

The Cost of Empty Threats: A Penny, Not a Pound

JACK SNYDER and ERICA D. BORGHARD *Columbia University*

APPENDIX: CODING SCHEME FOR TABLE A.1

Cases selected from Brecher and Wilkenfeld include all international crises between 1945 and 1994 in which the United States was a crisis actor, as listed in Table A.1. Cases are coded as follows:

Columns "Crisis Name," "Dates," "Crisis Actors," and "Description/Explanation" taken directly from Brecher and Wilkenfeld.

Nature of threat coded according to the following scheme:

- 0 = no threat, not enough information, irrelevant
- 1 = mobilization of troops or use of force without verbal threat
- 2 = ambiguous threat
- 3 = ambiguous threat plus troop mobilization or use of force
- 4 = specific threat
- 5 = specific threat plus troop mobilization or use of force

Note that this coding scheme cannot be interpreted in a direct way as an ordinal ranking of exposure to audience costs. All other things being equal, a specific threat with a show of force should generate more potential audience costs than an ambiguous threat with no show of force. However, further assessment of the case is required to know whether in fact all other things are equal, or even close to equal. Moreover, there is no reason to assume that a specific threat without a show of force is likely to generate either higher or lower potential audience costs than an ambiguous threat with a show of force. Thus, this coding scheme is not designed for statistical tests of audience costs hypotheses. Its function in our research process was to help us identify promising cases for further process-tracing. We include it here to help other scholars do the same.

Outcome coded according to the following scheme:

- 0 = N/A or ambiguous
- 1 = threatened state backs down
- 2 = democracy backs down
- 3 = crisis escalation

Table A.1: International Crises Involving the United States, 1945-1994

Crisis Name	Dates	Crisis Actors	Nature of Threats	Outcome	Description
Trieste I	1 May 1945 - 11 June 1945	UK, US, Yugoslavia	5	1	Tito enters Trieste with forces, UK and US do the same and issue command to Tito to give control to Supreme Allied Commander. Troops begin to enter Trieste and Tito backs down and agrees to negotiate.
Azerbaijan	23 August 1945 - 9 May 1946	Iran, UK, US, USSR	2	1	Soviet-backed rebels declare autonomy for Azerbaijan, and Soviet troops stop Iranian troops from going to the area. UK and US call for withdrawal of Soviet troops. Soviets continued to send more forces to Iran. US sends stronger note to Moscow and issue raised in Security Council. Soviets announce troop withdrawal.
Turkish Straits	7 August 1946 - 26 October 1946	Turkey, US	1	1	USSR challenges regime governing the Turkish Straits and conducts naval exercises in Black Sea; US sends forces to the area and USSR backs down.
Truman Doctrine	21 February 1947 - 22 May 1947	Greece, Turkey, US	0 (although the Truman Doctrine represented an implicit threat to the Communist bloc)	0	With suspension of British aid to Turkey and Greece, US institutes Truman Doctrine, providing support to states susceptible to USSR.
Berlin Blockade	7 June 1948 - 12 May 1949	USSR, France, UK, US	1	1	USSR blockades Berlin after Western Allies announce union of their occupation zones; US, UK, France increase airlift to Berlin; negotiations lead to ending of blockade.
China Civil War	23 September 1948 - 8 December 1949	China, US	0	0	Nationalist China falls to Communist troops, US decides not to send military assistance.

