**ANIMAL An International Journal of Animal Bioscience - Invited Review: Improving feed efficiency of beef cattle; current state of the art and future challenges**

Kenny DA, Fitzsimons C, Waters SM and McGee M

**Supplementary Table S1** Description of studies used for meta-analyses\* on the association between residual feed intake\*\* and feeding duration, change in back fat depth, final *longissimus* muscle area and carcass *longissimus* muscle area in growing beef cattle offered an energy dense diet

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Study |  |  | Study details | | | | Meta-analysis | | | |
|  | n | Animal type | Breed type1 | Start age2 | BW (kg)3 | Test duration (days) | Feeding duration (min/d) | ΔBF8 (mm/d) | LMA9 (cm2) | CLMA10 (cm2) |
| Basarab *et al.* (2003) | 148 | Steers | Beef | 235 | 291 | 112 | X | X |  | X |
| Nkrumah *et al.* (2004) | 150 | Steers | Beef, BxD | 248 | 325 | 70 |  | X |  | X |
| Kolath *et al.* (2006b)4 | 12 | Steers | EM | 262 | 262 | - |  |  |  | X |
| Kolath *et al.* (2006a)4 | 17 | Steers | EM | 325 | 325 | - |  |  |  | X |
| Nkrumah *et al.* (2006)5 | 27 | Steers | Beef | - | 509 | 70 | X |  |  |  |
| Castro Bulle *et al.* (2007) | 24 | Steers | Beef | 14-18 mo | 403 | 122 |  |  |  | X |
| Nkrumah *et al.* (2007a)6 | 464 | Steers | Beef | 252 | 459 | 70 | X |  |  |  |
| Nkrumah *et al.* (2007b)5 | 464 | Steers | Beef | - | 353 | 70 |  | X | X | X |
| Dobos and Herd (2008)5 | 70 | Steers | EM | - | 494 | 72 | X |  |  |  |
| Golden *et al.* (2008)5 | 12 | Steers | EM | - | 328 | 123 |  |  |  | X |
| Golden *et al.* (2008)5 | 17 | Steers | EM | - | 332 | 123 |  |  |  | X |
| Lancaster *et al.* (2009b) | 341 | Bulls | EM | 310 | 371 | 84 | X |  | X |  |
| Lancaster *et al.* (2009a) | 468 | Heifers | Brangus | 231 | 271 | 70 |  |  | X |  |
| Cruz *et al.* (2010) | 60 | Steers | EM | 12 mo | 296 | 120 |  |  |  | X |
| Kelly *et al.* (2010a) | 86 | Heifers | BxD | 247 | 192 | 82 | X | X |  |  |
| Kelly *et al.* (2011) | 58 | Bulls | EM + LM | 431 | 493 | 70 |  | X |  |  |
| Santana *et al.* (2012) | 46 | Bulls | Nellore | 22 mo | 409 | 84 |  | X | X |  |
| Bonilha *et al.* (2013) | 49 | Bulls | Nellore | 5407 | 343 | 74 |  |  | X |  |
| Fitzsimons *et al.* (2014a) | 67 | Bulls | EM | 426 | 431 | 105 |  | X |  |  |
| McGee *et al.* (2014) | 58 | Bulls | Wagyu | 474 | 420 | 70 | X |  |  |  |
| McGee *et al.* (2014) | 36 | Bulls | Wagyu | 423 | 364 | 70 | X |  |  |  |
| McGee *et al.* (2014) | 34 | Heifers | Wagyu | 433 | 299 | 70 | X |  |  |  |

\* Meta-analysis conducted using Comprehensive Meta-Analysis Software (version 3) using a random effects model.

\*\* Residual feed intake = RFI. Base model (dry matter intake (DMI) regressed on live weight and average daily gain) used to calculate predicted DMI.

1 Breed type; Beef = mixture of EM and LM beef cross-bred; BxD = Beef x Dairy cross-bred; EM = early maturing breed types; LM = late maturing breed types.

