

Table DSI Studies included in the meta-analysis

Study reference and country	Participants randomised/ in post-treatment analysis, <i>n</i>	Age, years mean (s.d.) ¹	Female %	Traumatic events	Mean duration of symptoms/ time since trauma	Types of treatment and control	Duration of treatment	PTSD outcome measures	Follow-up period	Randomisation concealment	ITT analysis	Masking of assessor
Brom <i>et al</i> , 1989 (The Netherlands)	112 100 completed (12 drop-outs reported)	42 (14.3)	79	Mixed	Less than 5 years	OT1 (psychodynamic therapy) OT2 (hypnotherapy) TFCBT (trauma desensitisation) Waiting list	Mean 14–19 sessions	SCL-90 (trauma symptoms) IES (intrusion and avoidance)	Post-treatment, 3 MFU	Not given	Completers only	Not given
Cooper & Clum 1989 (USA)	22 randomised 14 included in analysis (8 did not complete)	37	0	Combat (Vietnam)	Not given	TFCBT (imaginal flooding) Standard care (psychological and pharmacological)	Six to fourteen 1.5 h sessions including introduction and assessment (maximum 9 active flooding sessions)	Self-monitoring of re-experiencing symptoms and sleep Modified Vietnam Experiences Questionnaire (non-validated) Behavioural avoidance test SUDS	Post-treatment 3 MFU	Not given	Completers only	Not given
Keane <i>et al</i> , 1989 (USA)	24 24 completed	34.6 (4.3)	0	Combat (Vietnam)	Not given	TFCBT (implosive flooding) Waiting list	Fourteen to sixteen 90 min sessions	PTSD symptom checklist (Jackson Structured Interview) MMPI (PTSD sub-scale)	Post-treatment 6 MFU (CBT), 4.5 MFU (waiting list)	Not given	Yes	No
Foa <i>et al</i> , 1991 (USA)	45 35	31.8 (8.2)	100	Rape	6.2 (6.7) years	SM (stress inoculation) TFCBT (prolonged exposure) OT (supportive counselling) Waiting list	13.5 h	Clinician-rated PTSD severity	Post-treatment, 3 MFU	Not given	Completers only	Not given

(Continued)

Peniston & Kulkosky, 1991 (USA)	29 29	36.6 (2.82)	0	Combat (Vietnam)	12-15 years	TFCBT (neuro-feedback training) Usual care	4 h pre-training+ 15 h active intervention	MMPI-R	Post-treatment, 30 MFU	Not given	Yes	Masked evaluation of MMPI data
Jensen, 1994 (USA)	29 25	41.3 (2.84)	0	Combat (Vietnam)	Not given	EMDR Control	Not given (3 sessions in all)	Structured Interview for PTSD	Post-treatment only	Not given	Completers only	Not given
Vaughan <i>et al</i> , 1994 (Australia)	36 36	32 (14.7)	64	Mixed	Not given	EMDR TFCBT (image habituation training) SM (applied muscle relaxation)	Four 50 min sessions (all conditions)	PTSD Structured Interview IES	Post-treatment, 3 MFU	Not given	Yes	Yes
Echeburua <i>et al</i> , 1997 (Spain)	20	20 (7.09)	100	Sexual aggression (childhood and adult)	Not given	TFCBT (gradual self-exposure and cognitive restructuring) SM (progressive relaxation training)	Six 70 min self-exposure sessions Six 45 min relaxation sessions	Structured interview (scored on Scale of Severity of PTSD Symptoms)	Post-treatment, 1 MFU, 3 MFU, 6 MFU, 12 MFU	Not given	Yes	No
Marcus <i>et al</i> , 1997 (USA)	67 66 completed (1 drop-out reported)	41.0 (range 18-73)	79	Mixed	Not given	EMDR Standard care (including psychological and pharmacological)	No set duration; at least three 50 min sessions	Modified PTSD scale IES SCL-90 SUDS	Mid-therapy (after 3 sessions), post-treatment	Not given	Unclear	No
Rothbaum, 1997 (USA)	21 18 completed (3 drop-outs reported)	34.2 (11.1)	100	Rape (adulthood)	Not given Mean 104 months since rape (s.d.=106.6)	EMDR Waiting list	One information-gathering session then three 90 min active EMDR sessions	Structured interview (PSS) IES Rape Aftermath Symptom Test	Post-treatment, 3 MFU	Not given	Completers only	No (independent but not masked)
Zlotnick <i>et al</i> , 1997 (USA)	48 33 completed (13 drop-outs reported; 2 unaccounted for)	39 (9.59)	100	Childhood sexual abuse	Not given Mean age of first abuse 6.86 years (s.d.=2.36)	Group CBT (affect management group) Waiting list	One 2 h session per week for 15 weeks	CAPS-I Davidson Trauma Scale SCL-90-R	Post-treatment	Not given	Completers only	Not given

