. xv + 353. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997. £40. 0 521 46170 7

Focusing on Essex, but with implications for an understanding of seventeenth-century religion in general, Tom Webster's study of *Godly clergy in early Stuart England* is a richly nuanced study of forms and practices of clerical sociability that helped to define Puritanism and shape its response to the changing conditions of

the Caroline Church. Webster's interests are broad-ranging and his approach has been shaped by a familiarity with the methodologies of other disciplines. He demonstrates a flair for asking fresh questions of seemingly familiar material and helps his readers to find new angles of vision that bring us closer to understanding the godly clergy and their world.

Webster begins by studying the interaction of godly clergy at university and in informal regional associations, examining the process whereby practices adopted to enhance faith gradually served to define a godly community distinct from the members of the Church who did not participate in such efforts. He argues persuasively that activities viewed by some as subverting the life of the Church were initially undertaken in order to enhance it. Part II focuses on the experience of these ministers and offers original insights into activities such as sermons, fasts and the keeping of spiritual diaries. Here, too, Webster stresses that 'the godly view and experience of the ministry' that 'can, not unprofitably, be labeled "Puritan"... overlapped with a view which formed the common ground of English Protestantism' (p. 147). Having established this, he demonstrates how clergy united in their commitment to godly communities could take differing positions regarding the use of ceremonies or the refusal to use them. But part III shows how Laudian initiatives pushed the comformable godly closer to nonconformist colleagues in an increasingly besieged Puritan community. The discussion of the Ockley conference is of particular interest, with the author having pieced together various sources to examine the arguments advanced on both sides. Called to persuade John Cotton and Thomas Hooker to conform, it led instead to John Davenport and Phillip Nye rejecting their earlier conformist positions. Webster makes a strong case that Laudian policies and visitations broadened and united, while also alienating the godly community. The final part of the study surveys the Puritan diaspora to New England and the Netherlands, and the situation of those who remained in England. Webster concludes by suggesting how the ecclesiological fragmentation of the Puritan camp during the Civil Wars was related to earlier differences which had been minimised and put aside in the face of the Laudian threat.

While *Godly clergy* reflects recent concerns to explore the relationship between religious ideas and social experience, Webster has delved deeper than most and his findings will command the attention of other scholars. His is a new voice in the field of Puritan studies and one that promises to be an important one.

MILLERSVILLE UNIVERSITY OF PENNSYLVANIA FRANCIS J. BREMER

The politics of Irish dissent, 1650–1800. Edited by Kevin Herlihy. Pp. 126. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 1997. £30 (cloth), £11.95 (paper). 1 85182 301 8; 1 85182 302 6

The seven essays in *The politics of Irish dissent, 1650–1800* originated in papers delivered at the third annual conference in Dublin on the subject of Protestant dissent in Ireland. Papers presented to the earlier conferences have been published as *The Irish dissenting tradition, 1650–1750* and *The religion of Irish dissent, 1650–1800*. In the first essay in this book T. C. Barnard examines the roots of government hostility to dissent, revealing the genuine anxieties which often underlay suspicion and mere prejudice. Jacqueline Hill follows with an

illuminating investigation of the participation of dissenters in Dublin civic politics. Her findings rather surprisingly suggest that 'predominantly harmonious relations must have existed between Dublin presbyterians and members of the established church'. James Butler, first duke of Ormond, three times Irish lord lieutenant, has traditionally been regarded as a friend of the Ulster Presbyterians who would have done more for them if he had been able, but James McGuire puts a question mark over this perception which he traces back to the seventeenth-century Presbyterian historian, Patrick Adair. Clearly Ormond, whose support for the Established Church and the policies of the bishops is documented, had little sympathy with nonconformity, however courteous he may have been to individual Presbyterians like Adair. David Hayton's essay on the impact of the sacramental test on Irish dissenting politics begins by examining the origins of the 1704 Test Act and concludes that Presbyterian political influence declined after 1704, one reason being the tendency of better-off Presbyterians to conform. James Kelly explains why the repeal of the Test Act was so long delayed and throws more light on the Protestant establishment's fears. In a characteristically original contribution Raymond Gillespie introduces and reproduces a piece of popular Presbyterian propaganda in the form of a polemical poem entitled 'St Patrick's Church and Wood Street Meeting-House', illustrating tensions between dissenters and the Established Church in Dublin, probably from the pen of the Revd Joseph Boyse, minister of Wood-Street and a prominent dissenting apologist. Inevitably much of the discussion in these essays is concerned with relations between the Established Church, the government and the Presbyterians, the largest dissenting body in Ireland, but Robin Roddie, in 'John Wesley's political sensibilities in Ireland, 1747–1789', considers Wesley's attitude to politics in general and Irish politics in particular. He concludes that, although 'Wesley was without doubt the most adaptive and inventive religious leader of his age', his Englishness made Ireland 'a land which he undoubtedly loved but did not always understand'. Wesley was scarcely the first or last Englishman of which this was true. Kevin Herlihy, who edits and provides an introduction to these essays, and all who have contributed to them, have improved our understanding of often imperfectly understood aspects of Irish ecclesiastical history.

Union Theological College, Belfast

R. F. G. Holmes

The Trinitarian theology of Dr Samuel Clarke (1675–1729). Context, sources, and controversy. By Thomas C. Pfizenmaier. (Studies in the History of Christian Thought, 75.) Pp. ix + 238. Leiden–New York–Cologne: Brill, 1997. Nlg 112. 90 04 10719 3; 0081 8607

This revised doctoral thesis from Fuller Theological Seminary sets out to reassess the traditional description of Samuel Clarke as an 'Arian' in the light of modern study of Arianism. It first places Clarke in the intellectual setting of his time, then reviews his theology and its relation to that of Newton, and finally gives a brief survey of the controversy to which the publication of Clarke's *Scripture-doctrine of the Trinity* gave rise. There is plenty of interesting material presented, with generous citation of first-hand sources. While it is good to see a scholar concerned

with the period paying attention to recent Arian studies, regrettably Pfizenmaier's grasp of them is inadequate for the reassessment he is attempting. Rudolf Lorenz's *Arius Judiazans?*, R. Gregg and D. Groh's *Early Arianism* and Rowan Williams's *Arius* are all absent from his bibliography. More importantly he has not grasped the degree of revisionism in modern Arian studies with their questioning of all the traditional party labels. For him it is essentially a matter of the addition of an 'Origenistic–Eusebian–Cappadocian trajectory of thought' to the options of Arianism, Orthodoxy and Sabellianism. Arianism is still (as it was for Clarke's critics) defined by the two maxims 'created out of nothing' and 'there was a time when he was not' – which effectively makes it a null class, excluding even Arius himself. On that basis he can easily (and rightly) redefine Clarke as a Eusebian rather than an Arian. But he is quite wrong to use that redefinition to contrast Clarke with Whiston, who, despite major differences of style and minor differences of substance from Clarke, with equal justice also called himself a Eusebian and repudiated what he called 'gross Arianism'. Pfizenmaier traces the close similarities between Clarke and Newton well, rightly acknowledging the paucity of evidence for direct dependence (but he misses the reference in Whiston's *Life of Samuel Clarke*, p. 17). More questionable is his claim that Newton's views became less Arian in later life. Certainly the argument offered to show that he did does not hold water; there is no inconsistency in accepting (with reservations) the philosophically influenced views of Logos-theologians who insisted on the distinct personal identity of the Logos and at the same time firmly repudiating those theologians who, under similar philosophical influence, affirmed an impersonal Logos. Accuracy in points of detail falls below expected standards. In one passage of Clarke containing seventeen words of Greek, cited twice on pp. 138 and 173, there are four mistranscriptions or mistakes on one occasion and six on the other (one actually graced with a 'sic'). The indispensable Newton manuscripts are frequently cited, but it seems always at second hand and not always reliably. The contents of the three manuscripts referred to on p. 146 n.17, for example, are all completely misdescribed.

OXFORD MAURICE WILES

Susanna Wesley. The complete writings. Edited by Charles Wallace, Jr. Pp. xv + 504 + 12 ills. New York–Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997. £47.50. 0 19 507437 8

Queen of the Methodists. The countess of Huntingdon and the eighteenth-century crisis of faith and society. By Boyd Stanley Schlenther. Pp. xiv + 208 + 16 plates. Bishop Auckland: Durham Academic Press, 1997. £22.95. 1 900838 08 7

Susanna Wesley: the complete writings marks the first time that her papers have been collected into a single published volume – consisting of letters, journals and a third section comprising longer essays – which will prove both indispensable to the serious student and fascinating to the general reader. Rarely has such a collection of foundation documents been edited in such a user-friendly way. Proof-reading has been very carefully done and only in a couple of places are the cross references inaccurate, but then by only a page. The author's footnotes are also extremely helpful, for example on p. 182 where he draws our attention to the problems of later 'editing', and though the text has mostly been modernised, it

has been done with respect to British spelling. Susanna Wesley's letters are arranged chronologically but Charles Wallace has grouped them together in sections, each with a brief introduction, that enable specific areas of her life to be located quickly. These, together with the journals (the surviving diaries unfortunately only come from the period from 1709 to 1727) and the essays, reveal 'a woman attempting to define herself over and against the established powers'. In this respect she deserves more than the popular epithet of 'John Wesley's mother', since her keen intellect, spiritual insight and independence of thought made her a serious practical theologian in her own right. Indeed, Susanna Wesley's exploration of such issues as holiness, perfection and the place of reason in faith provide a rich resource for those wishing to understand the tensions present in the religious atmosphere of the early eighteenth century.