2 Days of age unless otherwise specified (months of age; mo).

3 BW (kg) = Initial BW.

4 Test duration not reported.

5 Start age not specified in the study.

6 Final BW reported in this study.

7 Age at slaughter, no start age specified.

8 ΔBF = Change in back fat depth measured in the live animal at the end of the RFI measurement period.

9 LMA = Final *longissimus* muscle area measured in the live animal at the end of the RFI measurement period.

10 CLMA = *longissimus* muscle area measured in the carcass following slaughter after the RFI measurement period.

**Supplementary Material S1** References listed in Supplementary Table S1 and Tables 1, 2, 3, 4 and 5

Basarab JA, Price MA, Aalhus JL, Okine EK, Snelling WM and Lyle KL 2003. Residual feed intake and body composition in young growing cattle. Canadian Journal of Animal Science 83, 189-204.

Bonilha EFM, Branco RH, Bonilha SFM, Araujo FL, Magnani E and Mercadante MEZ 2013. Body chemical composition of Nellore bulls with different residual feed intakes. Journal of Animal Science 9, 3457-3464.

Bonilha SFM, Branco RH, Corvino TLS, Alleoni GF, Figueiredo LA, and Razook AG 2009. Relationships between residual feed intake and internal organs of Nellore bulls. Proceedings of the American Dairy Science Association, Canadian Society of Animal Science, American Society of Animal Science Joint Annual Meeting, 12-16 July, Montreal, Quebec, Canada, pp. T310 (Abstract page no. 295).

Brown EG 2005. Sources of biological variation in residual feed intake in growing and finishing steers. PhD Thesis. Texas A&M University, College Station, TX, USA.

Castro Bulle FCP, Paulino PV, Sanches AC and Sainz RD 2007. Growth, carcass quality, and protein and energy metabolism in beef cattle with different growth potentials and residual feed intakes. Journal of Animal Science 85, 928-936.

Cruz GD, Rodriguez-Sanchez JA, Oltjen JW and Sainz RD 2010. Performance, residual feed intake, digestibility, carcass traits, and profitability of Angus-Hereford steers housed in individual or group pens. Journal of Animal Science 88, 324-329.

Dobos R and Herd R 2008. Spectral analysis of feeding patterns of steers divergent in residual feed intake. Australian Journal of Experimental Agriculture 48, 843-846.

Fitzsimons C, Kenny DA, Fahey AG and McGee M 2013. Methane emissions, body composition and rumen fermentation traits of beef heifers differing in phenotypic residual feed intake. Journal of Animal Science 91, 5789-5800.

Fitzsimons C, Kenny DA, Fahey AG and McGee M 2014b. Feeding behavior, rumen fermentation variables and body composition traits of pregnant beef cows differing in phenotypic residual feed intake. Journal of Animal Science 92, 2170-2181.

Fitzsimons C, Kenny DA and McGee M 2014a. Visceral organ weights, digestion and carcass characteristics of beef bulls differing in residual feed intake offered a high concentrate diet. Animal 8, 949-959.

Golden JW, Kerley MS and Kolath WH 2008. The relationship of feeding behavior to residual feed intake in crossbred Angus steers fed traditional and no-roughage diets. Journal of Animal Science 86, 180-186.

Gomes RDC, Sainz RD and Leme PR 2013. Protein metabolism, feed energy partitioning, behavior patterns and plasma cortisol in Nellore steers with high and low residual feed intake. Revista Brasileira de Zootecnia 42, 44-50.

Gomes RC, Sainz RD, Silva SL, César MC, Bonin MN and Leme PR 2012. Feedlot performance, feed efficiency reranking, carcass traits, body composition, energy requirements, meat quality and calpain system activity in Nellore steers with low and high residual feed intake. Livestock Science 150, 265-273.

