Appendix Table 1: Estimated Effects on Net Citizenship Policy Change (OLS)

(*With Salience Controls*)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 |
| Left | -0.03 (0.02) |  |  |  | -0.03 (0.02) |  | 0.13\*\* (0.07) |  |
| Center |  |  |  |  |  | -0.10 (0.07) | -0.07 (0.10) |  |
| Right | 0.01 (0.02) |  |  |  | 0.01 (0.02) | -0.07 (0.05) |  |  |
| Left-Right Cabinet Score |  | 0.02\*\* (0.01) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Radical Right Vote |  |  | 0.00 (0.00) |  |  |  |  |  |
| Far Left/Green Vote |  |  | -0.00 (0.00) |  |  |  |  |  |
| Change, Radical Right Vote |  |  |  | -0.00 (0.00) |  |  |  |  |
| Change, Far Left/ Green Vote |  |  |  | -0.01\*\* (0.00) |  |  |  |  |
| ENRP |  |  |  |  | 0.02 (0.02) | -0.02 (0.02) | 0.03\* (0.02) |  |
| ENLP |  |  |  |  | -0.01 (0.02) | -0.01 (0.02) | 0.00 (0.02) |  |
| Center x ENRP |  |  |  |  |  | 0.08\* (0.04) |  |  |
| Right x ENRP |  |  |  |  |  | 0.07\*\* (0.03) |  |  |
| Left x ENLP |  |  |  |  |  |  | -0.11\*\* (0.04) |  |
| Center x ENLP |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.03 (0.06) |  |
| Radical Right in Gov’t |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.11\* (0.06) |
| Far Left/ Green in Gov’t |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | -0.04\* (0.02) |
| Salience | 0.01\*\* (0.00) | 0.01\*\* (0.00) | 0.01\* (0.00) | 0.01\*\* (0.00) | 0.01\* (0.00) | 0.01\* (0.00) | 0.01\* (0.00) | 0.01\* (0.00) |
| Foreign Born Percent (log) | -0.01 (0.01) | -0.01 (0.01) | -0.01 (0.01) | -0.00 (0.01) | -0.01 (0.01) | -0.01 (0.01) | -0.00 (0.01) | -0.01 (0.01) |
| Migration Rate (lagged) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) |
| GDP Growth | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) |
| Liberal | 0.01 (0.02) | 0.01 (0.02) | 0.02 (0.02) | 0.02 (0.02) | 0.02 (0.02) | 0.02 (0.02) | 0.02 (0.02) | 0.02 (0.02) |
| Constant | -0.01 (0.03) | -0.11\*\*\* (0.04) | -0.01 (0.02) | -0.03 (0.02) | -0.03 (0.04) | 0.01 (0.04) | -0.06 (0.04) | -0.02 (0.02) |
| Observations | 638 | 635 | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 |
| N\_clust | 191.00 | 190.00 | 191.00 | 191.00 | 191.00 | 191.00 | 191.00 | 191.00 |
| r2 | 0.03 | 0.03 | 0.02 | 0.03 | 0.03 | 0.04 | 0.05 | 0.04 |

Standard errors in parentheses

\* p<.1, \*\* p<.05, \*\*\* p<.01Appendix Table 2: Estimated Effects on Net Citizenship Policy Change (OLS)

