

## Supplementary Information

### 1. Instructions for the Content Creators to Create the Content for the Main Study

---

Q821

#### Overview

ChatGPT-4 is the state-of-art large language model (LLM) developed by OpenAI. We are partnering with Accenture to study various aspects of human-LLM collaborations (for example, the potential impact of incorporating AI input into the content generation process).

As expert content generators, your experience is paramount. This is an academic study and you are completing the first part (not meant for actual marketing distribution to the public), in which you will be asked to generate some advertising contents for a product or some persuasive contents for a campaign. Though you will not be participating in the second part of the academic study, your content will be included as representative text to study participants. No identifying information will be asked or shared.

You will see further task instructions on the next page.

I have carefully reviewed the above information

---

----- Page Break -----

---

Q893

We would like you to complete two tasks.

In the first task, we want you to create advertising content for a product without relying on a large language model. You may search for information or inspirations online or offline, **but please do not use language models such as ChatGPT-4 to help with the task.**

In the second task, we want you to create persuasive contents for a campaign. **This time, we will provide you with the textual content generated by ChatGPT-4**, which you may use as your inspiration or a draft that you edit upon.

For both tasks, your responses are required to be textual (e.g., no graphical content).

Page 1 of the instructions given to the professional content creators: Overview

Q886

You will see your first task on the next page. The task is to write advertising content for a product in fewer than 100 words without relying on LLM.

Your goal is to get people interested in this product after seeing your content.

Page 2 of the instructions given to the professional content creators: The Goal for Advertising Content

**Product:** Ready America 72 Hour Emergency Kit

**Features:**

Emergency Kit For Disaster Preparedness: Stay Prepared For Emergency Situations Everywhere You Go. Ready America Emergency Survival Kits Sustain 2 People For 3 Days (72 Hours). Basic Essential Emergency Supplies Recommended By The American Red Cross

Includes 33-Piece First Aid Kit: Comes With First Aid Essentials For Minor Injuries Like Bandages And Wound Cleaning Solution. Take Care Of Medical Emergencies With Easy To-Use Supplies. Great For A Car Emergency Kit Or Boat Accessories

Food, Water, Emergency Blankets: Everything You Need In Case Of An Emergency. 2 Survival Food Bars (2400 Calories) And Water Pouches With A 5-Year Shelf Life, Survival Blankets, Disposable Dust Masks, Nitrile Gloves, Whistle, Ponchos, Pocket Tissues

Two Safety Light Sticks: In Case You're Outdoors Or In The Wilderness With No Light, This Emergency Bag Includes Two Safety Light Sticks. Equipped With Survival Gear For Hunting, Boating, Workplace, Camping, Backpacking, Fishing, Hiking, Travel, Home



Product3

**Please create advertising content for the above product in fewer than 100 words**

Page 3 of the instructions given to the professional content creators: The content creators all first complete a task without access to ChatGPT-4's content. For those who first complete a task about the product, they are given a picture and a description of the product and asked to create advertising content for the product. The products and campaigns vary for different content creators. For those who first complete a task about the campaign, they are given a task prompt revealing the campaign (see below).

Q1870

You will see your second task on the next page. Your task is to write persuasive content for a campaign in fewer than 100 words. Your goal is to persuade people to change their behavior after seeing your content.

We will provide you with the textual content generated by ChatGPT-4, which you may use either as inspiration for your own content or as a first draft that you can edit upon.

In order to obtain the persuasive content generated by ChatGPT-4, we provided ChatGPT-4 with a prompt on the campaign topic, and asked it to create persuasive content in fewer than 100 words. Both the input prompt and the output by ChatGPT-4 will be available to you on the next page.

Both the input prompt and output by ChatGPT-4 will be available to you on the next page.

---

Page 4 of the instructions given to the professional content creators: They are briefed about the second task, and they will be presented with the content generated by ChatGPT-4.

Racism\_AI

Please create persuasive content for a client (e.g., an NGO doing a campaign) to convince people to stop racism in fewer than 100 words.

Below is the persuasive content created by ChatGPT-4:

*Embrace unity and take a stand against racism! Our diverse world is built on the richness of varied cultures, backgrounds, and experiences. By dismantling prejudice and promoting understanding, we can foster a society where everyone is treated with fairness, respect, and dignity. Together, let's challenge discrimination and empower ourselves to celebrate our differences. It starts with you – have open conversations, educate yourself, and be an ally. Join the movement for a more inclusive, compassionate world, where we can all thrive, united in our humanity. Remember, love conquers hate – always.*

Page 3 of the instructions given to the professional content creators: The content creators all complete the second task with access to ChatGPT-4's content. For those whose first task is about a product, the second task will be about one of the five campaigns. For those whose first task is about a campaign, their second task will be about one of the five products. They are given a picture and a description of the product and asked to create advertising content for the product.

## 2. Content Generated by Human, AI, Augmented AI, and Augmented Human

Task	Human	AI	Augmented AI	Augmented Human
Emergency Kit	Gain peace of mind knowing	Be prepared for the unexpected	Be prepared for the unexpected	Stay prepared and confident with

	<p>you are taking your emergency preparedness efforts to the next level with Ready America Emergency Survival Kits. With basic essential emergency supplies and survival gear recommended by the American Red Cross, you'll have everything you need for two people to sustain three days (72 hours) in one backpack, including a 33-piece first aid kit, food bars,</p>	<p>with the Ready America 72 Hour Emergency Kit! Designed for two people, this kit provides essential emergency supplies for 3 days, as recommended by the American Red Cross. Inside, find a 33-piece first aid kit for minor injuries, 2400-calorie survival food bars, water pouches with a 5-year shelf life, emergency blankets, dust masks, nitrile gloves, a whistle, ponchos, and pocket tissues.</p>	<p>with the Ready America 72 Hour Emergency Kit! As recommended by the American Red Cross, this kit is designed for two people and provides essential emergency supplies for three days. Inside, you'll find a 33-piece first aid kit for minor injuries, two 2,400-calorie survival food bars, water pouches with a 5-year shelf life, emergency blankets, dust masks, nitrile gloves, a whistle, ponchos, pocket</p>	<p>Ready America's 72 Hour Emergency Kit. Designed for two people, this comprehensive kit includes essential emergency supplies recommended by the American Red Cross. From a 33-piece first aid kit to food bars, water pouches, blankets, and light sticks, you'll have everything necessary to face unexpected situations. Ideal for outdoor adventures, travel, or home use, this emergency kit</p>
--	--	---	--	---

	<p>water, blankets and light sticks. Perfect for hunting, hiking, fishing, boating, backpacking, camping, travel or even at home. Be prepared for whatever comes your way with Ready America Emergency Survival Kits.</p>	<p>Stay safe outdoors or at home with two safety light sticks, perfect for hunting, boating, camping, and more. Don't get caught unprepared - make Ready America your go-to emergency solution!</p>	<p>tissues, and two safety light sticks. Stay safe at home or outdoors when hunting, boating, camping, and more. Don't get caught unprepared - make Ready America your go-to emergency solution!</p>	<p>ensures you're ready for anything. Don't leave safety to chance – equip yourself with Ready America's 72 Hour Emergency Kit today.</p>
Electric bike	<p>The eBike Designed for the Smart City! Whatever your urban environment throws at you, the Heybike Cityscape Electric Bike has you</p>	<p>Ride into the future with the Heybike Cityscape Electric Bike - the ultimate 350W Electric City Cruiser! Experience the freedom of a 40-mile range,</p>	<p>Open doors to open roads. The 250W Electric City Cruiser Bicycle is built for adventure. Pre-assembled and ready to ride, your journey is everything that's</p>	<p>Introducing the Heybike Cityscape Electric Bike – the ultimate urban cruiser tailored for your city adventures! With its powerful 350W motor and</p>

