

International border restrictions during COVID-19 as global health security theater

Catherine Z. Worsnop, University of Maryland School of Public Policy

Supplementary Material

1. Table of the timing and type of border restrictions by state

State	Border restriction	Date of implementation
Afghanistan	Suspending or restricting international flights	1/26/20
Albania	Suspending or restricting international flights	3/9/20
Algeria	Suspending or restricting international flights	3/12/20
Andorra	Restricting visas	1/29/20
Angola	quarantine	2/6/20
Antigua and Barbuda	Restricting entry	1/31/20
Argentina	quarantine	3/12/20
Armenia	Closing international land borders	2/23/20
Australia	Restricting entry	2/1/20
Austria	Restricting visas	1/29/20
Azerbaijan	Closing international land borders	2/29/20
Bahamas	Restricting entry	1/30/20
Bahrain	Restricting exit	2/1/20
Bangladesh	Restricting visas	2/2/20
Barbados	quarantine	3/22/20
Belarus	quarantine	3/25/20
Belgium	Restricting visas	1/29/20
Belize	Restricting entry	2/8/20
Benin	quarantine	3/10/20
Bhutan	Restricting visas	3/6/20
Bolivia	Restricting entry	3/14/20
Bosnia and Herzegovina	Restricting entry	3/10/20
Botswana	Restricting entry	3/16/20

Brazil	quarantine	3/13/20
Brunei Darussalam	Restricting entry	1/30/20
Bulgaria	Restricting entry	3/13/20
Burkina Faso	Suspending or restricting international flights	3/20/20
Burundi	quarantine	3/5/20
Cabo Verde	Restricting entry	2/27/20
Cambodia	Suspending or restricting international ferries or ships	3/13/20
Cameroon	quarantine	3/18/20
Canada	quarantine	2/3/20
Central African Republic	Restricting exit	3/13/20
Chad	quarantine	3/7/20
Chile	quarantine	3/10/20
China	Restricting exit	1/23/20
Colombia	quarantine	3/11/20
Comoros	Restricting entry	2/7/20
Congo	quarantine	3/3/20
Cook Islands	Restricting entry	1/31/20
Costa Rica	Restricting entry	3/16/20
Cote D'Ivoire	quarantine	3/12/20
Croatia	quarantine	3/13/20
Cuba	quarantine	2/21/20
Cyprus	Restricting entry	3/13/20
Czech Republic	Restricting visas	1/29/20
Democratic People's Republic Of Korea	Suspending or restricting international flights	1/20/20
Democratic Republic Of The Congo	quarantine	3/7/20
Denmark	Restricting visas	1/29/20
Djibouti	Closing international land borders	3/18/20
Dominica	quarantine	3/5/20
Dominican Republic	Suspending or restricting international flights	2/28/20

Ecuador	quarantine	3/12/20
Egypt	Suspending or restricting international flights	1/27/20
El Salvador	Restricting entry	1/31/20
Equatorial Guinea	quarantine	3/9/20
Eritrea	quarantine	3/3/20
Estonia	Restricting visas	1/29/20
Eswatini	Restricting entry	3/17/20
Ethiopia	quarantine	3/20/20
Fiji	Restricting entry	2/3/20
Finland	Restricting visas	1/29/20
France	Restricting visas	1/29/20
Gabon	Restricting entry	2/7/20
Gambia	Restricting exit	3/13/20
Georgia	Suspending or restricting international flights	1/28/20
Germany	Restricting visas	1/29/20
Ghana	Restricting exit	3/10/20
Greece	Restricting visas	1/29/20
Grenada	Restricting entry	2/1/20
Guatemala	Restricting entry	1/31/20
Guinea	Suspending or restricting international flights	3/21/20
Guinea-Bissau	Suspending or restricting international flights	3/18/20
Guyana	Restricting entry	1/31/20
Haiti	Suspending or restricting international flights	3/9/20
Honduras	Restricting entry	3/12/20
Hungary	Restricting visas	1/29/20
Iceland	Restricting visas	1/29/20
India	Restricting visas	2/2/20
Indonesia	Restricting visas	2/2/20
Iran	Suspending or restricting international flights	1/31/20

