**Raising the flag among the ruins.**

**The crisis as helping hand for opposition parties?**

Nicolò Conti, Andrea Pedrazzani, Federico Russo

**Online Appendix**

**Appendix 1. Correspondence between MARPOR scheme and CAP scheme**

**Appendix 2. Robustness checks: GDP growth as a measure of economic performance**

**Appendix 3. Robustness checks: Exclusion of Greece**

**Appendix 4. Robustness checks: Snap elections**

**Appendix 5. Robustness checks: Exclusion of parties with a low number of seats or parliamentary questions**

**Appendix 1. Correspondence between MARPOR scheme and CAP scheme**

**Table A1. Classification scheme for comparing MARPOR and CAP data. Full details on correspondence between MARPOR categories and CAP minor topics.**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Policy domain** | **MARPOR category** | **CAP minor topic** |
| **1001 - Foreign Policy** | 101 - Foreign Special Relationships: Positive  102 - Foreign Special Relationships: Negative  103 - Anti-Imperialism  107 - Internationalism: Positive  109 - Internationalism: Negative | 1900 - General International Affairs and Foreign Aid  1901 - Foreign Aid  1905 - Developing Countries Issues  1906 - International Finance and Economic Development  1921 - Specific Country / Region  1926 - International Organizations Other than Finance  1927 - International Terrorism and Hijacking  1929 - Diplomats, Embassies, Citizens Abroad, Foreign Diplomats in Country, and Passports  1999 - Other - General International Affairs and Foreign Aid |
| **1002 - Military and Defence** | 104 - Military: Positive  105 - Military: Negative  106 - Peace | 1407 - Veterans Housing Assistance and Military Housing Programs  1600 - General Defense  1602 - Defense Alliances and Security Assistance  1603 - Military Intelligence and Espionage  1604 - Military Readiness, Coordination of Armed Services Air Support and Sealift Capabilities, and National Stockpiles of Strategic Materials  1605 - Arms Control and Nuclear Nonproliferation  1606 - Military Aid and Weapons Sales to Other Countries  1608 - Manpower, Military Personnel, and Dependents  1610 - Military Procurement and Weapons System Acquisitions and Evaluation  1611 - Military Installations, Construction, and Land Transfers  1612 - Reserve Forces and Reserve Affairs  1616 - Civilian Personnel and Civilian Employment by the Defense Industry  1617 - Oversight of Defense Contracts and Contractors  1619 - Direct War Related Issues  1620 - Relief of Claims Against National Military  1698 - Defense Research and Development  1699 - Other – Defense |
| **1003 - European Union** | 108 - European Community/Union or Latin America Integration: Positive  110 - European Community/Union or Latin America Integration: Negative | 1910 - Western Europe and Common Market Issues |
| **2001 - Freedom, Human Rights and Democracy** | 201 - Freedom and Human Rights  202 - Democracy | 200 - General Civil Rights, Minority Issues, and Civil Liberties  206 - Voting Rights and Issues  207 - Freedom of Speech and Religion  208 - Right to Privacy and Access to Government Information  299 - Other - Civil Rights, Minority Issues, and Civil Liberties  1925 - Human Rights  2012 - Regulation of Political Campaigns, Political Advertising, and Voter Registration |
| **3001 - Federalism and Constitution** | 203 - Constitutionalism: Positive  204 - Constitutionalism: Negative  301 - Federalism  302 - Centralisation | 2001 - Intergovernmental Relations  2011 - Government Branch Relations, Administrative Issues, and Constitutional Reforms  2014 - Capital City Affairs  2105 - Dependencies and Territorial Issues |
| **3002 - Government Operations and Administration** | 303 - Governmental and Administrative Efficiency  304 - Political Corruption  305 - Political Authority | 1523 - Domestic Disaster Relief  2000 - General Government Operations  2002 - Government Efficiency and Bureaucratic Oversight  2004 - Government Employee Benefits and Civil Service Issues  2005 - Nominations and Appointments Not Codable Elsewhere  2007 - Government Procurement, Procurement Fraud, and Contractor Management  2008 - Government Property Management  2009 - Tax Administration  2010 - Impeachment and Scandals  2013 - Census and Statistics  2015 - Relief of Claims Against the National Government  2099 - Other - Government Operations |
| **4001 - Market Regulation** | 401 - Free Market Economy  403 - Market Regulation  704 - Middle Class and Professional Groups | 1500 - General Banking, Finance, and Domestic Commerce  1501 - Banking System and Financial Institution Regulation  1502 - Securities and Commodities Regulation  1504 - Consumer Finance, Mortgages, and Credit Cards  1505 - Insurance Regulation  1507 – Bankruptcy  1520 - Corporate Mergers, Antitrust Regulation, and Corporate Management Issues  1521 - Small Business Issues  1522 - Copyrights and Patents  1525 - Consumer Safety and Consumer Fraud  1599 - Other - Banking, Finance, and Domestic Commerce |
| **4002 - Macroeconomic Policy and Approach** | 402 - Incentives: Positive  404 - Economic Planning  405 - Corporatism/ Mixed Economy  408 - Economic Goals  409 - Keynesian Demand Management  410 - Economic Growth: Positive  412 - Controlled Economy  413 - Nationalisation  414 - Economic Orthodoxy  415 - Marxist Analysis: Positive | 100 - General Domestic Macroeconomic Issues  101 - Inflation, Prices, and Interest Rates  103 - Unemployment Rate  104 - Monetary Supply, Central Bank, and the Treasury  105 - National Budget and Debt  107 - Taxation, Tax policy, VAT, and Tax Reform  108 - Industrial Policy  110 - Price Control and Stabilization  199 - Other - Domestic Macroeconomic Issues  1401 - Housing and Community Development  1403 - Urban Economic Development and General Urban Issues  1404 - Rural Housing and Farm Housing Assistance Programs  1405 - Rural Economic Development  1498 - Community Development and Housing Research and Development |
| **4003 - Foreign Trade Policy** | 406 - Protectionism: Positive  407 - Protectionism: Negative | 1800 - General Foreign Trade  1802 - Trade Negotiations, Disputes, and Agreements  1803 - Export Promotion, Regulation, and Export Credit Agencies  1804 - International Private Business Investment and Corporate Development  1806 - Productivity and Competitiveness of domestic business  1807 - Tariff and Import Restrictions  1808 - Exchange Rates and Related Issues  1899 - Other - Foreign Trade |