	<p>covered. Travel up to 40 miles per charge thanks to its 36V battery. A 350w rear-drive motor lets you cruise at up to 19mph, making even the longest commutes a breeze. Experienced cyclists will fall in love with the 7-speed transmission while new riders ease into cycling with dual shock absorbers and 3 adjustable pedal assist modes. From a relaxing ride to a cardio workout, the</p>	<p>thanks to a modular 36V, 10Ah battery, and reach top speeds of 19mph. Upgrade your commute with our Step-Through geometry frame and wide swept-back handlebar, ensuring a comfortable ride on 26" puncture-resistant tires, Shimano 7-speed, and dual shock absorber. Choose from 3 working modes to suit your journey, and trust in the dual disc brakes and lighting</p>	<p>ahead. REVOLUTIONARY FREEDOM- Thanks to a modular 36V and 10AH battery you can reach speeds of 19 mph with a 40-mile range and 3 working modes to choose from. SMOOTHER SAILING- Shimano 7-speed, dual shock absorber and 26" puncture resistance tires make for an easy ride. SAFE AND SOUND- Dual disc brakes and lighting system ensure safety with a better, more</p>	<p>long-range 36V, 10Ah battery, you can travel up to 40 miles per charge at speeds of up to 19mph. The step-through frame and swept-back handlebar ensure a comfortable ride, while the 26" puncture-resistant tires, Shimano 7-speed gears, and dual shock absorbers guarantee a smooth experience. Choose from throttle or three pedal-assist modes for effortless</p>
--	---	---	--	---

	<p>HeyBike Cityscape is the eBike you've been looking for.</p>	<p>system for unbeatable safety. Arriving mostly pre-assembled, just hop on and let the adventure begin!</p>	<p>geometric frame and wide swept-back handlebar.</p>	<p>commuting or a workout. Pre-assembled for convenience, the Cityscape also features an integrated rear rack for cargo. Transform your city rides today!</p>
<p>Tumbler</p>	<p>The Hydro Flask Reusable Mug. The Mug for drop off. The Mug for drop ins. The Mug you won't drop.</p>	<p>Introducing the Hydro Flask Stainless Steel Reusable Mug! Sip in style with a splash-proof, Closeable Press-In Lid, perfect for on-the-go enjoyment. Its Soft Touch Exterior ensures comfort and grip, while the</p>	<p>Meet the only mug you'll ever need. The Hydro Flask Stainless Steel Reusable Mug is soft on the outside for a comforting grip, with 18/8 pro-grade stainless steel on the inside so you'll never taste the metal. Its</p>	<p>Introducing the Hydro Flask Stainless Steel Reusable Mug: your ultimate companion for sips and spills. Featuring a closeable Press-In Lid that slides open for effortless drinking and straw access, while keeping splashes</p>

		<p>innovative TempShield double-wall vacuum insulation keeps your drinks hot or cold for hours. Crafted from 18/8 pro-grade stainless steel, taste the purity without flavor transfer. Live worry-free with a BPA-Free &amp; Toxin-Free design. Experience the ultimate sustainable companion for your favorite beverages. Cheers to a greener future!</p>	<p>TempShield double-wall vacuum insulation keeps liquids at the perfect temperature for hours – piping hot, icy cold, or wherever you like it in-between. The snug lid stops spills and splashes at home or on-the-go. It slides open for sips or straws. The mug is made of toxin-free materials (no BPAs!). You enjoy a safe and delicious drinking experience, every time.</p>	<p>at bay. The Soft Touch Exterior ensures comfortable grip and the TempShield double-wall vacuum insulation keeps your drinks hot or cold for hours. Made with 18/8 pro-grade stainless steel, enjoy pure taste without flavor transfer. BPA-free and toxin-free, sip with confidence. Say hello to the Hydro Flask Reusable Mug - easy to hold, and hard to drop.</p>
--	--	--	--	---

<p>Air Fryer</p>	<p>Enjoy yummy goodness every day—with 70% less calories from fat. Make crispy, golden fixings—guilt-free—with just a flip of the switch. With the #1 selling XL Power Brand Air Fryer, you can cook tender fall-off-the-bone ribs and wings with a crispy crust. Steam tender vegetables. Bake bread, toast bagels, or reheat pretzels. Air fry technology and 1-touch cooking presets mean you</p>	<p>Discover the PowerXL Air Fryer, your all-in-one kitchen solution from the #1 best-selling air fryer brand! This 7-qt multi-cooker features built-in commercial steaming technology, perfect for vegetables, shellfish, and bakery-style treats. Enjoy 10-in-1 LED digital 1-touch cooking presets and temperature control up to 400°. Savor crispy, tender bites with up to</p>	<p>Discover the PowerXL Air Fryer, an all-in-one kitchen solution from the #1 best-selling air fryer brand! Perfect for everything from vegetables and shellfish to bakery-style treats. Create delicious meals with up to 70% fewer calories from fat. Features include: 7-quart capacity with built-in commercial steaming technology. --10 one-touch digital cooking presets,</p>	<p>Discover the PowerXL Air Fryer – the ultimate kitchen gadget for guilt-free indulgence. Enjoy crispy, golden delights with 70% less fat, thanks to its innovative air-fry technology. The versatile 1700-watt, 7-qt air fryer features 10-in-1 LED digital one-touch cooking presets for everything from air frying and steaming to baking and reheating. Achieve perfect results with tender</p>
------------------	--	--	--	--

	<p>can press a button and forget about it. Serve a family-sized meal or just plate for yourself. Either way, cooking has never been easier. And with our dishwasher-safe parts, clean-up is a breeze. Just what you'd expect.</p>	<p>70% fewer calories from fat. The PowerXL Air Fryer includes a 7-qt fry basket, steamer/air fryer rack, and recipe book, with dishwasher-safe parts for easy cleanup. Elevate your culinary experience with the versatile, health-conscious PowerXL Air Fryer!</p>	<p>and temperature control up to 400°. --Includes a fry basket, steamer/air fryer rack, and recipe book, with dishwasher-safe parts for easy cleanup. Elevate your culinary experience with the versatile, health-conscious PowerXL Air Fryer!</p>	<p>steamed veggies, bakery-style bread, and crispy ribs or wings – all with fewer calories. The PowerXL Air Fryer comes with a fry basket, steamer rack, and recipe book, and its dishwasher-safe parts make cleanup a breeze. Revolutionize your cooking experience today!</p>
<p>Projector</p>	<p>What if your mobile phone could project cinema-quality video onto a 10-foot screen at</p>	<p>Introducing the WEMAX Go Advanced Portable Smart Laser Projector – innovation and</p>	<p>Present with confidence on the go—introducing the WEMAX Go Advanced Portable Smart</p>	<p>Experience cinema magic anytime, anywhere with the WEMAX Go Advanced</p>

