

## Reviews

---

*A sociological history of Christian worship.* By Martin D. Stringer. Pp. viii + 268.  
Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005. £40 (cloth), £16.99 (paper).  
0 521 81955 5; 0 521 52559 4; 13 978 0 521 81955 8; 13 978 0 521 52559 6  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S002204690621813X

This book sets out to be a history of Christian worship with a difference. Martin Stringer's field is anthropology and sociology, but, as an undergraduate, he had the opportunity to study liturgy in the theology faculty at Manchester in the days when Kenneth Stevenson and Richard Burton offered a very popular liturgy course at no cost to the university. Stringer is appreciative of the teaching, but notes that the syllabus was heavily text-based – as indeed were most liturgy courses in that era. This study purports to be from a very different perspective, namely, with the recognition that liturgy texts were for worship, and thus performance. After a brief history of the study of liturgy as a discipline, Stringer concludes that today liturgical studies mainly fall into three categories: historical study of rites, such as Stevenson's work on marriage rites; those of a more social and cultural approach, such as Susan White's study on women in worship; and those broader studies such as James White's *Brief history of Christian worship*. Stringer then turns to discuss some postmodern exponents on discourse, such as Foucault and Bourdieu, before setting out his own intention of telling a broader story of worship, with concern beyond the text, looking at performance, devotion and the story of more ordinary members of the congregations. The history is set forth in chapters covering 300 years at a time (though not hard and fast), with kaleidoscopic key themes of discourse, from text and context, to public space, hegemonic worship of empires, cosmological Christianity, devotional discourse, humanistic discourse and globalisation of worship.

Like many books of extravagant promise, this book whets the appetite but the author then fails to deliver the goods. To begin with the treatment of the material is extremely uneven, with worship not at all being the main focus of some chapters; the reader is left wondering whether sacred space, the spread of Christianity or modern mission is the real subject under scrutiny. Second, the work which promises to deliver beyond the text is in fact almost entirely based on secondary sources, some of which are now superseded. There is a certain irony in discussing postmodern writers, only to present a grand narrative based on other grand narratives; indeed, at times the book reads like a summary of the *Grove Liturgical Studies* series, with a few liturgical classics thrown in for good measure. Missing are the personal diaries and accounts (other than Egeria) which are absolutely central if the views of the ordinary Christian really are to be reflected. Third, there is too much that is dated and misleading. Few liturgical scholars would attempt single-handed to write a history of

worship covering so many dimensions over such wide a span of history. The reason is that worship studies – textual, contextual, together with the relevant study on church architecture, popular devotion, shifts in theological thinking and cultural factors – are so intricate now, that no one person has expertise in all areas for all periods. Such a venture as Stringer envisages is the work of a team of writers. For example, chapter ii, which looks at pre-Nicene material, centres on 1 Corinthians, the Didache, Ignatius, Justin Martyr, i.e. the Apostolic Tradition. The use to which Stringer puts the social setting of these documents is no startlingly new discovery; it is now common to most liturgical scholars of the early period. The difference is that the latter are usually more thorough in their discussion than Stringer. He cites the commentary by Niederwimmer, but nothing by Milavec. Whether the Didache is the result of a number of sources or a single document with an inner consistency does affect our understanding of the community from which it came and the implications of the text. Nathan Mitchell's important essay in the collection edited by Jefford (1995) would also be crucial to Stringer's discussion. But discussion of the social setting and the nature of the community (sociological) is certainly not an excuse for misreading the text; *pace* p. 45, Didache does not relate the bread and wine to the body and blood of Christ. There is no discussion in this chapter of the crucial and important early Syrian sources, particularly the Apocryphal Acts, and so a whole dimension of early worship is missing. Chapter iii expresses the outdated view that Charlemagne imposed the Roman rite on the Frankish kingdoms – the recent work by Yitzhak Hen demonstrates the fallacy of this old story, but Stringer has relied on older, more general histories. Likewise his sources on Byzantine architecture are outdated. The dating of Wesley's *The Sunday service* to 1748 must be the publisher's misprint, but Yates and Adelman show that surpliced choirs were common after the mid-1850s, not only after 1900. And why the accident of grammar of 'spirit' in the Odes of Solomon, not mentioned before, suddenly appears without explanation in the chapter on contemporary worship, remains an enigma.

This book was a brave undertaking, but it has so many inaccuracies and outdated information as to make it dangerous. Arthur Couratin, who taught the old comparative method of liturgy for many years at both Oxford and Durham, used to say, 'Read the liturgical texts, and you will then see why the textbooks are wrong.' This book amply illustrates his point. There are many recent works, such as Theodore Vial's *Liturgy wars*, which integrate ritual studies, cultural and political setting, theological background and liturgical text with much greater success and accuracy. What Stringer intended to do is excellent, but it needs to be done again, in a series rather than one book, with consistent focus, full use of primary sources and with academic rigour.

YALE DIVINITY SCHOOL AND INSTITUTE OF SACRED MUSIC

BRYAN D. SPINKS

*Simon Magus in patristic, medieval and early modern traditions.* By Alberto Ferreiro. (Studies in the History of Christian Traditions, 125.) Pp. xi + 371 incl. 28 figs. Leiden–Boston: Brill, 2005. €89. 90 04 14495 1; 1573 5664  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906228136

The true identity of the man known as Simon Magus is a matter which has long been debated and may never be solved. To trace the legend, on the other hand, is

a far simpler process. As a result of his behaviour in the Acts of the Apostles (viii.9–24), where he is first mentioned as a sorcerer who offers Peter money in order to obtain his divine powers, Simon Magus' name gave rise to the term 'simony'. In the second century Justin Martyr saw him (or Simon of Gitta) as the founder of Gnosticism; and his antics in the apocryphal Acts of Peter and the Passion of Peter and Paul led to his association with the dog who addressed him with a human voice (and thus with dogs in general), and with his attempt to fly and his consequent fall. A little later Irenaeus of Lyons introduced his companion, Helena 'the whore'. Thanks largely to Irenaeus' *Adversus haereses* and the Pseudo-Clementine Homilies and *Recognitiones*, he came to be regarded as the protoheretic, at the start of a pseudo-apostolic succession which ran parallel to the apostolic one, radiating imposture, lust and evil. Although other elements and associations were occasionally added, these were the main ingredients of the figure who appeared in that immensely successful thirteenth-century compilation, the *Legenda aurea* of Jacob of Voragine.

Alberto Ferreiro examines this tradition in many of its ramifications. Besides appearing in the work of various church Fathers, such as Jerome and Vincent of Lérins, Simon Magus is to be found in medieval Ireland and England, notably in Aelfric's Passion sermon and the Blickling Homilies, and, as the original impostor, he was sucked into anti-Islamic polemics by Embrico of Mainz and other writers in the twelfth century (who drew an obvious comparison between the Prophet's Night Journey and Simon Magus' efforts to fly). Some time later Simon Magus was mentioned in a sermon by Vincent Ferrer on St Peter, and he appears in a thirteenth-century stained glass window of the cathedral of León and in a seventeenth-century altar relief in the cathedral of Oviedo. In the last two cases, Ferreiro argues, the source was probably the *Legenda aurea*.

However promising the title and the subject of Ferreiro's study, the result is disappointing. The book consists of fifteen articles, fourteen of which have been published previously. The absence of any attempt to adapt the articles to the narrative one might expect of a book on a single theme means that they are highly repetitive. They are also amateurishly discursive and rambling, and are not even always of much relevance to the subject. Chapter ii, for example, is a (now outdated) bibliographical survey of the New Testament Apocrypha, in which Simon Magus is hardly mentioned at all. Nor is Ferreiro always reliable. In his chapter on Simon Magus and the Prophet Muhammad he writes (p. 221) that 'in earlier centuries heresiologists defined Islam as pagan' while 'in the high Middle Ages the prevailing opinion emerged that it was instead a heresy'. In fact the situation was far more complex. Eastern Christians had long associated the Arabs with the Jews, and John of Damascus, early in the eighth century, saw Islam (in the words of John V. Tolan to whom Ferreiro refers repeatedly), not as 'a new religion but the last in a long line of deviant Christianities'. Although this book does contain some interesting information as well as an extensive bibliography, what Ferreiro has to say could far better have been concentrated in a single article than spread out to cover more than 350 pages. As it stands the book does little credit either to the publisher or to the series.

*The written Gospel.* Edited by Markus Bockmuehl and Donald A. Hagner. Pp. xxvi + 360. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005. £45 (cloth), £18.99 (paper). 13 978 0 521 83285 4; 10 0 521 83285 3; 13 978 0 521 54040 7; 10 0 521 54040 2

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906238132

This volume – an advanced-level ‘Cambridge Companion to the Gospels’ in all but name – offers a well-conceived and clearly focused collection of essays on early Christian Gospels. It includes useful overviews of aspects of the origin and composition of these texts, as well as some of the reactions that they met and some of the developments to which they led in the second century and beyond. The book is in three parts. The first (‘Before writing’) addresses the origins of the Gospels – the use of the word ‘gospel’ in Herodian Judah (William Horbury), the gospel that Jesus proclaimed, and the development from eyewitness memory through the transmission of oral tradition to written narratives. The second (‘Writing the four Gospels’) focuses on the canonical Gospels. It includes essays on how each canonical evangelist composed his Gospel, as well as discussions of their genre and audience. Also in this section is a real gem of an essay by Morna Hooker on the importance of their beginnings and endings for the interpretation of each Gospel as a whole. The third section (‘After writing’), on the early reception history of the Gospels, contains essays on Jewish reactions to the Gospels (James Carleton Paget), pagan reactions as exemplified by Celsus (Loveday Alexander), the writing of other Gospels that did not come to be accepted in the canon (Christopher Tuckett), the emergence of the four-fold Gospel (Ron Piper) and the development of a Christian tradition of gospel commentary (Marcus Bockmuehl). Many essays offer magisterial surveys of recent scholarship; some give accessible introductions to topics that their authors have discussed at more length elsewhere. There is relatively little by way of new research, but the authority with which most contributors write means that there is much to be learned by scholars and by advanced students, most especially when the contributors cover ground not often included in many treatments of the Gospels. Here particular attention may be given to the essays from section three, and to Horbury’s magisterial and groundbreaking survey of the Greek and Aramaic vocabulary of ‘gospel’. He demonstrates that Jews in Herodian Judea were likely to have been familiar with both groups of words, and that this terminology had a higher profile in Judean circles, both non-Christian Jewish and Christian, than has been appreciated. The editors are to be congratulated for producing a book that is much more than the sum of its parts, and a worthy tribute to Graham Stanton, to whose scholarship and example the volume is dedicated. A bibliography of Stanton’s publications to date is included as an appendix.

UNIVERSITY COLLEGE,  
OXFORD

ANDREW GREGORY

*The formation of the early Church.* Edited by Jostein Ådna. (Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament, 183.) Pp. xii + 460. Tübingen: Mohr (Siebeck), 2005. €99. 3 16 158561 0; 0512 1604

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906248139

The volume under review consists of fourteen essays resulting from a conference of Scandinavian New Testament and patristic scholars held in Stavanger, Norway,

in June 2003. Its title is intentionally general but just about succeeds in capturing the broad range of subjects covered. The book is divided into four parts. Part I consists of three essays broadly related to the subject of the 'Parting of the ways'. Part II comes under the somewhat cumbersome title 'Developments of and contacts between early Christian communities and authority and power structures within them as reflected in the New Testament'. Part III is entitled 'Issues relating to the New Testament canon'; and part IV, 'Early Christian developments beyond the New Testament'. Most of the essays are helpful and thorough engagements with individual topics. Attention might be drawn to Mikael Telbe's discussion of the role of the temple tax in Jewish-Christian division; to Anders Klostegaard Petersen who gives a helpful account of the *status quaestionis* in the debate about the split between Christianity and Judaism; to Reidar Hvalvik who argues vigorously for a view of Paul's letters as evincing the idea of a unified ecclesiology; and Mikael Isacson and Matli Myllykoski who present helpful essays on aspects of the Ignatian correspondence. Most of the essays lack originality but can be consulted profitably for the overviews they provide. The English translations are generally good and the editor has provided a useful opening essay in which he summarises all fourteen contributions.

PETERHOUSE,  
CAMBRIDGE

JAMES CARLETON PAGET

*Late ancient Christianity*. Edited by Virginia Burrus. (A People's History of Christianity, 2.) Pp. xviii + 318 incl. 2 frontispieces and 52 ills + 10 colour plates. Minneapolis: Fortress, 2005. £35. 0 8006 3412 8

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906258135

In his foreword to this book Paul Janz, general editor of *A People's History of Christianity*, notes that the series breaks new ground by looking at Christianity's past from the vantage point not of the Church conceived of as a 'hierarchical-institutional-bureaucratic corporation' but rather from the perspective of the 'laity, the ordinary faithful, the people'. 'Their religious lives, their pious practices, their self-understandings as Christians ... this is the unexplored territory in which we are here setting foot' (p. xiii). Later on in the same foreword he goes on to acknowledge that quite a lot has already been done in this area and that the series will 'showcase the current state of the discipline and plot a trajectory into the future' (p. xv).

In her opening essay, 'Shifting the focus of history', Virginia Burrus fleshes out some of Janz's comments, here in relation to late antiquity. She explicitly rejects the discipline of the history of the early Church as 'patristics' with its primary concern being a study of the writings of the church Fathers and its implicit narrative being one of the triumphant move towards a well-honed doctrinal uniformity and an established hierarchy: 'Traditionally, ancient Christianity has been approached as either a religious institution or a doctrinal orthodoxy defined by the tension between a center and its unruly margins' (p. 22). Such a view of things leaves out too much, not least an appreciation of the rich diversity of early

Christian practices and beliefs, manifest amongst the people in specific local settings.

The volume is divided into three parts. Part I is entitled 'Hierarchy and subversion'. Here Elizabeth Clark looks at asceticism, class and gender, claiming amongst other things that asceticism's levelling tendencies did not entirely break the ancient world's class and status codes. In an essay which looks closely at a number of the apocryphal Acts, Judith Perkins shows how various groups of Christians were seeking through fictional narratives to construct and position themselves in the world. All such narratives seek to challenge the social, hegemonic claims of the elite but in sometimes quite different ways, she argues. In the final essay in the section, Robin Darling Young looks at the subject of martyrdom as exaltation and asks why martyrdom accounts took on an importance which did not accord with the relative infrequency of actual martyrdom. The spectacular quality of martyrdoms obviously played a role but so also did the way in which martyrdoms reinforced scriptural interpretation and *vice-versa*.

In part II, 'Local practices', a variety of issues are covered ranging from children's play and toys through baptismal rites and architecture to food and private chapels. Heavy emphasis is placed upon on what one might call the Christian's private domain, often seen, particularly when it pertained to such things as private chapels, as a challenge to the hierarchy.

The final part is entitled 'Identity at the boundaries'. Harry A. Maier, in an essay which more than almost any other in the collection takes up the rhetoric of a people's history, seeks to show how the household provided a potential haven for proscribed groups: 'The fact of their suppression and the studied efforts of the antiheretical Theodosian legislation to avoid reference to their meeting places as churches is evidence of the emergence of competing religious topographies in antiquity.' In a clear and well constructed piece on Jewish Christians, Judaizers and anti-Jewish polemic, Charlotte Fonrobert attempts to show in a variety of ways and in contradistinction to what one might call the official record, as witnessed in Christian anti-Jewish polemic, that '(i)n a certain sense ... the parting of the ways never really did take place decisively in late antiquity, or only did so by political fiat when one religion gained imperial power'. The final essay, by David Frankfurter, is entitled 'Beyond magic and superstition'. Frankfurter sets himself first the task of analysing the way in which elite sources sought to censure the magical and the heathen as inauthentic, noting in the process how in such criticism ideas associated with Roman understandings of superstition are often used to describe those who are censured; and secondly attempts to get behind the magical and other sources to the religiosity to which they give evidence.

This is a helpful set of essays which forms a suggestive introduction to an expansive and important enterprise. Much of what can be written about the people's Christianity in late antiquity is, on account of the sources, necessarily speculative. What popular evidence exists is minimal and complex and oftentimes, as is witnessed in the volume under review, one is forced to mirror-read elite texts to gain an insight into forms of popular piety. There is much talk in this book of the richness of the evidence available but in fact more often than not what we have is somewhat pallid and unsatisfactory. Early church history is not properly named patristics for the reasons Burrus states and an acknowledgement of the importance of the need to take account of non-elite forms of Christianity is necessary. But such acknowledgement

will not always lead to a straightforwardly unproblematic reconstruction of the sentiments of the majority in their full diversity. Given this, it is a pity that the volume lacks a purely methodological essay.

PETERHOUSE,  
CAMBRIDGE

JAMES CARLETON PAGET

*Christus, Kosmos, Diatribe. Themen der frühen Kirche als Beiträge zu einer historischen Theologie.*

By Karl-Heinz Uthemann. (Arbeiten zur Kirchengeschichte, 93.) Pp. xiii + 665.

Berlin–New York: Walter de Gruyter, 2005. €148. 3 11 018428 1

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906268131

Here are thirteen essays, as I count them, which have all appeared under other imprints elsewhere from 1982 onwards; they are usefully drawn together under the general heading of ‘contributions to an historical theology’. By this the author intends us to understand a disinterested account of the development of doctrine, and in particular of the points at which dilemmas have occurred and choices proved divisive. The Council of Chalcedon with Leo’s Tome and its reception, is one such point and three essays deal with it, with John Grammaticus’ (‘the impious grammarian from Caesarea’, according to Severus) defence of the council and a couple of other defences from the time of Justinian. We continue with essays on the anthropological model in Christology with special reference to Maximus the Confessor and there is a piece on Justinian. An essay on the depiction of Christ in the early Byzantine period and its relation to Christology introduces a secondary theme of this collection: style and language. Anastasius the Sinaite, Eunomius the Anomean, Severian of Gabala and Augustine have essays devoted to them in this connexion. The final piece, well worth having if somewhat remote in theme from the rest, is a summary account of what we may know and what we may not surmise about Cosmas Indicopleustes. All the essays deserved to be drawn together and represented, as they are here so admirably. The author is good at taking up what might seem an unimportant point and showing its real significance in the whole context; the attention given to less well-known themes and authors renders the collection of special use. This is a fine example of the genre ‘historical theology’, whose utility to theology and church life as a whole he emphasises in his foreword. He is quite right.

SKELMANTHORPE

LIONEL WICKHAM

*The parting of the ways. The Roman Church as a case study.* By Stephen Spence.

(Interdisciplinary Studies in Ancient Culture and Religion, 5.) Pp. vii + 404.

Louvain–Dudley, MA: Peeters, 2004. €4 (paper). 90 429 1336 3

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906278138

According to Stephen Spence, in this revised version of his dissertation, the so-called parting of the ways between Jews and Christians took place very early in Rome. The Christian Church there had always consisted of a Gentile Christian and Jewish Christian component. For the former there had from the beginning existed an inclination to become an eastern cult, separate from the synagogue; for the latter, the inclination had, in the main, been to remain as a sect within Judaism. Spence

argues that quite early on aggravation for separation had been present and this had been stimulated further by the expulsions of some, but not all, Jews, by Claudius in AD 49, an expulsion that probably resulted from some dispute over Christian claims (Suetonius' famous, and much controverted, reference to 'impulsore Chresto'). Paul's letter to the Romans witnesses to the tensions between Jewish and Gentile Christians (for Spence the Church consisted of separate house churches, mixed in character, but maintaining a loose fellowship) but nowhere hints at ongoing membership of the synagogue in Rome. Such separation had led some Christians, of Gentile origin, to attempt to sever themselves in all respects from their Jewish heritage, a point that Paul seeks to redress in his letter. The fact that Nero was able to identify the Christians as a separate group and persecute them and this only seven years after the writing of Romans, is further proof of this early separation, as is the lack of evidence of any tension between Jews and Christians in later Christian documents of Roman provenance, such as 1 *Clement*, the *Shepherd of Hermas* and Ignatius' *Epistle to the Romans*.

This is a clearly written book which builds upon and interacts with the already extensive literature on early Roman Christianity. Spence makes a lot of certain sociological models in the presentation of his thesis but not much of it seemed very illuminating. A distinction between cult and sect is simply another way of talking about non-separation and separation from the mother religion and does little but restate the problem under discussion. It is by no means clear that Gentile Christians entering an ostensibly Jewish movement, as Christianity in Rome must have been at the beginning, would have felt the need to become an oriental cult separate from the synagogue. There is simply no evidence to support this position. It is, I would suggest, relatively uncontroversial to posit a split between non-Christian Jews and the community devoted to the worship of Christ quite early on in Rome. That must be the implication of the Neronian persecution. But whether we can extrapolate from the situation in the capital of the Roman empire to other communities elsewhere is unclear, although Spence does not attempt to do this (except by implication: his sociological model would imply the possibility of such early splits everywhere).

At a time when scholars are keen to speak of non-separation between Christians and Jews and question the validity of the metaphor of 'the parting of the ways', Spence's book could be said to make a number of salutary observations. The book constitutes a useful addition to the literature.

PETERHOUSE,  
CAMBRIDGE

JAMES CARLETON PAGET

*Holy bishops in late antiquity. The nature of Christian leadership in an age of transition.* By Claudia Rapp. (The Transformation of the Classical Heritage, 37.) Pp. xii + 346 incl. frontispiece. Berkeley–Los Angeles–London: University of California Press, 2005. £32.50. 0 520 24296 3

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906288134

In this fascinating and thought-provoking book, Claudia Rapp draws upon a wide array of patristic, hagiographical, legal and epigraphic sources to challenge a number of traditional assumptions regarding the changing status of the bishop in the increasingly Christian world of late antiquity. Rejecting Weber's polarised



contrast of institutional and charismatic authority, Rapp reassesses the role of the bishop and the relationship between bishops, holy men and secular elites in the late Roman empire, and proposes a tripartite model of episcopal leadership, which better expresses the interaction of what she defines as the bishop's pragmatic, spiritual and ascetic authority (part I). Rapp places particular emphasis upon ascetic authority, which in her model represents 'the focal point at the interconnection between spiritual and pragmatic authority' (p. 18). Asceticism both prepared an individual to receive the Spirit and revealed those who possessed spiritual authority, for bishops no less than for holy men, while personal ascetic authority in turn legitimised the bishop's possession of the pragmatic authority of his episcopal office.

The great strength of this new model, as Rapp herself states, is that 'the combination of these three kinds of authority – spiritual, ascetic and pragmatic – provides the analytical tools that allow the study of bishops and holy men within the same cultural, religious, social and political context' (p. 18). Asceticism was not necessarily regarded as incompatible with ecclesiastical office and worldly engagement. Indeed, ascetic experience was often viewed as a valuable qualification for clerical service, and a number of monks became priests and bishops, despite their reluctance which would become a *topos* of hagiography. Yet tensions did arise between episcopal authority and the authority of the holy man, particularly concerning the right to teach, to offer intercession and to impose penance. As Rapp demonstrates, these tensions, which are visible in the controversy between Cyprian and the confessors of Carthage and in the Novatian and Donatist Schisms, did not originate from conflicts over the importance of ascetic values and moral virtue to the bishop, which moderate and rigorists alike upheld. Rather, the debates revolved around 'the definition of the nature of episcopal leadership and the relative importance of spiritual, ascetic and pragmatic authority in this context' (p. 97), and the issue of whether Christian authority rested in the individual or was inherent within the clerical office would continue to divide the Church for centuries.

Rapp then extends this comparison of bishops and holy men also to include the civic elites from whose numbers bishops were often drawn (part II). Within the framework of her tripartite model of episcopal authority, Rapp here returns to several long-debated questions regarding the social status and activities of bishops in late antiquity. While a few bishops did come from humble backgrounds, most fourth-century bishops were of curial origins, with senatorial bishops emerging in the late fourth and particularly in the fifth century. This conclusion is hardly new, but Rapp develops in detail the comparison between the public activities of bishops and the traditional behaviour of the Greco-Roman civic elite, including the construction of buildings, the distribution of food, the care of prisoners and their role as representatives of their communities before the imperial power. As she observes, the difference between the bishops and the secular elite lies less in their specific actions and more in their expressed motivation, and bishops did therefore remain distinct from the wider civic aristocracy. Rapp dismisses the now widely rejected claim of several older scholars that the powers given to bishops in the legislation of Constantine turned the bishops into functionaries of the state, and also challenges the similarly dated explanation of the rising importance of the bishop by reference to a so-called 'decline of the *curiales*'. She prefers to set that rise against the background of the increasing Christianisation of the late Roman world and the concentration of

civic power in fewer and fewer hands. The development of the role of the bishop was a gradual process throughout the period from Constantine to Justinian, a process that in her epilogue Rapp traces through the shifting hagiographical presentation of holy bishops 'from model Christians to model citizens' (p. 290).

Certain aspects of Rapp's model of episcopal authority do need to be handled with some caution. Thus, although Rapp acknowledges that 'spiritual authority conferred through ordination is what ultimately sets bishops apart from martyrs and holy men' (p. 98), she has chosen to omit from her book any detailed discussion of the development of the episcopal office as an institution. This omission, which also extends to the role of bishops in the great doctrinal controversies of the fourth and fifth centuries, reflects Rapp's emphasis on the similarities rather than the differences between bishops and holy men, and it is by no means self-evident that ordination was as she asserts 'primarily a confirmation of preexisting qualifications, whether spiritual or social, and only in the second place the bestowal of a license to a greater scope of activities and/or the conferral of additional spiritual powers' (p. 166). Rapp's insistence in her introduction upon the need for 'a study that deemphasises the reign of Constantine' (p. 13) likewise requires some qualification. Her own argument is in fact restricted solely to the impact of Constantine's episcopal legislation, and her entire book can equally be read as an eloquent testimony to the vast influence that the conversion of Constantine did of course exert upon the development of the Christian Church.

Most important, despite the impressive breadth of sources which Rapp cites, her conception of ascetic authority as the nexus uniting the bishop's pragmatic and spiritual authority derives almost exclusively from an ideal concept of the episcopate presented within a limited corpus of patristic and hagiographical texts. The authors upon whom she depends, particularly the Cappadocians, John Chrysostom, Augustine and Jerome, were all men who shared a strong interest in asceticism, and this in turn raises the question to what extent the concept of the episcopate presented in the writings of these exceptional individuals can be taken as representative of the wider Church. The model that Rapp presents is unquestionably of great value, but, as she herself would agree, more work is still required to achieve her stated aim 'to reinsert into their contemporary conceptual framework the thousands of bishops who were discharging their duties, for better or for worse, throughout late antiquity' (p. 22).

CHRIST CHURCH,  
OXFORD

DAVID M. GWYNN

*Ordained women in the early Church. A documentary history.* Edited and translated by Kevin Madigan and Carolyn Osiek. Pp. xv + 220 incl. 16 figs. Baltimore–London: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 2005. £32. 0 8018 7932 9  
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906298130

This is a collection, accompanied by a brief introduction and sufficient commentary to guide the student or general reader, of all of the evidence for ordained women in the period before AD 600 which the authors believe to exist from the Greek- and Latin-speaking worlds. The arrangement of the translations separates women deacons or deaconesses from presbyters, and further subdivisions distinguish eastern

from western evidence, and literary texts and inscriptions from canon and secular law. The relevant New Testament texts and patristic commentaries on them are also given a separate chapter. The utility of the collection might be questioned: it appears only a few years after Ute E. Eisen's *Women officeholders in early Christianity: epigraphical and literary studies* (Collegeville, MN 2000; German edn 1996), which is in some ways a more comprehensive survey (since its remit is wider than just ordained officeholders) and has fuller annotation, bibliographies and indexing. However, the new publication has the advantages of quoting the literary sources more fully than Eisen (who excluded the literary sources for women deacons altogether) and of a clearer layout which allows individual items of evidence to be easily identified. Among a few small errors it is worth mentioning that *cheirotonein* does not mean 'literally, to lay on hands' (p. 111) and that on p. 146 the distinction between the orders of widows and deacons, which the authors rightly insist upon, is undermined by an inadvertent use of the word 'widows' where 'deacons' is meant. The inclusion of so many passages from Tertullian in the evidence for women presbyters (pp. 174–81) is odd, since his concern in most of these is with teaching and other kinds of ministry and not specifically with ordained office; perhaps the passages should have been placed with Pliny and the *Shepherd of Hermas* (pp. 25–7) in a chapter on specifically 'early' evidence; most of the evidence, both literary and epigraphic, for ordained women is of course from the fourth century or later. The authors support the hypothesis that the letter Q following *episcopa* in the (unique) inscription mentioning a *[vene]rabilis fem[ina] episcopa* is the first letter of the woman's name (p. 193); the alternative that it is the beginning of the formula *quae vixit* ... is not mentioned. And is this inscription really Roman, as the authors claim? Eisen (*Women officeholders*, 199–200), states that it is Umbrian, as does J. Ysebaert in 'The deaconesses in the western Church of late antiquity and their origin', in G. J. M. Bartelink and others (eds), *Evlogia: mélanges offerts à Antoon A. R. Bastiaenson* (Steenbrugge 1991), 421–36 at p. 433, which is not mentioned. Another useful if short article absent from the notes, which in this case is also omitted by Eisen, is Sr Teresa (Joan White), 'The development and eclipse of the deacon-abbess', *Studia Patristica* xix (1989), 111–16.

LEYTON

GRAHAM GOULD

*The past is prologue. The revolution of Nicene historiography.* By Thomas C. Ferguson. (Supplements to *Vigiliae Christianae*. Texts and Studies of Early Christian Life and Language, 75.) Pp. xiii + 226. Leiden–Boston: Brill, 2005. €97.90 04 14457 9; 0920 623X

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906308135

This is an interesting book with a rather misleading title. Fully aware of the problems created by categories such as 'Arian', 'heresy' and 'orthodoxy' in understanding fourth-century Christianity (ch. i), Ferguson focuses his attention on 'the church historians writing as members of religious communities, Nicene and non-Nicene, attempting to reconstruct the past to conform to their own, current, historical realities' (p. 9). In this light, he places a new emphasis on the role of Eusebius of Caesarea (ch. ii) as the defender of Origen and the school of Caesarea (*Ecclesiastical history* vi–vii), although his argument becomes somewhat strained when he seeks

to interpret Eusebius' Panegyric Oration on the Church at Tyre (*Ecclesiastical history* x) and his account of the Council of Nicaea in the *Life of Constantine* as likewise defined by Eusebius' defence of his own theological tradition. More valuable to students and scholars alike is the importance that Ferguson rightly places upon several less studied historical writers of the fourth and fifth centuries who shared with Eusebius a strong emphasis upon community identity. Thus both the anonymous 'Arian' Chronicler who was used as a source by the *Chronicon paschale* (ch. iii, with the text helpfully presented in an appendix) and the 'Eunomian' Philostorgius (ch. v) defined their own communities in terms of continuity from the 'school of Lucian', a school that it might be argued is no less a construct than 'Arianism' itself. Ferguson also explores the parallels between Philostorgius and the Nicene Rufinus of Aquileia (ch. iv), for in their presentation of emperors and in their construction of their heroes (Aetius and Eunomius, and Athanasius, Basil of Caesarea and Gregory of Nazianzus respectively) these two church historians drew upon very similar methodologies to construct very different theological and community traditions. However, while these chapters on individual authors represent this book's primary strength, Ferguson's overall argument is nowhere near as comprehensive as his title might suggest. Possibly due to the limitations of the dissertation from which the book originated, several crucial elements in the development of Nicene historiography have been omitted from Ferguson's study. He is of course aware that the construction of the 'Arian Controversy' visible in Rufinus derived from Athanasius, but he gives only a very brief account of that construct (pp. 57–61), and never examines in detail how Rufinus and his successors used and adapted their Athanasian model. Likewise, Ferguson offers only a passing reference to Gelasius of Caesarea, whose possible influence on Rufinus remains open to more debate than Ferguson is prepared to admit (p. 88). And the relationship between Rufinus and the later Nicene historians Socrates, Sozomen and Theodoret, historians who had their own particular interpretations of Christian identity and whose dependence upon Rufinus was certainly not uncritical, needs considerably more attention than Rufinus has provided (pp. 168–9). This book is thus far from complete as an assessment of Nicene historiography, and Ferguson's conclusion that 'one additional way to explain the hegemony of Nicene orthodoxy is to examine how Nicenes wrote their history' (p. 170) awaits further investigation. But Ferguson has without question taken an important step towards making such an assessment possible in the future.

CHRIST CHURCH,  
OXFORD

DAVID M. GWYNN

*There is no crime for those who have Christ. Religious violence in the Christian Roman empire.* By Michael Gaddis. (Transformation of the Classical Heritage, 39.) Pp. xiv + 398. Berkeley–Los Angeles–London: University of California Press, 2005. £32.50. 0 520 24104 5

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906318131

Michael Gaddis tackles a host of stories and ideas which circle around religious violence in late antiquity, spanning the age of persecution to the fifth-century councils of Ephesus and Chalcedon. He looks at the persecution of Christians by pagan emperors, and then shows how the language and paradigms of persecution

and martyrdom continued to be claimed by Christians who were pursued in the Constantinian era and beyond for heresy. There is extensive consideration of the history of the Donatists which in turn leads to an examination of Augustine's attitude towards coercion as a tool to convert and correct heretics. Chapters v and vi explore the violence of holy men, from the perspectives of sympathisers and of opponents, and chapters vii and viii consider episcopal violence, the rhetorical opposition between tyrant-bishops and holy bishops and the proceedings of councils. This is a lucidly written and interesting book. Some of it covers familiar ground (such as Augustine on coercion, amply explored by Peter Brown), and deals with canonical texts and examples (such as Libanius' elephantine monks). However, Gaddis goes beyond this in his exploration of the contrast between the violence of so-called extremists, arising from zealous anger and self-confident belief in their own orthodoxy, and the violence of 'the centre', grounded in the desire of the Roman authorities to maintain unity and order in the empire. He also reveals the perverse variety of late antique violence and its victims: some Circumcellions wielded clubs for beating only and some went a step further and armed themselves with swords for real blood-letting; violence was committed against buildings and objects as much as against people. Although this is not a work of comparative history, Gaddis frequently, and sometimes to great effect, adduces later models and examples to counterpoint his theme. This book will be of interest to students of late antiquity and the early Church, but could also appeal to a more general audience. It is well-referenced and enjoys a comprehensive bibliography.

