Appendix of the article ‘Does the Iron Curtain Still Exist? The Convergence in Electoral Volatility between Eastern and Western Europe’, *Government and Opposition,* *An International Journal of Comparative Politics.*

Vincenzo Emanuele, Alessandro Chiaramonte and Sorina Soare

**Table A1**

*Coefficients of correlations between our data and other available volatility datasets, by volatility component and region*

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|   |   | Lane and Ersson (2007) | Powell and Tucker (2014) | Mainwaring, Gervasoni and España (2016) |
|   |   |
|   |   |
| All nations | TV | 0.91 | 0.80 | 0.89 |
| RegV |   | 0.63 | 0.86 |
| AltV |   | 0.80 | 0.75 |
| *N* | 116 | 139 | 97 |
| Western Europe | TV | 0.93 | 0.63 | 0.91 |
| RegV |   | 0.32 | 0.83 |
| AltV |   | 0.93 | 0.87 |
| *N* | 80 | 95 | 67 |
| Central and Eastern Europe | TV | 0.74 | 0.54 | 0.57 |
| RegV |   | 0.45 | 0.76 |
| AltV |   | 0.59 | 0.48 |
| *N* | 36 | 44 | 30 |

*Note*: Lane and Ersson (2007) do not disentangle electoral volatility into its internal components. This is why only the coefficients of correlation for TV are reported.

**Table A2**

*Total volatility, regeneration and alteration by country and electoral period*

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|   | RegV | AltV | TV |
| Country | Mean | 1990-2009 | 2010-2016 | Mean | 1990-2009 | 2010-2016 | Mean | 1990-2009 | 2010-2016 |
| Austria | 1.6 | 1.2 | 3.9 | 10.6 | 10.7 | 9.8 | 13.0 | 12.6 | 15.7 |
| Belgium | 1.2 | 1.4 | 0.9 | 10.1 | 9.5 | 11.6 | 12.1 | 11.7 | 12.8 |
| Bulgaria | 12.5 | 15.0 | 6.3 | 17.9 | 20.3 | 11.9 | 33.9 | 39.1 | 21.0 |
| Croatia | 4.6 | 1.0 | 6.9 | 8.9 | 10.3 | 8.0 | 15.2 | 13.1 | 16.6 |
| Cyprus | 1.6 | 1.2 | 2.4 | 6.8 | 6.6 | 7.3 | 9.0 | 8.2 | 10.7 |
| Czech Republic | 9.7 | 5.4 | 20.5 | 10.5 | 12.6 | 15.5 | 25.3 | 20.2 | 37.9 |
| Denmark | 0.9 | 0.8 | 1.2 | 13.5 | 9.4 | 13.9 | 11.8 | 10.6 | 15.2 |
| Estonia | 7.3 | 9.8 | 3.5 | 15.1 | 18.6 | 9.8 | 23.9 | 29.7 | 15.1 |
| Finland | 1.1 | 1.5 | 0.0 | 8.9 | 8.0 | 11.1 | 10.8 | 10.6 | 11.5 |
| France | 3.7 | 4.4 | 0.7 | 16.1 | 14.7 | 21.8 | 20.6 | 19.8 | 23.6 |
| Germany | 1.2 | 0.9 | 2.9 | 8.0 | 7.1 | 13.2 | 10.2 | 9.1 | 16.8 |
| Greece | 2.6 | 0.4 | 6.6 | 9.1 | 5.1 | 16.0 | 13.0 | 6.7 | 24.0 |
| Hungary | 5.6 | 4.0 | 8.8 | 16.2 | 17.3 | 14.2 | 23.0 | 22.3 | 24.3 |
| Iceland | 4.1 | 2.8 | 8.3 | 12.3 | 8.4 | 24.1 | 17.1 | 11.8 | 32.9 |
| Ireland | 1.4 | 0.3 | 3.7 | 12.2 | 7.6 | 21.3 | 15.4 | 9.5 | 27.2 |
| Italy | 7.2 | 5.3 | 18.7 | 11.7 | 11.0 | 16.1 | 20.5 | 17.9 | 36.7 |
| Latvia | 11.0 | 14.5 | 7.5 | 21.1 | 21.5 | 20.7 | 34.0 | 37.9 | 30.1 |
| Lithuania | 9.9 | 10.9 | 8.0 | 22.3 | 23.0 | 20.9 | 33.7 | 35.5 | 30.2 |
| Luxembourg | 0.9 | 0.5 | 2.2 | 6.1 | 5.8 | 7.0 | 7.6 | 7.1 | 9.6 |
| Malta | 0.2 | 0.3 | 0.0 | 3.0 | 2.4 | 6.3 | 3.4 | 2.8 | 6.5 |
| Netherlands | 3.2 | 4.3 | 0.5 | 16.6 | 15.9 | 18.4 | 20.9 | 21.4 | 19.7 |
| Norway | 0.6 | 0.5 | 1.2 | 13.5 | 13.7 | 12.6 | 15.0 | 15.1 | 14.4 |
| Poland | 8.2 | 7.3 | 10.5 | 10.7 | 19.3 | 11.3 | 27.0 | 28.8 | 22.7 |
| Portugal | 0.8 | 0.9 | 0.6 | 9.8 | 9.1 | 12.0 | 11.5 | 10.8 | 13.7 |
| Romania | 6.0 | 2.1 | 11.8 | 14.2 | 18.6 | 7.7 | 23.4 | 24.6 | 21.7 |
| Slovakia | 9.4 | 8.0 | 11.9 | 15.1 | 14.7 | 15.8 | 26.9 | 24.7 | 30.6 |
| Slovenia | 9.8 | 4.4 | 23.4 | 18.7 | 18.5 | 19.3 | 31.0 | 25.8 | 44.3 |
| Spain | 2.9 | 0.8 | 6.6 | 8.1 | 6.2 | 11.3 | 12.5 | 8.4 | 19.3 |
| Sweden | 0.9 | 1.0 | 0.7 | 11.8 | 13.1 | 8.5 | 13.3 | 14.6 | 9.8 |
| Switzerland | 0.8 | 1.0 | 0.1 | 5.8 | 5.9 | 5.6 | 7.3 | 7.6 | 6.4 |
| UK | 1.1 | 0.9 | 1.6 | 7.4 | 5.8 | 10.5 | 9.1 | 7.3 | 12.7 |
|   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |
| Western Europe | 2.0 | 1.5 | 3.2 | 9.9 | 8.8 | 13.1 | 12.8 | 11.2 | 17.3 |
| CEE | 8.8 | 7.8 | 10.6 | 16.5 | 17.8 | 14.2 | 27.4 | 27.9 | 26.6 |
| All nations | 4.2 | 3.4 | 6.2 | 12.1 | 11.5 | 13.6 | 17.6 | 16.2 | 21.1 |
| N | 209 | 148 | 61 | 209 | 148 | 61 | 209 | 148 | 61 |