(*With Control for Left-Right Cabinet Score*)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |
| Left-Right Cabinet Score | 0.02\*\*\* (0.01) | 0.02\*\*\* (0.01) | 0.02\*\* (0.01) | 0.02\*\*\* (0.01) | -0.01 (0.02) | -0.02 (0.02) |
| Radical Right Vote |  | 0.00\*\*\* (0.00) |  |  |  |  |
| Far Left/Green Vote |  | -0.00 (0.00) |  |  |  |  |
| Change, Radical Right Vote |  |  | 0.00 (0.00) |  |  |  |
| Change, Far Left/ Green Vote |  |  | -0.01\*\* (0.00) |  |  |  |
| ENRP |  |  |  | 0.03\* (0.02) | -0.05 (0.04) | 0.03\*\* (0.02) |
| ENLP |  |  |  | -0.01 (0.02) | -0.01 (0.02) | -0.15\* (0.08) |
| ENRP x Left-Right Cabinet Score |  |  |  |  | 0.02\* (0.01) |  |
| ENLP x Left-Right Cabinet Score |  |  |  |  |  | 0.02\* (0.01) |
| Foreign Born Percent (log) | 0.00 (0.01) | -0.01 (0.01) | 0.01 (0.01) | 0.01 (0.01) | 0.01 (0.01) | 0.01 (0.01) |
| Migration Rate (lagged) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) |
| GDP Growth | -0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | -0.00 (0.00) | -0.00 (0.00) | -0.00 (0.00) | -0.00 (0.00) |
| Liberal | 0.02 (0.02) | 0.03 (0.02) | 0.02 (0.02) | 0.02 (0.02) | 0.02 (0.02) | 0.02 (0.02) |
| Constant | -0.08\*\* (0.04) | -0.07\*\* (0.03) | -0.08\*\* (0.04) | -0.14\*\*\* (0.05) | 0.01 (0.09) | 0.09 (0.12) |
| Observations | 635 | 635 | 635 | 635 | 635 | 635 |
| N\_clust | 190.00 | 190.00 | 190.00 | 190.00 | 190.00 | 190.00 |
| r2 | 0.02 | 0.03 | 0.03 | 0.02 | 0.03 | 0.03 |

Standard errors in parentheses

\* p<.1, \*\* p<.05, \*\*\* p<.01

Appendix Table 3: Estimated Effects on Net Citizenship Policy Change (OLS)

(*With Control for Kayser and Lindstädt’s (2015) Loss Probabilities (LPR and LPR2*)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 |
| Left | -0.03 (0.03) |  |  |  | -0.02 (0.03) |  | 0.15\*\* (0.06) |  |
| Right | 0.01 (0.03) |  |  |  | 0.01 (0.02) | -0.15\*\* (0.06) |  |  |
| Center |  |  |  |  |  | -0.18\*\* (0.08) | -0.14 (0.12) |  |
| Left-Right Cabinet Score |  | 0.02\*\* (0.01) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Radical Right Vote |  |  | 0.01\*\*\* (0.00) |  |  |  |  |  |
| Far Left/Green Vote |  |  | -0.00 (0.00) |  |  |  |  |  |
| Change, Radical Right Vote |  |  |  | 0.00 (0.01) |  |  |  |  |
| Change, Far Left/ Green Vote |  |  |  | -0.01 (0.01) |  |  |  |  |
| ENRP |  |  |  |  | 0.05\*\* (0.02) | -0.01 (0.02) | 0.06\*\*\* (0.02) |  |
| ENLP |  |  |  |  | 0.01 (0.03) | 0.00 (0.03) | 0.01 (0.02) |  |
| Center x ENRP |  |  |  |  |  | 0.12\*\* (0.05) |  |  |
| Right x ENRP |  |  |  |  |  | 0.11\*\*\* (0.04) |  |  |
| Left x ENLP |  |  |  |  |  |  | -0.12\*\*\* (0.03) |  |
| Center x ENLP |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.07 (0.07) |  |
| Far Right in Gov't |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.19\*\* (0.07) |
| Far Left/Green in Gov't |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | -0.01 (0.02) |
| LPR | -0.10 (0.18) | -0.14 (0.16) | -0.07 (0.16) | -0.08 (0.17) | 0.03 (0.18) | -0.04 (0.17) | 0.09 (0.18) | -0.16 (0.15) |
| LPRsq | 0.16 (0.32) | 0.22 (0.29) | 0.12 (0.30) | 0.13 (0.31) | -0.00 (0.31) | 0.09 (0.29) | -0.06 (0.30) | 0.25 (0.27) |
| Foreign Born Percent (log) | 0.01 (0.01) | 0.01 (0.01) | -0.01 (0.01) | 0.01 (0.01) | 0.01 (0.01) | 0.00 (0.01) | 0.01 (0.01) | 0.00 (0.01) |
| Migration Rate (lagged) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) |
| GDP Growth | -0.00 (0.00) | -0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | -0.00 (0.00) | -0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) |
| Liberal | 0.02 (0.02) | 0.01 (0.02) | 0.03 (0.02) | 0.03 (0.02) | 0.02 (0.02) | 0.02 (0.02) | 0.02 (0.02) | 0.03 (0.02) |
| Constant | 0.02 (0.04) | -0.08\* (0.04) | 0.01 (0.03) | 0.00 (0.03) | -0.09 (0.06) | 0.01 (0.05) | -0.13\*\*\* (0.05) | 0.01 (0.03) |
| Observations | 513 | 513 | 513 | 513 | 513 | 513 | 513 | 513 |
| Clusters | 149.00 | 149.00 | 149.00 | 149.00 | 149.00 | 149.00 | 149.00 | 149.00 |
| *R*2 | 0.01 | 0.01 | 0.03 | 0.01 | 0.03 | 0.06 | 0.05 | 0.04 |

