**SUPPLEMENTARY MATERIAL**

**Support for deliberative mini-publics among the losers of representative democracy (Ref.:  Ms. No. BJPOLS-D-22-00649)**

Jean-Benoit PILET1\*, Camille BEDOCK2, David TALUKDER3 and Sacha RANGONI1

\* corresponding author

1 Université libre de Bruxelles (ULB), Belgium, 2 CNRS. Sciences Po Bordeaux, France, 3 University of Namur, Belgium

**Appendix 1. Descriptive statistics of the, dependent, independent and control variables**

**![Une image contenant blanc, texte, motif, reçu

Description générée automatiquement]()**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Variable | Mean | Standard deviation | Number of respondents |
| Satisfaction with democracy “On the whole, how satisfied are you with the way democracy works in [country], on a 0 to 10 scale?” | 5.3 | 2.7 | 14 847 |
| Incongruence with the government | 0.2 | 0.16 | 13 429 |
| Incongruence with the parliament | 0.2 | 0.17 | 13 429 |

Vote at the last election

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | % | Number of respondents |
| Voted for a government party | 24.9 | 3765 |
| Abstained | 19.9 | 3009 |
| Voted for a party currently in opposition | 20.7 | 3135 |
| Voted for a party permanently in opposition | 34.6 | 5233 |
| Total | 100 | 15142 |

Level of education

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | % | Number of respondents |
| Lower secondary or less | 29.2 | 4490 |
| Higher secondary | 32.5 | 4998 |
| Tertiary | 38.3 | 5899 |
| Total | 100 | 15387 |

Perception of current income

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | % | Number of respondents |
| Living comfortably | 20.9 | 3152 |
| Coping | 45.7 | 6891 |
| Difficult | 23.5 | 3545 |
| Very difficult | 9.8 | 1482 |
| Total | 100 | 15070 |

Internal political efficacy (‘Politics is too complicated for people like me’)

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | % | Number of respondents |
| Strongly disagree | 42.6 | 6146 |
| Somewhat disagree | 31.5 | 4547 |
| Somewhat agree | 19.4 | 2792 |
| Strongly agree | 6.5 | 935 |
| Total | 100 | 15070 |