	<p>the same resolution as modern flat-screen TVs? But what would you look at while you're watching the movie, you say? We've got good news. The WEMAX Go Advanced projector is the size of a phone and has the power of a movie theater. Best of all: it can handle ambient light, project onto most any angle, and has endless battery power. Very handy in the office, an offsite event, or any</p>	<p>convenience in the palm of your hand! Utilizing ALPD laser technology and TI DLP for vivid, bright images up to 120 inches, this ultra-portable projector is perfect for on-the-go presentations. With a built-in rechargeable battery lasting 1.5 hours, you can present without power outlets or cables. Weighing just 1.7 lbs and under 1-inch thick, it's the ideal travel companion. Say goodbye to</p>	<p>Laser Projector. Less than 1" thick and just 1.7 pounds, it goes everywhere with you—and with 1.5 hours of viewing time, it'll last through your meeting even when a charger isn't handy. You'll get high-end cinema-quality ALPD laser technology with industry-first portability. Wow your viewers even in ambient light with full HD using over 16.7M distinct colors and 600 ANSI lumens of brightness at up</p>	<p>Portable Smart Laser Projector. Harnessing ALPD and DLP technologies, this pocket-sized powerhouse delivers stunning, vivid visuals up to 120 inches, even in ambient light. With a rechargeable battery, enjoy 1.5+ hours of uninterrupted presentations or entertainment—simply extend with a power bank for limitless viewing. Weighing a mere 1.7 lbs, it's perfect for the office, conferences, or</p>
--	---	---	---	--

	<p>on-the-go adventure. The only other thing you'll need to bring is the popcorn.</p>	<p>complex setups with auto-calibration features, making every presentation a breeze. Experience the future of projection with WEMAX Go Advanced!</p>	<p>to 120" projection size. Advanced auto-calibration technology means you'll be up and running in seconds every time.</p>	<p>on-the-go adventures. Smart screen calibrations ensure hassle-free setup, so you can focus on what matters—just don't forget the popcorn!</p>
<p>Start recycling</p>	<p>What if you made a choice today that saved the life of a single tree? Instead of getting chopped down, chipped, and shipped to a paper mill, your tree stands tall for 1,000 years. Each day, it cleans carbon dioxide</p>	<p>Join the recycling revolution and make a difference for our planet! Recycling conserves precious resources, reduces waste, and combats pollution. It's a small action with a big impact, helping to</p>	<p>A letter to the next generation. We're sorry that we didn't do more. We're sorry that we didn't speak up. We're sorry that we didn't stand up. We're sorry that so many gave up. If only we realized the impact we could</p>	<p>Imagine making a simple decision today that could save a tree and make a lasting impact on our environment. By recycling paper, cardboard, and other reusable materials, you can help preserve trees that provide</p>

	<p>from the air and produces enough oxygen for a family of four. It shelters generations of wildlife, protects the soil with its roots, and lowers air temperature with its shade. Recycle paper, cardboard, and other reusable materials instead of putting them in the trash. The future of the world depends on the choices we all make today.</p>	<p>preserve our environment for future generations. Don't wait; start recycling today and become an agent of change. Together, we can create a cleaner, greener, and more sustainable world for all. Remember, it's not just about us – it's about our children, our wildlife, and the Earth we all share. Recycle, because every little bit counts!</p>	<p>have had, if only we knew the life you could have had, with only a few small changes. If we could turn back time, and do it all again, just know that we would do it differently. We'd recycle, for you &amp; for them. We'd recycle, for you to have a chance.</p>	<p>oxygen for families, homes for wildlife, and shade that cools our air. Your choice to recycle not only reduces waste but also combats climate change by minimizing carbon dioxide levels. Take action now - recycling is a small step with immense benefits. The future of our planet depends on the collective choices we make today.</p>
<p>Do More Physical Exercises</p>	<p>HEADLINE It's not about better</p>	<p>Get moving and unlock the power</p>	<p>The benefits of physical exercise</p>	<p>Transform your life by simply</p>

	<p>fitting pants—it’s everything to do with your heart.</p> <p>BODY/ARTICLE</p> <p>There’s a way to decrease the obesity rate in America, and it doesn’t take an expensive gym membership or exhaustive hours of training. It starts with your heart. Raising your heart rate doesn’t just slim down our waist, studies show physical activity can lower blood pressure and stress, reduce inflammation and slow the</p>	<p>of physical exercise! Boost your energy, improve your mood, and enhance your overall well-being by incorporating regular workouts into your daily routine.</p> <p>Experience the life-changing benefits, from reduced stress and better sleep to increased strength and weight management. It's not just about looking good; it's about feeling fantastic from the inside out. There's an activity for</p>	<p>go further than just skin deep.</p> <p>From a boost in energy to improvements in your mood, you can enhance nearly every facet of your well-being just by staying active and making time for physical activity in your daily routine.</p> <p>From reduced stress to better sleep to improved posture, regular exercise and physical activity provide countless benefits. Even weight management and increased strength</p>	<p>moving more! It's not just about fitting into your favorite outfit - it's about improving your heart health and overall well-being.</p> <p>Regular physical exercise can lower blood pressure, reduce stress, decrease inflammation, and help prevent diabetes, leading to a longer, healthier life. You don't need an expensive gym membership or grueling workout sessions. Start with these low-impact</p>
--	--	---	---	--

	<p>development of diabetes, which contribute to a longer life. Here are low-impact activities to increase heart health.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Swimming</li> <li>2. Walking</li> <li>3. Low-intensity interval training</li> <li>4. Bicycling</li> <li>5. Weightlifting</li> </ol>	<p>everyone – walk, run, dance, or lift, just get started.</p> <p>Take the first step towards a healthier, happier life today.</p> <p>Remember, a little progress each day adds up to big results!</p>	<p>if swimsuit season is, in fact, your biggest priority.</p> <p>There’s an activity for everyone, from low-impact to high-intensity!</p> <p>Take your first steps towards a healthier you! Get out and get moving!</p>	<p>activities to boost your heart health and happiness:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Swimming</li> <li>2. Walking</li> <li>3. Low-intensity interval training</li> <li>4. Bicycling</li> <li>5. Weightlifting</li> </ol> <p>Embrace the power of movement and unlock a healthier you!</p>
<p>Stop Racism</p>	<p>Racism still exists in our modern world, and it hurts us all. But hate can never end hate, and separating ourselves into angry camps will</p>	<p>Embrace unity and take a stand against racism!</p> <p>Our diverse world is built on the richness of varied cultures, backgrounds, and experiences. By</p>	<p>Would you rather live in a world fueled by love or hate? Perhaps that’s what we should ask ourselves as we consider the pervasive global</p>	<p>Together, we can overcome the destructive force of racism. It may persist in today's society, but we have the power to change that.</p> <p>Division and</p>

	<p>never bring us all together. We want to end racism in America today, tomorrow, and forever. By finding common ground where people can share without fear and listen without judgment, we believe that racism can forever be a relic of the past. Join us as we embark on a bold new journey to unite future generations and create a world free from an old affliction.</p>	<p>dismantling prejudice and promoting understanding, we can foster a society where everyone is treated with fairness, respect, and dignity. Together, let's challenge discrimination and empower ourselves to celebrate our differences. It starts with you – have open conversations, educate yourself, and be an ally. Join the movement for a more inclusive,</p>	<p>problem of systemic racism. Our world is built on the richness of diverse cultures, backgrounds and experiences. By dismantling prejudice, we can foster a society where everyone is treated with fairness, respect and dignity. But we all must do our part to openly challenge discrimination – have direct conversations, educate ourselves and be allies. Join the movement for a more inclusive, compassionate</p>	<p>hatred will not lead to unity, so we must choose understanding and empathy. Let's end racism, today and always, by fostering an environment where open dialogue thrives, without fear or judgment. Stand with us as we forge a path towards a future where generations can live in harmony, leaving racism behind as a distant memory. Embrace our shared humanity and help create a world free from</p>
--	--	---	--	---

