

Online Appendix:  
The Institutional Order of Liberalization

TABLE A 1: Sample of liberalizing autocracies from the ERT dataset

Country	Start	End	Outcome
Afghanistan	2002	2006	reverted liberalization
Albania	1919	1922	reverted liberalization
Albania	1946	1947	reverted liberalization
Albania	1991	1995	reverted liberalization
Albania	1998	2002	preempted transition
Algeria	1962	1964	reverted liberalization
Algeria	1977	1977	stabilized electoral autocracy
Algeria	1990	1990	reverted liberalization
Algeria	1995	1998	stabilized electoral autocracy
Angola	2008	2011	stabilized electoral autocracy
Argentina	1912	1926	democratic transition
Argentina	1932	1933	stabilized electoral autocracy
Argentina	1946	1948	stabilized electoral autocracy
Argentina	1957	1961	reverted liberalization
Argentina	1963	1964	democratic transition
Argentina	1972	1974	preempted transition
Argentina	1983	1985	democratic transition
Armenia	1998	2000	reverted liberalization
Austria	1918	1921	democratic transition
Azerbaijan	1991	1993	reverted liberalization
Bahrain	1972	1973	reverted liberalization
Bahrain	2000	2003	stabilized electoral autocracy
Bangladesh	1972	1974	reverted liberalization
Bangladesh	1977	1979	reverted liberalization
Bangladesh	1984	1997	democratic transition
Bangladesh	2009	2012	preempted transition
Barbados	1944	1977	democratic transition
Belgium	1919	1921	democratic transition
Belgium	1944	1954	democratic transition
Benin	1952	1964	reverted liberalization
Benin	1990	1997	democratic transition
Bhutan	2006	2014	democratic transition
Bolivia	1938	1939	reverted liberalization
Bolivia	1945	1948	reverted liberalization
Bolivia	1952	1961	reverted liberalization
Bolivia	1982	1987	democratic transition
Bosnia and Herzegovina	1996	2003	democratic transition
Botswana	1960	1967	democratic transition
Brazil	1945	1947	stabilized electoral autocracy
Brazil	1975	1993	democratic transition
Bulgaria	1990	1997	democratic transition

continued on next page

Table A1: Sample of liberalizing autocracies (continued)

Country	Start Year	End Year	Outcome
Burkina Faso	1949	1961	reverted liberalization
Burkina Faso	1978	1979	reverted liberalization
Burkina Faso	1990	2008	democratic transition
Burkina Faso	2016	2016	preempted transition
Burma/Myanmar	1922	1923	stabilized electoral autocracy
Burma/Myanmar	1945	1953	stabilized electoral autocracy
Burundi	1960	1962	reverted liberalization
Burundi	1982	1985	reverted liberalization
Burundi	1992	1993	reverted liberalization
Burundi	1999	2006	reverted liberalization
Cambodia	1947	1960	stabilized electoral autocracy
Cambodia	1990	1994	stabilized electoral autocracy
Cameroon	1990	1993	stabilized electoral autocracy
Canada	1920	1938	democratic transition
Cape Verde	1972	1975	reverted liberalization
Cape Verde	1980	1981	stabilized electoral autocracy
Cape Verde	1990	2000	democratic transition
Central African Republic	1947	1950	stabilized electoral autocracy
Central African Republic	1956	1961	reverted liberalization
Central African Republic	1987	1994	reverted liberalization
Central African Republic	2005	2010	reverted liberalization
Chad	1945	1957	reverted liberalization
Chad	1990	1997	stabilized electoral autocracy
Chile	1932	1937	stabilized electoral autocracy
Chile	1958	1971	democratic transition
Chile	1988	1994	democratic transition
Colombia	1958	1969	reverted liberalization
Colombia	1972	1975	stabilized electoral autocracy
Colombia	1982	1995	democratic transition
Comoros	1990	1991	reverted liberalization
Comoros	1997	1997	reverted liberalization
Comoros	2002	2014	democratic transition
Costa Rica	1919	1924	stabilized electoral autocracy
Costa Rica	1950	1962	democratic transition
Croatia	1992	2004	democratic transition
Cuba	1901	1904	reverted liberalization
Cuba	1909	1909	stabilized electoral autocracy
Cuba	1936	1945	stabilized electoral autocracy
Cyprus	1960	1961	preempted transition
Cyprus	1970	1983	democratic transition
Czech Republic	1920	1926	democratic transition
Czech Republic	1945	1947	reverted liberalization

continued on next page

Table A1: Sample of liberalizing autocracies (continued)

