# 6 Appendix

## 6.2 Z-test for EAclr3 models

| Timeline | Response | Distribution | Covariate       | Estimate | Std. Error | z value | $\Pr(> z )$ |
|----------|----------|--------------|-----------------|----------|------------|---------|-------------|
|          |          |              | $\nu$ intercept | -2.511   | 0.265      | -9.477  | < 0.01      |
|          |          | ND           | EngineCapacity  | -0.353   | 0.15       | -2.36   | 0.018       |
|          |          | ND           | BMS             | 0.47     | 0.014      | 33.78   | < 0.01      |
|          | EAclr3   |              | $\sigma$        | 0.384    |            |         |             |
|          |          |              | $\nu$ intercept | -2.82    | 0.148      | -19.08  | < 0.01      |
|          |          | PO           | EngineCapacity  | -0.109   | 0.073      | -1.51   | 0.132       |
| Start of |          |              | BMS             | 0.436    | 0.008      | 50.48   | < 0.01      |
| the week |          |              | $\mu$ intercept | -7.831   | 0.148      | -53.014 | < 0.01      |
|          |          | FONB         | EngineCapacity  | 0.122    | 0.069      | 1.773   | 0.038       |
|          |          | EGIND        | u               | 0.233    | 0.058      | 3.987   | < 0.01      |
|          | NumH     |              | $\kappa$        | 1.508    |            |         |             |
|          |          |              | $\mu$ intercept | -7.793   | 0.102      | -76.574 | < 0.01      |
|          |          | QP           | EngineCapacity  | 0.152    | 0.048      | 3.179   | < 0.01      |
|          |          |              | u               | 0.242    | 0.036      | 6.779   | < 0.01      |
|          |          |              | $\mu$ intercept | -7.723   | 0.143      | -54.010 | < 0.01      |
|          |          | EQNB         | EngineCapacity  | 0.090    | 0.069      | 1.314   | 0.094       |
|          |          |              | EAclr3          | 0.036    | 0.033      | 1.088   | 0.138       |
|          | NumH     |              | $\kappa$        | 1.547    |            |         |             |
|          |          |              | $\mu$ intercept | -7.678   | 0.100      | -76.690 | < 0.01      |
|          |          | QP           | EngineCapacity  | 0.120    | 0.048      | 2.496   | 0.013       |
|          |          |              | EAclr3          | 0.034    | 0.024      | 1.399   | 0.162       |

Table 9: Z-tests for EAclr3 count models and claim count models using EAclr3 predictions and observations as covariates

