

Online Appendix for Exclusion and Cooperation in Diverse Societies: Experimental Evidence from Israel

Ryan D. Enos and Noam Gidron

Table A.1: Sample description

	Our sample	Gutmann Sample
Male	52%	48%
College Degree	35%	34%
Sephardic	50%	48%
Income Above Average	15%	39%
Income Below Average	68%	34%
Average Age	41	43
Average left-right self-placement	5.2	4.8
Born in Israel	79%	64%
Ultra-Orthodox	51.6%	7.4%
N	459	2,803

This table presents the descriptive statistics of our sample, compared to data collected for the study ‘A Portrait of Israeli Jews Beliefs, Observance, and Values of Israeli Jews, 2009’, published by the Israel Democracy Institute. Ultra-Orthodox are intentionally over-represented in our sample, to allow for a close examination of the role of religion in shaping intergroup behaviors and attitudes.

Table A.2: Social Distance from Arabs and policy preferences

	<i>Dependent variable:</i>
	Government spending on Arabs
Social Distance (binary)	0.188*** (0.040)
Age	-0.004 (0.004)
Foreign Born	0.158 (0.142)
Male	-0.069 (0.110)
Left-right	0.132*** (0.041)
Religiosity (baseline: religious)	
Secular	-0.036 (0.184)
Traditional	0.040 (0.203)
Ultra-Orthodox	0.066 (0.174)
Education (baseline: graduate)	
High-school	0.351 (0.248)
Primary-school	1.085*** (0.347)
Undergrad	0.216 (0.253)
Income (baseline: average income)	
High income	0.089 (0.200)
Low income	-0.094 (0.156)
Very high income	-0.108 (0.296)
Very low income	-0.035 (0.147)
Ethnicity (baseline: Ashkenazy)	
Mixed	0.164 (0.201)
Other	-0.130 (0.325)
Sephardic	-0.050 (0.118)
Interactions (baseline: day)	
Month	0.005 (0.223)
Never	-0.178 (0.202)
Week	0.003 (0.233)
Year	-0.244 (0.238)
Constant	1.572*** (0.444)
Observations	361
R ²	0.189

Note: *p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01

This table presents the results of OLS regressions for respondents' answers to the following question: Some people think Arabs receive too much from the government, some people think they don't receive enough. Thinking about the following groups [Arabs], do you think they receive too much, too little, or just the right amount from the government? Answers range between Far too much (5), Somewhat too much (4), About the right amount (3), Somewhat too little (2), Far Too little (1).

Table A.3: Social Distance and Trust with Multiple Imputations

	<i>Dependent variable:</i>			
	Cooperation with PCI (=1)			
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Social Distance (binary)	-0.820*** (0.243)	-0.709** (0.283)	-0.651** (0.261)	-0.625** (0.293)
Trust in Arabs			0.519* (0.289)	0.371 (0.322)
Ideology		-0.237*** (0.084)		-0.220** (0.085)
Religiosity (baseline: religious)				
Secular		-0.893** (0.392)		-0.936** (0.392)
Traditional		-0.322 (0.425)		-0.368 (0.423)
Ultra-Orthodox		-0.285 (0.363)		-0.287 (0.362)
Education (baseline: graduate)				
High-school		0.677 (0.553)		0.733 (0.547)
Primary school		0.811 (0.721)		0.886 (0.712)
Undergrad		0.373 (0.552)		0.408 (0.559)
Income (baseline: average)				
Low		-0.277 (0.329)		-0.326 (0.334)
Very low		-0.293 (0.312)		-0.315 (0.312)
High		-0.155 (0.434)		-0.234 (0.425)
Very high		0.278 (0.626)		0.180 (0.613)
Age		0.243 (0.007)		-0.00 (0.007)
Foreign Born		0.188 (0.292)		0.183 (0.304)
Male		0.152 (0.228)		0.111 (0.230)
Ethnicity (baseline: Ashkenazi)				
Mixed		-0.101 (0.421)		-0.115 (0.421)
Other		0.730 (0.678)		0.753 (0.679)
Sephardic		-0.379 (0.246)		-0.361 (0.247)
Constant	-0.045 (0.213)	1.198 (0.872)	-0.264 (0.247)	1.032 (0.869)
Observations	439	439	439	439

Note:

*p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01

This table presents the results from Table 2 with multiple imputations using Amelia II (Honaker, King, and Blackwell, 2011).