Iraq	Restricting entry	2/2/20
Ireland	Suspending or restricting international ferries or ships	3/24/20
Israel	Restricting entry	2/2/20
Italy	Restricting visas	1/29/20
Jamaica	Restricting entry	1/31/20
Japan	Restricting entry	2/1/20
Jordan	Restricting entry	2/2/20
Kazakhstan	Restricting visas	1/28/20
Kenya	Suspending or restricting international flights	2/28/20
Kiribati	Restricting entry	2/1/20
Kuwait	Restricting entry	1/30/20
Kyrgyzstan	Closing international land borders	2/1/20
Lao People's Democratic Republic	Restricting visas	2/2/20
Latvia	Restricting visas	1/29/20
Lebanon	Suspending or restricting international flights	2/25/20
Lesotho	quarantine	3/18/20
Liberia	Restricting entry	3/16/20
Libya	Closing international land borders	3/4/20
Liechtenstein	Restricting visas	1/29/20
Lithuania	Restricting visas	1/29/20
Luxembourg	Restricting visas	1/29/20
Madagascar	Restricting entry	2/11/20
Malawi	quarantine	3/2/20
Malaysia	Restricting visas	1/27/20
Maldives	Restricting entry	2/3/20
Mali	quarantine	3/11/20
Malta	Restricting visas	1/29/20
Marshall Islands	Restricting entry	1/24/20
Mauritania	quarantine	2/5/20

Mauritius	Suspending or restricting international ferries or ships	2/2/20
Mexico	Closing international land borders	3/21/20
Micronesia	Restricting exit	1/31/20
Monaco	Restricting visas	1/29/20
Mongolia	Closing international land borders	1/27/20
Montenegro	Suspending or restricting international flights	2/28/20
Morocco	Suspending or restricting international flights	1/30/20
Mozambique	Restricting visas	1/28/20
Myanmar	Restricting entry	2/1/20
Namibia	Restricting entry	3/14/20
Nauru	Restricting entry	2/4/20
Nepal	Restricting visas	3/1/20
Netherlands	Restricting visas	1/29/20
New Zealand	Restricting entry	2/2/20
Niger	quarantine	3/13/20
Nigeria	Restricting entry	3/18/20
Niue	Restricting entry	2/3/20
North Macedonia	Restricting entry	3/13/20
Norway	Restricting visas	1/29/20
Oman	Suspending or restricting international flights	2/2/20
Pakistan	Suspending or restricting international flights	1/31/20
Palau	Suspending or restricting international flights	1/30/20
Panama	Suspending or restricting international flights	3/19/20
Papua New Guinea	Restricting entry	1/29/20
Paraguay	Restricting visas	1/31/20
Peru	quarantine	3/12/20
Philippines	Suspending or restricting international flights	1/23/20
Poland	Restricting visas	1/29/20
Portugal	Restricting visas	1/29/20

Qatar	quarantine	2/23/20
Republic Of Korea	Restricting entry	2/2/20
Republic Of Moldova	Restricting entry	3/10/20
Romania	quarantine	2/7/20
Russian Federation	Closing international land borders	1/31/20
Rwanda	Closing international land borders	3/18/20
Saint Kitts And Nevis	Restricting entry	2/1/20
Saint Lucia	Restricting entry	2/4/20
Saint Vincent And The Grenadines	quarantine	2/7/20
Samoa	Restricting entry	1/27/20
San Marino	quarantine	2/23/20
Sao Tome And Principe	Restricting entry	3/11/20
Saudi Arabia	Suspending or restricting international flights	2/2/20
Senegal	Suspending or restricting international ferries or ships	3/14/20
Serbia	Restricting entry	3/10/20
Seychelles	Restricting exit	1/29/20
Sierra Leone	quarantine	2/6/20
Singapore	Restricting entry	1/28/20
Slovakia	Restricting visas	1/29/20
Slovenia	Restricting visas	1/29/20
Solomon Islands	Restricting entry	2/1/20
Somalia	Restricting entry	3/15/20
South Africa	Restricting entry	3/15/20
South Sudan	Suspending or restricting international flights	3/13/20
Spain	Restricting visas	1/29/20
Sri Lanka	Restricting visas	1/28/20
Sudan	Suspending or restricting international flights	3/13/20
Suriname	quarantine	2/6/20
Sweden	Restricting visas	1/29/20