Crisis Name	Dates	Crisis Actors	Nature of Threats	Outcome	Description
Korean War I	25 June 1950 - 30 September 1950	South Korea, US, China, Taiwan	1	3	North Korea invades South Korea; President Truman authorizes use of US troops, sends 7th Fleet to Taiwan Straits. UN Resolutions create UN Unified Command and Korean War begins.
Korean War II	30 September 1950 - 10 July 1951	North Korea, China, USSR, US, South Korea	5	3	President Truman announces US is prepared to use anything in its arsenal (implying nuclear weapons) in response to Chinese involvement in Korean War (crossing Yalu River).
Guatemala	12 December 1953 - 29 June 1954	Guatemala, Honduras, US	1	1	US announces arms embargo of Guatemala and supports anti-government forces after Guatemala solicits arms from USSR. Guatemalan president ends up resigning and junta rule.
Dien Bien Phu	13 March 1954 - 21 July 1954	France, US, UK	2	2	Vietminh attack Dien Bien Phu; France asks US for support, and Secretary of State Dulles gives a speech affirming importance of Indochina to US national interests, threatening non-specific "united action." Dulles arrives in London, and with Eden makes public statement referencing collective defense under UN charter; US and France make similar joint statement. UK decides not to intervene in Indochina, President Eisenhower then does the same.
Taiwan Strait I	August 1954 - 23 April 1955	China, Taiwan, US	3	1	China bombs Quemoy and Matsu after creation of SEATO. Taiwan launches airstrikes, US sends 7th fleet and signs defense treaty with Taiwan. China bombards Tachen islands. Eisenhower gets permission from Congress for "free hand" in Taiwan. China backs down and negotiates.
Suez Nationalization War	26 July 1956 - 12 March 1957	France, UK, Egypt, USSR, US, Israel	5	2	Nasser nationalizes Suez Canal; Israel, UK, France work in secret, with Israel invading Egypt and UK and France issuing an ultimatum to Egypt and Israel. UK and France landed forces in the Canal zone. Egypt appeals to USSR, which threatens London, Paris, Tel Aviv with nukes; US pushes UK to back down. France and UK agree to ceasefire, Israel withdraws.

Crisis Name	Dates	Crisis Actors	Nature of Threats	Outcome	Description
Syria/Turkey Confrontation	18 August 1957 - 29 October 1957	Turkey, US, Syria	2	1	Pro-USSR colonel becomes chief of staff of Syrian armed forces; US rearticulates Eisenhower doctrine (US will aid states in Middle East under communist threat). USSR claims Turkey preparing to attack Syria as Turkish forces were participating in NATO exercises and US 6th Fleet engaged in maneuvers near Syria. Soviets backed down (for domestic political reasons).
Iraq-Lebanon Upheaval	8 May 1958 - October 1958	Lebanon, Jordan, US, UK	0	0	US troops sent to Lebanon and British troops to Jordan after rioting in Lebanon and a coup in Iraq.
Berlin Deadline	27 November 1958 - 15 September 1959	France, UK, US, West Germany, East Germany, USSR	1	0	US discussions of stationing of tactical nuclear weapons in Europe prompts Khrushchev to issue Note calling for demilitarization of West Berlin and declaring it a free city and, if not, the USSR would give completely sovereignty of East Berlin to East Germany and USSR affirmed commitment to security of East Germany. Western powers rejected Soviet note. Negotiations began, although tensions remained high as US sent nuclear-armed aircraft carriers to the Mediterranean and reinforced troops in Europe. Agreement signed that banned all nuclear weapons from Berlin and curtailed number of Western forces there.
Pathet Lao Offensive	9 March 1961 - 16 May 1961	US, Thailand	3	1	Pathet Lao forces supported by Vietminh break through Loatian defenses, President Kennedy orders US troops to be ready to enter Laos (various mobilizations taken). Kennedy calls TV news conference on March 23, "warns" USSR and Pathet Lao of increased chance for war, US and SEATO will consider response. Pathet Lao advance closer to Laos, US sends "token" military forces. USSR is "impressed by...US resolve" and agrees to negotiate ceasefire.
Bay of Pigs	15 April 1961 - 24 April 1961	Cuba, US	0	0	Cuban exiles invade Cuba with support from President Kennedy. Cuba accuses US of backing the invasion, and USSR reaffirms support for Cuba. US disavows role. Cuban exiles defeated. US later admits role.