| **4004 - Technology and Infrastructure** | 411 - Technology and Infrastructure: Positive | 498 - Agricultural Research and Development  898 - Energy Research and Development  1000 - General Transportation  1001 - Mass Transportation and Safety  1002 - Highway Construction, Transportation, Maintenance, and Safety  1003 - Airports, Airlines, Air Traffic Control, and Safety  1005 - Railroad Transportation and Safety  1007 - Maritime Issues  1010 - Public Works (Infrastructure Development)  1098 - Transportation Research and Development  1099 - Other - Transportation  1598 - Banking, Finance, and Domestic Commerce Research and Development  1700 - General Space, Science, Technology, and Communications  1701 - Government Use of Space and Space Exploration Agreements  1704 - Commercial Use of Space  1705 - Science Technology Transfer and International Scientific Cooperation  1706 - Telephone and Telecommunication Regulation  1708 - Weather Forecasting, Related Issues, and Oceanography  1709 - Computer Industry and Computer Security  1798 - Space, Science, Technology, and Communications Research and Development  1799 - Other - Space, Science, Technology, and Communications  2003 - Postal Service Issues  2104 - Water Resources Development and Research |
| **5001 - Environment and Energy** | 416 - Anti-Growth Economy and Sustainability  501 - Environmental Protection | 700 - General Environment  701 - Drinking Water Safety, Water Supply, Water Pollution, and Water Conservation  703 - Waste Disposal  704 - Hazardous Waste and Toxic Chemical Regulation, Treatment, and Disposal  705 - Air pollution, Global Warming, and Noise Pollution  707 - Recycling  708 - Indoor Environmental Hazards  709 - Species and Forest Protection  711 - Land and Water Conservation  798 - Environmental Research and Development  799 - Other - Environment  800 - General Energy  801 - Nuclear Energy  802 - Electricity and Hydroelectricity  803 - Natural Gas and Oil  805 - Coal  806 - Alternative and Renewable Energy  807 - Energy Conservation  899 - Other - Energy  1614 - Military Nuclear and Hazardous Waste Disposal and Military Environmental Compliance  1902 - International Resources Exploitation and Resources Agreement  2100 - General Public Lands, Water Management, and Territorial Issues  2103 - Natural Resources, Public Lands, and Forest Management  2199 - Other - Public Lands, Water Management, and Territorial Issues |
| **5002 - Culture** | 502 - Culture: Positive | 1524 - Tourism  1526 - Sports and Gambling Regulation  1707 - Newspaper, Publishing, and Broadcast Industry Regulation  2006 - Currency, Commemorative Coins, Medals, and National Mints  2030 - National Holidays  2101 - National Parks, Memorials, Historic Sites, and Recreation  2300 - General Cultural Policy Issues |
| **5003 - National Way of Life and Discrimination** | 503 - Equality: Positive  606 - Civic Mindedness: Positive  705 - Underprivileged Minority Groups  706 - Non-economic Demographic Groups  601 - National Way of Life: Positive  602 - National Way of Life: Negative  603 - Traditional Morality: Positive  604 - Traditional Morality: Negative  607 - Multiculturalism: Positive  608 - Multiculturalism: Negative | 201 - Ethnic Minority and Racial Group Discrimination  202 - Gender and Sexual Orientation Discrimination  204 - Age Discrimination  205 - Handicap and Disease Discrimination  1305 - Social Services and Volunteer Associations  209 - Government Restrictions on Anti-Government Activities  900 - General Immigration and Refugee Issues  2102 - Indigenous Affairs |
| **5004 - Welfare State** | 504 - Welfare State Expansion  505 - Welfare State Limitation | 300 - General Health  301 - Comprehensive Health Care Reform  302 - Insurance Reform, Availability, and Costs  321 - Regulation of the Drug Industry, Medical Devices, and Clinical Labs  322 - Facilities Construction, Regulation, and Payments  323 - Provider and Insurer Payments and Regulation  324 - Medical Liability, Fraud, and Abuse  325 - Health Manpower and Training  331 - Disease Prevention, Treatment, and Health Promotion  332 - Infants and Children  333 - Mental Health and Mental Retardation  334 - Long-Term Care, Home Health, Terminally Ill, and Rehabilitation Services  335 - Prescription Drug Coverage and Costs  341 - Tobacco Abuse, Treatment, and Education  342 - Drug and/or Alcohol Abuse and Treatment  398 - Health Research and development  399 - Other - Health  1300 - General Social Welfare  1302 - Poverty Assistance for Low-Income Families  1303 - Elderly Issues and Elderly Assistance Programs  1304 - Assistance to the Disabled and Handicapped  1308 - Parental Leave and Child Care  1399 - Other - Social Welfare  1400 - General Community Development and Housing Issues  1406 - Low and Middle Income Housing Programs and Needs  1408 - Elderly and Handicapped Housing  1409 - Housing Assistance for Homeless and Homeless Issues  1499 - Other - Community Development and Housing Issues |
| **5005 - Education** | 506 - Education Expansion  507 - Education Limitation | 600 - General Education  601 - Higher Education  602 - Elementary and Secondary Education  603 - Education of Underprivileged Students  604 - Vocational Education  606 - Special Education  607 - Educational Excellence  698 - Education Research and Development  699 - Other - Education |
| **6001 - Law and Order** | 605 - Law and Order | 1200 - General Law, Crime, and Family Issues  1201 - Agencies Dealing With Law and Crime  1202 - White Collar Crime and Organized Crime  1203 - Illegal Drug Production, Trafficking, and Control  1204 - Court Administration  1205 - Prisons  1206 - Juvenile Crime and the Juvenile Justice System  1207 - Child Abuse and Child Pornography  1208 - Family Issues  1210 - Criminal and Civil Code  1211 - Riots and Crime Prevention  1227 - Police and Other General Domestic Security Responses to Terrorism (e.g. Special Police)  1299 - Other - Law, Crime, and Family Issues  1615 - Civil Defense |
| **7001 - Labor** | 701 - Labor Groups: Positive  702 - Labor Groups: Negative | 500 - General Labor and Employment  501 - Worker Safety and Protection  502 - Employment Training and Workforce Development  503 - Employee Benefits  504 - Employee Relations and Labor Unions  505 - Fair Labor Standards and Labor Law  506 - Youth Employment and Child Labor  529 - Migrant and Seasonal Workers  599 - Other - Labor and Employment |
| **7002 - Agriculture** | 703 - Agriculture and Farmers | 400 - General Agriculture  401 - Agricultural Trade  402 - Government Subsidies to Farmers and Ranchers  403 - Food Inspection and Safety  404 - Agricultural Marketing and Promotion  405 - Animal and Crop Disease, Animal Welfare, and Pest Control  408 - Fisheries and Fishing  499 - Other - Agriculture |