**Appendix 2. Multinomial logit models with a trichotomized dependent variable (reference variable: opposed to DMPs replacing elected politicians)**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Ref : OPPOSED | Neutral | Favorable | Neutral | Favorable | Neutral | Favorable | Neutral | Favorable | Neutral | Favorable | Neutral | Favorable | Neutral | Favorable |
|  | Model 0 | Model 0 | Model 1 | Model 1 | Model 2 | Model 2 | Model 3 | Model 3 | Model 4 | Model 4 | Model 5 | Model 5 | Model 6 | Model 6 |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Vote (ref = voted for a government party) |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Abstained |  |  | **0.168\*\*** | 0.0358 |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.0682 | -0.0245 | 0.0498 | -0.0195 |
|  |  |  | (0.0647) | (0.0705) |  |  |  |  |  |  | (0.0699) | (0.0763) | (0.0701) | (0.0765) |
| Voted for a party permanently in opposition |  |  | **0.247\*\*\*** | **0.330\*\*\*** |  |  |  |  |  |  | **0.225\*\*\*** | **0.358\*\*\*** | **0.213\*\*\*** | **0.370\*\*\*** |
|  |  |  | (0.0574) | (0.0593) |  |  |  |  |  |  | (0.0604) | (0.0620) | (0.0604) | (0.0620) |
| Voted for a party currently in opposition |  |  | 0.111 | **0.193\*\*** |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.117 | **0.219\*\*\*** | 0.0902 | **0.241\*\*\*** |
|  |  |  | (0.0613) | (0.0636) |  |  |  |  |  |  | (0.0634) | (0.0655) | (0.0636) | (0.0658) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Ideological incongruence with government |  |  |  |  | **-0.738\*\*\*** | **1.015\*\*\*** |  |  |  |  | **-0.662\*\*\*** | **1.017\*\*\*** |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  | (0.144) | (0.144) |  |  |  |  | (0.146) | (0.147) |  |  |
| Ideological incongruence with Parliament |  |  |  |  |  |  | **-0.743\*\*\*** | **0.527\*\*\*** |  |  |  |  | **-0.685\*\*\*** | **0.555\*\*\*** |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  | (0.136) | (0.135) |  |  |  |  | (0.138) | (0.139) |
| *Education (ref. Tertiary)* |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1.Lower secondary or less |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | **0.275\*\*\*** | **0.274\*\*\*** | **0.311\*\*\*** | **0.314\*\*\*** | **0.308\*\*\*** | **0.318\*\*\*** |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | (0.0523) | (0.0545) | (0.0553) | (0.0577) | (0.0553) | (0.0576) |
| 2. Higher secondary |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | **0.143\*\*** | **0.154\*\*** | **0.179\*\*\*** | **0.145\*\*** | **0.180\*\*\*** | **0.149\*\*** |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | (0.0500) | (0.0523) | (0.0525) | (0.0549) | (0.0524) | (0.0549) |
| *Perception income (ref. living comfortably)* |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2.Coping |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | **0.291\*\*\*** | 0.0592 | **0.249\*\*\*** | 0.110 | **0.257\*\*\*** | 0.0930 |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | (0.0560) | (0.0564) | (0.0582) | (0.0588) | (0.0582) | (0.0587) |
| 3.Difficult |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | **0.387\*\*\*** | **0.212\*\*** | **0.340\*\*\*** | **0.263\*\*\*** | **0.355\*\*\*** | **0.242\*\*\*** |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | (0.0651) | (0.0659) | (0.0685) | (0.0697) | (0.0685) | (0.0695) |
| 4.Very difficult |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | **0.435\*\*\*** | **0.393\*\*\*** | **0.409\*\*\*** | **0.367\*\*\*** | **0.430\*\*\*** | **0.352\*\*\*** |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | (0.0882) | (0.0887) | (0.0936) | (0.0965) | (0.0937) | (0.0965) |