Crisis Name	Dates	Crisis Actors	Nature of Threats	Outcome	Description
Berlin Wall	August 1961 - 28 October 1961	East Germany, USSR, France, UK, West Germany, US	5	1	After failure by Kennedy and Khrushchev to reach agreement on status of Berlin, Kennedy announces to US public that US would fight in defense of Berlin, and called up reservists. Flow of refugees from East Berlin led Soviets to support building of wall around West Berlin. US sent troops to West Berlin, Western powers reinforced. Khrushchev backed down on deadline previously imposed for resolving Berlin issue. Confrontation between US and Soviet tanks at Checkpoint Charlie reinvigorated tensions, but both Kennedy and Khrushchev agreed to withdraw tanks.
Vietcong Attack	18 September 1961 - 15 November 1961	South Vietnam, US	0	0	Vietcong capture a provincial capital close to Saigon; Kennedy's National Security Council commits to sending advisors to South Vietnam to train and some equipment.
Nam Tha	6 May 1962 - 12 June 1962	US, Thailand	1	1	Pathet Lao attacks Nam Tha. President Kennedy mobilizes troops (sends 7th Fleet to Gulf of Siam, US forces in Pacific on alert, 5,000 troops ordered moved to Thailand). Pathet Lao ceases offensive and negotiations resume.
Cuban Missiles	16 October 1962 - 20 November 1962	US, Cuba, USSR	5	1	US receives information of Soviet military presence in Cuba, Kennedy issues ultimatum to Soviet to prevent Soviet deployment of missiles in Cuba. President Kennedy then finds evidence of Soviet missiles in Cuba and announces blockade. Kennedy accepts Khrushchev proposal to remove offensive missiles from Cuba if US commits not to invade Cuba.
Panama Flag	9 January 1964 - 12 January 1964	Panama, US	0	0	Riots in Panama when US students raise US flag at a school, with US troops killing rioters. Panama suspends diplomatic relations and calls for change of US-Panama treaties, President Johnson expresses remorse for killings.
Gulf of Tonkin	30 July 1964 - August 1964	US, North Vietnam	1	3	South Vietnamese patrol boats attack North Vietnamese islands in Gulf of Tonkin, North Vietnam attacks US destroyers. President Johnson orders attack of North Vietnamese gunboats and gets Congress to pass Gulf of Tonkin Resolution, expanding presidential war powers in Southeast Asia.
Congo II	4 August 1964 - 30 December 1964	Congo, Belgium, US, USSR	0	0	Belgium and US send troops to successfully rescue foreign civilian hostages taken in Stanleyville by rebels, central government regains control.

Crisis Name	Dates	Crisis Actors	Nature of Threats	Outcome	Description
Pleiku	7 February 1965 - March 1965	US, South Vietnam, North Vietnam	1	3	Vietcong attack military base at Pleiku; President Johnson begins air strikes (Operation Rolling Thunder)
Dominican Intervention	24 April 1965 - 31 August 1965	US, Dominican Republic	0	0	Civil war in Dominican Republic threatens US lives, President Johnson sends troops to evacuate foreign citizens and restore order.
Six Day War	17 May 1967 - 11 June 1967	Israel, Jordan, Egypt, US, Syria, USSR	1	0	Israel launches preemptive strike against Egypt, beginning Six Day War. USSR threatened to intervene, US moved 6th Fleet closer to Syrian coastline.
Pueblo	21 January 1968 - 23 December 1968	South Korea, US, North Korea	3	1	USS Pueblo captured by North Korea. US mobilizes (sends USS Enterprise to Sea of Japan, calls up reservists) and calls for release of Pueblo crew. US and North Korea agree to talks, US withdraws Enterprise and US apologizes but then retracts apology after crew returned.
Tet Offensive	30 January 1968 - 31 March 1968	South Vietnam, US	1	0	After Vietcong attack on Saigon, US increases ground combat troops in Vietnam. Negative assessment by chairman of joint chiefs leads President Johnson to stop bombing and begin negotiation.
Vietnam Spring Offensive	22 February 1969 - 8 June 1969	North Vietnam, US, South Vietnam	1	3	Hanoi launches offensive against South Vietnam, President Nixon responds with orders to bomb Cambodia, which he initially retracts but eventually carries out.
EC-121 Spy Plane	15 April 1969 - 26 April 1969	US, North Korea	1	0	North Korea shot down US EC-121 reconnaissance plane with 31 people on board. President Nixon mobilized forces in Sea of Japan, resumed reconnaissance flights with armed escorts. US moved naval forces into Yellow Sea after no additional action was taken by North Korea.
Invasion of Cambodia	13 March 1970 - 22 July 1970	North Vietnam, Cambodia, South Vietnam, US	1	3	President Nixon sends troops into Cambodia.