**Appendix 2. Robustness checks: GDP growth as a measure of economic performance**

**Table A2. Analyses of issue dissimilarity between parties’ manifestos and parliamentary questions (Greece, Italy, Portugal and Spain, 2000-2015). Robustness checks: GDP growth as a measure of economic performance.**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Model 1** | **Model 2** | **Model 3** | **Model 4** | **Model 5** | **Model 6** |
| GDP Growth | 0.008\*\* | 0.010\*\*\* | 0.008\*\* | 0.007\*\* | 0.009\*\* | 0.007\*\* |
|  | (0.003) | (0.003) | (0.003) | (0.003) | (0.004) | (0.003) |
| Term Year | -0.006 | -0.006 | -0.006 | -0.050\*\* | -0.054\*\* | -0.052\*\* |
|  | (0.006) | (0.006) | (0.006) | (0.025) | (0.025) | (0.025) |
| Term Year X Term Year |  |  |  | 0.008\* | 0.009\* | 0.008\* |
|  |  |  |  | (0.004) | (0.004) | (0.004) |
| Government Party | 0.078\*\*\* | 0.072\*\*\* |  | 0.077\*\*\* | 0.071\*\*\* |  |
|  | (0.024) | (0.024) |  | (0.024) | (0.024) |  |
| GDP Growth X Government Party |  | -0.009\* |  |  | -0.010\* |  |
|  |  | (0.005) |  |  | (0.005) |  |
| Alternation: |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| pre OPP - now OPP |  |  | -0.062\*\* |  |  | -0.060\*\* |
|  |  |  | (0.031) |  |  | (0.031) |
| pre OPP - now GOV |  |  | -0.007 |  |  | -0.009 |
|  |  |  | (0.033) |  |  | (0.033) |
| pre GOV - now OPP |  |  | -0.126\*\*\* |  |  | -0.127\*\*\* |
|  |  |  | (0.034) |  |  | (0.034) |
| Seat Share | -0.185\*\*\* | -0.178\*\* | -0.162\*\* | -0.181\*\*\* | -0.173\*\* | -0.155\*\* |
|  | (0.070) | (0.070) | (0.073) | (0.070) | (0.070) | (0.073) |
| Extreme Left | -0.003 | -0.008 | -0.009 | -0.004 | -0.009 | -0.01 |
|  | (0.023) | (0.023) | (0.023) | (0.023) | (0.023) | (0.023) |
| Extreme Right | -0.027 | -0.03 | -0.013 | -0.027 | -0.031 | -0.012 |
|  | (0.026) | (0.026) | (0.028) | (0.026) | (0.026) | (0.027) |
| Manifesto Entropy | -0.630\*\*\* | -0.633\*\*\* | -0.589\*\*\* | -0.636\*\*\* | -0.639\*\*\* | -0.594\*\*\* |
|  | (0.106) | (0.105) | (0.106) | (0.106) | (0.105) | (0.106) |
| Emphasis on Macroeconomics | -0.002\* | -0.002\* | -0.002\* | -0.002\* | -0.002\* | -0.002\* |
|  | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) |
| Country: |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Spain | 0.039 | 0.036 | 0.038 | 0.051 | 0.049 | 0.052 |
|  | (0.031) | (0.031) | (0.031) | (0.032) | (0.031) | (0.032) |
| Greece | 0.151\*\*\* | 0.151\*\*\* | 0.151\*\*\* | 0.154\*\*\* | 0.154\*\*\* | 0.154\*\*\* |
|  | (0.041) | (0.041) | (0.041) | (0.041) | (0.041) | (0.041) |
| Portugal | 0.123\*\*\* | 0.124\*\*\* | 0.133\*\*\* | 0.131\*\*\* | 0.132\*\*\* | 0.142\*\*\* |
|  | (0.032) | (0.032) | (0.033) | (0.032) | (0.032) | (0.033) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Constant | 1.027\*\*\* | 1.034\*\*\* | 1.061\*\*\* | 1.071\*\*\* | 1.082\*\*\* | 1.104\*\*\* |
|  | (0.089) | (0.088) | (0.091) | (0.092) | (0.091) | (0.093) |
| *Variance component:* |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Constant (party label) | 0.002\*\*\* | 0.002\*\*\* | 0.002\*\*\* | 0.002\*\*\* | 0.002\*\*\* | 0.002\*\*\* |
|  | (0.000) | (0.000) | (0.000) | (0.000) | (0.000) | (0.000) |
| Residual | 0.014\*\*\* | 0.014\*\*\* | 0.014\*\*\* | 0.014\*\*\* | 0.014\*\*\* | 0.013\*\*\* |
|  | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) |
| N | 263 | 263 | 263 | 263 | 263 | 263 |
| Log-likelihood | 176.699 | 178.226 | 180.08 | 178.29 | 180.068 | 181.867 |
| AIC | -325.397 | -326.451 | -328.16 | -326.579 | -328.136 | -329.734 |
| BIC | -275.387 | -272.869 | -271.005 | -272.997 | -270.982 | -269.007 |

*Notes*: Multilevel regression models with random intercepts on party label. Omitted reference category for alternation: *pre GOV - now GOV*. Omitted reference category for country: *Italy*. *GDP Growth* is the annual percentage change in real GDP and is lagged (previous year). Country data on GDP growth were taken from the World Bank database. Statistical significance: \* p<0.1, \*\* p<0.05, \*\*\* p<0.01.

**Figure A1. Difference in expected manifesto-questions dissimilarity between government and opposition parties, as a function of the annual GDP growth. Robustness checks: GDP growth as a measure of economic performance.**



*Notes*: Marginal impact estimated on the basis of Model 5.