The final letter in the collection is a poignant expression of Susanna's gratitude to an equally remarkable woman, Selina, countess of Huntingdon, who is the subject of a recent biography by Boyd Schlenther. It is difficult to combine the virtues of a readable biography with a fully researched work of historical analysis in just over 200 pages, but *Queen of the Methodists* does just this and compares very favourably with Edwin Welch's *Spiritual pilgrim* which appeared three years ago. Whereas the latter's study of this extraordinary woman is scholarly but rather dry in places, Schlenther has managed to capture the countess's world with a style that is as lively as Lady Huntingdon herself, though his incursions into family intrigues are always carefully related to the central theme of the book. This is a most entertaining and instructive book which gives the eighteenth-century religious background sufficient attention for the general reader to understand the context in which the countess's activities were set. A woman of extraordinary energy and talent, whose diverse interests included philanthropy, missionary ventures, business management and the founding of a theological college, the countess of Huntingdon's driving ambition was to promote 'the internal invigoration of the Church of England'. She made a valiant attempt, but Schlenther (rightly) comes to a more critical conclusion than Welch. In her favour the countess had drive, charisma and financial resources but these were offset by her erratic leadership and volatile personality. The countess's 'lively fancy', forever subject to wild fluctuations – her relationship with the Wesleyan Methodists and the Wesley brothers in particular makes for fascinating reading – caused insoluble problems and ultimately condemned her 'connexion' to the status of a marginalised ginger group.

Worcester Park, Surrey

Barrie Tabraham

The gallery tradition. Aspects of Georgian psalmody. Papers from the International Conference organised by The Colchester Institute, August 1995. Edited by Christopher Turner. Pp. xi + 109. Ketton: SG Publishing/Anglia Polytechnic University, 1997. £26. 0 9529336 0 8

'The gallery tradition' refers to music sung by choirs placed in the galleries of country churches, or, in terms of contemporary usage, to the repertoire of rural psalmody and song both in its historical forms and its modern practice. The papers in this collection stem from a conference held by the Colchester Institute

and Music School, and represent some of the different viewpoints essential if these particular musical traditions are to be researched adequately; the studies can be regarded as an indispensible introduction to elements in these complex areas, although some contributors admit that they represent research work formally still in its infancy. Included with the 'gallery tradition' are the living examples of Yorkshire and Derbyshire carolling, as representative of material dating from the eighteenth century and Victorian times, characterised by melismata, fuguing sections and two-part counterpoint performed at different levels. The dissonance between the heritage as described here, its recovery and realisation (language of 'revival' is discouraged by some contributors), and present liturgical trends is evident, as is the relevance of the evidence presented in these essays to parish churches and chapels without organists and looking, sometimes perhaps enviously, at local popular culture outside their walls. If at points in the text the reviewer began to question the appropriateness of the general title 'the gallery tradition', the quality and value of these musicological and ethomusicological researchers are unimpeachable, and the areas they represent are ripe for further research.

Wesley House, Ivor H. Jones
Cambridge

The Irish Catholic diaspora in America. Revised edn. By Lawrence J. McCaffrey. Pp. ix + 253. Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 1997 (first publ. as *The Irish diaspora in America*, Indiana University Press, 1976; repr. by Catholic University of America Press, 1984). £19.95 (paper). 0 8132 0896 3

When an outsider, by ethnicity and religion, reviews the work of a veteran insider, extreme caution is needed before venturing criticism and recording disappointment. Yet such a response is unavoidable. Twenty-eight pages of 'Suggestions for Further Reading' suggest that the book will treat a very broad variety of topics. There is indeed much fair-minded narrative, from 1170 to the present. There is an admirable chapter on politics in America. Economic fortunes and social change are well summarised, though we may regret that a bare 200 pages of text permit so little detail and lead to some abrupt generalisation. Where the text becomes fuller is in the treatment of nationalism, both in Ireland and the United States. But that means that the subject occupies one-third of the book, a proportion an outsider may well regard as excessive. That view is reinforced when we see what has been left out, or understated, in the Irish-American experience. McCaffrey insists that Catholicism has been central to Irish-American consciousness; and it is easy to agree. But that being so, Catholic life seems curiously under-emphasised, whether in its triumphs, discords or shortcomings. It could be argued that the laity would not have known about disputes between prelates and factional intrigues in Rome. Their lives were lived at a parochial level. But in that case it seems necessary to treat the heroic struggles to pay off debt for church-building, the campaign for parochial schools, and the launching of institutions – orphanages, sodalities, fraternals, the Society of St Vincent de Paul, temperance societies and old people's homes – to ensure that every part of life outside work was lived in a Catholic atmosphere. Tensions

between priests and leading laymen ought to be admitted. More emphasis is needed on relations between the Irish and later Catholic arrivals. It is not enough to say that the Irish led the others in adjusting to American life. There was a darker side to the relationship, involving disapproval and discrimination. Long ago, an American friend, in the privacy of a letter, ventured on a crude generalisation which I quote from memory: 'Of course the Irish always thought Catholicism too good for the Italians.' The heart of McCaffrey's book is revealed in its final chapter. After discussion of the present-day suburban middle-class Irish-Americans, many of whom have decided that 'they can be good Catholics while disobeying the Pope', the peroration chosen is a plea for the preservation of Irish-American identity.

University of Hull P. A. M. Taylor

The ceremonial city. Toulouse observed, 1738–1780. By Robert A. Schneider. Pp. x + 203 incl. 4 tables and 2 maps. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1995. £22.50 (cloth), £10.95 (paper). 0 691 03465 6; 0 691 93464 8

Between 1738 and 1780 Pierre Barthès, master tutor in Latin in the city of Toulouse, kept a remarkable journal. Its noteworthiness emanates not merely from its continuity and its insights into the mindset of a zealous, intractable, middle-class Catholic, blind to even the mildest influence of the Enlightenment, but for its author's eye for detail. Pierre Barthès absorbed and transmitted to paper the visual events of his world with a remarkable precision and in so doing created a series of *tableaux vivants* in which the rituals and ceremonies, recurrent and particular, were transmitted to his readers.

Robert Schneider's *The ceremonial city* makes an effective and engaging contribution to the fashionable preoccupation with reconstructing and interpreting ritual and visual space by using Barthès's observations to reconstruct the content of the calendar of events in his city. An opening section on the diarist and the specificities of Toulouse (seat of a *parlement*, an archbishopric and an intendance), and on the sporadic tensions and possibly disturbances involved in the provisioning problems of the people, is followed by a three-fold division of Barthès's public cosmos. This involved public executions, public devotions from processions to confraternal sociability and political festivities largely of commemoration. Like almost every other citizen of early modern Europe Barthes turned out to watch and comment upon a judicial system that rested on the spectacle of the harsh example as a deterrent force. He waited in trepidation for a criminal's pre-death repentance speech and felt jilted if one was not forthcoming. If he pitied a young maidservant hung for a petty theft from her employer (a very unusual crime to bring to court since employers commonly contented themselves with docking wages and threatening the girl, deeming the death penalty for *vol domestique* over-severe) he consoled himself with the salutary effect of such an example. For him, every rotting body on a gibbet reminded felons of what could be their fate. He was confident that the Last Judgment would rectify any miscarriage of justice.

Celebrations, firework displays and speeches kept alive the memory of Catholic victories in the Wars of Religion: the canonisation of saints such as Vincent de Paul and François Régis were particular events but, more regularly, con-

fraternities of penitents paraded in robes and cowls, or the numerous relics of the cathedral of Saint Sernin in jewelled reliquaries were aired on special feast days as were statues of the Virgin carried through the streets to mark the stages of the Marian year. Civic and national triumphs or a royal birth or marriage or coronation were marked by Te Deums in which mayor and judges paraded in their splendid robes.

What becomes apparent from this volume is the extent to which religion was the *leitmotif* of all ceremonial, whether centred upon the scaffold or the archbishop's chair. Toulouse was, of course, the city of the Calas affair, but its Catholic religiosity was by no means abnormal. One could not be sure that Rouen or Montpellier would not have behaved the same way. Schneider's lively book makes one ponder the void, the visual penury produced by Revolutionary deChristianisation which stripped altars and chapels, the traditional and the familiar and only profferred in return a demystified secularism, no *lieu de mémoire* redolent of local identity, and the part this penury played in the defeat of a regime.

MERTON COLLEGE, OLWEN HUFTON
OXFORD

No king, no popery. Anti-Catholicism in revolutionary New England. By Francis D. Cogliano. (Contributions in American History, 164.) Pp. xiii + 173. Westport, Conn. – London: Greenwood Press, 1995. £47.95. 0 313 29729 0; 0084 9219

Rome and the new republic. Conflict and community in Philadelphia Catholicism between the revolution and the civil war. By Dale B. Light. (Notre Dame Studies in American Catholicism.) Pp. xiii + 449. Notre Dame, South Bend, Ind. – London: University of Notre Dame Press, 1996. £39.50. 0 268 01652 6

The two works under review treat interconnections between religious faith, political ideology and social change. Cogliano's survey is the simpler and more successful book. Its thesis is that anti-popery lay at the heart of the culture of colonial New England and that its themes were exploited by ministers and revolutionary leaders to bolster support for independence during the period 1763–76. 'The Whig elite', concerned to avoid offending France, America's ally in the war against Britain, then concluded that 'anti-popery had lost its utility' and cajoled 'the common people' to accept a more positive view of the French and of Catholicism (p. 106). Cogliano concludes, mainly from close study of state-wide grass-roots debate over those clauses in Massachusetts' first constitution which granted limited toleration to Catholics, that 'by late 1790 anti-popery ceased to interest most New Englanders' (p. 145). 'Indifference and tolerance', he writes, 'had replaced fear and hatred of popery' (p. 146).