Standard errors in parentheses

\* p<.1, \*\* p<.05, \*\*\* p<.01

Appendix Table 4: Estimated Effects on Net Number of Citizenship Policy Changes (OLS)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 |
| Left | -0.12\* (0.07) |  |  |  | -0.14\* (0.07) |  | 0.41\* (0.22) |  |
| Right | 0.05 (0.08) |  |  |  | 0.05 (0.07) | -0.21 (0.20) |  |  |
| Center |  |  |  |  |  | -0.21 (0.19) | -0.19 (0.32) |  |
| Left-Right Cabinet Score |  | 0.07\*\*\* (0.02) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Radical Right Vote |  |  | 0.01\*\* (0.01) |  |  |  |  |  |
| Far Left/Green Vote |  |  | -0.00 (0.00) |  |  |  |  |  |
| Change, Radical Right Vote |  |  |  | -0.00 (0.01) |  |  |  |  |
| Change, Far Left/ Green Vote |  |  |  | -0.03\*\* (0.01) |  |  |  |  |
| ENRP |  |  |  |  | 0.09 (0.06) | -0.02 (0.04) | 0.12\*\* (0.06) |  |
| ENLP |  |  |  |  | -0.04 (0.08) | -0.05 (0.08) | 0.01 (0.07) |  |
| Center x ENRP |  |  |  |  |  | 0.20\* (0.11) |  |  |
| Right x ENRP |  |  |  |  |  | 0.24\* (0.13) |  |  |
| Left x ENLP |  |  |  |  |  |  | -0.37\*\*\* (0.14) |  |
| Center x ENLP |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.07 (0.18) |  |
| Far Right in Gov't |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.55\*\* (0.23) |
| Far Left/Green in Gov't |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | -0.20\*\* (0.09) |
| Foreign Born Percent (log) | 0.00 (0.03) | 0.01 (0.03) | -0.02 (0.03) | 0.02 (0.03) | 0.01 (0.03) | -0.00 (0.03) | 0.01 (0.03) | -0.00 (0.03) |
| Migration Rate (lagged) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) |
| GDP Growth | -0.01 (0.01) | -0.01 (0.01) | -0.01 (0.01) | -0.01 (0.01) | -0.01 (0.01) | -0.01 (0.01) | -0.01 (0.01) | -0.01 (0.01) |
| Liberal | 0.08 (0.07) | 0.07 (0.07) | 0.14\* (0.07) | 0.10 (0.07) | 0.09 (0.07) | 0.09 (0.07) | 0.10 (0.07) | 0.12\* (0.07) |
| Constant | 0.11 (0.08) | -0.30\*\* (0.12) | 0.08 (0.09) | 0.05 (0.06) | 0.02 (0.13) | 0.11 (0.13) | -0.09 (0.14) | 0.07 (0.07) |
| Observations | 638 | 635 | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 |
| Clusters | 191 | 190 | 191 | 191 | 191 | 191 | 191 | 191 |
| *R*2 | 0.02 | 0.02 | 0.02 | 0.01 | 0.02 | 0.03 | 0.04 | 0.04 |

