**Online Appendix – Frank Bandau: What Explains the Electoral Crisis of Social Democracy? A Systematic Review of the Literature. *Government and Opposition*.**

Figure A1: Flow Diagram

**Identification of studies via *Web of Science***

81 duplicate records removed

702 records identified from database1

**Identification**

621 records screened for eligibility2

591 records excluded

**Screening**

30 records assessed as eligible

21 records identified through snowball research3

51 records included in systematic review

Categorization of records:

Evidence on aggregate level (n = 14)

Cross-country evidence on individual level (n = 20)

Country evidence on individual (or meso) level (n = 27)

**Included**

1 Search protocol: „social democracy“ AND crisis = 78 results; „social democr\*“ AND elect\* = 289 results; „mainstream left“ AND elect\* = 17 results; „mainstream parties“ AND elect\* = 163 results; „left parties“ AND elect\* = 99 results;

„social democr\*“ AND „vote share“ = 12 results; „vote switching“ = 44 results

2 Peer-reviewed English-language journal article. Criteria for inclusion:

* Focus on Western Europe (excluding studies on left parties in Eastern Europe)
* Focus on determinants of social democratic vote share.
* Focus on drivers of individual voting intentions for/against social democrats.
* Provision of other forms of evidence to verify/falsify at least one of the outlined hypotheses.

3 Bibliographical search applying cross-referencing techniques.

Adapted from Page MJ, McKenzie JE, Bossuyt PM, Boutron I, Hoffmann TC, Mulrow CD, et al. (2021): The PRISMA 2020 Statement: An Updated Guideline for Reporting Systematic Reviews. BMJ 2021;372:n71. doi: 10.1136/bmj.n71

Table A1: Empirical Evidence for Competing Explanations of Social Democratic Crisis

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | **N** | **Period** | **Sociological** | **Materialist** | **Ideational** | **Institution.** |
| **Aggregate Level** |  |  | H1 | H2 | H3 | H4 | H5 | H6 | H7 | H8 |
| Abou-Chadi/Wagner 2019 | 22 | 1975-latest |  |  |  |  | - | - |  | - |
| Abou-Chadi/Wagner 2020 | 13 | 2002-2016 |  |  |  |  |  | - |  |  |
| Alonso/Ruiz-Rufino 2020 | 12 | 1999-2015 |  |  | + | + |  |  |  |  |
| Arndt/Rennwald 2016 | 16 | 2002-2010 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | + |
| Benedetto et al. 2020(1)*a* | 27 | 1989-2017 | + |  | - | + |  |  | + |  |
| Benedetto et al. 2020(2)*a* | 27 | 1989-2017 | - |  | - | + |  |  |  |  |
| Bojar 2018*b* | 21 | 1970-2015 |  |  |  | - |  |  |  |  |
| Giger/Nelson 2011 | 18 | 1970-2002 |  |  |  | - |  |  |  |  |
| Horn 2020 | 18 | 1971-2011 |  |  |  | + |  |  |  |  |
| Keman 2011 | 20 | 1975-2005 |  |  |  |  | - |  |  |  |
| Loxbo et al. 2021 | 16 | 1975-2014 |  |  |  | ~ | ~ | ~ |  | - |
| Milner 2021*c* | 15 | 1990-2018 |  |  | + |  |  |  |  |  |
| Polacko 2021 | 22 | 1965-2019 |  |  |  |  | ~ | - |  | - |
| Rennwald/Pontusson 2021 | 19 | 2001-2015 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | + |
| Schumacher et al. 2013*d* | 14 | 1970-2002 |  |  |  | + |  |  |  |  |
| **Voter Level** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Abou-Chadi/Wagner 2019 | 17 | 2002-2014 |  | ~ |  |  | - | - |  | + |
| Abou-Chadi/Wagner 2020 | 13 | 2002-2016 |  | - |  |  | - | - |  | + |
| Arndt 2014a | 16 | 1992-2006 |  | ~ |  |  | ~ | ~ |  | + |
| Arndt/Rennwald 2016 | 16 | 2002-2010 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | + |
| Benedetto et al. 2020 | 14 | 2002-2016 | + |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Best 2011 | 8 | 1975-2002 | + |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Gingrich 2017 | 16 | 1978-2014 |  | + |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Gingrich/Häusermann 2015 | 15 | 1972-2012 |  | + |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Grant 2021 | 22 | 1996-2006 |  |  |  |  |  |  | ~ |  |
| Hobolt/Tilley 2016 | 17 | 2010-2014 |  |  | + | + |  |  | + |  |
| Kweon 2018 | 18 | 1999-2015 |  |  |  | + |  |  |  | + |
| Marx 2014 | 15 | 2007-2011 |  | - |  |  |  |  |  | + |
| Milner 2021 | 15 | 2002-2016 |  |  | - |  |  |  |  | + |
| Mosimann et al. 2019 | 11 | 2010-2016 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | + |
| Polacko 2021 | 21 | 1996-2018 |  |  |  |  | ~ | + |  | + |
| Rennwald/Pontusson 2021 | 16 | 2001-2015 |  | + |  |  |  |  |  | + |
| Rovny/Rovny 2017 | 17 | 2002-2010 |  | + |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Spoon/Klüver 2019 | 16 | 2001-2013 |  |  |  |  |  |  | + |  |
| Spoon/Klüver 2020 | 6 | 1998-2013 |  |  |  |  |  | + |  |  |
| Turnbull-Dugarte 2020 | 15 | 2002-2017 |  |  | + |  |  |  |  |  |