		<p>compassionate world, where we can all thrive, united in our humanity.</p> <p>Remember, love conquers hate – always.</p>	<p>world, where we can all thrive, united in our humanity. Love can conquer hate.</p>	<p>prejudice.</p>
<p>Wash their hands often</p>	<p>If you could make one simple, fast, effective, and free choice every day that would improve your health, wouldn't you try it? Then simply wash your hands. All it takes is a little soap, water, and less than 30 seconds of your time, and you can drastically reduce</p>	<p>Clean hands save lives! Washing your hands regularly is a simple yet powerful way to protect yourself and those around you from illness. By making hand hygiene a priority, you can effectively combat the spread of harmful germs and viruses. It's</p>	<p>It's easy to save a life: Wash your hands. It's simple. Just follow these 3 steps before and after eating and after touching public surfaces:</p> <p>1) Use soap and water to create a lather. 2) Rub your hands together for at least 20 seconds. 3)</p>	<p>Protect your health and the well-being of those around you with one quick, easy, and cost-free action: washing your hands. Using just soap and water for 20-30 seconds, you can significantly decrease the spread of germs, safeguarding your health and the</p>

	<p>the spread of bacteria, viruses, and microbes, keeping you and others around you healthy. Demonstrating this to children and encouraging them to do it before and after eating, using the bathroom, and riding the bus can help stem the spread of illness worldwide.</p>	<p>easy, quick, and a cornerstone of good health. So, remember to lather up with soap and water for at least 20 seconds, especially before meals and after touching public surfaces. Let's all commit to healthier habits, and together, we can create a safer, cleaner world for everyone. Wash your hands, because prevention starts with you!</p>	<p>Rinse and dry. That's it! Do it now. And start saving lives.</p>	<p>health of others. Teach children the importance of handwashing before and after meals, restroom breaks, and public transportation use. This simple habit is a powerful tool in preventing the spread of illnesses globally. Choose handwashing, and contribute to a healthier world for all.</p>
<p>Eat less junk food</p>	<p>Real food tastes better. It's better</p>	<p>Transform your life by choosing</p>	<p>Junk food makes us feel</p>	<p>Savor the true flavors of life!</p>

	<p>for your body and the planet. You don't have to be a five-star chef to move beyond junk food—you just have to consider all your options and make the healthier choice more often.</p> <p>Apples? Delicious! Salad? Your new best friend. Roast chicken? Easier than you think and so, so worth it.</p> <p>And hey, when you do eat those nachos or scarf down that cheesecake, enjoy every moment of it, because guilt</p>	<p>healthier alternatives to junk food!</p> <p>Consuming excess junk food can lead to weight gain, fatigue, and long-term health issues. Opt for nutritious meals packed with vitamins, minerals, and antioxidants to feel energized, maintain a healthy weight, and reduce your risk of chronic diseases. Embrace the power of wholesome ingredients and discover the delicious flavors</p>	<p>good...almost immediately. Just thinking about it makes our mouths water. So why is it called junk food? Because you're being tricked. And not in a fun magician kind of way. No, junk food tricks your brain and body into thinking you're better off. It triggers all the feel-good chemicals without giving you the actual good stuff you need to feel better tomorrow when you wake up...or five years from now. So,</p>	<p>Prioritize your well-being and the environment by opting for wholesome, natural foods.</p> <p>With countless nutritious alternatives, ditching junk food doesn't require culinary expertise—just a commitment to making better choices. Relish the crunch of apples, the freshness of salads, or the warmth of a home-cooked roast chicken.</p> <p>Treat yourself guilt-free to the</p>
--	---	--	---	--

	<p>tastes terrible—and you deserve the best.</p>	<p>of fruits, vegetables, lean proteins, and whole grains. Remember, a balanced diet is the key to a happier, healthier you. Make the switch today – your body and mind will thank you!</p>	<p>maybe try eating less junk food, and see how you feel. We think you'll feel it, and this time in a good way.</p>	<p>occasional indulgence, knowing you're on the path to a healthier lifestyle. Choose quality over junk and elevate your taste buds and overall health to new heights!</p>
--	--	---	---	--

**3. Instructions for the Online Participants to Rate the Content Quality**

### Informed Consent

Your decision to complete this survey is voluntary. There is no way for us to identify you. The only information we will have, in addition to your responses, is the time at which you completed the survey. The results of the research may be presented at scientific meetings or published in scientific journals. Going to the next page indicates that you are at least 18 years of age and agree to complete this survey voluntarily.

Q894

Please also verify the following

I'm not a robot  [Privacy - Terms](#)

Page Break

workid



Please enter your WorkerID (we will delete this information after approving your work)

Page Break

Q821



Overview

We have generated some advertising content for five different products and some persuasive content for five different campaigns. We want you to evaluate the quality of the text you will read.

I have carefully reviewed the above information

Page 1 of the instructions given to the online participants: Overview

▼  Display this question

If `study` is Equal to 1

Or `study` is Equal to 2

### Information about Content Generators (please read carefully before proceeding)

The textual content for the products and campaigns you are about to evaluate were generated under one of the four paradigms:

- AI only,
- A Human Expert only,
- AI-generated first, with final edits by human expert, or,
- Human Expert-generated first, with final edits by AI.

**AI Only:** For each task, the textual content is generated by ChatGPT-4 developed by OpenAI, which is the state-of-the-art large language models trained to produce human-like textual contents. For example, we gave a product's name and its feature descriptions to the AI and asked it generate advertising content. Or we gave the prompt of a campaign to the AI and asked it to generate persuasive content. The output by ChatGPT-4 was taken directly without further human-edit.

**Human Expert Only:** Each textual content is generated by a human expert without the help of ChatGPT-4 or other large language models. The human experts are recruited from one of the world's best consulting firms. Each human expert was given the same information as the AI, and their generated content was taken directly without further editing.

**AI-generated first, with final edits by human expert:** In addition to the information provided in the "human expert only" condition, the professional content creators were also given the content generated by ChatGPT-4 (i.e., the exact output by the AI in the "AI Only" condition), which they may use as an inspiration or a first draft that they can edit upon. In other words, in this condition, a human expert will have access to the content generated by ChatGPT-4 but humans will finalize the output for each task.

**Human Expert-generated first, with final edits by AI:** In addition to the information provided in the "AI only" condition, ChatGPT-4 was also given the content generated by one of the professional content creators who had completed the task (i.e., the exact output by a human expert in the "Human Expert Only" condition), which ChatGPT-4 may edit. In other words, in this condition, the AI will have access to the content generated by a human expert but the AI will finalize the output for each task.

I have carefully reviewed the above information

Page 2 of the instructions given to the online participants: Those who are in the baseline condition skipped this page. Only those in the “partially informed” and “informed” condition saw this information.

lan\_check

**Language Check: What is the eleventh month of a year called?**

- December
- October
- July
- November
- June
- January

Page 3 of the instructions given to the online participants: Attention Check

▼  Display this question

If study Is Equal to 0

### Instructions

You will first evaluate advertising content generated for five different products. When generating the advertising content, a content generator was given the product's name and a description of its features.