PETERHOUSE,  
CAMBRIDGE

SOPHIE LUNN-ROCKLIFFE

*Remains of the Jews. The Holy Land and Christian empire in late antiquity.* By Andrew S. Jacobs. (Divinations. Rereading Late Ancient Religion.) Pp. xiv + 249. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2004. \$55. 0 8047 4705 9  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906328138

In this revised version of a Duke dissertation, written under the supervision of Elizabeth A. Clark, Andrew S. Jacobs seeks to apply the insights of post-colonial criticism to the representation of Jews in the Holy Land in Constantinian and post-Constantinian literature. Central to his thesis is the contention that the imperial setting of these representations is fundamental to their interpretation.

The book is divided into two parts. Part I (chapters ii–iii) looks at what Jacobs terms 'discourses of knowledge'. 'The Jew' ranked high among the deviant figures of Christian discourse to be 'known' and thus controlled by Christians. As the Christian Holy Land rose in prominence, it served the function of Chidester's 'frontier zone', a complex site within which we find Christian authors producing knowledge about Jews in order to construct 'a comprehensive vision of Christianness' (p. 25). Different facets of this discourse are examined through the works of Eusebius of Caesarea, Cyril of Jerusalem and Epiphanius of Salamis. In chapter iii, on broadly the same theme, Jerome's use of Jewish expertise in his exegetical work and his justification of such a procedure are examined, and Jacobs skilfully shows the way in which Jerome's approach both disempowers and empowers the Jew.

The second part (chapters iv–v) of the book examines representations of Christian power in the Holy Land. To this effect chapter iv looks at the representation of Jews in a number of pieces of travel-writing (the anonymous work of the Bourdeaux pilgrim, Egeria, and the work of the Piacenza pilgrim). All of these writers, so Jacobs contends, in different ways ‘mold the contours of a sacred landscape into the site of Christian domination’ (p. 138). In chapter v, the last substantive chapter, Jacobs seeks to show how ‘Jerusalem was transformed into a site of simultaneous religious and political authority, through the benefaction of emperors and the settlement of monks, as well as the discovery and distribution of relics’ (p. 17). Jacobs argues that the attempt to appropriate, even to erase, knowledge of Jewish occupation of Jerusalem and association with it, again served in part to show up the potentially destabilising fact of a Jewish presence: ‘In Christian Jerusalem the trace of the Jewish other must constantly be remastered and reconquered, and it paradoxically repeats the threat of its own resistance and power’ (p. 191).

The book ends with a brief concluding chapter in which Jacobs seeks to show how his work contributes to the interminable debate about rhetoric and reality in the representation of the Jew in early Christian texts. It is Jacobs’s contention that such a distinction is not that helpful: ‘My understanding of Christian culture as imperial during this period should signal that the language of Christians was not incidental or without consequence: when imperial subjects speak authoritatively, we cannot dismiss it as “mere rhetoric”. Nor, however, can we benignly condone imperial Christian language as “merely reflective” of “real” conflict between Jews and Christians.’ After all, Jacobs avers, language is itself a site for the production of reality (p. 207).

This is a wide-ranging and well constructed book which seeks to argue a particular case with vigour and intelligence, and I fear that this slight review only hints at some of its many qualities. Some, of course, may find the author’s vocabulary gratingly jargonistic (‘totalising’, ‘discourse’, ‘appropriation’, ‘otherness’ etc. occur with considerable frequency) but this may simply be the consequence of examining the material in question from a particular ideological perspective. Others may take badly to the author’s employment of a very obvious hermeneutics of suspicion in which ‘no human utterance is seen as innocent’ (the words of Annia Loomba, quoted on p. 207). At a more prosaic level some may wonder why relevant Jewish literature is not examined. Jacobs answers this question by stating that too often such material is used as countertext, either to validate or refute Christian texts, and this has the effect of neutralising the Christian evidence, and in the process risks glossing over the effective power of colonialist discourse, and stripping Christian literature of its ideological impact. And in the end this clear answer to a searching question makes plain that this is a book principally interested in the issue of representation, or as Jacobs puts it elsewhere, here quoting Bhaba, ‘the mechanics of the constitution of the other’ (p. 208), the other obviously understood as the Jew. Whether such an approach really succeeds in integrating the problem of rhetoric and reality in the Christian representation of the Jew, even in its assertion about the reality-creating character of language, is a question. Some may think that it merely eschews the issue of authenticity on prior ideological grounds.

*Latin Christian writers in late antiquity and their texts.* By Mark Vessey. (Collected Studies, 837.) Pp. xii + 338 + frontispiece. Aldershot–Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2005. £60. 0 86078 981 0

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906338134

Patrology – to use the old term for a discipline much rechristened (or unchristened) – remains the most bookish of antiquarian pastimes, even where the term ‘heresy’ is gingerly replaced by ‘heterodoxy’ and the history of dogma by histories of ideas. The text abides; the canonised author functions still as a canon for the editing, attribution and explication of it; no wonder that Foucault, in ‘What is an author?’, credits Jerome with the invention of bibliography. As Vessey notes, the practice is attested or prefigured in a host of earlier sources; yet it is Jerome who furnishes matter here for two studies on the authority that an author can derive from his advocacy of a great precursor. He is Origen’s ‘brilliant understudy’ in essay IV; in the twelfth it is Erasmus who – transcribing Jerome’s recapitulation of a passage surviving only as a Eusebian quotation from Irenaeus – makes a vacant place for his own name in a tribute to the sanctity of texts. The polarity between humanism and biblicism, espoused today by some unsurprised students of the Renaissance, is exploded here, and again in essay XIII on the Benedictine Germain Morin, successor of the Maurists. Essay I, by contrast, records the attempt of a certain Rusticus to graft his own reputation on to that of another late Roman, equally famous nowadays only for not being famous. One of Jerome’s experiments in the new science of canonisation in the fourth century is the subject of essay VIII, ‘The forging of orthodoxy’, which finds Rufinus (or Vessey) sprinkling a pinch of Attic salt upon his claim to have been a victim of heretical imposture. Augustine, who distributed a surreptitious rejoinder to Jerome’s apology for apostolic subterfuge, is discovered in essay V to have renewed the attack discreetly in his *Confessions* and his treatise *On Christian doctrine*. Marrou plays Jerome to Peter Brown’s Augustine in the eleventh piece, where once again the question lies between those who affirm the sovereignty of the text and those for whom the text itself derives meaning only from its milieu. The vicissitudes of Augustine’s reputation can be traced in essays VI and IX, where Vincent of Lérins figures both as ‘Vincent’, a compiler of Augustinian maxims for the Council of Ephesus, and as ‘Peregrinus’, champion of a limited freedom against predestination in the name of catholic antiquity. Stock’s reading of the *Confessions* in a manner homologous with the writing of them is applauded (not without astute reservations) in the sixth piece, while in ‘Literacy and letteratura’ (essay III) Vessey seems to endorse Stock’s speculations on the interdependence of literacy and orality in the world that Rome converted through the Scriptures. The oral promulgation of a new canon of laws is illustrated in a learned article on the *Collectio sirmondiana* (essay X). The style throughout is subtle but lucid; Vessey can always find his own meaning in English without a neologism, nor does he cultivate the reticular syntax or capricious punctuation of other ‘literary theorists’ whose inanities the patrologist rightly shuns.

CHRIST CHURCH,  
OXFORD

MARK J. EDWARDS

*The mysticism of Saint Augustine. Rereading the Confessions.* By John Peter Kenney. Pp. xv + 160. New York–London: Routledge, 2005. £16.99 (paper).  
 0 415 28832 0; 0 415 28833 9  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906348130

While another book analysing the movement of the *Confessions* demands more than a little justification, this latest proves itself worthy by taking up the far-reaching Augustinian themes of contemplation and mystical ascent. John Peter Kenney is professor of religious studies at St Michael's College, Vermont, and the main concern of his latest work is to show how Augustine's description of divine ascent both employs and distances itself from the imagery and taxonomy of the paradigmatic Neoplatonic account. Composed in part to explain his ecstatic yet episodic experiences of self-transcendence, Augustine's *Confessions* are unsurpassably rich when contrasting Christian and Neoplatonic understandings of ascent, the body, silence, the divine and the boundaries of the human soul. Kenney divides this volume into three main sections. The first, 'Flight to the alone' (pp. 15–46), is a helpful summary of Neoplatonic mysticism. This is an essential gambit, as Plotinus supplied generations of philosophers, theurgists, intelligentsia and mystics with a canon by which to measure and thus make vivid varying accounts of their encounters with the divine. More to the point, in such transcendentalism Augustine finds both his cure to Manichean materialism and the tools with which to describe his first encounter with *Idipsum*. The second section, 'The vision at Ostia' (pp. 47–86), is an extended treatment of what Kenney considers the three main movements of divine ascendancy in the *Confessions*: vii.x.16 (overtly Platonic ecstasy), vii.xvii.23 (another similar attempt) and ix.x.25 (the shared Christian experience at Ostia). With its ability to incorporate the nobility of corporality and community, the Christian experience is depicted so as to show an 'acute concern for [Monica and Augustine] as persons. And it is this eternal wisdom that they attained at that moment of understanding, a personal One who calls from the eternity in which he abides' (p. 86). With that, Kenney rightly turns to books x–xiii as well as some later, pertinent passages found elsewhere. Whereas too many commentators unfortunately bifurcate the omni-biography of books i–ix from the rest of the *Confessions*, Kenney sees how books x–xiii form a 'theological coda' integral to the narrative of the first nine books and, in them, 'we hear the voice of their author as a participant in the confession, speaking out of the depths of fallen existence to God' (p. 87). Therefore, 'A living soul of the faithful' (pp. 87–145) treats the latter books of the *Confessions*, showing how the too often forgotten themes of contemplation, the iconic role of creation, the employment of the heart and affect, as well as the 'psychological immediacy', are inextricably woven throughout these more technical books.

CAMPION HALL,  
 OXFORD

DAVID VINCENT MECONI

*Les Virtuoses et la multitude. Aspects sociaux de la controverse entre Augustin et les pélagiens.* By Jean-Marie Salamito. (Collection Nominia. Essais et documents.) Pp. 351. Grenoble: Éditions Jérôme Millon, 2005. €29 (paper). 2 84137 168 9  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906358137

As the title hints, and as the author tells us, this book is a historical reflection with the aid of sociological concepts borrowed from Max Weber. This recourse



to sociological categories may be a help in interpreting social aspects of the evidence, but the use made here, especially of Weber's notion of 'elective affinities' (in his phrase borrowed from Goethe) also encourages undue haste. The central theme of the book, as the author tells us, illustrates the conflict, formulated in Weberian categories, of 'all virtuoso religiosity' and the official power of a 'grace-dispensing institution'. It concludes that 'in the perspective of the present essay, it may be said that Pelagianism is typically a project of Christian perfection for aristocrats', whereas Augustine's teaching is for a Christianity of the masses. This statement, like the book's argument, fails to distinguish between two very different (though not incompatible) arguments, and gains its plausibility from sliding too easily from one to the other: that the teaching of Pelagius and his followers was addressed mainly to an upper-class elite, and that the religion taught by them was a spirituality designed for an elite within the Christian community. Unlike the latter statement, the first has been widely shared among historians of the Pelagian movement for half a century or more. Pelagius, it is now generally agreed, was one of the many mentors of aristocratic families, and the work of his disciple Julian of Eclanum was even more specifically addressed to aristocrats. But the religion they preached was intended not for an elite, but for all Christians. Nothing could be clearer than that the demand for perfection in the letter addressed by Pelagius to the Christian aristocratic girl Demetrias, was intended for all. It was not a summons to an elite version of Christianity, but a universal demand for a Christianity more authentic than one 'in name only'. In the course of the fourth century Christian aristocrats had come to share the traditional values and life styles of their non-Christian fellows. That is what the Pelagian movement saw as objectionable. In a society in which Christianity had become so largely invisible, they wanted to reform the Church so that it would stand out as an elite in the society around it. Nominal Christianity was not enough, for anybody, not only for an elite. Salamito's treatment slides continually between representing Pelagian teaching as advocating a spirituality for an elite within the Church and Christianity conceived as the religion of an elite within Roman society. This unresolved ambiguity pervades what is a book rich in insights.

NOTTINGHAM

R. A. MARKUS

*Un Héritage de paix et de piété. Étude sur les histoires ecclésiastiques de Socrate et de Sozomène.*

By Peter Van Nuffelen. (*Orientalia Lovaniensia Analecta*, 142.) Pp. lxxx + 589.

Leuven–Paris–Dudley, MA: Uitgeverij Peeters/Departement Oosterse Studies, 2004. €70. 90 429 1541 2; 2 87723 830 X

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906368133

This weighty analysis deserves warm praise, and must become an important reference work for future students of Socrates and Sozomen. The reference tools constitute fifty pages of bibliography, seventy of appendices and eighty-four of indices. One appendix gives a plan of each of the *Histoires*; four more set out the sources and parallels more fully than is done anywhere else, a most valuable piece of work in an area where the surviving authors often overlap, and where important ancient sources available to them are now lost. Van Nuffelen sides with the sceptics about the use of Gelasius as a source. The *Index nominum* is professionally done, with

articulated subheadings in many cases (a few more would have been even better). All citations in text and notes can be located through a long *Index locorum*. The main text begins with a study of the two authors, their biography, education, the origin of the *History* concerned and the principles and prejudices embraced by each author. Both are compelling reading, but Socrates is particularly interesting: 'beaucoup moins neutre que l'on ne le croyait'. This is due to his commitments to Origen, Novatianism and the Constantinopolitan circles that opposed John Chrysostom: in the last he is definitely opposed to Sozomen. Van Nuffelen rejects both the later dating of Sozomen's *History* and the alleged partisanship for Pulcheria associated with it. Both writers, though often biased by their sources (notably Athanasius), are more prone to find virtue in heretics than the other historians of the ancient Church, all of whom hold important offices among the orthodox clergy. A further section elaborates 'La théologie de l'histoire', and accounts for the peace and piety in the book title: both writers envisage the Gospel as bringing universal peace through its fulfilment in the Christian empire, a vision traced back obviously to Eusebius, but further to Origen's response to Celsus; and they see the Christian empire as enabling the conversion of individuals and races to evangelical virtue ('*piété*'). Thirdly, Van Nuffelen turns to the literary *genre* of ecclesiastical history, including a useful comparison with the classical historians. Fourthly there is a detailed analysis of the historical and literary methods used by each author in composing his text. Finally, there is analysis, often original, of the sources available to the writers. This has valuable points to make about the sources for the early Arian conflict, Athanasius, Julian and the councils held at Constantinople in 381 and 383. Someone must soon get round to a new English version of these important church historians, and will have to have Van Nuffelen's book to hand.

UNIVERSITY OF ST ANDREWS

STUART G. HALL

*John Climacus. From the Egyptian desert to the Sinaite mountain.* By John Chrysavgis. Pp. xii + 258 incl. map and 7 ill. Aldershot–Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2004. £50. 0 7546 5040 5  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S002204690637813X

The stature of St John 'of the Ladder', *tis Klimakos*, latinised as 'Climacus', in eastern Orthodox monasticism is roughly equivalent to that of St Benedict in western monasticism. His legacy, however, is very different. Neither a monastic founder like Benedict, nor the author of a monastic rule, John Climacus holds his position in Orthodox monasticism through the popularity of the work from which he takes his name, *The ladder of divine ascent*, a summary of the ascetic life of the monk, conceived of as a ladder of thirty steps, leading from the foundations of the monastic life in renunciation, detachment and exile to union with God through stillness, prayer, *apatheia* and love; in between John discusses the virtues to be cultivated and the vices to be avoided. In present-day Orthodox monasticism, the *Ladder* is read aloud in church or refectory throughout Lent: this is certainly an ancient practice, though whether it goes back to the time of John himself (of which Chrysavgis has 'no doubt': p. 233) may be doubted. The *Ladder* has also been influential in western monasticism, and also been much read among the laity (the most quoted book after the Bible in the correspondence of Tsar Ivan the Terrible). Despite all this, very

little scholarly attention has been paid to it, save for the iconography found in illuminated manuscripts: there is no critical edition of the text (the variants in the available printed editions are not minor), and only one monograph – in German, nearly forty years old now, by the indefatigable Völker. There is, then, a real need for a serious study of Climacus, which is fulfilled by this book in a distinctive way. Originally an Oxford DPhil. thesis, already published more or less in that form, this book focuses on Climacus' understanding of what it is to be human – the very basis, from one perspective, of his ascetic teaching – and seeks to put this in the context of the development of Byzantine monastic asceticism. Chryssavgis is learned, and deeply sympathetic to his author. He begins by placing John in his historical context, candidly admitting that certainty is impossible, but inclining towards his flourishing in the first half of the sixth century. He stresses the importance for Climacus of the spirituality of the ascetics of the fourth-century Egyptian desert, as witnessed in the collections of their sayings, and their successors, especially in the sixth-century Gaza desert – Barsanuphios and John, and their disciple Dorotheos. He discusses, too, other influences – Evagrius, the author of the Macarian homilies, and Diadochos of Photike – but has little to say about the influence of classical philosophy, arguing with conviction that any such influence reached John indirectly, through Christian sources. This is, however, much more than an academic monograph, though it is rarely less than that: it is an introduction to a spiritual master for those who wish to learn from him how to pray, and find union with God in stillness and simplicity.

UNIVERSITY OF DURHAM

ANDREW LOUTH

*La Décrétale Ad gallos episcopos. Son texte et son auteur. Texte critique, traduction française et commentaire.* By Yves-Marie Duval (Supplements to *Vigiliae Christianae*. Texts and Studies of Early Christian Life and Language, 73). Pp. ix + 182. Leiden–Boston: Brill, 2005. €75. 90 04 14170 7; 0920 623X  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906388136

The *Canones synodi romanorum ad gallos episcopos* are notable for their considerable age and their defective Latin. They were edited many times and were customarily assigned to Pope Innocent I (401–17) or to his predecessor Siricius (384–99), that is, until Ernst Charles Babut claimed Pope Damasus I (366–84) as their author and declared this synodal text to be the oldest papal decretal. Duval supports this thesis, which over the years has had as many supporters as detractors. But in order to make the attribution as cast-iron as possible, and in contrast to Babut, he does not only trace the proximity of the *canon* to the decretals of Siricius or Innocent, but also wants to include a discussion of the whole spiritual environment of the pontificate of Damasus. After a review of the history of research from the first printing of the *canones* by Jacques Sirmond (pp. 1–7), and presentations of the history of transmission (pp. 9–18), of the edition and of the translation of the text (pp. 19–49), there follows a very detailed commentary (pp. 51–124). This opens up with *notes critiques* in which difficult problems in the critical apparatus are discussed. The actual commentary, ‘de nature essentiellement historique et doctrinale’, attempts to identify the sources which the author of the text might have had in mind. Parallels with Tertullian, Cyprian and Origen are frequently cited as well as those with certain biblical versions, which in the opinion of the author might have been disseminated by

Jerome. The final chapter is taken up with a discussion of Jerome's position as the pope's secretary which he held from 382 (pp. 125–38); on the basis of the close relationship between the pope and the church Father, Duval posits the authorship or at least a participation in the writing of the formulation of the *Canones* to Jerome, by means of which Damasus' authorship for these decretals is finally established. These conclusions do not convince because the claim that Jerome participated in the authorship of the *canones* is premised upon the view that Damasus is without doubt their author. And to this decisive question Duval is unable to bring any new arguments. The strange language of the text, which is not explained solely by reference to circumstances of transmission, and which shows absolutely no parallels with the language of Damasus' genuine letters, as well as the use of a vocabulary more characteristic of decretals of a later age, militate decisively against Damasus' authorship. Finally reference should be made to an oversight. The fragments of the collection of *Taufers* (not of von Thierhaupten, p. 15), bear the signature München, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek Clm 29550/1, not Clm 21053 (so pp. 15, 19): that is, the signature of the fifteenth-century manuscript from the monastery of Thierhaupten near Augsburg, from whose binding the remains of the collection of *Taufers* were released. Two appendices, one with contemporary texts, especially of Pope Siricius and Pope Innocent I, and the other containing the rhythmical endings of sentences, a fairly faulty bibliography as well as an index of sources, persons and items, bring the volume to a conclusion.

MGH MÜNCHEN

DETLEV JASPER

Gregory the Great, *Homélies sur l'Évangile*. Translation, introduction and notes by Raymond Étaix, Charles Morel and Bruno Judic. (Sources Chrésiennes, 485.) Pp. 493. Paris: Les Éditions du Cerf, 2005. €41 (paper). 2 204 07691 0; 0750 1978  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906398132

The critical edition of Gregory the Great's Homilies on the Gospels, prepared by the late Raymond Étaix, and published in 1999 was a landmark in several respects: it gave new insight (partly founded on the pioneering work of Antoine Chavassee) into the pope's liturgical preaching, into his editorial practice and his revisions of the delivered homilies, and their chronology. He distinguished two stages of the texts in the collection, one prior, the other posterior to revision. To his edition, lightly revised, accompanied by a French translation by the late *père* Charles Morel, Bruno Judic has added a long introduction and annotations. The former contains a summary of Étaix's editorial work and a substantial section on the *Nachleben* of the homilies – among the most widely known and utilised in the Middle Ages (Étaix examined some 450 manuscripts) – as well as general sections on the historical context and on Gregory's preaching. Apart from the startling claim which would certainly have puzzled, for instance, Augustine, that the Fathers were all agreed in their expectation of an imminent *eschaton*, this is generally helpful. With another volume containing the remaining twenty homilies of book II this edition will provide the critical text in a useful format and a welcome alternative to the available translations.

NOTTINGHAM

R. A. MARKUS

*Early Christian Ireland*. By T. M. Charles-Edwards. Pp. xix + 707 incl. 14 maps, 32 tables and 26 figs. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000. £45.00 521 36395 0

*Church organisation in Ireland A.D. 650 to 1000*. By Colmán Etchingham. Pp. viii + 538 incl. 5 maps. Maynooth, Co. Kildare: Laigin Publications, 1999. £34.00 9537598 0 6

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906408137

The publication of these two substantial books marks a watershed in early Irish history that is doubtless of greater significance than the more recent, though much delayed, publication of the first volume of the *New History of Ireland*, which they, and other publications, had largely superseded before it ever went to press. Between them they present us with more than 1,200 pages of closely argued, high quality research, yet they are very different books.

Charles-Edwards's book was conceived as a textbook, underpinning undergraduate teaching on Irish history between the conversion and the coming of the Vikings. The author begins, innovatively, but very wisely, by presenting a normative view of society *c.* AD 700. The decades around the turn of the seventh and eighth centuries have left us not only with the earliest collection of hagiography from these islands (Muirchú's 'Life of Patrick', Adomnán's 'Life of Columba', the various *Lives* of Brigit, not to mention English works such as the Whitby 'Life of Gregory', and the earliest *Lives* of Cuthbert, Wilfrid and Guthlac), but also the major collections of early Irish law, both secular and ecclesiastical. In his opening chapter Charles-Edwards, building on the work of Catherine Swift, takes the reader on a tour of Ireland seen through the eyes of Tirechán whose *Collectanea*, written at this period, purports to describe the journeys of St Patrick around Ireland. This device gives us a snapshot of the political geography of the island in Tirechán's time accompanied by a contemporary historical perspective. This tour is then followed by chapters covering communal organisation (chapter ii), lay and ecclesiastical, and social hierarchies (chapter iii). These three introductory chapters deal with an Ireland in which Christianity is firmly established and which has enjoyed some social and political stability for a number of decades. Chapters iv and v jump back into the more problematic fifth and sixth centuries and deal with the coming of Christianity and its context. The major question that hovers over this period is the extent to which the undocumented pre-Christian Iron Age resembled the world of the seventh century into which Christianity had introduced textual records. This most speculative section of the book is dealt with meticulously and although many questions remain unanswered the reader is left in no doubt as to why this should be.

After a brief discussion of the organisation of the Church (chapter vi), the second part of the book transforms itself into a research monograph and subsequent chapters deal with particular thorny issues. Chapter vii, 'Columba, Iona and Lindisfarne', is concerned almost entirely with British history and should be read by all students of the Anglo-Saxon and Scottish Churches, while chapter viii takes us further afield as it follows Columbanus and his disciples around the continent in an attempt to identify peculiar Irish contributions to mainstream late antique Christianity. Chapters ix and x deal with the related issues of the Paschal controversy and the primatial authority and their scope spans both Britain and Ireland. Charles-Edwards offers a solution to the problematic claims for primacy made by some texts

emanating from Kildare by suggesting, convincingly, that Kildare briefly held the primacy of the *Romani* party while Armagh remained in schism over the Easter question in the mid-seventh century. This section of the book, chapters vii–x, which will be of greatest interest to readers of this JOURNAL, is of great importance beyond the confines of Irish history and is, for example, essential reading for understanding the background to Bede's world.

The final section of the book deals with kingship and in particular with the Uí Néill dynasty and the kingship of Tara. Contrary to the paradigm established by scholars such as Byrne and Ó Córráin in the 1970s, which argued that the 'high-kingship' of Ireland was largely a fiction projected back into this period from the latter part of the Viking Age, Charles-Edwards argues that we should take the pretensions of the kings of Tara, from the sixth century at least, mostly members of the Uí Néill dynasty, seriously. This part of the book was the most surprising to encounter but the author makes a very strong case and it remains to be seen how his arguments will be received in the long run. There is a tendency for historians of both Britain and Ireland to look at their islands in isolation and to fail to appreciate how small they really are when compared to the European continent. Modern accounts of missionaries and warlords amongst the early Irish and Anglo-Saxons seem to owe much to the European experience of the opening up of Africa in the nineteenth century; Patrick living, and dying, like Mr Kurtz, in the Heart of Darkness. Simple recourse to the scale on our maps (and Charles-Edwards provides us with plenty of those) reminds us that our islands could be traversed, coast to coast, in two or three days hard riding if necessary. Frankish and Gothic generals could win and lose in a day whole provinces which covered more land than Ireland. It would be more remarkable if the political horizons of the sixth-century insular world were really circumscribed by a couple of hours at a walking pace.

Colmán Etchingham's equally important book is another kettle of fish entirely. By identifying terminal dates of 650 and 1000, Etchingham avoids the need for narrative by eliminating the controversies and transformations associated with conversion (and to a great extent the Paschal controversy) and Hildebrandine reform. He is also far more Hibernocentric than Charles-Edwards and this reviewer found himself constantly advising the pages in front of him that a glance across the Irish Sea to English hagiography or canons might have cast some useful light on the problems under discussion. This insularity also allows Etchingham to avoid the question of the tenth-century Benedictine reform, which it is hard to believe could have entirely passed Ireland by.

Etchingham focuses very strictly on church organisation and in doing so he divides his evidence into three categories: laws, hagiography and annals. Subsequent chapters deal with 'Models of authority', 'Models of jurisdiction', 'The reality of jurisdiction', 'Pastoral cares and dues', 'Paramonasticism' (i.e. penitentiary communities) and 'Monasticism in its primary sense'. The main section of the book closes with two chapters on *manaig*, the lay dependants of major churches, and the two appendices, which comprise a major reappraisal of the workings of the practice of clientage in early medieval Ireland, relate most closely to these. Etchingham's main thrust is that we should move away from the habit we have acquired of equating early Irish churches with monasteries. In his view, while most major 'church settlements' [his preferred term] may well have included a truly monastic component, the core cultic and economic centre of such settlements should

not, in itself, be seen as monastic. His methodology throughout is to try and make sense of the complex and often apparently contradictory canonical material and to test it against the hagiography and the annals. He is very careful to try and distinguish between the different periods of hagiographical production and to raise questions of the chronicle evidence, pointing out, as he has done elsewhere, that apparent changes in ecclesiastical practice may reflect the interests of the chroniclers as much as any real changes in church organisation.

All of this is very useful but Etchingham's book is incredibly difficult to read. In part this is doubtless due to the nature of the canon law which forms the core of his material but some of the fault must be laid at the door of his own style which at times verges upon the verbose and which at others seems to take caution to such extremes that he is not willing to hazard even straightforward interpretations. He also has the habit of referring back to early parts of the book, sometimes some chapters previously, with little or no recap so the reader is forced to hunt back for a more detailed explanation before he can progress. In short Etchingham, though clearly entirely on top of his material, has no empathy for the reader coming to it with less experience. Perhaps this book is not intended for a wide readership, which is a shame, but its prose is certainly in stark contrast to that of Charles-Edwards who is able to lead his readers through quite complex territory without sacrificing clarity. For most students and dilettantes, perhaps the most useful part of Etchingham's work is the historiographical survey in chapter ii. This is very thorough and those who know Etchingham will recognise the tone of his 'live performances' as he cuts a swathe through the literature, mowing down friend and foe alike. Colmán Etchingham is a judge from whom one might expect justice but not mercy.

UNIVERSITY OF ST ANDREWS

ALEX WOOLF

*Charlemagne. Empire and society.* Edited by Joanna Story. Pp. xix + 330 incl. 9 ill.

Manchester–New York: Manchester University Press, 2005. £16.99 (paper).

0 7190 7088 0; 0 7190 7089 9

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906418133

Recent additions to the ever-growing literature on Charlemagne have included a notable number of single-author studies, including those of Alessandro Barbero, Matthias Becher and Roger Collins, and with others awaited from Rosamond McKitterick and Janet Nelson. This volume, originating in a conference at Oxford in February 2000, takes a different approach: Joanna Story has assembled fifteen contributions by leading scholars, which examine key issues of the reign of Charlemagne from different perspectives and using different approaches. The result is a wide-ranging and uniformly strong collection of essays, with much to offer both students and specialists of the period. At the core of the book are four important essays on Charlemagne's government and aristocracy, the Church and the Carolingian renaissance (by Matthew Innes, Stuart Airlie, Mayke de Jong and Rosamond McKitterick respectively), which students will find especially helpful for their accessible presentation of recent research. Careful analysis of the written sources and their contexts offer the reader a new look at some familiar themes, including David Ganz's penetrating essay on Einhard, Roger Collins's analysis of the Lorsch Annals, the late Donald Bullough's discussion of the careers of Alcuin,

Hildebald and Arn and Janet Nelson's consideration of Charlemagne the man (and indeed whether biography is possible). Paul Fouracre's consideration of Carolingian denigration of the Merovingians reveals also how much recent work has improved our understanding of the first half of the eighth century. Essays by the late Timothy Reuter, Joanna Story and Neil Christie explore Charlemagne's influence beyond his realm and the implications of Carolingian relations with their eastern, Anglo-Saxon and Italian neighbours. While the essays focus upon Charlemagne, many of the contributions have wider implications or discuss a broader period than his reign; the impact of Charlemagne's subsequent reputation is also given due consideration. The archaeological contributions by Christopher Loveluck and Frans Verhaeghe (with Christopher Loveluck and Joanna Story) in particular span a far longer period: 700–1000, with glances back to late antiquity too. The inclusion of these two accessible essays on rural and urban settlements, and of Simon Coupland's careful analysis of the coinage of Charlemagne, is especially welcome, opening up the important archaeological and numismatic evidence and the widely-dispersed literature on these subjects to a wider audience. The volume is modestly illustrated with three maps and six black-and-white figures (accompanying only two of the papers). This doubtless helped to achieve the book's accessible price, but more substantial illustration would have further enriched this valuable essay collection.