Guan LL, Nkrumah JD, Basarab JA and Moore SS 2008. Linkage of microbial ecology to phenotype: correlation of rumen microbial ecology to cattle's feed efficiency. FEMS Microbiology Letters 288, 85-91.

Hegarty RS, Goopy JP, Herd RM and McCorkell B 2007. Cattle selected for lower residual feed intake have reduced daily methane production. Journal of Animal Science 85,1479-1486.

Hernandez-Sanabria E, Guan LL, Goonewardene LA, Li M, Mujibi DF, Stothard P, Moore SS and Leon-Quintero MC 2010. Correlation of particular bacterial PCR-denaturing gradient gel electrophoresis patterns with bovine ruminal fermentation parameters and feed efficiency traits. Applied and Environmental Microbiology 76, 6338-6350.

Hernandez-Sanabria E, Goonewardene LA, Wang Z, Durunna ON, Moore SS and Guan LL 2012. Impact of feed efficiency and diet on adaptive variations in the bacterial community in the rumen fluid of cattle. Applied and Environmental Microbiology 78, 1203-1214.

Jones FM, Phillips FA, Naylor T and Mercer NB 2011. Methane emissions from grazing Angus beef cows selected for divergent residual feed intake. Animal Feed Science and Technology 166-167, 302-307.

Kelly AK, McGee M, Crews DH, Fahey AG, Wylie AR and Kenny DA 2010a. Effect of divergence in residual feed intake on feeding behavior, blood metabolic variables, and body composition traits in growing beef heifers. Journal of Animal Science 88, 109-123.

Kelly AK, McGee M, Crews DH, Lynch CO, Wylie AR, Evans RD and Kenny DA 2011. Relationship between body measurements, metabolic hormones, metabolites and residual feed intake in performance tested pedigree beef bulls. Livestock Science 135, 8-16.

Kolath WH, Kerley MS, Golden JW and Keisler DH 2006a. The relationship between mitochondrial function and residual feed intake in Angus steers. Journal of Animal Science 84, 861-865.

Kolath WH, Kerley MS, Golden JW, Shahid SA and Johnson GS 2006b. The relationships among mitochondrial uncoupling protein 2 and 3 expression, mitochondrial deoxyribonucleic acid single nucleotide polymorphisms, and residual feed intake in Angus steers. Journal of Animal Science 84, 1761-1766.

Krueger WK, Carstens GE, Gomez RR, Bourg BM, Lancaster PA, Slay LJ, Miller JC, Anderson RC, Horrocks SM, Krueger NA and Forbes TDA 2009a. Relationships between residual feed intake and apparent nutrient digestibility, in vitro methane producing activity and VFA concentrations in growing Brangus heifers. Journal of Animal Science 87 (E-suppl. 2), 129 (Abstract page no. 153).

Krueger WK, Carstens GE, Paddock ZD, Calloway TR, Anderson RC, Krueger NA, Gontcharova V, Dowd SE, Gomez RR and Pinchak WE 2009b. Associations between feed efficiency and gut microbial ecology and fermentation parameters in feedlot cattle. Journal of Animal Science 87 (E-suppl. 2), T312 (Abstract page no. 295).

Lancaster PA, Carstens GE, Crews DH, Welsh TH, Forbes TDA, Forrest DW, Tedeschi LO, Randel RD and Rouquette FM 2009a. Phenotypic and genetic relationships of residual feed intake with performance and ultrasound carcass traits in Brangus heifers. Journal of Animal Science 87, 3887-3896.

Lancaster PA, Carstens GE, Ribeiro FR, Tedeschi LO and Crews DH 2009b. Characterization of feed efficiency traits and relationships with feeding behavior and ultrasound carcass traits in growing bulls. Journal of Animal Science 87, 1528-1539.

Lawrence P, Kenny DA, Earley B, Crews DH and McGee M 2011. Grass silage intake, rumen and blood variables, ultrasonic and body measurements, feeding behavior and activity in pregnant beef heifers differing in phenotypic residual feed intake. Journal of Animal Science 89, 3248-3261.

