Online Appendix

Incentivized choice in large-scale voting experiments

Tanja Artiga González, Georg D. Granic, Franziska Heinicke, Stephanie Rosenkranz, and Utz Weitzel

Appendix A: Additional analyses

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Treatment | P | PI | A | AI | p-value |
| Age category | 6.17 (3.21) | 6.00 (3.15) | 6.11 (3.33) | 5.81 (3.31) | 0.547 |
| Gender (female) | 56.11% | 50.94% | 49.04% | 47.21% | 0.135 |
| Education (university degree) | 31.56% | 30.00% | 29.30% | 31.05% | 0.927 |
| Full-time working | 35.00% | 35.31% | 34.71% | 36.27% | 0.980 |
| Voted in 2017 | 74.06% | 74.38% | 75.16% | 72.88% | 0.933 |
| Intend to vote in 2021 | 78.13% | 81.56% | 77.07% | 78.10% | 0.534 |
| # Participants | 320 | 320 | 314 | 306 |  |

Table A.1: Demographic variables by treatment displaying mean (sd) for age categories and share for all binary variables. The p-value refers to a test on equal distributions between treatments. Chi2 test is used for binary variables, Kruskal-Wallis test for ordinal age variable. Age categories are Younger than 20, 20-24, 25-29, 30-34, 35-39, 40-44, 45-49, 50-54, 55-59, 60-64, 65-69, 70 or older. Category 6 is 45-49 years old.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Treatment | P | PI | A | | AI | |
|  | Vote share | Vote share | Approval rate | Approval share | Approval rate | Approval share |
| VVD | 18.8% | 15.9% | 30.3% | 15.9% | 23.9% | 13.7% |
| PVV | 16.6% | 15.9% | 28.3% | 14.9% | 27.1% | 15.6% |
| CDA | 6.3% | 6.3% | 12.4% | 6.5% | 13.7% | 7.9% |
| D66 | 6.3% | 6.9% | 14.3% | 7.5% | 13.1% | 7.5% |
| Groenlinks | 8.1% | 5.3% | 15.6% | 8.2% | 13.7% | 7.9% |
| SP | 10.6% | 10.0% | 14.3% | 7.5% | 16.0% | 9.2% |
| PvdA | 10.3% | 8.1% | 13.7% | 7.2% | 14.7% | 8.5% |
| CU | 2.5% | 3.8% | 7.6% | 4.0% | 8.8% | 5.1% |
| PvdD | 7.5% | 10.0% | 12.1% | 6.4% | 9.5% | 5.5% |
| 50Plus | 2.8% | 5.0% | 10.2% | 5.4% | 9.5% | 5.5% |
| SGP | 1.6% | 0.9% | 2.2% | 1.2% | 0.7% | 0.4% |
| DENK | 0.0% | 0.6% | 3.2% | 1.7% | 1.3% | 0.8% |
| FvD | 5.9% | 8.1% | 15.9% | 8.4% | 11.1% | 6.4% |
| Piraten | 0.0% | 0.6% | 1.3% | 0.7% | 1.6% | 0.9% |
| BIJ1 | 0.0% | 0.0% | 0.3% | 0.2% | 0.3% | 0.2% |
| LP | 0.0% | 0.3% | 0.6% | 0.3% | 0.7% | 0.4% |
| BBB | 0.3% | 0.0% | 0.3% | 0.2% | 0.3% | 0.2% |
| Code Oranje | 0.0% | 0.3% | 1.0% | 0.5% | 0.7% | 0.4% |
| JONG | 0.0% | 0.3% | 0.3% | 0.2% | 0.7% | 0.4% |
| NIDA | 0.0% | 0.0% | 0.3% | 0.2% | 0.3% | 0.2% |
| NLBeter | 0.0% | 0.0% | 0.6% | 0.3% | 1.0% | 0.6% |
| PvdT | 1.9% | 1.3% | 2.5% | 1.3% | 3.3% | 1.9% |
| PvPB | 0.0% | 0.0% | 1.3% | 0.7% | 1.3% | 0.8% |
| Volt | 0.6% | 0.3% | 1.3% | 0.7% | 0.7% | 0.4% |
| # Participants | 320 | 320 | 314 | 314 | 306 | 306 |
| Total number of votes / approvals | 320 | 320 | 597 | 597 | 532 | 532 |

Table A 2: Vote share, approval rate, and approval share for all parties in the experiment for each treatment. Approval share: number of approvals received by a party divided by number of participants in q treatment. Approval share: number of approvals received by a party divided by the total number of approvals cast in treatment. χ^2 tests indicate no significant difference between distributions under incentivized and hypothetical for plurality voting and approval voting (p-values are 0.532 and 0.967, respectively).

Figure A 1: Average Euclidean distance between parties voted for and the voters’ self-placements, by treatment. Calculations are based on party placements in a two-dimensional policy space obtained from “Kieskompas” (<https://www.kieskompas.nl/en/>). Kieskompas scores all parties along the conservative/progressive dimension (GAL/TAN dimension) and along the economic left/economic right dimension. Voters in the experiment self-placed on these dimensions. For each voter, we calculate the Euclidean distance between the party s/he voted for and his or her self-placement. For A and AI, we calculate the averaged Euclidean over all approved parties by a voter. The observed differences between approval voting and plurality voting are significant according to one-sided, two-sample t-tests (p-value A vs P was = 0.042 and p-value AI vs PI = 0.045). Incentives had no significant effect (both p-values > 0.528).