Cogliano has fashioned an entertaining description of the intellectual gymnastics performed by previously anti-Catholic New England ministers as they confronted the military necessity of an alliance with France. To Tory gibes that devious French Catholics sought to exploit the Franco–American alliance in order that the children of New England 'might enjoy the mighty boon of being slaves of the Most Christian King [Louis XVI]' (p. 81), patriotic ministers responded with tracts offering a tortured reading of the Book of Ezra (highlighting

Cyrus' role in delivering the Israelites from Babylonian oppression but ignoring his subsequent demand for tribute from them), or pious hopes that the alliance would encourage Protestantism in France! However, I am not convinced by Cogliano's argument that New England's ministers and elected officials successfully suppressed during the revolutionary war that anti-Catholic and anti-French bigotry among the people at large that they had exploited during the struggle for independence. Cogliano attempts to sustain his thesis regarding a change in popular attitudes via an often intriguing analysis of tensions caused in New England's seaport towns by the presence of large numbers of French sailors. This assumes that French sailors of the lower-deck were devout Catholics. It also assumes that the American sailors and labourers in the maritime trades with whom the French occasionally brawled were representative New Englanders (legatees of the region's anti-popery) from whose comparatively complacent response to the presence of foreign Catholics in their midst we can infer that a change in values was occurring simultaneously in the small and isolated rural towns where the bulk of New England's population lived. (In fact Cogliano's analysis of debate over Massachusetts' first state constitution suggests that isolated towns were less likely than seaport towns to demonstrate that growing toleration born of increasing indifference which Cogliano argues characterised the region as a whole.) Moreover, Bostonians' relatively calm response to an inundation of Frenchmen was, as Cogliano recognises, prompted by several factors not the least of which was the tact displayed by French commanders. Cogliano's explanation for the decline of anti-popery is not persuasive but, merely by examining events after 1776, his book complements and to some extent corrects, the work of scholars such as Nathan Hatch who have explained better than he the xenophobia characteristic of the late colonial New England mindset.

Dale Light's *Rome and the new republic* details conflict between bishops and dissenters (lay and clerical, German, Irish and French) in the Catholic congregations of nineteenth-century Philadelphia. Conflict was caused by ethnic tensions, disputes over the selection and payment of priests, contested elections of lay trustees, and conflicting interpretations of doctrine. Rome pressured the bishops of Baltimore and Philadelphia to impose order on their disputatious dioceses, dissenters demanded a greater role in the governance of the Church. Light's treatment of this conflict, particularly his description of a period of extreme factionalism *c.* 1815–30, is informed by a prodigious labour in the archives and fully conveys the flavour of these disputes. In 1828, for example, two Philadelphia pastors were stripped of their faculties and ordered by Rome to remove themselves to Cincinnatti, Ohio. The pair protested that 'no foreign prince' could order an American citizen to relocate and that they could not obey without violating their oath of loyalty to the Republic. They wrote to the US Secretary of State Henry Clay protesting at this infringement of their rights as American citizens and argued that if they obeyed their orders 'the priesthood of our church' would be at 'the complete … disposal of the Court of Rome' (p. 231). Light provides countless other examples of participants in the power struggles which wracked Philadelphia Catholicism employing a rhetoric whose denunciations of arbitrary power and affirmations of 'rights' devolved from citizenship could be described loosely as 'republican'. Light has little doubt that the language employed by those who disputed church authority *should* be

described as republican. His dissenters spoke straight from the heart, employing rhetoric rooted in their understanding of ethnic and socio-economic tension. At no point, apparently, did they tailor their remarks in order to use American national self-regard as a stick with which to beat ultramontane conservatives. This seems implausible and it was, in any case, ultimately unsuccessful. Light is right to argue that the attitudes and values of lay and clerical dissenters deserve study. His clumsy treatment of those attitudes, characterised by an irritating insistence that the language of congregational dissent was not just loosely reminiscent of republican ideology (never defined) but was in fact informed by a commitment to some or all of its nebulous values, diminishes the worth of his study.

St Cross College, Oxford

Peter Thompson

The tree of liberty. Radicalism, Catholicism and the construction of Irish identity, 1760–1830. By Kevin Whelan. (Critical Conditions. Field Day Essays and Monographs, 1.) Pp. x+236. Cork: Cork University Press, 1996. £14.95 (paper). 1 85918 060 4

The four independent but interlocking essays which make up this book chiefly examine the 1790s, a crucial decade for understanding contemporary Irish history. They come from the pen of a noted scholar who has done much to expound and interpret the history of late eighteenth-century Ireland. Among the subjects dealt with in this volume Whelan provides a stimulating discussion of the role of Catholic middlemen in land economy and politics and shows how this group was, in many ways, among the most conservative of forces in Ireland in the period under discussion. They and the higher clergy were the first to articulate the view that Catholic Ireland's hopes lay in a reconciliation with the Hanoverian *realpolitik*, rather than adherence to Jacobite romanticism. There is an implied criticism of the Catholic hierarchy in its desire to, ironically, uphold the structures of the state in the face of the growing popularity of French revolutionary ideas, culminating in the United Irishmen's rebellion of 1798. However, in my view, Whelan too readily subscribes to the view that the United Irishmen provided a context for a 'non-sectarian, democratic and inclusive politics' in Ireland. If such an assertion is true it is only partially so. The reason Presbyterians and some Anglicans, such as Wolf Tone who was in any case scarcely an orthodox Christian, saw hope for a political alliance with Catholics was precisely that the experience of revolutionary France demonstrated that Catholics were prepared, given the right stimulus, to cast aside their adherence to the precepts of Catholicism and in particular to reject the authority of the pope. Did Tone himself not exuberantly proclaim in his *Argument on behalf of the Catholics of Ireland*, 'Look at France; where is the intolerance of Papish bigotry now? Has not the Pope been burned in effigy…?' (cf. p. 100). The intellectual climate which fed the political ideas of the United Irishmen was in many ways both anti-religious and anti-Catholic. The Irish Catholic bishops were rightly concerned that the bloody reign of terror unleashed in France against Catholicism would be repeated in revolutionary Ireland, although Whelan believes that because of its relatively disadvantaged position the Catholic Church was

'insulated from radical attack' (p. 109). Nevertheless he does admit (p. 61) that the United Irishmen's agenda was to forward acceptance of Enlightenment principles. Many of those principles were in direct contradiction of even liberal Catholic attitudes. Equally Whelan rightly emphasises that the appeal to sectarianism was the chief weapon in the anti-revolutionary armoury. In his concluding essay on the historiography of 1798 the author draws attention to the fact that some early commentators on the rising were well aware that their history writing was 'an intervention in contemporary politics' (p. 166), a phenomenon which is still very much part of the Irish historical scholarly enterprise but without the matching candour.

CAMPION HALL, OXFORD — OLIVER P. RAFFERTY SJ

Aspects of the Georgian Church. Visitation studies of the diocese of York, 1761–1776. By Judith Jago. Pp. 307 incl. 8 ills. Madison–Teaneck: Fairleigh Dickinson University Press/London: Associated University Presses, 1997. £35. 0 8386 3692 6

This sympathetic regional study of the eighteenth-century Church draws on the extensive material and correspondence associated with Drummond's primary visitation of the diocese, material which is itself testimony to the industry of the archbishop, at least in informing himself if not in reforming the institution. Dr Jago's conclusion that 'he held the evidence in his palace at Bishopthorpe but was unaware that it pointed to the precipice which the church was approaching' is a little harsh in the context of her overall argument and of the voluminous correspondence which survives and which Dr Jago's untimely death prevented her from utilising fully. Much of it reveals the wearisome attention required in dealing with awkward clerics such as Thomas Hudson, curate of Stokesley, who invited a Methodist preacher to the pulpit without informing the rector, but Dr Jago shows that Drummond retained an eye for more fundamental issues. The problems facing poor clergy and those of parochial finance were addressed if not solved by him, whilst in the parishes the catechism, which Ian Green has recently reminded us was so important, was regularly and almost everywhere an integral part of religious instruction. The difficult circumstances under which this book was completed explains why, at times, the reader is left uncertain as to whether the author sides with the optimists or the pessimists about the Georgian Church, but its very completion is itself a testimony to her competence and orderliness, qualities which she so admired in Drummond. Even so those qualities could not prevent Drummond presiding over an institution which, in Dr Jago's happy phrase, reflected 'superficially sound cover over ground in which deeply damaging cracks were forming'. It is entirely fitting therefore that one of her particular pleasures in the writing of this book was being led 'through muddy undergrowth' to find Drummond's burial place in the ruined church of St Andrew, Bishopthorpe. Dr Jago has provided a memorial which, if a little unfinished in parts, rescues her subject from the undergrowth and, in its understated way, reveals her own considerable qualities.

UNIVERSITY OF YORK — W. J. SHEILS

Democratic religion. Freedom, authority and church discipline in the Baptist South, 1785–1900. By Gregory A. Wills. (Religion in America Series.) Pp. ix + 195. New York: Oxford University Press, 1997. £30. 0 19 510412 9

This meticulously presented monograph is the product of very thorough research on Baptist church records in the American South, concentrated particularly on Georgia in the decades before the Civil War. Wills uses this material vividly and effectively in order to reconstruct the texture and dynamics of congregational life. His particular interest is in the nature and role of church discipline, the process of excluding members for moral failure or theological inexactitude. Wills shows convincingly that despite the oppressiveness potentially inherent in such procedures their application was democratic and generally even-handed, and that they played an important part in maintaining spiritual vitality. Antebellum Baptist churches demonstrated a remarkable capacity to transcend the normal social divisions of southern society: both women and slaves were accorded considerable respect and influence. After the Civil War, however, the use of discipline fell into decline, and the character of the churches was gradually transformed by a new emphasis on 'efficiency', and by the consequences of urbanisation. The argument is stimulating and, as far as it goes, convincing and illuminating. The book, however, lacks much engagement with a wider historical context, even when judged by the standards of other monographs. An initial survey chapter on the social and religious fabric of the antebellum South would have done much not only to assist the non-specialist reader but also to point up the wider significance of the book's insights. There is, further, a disappointing failure to engage purposefully with recent very seminal works on American religious history, above all those of Nathan Hatch and Richard Carwardine. Having said that, however, this book constitutes, within its limitations, a thoroughly worthwhile presentation of excellent and important research, which would serve as a very useful model and comparison for those studying the internal life of evangelical Protestant churches in other geographical and denominational contexts.