*Notes:* (+) = support for hypothesis, (-) = no support for hypothesis, (~) = conditional support for hypothesis.

*a* (1) = levels of social democratic vote shares, (2) = changes in social democratic vote shares.

*b* Study relies on polls instead of actual vote shares.

*e* Results based on the regional level.

*d* Study tests for ‘parties with positive welfare image’ which includes social democratic parties.

Table A2: Empirical Evidence from Country Studies

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Comparative Studies** |  | H1 | H2 | H3 | H4 | H5 | H6 | H7 | H8 |
| Arndt 2013a*a* | DEN, GER, SWE, UK – 1991-2009 |  |  |  | + | + |  |  |  |
| Karreth et al. 2013 | GER, SWE, UK – 1979-2010 |  |  |  |  | + |  | + |  |
| **Germany** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Chou et al. 2021 | GER – 2016-2017 |  | + |  |  |  | - |  |  |
| Elff/Roßteutscher 2011 | GER – 1994-2009 | - |  |  |  |  |  | + |  |
| Elff/Roßteutscher 2017 | GER – 1994-2013 | - |  |  |  |  |  | + |  |
| Fossati et al. 2021 | GER – 2009 |  |  |  | + |  |  |  |  |
| Pardos-Prado et al. 2014 | GER – 1999-2009 |  |  |  |  |  | + |  |  |
| Schwander/Manow 2017 | GER – 1998-2009 |  |  |  | + | + |  |  |  |
| Spoon/Klüver 2020 | GER – 2013-2017 |  |  |  |  |  | - |  |  |
| Wurthmann et al. 2021 | GER – 2017 |  |  |  |  |  | + |  |  |
| **Nordic Countries** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Arndt 2013b | DEN – 1993-2001 |  |  |  | + | + |  |  |  |
| Arndt 2014b | DEN – 1998-2007 |  |  |  |  |  |  | + |  |
| Arndt/Rennwald 2016 | SWE – 1985-2010 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | + |
| Dahlström/Sundell 2012 | SWE – 2010 |  |  |  |  |  | - |  |  |
| Hjorth/Larsen 2020 | DEN – 2019 |  | + |  |  |  | - |  |  |
| Jylhä et al. 2019 | SWE - 2018 |  |  |  |  |  | + |  |  |
| Koivula et al. 2020 | FIN – 2016/17 |  |  |  |  |  |  | + |  |
| Lindvall/Rueda 2014 | SWE – 1994-2010 |  | + |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Oskarson/Demker 2015 | SWE – 1986-2010 |  |  |  |  |  |  | + |  |
| **United Kindom** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Evans/Mellon 2016 | UK – 2004-2015 |  |  |  |  |  | + |  |  |
| Evans/Tilley 2012a | UK – 1959-2006 | - |  |  |  |  |  | + | + |
| Evans/Tilley 2012b | UK – 1983-2010 | - |  |  |  | + |  | + |  |
| Gingrich 2017 | UK – 1978-2014 |  | + |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Heath 2015 | UK – 1964-2010 | - |  |  |  |  |  | + |  |
| Heath 2018 | UK – 1964-2010 | - |  |  |  |  |  | + |  |
| O’Grady 2019 | UK – 1987-2007 |  |  |  |  |  |  | + |  |
| **Other Countries** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Gaasendam et al. 2021 | BEL – 2007 |  |  |  |  |  | + | + |  |
| Rennwald/Evans 2014 | AUT, CHE – 1971-2008  |  | + |  |  |  |  |  |  |