Table A.4: Social Distance and Trust as Ordinal Variables

	<i>Dependent variable:</i>			
	Cooperation with PCI (=1)			
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Social distance (baseline: relative and friend)				
Social distance: Neighbor	-0.366 (0.607)	-0.836 (0.735)	-0.049 (0.631)	-0.618 (0.741)
Social distance: Co-worker	-0.238 (0.489)	-0.333 (0.577)	0.039 (0.506)	-0.215 (0.587)
Social distance: Citizen	-1.133** (0.443)	-1.206** (0.534)	-0.757 (0.468)	-1.040* (0.551)
Social distance: Visitor	-0.642 (0.488)	-0.462 (0.596)	-0.161 (0.522)	-0.201 (0.620)
Social distance: None	-1.036** (0.408)	-0.928* (0.527)	-0.356 (0.467)	-0.529 (0.567)
Trust (baseline: much and some)				
Trust: Little			-0.185 (0.369)	-0.250 (0.424)
Trust: None			-0.831** (0.326)	-0.695* (0.378)
Ideology		-0.223** (0.095)		-0.209** (0.097)
Religiosity (baseline: religious)				
Secular		-0.943** (0.419)		-1.090** (0.434)
Traditional		-0.722 (0.461)		-0.874* (0.475)
Ultra-Orthodox		-0.384 (0.389)		-0.504 (0.398)
Education (baseline: graduate)				
High-school		0.876 (0.595)		1.018* (0.618)
Primary school		0.998 (0.783)		1.105 (0.803)
Undergrad		0.521 (0.605)		0.617 (0.630)
Income (baseline: average)				
Low		-0.419 (0.353)		-0.396 (0.361)
Very low		-0.391 (0.328)		-0.371 (0.332)
High		-0.060 (0.442)		-0.037 (0.448)
Very high		0.139 (0.638)		0.109 (0.649)
Age		-0.0004 (0.008)		-0.00002 (0.008)
Foreign Born		0.117 (0.323)		0.034 (0.332)
Male		0.322 (0.250)		0.266 (0.257)
Ethnicity (baseline: Ashkenazi)				
Mixed		-0.126 (0.467)		-0.109 (0.473)
Other		0.521 (0.722)		0.837 (0.760)
Sephardic		-0.339 (0.270)		-0.283 (0.273)
Constant	0.143 (0.379)	1.349 (0.972)	0.250 (0.415)	1.488 (0.999)
Observations	439	375	432	371
Log Likelihood	-273.213	-224.641	-265.210	-219.032

Note:

*p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01

This table presents the results from Table 2 with Social Distance and trust as ordinal variables.

Table A.5: Social Distance and Trust as Ordinal Variables with Multiple Imputations

	<i>Dependent variable:</i>			
	Cooperation with PCI (=1)			
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Social distance (baseline: relative and friend)				
Social distance: Neighbor	-0.295 (0.615)	-0.520 (0.652)	-0.242 (0.604)	-0.467 (0.641)
Social distance: Co-worker	-0.154 (0.483)	-0.080 (0.527)	0.034 (0.492)	-0.036 (0.529)
Social distance: Citizen	-0.989** (0.432)	-0.919* (0.469)	-0.757* (0.457)	-0.812* (0.494)
Social distance: Visitor	-0.531 (0.496)	-0.271 (0.546)	-0.215 (0.510)	-0.119 (0.555)
Social distance: None	-0.904** (0.405)	-0.717* (0.468)	-0.447 (0.454)	-0.476 (0.505)
Trust (baseline: much and some)				
Trust: Little			-0.264 (0.363)	-0.168 (0.389)
Trust: None			-0.857** (0.317)	-0.722** (0.343)
Ideology		-0.253*** (0.085)		-0.217** (0.086)
Religiosity (baseline: religious)				
Secular		-0.898** (0.396)		-0.904** (0.402)
Traditional		-0.358 (0.415)		-0.340 (0.420)
Ultra-Orthodox		-0.415 (0.361)		-0.337 (0.366)
Education (baseline: graduate)				
High-school		0.751 (0.550)		0.787* (0.558)
Primary school		0.930 (0.695)		0.957 (0.728)
Undergrad		0.429 (0.554)		0.451 (0.562)
Income (baseline: average)				
Low		-0.235 (0.325)		-0.196 (0.333)
Very low		-0.333 (0.309)		-0.329 (0.313)
High		-0.078 (0.415)		-0.203 (0.423)
Very high		0.241 (0.609)		0.306 (0.623)
Age		-0.000 (0.007)		-0.000 (0.007)
Foreign Born		0.055 (0.298)		0.108 (0.301)
Male		0.123 (0.227)		0.42 (0.229)
Ethnicity (baseline: Ashkenazi)				
Mixed		0.006 (0.407)		0.024 (0.408)
Other		0.633 (0.678)		0.521 (0.692)
Sephardic		-0.426* (0.245)		-0.402 (0.247)
Constant	0.015 (0.373)	1.316 (0.936)	0.332 (0.403)	1.515 (0.925)
Observations	439	439	439	439