THE OPEN UNIVERSITY JOHN WOLFFE

Freedom and religion in the nineteenth century. Edited by Richard Helmstadter. (The Making of Modern Freedom.) Pp. xi + 448. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1997. 0 8047 3087 3

This is a volume in the series *The Making of Modern Freedom*, growing out of conferences held at the Center for the History of Freedom at Washington University in St Louis. In this context, freedom is defined, not as individual self-realisation or relief from the pressures of want or fear, but as 'civil and political liberty'. Three of the essays are informative rather than raising questions of principle, though none the less interesting for that: Simon Collier on 'Church–State relations in Chile', R. J. Jones adding nuances to the accepted view of the *Kulturkampf*, and N. O. Hatch providing a case study of the conditions favourable to religious freedom – the surge of multiple groups of immigrants into North America in the twenty years before the War of Independence, coming into a country with recklessly productive printing presses and a moving frontier. The

other chapters raise questions concerning variant interpretations of the nature of freedom in matters religious. F. M. Turner attacks the myth, fostered by Voltaire and Enlightenment anglophiles, that science and liberty go together; on the contrary, science flourishes under illiberal regimes and tramples on backward cultures, working towards 'an agreed-upon truth', rather than promoting a diversity of sects, each with its own. In early Victorian Britain, Dissenters fought the establishment over confessional tests for university entrance and church rates; J. P. Ellens studies their arguments and concludes that the shift from emphasis on the community to the rights of the individual comes later than Jonathan Clark has put it. What are the limits of speculation allowable within a formal religion? R. K. Webb discusses the question with regard to *Essays and Reviews* (1860) and *Lux Mundi* (1889), together with similar crises among Unitarians and Quakers. Does freedom consist of a crude equality for all? Jews worshipped freely in France, but no allowances were made for their dietary laws or burial customs in state boarding schools; by contrast, there was a beginning of 'pluralism' in England (D. C. Itkowitz). The alliance between Catholicism and liberalism foreseen by Tocqueville and Acton is interpreted by R. Grew; against Rome of the Syllabus and Index he sets the role given to women in the religious orders, the rise of Social Catholicism, the 'bringing of the masses into political life' by pilgrimages, the press and propaganda, and the great campaigns for liberty of education. A detailed assessment of this theme in France from 1787 to 1908 follows in two chapters by C. T. McIntire; his account is new in its emphasis on the continuing Gallicanism of all French governments, not only with regard to the Catholic Church, but to the Lutherans, the Reformed, the Jews and Islam in Algeria. Was religion a tool of imperialism? J. Cox gives a masterly reassessment of the relations between Christianity and British imperial power, with Henry Venn of the CMS as his exemplar. Venn wanted an end to the slave trade, to provide education to native peoples and encouragement for them to join in 'healthy commerce' – and all this was to lead to the creation of an independent native clergy and the 'euthanasia of the mission'. But only the imperial power could help him, 'voluntarist religion was caught in the imperialist trap'. If there is to be a conclusion to these eleven diverse essays, it must present the differing aspects of freedom and the diversity of the persons and groups who claim it – according to how they define it. Richard Helmstadter does this perceptively, in an elegant essay.

All Souls College, John McManners
Oxford

Religions in conflict. Ideology, cultural contact and conversion in late colonial India. By Antony Copley. Pp. xvii + 279 + 5 maps and 5 plates. Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1997. £25. 0 19 563676 7

The title of this well-written and informative book on Indian missions in the nineteenth century might well have been 'Great Expectations', so much did British missionaries believe that their Christian message would be quickly and completely embraced by the teeming Hindu and Muslim masses in India. But for all the effort and money, the results were initially rather disappointing. Copley documents this futile attempt at early mission first by examining its two principal

strategies, itinerancy and education, and then by sketching out the cultural context in which mission took place. He then presents case histories of individual missionaries in various parts of the Indian subcontinent, ending with an extremely interesting examination of the religious and cultural hardships faced by some of the more famous native converts, several of whom, after embracing Christianity, were not only ostracised by their families and communities but also marginalised by xenophobic British missionaries. While based on manuscript sources, the book draws heavily on the archives of the Church Missionary Society, giving a decidedly evangelical Anglican bias to the story. The archives of the Baptist Missionary Society and the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel are also used, through to a much lesser degree. Inclusion of material from the London Missionary Society (Council for World Missions) and the Methodist Missionary Society, both of which were active in India and today have extensive archives at the School of Oriental and African Studies (University of London), would have given Copley's work more balance. Nevertheless, this book will be of consequence not only to historians of Christian missions in India and scholars interested in the historic dynamic between Protestant Christianity and the Hindu, Muslim and Sikh religions, but also to historians of the various home missionary organisations in Britain needing a crash course on what these missions were up to in the field.

Randolph–Macon College
Ashland,
Virginia

Roger H. Martin

Nineteenth-century Anglican theological training. The redbrick challenge. By David A. Dowland. (Oxford Theological Monographs.) Pp. ix + 241 incl. 6 plates. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1997. £37.50 0 19 826929 3

David Dowland sets out to explore the variety of colleges that became available for the training of non-graduate Anglican clergy in England and Wales in the nineteenth century. He does this by concentrating on five foundations which provided the so-called 'redbrick' challenge to Oxford and Cambridge, St David's College Lampeter, King's College London, the Evangelical colleges of St Aidan's Birkenhead and St John's Highbury and Kelham, founded by Herbert Kelly of the Society of the Sacred Mission. Dowland provides a chapter on each institution (with the exception of St Aidan's and St John's which share one). This gives the not altogether satisfactory effect of a succession of potted institutional histories, with the focus more on the colleges themselves than on the men who emerged from them. It becomes clear that the colleges were often under the sway of domineering founders or early principals, and that finances were often precarious. In a final chapter Dowland rehearses the well-trodden ground of theological education at nineteenth-century Oxford and Cambridge. The new non-graduate colleges, emerging as they did from a variety of individual initiatives in the uncentralised and idiosyncratic world of the nineteenth-century Church, were all very different from each other. They catered for different types of non-graduate ordinands in very diverse urban and rural settings. The irony is that throughout this period the majority of bishops were suspicious of the new non-graduate colleges. They remained committed to the imposition of a single

ideal, that of graduate and preferably Oxbridge-educated clergy, even if such candidates could muster nothing more than a modest pass degree. Thus a central theme of the book is the life-long 'slur' which non-Oxbridge clergy were made to feel. This probably says as much about England and its peculiar educational and class structure, as it does about Anglican theological training. Indeed, there is not a great deal of emphasis on the *theology* which underlay these nineteenth-century attempts at broadening the Church's ministry, which is perhaps surprising in view of the book's appearance in the Oxford Theological (rather than the Historical) Monographs series. This book provides a useful survey, but there are also a number of apparent ambiguities, as when the Welsh prelates are described as having shown an exceptional amount of favour towards Lampeter on p. 164, a view partially contradicted on pp. 166–7. Some unfortunate errors have also slipped through what is normally the rigorous editing process at OUP. An entire line is printed twice on p. 161; St Albans should have no apostrophe (p. 163); Dean Inge was never principal of St Stephen's House (p. 195); St David's College was never in Carmarthenshire, nor has it ever been known as the University College of Wales Lampeter (pp. v, 153, 207).

University of Wales,
Lampeter Frances Knight

Don Bosco's dreams. A historico-documentary analysis of selected samples. By Pietro Stella, translated by John Drury (Don Bosco in the History of Catholic Religious Thought and Practice.) Pp. xvi + 98. New Rochelle, NY: Salesiana, 1996 (first publ. as an appendix in *Don Bosco nella storia della religiosità cattolica*, II: *Mentalità religiosa e spiritualità*, Rome: Las-Roma, 1981). $20 (cloth), $10 (paper). 0 89944 269 2; 0 89944 270 6

Don Bosco. Religious outlook and spirituality. 2nd revised edn. By Pietro Stella (Don Bosco in the History of Catholic Religious Thought and Practice, 2.) (Trans. by John Drury of *Don Bosco nella storia della religiosità cattolica*, II: *Mentalità religiosa e spiritualità*, Rome: Las-Roma, 1981.) Pp. xxi + 594. New Rochelle, NY: Salesiana, 1996. $49 (cloth), $36 (paper). 0 89944 161 0; 0 89944 162 9

Don Bosco. Life and work. 2nd revised edn. By Pietro Stella (Don Bosco in the History of Catholic Religious Thought and Practice, 3.) (Trans. by John Drury of *Don Bosco nella storia della religiosità cattolica*, I: *Vita e opere, seconda edizione riveduta dall'autore*, Rome: Las-Roma, 1979.) Pp. xxiii + 305. New Rochelle, NY: Salesiana/Don Bosco Publications, 1985. 0 89944 080 0