Country	Start Year	End Year	Outcome
Czech Republic	1990	1991	democratic transition
Democratic Republic of the Congo	1955	1960	reverted liberalization
Democratic Republic of the Congo	1998	2009	reverted liberalization
Denmark	1901	1902	democratic transition
Denmark	1945	1946	democratic transition
Dominican Republic	1924	1925	reverted liberalization
Dominican Republic	1961	1963	reverted liberalization
Dominican Republic	1966	1970	stabilized electoral autocracy
Dominican Republic	1978	1988	democratic transition
Dominican Republic	1995	2013	democratic transition
Ecuador	1911	1912	stabilized electoral autocracy
Ecuador	1938	1939	reverted liberalization
Ecuador	1947	1953	stabilized electoral autocracy
Ecuador	1967	1969	reverted liberalization
Ecuador	1978	1984	democratic transition
Egypt	1956	1965	stabilized electoral autocracy
El Salvador	1982	1985	stabilized electoral autocracy
El Salvador	1991	2000	democratic transition
Equatorial Guinea	1968	1969	reverted liberalization
Equatorial Guinea	1982	1994	stabilized electoral autocracy
Eritrea	1940	1942	stabilized electoral autocracy
Estonia	1919	1922	democratic transition
Estonia	1993	1993	democratic transition
Eswatini	1964	1969	reverted liberalization
Ethiopia	1987	1992	reverted liberalization
Fiji	1963	1977	democratic transition
Fiji	1992	1997	democratic transition
Fiji	2002	2002	democratic transition
Finland	1917	1925	democratic transition
France	1945	1949	democratic transition
Gabon	1957	1961	reverted liberalization
Gabon	1987	1994	stabilized electoral autocracy
Georgia	1993	2005	democratic transition
Germany	1919	1925	democratic transition
Ghana	1947	1951	stabilized electoral autocracy
Ghana	1969	1971	reverted liberalization
Ghana	1979	1980	preempted transition
Ghana	1993	2001	democratic transition
Greece	1924	1924	reverted liberalization
Greece	1927	1930	reverted liberalization
Greece	1945	1953	stabilized electoral autocracy
Greece	1974	1976	democratic transition

continued on next page

Table A1: Sample of liberalizing autocracies (continued)

Country	Start Year	End Year	Outcome
Guatemala	1945	1949	reverted liberalization
Guatemala	1984	2004	democratic transition
Guinea	1957	1958	reverted liberalization
Guinea	1985	2001	stabilized electoral autocracy
Guinea-Bissau	1973	1977	stabilized electoral autocracy
Guinea-Bissau	1990	2002	reverted liberalization
Guinea-Bissau	2005	2006	reverted liberalization
Guinea-Bissau	2014	2015	democratic transition
Guyana	1901	1906	stabilized electoral autocracy
Guyana	1957	1958	stabilized electoral autocracy
Guyana	1966	1967	reverted liberalization
Guyana	1986	2009	democratic transition
Haiti	1951	1951	stabilized electoral autocracy
Haiti	1987	1988	reverted liberalization
Haiti	1991	1991	reverted liberalization
Haiti	1993	1998	reverted liberalization
Haiti	2006	2007	stabilized electoral autocracy
Honduras	1949	1951	reverted liberalization
Honduras	1971	1971	reverted liberalization
Honduras	1980	1996	democratic transition
Hong Kong	1985	1992	stabilized electoral autocracy
Hungary	1918	1918	reverted liberalization
Hungary	1920	1925	stabilized electoral autocracy
Hungary	1988	1995	democratic transition
Iceland	1904	1909	democratic transition
India	1950	1957	democratic transition
Indonesia	1945	1956	preempted transition
Indonesia	1997	2000	democratic transition
Iran	1906	1910	stabilized electoral autocracy
Iraq	2004	2011	stabilized electoral autocracy
Ireland	1921	1924	democratic transition
Israel	1949	1957	democratic transition
Italy	1944	1961	democratic transition
Ivory Coast	1990	1993	reverted liberalization
Ivory Coast	1995	1996	reverted liberalization
Ivory Coast	2001	2006	reverted liberalization
Ivory Coast	2008	2019	democratic transition
Jamaica	1935	1945	stabilized electoral autocracy
Jamaica	1953	1956	democratic transition
Jamaica	1984	1998	democratic transition
Japan	1945	1964	democratic transition
Jordan	1989	1994	stabilized electoral autocracy

continued on next page

Table A1: Sample of liberalizing autocracies (continued)

Country	Start Year	End Year	Outcome
Kenya	1956	1965	reverted liberalization
Kenya	1990	2003	reverted liberalization
Kenya	2010	2016	reverted liberalization
Kosovo	2002	2007	democratic transition
Kuwait	1961	1966	reverted liberalization
Kuwait	1981	1981	reverted liberalization
Kuwait	1991	2005	stabilized electoral autocracy
Kyrgyzstan	1991	1992	reverted liberalization
Kyrgyzstan	2003	2012	reverted liberalization
Laos	1945	1948	reverted liberalization
Laos	1950	1958	reverted liberalization
Latvia	1922	1923	democratic transition
Lebanon	1942	1944	stabilized electoral autocracy
Lebanon	1996	2010	preempted transition
Lesotho	1960	1967	reverted liberalization
Lesotho	1992	1994	reverted liberalization
Lesotho	2002	2003	democratic transition
Liberia	1985	1988	reverted liberalization
Liberia	1997	1998	reverted liberalization
Liberia	2005	2007	democratic transition
Libya	2011	2013	preempted transition
Lithuania	1920	1922	democratic transition
Luxembourg	1916	1920	democratic transition
Luxembourg	1945	1954	democratic transition
Madagascar	1956	1961	stabilized electoral autocracy
Madagascar	1985	1994	democratic transition
Madagascar	2003	2006	democratic transition
Malawi	1960	1964	reverted liberalization
Malawi	1992	1995	preempted transition
Malawi	2005	2015	democratic transition
Malaysia	1946	1956	stabilized electoral autocracy
Malaysia	1972	1975	stabilized electoral autocracy
Maldives	1933	1935	stabilized electoral autocracy
Maldives	2003	2010	democratic transition
Mali	1946	1961	stabilized electoral autocracy
Mali	1992	1993	democratic transition
Mali	2014	2015	democratic transition
Malta	1921	1921	stabilized electoral autocracy
Malta	1932	1933	reverted liberalization
Malta	1945	1951	democratic transition
Malta	1962	1965	democratic transition
Mauritania	1945	1947	stabilized electoral autocracy

continued on next page

Table A1: Sample of liberalizing autocracies (continued)