**Appendix 3. Robustness checks: Exclusion of Greece**

**Table A3. Analyses of issue dissimilarity between parties’ manifestos and parliamentary questions (Italy, Portugal and Spain, 2000-2015). Robustness checks: Greece excluded.**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Model 1** | **Model 2** | **Model 3** | **Model 4** | **Model 5** | **Model 6** |
| EPI | 0.003\*\* | 0.004\*\*\* | 0.003\*\* | 0.003\* | 0.003\*\* | 0.003\* |
|  | (0.001) | (0.002) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.002) | (0.001) |
| Term Year | -0.009 | -0.009 | -0.009 | -0.067\*\*\* | -0.068\*\*\* | -0.072\*\*\* |
|  | (0.006) | (0.006) | (0.006) | (0.026) | (0.025) | (0.025) |
| Term Year X Term Year |  |  |  | 0.010\*\* | 0.010\*\* | 0.011\*\* |
|  |  |  |  | (0.004) | (0.004) | (0.004) |
| Government Party | 0.070\*\*\* | 0.339 |  | 0.067\*\*\* | 0.348 |  |
|  | (0.025) | (0.241) |  | (0.025) | (0.238) |  |
| EPI X Government Party |  | -0.003 |  |  | -0.003 |  |
|  |  | (0.003) |  |  | (0.003) |  |
| Alternation: |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| pre OPP - now OPP |  |  | -0.038 |  |  | -0.034 |
|  |  |  | (0.033) |  |  | (0.033) |
| pre OPP - now GOV |  |  | 0.018 |  |  | 0.013 |
|  |  |  | (0.033) |  |  | (0.033) |
| pre GOV - now OPP |  |  | -0.097\*\*\* |  |  | -0.100\*\*\* |
|  |  |  | (0.035) |  |  | (0.034) |
| Seat Share | -0.162\*\* | -0.160\*\* | -0.137\* | -0.153\*\* | -0.150\* | -0.123 |
|  | (0.077) | (0.078) | (0.081) | (0.077) | (0.078) | (0.081) |
| Extreme Left | 0.009 | 0.008 | 0.007 | 0.008 | 0.007 | 0.005 |
|  | (0.025) | (0.025) | (0.025) | (0.025) | (0.025) | (0.024) |
| Extreme Right | -0.065\*\* | -0.067\*\* | -0.048 | -0.064\*\* | -0.067\*\* | -0.045 |
|  | (0.029) | (0.029) | (0.031) | (0.029) | (0.029) | (0.031) |
| Manifesto Entropy | -0.405\*\*\* | -0.397\*\*\* | -0.386\*\*\* | -0.421\*\*\* | -0.413\*\*\* | -0.403\*\*\* |
|  | (0.138) | (0.138) | (0.137) | (0.137) | (0.137) | (0.136) |
| Emphasis on Macroeconomics | -0.002 | -0.002 | -0.002 | -0.002 | -0.002 | -0.002 |
|  | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) |
| Country: |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Spain | 0.050 | 0.048 | 0.047 | 0.061\* | 0.058\* | 0.060\* |
|  | (0.033) | (0.033) | (0.033) | (0.033) | (0.034) | (0.033) |
| Portugal | 0.117\*\*\* | 0.114\*\*\* | 0.121\*\*\* | 0.126\*\*\* | 0.123\*\*\* | 0.133\*\*\* |
|  | (0.033) | (0.034) | (0.034) | (0.033) | (0.034) | (0.035) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Constant | 0.579\*\*\* | 0.525\*\*\* | 0.617\*\*\* | 0.695\*\*\* | 0.639\*\*\* | 0.739\*\*\* |
|  | (0.167) | (0.174) | (0.163) | (0.172) | (0.179) | (0.168) |
| *Variance component:* |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Constant (party label) | 0.002\*\*\* | 0.002\*\*\* | 0.002\*\*\* | 0.002\*\*\* | 0.002\*\*\* | 0.002\*\*\* |
|  | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) |
| Residual | 0.013\*\*\* | 0.013\*\*\* | 0.012\*\*\* | 0.012\*\*\* | 0.012\*\*\* | 0.012\*\*\* |
|  | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) |
| N | 230 | 230 | 230 | 230 | 230 | 230 |
| Log-likelihood | 164.042 | 164.66 | 166.926 | 166.709 | 167.404 | 170.112 |
| AIC | -302.085 | -301.32 | -303.853 | -305.419 | -304.808 | -308.225 |
| BIC | -257.39 | -253.187 | -252.281 | -257.286 | -253.237 | -253.216 |

*Notes*: Multilevel regression models with random intercepts on party label. Omitted reference category for alternation: *pre GOV - now GOV*. Omitted reference category for country: *Italy*. Statistical significance: \* p<0.1, \*\* p<0.05, \*\*\* p<0.01.

**Figure A2. Difference in expected manifesto-questions dissimilarity between government and opposition parties, as a function of the Economic Performance Index. Robustness checks: Greece excluded.**



*Notes*: Marginal impact estimated on the basis of Model 5. While in Figure 2 in the main text the impact of *Government Party* is estimated for *EPI* ranging between 50 and 90, here it is estimated for *EPI* ranging between 60 and 92. This is because the minimum value of *EPI* is about 60 if we exclude Greece from our data.