Crisis Name	Dates	Crisis Actors	Nature of Threats	Outcome	Description
Black September	15 September 1970 - 29 September 1970	Syria, US, Israel, Jordan	0	0	Syria invades Jordan, Israel decides will use military force if necessary. US commits to support Israel if USSR and Egypt intervene, and mobilizes forces. Jordan and Syria sign peace agreement.
Cienfuegos Submarine Base	16 September 1970 - 23 October 1970	US, USSR, Cuba	0	1	President Nixon discovers construction of Soviet base in Cuba. When discovery becomes public, US warns Soviets and asks for explanation. Soviet deny that construction violated 1962 agreement. Soviet naval forces leave the area and Soviets stop construction.
Vietnam Ports Mining	30 March 1972 - 19 July 1972	South Vietnam, US, North Vietnam	2	1	President Nixon orders mining of North Vietnamese ports, North Vietnam says it will not respond to US "ultimatum," crisis dissipates as both sides renew peace discussion.
Christmas Bombing	23 October 1972 - 27 January 1973	South Vietnam, US, North Vietnam	1	0	President Nixon bombs North Vietnam to coerce the North Vietnamese to resume peace negotiations, which was achieved.
October-Yom Kippur War	5 October 1973 - 31 May 1974	Israel, Syria, US, Egypt, USSR	2	0	Israel, Egypt, Syria engaged in armed conflict, and then agree to ceasefire. Israel violates ceasefire, prompting USSR to warn US that it would intervene if Israel does not stop actions on Suez Canal; President Nixon pressures Israel, but US also goes to Defcon 3. Crisis ends with US-USSR sponsored Security Council resolution.
Mayaguez	12 May 1975 - 15 May 1975	US, Cambodia	5	1	Khmer Rouge takes US cargo ship Mayaguez. President Ford threatens use of force against Cambodia if crew and ship not returned. US decides to use military force, and Cambodia releases crew shortly after use of force begins (even though engagements between US and Khmer Rouge troops continue with casualties near Koh Tong).
War in Angola	12 July 1975 - 27 March 1976	Zaire, Zambia, South Africa, Angola, Cuba, USSR, US	0	0	US increases covert aid to Zaire; President Ford requests more aid from Congress for FNLA/UNITA, but Congress refuses.

Crisis Name	Dates	Crisis Actors	Nature of Threats	Outcome	Description
Poplar Tree	17 August 1976 - 16 September 1976	US, North Korea	3	1	US soldiers killed in DMZ pruning a poplar tree; US demands North Korea accept responsibility, punish perpetrators, and commit not to do again, and US mobilizes large military forces and goes to Defcon3. North Korea puts troops on war posture and US takes down the poplar tree with a huge show of force. North Korea issues statement of regret.
Shaba II	11 May 1978 - 30 July 1978	Zaire, Angola, Belgium, France, US	1	1	Katangan rebels invade Shaba and President Mobutu blames Angola and asks for Western troops. US sends airlift with French and Belgian troops to Zaire after massacre of French and Belgian citizens. Angola announces rebel movement across border will cease, foreign forces leave.
Afghanistan Invasion	March 1979 - 28 February 1980	USSR, Afghanistan, Pakistan, US	0	0	Soviets invade Afghanistan; President Carter blocks grain shipments to USSR and sale of technology to USSR, as well as other diplomatic maneuverings including boycotting the Olympics. Iran hostage crisis overshadows US involvement in Afghanistan invasion, as US decides to resume relations with USSR but send arms to guerrillas through Pakistan.
U.S. Hostages in Iran	4 November 1979 - 20 January 1981	US, Iran	3	1	After Islamic radicals take US embassy hostage, President Carter initially responds with diplomatic maneuvers, but then threatens to use military force to rescue hostage. Failed rescue attempt ensues, and the US does not use force again. Eventually hostages are released, but not until Reagan is president.
Gulf of Syrte I	12 August 1981 - 1 September 1981	Libya, US	5	3	Libya claims Gulf of Syrte is Libyan territory; US claims international waters. US maneuvers in Mediterranean near Gulf of Syrte, shoots down 2 Libyan SU-22 fighters, and threatens military action if Libya interferes with US maneuvers. Qaddafi says Libya will defend territory, even in war with US. Crisis over when Qaddafi threatens to attack US nuclear base and cause "international catastrophe" if US enters Gulf of Syrte.
Able Archer 83	2 November 1983 - 11 November 1983	USSR, US	0	0	Soviet misperceives NATO military exercise, called Able Archer, as actual preparations for nuclear war.
Nicaragua MIG-21s	6 November 1984 - 12 November 1984	US, Nicaragua	3	2	US thought Soviet cargo ship was sending MIGs to Sandinistas in Nicaragua. US mobilizes forces in the region in a show of strength, coupled with hawkish rhetoric. Then, US receives new information that Soviet ships were not in fact carrying MIGs, so backs down and confirms not intending to invade Nicaragua.