After seeing the advertising content for each product, we want to know

(1) to what extent you are interested in learning more about the product (e.g., its price, user reviews, complete product descriptions, etc.)

(2) suppose you are the seller of the product, to what extent you are satisfied with the generated advertising content

(3) suppose you are the seller of the product and the content has a copyright, what is the maximum amount of money you are willing to pay to use the content as your advertisement. (Assuming you have a \$1000-budget for this content and please state the maximum amount you are willing to pay between \$1 and \$1000. Please enter a numerical value without the \$ sign).

**Each advertising content should contain fewer than 100 words. Please read the content carefully.**

I have reviewed the above information



Display this question

If study Is Equal to 1

### Instructions

You will first evaluate advertising content generated for five different products. When generating the advertising content, each content generator (*either an AI, or a human expert, or a human expert who finalizes content first generated by AI, or an AI that finalizes content first generated by a human expert*) was given the product's name and a description of its features.

After seeing the advertising content for each product, we want to know

(1) to what extent you are interested in learning more about the product (e.g., its price, user reviews, complete product descriptions, etc.)

(2) suppose you are the seller of the product, to what extent you are satisfied with the generated advertising content

(3) suppose you are the seller of the product and the content has a copyright, what is the maximum amount of money you are willing to pay to use the content as your advertisement. (Assuming you have a \$1000-budget for this content and please state the maximum amount you are willing to pay between \$1 and \$1000. Please enter a numerical value without the \$ sign).

**Each advertising content should contain fewer than 100 words. Please read the content carefully.**

I have reviewed the above information

▼  Display this question

If study Is Equal to 2

### Instructions

You will first evaluate advertising contents generated for five different products. When generating the advertising content, each content generator (*either an AI, or a human expert, or a human expert who finalizes content first generated by AI, or an AI that finalizes content first generated by a human expert*) was given the product's name and a description of its features.

After seeing the advertising content for each product, we want to know

(1) to what extent you are interested in learning more about the product (e.g., its price, user reviews, complete product descriptions, etc.)

(2) suppose you are the seller of the product, to what extent you are satisfied with the generated advertising content

(3) suppose you are the seller of the product and the content has a copyright, what is the maximum amount of money you are willing to pay to use the content as your advertisement. (Assuming you have a \$1000-budget for this content and please state the maximum amount you are willing to pay between \$1 and \$1000. Please enter a numerical value without the \$ sign).

**Each advertising content should contain fewer than 100 words. Please read the content carefully. We will also tell you under which paradigm a content is created.**

I have reviewed the above information

Page 4 of the instructions given to the online participants in the informed condition. Note that they are told they will be informed under which paradigm a content is created

Q1122

**The task will start on the next page. Please read the content and questions carefully!**

I have reviewed the above information

---

Page 5 of the instructions given to the online participants



Q1908

▼ [Display this question](#)

If p5 Is Equal to 1

And study Is Not Equal to 2

**Below is the advertising content:**

*"What if your mobile phone could project cinema-quality video onto a 10-foot screen at the same resolution as modern flat-screen TVs? But what would you look at while you're watching the movie, you say? We've got good news. The WEMAX Go Advanced projector is the size of a phone and has the power of a movie theater. Best of all: it can handle ambient light, project onto most any angle, and has endless battery power. Very handy in the office, an offsite event, or any on-the-go adventure. The only other thing you'll need to bring is the popcorn."*

I have reviewed the above advertising content

Q1065

▼ [Display this question](#)

If p5 Is Equal to 1

And study Is Equal to 2

**Below is the advertising content created by a human expert:**

*"What if your mobile phone could project cinema-quality video onto a 10-foot screen at the same resolution as modern flat-screen TVs? But what would you look at while you're watching the movie, you say? We've got good news. The WEMAX Go Advanced projector is the size of a phone and has the power of a movie theater. Best of all: it can handle ambient light, project onto most any angle, and has endless battery power. Very handy in the office, an offsite event, or any on-the-go adventure. The only other thing you'll need to bring is the popcorn."*

Page 6 of the instructions given to the online participants who saw human generated content for the product. Note those in the informed condition also saw the identity of the content creator, but those in the other two conditions were not.

If p5 Is Equal to 2  
And study Is Not Equal to 2

**Below is the advertising content:**

*"Introducing the WEMAX Go Advanced Portable Smart Laser Projector – innovation and convenience in the palm of your hand! Utilizing ALPD laser technology and TI DLP for vivid, bright images up to 120 inches, this ultra-portable projector is perfect for on-the-go presentations. With a built-in rechargeable battery lasting 1.5 hours, you can present without power outlets or cables. Weighing just 1.7 lbs and under 1-inch thick, it's the ideal travel companion. Say goodbye to complex setups with auto-calibration features, making every presentation a breeze. Experience the future of projection with WEMAX Go Advanced!"*

I have reviewed the above advertising content

Q1066

▼  Display this question

If p5 Is Equal to 2  
And study Is Equal to 2

**Below is the advertising content created by an AI:**

*"Introducing the WEMAX Go Advanced Portable Smart Laser Projector – innovation and convenience in the palm of your hand! Utilizing ALPD laser technology and TI DLP for vivid, bright images up to 120 inches, this ultra-portable projector is perfect for on-the-go presentations. With a built-in rechargeable battery lasting 1.5 hours, you can present without power outlets or cables. Weighing just 1.7 lbs and under 1-inch thick, it's the ideal travel companion. Say goodbye to complex setups with auto-calibration features, making every presentation a breeze. Experience the future of projection with WEMAX Go Advanced!"*

I have reviewed the above advertising content

Page 6 of the instructions given to the online participants who saw AI generated content for the product.

Q1910

▼  Display this question

If p5 Is Equal to 3

And study Is Not Equal to 2

**Below is the advertising content:**

*"Present with confidence on the go—introducing the WEMAX Go Advanced Portable Smart Laser Projector. Less than 1" thick and just 1.7 pounds, it goes everywhere with you—and with 1.5 hours of viewing time, it'll last through your meeting even when a charger isn't handy. You'll get high-end cinema-quality ALPD laser technology with industry-first portability. Wow your viewers even in ambient light with full HD using over 16.7M distinct colors and 600 ANSI lumens of brightness at up to 120" projection size. Advanced auto-calibration technology means you'll be up and running in seconds every time."*

I have reviewed the above advertising content

---

Q1067

▼  Display this question

If p5 Is Equal to 3

And study Is Equal to 2

**Below is the advertising content created by a human expert who edits and finalizes the content first generated by the AI:**

*"Present with confidence on the go—introducing the WEMAX Go Advanced Portable Smart Laser Projector. Less than 1" thick and just 1.7 pounds, it goes everywhere with you—and with 1.5 hours of viewing time, it'll last through your meeting even when a charger isn't handy. You'll get high-end cinema-quality ALPD laser technology with industry-first portability. Wow your viewers even in ambient light with full HD using over 16.7M distinct colors and 600 ANSI lumens of brightness at up to 120" projection size. Advanced auto-calibration technology means you'll be up and running in seconds every time."*

I have reviewed the above advertising content

Page 6 of the instructions given to the online participants who saw “augmented human” generated content for the product.