Country	Start Year	End Year	Outcome
Mauritania	1957	1957	stabilized electoral autocracy
Mauritania	1987	1994	stabilized electoral autocracy
Mauritania	2007	2007	reverted liberalization
Mauritania	2010	2010	reverted liberalization
Mauritius	1948	1949	stabilized electoral autocracy
Mauritius	1959	1961	reverted liberalization
Mauritius	1968	1983	democratic transition
Mexico	1915	1918	stabilized electoral autocracy
Mexico	1977	2002	democratic transition
Moldova	1994	1998	democratic transition
Moldova	2006	2011	democratic transition
Mongolia	1951	1952	stabilized electoral autocracy
Mongolia	1990	1998	democratic transition
Montenegro	1999	2004	democratic transition
Morocco	1963	1964	reverted liberalization
Morocco	1993	2005	stabilized electoral autocracy
Namibia	1989	1991	preempted transition
Namibia	1995	1995	democratic transition
Nepal	1950	1952	stabilized electoral autocracy
Nepal	1990	1992	stabilized electoral autocracy
Nepal	2006	2009	democratic transition
Nepal	2014	2014	democratic transition
Netherlands	1917	1923	democratic transition
Netherlands	1945	1949	democratic transition
Nicaragua	1980	1991	democratic transition
Niger	1957	1961	reverted liberalization
Niger	1988	1991	reverted liberalization
Niger	1993	1994	democratic transition
Niger	1997	1998	reverted liberalization
Niger	2000	2002	democratic transition
Niger	2011	2012	democratic transition
Nigeria	1976	1980	reverted liberalization
Nigeria	1998	2000	stabilized electoral autocracy
Nigeria	2010	2016	democratic transition
North Macedonia	1993	1999	democratic transition
North Macedonia	2017	2019	democratic transition
Norway	1906	1918	democratic transition
Norway	1945	1948	democratic transition
Oman	2000	2003	stabilized electoral autocracy
Pakistan	1962	1974	reverted liberalization
Pakistan	1985	1990	stabilized electoral autocracy
Pakistan	2002	2015	reverted liberalization

continued on next page

Table A1: Sample of liberalizing autocracies (continued)

Country	Start Year	End Year	Outcome
Palestine/West Bank	1994	2005	democratic transition
Panama	1904	1905	stabilized electoral autocracy
Panama	1947	1950	reverted liberalization
Panama	1953	1956	stabilized electoral autocracy
Panama	1990	1992	democratic transition
Papua New Guinea	1960	1977	democratic transition
Paraguay	1990	1994	democratic transition
Peru	1939	1940	stabilized electoral autocracy
Peru	1950	1957	reverted liberalization
Peru	1964	1964	reverted liberalization
Peru	1976	1982	democratic transition
Peru	1994	1996	reverted liberalization
Peru	2001	2004	democratic transition
Philippines	1944	1948	stabilized electoral autocracy
Philippines	1982	1990	democratic transition
Philippines	2007	2015	democratic transition
Poland	1919	1920	democratic transition
Poland	1980	1994	democratic transition
Portugal	1908	1916	reverted liberalization
Portugal	1970	1984	democratic transition
Republic of the Congo	1957	1961	reverted liberalization
Republic of the Congo	1990	1993	reverted liberalization
Republic of the Congo	2002	2003	stabilized electoral autocracy
Republic of Vietnam	1955	1957	stabilized electoral autocracy
Republic of Vietnam	1966	1968	stabilized electoral autocracy
Romania	1990	1997	democratic transition
Russia	1987	1992	democratic transition
Rwanda	1955	1962	reverted liberalization
Rwanda	1979	1982	stabilized electoral autocracy
Rwanda	1991	1992	reverted liberalization
Sao Tome and Principe	1972	1975	stabilized electoral autocracy
Sao Tome and Principe	1987	1995	democratic transition
Senegal	1945	1946	stabilized electoral autocracy
Senegal	1960	1961	reverted liberalization
Senegal	1978	1982	reverted liberalization
Serbia	1992	1993	stabilized electoral autocracy
Serbia	2000	2003	democratic transition
Seychelles	1963	1970	reverted liberalization
Seychelles	1979	1985	reverted liberalization
Seychelles	1991	2004	stabilized electoral autocracy
Seychelles	2016	2017	democratic transition
Sierra Leone	1958	1963	reverted liberalization

continued on next page



Table A1: Sample of liberalizing autocracies (continued)