(Continued)

Carlson <i>et al</i> , 1998 (USA)	35 34 completed (1 drop-out up to post-treatment assessment, 30 at 3 MFU, 12 at 9 MFU)	48 (8.6)	0	Combat	Not given	EMDR SM (biofeedback-assisted relaxation) Waiting list	EMDR: twelve 60-75 min sessions over 6 weeks Relaxation: twelve 40 min sessions over 6 weeks	CAPS-I PTSD Symptom Scale IES Mississippi Scale for Combat-Related PTSD	Post-treatment (all) 3 MFU, 9 MFU (intervention groups only)	Not given	Completers only	Post-treatment/ 3 MFU mask- ing unclear Masked assessment reported at 9 MFU
Marks <i>et al</i> , 1998 (UK)	87 77 completed (10 drop-outs reported)	38 (10)	36	Various	At least 6 months, mean 46 months (s.d.=58)	TFCBT 1 (prolonged imaginal and live exposure therapy) TFCBT 2 (cognitive restructuring) TFCBT 3 (combined prolonged exposure and cognitive restructuring) SM (relaxation)	All conditions, ten 90 min sessions (105 min for combined group)	CAPS-2 IES PSS	Post-treatment, 1 MFU, 3 MFU, 6 MFU	Not given	Completers only	Yes
Scheck <i>et al</i> , 1998 (USA)	67 60 completed (7 drop-outs reported)	20.9 (range 16-25)	100	Mixed: 50% sexual trauma	Not given	EMDR OT (active listening)	Two 90 min sessions (both conditions)	Penn Inventory for PTSD IES	Post-treatment, 3 MFU	Not given	Completers only	Masked ad- ministration at end-point, masking of assessment unclear 3 MFU not masked Not given
Deville & Spence, 1999 (Australia)	32 23 completed (9 drop-outs reported)	37.96 (12.82)	65 (of completers)	Not given	Not given	TFCBT (CBT - trauma treatment protocol) EMDR	CBT: nine sessions (6x 90 min +3x 120 min) EMDR: up to eight 90-120 min sessions 8 h approximately 10.5 h	SCL-90-R SUDS Civilian Mississippi Scale for PTSD IES PSS-SR PTSD Interview CAPS IES PSS-I	Post-treatment, 2 weeks, 3 months 6 MFU 12 MFU	Not given	Completers only	Not given
Fecteau & Nicki, 1999 (Canada)	23	41.3 (range 25-63)	70	RTA	18.8 months (mean)	TFCBT Waiting list			6 MFU	Not given	Completers only	Not given
Foa <i>et al</i> , 1999 (USA)	96 79	34.9 (10.6)	100	Assault of which 72% sexual assault	Not given	TFCBT (exposure therapy) SM (stress inoculation training) TFCBT+SM (combination exposure and stress inoculation) Waiting list			12 MFU	Not given	Completers only	Not given

(Continued)