**Table A3**

*Descriptive statistics*

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Variable | Mean | Max. | Min. | Std. Dev. | N |
| TV | 17.61 | 51.45 | 0.50 | 11.06 | 209 |
| RegV | 4.20 | 29.03 | 0.00 | 5.77 | 209 |
| AltV | 12.10 | 34.00 | 0.25 | 6.70 | 209 |
| Trade-union density | 0.36 | 0.95 | 0.40 | 0.22 | 209 |
| Cultural fractionalization | 0.27 | 0.57 | 0.07 | 0.14 | 209 |
| GDP growth rate | 2.21 | 11.09 | -14.06 | 3.78 | 209 |
| Turnout change | 4.01 | 19.30 | 0.00 | 3.72 | 209 |
| ENEP (t-1) | 4.96 | 13.82 | 2.01 | 1.83 | 209 |
| Average district magnitude | 21.94 | 309.00 | 1.00 | 49.04 | 209 |
| Birth year of democracy  | 67.81 | 180.00 | 26.00 | 46.91 | 209 |
| Time between elections | 3.71 | 5.44 | 0.11 | 0.99 | 209 |
| CEE | 0.33 | 1.00 | 0.00 | 0.47 | 209 |

**Table A4**

*OLS regression for volatility by regeneration in Europe (1990-2016), by decade*

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| DV: Volatility by Regeneration | Model 1 (1990-1999) | Model 2 (2000-2009) | Model 3 (2010-2016) |
|
| Trade-union density | -1.16 (1.64) | -2.34 (2.60) | -2.26 (4.93) |
| Cultural fractionalization | 0.40 (3.47) | 9.64 (7.00) | 7.13 (5.83) |
| GDP growth rate | 0.13 (0.10) | -0.01 (0.17) | 0.22 (0.25) |
| Turnout change | -0.29 (0.16) | -0.37 (0.22) | 0.34 (0.28) |
| ENEP (t-1) | 0.49 (0.24) | -0.16 (0.57) | -0.30 (0.39) |
| ADM (ln) | 0.15 (0.38) | -0.02 (0.54) | 0.99 (0.69) |
| Birth year of democracy (ln) | -0.05 (0.92) | 0.67 (1.16) | -0.33 (2.43) |
| Time between elections | -0.61 (0.52) | -0.12 (0.58) | 0.59 (0.63) |
| CEE | 6.15\*\* (1.92) | 8.10\* (3.23) | 6.88 (3.66) |
| Constant | 2.40 (5.30) | -0.67 (5.51) | 3.44 (10.99) |
| Number of elections | 70 | 78 | 61 |
| Number of countries | 31 | 31 | 31 |
| R2 | 0.56 | 0.37 | 0.40 |

*Note*: OLS regression with robust standard errors clustered by country; robust standard errors (se) in parentheses. \*p < .05; \*\*p < .01, \*\*\*p < .001.