**Appendix 4. Robustness checks: Snap elections**

**Table A4. Analyses of issue dissimilarity between parties’ manifestos and parliamentary questions (Greece, Italy, Portugal and Spain, 2000-2015). Robustness checks: Snap elections.**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Model 1** | **Model 2** | **Model 3** | **Model 4** | **Model 5** | **Model 6** |
| EPI | 0.003\*\* | 0.004\*\*\* | 0.003\*\* | 0.003\*\* | 0.003\*\* | 0.003\*\* |
|  | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) |
| Term Year | -0.009 | -0.009 | -0.009 | -0.076\*\*\* | -0.078\*\*\* | -0.077\*\*\* |
|  | (0.006) | (0.006) | (0.006) | (0.026) | (0.026) | (0.026) |
| Term Year X Term Year |  |  |  | 0.012\*\*\* | 0.012\*\*\* | 0.012\*\*\* |
|  |  |  |  | (0.004) | (0.004) | (0.004) |
| Government Party | 0.077\*\*\* | 0.247\* |  | 0.075\*\*\* | 0.267\* |  |
|  | (0.024) | (0.143) |  | (0.024) | (0.141) |  |
| EPI X Government Party |  | -0.002 |  |  | -0.002 |  |
|  |  | (0.002) |  |  | (0.002) |  |
| Alternation: |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| pre OPP - now OPP |  |  | -0.064\*\* |  |  | -0.062\*\* |
|  |  |  | (0.031) |  |  | (0.030) |
| pre OPP - now GOV |  |  | 0.002 |  |  | -0.001 |
|  |  |  | (0.033) |  |  | (0.033) |
| pre GOV - now OPP |  |  | -0.117\*\*\* |  |  | -0.119\*\*\* |
|  |  |  | (0.034) |  |  | (0.033) |
| Seat Share | -0.194\*\*\* | -0.198\*\*\* | -0.181\*\* | -0.191\*\*\* | -0.195\*\*\* | -0.176\*\* |
|  | (0.071) | (0.071) | (0.074) | (0.070) | (0.071) | (0.073) |
| Extreme Left | -0.001 | -0.005 | -0.004 | -0.002 | -0.007 | -0.006 |
|  | (0.023) | (0.023) | (0.023) | (0.023) | (0.023) | (0.023) |
| Extreme Right | -0.023 | -0.024 | -0.012 | -0.022 | -0.024 | -0.011 |
|  | (0.026) | (0.027) | (0.028) | (0.026) | (0.026) | (0.027) |
| Manifesto Entropy | -0.599\*\*\* | -0.599\*\*\* | -0.561\*\*\* | -0.603\*\*\* | -0.603\*\*\* | -0.565\*\*\* |
|  | (0.106) | (0.106) | (0.106) | (0.105) | (0.105) | (0.105) |
| Emphasis on Macroeconomics | -0.001 | -0.002 | -0.002 | -0.001 | -0.002 | -0.001 |
|  | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) |
| Snap | 0.066\*\*\* | 0.064\*\*\* | 0.065\*\*\* | 0.082\*\*\* | 0.081\*\*\* | 0.081\*\*\* |
|  | (0.025) | (0.025) | (0.025) | (0.025) | (0.025) | (0.025) |
| Country: |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Spain | 0.071\*\* | 0.067\*\* | 0.070\*\* | 0.083\*\*\* | 0.078\*\* | 0.082\*\*\* |
|  | (0.031) | (0.032) | (0.031) | (0.031) | (0.032) | (0.031) |
| Greece | 0.185\*\*\* | 0.176\*\*\* | 0.185\*\*\* | 0.179\*\*\* | 0.169\*\*\* | 0.179\*\*\* |
|  | (0.055) | (0.055) | (0.054) | (0.054) | (0.055) | (0.054) |
| Portugal | 0.121\*\*\* | 0.118\*\*\* | 0.127\*\*\* | 0.128\*\*\* | 0.126\*\*\* | 0.136\*\*\* |
|  | (0.032) | (0.033) | (0.033) | (0.032) | (0.032) | (0.033) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Constant | 0.709\*\*\* | 0.693\*\*\* | 0.748\*\*\* | 0.815\*\*\* | 0.800\*\*\* | 0.854\*\*\* |
|  | (0.154) | (0.154) | (0.152) | (0.157) | (0.157) | (0.155) |
| *Variance component:* |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Constant (party label) | 0.002\*\*\* | 0.002\*\*\* | 0.002\*\*\* | 0.002\*\*\* | 0.002\*\*\* | 0.002\*\*\* |
|  | (0.000) | (0.000) | (0.000) | (0.000) | (0.000) | (0.000) |
| Residual | 0.014\*\*\* | 0.014\*\*\* | 0.013\*\*\* | 0.013\*\*\* | 0.013\*\*\* | 0.013\*\*\* |
|  | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) |
| N | 263 | 263 | 263 | 263 | 263 | 263 |
| Log-likelihood | 179.725 | 180.449 | 182.884 | 183.191 | 184.123 | 186.578 |
| AIC | -329.45 | -328.897 | -331.768 | -334.381 | -334.246 | -337.157 |
| BIC | -275.868 | -271.743 | -271.042 | -277.227 | -273.519 | -272.858 |

*Notes*: Multilevel regression models with random intercepts on party label. Omitted reference category for alternation: *pre GOV - now GOV*. Omitted reference category for country: *Italy*. Variable *Snap* is a dummy indicating years truncated by snap elections. In particular, *Snap* is equal to 1 in the following cases: Greece 2012 (Legislature XIII) and 2014 (Legislature XV), Italy 2008 (Legislature XV), Portugal 2004 (Legislature IX) and 2011 (Legislature XI), and Spain 2011 (Legislature IX). Statistical significance: \* p<0.1, \*\* p<0.05, \*\*\* p<0.01.

**Figure A3. Effect of the electoral cycle on the issue dissimilarity between parties’ manifestos and their parliamentary questions. Robustness checks: Snap elections.**



*Notes*: Marginal impact estimated on the basis of Model 5.

**Appendix 5. Robustness checks: Exclusion of parties with a low number of seats or parliamentary questions**

**Table A5. Analyses of issue dissimilarity between parties’ manifestos and parliamentary questions (Greece, Italy, Portugal and Spain, 2000-2015). Robustness checks: Parties holding less than 2 percent of parliamentary seats are excluded.**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Model 1** | **Model 2** | **Model 3** | **Model 4** | **Model 5** | **Model 6** |
| EPI | 0.003\* | 0.003\*\* | 0.003\* | 0.003 | 0.003\* | 0.002 |
|  | (0.002) | (0.002) | (0.002) | (0.002) | (0.002) | (0.002) |
| Term Year | -0.009 | -0.010 | -0.010 | -0.036 | -0.040 | -0.041 |
|  | (0.007) | (0.007) | (0.007) | (0.028) | (0.028) | (0.028) |
| Term Year X Term Year |  |  |  | 0.005 | 0.005 | 0.006 |
|  |  |  |  | (0.005) | (0.005) | (0.005) |
| Government Party | 0.066\*\*\* | 0.266\* |  | 0.066\*\*\* | 0.277\*\* |  |
|  | (0.023) | (0.136) |  | (0.023) | (0.136) |  |
| EPI X Government Party |  | -0.003 |  |  | -0.003 |  |
|  |  | (0.002) |  |  | (0.002) |  |
| Alternation: |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| pre OPP - now OPP |  |  | -0.044 |  |  | -0.044 |
|  |  |  | (0.029) |  |  | (0.029) |
| pre OPP - now GOV |  |  | -0.008 |  |  | -0.01 |
|  |  |  | (0.033) |  |  | (0.033) |
| pre GOV - now OPP |  |  | -0.113\*\*\* |  |  | -0.115\*\*\* |
|  |  |  | (0.033) |  |  | (0.033) |
| Seat Share | -0.088 | -0.092 | -0.053 | -0.088 | -0.092 | -0.051 |
|  | (0.067) | (0.069) | (0.069) | (0.066) | (0.069) | (0.068) |
| Extreme Left | 0.015 | 0.010 | 0.006 | 0.015 | 0.010 | 0.005 |
|  | (0.024) | (0.025) | (0.024) | (0.024) | (0.025) | (0.024) |
| Extreme Right | -0.040 | -0.042 | -0.025 | -0.040 | -0.042 | -0.024 |
|  | (0.025) | (0.026) | (0.026) | (0.025) | (0.026) | (0.026) |
| Manifesto Entropy | -0.868\*\*\* | -0.879\*\*\* | -0.824\*\*\* | -0.872\*\*\* | -0.884\*\*\* | -0.827\*\*\* |
|  | (0.121) | (0.123) | (0.120) | (0.120) | (0.123) | (0.119) |
| Emphasis on Macroeconomics | -0.003\*\* | -0.004\*\* | -0.004\*\* | -0.003\*\* | -0.004\*\* | -0.004\*\* |
|  | (0.002) | (0.002) | (0.002) | (0.002) | (0.002) | (0.002) |
| Country: |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Spain | 0.062\*\* | 0.059\* | 0.064\*\* | 0.066\*\* | 0.063\*\* | 0.069\*\* |
|  | (0.030) | (0.032) | (0.030) | (0.030) | (0.032) | (0.030) |
| Greece | 0.174\*\*\* | 0.165\*\*\* | 0.170\*\*\* | 0.172\*\*\* | 0.163\*\*\* | 0.168\*\*\* |
|  | (0.057) | (0.058) | (0.057) | (0.057) | (0.058) | (0.056) |
| Portugal | 0.182\*\*\* | 0.181\*\*\* | 0.194\*\*\* | 0.185\*\*\* | 0.184\*\*\* | 0.198\*\*\* |
|  | (0.030) | (0.031) | (0.031) | (0.030) | (0.031) | (0.031) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Constant | 0.969\*\*\* | 0.953\*\*\* | 0.996\*\*\* | 1.018\*\*\* | 1.005\*\*\* | 1.050\*\*\* |
|  | (0.170) | (0.170) | (0.166) | (0.176) | (0.176) | (0.172) |
| *Variance component:* |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Constant (party label) | 0.001\*\*\* | 0.001\*\*\* | 0.001\*\*\* | 0.001\*\*\* | 0.001\*\*\* | 0.001\*\*\* |
|  | (0.000) | (0.000) | (0.000) | (0.000) | (0.000) | (0.000) |
| Residual | 0.013\*\*\* | 0.013\*\*\* | 0.013\*\*\* | 0.013\*\*\* | 0.013\*\*\* | 0.013\*\*\* |
|  | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) |
| N | 204 | 204 | 204 | 204 | 204 | 204 |
| Log-likelihood | 146.778 | 147.814 | 150.078 | 147.273 | 148.432 | 150.72 |
| AIC | -265.556 | -265.628 | -268.157 | -264.547 | -264.864 | -267.44 |
| BIC | -219.102 | -215.857 | -215.067 | -214.775 | -211.774 | -211.032 |