Tarrier <i>et al</i> , 1999a (UK)	72 62 completed; 57 at 6 MFU, 54 at 12 MFU	37.9 (11.8)	41	Mixed	Not given	TFCBT 1 (imaginal exposure) TFCBT 2 (cogni- tive therapy)	Sixteen 60 min sessions in both conditions (mean attendance 11.2 sessions, s.d.=4.5)	IES CAPS Penn Inventory for PTSD	Post- treatment, 12 MFU	Not given	Completers only	Yes
Tarrier <i>et al</i> , 1999b (UK)	72 62 completed 57 at 6 MFU	8.6 (11.6)	42	Mixed (non-CSA)	34% < 12 months 40% 1-2 years 26% 2-10 years	TFCBT 1 (imaginal exposure) TFCBT 2 (cognitive therapy)	Sixteen sessions 60 min in both conditions	IES CAPS Penn Inventory for PTSD	6 MFU	Not given	Completers only	Yes
Gersons <i>et al</i> , 2000 (The Netherlands)	42 23 completed (1 drop-out included in analysis)	36.5 (7)	22	Traumatic event at work (all police officers)	3 years	TFCBT (brief eclectic psy- chotherapy) Waiting list	16 h	Clinician-rated PTSD symptoms	3 MFU	Not given	Yes	Yes
Classen <i>et al</i> , 2001 (USA)	55 52	Not given	100	Adult survivors of CSA	Not given	Group TFCBT (trauma-focused group therapy) Group CBT (present-centred group therapy) Waiting list	36 h	Trauma Symptom Checklist-40	6 MFU	Not given	Completers only	Not given
Krakow <i>et al</i> , 2001 (USA)	168 114 (end-point) 96 (3 MFU) 99 (6 MFU)	36.9 (12.7)	100	Sexual assault (adult and CSA)	Not given	Group CBT (group imagery rehearsal) Waiting list	Three 3 h sessions	DSS CAPS	Post- treatment, 3 MFU, 6 MFU	Not given	Yes	Yes
Paunovic & Ost, 2001 (Sweden)	20 16 completed (4 drop-outs reported)	37.9 (7.6)	19	Mixed (refugee population)	7.8 years (s.d.=7.0)	TFCBT 1 (trauma- focused CBT) TFCBT 2 (expo- sure therapy)	Sixteen to twenty 60-120 min (both conditions)	CAPS-IV IES-R PSS	Post- treatment, 6 MFU	Not given	Completers only	No
Cloitre <i>et al</i> , 2002 (USA)	58 46	34 (7.22)	100	Adult survivors of CSA	Not given	TFCBT (CBT and modified prolonged exposure) Waiting list	20 h	CAPS Modified PSS-SR	9 MFU	Not given	Completers only	Not given

(Continued)

Ironson <i>et al</i> , 2002 (USA)	22 19 completed (3 drop-outs reported) 12 at 3 MFU	Limited data given (range 16-62 years)	77	Mixed	Not given	EMDR TFCBT (prolonged exposure)	In both conditions 3 non-active sessions, 3 active sessions with homework	SUDS PSS-SR	Post-treatment, 3 MFU	Not given	Completers only	No
Lee <i>et al</i> , 2002 (USA)	24 21 completed (3 drop-outs reported)	35.3 (17.16)	46	Mixed	Time since trauma: mean 14.9 months (s.d.=15.71)	EMDR SM+TFCBT (stress inoculation training with prolonged exposure)	Seven 90 min sessions	SI-PTSD IES Keane's PTSD scale from the MMPI	Post-treatment, 3 MFU	Not given	Completers only	No
Power <i>et al</i> , 2002 (UK)	105 72 completed (33 drop-outs reported)	Completers: 39.2 (11.8)	58 (of completers)	Mixed	Time since trauma (completers): mean 199.3 weeks (s.d.=426)	EMDR TFCBT (cognitive restructuring and exposure therapy) Waiting list	Maximum of ten 90 min sessions	CAPS IES SI-PTSD (self-report version)	Post-treatment, 15 MFU	Not given	Completers only	Yes
Resick <i>et al</i> , 2002 (USA)	171 121 completed (50 drop-outs reported)	32 (9.9)	100	Rape (during childhood and/or adulthood)	At least 3 months since trauma, mean 8.5 years (s.d.=8.5)	TFCBT 1 (cognitive processing therapy) TFCBT 2 (prolonged exposure) Minimal attention	Total 13 h active treatment over 6 weeks, plus homework (TFCBT 1 mean 22.6 h, TFCBT 2 mean 44.8 h)	CAPS PSS	Post-treatment, 3 MFU, 9 MFU	Not given	Yes	Not given
Blanchard <i>et al</i> , 2003 (USA)	73 53	41 (13.1)	73	RTA	9.8-15.1 months average duration across treatment groups	TFCBT OT (supportive psychotherapy) Waiting list	8-12 sessions (length unspecified)	CAPS IES	3 MFU	Not given	Completers only	Yes
Bryant <i>et al</i> , 2003 (Australia)	58 45 completed	35.2 (12.31)	52	Mixed (excluding sexual assault)	Minimum 3 months	TFCBT 1 (prolonged imaginal exposure and cognitive restructuring) TFCBT 2 (prolonged imaginal exposure) OT (supportive counselling)	All conditions: eight 90 min sessions	CAPS-2 IES	Post-treatment, 6 MFU	Not given	Yes	Yes
Kubany <i>et al</i> , 2003 (USA)	37 32 completed (5 drop-outs reported) 25 at 3 MFU	36.4 (9.1)	100	Mixed traumas within a population of 'battered women'	Not given	TFCBT (cognitive trauma therapy for battered women) Waiting list	Mean 8.5 (range 7-11) sessions (90 min)	CAPS	Post-treatment, 3 MFU	Not given	Yes	Yes