| Satisfaction with democracy | **-0.0853\*\*\*** | **-0.0879\*\*\*** | **-0.0740\*\*\*** | **-0.0745\*\*\*** | **-0.0836\*\*\*** | **-0.0767\*\*\*** | **-0.0839\*\*\*** | **-0.0760\*\*\*** | **-0.0721\*\*\*** | **-0.0762\*\*\*** | **-0.0615\*\*\*** | **-0.0513\*\*\*** | **-0.0618\*\*\*** | **-0.0507\*\*\*** |
|  | (0.00750) | (0.00862) | (0.00794) | (0.00902) | (0.00808) | (0.00909) | (0.00803) | (0.00914) | (0.00787) | (0.00890) | (0.00884) | (0.00975) | (0.00880) | (0.00978) |
| Politics is too complicated (ref strongly disagree) |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2. Somewhat disagree | **0.541\*\*\*** | **0.299\*\*\*** | **0.532\*\*\*** | **0.294\*\*\*** | **0.536\*\*\*** | **0.366\*\*\*** | **0.544\*\*\*** | **0.344\*\*\*** | **0.508\*\*\*** | **0.272\*\*\*** | **0.504\*\*\*** | **0.331\*\*\*** | **0.512\*\*\*** | **0.310\*\*\*** |
|  | (0.0479) | (0.0511) | (0.0481) | (0.0515) | (0.0500) | (0.0536) | (0.0498) | (0.0534) | (0.0485) | (0.0516) | (0.0507) | (0.0545) | (0.0506) | (0.0542) |
| 3.Somewhat agree | **0.752\*\*\*** | **0.743\*\*\*** | **0.743\*\*\*** | **0.756\*\*\*** | **0.765\*\*\*** | **0.831\*\*\*** | **0.775\*\*\*** | **0.809\*\*\*** | **0.707\*\*\*** | **0.698\*\*\*** | **0.721\*\*\*** | **0.802\*\*\*** | **0.729\*\*\*** | **0.782\*\*\*** |
|  | (0.0586) | (0.0607) | (0.0590) | (0.0611) | (0.0624) | (0.0647) | (0.0624) | (0.0645) | (0.0594) | (0.0617) | (0.0636) | (0.0660) | (0.0636) | (0.0658) |
| 4.Strongly agree | **0.579\*\*\*** | **1.224\*\*\*** | **0.600\*\*\*** | **1.273\*\*\*** | **0.562\*\*\*** | **1.353\*\*\*** | **0.573\*\*\*** | **1.362\*\*\*** | **0.559\*\*\*** | **1.200\*\*\*** | **0.552\*\*\*** | **1.359\*\*\*** | **0.562\*\*\*** | **1.365\*\*\*** |
|  | (0.105) | (0.0974) | (0.106) | (0.0982) | (0.118) | (0.104) | (0.118) | (0.105) | (0.107) | (0.0994) | (0.120) | (0.106) | (0.120) | (0.107) |
| Gender (Women =1) | -0.00403 | **-0.226\*\*\*** | -0.00700 | **-0.230\*\*\*** | -0.00903 | **-0.233\*\*\*** | -0.00663 | **-0.237\*\*\*** | -0.0249 | **-0.247\*\*\*** | -0.0285 | **-0.254\*\*\*** | -0.0268 | -0.257\*\*\* |
|  | (0.0416) | (0.0438) | (0.0419) | (0.0440) | (0.0436) | (0.0459) | (0.0436) | (0.0459) | (0.0422) | (0.0442) | (0.0443) | (0.0466) | (0.0443) | (0.0465) |
| Age | **-0.0125\*\*\*** | **-0.00808\*\*\*** | **-0.0120\*\*\*** | **-0.00843\*\*\*** | **-0.0134\*\*\*** | **-0.00941\*\*\*** | **-0.0135\*\*\*** | **-0.00934\*\*\*** | **-0.0134\*\*\*** | **-0.00873\*\*\*** | **-0.0143\*\*\*** | **-0.0109\*\*\*** | **-0.0145\*\*\*** | **-0.0108\*\*\*** |
|  | (0.00133) | (0.00138) | (0.00135) | (0.00141) | (0.00140) | (0.00145) | (0.00140) | (0.00145) | (0.00136) | (0.00140) | (0.00144) | (0.00150) | (0.00144) | (0.00150) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Constant | 0.528\*\*\* | 0.331\*\*\* | 0.297\*\* | 0.0953 | 0.698\*\*\* | 0.0478 | 0.714\*\*\* | 0.154 | 0.126 | 0.0796 | 0.124 | -0.460\*\*\* | 0.148 | -0.361\*\* |
|  | (0.0896) | (0.0928) | (0.105) | (0.110) | (0.0990) | (0.103) | (0.0994) | (0.103) | (0.103) | (0.106) | (0.126) | (0.131) | (0.126) | (0.131) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Observations | 13,413 | 13,413 | 13,299 | 13,299 | 12,257 | 12,257 | 12,257 | 12,257 | 13,238 | 13,238 | 12,045 | 12,045 | 12,045 | 12,045 |
| Robust standard errors in parentheses | |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| \*\*\* p<0.001, \*\* p<0.01, \* p<0.05 | |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