▼  Display this question

If p5 Is Equal to 4

And study Is Not Equal to 2

**Below is the advertising content:**

*"Experience cinema magic anytime, anywhere with the WEMAX Go Advanced Portable Smart Laser Projector. Harnessing ALPD and DLP technologies, this pocket-sized powerhouse delivers stunning, vivid visuals up to 120 inches, even in ambient light. With a rechargeable battery, enjoy 1.5+ hours of uninterrupted presentations or entertainment—simply extend with a power bank for limitless viewing. Weighing a mere 1.7 lbs, it's perfect for the office, conferences, or on-the-go adventures. Smart screen calibrations ensure hassle-free setup, so you can focus on what matters—just don't forget the popcorn!"*

I have reviewed the above advertising content

Q1068

▼  Display this question

If p5 Is Equal to 4

And study Is Equal to 2

**Below is the advertising content created by an AI that edits and finalizes the content first generated by a human expert:**

*"Experience cinema magic anytime, anywhere with the WEMAX Go Advanced Portable Smart Laser Projector. Harnessing ALPD and DLP technologies, this pocket-sized powerhouse delivers stunning, vivid visuals up to 120 inches, even in ambient light. With a rechargeable battery, enjoy 1.5+ hours of uninterrupted presentations or entertainment—simply extend with a power bank for limitless viewing. Weighing a mere 1.7 lbs, it's perfect for the office, conferences, or on-the-go adventures. Smart screen calibrations ensure hassle-free setup, so you can focus on what matters—just don't forget the popcorn!"*

I have reviewed the above advertising content

Page 6 of the instructions given to the online participants who saw “augmented AI” generated content for the product.

To what extent are you interested in learning more about the product (e.g., its price, user reviews, complete product descriptions, etc.) on a scale from 1 to 7?

1 - Not interested at all	2 - Uninterested	3 - Somewhat uninterested	4 - Neither uninterested nor interested	5 - Somewhat interested	6 - Interested	7 - Very interested
<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>

---

sat5

Suppose you are the seller of the product, to what extent are you satisfied or unsatisfied with the generated advertising content on a scale from 1 to 7?

1 - Very unsatisfied	2 - Unsatisfied	3 - Somewhat unsatisfied	4 - Neutral	5 - Somewhat satisfied	6 - Satisfied	7 - Very satisfied
<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>

---

pay5

Suppose you are the seller of the product and the content has a copyright, what is the maximum amount of money you are willing to pay to use the content as your advertisement? (Assuming you have a budget of \$1000, please state your max willingness-to-pay between \$1 and \$1000.)

Page 6 of the instructions given to the online participants: the variables of interest.

att check

att\_check

**Attention Check: 1+1 = ?**

1

2

3

4

5

6

Page 7 of the instructions given to the online participants: attention check.

Q1047

▼  Display this question

If study Is Equal to 0

### Instructions

Next you will evaluate persuasive contents generated for five different campaigns. After seeing the persuasive content for each campaign, we want to know

- (1) to what extent you are convinced by the content to change your behavior
- (2) suppose you are the campaign manager, to what extent you are satisfied or unsatisfied with the generated persuasive content
- (3) suppose you are the campaign manager and the content has a copyright, what is the maximum amount of money you are willing to pay to use the content for persuasion. (Assuming you have a \$1000-budget for this content and please state the maximum amount you are willing to pay between \$1 and \$1000. Please enter a numerical value without the \$ sign).

**Each persuasive content should contain fewer than 100 words. Please read the content carefully.**

I have reviewed the above information

Page 8 of the instructions given to the online participants in the baseline condition.

Display this question

If study Is Equal to 1

### Instructions

Next you will evaluate persuasive contents generated for five different campaigns. Similar to the advertising content, each persuasive content was also generated under one of the four paradigms (*either an AI, or a human expert, or a human expert who finalizes content first generated by AI, or an AI that finalizes content first generated by a human expert*).

After seeing the persuasive content for each campaign, we want to know

- (1) to what extent you are convinced by the content to change your behavior
- (2) suppose you are the campaign manager, to what extent you are satisfied or unsatisfied with the generated persuasive content
- (3) suppose you are the campaign manager and the content has a copyright, what is the maximum amount of money you are willing to pay to use the content for persuasion. (Assuming you have a \$1000-budget for this content and please state the maximum amount you are willing to pay between \$1 and \$1000. Please enter a numerical value without the \$ sign.).

**Each advertising content should contain fewer than 100 words. Please read the content carefully.**

I have reviewed the above information

Page 8 of the instructions given to the online participants in the partially informed condition.

▼  Display this question

If study Is Equal to 2

### Instructions

Next you will evaluate persuasive contents generated for five different campaigns. Similar to the advertising content, each persuasive content was also generated under one of the four paradigms (*either an AI, or a human expert, or a human expert who finalizes content first generated by AI, or an AI that finalizes content first generated by a human expert*).

After seeing the persuasive content for each campaign, we want to know

(1) to what extent you are convinced by the content to change your behavior

(2) suppose you are the campaign manager, to what extent you are satisfied or unsatisfied with the generated persuasive content

(3) suppose you are the campaign manager and the content has a copyright, what is the maximum amount of money you are willing to pay to use the content for persuasion. (Assuming you have a \$1000-budget for this content and please state the maximum amount you are willing to pay between \$1 and \$1000. Please enter a numerical value without the \$ sign).

**Each advertising content should contain fewer than 100 words. Please read the content carefully. We will also tell you under which paradigm a content is created.**

I have reviewed the above information

Page 8 of the instructions given to the online participants in the informed condition.

▼  Display this question

If p10 Is Equal to 1

And study Is Not Equal to 2

**Below is the persuasive content:**

*"Real food tastes better. It's better for your body and the planet. You don't have to be a five-star chef to move beyond junk food—you just have to consider all your options and make the healthier choice more often. Apples? Delicious! Salad? Your new best friend. Roast chicken? Easier than you think and so, so worth it. And hey, when you do eat those nachos or scarf down that cheesecake, enjoy every moment of it, because guilt tastes terrible—and you deserve the best."*

I have reviewed the above persuasive content

---

Q1086

▼  Display this question

If p10 Is Equal to 1

And study Is Equal to 2

**Below is the persuasive content created by a human expert:**

*"Real food tastes better. It's better for your body and the planet. You don't have to be a five-star chef to move beyond junk food—you just have to consider all your options and make the healthier choice more often. Apples? Delicious! Salad? Your new best friend. Roast chicken? Easier than you think and so, so worth it. And hey, when you do eat those nachos or scarf down that cheesecake, enjoy every moment of it, because guilt tastes terrible—and you deserve the best."*

I have reviewed the above persuasive content

---

Page 9 of the instructions given to the online participants who saw human generated content.

Q1942

▼  Display this question

If p10 Is Equal to 2

And study Is Not Equal to 2

**Below is the persuasive content:**

)

***"Transform your life by choosing healthier alternatives to junk food! Consuming excess junk food can lead to weight gain, fatigue, and long-term health issues. Opt for nutritious meals packed with vitamins, minerals, and antioxidants to feel energized, maintain a healthy weight, and reduce your risk of chronic diseases. Embrace the power of wholesome ingredients and discover the delicious flavors of fruits, vegetables, lean proteins, and whole grains. Remember, a balanced diet is the key to a happier, healthier you. Make the switch today – your body and mind will thank you!"***

I have reviewed the above persuasive content

▶

Q1087

▼  Display this question

If p10 Is Equal to 2

And study Is Equal to 2

**Below is the persuasive content created by an AI:**

***"Transform your life by choosing healthier alternatives to junk food! Consuming excess junk food can lead to weight gain, fatigue, and long-term health issues. Opt for nutritious meals packed with vitamins, minerals, and antioxidants to feel energized, maintain a healthy weight, and reduce your risk of chronic diseases. Embrace the power of wholesome ingredients and discover the delicious flavors of fruits, vegetables, lean proteins, and whole grains. Remember, a balanced diet is the key to a happier, healthier you. Make the switch today – your body and mind will thank you!"***

I have reviewed the above persuasive content

Page 9 of the instructions given to the online participants who saw AI generated content.