Switzerland	Restricting visas	1/29/20
Syrian Arab Republic	Closing international land borders	2/28/20
Tajikistan	quarantine	1/29/20
Thailand	Suspending or restricting international flights	1/24/20
Timor-Leste	Restricting entry	1/29/20
Togo	Suspending or restricting international flights	3/16/20
Tonga	Restricting entry	2/5/20
Trinidad and Tobago	Restricting entry	1/30/20
Tunisia	Suspending or restricting international ferries or ships	3/4/20
Turkey	Suspending or restricting international flights	1/23/20
Turkmenistan	Closing international land borders	1/31/20
Tuvalu	Restricting entry	2/3/20
Uganda	quarantine	2/6/20
Ukraine	Restricting visas	3/14/20
United Arab Emirates	Suspending or restricting international flights	2/3/20
United Kingdom Of Great Britain And Northern Ireland	quarantine	2/25/20
United Republic Of Tanzania	Suspending or restricting international flights	3/15/20
United States Of America	Restricting entry	1/31/20
Uruguay	quarantine	3/13/20
Uzbekistan	Suspending or restricting international flights	2/1/20
Vanuatu	Restricting entry	1/31/20
Venezuela	Suspending or restricting international flights	3/12/20
Viet Nam	Restricting visas	1/30/20
Yemen	Restricting visas	2/29/20
Zambia	quarantine	2/21/20
Zimbabwe	Restricting entry	3/4/20

2. Summary table of control variables included in the primary analysis and robustness checks

Variable	Source	Definition	Primary analysis or robustness check
Air Travel	Bosancianu et al. 2020 (World Bank Indicators)	Air passengers carried include both domestic and international aircraft passengers of air carriers registered in the country. (IS.AIR.PSGR) (logged)	Robustness check
GDP per capita	World Bank Indicators	GDP per capita (current US\$). GDP per capita is gross domestic product divided by midyear population. GDP is the sum of gross value added by all resident producers in the economy plus any product taxes and minus any subsidies not included in the value of the products. It is calculated without making deductions for depreciation of fabricated assets or for depletion and degradation of natural resources. Data are in current U.S. dollars.	Primary Analysis
Human Development Index	United Nations Development Program	The Human Development Index (HDI) is a summary measure of average achievement in key dimensions of human development: a long and healthy life, being knowledgeable and having a decent standard of living. The HDI is the geometric mean of normalized indices for each of the three dimensions.	Robustness check
Democracy	Center for Systemic Peace, PolityProject	The competitiveness and regulation of political participation, the openness and competitiveness of executive recruitment, and constraints on the chief executive. Ranges from -10 (strongly autocratic) to 10 (strongly democratic)	Primary Analysis
Domestic rule of law	Worldwide Governance Indicators	Rule of law captures perceptions of the extent to which agents have confidence in and abide by the rules of society, and in particular the quality of contract enforcement, property rights, the police, and the courts, as well as the likelihood of crime and violence. Ranges from -2.5 to 2.5.	Primary Analysis
Globalization	KOF Globalisation Index	The KOF Globalization Index measures the economic, social and political dimensions of globalisation	Robustness check
Government effectiveness	Worldwide Governance Indicators	Government effectiveness captures perceptions of the quality of public services, the quality of the civil service and the degree of its independence from political pressures, the quality of policy formulation and implementation, and the credibility of the government's commitment to such policies. Ranges from -2.5-2.5.	Robustness check
Trade exposure	World Bank Indicators	Trade is the sum of exports and imports of goods and services measured as a share of gross domestic product, logged.	Primary Analysis
Share trade with China	World Integrated Trade Solution (WITS)	Sum of exports and imports of goods and services with China divided by total exports and imports of goods and services, logged.	Primary Analysis
Belt and Road Initiative	Hillman and Sacks 2021	States with projects funded by BRI	Robustness check
Other countries in the region imposing border restrictions	Authors' calculation	For state A, the proportion of other states in state A's WHO region that have imposed border restrictions each day of the observation period (lagged by one day)	Primary Analysis
Pandemic preparedness	GHSI Index score	A comprehensive assessment of states' ability to prevent infectious disease outbreaks and to detect and report, and rapidly respond to mitigate the spread.	Primary Analysis
Capacity at points of entry (POE)	World Health Organization	Self-assessed score for capacity at points of entry. Measures capacity for routine surveillance and response, plus capacities to respond to public health emergencies. Ranges from 0-100.	Robustness check
Geographic distance from Wuhan, China	world.cities data in R	The distance between the capital city of each state and Wuhan, China where the outbreak began. Measured as haversine distance in hundreds of kilometers.	Primary Analysis
Number of cases in each state	<u>Dong, Du, and Gardner 2020</u> (Johns Hopkins COVID-19 Data Tracker)	The total number of reported COVID-19 cases in each state per day of the observation period (lagged by one day)	Primary Analysis
Past border restrictions	Worsnop 2017a,b	Whether each state imposed border restrictions during H1N1 (2009) or Ebola (2014).	Robustness check
Region	World Health Organization	Categorical variable coding which WHO region each state belongs to.	Primary Analysis