**Appendix 3. Descriptive statistics of the statistical relationship between satisfaction with democracy and our main independent variables**

**One-Way ANOVA comparing the mean satisfaction with democracy across vote at the last national election**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Vote at the last national election | Summary of SWD |  |
|  | Mean | Freq. |
|  |  |  |
| Abstained | 5,018 | 2791 |
| Voted for a party permanently in opposition | 4,498 | 5058 |
| Voted for a party currently in opposition | 5,469 | 3097 |
| voted for a government party | 6,655 | 3724 |
|  |  |  |
| Total | 5,349 | 14670 |
| p-value (Between-groups) | 0,000 |  |

**One-Way ANOVA comparing the mean satisfaction with democracy across gender**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Gender | Summary of SWD |  |
|  | Mean | Freq. |
|  |  |  |
| Male | 5,418 | 7265 |
| Female | 5,264 | 7566 |
|  |  |  |
| Total | 5,340 | 14831 |
| p-value (Between-groups) | 0,0005 |  |

**One-Way ANOVA comparing the mean satisfaction with democracy across level of formal education**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Level of formal education | Summary of SWD |  |
|  | Mean | Freq. |
|  |  |  |
| Lower secondary or less | 5,103 | 4258 |
| Higher secondary | 5,276 | 4805 |
| Tertiary | 5,569 | 5759 |
|  |  |  |
| Total | 5,340 | 14822 |
| p-value (Between-groups) | 0,000 |  |

**One-Way ANOVA comparing the mean satisfaction with democracy across perception of current income**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Perception of current income | Summary of SWD |  |
|  | Mean | Freq. |
|  |  |  |
| Living comfortably | 6,208 | 3093 |
| Coping | 5,542 | 6691 |
| Difficult | 4,776 | 3413 |
| Very difficult | 3,849 | 1403 |
|  |  |  |
| Total | 5,341 | 14600 |
| p-value (Between-groups) | 0,000 |  |

**Correlations between satisfaction with democracy and ideological congruence**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|  | Satisfaction with democracy |
|  |  |
| Ideological incongruence with Parliament | -0,0025 |
| *p-value* | *0,7773* |
| Ideological incongruence with government | 0,0084 |
| *p-value* | *0,3322* |

**Appendix 4 – Path analyses (Robustness check)**

**Model A (sets of regressions using SEM with Country clustered robust standard error)**

**Une image contenant diagramme

Description générée automatiquement**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  |  | Robust |  |  |  |  |
| Coef. | Coefficient | Std. Err. | z | P>z | [95% Conf. | Interval] |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Structural |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Support for Deliberation |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Age | 0,11551 | .0039022 | -2.96 | 0.003 | -.0192001 | -.0039037 |
| Satisfaction w. democracy | -0,1213272 | .0343138 | -3.54 | 0.000 | -.1885811 | -.0540734 |
| Politics is too complicated | 0,5440096 | .033395 | 16.29 | 0.000 | .4785566 | .6094625 |
| \_cons | 4,597475 | .2900632 | 15.85 | 0.000 | 4.028961 | 5.165988 |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| var(e.supportddgen2) | 8,888805 | .2001886 |  |  | 8.504977 | 9.289956 |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Fit statistic | Value | Description |
| Size of residuals |  |  |
| SRMR | 0 | Standardized root mean squared |
| CD | 0,043 | Coefficient of determination |