Appendix B: Instructions

**Indications of treatments:**

* Approval voting [included in gray]
* *Incentives [included in italics]*

**WELCOME**

Thank you for participating in this survey, which will take less than 5 minutes.

This survey is part of an academic research project. By proceeding you explicitly give us your consent that:

* We can collect your anonymous, non-sensitive personal data (like age, income, etc).
* We can use this data for scientific purposes and store it on our safe-guarded university servers for up to 10 years.
* We can make anonymized data available to other researchers online.
* We promise to protect your data according to the new General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR) data regulation laws.

You can withdraw your consent at any time by contacting us via Dynata.

Please read all questions carefully and answer honestly.

**INSTRUCTIONS**

We will ask you to cast a vote for a political party of the Netherlands.

You can vote for one party only. The party you vote for receives one vote. / For this, we will use a new voting method. It works like this: You can vote for as many parties as you wish. Each party you vote for receives one vote.

You cannot abstain from voting.

The party with the most votes is the winner of the election.

Assume that the 'lijsttrekker' (first candidate on party list) of the winning party will be the new Prime Minister.

***INCENTIVES***

*Your vote counts and has real consequences!*

*In about three weeks we will donate €500 to the party that received the most votes in this survey.*

*Donations are an important resource for parties in election campaigns. This means that your vote affects which party will receive a contribution for the election campaign 2021.*

*Proof of the donation to the winning party will be communicated by the research team via special web site. This is to ensure that all information is transparent and credible. Further details will be provided at the end of the survey.*

**SUMMARY**

You can vote for one party only. / You can vote for as many parties as you like. Every party you vote for receives one vote.

The lijsttrekker of the winning party will be the new Prime Minister.

*We will donate €500 to the winning party.*

Take your time. The 'next' button will appear in 10 seconds.

**DECISION**

Which party do you vote for?

Important:

Please answer honestly.

You can vote for one party only. / You can vote for as many parties as you like.

*We donate €500 to the winning party.*

* VVD
* PVV (Partij voor de Vrijheid)
* CDA
* D66
* GROENLINKS
* SP (Socialistische Partij)
* Partij van de Arbeid (PvdA)
* ChristenUnie
* Partij voor de Dieren
* 50PLUS
* Staatkundig Gereformeerde Partij (SGP)
* DENK
* Forum voor Democratie
* Piratenpartij
* BIJ1
* LP (Libertarische Partij)
* BBB
* Code Oranje
* JONG
* NIDA
* NLBeter!
* Partij voor de Toekomst
* Platform voor Plaatselijke Belangen
* Volt Nederland

**SURVEY**

* What is your gender?
  + Male, Female, I prefer not to comment
* What is your age?
  + Younger than 20, 20-24, 25-29, 30-34, 35-39, 40-44, 45-49, 50-54, 55-59, 60-64, 65-69, 70 or older
* What is your highest educational degree?
  + Basisonderwijs, VMBO, HAVO, VWO, MBO, Bachelor degree (HBO/WO), Master degree, Doctoral degree (Dutch degrees)
* What is your marital status?
  + Married, Divorced, Separated, Widowed, Unmarried
* What is your current employment status?
  + Full-time employment, Part-time employment, Unemployed, Self-employed, Home-maker, Student, Retired
* Are you a member of a political party?
  + Yes, No
* Were you eligible to vote in the Tweede Kamerverkiezingen (Dutch general election) 2017?
  + Yes, No
* Did you vote in the Tweede Kamerverkiezingen 2017?
  + Yes, No, I don't remember
* Do you plan to vote in the upcoming 2021 election?
  + Yes, I am certain., Yes, but I am still undecided., No, but I am still undecided., No, certainly not.
* How interested are you in politics in general?
  + not at all interested, a little interested, quite interested, very interested
* How often do you consume political news per week (e.g., TV, newspaper, internet)?
  + Never, 1-2 times, 3-4 times, 5-6 times, Everyday
* In political matters, people often talk of “the left” and “the right”. How would you place your views on economic policy? Voters from of the economic left want the government to play an active role in the economy. Voters on the economic right want to reduce the economic role of the government.
  + Scale: 0 (far-left) to 10 (far-right)
* In political matters, people often talk of “liberals” and “conservatives”. How would you place your views? Liberals favor expanded personal freedoms, for example, access to abortion, active euthanasia, same-sex marriage, or greater democratic participation. Conservatives often reject these ideas; they value order, tradition, and stability, and believe that the government should be a firm moral authority on social and cultural issues.
  + Scale: 0 (liberal) to 10 (conservative)

***DONATION PROOF***

*In about 3 weeks, you will be able to see proof of the donation to the winning party.*

*The information will be posted on this web page: [URL posted here - not live anymore]*

*Please write down the address of the web page if you want to visit it in 3 weeks.*

*Thank you for your participation!*

*\*\*\* PLEASE CLICK BELOW TO COMPLETE THE SURVEY \*\*\**