Populism	Bosancianu et al. 2020 (Populism in Power)	From Kyle and Meyer (2020) and focuses specifically on electoral populism and classifies 17 states currently as having governments led by electoral populist parties	Robustness check
Size of Travel and Tourism industry	World Travel and Tourism Council	Travel And Tourism Total Contribution To GDP, US\$ (Billions), logged	Robustness check
Health expenditures	World Bank Indicators	Current health expenditures (public + private) as share of GDP, logged.	Robustness check
Nationalist government	Varieties of Democracy Project (V-Dem)	The extent to which the government promotes a nationalist ideology. Proportion of survey respondents that answered nationalist to the question "How would you characterize the ideology/ideologies identified in the previous question?" Ranges from 0-1. Values are from December, 2019. Following the V-Dem codebook, country values are excluded that had three or fewer coders (Coppedge et al. 2019, 25).	Robustness check
Border orientation	The average border orientation score for each country, meant to capture "the extent to which the state is committed to the spatial display of capacities to control the terms of penetration of its national borders." From 2018, the most recent year available.	Simmons, Beth A., and Michael R. Kenwick. "Border Orientation in a Globalizing World." <i>American Journal of Political Science</i> 66, no. 4 (2022): 853–70.	Robustness check
Time between international border restrictions and domestic stay at home recommendations	Coded as the number of days between a state's imposition of international border restriction and recommending or requiring staying at home for most people.	Oxford COVID-19 Government Response Tracker	Robustness check

3. Summary statistics of variables used in primary analysis

Border restrictions	Days since outbreak start	Nationalist government	Democracy	Domestic rule of law	GHSI score	ln(GDP per capita)
Min. :0.0000	Min. :20.00	Min. :0.0000	Min. :>10.000	Min. :>2.35095	Min. :16.20	Min. : 5.430
1st Qu.:0.0000	1st Qu.:30.00	1st Qu.:0.4000	1st Qu.: -1.250	1st Qu.:>0.76507	1st Qu.:29.07	1st Qu.: 7.695
Median :1.0000	Median :34.50	Median :0.6000	Median : 7.000	Median :>0.23345	Median :37.50	Median : 8.732
Mean :0.634	Mean :47.58	Mean :0.5789	Mean : 4.043	Mean :>0.08625	Mean :40.24	Mean : 8.745
3rd Qu.:1.0000	3rd Qu.:70.00	3rd Qu.:0.7710	3rd Qu.: 9.000	3rd Qu.: 0.52755	3rd Qu.:49.17	3rd Qu.: 9.785
Max. :1.0000	Max. :85.00	Max. :1.0000	Max. : 10.000	Max. : 2.05802	Max. :83.50	Max. :12.152
NA's :1	NA's :1	NA's :29	NA's :31	NA's :4	NA's :1	NA's :7