# 6.3 Cross-validation for EAclr3 models

| Timolino  | Demonso                      | D:24                    | Fold 1                | Fold 2                  | Fold 3          | Fold 4          | Fold 5          |
|-----------|------------------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------|-------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|
| т штеппе  | response                     | UISU.                   | BMS Bench.            | BMS Bench.              | BMS Bench.      | BMS Bench.      | BMS Bench.      |
|           |                              | NB                      | 2.8609 < 4.1925       | 0.9839 < 1.2060         | 0.3999 < 0.7137 | 0.1835 < 0.1974 | 0.1314 > 0.1095 |
|           |                              | $NB^{\dagger}$          | 2.9260 < 4.2204       | 0.9765 < 1.1803         | 0.4060 < 0.6890 | 0.2015 > 0.1955 | 0.1529 > 0.1032 |
|           | $\mathrm{ER}_{\mathrm{rel}}$ | PO                      | 2.9076 < 4.2021       | 0.9808 < 1.1851         | 0.3998 < 0.6953 | 0.1991 > 0.1879 | 0.1458 > 0.0999 |
|           |                              | $PO^{\dagger}$          | 2.9446 < 4.2204       | 1.0107 < 1.1803         | 0.4081 < 0.6890 | 0.2137 > 0.1955 | 0.1645 > 0.1032 |
| Start of  |                              | MVNB                    | 4.0402                | 1.1396                  | 1.1706          | 8.2612          | 11.1971         |
| the week  |                              | $MVNB^{\dagger}$        | 4.0401                | 1.1435                  | 0.8644          | 10.1639         | 10.2338         |
|           |                              | EQNB                    | 0.4460 < 0.4536       | 0.1115 < 0.1116         | 0.4963 < 0.5016 | 0.5034 < 0.5076 | 0.4700 < 0.4737 |
|           | NiimH                        | EQNB <sup>†</sup>       | 0.4550 < 0.4592       | 0.1119 < 0.1119         | 0.4991 < 0.5023 | 0.5075 < 0.5101 | 0.4724 < 0.4755 |
|           |                              | QP                      | 0.4393 < 0.4467       | 0.1115 < 0.1116         | 0.4897 < 0.4951 | 0.4945 < 0.4995 | 0.4632 < 0.4674 |
|           |                              | $\mathrm{QP}^{\dagger}$ | 0.4498 < 0.4551       | 0.1118 < 0.1118         | 0.4923 < 0.4963 | 0.5001 < 0.5038 | 0.4669 < 0.4711 |
|           |                              | EQNB                    | 0.4476 < 0.4536       | 0.1116 < 0.1116         | 0.5009 < 0.5016 | 0.5071 < 0.5076 | 0.4733 < 0.4737 |
| End of    | NiimH                        | EQNB <sup>†</sup>       | 0.4538 < 0.4592       | 0.1118 < 0.1119         | 0.5018 < 0.5023 | 0.5097 < 0.5101 | 0.4749 < 0.4755 |
| the week  |                              | QP                      | 0.4408 < 0.4467       | 0.1115 < 0.1116         | 0.4945 < 0.4951 | 0.4989 < 0.4995 | 0.4670 < 0.4674 |
|           |                              | ${ m QP^{\dagger}}$     | 0.4495 < 0.4551       | 0.1117 < 0.1118         | 0.4957 < 0.4963 | 0.5033 < 0.5038 | 0.4706 < 0.4711 |
| † denotes | distribution                 | s without t             | raditional rating fac | tors $(\mathbf{X}_i)$ . |                 |                 |                 |

Table 10: 5-fold mean squared error cross-validation for EBrak3 models

| Thim altin a | Demonstra                    | D:24                    | Fold 1                | Fold 2                  | Fold 3          | Fold 4          | Fold 5          |
|--------------|------------------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------|-------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|
| т шенне      | response                     | Usu.                    | BMS Bench.            | BMS Bench.              | BMS Bench.      | BMS Bench.      | BMS Bench.      |
|              |                              | NB                      | 3.9046 < 5.0578       | 0.8858 > 0.6088         | 0.5747 < 0.9311 | 0.2338 > 0.2101 | 0.0856 < 0.1141 |
|              |                              | $\mathrm{NB}^{\dagger}$ | 3.9848 < 5.0829       | 0.7765 > 0.5532         | 0.5504 < 0.9128 | 0.2500 > 0.2055 | 0.1066 > 0.1048 |
|              | $\mathrm{FR}_{\mathrm{rab}}$ | $\rm PO$                | 3.9395 < 5.0691       | 0.8207 > 0.5608         | 0.4910 < 0.9178 | 0.2165 > 0.1992 | 0.1242 > 0.1030 |
|              |                              | $PO^{\dagger}$          | 3.9021 < 5.0829       | 0.8393 > 0.5532         | 0.4995 < 0.9128 | 0.2196 > 0.2055 | 0.1388 > 0.1048 |
| Start of     |                              | MVNB                    | 4.9237                | 0.6527                  | 1.1922          | 4.6459          | 11.9269         |
| the week     |                              | $MVNB^{\dagger}$        | 4.9258                | 0.6447                  | 0.9806          | 5.5079          | 10.6218         |
|              |                              | EQNB                    | 0.4465 < 0.4536       | 0.1116 < 0.1116         | 0.4951 < 0.5016 | 0.5030 < 0.5076 | 0.4697 < 0.4737 |
|              | NumH                         | EQNB <sup>†</sup>       | 0.4418 < 0.4467       | 0.1115 < 0.1116         | 0.4867 < 0.4951 | 0.4935 < 0.4995 | 0.4619 < 0.4674 |
|              |                              | QP                      | 0.4418 < 0.4467       | 0.1115 < 0.1116         | 0.4867 < 0.4951 | 0.4935 < 0.4995 | 0.4619 < 0.4674 |
|              |                              | $\mathrm{QP}^{\dagger}$ | 0.4491 < 0.4551       | 0.1117 < 0.1118         | 0.4891 < 0.4963 | 0.4985 < 0.5038 | 0.4653 < 0.4711 |
|              |                              | EQNB                    | 0.4527 < 0.4536       | 0.1116 < 0.1116         | 0.5014 < 0.5016 | 0.5075 < 0.5076 | 0.4737 < 0.4737 |
| End of       | NumH                         | EQNB <sup>†</sup>       | 0.4577 < 0.4592       | 0.1118 < 0.1119         | 0.5022 < 0.5023 | 0.5101 < 0.5101 | 0.4753 < 0.4755 |
| the week     |                              | QP                      | 0.4534 < 0.4551       | 0.1117 < 0.1118         | 0.4961 < 0.4963 | 0.5037 < 0.5038 | 0.4710 < 0.4711 |
| † denotes    | distribution.                | s without t             | raditional rating fac | tors $(\mathbf{X}_i)$ . |                 | -               |                 |