Piedmont, commonly associated in the minds of historians with an intensive if belated process of secularisation from the 1850s, has had a particularly vital religious life in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. Here Catholic social action has been distinguished by a greater attention to the problems of urban society than perhaps anywhere else in Italy. A high proportion of the congregations ('mini-orders') of priests and sisters dedicated to service to the community that were founded in nineteenth-century Italy originated there. Don John Bosco's Salesians are the best known. Bosco (1815–88) engaged in a mission to the marginalised youth in the Turin of the 1840s, a city then in the early stages of industrialisation and subject to a large seasonal immigration of young men and

boys. Out of his Oratory of St Francis de Sales, a boys' refuge, grew his educational enterprises providing poor boys with either an academic education or training in a craft. To conduct this work, Bosco founded the Society of St Francis de Sales, a congregation of priests bound by simple vows and living a common life, supported by lay brothers; affiliated to it were the Cooperators (*Soci esterni*), a body of lay supporters and benefactors. Bosco also instigated the foundation of the 'Salesian Sisters' or, more properly, the Daughters of Mary Help of Christians, who conducted parallel work in the female sphere. The dedication of Bosco's foundations to St Francis de Sales (1567–1655), bishop of Annecy in Savoy, had a pastoral significance as well as a local reference. St Francis had sought to show that the Christian way of perfection was open to all; he had stood for a benign, supple pastoral method notably contrasting with that dour rigorism of certain leading French contemporaries which has been loosely termed 'Jansenism'. In the early nineteenth-century Piedmontese Church there was an intense debate between the 'Jansenising' exponents of a rigorist confessional practice and the 'benignists'. Bosco, convinced of the need to carry Catholicism to the masses, firmly belonged to the latter camp. His enterprises were favoured by members of Piedmontese social elites, not necessarily committed Catholics; the Cooperators included non-Catholics and even practising Jews. Indeed, some anti-clerical politicians, including Rattazzi and Crispi, were favourably disposed to Bosco. Bosco was a hard-liner: for him there was no salvation outside the Church; he shared the paranoid vision of the 'intransigentists', those clericals who stood out against compromise with a liberal state that had despoiled the papacy, a vision that saw the Church as assailed by satanic forces. But his engagement in practical social work also made for collaboration with, even warmth towards, benefactors outside the fold. Besides, in Piedmont, under the auspices of the royal house of Savoy, with educational and charitable works providing a common ground, there was a certain *modus vivendi* between clericals and the liberal establishment. Bosco, personally apolitical but shrewd, served as a mediator between the Vatican and the Italian government and helped in the nomination for bishoprics of candidates acceptable to both parties.

Professor Don Pietro Stella, himself a Salesian, who has taught in Italian universities both Catholic and state, is the leading authority on nineteenth-century Italian Catholic spirituality; he has published books on eighteenth-century Italian Jansenism and has contributed to the *Dictionnaire de spiritualité* and to the *Storia dell'Italia religiosa*: III: *L'età contemporanea*, edited by Gabriele de Rosa and Tullio Gregory (Rome–Bari 1995). His life of Bosco, a critical hagiography and study of spirituality in three volumes in Italian to date, is perhaps directed first and foremost to fellow Salesians, but it also contains matters of interest to academic historians, and its publication in English will be especially valuable to those unable to read Don Stella's writings of a more general character in Italian. Particularly useful is the material on the Italian Church and religion as a whole, and sections on the religious situation and religious ideology in Piedmont. Volume i of the work, *Don Bosco: life and work*, is regrettably almost out of print. The second, most recently published volume, *Don Bosco: religious outlook and spirituality*, examines Bosco's spiritual writings, together with his publications for the young and for the common people, including histories. Readers without a strong interest in spirituality may perhaps be most interested in the sections on

the development of Marian and Sacred Heart cults and on the *History of Italy*, written for children, a typical and widely disseminated example of the clericalist identification of Italy's authentic tradition with Catholicism. The third volume, *Don Bosco's dreams: a historico-documentary analysis of selected samples*, was, in the Italian edition an appendix to volume ii. These 'dreams' might best be described as parables and prophetic utterances. Don Stella's investigation of their literary sources demonstrates how these, especially the prophetic message to Pius ix and Emperor Franz Joseph, are revealing documents of the *exalté* sectarian mentality of Italian clerical intransigentism. This biography gives valuable insights into that strange mental world with its belief in the marvellous. But it also shows, in the life of this individual who combined bigotry with a certain generous eirenicism, that the sectarian boundaries were not as rigid as they might at first appear.

University of East Anglia Oliver Logan

Geology and religious sentiment. The effect of geological discoveries on English society and literature between 1829 and 1859. By J. M. I. Klaver. (Brill's Studies in Intellectual History, 80.) Pp. xvi + 215 incl. frontispiece. Leiden New York–Cologne: Brill, 1997. Nlg 133. 90 04 10882 3; 0920 8607.

This book describes and analyses the contributions to geology and related disciplines made by Charles Lyell (who gets nearly half the volume), William Buckland, Adam Sedgwick and William Whewell – from the appearance of Ure's pro-Mosaic *New system of geology* (1829) to that of Darwin's *Origin of species* (1859). The material is discussed in the context of what the author misleadingly calls 'religious sentiment', by which he usually means belief, specifically belief in Archbishop Ussher's chronology. The seemingly technical controversy between Lyell's 'uniformitarian' theory (the operations of nature are uniform and undeviating – nature is not 'progressive' but 'cyclical') derived from G. H. Toulmin, and the 'catastrophism' favoured by Buckland and Sedgwick, is shown to be related in part to the authors' desire to provide a scientific theory which leaves the Mosaic account of creation as little disturbed as possible, and/or which may be of service to natural theology. Whewell's rejection of uniformitarianism derived from the latter's seeming failure to account for origins, led him to a more careful demarcation between scientific and biblical knowledge than previous authors (mentioned in this book) had attempted. Despite its subtitle, this book tells us practically nothing about the effects of geological discoveries on 'English society' in the mid nineteenth century, and very little about the effects on 'literature'. Novels by Disraeli, Thackeray, William Gresley, J. A. Froude, Newman, Gosse, Butler and one or two others are briefly surveyed. Poems by Tennyson, Kingsley and Elizabeth Barret Browning are mentioned. But part iii, which contains this material, is not integrally related to the central argument and could have been omitted with very little loss. What is important in Klaver's book is the way in which four scrupulous and distinguished scientists, who were also men of faith, are shown to have wrestled bravely and ingeniously with the problems – some real and some imaginary – which their discoveries seemed to present to orthodox Christian belief. However, Klaver's presentation of his central theme would have been enriched by more attention to the wider

intellectual context of the 1830s: in particular by careful attention to the work of Richard Whately and his chaplain Samuel Hinds. For Hinds was one of the first to argue (in 1831) that 'knowledge of nature' and 'knowledge of God' are to some extent incommensurable and non-competing.

ST JOHN'S COLLEGE, A. M. C. WATERMAN
WINNIPEG

Religious liberty and international law in Europe. By Malcolm D. Evans. (Cambridge Studies in international and comparative law, 6.) Pp. xxxi + 395. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997. £45. 0 521 55021 1

Upon the list of human rights promulgated by the United Nations stands the phrase 'freedom of religion'. What does it mean? We are in the question, which religions are socially helpful and not harmful. But may a religion be socially helpful in some situations and socially harmful in others? An evangelist who did good if he/she preached in Arkansas might cause riot and murder if the same sermon were preached in Amritsar; and though the state would have the duty to prevent the murder it would think it better to stop the sermon from being delivered and so not to risk its policemen. Toleration, says the United Nations, ought to be practised in all countries. But some countries cannot, in the state of opinion among their peoples, practise it; and even in the countries where it is officially practised, the difficulties can keep coming into the courts. It is a freedom inseparable from other freedoms – that of assembly, of speech, and of moving about. But many states still cannot afford or do not wish to provide for freedom of movement or speech and yet may still do something towards the freedom of religion.

Because western Europe had fought wars of religion with disaster as a result it was here that the concept of toleration flowered. In this fine book Malcolm Evans regards the treaty of Berlin in 1878 as a landmark because there the Great Powers accepted the existence of a state of Romania but only on condition that it practised religious toleration, not least for its Jews. This treaty did not work so far as that object went. Its phrase was sweeping – 'the freedom and exercise of all forms of religion shall be assured to all persons' – did it mean all forms of religion, or all forms of religion practised at that moment in that land and with leave for visitors? When the League of Nations was founded, its draft clause was more cautious and limited – 'any particular creed, religion or belief whose practices are not inconsistent with public order or public morals'. But the drafters found the subject difficult and after hither and thither no clause on religious freedom went into the covenant of the League.

But they recreated a state of Poland, a country with many Jews, and one where the problem of toleration was acute. They took over the draft which failed to get into the covenant and accepted it as a clause of the treaty. The provision became a model for other states of Eastern Europe. The Greek treaty was special because it had to include protection for the rights of the Muslims in Thrace and of the monks on Mount Athos. The Greek government frustrated a western attempt to include protection for the Jews in Salonika.

In the Second World War the Atlantic Charter talked of freedoms but made no reference to the freedom of worship. The Universal Declaration of Human

Rights asserted that it is a human right to change one's religion if one wishes and to manifest one's religion in teaching, practice, observance and worship. This did not get through without opposition – the Soviets thought religion anti-social and wished the state to control it, the Muslim states could not bear the idea that persons can freely change their creed. The trouble with the Declaration was that it could hardly fit all circumstances, was not acceptable to a minority of members who reserved their rights on the question, and was vague enough to be interpreted in various ways. The Spaniard and Latin American later argued that atheism is not religion and its profession is not protected by the article. The Saudi Arabian said that freedom of religion must be protected by the article and a person's religion is not free if it is under pressure, and proselytism is pressure. No one knew whether conscientious objection to military service was a religious right or not; or whether wearing a particular headgear or face-hair was a piece of religious freedom or not. If a religion compelled all women to hide their faces behind veils, did that conflict with another human right and could be banned by the state? British law gives priests or pastors no right to withhold evidence about crimes of which they learn in their pastoral duty or confessional – is that contrary to the Declaration? If a state has a law that only the state may set up schools is that contrary?