▼  Display this question

If p10 Is Equal to 3

And study Is Not Equal to 2

**Below is the persuasive content:**

*"Junk food makes us feel good...almost immediately. Just thinking about it makes our mouths water. So why is it called junk food? Because you're being tricked. And not in a fun magician kind of way. No, junk food tricks your brain and body into thinking you're better off. It triggers all the feel-good chemicals without giving you the actual good stuff you need to feel better tomorrow when you wake up...or five years from now. So, maybe try eating less junk food, and see how you feel. We think you'll feel it, and this time in a good way."*

I have reviewed the above persuasive content

---

Q1088

▼  Display this question

If p10 Is Equal to 3

And study Is Equal to 2

**Below is the persuasive content created by a human expert who edits and finalizes the content first generated by the AI:**

*"Junk food makes us feel good...almost immediately. Just thinking about it makes our mouths water. So why is it called junk food? Because you're being tricked. And not in a fun magician kind of way. No, junk food tricks your brain and body into thinking you're better off. It triggers all the feel-good chemicals without giving you the actual good stuff you need to feel better tomorrow when you wake up...or five years from now. So, maybe try eating less junk food, and see how you feel. We think you'll feel it, and this time in a good way."*

I have reviewed the above persuasive content

▼  Display this question

If p10 Is Equal to 4

And study Is Not Equal to 2

**Below is the persuasive content:**

*"Savor the true flavors of life! Prioritize your well-being and the environment by opting for wholesome, natural foods. With countless nutritious alternatives, ditching junk food doesn't require culinary expertise—just a commitment to making better choices. Relish the crunch of apples, the freshness of salads, or the warmth of a home-cooked roast chicken. Treat yourself guilt-free to the occasional indulgence, knowing you're on the path to a healthier lifestyle. Choose quality over junk and elevate your taste buds and overall health to new heights!"*

I have reviewed the above persuasive content

---

Q1089

▼  Display this question

If p10 Is Equal to 4

And study Is Equal to 2

**Below is the persuasive content created by an AI that edits and finalizes the content first generated by a human expert:**

*"Savor the true flavors of life! Prioritize your well-being and the environment by opting for wholesome, natural foods. With countless nutritious alternatives, ditching junk food doesn't require culinary expertise—just a commitment to making better choices. Relish the crunch of apples, the freshness of salads, or the warmth of a home-cooked roast chicken. Treat yourself guilt-free to the occasional indulgence, knowing you're on the path to a healthier lifestyle. Choose quality over junk and elevate your taste buds and overall health to new heights!"*

I have reviewed the above persuasive content

Page 9 of the instructions given to the online participants who saw “augmented AI” content.

int10

To what extent are you convinced by the above content to eat less junk food on a scale from 1 to 7?

- |                          |                       |                            |                       |                        |                       |                       |
|--------------------------|-----------------------|----------------------------|-----------------------|------------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| 1 - Not convinced at all | 2 - Not convinced     | 3 - Somewhat not convinced | 4 - Neutral           | 5 - Somewhat convinced | 6 - Convinced         | 7 - Very convinced    |
| <input type="radio"/>    | <input type="radio"/> | <input type="radio"/>      | <input type="radio"/> | <input type="radio"/>  | <input type="radio"/> | <input type="radio"/> |

sat10

Suppose you are the campaign manager, to what extent are you satisfied or unsatisfied with the generated persuasive content on a scale from 1 to 7?

- |                       |                       |                          |                       |                        |                       |                       |
|-----------------------|-----------------------|--------------------------|-----------------------|------------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| 1 - Very unsatisfied  | 2 - Unsatisfied       | 3 - Somewhat unsatisfied | 4 - Neutral           | 5 - Somewhat satisfied | 6 - Satisfied         | 7 - Very satisfied    |
| <input type="radio"/> | <input type="radio"/> | <input type="radio"/>    | <input type="radio"/> | <input type="radio"/>  | <input type="radio"/> | <input type="radio"/> |

pay10

Suppose you are the campaign manager and the content has a copyright, what is the maximum amount of money you are willing to pay to use the content for persuasion? (Assuming you have a budget of \$1000, please state your max willingness-to-pay between \$1 and \$1000.)

Page 9 of the instructions given to the online participants: the variables of interest.

#### 4. Additional Results 1: partially informed vs Informed

We also compare participants' evaluation of content quality between the "partially informed" and the "informed" condition. The results are illustrated by a comparison between the "pinkish" bar (baseline) and the "bluish" bar (informed) within each paradigm in Figure 1 and Figure 2. The regression analysis is the same as previously mentioned except we change the coding for the dummy variable (1 = informed, 0 = partially informed). First, we find that given the same content generated solely by a human expert, participants felt more satisfied with the content and were willing to pay more if they were informed of the content was created by a human expert ( $b_{satisfaction} = 0.23, p = 0.0000$ ;  $b_{wtp} = 0.21, p = 0.01$ ). Although participants were slightly more satisfied with the content generated solely by AI when they were informed ( $b = 0.14, p = 0.01$ ), their willingness-to-pay did not increase significantly ( $b = 0.08, p = 0.11$ ). We also do not find any effect on the satisfaction level or willingness-to-pay for the remaining two content generation paradigms (Augmented Human:  $b_{satisfaction} = -0.03, p = 0.62$ ,  $b_{wtp} = 0.02, p = 0.81$ ; Augmented AI:  $b_{satisfaction} = 0.07, p = 0.18$ ,  $b_{wtp} = 0.11, p = 0.14$ ). Therefore, we again have evidence of human favoritism after resolving uncertainty around the identity of the content creator. Nevertheless, evidence for AI favoritism is ambiguous because although the positive effect on perceived satisfaction

after resolving uncertainty is marginally significant, there is no effect on willingness-to-pay.

## **5. Additional Results 2: Separate Analysis on Quality Evaluation for the Advertising Content and Persuasive Content**

In this section, we compare the perceived quality of content generated for campaigns and products separately (as a clarification, all t-tests are two-sided two-sample t-tests). We first examine participants' stated level of satisfaction for the persuasive content for campaigns generated under different paradigms. As depicted by the baseline condition in Figure 3, participants expressed varying degrees of satisfaction with content produced under different paradigms (one-way ANOVA,  $p = 0.000$ ). On average, advertising content generated solely by ChatGPT-4 resulted in higher satisfaction level than content generated solely by a human expert (5.11 vs 4.83, two-sample t-test,  $p = 0.002$ , cohen's  $d = 0.19$ ). Content generated by "augmented AI" also outperformed content generated by "augmented human" (4.93 vs 4.45, two-sample t-test,  $p = 0.000$ , cohen's  $d = 0.31$ ). Advertising content generated solely by ChatGPT-4 resulted in higher satisfaction level than content generated solely by a human expert (5.48 vs 5.03, two-sample t-test,  $p = 0.000$ , cohen's  $d = 0.33$ ). Advertising content generated by "augmented AI" also outperformed content generated by "augmented human" (5.51 vs 5.47, two-sample t-test,  $p = 0.61$ ).