**Table A5**

*OLS regression for volatility by alteration in Europe (1990-2016), by decade*

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| DV: Volatility by Alteration | Model 1 (1990-1999) | Model 2 (2000-2009) | Model 3 (2010-2016) |
|
| Trade-union density | -0.41 (3.62) | -1.66 (3.78) | -3.47 (7.40) |
| Cultural fractionalization | -5.96 (5.62) | -6.68 (4.92) | -11.72 (7.23) |
| GDP growth rate | -0.25 (0.15) | -0.46 (0.33) | -0.63\* (0.26) |
| Turnout change | 0.21 (0.25) | -0.01 (0.12) | 0.12 (0.27) |
| ENEP (t-1) | 0.54 (0.34) | 1.80\*\* (0.57) | 0.87 (0.63) |
| ADM (ln) | -0.27 (1.01) | -0.49 (0.80) | 0.36 (0.50) |
| Birth year of democracy (ln) | -1.62 (1.22) | -1.46 (1.41) | 0.95 (3.20) |
| Time between elections | 1.61\* (0.63) | -1.21 (0.64) | 0.75 (0.74) |
| CEE | 7.41\* (3.28) | 6.91\* (2.66) | 2.74 (3.70) |
| Constant | 9.25 (5.94) | 16.57\* (7.42) | 4.94 (12.28) |
| Number of elections | 70 | 78 | 61 |
| Number of countries | 31 | 31 | 31 |
| R2 | 0.53 | 0.50 | 0.18 |

*Note*: OLS regression with robust standard errors clustered by country; robust standard errors (se) in parentheses. \*p < .05; \*\*p < .01, \*\*\*p < .001.

**Table A6**

*Generalized Estimating Equations (GEE) for electoral volatility in Europe (1990-2016), by decade*

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| DV: Total Volatility | Model 1 (1990-1999) | Model 2 (2000-2009) | Model 3 (2010-2016) |
|
| Trade-union density | -1.68 (4.12) | -3.17 (5.63) | -3.08 (10.34) |
| Cultural fractionalization | -4.44 (7.82) | 0.27 (9.92) | 14.81 (10.25) |
| GDP growth rate | -0.14 (0.17) | -0.88\*\* (0.31) | -0.85\* (0.40) |
| Turnout change | 0.10 (0.31) | -0.22 (0.26) | 0.16 (0.37) |
| ENEP (t-1) | 1.16\*\* (0.43) | 2.04\* (0.83) | -0.36 (0.88) |
| ADM (ln) | -0.33 (1.13) | -0.99 (1.03) | 1.79\* (0.72) |
| Birth year of democracy (ln) | -2.35 (1.69) | -2.27 (1.99) | -1.48 (4.88) |
| Time between elections | 0.89 (0.85) | 0.93 (1.21) | 2.19\* (0.88) |
| CEE | 13.76\*\* (4.07) | 14.94\*\* (4.92) | 9.14 (6.50) |
| Constant | 15.60 (8.99) | 17.44 (10.15) | 17.53 (20.61) |
| Number of elections | 70 | 78 | 61 |
| Number of countries | 31 | 31 | 31 |
| Wald Chi2 | 191.98\*\*\* | 110.69\*\*\* | 72.41\*\*\* |

*Note*: Generalized estimating equations (GEE); semi-robust standard errors (se) in parentheses. R2 is not reported because this statistic is not defined for GEE models. \*p < .05; \*\*p < .01, \*\*\*p < .001.

**Figure A1**

*Total volatility in Europe, 1990-1999*

****

**Figure A2**

*Total volatility in Europe, 2000-2009*



**Figure A3**

*Total volatility in Europe, 2010-2016*



**Figure A4**

*Volatility by regeneration in Europe, 1990-1999*



**Figure A5**

*Volatility by regeneration in Europe, 2000-2009*

****

**Figure A6**

*Volatility by regeneration in Europe, 2010-2016*



**Figure A7**

*Volatility by alteration in Europe, 1990-1999*

****

**Figure A8**

*Volatility by alteration in Europe, 2000-2009*

****

**Figure A9**

*Volatility by alteration in Europe, 2010-2016*