Table 11: 5-fold mean squared error cross-validation for EAch3 models

#### 6.4 Total claim count simulation



Figure 9: Total claim counts distribution of the extended test dataset. EAclr3 Negative Binomial model with traditional factors (left) and without traditional factors (right)



Figure 10: Total claim counts distribution of the extended test dataset. EAclr3 Poisson model with traditional factors (left) and without traditional factors (right)

| Driver    | Week $(j)$ | EAclr3 | $\ell_{i,j-1}$ | $ u_{i,j}$ | $\overline{C} \cdot \mu_{i,j}^{(-)}$ | $\overline{C} \cdot \mu_{i,j}^{(+)}$ | $\overline{C} \cdot A_{i,j-1}$ | $P_{i,j}$ | $P_{i,j}^{(b)}$ |
|-----------|------------|--------|----------------|------------|--------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|--------------------------------|-----------|-----------------|
|           | 1          | 0      | 0              | 0.02       | 1.95                                 | 1.90                                 | 0                              | 1.95      | 1.90            |
|           | 2          | 1      | -1             | 0.01       | 1.95                                 | 1.97                                 | -0.05                          | 1.90      | 1.90            |
|           | 3          | 0      | 7.43           | 0.65       | 2.26                                 | 1.90                                 | 0.02                           | 2.29      | 1.90            |
| Profile 1 | 4          | 0      | 6.43           | 0.41       | 2.14                                 | 1.90                                 | -0.36                          | 1.78      | 1.90            |
|           | 5          | 2      | 5.43           | 0.25       | 2.06                                 | 2.05                                 | -0.23                          | 1.83      | 1.90            |
|           | 6          | 0      | 9              | 1.36       | 2.67                                 | 1.90                                 | -0.02                          | 2.65      | 1.90            |
|           | 7          | 1      | 8              | 0.85       | 2.37                                 | 1.97                                 | -0.76                          | 1.61      | 1.90            |
|           | 8          | 0      | 9              | 1.36       | 2.67                                 | 1.90                                 | -0.40                          | 2.27      | 1.90            |
|           | 1          | 0      | 0              | 0.02       | 1.95                                 | 1.90                                 | 0                              | 1.95      | 1.90            |
|           | 2          | 0      | -1             | 0.01       | 1.95                                 | 1.90                                 | -0.05                          | 1.90      | 1.90            |
|           | 3          | 0      | -2             | 0.01       | 1.95                                 | 1.90                                 | -0.04                          | 1.90      | 1.90            |
| Profile 2 | 4          | 0      | -3             | 0          | 1.95                                 | 1.90                                 | -0.04                          | 1.90      | 1.90            |
|           | 5          | 0      | -3             | 0          | 1.95                                 | 1.90                                 | -0.04                          | 1.90      | 1.90            |
|           | 6          | 0      | -3             | 0          | 1.95                                 | 1.90                                 | -0.04                          | 1.90      | 1.90            |
|           | 7          | 0      | -3             | 0          | 1.95                                 | 1.90                                 | -0.04                          | 1.90      | 1.90            |
|           | 8          | 0      | -3             | 0          | 1.95                                 | 1.90                                 | -0.04                          | 1.90      | 1.90            |