*Notes:* (+) = support for hypothesis, (-) = no support for hypothesis

*a* No journal article.

References

**Abou-Chadi** **T and Wagner** **M** (2019) The Electoral Appeal of Party Strategies in Postindustrial Societies. When Can the Mainstream Left Succeed? *Journal of Politics* **81**, 1405–1419.

**Abou-Chadi** **T and Wagner** **M** (2020) Electoral Fortunes of Social Democratic Parties. Do Second Dimension Positions Matter? *Journal of European Public Policy* **27**, 246–272.

**Alonso** **S and Ruiz-Rufino** **R** (2020) The Costs of Responsibility for the Political Establishment of the Eurozone (1999–2015). *Party Politics* **26**, 317-333.

**Arndt** **C** (2013a) *The Electoral Consequences of Third Way Welfare State Reforms: Social Democracy’s Transformation and Its Political Costs*. Amsterdam University Press: Amsterdam.

**Arndt C** (2013b) The Electoral Consequences of Welfare State Reforms for the Danish Social Democrats. *World Political Science* **9**, 319–335.

**Arndt** **C** (2014a) Social Democracy’s Mobilization of New Constituencies. The Role of Electoral Systems. *Party Politics* **20**, 778–790.

**Arndt** **C** (2014b) Beating Social Democracy on Its Own Turf. Issue Convergence as Winning Formula for the Centre-Right in Universal Welfare States. *Scandinavian Political Studies* **37**, 149–170.

**Arndt** **C and Rennwald** **L** (2016) Union Members at the Polls in Diverse Trade Union Landscapes. *European Journal of Political Research* **55**, 702–722.

**Benedetto** **G, Hix** **S and Mastrorocco** **N** (2020) The Rise and Fall of Social Democracy, 1918-2017. *American Political Science Review* **114**, 928–939.

**Best** **RE** (2011) The Declining Electoral Relevance of Traditional Cleavage Groups. *European Political Science Review* **3**, 279–300.

**Bojar** **A** (2018) The Electoral Advantage of the Left in Times of Fiscal Adjustment. *European Political Science Review* **10**, 291–322.

**Bornschier** **S** (2010) The New Cultural Divide and the Two-Dimensional Political Space in Western Europe. *West European Politics* **33**, 419–444.

**Chou** **W** et al. (2021) Competing for Loyalists? How Party Positioning Affects Populist Radical Right Voting. *Comparative Political Studies* **54**, 2226-2260.

**Dahlström** **C and Sundell** **A** (2012) A Losing Gamble. How Mainstream Parties Facilitate Anti-Immigrant Party Success. *Electoral Studies* **31**, 353–363.