NEWNHAM COLLEGE,  
CAMBRIDGE

ELINA SCREEN

*Ritual and the rood. Liturgical images and the old English poems of the Dream of the rood tradition.* By Éamonn Ó Carragáin. (The British Library Studies in Medieval Culture.) Pp. xxxii + 427 incl. 60 figs + 16 colour plates. Toronto–Buffalo: University of Toronto Press/London: The British Library, 2005. £50. 0 8020 9008 7; 0 7123 4875 1

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S002204690642813X

The bulk of this substantial volume (pp. 1–303) is devoted to a protracted exploration of the verbal and visual imagery of the monumental Anglo-Saxon stone cross at Ruthwell (Dumfreisshire). Particular stress is placed on its conceptual relationship to Roman liturgical practices, though an openness to Columban spirituality is also perceived. Much shorter sections treat the version of the Old English poem *Dream of the rood* that is found in the Vercelli Book (pp. 308–38) and the late Anglo-Saxon reliquary cross in Bruxelles, whose inscriptions include two verses from the same tradition (pp. 339–54); while an epilogue (pp. 355–71) tracks one of the key ideas – the evocation of the incarnation in the imagery of the crucifixion – forward to the work of John Donne. The resonance of the visual and poetic imagery of this rich tradition is abundantly demonstrated, as is the centrality of Roman culture to the thought-world reflected therein. Unfortunately, the pace of the work is so leisurely and the approach so diffuse – particularly in relation to Ruthwell – that many readers are likely to be overwhelmed rather than informed. The lengthy expositions of Roman liturgy and practice, the reporting of manifold previous views on divers aspects of the subject and the apparent determination to explore the exegetical possibilities of every detail, add up to a surfeit rather than a feast. Even the subheadings are overburdened: that of ch. v, section ix, for instance, is



‘Inculturation and unity from diversity (b): to follow Ninian by imitating the Vatican when it was inspired by St Martin’s at Tours’. Yet amidst the welter of exegetical exposition, the analysis floats curiously free of the history of the kingdom in which the Ruthwell Cross appears; indeed, major modern treatments thereof – ranging from Peter Hunter Blair, *The world of Bede* (1973), and A. P. Smyth, *Warlords and holy men* (1984), through N. Higham, *The kingdom of Northumbria* (1993), to D. Rollason, *Northumbria, 500–1100* (2003), and L. Alcock, *Kings and warriors, craftsmen and priests in northern Britain* (2003) – are conspicuous by their absence, even from the bibliography. This is an important and insightful book; but carefully pruned to about half its length (which would still have been over 200 pages), it would have made its case twice as effectively (as the shorter, sharper treatment accorded to the Bruxelles Cross demonstrates): as it is, the result is exhausting rather than exhaustive. (Those with limited leisure and stamina who are interested in the author’s views on such matters as the date and audience of the Ruthwell Cross will find them buried on pp. 213, 246–7, 296 [730x5].)

CANTERBURY

RICHARD GAMESON

*Arméniens et Byzantins à l’époque de Photius. Deux débats théologiques après le triomphe de l’orthodoxie.* By Igor Dorfmann-Lazarev. (Corpus Scriptorum Christianorum Orientalium, 609. Subsidia, 117.) Pp. xx + 326. Louvain: Peeters, 2004. €75 (paper). 90 429 1412 2; 2 87723 769 9  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906438136

In the early 860s the Byzantine empire began to recover its control over Asia Minor and in 863 Petronas, the brother of Bardas Caesar, crushed an Arab army under the command of Umar, emir of Melitene. These victories re-established Byzantine control over Asia Minor, and brought Armenia once again close to the Byzantine empire; indeed some Armenian territory was reincorporated in the empire. This engagement between Armenia and the Byzantines had important ecclesiastical consequences, for the Armenian Church did not accept the Synod of Chalcedon of 451; there had been no Armenian bishops there, and when eventually they learned about it they sided with those who rejected it, called by the Orthodox ‘monophysite’. One of Photios’s longest letters (*ep.* cclxxxiv in the critical edition) is addressed to Ašot, the Armenian ‘prince of princes’, on the subject of theopaschism, the central issue at stake between the Chalcedonians and non-Chalcedonians. Another letter of Photios’s – to the Armenian catholicos – survives in Greek, but a great deal more, including the representations of the Armenians, survives in Armenian. In this brilliant book, Igor Dorfmann-Lazarev gives the first thorough analysis of this remarkable encounter, carefully going through all the material and reconstructing the events to which it relates. There were two phases in the Byzantine-Armenian *rapprochement*: first of all, around 863, when a synod was held at Širakawan; later there were contacts during Photios’s second patriarchate. Most of the literary material concerns the synod, including what Dorfmann-Lazarev argues is a statement of the Armenian position, ascribed to Vahan, analysis of which is the central part of this book. The first encounter took place at the same time as Pope Nicholas I’s intervention in the question of Photios’s election as patriarch. Photios sought to use the Armenian question as a way of illustrating the world-wide

(‘œcumenical’) remit of the patriarchate of Constantinople, no mere subordinate of the pope. Perhaps for that reason Photios took an irenic line, making the Formula of Reunion of 433, agreed between Cyril and Alexandria and John of Antioch, the touchstone of Orthodoxy, and arguing that, though the Armenians reject Chalcedon, that in itself does not make them heretics, for they accept the first three œcumenical synods which, Photios argues, Chalcedon simply confirms. The Armenians took a similarly irenic line, using at least some of the language of Chalcedon. The work ascribed to Vahan (which seems to be in two parts, the former an earlier, reworked confession, to which a latter section has been added) is divided by an insertion which Dorfmann-Lazarev argues consists of the canons of the Synod of Širakawan. These are particularly concerned with the sincerity with which the more developed Christology of Chalcedon and the later synods is accepted or rejected, presumably intended to prevent opportunist conversion. Dorfmann-Lazarev also includes a discussion of the development of the non-Chalcedonian Christological language and its rendering into Armenian, and provides a lexical appendix. The book opens up an important, though little known, episode in ancient ‘œcumenical’ dialogue.

UNIVERSITY OF DURHAM

ANDREW LOUTH

*Johannes VIII. Päpstliche Herrschaft in den karolingischen Teilreichen am Ende des 9. Jahrhunderts.* By Dorothee Arnold. (Europäische Hochschulschriften. European University Studies, Ser. 23. Theology, 797.) Pp. 268. Frankfurt-am-Main: Peter Lang, 2005. £29.80 (paper). 3 631 53179 6; 0721 3409  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906448132

John VIII (872–82) was one of the most conspicuously active popes of the ninth century. His pontificate involved him closely in the politics of the late Carolingian empire, the evangelisation of the Slavs, the military defence of central Italy and high-profile ecclesiastical relations with Byzantium. At the same time his career was inescapably enmeshed in the factional politics of Rome, which ultimately led to his murder. Although his *Vita* is missing from the *Liber pontificalis*, John’s eventful career is documented in a long and detailed collection of his correspondence. Dorothee Arnold’s book takes advantage of this rich material to provide a valuable new study of the pontificate. It is not, however, intended as a biography. Readers are presented instead with a study of the pope’s political relationship with the kingdoms and rulers of the empire, structured as a series of detailed and geographically-organised case studies. Perhaps unsurprisingly, the pope’s dealings with Italy are illuminated most brightly, but the letters also contain a lot of information about the west and, to a lesser extent, east Frankish realms. Ultimately, Arnold shows that John frequently failed to impose his will on the succession disputes, matters of jurisdiction and episcopal elections which occupied much of his attention. At the same time, however, she argues that his insistent self-representation in letters, charters and synods was crucial in establishing and legitimising particular ways of thinking about papal authority. For example, she contends that papal descriptions of the imperial coronation of Charles the Bald (875) emphasised the ‘constitutive’ role of the pope in the ceremony with a view to establishing new precedent. Papal rhetoric

of this kind is methodically illuminated and documented. The text through which these arguments are threaded is systematic and highly detailed, to the extent that the analytical thrust of the book occasionally threatens to become submerged in information. The book's intense focus is impressive, but sometimes becomes a weakness: claims for the novelty of John's brand of papal self-representation would have carried more weight if the pontificate were placed in a broader chronological context. Nevertheless, this is a closely-argued and scholarly treatment of an important ninth-century figure, and its case studies will be a very useful starting point for historians interested in the politics of the period.

UNIVERSITY OF ST ANDREWS

SIMON MACLEAN

*The sacramentary of Ratoldus.* (Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, lat. 12052). Edited by Nicholas Orchard. (Henry Bradshaw Society, 116.) Pp. ccvi + 601 incl. 4 plates.

London: Boydell Press (for the Henry Bradshaw Society), 2005. £35.

1 870252 22 5; 0144 0241

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906458139

Jean Morin, Jean Mabillon, Edmond Martène, André Wilmart, Edmund Bishop, Victor Leroquais, Christopher Hohler, Derek Turner: the roll call of eminent scholars who have worked on this tenth-century codex attests to its significance. Whilst certain of its pontifical rites have been in print since the eighteenth century, including its version of the famous Second English Coronation Ordo, the entire work has not, and it is only thanks to Nicholas Orchard's careful and systematic editing that we now have easy access to this rich source. As Orchard makes clear in his introduction, this codex belongs to an elite group of manuscripts which fully combine a sacramentary with a pontifical: others in this group include both the Old Gelasian and Gellone Sacramentaries. *Ratoldus* was made, according to an entry in the calendar added over an erasure for 15 March, at the instigation of Ratoldus, abbot of Corbie (c. 972–86); palaeographical analysis confirms that the main part of the manuscript was written in the third or fourth quarter of the tenth century by three scribes in a similar style to the scribe who copied, c. 975, a sacramentary for use at the abbey of Saint-Thierry, Reims (Reims, Bibliothèque municipale, 214). Whether *Ratoldus* was copied at Corbie itself is by no means clear, but material was added there in eleven later hands, the last in the mid-twelfth century; *Ratoldus*'s later provenance shows that it remained at Corbie throughout the Middle Ages before entering the Maurists' collection in the seventeenth century.

It is an odd work to have emerged from late tenth-century Corbie, uniting two different liturgical collections: a Saint-Denis sacramentary and a Canterbury pontifical. Building on earlier scholarship, particularly that by Christopher Hohler, Orchard's careful analysis demonstrates how the text of the sacramentary part was based on one from Saint-Denis, which had been adapted for use by the canons of the Breton cathedral of Dol in the mid-tenth century, during their exile from Dol, as a consequence of the viking invasions in the 920s, first in Paris, and later at Saint-Symphorien, Orléans. He also follows Hohler in removing the likelihood of any direct connection between Ratoldus and the great ninth-century centre of sacramentary production, the abbey of Saint-Vaast, Arras; as he demonstrates,

whoever copied the material for the masses for the deposition and translation of St Vedastus seems not to have been very familiar with the liturgy of the cult, making several mistakes, including erroneously describing the feast of translation as the *natale*. He thus suggests that the Saint-Vaast material was added when the sacramentary was being copied for *Ratoldus*. The pontifical part, however, is based on an English model. Here *Ratoldus* has much in common with the earlier of the Canterbury pontificals, including Claudius I, the Lanalet and Sidney Sussex Pontificals, whilst the benedictional, as Andrew Prescott has shown, has many parallels with Æthelwold's benedictional. Orchard therefore suggests that the pontifical section was probably copied from a Canterbury book taken to the continent by Oswald, nephew of Archbishop Oda of Canterbury (941–58). But, as Orchard demonstrates, *Ratoldus* also includes material from the mid tenth-century Romano-German Pontifical; Orchard therefore revises Hohler's suggested date of compilation for the model of the pontifical-part from the 930s to the mid tenth century. Others have suggested that the Romano-German Pontifical was only introduced into England in the late tenth or early eleventh century, but Orchard argues that it had already influenced the Canterbury model for *Ratoldus*: he thus argues that the prayers for the consecration of the cemetery are 'the first English reworkings of the German original' rather than the antecedents for those included in the Romano-German pontifical, as Helen Gittos has recently suggested. Orchard's conclusions are convincing but he is too careful a scholar to make them clear-cut: other rites suggest that the Canterbury original underwent some reworking before its inclusion in *Ratoldus*. The rite for the election and consecration of a bishop is a hybrid of continental and English rites, and includes a specifically north-French petition. The *ordines* which I know best are those for penance; here Orchard shows the parallels between these rites and those which appear in the Canterbury pontificals, especially the early eleventh-century Claudius I pontifical (not Claudius III as per the guide to manuscripts cited in the collation tables, p. 443), but argues for an ultimately north French origin for these English rites. The Ash Wednesday rite for entering into penance is very similar to that in Claudius I; adducing evidence from the parallels with the rite in a little known late eleventh-century pontifical, probably from Arras (Boulogne-sur-Mer, Bibliothèque municipale, MS 84), Orchard thus argues for an originally north French origin for this rite. Similarly the rite for the reconciliation of penitents on Maundy Thursday shares several features with other English books of the period, notably the Egbert pontifical (c. 1000), but also shows north French influences. The result was a penitential liturgy which differed from that circulated in both the Romano-German Pontifical, and the 'north-central' rite, identified by Josef Jungmann and Mary Mansfield, and which seems to have evolved in England, under French influence, before the mid-tenth century.

Orchard holds the pontifical to be an exclusively episcopal book. He therefore goes against the grain of some recent work which has identified certain pontificals with monastic rather than episcopal churches. Orchard concludes that, given the inclusion of a pontifical, it is improbable that *Ratoldus* was originally intended for use within Corbie, but rather that it was composed for an unknown French bishop (hence the addition of the Saint-Vaast material) but was never, for some reason, presented to him. The later additions to the text made at Corbie were all to the sacramentary part, and not the pontifical, confirming that the pontifical had little relevance for this community.

As this review makes clear, Orchard's lengthy introduction is full of rich and thought-provoking details, which cast new light not just on *Ratoldus* but on the wider liturgical history of both northern France and England in the tenth century. The edition which follows is exemplary, as texts are systematically compared to both printed and manuscript sources. The result is a most welcome addition to the Henry Bradshaw Society's canon.

UNIVERSITY OF EXETER

SARAH HAMILTON

*Die Annales quedlinburgenses*. Edited by Martina Giese. (Monumenta Germaniae Historica. Scriptores Rerum Germanicarum in Usum Scholarum, 72.) Pp. 680. Hanover: Hahnsche Buchhandlung, 2004. €56. 3 7752 5472 2; 0343 0820 *JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906468135

Established in 936, the female canonry of St Servatius, Quedlinburg, was meant to cultivate the *memoria* (liturgical commemoration) of its founders, their ancestors and their descendants. The exalted position of those founders, however – King Otto I and his mother, Mathilda – set it apart: its abbesses were drawn from the royal family, its lands and buildings were increased by royal largesse and its precincts served as a regular stopping-place for the itinerant rulers and their retinues. By the death of its foundress in 968 St Servatius occupied an exalted status within the Ottonian kingdom, equalling if not surpassing that enjoyed by the Westphalian convent of Gandersheim (established by Otto I's great-grandparents) and epitomising the 'boom' in aristocratic female religious communities east of the Rhine. Among the best-known witnesses to Quedlinburg's cultic and political life is the historical record compiled there, known to modern scholars as the 'Quedlinburg annals' (*Annales quedlinburgenses*), newly edited and annotated here by Martina Giese. Although the late and fragmentary nature of the manuscript makes analysis of the text and its original production a complicated task, Giese suggests (following Robert Holtzmann) that the *Annals* were written in a series of stages during the first three decades of the eleventh century, drawing upon a broad range of earlier annalistic sources (in particular the now-lost *Hersfeld* and *Hildesheim annals*) for the period up to 1002, and contemporary observation, records and recollection for the subsequent three decades. In light of the work's clear origins at St Servatius, Giese also accepts (albeit with surprising hesitation) recent scholarly attribution of the work to a female author. As such, the *Quedlinburg annals* represent an important source of information not only for late Ottonian and earlier Salian rule in Germany, but for the way in which the (particularly tenth-century) past was remembered. In some ways it is a (female, monastic) counterpart to the contemporaneous (male, episcopal) *Chronicon* of Thietmar of Merseburg. The length of Giese's edition (680 pages) might appear excessive, given that only one late, incomplete manuscript of the *Annals* survives; indeed, Giese's text is largely the same as in Georg Pertz's original (1839) MGH edition. The volume's size, however, is justified by Giese's exhaustive introduction to the text: nearly 340 pages in length, it offers not only a definitive analysis of the *Annals*, but a valuable contribution to early medieval historiography in general. Giese cogently places the text within the political and cultural context of tenth- and eleventh-century Saxony, addressing the complicated

nature of its composition and authorship, its value as a witness to contemporary events, its role in the 'memorialisation' of the Ottonian dynasty and the preservation of the 'local' traditions of the community itself, and its use by subsequent historians, most particularly Thietmar of Merseburg and the so-called *Annalista Saxo*. At some points, Giese seems to be overreaching: her attempt to fill in the *lacunae* in our manuscript, for example, amounts to double extrapolation, since the supposed sources for the *Annals* must themselves be reconstructed from other, later texts. Nevertheless, Giese is to be commended for producing a volume that, in the best tradition of the MGH, weds sound textual scholarship with a wealth of historical insight.

SMITH COLLEGE,  
NORTHAMPTON,  
MA

SEAN GILSDORF

*Medieval marriage. Symbolism and society.* By David d'Avray. Pp. xii + 322 + erratum. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005. £60. 0 19 820821 9  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906478131

The basic problems that David d'Avray sets out to address in this impressive study are 'How, when, and why marriage symbolism became a force in the lay world.' The key, he suggests, lies in the marriage symbolism embedded in the sermons that laymen heard because, he argues, preaching was the primary means of mass communication available during the Middle Ages. Although it is clear that after the beginning of the thirteenth century the sermons of mendicant preachers dealt abundantly with themes that one way or another involved marriage, there is scant evidence that the laity heard very much about marriage from the pulpit prior to about 1200. What little they did hear was further limited by the meagre education of most of the early medieval clergy. D'Avray's analysis of the treatment of marriage in pre-1200 marriage sermons centres on three major symbolic ideas: indissolubility, bigamy and consummation. He finds that early medieval churchmen were seriously hampered in their efforts to enforce in practice the teachings of the Fathers of the Church and early medieval popes about indissolubility because the Church was unable to make good its claims to exclusive jurisdiction over matrimonial matters until the pontificate of Innocent III. Ecclesiastical concerns about bigamy focused not, as we might expect, on simultaneous marriage to more than one spouse, but rather on unions in which the wife had lost her virginal purity (whether in marriage or outside of it) to someone other than her husband prior to their marriage. The husband in such a situation could not be counted 'the husband of one wife' (Titus i.6) and he consequently became ineligible for ordination. Medieval marriage sermons, d'Avray finds, dealt with the sexual consummation of marriage primarily as a symbol of the union of Christ and the Church. Preachers informed their congregations of conclusions current among canonists and theologians that indissolubility rested upon sexual union of the partners. In consequence unconsummated marriages were incomplete and could be dissolved under appropriate circumstances. D'Avray bases his arguments upon an extensive array of manuscript and printed evidence that draws not only upon sermons, but also upon canonical texts and

commentaries, pastoral manuals and the records of the papal penitentiary. The eighty pages of documents, many freshly edited, that follow the text not only bolster d'Avray's arguments but also provide a helpful resource for other scholars concerned with medieval marriage symbolism and laity's understanding of it.

UNIVERSITY OF KANSAS

JAMES A. BRUNDAGE

*Voices in dialogue. Reading women in the Middle Ages.* Edited by Linda Olson and Kathryn Kerby-Fulton. Pp. xvii + 508 incl. 7 ills. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2005. \$50. 0 268 03717 5

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906488138

*Voices in dialogue* is a lengthy and ambitious volume of essays and responses, the aim of which is to encourage an interrogation of traditionally accepted methodologies within scholarly discourse by placing groups of its contributors in direct dialogue with one another. This, it is claimed, will serve to identify the perennial problems evinced by the notion of what constitutes 'evidence' and how that 'evidence' is used by the historian, literary or otherwise. The desired result is a scholarly rethink on how history is both conceived and promulgated. Ambitious indeed – and even more so for a volume which frequently rejects cohesiveness in favour of a disharmonious, sometimes heated, contention between contributors who fall into somewhat unbalanced groups of two, three or, in the case of those with a focus on *The book of Margery Kempe* (Watson, Riddy, Watson and Riddy, Gertz-Robinson, Wallace) five. Similarly, there is some inconsistency in the length of contributions, which vary between, for example, thirty-nine pages (Watson) and twelve (Beach), something which threatens at times to tip the volume into a potentially frustrating imbalance. Most texts focused on are, however, refreshingly extra-canonical or, at least, hover somewhere at the margins of the canonical: Augustine's correspondence with women (Conybeare, Vessey); the prayers of Anselm (Morrow, Bell); the *Epistolae duorum amantium*, sometimes ascribed to Heloise and Abelard (Jaeger, Constable, Jaeger); a series of unattributed homiles from the Benedictine community of Admont in Austria (Beach, Van Engen); the Czech *Wycliffite woman* (Thomas, Elliott); Birgitta of Sweden's *Sermo anglicus* (Zieman, Fassler); *The myrour of oure ladye* (Schirmer, Justice); *The examinations of Anne Askew* (Gerz-Robinson, Wallace). In addition, there is a stimulating interchange of ideas on women and Lollard theology (Somerset, Kirby-Fulton) and another which focuses on the creative intelligence of women in medieval thought (Blamires, Newman). Whilst very many of these essays offer new and arresting insights into issues concerning 'voices', authorship and literary texts, the dialogues between them and the responses are variable in their success, due in part to further inconsistencies in length and depth. Moreover, some essay responses themselves elicit further response (Jaeger on Constable; Watson and Riddy on themselves and each other), resulting in occasional circularity and reiteration. The main problem arising from this potentially unstable format is perhaps best identified by recourse to Riddy's observation in her response to Watson's argument regarding the authorial 'voice' within *The book of Margery Kempe*. According to Riddy, within Kempe's book the 'first and third persons' predominate; the second person 'you' is absent. In her concomitant conclusion, therefore, 'Where the actual reader is positioned is not clear' (p. 440), Riddy inadvertently identifies a very real sense of

the potential for readerly exclusion from the highly important debates being aired in this volume and the denial of the benefits of the type of 'recollection in tranquillity' which is provided by more conventional collection formats. That said, this is a problem easily overridden by the alert and proactive reader and *Voices in dialogue*, therefore, is to be welcomed as a pioneering attempt to offer contentious debate and nuance on a variety of thorny issues under a single cover.

UNIVERSITY OF WALES,  
SWANSEA

LIZ HERBERT McAVOY

*The Jews of Europe in the Middle Ages (tenth to fifteenth centuries). Proceedings of the international symposium held at Speyer, 20–25 October 2002.* Edited by Christoph Cluse. (Cultural Encounters in Late Antiquity and the Middle Ages, 4.) Pp. xvii + 512 incl. 53 ill. and 24 maps. Turnhout: Brepols, 2004. €60. 2 503 51697 1  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906498134

This book is the outcome of a conference held in Speyer in 2002 and sets out to present a comprehensive picture of the Jewish experience in Europe from c. 1000 to c. 1500. More than thirty articles by an impressive array of scholars are divided into five sections. The first, entitled 'Dimensions of the subject', seeks, according to the editor, to elucidate the themes 'which mark the special character of Jewish historical experience in Europe' (p. 17). In this section, and of special interest to this reviewer, one can find Anna Sapir Abulafia's 'Christians and Jews in the high Middle Ages: Christian views of Jews', which presents a brief overview of the changing attitudes of Christians towards the Jews in the later Middle Ages and the breakdown of the Augustinian attitude towards the Jews as the *testimonium veritatis*. The second section deals with some of the Jewish communities around the Mediterranean and is followed by the third which concentrates on the northern European communities. Commendable is the attempt to show the diversity of the Jewish experience in the Iberian peninsula, with separate studies on Al-Andalus, Aragon, Castile and Navarre. In the northern context, the contrast, made evident by the available evidence, between the communities in Germany and England is of great interest. The fourth section deals with social, economic and intellectual history, focusing on rabbinic *responsa*, money-lending, medicine and the role of Jewish women in business, community and ritual. Strange is the inclusion in this section of two otherwise interesting articles dealing with the iconography of synagogues in the Diaspora and on whether Yiddish should be considered a language in the Middle Ages. Noteworthy is the article by Haym Soloveitchik where he puts forward the thesis that the Jewish expertise in viticulture and abstention from initiating trade in Gentile wines in Germany led them to focus on extending credit to wine producers, which in turn made them an essential part of the German wine industry and helps explain their gravitation to money-lending in the later Middle Ages. The fifth section focuses on a few individual Jewries in northern Europe making use of archival material and archaeological evidence. The book includes a large number of illustrations and informative maps. Each essay in the volume is followed by suggestions for further reading and an abstract in Spanish, and there is a bibliography of works cited together with an index at the end of the volume.

BEN GURION UNIVERSITY OF THE NEGEV

HARVEY J. HAMES



*Juden in der Grafschaft Burgund im Mittelalter.* By Annegret Holtmann. (Forschungen zur Geschichte der Juden, A, 12.) Pp. x+502+6 maps. Hanover: Hahnsche Buchhandlung, 2003. €54. 3 7752 5621 0  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906508139

This book concerns the settlement of Jews in the county of Burgundy in the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries. The work is based on Annegret Holtmann's doctoral dissertation presented at the University of Trier as part of the highly productive research activity on medieval Jewish history which is being undertaken under the guidance of Alfred Haverkamp. As with the other regional studies emanating from this project, and published in this series, the book traces and analyses most meticulously all available published and unpublished sources. Geographic, legal and political issues are explored in the first section. The circumstances of the Jews are carefully studied within the broader framework of their host society. Economic matters follow. For this Holtmann has made especial use of two remarkable Hebrew business ledgers from the first twenty years of the fourteenth century, which she discovered in the Archives Départementales de la Côte d'Or in Dijon. Together they provide more than 100 folios of information on the lending activities of a consortium of Jews based in Vesoul. The sums lent out were recorded as were the names of the borrowers and their places of abode and the names of the guarantors and where they lived. In an appendix Holtmann provides lists of the place names mentioned in the first account book; she also gives the text of the section of the ledger concerning Villers-le-Sec and she transcribes the Hebrew text of one folio of the second ledger and translates it into German. This is clearly highly intricate material rife with palaeographical and linguistic complexities, and Holtmann should be congratulated for her interpretation of it. Using it and other material she has been able to paint a comprehensive picture of the economic activities of the Jews in Burgundy including money-lending to members of the nobility, giving credit to the members of the rural population, pawnbroking and the wine business. The relationship between the money-lending activities of the Jews and the Lombards is also discussed. The book closes with a section analysing the persecutions and expulsions of Jews in the fourteenth century in France and Burgundy. Extremely useful maps follow marking Jewish settlements between 1250 and 1318. This is a very welcome and very valuable addition to the growing number of Trier regional studies on the history of the Jews in Europe.

LUCY CAVENDISH COLLEGE,  
CAMBRIDGE

ANNA SAPIR ABULAFIA

*Omnia disce. Medieval studies in memory of Leonard Boyle, O.P.* Edited by Anne J. Duggan, Joan Greatrex and Brenda Bolton. (Church, Faith and Culture in the Medieval West.) Pp. xvii+322 incl. frontispiece and 34 figs. Aldershot–Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2005. £50. 0 7546 5115 0

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906518135

This volume, in memory of the influential medievalist and Prefect of the Vatican Library Leonard Boyle (d. 1999), contains eighteen papers by an international group of contributors (John Osborne, Joan Barclay Lloyd, Isabelle Engammare, Ludwig Schmugge, Margaret Harvey, Per Ingesman, David Ganz, Michelle Brown, Carol

A. Farr, Christine Maria Grafinger, Patrick Zutshi, James R. Ginther, Andrea Winkler, Richard Copsey, Kirsi Salonen and the three editors). Combined with these are three shorter and more personal reflections on Leonard Boyle and his scholarship, and the text of Boyle's final talk (on the *Summa Theologiae* of Thomas Aquinas), delivered six months before his death. The papers are divided into three groups to represent three themes prominent in Boyle's research. The first section deals with the history of Rome and the papacy, and in particular the church of San Clemente, the Dominican convent in which Boyle lived while in Rome. Highlights include Lloyd and Engammare's papers on the mosaics of San Clemente, complete with illustrations, and Bolton's discussion of how Innocent III used his extensive travels in the Papal Patrimony to build up his authority there. The second section focuses on palaeography and manuscript studies, and contains a number of interesting papers, ranging from Ganz on the history of palaeography teaching in universities and Brown on early English and Irish vernacular scripts, to Grafinger on an eighteenth-century abbot who stole manuscripts from the Vatican Library, and Duggan's edition and discussion of an early liturgical office for Thomas Becket. The papers in the third section examine the history of clerical education, pastoral care and the friars from many different perspectives. Thus Zutshi shows how Pope Honorius III was personally involved in writing an early papal letter that first recognised the Dominicans' role as preachers; Ginther argues that Thomas Aquinas's Psalms commentary dealt with themes that were relevant to Dominican life, particularly the care of souls; and Copsey surveys the education of medieval English Carmelite friars. A theme running through much of the book is the attention given to unpublished manuscript and archive sources, including the Roman notaries' archives used by Harvey; Duggan's Becket office; the Book of Kells, discussed by Farr; and, above all, the papal archives analysed by Schmutge, Ingelman, Zutshi and Salonen. Overall, this is a varied and interesting set of papers that does justice to the range of Boyle's own interests, and the personal reflections that finish the volume give the reader a sense of the man as well as the scholar.

CHRIST'S COLLEGE,  
CAMBRIDGE

CATHERINE RIDER

*Architecture and society in Normandy, 1120–1270*. By Lindy Grant. Pp. viii + 274 incl. 220 plates, 3 maps and 4 genealogical tables. New Haven–London: Yale University Press, 2005. £45. 0 300 10686 6  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906528131

The history of the duchy of Normandy is so dominated by political and administrative matters that, until recently, its remarkable heritage of Romanesque and Gothic architecture has not enjoyed the attention it deserves. This point is made in characteristically unpolemical fashion in Lindy Grant's new, indeed unprecedented, overview of the major and lesser monuments of Gothic greater church building in Normandy in the first century and a half of the new style. The book, though in effect the author's 1987 doctoral dissertation, carries off its project of providing the first sustained English-language commentary on this aspect of French Gothic architecture with remarkable panache. Grant, already established as a sympathetic, perceptive and humane commentator on Abbot Suger and his

patronage, is unusually good at writing both about people and buildings, 'society' in this case being the commissioning classes rather than the producers of the buildings in question, about whom far less is known. The author provides an adroit discussion of the Norman Church's institutions and main agents. She is balanced in her assessment of the various personal and cultural forces involved. In comparison with England, bishops and their outlook emerge as being of relatively greater importance than the deans and cathedral chapters. She offers a general survey of the emergence of the Gothic in the Paris area, the key focus of dialogue with Normandy, rather than England. Norman Gothic architecture is presented to us, cross-Channel politics notwithstanding, as essentially French, the styles fostered under the Capetians having the greatest impact, increasingly so after 1204 and the end of the duchy. The impact of Chartres, Soissons, Bourges and Reims as well as of the Rayonnant style is reflected in various buildings. In her important concluding chapter (which raises rather belatedly issues which might have framed the discussion from the start) the French character of the planning and layout of these churches, their choirs, portals and orientation towards their city contexts, is discussed. Norman Gothic was not a leading 'movement' in the sense that its eclectic English equivalent came to be, but rather comprised a series of accommodations with the architecture of the surrounding territories in France. This was true of its greatest monuments – the cathedrals of Rouen, Le Mans and Coutances – as well as its lesser ones, including those of the religious houses, which receive due attention here. The author seems less inclined to consider more general cultural and religious issues and is cautious in pursuing the implications of some of the discussions of institutions and agency. For example, did the fact that the cathedral of Séez came to be staffed by Victorine canons regular have any implications for the style of its building, given current debate about the importance of the Victorines in stimulating liturgical artistic reform? The author is also sceptical about the meshing of architecture with new devotional and liturgical thinking. This is in many ways a thoroughly undogmatic book, filled with clear practical criticism and mature judgement. No idea is forced beyond its limits. No building receives undue praise: Rouen Cathedral, for example, 'is not a beautiful building', being the 'ugly sister' of Chartres; Coutances and Le Mans on the other hand are given their due place as masterpieces. This spirited and stylish book is also elegantly illustrated with photographs by, among others, Lawrence of Arabia; one of these, showing Le Mont-Saint-Michel c. 1880 with fisherman in the foreground, is a fantasia worthy of one of the calendar pages in the Très Riches Heures of Jean de Berry.

GONVILLE AND CAIUS COLLEGE,  
CAMBRIDGE

PAUL BINSKI

*Rievaulx Abbey and its social context, 1132–1300. Memory, locality, and networks.* By Emilia Jamroziak. (Medieval Church Studies, 8.) Pp. xii + 252. Turnhout: Brepols, 2005. €60. 2 503 52177 0

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906538138

Despite the distinctly modish wording of its subtitle, Emilia Jamroziak's study of the formation and development of the Rievaulx Abbey estate supplies a competent and commendably old-fashioned account of the landed endowment of one of the greater

Cistercian houses of northern England, very much in the same tradition as Joan Wardrop's recent study of Fountains and informed by Janet Burton's more wide-ranging survey of *The monastic order in Yorkshire* (1999). Using the early Rievaulx cartulary as her principal source, Jamroziak traces the relations between Rievaulx and its various patrons, including the archbishops of York and the bishops of Durham. She has some particularly useful things to report of the breakdown in relations between the abbey and the Ros family, whose keenest affections, for a time invested in Rievaulx, very soon reverted to the Augustinians of Kirkham Priory, where many of the family chose to be buried and on whose gatehouse the family arms were prominently displayed. In this context, the wider question of precisely what the particular expectations and prohibitions of Cîteaux may have been in respect to patronal families would have been well worth posing, just as, in general, one would dearly like to know more of the relations between the original community of monks – in Jamroziak's interpretation Burgundians imported direct from Clairvaux – and the new blood, such as Aelred, introduced later and for the most part from local north-country families. As Jamroziak is aware, Cistercian studies are presently reeling from the shockwaves generated by Constance Berman's attempted redating of the Carta Caritatis and the whole idea of a Cistercian 'order' to the 1150s and 60s. Berman's extension of this assault to the history of Rievaulx and the English Cistercians (*Haskins Society Journal* xiii [1999], 1–19) is only briefly alluded to here, but surely required either fundamental changes to Jamroziak's thesis or a more forthright refutation. By challenging the traditional linkage of St Bernard's letter to King Henry I to the foundation of Rievaulx, and by demonstrating, for the most part convincingly, that the majority of early Cistercian houses in mainland Europe were merely incorporated Benedictine houses of older foundation, rebranded as Cistercian but not, in their origins, direct offshoots of Cîteaux, Berman has suggested that the English houses such as Rievaulx may have been not so much exceptions to the general European trend as the object of a retrospective rewriting of history in which their supposedly direct affiliations to Cîteaux and Clairvaux were to a large extent fictitious. Jamroziak herself admits that the so-called foundation charter of Rievaulx, preserved in the abbey's cartulary, is in fact a conflation of two awards from Walter Espec made c. 1131 and c. 1145, and she also acknowledges that the abbey's estate was seriously affected by disputes between the Stuteville and Mowbray families and the accession of Henry II after 1154, to such an extent indeed that the makers of the abbey's cartulary almost certainly suppressed whatever charters the monks had obtained from King Stephen. Henry II's subsequent award of the substantial waste of Pickering was not, as Jamroziak at one point implies (p. 119, no. 206), a confirmation of a grant by King Henry I, but, as she elsewhere describes it (p. 117), an entirely new award, necessitating a plethora of instructions to local officers and the redefinition of local boundaries, all but one of them preserved in royal charters known uniquely from the Rievaulx cartulary. As such 'problem' cases suggest, our dependence upon the abbey's own cartulary does rather beg the question as to whether the cartulary-makers were engaged in a far more substantial suppression of facts than Jamroziak is prepared to admit. Here, a more forensic approach to particular classes of evidence – royal and papal charters, and the later records of the Cistercian chapter, for example, not to mention the writings of and about Abbot Aelred – might have helped to clarify matters. Likewise, a self-avowedly 'social' study which avoids virtually any discussion of the local economy,

even to the extent of Rievaulx's association with the wool trade and the obvious significance in a local context of forest and hunting privileges, cannot be accounted an entirely comprehensive venture. None the less as the book deriving from a competent PhD thesis, this must be accounted a promising first effort by a historian of some talent.