6.5 Detailed pricing scheme using EAclr3 models

Table 12: Pricing scheme with a EAclr3 bonus-malus model for profiles 1 and 2

## 6.6 Gini index

|            | Alternative             |       | EB             | rak3  |                         |       | Benc           | hmark |                         | Mar  |
|------------|-------------------------|-------|----------------|-------|-------------------------|-------|----------------|-------|-------------------------|------|
| Baseline   |                         | NB    | $NB^{\dagger}$ | PO    | $\mathrm{PO}^{\dagger}$ | NB3   | $NB^{\dagger}$ | PO    | $\mathrm{PO}^{\dagger}$ | Max  |
|            | NB                      |       | 0.12           | -0.11 | 0.11                    | 0.08  | 0.09           | -0.07 | 0.09                    | 0.12 |
| EBrak3     | $NB^{\dagger}$          | -0.09 |                | -0.08 | -0.03                   | -0.07 | 0.02           | -0.07 | -0.02                   | 0.02 |
|            | PO                      | 0.12  | 0.12           |       | 0.12                    | 0.09  | 0.10           | 0.09  | 0.11                    | 0.12 |
|            | $\mathrm{PO}^{\dagger}$ | -0.08 | 0.03           | -0.09 |                         | -0.07 | 0.03           | -0.07 | -0.00                   | 0.03 |
|            | NB                      | -0.05 | 0.12           | -0.05 | 0.12                    |       | 0.13           | -0.13 | 0.14                    | 0.14 |
| Bonchmark  | $NB^{\dagger}$          | -0.04 | 0.01           | -0.04 | 0.16                    | -0.11 |                | -0.11 | -0.08                   | 0.16 |
| Deneminark | PO                      | 0.11  | 0.12           | -0.05 | 0.13                    | 0.14  | 0.14           |       | 0.14                    | 0.14 |
|            | $\mathrm{PO}^{\dagger}$ | -0.04 | 0.05           | -0.04 | 0.10                    | -0.12 | 0.08           | -0.11 |                         | 0.10 |

† denotes distributions without traditional rating factors  $(\mathbf{X}_i)$ .

Table 13: Gini indices for EBrak3 bonus-malus models and benchmark models

|           | Alternative             |       | EA             | .clr3 |                         |       | Benc                    | hmark |                         | Mor  |
|-----------|-------------------------|-------|----------------|-------|-------------------------|-------|-------------------------|-------|-------------------------|------|
| Baseline  |                         | NB    | $NB^{\dagger}$ | PO    | $\mathrm{PO}^{\dagger}$ | NB3   | $\mathrm{NB}^{\dagger}$ | PO    | $\mathrm{PO}^{\dagger}$ | Max  |
|           | NB                      |       | 0.11           | -0.10 | 0.10                    | 0.06  | 0.08                    | -0.08 | 0.09                    | 0.11 |
| EAclr3    | $NB^{\dagger}$          | -0.09 |                | -0.08 | -0.11                   | -0.08 | 0.00                    | -0.08 | -0.03                   | 0.00 |
|           | PO                      | 0.12  | 0.12           |       | 0.13                    | 0.08  | 0.10                    | 0.06  | 0.10                    | 0.13 |
|           | $\mathrm{PO}^{\dagger}$ | -0.07 | 0.12           | -0.09 |                         | -0.09 | 0.07                    | -0.08 | 0.01                    | 0.12 |
|           | NB                      | -0.03 | 0.12           | -0.05 | 0.13                    |       | 0.13                    | -0.13 | 0.14                    | 0.14 |
| Benchmark | $NB^{\dagger}$          | -0.04 | 0.02           | -0.05 | -0.06                   | -0.11 |                         | -0.11 | -0.08                   | 0.02 |
|           | PO                      | 0.11  | 0.13           | -0.04 | 0.13                    | 0.14  | 0.14                    |       | 0.14                    | 0.14 |
|           | PO <sup>†</sup>         | -0.04 | 0.05           | -0.05 | -0.07                   | -0.12 | 0.08                    | -0.11 |                         | 0.08 |

 $\dagger$  denotes distributions without traditional rating factors  $(\mathbf{X}_i)$ .