**Model B path analysis (direct and indirect effect with Country clustered robust standard error)**

**Une image contenant diagramme

Description générée automatiquement**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Direct effect** | | | | | | |
|  | Coef, | Robust standard error | z | P>z | [95% Conf, | Interval] |
| Structural |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| DV : Support for Deliberation | | | | | | |
| Satisfaction w. democracy | -0,085 | 0,034 | -2,470 | 0,014 | -0,152 | -0,017 |
| Age | -0,015 | 0,004 | -3,930 | 0,000 | -0,022 | -0,007 |
| Education | -0,199 | 0,069 | -2,890 | 0,004 | -0,334 | -0,064 |
| Perception of income | 0,178 | 0,042 | 4,240 | 0,000 | 0,096 | 0,261 |
| Gender | -0,253 | 0,082 | -3,090 | 0,002 | -0,414 | -0,092 |
| Politics is too complicated | 0,591 | 0,031 | 19,240 | 0,000 | 0,531 | 0,652 |
| Ideological Incongruence with government | 1,157 | 0,411 | 2,810 | 0,005 | 0,351 | 1,962 |
| Vote last election (0 :Abstention to 4: vote for a government party) | -0,073 | 0,037 | -2,000 | 0,045 | -0,145 | -0,002 |
|  | | | | | | |
| DV : Satisfaction w. democracy |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Education | 0,074 | 0,072 | 1,020 | 0,308 | -0,068 | 0,215 |
| Perception of income | -0,614 | 0,053 | -11,640 | 0,000 | -0,717 | -0,511 |
| Gender | 0,020 | 0,047 | 0,430 | 0,667 | -0,073 | 0,114 |
| Ideological Incongruence with government | -0,072 | 0,367 | -0,200 | 0,844 | -0,792 | 0,648 |
| Vote at last election | 0,543 | 0,101 | 5,370 | 0,000 | 0,345 | 0,741 |
| **Indirect effect** | | | | | | |
|  | Coef, | Robust Std, Err, | z | P>z | [95% Conf, | Interval] |
| Structural |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| DV : Support for Deliberation | | | | | | |
| Satisfaction w. democracy | 0,000 | (no path) |  |  |  |  |
| Age | 0,000 | (no path) |  |  |  |  |
| Education | -0,006 | 0,006 | -1,030 | 0,305 | -0,018 | 0,006 |
| **Perception of income** | **0,052** | **0,024** | **2,160** | **0,030** | **0,005** | **0,099** |
| Gender | -0,002 | 0,004 | -0,420 | 0,676 | -0,010 | 0,006 |
| Politics is too complicated | 0,000 | (no path) |  |  |  |  |
| Ideological Incongruence with government | 0,006 | 0,031 | 0,200 | 0,841 | -0,054 | 0,066 |
| **Vote at last election** | **-0,046** | **0,019** | **-2,390** | **0,017** | **-0,084** | **-0,008** |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Total effect** | | | | | | |
|  | Coef, | Robust Std, Err, | z | P>z | [95% Conf, | Interval] |
| Structural | | | | | | |
| Support for Deliberation | | | | | | |
| Satisfaction w. democracy | -0,085 | 0,034 | -2,470 | 0,014 | -0,152 | -0,017 |
| Age | -0,015 | 0,004 | -3,930 | 0,000 | -0,022 | -0,007 |
| Education | -0,205 | 0,071 | -2,870 | 0,004 | -0,345 | -0,065 |
| Perception of income | 0,230 | 0,056 | 4,150 | 0,000 | 0,122 | 0,339 |
| Gender | -0,255 | 0,085 | -3,000 | 0,003 | -0,422 | -0,089 |
| Politics is too complicated | 0,591 | 0,031 | 19,240 | 0,000 | 0,531 | 0,652 |
| Ideological Incongruence with government | 1,163 | 0,401 | 2,900 | 0,004 | 0,376 | 1,950 |
| Vote last election | -0,119 | 0,044 | -2,720 | 0,006 | -0,205 | -0,034 |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Satisfaction w. democracy |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Education | 0,074 | 0,072 | 1,020 | 0,308 | -0,068 | 0,215 |
| Perception of income | -0,614 | 0,053 | -11,640 | 0,000 | -0,717 | -0,511 |
| Gender | 0,020 | 0,047 | 0,430 | 0,667 | -0,073 | 0,114 |
| Ideological Incongruence with government | -0,072 | 0,367 | -0,200 | 0,844 | -0,792 | 0,648 |
| Vote last election | 0,543 | 0,101 | 5,370 | 0,000 | 0,345 | 0,741 |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Fit statistic | Value | Description |
| Size of residuals |  |  |
| SRMR | 0,01 | Standardized root mean squared |
| CD | 0,151 | Coefficient of determination |