In 1981 a new Declaration was put forward; it is not final. There was still a touch of Cold War in the argument. The democratic States wanted to protect the freedom of religion. The Soviet bloc wanted under the same article to protect the freedom of irreligion. These needs led to drafting confusion. Iran attacked the idea of any Declaration vehemently. In 1995 a special reporter for the United Nations reported 232 instances of practice not consistent with the Declaration. There was the murder of a Christian pastor in Iran, for religious motives, threats of murder in Pakistan against priests who advocated human rights, repressions of Buddhist monks and Christians in China, the expulsion of Jehovah's Witnesses from Malawi, a hanging for apostasy in the Sudan; how does the Convention apply to events in Israel–Palestine? One official was foolish enough to argue that the only way to cure intolerance in the world is by a vast educational programme on the subject of human rights. He moved towards the paradox that religious persons who are intolerant are rightly suppressed by the state.

After reading this beautifully documented account of the debates about the human right on freedom of religion, the reader is left wondering whether the drafters wasted the time of the United Nations and whether we are better served by the steady wider attempts to get justice in the world and will do better to protest not against breaches of a Convention which many do not accept but against maltreatment of individuals or groups. The book ends with moderate and sensible suggestions on what might be done.

Selwyn College, Owen Chadwick
Cambridge

Frederick Temple, archbishop of Canterbury. A life. By Peter Hinchliff. Pp. vii + 311. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1998. £40. 0 19 826386 4

In this admirable study of one of the nineteenth century's most neglected churchmen, Peter Hinchliff offers his final contribution to ecclesiastical history:

a posthumous publication, following his death in 1995, edited with minor interpolations and a concluding summary by Dr Grayson Carter. Not since Ernest Sandford's two-volume symposium of 'Memorials by Seven Friends' (1906) has any attempt been made to assess the life and career of a man whose early vicissitudes in life promised so little of what was to come. His mother was left a widow on a meagre pension when Temple was only twelve years old; he had no formal education, spending most of his days at work on their small Devonshire farm, until he went to Blundell's in 1834, where he was treated as something of a rustic oddity despite the intensity of his determination to prosper academically. Five years later he proceeded to Balliol through the good fortune of one of the closed Blundell's scholarships. From that moment he never looked back. Early poverty had endowed him with an ingrained austerity; and something of the rustic, in his harsh provincial accent and brusqueness of manner, remained with him for life. But at Balliol he discovered a mentor in his tutor, A. C. Tait; and through Tait he became part of the Balliol Broad Church circle, including Matthew Arnold and A. H. Clough and Benjamin Jowett. Prior to this, his religious upbringing had been a strictly 'pre-Tractarian High Church' piety. Unlike many of his contemporaries, both Evangelicism and the fashionable 'Newmania' seem to have left him cold. A Balliol Fellowship, together with the constant championship of Tait, now at Rugby as Arnold's successor, held out hopes of a distinguished future.

The principalship of a training college for teachers of poorhouse children – Temple's first appointment at Kneller Hall – would seem on the face of it an unlikely springboard for the headmastership of Rugby. But Tait's determination to have Temple as his successor in 1857 proved decisive. Hinchliff points out, however, that the Kneller Hall phase was far from being an irrelevant parenthesis in Temple's career, in that his whole concept of education as essentially 'Cultivation', the personal influence of the teacher on his pupils, became a lifelong conviction which was to influence his stance on the Taunton Commission and in subsequent debates on education in the House of Lords. Three years after his appointment to Rugby, the storm over his contribution to the notorious *Essays and Reviews* broke about his head. Two of the weightiest chapters in Hinchliff's book are devoted to this issue and to Temple's Bampton Lectures of 1884 on 'The relations of religion and science', brilliantly analysing, in the first place, the subtle nuances of Broad Churchmanship, and – in the later publication – the various influences on Temple's thought, an amalgam of Coleridge, Paley, Kant and Herbert Spencer, curiously ignoring their contradictory positions.

Temple's contribution to *Essays and Reviews* – only mildly injudicious in his acceptance of a progressive concept of revelation – was to impose an enduring strain on his friendship with both Tait and Jowett, and for entirely opposite reasons. Jowett felt that Temple's subsequent calculated reluctance, on becoming bishop of Exeter, to develop a liberal approach to theology amounted to betrayal. Tait, on the other hand, did his utmost to persuade Temple to dissociate himself from the other essayists in order to placate the vociferous opposition to his appointment to Exeter on the grounds of heterodoxy. It was not in Temple's nature either to compromise or to allow himself to be bullied or hectored. Perhaps there was a touch of naivety in his sustained attitude of injured innocence over the whole affair. He was certainly, at Exeter, London and Canterbury, inclined

to be very stubborn in adhering to his own convictions, while – at the same time – innovative in the extent of consultation that he encouraged at all levels. It had been so at Rugby; at Exeter he held regular diocesan conferences and meetings with his rural deans – possibly rather more cosmetic than genuine, because he always reserved final decisions to himself. Furthermore, unlike Tait and Benson, he disliked delegation and working through a closed circle of confidential advisers, much to the chagrin of Randall Davidson who had come to expect frequent calls upon his advice.

In his later years, Temple was sometimes accused of 'masterly inaction'. That Arthur Benson felt this so strongly was doubtless because overwork had been the cause of his father's early death. Sometimes, it is true, Temple's inaction, such as his failure to go to the lengths that Cardinal Manning was prepared to do in order to end the London Dock Strike of 1889, was damaging to his reputation, although Hinchliff explains the circumstances more sympathetically to Temple than has usually been the case. In other respects, inaction as displayed in his persistent determination to veto prosecutions against ritualists probably in the long run served the Church well. His attitude towards extremists was one of 'half-amused ferocity', since he believed, a little naively, that a kindly rebuke from the bishop was much more likely to be respected than the invitation to martyrdom resulting from judicial proceedings.

Temple could never be described as one of the greatest of the nineteenth-century archbishops of Canterbury. He was, after all, seventy-five when he succeeded to the primacy, in doubtful health and with failing strength. It is clear that his was always intended to be only a caretaker archiepiscopate, to allow Randall Davidson a few more years as diocesan bishop before proceeding to the office himself. In the event he had only to wait six years.

Hinchliff's achievement, based on official papers not accessible to Sandford, must be saluted as a splendidly balanced study of a man of genuine stature. The one sadness is that so scholarly and readable a book was not completed for publication before its distinguished author could appreciate the eulogy that it deserves.

CUMBRIA DAVID NEWSOME

The contribution of Cambridge ecclesiologists to the revival of Anglican choral worship, 1839–62. By Dale Adelmann. (Music in Nineteenth-century Britain.) Pp. xiv + 244. Aldershot: Ashgate, 1997. £39.50. 1 85928 389 6

Dale Adelmann has produced a detailed analysis of an important aspect of mid nineteenth-century church history, namely the changes that took place in church music and the riole of the ecclesiologists in those changes. The Cambridge Camden Society was primarily interested in questions of architecture, and it is those aspects of its work that have primarily interested both ecclesiastical and architectural historians. Adelmann shows, from the publications and archival records of the Society, and from the work of individual members in their own parishes, that the Society also made an important contribution to the changes that took place in church music. He notes that, whilst ecclesiologists had an important role in the revival of plainchant, many were quite catholic in their

promotion of what they defined as 'good' church music and did not condemn out of hand all work of the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. This is a well-researched monograph that should be read by all those interested in nineteenth-century church history and liturgy. The only criticism that might be made of it is that the author has concentrated too heavily on developments after 1839 without setting them adequately in the context of church music in the immediately preceding period. He tends to assume that the overall standard of church music in this earlier period was not very high without illustrating this assumption. Since it is now clear that earlier assumptions about other aspects of English church life in the first three decades of the nineteenth century require considerable revision, the same may well be true of the standard of church music, but this is a point which Adelmann has not really explored. He, or others, should be encouraged to do so.

BLANDFORD FORUM NIGEL YATES

The 1851 religious census. Surrey. Edited by David Robinson, transcribed by Cliff Webb. (Surrey Record Society, 35.) Pp. ccxxxvii + 165 incl. 34 ills + 3 pull-out maps. Guildford: Surrey Record Society, 1997. £25. 0 902978 10 1

Suffolk returns from the census of religious worship, 1851. Edited by T. C. B. Timmins. (Suffolk Records Society, 39.) Pp. lxxiii + 230 incl. 4 maps and 5 tables. Woodbridge: Boydell Press (for the Suffolk Records Society), 1997. £25. 0 85115 577 4

These counties provided contrasting experiences for the census takers, one a rural county with a traditional parochial structure and a predictable pattern of nonconformist organisation, the other a rapidly suburbanising area with many newly-drawn parochial districts served by new churches and a plethora of nonconformist chapels, some of them exotic. For Surrey the ancient parish of Lambeth can serve as an example: with one parish church for a population of 57,368 in the 1820s there were seventeen recorded places of Anglican worship in 1851, mostly well-filled but still only catering for 22 per cent of the population on census day; the thirty-four nonconformist chapels catered for another 10 per cent of the population so, despite this mostly voluntary endeavour in church building over two-thirds of the people did not attend a church on census day, and this proportion was significantly higher in the crowded streets and yards near Waterloo. The extremely detailed and well-illustrated introduction to the Surrey volume amounts to an excellent study of the state of churchgoing in the county at this date and makes it easy for the user to extract the above details from the edition, and there are excellent appendices on accommodation, Sunday scholars and landholding. The response to the census was good, despite the views of a minority of Anglican clergy who, like the rector of Sanderstead, considered the whole exercise 'an inquisitorial and suspicious document'. Historians are also rightly suspicious of the document but here again the editor's introduction provides the clearest guide yet to the problems of the material and the best methods of overcoming them. The opposition of those few Surrey incumbents to the census was shared by Thomas Turton, bishop of Ely, in whose diocese part of Suffolk lay. Despite this the returns from the county were more or less

complete, though non-parochial services and nonconformist gatherings were more likely to evade the registrars, so that the editor concludes that some 15 per cent of places of worship were missed. In a very helpful appendix many of these are listed and include services in workhouses and hospitals by Anglican clergy as well as cottage meetings such as that of the Baptists at Woolpit. The well-presented text reveals the usual range of practice and provision familiar to students of the census, and the parochial information is supported by local details gleaned from contemporary sources such as visitation returns and trade directories. The lengthy introduction sets out the process of the census clearly and assesses the situation of each denominational grouping, supporting these findings with well-produced maps. Unlike the Surrey volume, however, the intention is descriptive rather than analytical, and it remains for others to use this well-produced volume to write the history of religious affiliation in the county. It is disappointing also to find that the publishers have chosen to illustrate the dust jacket with an interior of a Kentish church; surely Suffolk was not so provincial as to be unable to furnish a suitable picture! These volumes add to the growing number of such editions which county record societies have recently provided, but these are largely confined to the southern regions and it is time that their counterparts north of the Trent looked to publishing this source so that similar work might be undertaken on the very different economic and social contexts to be found there. Profit will be gained from both these volumes and that for Surrey will serve such future editors well as a model.