Country	Start Year	End Year	Outcome
Sierra Leone	1994	1997	reverted liberalization
Sierra Leone	2002	2003	democratic transition
Sierra Leone	2013	2019	democratic transition
Singapore	1955	1960	stabilized electoral autocracy
Slovakia	1994	2010	democratic transition
Slovenia	1990	1998	democratic transition
Solomon Islands	1960	1982	democratic transition
Solomon Islands	2002	2004	preempted transition
Solomon Islands	2007	2011	democratic transition
Somalia	1950	1966	reverted liberalization
Somaliland	1993	2014	reverted liberalization
South Africa	1990	1995	democratic transition
South Korea	1945	1949	stabilized electoral autocracy
South Korea	1964	1964	stabilized electoral autocracy
South Korea	1976	1998	democratic transition
Spain	1931	1932	democratic transition
Spain	1976	1980	democratic transition
Sri Lanka	1947	1948	democratic transition
Sri Lanka	1983	1987	democratic transition
Sri Lanka	2011	2016	democratic transition
Sudan	1949	1956	reverted liberalization
Sudan	1965	1965	reverted liberalization
Sudan	1986	1987	reverted liberalization
Sudan	1996	2009	stabilized electoral autocracy
Suriname	1949	1956	democratic transition
Suriname	1987	1990	preempted transition
Suriname	1992	1992	democratic transition
Sweden	1917	1929	democratic transition
Syria	1943	1948	reverted liberalization
Syria	1953	1955	reverted liberalization
Syria	1961	1962	reverted liberalization
Taiwan	1987	2002	democratic transition
Tanzania	1958	1964	reverted liberalization
Tanzania	1986	1996	democratic transition
Thailand	1933	1938	stabilized electoral autocracy
Thailand	1974	1975	reverted liberalization
Thailand	1978	1987	reverted liberalization
Thailand	1992	2001	democratic transition
Thailand	2008	2008	reverted liberalization
Thailand	2010	2012	preempted transition
The Gambia	1946	1948	stabilized electoral autocracy
The Gambia	1960	1962	reverted liberalization

continued on next page

Table A1: Sample of liberalizing autocracies (continued)

Country	Start Year	End Year	Outcome
The Gambia	1966	1971	preempted transition
The Gambia	1996	1998	stabilized electoral autocracy
Timor-Leste	1998	2008	democratic transition
Togo	1956	1960	reverted liberalization
Togo	1991	1999	stabilized electoral autocracy
Togo	2005	2009	preempted transition
Togo	2012	2014	democratic transition
Trinidad and Tobago	1925	1926	stabilized electoral autocracy
Trinidad and Tobago	1933	1967	democratic transition
Tunisia	1956	1960	stabilized electoral autocracy
Tunisia	2011	2012	democratic transition
Turkey	1908	1909	reverted liberalization
Turkey	1946	1951	reverted liberalization
Turkey	1962	1967	democratic transition
Turkey	1983	2006	democratic transition
Uganda	1953	1963	reverted liberalization
Uganda	1981	1981	reverted liberalization
Uganda	1989	1992	reverted liberalization
Ukraine	1991	1996	democratic transition
Ukraine	2005	2007	democratic transition
United Kingdom	1919	1931	democratic transition
United States of America	1913	1921	democratic transition
Uruguay	1915	1920	democratic transition
Uruguay	1922	1926	democratic transition
Uruguay	1936	1949	democratic transition
Uruguay	1981	1986	democratic transition
Vanuatu	1970	1984	democratic transition
Venezuela	1936	1948	reverted liberalization
Venezuela	1958	1974	democratic transition
Vietnam	1946	1947	reverted liberalization
Yemen	1988	1993	reverted liberalization
Zambia	1961	1964	reverted liberalization
Zambia	1990	1993	stabilized electoral autocracy
Zanzibar	1957	1963	reverted liberalization
Zanzibar	1992	1999	stabilized electoral autocracy
Zimbabwe	1979	1981	stabilized electoral autocracy

TABLE A2: Indicators used for analysis

Indicator	Variable	Index	collapsed states			country-year		
			Obs	Mean	SD	Obs	Mean	SD
Media bias	v2mebias_ord	Information	1257	2.27	1.17	1850	2.25	1.17
Media critical	v2mecrit_ord	Information	1266	2.48	1.15	1859	2.46	1.15
Media perspectives	v2merange_ord	Information	1266	2.44	1.40	1859	2.39	1.41
EMB autonomy	v2elembaut_ord	Clean elections	1265	1.47	1.21	1858	1.44	1.21
Election free and fair	v2elrfair_ord	Clean elections	1266	2.13	1.35	1859	2.12	1.35
Voter registry	v2elrgstry_ord	Clean elections	1266	2.18	1.27	1859	2.16	1.25
Election intimidation	v2elintim_ord	Clean elections	1256	2.40	1.37	1849	2.41	1.36
Other voting irregularities	v2elirreg_ord	Clean elections	1266	1.60	1.23	1859	1.58	1.23
EMB capacity	v2elembcap_ord	Clean elections	1262	1.94	1.21	1855	1.92	1.21
Vote buying	v2elvotbuy_ord	Clean elections	1266	1.53	1.20	1859	1.51	1.18
Other electoral violence	v2elpeace_ord	Clean elections	1266	2.42	1.38	1859	2.41	1.37
CSO entry and exit	v2cseeorgs_ord	Association	1266	2.02	1.00	1859	1.99	1.00
CSO repression	v2csreprss_ord	Association	1266	2.35	0.99	1859	2.32	0.97
Elections multiparty	v2elmulpar_ord	Association	1266	2.76	1.56	1859	2.74	1.55
Barriers to parties	v2psbars_ord	Association	1266	3.03	1.10	1859	3.00	1.12
Opposition parties autonomy	v2psoppaut_ord	Association	1251	2.80	1.00	1844	2.76	1.02
Party ban	v2psparban_ord	Association	1266	3.31	1.06	1859	3.31	1.08
Harassment of journalists	v2meharjrn_ord	Expression	1266	1.71	0.79	1859	1.69	0.78
Discussion for men	v2cldiscm_ord	Expression	1266	2.31	0.99	1859	2.30	0.96
Academic & cultural expression	v2clacfree_ord	Expression	1266	2.11	1.00	1859	2.10	0.99
Government media censorship	v2mecenefm_ord	Expression	1265	1.83	1.16	1858	1.83	1.14
Discussion for women	v2cldiscw_ord	Expression	1266	2.23	0.96	1859	2.22	0.94
Media self-censorship	v2meslfcen_ord	Expression	1266	2.27	1.18	1859	2.27	1.17
Suffrage	e_v2x_suffr_5C	Suffrage	1265	3.22	1.40	1858	3.16	1.45