Lange <i>et al</i> , 2003 (The Netherlands)	184 101 at post-treatment (83 drop-outs reported) 57 at 6 weeks	Completers: 39.0 (10.5)	80	Mixed	At least 3 months since trauma, mean 9.0 years (s.d.=11.6)	Interapy Waiting list	Ten 45 min writing exercises	SCL-90 IES	Post-treatment, 6 weeks FU	Not given	Completers only	Not given
Taylor <i>et al</i> , 2003 (Canada)	60 45 completed	37 (10)	75	Mixed	Mean duration 8.7 years (s.d.=10.8)	EMDR TFCBT (exposure therapy) SM (relaxation)	All conditions: eight 90 min sessions	CAPS PSS	Post-treatment, 3 MFU	Not given	Both completer and (limited) ITT analyses re-reported	Yes
Schnurr <i>et al</i> , 2003 (USA)	360 253 completed (325 participated in follow-up)	50.7 (3.7)	0	Combat (Vietnam)	Not given	Group TFCBT Group CBT (present-centred group therapy)	Both conditions: thirty 90–120 min sessions, then five 90 min 'booster' sessions	CAPS PTSD Checklist SF-36	Post-treatment, 12 months (end of booster period) 18 MFU, 24 MFU	Not given	Yes	Yes
Ehlers <i>et al</i> , 2005 (UK)	28 28	36.6 (11.2)	53.5	Mixed	11.5 months (median)	TFCBT (trauma-focused cognitive therapy) Waiting list	Up to 15 sessions (mean 12.4)	CAPS PDS	6 MFU	Not given	Yes	Yes
Kubany <i>et al</i> , 2004 (USA)	125 85 analysed post-treatment	42.2 (10.1)	100	Mixed traumas within a population of 'battered women'	Where trauma was partner abuse, mean 5.0 years since last abuse (s.d.=7.4)	TFCBT (immediate cognitive trauma therapy) Waiting list	8–11 sessions of 90 min	CAPS Distressing Event Questionnaire	Post-treatment, 3 MFU, 6 MFU	Not given	Both completer and ITT analyses reported	Yes
Neuner <i>et al</i> , 2004 (Germany)	43 40 analysed post-treatment, 38 at 12 MFU	33.1 (7.9)	60	Refugee population (Sudanese civil war)	Mean 7.5 years since 'worst' trauma (s.d.=3.3)	TFCBT (narrative exposure therapy) OT I (supportive counselling) Psychoeducation	TFCBT and OT I: four 90–120 min sessions Psychoeducation: one 90–120 min session	PDS CIDI-PTSD part	Post-treatment, 4 MFU, 12 MFU	Not given	Completers only	Yes
Rothbaum <i>et al</i> , 2005 (USA)	74 60 completed	Completers: 33.77 (11.03)	100	Rape in adulthood (> 12 years old)	More than 12.3 months since trauma	TFCBT (prolonged exposure) EMDR Waiting list	Both conditions: nine 90 min sessions	CAPS SCID PSS-SR IES-R	Post-treatment, 6 MFU, 12 MFU	Not given	Completers only	Yes

CAPS, Clinician Administered PTSD Scale; CBT, cognitive-behavioural therapy; CIDI, Composite International Diagnostic Interview; CSA, childhood sexual abuse; DSS, Depression Symptom Scale; EMDR, eye movement desensitisation and reprocessing; IES(-R), Impact of Events Scale (Revised); ITT, intention-to-treat; MFU, months of follow-up; MMPI(-R), Minnesota Multiphasic Personality Interview (Revised); OT, other therapies; PDS, PTSD Diagnostic Scale; PSS(I, SR), PTSD Symptom Scale (Interview, Self-Report); PTSD, post-traumatic stress disorder; RTA, road traffic accident; SCID, Structured Clinical Interview for DSM-IV; SCL-90-R, Symptom Checklist 90 - Revised; SI-PTSD, Structured Interview for PTSD; SM, stress management; SUDS, Subjective Units of Distress Scale; TFCBT, trauma-focused cognitive-behavioural therapy.

1. Where standard deviations are given for each treatment group separately, the highest across treatment groups is reported.