University of York W. J. Sheils

The origins of moral theology in the United States. Three different approaches. By Charles E. Curran. (Moral Traditions and Moral Arguments.) Pp. xiii + 311. Washington, DC: Georgetown University Press 1997. £42.95 (cloth), £19.50 (paper). 0 87840 634 4; 0 87840 635 2

Charles Curran's account of the origins of Roman Catholic moral theology in the United States in the late nineteenth century, is based upon detailed studies of the different approaches to the discipline adopted by three European immigrants: Aloysius Sabetti, Thomas J. Bouquillon and John B. Hogan. He prefaces his discussion of their work by outlining the chief stages in the development of moral theology from its beginnings in the early Church onwards, but he reserves his most detailed treatment for those developments in nineteenth-century Europe which provided the ecclesiastical background of his three American moral theologians: the rise of ultramontanism; the imposition upon the Church of a neo-scholastic moral theology remote from the spirit and method of St Thomas Aquinas; and the growing use of papal encyclicals as a means of imposing a rigid and authoritarian moral discipline. He also sketches a picture of Roman Catholicism in nineteenth-century North America. Each of the three moral theologians under review adopted a distinct method of approach to his discipline. Sabetti was a seminary teacher who provided manuals for seminarians and confessors, intended as practical guides in the administration of the sacrament of penance. He belonged to an old European tradition, which began with the reforms of the Council of Trent and flowered in the work of St Alphonsus Ligouri.

Bouquillon was a university professor who pursued an intellectual method based upon the neo-scholastic approach increasingly favoured in Rome. Hogan was a more independent spirit; in his pastoral guides for priests he adopted an inductive and historically conscious approach to moral questions. Unlike Sabetti and Bouquillon, for whom obedience was automatic, Hogan was not afraid to ignore or disregard papal pronouncements. Curran shows that the history of late nineteenth-century moral theology followed a road distinct from the more familiar path of dogmatic theology. The old manualist approach, which owed little to St Thomas Aquinas, survived alongside neo-scholasticism. It was even possible to adopt a relatively independent, historically aware approach to moral teaching. (Although had Hogan lived to teach after 1910, he would not have survived the post-Modernist clamp-down.) The theological pluralism of post-Vatican II Roman Catholicism, which stands in contrast to the monolithic rigidity of the first half of the twentieth century, was not wholly unprecedented in the late Victorian era. Curran admits that his three moral theologians were not of the first rank, but his admirably clear and well-documented account of their work is a significant contribution to our understanding of the development of both moral theology and modern Roman Catholicism.

CANTERBURY CHRIST CHURCH COLLEGE PETER DAVIE

Wilhelm Herrmanns Stellung in der Ritschlschen Schule. By Joachim Weinhardt. (Beiträge zur historischen Theologie, 97.) Pp. viii + 331. Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr, 1996. DM 178. 3 16 146596 2; 0340 6741

The history of German Liberal Protestantism is clear; there's a trajectory running from Schleiermacher through the likes of Rothe, Holtzmann and Ritschl to Harnack, Herrmann and Troeltsch. And at that point Liberal Protestantism has had its day. Though it keeps on stuttering into life in various forms, and is transported to, and modified in, the USA in the twentieth century, it was the period from 1870 to 1914 when it was at its height. This at least, is how many text books and introductory lectures would have us hear the story. Some of those features may well be able to remain intact, implicitly at least, after this book. But the text books and lectures will nevertheless need substantial revision. Building upon some of the revisionary work already undertaken on Ritschl and his school (for example Schäfer, Mueller, Richmond, Kuhlmann), and on the early Barth (for example Beintker, Spieckermann, van der Kooi, though not McCormack's 1995 work, which presumably appeared too late to be considered), this impressive piece of intellectual archaeology examines Wilhelm Herrmann's relationship to the so-called 'Ritschl school'. After a thorough examination of Ritschl's legacy, and of the content and impact of Ritschl's thought within the politics of German academic life in the closing decades of the nineteenth century, Weinhardt shows how Herrmann effectively shifted from support for Ritschl's 'revelatory positivism', which preserved Christianity's distinctiveness, to a defence of a form of natural theology which blurred the boundaries between Christianity and other religious traditions. The shift was not always clear-cut and unambiguous, however, and there is clearly a sense in which Herrmann remained a Ritschlian, through his (ultimately only apparent) Christocentrism,

and despite other points at which he clearly shifted, for example in moving away from the thoroughly systematic character of Ritschl's theology. Weinhardt's study concludes at the point where it began: asking questions about Barth. Weinhardt notes that Barth can be seen to be a kind of conservative Ritschlian, in the sense that what repelled him about Herrmann merely drew him back to features of Ritschl's theology against which Herrmann himself had reacted, though Barth did not fully appreciate this. This is an excellent study and it has crucial implications not only for the history of theology, but also for the way in which contemporary theological discussions (especially the liberal/post-liberal debate) can be informed by this history. The role of experience in theology, for example, surfaces as a major sticking-point (and the discussion on pp. 247–53 is particularly helpful). I have some quibbles. Arguably, because Herrmann is the focus, his inconsistencies are more apparent than those of others, and the extent of the Ritschl–Barth continuity (long-known, but rarely as closely analysed as here) is accentuated all the more. But other thinkers in the period will have had their inconsistencies too. Also, there is further relevant work in English – some of which has been around for a while – which is not considered (Barnett, Jodock, Fisher, Wyman). Interplay between German- and English-speaking theology is currently not at its most creative, and efforts need to be expended to ensure that more of it happens. That said, this remains a splendid study. The book is even worth buying for the brilliantly-nuanced clarification of different types of Ritschlianism, and its explanation of why Ritschl, in a number of senses (not least historical) was never a liberal.

University College of Ripon and York St John Clive Marsh

John Henry Newman. Universal revelation. By Francis McGrath, foreword by Gerard Tracey. Pp. 169. Macon, Ga: Mercer University Press, 1997 (first publ. Tunbridge Wells: Burns & Oates). $30. 0 86554 603 7

This book began life as an Oxford doctoral dissertation, and my impression is that the original thesis has been drastically abridged, and certainly rather hastily edited for publication as a book. It often seemed as if the author must have gone through the original typescript highlighting key passages, especially quotations from Newman. There are some verbless sentences which are little more than notes. The result is a book consisting of a series of extremely brief chapters which read somewhat abruptly. The title, too, is misleading as this study is concerned with the whole of Newman's theology of revelation, not just his views on the possibility of universal revelation. It is a pity that McGrath presumably failed to find a university press which would publish his original study in its entirety, as there is no doubting his competence and scholarship. The first part of the book deals with the development of Newman's understanding of revelation, beginning with his early evangelical years. The next two chapters are concerned with what Newman learned from Bishop Butler, Justin Martyr and Clement of Alexandria about the possibility of divine revelation outside Judaism and Christianity, conscience in particular being a channel for revelation that is available for all human beings. Chapters iv and v deal with Newman's reaction to liberal Anglicanism during the Oxford Movement, especially his attack on the way in

which Latitudinarians ironically insisted on limiting God's revelation to Scripture to the exclusion of the tradition of the Church, as well as refusing to accept any doctrine which appeared to contain traces of Platonism, Judaism or paganism, as part of Christian revelation. As a Catholic, Newman did not abandon his idea of universal revelation, and McGrath ascribes the disappointing lack of reference in the final chapter of the *Grammar of assent* on natural and revealed religion to Newman's anxiety not to stir up more trouble for himself at Rome during the controversy over papal infallibility and the Ultramontane attempt to have an extreme definition passed by the First Vatican Council. Part II of the book deals with Newman's view of the external and internal evidences for revelation, with his theory of doctrinal development, with his insistence on the integral connexion of revelation with mystery, and finally with his thoughts on revelation and biblical inspiration. An epilogue all too briefly considers Newman in relation to some twentieth-century theologies of revelation.

CAMPION HALL,
OXFORD IAN KER

Anglican orders. The documents in the debate. Edited by Christopher Hill and Edward Yarnold SJ. Pp. xiv + 356. Norwich: Canterbury Press, 1997. £30. 1 85311 163 5

From Malines to ARCIC. The Malines Conversations commemorated. Edited by A. Denaux and J. Dick. (Bibliotheca Ephemeridum Theologicarum Lovaniensium, 130.) Louvain: Leuven University Press/Peeters, 1997. B.Fr. 1,800. 90 6186 795 9; 90 6831 916 7

If ever an event in the history of the Christian Church represented the triumph of hope over experience, then that event was surely the Malines Conversations of 1921–8. These two books offer accounts not only of the documents surrounding the publication of *Apostolicae Curae*, and the Conversations held twenty-five years later, but also serve as a reminder of the quality of vision, tenacity and friendship displayed by the protagonists of this theological drama in two acts.