Standard errors in parentheses

\* p<.1, \*\* p<.05, \*\*\* p<.01

Appendix Table 5: Estimated Effects on Net Weighted Citizenship Policy Change (OLS)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 |
| Left | -0.03 (0.03) |  |  |  | -0.04 (0.04) |  | 0.25\*\*\* (0.09) |  |
| Right | 0.03 (0.03) |  |  |  | 0.03 (0.03) | -0.14\* (0.08) |  |  |
| Center |  |  |  |  |  | -0.17\* (0.10) | -0.06 (0.09) |  |
| Left-Right Cabinet Score |  | 0.02\*\*\* (0.01) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Radical Right Vote |  |  | 0.00\*\* (0.00) |  |  |  |  |  |
| Far Left/Green Vote |  |  | -0.00 (0.00) |  |  |  |  |  |
| Change, Radical Right Vote |  |  |  | 0.00 (0.01) |  |  |  |  |
| Change, Far Left/ Green Vote |  |  |  | -0.01\* (0.01) |  |  |  |  |
| ENRP |  |  |  |  | 0.05\*\* (0.02) | -0.02 (0.02) | 0.06\*\*\* (0.02) |  |
| ENLP |  |  |  |  | -0.03 (0.03) | -0.04 (0.03) | 0.00 (0.02) |  |
| Center x ENRP |  |  |  |  |  | 0.12\*\* (0.05) |  |  |
| Right x ENRP |  |  |  |  |  | 0.12\*\*\* (0.04) |  |  |
| Left x ENLP |  |  |  |  |  |  | -0.20\*\*\* (0.06) |  |
| Center x ENLP |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.01 (0.05) |  |
| Far Right in Gov't |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.17\*\*\* (0.06) |
| Far Left/Green in Gov't |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | -0.03 (0.03) |
| Foreign Born Percent (log) | -0.00 (0.01) | 0.00 (0.01) | -0.02 (0.02) | 0.00 (0.01) | 0.00 (0.01) | -0.01 (0.01) | 0.00 (0.01) | -0.00 (0.01) |
| Migration Rate (lagged) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) |
| GDP Growth | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) |
| Liberal | 0.04 (0.03) | 0.04 (0.02) | 0.06\*\* (0.03) | 0.05\* (0.03) | 0.05\* (0.03) | 0.05\* (0.02) | 0.05\*\* (0.02) | 0.06\*\* (0.02) |
| Constant | 0.01 (0.03) | -0.13\*\* (0.05) | 0.03 (0.04) | -0.01 (0.03) | -0.01 (0.06) | 0.07 (0.06) | -0.08 (0.06) | -0.01 (0.03) |
| Observations | 638 | 635 | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 |
| Clusters | 191 | 190 | 191 | 191 | 191 | 191 | 191 | 191 |
| *R*2 | 0.01 | 0.02 | 0.01 | 0.02 | 0.02 | 0.04 | 0.04 | 0.02 |

Standard errors in parentheses

\* p<.1, \*\* p<.05, \*\*\* p<.01

Appendix 6: Estimated Effects on Net Citizenship Policy Change (OLS)