Range for all variables is 0–4, from low to high democracy. The ranges for the following variables have been rescaled from their original 0-3 ordinal scale by division: media critical (v2mecrit\_ord), media perspectives (v2merange\_ord), and media self-censorship (v2meslfcen\_ord). Suffrage (e\_v2x\_suffr\_5C) has been rescaled from 0–1 proportion quintiles to a 0–4 range by multiplication. The following election-specific variables have been carried forward within the electoral regime (v2x\_elecreg): v2elmulpar\_ord, v2elpeace\_ord, v2elrgstry\_ord, v2elvotbuy\_ord, v2elirreg\_ord, v2elintim\_ord, v2elrfair\_ord. Sample limited to uncensored liberalizing autocracy episodes in the ERT dataset (Edgell et al. 2020).

TABLE A3: Domination table for Figure 1

Indicator	Democratic			Non-democratic		
	<i>d</i>	<i>r</i>	score	<i>d</i>	<i>r</i>	score
Suffrage	19	0	-19	20	0	-20
Barriers to parties	16	0	-16	17	0	-17
Party ban	16	0	-16	20	0	-20
Elections multiparty	14	0	-14	17	0	-17
Opposition parties autonomy	13	0	-13	11	3	-8
Other electoral violence	7	1	-6	5	3	-2
Media perspectives	7	1	-6	5	2	-3
Election intimidation	6	1	-5	5	3	-2
Election free and fair	4	3	-1	1	5	4
Voter registry	4	3	-1	1	5	4
Media critical	5	4	-1	6	3	-3
Discussion for men	5	5	0	5	4	-1
Discussion for women	4	5	1	5	5	0
CSO repression	4	5	1	5	4	-1
Media bias	4	5	1	5	4	-1
EMB capacity	3	5	2	0	14	14
Media self-censorship	3	5	2	5	4	-1
CSO entry and exit	2	7	5	3	5	2
Academic & cultural expression	1	8	7	3	5	2
Government media censorship	1	10	9	0	6	6
EMB autonomy	0	15	15	0	19	19
Harassment of journalists	0	17	17	1	14	13
Other voting irregularities	0	18	18	0	16	16
Vote buying	0	20	20	0	16	16

Results from pairwise domination analysis of collapsed "states" in episodes of liberalizing autocracy, disaggregated by outcome type. Statistics: *d* = number of indicators dominated; *r* = number of indicators dominated by; score = domination score (*d-r*). Results are sorted from low to high on domination score for democratic outcome. Unit of analysis is the collapsed state.

TABLE A4: Estimating the similarity of domination scores in episodes of liberalizing autocracy with democratic (x) and non-democratic (y) outcomes

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
	All	Preempted	Stabilized	Reverted
Coefficient	0.94*	1.01*	0.86*	0.98*
	(0.08)	(0.10)	(0.07)	(0.09)
Constant	0.00	-0.00	-0.00	-0.00
	(0.86)	(1.08)	(0.80)	(0.97)
Obs	24	24	24	24
R <sup>2</sup>	0.86	0.82	0.86	0.84
Adjusted R <sup>2</sup>	0.85	0.81	0.85	0.83
Residual Std. Error	4.19	5.27	3.92	4.77
F Statistic	136.55*	100.64*	133.51*	115.65*

Estimated coefficients and standard errors from bivariate linear regression models. The dependent variable (y) is the domination score for 24 indicators in liberalizing autocracies with non-democratic outcomes. The independent variable (x) is the domination score for those same 24 indicators in episodes of liberalizing autocracy with a democratic outcome. Domination scores calculated using collapsed states. \*p<0.01