Geo. distance from Wuhan	WHO region	Gov. effectiveness	ln(population)	ln(Air passenger volume)	ln(Travel/tourism % GDP)	Belt & Road	Globalization
Min. : 10.57	Africa :47	Min. :>2.44941	Min. : 9.363	Min. : 5.759	Min. :0.623	Min. :0.0000	Min. :30.00
1st Qu.: 70.50	Americas :35	1st Qu.:>0.67503	1st Qu.:14.529	1st Qu.:13.142	1st Qu.:1.879	1st Qu.:0.0000	1st Qu.:51.00
Median : 86.78	Eastern Mediterranean:21	Median :>0.15339	Median :16.009	Median :14.691	Median :2.243	Median :1.0000	Median :62.00
Mean : 92.02	Europe :53	Mean :>0.06195	Mean :15.624	Mean :14.742	Mean :2.332	Mean :0.6667	Mean :62.26
3rd Qu.:116.77	South-East Asia :11	3rd Qu.: 0.49950	3rd Qu.:17.174	3rd Qu.:16.565	3rd Qu.:2.714	3rd Qu.:1.0000	3rd Qu.:72.00
Max. :194.72	Western Pacific :27	Max. : 2.23147	Max. :21.058	Max. :20.606	Max. :4.312	Max. :1.0000	Max. :91.00
	NA's : 1	NA's :8	NA's :3	NA's :47	NA's :25	NA's :3	NA's :10

4. Robustness checks¹

4.1 Including additional controls and alternative measures of capacity and economic factors (logit models, DV: whether each state imposed its first border restriction in the early phase, before February 29, 2020).

For the model using alternative measures of capacity and economic factors I use total health expenditures as percent GDP and the Human Development Index health as measures of state capacity (vulnerability to COVID-19) in place of GDP per capita, GHSI, and government effectiveness. I use share of trade with China and trade exposure as measures of economic factors instead of the size of the travel and tourism industry and globalization.

¹ Note that for all survival models, coefficients are presented as hazard rates (exponentiated coefficients), but standard errors are of coefficient values, not of the hazard rates. And, for all time-series survival models, standard errors are clustered by state.