(*With Controls for Ortega and Peri’s (2013) Immigration Policy Scores*)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 |
| Left | 0.06 (0.04) |  |  |  | 0.03 (0.04) |  | 0.26 (0.17) |  |
| Right | 0.05 (0.04) |  |  |  | 0.05 (0.04) | -0.26\*\*\* (0.08) |  |  |
| Center |  |  |  |  |  | -0.26\*\* (0.11) | -0.33 (0.27) |  |
| Left-Right Cabinet Score |  | 0.01 (0.01) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Radical Right Vote |  |  | 0.01\*\* (0.00) |  |  |  |  |  |
| Far Left/Green Vote |  |  | 0.00 (0.00) |  |  |  |  |  |
| Change, Radical Right Vote |  |  |  | 0.01 (0.01) |  |  |  |  |
| Change, Far Left/ Green Vote |  |  |  | -0.00 (0.01) |  |  |  |  |
| ENRP |  |  |  |  | 0.07\*\* (0.03) | 0.00 (0.02) | 0.07\*\* (0.03) |  |
| ENLP |  |  |  |  | 0.00 (0.07) | -0.04 (0.07) | 0.07 (0.06) |  |
| Center x ENRP |  |  |  |  |  | 0.14\*\* (0.06) |  |  |
| Right x ENRP |  |  |  |  |  | 0.16\*\*\* (0.05) |  |  |
| Left x ENLP |  |  |  |  |  |  | -0.19 (0.13) |  |
| Center x ENLP |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.19 (0.17) |  |
| Far Right in Gov't |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.36\*\*\* (0.12) |
| Far Left/Green in Gov't |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.06 (0.06) |
| Immigration Policy (Entry) | 0.01 (0.01) | 0.01 (0.01) | 0.01 (0.01) | 0.00 (0.02) | 0.01 (0.02) | 0.02 (0.02) | 0.01 (0.01) | 0.00 (0.01) |
| Immigration Policy (Residence) | 0.01 (0.02) | 0.01 (0.02) | 0.01 (0.02) | 0.01 (0.02) | -0.00 (0.02) | -0.02 (0.02) | -0.00 (0.02) | 0.01 (0.01) |
| Immigration Policy (Asylum) | -0.01 (0.02) | -0.00 (0.02) | 0.02 (0.02) | 0.00 (0.02) | 0.02 (0.02) | 0.01 (0.02) | 0.01 (0.02) | 0.01 (0.01) |
| Foreign Born Percent (log) | -0.02 (0.02) | -0.01 (0.02) | -0.02 (0.02) | -0.02 (0.03) | 0.01 (0.02) | 0.01 (0.02) | 0.02 (0.02) | -0.04\* (0.02) |
| Migration Rate (lagged) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) |
| GDP Growth | -0.00 (0.01) | -0.00 (0.01) | -0.00 (0.01) | -0.00 (0.01) | -0.00 (0.01) | 0.00 (0.01) | -0.00 (0.01) | 0.00 (0.01) |
| Liberal | 0.05 (0.04) | 0.05 (0.04) | 0.04 (0.04) | 0.05 (0.04) | 0.06\* (0.03) | 0.08\*\* (0.03) | 0.07\*\* (0.03) | 0.06 (0.04) |
| Constant | -0.00 (0.05) | -0.02 (0.06) | -0.01 (0.06) | 0.04 (0.05) | -0.17 (0.11) | 0.05 (0.09) | -0.22\*\* (0.11) | 0.05 (0.04) |
| Observations | 204 | 202 | 204 | 204 | 204 | 204 | 204 | 204 |
| Clusters | 65 | 65 | 65 | 65 | 65 | 65 | 65 | 65 |
| *R*2 | 0.04 | 0.03 | 0.06 | 0.04 | 0.06 | 0.12 | 0.08 | 0.10 |

Standard errors in parentheses

\* p<.1, \*\* p<.05, \*\*\* p<.01Appendix Table 7: Estimated Effects on Net Citizenship Policy Change (OLS)