TABLE A5: Residuals from bivariate regressions reported in A4

Indicator	(1) All	(2) Preempted	(3) Stabilized	(4) Reverted
Party ban	-5.03	-0.84	-7.18	-4.32
Academic & cultural expression	-4.55	-1.07	-4.05	-6.86
Elections multiparty	-3.90	-3.86	-1.90	-5.28
Harassment of journalists	-2.90	-1.17	-8.69	-0.66
Media self-censorship	-2.87	-2.02	-0.73	-3.96
Vote buying	-2.71	1.80	-3.28	-2.60
CSO entry and exit	-2.68	-3.05	-1.32	-2.90
Government media censorship	-2.42	-5.09	1.22	-1.82
Suffrage	-2.23	0.19	-4.58	-1.38
Media critical	-2.06	-3.99	-2.14	-1.02
Barriers to parties	-2.03	-1.84	-0.18	-2.32
CSO repression	-1.94	0.99	0.14	-1.98
Media bias	-1.94	-7.01	-0.86	-1.98
Discussion for men	-1.00	8.00	1.00	-1.00
Discussion for women	-0.94	5.99	-0.86	-0.98
Other voting irregularities	-0.84	-1.18	1.45	-1.64
Media perspectives	2.61	-7.94	2.18	3.88
Election intimidation	2.68	-5.95	5.32	3.90
Other electoral violence	3.61	7.06	2.18	3.88
Opposition parties autonomy	4.16	3.13	4.23	3.74
Election free and fair	4.94	0.01	5.86	0.98
Voter registry	4.94	7.01	2.86	3.98
EMB autonomy	4.97	-2.15	6.04	4.30
EMB capacity	12.13	12.98	3.27	16.04

Estimated residuals from bivariate linear regression models. The dependent variable (y) is the domination score for 24 indicators in liberalizing autocracies with non-democratic outcomes. The independent variable (x) is the domination score for those same 24 indicators in episodes of liberalizing autocracy with a democratic outcome. Domination scores calculated using collapsed states.

TABLE A6: Domination table for non-democratic outcomes by type

Indicator	Preempted			Stabilized			Reverted		
	<i>d</i>	<i>r</i>	score	<i>d</i>	<i>r</i>	score	<i>d</i>	<i>r</i>	score
Suffrage	19	0	-19	21	0	-21	20	0	-20
Elections multiparty	18	0	-18	14	0	-14	19	0	-19
Barriers to parties	18	0	-18	16	2	-14	18	0	-18
Party ban	17	0	-17	21	0	-21	20	0	-20
Media perspectives	15	1	-14	5	2	-3	5	3	-2
Election intimidation	12	1	-11	2	3	1	5	4	-1
Opposition parties autonomy	12	2	-10	9	2	-7	12	3	-9
Media bias	10	4	-6	3	3	0	5	4	-1
Media critical	9	4	-5	6	3	-3	6	4	-2
Election free and fair	6	5	-1	1	6	5	5	5	0
Media self-censorship	5	5	0	3	4	1	6	4	-2
Other electoral violence	5	6	1	5	2	-3	5	3	-2
CSO entry and exit	4	6	2	2	5	3	3	5	2
CSO repression	5	7	2	3	4	1	5	4	-1
Government media censorship	4	8	4	0	9	9	1	8	7
Academic & cultural expression	3	9	6	3	5	2	5	5	0
Voter registry	3	9	6	1	3	2	2	5	3
Discussion for women	2	9	7	4	4	0	5	5	0
Discussion for men	2	10	8	3	4	1	6	5	-1
EMB autonomy	1	14	13	0	19	19	0	19	19
EMB capacity	1	16	15	0	5	5	0	18	18
Harassment of journalists	1	17	16	2	8	6	0	16	16
Other voting irregularities	0	17	17	0	17	17	0	16	16
Vote buying	0	22	22	0	14	14	0	17	17

Results from pairwise domination analysis of collapsed "states" in episodes of liberalizing autocracy, disaggregated by non-democratic outcome type. Statistics: *d* = number of indicators dominated; *r* = number of indicators dominated by; score = domination score ( $r-d$ ). Results are sorted from low to high on domination score for preempted transition outcome. Unit of analysis is the collapsed state.

TABLE A7: Bivariate regressions of domination scores based on country-year observations

	(1) All	(2) Preempted	(3) Stabilized	(4) Reverted
Coefficient	0.94*	1.01*	0.91*	0.97*
	(0.08)	(0.11)	(0.07)	(0.10)
Constant	-0.00	-0.00	-0.00	0.00
	(0.83)	(1.15)	(0.77)	(1.02)
Observations	24	24	24	24
R <sup>2</sup>	0.87	0.80	0.88	0.82
Adjusted R <sup>2</sup>	0.87	0.79	0.87	0.82
Residual Std. Error	4.05	5.65	3.75	5.01
F Statistic	148.78*	87.86*	159.87*	102.66*

Estimated coefficients and standard errors from bivariate linear regression models. The dependent variable (y) is the domination score for 24 indicators in liberalizing autocracies with non-democratic outcomes. The independent variable (x) is the domination score for those same 24 indicators in episodes of liberalizing autocracy with a democratic outcome. Domination scores calculated using country-year observations. \*p<0.01