	Border orientation	Past barriers	Welcoming score	Nationalist government x democracy	GHSI x democracy	Alt. measures of capacity and economic factors
Nartionalist government	3.79* (1.71)	3.44** (1.27)	3.67** (1.32)	4.21* (1.69)	3.50** (1.28)	3.40* (1.41)
GHSI score	0.10 (0.06)	0.04 (0.05)	0.03 (0.05)	0.04 (0.05)	0.07 (0.06)	
<i>ln</i> (GDP per capita)	1.83* (0.90)	1.07 (0.61)	1.52* (0.66)	1.20* (0.61)	1.42* (0.66)	
Gov. effectiveness	2.72 (2.26)	2.49 (1.56)	2.18 (1.50)	1.98 (1.47)	2.08 (1.51)	
Geo. distance from Wuhan	-0.04 (0.03)	-0.02 (0.02)	-0.02 (0.02)	-0.03 (0.02)	-0.02 (0.02)	-0.01 (0.02)
<i>ln</i> (Population)	0.70 (0.56)	0.29 (0.36)	0.48 (0.35)	0.34 (0.36)	0.51 (0.36)	0.45 (0.33)
<i>ln</i> (Air passenger volume)	-0.73* (0.31)	-0.40 (0.23)	-0.46* (0.23)	-0.42 (0.23)	-0.50* (0.23)	-0.40 (0.23)
Democracy	-0.05 (0.09)	-0.01 (0.06)	0.00 (0.06)	0.09 (0.13)	0.22 (0.22)	0.00 (0.07)
Populist leader	-1.24 (1.34)	-0.92 (0.93)	-0.98 (0.94)	-0.56 (0.97)	-0.87 (0.92)	-0.28 (0.95)
Domestic rule of law	-1.25 (1.81)	-0.07 (1.23)	0.02 (1.18)	0.26 (1.17)	0.22 (1.18)	2.12** (0.73)
<i>ln</i> (Travel/tourism % GDP)	-1.51 (0.91)	-0.61 (0.62)	-0.67 (0.63)	-0.56 (0.60)	-0.53 (0.60)	
Belt & Road	-0.97 (1.01)	-0.39 (0.74)	-0.52 (0.76)	-0.33 (0.74)	-0.53 (0.75)	-0.73 (0.79)
Globalization	-0.05 (0.09)	-0.14* (0.07)	-0.15* (0.07)	-0.14 (0.07)	-0.16* (0.07)	
Americas	0.75 (1.93)	1.56 (1.39)	1.30 (1.38)	1.37 (1.38)	1.14 (1.40)	1.17 (1.54)
Eastern Mediterranean	3.07 (1.82)	2.96* (1.35)	3.74* (1.53)	2.74* (1.37)	3.18* (1.40)	4.81** (1.86)
Europe	0.58 (2.38)	1.29 (1.38)	2.10 (1.48)	0.98 (1.51)	1.80 (1.45)	2.12 (1.43)
South-East Asia	0.51 (3.10)	1.40 (2.07)	1.44 (2.02)	0.85 (2.05)	1.32 (2.05)	1.46 (2.04)
Western Pacific	0.55 (3.37)	1.81 (1.91)	2.61 (1.90)	1.88 (1.86)	2.28 (1.85)	1.04 (1.84)
Border orientation	-1.44 (0.88)					
H1N1/Ebola border restrictions		-0.71 (0.62)				
Welcoming score			0.01 (0.01)			
Nationalist gov. x Democ.				-0.18 (0.23)		
GHSI x Democ.					-0.01 (0.01)	
HDI						3.27 (4.76)
Health expenditures % GDP						-0.04 (0.17)
<i>ln</i> (Trade % GDP)						1.27* (0.59)
<i>ln</i> (Trade w China % total trade)						1.87** (0.60)
AIC	102.99	131.88	131.36	132.58	132.13	116.18
Num. obs.	101	122	121	122	122	115

*** $p < 0.001$; ** $p < 0.01$; * $p < 0.05$; $p < 0.1$

4.2 Extending the survival analysis through the end of March when all states had imposed their first border restriction (Cox proportional hazard models, DV: the number of days from outbreak start until each state imposed its first border restriction)

Extending observation period to end of March	cross-sectional	cross-sectional	TSCS	TSCS
Nationalist government	2.49* (0.38)	3.27** (0.46)	2.49* (0.43)	3.24** (0.38)
GHSI score	1.01 (0.01)	1.02 (0.02)	1.01 (0.01)	1.02 (0.02)
$\ln(\text{GDP per capita})$	1.11 (0.12)	1.04 (0.24)	1.11 (0.12)	0.94 (0.21)
Gov. effectiveness	1.03 (0.22)	2.87* (0.53)	1.03 (0.20)	2.88* (0.44)
Geo. distance from Wuhan	0.99*** (0.00)	0.99 (0.01)	0.99*** (0.00)	0.99 (0.01)
$\ln(\text{Population})$		0.96 (0.16)		0.92 (0.13)
$\ln(\text{Air passenger volume})$		0.88 (0.10)		0.88 (0.08)
Democracy		1.01 (0.02)		1.01 (0.02)
Populist leader		0.50 (0.43)		0.44 (0.56)
Domestic rule of law		0.63 (0.42)		0.67 (0.34)
$\ln(\text{Travel/tourism \% GDP})$		0.63* (0.23)		0.61* (0.20)
Belt & Road		0.89 (0.29)		0.90 (0.25)
Globalization		0.97 (0.03)		0.97 (0.03)
Americas		2.40 (0.52)		3.90* (0.54)
Eastern Mediterranean		5.18** (0.52)		13.66*** (0.70)
Europe		2.15 (0.58)		7.64* (0.81)
South-East Asia		4.84* (0.67)		16.34*** (0.83)
Western Pacific		4.99** (0.58)		19.31*** (0.79)
Reported cases by country				1.01*** (0.00)
% Region border restrictions				0.97 (0.02)
AIC	1040.76	745.04	1040.76	739.73
Num. events	136	104	136	104
Num. obs.	136	104	7174	5234