Similar patterns emerge when we use participants' willingness-to-pay for the content as a measure of content quality. As depicted by the baseline condition in Figure 4, participants had different willingness-to-pay for content generated under different paradigms (one-way ANOVA,

$p = 0.000$ , for both categories). Furthermore, on average, participants' willingness-to-pay for campaign content was slightly higher for content generated solely by AI than solely by a human expert, (4.70 vs 4.45, two-sample t-test,  $p = 0.06$ , cohen's  $d = 0.12$ ). On the other hand, persuasive content generated by "augmented AI" achieved higher willingness-to-pay than content generated by "augmented human" (4.48 vs 3.96, two-sample t-test,  $p = 0.000$ , cohen's  $d = 0.23$ ). On average, participants' willingness-to-pay for advertising content was the same for content generated solely by AI and solely by a human expert, (4.97 vs 4.77, two-sample t-test,  $p = 0.09$ , cohen's  $d = 0.11$ ). On the other hand, advertising content generated by "augmented AI" also had the same willingness-to-pay as content generated by "augmented human" (5.21 vs 5.19, two-sample t-test,  $p = 0.76$ ).

Similar patterns also emerge when we examine the level of interest after seeing the advertising content and the degree of persuasion after seeing persuasive content as measures of content quality. As depicted by the baseline condition in Figure 5, participants had different levels of interest for content generated under different paradigms (one-way ANOVA,  $p$  for campaigns = 0.000,  $p$  for products = 0.01). Interestingly, for the advertising content, there was no difference between content generated by AI and humans. The level of interest in the product after seeing advertising content solely by a human expert is 4.70 vs 4.85 after seeing content generated solely by AI (two-sample t-test,  $p = 0.15$ ). The level of interest in the product after seeing advertising content by "augmented human" is 4.91 vs 5.02 after seeing content generated by "augmented AI" (two-sample t-test,  $p = 0.22$ ). However, the degree of persuasion after seeing persuasive content generated solely by AI for campaigns is still stronger than that by a human expert (5.07 vs 4.82, two-sample t-test,  $p = 0.008$ , cohen's  $d = 0.17$ ). The degree of persuasion

after seeing persuasive content generated by “augmented AI” for campaigns is still stronger than that by “augmented human” (4.91 vs 4.47, two-sample t-test,  $p = 0.000$ , cohen’s  $d = 0.28$ ).

We repeat the above analysis for the “partially informed” condition. As depicted by the “partially informed” condition in Figure 3, on average, advertising content generated solely by ChatGPT-4 resulted in higher satisfaction level than content generated solely by a human expert (4.93 vs 4.72, two-sample t-test,  $p = 0.03$ , cohen’s  $d = 0.13$ ). Content generated by “augmented AI” also outperformed content generated by “augmented human” (4.98 vs 4.56, two-sample t-test,  $p = 0.000$ , cohen’s  $d = 0.28$ ). Advertising content generated solely by ChatGPT-4 resulted in higher satisfaction level than content generated solely by a human expert (5.30 vs 4.87, two-sample t-test,  $p = 0.000$ , cohen’s  $d = 0.29$ ). Advertising content generated by “augmented AI” also outperformed content generated by “augmented human” (5.48 vs 5.4, two-sample t-test,  $p = 0.30$ ).

Next we examine participants’ willingness-to-pay for the content as a measure of content quality. As depicted by the baseline condition in Figure 4, on average, participants’ willingness-to-pay for campaign content was the same for content generated solely by AI and solely by a human expert, (4.51 vs 4.50, two-sample t-test,  $p = 0.98$ ). On the other hand, persuasive content generated by “augmented AI” achieved higher willingness-to-pay than content generated by “augmented human” (4.57 vs 4.27, two-sample t-test,  $p = 0.02$ , cohen’s  $d = 0.14$ ). On average, participants’ willingness-to-pay for advertising content was higher for content generated solely by AI than solely by a human expert, (5.00 vs 4.68, two-sample t-test,  $p = 0.007$ , cohen’s  $d = 0.17$ ). On the other hand, advertising content generated by “augmented AI”

had the same willingness-to-pay as content generated by “augmented human” (5.12 vs 5.04, two-sample t-test,  $p = 0.45$ ).

Last but not least, we examine the level of interest after seeing the advertising content and the degree of persuasion after seeing persuasive content as measures of content quality. As depicted by the baseline condition in Figure 5, for the advertising content, there was no difference between content generated solely by AI and humans. The level of interest in the product after seeing advertising content solely by a human expert is 4.88 vs 4.78 after seeing content generated solely by AI (two-sample t-test,  $p = 0.29$ ). The level of interest in the product after seeing advertising content by “augmented human” is 5.03 vs 4.96 after seeing content generated by “augmented AI” (two-sample t-test,  $p = 0.46$ ). Furthermore, the degree of persuasion after seeing persuasive content generated solely by AI for campaigns is also the same as content generated solely by a human expert (4.82 vs 4.75, two-sample t-test,  $p = 0.50$ ). However, the degree of persuasion after seeing persuasive content generated by “augmented AI” for campaigns is still stronger than that by “augmented human” (4.96 vs 4.50, two-sample t-test,  $p = 0.000$ , cohen’s  $d = 0.30$ ).

## **6. Additional Results 3: Examining Potential Bias for the Advertising Content and Persuasive Content Separately**

Within a content generation paradigm, we regress the DVs on the condition (1 = informed, 0 = baseline) with task fixed effects. A positive (negative) coefficient suggests people perceive the content generated under the paradigm as higher (lower) quality after knowing the identity of the

content creator. Overall, we observe human favoritism, especially in the content generated for products.

We first report the coefficient for content generated for the **campaigns**.

Paradigm	DV	Coefficient	Cluster-Robust Standard Error	P-value
Human	Satisfaction	0.08	0.04	0.07
Human	WTP	0.20	0.08	0.01
AI	Satisfaction	-0.10	0.08	0.29
AI	WTP	-0.10	0.08	0.20
Augmented Human	Satisfaction	0.04	0.04	0.34
Augmented Human	WTP	0.20	0.12	0.09
Augmented AI	Satisfaction	0.15	0.08	0.07
Augmented AI	WTP	0.22	0.12	0.07

*Table 1* The coefficient is the coefficient of the interaction term in the regression. Cluster-robust standard errors and the p-values are also reported.

We first report the coefficient for content generated for the **products**.

Paradigm	DV	Coefficient	Cluster-Robust Standard Error	P-value
Human	Satisfaction	0.10	0.04	0.02
Human	WTP	0.16	0.04	0.000
AI	Satisfaction	0.003	0.03	0.91
AI	WTP	0.09	0.07	0.23
Augmented Human	Satisfaction	-0.05	0.08	0.57
Augmented Human	WTP	-0.01	0.08	0.86
Augmented AI	Satisfaction	0.01	0.04	0.82
Augmented AI	WTP	0.02	0.06	0.73

**Table 1** The coefficient is the coefficient of the interaction term in the regression. Cluster-robust standard errors and the p-values are also reported.