Note:

* p<0.1; ** p<0.05; *** p<0.01

This table presents the results from Table 2 with Social Distance and trust as ordinal variables with multiple imputations using Amelia II (Honaker, King, and Blackwell, 2011).

Table A.6: Social Distance and repeated Interactions with outgroup members

	<i>Dependent variable:</i>		
	Cooperation with Arabs (=1)		
	(1)	(2)	(3)
Social Distance (binary)	-0.820*** (0.243)	-0.367 (0.528)	-0.085 (0.620)
Interactions		0.148 (0.140)	0.205 (0.165)
Distance:Interactions		-0.150 (0.171)	-0.184 (0.197)
Age			-0.001 (0.008)
Foreign Born			0.138 (0.320)
Male			0.295 (0.250)
Left-right			-0.204** (0.094)
Religiosity (baseline: religious)			
Secular			-0.982** (0.416)
Traditional			-0.711 (0.462)
Ultra-Orthodox			-0.376 (0.388)
Education (baseline: graduate)			
High-school			0.831 (0.582)
Primary school			1.020 (0.785)
Undergrad			0.465 (0.590)
Income (baseline: average)			
High			-0.025 (0.442)
Low			-0.312 (0.359)
Very high			0.272 (0.636)
Very low			-0.291 (0.330)
Ethnicity (baseline: Ashkenazy) Mixed			
Mixed			-0.145 (0.461)
Other			0.696 (0.721)
Sephardic			-0.366 (0.270)
Constant	-0.045 (0.213)	-0.502 (0.484)	0.349 (1.016)
Observations	439	434	372
Log Likelihood	-274.275	-270.227	-223.032

Note:

*p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01

This table examines whether repeated interactions with Arabs diminishes the negative relationship between exclusionary attitudes and cooperation (?). We find no support in the analysis for this argument. The interaction variable ranges from 1 (never) to 5 (daily). Note that more than 50% of our sample never interactions with Arabs.

Table A.7: Social Distance and local context

	<i>Dependent variable:</i>				
	Cooperation with Arabs (=1)				
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)
Social Distance (binary)	-0.813*** (0.244)	-0.577* (0.308)	-0.806*** (0.244)	-0.624** (0.307)	-0.549* (0.310)
Age		-0.002 (0.008)		-0.002 (0.008)	-0.003 (0.008)
Foreign Born		0.150 (0.319)		0.145 (0.319)	0.145 (0.320)
Sex		0.329 (0.246)		0.318 (0.245)	0.328 (0.247)
Left-right		-0.212** (0.093)		-0.203** (0.093)	-0.211** (0.094)
Religiosity (baseline: religious)					
Secular		-0.902** (0.414)		-0.946** (0.412)	-0.967** (0.419)
Traditional		-0.700 (0.462)		-0.724 (0.459)	-0.724 (0.464)
Ultra-Orthodox		-0.428 (0.390)		-0.365 (0.386)	-0.478 (0.396)
Education (baseline: graduate)					
High-school		0.915 (0.585)		0.771 (0.583)	0.890 (0.588)
Primary school		1.009 (0.778)		0.857 (0.776)	0.972 (0.783)
Undergrad		0.525 (0.591)		0.412 (0.591)	0.498 (0.594)
Income (baseline: average income)					
High		-0.094 (0.439)		-0.094 (0.437)	-0.095 (0.441)
Low		-0.401 (0.350)		-0.428 (0.350)	-0.416 (0.351)
Very high		0.135 (0.628)		0.103 (0.630)	0.072 (0.633)
Very low		-0.327 (0.325)		-0.384 (0.325)	-0.337 (0.328)
Ethnicity (baseline: Ashkenazy)					
Mixed		-0.066 (0.457)		-0.076 (0.460)	-0.056 (0.462)
Other		0.500 (0.715)		0.609 (0.718)	0.522 (0.716)
Sephardic		-0.365 (0.269)		-0.256 (0.273)	-0.332 (0.278)
Local context					
Non-Jewish percentage	-0.037* (0.021)	-0.045* (0.025)			-0.082 (0.052)
Non-Jewish segregation*Non-Jewish percentage					0.127 (0.140)
Non-Jewish Segregation			0.999 (0.665)	0.761 (0.764)	-0.014 (0.943)
Constant	0.168 (0.247)	1.226 (0.918)	-0.403 (0.320)	0.795 (0.936)	1.265 (0.987)
Observations	439	375	439	375	375
Log Likelihood	-272.708	-225.062	-273.139	-226.311	-224.458