UNIVERSITY OF EAST ANGLIA

NICHOLAS VINCENT

*Hermeneutik der Heilsgeschichte. De septem sigillis und die sieben Siegel im Werk Joachims von Fiore.* By Julia Eva Wannenmacher. (Studies in the History of Christian Traditions, 118.) Pp. xiii + 393 incl. 3 ills. Leiden–Boston: Brill, 2005. €119.90 04 13750 5; 1573 5664

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906548134

This lightly revised version of a doctoral dissertation treats a work by Joachim of Fiore that is short enough to be found in most manuscripts on a page or two. Thus the ratio of pages between Wannenmacher's analysis and the text she treats is roughly in the order of fifteen to one. Were the work by Joachim, *De septem sigillis*, startlingly unusual one might not grumble at the lavish expenditure of type, but in fact it is quite routine – a concise summary of positions already taken. To be sure, Wannenmacher wants to convince us that it is more than that. For her, the few paragraphs represent the culmination of the abbot's mature thought on salvational history, pushing certain implications that she finds in his previous writings to their limits. But this argument fails to convince because much of it is based on the absence of a word (AntiChrist) that is most easily explicable by the quest for concision. Moreover, despite the length of her disquisition, Wannenmacher fails to provide comparisons with two works that would be needed to convince someone that her text is Joachim's 'last answer': the detailed explanation of the apocalyptic dragon's seven heads appearing in Joachim's *Book of figures* (ironically enough a reproduction of this graces Wannenmacher's cover), and the uncompleted work generally assumed to have been the abbot's last, the *Tractatus super quattuor evangelia*. Students of Joachim will be glad to have the expert edition of *De septem sigillis* provided in the appendix, for it is based on twelve manuscript witnesses, as opposed to the six used for the edition of 1954 produced by Marjorie Reeves and Beatrice Hirsch-Reich. Even so, the worth of the edition lies primarily in its apparatus of variants because the addition of six manuscripts to the data base yields no significant changes in Reeves and Hirsch-Reich's base readings.

NORTHWESTERN UNIVERSITY

ROBERT. E. LERNER

*The Barons' Crusade. A call to arms and its consequences.* By Michael Lower. (The Middle Ages Series.) Pp. xi + 256 incl. 3 maps. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2005. £32.50. 0 8122 3873 7

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906558130

The convention is that after the Fifth Crusade you stop numbering them because they become too numerous, diverse and diffuse. This is all too clearly borne out by the Barons' Crusade, which comprised a series of distinct expeditions undertaken

between 1239 and 1241: that of the Latin Emperor Baldwin II to Constantinople; a French crusade to the Holy Land under Thibaut, count of Champagne (and king of Navarre), and Peter, ex-count of Brittany; various English expeditions to the Holy Land, of which the most important was that led by Richard, earl of Cornwall. This was among the most important bursts of crusading activity in the thirteenth century, but has been pretty much neglected by modern historians, who have sandwiched it between Frederick II's crusade of 1228–9 and St Louis's first crusade twenty years later. One reason for this is that it failed to find any chronicler. This might be an advantage, because there is not the temptation to build a narrative around an existing one. The main source for the Barons' Crusade comes in the shape of the Registers of Pope Gregory IX (1227–41). But Michael Lower has deliberately not written a history of the crusade under Gregory IX, because he wishes to avoid the view from Rome, which was of the crusade as a collective response of Christendom under the leadership of the papacy. This might have been the canon law position, but Lower's argument is that it was far from crusading realities, which he sensibly sees as dominated by local conditions. As a result, he is much more interested in the preparations for the crusade than in the crusade itself, to which he devotes less than thirty pages. The essential is that Gregory IX wished to divert the crusade to the aid of Constantinople, but there was an extreme reluctance to carry out the pope's bidding. It bears out Malcolm Barber's contention that there was 'a hierarchy of crusading priorities', in which Constantinople came very low down. Lower does not see it as part of his remit to provide a detailed examination of the continuing adherence of most crusaders to an 'old-fashioned' Jerusalem-centric view of the crusade. Nor does he explain why there was such a deep-seated reluctance to go to the aid of Constantinople. What interests him are the realities of crusading. He is best on the political side, because the evidence is stronger. He is less good on the nuts and bolts of mounting a crusade – recruitment, financing etc. – because the evidence turns out to be surprisingly poor. What he does show is the gap that existed between the papacy, which was trying to introduce by way of commutation of crusader vows a systematic means of financing the crusade, and the rank and file of crusaders, who were suspicious of such innovations. The bits of evidence there are suggest that the old hand to mouth arrangements for raising cash to go on crusade persisted. Lower finishes on a surprisingly upbeat note: 'the Barons' crusade did more for the Christian cause in the Holy Land than any after the First Crusade'. This was not because of any military success, but because of political conditions in the Ayyubid territories, which could be exploited diplomatically. In fact, it was a hollow triumph. The disasters of 1244 were just around the corner.

UNIVERSITY OF EDINBURGH

MICHAEL ANGOLD

*The theology of Thomas Aquinas*. Edited by Rik van Nieuwenhove and Joseph Wawrykow. Pp. xx+472 incl. frontispiece. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2005. \$37.50. 0 268 04363 9  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906568137

Seventeen contributors from eight countries have combined to produce a substantial and authoritative collection of essays which add up to a valuable introduction to the theological thought of St Thomas. One of the editors,

Joseph Wawrykow, is from the theology department at Notre Dame, and so are three of the other contributors. Two contributors are from the Utrecht faculty of Catholic theology and two from Fribourg University. Nine other institutions are represented, including the University of Limerick, home of the second editor. Unusually for such a collection, only three of the contributors are members of the Order of Preachers. All the major themes of St Thomas's theology are treated: the Trinity, creation, providence and predestination, original sin, grace and morality, the incarnation and the redemption, the role of the Church and the nature of the sacraments, and the four last things: death, judgement, heaven and hell. The standard of discussion is high, and the approach is historico-theological; the book is far removed from the neo-scholastic textbooks of an earlier generation. Three of the essays seek to situate St Thomas's endeavour in relation to other approaches to the subject matter of theology: Bruce Marshall contrasts Aquinas's systematic theology with the faith of the unlearned; David Burrell compares it with the more mystical and poetic approaches of Eckhart and John of the Cross; and Paul O'Grady, in a particularly insightful piece, demonstrates its compatibility with analytical philosophy. The contributors to the collection are united in their admiration for St Thomas and their belief that he has much to teach contemporary theologians, but they are not afraid to disagree with him and with each other. Thus Thomas O'Meara OP brings out the comparatively jejeune nature of Aquinas's ecclesiology, Bruce Marshall and Eugene Rogers are less happy than O'Grady to see Aquinas as a philosopher no less than a theologian and the two editors present different accounts of the role of efficient causality in the providential government of the world. Developments in Aquinas's own thought are emphasised, as in Wawrykow's essay on grace, which documents the way in which the influence of the late works of Augustine increased over time. Ample footnotes allow the reader to trace in the saint's own texts the sources of the varying interpretations offered by the contributors. The book is attractively produced, with a handsome frontispiece and dust-jacket displaying Aquinas in an illuminated initial lecturing, unusually, to nuns as well as friars.

ST JOHN'S COLLEGE,  
OXFORD

ANTHONY KENNY

*Essays in medieval philosophy and theology in memory of Walter H. Principe, CSB. Fortresses and launching pads.* Edited by James R. Ginther and Carl N. Still. Pp. ix + 177.

Aldershot–Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2005. £50. 0 7546 5041 3

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906578133

Walter Principe is remembered in scholarly circles chiefly for his groundbreaking work on early thirteenth-century theology, having published four volumes on the doctrine of the hypostatic union during this period (respectively on William of Auxerre, Alexander of Hales, Hugh of St Cher and Philip the Chancellor), and having prepared an edition, published posthumously, of the *Quodlibeta* of the early Parisian Dominican Guerric of St-Quentin. Principe's *oeuvre* is marked by textual care and accuracy as well as by close attention to theological detail, his interests being philological and exegetical rather than critical and analytic. This memorial volume includes essays (for the most part brief) by ten of Principe's peers and

students, reflecting both Principe's interests and his particular approach to his topics, and covering material from Augustine to Capreol, focusing on Thomas Aquinas. The collection concludes with a short memoir of Principe by his younger brother. Many of the essays, for all their slightly understated rhetoric, make small but significant contributions to scholarly debate. Joanne McWilliam shows that Augustine's early Trinitarian theology extends beyond concerns merely with the economic Trinity. Abigail Ann Young relates the theological insights of two twelfth-century mystics, Rupert of Deutz and Hildegard of Bingen, to their accounts of their spiritual experiences. James Ginther offers useful reflections on the place of the Scripture in scholastic theology, arguing that medieval theologians rarely encountered the Bible as a single work, and that the scholastic disputation is fundamentally, for all its ludic qualities, a matter of scriptural exegesis. Jean-Pierre Torrell provides a useful overview of some of the Christological themes in Gueric of St-Quentin's *Quodlibeta*. Philip Lyndon Reynolds shows that the notion of sacramental causality as developed by Thomas Aquinas is fundamentally vacuous and amounts to no more than an expression of his fundamentally apophatic theological standpoint. Mark Johnson highlights the novelty of the *secunda pars* of the *Summa theologiae* in terms of scope, structure and content. An account by Pamela Reeve of Aquinas's views on mystical experience and the cognition of disembodied souls somewhat disappointingly makes no attempt to deal with the well-known difficulty of the issue: how to reconcile Aquinas's claim that the body hinders cognition of God with his claim that the embodiment of the soul is a perfection. Carl Still offers a useful contribution on Aquinas on the virtue of faith, tying in neatly with a treatment of the same issue in Capreol by Romanus Cessario. Lawrence Dewan attempts to refute Richard Swinburne's *a priori* deduction of the doctrine of the Trinity. Dewan writes elegantly, but seems to assume (falsely) that merely stating Aquinas's contrary position is sufficient to refute those who adopt differing views. Overall, a useful collection of essays and a worthy tribute to its honorand.

ORIEL COLLEGE,  
OXFORD

RICHARD CROSS

*Health, sickness, medicine and the friars in the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries.* By Angela Montford. (The History of Medicine in Context.) Pp. xv + 303 incl. frontispiece and 19 ills. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2004. £57.50. 0 7546 3697 6  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S002204690658813X

No religious order with sick brethren, infirmaries and *medici* of its own could be unaffected by the changes occurring in secular medical practice in the period discussed in this book. Angela Montford has written a lucid, well focused and original study of medical practice by mendicants inside and outside their convents, their resort to secular physicians, surgeons and apothecaries and the medicinal remedies given to their sick brethren in this changing environment. However, a glossary of medical terms was needed; so too more help than is provided with currency and money values. Among the wide range of sources used are two account books of the Dominican convent of S. Domenico in Bologna for, respectively, the years 1331–43 and 1350–7, and that of Diotaiuti de Cecco da Sassoletra, an apothecary of Imola, who was patronised by this convent and by the Franciscans of



Bologna, for the years 1356–67. The availability of these sources explains the prominence in the book of medical matters in S. Domenico, and a focus of this kind gives the book exceptional interest. Nevertheless, readers need to bear in mind that, with the exception of meat-eating (forbidden to healthy friars), the standard of living at S. Domenico, and the treatments within its grasp, were those of a wealthy north Italian household. Medical practice by mendicants outside their convents was an integral part of their service of the poor but had a wider reference. Montford perhaps takes too literal a view of the repeated prohibitions by general and provincial chapters of unlicensed practice outside the convent, and, from the mid-fourteenth century, of any such practice. ‘No smoke without fire’ may represent a more realistic interpretation of even the most strictly worded texts of this kind. Some of the friars with medical associations of one kind or another listed in a useful appendix were evidently learned to the point where the confinement of their knowledge in medical matters to their own convent would have been difficult. It is impossible to say how far the sick friars of S. Domenico were treated with remedies dispensed in their own infirmary by their own, now secular, infirmarer, since many of these may not have occasioned entries in the surviving accounts. The evidence as a whole suggests that if the apothecary’s remedies seemed to be called for, they were probably purchased without counting the cost. Thus in 1350, when the basic cost of a week’s residence in the infirmary was probably 2s. 6d., the infirmary spent as much as 23*li.* 18*s.* 0*d.* on medicine for three patients. Even so, cost may have been a major reason why the friars of S. Domenico made little use of the therapeutic baths of Porretta, here described in illuminating detail. It is of interest that in 1389 Ludovico, a Franciscan lay brother in Bologna, was sent there at a cost of 40*s.*

SOMERVILLE COLLEGE,  
OXFORD

BARBARA HARVEY

*The Trinity Apocalypse.* (Trinity College Cambridge, MS R.16.2). Edited by David McKitterick. (The British Library Studies in Medieval Culture.) Pp. xvi + 173 incl. 133 figs + 24 colour plates and CD ROM. London: The British Library/Toronto–Buffalo: University of Toronto Press, 2005. £45 (cloth), £19.95 (paper). 0 7123 4872 7; 0 7123 0690 0; 0 8020 9009 5; 0 8020 4893 5  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906598136

The Trinity College Apocalypse, illuminated in gold and full colour and written in Anglo-Norman French at some point perhaps in the 1250s, is one of the grandest and most thoroughly reproduced of English medieval manuscripts. In the present volume the aim is not to produce another facsimile, but rather a commentary volume, assembled from the opinions of established authorities: Nigel Morgan on thirteenth-century English art and the Apocalypses especially, Teresa Webber on palaeography, Ian Short on insular French and David McKitterick on the history of the book itself. It is hard to think of higher authorities. Nigel Morgan tackles three key areas: the fashion for Apocalypses in mid thirteenth-century England, style and iconography. The first, context, discusses more deeply than hitherto the framework for the sudden eruption of Apocalypses in the 1240s, examining the Spanish Beatus manuscripts and French *Bibles moralisées*, and their possible impact in England, as well as what might be called the cultural apocalypticism of the times amongst the

mendicant orders and sympathetic secular clergy and aristocrats. The unusual layout of some of the folios is shown by Morgan, following Freyhan and Brieger, to reveal the impact of Castilian Beatus manuscripts, perhaps via royal marriage links or connections in Gascony. A new, though hypothetical, insight stems from the observation that the manuscript might have been produced before the 1257 condemnation by St Bonaventure of the remarks concerning the Franciscan 'new gospel'. Morgan in any event sees the Trinity manuscript as a remarkable and isolated *unicum*. Though his discussion of the styles of the Trinity Apocalypse owes much to the vivid and seminal writings of George Henderson in the 1960s, Morgan completely rejects Henderson's appreciation of Trinity as a central reference point for many of the subsequent illustrated Apocalypses, favouring the iconographic stemma proposed by Jessie Poesch and, later, Peter Klein, which isolates it and renders it dependent. His interest in the milieu of the manuscript revives the concerns of Klingender and Freyhan in the 1950s. This interest is enriched further by the contribution by Ian Short, whose essay will have wider value for Anglo-Norman specialists because it stresses the role of insular French as a language of culture. Short has important things to say about the pastoral utility of such books and, most originally for this reviewer, about the debt of many of its textual components both to earlier and to more recent texts. One of these, the French *Life* of St John at the end, is close to, but not derived from, an early text in Paris supposedly from the workshop of De Brailles in Oxford. Though an Oxford origin is not demonstrated, Trinity emerges with a far more interesting and complex textual archaeology than has been demonstrated before; it is the product of the copying of an exemplar, or exemplars, which were themselves of some complexity. This is exactly the sort of new scholarly insight such manuscripts require, and it justifies the present book's programme of assembling opinions from different fields. And yet the Trinity manuscript itself remains elusive. Where and for whom it was made is not elucidated by the text, script or style, or the presence of upper-class women and mendicants in the illustrations, though a better sense of its identity is derived from its paintings than from its script. The discussion seems locked in to the now familiar range of hypothetical aristocratic lady patrons. Doubtless there is little alternative. Amongst the best artistic analogies are found in the Chertsey Tiles, which raises suspicion that Trinity might have been the work of artists who were not solely illuminators, working somewhere in the area Salisbury–Oxford–London. Art historically the situation has not changed much; this book is most useful for its treatment of the text.

GONVILLE AND CAIUS COLLEGE,  
CAMBRIDGE

PAUL BINSKI

*Vicars choral at English cathedrals. Cantate domino. History, architecture and archaeology.*  
Edited by Richard Hall and David Stocker. Pp. viii + 215 incl. 161 figs. Oxford:  
Oxbow Books, 2005. £50. 1 84217 153 4  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906608130

This book consists of papers read at a conference at St William's College in York on 22–4 March 2002. Its contents deal with the colleges of vicars choral at the nine old secular cathedrals: Chichester, Exeter, Hereford, Lichfield, Lincoln, St Paul's in

London, Salisbury, Wells and York. Some of the authors, especially Warwick Rodwell, Tim Tatton Brown and Barrie Dobson, are well known for their writings on ecclesiastical history. Others, including the two editors, have published less broadly but have specialised knowledge of specific sites and of archaeology.

Vicars choral were introduced into English cathedrals shortly after the Norman Conquest to take the place of non-resident senior clergy in liturgical services. In addition to singing the services which formed the daily round of worship they participated in chantry masses, funerals, civic ceremonies and other special events. At their height, in the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries, they were numerous: there were more than fifty at St Paul's, Lincoln, Salisbury and Wells and twenty-five or more in the smallest establishments at Hereford and Exeter. From the beginning it was not possible for most of them to live with the canons they served vicariously, since their seniors were seldom present. They soon established their own places of residence, known as Bederns (the word means a place of prayer) or closes of the vicars choral. As the account of the Bedern at York argues, they may originally have slept in common dormitories and led a communal life, but as time passed and their resources increased they came to have individual small houses such as those which survive in the well-known Vicars' Close at Wells. Their importance declined following the Reformation, partly because of the dissolution of the chantries and simplification of liturgical practices, and their colleges were eventually dissolved. At Hereford, for instance, the last vicar choral, Philip Barrett (also a fine historian of the nineteenth-century Church), resigned in 1986 and died in 1998.

The chapters in this volume exhibit the strengths and weaknesses usual in such collections of individual studies. Most of them are descriptions of recent archaeological examinations of specific sites. They vary substantially in length. The longest and most detailed account is that of the Bedern at York. This is appropriate, both because of major excavations there in recent years and because the papers were read in York, but the illustrations of archaeological finds at York may be more numerous than necessary. There is also new evidence of the Bedern at Lichfield, and there are some new details and revised interpretations of the close of Wells. The accommodations of the vicars at Lincoln are interesting, as had been pointed out earlier, because they consist of suites of rooms opening off common staircases, as in the colleges at Oxford and Cambridge. All vicars' colleges appear to have had common dining halls and chapels. Perhaps surprisingly, relatively little is known of the vicars' lodgings at St Paul's and Salisbury. In addition to the cathedrals, the great churches at Ripon, Beverley and Southwell had colleges of vicars choral, and an interesting chapter deals with them.

The accounts of the several cathedral establishments are not parallel in length and detail. They ask different questions and are based on different sources. Almost all the chapters emphasise archaeology and what it can tell us about living arrangements. There is little on the vicars themselves: surviving documentation may be meagre, but surely more can be learned about their social background, education, length of service and progress to higher position in the Church. Liturgy and music are similarly neglected. Obviously the vicars choral were not the only ones involved in these activities, which have been studied from other points of view, but the role and achievements of the vicars surely merit a fresh examination. All in all, then, this volume presents important new evidence about the vicars choral and their physical accommodation but implies the desirability of a new general study which would

compare the several establishments rather than treating them individually and might present a comprehensive picture of these important members of the cathedral staff.

UNIVERSITY OF MINNESOTA

STANFORD LEHMBERG

*St George's Chapel, Windsor, in the fourteenth century.* Edited by Nigel Saul. Pp. xvii + 241 incl. 35 figs. Woodbridge: Boydell, 2005. £45. 1 84383 117 1  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906618137

The royal collegiate chapel of St George at Windsor has recently attracted considerable scholarly attention. The proceedings of a conference on the chapel in the fifteenth century were published in 2001, edited by Colin Richmond. The present volume, similarly based on papers delivered at a conference held in 2002, focuses on the earlier, formative period in the history of the chapel. It was the period when Windsor Castle was transformed by Edward III into 'the flagship of the English monarchy and the mightiest and most romantic of England's royal residences'. As part of this process of transformation, an earlier chapel within the castle was reconstituted as the spiritual home of the king's new Order of the Garter, itself the most vivid expression of that combination of chivalry and piety which was so important in providing an acceptable, propaganda face for the king's military ambitions.

As with all published conference proceedings of this sort, the papers vary greatly in character, content and quality. They fall largely, with some outliers, into three successive groups, those concerned with the ideology, as it were, of the chapel and of the Order of the Garter, those dealing with the affairs of the canons and their worship and finally those concerned with the building work itself. The foundation of the order is characterised in turn by successive writers both as a short-term ideological device, and also as a culmination of longer-term, fundamental cultural trends. But we are usefully reminded of the French and papal, and even Hungarian, origins of the cult of St George. Those papers concerned with architectural matters are inhibited by the subsequent fate of much of Edward III's building work, and are also impaired by fuzzy photographs and the absence of readable plans. But Goodall's study of the Aerary porch, so pregnant for future architectural development in England, at least reminds us of the distinction of his earlier account of God's House at Ewelme. Most successful are the contributions which dwell upon the life of the chapel and its canons. Clive Burgess deftly places the collegiate church within the development of religious communities in medieval England. Yet after his odd reassurance that 'St George's celebrated a profoundly Catholic liturgy' (p. 78) it seems paradoxical to speak of its 'survival' (p. 96). Pride of place goes to two other contributions in this section. Nigel Saul's analysis of the canons reveals much that is unexpected. Their relative lack of distinction is remarkable in a foundation itself so distinguished, as is their long tenure and their tendency to reside. Particularly subtle is his delineation of a growing sense of community among the canons, much of it to be associated with Edward IV's lavish act of refoundation. Dr Evans's paper has the unpromising title of 'Litigation for proprietary rights'. Yet her study of the dispute between the canons and the vicar of their church of Saltash, like all the best miniatures, throws a flood of light on a much larger topic, the working of the legal

system, and shows how in such matters, even in late medieval England, might was not always right – particularly when deployed against so determined and resourceful an individual as the vicar of Saltash.

Pervading most of these studies, although never quite centre-stage, is the figure of Edward III. He mobilised at Windsor the most ambitious building project of any medieval English king, requisitioning at times some 500 stone-workers and breaking his own wage legislation to keep them there. Taking their cue from his presence, as it were, some contributors adopt an oddly chauvinistic view of their subject, speaking of the English as here appropriating, colonising almost, the royal ideology of the French monarchy. We read of St George's 'wresting the spiritual mantle from France'. Yet, as one contributor acknowledges, the model for St George's was La Sainte Chapelle (revealingly misspelt). And even the progress of the building work seems to have been dependent on French money, paid to ransom their king. In reality what was made manifest in the chapel and the order was the supremacy of a royalist theology which was predominantly French in its inspiration. How appropriate that Edward IV's subsequent transformation of the chapel at Windsor into a royal mausoleum should follow the triumph of French arms in laying bare the folly of Edward III's French ambitions.

PETERHOUSE,  
CAMBRIDGE

ROGER LOVATT

*Der Deutsche Orden im Spiegel seiner Besitzungen und Beziehungen in Europa.* By Bernhard Demel. (Europäische Hochschulschriften. European University Studies. Ser. III, Geschichte und ihre Hilfswissenschaften. History and Allied Studies, 961.) Pp. 742 incl. 16 ills. Frankfurt-am-Main: Peter Lang, 2004. £60. 3 631 51017 9; 0531 7320

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906628133

To judge by its title, this book would seem to promise a comprehensive study of the possessions of the Teutonic Order by the current director of the order's central archive in Vienna. In fact it comprises seven separate, essentially monographic, studies of varying approach, length and scope. The first and longest of these is a survey of the order's bailiwick of Saxony from the thirteenth to the nineteenth centuries, organised around short sections dealing with all of its known officers and landed possessions (pp. 7–189). A similar approach is taken in the final study, which is essentially a prosopographical catalogue of the order's ambassadors to the imperial German diets from 1495 to 1805 (pp. 604–56). The other studies are diverse, but more narrative and analytical in character. They deal variously with the order's attempts to recover its Livonian possessions from 1558 to 1794 (pp. 190–258), its history in Silesia and Moravia in 1742–1918 (pp. 379–472), the Piarist school in Freudenthal in Silesia (pp. 472–538) and the biography of Leopold Wilhelm of Austria, grand-master of the order in 1641–62 (pp. 538–606). The most accessible section is a general survey of the order's institutional history from the fifteenth to the twentieth centuries (pp. 259–378), which outlines the main characteristics of its development after the loss of its independent territories in Prussia and Livonia, and also identifies *desiderata* for future research. It is a pity that this section could not have been expanded, to the exclusion of one or two of the more recondite studies which

have evidently already been published elsewhere. As a whole, the collection contains a wealth of information, especially on the prosopography and landholdings of the order, but it is by no means easy to use, despite a detailed overarching index of eighty pages. The appearance of the volume is also unattractive, being set in a sans-serif font and with much incorrect spacing – for some reason almost all dashes are spaced as if they were hyphens – while an unnecessarily generous line spacing (at twenty-nine lines to the page) has resulted in inordinate length. A more careful approach to formatting could have conceivably saved 100–200 pages and possibly reduced the cost to the purchaser. The vast amount of material in this volume, founded on the author's deep knowledge of the order's archival sources, might have been more profitably presented by concentrating on one or two themes (for example, the diplomatic history of the order between the fifteenth and eighteenth centuries), in order to produce a work combining coherent narrative history and reference, rather than bringing together these diverse studies under one cover.

INSTITUTE FOR MEDIEVAL STUDIES,  
UNIVERSITY OF LEEDS

ALAN V. MURRAY

*Kurie und Region. Festschrift für Brigide Schwarz zum 65. Geburtstag.* Edited by Brigitte Flug, Michael Matheus and Andreas Rehberg. (Geschichtliche Landeskunde, 59.) Pp. 460 incl. frontispiece and 9 figs. Stuttgart: Franz Steiner, 2005. €68. 3 515 08467 3  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S002204690663813X

In many ways this is a companion volume to the *Festschrift* for Ludwig Schmutge (2004), reviewed in this JOURNAL. Not only do their topics overlap and intersect frequently, but each honoree wrote an article in the other's honour, and five other authors appear in both collections. Their best common feature is the solid historical value of the contributions. Here there are twenty-four articles, twenty in German, two in Italian and one each in French and English. They are distributed under four headings: 'Curia, offices and institutions'; 'Money and the curia'; 'Germans in Rome: routes and motives'; and that most accommodating of oddbins, 'Centre and periphery'. Karl Borchart extracts the Hospitallers' business from the petition registers of Clement VI (1342–52). Kirsi Salonen counts the 'Finlanders', i.e. the natives of the diocese of Turku, as petitioners in the papal court (1450–1520). Götz-Rüdiger Tewes works out the real 'problematic' course of annates paid by Germany to the curia, the issue of the epistolary quarrel (1457) between the chancellor of Cologne and the future Pius II. Claudia Märkl has a searching description of the curia's bookkeeping under the same pope (1458–64). The article by Wolfgang Reinhard, 'Vom *Schedario* zur Datenbank', has a particular contemporary appeal, showing how prosopographical files (for example his own from the fifteenth- and sixteenth-century Borghese dynasty) can be sliced in any number of ways by computer database programs to reveal larger institutional and political structures. Several of the contributors here, as in the Schmutge *Festschrift*, have taken the occasion to publish the Latin sources of their studies. Intimate details of the sale of curial offices are provided in the actual contracts (1479–83) edited by Anna Esposito. Patrick Zutshi offers 'Unpublished fragments of the registers of common letters of Pope Urban VI (1378)'. From the other obedience, in the same year, Brigitte Hotz

gives a roll of petitions from the city of Zurich to Clement VII of Avignon. From 1524–7, in the pontificate of the other Clement VII, Christiane Schuchard has four testaments of members of the German confraternity of S. Maria dell'Anima in Rome. Johannes Helmrath adds to the known corpus of Apostolic Chancery ordinances one not by a pope but by the Council of Basel (1439). Bernhard Schimmelpfennig presents the papal ritual of the Jubilee Year 1450 as recorded by the cardinal of Augsburg's chaplain. Pierre Jugie edits and tabulates two inventories of precious metal belonging to Cardinal Andrea Ghini Malpigli (1340–2), with a meticulous survey of the secondary literature.

STATE UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK AT BINGHAMTON

DANIEL WILLIMAN

*Art and architecture of late medieval pilgrimage in northern Europe and the British Isles*, I: *Texts*; II: *Plates*. Edited by Sarah Blick and Rita Tekippe. (Studies in Medieval and Reformation Traditions, 104.) Pp. xxxii + 880; xl + 348 plates. Leiden–Boston: Brill, 2005. €299. 90 94 12332 6; 1573 4188

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906648136

This formidable set of twenty-seven essays, an offshoot of sessions on pilgrimage held at the International Congress of Medieval Studies at Kalamazoo, is divided into no less than seven thematic sections: the pilgrim's journey; churches and shrines; discerning meaning; Jerusalem; pilgrim souvenirs; the politics of cult development; and cult practices. The range of western European material covered is correspondingly wide: from Netherlandish paintings and shrines by Hans Memling, to Flamboyant Gothic architecture and Mosan metalwork shrines (half-a-dozen essays at least); Chartres' architecture, Autun's sculpture, local saints at Amiens, three essays on different aspects of Canterbury and St Thomas (to be compared with those in Morris and Roberts's recent edited collection, *Pilgrimage: the English experience from Becket to Bunyan* [Cambridge 2002]), labyrinths, pilgrim badges, host miracles, the Chartreuse at Champmol, all introduced by an essay which begins with the apparently now-obligatory nod to Victor and Edith Turner before summing up the essays which follow. In theory this book should have been a real event. And there are substantial and assured wider essays, for example those by James Bugslag on Chartres Cathedral and Mitchell Merback on host-miracle churches in late medieval Germany. But in practice not all is well. Some essays, though engaging, have a particular method of proof which relies on very sophisticated and clearly anachronistic notions of connotation and association, rather than hard evidence. For instance, Daniel K. Connolly's lively essay on the labyrinth at Chartres as a representation of Jerusalem – and hence the reason for its being included in this volume at all – should be read very closely indeed for real evidence that such early labyrinths were ever thought of as being or showing 'Jerusalem', as opposed to being heroic assertions of the creative authority of the master mason, of whom Dedalus was the type, and to whom 'pilgrimage' in the ordinary sense would be absurd. The Reims labyrinth, which followed directly that at Chartres, showed the architects of the cathedral, not Zion. The essays on the British Isles failed especially to engage this reviewer. Anne Harris's paper on Canterbury switches to and fro from archaeological to text-critical mode in such a way that the actual building falls from sight, and relies on a false apposition (echoing this split in method) of elite

textuality and popular visual experience which renders demonstrably false her assertion that the *candidus et rubicundus* themes in the narratives of St Thomas's martyrdom 'never engage the realm of visual representation'. The red and white columns of the building are obvious evidence against this. Sarah Blick's argument, in her essay on pilgrim badges, that the shrine of St Thomas included an effigy of the saint as well as a shrine, on the grounds that this is what the pilgrim badges appear to show, is a manifest *non sequitur* without any corroborative evidence at all. Some unevenness in a volume of this size is to be expected, but readers may find that real qualitative issues are not offset by significant original insights or by a sense of cumulative intellectual achievement.