Table 14: Gini indices for EAclr3 bonus-malus models and benchmark models

| Mour        | MBIM                    | 0.12  | 0.02                    | 0.13     | 0.06               | 0.11  | 0.12                   | 0.13  | 0.14           | 0.14  | 0.16           | 0.14         | 0.10           |                       |
|-------------|-------------------------|-------|-------------------------|----------|--------------------|-------|------------------------|-------|----------------|-------|----------------|--------------|----------------|-----------------------|
|             | $PO^{\dagger}$          | 0.09  | -0.02                   | 0.11     | -0.00              | 0.09  | -0.03                  | 0.10  | 0.01           | 0.14  | -0.08          | 0.14         |                |                       |
| ımark       | Ю                       | -0.07 | -0.07                   | 0.09     | -0.07              | -0.08 | -0.08                  | 0.06  | -0.08          | -0.13 | -0.11          |              | -0.11          |                       |
| Bench       | $NB^{\dagger}$          | 0.09  | 0.02                    | 0.10     | 0.03               | 0.08  | 0.00                   | 0.10  | 0.07           | 0.13  |                | 0.14         | 0.08           |                       |
|             | NB                      | 0.08  | -0.07                   | 0.09     | -0.07              | 0.06  | -0.08                  | 0.08  | -0.09          |       | -0.11          | 0.14         | -0.12          |                       |
|             | $PO^{\dagger}$          | 0.11  | -0.06                   | 0.12     | -0.12              | 0.10  | -0.11                  | 0.13  |                | 0.13  | -0.06          | 0.13         | -0.07          |                       |
| olr3        | Ю                       | -0.05 | -0.04                   | 0.12     | -0.04              | -0.10 | -0.08                  |       | -0.09          | -0.05 | -0.05          | -0.04        | -0.05          |                       |
| EAc         | NB†                     | 0.11  | 0.00                    | 0.12     | 0.06               | 0.11  |                        | 0.12  | 0.12           | 0.12  | 0.02           | 0.13         | 0.05           |                       |
|             | NB3                     | 0.10  | -0.05                   | 0.13     | -0.05              |       | -0.09                  | 0.12  | -0.07          | -0.03 | -0.04          | 0.11         | -0.04          | $(\mathbf{X}_i).$     |
|             | $\rm PO^{\dagger}$      | 0.11  | -0.03                   | 0.12     |                    | 0.10  | 0.12                   | 0.10  | 0.14           | 0.12  | 0.16           | 0.13         | 0.10           | factors               |
| ak3         | РО                      | -0.11 | -0.08                   |          | -0.09              | -0.09 | -0.06                  | -0.09 | -0.06          | -0.05 | -0.04          | -0.05        | -0.04          | l rating              |
| EBr         | $\mathrm{NB}^{\dagger}$ | 0.12  |                         | 0.12     | 0.03               | 0.09  | 0.02                   | 0.10  | 0.09           | 0.12  | 0.01           | 0.12         | 0.05           | ditiona               |
|             | NB                      |       | -0.09                   | 0.12     | -0.08              | -0.07 | -0.06                  | 0.08  | -0.06          | -0.05 | -0.04          | 0.11         | -0.04          | nout tra              |
| Alternative |                         | NB    | $\mathrm{NB}^{\dagger}$ | PO       | $\rm PO^{\dagger}$ | NB    | $NB^{\dagger}$         | PO    | $PO^{\dagger}$ | NB    | $NB^{\dagger}$ | PO           | $PO^{\dagger}$ | stributions with      |
| /           | Baseline                |       | $FB_{rol}^{2}$          | CAD LULL |                    |       | $F \Lambda \sigma r^2$ | CHOVE |                |       | Bonchmark      | Deficitition |                | $\dagger$ denotes dis |

Table 15: Gini indices for bonus-malus models (EBrak3 and EAclr3) and benchmark models