*Notes*: Multilevel regression models with random intercepts on party label. Omitted reference category for alternation: *pre GOV - now GOV*. Omitted reference category for country: *Italy*. Parties holding less than 2 percent of parliamentary seats are excluded. This corresponds to 6 MPs in the Greek parliament, to 13 MPs in the Italian Chamber of Deputies, to 5 MPs in the Portuguese parliament, and to 7 MPs in the Spanish Congress of Deputies. Statistical significance: \* p<0.1, \*\* p<0.05, \*\*\* p<0.01.

**Figure A6. Difference in expected manifesto-questions dissimilarity between government and opposition parties, as a function of the Economic Performance Index. Robustness checks: Parties holding less than 2 percent of parliamentary seats are excluded.**



*Notes*: Marginal impact estimated on the basis of Model 5.

**Table A6. Analyses of issue dissimilarity between parties’ manifestos and parliamentary questions (Greece, Italy, Portugal and Spain, 2000-2015). Robustness checks: Parties holding less than 3 percent of parliamentary seats are excluded.**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Model 1** | **Model 2** | **Model 3** | **Model 4** | **Model 5** | **Model 6** |
| EPI | 0.003 | 0.003\* | 0.002 | 0.002 | 0.003\* | 0.002 |
|  | (0.002) | (0.002) | (0.002) | (0.002) | (0.002) | (0.002) |
| Term Year | -0.01 | -0.011 | -0.011 | -0.036 | -0.039 | -0.041 |
|  | (0.007) | (0.007) | (0.007) | (0.029) | (0.029) | (0.029) |
| Term Year X Term Year |  |  |  | 0.005 | 0.005 | 0.005 |
|  |  |  |  | (0.005) | (0.005) | (0.005) |
| Government Party | 0.064\*\*\* | 0.274\*\* |  | 0.064\*\*\* | 0.283\*\* |  |
|  | (0.023) | (0.140) |  | (0.023) | (0.139) |  |
| EPI X Government Party |  | -0.003 |  |  | -0.003 |  |
|  |  | (0.002) |  |  | (0.002) |  |
| Alternation: |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| pre OPP - now OPP |  |  | -0.043 |  |  | -0.042 |
|  |  |  | (0.029) |  |  | (0.029) |
| pre OPP - now GOV |  |  | -0.011 |  |  | -0.013 |
|  |  |  | (0.033) |  |  | (0.033) |
| pre GOV - now OPP |  |  | -0.113\*\*\* |  |  | -0.115\*\*\* |
|  |  |  | (0.033) |  |  | (0.033) |
| Seat Share | -0.078 | -0.088 | -0.042 | -0.077 | -0.087 | -0.038 |
|  | (0.069) | (0.072) | (0.070) | (0.069) | (0.072) | (0.070) |
| Extreme Left | 0.01 | 0.005 | -0.001 | 0.01 | 0.005 | -0.002 |
|  | (0.025) | (0.026) | (0.025) | (0.025) | (0.026) | (0.025) |
| Extreme Right | -0.04 | -0.043 | -0.025 | -0.04 | -0.043 | -0.024 |
|  | (0.026) | (0.026) | (0.026) | (0.026) | (0.026) | (0.026) |
| Manifesto Entropy | -0.869\*\*\* | -0.885\*\*\* | -0.826\*\*\* | -0.872\*\*\* | -0.889\*\*\* | -0.830\*\*\* |
|  | (0.122) | (0.126) | (0.121) | (0.122) | (0.125) | (0.120) |
| Emphasis on Macroeconomics | -0.004\*\* | -0.004\*\* | -0.004\*\* | -0.004\*\* | -0.004\*\* | -0.004\*\* |
|  | (0.002) | (0.002) | (0.002) | (0.002) | (0.002) | (0.002) |
| Country: |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Spain | 0.056\* | 0.058\* | 0.060\* | 0.059\* | 0.061\* | 0.063\* |
|  | (0.033) | (0.035) | (0.033) | (0.033) | (0.035) | (0.032) |
| Greece | 0.166\*\*\* | 0.161\*\*\* | 0.162\*\*\* | 0.163\*\*\* | 0.158\*\*\* | 0.158\*\*\* |
|  | (0.060) | (0.061) | (0.059) | (0.060) | (0.061) | (0.059) |
| Portugal | 0.183\*\*\* | 0.182\*\*\* | 0.196\*\*\* | 0.186\*\*\* | 0.186\*\*\* | 0.201\*\*\* |
|  | (0.030) | (0.032) | (0.031) | (0.030) | (0.032) | (0.031) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Constant | 0.999\*\*\* | 0.969\*\*\* | 1.025\*\*\* | 1.048\*\*\* | 1.022\*\*\* | 1.082\*\*\* |
|  | (0.180) | (0.181) | (0.175) | (0.187) | (0.188) | (0.182) |
| *Variance component:* |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Constant (party label) | 0.001\*\*\* | 0.001\*\*\* | 0.001\*\*\* | 0.001\*\*\* | 0.001\*\*\* | 0.000\*\*\* |
|  | (0.000) | (0.000) | (0.000) | (0.000) | (0.000) | (0.000) |
| Residual | 0.014\*\*\* | 0.013\*\*\* | 0.013\*\*\* | 0.014\*\*\* | 0.013\*\*\* | 0.013\*\*\* |
|  | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) |
| N | 192 | 192 | 192 | 192 | 192 | 192 |
| Log-likelihood | 136.139 | 137.181 | 139.432 | 136.559 | 137.697 | 139.996 |
| AIC | -244.277 | -244.361 | -246.865 | -243.118 | -243.394 | -245.992 |
| BIC | -198.672 | -195.499 | -194.745 | -194.255 | -191.274 | -190.615 |