(*With Controls for Liberal Party Variables*)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Liberal Party Vote Share | 0.00 (0.00) | -0.00 (0.00) |  |  |  |
| Radical Right Vote |  | 0.00\*\*\* (0.00) |  |  |  |
| Far Left/Green Vote |  | -0.00 (0.00) |  |  |  |
| Liberal Party in Gov't |  |  | 0.01 (0.02) | -0.11\*\* (0.06) | 0.09 (0.06) |
| ENRP |  |  |  | -0.00 (0.01) | 0.02 (0.02) |
| ENLP |  |  |  | 0.00 (0.02) | 0.01 (0.03) |
| Liberal Party in Gov't x ENRP |  |  |  | 0.07\*\* (0.03) |  |
| Liberal Party in Gov't x ENLP |  |  |  |  | -0.05 (0.03) |
| Foreign Born Percent (log) | 0.00 (0.01) | -0.01 (0.01) | 0.00 (0.01) | 0.01 (0.01) | 0.01 (0.01) |
| Migration Rate (lagged) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) | 0.00 (0.00) |
| GDP Growth | -0.00 (0.00) | -0.00 (0.00) | -0.00 (0.00) | -0.00 (0.00) | -0.00 (0.00) |
| Liberal | 0.03 (0.02) | 0.03\* (0.02) | 0.03 (0.02) | 0.03 (0.02) | 0.03 (0.02) |
| Constant | 0.01 (0.02) | 0.02 (0.03) | 0.00 (0.02) | -0.01 (0.04) | -0.06 (0.04) |
| Observations | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 |
| Clusters | 191 | 191 | 191 | 191 | 191 |
| *R*2 | 0.00 | 0.01 | 0.00 | 0.02 | 0.01 |

Standard errors in parentheses

\* p<.1, \*\* p<.05, \*\*\* p<.01

Appendix 8: Estimated Effects of Party Competition on Liberalizations and Restrictions (Logistic Regression)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| *Restrictions* | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | *Liberalizations* | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 |
| Right Party Vote | 0.99 (0.01) |  |  |  |  | Left Party Vote | 1.06\*\* (0.03) |  |  |  |  |
| Radical Right Party Vote | 1.07\*\*\* (0.02) |  |  |  | 1.05\* (0.03) | Far Left/Green Party Vote | 1.03 (0.03) |  |  |  | 1.02 (0.04) |
| Right Gov’t |  |  | 1.28 (0.36) | 0.38 (0.29) | 0.70 (0.27) | Left Gov’t |  |  | 2.54\* (1.27) | 0.05\*\* (0.06) | 1.33 (1.04) |
| Radical Right in Gov’t |  | 3.66\*\*\* (1.58) |  |  |  | Far Left/Green in Gov't |  | 3.00\*\* (1.50) |  |  |  |
| ENRP |  |  | 1.55\*\* (0.30) | 1.21 (0.30) |  | ENLP |  |  | 1.73 (0.63) | 0.64 (0.31) |  |
| Right Gov’t x ENRP |  |  |  | 1.94 (0.78) |  | Left Gov’t x ENLP |  |  |  | 8.65\*\*\* (5.69) |  |
| Right Gov’t x Radical Right Vote |  |  |  |  | 1.10\*\* (0.04) | Left Gov’t x Far Left/Green Vote |  |  |  |  | 1.05 (0.06) |
| Foreign Born Percent (log) | 1.12 (0.24) | 1.39 (0.31) | 1.47\* (0.32) | 1.43 (0.32) | 1.12 (0.25) | Foreign Born Percent (log) | 1.62\*\* (0.39) | 1.48\* (0.34) | 1.55\* (0.36) | 1.50\* (0.34) | 1.67\* (0.48) |
| Migration Rate (lagged) | 0.97 (0.03) | 0.98 (0.03) | 0.98 (0.03) | 0.98 (0.03) | 0.97 (0.03) | Migration Rate (lagged) | 0.94\* (0.03) | 0.94\*\* (0.03) | 0.94\*\* (0.03) | 0.94\* (0.03) | 0.94 (0.05) |
| Liberal | 1.95\*\* (0.61) | 1.55 (0.46) | 1.35 (0.40) | 1.35 (0.40) | 1.80\* (0.56) | Liberal | 0.47 (0.29) | 0.39 (0.24) | 0.35\* (0.21) | 0.31\*\* (0.18) | 0.39\* (0.21) |
| Constant | 0.07\*\*\* (0.04) | 0.05\*\*\* (0.02) | 0.02\*\*\* (0.01) | 0.03\*\*\* (0.02) | 0.05\*\*\* (0.02) | Constant | 0.00\*\*\* (0.00) | 0.02\*\*\* (0.01) | 0.01\*\*\* (0.01) | 0.05\*\*\* (0.05) | 0.01\*\*\* (0.01) |
| Chi2 | 20.63 | 14.82 | 9.95 | 13.45 | 27.24 |  | 15.54 | 17.46 | 10.12 | 27.97 | 12.39 |
| Observations | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 |  | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 |

