**Online Appendix**

**“Beyond positive and negative: New perspectives on feedback effects in public opinion on the welfare state”, British Journal of Political Science**

**Authors:** Marius R. Busemeyer (University of Konstanz), Aurélien Abrassart (University of Berne), Roula Nezi (GESIS Cologne)

**Explanatory note:** Table A1 present descriptive statistics on the size of the middle categories in the ISSP surveys across waves and policy fields. Tables A2 to A11 concern the MLE pseudo-panel analysis; Tables A12 to A19 display additional results from the Bayesian replication.

**Methodological note on Bayesian replication:** Non-response answers are treated as missing values. After removing individuals with missing values on covariates, we are left with around 700-750 groups of individuals, which is a sufficiently large sample size for a Bayesian analysis to provide robust results. In contrast to inference-based methods, the Bayesian approach computes a posterior distribution of coefficient estimates on the basis of a large number of iterations. Since our goal is to predict accurate representation we need to sample a large number of representative points from this posterior distribution. To generate this distribution, we rely on the Markov Chain Monte Carlo (MCMC) approach as is common in this field (Gelman, Carlin, Stern & Rubin 2014). The basic model is a regression with a random (varying) intercept. Following Gelman and Hill, we assign ’non-informative’ priors for the macro level parameters (Gelman & Hill 2006). The random effects at the macro level are assumed to have a normal distribution as well and are given a uniform prior normal distribution between 0 and 100. The mean and the standard deviation of each parameter is estimated at the 2*.*5% and the 97*.*5% credible intervals. The credible intervals define the region from which the 95% of all parameters are drawn. We estimated our covariates by running the model with five chains and five thousand iterations (Cowles 2013).

**References:**

Cowles, Mary Kathryn. 2013. Applied Bayesian statistics: with R and OpenBUGS examples. Vol. 98 Springer Science & Business Media.

Gelman, Andrew & Jennifer Hill. 2006. Data analysis using regression and multi- level/hierarchical models. Cambridge University Press.

Gelman, Andrew, John B Carlin, Hal S Stern & Donald B Rubin. 2014. *Bayesian Data Analysis*. Eds: Chapman & Hall/CRC Texts in Statistical Science. Third Edition. CRC Press Taylor & Francis Group.

Table A1: Descriptive statistics: Share of respondents in middle category across ISSP waves and policy fields.

**Panel A: ISSP Wave 1996**

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Country** | **Education** | **Health** | **Retirement** | **Unemployment** |
| Australia | 26.9 | 18 | 46.77 | 46.77 |
| Canada | 29.45 | 38.02 | 60.09 | 60.09 |
| Czech Republic | 28.95 | 15.64 | 30.39 | 30.39 |
| France | 28.04 | 38.47 | 57.34 | 57.34 |
| Germany | 40.75 | 35.2 | 46.62 | 46.62 |
| Sweden | 38.59 | 22.34 | 40.66 | 40.66 |
| Hungary | 17.2 | 5.97 | 13.64 | 35.03 |
| Ireland | 34.68 | 15.32 | 24.54 | 24.54 |
| New Zealand | 16.46 | 11.19 | 48.55 | 48.55 |
| Norway | 44.71 | 13.46 | 41.48 | 41.48 |
| Poland | 13.78 | 4.55 | 15.61 | 15.61 |
| Spain | 24.16 | 19.11 | 30.16 | 30.16 |
| Switzerland | 15.89 | 47.94 | 55.96 | 55.96 |
| United States | 3.48 | 25.76 | 39.33 | 39.33 |

**Panel B: ISSP Wave 2006**

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Country** | **Education** | **Health** | **Retirement** | **Unemployment** |
| Australia | 19.69 | 9.35 | 43.53 | 48.54 |
| Canada | 31.06 | 20 | 43.67 | 56.95 |
| Czech Republic | 31.07 | 23.78 | 32.82 | 43.5 |
| Denmark | 36.33 | 17.87 | 43.3 | 60.49 |
| Finland | 52.28 | 32.73 | 46.71 | 45.59 |
| France | 33.29 | 28.45 | 42.33 | 49.08 |
| Germany | 15.57 | 16.42 | 23.86 | 45.76 |
| United Kingdom | 26.49 | 5.89 | 20.72 | 38.93 |
| Hungary | 25.08 | 6.31 | 9.91 | 35.35 |
| Ireland | 11.46 | 25.86 | 36.89 | 52.23 |
| Japan | 40.65 | 15.12 | 45.24 | 36.24 |
| New Zealand | 29.53 | 13.55 | 39.41 | 59.13 |
| Norway | 36.54 | 6.97 | 7.58 | 33.58 |
| Poland | 19.31 | 5.95 | 7.44 | 27.29 |
| Portugal | 14.07 | 16.99 | 34.6 | 36.98 |
| Slovenia | 17.83 | 11.98 | 16.33 | 33.43 |
| Spain | 12.38 | 18.56 | 35.81 | 51.26 |
| Sweden | 43.59 | 42.87 | 42.39 | 58.55 |
| Switzerland | 27.78 | 13.82 | 28.36 | 49.09 |
| The Netherlands | 26.3 | 17.79 | 26.36 | 43.87 |
| United States | 13.43 | 27.65 | 51.65 | 53.48 |