GONVILLE AND CAIUS COLLEGE,  
CAMBRIDGE

PAUL BINSKI

*The processional cross in late medieval England. The Dallye Cross.* By Colum Hourihane. (Reports of the Research Committee of the Society of Antiquaries of London, 71.) Pp. ix + 162. London: Society of Antiquaries of London, 2005. £25. 0 85431 281 1; 0953 7163  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906658132

With this short book Colum Hourihane has opened up a much (and strangely) neglected field in the history of English medieval metalwork. At the same time he has left work for other researchers to do. In essence the book is a catalogue of the thirty surviving processional crosses known to the author, all of which date from the fifteenth or early sixteenth century. Also catalogued is a series of detached figures of Christ crucified and St John the Evangelist which it is reasonable to hypothesise come from lost processional crosses (though paxes and altar crosses are possible alternatives). Some of these are of the fourteenth century, from which no complete crosses survive. This catalogue is very generously illustrated with black-and-white plates: most of the items listed are shown from both front and rear. More than once Hourihane states that his list is unlikely to prove exhaustive, and indeed this reviewer can add an overlooked example: the processional cross at the parish church of St Giles at Little Malvern in Worcestershire, donated in 1912 by Miss Sybil Severn-Walker. This has close formal and stylistic affinities with the Oscott College cross, number 4 in the catalogue, but is superior in that it retains its figures of Mary and John on their brackets. The catalogue is preceded by a discussion of the use and iconography of processional crosses in medieval England. There are two chapters on the liturgical and para-liturgical uses of processional crosses, and another on the form, style, iconography and dating of English examples, in which surviving crosses are classified in seven groups. This discussion contains much of interest and use. However, it also leaves much unsaid, and provokes questions about the methodology adopted in the analysis and dating of the crosses. Very little evidence for the use of processional crosses is adduced from medieval texts. Rather, manuscript illustration, much of it continental, is offered as evidence for their function in English ritual. One is somewhat uneasy about this, because manuscript illustration is certainly not an infallible witness to medieval customs and practices. Moreover, one wonders why manuscript painting is privileged here. The analysis could have been enriched with reference to representations of crosses in wall painting and stained glass. The



iconography of the resurrected Christ, who frequently carries a processional cross (for example Long Melford, Suffolk: tomb of Sir John Clopton), and of the Agnus Dei, could also have been assessed for their semantic bearing on this explicitly Christological subject. As to dating, much reliance is placed upon the appearance on crosses of what the author calls the Tudor rose. However, none of the engraved roses represented are double roses proper, and in any case both single and double roses frequently appear before 1485 (for example the stained glass at Tattershall, Lincolnshire). This said, such misgivings should not distract readers from the basic importance of this book. All institutions and individuals concerned with the history of the Church and of metalwork in medieval England should possess a copy.

UNIVERSITY OF ST ANDREWS

JULIAN LUXFORD

*Nicholas Love, The mirror of the blessed life of Jesus Christ. A full critical edition.* Edited by Michael Sargent. (Exeter Medieval Texts and Studies.) Pp. xviii + 163 (intro) + 433 (text) incl. 7 colour and four black-and-white plates. Exeter: University of Exeter Press, 2005. £60. 0 85989 740 0  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906668139

Nicholas Love, prior of Mount Grace Charterhouse, translated into English the *Meditationes vitae Christi*, then ascribed to St Bonaventura, sometime soon after 1410. Love described his book as being ‘of devoute ymaginaciouns and likenessis styryng symple soules to þe loue of god’. The Latin work he translated was one of the most popular and influential of the devotional texts emanating from the Franciscans, surviving in hundreds of manuscripts and translated into many medieval vernaculars. Love’s English version is a translation in the medieval manner, with passages added, and with variant versions of differing lengths attested by the manuscript evidence. It survives in sixty-one manuscripts and fragments, including forty-nine that are either still complete or were so originally. In addition it was printed nine times altogether (four times before 1500), by Caxton (twice), Pynson (twice), and Wynkyn de Worde (five times). Between 1500 and 1530 there were five printings, the latest in 1530. After the Anglican Establishment, it sank from sight like a stone, along with other obviously Roman Catholic material, not to be seen again until the interest of modern scholarship revived it in the late nineteenth century. Since then, it has been an object of continuous interest to many historians of English prose, late medieval spirituality and, especially of late, the Lollard controversy, but the text itself received surprisingly little sustained editorial attention. That has now been rectified with the publication of this massive ‘full critical edition’ by Michael Sargent. Sargent published an edition of the work in 1992 with Garland Press but this edition surpasses it in every respect. The fruit of a life’s labours, it authoritatively and comprehensively sets out the *Mirror’s* text, and its political and ecclesiastical contexts, for at least a generation or two to come.

It is indeed a ‘full’ edition. The introduction itself is the length of many ordinary monographs; the text is presented with both textual and explanatory notes, representing a full collation of the main manuscript groups with the readings of Sargent’s base manuscript A1 (CUL MS Additional 6578, written at Mount Grace during Love’s lifetime), the same basis selected for his 1992 edition. In addition there is a bibliography, a glossary of the Middle English words and indices of

scriptural and liturgical sources, of manuscripts cited and a general index. The inclusion of a glossary suggests that the volume was assembled with the needs of a variety of students in mind, though it is difficult to imagine such a hefty book (in every way, including price) receiving many classroom adoptions. (Exeter Press has also produced a paperbound 'reading text', more suitable for beginners, from this 'full' edition.) One rarely sees any longer a definitive edition of this sort, and Exeter University Press is to be commended for bringing out such a complex book. One often hears of big books being broken in pieces by fearful presses; Sargent's introduction, its pages separately numbered from the text, could have been so treated, but that would have seriously impoverished the endeavour. For it is the sheer richness, the bounty of this late vernacular spiritual composition that astonishes even now.

The text is presented with a comprehensive critical apparatus, printed separately after it, a decision that makes for easier printing but is less than ideal for the reader. A descriptive catalogue of all manuscripts and fragments is included, and the relational groupings among them, together with the early printed editions, are fully analysed and laid out both in the editorial discussion and in the apparatus of variants, of which there are a vast number. Sargent's analysis is clear, well organised and as concise as can be, given the weight of material with which he had to deal.

The extensive introduction focuses on the political and dogmatic controversies which impinge upon the work. Rightly described as 'the most important literary version of the life of Christ before modern times' (intro. p. 10), present scholarship has focused on the *Mirroure*'s role in the Wycliffite controversies of the late Middle Ages and Bishop Arundel's interventions in Lancastrian and church politics. The *Mirroure* includes specific anti-Wycliffite language; it is this that is the focus of much interest in it now. It has produced a rich body of twentieth-century scholarship, from Elizabeth Salter, Ian Doyle, Jonathan Hughes, Nicholas Watson, Vincent Gillespie and many others in North America, Britain and Japan (five of the manuscripts are now in Japan). Sargent summarises this scholarship thoughtfully, while making his own conclusions clear. He also provides a lengthy history of Mount Grace priory – itself a complex story, involving the deadly vagaries of Lancastrian politics. And he includes a generous summary of the text of the *Mirroure*, its far-flung sources and its place in fifteenth-century 'vernacular theology' – if such a genre can meaningfully be defined. This all makes for an unusually leisured introduction, which can seem overly long in recounting details of scholarly controversies likely to seem *passé* in a few years, and of archival matters that might better have been treated in a separate essay. The length of time it has taken to produce this work also shows: the preponderance of citations is to works published well before 2000, and a 1988 study is characterised as 'recent' (intro. p. 34). The bibliography is selective but the principle of selection is not stated, and some post-1992 scholarship on topics which Sargent discusses as germane to Love is puzzlingly omitted (such as Sheila Delaney's work on Osbern Bokenham, Ann Hutchison's on the Briggittines of Syon and Leo Carruthers's on late medieval English vernacular sermons). However, recent Japanese scholarship is well represented in the bibliography, a welcome inclusion. Sargent's edition will help consolidate and guide the study of English 'vernacular theology' for some decades to come.

*Children of the promise. The Confraternity of the Purification and the socialization of youths in Florence, 1427–1785.* By Lorenzo Polizzotto. (Oxford–Warburg Studies.) Pp. xv+381+9 plates. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004. £65.00 926332 9

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906678135

With his monograph on the youth Confraternity of the Purification, Lorenzo Polizzotto has marked yet another milestone in research not only in the history of Florence, but also in the history of lay religion, education and youth in early modern Europe. His meticulously researched study, firmly grounded in archival research and a wide range of readings, demonstrates the fundamental role played by youth confraternities in the education and socialisation of young men in Florence from the early fifteenth to the late eighteenth centuries. At the same time, it corrects a number of factual errors that had crept into the literature and introduces a wealth of new considerations, observations and information for future scholars to digest and incorporate into their own studies. Nothing short of brilliant, the volume is also a captivating read, well structured, well written and well produced. By focusing on one confraternity in particular, that of the Purification of the Blessed Virgin Mary, Polizzotto is able to paint a picture that is not only a riveting portrait of one particular sodality from its foundation in 1427 to its suppression in 1785, but also an emblematic image of an entire movement that sought to educate youths in the Christian faith, in the art of social coexistence and in the skills necessary for success in a thriving, competitive, urban environment such as that of Renaissance Florence. As the author regularly points out, in the course of its three and a half centuries of existence the Purificazione changed and adapted in response to current circumstances, but ‘never lost sight of its primary duty to the adolescents and youths of Florence. The ideals that had inspired its founders continued to guide the confraternity till the time of its suppression’ (p. 5). Those ideals were, first and foremost, to help young males become good Christians and attain eternal salvation, but then also to prepare them for an earthly life that required them to be socially adept, economically self-sufficient and politically astute. While we scholars have generally tended to emphasise the latter three, mostly because of our own contemporary biases and interests, we ought also to keep in mind that in early modern youth confraternities ‘civic virtues ... were always subordinated to religious principles. In addition, all the confraternity’s activities, whether educational, artistic, or economic, were undertaken only after a careful assessment of their religious implications and effects’ (p. 6). While this primacy of goals is certainly true, it is difficult, however, to gauge the actual extent to which confraternity administrators and members really did ‘assess’ the religious implications of their various activities – confraternity records are, on the whole, frustratingly silent about such discussions. And they also remain silent on the nature and implications of the various reforming movements of the time – neither the Protestant Reformation nor the Catholic renewal (whether Nicomachean or Tridentine) are mentioned, let alone discussed, in the records. Polizzotto himself acknowledges this silence, but then points out that it would have been surprising if the confraternity had discussed such ‘epoch-making’ events because its ‘horizons were restricted, and its interests sharply defined’ (p. 7). In spite of this, Polizzotto is able to overcome the silence by concentrating on how the confraternity adhered to the educational and religious ‘principles’ that inspired its foundation and underlay its various activities. ‘These

principles [as the author points out] enabled the Purification and the other youth confraternities to play an active role in the formation of Florentine citizens and, therefore, in the pursuit of the city's perceived destiny' (p. 9). That destiny, as we know, was firmly linked with the city's view of itself in millenarian terms as a 'new Jerusalem'. Organised chronologically and divided into six chapters, this monograph takes the reader through an examination of the confraternity's first fifteen years, the benefits it gathered from its close association with the Medici family in the 1440–90s, its precarious survival in the shadow of Savonarola and the post-Savonarolan movement, its adaptation to the new exigencies of political and religious changes between the 1530s and the 1620s, its diversification and philanthropy in the seventeenth century and its final century of activity leading up to its suppression in 1785. My only two regrets are that the volume does not contain a bibliography of archival sources used, nor does the bibliography of printed sources indicate the publishers of the books its lists – but these are minor criticisms to what is, otherwise, a splendid milestone in scholarship on Florentine lay religious associations.

VICTORIA COLLEGE,  
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

KONRAD EISENBICHLER

*The Knights Hospitaller of the English Langue, 1460–1565.* By Gregory O'Malley. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005. Pp. xvii + 427. £65. 0 19 925379 X  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906688131

At an early point in this book its author describes an encounter with the distinguished historian Sir John Plumb. On being told that O'Malley was working on the English Hospitallers in the fifteenth and early sixteenth centuries, Plumb's 'brisk but pertinent' response was 'Weren't they all decadent by then?' In a sense this immensely learned study of the order's English *langue* is an answer to that question, and the picture that emerges is a striking one. Without doubt the central preoccupations of the *langue*'s brethren were the efficient management and improvement of their estates in England, and the performance of services to the crown, which proved increasingly interventionist and demanding. In one telling passage O'Malley lists the long series of instructions that were sent back to England by the preceptor Hugh Middleton in c. 1448. Although he was in Italy or Rhodes when he wrote the letter, Middleton was keeping a close eye on the properties for which he was responsible. The roots of the English Hospitallers among the gentry, especially in the north of England, are amply demonstrated here: while the *langue* never became a 'closed shop', ties of kinship among the brethren were strong and they were sustained over generations. This is not surprising, nor is the degree to which the priors in particular were absorbed by royal affairs. But O'Malley shows clearly that the twin pressures of estate management and service to the crown did not stop the English *langue* from taking an active part in the work of the order on Rhodes. Middleton himself was *turcopolier*, the official charged with coastguard defence at Rhodes. It is true that perceptions of the order within England had become virtually stripped of crusading connotations, but English brethren and money made their way to the convent, especially at times of crisis in the east: over £6,000 was dispatched in 1522 to help besieged Rhodes. Within the order the English could not compete

with the French, Italian or Spanish, but their share of its major offices was greater than their numbers would lead one to expect. The English brethren were not intellectually brilliant and it is hard to detect much religious zeal amongst their ranks, but on the whole they were diligent and responsive in serving their order. O'Malley concludes that if the Reformation had not intervened the English Hospitallers would probably have continued to perform conventual service at Malta 'for centuries to come'. This hardly constitutes decadence. Although focused on one religious order in just one of its regions, this is a significant contribution to the debate about the Reformation. In the narrower field of Hospitaller history it is undoubtedly a landmark study. O'Malley's research, above all in the order's archive on Malta, is exceptionally thorough and his analysis is painstaking and judicious. His description of what was done by the last four English priors will surely not be surpassed, and he includes a valuable chapter on the Hospitallers in Ireland and Scotland. The care with which the author has carried out his research and written his book is matched by its production by Oxford University Press.

UNIVERSITY OF LEICESTER

NORMAN HOUSLEY

*Renaissance monks. Monastic humanism in six biographical sketches.* By Franz Posset. (Studies in Medieval and Reformation Traditions, 108.) Pp. xix + 196 incl. 13 figs. Leiden–Boston: Brill, 2005. €109. 90 04 14431 5; 1573 4188  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906698138

Franz Posset has set out to fill some gaps in our knowledge of German *Klosterhumanismus*, particularly connections between monastic humanist scholars and the Reformers. He has written biographical sketches of six monks, three Benedictines and three Cistercians: Conradus Leontorius of Maulbronn; Benedictus Chelidonius of Nuremberg; Bolfgangus Marius of Aldersbach; Henricus Urbanus of Georgenthal, Thuringia; Vitus Bild Acropolitani of Augsburg; and Nikolaus Ellenbog of Ottobeuren, Swabia. Posset describes their studies and their intellectual and personal connections with other humanists, especially Lutherans. He reaches three main conclusions: that these six monks all hoped for church reform; that despite being cloistered they formed strong networks with other scholars, including some Wittenberg Reformers, virtually sharing the Reformation's intellectual and spiritual background; that, in consequence, we must abandon the old idea of deformed late medieval monasticism being confronted by modernising Reformers. Posset also points to contemporary lay admiration for monk-scholars, especially contemplatives, citing the monastic ethos of Thomas More's *Utopia*: he suggests that those who sought to reform religion, politics and education leaned quite heavily on the monastic combination of contemplative reflection and scholarship. Some of Posset's conclusions are not new, but his descriptive biographies and his arguments about monastic humanist scholarship will stimulate further studies of humanism and the Reformation. Historians might, for example, pursue the considerable traffic of scholars and ideas around Europe – to and from Germany, England, France, Spain, the Netherlands, Bohemia, Slovenia, Croatia, Poland and Italy – movements upon which he touches only briefly. In particular, links between German and Italian humanist monks were probably greater than we realise, especially before the Council of Trent. Posset's book also

suggests that there may be value in studying relationships between monastic and secular humanism in German lands and in Europe generally. An example is the case of Corpus Christi College, Oxford, the founder of which originally intended it for monastic humanists but changed his mind and built it as a secular humanist college in 1517, just months before Luther's 95 theses. Similarly, Posset's work may encourage historians to study relationships between secular and monastic humanism after the Reformation, when monks who had at first appreciated Luther's insights became more distant following the political upheavals of the 1520s and political-ecclesiastical breaks with Rome. Theological questions may also have brought other changes in their scholarly relationship. In common with the Reformers, earlier monastic humanists addressed questions of guilt and justification, but they later veered away from these questions to confront the uncertainties that Reformed theology had aroused about sanctification. When that happened, monastic humanists (and non-monastic Catholic humanists) concentrated even more upon Greek patristic writings about sanctification. As the studies of Protestants and Catholics were increasingly directed towards different theological ends, the *studia humanitatis* that once had been common ground for monks and Reformers became something of a battleground. This book is an important step towards understanding the change.

UNIVERSITY OF MELBOURNE/  
UNIVERSITY OF OXFORD

BARRY COLLETT

*The front-runner of the Catholic Reformation. The life and works of Johann von Staupitz.* By Franz Posset. (St Andrews Studies in Reformation History.) Pp. xxii + 398 incl. 4 ills. Aldershot–Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2003. £59.50. 0 7546 0866 2  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906708132

Over the last fifteen years or so Franz Posset has produced a series of illuminating studies of Luther's theological debt to Staupitz, and to Bernard of Clairvaux via Staupitz. This biography, which seeks to synthesise the results of his own researches and those of others (notably Wriedt and Zumkeller) for an English-speaking readership, is therefore welcome. Posset argues that, thanks largely to Steinmetz, the significance of Staupitz for Luther has been reduced to that of 'a mediocre theologian who may have had some pastoral influence on Luther' (p. 371). Instead, the author asks us to take seriously Luther's own repeated affirmations of Staupitz's importance for him, identifying five areas in which Staupitz was not merely a forerunner but a front-runner of the Reformation (p. 376). A second purpose of the book is to reclaim Staupitz as a legitimate representative of reform-minded Catholicism against the tendency to read back a Thomist uniformity into pre-Tridentine Catholic theology. These two aims are confusingly combined in the title, and this confusion sets the tone for a book which is both useful and stimulating but not wholly convincing. One problem with it is that Posset appears to have had limited access to the considerable proportion of Staupitz's work still unpublished: certainly the primary bibliography contains no reference to the manuscript collections. Another is the selective approach taken towards Luther as a source. While Posset is willing to take Luther's word at face-value in his positive evaluations of Staupitz, especially those which acknowledge the consonance of their teaching, he

tends to play down Luther's more negative evaluations which date from the time of their split (1521–2). It is not obvious how one can appeal to Luther's testimony as determinative for understanding Staupitz's theology in some cases (p. 227), but accuse him of a 'distorted perception' of it in others (p. 295). Both these problems weaken Posset's revisionist strategy: the attack on Steinmetz over whether Staupitz 'defended' the immaculate conception (pp. 224–7), for instance, goes nowhere. A less serious problem with the book is its infelicity of expression and translation: Staupitz's preaching activity is referred to throughout as 'sermonizing', but the pejorative meaning of this word is clearly not intended; 'Mount Olive' appears for the Mount of Olives (p. 136); 'nostra tempestate' means simply 'in our time', not 'in these tempestuous times' (p. 209); Pope Leo's demand for mediators that are 'learned and probed' (p. 228) suggests a more intimate examination than 'doctos et probos' warrants. Mistranslation materially affects one of Posset's arguments. On the assumption that a particular treatise was only edited ('editus') and not composed by Luther, Posset proposes that its real author was Staupitz (pp. 215–18). 'Editus' did not, however, at this time mean 'edited' in the modern sense but 'published', and therefore confirms Luther's authorship. These specific criticisms aside, Posset's book makes a useful contribution to English-language scholarship on Staupitz; but ultimately it fails to solve the puzzle of the man and of his role in the early Reformation period.

UNIVERSITY OF HULL

DAVID BAGCHI

*Sacred space in early modern Europe*. Edited by Will Coster and Andrew Spicer. Pp. xiii + 350 incl. 26 ills and 6 figs. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005. £50. 13 978 0 521 82487 3; 10 0 521 82487 7  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906718139

Henri Lefebvre, quoted in this enjoyable collection of essays, described late medieval Europe as a land 'haunted by the Church', and Catholics and Protestants alike in the Reformation period had to decide what to do with that formidable legacy. The editors start with Protestant experiences, leap nimbly through one Balkan case study to the Counter-Reformation and then on to particular inter-confessional conflicts. Beat Kümin modifies the frequently-stated opposition of Church and Tavern, showing that their cultural functions were different but not necessarily incompatible. Bridget Heal uses the spectacular survival of pre-Reformation church furnishings in Nuremberg as the centrepiece for her argument that Lutheran churchgoers experienced such pre-Reformation buildings in a new way: bereft of processions, church interiors became places of communal prayer rather than loci of sacred power, and older surviving furnishings took on new meanings. The numerous officers who kept order and cleanliness in churches were there primarily to prevent disruption to worship, or in Lutheran settings private prayer outside service time, rather than to preserve sacred space from defilement. Christian Grosse explores the redefinition of holiness in Reformed Protestantism: in John Calvin's teaching it was located not so much in any earthly place as in the journey of sanctification made by elect human beings in their earthly lives. The Zürich version of Reformed identity embodied in the Second Helvetic Confession struck a different note, reasserting the holiness of places where God was worshipped, and even in Geneva

the new simplicity of churches and the arrangement of benches facing each other round the pulpit asserted a new communal intimacy, both within the congregation and with an unmediated God. Andrew Spicer examines architectural, theological and liturgical consequences of efforts by the early Stuart kings to enrich (that is, Anglicise) the liturgy of the Reformed Church of Scotland: David Lindsay, second bishop of Edinburgh, produced a new theology of the nature of holiness in churches and presided over an interesting rite of consecration for the new church at South Queensferry which included the two biblical sacraments of baptism and eucharist. John Craig tries to recapture salient noises of the Church of England's post-Reformation worship: besides the voice of the minister in pulpit or reading-desk and the congregational roar of metrical psalms, it included an unexpected amount of groaning from the devout in heartfelt and reverent comment on sermons, no doubt occasionally disturbing the slumbers of the omnipresent churchgoing dogs at their masters' feet. Will Coster draws on unusually detailed burial records at Holy Trinity, Chester, to map a social structure for the parish's dead: his sample is small, but enough to justify his perhaps unsurprising conclusion that population pressure increasingly reserved privileged access to burial inside the church building to the parish elite. In a study of medieval Moldavia (valuable but not always easy to follow), Maria Crăciun discusses its unique architectural feature, a burial chamber which intrudes into the plans of Byzantine-style Moldavian churches, cutting off the nave from the narthex. This innovation was exclusively associated with the late medieval ruling dynasty, converts from western Latin Christianity to eastern Orthodoxy, who wanted to have their cake and eat it by claiming a privileged burial space as near as possible to the altar without violating eastern Orthodox prohibitions on burials in nave or sanctuary. Simon Ditchfield describes how Counter-Reformation popes and their historians, led by Cesare Baronio and Antonio Bosio, made the most of a sudden windfall of early Christian archaeological finds in Rome, using a combination of scholarship and wishful thinking to conjure up a host of martyrs from the catacombs for the benefit of the contemporary Church. One of the most enjoyable essays comes from Trevor Johnson, dealing with another aspect of Counter-Reformation remoulding of the landscape. From the 1590s Discalced Carmelites in Spain and elsewhere began creating artificial 'deserts' or 'wildernesses' in remote places to reproduce the legendary conditions of their founders on Mount Carmel. This remarkable piece of self-fashioning in an order much given to such reinvention anticipated the Christian theme parks of present-day evangelical north America, but emphatically there were no paying customers: each manufactured primeval wilderness formed an exclusive enclosed refuge for a maximum of twenty-four friars. Alex Walsham describes the survival of St Winefride's well at Holywell in post-Reformation Welsh and English culture: first hanging on by the skin of its teeth because of recent patronage from Henry VIII's grandmother, becoming part Protestant tourist attraction, part rallying-point for Catholic survival through the most unpromising of times. Perhaps in this sprightly piece we might have heard something about the parish church whose gloomy Georgian successor disapprovingly overlooks the shrine and its pool – a parallel dysfunctional relationship can be found at the Irish shrine of St Gonnat at Ballyvourney in Co. Cork. Elizabeth Tingle considers how the Counter-Reformation interacted with vigorous but rather different patterns of traditional religion in Brittany: it enlisted the landscape and reordered existing buildings as a



means of reconciliation between old and new. At much the same time as the Discalced Carmelites, wandering Counter-Reformation preachers consciously sought out the wilderness retreats of early Breton Christianity, identifying with the harsh lives of ordinary people, and prehistoric menhirs were Christianised by being engraved or topped with a cross. Altogether, Catholics had an easier time allying with the visible past than did Protestants. Amanda Eurich describes Clochemerlesque contention over confessional space in Orange, a little enclave in France where Protestant and Catholic had an unusual balance of advantages thanks to the continuing rights of the House of Nassau (the comedy became particularly intense when William the Silent's devoutly Catholic son confronted Protestant governors ruling in his name). Duane J. Corpis has similar urban tales of petty point-scoring from the carefully-balanced Catholic and Lutheran communities of Augsburg in the wake of the Peace of Westphalia. Howard Louthan spells out the suicidal folly of the Elector Palatine Frederick as 'Winter King' in Bohemia, pursuing doctrinaire Reformed Protestant iconophobia to vandalise churches in Prague which the Hussite Church had left full of traditional imagery: his defeat was marked by a rapid accumulation of triumphalist architecture by the Catholic victors, notably in the addition of a 'virtual army' of statues of saints to Prague's famous Charles Bridge. This excellent collection, with not a single weak contribution, demonstrates the centrality of material culture and sacred geography to understanding the Reformation and Counter-Reformation.

ST CROSS COLLEGE,  
OXFORD

DIARMAID MACCULLOCH

*Town, country, and regions in Reformation Germany.* By Tom Scott. (Studies in Medieval and Reformation Traditions. History, Culture, Religion, Ideas, 106.) Pp. xxv + 452 incl. 5 ills. and 12 maps. Leiden–Boston: Brill, 2005. €149. 90 04 14321 1; 1573 4188

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906728135

This essay collection by Tom Scott, honorary professor at the St Andrews Institute of Reformation Studies, is a highly welcome contribution to the history and historiography of late medieval and early modern Germany. It brings together a selection of fifteen articles published over the last thirty years. None of the essays is 'new' but there is no doubt that some of them will be novel to the readers since they appear here in English for the first time. Several of them have been lifted from the vaults of rather obscure publication locations and by not just reprinting them but translating them from German into English Scott also makes them available to a much wider audience of the increasing number of those who lack the language skills to read them in German. Apart from the translation the essays remain largely as written; only the footnotes have been updated on secondary literature, thus allowing the opportunity to notice how Scott's views and arguments have evolved over time.

At first glance the title of the volume might be misleading. 'Reformation Germany' seems to suggest that the period covered is post-1500. In fact, the essays range from c. 1350 to 1600. To speak of Germany in this period can be misleading too. Thomas A. Brady, Jr, well aware of these pitfalls, warily – but not without controversy – subtitles his introduction to the volume 'The German lands in the

early modern era, 1300–1600'. However, it should be more accurately termed German-speaking lands since Scott's home territory, and the focal point of the essays, is the Upper Rhine valley from Lake Constance to the banks of the Middle Rhine, encompassing the regions of the Alsace, the Breisgau and the northern parts of the Swiss Confederation.

The essays are arranged in three parts. The six essays in part I deal with aspects of 'Town and country between reform and revolt', while the five essays in part II, 'Economic landscapes', centre on the concept of economic regions structured by a plurality of town-country relations. Scott discusses critically older models like the central-place theory or more recent ones, such as theories of economic landscapes and urban networks. The final four essays of part III, subsumed under 'Regions and local identities', comprise a rather mixed bag dealing with economic, cultural and social aspects. The impressively wide-ranging subjects covered here and the spanning of 'canonised' periods such as the Middle Ages and early modern times reflect Scott's own understanding of his craft as historian. He is one of the few British scholars who have embraced the German concept of *Geschichtliche Landeskunde* or historical regional studies based on a comparative, interdisciplinary approach to history which features a strong emphasis on historical geography and economic politics as well as the understanding that it is necessary to study particular regions over an extended period of time.

In the remainder of the review I will confine my remarks to the six articles in part I, assuming that they are of the most interest for the readers of this JOURNAL. The central questions he pursues are the revolutionary quality of the *Bundschuh* revolts shortly before and after 1500, their connection with the Peasants' War of 1524–6, the formative role of radical preachers or evangelical peasants in these events and the extent of and motivation for the political collaboration between townspeople and revolutionary countryfolk. The first article, 'Reformation and Peasants' War in Waldshut and environs' (1978/9) discusses in great detail these questions for the county town of Waldshut, which lies at the southern edge of the Black Forest and only thirty and forty miles away respectively from Basle and Zürich. Scott, *inter alia* the author of an influential monograph on Thomas Müntzer (1989), argues that the influence of radical theologians such as Balthasar Hubmaier, who first introduced Zwinglian and subsequently Anabaptist reforms to Waldshut, or of Müntzer himself (who was active in the area in 1525), is often overstated. For Scott there is no doubt that the proximity to the Swiss Confederation and the socio-economic conflict with neighbouring monastic institutions constitute the decisive factors in explaining the scale of Waldshut's involvement with the militant peasantry in the countryside. In other words it was far less religious ideology and more opportunistic considerations that shaped Waldshut's policies during the Peasants' War. However, Scott's downplaying of the role of theology is certainly something which is open to debate.

Naturally, Peter Blicke is a name that crops up in almost all of Scott's publications, an acknowledgment of the former's paramount influence on studies about the common man and Reformation. But Scott also never shies away from an argument if he considers a thesis overstretches its applicability. In his article 'The communal Reformation between town and country' (1993) Scott questions the validity of Blicke's concept of *Gemeindereformation* ('Communal Reformation') in regard to the Swiss Catholic inner cantons and to the Alsace. By taking the necessity of a Protestant reformation out of Blicke's concept he concludes firmly 'that it

was possible to achieve a Communal Reformation without the introduction of evangelical religion' (p. 75). This also gives a clue to Scott's understanding of 'Reformation' (and ultimately to the title of the volume). For him Reformation is a late-medieval desire to 'Christianise' the Church which did not have to lead to the adoption of 'proper' evangelical principles.

Essays 3 ('The "Butzenkrieg": the Rouffach revolt of 1514' [1998]) and 5 ('From the Bundschuh to the Peasants' War' [2004]) are strong pleas that the revolutionary potential of peasants' risings cannot be denied just because they did not yet have the impetus of Protestant doctrine. Essay 4 ('Freiburg and the Bundschuh' [1998]) again demonstrates how important socio-political factors were in shaping the response of towns towards rebellious peasants. This theme is picked up in the final essay of this part ('South-west German towns in the Peasants' War' [2001]) which gives a tremendously valuable synopsis of over 110 towns along the Rhine valley ranging from voluntary and involuntary alliances with the peasant troops to towns not taking part in the Peasants' War at all. In an appendix to this essay each town is listed with references to archival and secondary sources.

More more could be said about this multi-faceted book. Tom Scott has presented not only highly readable narratives and shared his vast knowledge of source materials but he also offers a range of challenging views and arguments. His essay collection should be the starting point for every student of the area and the period; the only drawback might be the price.

UNIVERSITY OF ESSEX

HERBERT EIDEN

*Reforming the Reformation. Essays in honour of Principal Peter Matheson.* Edited by Ian Breward. Pp. x + 239 incl. 2 ill. Melbourne: Australian Scholarly, 2004. A\$50 (paper). 1 74097 065 9

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906738131

The academic career of Peter Matheson – 'a Scot with an Antipodean overlay' (p. 3) – has taken him from a North British department of church history to the leadership of theological colleges in New Zealand and Australia. His *Festschrift* is unusual in the amount of space allocated to biographical memoir, so much so that the reader is all but invited to relate his academic interests to his biography, and to see him as a true child of the 1960s. Part of a group of divinity lecturers who were regarded, by themselves at least, as *enfants terribles* (though in their genteel Edinburgh way this led to the satirising of the Kirk Assembly rather than to the manning of barricades), Matheson was later drawn to the radicalism of Thomas Müntzer, whose works he translated in 1988. This led him in turn to the writings of the more patrician but still marginalised Argula von Stauffen, and ultimately to the wider consideration of Reformation pamphlet literature in his two late works, *The rhetoric of the Reformation* (1997) and *The imaginative world of the Reformation* (2000). In the same way, it was perhaps the spirit of ecumenism, still strong in the '60s, which explains the focus of his first book, on the Colloquy of Regensburg (*Cardinal Contarini at the Diet of Regensburg* [1972]). The tributes in this book fall broadly into these four areas of Matheson's interest: Müntzer and radicalism; von Stauffen; communication processes in the Reformation; unity and toleration.