Lawrence P, Kenny DA, Earley B and McGee M 2012. Grazed grass herbage intake and performance of beef heifers with predetermined phenotypic residual feed intake classification. Animal 6, 1648-1661.

Lawrence P, Kenny DA, Earley B and McGee M 2013. Intake of conserved and grazed grass and performance traits in beef suckler cows differing in phenotypic residual feed intake. Livestock Science 152, 154-166.

Lines DS, Pitchford WS, Bottema CDK, Herd RM and Oddy VH 2014. Selection for residual feed intake affects appetite and body composition rather than energetic efficiency. Animal Production Science http://dx.doi.org/10.1071/AN13321.

McDonnell RP, Hart KJ, Boland TM, Kelly AK, McGee M and Kenny DA 2016. Effect of divergence in phenotypic residual feed intake on methane emissions, ruminal fermentation, and apparent whole-tract digestibility of beef heifers across three contrasting diets. Journal of Animal Science 94, 1179-1193.

McGee M, Ramirez JA, Carstens GE, Price WJ, Hall JB and Hill RA 2014. Relationships of feeding behaviors with efficiency in RFI-divergent Japanese Black cattle. Journal of Animal Science 92, 3580-3590.

Meale SJ, Morgavi DP, Cassar-Malek I, Andueza D, Ortigues-Marty I, Robins RJ, Schiphorst AM, Laverroux S, Graulet B, Boudra H and Cantalapiedra-Hijar G 2017. Exploration of biological markers of feed efficiency in young bulls. Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry 65, 9817-9827.

Nkrumah JD, Basarab JA, Price MA, Okine EK, Ammoura A, Guercio S, Hansen C, Li C, Benkel B, Murdoch B and Moore SS 2004. Different measures of energetic efficiency and their phenotypic relationships with growth, feed intake, and ultrasound and carcass merit in hybrid cattle. Journal of Animal Science 82, 2451-2459.

Nkrumah JD, Basarab JA, Wang Z, Li C, Price MA, Okine EK, Crews DH and Moore SS 2007b. Genetic and phenotypic relationships of feed intake and measures of efficiency with growth and carcass merit of beef cattle. Journal of Animal Science 85, 2711-2720.

Nkrumah JD, Crews DH, Basarab JA, Price MA, Okine EK, Wang Z, Li C and Moore SS 2007a. Genetic and phenotypic relationships of feeding behavior and temperament with performance, feed efficiency, ultrasound, and carcass merit of beef cattle. Journal of Animal Science 85, 2382-2390.

Nkrumah JD, Okine EK, Mathison GW, Schmid K, Li C, Basarab JA, Price MA, Wang Z and Moore SS 2006. Relationships of feedlot feed efficiency, performance, and feeding behavior with metabolic rate, methane production, and energy partitioning in beef cattle. Journal of Animal Science 84, 145-153.

Richardson EC, Herd RM, Archer JA and Arthur PF 2004. Metabolic differences in Angus steers divergently selected for residual feed intake. Australian Journal of Experimental Agriculture 44, 441-452.

Richardson EC, Herd RM, Arthur PF, Wright J, Xu G, Dibley K and Oddy VH 1996. Possible physiological indicators for net feed conversion efficiency in cattle. Proceedings of the Australian Society of Animal Production 21, 103-106.

Richardson EC, Herd RM, Oddy VH, Thompson JM, Archer JA and Arthur PF 2001. Body composition and implications for heat production of Angus steer progeny of parents selected for and against residual feed intake. Australian Journal of Experimental Agriculture 41, 1065-1072.

Santana MHA, Rossi P, Almeida R and Cucco DC 2012. Feed efficiency and its correlations with carcass traits measured by ultrasound in Nellore bulls. Livestock Science 145, 252-257.