Table A2: Feedback effects excluding groups smaller than 20.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|   | Lag 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| **Specific feedback effect** |  |  |  |  |  |
| Education | -0.0437 | 0.0219 | 0.0153 | -0.0156 | -0.0149 |
|  | (0.0306) | (0.0270) | (0.0306) | (0.0299) | (0.0401) |
| Health | -0.0816\* | -0.0320 | -0.0432 | -0.0449\* | 0.0198 |
|  | (0.0441) | (0.0312) | (0.0322) | (0.0253) | (0.0254) |
| Retirement | 0.0699 | -0.00173 | -0.0132 | 0.000790 | 0.0167 |
|  | (0.0559) | (0.0425) | (0.0411) | (0.0365) | (0.0316) |
| Unemployment | -0.0954\*\*\* | -0.121\*\*\* | -0.145\*\*\* | -0.138\*\*\* | -0.146\*\*\* |
|  | (0.0361) | (0.0375) | (0.0331) | (0.0279) | (0.0434) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **General feedback effect** |  |  |  |  |  |
| Education | -0.0472 | -0.0336 | -0.00236 | 0.0126 | 0.0196 |
|  | (0.0431) | (0.0380) | (0.0397) | (0.0359) | (0.0378) |
| Health | -0.0141 | -0.0102 | -0.0204 | 0.00945 | 0.0406 |
|  | (0.0546) | (0.0397) | (0.0363) | (0.0315) | (0.0324) |
| Retirement | -0.110\*\* | -0.126\*\*\* | -0.148\*\*\* | -0.111\*\*\* | -0.0743\*\* |
|  | (0.0533) | (0.0405) | (0.0372) | (0.0321) | (0.0331) |
| Unemployment | -0.122\* | -0.0996\*\* | -0.113\*\*\* | -0.0816\*\* | -0.0297 |
|   | (0.0625) | (0.0445) | (0.0405) | (0.0350) | (0.0361) |
| Standard errors in parentheses |  |  |  |  |  |
| \*\*\* p<0.01, \*\* p<0.05, \* p<0.1 |  |  |  |  |  |

Table A3: Feedback effects including only countries that are included in both ISSP waves.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|   | Lag 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| **Specific feedback effect** |  |  |  |  |  |
| Education | -0.0746\*\* | 0.0337 | 0.0184 | 0.0159 | -0.0150 |
|  | (0.0357) | (0.0336) | (0.0396) | (0.0412) | (0.0369) |
| Health | -0.0812 | -0.0525 | -0.0636\* | -0.0554\* | 0.00656 |
|  | (0.0517) | (0.0376) | (0.0379) | (0.0306) | (0.0304) |
| Retirement | 0.0532 | -0.00228 | -0.00386 | 0.00759 | 0.0274 |
|  | (0.0707) | (0.0494) | (0.0481) | (0.0421) | (0.0360) |
| Unemployment | -0.0548 | -0.0737 | -0.111\*\* | -0.0886\*\* | -0.140\*\* |
|  | (0.0471) | (0.0514) | (0.0461) | (0.0372) | (0.0583) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **General feedback effect** |  |  |  |  |  |
| Education | 0.0505 | 0.108\* | 0.157\*\*\* | 0.137\*\*\* | 0.135\*\*\* |
|  | (0.0744) | (0.0624) | (0.0526) | (0.0446) | (0.0462) |
| Health | -0.104 | -0.0544 | -0.0493 | -0.0215 | 0.0238 |
|  | (0.0658) | (0.0481) | (0.0436) | (0.0378) | (0.0396) |
| Retirement | -0.149\*\* | -0.128\*\*\* | -0.131\*\*\* | -0.101\*\*\* | -0.0696\* |
|  | (0.0601) | (0.0441) | (0.0403) | (0.0351) | (0.0372) |
| Unemployment | -0.0441 | -0.0425 | -0.0491 | -0.0350 | -0.0241 |
|   | (0.0715) | (0.0529) | (0.0483) | (0.0419) | (0.0433) |
| Standard errors in parentheses |  |  |  |  |  |
| \*\*\* p<0.01, \*\* p<0.05, \* p<0.1 |  |  |  |  |  |

Table A4: Specific feedback effect, education (standardized coefficients)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| LAG | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 5-year average |
| VARIABLES | Support for spending on education |
|   |   |   |   |   |   |  |
| 2006 | 0.101\*\*\* | 0.183\*\*\* | 0.181\*\*\* | 0.234\*\*\* | 0.439\*\*\* | 0.441\*\*\* |
|  | (0.0294) | (0.0342) | (0.0342) | (0.0456) | (0.0457) | (0.0456) |
| Political orientation | -0.0334\*\*\* | -0.0277\*\* | -0.0272\*\* | -0.0318\*\*\* | -0.0303\*\*\* | -0.0310\*\*\* |
|  | (0.0109) | (0.0111) | (0.0112) | (0.0116) | (0.0110) | (0.0110) |
| Income decile | -0.0224 | -0.0302\* | -0.0311\*\* | -0.0310\* | -0.0446\*\*\* | -0.0436\*\*\* |
|  | (0.0154) | (0.0156) | (0.0157) | (0.0169) | (0.0159) | (0.0159) |
| GINI net | 0.0630 | 0.0623 | 0.0621 | -0.0643 | -0.542\*\*\* | -0.565\*\*\* |
|  | (0.0403) | (0.0419) | (0.0412) | (0.118) | (0.0932) | (0.101) |
| Unemployment rate | -0.00750 | 0.0312 | 0.0271 | 0.0162 | 0.0309 | 0.0409 |
|  | (0.0239) | (0.0262) | (0.0267) | (0.0383) | (0.0440) | (0.0411) |
| GDP growth | -0.0321 | -0.0647\*\*\* | -0.0679\*\*\* | -0.0119 | 0.0370 | 0.0435 |
|  | (0.0202) | (0.0212) | (0.0219) | (0.0321) | (0.0321) | (0.0340) |
| Spending on specific field  | -0.0418 | 0.0283 | 0.0270 | 0.0199 | 0.000862 | -0.0265 |
|  | (0.0315) | (0.0272) | (0.0315) | (0.0349) | (0.0403) | (0.0472) |
| Constant | 0.843\*\*\* | 0.768\*\*\* | 0.769\*\*\* | 0.724\*\*\* | 0.573\*\*\* | 0.575\*\*\* |
|  | (0.0821) | (0.0850) | (0.0852) | (0.0970) | (0.175) | (0.177) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Observations | 767 | 748 | 748 | 704 | 682 | 682 |
| Number of countries | 20 | 20 | 20 | 20 | 20 | 20 |
| Standard errors in parentheses |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| \*\*\* p<0.01, \*\* p<0.05, \* p<0.1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |

Table A5: Specific feedback effect, health (standardized coefficients)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| LAG | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 5-year average |
| VARIABLES | Support for spending on health |
|   |   |   |   |   |   |  |
| 2006 | 0.148\*\*\* | 0.146\*\*\* | 0.165\*\*\* | 0.157\*\*\* | 0.104\*\*\* | 0.154\*\*\* |
|  | (0.0430) | (0.0398) | (0.0430) | (0.0385) | (0.0351) | (0.0417) |
| Political orientation | -0.0235\*\* | -0.0329\*\*\* | -0.0333\*\*\* | -0.0346\*\*\* | -0.0326\*\*\* | -0.0338\*\*\* |
|  | (0.0105) | (0.0108) | (0.0108) | (0.0109) | (0.0109) | (0.0109) |
| Income decile | -0.00273 | 0.00267 | 0.00330 | 0.00435 | 0.00254 | 0.00334 |
|  | (0.0143) | (0.0144) | (0.0144) | (0.0145) | (0.0145) | (0.0144) |
| GINI net | 0.156\*\*\* | 0.145\*\*\* | 0.135\*\*\* | 0.139\*\*\* | 0.124\*\*\* | 0.137\*\*\* |
|  | (0.0423) | (0.0456) | (0.0429) | (0.0433) | (0.0439) | (0.0433) |
| Unemployment rate | -0.155\*\*\* | -0.152\*\*\* | -0.143\*\*\* | -0.134\*\*\* | -0.165\*\*\* | -0.144\*\*\* |
|  | (0.0265) | (0.0273) | (0.0283) | (0.0299) | (0.0290) | (0.0287) |
| GDP growth | 0.00250 | 0.0155 | 0.0188 | 0.0168 | 0.0343\* | 0.0191 |
|  | (0.0229) | (0.0239) | (0.0217) | (0.0219) | (0.0204) | (0.0222) |
| Spending on specific field  | -0.0895\* | -0.0504 | -0.0653\* | -0.0558\*\* | 0.000758 | -0.0583 |
|  | (0.0473) | (0.0346) | (0.0351) | (0.0283) | (0.0285) | (0.0361) |
| Constant | 0.995\*\*\* | 0.988\*\*\* | 0.973\*\*\* | 0.980\*\*\* | 1.013\*\*\* | 0.982\*\*\* |
|  | (0.0992) | (0.0984) | (0.0977) | (0.0968) | (0.0990) | (0.0974) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Observations | 808 | 787 | 787 | 787 | 787 | 787 |
| Number of countries | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 |
| Standard errors in parentheses |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| \*\*\* p<0.01, \*\* p<0.05, \* p<0.1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |

Table A6: Specific feedback effect, retirement (standardized coefficients)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| LAG | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 5-year average |
| VARIABLES | Support for spending on retirement |
|   |   |   |   |   |   |  |
| 2006 | 0.174\*\*\* | 0.187\*\*\* | 0.190\*\*\* | 0.187\*\*\* | 0.181\*\*\* | 0.184\*\*\* |
|  | (0.0299) | (0.0302) | (0.0306) | (0.0292) | (0.0295) | (0.0300) |
| Political orientation | -0.0203\* | -0.0204\* | -0.0205\* | -0.0204\* | -0.0205\* | -0.0204\* |
|  | (0.0106) | (0.0106) | (0.0106) | (0.0106) | (0.0106) | (0.0106) |
| Income decile | -0.0164 | -0.0164 | -0.0165 | -0.0164 | -0.0161 | -0.0162 |
|  | (0.0141) | (0.0141) | (0.0141) | (0.0141) | (0.0141) | (0.0141) |
| GINI net | 0.00119 | -0.00467 | -0.00494 | -0.00487 | -0.00796 | -0.00477 |
|  | (0.0515) | (0.0497) | (0.0494) | (0.0498) | (0.0515) | (0.0502) |
| Unemployment rate | -0.0864\*\*\* | -0.0727\*\* | -0.0705\*\* | -0.0732\*\* | -0.0786\*\* | -0.0759\*\* |
|  | (0.0321) | (0.0309) | (0.0317) | (0.0307) | (0.0312) | (0.0314) |
| GDP growth | -0.00647 | 0.00159 | 0.00274 | 0.00117 | -0.00218 | -0.000419 |
|  | (0.0272) | (0.0267) | (0.0265) | (0.0271) | (0.0269) | (0.0269) |
| Spending on specific field  | 0.0567 | 0.00116 | -0.00605 | 0.00268 | 0.0168 | 0.0118 |
|  | (0.0588) | (0.0448) | (0.0436) | (0.0385) | (0.0333) | (0.0430) |
| Constant | 0.535\*\*\* | 0.532\*\*\* | 0.531\*\*\* | 0.532\*\*\* | 0.535\*\*\* | 0.533\*\*\* |
|  | (0.0948) | (0.0927) | (0.0925) | (0.0927) | (0.0940) | (0.0932) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Observations | 764 | 764 | 764 | 764 | 764 | 764 |
| Number of countries | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 |
| Standard errors in parentheses |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| \*\*\* p<0.01, \*\* p<0.05, \* p<0.1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |

Table A7: Specific feedback effect, unemployment (standardized coefficients)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| LAG | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 5-year average |
| VARIABLES | Support for spending on unemployment |
|   |   |   |   |   |   |  |
| 2006 | 0.0657\* | 0.0576 | 0.0360 | 0.0316 | 0.0496 | 0.0498 |
|  | (0.0394) | (0.0382) | (0.0379) | (0.0388) | (0.0367) | (0.0391) |
| Political orientation | -0.0598\*\*\* | -0.0606\*\*\* | -0.0622\*\*\* | -0.0625\*\*\* | -0.0623\*\*\* | -0.0626\*\*\* |
|  | (0.0126) | (0.0126) | (0.0126) | (0.0126) | (0.0126) | (0.0127) |
| Income decile | -0.0929\*\*\* | -0.0915\*\*\* | -0.0906\*\*\* | -0.0912\*\*\* | -0.0899\*\*\* | -0.0887\*\*\* |
|  | (0.0167) | (0.0167) | (0.0166) | (0.0166) | (0.0168) | (0.0169) |
| GINI net | -0.0858 | -0.0854 | -0.0596 | -0.0551 | -0.0431 | -0.0226 |
|  | (0.0536) | (0.0522) | (0.0505) | (0.0513) | (0.0554) | (0.0548) |
| Unemployment rate | -0.0344 | -0.0105 | 0.0359 | 0.0168 | 0.0664 | 0.0310 |
|  | (0.0321) | (0.0360) | (0.0404) | (0.0369) | (0.0444) | (0.0387) |
| GDP growth | 0.0863\*\*\* | 0.0809\*\*\* | 0.0586\*\* | 0.0693\*\*\* | 0.0378 | 0.0378 |
|  | (0.0265) | (0.0243) | (0.0235) | (0.0234) | (0.0313) | (0.0321) |
| Spending on specific field  | -0.0594 | -0.0844\*\* | -0.115\*\*\* | -0.0972\*\*\* | -0.116\*\* | -0.0832\*\* |
|  | (0.0405) | (0.0422) | (0.0373) | (0.0320) | (0.0474) | (0.0421) |
| Constant | -0.0738 | -0.0656 | -0.0467 | -0.0463 | -0.0455 | -0.0517 |
|  | (0.122) | (0.120) | (0.117) | (0.117) | (0.114) | (0.116) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Observations | 788 | 788 | 788 | 788 | 766 | 766 |
| Number of countries | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 |
| Standard errors in parentheses |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| \*\*\* p<0.01, \*\* p<0.05, \* p<0.1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |

Table A8: General feedback effect, education (standardized coefficients)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| LAG | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 5-year average |
| VARIABLES | Support for spending on education |
|   |   |   |   |   |   |   |
| 2006 | 0.126\*\*\* | 0.120\*\*\* | 0.109\*\*\* | 0.121\*\*\* | 0.108\*\*\* | 0.116\*\*\* |
|  | (0.0284) | (0.0290) | (0.0297) | (0.0292) | (0.0298) | (0.0293) |
| Political orientation | -0.0310\*\*\* | -0.0294\*\*\* | -0.0274\*\* | -0.0269\*\* | -0.0279\*\* | -0.0278\*\* |
|  | (0.0110) | (0.0110) | (0.0108) | (0.0108) | (0.0108) | (0.0109) |
| Income decile | -0.0142 | -0.0156 | -0.0178 | -0.0188 | -0.0165 | -0.0174 |
|  | (0.0149) | (0.0149) | (0.0148) | (0.0148) | (0.0147) | (0.0148) |
| GINI net | -0.0165 | -0.0500 | -0.0994 | -0.107 | -0.104 | -0.0859 |
|  | (0.0659) | (0.0873) | (0.0935) | (0.0949) | (0.0952) | (0.0921) |
| Unemployment rate | -0.0677\*\* | -0.0803\*\* | -0.114\*\*\* | -0.103\*\*\* | -0.106\*\*\* | -0.0997\*\*\* |
|  | (0.0326) | (0.0344) | (0.0371) | (0.0347) | (0.0362) | (0.0354) |
| GDP growth | 0.0162 | 0.0152 | 0.0217 | 0.00801 | 0.00385 | 0.00888 |
|  | (0.0284) | (0.0290) | (0.0306) | (0.0308) | (0.0312) | (0.0304) |
| Overall social spending | 0.0378 | 0.0763 | 0.134\*\* | 0.120\*\*\* | 0.114\*\* | 0.124\*\* |
|  | (0.0655) | (0.0592) | (0.0523) | (0.0438) | (0.0459) | (0.0575) |
| Constant | 0.816\*\*\* | 0.813\*\*\* | 0.810\*\*\* | 0.804\*\*\* | 0.812\*\*\* | 0.807\*\*\* |
|  | (0.0914) | (0.0990) | (0.112) | (0.111) | (0.111) | (0.109) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Observations | 769 | 769 | 769 | 769 | 769 | 769 |
| Number of countries | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 |
| Standard errors in parentheses |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| \*\*\* p<0.01, \*\* p<0.05, \* p<0.1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |

Table A9: General feedback effect, health (standardized coefficients)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| LAG | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 5-year average |
| VARIABLES | Support for spending on health |
|   |   |   |   |   |   |   |
| 2006 | 0.116\*\*\* | 0.116\*\*\* | 0.119\*\*\* | 0.112\*\*\* | 0.103\*\*\* | 0.114\*\*\* |
|  | (0.0285) | (0.0290) | (0.0297) | (0.0287) | (0.0301) | (0.0293) |
| Political orientation | -0.0318\*\*\* | -0.0317\*\*\* | -0.0317\*\*\* | -0.0314\*\*\* | -0.0307\*\*\* | -0.0314\*\*\* |
|  | (0.0110) | (0.0110) | (0.0110) | (0.0110) | (0.0110) | (0.0110) |
| Income decile | 0.00523 | 0.00499 | 0.00503 | 0.00512 | 0.00486 | 0.00500 |
|  | (0.0147) | (0.0147) | (0.0147) | (0.0147) | (0.0147) | (0.0147) |
| GINI net | 0.0459 | 0.0604 | 0.0598 | 0.0673 | 0.0753 | 0.0641 |
|  | (0.0511) | (0.0479) | (0.0478) | (0.0473) | (0.0479) | (0.0480) |
| Unemployment rate | -0.190\*\*\* | -0.191\*\*\* | -0.185\*\*\* | -0.192\*\*\* | -0.199\*\*\* | -0.191\*\*\* |
|  | (0.0299) | (0.0298) | (0.0307) | (0.0300) | (0.0305) | (0.0302) |
| GDP growth | 0.0910\*\*\* | 0.0834\*\*\* | 0.0811\*\*\* | 0.0794\*\*\* | 0.0673\*\* | 0.0806\*\*\* |
|  | (0.0299) | (0.0280) | (0.0270) | (0.0282) | (0.0292) | (0.0284) |
| Overall social spending | -0.0695 | -0.0420 | -0.0415 | -0.0188 | 0.0179 | -0.0263 |
|  | (0.0569) | (0.0431) | (0.0397) | (0.0348) | (0.0363) | (0.0419) |
| Constant | 1.003\*\*\* | 1.000\*\*\* | 0.997\*\*\* | 1.000\*\*\* | 1.002\*\*\* | 0.999\*\*\* |
|  | (0.0968) | (0.0966) | (0.0965) | (0.0968) | (0.0978) | (0.0966) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Observations | 765 | 765 | 765 | 765 | 765 | 765 |
| Number of countries | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 |
| Standard errors in parentheses |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| \*\*\* p<0.01, \*\* p<0.05, \* p<0.1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |

Table A10: General feedback effect, retirement (standardized coefficients)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| LAG | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 5-year average |
| VARIABLES | Support for spending on retirement |
|   |   |   |   |   |   |   |
| 2006 | 0.199\*\*\* | 0.209\*\*\* | 0.220\*\*\* | 0.207\*\*\* | 0.211\*\*\* | 0.212\*\*\* |
|  | (0.0272) | (0.0276) | (0.0281) | (0.0272) | (0.0288) | (0.0278) |
| Political orientation | -0.0219\*\* | -0.0224\*\* | -0.0228\*\* | -0.0230\*\* | -0.0219\*\* | -0.0226\*\* |
|  | (0.0106) | (0.0106) | (0.0106) | (0.0106) | (0.0106) | (0.0106) |
| Income decile | -0.0158 | -0.0162 | -0.0160 | -0.0151 | -0.0165 | -0.0159 |
|  | (0.0141) | (0.0140) | (0.0140) | (0.0140) | (0.0141) | (0.0140) |
| GINI net | -0.0446 | -0.0309 | -0.0336 | -0.0185 | -0.0116 | -0.0288 |
|  | (0.0537) | (0.0478) | (0.0465) | (0.0454) | (0.0452) | (0.0469) |
| Unemployment rate | -0.0640\*\* | -0.0597\*\* | -0.0421 | -0.0524\* | -0.0525\* | -0.0522\* |
|  | (0.0295) | (0.0291) | (0.0297) | (0.0292) | (0.0298) | (0.0294) |
| GDP growth | 0.0304 | 0.0292 | 0.0246 | 0.0326 | 0.0272 | 0.0315 |
|  | (0.0299) | (0.0275) | (0.0263) | (0.0271) | (0.0276) | (0.0275) |
| Overall social spending | -0.116\*\* | -0.120\*\*\* | -0.130\*\*\* | -0.104\*\*\* | -0.0766\*\* | -0.116\*\*\* |
|  | (0.0555) | (0.0416) | (0.0380) | (0.0332) | (0.0345) | (0.0399) |
| Constant | 0.536\*\*\* | 0.529\*\*\* | 0.522\*\*\* | 0.528\*\*\* | 0.524\*\*\* | 0.527\*\*\* |
|  | (0.0916) | (0.0905) | (0.0894) | (0.0888) | (0.0882) | (0.0893) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Observations | 764 | 764 | 764 | 764 | 764 | 764 |
| Number of countries | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 |
| Standard errors in parentheses |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| \*\*\* p<0.01, \*\* p<0.05, \* p<0.1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| LAG | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 5-year average |
| VARIABLES | Support for spending on unemployment |
|   |   |   |   |   |   |   |
| 2006 | 0.0978\*\*\* | 0.103\*\*\* | 0.109\*\*\* | 0.103\*\*\* | 0.105\*\*\* | 0.104\*\*\* |
|  | (0.0325) | (0.0331) | (0.0339) | (0.0327) | (0.0344) | (0.0334) |
| Political orientation | -0.0604\*\*\* | -0.0607\*\*\* | -0.0610\*\*\* | -0.0611\*\*\* | -0.0606\*\*\* | -0.0608\*\*\* |
|  | (0.0126) | (0.0126) | (0.0126) | (0.0127) | (0.0127) | (0.0127) |
| Income decile | -0.0917\*\*\* | -0.0917\*\*\* | -0.0917\*\*\* | -0.0913\*\*\* | -0.0918\*\*\* | -0.0916\*\*\* |
|  | (0.0169) | (0.0169) | (0.0168) | (0.0169) | (0.0169) | (0.0169) |
| GINI net | -0.0295 | -0.0288 | -0.0319 | -0.0255 | -0.0232 | -0.0292 |
|  | (0.0614) | (0.0571) | (0.0566) | (0.0556) | (0.0555) | (0.0568) |
| Unemployment rate | -0.00705 | -0.00485 | 0.00328 | -0.00142 | -0.00161 | -0.00176 |
|  | (0.0340) | (0.0340) | (0.0351) | (0.0343) | (0.0349) | (0.0345) |
| GDP growth | 0.0253 | 0.0273 | 0.0267 | 0.0298 | 0.0280 | 0.0290 |
|  | (0.0349) | (0.0326) | (0.0315) | (0.0326) | (0.0334) | (0.0330) |
| Overall social spending | -0.0326 | -0.0444 | -0.0552 | -0.0431 | -0.0326 | -0.0461 |
|  | (0.0661) | (0.0499) | (0.0458) | (0.0400) | (0.0411) | (0.0483) |
| Constant | -0.0935 | -0.0959 | -0.0996 | -0.0966 | -0.0982 | -0.0969 |
|  | (0.115) | (0.115) | (0.114) | (0.114) | (0.114) | (0.114) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Observations | 766 | 766 | 766 | 766 | 766 | 766 |
| Number of countries | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 |
| Standard errors in parentheses |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| \*\*\* p<0.01, \*\* p<0.05, \* p<0.1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |

Table A11: General feedback effect, unemployment (standardized coefficients)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| LAG VARIABLES |  1 |  2 |  3 |  4 |  5 |  5-year average |  |
| 2006 | 0.059 | 0.104 | 0.097 | 0.135 | 0.223 | 0.225 |
|  | (0.024,0.095) | (0.063,0.146) | (0.058,0.138) | (0.088,0.186) | (0.166,0.279) | (0.164,0.283) |
| Political orientation | -0.021 | -0.021 | -0.02 | -0.025 | -0.026 | -0.026 |
|  | (-0.034,-0.007) | (-0.034,-0.007) | (-0.034,-0.006) | (-0.039,-0.011) | (-0.040,-0.012) | (-0.040,-0.012) |
| Income decile | -0.025 | -0.025 | -0.031 | -0.032 | -0.043 | -0.042 |
|  | (-0.034,-0.007) | (-0.044,-0.006) | (-0.051,-0.012) | (-0.052,-0.012) | (-0.062,-0.023) | (-0.062,-0.022) |
| GINI net | 0.05 | 0.05 | 0.047 | -0.02 | -0.21 | -0.213 |
|  | (-0.034,0.007) | (-0.001,0.097) | (-0.005,0.094) | (-0.133,0.059) | (-0.330,-0.083) | (-0.341,-0.077) |
| Unemployment rate | -0.003 | -0.003 | 0.01 | 0.015 | 0.027 | 0.032 |
|  | (-0.034,0.007) | (-0.031,0.027) | (-0.023,0.042) | (-0.029,0.060) | (-0.024,0.077) | (-0.016,0.080) |
| GDP growth | -0.014 | -0.014 | -0.031 | 0.001 | 0.015 | 0.017 |
|  | (-0.034,0.007) | (-0.03,0.010) | (-0.057,-0.005) | (-0.033,0.037) | (-0.024,0.054) | (-0.024,0.059) |
| Spending on specific field | -0.007 | 0.037 | 0.029 | 0.02 | 0.01 | 0 |
|  | (-0.046,0.033) | (0.005,0.071) | (-0.008,0.068) | (-0.021,0.061) | (-0.037,0.058) | (-0.056,0.054) |
| Constant | 0.573 | 0.537 | 0.542 | 0.514 | 0.455 | 0.458 |
|  | (0.465,0.679) | (0.425,0.647) | (0.432,0.652) | (0.390,0.633) | (0.263,0.638) | (0.266,0.639) |
| Observations | 721 | 721 | 721 | 721 | 721 | 721 |
| Number of countries | 20 | 20 | 20 | 20 | 20 | 20 |