Tom Scott contributes an inquiry into the origins of Müntzer's description of the mustard-seed of faith which can move mountains as not only small but also bitter. He finds no exact parallels in any of the reformers or in the theological tradition to which Müntzer was heir, and concludes that the trope of the bitter mustard-seed was the product of Müntzer's extraordinary religious imagination, inspired by the bitter-sweet experience of practical ministry. This fits neatly into the themes of the volume, but one would like to have seen further investigation of the closest parallels Scott found, those with Tauler, Luther and Karlstadt. It suggests some connection with Staupitz, for whom the idea of divine 'sweetness' was so richly suggestive, but in Müntzer's view so facile. Alejandro Zorzin charts the journey of another radical, Fridolin Meyger, a Strasbourg lawyer, from evangelical humanist to Anabaptist. In a testimony given while a prisoner of the Strasbourg authorities, Meyger explained how he had been driven by the clash between Luther and Erasmus to conclude that conventional Lutheranism undervalued the importance of good works. This made him easy pickings for Anabaptists. Thereafter, he committed himself in particular to exposing the unChristian nature of usury.

Dorothee Kommer analyses the manuscripts of von Stauffen's first two pamphlets (which were discovered by Matheson in the Bavarian State Library), and reminds us that the age of printing did not eclipse immediately the process or the importance of manuscript circulation. Siegfried Bräuer's contribution concerns biblical drama, which he describes as the 'fifth medium' of Reformation propaganda (after sermons, pamphlets, broadsheets and song). Taking as an example the 'comedia' of the rich man and Lazarus by the Zwickau schoolmaster Johannes Krüginger in 1534 (also discussed by Stephen Wailes in his 1997 monograph on dramatic representations of this parable), Bräuer emphasises its role as part of a Lutheran campaign against usury while providing assurance to the poor of God's ultimate, if posthumous, vindication of their cause. Charles Zika offers a fascinating study of the woodcut, by the unfortunately-named Johann Teufel, of the witch of Endor, which begins to appear in editions of the Luther Bible from 1572. Teufel's depiction of the witch differed from the French original in possessing a rosary and diabolical paraphernalia, reflecting the hardening of Lutheran attitudes both to Catholic devotion and to such 'harmless' practices as fortune-telling. Denis Janz provides an attractive exposition of Luther's understanding of faith, and rightly urges Reformation historians to enter more imaginatively into the theological mindset of their chosen period.

In a wide-ranging discussion, George Newlands considers whether the Reformation was 'the powerhouse of the [human] rights revolution' (p. 107). His verdict, not surprisingly, tends to the negative: so long as Christ was perceived primarily as king or judge, censure and persecution remained concomitants of Christianity across the denominations. It was only by reaching beyond revealed truth to natural law, as in Aquinas and especially Grotius, that important steps towards a culture of human rights could be taken. By contrast, Nick Thompson reminds us that 'European irenic theology, far from withering away in the era of confessionalisation, was kept alive by a second and then a third generation of confessional misfits' (p. 128). The misfit he discusses is William Forbes, first bishop of Edinburgh, who was unusual among seekers after a *via media* in refusing to demonise the extremes: on the sacrifice of the mass, for example, he sought not so much a third way as a genuine common way that, as far as possible, incorporated conflicting

viewpoints. Ian Breward points out that recent attempts to rehabilitate the reputation of Archbishop Laud have failed to take account of his catastrophic failure to read the religious situation in Scotland when he tried to introduce the Prayer Book there.

Overall, this is an attractive and stimulating volume. It is however let down by the typesetting which is poor throughout and mangles the sense of a couple of pages (pp. 48 and 54). It was also a strange editorial decision to have the text of Bräuer's article translated into English, but not his extensive and important notes.

UNIVERSITY OF HULL

DAVID BAGCHI

*Universitätstheologie und Kirchenreform. Die Anfänge der Reformation in Wittenberg, 1516–1522.*

By Jens-Martin Kruse. (Veröffentlichungen des Instituts für Europäische Geschichte Mainz, 187.) Mainz-am-Rhein: Philipp von Zabern, 2002. €42.

3 8053 2758 7

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906748138

For many years Martin Luther weighed so heavily on the writing of the German Reformation that it became a commonplace to write narratives of the broader movement primarily from the perspective of the Wittenberg reformer. Modern historiography no longer privileges Luther or his theological ideas to the same extent; indeed, recent work on the Reformation represents something of an inversion of the earlier approach, as historians work to understand the internal dimensions of the reformer and his reform movement from the perspective of his external world. Contextualising Luther and his ideas, however, does not necessarily mean diminishing his importance or reducing his role, as Jens-Martin Kruse demonstrates to great effect in *Universitätstheologie und Kirchenreform*, an excellent study of the rise of the Wittenberg reform movement from the eve of the indulgence debate to the outbreak of unrest in the town. The main focus of the work is the shaping of the Wittenberg theology as a cooperative or communal venture within the framework of a gild of university scholars who showed interest in Luther's theological ideas. In the opening chapters, Kruse recreates the conditions, the dynamic and the personalities involved in the evolution of this reform sodality (which he likens to a community devoted to and defined by the exchange of ideas, a *Diskussionsgemeinschaft*), starting with the early Wittenberg appointments and looking in detail at the figures who came to play a substantial role in the making of the early movement, from Nikolaus von Amsdorf, Johannes Dölsch and Johann Lang to Andreas Karlstadt. In the accounts of the early Wittenberg reformers there was a clear sense of the force of Luther's personality and the methods he used – teaching, preaching, writing (both letters and published texts), debating, even gift-giving – in order to win support for his ideas; but Kruse does a skilful job of balancing this influence against the personal histories of his followers, who were more likely to attribute their turn to the emerging Wittenberg theology with reference to the study of Scripture or the works of Augustine. Indeed, much of the book is devoted to the study of the exchange of ideas in the early years (which was much more open-ended than is often assumed) and the extent to which the reform movement was fashioned in a dialogue between local scholars within the setting of the newly-created Saxon university.

Ultimately, this sense of a common endeavour began to fade once the Wittenberg movement attracted the attention of the church authorities. The community of scholars did not disband, and the *Diskussionsgemeinschaft* remained as reforms were implemented in the university and the town. Karlstadt in particular continued to play a prominent role once the debate appeared on the imperial stage. But the focus was clearly shifting to the words and the works of Luther, both within Wittenberg and in the German lands in general. (Already by 1519, as Johannes Eck prepared for the debate in Leipzig, he was referring to Luther as founder of the new doctrine.) As a consequence, the history traced by Kruse from the posting of the theses to Heidelberg, Augsburg, Leipzig, the burning of the papal bull and the Wittenberg movement and its resolution in 1523 – which effectively excluded the influence of Karlstadt – is increasingly a return to the narrative of Luther's personal struggle against his opponents (and indeed his supporters) to see through his theological vision. As Luther began to stamp his *imprimatur* on the movement, and as his conviction grew that he was a tool in the hands of God, the spirit of dialogue was eventually eclipsed by the weight of his growing *auctoritas*, and he began to apply the talents he had demonstrated in gathering together colleagues in Wittenberg to a broader stage. This is the story of the German Reformation that has been written in recent years, the making of Martin Luther and the evangelical movement within the framework of the social, cultural and personal relations that helped to turn it into a historical event. In *Universitätstheologie und Kirchenreform*, Jens-Martin Kruse adopts a similar perspective and applies it to the point of origin, the University of Wittenberg. This is a meticulous and important work of Reformation history, and it should figure prominently in many of the discussions to come.

QUEEN'S UNIVERSITY,  
BELFAST

C. SCOTT DIXON

*Reformation and the culture of persuasion.* By Andrew Pettegree. Pp. xi + 237 incl. 10 ill.  
Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005. £40 (cloth), £15.99 (paper).  
13 978 0 521 84175 7; 10 0 521 84175 5; 13 978 0 521 60264 8; 10 0 521 60264 5  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906758134

Less than a decade ago Andrew Pettegree, founding director of the Reformation Studies Institute at the University of St Andrews, established the St Andrews French Vernacular Book Project, the purpose of which is to create an analytical bibliography of all known books that were published in French before the beginning of the seventeenth century. In its own way, the French Vernacular Book Project is likely to become as essential as the famous *Short-title catalogue* has been to scholars for books in English. The *STC* (began in the 1920s) first spurred forward vast efforts to locate, list and then microfilm rare books for research libraries all over the world; and now, especially, it is renowned as the progenitor of 'Early English Books on Line', which can bring incunabula to every desktop. The French Book Project will probably become more useful than the old *STC*, as it has been designed to meet the demands of the electronic age.

In *Reformation and the culture of persuasion*, Pettegree has drawn upon his experience with the history of the printed book to survey the current state of the field. Why did people make the choices that they did in the sixteenth century? What were the

dynamics of conversion that prompted them to accept changes in their faith? His survey examines a constellation of media that imbued the culture of Protestantism, including preaching, singing, drama and the visual image.

For Pettegree, the late medieval Roman Catholic Church was strong and in good health. Innovations were wrought inside its own wide embrace, but some of the security it enjoyed in society and in people's hearts was undermined due to the success Martin Luther enjoyed in the pulpit, combined with a cascade of print. The economics of book production took a long time to develop. First as a 'prestige venture' (p. 129) that required large investments by wealthy patrons (including bishops and monasteries), the book trade had to be restructured between 1490 and 1520, when smaller centres of print (like St Albans) failed because the nature of the market was not yet understood. Thereafter the dominant places for printing were Paris, Antwerp, Venice, Rome, Basle, Cologne and London, and soon important regional presses were established elsewhere, as in Augsburg.

Among the most useful ideas that *The culture of persuasion* establishes is that of the 'pamphlet moment'. Steady sales were less important to the development of the Reformation than convergences, especially when political crises were marked by startling spikes in the demand for books. The first great pamphlet moment was brought on not by Luther's ninety-five theses in October 1517, but rather when his *Sermon on indulgences* was printed the following March. From 1518 to 1526 an astonishing six million copies of some six thousand separate works poured from presses in the German empire, most of them books in a small quarto format (p. 165). Luther's sermons, his New Testament translation and his theological tracts were in such heavy demand that Wittenberg (backed by Lucas Cranach's shrewd investments) was transformed into a veritable 'boomtown' (p. 134) of print. It happened again for Geneva in the 1540s and 1550s, as John Calvin issued his *Institutes*, plus other works that totalled more than 100,000 or even 200,000 words annually, even before he oversaw the translation of the French Bible and the metrical Psalms (pp. 142–3). A new French pamphlet moment occurred from 1560 to 1565, when one-third of all the Protestant works published in France in the sixteenth century flooded from new presses in Caen, Orleans and Lyon (p. 178). Under the kind of pressures that ultimately fuelled the religious wars, and the St Bartholomew's Day Massacre, the type of polemical writing which had been open to negotiation now gave way to propaganda (pp. 182–4).

Pettegree challenges some the assumptions that have commanded the field of Reformation studies ever since the late Bob Scribner published his masterly *For the sake of simple folk* in 1981. Certainly Luther or Calvin or any other polemist, like the Catholic Johannes Eck, wrote to persuade. But how did people use books? With poor eyesight a common problem (p. 108), could people easily interpret what they saw? Acoustic reading, as a means of persuasion, Pettegree argues, was surprisingly rare, except for the Bible. The Bible was the public book *par excellence*. It was read aloud in churches, and read privately at home. More than 100,000 copies of the New Testament were printed in Wittenberg alone during Luther's life. (p. 139). But there is little evidence to show how more ephemeral material, like pamphlets and woodcuts, were read. Scholars should no longer entertain the 'imagined scenario' of masters pausing to teach their apprentices what some woodcut meant (p. 119).

If that is the case, why were tens of thousands of printed works bought by the men and women of the sixteenth century? Or were they buying for other reasons? Here

Pettegree raises some useful *caveats* about the ways in which books were 'read', for the book was also recognised as being important for its own sake as an object. Some books were as holy as relics. They were desirable for the sheer joy of ownership. Sometimes groups of pamphlets were bundled together by the seller, binder or buyer, and bound as if they were a single book. This will be a familiar fact to scholars who have ordered a single work in a Rare Books Room, only to discover that it was originally bound with a group of others, all by the same author, or all on a similar topic: an experience that may become rarer for English books due to the convenience of EEBO. Pettegree notes that such small collections represent the 'irresistible pressure' exerted by the multiplication of reinforcement. 'They were the crowd made text' (p. 162).

*Reformation and the culture of persuasion* is a thoughtful and elegant addition to desk, bookshelf and scholarship.

FORDHAM UNIVERSITY

SUSAN WABUDA

*Singing the Gospel. Lutheran hymns and the success of the Reformation.* By Christopher Boyd Brown. Pp. xiii + 298 incl. 6 figs and 4 tables. Cambridge, MA–London: Harvard University Press, 2005. £25.95. 0 674 01705 6  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906768130

Christopher Boyd Brown's *Singing the Gospel* is a stimulating contribution to the discussion of popular religion and the role of music in the Lutheran Reformation. Brown argues that the widespread view that after the first enthusiastic decade Lutheranism failed to embrace and engage popular culture and thus became the Reformation 'from above' is flawed. He sees this as largely due to a one-sided study of Lutheranism concentrating on aspects such as visitations and catechisms, while other attempts to reform society and create a Lutheran identity especially among the laity using such means as hymns and prayers remain understudied. Brown seeks to rectify the picture with an examination of the religious life of the Bohemian mining town of Joachimsthal, from the very start of the Reformation through to the mid-seventeenth century. His study illustrates the widespread and successful use of Lutheran hymns in all parts of life in Joachimsthal, public and private, in church, schools and homes. The lasting influence of Lutheran hymns in this town and, as a consequence, of the Reformation was largely the work of the cantor Nicolaus Herman and the rector and preacher Johann Mathesius. These two, together with a supportive town council and a devout laity, allowed Lutheran hymns and thus Lutheran teaching to penetrate all aspects of life. Hymns with all their pedagogical advantages were an especially successful tool since they also reached the more neglected groups in sixteenth-century society, women and children, who in turn were also less subject to repression. For Brown it was precisely this 'shared religious culture' of Joachimsthal that enabled Lutheranism to survive for another generation despite various attempts to destroy the town's strong religious identity during Habsburg rule and the Counter-Reformation.

Four appendices describe the contents of Nicolaus Herman's *Sonntags-Evangelia* (1560–1630) and *Historien von der Sindflut* (1562–1607), and the various editions. The lists of editions, compiled from bibliographies such as the *VD16* and *Das deutsche Kirchenlied*, contain all relevant bibliographical information as well as descriptions of the contents of each edition. The two appendices listing the contents of both of



Herman's works, again with references to musical bibliographies, illustrate both the liturgical and biblical connections of these songs as well as their applicability to all parts of Christian life. Altogether, the appendices illustrate and explain Brown's presentation of Herman's songs in particular and Lutheran hymns in general as a potent medium of the evangelical message. This book is an excellent example of sound interdisciplinary research embedded in a fascinating study of the history of one Lutheran town, appealing to historians, pedagogues, theologians, musicologists and general readers alike. Together with Wagner Oettinger's valuable *Music as propaganda in the German Reformation*, Brown's study of the success of Lutheran hymns in winning the hearts and minds of the people of Joachimsthal provides a crucial re-evaluation of the importance of the medium of music for the success of the (Lutheran) Reformation.

UNIVERSITY OF ZURICH

ALEXANDRA KESS

*Music and religious identity in counter-Reformation Augsburg, 1580–1630.* By Alexander J. Fisher. (St Andrews Studies in Reformation History.) Pp. xvi + 345 incl. 11 figs, 2 tables and 22 music examples. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2004. £59.50. 0 7546 3875 8

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906778137

The city of Augsburg provides an ideal case for the study of confessional coexistence in the period of reforms: it was a leading commercial and political centre and witnessed major religious debates and treaties, above all the Peace of Augsburg (1555), which for the town itself meant the continuous power-sharing of Roman Catholics and Lutherans in civic institutions. Augsburg's churches and schools (the Catholic cathedral, the Lutheran church and *Gymnasium* of St Anna, the Benedictine abbey of St Ulrich and Afra, the Jesuit church and college of St Salvator and so forth) were important centres of music-making and musical production throughout the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, despite increasing confessional tensions and the ravages of the Thirty Years War. Alexander J. Fisher presents the outlines of Augsburg's political and institutional history as a framework to a more trenchant story, that of religious identity and mentality as expressed in religious song. This choice of topic, which already defined the author's Harvard dissertation of 2000, is made more relevant through the exploration of hitherto unknown archival documentation from the local criminal courts, concerning the prosecution of confessional militants. In fact the imposed confessional 'parity' was so fragile at times that a local weaver, a hospital nurse and her patients, and various other citizens were barbarically tried in court for circulating, singing and even owning anti-Catholic songs. These were usually *contrafacta* of popular Lutheran hymns, provided with more topical religious and political texts by Protestant intellectuals of the city. Fisher aims to weave these stories into the larger panorama of the cultivation of sacred music in Augsburg. He traces the confessional liturgies and various traditions of musical practice, for example the street-singing of the Protestant church choirs on feast-days, or the newly-revived processions and pilgrimages of the Catholic population. He compares the output of the church composers (Adam Gumpelzhaimer at St Anna, Gregor Aichinger and Christian Erbach at the cathedral, and many others), and investigates their music libraries: the repertory of St Anna appears as 'ecumenical', that of the cathedral as confessionally narrow. All

these divergent materials are presented with historiographical skill, love of detail and obvious empathy for the human aspects of the subject on either side of the community. The music examples of hymn melodies and figural settings, and the many full transcriptions of song-texts, administrative documents and, especially, criminal trial records make absolutely compelling reading. This book is an outstanding specimen of the growing literature on urban religious and musical life in early modern Europe. It may not yield an entirely straightforward picture of Augsburg's history (but then, its subject was not of that kind) and its findings are not easily integrated into the larger panorama of German religious history as a whole, but Fisher has made a significant, even indispensable, contribution towards that history.

FACULTY OF MUSIC,  
UNIVERSITY OF OXFORD

REINHARD STROHM

*The seventh window. The King's Window donated by Philip II and Mary Tudor to Sint Janskerk in Gouda (1557).* Edited and compiled by Wim de Groot. Pp. 304 incl. 116 black-and-white and colour ills + CD. Hilversum: Verloren, 2005. €40 (book), CD €10 (CD). 90 6550 822 8

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906788133

The Sint Janskerk in Gouda, the longest church in the Netherlands and one of the most splendid in its cathedral-like proportions, might be thought in itself to justify such a magnificently-produced treatment as this book, but in fact only one single stained-glass window in the extraordinary sequence of windows surviving in that great building forms the actual subject of Wim de Groot's collective venture. The King's Window was commissioned from the celebrated stained-glass artist Dirck Crabeth (c. 1500–74) by Philip II of Spain (and king consort of England): it was installed between 1557 and 1559, as a major symbol of Habsburg power in an increasingly fragmented and contentious Netherlands, and as a royal contribution to the rebuilding of the church after a disastrous fire in 1552. For the English it has a special significance as including a rare portrait of Philip with his wife Queen Mary Tudor, kneeling as devout spectators of the Last Supper, while its strong identification of Philip with King Solomon is one of the first examples of the theme which became so important to the self-image of the world-ruler, living in his reconstruction of Solomon's Temple at the Escorial, half-monastery, half-palace. The glazing scheme survived the iconoclastic fury of 1566 thanks to the power of the president of the Secret Council, Viglius van Aytta, who had probably been responsible for prompting Philip's gift of the King's Window in the first place: subsequently it was not so fortunate in its relationship with Dutch weather, and only about half the glass is now original. Yet the unique distinction of the window is the survival still in the Sint Janskerk archives of Crabeth's full-size cartoon for the glass, which enabled the window's triumphant restoration at the beginning of the last century. In 1997 the cartoon became the centrepiece of a major exhibition at the Museo del Prado in Madrid: this agreeable symbol of Hispano-Dutch reconciliation was the inspiration for this volume, edited by the man responsible for conserving Crabeth's drawings for the exhibition. The contents provide not simply a detailed analysis of the window itself and its context in the Habsburg Netherlands,

but a pleasingly discursive set of essays which range from a conspectus of the life and music of a great Dutch church, as far as a treatment of the portrayal of King Solomon in the Hebrew Bible. With essays from Spanish and Dutch scholars as well as from such English luminaries as Geoffrey Parker and Glyn Redworth, this is a triumph of collaborative presentation. There is a CD illustrating the window, and the illustrations are superb, including the alarming photograph of a burned-out workman's hut immediately below the window in 2003, which finally would have done for it, but for the effectiveness of Dutch protective double-glazing.

ST CROSS COLLEGE,  
OXFORD

DIARMAID MACCULLOCH

*The Church in the republic. Gallicanism and political ideology in Renaissance France.* By Jotham Parsons. Pp. xi + 322. Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 2004. \$59.95. 0 8132 1384 3  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S002204690679813X

This is an important study the claims and implications of which will have to be considered and tested by a broad spectrum of French historians, including specialists from the fifteenth to the seventeenth centuries, indeed to 1789; those concerned with political events as well as with political theory; social as well as ecclesiastical historians. And, given the deeper resonances of Gallicanism elsewhere in early modern Europe, including Venice and England, this is a book that deserves an even wider audience. Jotham Parsons argues that the early modern French state cannot be properly understood without grasping the evolution of the politics and ideologies embraced by the term Gallicanism. This claim places religion at the heart of the early modern state, in a way that may seem at first glance to support the recent demand to put religion back into the wars of religion; intriguingly, however, Parsons's account downplays the significance of those wars, at least in respect of the importance usually attributed to Protestant monarchomach and resistance theories in accounts of early modern French political thought. Parsons examines the development of various strands of Gallicanism from medieval conciliarism and humanistic criticism of Roman corruption, through the emergence of a historicised, learned account developed by jurists such as Estienne Pasquier, Pierre Pithou, Antoine Loisel and Antoine Arnauld, progenitor of the Jansenist clan (although the intertwining of Jansenism and Gallicanism later in the seventeenth century is only briefly alluded to in the concluding chapter). Parsons provides a clear account of the significance of jurisdictional conflicts in the assertion of the liberties of the Gallican Church from the claims of Rome but also in the conflicts within France between royal courts and the hierarchy. Such jurisdictional claims could, however, be inconvenient to the crown itself. Parsons's learning is profound. A dozen pages of printed primary sources are listed in his bibliography. He has also examined with exemplary care manuscript collections, so that he is able to discuss authoritatively their provenance; to correct misattributions in the catalogue of the Bibliothèque Nationale; and to identify marginalia in printed works. Such scholarship demands close and careful reading. Parsons's footnotes offer the attentive reader some pleasing wit as well as learning. In his discussion of the style of the seventeenth-century Bourbon monarchy, which he is not afraid to suggest, against recent trends, may still conveniently be labelled 'absolute', he makes a comparison in the main

text with Donald Rumsfeld; it would be good to think that Parsons's scholarship will continue to be consulted long after that allusion has lost its force.

UNIVERSITY OF ESSEX

JOAN DAVIES

*Moderate voices in the European Reformation*. Edited by Luc Racaut and Alec Ryrie. Pp. xiv + 219. Aldershot–Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2005. £47.50. 0 7546 5021 9

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906808134

*Moderate voices in the European Reformation* is the latest contribution to a growing body of literature that considers those individuals of the Reformation era who resisted extremism and confessional polarisation. What is most significant in this volume of collected essays is the manner in which the contributors conceptualise religious moderation. While, a generation ago, scholars traditionally focused on figures such as Sebastian Castellio or groups such as the Polish Brethren in their quest to chart the progress of modern notions of toleration, historians today are critical of what they perceive as a Whiggish bias to the study of religious moderation in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries. The contributors to this collection problematise the concept of moderation in a helpful fashion. As these essays clearly illustrate, this was a bewilderingly complex, multi-layered and often ambiguous phenomenon. Its practitioners may not always have been recognised as moderate in the modern sense of the word. To use what is certainly the most striking metaphor in the entire volume, Mark Greengrass argues that moderation was like 'heated wax in a lava lamp', constantly shifting and changing shape. There are two significant clusters of essays in this collection. Three are devoted to Tudor England. In a critical analysis of the Elizabethan *via media*, Ethan Shagan argues that the search for a middle way was much more contested and contentious than many have assumed. Louise Campbell investigates the career of Matthew Parker, Elizabeth's first archbishop and an individual who has been often seen as the embodiment of the queen's moderate religious temper. Campbell questions this traditional assessment and further complicates our understanding of the Elizabethan Settlement. The second major grouping, nearly half the essays in the volume, investigates the French context. Alain Tallon considers Gallicanism as a platform for religious dialogue and what he sees as a type of 'Catholic Anglicanism'. Alexandra Kess focuses on the early sixteenth century and the court of Francis I. Here she follows the efforts of the Du Bellay brothers and their diplomatic negotiations with German Protestants. In a thoughtful conclusion Mark Greengrass charts the ambiguities of moderation primarily through the work of Philip du Plessis-Mornay and Jean Bodin. As with any edited collection, there are issues of imbalance with *Moderate voices*. Central Europe receives little attention, and the Low Countries are passed over altogether. But though coverage is decidedly slanted toward France and England, the volume's most valuable contribution is its expanded and more nuanced understanding of the Reformation's middle parties. *Moderate voices* could be used profitably in conjunction with another recent publication, *Conciliation and confession* (Notre Dame 2004), a collection of essays investigating attempts at ecclesiastical mediation from the fifteenth to the seventeenth century.

UNIVERSITY OF FLORIDA

HOWARD LOUTHAN

*Catholics and the Protestant nation. Religious politics and identity in early modern England.*

Edited by Ethan H. Shagan. (Politics, Culture and Society in Early Modern Britain.) Pp. viii + 213. Manchester–New York: Manchester University Press, 2005. £49.99. 0 7190 5768 X; 978 0 7190 5768 7

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906818130

The avowed aim of this collection of vigorously written essays is to take ‘Catholic’ history out of the ghetto, not only by restoring it to a central place in the political and cultural history of early modern England but by suggesting that many key areas of English history cannot be properly understood without consideration of a Catholic perspective. To this end many of the essays touch upon ‘Catholic’ as a contested category, a view which, as Marshall’s lively opening essay demonstrates, emerged as early as the reign of Henry VIII, though whether the term retained quite the same resonances a century later remains doubtful. The subsequent multiple definitions of the term, and the consequences for action which followed from them, are also central to the essays of McCoog and Sommerville, the first of which offers a broad European context as a way of reconsidering the use, or non-use of martyrology, by English Catholics for an English audience. This is a convincing argument which shifts the focus of the recent work by Dillon on to the intra-Catholic disputes which informed that debate, suggesting that contemporaries were circumspect about the use of martyrologies as a means of confessional identity, and that their emergence owed as much to the conflicts between the appellants and the Jesuits as to any desire to establish a distinctly Catholic tradition to combat that produced by the Protestant establishment. This analysis breaks new ground and provides the most convincing explanation for the manuscript circulation of accounts, such as that of Margaret Clitherow by John Mush, before their appearance in print. Somerville’s essay also looks at European thinkers in the light of English experience to ‘revise the revisionists’, including the views of his fellow contributor Questier, and restore a more traditional interpretation of the oath of allegiance and Catholic responses to it. This is convincing if rather slightly done, perhaps due to the nature of the evidence, or perhaps determined by the terminal date of 1625, and this reviewer is not convinced that the line of argument could be sustained quite as strongly if carried through to the years 1635–70, when the shifts in Catholic political thought in those years may have owed as much to the changes in government as to responses to the oath, though that still dominated discussion.

Discussion of the oath brings us to relations with central government, and these form the central plank of the essays by Questier and Lake, each of which explore the use of ‘bad counsel’ as a means by which Catholics could both criticise and profess loyalty to the regime, or in the case of Lake, to the expected regime. Through this device Catholics were able to suggest that the political problems of the late Elizabethan polity were due chiefly to its capture by a Protestantism which was inherently susceptible to division and faction. Each essay produces complex arguments from difficult texts and, while the texts are sometimes subject to rather heavy-handed scrutiny, the important point, in the light of the concerns of the collection, that Catholic criticism of the regime shared much, and even could be said to pre-date, the characteristic pattern of Puritan criticism of the Stuart court is important and well made. The use of Jesuit political theorists by Civil War radicals becomes more intelligible in the light of these essays. In that sense these works, and

Catholic exploitation of them, were central to what is now thought of as the 'political culture' of the period.

The remaining essays, by Shagan and Shell, offer different perspectives. Shagan, following the line of his recent book, negotiates the 'petty' conflicts which arose between neighbours, and his focus on these in the context of mid-Tudor England, and the failure of the Marian regime to 'put the clock back' raises important points about the nature of subsequent 'wars of religion' in the villages, given that these can be identified equally well in the mid-Tudor crisis. It is not clear how 'Catholic' these wars were, or how significant they were for subsequent disputes between recusants and church papists, but the essay makes the important point that Reformation conflicts were just as likely to emerge within as between confessional groups of laity as well as clerics, given the destabilising nature of the process. Shell's essay is a sparkling development of her earlier work and again demonstrates the point that full awareness of the activity of English Catholics can only be understood by what they were also doing whilst they were in Europe – in that sense linking with McCoog and Sommerville – and that the 'marginalisation' of English Catholic history, by Catholic and non-Catholic historians alike, owes much to the long-established Anglocentric view of its historians. In that context, however, it is surprising to find that neither Ireland nor Rome warrant an entry in the index, and the absence of consideration of events in Ireland, and their impact on English Catholic relations with the 'Protestant Nation', is a significant gap in the story which the essays set out to tell. This may owe something to chronology, for, with the exception of Shell's essay, 'early modern' is here located firmly in the century between 1530 and 1630, a century in which the contested word 'Catholic' was itself subject to considerable change. It certainly did not have the same resonances in the conflicts of the 1630s that it had in those of the 1530s, and more direct analysis of its shifting meanings, and those of its near neighbour 'papist', would clarify the relationship which forms the organising principle of what is an important collection of essays. That said, the volume achieves its stated aim of placing Catholics at the centre of post-Reformation English politics, and the essays both reflect and further what one might call a renaissance in the history of English Catholics and Catholicism.

UNIVERSITY OF YORK

W. J. SHEILS

*Richard Hooker and his early doctrine of justification. A study of his Discourse of justification.*

By Corneliu C. Simuț. (Ashgate New Critical Thinking in Religion, Theology and Biblical Studies.) Pp. x + 180. Aldershot–Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2005. £45. 0 7546 5268 8

*The doctrine of salvation in the sermons of Richard Hooker.* By Corneliu C. Simuț. (Arbeiten zur Kirchengeschichte, 94.) Pp. xiv + 351. Berlin–New York: Walter de Gruyter, 2005. €98. 13 978 3 11 018498 3; 10 3 11 018498 2  
JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906828137

Few scholars can claim to have written more than one book on Richard Hooker, so Simuț's publication of two monographs in the same year must surely be unique. The earlier to be published was *Richard Hooker and his early doctrine of justification*. Although Hooker's views on justification are particularly important for an understanding of the early treatment of the doctrine in the post-Reformation Church of England, a

book devoted wholly to this topic is decidedly specialist. However, a book devoted to analysing Hooker's early doctrine of justification, focusing mainly on the tractate *A learned discourse of justification, workes, and how the foundation of faith is overthrowne*, is specialist indeed. *A learned discourse* is a compilation of several sermons on Habakkuk written c. 1585–6, in the early years of Hooker's tenancy of the mastership of Temple Church in London. It thus predates by some years his great work *Of the lawes of ecclesiasticall politie*, which began to be published in 1593, not to mention Hooker's late manuscript defence of the *Lawes*. This point is important because, like many writers before him, Simuț looks only at Hooker's early work in assessing his doctrine of justification. He is clearly aware, though, that Hooker deals with the subject in his later writings, and moreover that there is evidence that Hooker's theology underwent a development in his later years. This leads to a tension in Simuț's argument: he is careful formally to limit his discussion to Hooker's 'early' writings and doctrine of justification, but he wants his arguments to be true for Hooker's theology and work as a whole. That is a presumption which should no longer go untested.

Simuț's sketches of earlier Protestant theories of justification in chapter i are welcome, yet he makes little use of this material for comparative purposes in the subsequent chapters, apart from the conclusion. His analysis of Hooker is, though, heavy with accounts of the work of other scholars in the field, indeed overly so. On the really crucial passages from Hooker's early work, however, his own treatment is at times rather brief. Simuț is above all concerned to counter the claim of John Henry Newman and others that Hooker places sanctification earlier in the *ordo salutis* than justification, making it thereby a cause of the justifying act. This would have the effect of distancing Hooker from the Reformed doctrine that justification is on the basis of (or to be precise, is formally caused by) the external righteousness of Christ which is imputed to the believer. Simuț is certainly correct that Hooker has a consistently forensic approach to justification, and that he outrightly condemns the view that justification can be formally caused by a believer's inherent sanctification. Yet so anxious is Simuț to prove this point, and the related claim that Hooker is a Reformed (if somewhat eclectic) theologian, that he proceeds to the opposite extreme, in what must be the major original contribution of his book, and argues that Hooker places justification earlier than sanctification in the *ordo salutis*. His own analyses of the relevant passages as regards this notion are all too brief, and I continue to read Hooker as being quite clear in *A learned discourse* that (habitual) sanctification and justification are chronologically simultaneous, but logically sequential, with the former coming first. Simuț is also committed to the notion that 'Hooker denies free will as instrumental in salvation', yet there is no consideration of any of the passages on the freedom of the will in Hooker's writings. There are also a number of unfortunate errors in the book. For instance, it is not true that Hooker rejected the idea of created grace, as his comments on faith as a habit of the reason make clear; and the notion that Hooker, unusually for his day, argued for the salvation of godly heathens would appear to rest on a simple misreading of the passage concerned (a point which has been made to him before, to judge from one of the footnotes).