*Notes*: Multilevel regression models with random intercepts on party label. Omitted reference category for alternation: *pre GOV - now GOV*. Omitted reference category for country: *Italy*. Parties holding less than 3 percent of parliamentary seats are excluded. This corresponds to 9 MPs in the Greek parliament, to 19 MPs in the Italian Chamber of Deputies, to 7 MPs in the Portuguese parliament, and to 11 MPs in the Spanish Congress of Deputies. Statistical significance: \* p<0.1, \*\* p<0.05, \*\*\* p<0.01.

**Figure A7. Difference in expected manifesto-questions dissimilarity between government and opposition parties, as a function of the Economic Performance Index. Robustness checks: Parties holding less than 3 percent of parliamentary seats are excluded.**



*Notes*: Marginal impact estimated on the basis of Model 5.

**Table A7. Analyses of issue dissimilarity between parties’ manifestos and parliamentary questions (Greece, Italy, Portugal and Spain, 2000-2015). Robustness checks: Parties holding less than 4 percent of parliamentary seats are excluded.**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Model 1** | **Model 2** | **Model 3** | **Model 4** | **Model 5** | **Model 6** |
| EPI | 0.003\* | 0.005\*\* | 0.003\* | 0.003\* | 0.004\*\* | 0.003\* |
|  | (0.002) | (0.002) | (0.002) | (0.002) | (0.002) | (0.002) |
| Term Year | -0.007 | -0.007 | -0.008 | -0.024 | -0.029 | -0.030 |
|  | (0.007) | (0.007) | (0.007) | (0.030) | (0.029) | (0.029) |
| Term Year X Term Year |  |  |  | 0.003 | 0.004 | 0.004 |
|  |  |  |  | (0.005) | (0.005) | (0.005) |
| Government Party | 0.067\*\*\* | 0.331\*\* |  | 0.067\*\*\* | 0.342\*\* |  |
|  | (0.024) | (0.147) |  | (0.024) | (0.148) |  |
| EPI X Government Party |  | -0.003\* |  |  | -0.003\* |  |
|  |  | (0.002) |  |  | (0.002) |  |
| Alternation: |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| pre OPP - now OPP |  |  | -0.047 |  |  | -0.046 |
|  |  |  | (0.030) |  |  | (0.030) |
| pre OPP - now GOV |  |  | -0.011 |  |  | -0.013 |
|  |  |  | (0.033) |  |  | (0.033) |
| pre GOV - now OPP |  |  | -0.117\*\*\* |  |  | -0.118\*\*\* |
|  |  |  | (0.033) |  |  | (0.033) |
| Seat Share | -0.084 | -0.102 | -0.058 | -0.083 | -0.102 | -0.056 |
|  | (0.079) | (0.084) | (0.080) | (0.079) | (0.084) | (0.080) |
| Extreme Left | 0.025 | 0.018 | 0.017 | 0.025 | 0.018 | 0.016 |
|  | (0.029) | (0.031) | (0.029) | (0.029) | (0.031) | (0.029) |
| Extreme Right | -0.047\* | -0.050\* | -0.031 | -0.047\* | -0.050\* | -0.03 |
|  | (0.028) | (0.029) | (0.029) | (0.028) | (0.029) | (0.029) |
| Manifesto Entropy | -0.926\*\*\* | -0.959\*\*\* | -0.880\*\*\* | -0.928\*\*\* | -0.964\*\*\* | -0.883\*\*\* |
|  | (0.130) | (0.136) | (0.129) | (0.130) | (0.136) | (0.129) |
| Emphasis on Macroeconomics | -0.002 | -0.003 | -0.002 | -0.002 | -0.003 | -0.002 |
|  | (0.002) | (0.002) | (0.002) | (0.002) | (0.002) | (0.002) |
| Country: |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Spain | 0.054 | 0.057 | 0.059 | 0.056 | 0.06 | 0.062 |
|  | (0.038) | (0.042) | (0.038) | (0.039) | (0.042) | (0.038) |
| Greece | 0.181\*\*\* | 0.177\*\*\* | 0.177\*\*\* | 0.179\*\*\* | 0.175\*\*\* | 0.174\*\*\* |
|  | (0.065) | (0.065) | (0.064) | (0.065) | (0.065) | (0.064) |
| Portugal | 0.199\*\*\* | 0.202\*\*\* | 0.211\*\*\* | 0.201\*\*\* | 0.204\*\*\* | 0.215\*\*\* |
|  | (0.034) | (0.037) | (0.035) | (0.034) | (0.037) | (0.035) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Constant | 0.940\*\*\* | 0.901\*\*\* | 0.964\*\*\* | 0.974\*\*\* | 0.941\*\*\* | 1.005\*\*\* |
|  | (0.190) | (0.192) | (0.185) | (0.197) | (0.199) | (0.192) |
| *Variance component:* |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Constant (party label) | 0.001\*\*\* | 0.002\*\*\* | 0.001\*\*\* | 0.001\*\*\* | 0.002\*\*\* | 0.001\*\*\* |
|  | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) |
| Residual | 0.013\*\*\* | 0.013\*\*\* | 0.013\*\*\* | 0.013\*\*\* | 0.013\*\*\* | 0.013\*\*\* |
|  | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) |
| N | 173 | 173 | 173 | 173 | 173 | 173 |
| Log-likelihood | 122.814 | 124.282 | 126.142 | 122.999 | 124.577 | 126.436 |
| AIC | -217.628 | -218.564 | -220.283 | -215.998 | -217.155 | -218.872 |
| BIC | -173.482 | -171.265 | -169.831 | -168.699 | -166.702 | -165.267 |

*Notes*: Multilevel regression models with random intercepts on party label. Omitted reference category for alternation: *pre GOV - now GOV*. Omitted reference category for country: *Italy*. Parties holding less than 4 percent of parliamentary seats are excluded. This corresponds to 12 MPs in the Greek parliament, to 25 MPs in the Italian Chamber of Deputies, to 9 MPs in the Portuguese parliament, and to 14 MPs in the Spanish Congress of Deputies. Statistical significance: \* p<0.1, \*\* p<0.05, \*\*\* p<0.01.