In preparing their fascinating collection, Hill and Yarnold, already together the authors of the useful *Anglicans and Roman Catholics: the search for unity* (SPCK) and both former members of ARCIC, have not enjoyed access to the archive of the Congregation of the Doctrine of the Faith, but have built upon the researches of Fr Rambaldi SJ, who has searched out the documents in other archives and libraries over a number of years. They present the documents in a way which illustrates the explorations of the theological commission of 1896, together with a scholarly introduction, giving an account of the theological issues, and set the whole question in the context of the continuing work of ARCIC, and of the work on Apostolicity and Succession, undertaken in the course of the conversations leading to the Porvoo Agreement (1993) between the Anglican Churches of the British Isles and the Nordic and Baltic Lutheran Churches.

But the story of Halifax and Portal's failed attempt, and of their friendship, does not end with the disappointments of *Apostolicae Curae*: twenty-five years later their mutual determination led them to this 'most astonishing adventure', a renewed dialogue which became a true meeting of minds and which bore fruit

long after their deaths, in the years following Vatican II. Adelbert Denaux and John Dick have collected the addresses given at the seventy-fifth anniversary commemoration of the Malines Conversations, together with a selection of the contemporary documents, and essays on the work of ARCIC by Christopher Hill and Jean Tillard. They conclude with a cumulative bibliography of ARCIC 1966–96.

Both volumes set the endeavours of the past in the context of present and future relationships, and Hill and Yarnold end their book with Halifax's moving letter to Portal, written in the week following the publication of *Apostolicae Curae*:

> Assuredly it was the love of souls that moved us: we did not think of anything else. May something be done to put an end to the divisions among those who love our Lord Jesus Christ – those divisions that keep so many souls far away from Him – so that those who love each other, communicating at the same altars, may love each other more.... There are some bitter things which are worth all the joys of earth, and I prefer, many thousand times, to suffer with you in such a cause, than to triumph over the whole world.

COUNCIL FOR CHRISTIAN UNITY, LONDON — FLORA WINFIELD

The religious policy of the Stalinist state. A case study. The Central Standing Commission on Religious Questions, 1929–1938. By Arto Luukkanen. (Studia Historica, 57.) Pp. 214 incl. 9 ills. Helsinki: Suomen Historiallinen Suera, 1997. 951 710 068 X; 0081 6493

A key flaw of much of the literature on Soviet religious policy has been its tendency to ignore developments in the wider study of the Soviet Union. Thus students of religion have tended to operate on the assumption that through most of the Soviet period a monolithic state singlemindedly pursued the goal of eliminating religion, in particular during the Stalinist period. Yet many recent studies of the 1930s and 1940s suggest a more nuanced and chaotic picture in which central aspirations clashed with the age-old realities of Russian inertia and local resistance to central control. Lukkanen's book, though perhaps too dismissive of the earlier literature (pp. 39–42), has the great virtue of integrating the study of religion into our broader understanding of the Soviet polity. The study focuses largely on the 1930s when the Stalinist state was being created and, making use of newly available archival material, examines the work of the Standing Commission on Religious Questions. Noting that Stalin exhibited little personal enthusiasm for the anti-religious struggle, other than a general desire to assert political control over all aspects of social life, Luukkanen sees much atheist activity as the product of debates within the Communist Party. None the less, the so-called Cult Commission was given clear objectives, namely 'to create a uniform method and to co-ordinate procedures in dealing with religious organisations'. In early 1930 the Communist Party Politburo took the decision to pursue the mass closure of churches, a task that was to be carried out by many agencies but to be overseen by the Commission. Yet in practice this body struggled as members failed to attend meetings at the centre, and as local officials repeatedly ignored its advice. Luukkanen concludes that here as in other areas of public life the seemingly all powerful central state had considerable difficulty

in dealing with the periphery for local personnel 'had their own stubborn network of power – Soviet "anarchy in the middle"' (p. 181). And much of his evidence suggests that it was often local officials who adopted harsher policies towards religious institutions, rather than the Stalinist state. All this leads Luukkanen to emphasise the need for further study, with a greater focus than hitherto on centre–periphery relations. At the same time he rejects the traditional interpretation which depicts a purposeful state pursuing a centralised and well-thought out plan to eliminate religious influences, though this does not preclude the conclusion that many within the party elite hoped to see the eventual elimination of religious activity.

UNIVERSITY OF ST ANDREWS JOHN ANDERSON

Eternity in time. Christopher Dawson and the Catholic idea of history. Edited by Stratford Caldecott and John Morrill. Pp. vii + 214. Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark (for The Centre for Faith & Culture), 1997. £19.95. 0 567 08548 1

Christopher Dawson (1889–1970) came late to recognition. He was sixty-eight when he gained his first full-time academic post as Professor of Roman Catholic Studies at Harvard. He was overlooked in the 1961–70 volume of the *DNB*, stealing in through the back door in the supplementary volume of *Missing persons*. A pupil of Ernest Barker, he is accurately described there as a 'historian of ideas and social cultures'. The historian, Dawson believed, anticipating Collingwood, needed not only to study documents and assemble facts, but also to acquire a 'vision' of the social life of a period different from his own. His most ambitious project was a five-volume history of culture, of which only three were completed: *The age of the Gods* (1928), *Progress and religion* (1929) and *The making of Europe* (1932). This undertaking was not calculated to appeal to British academic historians for several reasons: he regarded the writing of history not just as an intellectual but as a moral enterprise; he was not a specialist but a polymath, who moved with ease through the whole range of world history; not content with establishing facts he practised 'metahistory', understood as the investigation of 'the meaning of history and the cause and significance of historical change'; like Acton, he believed that a civilisation can be understood only in relation to its religion; he maintained that there was such a thing as 'Catholic history', not just in the sense of a history of the Catholic Church or an apologia for it after the manner of Belloc, but in the sense of general history written from a Catholic perspective, as instanced by St Augustine. His rejection of the world-views of Wells and Toynbee did not prevent him from admiring their unifying grand designs. The volume under review is for the most part a collection of the papers read at a conference held at Westminster College to mark the silver jubilee of Dawson's death. His daughter, Christina Scott, sets the scene with a biographical chapter. Aidan Nichols OP, writes on Dawson's Catholic background. Francesco Cervantes's chapter on Dawson's vision of a Europe united by a common faith and classical culture leads the reader to reflect on the shallowness of the search for European unity today. Russell Sparkes considers the contemporary relevance of Dawson's critique of the cultures of ancient Rome and the capitalism of the 1930s. Dermot Quinn and Francesca Murphy discuss the meaning and possibility

of 'Catholic' history. Glenn Olsen seeks light from the parallel quest for a 'Catholic' philosophy. Michael O'Brien illustrates the working of historical imagination. The editors, John Morrill and Stratford Caldecott, add respectively an introduction and a conclusion. This collection is to be welcomed as a step towards the rehabilitation of the reputation of an erudite and prophetic scholar and an exquisite stylist.

CAMPION HALL, EDWARD YARNOLD SJ
OXFORD

Studium und Alltag hinter Stacheldraht. Birger Forells Beitrag zum theologisch–pädagogischen Lehrbetrieb im Norton Camp, England (1945–1948). By Klaus Loscher. (Neukirchener Theologische Dissertationen und Habilitationen, 12.) Pp. xiv + 520 incl. 36 ills. Neukirchen-Vluyn: Neukirchener, 1997. DM 98 (paper). 3 7887 1632 0

This labour of love, which doubled as a successful doctoral thesis, ought to be in every British theological library, simply as a matter of record. Coping with German prisoners of war was no great British problem until the final stages of the war when they came in in great numbers. Norton Camp, on the fringes of Welbeck Abbey park in Nottinghamshire, differed from other POW establishments in that it came to be selected for the internment of men looking to a theological training, or to careers as teachers or youth-club leaders. The initiative had, of course, to come from outside Germany; it was predictably taken by Bishop Bell, who, in a moment of inspiration, got Birger Forell, a former chaplain to the Swedish embassy in Berlin, and now incumbent of a parish in southern Sweden, to do the leg-work. He somehow combined his parish responsibilities with getting the YMCA to finance the venture with (mostly) American money, recruiting *Dozenten* among the POWs, getting books from Oxford and the huge private library of Nathaniel Micklem, and an absolutely star-studded cast of occasional teachers from Britain and abroad. The range of assistance both confessional and geographical was quite extraordinary, the home team including Micklem (on the theology of reconciliation), H. H. Rowley, Nicholas Zernov, Franz Hildebrandt (Bonhoeffer's old friend), Gabriel Hebert, Charles Cranfield and Victor Gollancz, the away team including Anders Nygren, Otto Eissfeldt and Markus Barth. The object was both to force up the standard to the point where the *Landeskirchen* and German universities would accept Norton examinations, and to give a religious impulse to German prison camps elsewhere. The German Churches being willing to authorise lay administration of the sacraments, both these objects were fully achieved. Not the least contribution to a camp which sustained a happy atmosphere and an active musical as well as intellectual and athletic life, was made by the Commandant, Major Boughton. He was a Roman Catholic who saw that provision was made for Catholics in the camp, and more importantly, opened the minds of his charges to a new concept with the text in his office 'Christianity with a Smile'; he also adroitly evaded non-fraternisation regulations to permit sharing with local churches and matches with local football teams. And the results in the four years before the camp was closed by repatriation? 150 *Vikare* and other church officers, who subsequently numbered

twenty-six professors at every level including theologians of the calibre of a Jürgen Moltmann and church historians like J. F. G. Goeters, ninety pastors, a series of church dignitaries, two church music directors and a member of a *Landtag*. A remarkable end to bitter military conflict, and hardly the result of the camp porridge, here defined for German readers as 'a milk soup with oat-flakes and raisins'!

PETERSFIELD W. R. WARD