Simuț's second book, *The doctrine of salvation in the sermons of Richard Hooker*, is a larger tome, dealing as it does with all of Hooker's major early works. He also here covers Hooker's soteriology as a whole, instead of focusing purely on justification and

sanctification. The first chapter presents a survey of Hooker criticism over the centuries, though it is heavily weighted towards the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. It is pity that Simuț's survey does not draw on the recent studies of Diarmaid MacCulloch and Michael Brydon concerning Hooker's reputation, which have transformed our understanding of this subject. Simuț consequently misses the long pre-twentieth-century history of interpreting Hooker as a Reformed theologian, which would in fact have aided his argument.

As in the first book, Simuț then provides a chapter on Hooker's Reformed predecessors, as a context against which to understand Hooker's own theology. This time, instead of looking primarily at continental writers he has chosen a series of purely English theologians: Tyndale, Frith, Barnes, Cranmer, Bradford and Foxe. Unlike in the other book, he makes repeated use of this material in the subsequent chapters, continually comparing Hooker with these figures, though some of the points of comparison are by no means exclusively Reformed.

The remaining chapters look one at a time at Hooker's major early writings. Simuț is particularly interested in Hooker's concept of faith, and here he makes a significant contribution to Hooker scholarship by emphasising the element of faith as trust in Hooker's thought, as well as faith as rational assent. It is worth noting here, though, Richard A. Muller's observation that this distinction had in fact been adopted earlier by many medieval scholastic theologians (*The unaccommodated Calvin*, Oxford 2000, 170). More generally, Simuț again hammers home the view that Hooker's soteriology is wholeheartedly Reformed, with the exception of Hooker's rejection of double predestination.

Given the focus on the sermons, it would perhaps be unfair to criticise Simuț for not doing something in this book that he has not purported to do – look at Hooker's soteriology across his works as a whole, including seeing whether it developed by the time of his later works. Yet Simuț also does not consider whether there were developments over the course of these early works. John Keble, and a number of critics since, have observed that while Hooker's earliest surviving sermon on *Jude* contains a classically Reformed account of how the justified can infallibly know that they are elect, by the time of his *Sermon of the certaintie and perpetuitie of faith in the elect* he had abandoned this view. Indeed, in his late writings, when Hooker came to give his own version of the Lambeth Articles, he chose to omit the article on assurance altogether. Yet despite the copious references to secondary criticism in Simuț's footnotes, on this matter he is silent.

This appears to be related to an unhappy feature of this book: on three separate occasions, through a basic error of misinterpretation, he identifies Hooker's own position with the position that Hooker is in fact summarising only in order to condemn. This suggests that Simuț is not entirely at home with Hooker's prose. The first case is that also found in the first book, concerning the salvation of godly heathens. The second concerns Hooker's condemnation of those (like Calvin) who argue: 'that of the will of God to do this or that, there is no reason besides his will'. The third, and by far the most important, again concerns the doctrine of assurance and the *Sermon of the certaintie and perpetuitie of faith in the elect*, because Simuț's misinterpretation affects his entire fourth chapter. Hooker's argument is that in terms of evidential certainty, that which we know through our senses is more certain than the promises made in Holy Scripture. Yet because a justified believer loves and trusts in those promises as well as assents to them, there is also a 'certainty of



adherence' which ensures that their faith will never ultimately fail. Simuț again identifies Hooker's summary of the view he is opposing with Hooker's own view, and claims that Hooker believes that 'every believer should have a stronger apprehension of spiritual things compared to whatever he perceives in the natural world'. This is remarkable, given that Walter Travers, Hooker's fellow minister at the Temple Church, had evidently understood Hooker well enough when he accused him before the privy council of preaching that 'the assurance of that we beleve by the word, is not so certeyne as of that we perceyve by sense', and that Hooker then went on to defend his own view. The matter is important because if certainty of evidence is always imperfect in matters of faith in this life, then one will never have sufficient evidence to be infallibly sure of one's election; a point that Simuț fails even to comment upon.

Of the remaining chapters, that on a *Learned discourse of justification* is significant in offering a cut-down version of the argument in the first book, that still manages to convey its essentials. Curiously, one long quotation from this work, reproduced correctly in the first book, appears in a disconcerting form on this occasion. Simuț has included a Latin footnote of Hooker's in the middle of the quotation without mentioning that he has done this, despite the fact that he has translated the footnote and only included part of it. This unfortunately only adds to the impression that this is a book that the reader should approach with diligent circumspection.

OXFORD

NIGEL VOAK

*The new Cambridge paragraph Bible. With the Apocrypha. King James version.* By David Norton. Pp. xxxvi + 1868. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005. £45. 0 521 84386 3; 978 0 521 84386 7

*A textual history of the King James Bible.* By David Norton. Pp. xii + 387 incl. 5 ill. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005. £55. 0 521 77100 5; 978 0 521 77100 9

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906838133

The King James Bible is a remarkable work, yet its text has suffered many defects since its initial publication in 1611. From the *editio princeps* to the most recent editions, which are still based on Blayney's 'corrected' Oxford edition of 1769, versions of the King James Bible have contained many errors and changes, both accidental and deliberate. These alterations perpetuate an injustice on the efforts of the seventeenth-century translators, and they interfere with the modern reader's understanding of the text. In his updated version of the *Cambridge paragraph Bible*, first published in 1873, David Norton offers a more authentic and readable text, based on ten years of research and scrupulous editorial work. This new edition of the King James Bible reconstructs the scriptural text as it was decided upon by the original translators, free from the accrued editorial and typographical changes of the intervening four centuries. The companion book provides a rationale for Norton's textual corrections, many of which are based on manuscript evidence of the translators' work. In the book, Norton also gives an account of how certain erroneous readings were standardised, thereby unravelling the tangled web of corruptions and changes imposed upon the text of the King James Bible since it left the hands of its translators. The latter half of the book comprises useful appendices

that illuminate the history of revisions. Norton has once again made an invaluable contribution to the study of the English Bible, and he rightly draws attention to a fact, recognised by few modern readers of the King James Bible, that most current editions represent neither the text of the first edition nor the text as the translators originally intended it to be published.

ROCKY MOUNTAIN COLLEGE,  
MONTANA

ELLIE BAGLEY

*Faith and boundaries. Colonists, Christianity, and community among the Wampanoag Indians of Martha's Vineyard, 1600–1871.* By David J. Silverman. Pp. xxiv + 303 incl. 2 maps, 7 tables and 12 figs. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005. £45. 978 0 521 84280 8; 0 521 84280 8  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S002204690684813X

David J. Silverman's deeply researched and gracefully written study of the Christian Wampanoag Indians of Martha's Vineyard makes a significant contribution to the growing body of literature on the Indians of early America. An unmistakeable strength of this new book is Silverman's extraordinary research on both sides of the Atlantic. The author draws from largely untapped court records on Martha's Vineyard and Nantucket, state and private archives, colonial newspapers, the New England Company records in London and many other primary sources. In addition, in footnote after footnote, Silverman demonstrates his thorough grasp of early American, Indian and religious historiography, knowledgeably debating both broad and more particular questions of Indian history and terminology. Silverman's goal in writing *Faith and boundaries* is to account for the persistence of the Christian Indian community on Martha's Vineyard. He argues that 'exceptions to the pattern of total Indian dispossession and removal in the face of Anglo-American expansion need to be studied in order to critique the widespread assumption that this outcome was inevitable' (p. xxi). Silverman notes that the bulk of scholarship on Indian adoption of Christianity has viewed it as a negative influence, a tool of European conquest and cultural degradation, but argues persuasively that on Martha's Vineyard Christianity instead became a powerful force for cultural preservation, intercultural diplomacy and resistance to the incursions of English settlement. Silverman's examination of that role is strongest in his first four chapters where, in case after case, he makes clear both the Wampanoags' spiritual commitment to their adopted faith and their insistence that they inform it with their own values and lead their own churches. Over time, these churches became substitutes for the sachemship (the rule of Indian leaders, or sachems), which increasingly fell short in its traditional roles of defending the land, assisting the poor and negotiating diplomacy with other communities. Silverman's later chapters (v–vii) fall chronologically after the smallpox epidemic of 1690, which had a devastating impact on the Indian communities of the island; the story of the Vineyard Wampanoags after that point becomes more desperate as the Indians appeal in turn to sachems, English officials, rival churches and exogamous marriages to try to keep the community alive in the face of diminished numbers. During that time, too, the Christian churches play a cohesive role, though one less clearly defined than in earlier chapters. By 1871, when his study ends, Silverman concedes that growing racism had counteracted many of the positive gains made by

the Christian Wampanoags. None the less, the community and church survived, providing a compelling contradiction to the stereotypical tale of Native American dispossession and disappearance. This elegantly written, exhaustively researched book deserves a wide readership and is sure to have a lasting impact on our understanding of the role of Christianity in early American Indian history.

BRIGHAM YOUNG UNIVERSITY

JENNY HALE PULSIPHER

*Os Franciscanos no Maranhão e Grão-pará. Missão e cultura na primeira metade de seiscentos.* By Maria Adelina Amorim. (Estudos de História Religiosa, 2.) Pp. 375 incl. 46 black-and-white and colour plates. Lisbon: Universidade de Lisboa/Universidade Católica Portuguesa, 2005. 862 7361 29 3  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906858136

In the Portuguese empire, at least after 1540, missionaries and colonisers worked closely, if not always harmoniously, together. Maria Adelina Amorim's book concentrates on Maranhão and Pará, the vast northern provinces of Brazil, which from 1618 were administered separately from the rest of the country. There Franciscans and later Jesuits strove to convert souls, in a way which has not always been admired or even understood by English-speaking historians. One of the reasons has always been lack of available documentation. Now, however, Amorim has uncovered and published much interesting material. Her sympathies are with the Franciscans, and especially the remarkable friar, Cristóvão de Lisboa, who worked in Maranhão from 1624 to 1635. He and his colleagues had much to put up with, including the hostility of the Jesuits, who accused their rivals of being unprofessional missionaries because they did not learn the languages of those whom they were trying to convert. This was bad publicity, and quite untrue, as the members of the seraphic order complained. They, like the Jesuits, compiled vocabularies and *artes* (grammars) of Amerindian languages but, bound by the requirement of apostolic poverty, never had the money to publish them. The Franciscans were totally dependent on alms, and in practice in Maranhão were totally dependent on the crown, which saw in them a useful tool for 'reducing the Indians to our obedience'. Loyal Catholic Indians were essential in the struggle to chase off foreigners, French, Dutch and English, whose designs on Brazil stretched the overburdened military and naval resources of Portugal to their limit. But Cristóvão de Lisboa used the privileged position of his order skilfully, and even before sailing to Maranhão had persuaded the monarch, at the time Philip III of Spain, to give the Franciscans control over resettled Indians. This was the only way, Brother Cristóvão argued, of ensuring fair treatment for the native peoples of the area, but their legal status remained ambiguous and the friars were soon in conflict with the secular authorities. Lisboa's sermons in defence of the Indians, published in 1638, antedate the better-known writings on the same theme of the Jesuit António Vieira, which were delivered in the 1650s. Urged on by his brother, the learned Manuel Severim de Faria, Lisboa also composed a natural history of Maranhão, with attractive illustrations (probably drawn by one of the friar's companions). However, Lisboa's work, which was first published only in 1967, has been completely overshadowed by the famous series of engravings produced later in the seventeenth century under the patronage of Prince Maurice

of Nassau, the governor of the short-lived Dutch colony in Brazil. Amorim's book is itself attractively produced and illustrated. It is based on a master's thesis and shows signs of inexperience. But the material she has found is fascinating and should help to give a more rounded picture of the Portuguese as missionaries.

OXFORD

THOMAS EARLE

*Protestant war. The British of Ireland and the wars of the three kingdoms.* By Robert Armstrong. Pp. viii + 261. Manchester–New York: Manchester University Press, 2005. £55. 0 7190 6983 1; 978 0 7190 6983 3  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906868132

In recent years, the Wars of the Three Kingdoms have become a favourite topic for exponents of 'British' history. The events of the 1640s, perhaps better than any others, show the strains and stresses in the Stuarts' composite monarchy. Bit by bit, the separate contributions of England, Ireland and Scotland have been described, often in impressive detail. Also, some of the interactions between the three kingdoms have been revealed: in the case of Ireland, the intervention of the Scottish Covenanters in the north of the island, the repercussions in England of the reports of atrocities in and after 1641 and the connections of the insurgent Irish Catholics with coreligionists in continental Europe. While the confederated Catholics based at Kilkenny have come into clearer focus thanks to recent researches, the beleaguered Protestant minority remains shadowy. In part, this is because the Protestant interest fractured. The splinters in Ulster and Munster have received more attention than the remnant in Dublin. The imbalance is now corrected by Robert Armstrong's meticulous investigation. Any such study has to be placed in the larger contexts of the struggle in England, Scotland and beyond. To achieve these perspectives involves mastering an intimidatingly large body of writing, some of which is argumentative and its arguments disputed. It also requires a familiarity with an extensive body of sources. Armstrong is especially helpful in uncovering the dealings of the Dublin administration, nominally still loyal to Charles I, with both the monarch and his adversaries at Westminster. He is perceptive about the king's attitudes and priorities, with Ireland seen as important in proportion to the likelihood of its contributing materially to the Stuart cause in England and Wales. He also brings out the differences within the English parliament in attitudes towards the Irish imbroglio. Irish Protestants outside Ulster, for their part, felt neglected once the parliamentarians had allied with the Scottish covenanters. This was an understandable response since money, provisions and soldiers were directed disproportionately towards the north of Ireland. Given such tensions, emphasised by Armstrong, hopes of a unified 'British' approach to the crisis faded. Instead, it degenerated into largely separate and occasionally conflicting campaigns. The covenanters' backing for their fellow countrymen and coreligionists in the north of Ireland established Presbyterianism there and so accentuated the differences between the area and the rest of the island. Tensions within the Westminster parliament and between it and its Scottish allies worsened after the war was won. In turn, they affected dealings with Ireland. Parliament meddled more frequently in Irish affairs, presaging the enforced union of the two countries during the 1650s. These insights are part of a treatment of Irish Protestant responses unparalleled in its

detail. What was happening confused contemporaries, so that it is no discredit to Armstrong that the struggle remains confusing even after his painstaking reconstruction. At the same time, he has furnished the interested with an account with much in it to ponder. Fresh light falls on Charles I and his parliamentarian and covenanting adversaries. The decade is also placed in the longer continuum of English and Scottish relations with Ireland, with both neighbours keen to subordinate the westerly kingdom more ruthlessly. These efforts bequeathed lasting antagonisms. Above all, the religious warfare that overtook Ireland in the 1640s worsened existing confessional and racial antagonisms.

HERTFORD COLLEGE,  
OXFORD

TOBY BARNARD

*Niels Stensen, 1638–1686. The scientist who was beatified.* By Hans Kermit. Pp. ix + 179 incl. 38 ills. Leominster: Gracewing, 2003. £12.99 (paper). 0 85244 583 0

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906878139

Niels Stensen or, as he is known outside Scandinavia, Nicolai Steno (1638–86) was an internationally famous natural philosopher and anatomist in his own lifetime. His conversion from Lutheranism to Catholicism caused great interest in his own day and has continued to fascinate, Scandinavian scholars in particular, especially those with roots within the small Catholic communities of the Nordic countries. The present work is an addition to this confessionally inspired scholarship. Kermit correctly acknowledges in his introduction that for Steno religion and ‘science’ (my inverted commas – natural philosophy would be a more appropriate term) were part of the same quest, namely to understand God’s creation, be that through anatomy or geology. Despite that the book surprisingly falls into two parts, the first dealing with Steno’s life, and the second with his different pursuits as anatomist, geologist and finally Catholic priest/bishop. Consequently the potentially fascinating interplay between Steno’s faith and natural philosophy and anatomy remains unexplored. On the positive side the book is engagingly written and provides a reliable introduction in English to the scholarly literature on, and view of, Steno. It also offers a useful list of secondary literature, but unfortunately has no footnotes. With that in mind I think that interested readers are still better served by Troels Kardel’s shorter biography, *Steno: life – science – philosophy*, published in 1994.

THE OPEN UNIVERSITY

OLE PETER GRELL

*William III, the stadholder-king. A political biography.* By Wout Troost (translated by J. C. Grayson). Pp. xvii + 361 incl. 5 maps and 26 ills. Aldershot–Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2005. £55. 0 7546 5071 5

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906888135

In many respects this is the book scholars of late Stuart Britain have been waiting for. Although William III has been acknowledged as a mould-breaking monarch, although his Dutch career has been recognised as the source of his approach to rule, and although there have been earlier biographies, few texts have made available the fruits of recent continental researches into William’s career in the United Provinces

and so allowed English-speaking historians to understand his upbringing, resources and formative experiences in the Netherlands. Wout Troost's clear and judicious narrative of William's life supplies this need. Devoting eight of its thirteen chapters to the period before the Glorious Revolution, it explains William's rise to power in 1672 and his lifelong *animus* against Louis XIV, before outlining the struggle against France in the 1670s, and the circumstances which led William to intervene in Britain in the next decade. Among the fresh material here for British-based scholars is the highly local nature of Dutch politics (a feature which makes it hard to describe William as the leader of a coherent or national party); and the possibility that this prince of Orange misunderstood Louis's intentions after the 1678 Peace of Nijmegen, mistaking France's aggressive defence of frontiers for continued ambition for universal monarchy. Once dealing with the island kingdoms, the account remains sure-footed. There are clear narratives of William's dealings with England, Scotland, Ireland and the European war – and sensible discussion of when the prince decided to invade (quite late) and what he initially wanted to achieve (an anti-French foreign policy for England, rather than necessarily the crown). For readers of this JOURNAL, the main point of interest will be William's highly religious sense of his destiny. Troost portrays Orange as a man convinced that he had a providential duty to save Europe from Louis's threatened hegemony; he shows that his fear of French dominance had a strong spiritual element (Versailles' universal monarchy would crush the European Protestant Reformation); and he demonstrates that William's sense of his role led him away from intolerant policies which might divide the Protestant cause. He therefore refused to back any Voetian pogrom against rival factions in the Dutch Church; he wanted a generous settlement for dissenters (including Catholics in Ireland) in each of his kingdoms so that they could unite against France; and he even confused predestination (which not all Protestants accepted) with providence (on which they all agreed). Overall, Troost concludes, William was more tolerant than James II. For all his declarations of indulgence, the Stuart's horror of domestic opposition and at refugee Huguenots, suggest a bigot. If this work has weaknesses, they are closely bound to the material. The dense, almost relentless, narrative allows only a short section on William's personality or deeper drives, but this was a cold, odd man who let few contemporaries (let alone later scholars) close. This reviewer is also not sure that Troost fully understands the 1689 ecclesiastical settlement in England. He questionably implies that the proposed comprehension of dissenters was less radical than the misnamed 'toleration' measure. On the other hand, the 1689 settlement was complex. What emerged was not what anybody intended: what anybody intended remains debateable.

UNIVERSITY OF WALES,  
BANGOR

TONY CLAYDON

*The evangelical conversion narrative. Spiritual autobiography in early modern England.*

By D. Bruce Hindmarsh. Pp. xiii + 384 incl. frontispiece. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005. £60. 0 19 924575 4; 978 0 19 924575 8

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906898131

As Bruce Hindmarsh points out, there are numerous works on seventeenth-century Puritan conversion narratives, yet no full-scale treatment of the genre as it

reappeared during the Evangelical Revival. (He handsomely acknowledges W. R. Ward's contribution to the subject in his edition of John Wesley's journal.) Hindmarsh begins by discussing some modern theoretical approaches to the study of autobiography, along with alleged precedents for evangelical conversion narratives from St Paul onwards. In reality this distinctive type emerged in the early modern period. It developed under the influence partly of the enhanced Renaissance sense of the individual, followed by the doctrinal disputes and spiritual anxieties of the Reformation. It 'appeared on the trailing edge of Christendom and the leading edge of modernity' (pp. 2–3). The pattern was pioneered by Calvinistic Puritans seeking evidence for their election to salvation and Congregationalists eliciting proof of fitness for church membership. Parallel narratives appeared among continental Pietists. The pattern revived with the publicity given to conversion stories in the British and American Evangelical Awakening. In the chapters which follow, Hindmarsh shows how a common pattern of conviction of sin, a struggle to save oneself and the experience of conversion through God's grace was marked by variations in the circumstances and beliefs of different evangelical communities. Whitefield and John Wesley recorded their activities in published journals which were coloured by the conventions of travel and voyage narratives. They included descriptions of their own conversions as well as examples of those of others. 'White-hot piety' is revealed in a collection of early Methodist letters to Charles Wesley describing conversion soon after the event and innocent of later editorial interventions. The Arminianism of Wesley's Methodism, unlike the Calvinism of his rivals, meant that conversion was liable to be lifelong. It could be lost and regained and succeeded by further experiences of assurance, 'perfection', for some a call to preach and for all a triumphant death. The published *Lives* of early Methodist preachers, written late in life, show the full pattern. In contrast with Methodist 'soul-distress under the preaching of the Law', the Moravians portrayed 'the ideal of self-abandonment and childlike trust in the love of the bleeding Saviour' (p. 162). This was described in highly physical terms, at times reminiscent of Catholic piety of the Sacred Heart and the bridal mysticism of the 'Song of Songs'. Moravian experience was also shaped by its rich liturgical life. Different again are the records taken – and vetted by ministers – of conversions at Cambuslang in Scotland. What we see here are Presbyterian Calvinists drilled in the Bible and Reformed theology. For Anglican evangelicals the example used is of the three 'Olney autobiographies': John Newton, William Cowper and Thomas Scott. These display a moderate Calvinism, with more conscious literary influence and the expression of strikingly different personalities. Newton, the former slave-trader, felt transformed by providential grace. Cowper saw his descent into madness as a means to his conversion, though sadly his despair returned in later years. Scott was highly unusual in experiencing a conversion essentially by intellectual means, from the temptation to anti-Trinitarianism to orthodoxy and then evangelicalism. It should be added that interesting examples are given of the special features of women's conversion narratives, including those who became Methodist preachers – a calling often concealed by Wesley's editorial successors. In Calvinistic Dissent the Puritan pattern of conversion persisted and revived. Conversion, especially for adolescents, was a test of 'real' Christianity as well as a qualification for church membership. In his final chapter Hindmarsh analyses differing reactions to the experience of conversion under evangelical overseas missionaries in three areas. By contrast

to England they show the conditions necessary for the type to flourish in full force. Hindmarsh then returns to his contention that the narrative appeared on the 'trailing edge of Christendom and the leading edge of modernity'. By the end of the eighteenth century there was emerging a 'modernist identity' characterised by self-development freed of any sense of divine guidance. James Lackington in his *Memoirs* claimed that he succeeded by his own efforts and included scurrilous tales about his former Methodist associates. Though often seen as distinctly individualistic in their religious experience and charitable activities, Hindmarsh rightly claims that evangelicals were profoundly influenced by the faith communities into which they entered. These communities were 'as much discovered' as 'constructions of human agency' (p. 344). Lackington's later *Confessions* retracted his *Memoirs* and returned to evangelical piety because he found moral and spiritual self-sufficiency intolerable. This outline does not do justice to an impressively documented, subtle and sensitive historical analysis. Hindmarsh has succeeded in his aim of avoiding the dangers liable to affect studies of subjects of this kind: on the one hand naivety in accepting spiritual testimonies at face value; on the other, allowing the weight of theoretical analysis to overwhelm the historical evidence. This is likely to be the standard work on the subject for a considerable time to come although, as Hindmarsh says, there is scope for further work beyond his chosen focus on England. The Cambuslang material helped to compensate for the lack of Calvinistic Methodist narratives. It might be worth looking further into the Welsh Calvinistic Methodist records. The early Methodist letters to Charles Wesley certainly deserve further study because of their rare unedited condition and wider social interest. Literary influences, both secular and religious, can be illustrated further from some Methodist narratives. Two suggestive examples are Silas Told and Elizabeth Rhodes. Told's autobiography reads like a mixture of *Robinson Crusoe* and *Grace abounding*. Rhodes resisted aristocratic seducers and even an honourable proposal from a clerical baronet and instead married a Methodist preacher. Had she read Richardson's *Pamela*? Again, why are there apparently no plebeian conversion narratives from Anglican evangelicals? There also seem to be few parallels in evangelical Dissent to the detailed first-hand accounts in Methodism. But although it is to be hoped that Hindmarsh's work will stimulate further research, he has given us an exemplary analysis of a central feature of early evangelical history.

MANCHESTER

HENRY D. RACK

*Die Liturgie in der Herrnhuter Brüdergemeine Zinzendorfs*. By Nicole Schatull. (Mainzer Hymnologische Studien, 14.) Pp. 263. Tübingen: Francke, 2005. €48 (paper). 3 7720 8062 6

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906908136

In the eighteenth century, during which Protestant liturgy was variously fossilised by orthodox churchmen, rejected by Pietists and diluted by rationalists, the *Brüdergemeine* (the Moravian Church) stood out as a community in which life was understood as liturgy (so that there was no distinction, in time or space, between sacred and profane) and structured by liturgy, and for which Zinzendorf created a new and original liturgical tradition. Moravian worship was distinctive, diverse and innovative, yet historically rooted; it was framed by liturgical order and texts, yet not



constrained by them; it was documented in a wealth of liturgical and musical texts, contemporary descriptions and depictions (published and unpublished). It is therefore remarkable that it has not been the subject of a comprehensive study. This doctoral thesis is not that study, but represents an essential basis for it. The author provides a systematic overview of the seven daily *Versammlungen* (assemblies), additional Sunday *Versammlungen*, monthly 'congregation day' and annual festivals that set the rhythm of life in the Moravians' communal villages, as well as the sacraments, pastoral services, lovefeasts and footwashings, locating them in Zinzendorf's understanding of worship and in relation to each other. The rhetorical/homiletic *Redeversammlungen* or *Stunden* (the public Sunday sermon, aimed at converting outsiders, and edifying addresses to the congregation) roughly equalled in number the liturgical/musical *Liturgien* (which have received more attention). The latter included both fixed (though mutable) texts (liturgies in the narrower sense) and ordered structures which gave space for freedom and spontaneity: the *Singstunde* (a sermon in song), holy communion (similarly consisting largely of hymn verses) and the lovefeast (perhaps as much a spiritual *conversazione* with musical interludes and light refreshments as a revival of the primitive *agape*). There is a similar systematic overview of the successive hymn and liturgy books and of the liturgical texts. In form these were mostly based on Luther's German Litany, his Te Deum or the Lord's Prayer, and designed for singing by alternate groups, or consisted of hymn verses appropriate for the different stages of sacramental or pastoral services. The analysis of primary sources is good and the discussion is set in the context of earlier scholarly work. In writing her thesis, the author understandably limited her task by focusing on the 1750s (a period of consolidation and ordering, after the stormy and creative 1740s) and on Herrnhut (the admittedly not wholly typical mother congregation); the manuscript sources are so extensive that evaluating all of them would be a lifetime's work. While stressing the continual development of Moravian liturgy notwithstanding the printing of liturgical texts, she does not examine that development in detail. A critical study of the successive recensions of formal liturgical texts, their highly distinctive theology and how far it was altered by textual changes (surely at least partly responding to public criticism – a point not brought out here) is still needed. Similarly, the fruits of the scattered published studies on the development and logic of individual types of service now need to be integrated into the framework that this book provides. Nicole Schatull has provided a firm foundation on which others can build.

LONDON

COLIN PODMORE

*An introduction to world Methodism.* By Kenneth Cracknell and Susan J. White.

Pp. xiii + 283 incl. 15 ills. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005. £45 (cloth), £16.99 (paper). 978 0 521 81849 0; 0 521 81849 4; 978 0 521 52170 3; 0 521 52170 X

JEH (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906918132

Had this book appeared six months earlier, this would have been a rather different review. As it is, David Hempton's *Methodism: empire of the spirit*, covering virtually the same ground, comprehensively eclipses *World Methodism* and is infinitely more readable. It is difficult not to compare, given the coincidences not only of publication

date but that the authors can all claim to be genuinely transatlantic. Which is a pity, for *World Methodism* has a place and purpose. Although at times it is not clear whether Cracknell and White are attempting an historical overview of an essentially transatlantic denomination or a contemporary picture of a global Church, they do, albeit haltingly, achieve something of both. The layout is predictable: an introduction about John Wesley (which trots out much of the conventional narrative), the development of Methodism in Britain, broadening the story to North America and then global Methodism today (which is, after all, bigger than the Anglican communion). These are followed by chapters on theology, 'the common life', spirituality, worship, social ethics, ecumenical and interfaith concerns. The authors, who by their backgrounds and careers embrace British and American Methodism, and are currently both Texas-based, have contributed this volume to a Cambridge series on world religious traditions. Yet as an insider denominational production, it reads as an *apologia* for Methodism. Interestingly, as in Hempton's book, the notion of what is 'Methodist' seems to have a distinct homogeneity whereas it might be more true to suggest that there are actually many Methodisms. Incredibly there are no notes, which given the sprinkling of unfamiliar quotes is frustrating. The 'further reading' book list is at points eclectic. The sequence I found at times muddled and there are very occasional factual oversights such as (p. 66) the unexplained use of the term 'world parish'. Read this as an adjunct to Hempton: transatlantic Methodism in its eventide reliving its glory days, reasserting its identity and possibly trying to reinvent itself one more time.

OXFORD BROOKES UNIVERSITY

PETER FORSAITH

*The countess of Huntingdon's connexion. A sect in action in eighteenth-century England.* By Alan Harding. (Oxford Theological Monographs.) Pp. xiv + 415 incl. map. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2003. £65. 0 19 826369 4  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906928139

Recent years have seen an upsurge of interest in Selina, the countess of Huntingdon, and readers now have a choice of modern treatments of an extraordinary woman whose formidable talent for independent thought and action enabled her to make a considerable contribution to the eighteenth-century religious revival. The title of Alan Harding's recent study points to its primary purpose, which is to serve as an analysis of the countess's organisation, rather than to be another biography as such. In this sense *The countess of Huntingdon's connexion* complements, rather than rivals or supplants, the two most recent works – *Spiritual pilgrim* by Edwin Welch (1995) and Boyd Stanley Schlenther's *Queen of the Methodists* (1997). Readers wishing to immerse themselves in the countess' personal affairs will find more pertinent material in these two biographies: Welch examined the countess's life and in particular her family relationships; Schlenther, on the other hand, was more concerned with exploring her inner motives and the 'lively fancy' that drove her to philanthropy, missionary ventures, business management and the founding of a theological seminary. What makes Alan Harding's survey interesting – and its emphasis different – is that the author sets out to examine the connexion systematically in a way that has not been done before. And so, for example, we are given a finely-detailed window into the way that the connexion developed at grassroots level, how preachers were

recruited and trained and the (often uneasy) relationship between central direction and local initiative. It comes as something of a surprise, therefore, to find the author's analysis of the countess's relationship with the Wesleys passing over the subtle differences in her attitude to John and Charles – the latter being one of her 'favourites'. Much better is the way that the connexion is set in the overall context of religious thought in eighteenth-century Britain; we are reminded that the connexion was 'a microcosm of the varied elements within Calvinist evangelicalism, rather than a unifying factor' (p. 295). Since *The countess of Huntingdon's connexion* is based heavily on archive correspondence between the countess and her preachers there is, almost inevitably, a large number of notes. Whether one should employ footnotes or endnotes is perhaps a matter of taste, as there are good arguments in support of both methods of recording references and adding relevant comments. In this case, with over 1,800, the choice of footnotes was probably wise. The most interesting reference for the general reader, however, will undoubtedly be the *Articles of the Countess of Huntingdon's connexion* which is reproduced in the appendices, the text of which shows quite clearly where the countess's doctrinal emphases lay. Article VI – 'of predestination and election' – is notable for its brevity, considering the problems inherent in this doctrine. The nineteenth century saw a number of very slanted treatments of this remarkable woman which served only to mislead later generations into exaggerating her impact upon the eighteenth-century evangelical revival in general, and on Methodism in particular. With this addition of Alan Harding's excellent investigation into the countess of Huntingdon's connexion, readers will now have no excuse – its rather high price notwithstanding – for not reaching a more balanced appraisal.

SURREY

BARRIE TABRAHAM

*Ultramontanismus. Tendenzen der Forschung.* Edited by G. Fleckenstein and J. Schmiedl. (Einblicke, 8.) Pp. 179. Paderborn: Bonifatius, 2005. €16 (paper). 3 89710 306 0  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906938135

This collection of essays bears witness to the discovery of recent scholarship (Washington and Louvain figure prominently in the places of publication of the relevant literature) that 'Ultramontanism' is a highly varied phenomenon, both as to its causes, its content and its characteristic forms of expression and, not least, that it repays study on a country-to-country basis. The book divides into two unequal parts. The second part, with the lion's share of text, considers Ultramontane Catholicism in Belgium, the Habsburg Monarchy (not a survey but the exploration of a single motif) and Poland, as well as two sharply contrasting features of its wider flung spirituality – its enthusiasm for contemporary mystics, or alleged mystics, and its focus on mission, both home and abroad. The first and shorter part of the collection represents an unusual choice by the editors: autobiographical essays, detailing literary involvement with the subject, from the hand of two notable Germanophone historians of the nineteenth-century Church of Rome, Victor Conzemius, an Anglophile Luxemburger best known for his edition of the Acton–Doellinger correspondence, and the historian of Bavarian Catholicism in the same period Otto Weiss.