**Figure A8. Difference in expected manifesto-questions dissimilarity between government and opposition parties, as a function of the Economic Performance Index. Robustness checks: Parties holding less than 4 percent of parliamentary seats are excluded.**



*Notes*: Marginal impact estimated on the basis of Model 5.

**Table A8. Analyses of issue dissimilarity between parties’ manifestos and parliamentary questions (Greece, Italy, Portugal and Spain, 2000-2015). Robustness checks: Parties delivering less than 18 parliamentary questions in a given year are excluded.**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Model 1** | **Model 2** | **Model 3** | **Model 4** | **Model 5** | **Model 6** |
| EPI | 0.001 | 0.002 | 0.001 | 0.001 | 0.002 | 0.001 |
|  | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) |
| Term year | -0.013\*\*\* | -0.013\*\*\* | -0.011\*\* | -0.059\*\* | -0.060\*\*\* | -0.059\*\*\* |
|  | (0.005) | (0.005) | (0.005) | (0.023) | (0.023) | (0.023) |
| Term Year X Term Year |  |  |  | 0.008\*\* | 0.008\*\* | 0.009\*\* |
|  |  |  |  | (0.004) | (0.004) | (0.004) |
| Government Party | 0.063\*\*\* | 0.242 |  | 0.061\*\*\* | 0.257\* |  |
|  | (0.020) | (0.151) |  | (0.020) | (0.149) |  |
| EPI X Government Party |  | -0.002 |  |  | -0.002 |  |
|  |  | (0.002) |  |  | (0.002) |  |
| Alternation: |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| pre OPP - now OPP |  |  | -0.033 |  |  | -0.031 |
|  |  |  | (0.026) |  |  | (0.025) |
| pre OPP - now GOV |  |  | 0.063\*\* |  |  | 0.061\*\* |
|  |  |  | (0.028) |  |  | (0.028) |
| pre GOV - now OPP |  |  | -0.047\* |  |  | -0.049\* |
|  |  |  | (0.028) |  |  | (0.028) |
| Seat Share | -0.136\*\* | -0.138\*\* | -0.135\*\* | -0.134\*\* | -0.135\*\* | -0.132\*\* |
|  | (0.058) | (0.059) | (0.061) | (0.057) | (0.059) | (0.060) |
| Extreme Left | 0.008 | 0.005 | 0.014 | 0.007 | 0.005 | 0.013 |
|  | (0.020) | (0.020) | (0.020) | (0.019) | (0.020) | (0.020) |
| Extreme Right | -0.048\*\* | -0.048\*\* | -0.046\*\* | -0.050\*\* | -0.050\*\* | -0.046\*\* |
|  | (0.022) | (0.022) | (0.023) | (0.022) | (0.022) | (0.022) |
| Manifesto Entropy | -0.825\*\*\* | -0.834\*\*\* | -0.817\*\*\* | -0.834\*\*\* | -0.844\*\*\* | -0.824\*\*\* |
|  | (0.099) | (0.100) | (0.099) | (0.098) | (0.099) | (0.098) |
| Emphasis on Macroeconomics | -0.004\*\*\* | -0.004\*\*\* | -0.004\*\*\* | -0.004\*\* | -0.004\*\*\* | -0.004\*\* |
|  | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) | (0.001) |
| Country: |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Spain | 0.072\*\*\* | 0.071\*\*\* | 0.065\*\*\* | 0.079\*\*\* | 0.078\*\*\* | 0.073\*\*\* |
|  | (0.024) | (0.024) | (0.024) | (0.024) | (0.024) | (0.024) |
| Greece | 0.057 | 0.055 | 0.058 | 0.056 | 0.053 | 0.057 |
|  | (0.045) | (0.045) | (0.044) | (0.044) | (0.045) | (0.044) |
| Portugal | 0.142\*\*\* | 0.141\*\*\* | 0.131\*\*\* | 0.146\*\*\* | 0.144\*\*\* | 0.136\*\*\* |
|  | (0.026) | (0.026) | (0.027) | (0.025) | (0.026) | (0.027) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Constant | 1.078\*\*\* | 1.062\*\*\* | 1.099\*\*\* | 1.145\*\*\* | 1.129\*\*\* | 1.164\*\*\* |
|  | (0.124) | (0.126) | (0.122) | (0.127) | (0.128) | (0.124) |
| *Variance component:* |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Constant (party label) | 0.001\*\*\* | 0.001\*\*\* | 0.001\*\*\* | 0.001\*\*\* | 0.001\*\*\* | 0.001\*\*\* |
|  | (0.000) | (0.000) | (0.000) | (0.000) | (0.000) | (0.000) |
| Residual | 0.007\*\*\* | 0.007\*\*\* | 0.007\*\*\* | 0.007\*\*\* | 0.007\*\*\* | 0.006\*\*\* |
|  | (0.000) | (0.000) | (0.000) | (0.000) | (0.000) | (0.000) |
| N | 183 | 183 | 183 | 183 | 183 | 183 |
| Log-likelihood | 187.58 | 188.258 | 190.897 | 189.616 | 190.441 | 193.295 |
| AIC | -347.16 | -346.516 | -349.794 | -349.232 | -348.883 | -352.591 |
| BIC | -302.227 | -298.374 | -298.443 | -301.09 | -297.531 | -298.03 |

*Notes*: Multilevel regression models with random intercepts on party label. Omitted reference category for alternation: *pre GOV - now GOV*. Omitted reference category for country: *Italy*. Parties delivering less than 18 parliamentary questions in a given year are excluded. Statistical significance: \* p<0.1, \*\* p<0.05, \*\*\* p<0.01.

**Figure A9. Difference in expected manifesto-questions dissimilarity between government and opposition parties, as a function of the Economic Performance Index. Robustness checks: Parties delivering less than 18 parliamentary questions in a given year are excluded.**



*Notes*: Marginal impact estimated on the basis of Model 5.