**Elff** **M and Roßteutscher** **S** (2011) Stability or Decline? Class, Religion and the Vote in Germany. *German Politics* **20**, 107–127.

**Elff** **M and Roßteutscher** **S** (2017) Social Cleavages and Electoral Behaviour in Long-Term Perspective. Alignment without Mobilisation? *German Politics* **26**, 12–34.

**Evans** **G and Mellon** **J** (2016) Working Class Votes and Conservative Losses: Solving the UKIP Puzzle. *Parliamentary Affairs* **69**, 464–479.

**Evans** **GC and Tilley** **J** (2012a) How Parties Shape Class Politics. Explaining the Decline of the Class Basis of Party Support. *British Journal of Political Science* **42**, 137–161.

**Evans** **GC and Tilley** **J** (2012b) The Depoliticization of Inequality and Redistribution: Explaining the Decline of Class Voting. *The Journal of Politics* **74**, 963–976.

**Fossati** **F and Trein** **P** (2021) Cobbler, Stick to Your Last? Social Democrats’ Electoral Returns from Labour Market Policy. *Journal of Social Policy* **50**, 188–208.

**Gaasendam** **CR** et al. (2021) Lost Connection? The Attitudinal and Ideological (In)congruence of Social Democracy’s Elites, Members and Voters in Flanders-Belgium. *Acta Politica* **56**, 395–415.

**Giger** **N and Nelson** **M** (2011) The Electoral Consequences of Welfare State Retrenchment. Blame Avoidance or Credit Claiming in the Era of Permanent Austerity? *European Journal of Political Research* **50**, 1–23.

**Gingrich** **JR** (2017) A New Progressive Coalition? The European Left in a Time of Change. *The Political Quarterly* **88**, 39–51.

**Gingrich** **JR and Häusermann** **S** (2015) The Decline of the Working Class Vote, the Reconfiguration of the Welfare Support Coalition and Consequences for the Welfare State. *Journal of European Social Policy* **25**, 50–75.

**Grant** **ZP** (2021) Crisis and Convergence. How the Combination of a Weak Economy and Mainstream Party Ideological De-Polarization Fuels Anti-System Support. *Comparative Political Studies* **54**, 1256-1291.

**Heath** **O** (2015) Policy Representation, Social Representation and Class Voting in Britain. *British Journal of Political Science* **45**, 173–193.

**Heath** **O** (2018) Policy Alienation, Social Alienation and Working-Class Abstention in Britain, 1964-2010. *British Journal of Political Science* **48**, 1053–1073.

**Hjorth** **F and Larsen** **MV** (2020) When Does Accommodation Work? Electoral Effects of Mainstream Left Position Taking on Immigration. *British Journal of Political Science*. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1017/S0007123420000563>.

**Hobolt** **SB and Tilley** **J** (2016) Fleeing the Centre. The Rise of Challenger Parties in the Aftermath of the Euro Crisis. *West European Politics* **39**, 971–991.

**Horn** **A** (2021) The Asymmetric Long-Term Electoral Consequences of Unpopular Reforms. Why Retrenchment Really Is a Losing Game for Left Parties. *Journal of European Public Policy* **28**, 1494–1517.

**Jylhä KM, Rydgren J and Strimling P** (2019) Radical Right‐Wing Voters from Right and Left: Comparing Sweden Democrat Voters Who Previously Voted for the Conservative Party or the Social Democratic Party. *Scandinavian Political Studies* **42**, 220–244.

**Karreth** **J, Polk** **J and Allen** **CS** (2013) Catchall or Catch and Release? The Electoral Consequences of Social Democratic Parties’ March to the Middle in Western Europe. *Comparative Political Studies* **46**, 791–822.

**Keman** **H** (2011) Third Ways and Social Democracy. The Right Way to Go? *British Journal of Political Science* **41**, 671–680.