Conzemius' essay tells readers far more about Liberal Catholicism than its Ultramontane competitor, though one could argue, as the author does, that the

two are shadows of each other. It is informative for a shift in the author's attitudes, in reaction to his changing church milieu. Despite his sympathy for Liberal Catholic intellectuals, and up to a point for Old Catholicism, he is irritated by the modern 'purely polemical-negative interpretation' of Ultramontanism which, among other things, embodied the ideal of an ecclesial base movement from below supposedly beloved of Catholic Liberals after a second 'Vaticanum'. Insofar as Conzemius offers a genealogy, he is inclined to de Tocqueville's view that Ultramontanism at Rome itself was more a consequence than a cause.

For his part, Weiss is inclined to see German Ultramontanism as an import from France, not Italy. In the German context, he emphasises the need to find a new ecclesial profile after the collapse of the *Reichskirche* in the Napoleonic settlement and the relation of Ultramontanism to early 'social Catholicism' (extremely important for the rise of the Catholic Centre Party in the Second *Reich*). Most typically, what the movement precipitated in Germany was an intellectual struggle between university (Idealist or Humboldt-esque) and 'Roman' (i.e. scholastic) theology. But in the period, as later, those sampling the debate have to accept that 'prejudices, stereotypes, and national and other myths' form its bread-and-butter. Quite a sophisticated morphology is needed to cope with Weiss's 'anti-Ultramontane Ultramontanism' (for those who were *papsttreu* yet *romkritisch*), his counter-posing of Vetro- and Neo-Ultramontanism and his depiction of a mystical, Romantic strain over against a rationalist, neo-scholastic current.

The remaining essays tend to support this confession of the complexity of 'Ultramontanism', too often treated as simply a label, whether by Catholic Modernists or National Socialists. The concluding piece, by Viktoria Pollmann on Ultramontanism in Poland, makes the claim that the dualistic thinking encouraged by Polish Ultramontanism played its part in the rise of political antisemitism in that country. But on her account, Ultramontanism is not only nationalist, but concerned to exalt the authority of episcopal – and not only papal – office-holders. The difficulty of fitting her scenario into any of the definitions or quasi-definitions offered by Conzemius and Weiss shows the need for further research – and synthesis – on this subject.

BLACKFRIARS,  
CAMBRIDGE

AIDAN NICHOLS

*Edward Caswall, Newman's brother and friend.* By Nancy Marie de Flon. Pp. xii + 226. Leominster: Gracewing, 2005. £14.99 (paper). 0 85244 607 1

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906948131

Like many, I suspect, Edward Caswall (1840–78) was no more to me than a name at the bottom of a hymn in a hymnal. I had little idea how extensive his contribution to hymnody was. He was far more than a translator of early Latin hymns, a sort of Roman Catholic John Mason Neale. I had never even realised that he was the author of the charming Christmas carol *See, amid the winter snow*. Nor did I know much about his life beyond the fact that he was a Tractarian convert to Rome. De Flon's biography therefore brings to life a neglected figure who was described by Newman on his death as one of his 'three great and loyal friends'. It is based on

extensive research in the archives of the Birmingham Oratory whose archivist, the late Gerard Tracey, brought to the author's notice Caswall's unpublished 630-page journal. This is especially helpful in charting, in the core chapter of the book, the reasons for his conversion and the particular path it took. Caswall was not an evangelical moving 'onwards and upwards' in his spiritual journey as were many Tractarians. Rather he was a prayerful and pastoral Anglican clergyman of the 'Orthodox' variety, the great-nephew of Bishop Thomas Burgess of Salisbury, who was beset by intellectual doubts regarding the Church of England's catholicity and moved, like W. G. Ward, by Roman Catholic devotional practices. Caswall was a man of some means and subsequent to his conversion – and the sudden death of his wife Louisa in 1849 – chose the Roman Catholic priesthood. Thereafter he committed himself wholeheartedly to the work of the Oratory especially its pastoral outreach. Then aged thirty-five he was, like Newman, to spend half his life in one Church and half in another. De Flon gives a full account of the family background and an attractive account of Caswall's educational work and concern for the poor in Edgbaston and Smethwick. Chapter vi, placing Caswall's considerable contribution to Victorian hymnody in context, is particularly informative. It corrects some errors and lays the foundation perhaps for a fuller literary and devotional study. The author writes with a warm sympathy for her subject; some may find the tone verges on the mildly hagiographic. The book will appeal particularly to those interested in Newman's circle and the nineteenth-century Catholic revival, especially where history and literature overlap. Peter Nockles commends the book in an incisive foreword that acutely highlights where he sees its merits lie.

ST GEORGE'S,  
BLOOMSBURY

PERRY BUTLER

*In pursuit of a Welsh episcopate. Appointments to Welsh sees, 1840–1905.* By Roger Lee Brown. Pp. xvi + 365. Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2005. £35.  
0 7083 1939 4

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906958138

Finding bishops for Welsh sees in this period of rising national consciousness, burgeoning Dissent and mounting indifference to organised religion was a problem that vexed Queen Victoria's prime ministers. There were possible candidates but they spoke no Welsh. There were fluent, native Welsh-speakers (sometimes, according to Gladstone, 'wordy and windy') but they lacked the education, social skills and family background then deemed necessary for a bishop. Brown's excellent study reveals how prime ministers tried to square the circle, and how they almost always failed. Not seeing the need for a Welsh-speaking bishop brought a Vowler Short to St Asaph, an excellent administrator with a visceral hatred of all things Welsh. Inability to distinguish between an English speaker of Welsh and a native Welsh-speaker brought the appointment of unsuitable men like Connop Thirlwall and James Colquhoun Campbell. But when native Welshmen were found and appointed, the result was a nonentity like John Lloyd, an *apparatchik* like John Owen, or an intolerant, ruthless, intriguer like A. G. Edwards. Brown's thoughtful and meticulously documented study gives us the first full analysis of a problem for which no solution could be found – because there was no truly satisfactory solution

to be found. The volume is another fine addition to the current series promoted by the Centre for the Advanced Study of Religion in Wales, at the University of Wales, Bangor.

UNIVERSITY OF WALES,  
LAMPETER

JOHN MORGAN-GUY

*Borrowed gods and foreign bodies. Christian missionaries imagine Chinese religion.* By Eric Reinders. Pp. xvi + 266 incl. 10 figs. Berkeley–Los Angeles–London: University of California Press, 2004. £32.50. 0 520 24171 1  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906968134

Eric Reinders's skilful and strongly-argued book examines the way in which Protestant missionaries in China created a distorted image of Chinese religion in order to strengthen their own evangelising aims. His book draws on Edward Said's now-classic *Orientalism* in its argument, but while acknowledging the often patronising nature of the missionaries' images of China, he does not simply condemn missionary activity as racist imperialism, instead interpreting the missionary encounter as a struggle between often noble aims and less laudable reality. One particular phenomenon which Reinders explores with great skill is the way in which missionaries' frustrations at understanding Chinese religious practice, and their slow pace in learning the Chinese language, led to a widespread transfer of frustration from their own inabilities to an imputation of more general inadequacy on the part of the Chinese. If Chinese religious practice could not be easily explained, it must therefore be irrational; if the Chinese language proved difficult to learn, it must have been made so by Satan. Reinders makes liberal and productive use of sociocultural approaches, including the cultural history of the body and cutting-edge subfields such as olfactory history. Two chapters, for example, examine the importance of smell and taste in the construction of Protestant Christianity in China: masculine meat-eating was made an essential part of the performance of Christianity, in contrast with the feminised vegetarianism of Buddhism. In another subtle chapter, the links between language and power are analysed: literalistic translations of Chinese, which contained no definite articles or prepositions, were used to demonstrate a supposed deficiency of Chinese, when compared with English, in conveying complex thought. Also highly astute is the argument throughout the book that the construction of Chinese religion in the Protestant mind was as much about intra-western rivalry as about Chinese–western misunderstanding. Although the book's subtitle refers to 'Christian missionaries', the protagonists here are Protestants, and the conflict with the Catholic presence in China is intriguingly shown up by one of the contrasts made by the Protestants: that traditional Chinese religion was to be condemned, at least in part, because of an idolatry that seemed dangerously similar to Catholic practice. Overall, this is a stimulating study backed up by wide research in primary sources, and will be of interest both to historians of China and historians of the missionary experience.

INSTITUTE FOR CHINESE STUDIES,  
UNIVERSITY OF OXFORD

RANA MITTER

*Les Franciscains en Terre Sainte (1869–1889). Religion et politique. Un recherche institutionnelle.*

By Giuseppe Buffon. Pp. 605 + 44 plates. Paris: Les Éditions du Cerf/Les Éditions franciscaines, 2005. €58 (paper). 2 204 07410 1; 0769 2633

*JEH* (57) 2004; doi:10.1017/S0022046906978130

The Franciscans arrived in the Holy Land in 1333, and by the end of the century had received the position of Custodians of the Holy Land with the responsibility of caring for the holy sites. An international balance was maintained with positions of authority shared between Italians, Spaniards and French. This long-standing position was challenged in the nineteenth century, especially in the two decades examined in this study. The period chosen ended in 1889 with the appointment of a former member of the Custody, Lodovico Piavi, as Latin patriarch of Jerusalem. European states, expanding and competing, took advantage of the decline of the Ottoman empire to extend their influence in the Middle East. Nationally based religious orders – such as the French White Fathers who set up a school at St Anne's in 1878 – were encouraged to establish houses in the Holy Land. Protestant missionaries from Germany and Britain settled on the sea coasts challenging Catholic dominance. A desire to educate local Catholics and others created the need for schools and colleges. And the growing numbers of pilgrims demanded better facilities and a more proactive Christian presence. The European alliances, especially in the period before and after the Treaty of Berlin in 1878, produced newly dominant powers in the Middle East. This study uses Franciscan archival material and contemporary newspapers among other sources to show the criticism directed at the 'useless monks' of the Custodians (p. 12) and then to analyse the successive challenges to the position of the Custodians. It demonstrates that the carefully balanced international character and its autonomy in respect of external influences enabled it to adapt and survive these pressures and respond to the new demands. It ends by showing the position of the Custodians consolidated and confident. As well as a meticulous recounting of events, the book contains contemporary photographs, a collection of documents and a catalogue of archival material. It presents a detailed and absorbing account of a period of significance not only to the Franciscan order but to the history of Christianity in the Holy Land.

GREAT ST MARY'S,  
CAMBRIDGE

JOHN BINNS

*The dominance of evangelicalism. The age of Spurgeon and Moody.* David W. Bebbington.

(A History of Evangelicalism.) Pp. 284. Leicester: Inter-Varsity Press, 2005.

£16.99. 13 978 1 84474 070 6; 10 1 84474 070 6

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906988137

Bebbington's *The dominance of evangelicalism* is an excellent contribution to a projected series of five chronologically-ordered volumes on the history of evangelicalism in the English-speaking world. What unites these volumes is a common definition of evangelicalism (a notoriously slippery category) stressing the Bible, the cross, conversion and activism. Bebbington argues that the incipient movement in the mid-to-late eighteenth century was followed, a century later, by a 'powerful force' (p. 96) that readily crossed national boundaries and flowered between 1850 and 1900. The global character of evangelicalism in the latter half of the nineteenth

century persists throughout Bebbington's meticulous work, as he manages a tremendous feat: seamlessly drawing from a wide range of primary resources – most frequently denominational periodicals from the period (conveniently listed in a valuable, if select, bibliography) – in order to illustrate the way in which evangelicals shared a common spirituality that rapidly encompassed the globe. On two counts the title itself is perhaps a misleading indication of the contents of the book. First, it ought to be noted that Spurgeon and Moody are relatively minor players in this full-bodied account; they are, rather, Bebbington's exemplars, used to set the tone of the movement and to elucidate the fundamental categories and concerns he explores. In Bebbington's broad and detailed treatment, it quickly becomes apparent just how diverse the movement really was during the latter half of the nineteenth century. In eight fascinating chapters, which will be of interest to undergraduates and seasoned scholars alike, Bebbington uncovers the way in which Anglicans, Presbyterians, Congregationalists, Methodists and a host of other denominations, associations and movements participated in a common ethos. He traces their practical spirituality not only in the expected patterns of worship, doctrine and mission, but equally in their social concerns, leisure activities and print literature. Bebbington's treatment of evangelicalism and Romanticism is an especially interesting chapter that further points to the wide diversity of the movement during the period. There, he highlights how evangelicalism is not, as one might have imagined, subject to a conservative resistance to higher biblical criticism and new scientific advances (especially those issues that came to redefine the movement in the early decades of the twentieth century). Instead, a strong and even 'prevailing pattern' of evangelicalism was 'a trend towards a more liberal stance' (p. 171) on doctrines such as God, the atonement and hell. Moreover, as the seventh chapter, on 'Evangelicals and society', suggests, the period saw decisive and often sharp divisions over the sexes, races and matters of cultural engagement. Bebbington's study thereby provides a detailed mosaic marked by fascinating statistics, anecdotes and primary source illustrations of a worldwide phenomenon. Yet, returning to the title, one wonders if 'the *dominance* of evangelicalism' accurately reflects the author's presentation. Again and again I found that Bebbington's work points to the deep tensions, diversity and even fragmentation that restlessly agitated beneath these recognisable familial traits. It was undoubtedly a pervasive movement and even, as his final sentence seems to concede, 'a dominant force' (p. 249), but one ever destabilised by its own variety.

ORAL ROBERTS UNIVERSITY,  
TULSA

JEFFREY W. BARBEAU

*Catholicism, popular culture, and the arts in Germany, 1880–1933.* By Margaret Stieg Dalton.

Pp. xi + 379. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2005. \$70 (cloth), \$35 (paper). 0 268 02566 5; 0 268 02567 3

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906998133

Political Catholicism, popular religion and the socio-economic plight of Roman Catholics within imperial Germany and during the Weimar Republic have attracted a good deal of attention. Less well studied, on the other hand, is the cultural milieu of Germany's Catholic minority, and Margaret Stieg Dalton's book seeks to fill



that void. To that end, she describes Catholic intellectual and aesthetic responses to what members of that religious denomination perceived as the secularisation, modernisation and coarsening of modern culture. Drawing on mostly printed material, Dalton has much to say about the Catholic cultural agenda, the clergy and laymen who provided intellectual leadership, their debates over goals and aims and the network of organisations that nurtured Catholic cultural ambitions. According to Dalton, Catholic cultural activities were characterised by a good deal of energy and enthusiasm in the years before the First World War. Catholics founded new organisations and launched new initiatives across the broad cultural spectrum of art, drama, literature, music, even cinema. But this constructive energy waned after 1918, and she argues that by the end of the 1920s – well before the advent of the Nazis – the Catholic cultural movement had disappointed its proponents and failed of its purpose. It failed, Dalton claims, partly because a Catholic audience alone was too narrow to guarantee economic viability for the movement's cultural products. Germany's Catholics were 'less likely to be educated and more likely to be poor' (p. 238). But the Catholic cultural movement also failed because its intellectual claims rarely met more exacting critical standards and for that reason never constituted a serious challenge to Germany's dominant cultural sectors. Catholic cultural output simply lacked broad appeal. Too often prudery, moralising emotionalism and kitsch became the hallmarks of Catholic cultural creations. What impressed Catholic spokesmen as worthwhile, struck the majority of their fellow countrymen as too defensive, too didactic and too preoccupied with Catholic values. Even those Catholics who were more responsive to the movements of opinion and thought in the nation increasingly preferred compromise with Germany's secular cultural ideals to intransigent resistance and rejection. Trained in both the history of Tudor England and library science, Dalton offers a useful perspective on Catholic cultural aspirations and the Roman Church's efforts to fortify its own religious and cultural comfort zone against the inroads of secular culture. At the same time, moreover, Dalton draws attention to the segmented character of German society and the abiding importance of religion in Germany's cultural life. Yet for all her determination to provide a comprehensive picture of Catholic cultural aspirations, Dalton's narrow and traditional focus on ideology, leaders and organisation provides little insight into the behaviour, beliefs and values of ordinary Catholics who, after all, were the intended consumers of Catholic culture.

UNIVERSITY OF WISCONSIN–MILWAUKEE

RONALD J. ROSS

*Anglican papalism. A history, 1900–1960.* By Michael Yelton. Pp. xiv + 266 + 32 plates.

London: Canterbury Press Norwich, 2005. £30. 1 85311 655 6

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906218141

Michael Yelton's book lifts a corner so that we can look, for some perhaps with increasing surprise, into a segment of the Anglo-Catholic underworld in the first half of the twentieth century. It is not always a pretty sight. It is peopled with priests who show little or no loyalty to the Church of their ordination, yet are involved in advocating union with a Church which would demand from them strict and unquestioning obedience. The Anglican papalists professed belief that the totality of

Roman Catholic doctrine and practice could be held and exercised in the Church of England. Yet, although many of them said that the only factor which prevented them submitting to Rome was the necessity of denying the validity of their Anglican orders, Yelton details considerable seeking after the ministration of various *Episcopi vagantes* in order to validate those orders. This, and other detailed and curious information on a movement which was delivered a body blow by the decisions of the Second Vatican Council, is often delivered in a gossipy style which seems to replicate the small talk of the ‘spikey’ presbytery over a gin and tonic (wearing a biretta, of course).

STAMFORD,  
LINCOLNSHIRE

DONALD GRAY

*Pentecostal origins. Early Pentecostalism in Ireland in the context of the British Isles.* By James Robinson (foreword Neil Hudson). (Studies in Evangelical History and Thought.) Pp. xxvii + 367 incl. 4 maps, 5 figs and 8 plates. Milton Keynes–Waynesboro, GA: Paternoster, 2005. £24.99 (paper). 1 84227 329 9  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906228148

Thorough academic histories of Pentecostalism are scarce, and almost non-existent as far as British Pentecostalism is concerned. This study is a most welcome exception to this dearth and is largely based on extensive archival material and painstaking primary source research, carefully and comprehensively footnoted throughout. Although concentrating on the first two decades of Pentecostalism in Ireland, the story is firmly set within the wider context of the movement’s origins in Great Britain, its contacts with North America and continental Europe, its British precursors in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries (the Irvingite, Keswick and Welsh Revival movements) and some of its most significant leaders. Hitherto unpublished material sheds light on Pentecostal pioneers like the Anglican vicar in Sunderland Alexander Boddy, the Welsh evangelist George Jeffreys (who spent the first seven years of his Elim movement exclusively in Ireland), the controversial Irish county court judge John Leech and William Booth’s son-in-law, the Irishman Arthur Booth-Clibborn, among others. The Elim Pentecostal Church in Northern Ireland in particular and the Apostolic Church are given careful attention. Although Pentecostalism has remained relatively small in the British Isles, its importance in global Christianity in the twentieth century is enormous. This book fills a gap and provides the most complete historical study of Pentecostalism in Britain and Ireland to date.

UNIVERSITY OF BIRMINGHAM

ALLAN ANDERSON

*Messiaen.* By Peter Hill and Nigel Simeone. Pp. xii + 435 incl. 205 ills. New Haven–London: Yale University Press, 2005. £29.95. 0 300 10907 5  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906238144

This revealing book is the first biography of Olivier Messiaen (1908–92) to make extensive use of unpublished documents, principally those owned and archived by Mlle Loriod-Messiaen, the composer’s second wife and principal interpreter of his

piano music. It is revealing, amongst other reasons, because although the central importance of Catholicism to Messiaen's music has been known since the outset of his composing career, the sense in which it was fundamental to his thought and his practice has not hitherto been so scrupulously investigated. Catholicism was not just an 'influence' on Messiaen, it was the foundation of his entire view of life and therefore pervaded his music just as it pervaded his conduct and his personality. This view of life was a positive one that saw value in the whole of God's creation and in much of mankind's use of it. As it was with Catholic dogma and devotion, so it was with the songs of the birds, with the wonders of celestial and terrestrial nature, with the rhythms of ancient Greek and traditional Indian music and of much else besides: all was grist to his compositional mill, but always because of its divine origin. So also was it with the erotic imagery that he drew upon in several major works of the 1940s and which pervaded even some of his avowedly sacred works (especially the *Trois petites liturgies de la présence divine* of 1945): erotic love was to be celebrated as a gift, not treated as an unfortunate blot on the Creator's work. Nor would Messiaen have regarded it as synonymous with uncontrolled hedonism. Messiaen's lifelong dedication to his work, and a certain ruthlessness in ensuring that his intentions for it were carried out, were part and parcel of his religious makeup. He filled about 200 notebooks with birdsongs notated in the field – a gift to ornithology if ever there was one – often rising at 4.00 a.m. or working through the night to do so, at first in France but eventually in virtually every continent. His concern for the preservation of his work, and for its adequate performance and publication, are legendary. As a teacher at the Paris Conservatoire he exerted a colossal influence on the next generation. Yet he also filled the post of organist at the Trinité for close on sixty years – using it not just as a vehicle for the performance of his music and for the improvisations for which he was famous but participating in some of the most humble (and musically unrewarding) ceremonies at the church. Evidently Messiaen's life was all of a piece. In a touching page towards the end we read of his and his wife's boundless generosity to those in need, and of the orphans from all over the world whom they supported. In this fascinating book we learn more than could have been guessed about a remarkable composer and his remarkable music.

JESUS COLLEGE,  
OXFORD

JOHN CALDWELL

*Karl Barth in Deutschland (1921–1935). Aufbruch-Klärung-Widerstand. Beiträge zum Internationalen Symposium vom 1. bis 4. Mai 2003 in der Johannes a Lasco Bibliothek Emden.* Edited by Michael Beintker, Christian Link and Michael Trowitzsch. Pp. 511. Zürich: TVZ, 2005. €40. 3 290 17344 5  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906248140

As its title indicates, this volume, consisting of twenty-two lectures, a sermon and a panel discussion, is concerned with what is increasingly acknowledged to be a vitally significant period of Barth's life, that between the call to his first professorship at Göttingen and his expulsion from Germany fourteen years later. Contributors examine Barth's response to the political and theological developments in Germany at that time and his work from the second edition of the Romans Commentary, through the publication of the Göttingen Dogmatics and the book on Anselm, to the

first part of *Church dogmatics*. The 'international' aspect of the symposium, as evidenced by the volume's contributors, is a bit of a stretch, since the great majority are from Germany, with a few from Switzerland, the Netherlands and Hungary and one English-speaking participant, B. McCormack of Princeton Theological Seminary. None the less, this is an invaluable collection. McCormack's contribution begins the first of three groups of essays, discussing what he argues is the distinctively new element of Barth's work, his critical-realism. E. Jüngel offers a rather different view on the basis of which he explains why Barth provoked anger among his contemporaries and is still provocative today. Another especially noteworthy essay in this group is by E. Herms, who describes Barth's discovery of ecclesiology as the framework for dogmatics, and concludes by noting significant parallels with Schleiermacher's project. A second group of essays examines controversies between Barth and his contemporary critics, including Harnack, H. Scholz, E. Brunner and Peterson. Here, too, G. Pfeleiderer presents a very useful critical discussion of the main options in Barth interpretation today. The final group of essays is more diverse. Among them are C. Link on the continuing relevance of the Tambach Lecture, E. Busch on Barth and Judaism, and a provocative discussion of the reception of dialectical theology by D. Korsch. Finally, a panel discussion among six symposium participants is especially valuable in addressing a fairly wide range of questions, both historical and theological. Consistently interesting and at a high level, this collection is strongly recommended for anyone involved in Barth scholarship. It will be very helpful, too, for those systematic theologians who are wrestling with issues similar to those faced by Barth in a context that, although certainly different from our own, is yet not so different that we cannot learn much from him.

ST. JOHNS UNIVERSITY,  
STATEN ISLAND,  
NY

NICHOLAS HEALY

*Westdeutscher Protestantismus und politische Parteien. Anti-Parteien-Mentalität und parteipolitisches Engagement von 1945 bis 1963.* By Michael Klein. (Beiträge zur historischen Theologie, 129.) Pp. xvi + 531. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2005. €109. 3 16 148493 2; 0340 6741

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906258147

Michael Klein has written an absorbing study of Protestant contributions to the democratisation and modernisation of German society after the collapse of Nazism. This is not a theological treatise. Party programmes, policies or the spirituality of Protestants are not the focus of his study, but rather the debate about how the Christian Churches could best share responsibility for future societal developments. In some quarters there were fears about the 'clericalisation' of politics under the domineering figure of 'Konradolf'. In keeping with tradition, the official representatives of the various organisational embodiments of German Protestantism struggled to maintain equidistance from the parties while supporting the involvement of individual church members in politics. The author highlights a widespread unease amongst Protestant intellectuals about the nature of political parties, which he links to a naive anti-Enlightenment romanticism. Secularism was deemed to be the rotten root of the party system. Reservations about the propriety of

getting involved in the 'dirty' business of politics could be found in all theological camps, although, paradoxically, the development of parties in the modern era in Germany has not a little to do with the theological debates of 1848/9. In the first part of the book the author sketches Protestantism's relationships with the ideologies of conservatism, liberalism and socialism in the period from 1789 to 1945. In the second part separate chapters deal with Protestant involvement in the main centrist political parties in the early post-war period. Involvement in the Expellees' Association, regional protest groups or extreme right-wing parties is not considered, which is rather surprising given the traditional conservative nationalism of German Protestants. By far the longest chapter, covering some 174 pages, focuses on the establishment of the inter-denominational CDU/CSU in the West German states. Here the question immediately arises whether some discussion of the positions taken by Christian Democrats in Berlin and the Soviet Zone is necessary for a full understanding of 'Protestant' politics. There is no mention, for example, of the fact that in 1951/2 the East German CDUD adopted 'Christian realism' as their official creed. While reference is made to the significance of the Free Church tradition in Britain in the development of democracy, one wonders whether German Free Churchmen made any contribution to the debate. Did British and American Free Churchmen working for the military administrations in occupied Germany involve themselves in the process of modernising German Protestantism? The arguments for and against the use of the adjective 'Christian' to describe a party are considered in depth. The issue divided Protestants. In the period under consideration most Protestants began to favour the Social Democratic Party over the CDU, the latter generally being perceived to be predominantly Catholic. Klein argues that it was mainly Protestant Christian Democrats who were responsible for the drift of the CDU away from liberal and socialist ideas towards a much more conservative, pro-capitalist stance. His work is a useful addition to Frederic Spotts's book on the role of the Churches in Germany.

UNIVERSITY OF ULSTER

NICHOLAS M. RAILTON

*John Marco Allegro. The maverick of the Dead Sea scrolls.* By Judith Anne Brown. (Studies in the Dead Sea Scrolls and Related Literature.) Pp. xvi + 288 incl. 47 ills. Grand Rapids, MI–Cambridge: Eerdmans, 2005. £15.95 (\$25). 0 8028 2849 3  
*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906268143

J. M. Allegro was, as the subtitle of this book puts it, a maverick. Trained for the Methodist ministry, though never ordained, he was invited to Jerusalem in 1951 to join the team handling the newly-discovered Dead Sea Scrolls; there he proved highly competent at deciphering and translating the texts. A few years later he was largely responsible for organising the complicated process of opening up the tightly rolled Copper Scrolls, which was carried out by scientists in Manchester University, where he was by now himself a lecturer. For some years his spare time was largely taken up with his work on the scrolls and on prospecting for further fragments of text in the Qumran area. In 1956 he produced for Penguin Books an account of the discovery of the scrolls and of the community of Essenes (an ascetic Jewish sect of the late pre-Christian period) from which they were generally held to have originated. What he wrote on these topics was sound enough, and broadly

anticipated the view now generally held. He went further, however, and in the process displayed what was to be a disastrous life-long trait, an urge – almost a compulsion – to carry speculation far beyond what the evidence would justify. In this case, by exaggerating the similarities between the teachings of the scrolls and New Testament Christianity, and ignoring some fundamental differences, and by means of some tendentious translations, he sought to represent Christianity as simply a development, or even a version, of the religion of Qumran. This was a perversion of a real insight, namely that the scrolls throw a great deal of light on New Testament religion, but Allegro insisted on his view all his life, claiming that Christianity was little more than modified Essenism. He even wrote ‘indeed it is Essenism’. This contention, and the urge to irresponsible speculation which produced it, reached their climax in 1970 when he produced a book called *The sacred mushroom and the cross*. This claimed that ancient Sumerian religion centred on a hallucinogenic drug derived from a sacred mushroom, and that this religious situation continued undercover, largely unmodified, for thousands of years, so that the New Testament Gospels were simply trumped-up cover stories designed to convey cultic messages to initiates in the know. This thesis, no doubt influenced by the dislike of religion of all kinds that he had by now developed, was rejected, and indeed ridiculed, by all competent judges. Allegro’s career was irretrievably ruined, and none of the modifications of his position he later attempted succeeded in making it tenable. To his credit it must be added that he pleaded from the start for the speedy publication of the scroll texts, even, if need be, in tentative form, so that a wider group of scholars could work on them. Failure to take his advice led the scholars who had access to the texts to adopt a policy of secrecy with regard to their contents so extreme that it became a scandal, only ended in 1991 when the Huntington Library took the unilateral decision to make the material publicly available. Although the author of this book is Allegro’s daughter, she deals pretty faithfully with the facts, and does not allow her desire to improve her father’s image seriously to distort the picture. She has valuable things to say about her father’s character and personality, and what emerges has something of the character of a Greek tragedy – an able, well-meaning and in some ways engaging man brought down by a fundamental defect of character. His daughter rightly talks of ‘my father’s wasted genius’; he simply could not resist his urge to go beyond the evidence and incidentally, in the process, ‘épater les bourgeois’.

OXFORD

DENNIS NINEHAM

*A Catholic in the White House? Religion, politics, and John F. Kennedy’s presidential campaign.*

By Thomas J. Carty. Pp. viii + 215 incl. 12 ill. New York–Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2004. £26.99. 1 4039 6252 9

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S002204690627814X

Thomas Carty’s book is a labour of love, a careful compilation of the data and issues relating to the role of Catholicism in presidential elections, particularly that of 1960. Two chapters treat the long period prior to 1960, the epilogue carries the discussion from 1960 to the present, while the five substantive chapters, for which there is a significant amount of original research, focus on the election of John Kennedy. The author does not subject the voting returns of 1960 to new analysis, but rather

relies on the psephological studies that appeared in the aftermath of the election, which indicated that while Kennedy's lead in the popular vote was reduced by the Catholic issue he gained in the electoral college because of the strong Catholic vote in such key states as New York, Illinois and Pennsylvania. If this is old news, Mr Carty does tell us a lot about the calculations of strategists, coverage in the press and the highly complex manoeuvrings of both Democratic and Republican party leaders. One interesting phenomenon highlighted is the degree of suspicion of a Catholic candidate among a significant number of liberal Democrats. Carty is no doubt right to stress the complexity of the Catholic issue and the sometimes unexpected ways in which it surfaced in presidential politics, but no very clear thesis emerges in his account. The book would have benefited from better editing – there is too much repetition and words are sometimes wrongly used – and the index is almost entirely confined to proper names.

UNIVERSITY OF LANCASTER/  
ROTHERMERE AMERICAN INSTITUTE,  
OXFORD

M. J. HEALE

*Migration und Religion im Zeitalter der Globalisierung*. Edited by Hartmut Lehmann. (Bausteine zu einer Europäischen Religionsgeschichte im Zeitalter der Säkularisierung, 7.) Pp. 144. Göttingen: Wallstein, 2005. €19 (paper).  
3 89244 938 4

*JEH* (57) 2006; doi:10.1017/S0022046906288146

This book consists of papers from a conference at the Max-Planck-Institute in Freiburg, Germany, which marked the end of a longstanding research project on multi-religiosity in Europe. While the focus of the project was on the diversity of religions in Europe, the book broadens its perspective by including two non-European studies (Miller and Dahm). Each of the nine articles is written from a different methodological approach, from religious studies (for example Deeg) and history (for example Lehmann) to sociology (for example Miller) and law (for example Lochen and Marauhn). Hence it is difficult to single out common themes. At the beginning it seems rather strange that in his introductory remarks the editor could ignore the wide range of non-German publications about religion and migration (for instance, a vast number of new Latino studies include religion in their approach to the complex question of migration), though he makes a particular point of discussing the role of religion in American migration history. His eurocentric starting point can be understood only within the narrow frame of his research project. Still, the book in sum represents with its multidisciplinary approach an interesting addition to religion and migration studies. Two articles will be probably of special interest to readers of this JOURNAL: that by Dölemeyer on the Huguenots and their role in Protestant church history in Germany, and Ribbat's article on the influence of so-called Masurean immigrants in the Protestant Church and their prayer meeting groups in the Ruhr area of Germany in 1900. Ribbat discusses an important though often neglected point: the physical dimension of religious experience in the migration, an aspect that is also very important in Caribbean religious communities. Three other articles present European case studies: Deeg discusses Chinese diaspora groups in Vienna, Tellenbach the Spanish Jewish

community in Istanbul and Filos looks at legal aspects of religious practice in Greece, a religiously homogenous country. The two articles presenting non-European case studies are by Miller (the only article published in English) who focuses on one location, Los Angeles, and its religious diversity, and by Dahm who covers one region, South-East Asia, in particular the Philippines, Indonesia and Vietnam. The authors of the final article, Lochen and Marauhn, summarise legal debate about religion in the context of international human rights conventions. Though this last article does not refer to empirical research of any kind, the book as a whole presents the results of some interesting research. In particular the quite unusual structure of the book, and its lack of cohesion, can be seen as its most interesting aspect: religion and migration cannot be studied from one perspective alone but only from various approaches taken together. Hence we can only hope that the research will continue, this time without any geographical limit.

UNIVERSITY OF OXFORD

BETTINA SCHMIDT