TABLE A8: Residuals from bivariate regressions reported in A7

Indicator	(1) All	(2) Preempted	(3) Stabilized	(4) Reverted
Academic & cultural expression	-4.61	-2.08	-4.34	-6.78
Government media censorship	-4.44	-6.11	0.94	-4.69
Party ban	-3.95	-1.81	-5.59	-3.53
Elections multiparty	-3.78	-2.85	-3.31	-3.44
Harassment of journalists	-3.05	-0.19	-6.41	-2.47
Media self-censorship	-2.89	-2.02	-0.81	-3.94
Suffrage	-2.06	1.21	-3.78	-1.60
Media critical	-2.06	-5.99	-3.09	-2.03
CSO repression	-1.94	-0.01	0.09	-1.97
Barriers to parties	-1.89	-2.82	2.50	-2.50
Media bias	-1.89	-6.02	-1.81	-2.94
Vote buying	-1.88	-0.22	-3.13	-0.37
CSO entry and exit	-1.78	-3.04	1.37	-2.87
Discussion for men	-1.00	3.00	1.00	-2.00
Discussion for women	-0.94	1.99	-2.91	-0.97
Other voting irregularities	0.00	0.80	0.69	-0.44
Media perspectives	0.78	-10.96	-0.37	0.87
Election intimidation	2.72	-1.95	1.53	2.84
Other electoral violence	3.67	8.07	2.44	3.81
Opposition parties autonomy	4.27	3.14	4.78	4.59
Election free and fair	4.89	4.02	6.81	2.94
Voter registry	4.94	6.01	3.91	4.97
EMB autonomy	5.78	0.85	7.31	5.44
EMB capacity	11.11	16.98	2.19	17.06

Estimated residuals from bivariate linear regression models. The dependent variable (y) is the domination score for 24 indicators in liberalizing autocracies with non-democratic outcomes. The independent variable (x) is the domination score for those same 24 indicators in episodes of liberalizing autocracy with a democratic outcome. Domination scores calculated using country-year observations.

TABLE A9: Domination table for country-year observations by outcome type

Indicator	Democratic			Non-democratic			Preempted			Stabilized			Reverted		
	<i>d</i>	<i>r</i>	score	<i>d</i>	<i>r</i>	score	<i>d</i>	<i>r</i>	score	<i>d</i>	<i>r</i>	score	<i>d</i>	<i>r</i>	score
Suffrage	19	0	-19	20	0	-20	18	0	-18	21	0	-21	20	0	-20
Party ban	17	0	-17	20	0	-20	19	0	-19	21	0	-21	20	0	-20
Barriers to parties	16	0	-16	17	0	-17	19	0	-19	14	2	-12	18	0	-18
Elections multiparty	14	0	-14	17	0	-17	17	0	-17	16	0	-16	17	0	-17
Opposition parties autonomy	13	0	-13	11	3	-8	14	4	-10	9	2	-7	11	3	-8
Other electoral violence	7	1	-6	5	3	-2	5	7	2	5	2	-3	5	3	-2
Election intimidation	6	1	-5	5	3	-2	9	2	-7	5	2	-3	5	3	-2
Media perspectives	6	2	-4	5	2	-3	15	0	-15	6	2	-4	5	2	-3
Election free and fair	5	3	-2	2	5	3	5	7	2	1	6	5	4	5	1
Voter registry	4	3	-1	1	5	4	4	9	5	1	4	3	2	6	4
Media critical	5	4	-1	6	3	-3	10	3	-7	7	3	-4	7	4	-3
Discussion for men	5	5	0	5	4	-1	4	7	3	3	4	1	6	4	-2
Discussion for women	4	5	1	5	5	0	4	7	3	5	3	-2	5	5	0
CSO repression	4	5	1	5	4	-1	5	6	1	3	4	1	5	4	-1
EMB capacity	3	5	2	0	13	13	0	19	19	1	5	4	0	19	19
Media bias	3	5	2	4	4	0	8	4	-4	4	4	0	5	4	-1
Media self-censorship	3	5	2	5	4	-1	5	5	0	3	4	1	6	4	-2
CSO entry and exit	2	6	4	3	5	2	5	6	1	2	7	5	4	5	1
Academic & cultural expression	1	8	7	3	5	2	4	9	5	3	5	2	5	5	0
Government media censorship	1	11	10	1	6	5	4	8	4	0	10	10	3	8	5
EMB autonomy	0	14	14	0	19	19	0	15	15	0	20	20	0	19	19
Harassment of journalists	0	17	17	1	14	13	1	18	17	2	11	9	1	15	14
Other voting irregularities	0	18	18	0	17	17	0	19	19	0	17	17	0	17	17
Vote buying	0	20	20	0	17	17	0	20	20	0	15	15	0	19	19

Results from pairwise domination analysis in episodes of liberalizing autocracy, disaggregated by non-democratic outcome type. Statistics: *d* = number of indicators dominated; *r* = number of indicators dominated by; score = domination score (*r-d*). Results are sorted from low to high on domination score for democratic transition outcome. Unit of analysis is country-year.

TABLE A10: Bivariate regressions of domination scores using two-thirds threshold

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
	All	Preempted	Stabilized	Reverted
Coefficient	0.89*	1.35*	0.80*	0.95*
	(0.08)	(0.15)	(0.09)	(0.07)
Constant	-0.00	-0.00	0.00	-0.00
	(0.44)	(0.81)	(0.49)	(0.42)
Observations	24	24	24	24
R <sup>2</sup>	0.85	0.80	0.79	0.88
Adjusted R <sup>2</sup>	0.85	0.79	0.78	0.87
Residual Std. Error	2.16	3.97	2.38	2.05
F Statistic	126.64*	86.66*	83.50*	161.31*