**Koivula A, Koiranen I, Saarinen, A and Keipi T** (2020) Social and Ideological Representativeness: A Comparison of Political Party Members and Supporters in Finland after the Realignment of Major Parties. *Party Politics* **26**, 807–821.

**Kweon** **Y** (2018) Types of Labor Market Policy and the Electoral Behavior of Insecure Workers. *Electoral Studies* **55**, 1–10.

**Lindvall** **J and Rueda** **D** (2014) The Insider-Outsider Dilemma. *British Journal of Political Science* **44**, 460–475.

**Loxbo** **K** et al. (2021) The Decline of Western European Social Democracy. Exploring the Transformed Link between Welfare State Generosity and the Electoral Strength of Social Democratic Parties, 1975-2014. *Party Politics* **27**, 430–441.

**Marx** **P** (2014) Labour Market Risks and Political Preferences. The Case of Temporary Employment. *European Journal of Political Research* **53**, 136–159.

**Milner** **HV** (2021) Voting for Populism in Europe: Globalization, Technological Change, and the Extreme Right. *Comparative Political Studies* **54**, 2286-2320.

**Mosimann** **N, Rennwald** **L and Zimmermann** **A** (2019) The Radical Right, the Labour Movement and the Competition for the Workers’ Vote. *Economic and Industrial Democracy* **40**, 65–90.

**O’Grady** **T** (2019) Careerists versus Coal-Miners. Welfare Reforms and the Substantive Representation of Social Groups in the British Labour Party. *Comparative Political Studies* **52**, 544–578.

**Oskarson** **M and Demker** **M** (2015) Room for Realignment. The Working-Class Sympathy for Sweden Democrats. *Government and Opposition* **50**, 629–651.

**Pardos-Prado** **S, Bram** **L and Sagarzazu** **I** (2014) Immigration and Electoral Change in Mainstream Political Space. *Political Behavior* **36**, 847–875.

**Polacko** **M** (2022) The Rightward Shift and Electoral Decline of Social Democratic Parties under Increasing Inequality. *West European Politics* **45**, 665–692.

**Rennwald L and Evans GC** (2014) When Supply Creates Demand. Social Democratic Party Strategies and the Evolution of Class Voting. *West European Politics* **37**, 1108–1135.

**Rennwald** **L and Pontusson** **J** (2021) ‘Paper Stones’ Revisited. Class Voting, Unionization and the Electoral Decline of the Mainstream Left. *Perspectives on Politics* **19**, 36–54.

**Rovny** **AE and Rovny** **J** (2017) Outsiders at the Ballot Box: Operationalizations and Political Consequences of the Insider–Outsider Dualism. *Socio-Economic Review* **15**, 161-185.

**Schumacher** **G, Vis** **B and van Kersbergen** **K** (2013) Political Parties’ Welfare Image, Electoral Punishment and Welfare State Retrenchment. *Comparative European Politics* **11**, 1–21.

**Schwander** **H and Manow** **P** (2017) ‘Modernize and Die’? German Social Democracy and the Electoral Consequences of the Agenda 2010. *Socio-Economic Review* **15**, 117–134.

**Spoon** **J-J and Klüver** **H** (2019) Party Convergence and Vote Switching. Explaining Mainstream Party Decline across Europe. *European Journal of Political Research* **58**, 1021–1042.

**Spoon** **J-J and Klüver** **H** (2020) Responding to Far Right Challengers. Does Accommodation Pay Off? *Journal of European Public Policy* **27**, 273–291.

**Turnbull-Dugarte** **SJ** (2020) Why Vote When You Cannot Choose? EU Intervention and Political Participation in Times of Constraint. *European Union Politics* **21**, 406–428.

**Wurthmann** **LC** et al. (2021) Many Losers – One Winner? An Examination of Vote Switching to the AfD in the 2017 German Federal Election Using VAA Data. *Party Politics* **27**, 870-882.