Crisis Name	Dates	Crisis Actors	Nature of Threats	Outcome	Description
Gulf of Syrte II	24 March 1986 - 21 April 1986	Libya, US	5	3	US announces naval exercises and sends 6th fleet into Gulf of Syrte; Libya and US exchanges clashes. Exercise ends, but Secretary of State threatens to take more action if US feels it's appropriate. Berlin disco bombing kills US soldier, US blames Libya and Reagan calls Qaddafi a "mad dog" and threatens US retaliation. US launches airstrikes against 2 Libyan cities.
Libyan Jets	21 December 1988 - 12 January 1989	Libya, US	0	0	US accuses Libya of responsibility for Pan Am crash. Holds naval maneuvers in Mediterranean and shoots down 2 Libyan MIGs.
Gulf War	2 August 1990 - 12 April 1991	Kuwait, US, Iraq, Saudi Arabia, Bahrain, Egypt, France, Israel, Oman, Qatar, Syria, UAE, UK, USSR	5	3	Iraq invades Kuwait. US calls for Iraqi withdrawal from Kuwait and restoration of Kuwaiti regime, as does UN Security Council. US announces troop deployment to Saudi Arabia. Leads to Operation Desert Storm.
North Korea Nuclear Crisis	March 1993 - 21 October 1994	North Korea, South Korea, US	0	0	When IAEA seeks inspections of North Korean nuclear sites, North Korea announces withdrawal from NPT, removes fuel rods from Yongbyon. Jimmy Carter serves as mediator. North Korea brought into talks, sign Agreed Framework.
Iraq Troop Deployment-Kuwait	7 October 1994 - 10 November 1994	Kuwait, Saudi Arabia, US, Iraq	5	1	Iraq deploys troops close to Kuwaiti border; US issues a series of threatening statements and President Clinton sends USS Eisenhower and Aegis to area, deploys 4,000 troops to Kuwait, and issues a clearer threat to Iraq ("It would be a grave error for Iraq to repeat the mistakes of the past or to misjudge either American will or American power"). Clinton announces additional 36,000 troop deployment to area. Iraq withdraws from border, even as US sends more troops to the area.
Invasion of Grenada	19 October 1983 - 28 October 1983	US, Grenada	1	3	Coup in Grenada. US sends naval forces to the Caribbean. President Reagan decides to invade Grenada (occurring at same time as Lebanon barracks bombing).

Crisis Name	Dates	Crisis Actors	Nature of Threats	Outcome	Description
Invasion of Panama	15 December 1989 - 3 January 1990	US, Panama	1	1	US covert attempts to unseat General Noriega fail. US marine killed, Panama announces in a state of war with US. President Bush, in Operation Just Cause, launches military intervention, Noriega surrenders.
Haiti Military Regime	July 1994 - 15 October 1994	US, Haiti	5	1	Haitian refugees to US prompt President Clinton to announce intervention in Haiti, coupled with UN Security Council resolution. US domestic political discontent with intervention leads Clinton to suggest mediation, with Clinton announcing to the American public a threat to invade Haiti (if mediation fails), invoking Monroe and Truman doctrines. Junta rescinds power, 20,000 US troops arrive in Haiti.