Estimated coefficients and standard errors from bivariate linear regression models. The dependent variable (y) is the domination score for 24 indicators in liberalizing autocracies with non-democratic outcomes. The independent variable (x) is the domination score for those same 24 indicators in episodes of liberalizing autocracy with a democratic outcome. Domination scores calculated using collapsed states with a threshold of at least two-thirds for domination. \*p<0.01

TABLE A11: Residuals from bivariate regressions reported in A10

Indicator	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
	All	Preempted	Stabilized	Reverted
Harassment of journalists	-4.01	-0.15	-4.16	-3.55
Suffrage	-3.43	1.55	-3.66	-1.64
Party ban	-3.43	3.55	-4.66	-3.64
Media self-censorship	-1.67	-3.05	-1.39	-1.85
Academic & cultural expression	-1.56	-0.40	-1.18	-0.80
Government media censorship	-1.45	-3.75	-0.98	-1.75
Discussion for men	-0.78	1.30	-0.59	-0.90
CSO repression	-0.78	-0.70	-0.59	-1.90
Discussion for women	-0.67	-1.05	-2.39	-0.85
Media bias	-0.67	-7.05	-0.39	-0.85
Opposition parties autonomy	-0.55	0.75	0.98	0.75
Other voting irregularities	-0.45	3.25	0.02	-0.75
Vote buying	-0.45	12.25	0.02	-0.75
Media critical	-0.11	-0.65	-0.20	-0.05
CSO entry and exit	0.33	-2.05	-0.39	0.15
Election intimidation	0.89	-2.65	1.80	0.95
Media perspectives	0.89	-5.65	0.80	0.95
Other electoral violence	1.89	2.35	0.80	1.95
Barriers to parties	1.90	-1.50	2.95	0.51
Election free and fair	2.00	0.00	2.00	2.00
Voter registry	2.00	4.00	2.00	2.00
EMB capacity	2.22	3.30	0.41	3.10
EMB autonomy	3.55	0.25	4.02	4.25
Elections multiparty	4.34	-3.90	4.77	2.70

Estimated residuals from bivariate linear regression models. The dependent variable (y) is the domination score for 24 indicators in liberalizing autocracies with non-democratic outcomes. The independent variable (x) is the domination score for those same 24 indicators in episodes of liberalizing autocracy with a democratic outcome. Domination scores calculated using collapsed states with a threshold of at least two-thirds for domination.

TABLE A 12: Domination table by outcome type using two-thirds threshold

Indicator	Democratic			Non-democratic			Preempted			Stabilized			Reverted		
	<i>d</i>	<i>r</i>	score	<i>d</i>	<i>r</i>	score	<i>d</i>	<i>r</i>	score	<i>d</i>	<i>r</i>	score	<i>d</i>	<i>r</i>	score
Suffrage	13	0	-13	15	0	-15	16	0	-16	14	0	-14	14	0	-14
Party ban	13	0	-13	15	0	-15	14	0	-14	15	0	-15	16	0	-16
Barriers to parties	10	0	-10	7	0	-7	15	0	-15	5	0	-5	9	0	-9
Elections multiparty	6	0	-6	1	0	-1	12	0	-12	0	0	0	3	0	-3
Opposition parties autonomy	5	0	-5	5	0	-5	6	0	-6	3	0	-3	5	1	-4
Election intimidation	1	0	-1	0	0	0	4	0	-4	0	1	1	0	0	0
Other electoral violence	1	0	-1	0	1	1	2	3	1	0	0	0	0	1	1
Media critical	1	0	-1	1	0	-1	3	1	-2	1	0	-1	1	0	-1
Media perspectives	1	0	-1	0	0	0	7	0	-7	0	0	0	0	0	0
Election free and fair	0	0	0	0	2	2	1	1	0	0	2	2	0	2	2
Voter registry	0	0	0	0	2	2	1	5	4	0	2	2	0	2	2
Discussion for men	0	2	2	1	2	1	1	5	4	1	2	1	1	2	1
CSO repression	0	2	2	1	2	1	1	3	2	1	2	1	1	1	0
EMB capacity	0	2	2	0	4	4	0	6	6	0	2	2	0	5	5
Discussion for women	0	3	3	0	2	2	1	4	3	1	1	0	1	3	2
CSO entry and exit	0	3	3	0	3	3	2	4	2	0	2	2	0	3	3
Media bias	0	3	3	0	2	2	4	1	-3	0	2	2	0	2	2
Media self-censorship	0	3	3	0	1	1	3	4	1	0	1	1	0	1	1
Academic & cultural expression	0	4	4	0	2	2	1	6	5	0	2	2	0	3	3
EMB autonomy	0	5	5	0	8	8	0	7	7	0	8	8	0	9	9
Other voting irregularities	0	5	5	0	4	4	0	10	10	0	4	4	0	4	4
Vote buying	0	5	5	0	4	4	0	19	19	0	4	4	0	4	4
Government media censorship	0	5	5	0	3	3	1	4	3	0	3	3	0	3	3
Harassment of journalists	0	9	9	0	4	4	0	12	12	0	3	3	0	5	5

Results from pairwise domination analysis of collapsed "states" in episodes of liberalizing autocracy, disaggregated by non-democratic outcome type. Statistics: *d* = number of indicators dominated; *r* = number of indicators dominated by; score = domination score (*r-d*). Results are sorted from low to high on domination score for democratic transition outcome. Domination calculated using a threshold of at least two-thirds.