Table A12: Specific feedback effect, education, Bayesian replication.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| LAG VARIABLES | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 5 yearsaverage |
| 2006 | 0.09 | 0.086 | 0.096 | 0.106 | 0.067 | 0.097 |
|  | (0.028,0.150) | (0.030,0.141) | (0.031,0.157) | (0.050,0.162) | (0.017,0.118) | (0.037,0.154) |
| Political orientation | -0.018 | -0.019 | -0.019 | -0.02 | -0.019 | -0.02 |
|  | (-0.033,-0.003) | (-0.035,-0.004) | (-0.035,-0.004) | (-0.036,-0.004) | (-0.034,-0.004) | (-0.035,-0.004) |
| Income decile | -0.002 | -0.002 | -0.001 | 0 | -0.002 | -0.001 |
|  | (-0.023,0.018) | (-0.023,0.020) | (-0.022,0.021) | (-0.022,0.020) | (-0.023,0.019) | (-0.022,0.020) |
| GINI net | 0.136 | 0.124 | 0.117 | 0.122 | 0.114 | 0.12 |
|  | (0.074,0.202) | (0.062,0.197) | (0.058,0.182) | (0.062,0.192) | (0.054,0.179) | (0.059,0.187) |
| Unemployment rate | -0.072 | -0.071 | -0.066 | -0.055 | -0.077 | -0.065 |
|  | (-0.109,-0.035) | (-0.109,-0.033) | (-0.106,-0.027) | (-0.097,-0.013) | (-0.118,-0.037) | (-0.105,-0.026) |
| GDP growth | 0.028 | 0.036 | 0.037 | 0.032 | 0.044 | 0.036 |
|  | (-0.004,0.059) | (0.004,0.069) | (0.006,0.067) | (0.000,0.063) | (0.014,0.072) | (0.005,0.0676) |
| Spending on specific field | -0.045 | -0.021 | -0.029 | -0.038 | 0.001 | -0.032 |
|  | (-0.106,0.019) | (-0.067,0.026) | (-0.077,0.019) | (-0.078,0.001) | (-0.038,0.041) | (-0.081,0.017) |
| Constant | 0.686 | 0.686 | 0.683 | 0.67 | 0.696 | 0.677 |
|  | (0.540,0.836) | (0.542,0.831) | (0.536,0.834) | (0.528,0.810) | (0.551,0.838) | (0.532,0.833) |
| Observations | 749 | 749 | 749 | 749 | 749 | 749 |
| Number of countries | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 |

 Table A13: Specific feedback effect, health, Bayesian replication.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| LAG VARIABLES | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 5-year average |
| 2006 | 0.107 | 0.11 | 0.112 | 0.111 | 0.109 | 0.11 |
|  | (0.064,0.150) | (0.066,0.154) | (0.069,0.156) | (0.068,0.153) | (0.067,0.152) | (0.065,0.152) |
| Political orientation | -0.015 | -0.015 | -0.015 | -0.015 | -0.015 | -0.015 |
|  | (-0.031,0.001) | (-0.032,0.001) | (-0.031,0.001) | (-0.031,0.001) | (-0.031,0.001) | (-0.032,0.001) |
| Income decile | -0.013 | -0.013 | -0.014 | -0.013 | -0.013 | -0.013 |
|  | (-0.034,0.008)  | (-0.035,0.008) | (-0.035,0.007) | (-0.034,0.008) | (-0.035,0.008) | (-0.035,0.009) |
| GINI net | 0.029 | 0.026 | 0.027 | 0.026 | 0.027 | 0.026 |
|  | (-0.037,0.090) | (-0.040,0.087) | (-0.039,0.087) | (-0.036,0.086) | (-0.035,0.085) | (-0.040,0.087) |
| Unemployment rate | -0.043 | -0.041 | -0.039 | -0.04 | -0.042 | -0.041 |
|  | (-0.087,0.000) | (-0.085,0.002) | (-0.082,0.005) | (-0.083,0.003) | (-0.086,0.001) | (-0.085,0.001) |
| GDP growth | 0.014 | 0.017 | 0.017 | 0.017 | 0.017 | 0.017 |
|  | (-0.023,0.052) | (-0.020,0.054) | (-0.021,0.055) | (-0.022,0.055) | (-0.021,0.055) | (-0.021,0.053) |
| Spending on specific field  | 0.009 | -0.003 | -0.008 | -0.004 | 0 | -0.002 |
|  | (-0.063,0.085) | (-0.063,0.058) | (-0.066,0.049) | (-0.055,0.049) | (-0.044,0.046) | (-0.057,0.056) |
| Constant | 0.432 | 0.429 | 0.431 | 0.43 | 0.428 | 0.43 |
|  | (0.303,0.562) | (0.298,0.561) | (0.298,0.561) | (0.294,0.562) | (0.297,0.561) | (0.297,0.562) |
| Observations | 741 | 741 | 741 | 741 | 741 | 741 |
| Number of countries | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 |