*** $p < 0.001$; ** $p < 0.01$; * $p < 0.05$; \cdot $p < 0.1$. Standard errors clustered by state in the TSCS models.

Note that standard errors are of coefficient values, not of the hazard rates (exponentiated coefficients)

4.3 Multiple imputation to account for missingness (logit models, DV: whether each state imposed its first border restriction in the early phase, before February 29, 2020).

Multiple imputation	Model 1	Model 2
Nationalist government	1.75*	1.89*
	(0.82)	(0.93)
GHSI score	-0.03	0.05
	(0.02)	(0.04)
$\ln(\text{GDP per capita})$	0.64**	0.95*
	(0.25)	(0.42)
Gov. effectiveness	0.57	0.53
	(0.43)	(0.86)
Geo. distance from Wuhan	-0.02***	-0.03*
	(0.00)	(0.02)
$\ln(\text{Population})$		0.24
		(0.25)
$\ln(\text{Air passenger volume})$		-0.35*
		(0.17)
Democracy		-0.05
		(0.05)
Populist leader		-0.38
		(0.76)
Domestic rule of law		0.45
		(0.72)
$\ln(\text{Travel/tourism \% GDP})$		0.04
		(0.40)
Belt & Road		0.01
		(0.49)
Globalization		-0.05
		(0.05)
Americas		1.83*
		(0.93)
Eastern Mediterranean		0.89
		(0.93)
Europe		-0.13
		(1.08)
South-East Asia		0.20
		(1.44)
Western Pacific		2.15
		(1.29)
Num. obs.	975	975
Num. imp.	5	5

*** $p < 0.001$; ** $p < 0.01$; * $p < 0.05$; $p < 0.1$

4.4 Alternative measure of domestic response. DV: the number of days between each state's first international border restriction and when they first recommended or required internal movement restrictions (Cox proportional hazard models).

Days between states' first international border restriction and first internal movement restriction	Model 1	Model 2
Nationalist government	0.48* (0.41)	0.36* (0.49)
GHSI score	1.01 (0.01)	1.02 (0.02)
$\ln(\text{GDP per capita})$	1.10 (0.13)	1.01 (0.25)
Gov. effectiveness	0.90 (0.23)	1.72 (0.65)
Geo. distance from Wuhan	1.01** (0.00)	1.01 (0.01)
$\ln(\text{Population})$		1.04 (0.14)
$\ln(\text{Air passenger volume})$		0.82* (0.10)
Democracy		1.02 (0.02)
Populist leader		2.69* (0.45)
Domestic rule of law		0.54 (0.57)
$\ln(\text{Travel/tourism \% GDP})$		0.86 (0.26)
Belt & Road		0.91 (0.32)
Globalization		1.01 (0.03)
Americas		0.51 (0.61)
Eastern Mediterranean		1.62 (0.53)
Europe		0.69 (0.55)
South-East Asia		0.82 (0.66)
Western Pacific		0.63 (0.57)
AIC	910.69	698.43
Num. events	120	96
Num. obs.	120	96

*** $p < 0.001$; ** $p < 0.01$; * $p < 0.05$; · $p < 0.1$

4.5 Variance inflation factor tests

Variance inflation factors for several predictors in the full regression models suggest that multicollinearity could influence the results (for example, the regional dummies are correlated with distance from Wuhan and government effectiveness is correlated with GHSI score and GDP per capita). After removing some of these predictors from the model, the VIF for all predictors falls below 4 and the findings remain consistent.