Exponentiated coefficients; Standard errors in parentheses. \* p<0.10, \*\* p<0.05, \*\*\* p<0.01

Appendix 9: Estimated Effects of Party Competition on Liberalizations and Restrictions (Rare Events Logistic Regression), with Salience Control

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| *Restrictions* | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | *Liberalizations* | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 |
| Right Party Vote | 1.00 (0.01) |  |  |  |  | Left Party Vote | 1.06\*\* (0.03) |  |  |  |  |
| Radical Right Party Vote | 1.06\*\* (0.02) |  |  |  | 1.03 (0.03) | Far Left/Green Party Vote | 1.03 (0.03) |  |  |  | 1.03 (0.04) |
| Right Gov’t |  |  | 1.24 (0.35) | 0.41 (0.33) | 0.77 (0.30) | Left Gov’t |  |  | 2.46\*\* (0.99) | 0.07\* (0.09) | 1.33 (1.02) |
| Radical Right in Gov’t |  | 1.85 (0.90) |  |  |  | Far Left/Green in Gov't |  | 3.28\*\* (1.55) |  |  |  |
| ENRP |  |  | 1.24 (0.26) | 1.01 (0.26) |  | ENLP |  |  | 1.77 (0.65) | 0.73 (0.42) |  |
| Right Gov’t x ENRP |  |  |  | 1.83 (0.74) |  | Left Gov’t x ENLP |  |  |  | 7.32\*\*\* (5.65) |  |
| Right Gov’t x Radical Right Vote |  |  |  |  | 1.08\* (0.04) | Left Gov’t x Far Left/Green Vote |  |  |  |  | 1.05 (0.06) |
| Salience | 1.12\*\*\* (0.05) | 1.14\*\*\* (0.05) | 1.15\*\*\* (0.04) | 1.14\*\*\* (0.04) | 1.11\*\* (0.04) | Salience | 1.03 (0.07) | 0.96 (0.06) | 0.99 (0.06) | 0.99 (0.06) | 1.00 (0.06) |
| Foreign Born Percent (log) | 0.97 (0.22) | 1.14 (0.25) | 1.14 (0.25) | 1.13 (0.25) | 1.01 (0.23) | Foreign Born Percent (log) | 1.53 (0.45) | 1.53 (0.42) | 1.54 (0.43) | 1.48 (0.41) | 1.62\* (0.47) |
| Migration Rate (lagged) | 0.98 (0.03) | 0.98 (0.03) | 0.98 (0.03) | 0.98 (0.03) | 0.97 (0.03) | Migration Rate (lagged) | 0.95 (0.05) | 0.94 (0.05) | 0.94 (0.05) | 0.94 (0.05) | 0.94 (0.05) |
| Liberal | 1.55 (0.49) | 1.30 (0.39) | 1.21 (0.36) | 1.21 (0.36) | 1.54 (0.48) | Liberal | 0.51 (0.26) | 0.44 (0.23) | 0.39\* (0.20) | 0.35\* (0.19) | 0.44 (0.22) |
| Constant | 0.03\*\*\* (0.02) | 0.03\*\*\* (0.01) | 0.02\*\*\* (0.01) | 0.03\*\*\* (0.02) | 0.04\*\*\* (0.02) | Constant | 0.00\*\*\* (0.00) | 0.03\*\*\* (0.02) | 0.01\*\*\* (0.01) | 0.05\*\*\* (0.06) | 0.01\*\*\* (0.01) |
| Chi2 | 28.44 | 24.87 | 24.31 | 26.41 | 34.20 |  | 8.73 | 10.56 | 9.75 | 19.12 | 11.84 |
| Observations | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 |  | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 |

Exponentiated coefficients; Standard errors in parentheses. \* p<0.10, \*\* p<0.05, \*\*\* p<0.01