Table A14: Specific feedback effect, retirement, Bayesian replication.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| LAGVARIABLES | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 5 yearsaverage |
| 2006 | 0.074 | 0.076 | -0.081 | 0.078 | 0.075 | 0.077 |
|  | (0.026,0.122) | (0.028,0.124) | (-0.030,0.129) | (0.030,0.125) | (0.024,0.124) | (0.027,0.125) |
| Political orientation | -0.047 | -0.047 | -0.047 | -0.047 | -0.047 | -0.047 |
|  | (-0.066,-0.028) | (-0.065,-0.029) | (-0.066,-0.028) | (-0.066,-0.029) | (-0.065,-0.028) | (-0.066,-0.029) |
| Income decile | -0.061 | -0.061 | -0.061 | -0.061 | -0.061 | -0.061 |
|  | (-0.086,-0.037) | (-0.085,-0.037) | (-0.086,-0.037) | (-0.085,-0.036) | (-0.085,-0.037) | (-0.086,-0.036) |
| GINI net | -0.007 | -0.006 | -0.012 | -0.009 | -0.006 | -0.009 |
|  | (-0.103,0.086) | (-0.099,0.079) | (-0.098,0.070) | (-0.097,0.074) | (-0.091,0.079) | (-0.094,0.075) |
| Unemployment rate | -0.015 | -0.013 | -0.009 | -0.011 | -0.014 | -0.012 |
|  | (-0.065,0.035) | (-0.062,0.036) | (-0.062,0.042) | (-0.060,0.039) | (-0.066,0.038) | (-0.062,0.039) |
| GDP growth | 0.027 | -0.028 | 0.03 | 0.032 | 0.028 | 0.029 |
|  | (-0.027,0.079) | (-0.019,0.076) | (-0.016,0.077) | (-0.014,0.080) | (-0.022,0.077) | (-0.019,0.078) |
| Overall social spending | -0.002 | -0.012 | -0.025 | -0.02 | -0.004 | -0.014 |
|  | (-0.105,0.099) | (-0.085,0.060) | (-0.094,0.043) | (-0.079,0.038) | (-0.064,0.056) | (-0.084,0.057) |
| Constant | -0.028 | -0.031 | 0.029 | 0.027 | -0.028 | -0.03 |
|  | (-0.205,0.152) | (-0.206,0.147) | (0.211,0.155) | (-0.202,0.150) | (-0.204,0.144)  | (-0.210,0.148) |
| Observations | 760 | 760 | 760 | 760 | 760 | 760 |
| Number of countries | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 |

 Table A15: Specific feedback effect, unemployment, Bayesian replication.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| LAG VARIABLES | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 5-year average |
| 2006 | 0.065 | 0.061 | 0.052 | 0.059 | 0.056 | 0.052 |
|  | (0.033,0.099) | (0.026,0.0965) | (0.017,0.088)  | (0.025,0.093) | (0.020,0.092) | (0.018,0.088) |
| Political orientation | -0.019 | -0.018 | -0.018 | -0.018 | -0.02 | -0.018 |
|  | (-0.032,-0.005) | (-0.032,-0.005) | (-0.031,-0.00) | (-0.031,-0.004) | (-0.035,-0.00) | (-0.032,-0.00) |
| Income decile | -0.025 | -0.025 | -0.026 | -0.026 | 0.009 | -0.025 |
|  | (-0.042,-0.006) | (-0.043,-0.006) | (-0.044,-0.00) | (-0.045,-0.008) | (-0.003,0.021) | (-0.043,-0.00) |
| GINI net | 0.004 | -0.008 | -0.015 | -0.018 | 0.005 | -0.02 |
|  | (-0.073,0.064) | (-0.092,0.060) | (-0.105,0.060) | (-0.110,0.056) | (-0.080,0.072)  | (-0.113,0.055) |
| Unemployment rate | -0.035 | -0.039 | -0.054 | -0.047 | -0.048 | -0.05 |
|  | (-0.071,0.001) | (-0.092,-0.004) | (-0.094,-0.01) | (-0.085,-0.009) | (-0.087,-0.01) | (-0.088,-0.01) |
| GDP growth | 0.01 | 0.009 | 0.01 | 0.004 | 0.007 | 0.001 |
|  | (-0.025,0.044) | (-0.024,0.042) | (-0.023,0.044) | (-0.031,0.038) | (-0.028,0.041) | (-0.032,0.036) |
| Overall social spending | 0.037 | 0.053 | 0.076 | 0.064 | 0.052 | 0.063 |
|  | (-0.035,0.128) | (-0.009,0.120) | (0.019 ,0.134) | (0.016,0.115) | (0.003,0.105) | (0.013,0.115) |
| Constant | 0.567 | 0.565 | 0.57 | 0.565 | 0.599 | 0.569 |
|  | (0.446,0.685) | (0.438,0.680) | (0.437,0.695) | (0.435,0.691) | (0.507,0.690) | (0.437,0.695) |
| Observations | 738 | 738 | 738 | 738 | 738 | 738 |
| Number of countries | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 |

 Table A16: General feedback effect, education, Bayesian replication.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| LAG VARIABLES | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 5-year average |
| 2006 | 0.075 | 0.074 | 0.076 | 0.072 | 0.64 | 0.072 |
|  | (0.035,0.116) | (0.033,0.115) | (0.034,0.118) | (0.030,0.114) | (0.021,0.107) | (0.030,0.115) |
| Political orientation | -0.017 | -0.018 | -0.018 | -0.017 | -0.017 | -0.017 |
|  | (-0.033,-0.002) | (-0.033,-0.002) | (-0.033,-0.002) | (-0.033,-0.002) | (-0.033,-0.002) | (-0.033,-0.001) |
| Income decile | 0.001 | 0.001 | 0.001 | 0.001 | 0.001 | 0.001 |
|  | (-0.020,0.022) | (-0.020,0.022) | (-0.021,0.022) | (-0.020,0.022) | (-0.020,0.023) | (-0.021,0.022) |
| GINI net | 0.063 | 0.068 | 0.067 | 0.071 | 0.077 | 0.07 |
|  | (-0.002,0.130) | (0.008,0.134) | (0.004,0.131) | (0.011,0.133) | (0.017,0.139) | (0.009,0.135) |
| Unemployment rate | -0.099 | -0.1 | -0.098 | -0.101 | -0.107 | -0.101 |
|  | (-0.141,-0.059) | (-0.140,-0.058) | (-0.141,-0.055) | (-0.142,-0.061) | (-0.150,-0.065) | (-0.142,-0.060) |
| GDP growth | 0.08 | 0.077 | 0.077 | 0.076 | 0.067 | 0.075 |
|  | (0.041,0.119) | (0.040,0.113) | (0.042,0.113) | (0.040,0.112) | (0.028,0.104) | (0.039,0.114) |
| Overall social spending | -0.019 | -0.006 | -0.01 | -0.001 | 0.023 | 0.002 |
|  | (-0.092,0.054) | (-0.063,0.050) | (-0.064,0.042) | (-0.048,0.046) | (-0.018,0.074) | (-0.055,0.058) |
| Constant | 0.684 | 0.685 | 0.686 | 0.686 | 0.688 | 0.686 |
|  | (0.551,0.821) | (0.545,0.829) | (0.548,0.829) | (0.546,0.824) | ( 0.549,0.831) | (0.548,0.822) |
| Observations | 712 | 712 | 712 | 712 | 712 | 712 |
| Number of countries | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 |