For Table 1 Model 2

	VIF
Nationalist government	1.50
GHSI score	3.70
$\ln(\text{GDP per capita})$	6.72
Gov. effectiveness	14.50
Geo. distance from Wuhan	8.72
$\ln(\text{population})$	3.92
$\ln(\text{Air passenger volume})$	3.75
Democracy	1.95
Populist leader	1.61
Domestic rule of law	9.19
$\ln(\text{Travel and tourism \% GDP})$	1.89
Belt and road	1.25
Globalization	9.76
WHO region	71.84

Removing WHO region, gov. effectiveness, and globalization from the model results in more acceptable VIFs, again for Table 1 Model 2.

	VIF
Nationalist government	1.23
GHSI score	2.84
$\ln(\text{GDP per capita})$	3.83
Geo. distance from Wuhan	1.46

<i>ln</i> (population)	3.22
<i>ln</i> (Air passenger volume)	3.43
Democracy	1.43
Populist leader	1.44
Domestic rule of law	2.51
<i>ln</i> (Travel and tourism \% GDP)	1.23
Belt and road	1.12

And, the substantive results remain even after removing those variables from the full models (Table 1 Model 2, Table 2 Models 4 and 6, Table 3 Model 8)

Table 1 Model 2	
Nationalist government	3.05** (1.05)
GHSI score	-0.00 (0.04)
<i>ln</i> (GDP per capita)	1.06* (0.42)
Geo. distance from Wuhan	-0.03*** (0.01)
<i>ln</i> (Population)	0.27 (0.27)
<i>ln</i> (Air passenger volume)	-0.27 (0.20)
Democracy	-0.03 (0.05)
Populist leader	-1.14 (0.82)
Rule of law	0.76 (0.53)
<i>ln</i> (Travel/tourism \% GDP)	-0.19 (0.42)
Belt & Road	-0.24 (0.65)
AIC	130.14
Num. obs.	123

*** $p < 0.001$; ** $p < 0.01$; * $p < 0.05$; $p < 0.1$

	Table 2 Model 4	Table 2 Model 6
Nationalist government	6.76** (0.60)	7.49*** (0.53)
GHSI score	1.00 (0.02)	1.01 (0.02)
$\ln(\text{GDP per capita})$	1.07 (0.24)	1.07 (0.25)
Geo. distance from Wuhan	0.98*** (0.00)	0.98*** (0.01)
$\ln(\text{Population})$	0.93 (0.18)	0.85 (0.16)
$\ln(\text{Air passenger volume})$	1.05 (0.13)	1.04 (0.12)
Democracy	0.98 (0.02)	0.98 (0.02)
Populist leader	0.94 (0.46)	1.18 (0.52)
Domestic rule of law	1.17 (0.30)	1.11 (0.26)
$\ln(\text{Travel/tourism \%GDP})$	0.99 (0.24)	0.95 (0.27)
Belt & Road	0.84 (0.38)	0.92 (0.32)
Reported cases by country		1.01*** (0.00)
% region border restrictions		0.99 (0.01)
AIC	498.94	496.19
Num. events	61	61
Num. obs.	105	4716

*** $p < 0.001$; ** $p < 0.01$; * $p < 0.05$; $p < 0.1$

Table 3 Model 8

Nationalist government	0.16*** (0.48)
GHSI score	1.04** (0.01)
$\ln(\text{GDP per capita})$	0.91 (0.18)
Geo. distance from Wuhan	1.01* (0.00)
$\ln(\text{Population})$	0.77* (0.12)
$\ln(\text{Air passenger volume})$	1.06 (0.10)
Democracy	1.01 (0.02)
Populist leader	1.37 (0.44)
Domestic rule of law	0.55** (0.23)
$\ln(\text{Travel/tourism \%GDP})$	1.10 (0.17)
Belt & Road	1.01 (0.29)
AIC	715.97
Num. events	100
Num. obs.	100

*** $p < 0.001$; ** $p < 0.01$; * $p < 0.05$; $p < 0.1$