Note:

*p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01

This table presents the results of logit regressions for cooperation with Arabs while accounting also for the share of the non-Jewish population and its segregation in the locality. Segregation scores were computed based on the dissimilarity index. In most localities, it is reasonable to assume that many (although not all) of the non-Jewish population is Arab.

Table A.8: Social Distance from Arabs and cooperation with ingroup

	<i>Dependent variable:</i>			
	secular ingroup		uo ingroup	
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Social Distance from Arabs (binary)	-0.547 (0.411)	-0.691 (0.511)	-1.560 (1.047)	-1.876 (1.168)
Age		0.003 (0.016)		0.005 (0.016)
Foreign Born		-0.365 (0.583)		-1.010 (0.679)
Male		0.337 (0.454)		0.156 (0.445)
Left-right		-0.097 (0.201)		0.181 (0.160)
Education (baseline: graduate)				
High-school		-0.364 (1.028)		0.355 (1.030)
Primary school				0.811 (1.326)
Undergrad		-0.544 (1.062)		0.798 (1.030)
Income (baseline: average)				
High		-0.019 (0.659)		0.646 (0.965)
Low		0.220 (0.629)		0.046 (0.624)
Very high		-1.853 (1.361)		-0.281 (1.352)
Very low		0.308 (0.652)		0.226 (0.560)
Ethnicity (baseline: Ashkenazy) Mixed				
Mixed		-0.705 (0.853)		-0.606 (0.809)
Other		-0.388 (1.058)		14.167 (882.744)
Sephardic		-0.138 (0.544)		0.240 (0.424)
Constant	0.802** (0.334)	1.695 (1.576)	2.708*** (1.033)	1.330 (1.758)
Observations	113	103	207	173
Log Likelihood	-74.628	-64.893	-109.181	-82.372

Note:

*p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01

Table A.9: Interactions of Social Distance and contextual factors

	<i>Dependent variable:</i>	
	Cooperation with PCI (=1)	
	(1)	(2)
Social Distance (binary)	-0.246 (0.453)	-1.063 (0.744)
Non-Jewish percentage	0.003 (0.054)	
Non-Jewish Segregation		-0.242 (1.727)
Social Distance*Non-Jewish percentage	-0.060 (0.060)	
Social Distance*Non-Jewish segregation		1.231 (1.902)
Age	-0.002 (0.008)	-0.002 (0.008)
Foreign Born	0.136 (0.320)	0.135 (0.319)
Sex	0.301 (0.248)	0.332 (0.247)
Ideology	-0.207** (0.093)	-0.201** (0.093)
Religiosity (baseline: religious)		
Secular	-0.940** (0.415)	-0.938** (0.413)
Traditional	-0.744 (0.465)	-0.721 (0.460)
Ultra-Orthodox	-0.477 (0.393)	-0.359 (0.387)
Education (baseline: graduate)		
High-school	0.901 (0.582)	0.828 (0.591)
Primary school	1.001 (0.776)	0.897 (0.780)
Undergrad	0.523 (0.589)	0.467 (0.599)
Income (baseline: average income)		
High	-0.113 (0.440)	-0.075 (0.438)
Low	-0.422 (0.351)	-0.429 (0.350)
Very high	0.073 (0.632)	0.103 (0.630)
Very low	-0.324 (0.326)	-0.394 (0.325)
Ethnicity (baseline: Ashkenazy)		
Mixed	-0.112 (0.462)	-0.077 (0.461)
Other	0.504 (0.713)	0.606 (0.716)
Sephardic	-0.366 (0.269)	-0.261 (0.273)
Constant	1.007 (0.945)	1.086 (1.039)
Observations	375	375
Log Likelihood	-224.567	-226.102
<i>Note:</i>	*p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01	