 Table A17: General feedback effect, health, Bayesian replication.

Table A18: General feedback effect, retirement, Bayesian replication.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| LAG VARIABLES | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 5-year average |
| 2006 | 0.114 | 0.121 | 0.127 | 0.121 | 0.112 | 0.122 |
|  | (0.075,0.154)  | (0.079,0.163) | (0.086,0.169) | (0.081,0.161) | (0.079,0.164) | (0.081,0.163) |
| Political orientation | -0.016 | -0.016 | -0.016 | -0.016 | -0.016 | -0.016 |
|  | (-0.032,0.001) | (-0.032,0.000) | (-0.032,0.000) | (-0.032,0.000) | (-0.032,0.000) | (-0.032,0.000) |
| Income decile | -0.013 | -0.014 | -0.014 | -0.013 | -0.014 | -0.013 |
|  | (-0.034,0.007) | (-0.035,0.007) | (-0.035,0.008) | (-0.034,0.008) | (-0.035,0.008) | (-0.035,0.007) |
| GINI net | 0.013 | 0.013 | 0.011 | 0.015 | 0.019 | 0.013 |
|  | (-0.059,0.078) | (-0.050,0.074) | (-0.052,0.073) | (-0.043,0.074) | (-0.041,0.078) | (-0.049,0.076) |
| Unemployment rate | -0.038 | -0.034 | -0.025 | -0.03 | -0.032 | -0.032 |
|  | (-0.080,0.004) | (-0.075,0.007) | (-0.067,0.017) | (-0.073,0.012) | (-0.076,0.011) | (-0.074,0.011) |
| GDP growth | 0.024 | 0.026 | 0.024 | 0.03 | 0.028 | 0.028 |
|  | (-0.016,0.065) | (-0.012,0.063) | (-0.012,0.060) | (-0.008,0.068) | (-0.010,0.067) | (-0.011,0.066) |
| Overall social spending | -0.038 | -0.049 | -0.06 | -0.051 | -0.036 | -0.05 |
|  | (-0.113,0.039) | (-0.109,0.010) | (-0.115,-0.006) | (-0.098,0.004) | (-0.083,0.014) | (-0.105,0.006) |
| Constant | 0.432 | 0.42 | 0.426 | 0.428 | 0.427 | 0.426 |
|  | (0.303,0.558) | (0292,0.551) | (0.303,0.559) | (0.305,0.558) | (0.299,0.553) | (0.296,0.556) |
| Observations | 741 | 741 | 741 | 741 | 741 | 741 |
| Number of countries | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| LAG VARIABLES | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 5-year average |
| 2006 | 0.074 | 0.076 | -0.081 | 0.078 | 0.075 | 0.077 |
|  | (0.026,0.122) | (0.028,0.124) | (-0.030,0.129) | (0.030,0.125) | (0.024,0.124) | (0.027,0.125) |
| Political orientation | -0.047 | -0.047 | -0.047 | -0.047 | -0.047 | -0.047 |
|  | (-0.066,-0.028) | (-0.065,-0.029) | (-0.066,-0.028) | (-0.066,-0.029) | (-0.065,-0.028) | (-0.066,-0.029) |
| Income decile | -0.061 | -0.061 | -0.061 | -0.061 | -0.061 | -0.061 |
|  | (-0.086,-0.037) | (-0.085,-0.037) | (-0.086,-0.037) | (-0.085,-0.036) | (-0.085,-0.037) | (-0.086,-0.036) |
| GINI net | -0.007 | -0.006 | -0.012 | -0.009 | -0.006 | -0.009 |
|  | (-0.103,0.086) | (-0.099,0.079) | (-0.098,0.070) | (-0.097,0.074) | (-0.091,0.079) | (-0.094,0.075) |
| Unemployment rate | -0.015 | -0.013 | -0.009 | -0.011 | -0.014 | -0.012 |
|  | (-0.065,0.035) | (-0.062,0.036) | (-0.062,0.042) | (-0.060,0.039) | (-0.066,0.038) | (-0.062,0.039) |
| GDP growth | 0.027 | -0.028 | 0.03 | 0.032 | 0.028 | 0.029 |
|  | (-0.027,0.079) | (-0.019,0.076) | (-0.016,0.077) | (-0.014,0.080) | (-0.022,0.077) | (-0.019,0.078) |
| Overall social spending | -0.002 | -0.012 | -0.025 | -0.02 | -0.004 | -0.014 |
|  | (-0.105,0.099) | (-0.085,0.060) | (-0.094,0.043) | (-0.079,0.038) | (-0.064,0.056) | (-0.084,0.057) |
| Constant | -0.028 | -0.031 | 0.029 | 0.027 | -0.028 | -0.03 |
|  | (-0.205,0.152) | (-0.206,0.147) | (0.211,0.155) | (-0.202,0.150) | (-0.204,0.144)  | (-0.210,0.148) |
| Observations | 760 | 760 | 760 | 760 | 760 | 760 |
| Number of countries | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 |

 Table A19: General feedback effect, unemployment, Bayesian replication.