

Reviews

Theologische Realenzyklopädie, XXXV: *Vernunft III–Wiederbringung aller*. Edited by Gerhard Müller. Pp. iv + 820. Berlin–New York: Walter de Gruyter, 2003. €248. 3 11 017781 1

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905214380

We have arrived at the penultimate volume of this excellent encyclopaedia. The states here are Wales (Denzil Morgan) and the West Indies; of the old German states we have West and East Prussia, hence coming oddly under West; and Westphalia together with a separate article on the Treaty of 1648 for which see also the article on international law (*Völkerrecht*). In missionary history there is Viet-Nam. Of individuals the English evangelists Wesley and Whitefield (both by W. R. Ward) come out best. The biblical critics from Wettstein onward are well represented, and Westcott is among them though one wonders whether his work had the weight of the others. The only ‘denomination’ treated is the Waldensian (Euan Cameron). On key subjects one may select Christmas and its sermons (*Weihnacht* and *Weihnachtspredigt*) and pilgrimage (*wallfahrt*) and the ethics of resistance including tyrannicide (*Widerstand*), important for the history of the Reformation. Except for the critics there is no dominance by Protestants. Vitoria for the founder of later Spanish scholasticism, Vives for the Catholic Renaissance, Vincent de Paul for the French Church at its best. In view of the weight which the idea of a ‘People’s Church’ (*Volkskirche*) carried in Nazi Germany (but not only there) it would have been helpful to have had a rather fuller treatment of the theme. Of all the articles on the German nineteenth century the most interesting to some English readers will be the long article on Wessenberg and his efforts for a reformed Catholicism. In each volume there is a pleasant piece of historical liturgy, and here it is the history of incense (*Weihrauch*) where the information will surprise some readers.

SELWYN COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

OWEN CHADWICK

Theologische Realenzyklopädie, XXXVI: *Wiedergeburt–Zyperm*. Edited by Gerhard Müller. Pp. v + 872. Berlin–New York: Walter de Gruyter, 2004. 3 11 017842 7

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905224387

With this volume the publisher Walter de Gruyter and the general editor Gerhard Müller bring to completion a very distinguished encyclopaedia. The first volume

appeared in 1977, the last in 2004, and this is a long enough space to shake their determination that each article shall be up-to-date with modern research, especially when they determined on such excellent bibliographies. We are still promised an index volume to the whole. They have created an essential tool for Reformation studies and also, for patristic. It is pleasing that this volume begins with a full article on Wigand, the first of modern church historians, and later has thoughtful considerations of *Zeitgeschichte*, *Kirchliche*. As usual the German biblical critics of the nineteenth century are well represented, here Wrede the most impressive. Z is an important letter, with Zwingli and then Zürich at the top, and with our Cs, like Censorship and Celibacy (important) and the Centre Party (not very full); and studies of the complexities of tithe and rates of interest, and Jehovah's Witnesses and Glossolalia (*Zungenrede*) and Cyprus. Wyclif has an unusually long article. Württemberg is given the length it deserves. They always illuminate the history of universities – here Wittenberg and Würzburg and Yale.

SELWYN COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

OWEN CHADWICK

Bonds of imperfection. Christian politics, past and present. By Oliver O'Donovan and Joan Lockwood O'Donovan. Pp. vi + 324. Grand Rapids, MI–Cambridge: Eerdmans, 2004. £24.99 (\$35) (paper). o 8028 4975 X
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905234383

Bonds of imperfection forms a companion piece to the authors' previous work, *From Irenaeus to Grotius: a sourcebook in Christian political thought*. The latter is an overview of the history of Christian political thought from the years to 1625, and is comprised of primary source texts with brief introductions and commentaries. The former provides a sustained analysis and application of significant figures, themes and developments from within this history. The work is mostly composed of previously published essays spanning nearly two decades, and is divided into two parts with part I treating 'moments' in the theological-political tradition and part II addressing contemporary themes. Part I covers a wide range of topics, including a rich study of the Book of Revelation and John's vision of the political; a probing survey of medieval usury theory; a fresh analysis of Erasmus' ethical poetics and its contribution to Christian social and political thought; and an exploration of jurist-theologian Hugo Grotius' understanding of distributive justice as it comes to him through its Aristotelian and Thomistic legacy. A particularly interesting essay is Joan Lockwood O'Donovan's 'The challenge and the promise of proto-modern Christian political thought'. O'Donovan challenges modern democracy's emphasis on populist and egalitarian elaborations of rights and self-government with the late medieval and early modern notions of 'God's continuing sovereignty over civil polity, the juridical task of civil government, and the waywardness of the multitude' (p. 165). This highlights a common theme throughout part I and indeed the book, namely, that the history of Christian political thought is marked by 'the sphere of judgment, divine and human, that gives order to the human community in history' (p. 2). Part II continues this theme by way of a discussion of Catholic social thought and subsidiarity; a comparison of Karl Barth's and Paul Ramsey's understanding of political power and force; and an evaluation of the modern notion of the nation state in the light of a

theological understanding of 'the nation'. An important essay is Oliver O'Donovan's 'Government as judgment'. O'Donovan contends that the modern period locates political authority, especially legislative and judicial acts, in 'the people', as opposed to the late medieval and early modern periods when political life was rooted in natural and revealed divine law. Consequently, modern democracy is not capable of true judgement and therefore must assert its authority by way of legislation, resulting in a 'tyranny of legislative rationality' (p. 14). In the end, students of western and Christian political history will find something of interest among the essays of part I, and those interested in how the Christian tradition bears on contemporary political issues and problems will find ample resources for further thought and challenge in part II. With this collection of essays, there can be no doubt that Joan and Oliver O'Donovan have established themselves as leading thinkers in the growing field of both historical and contemporary political theology.

PRINCETON THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY

TODD V. CIOFFI

Religious identity and the problem of historical foundation. The foundational character of authoritative sources in the history of Christianity and Judaism. Edited by Judith Frishman, Willemien Otten and Gerard Rouwhorst. (Jewish and Christian Perspectives, 8.) Pp. x + 589. Leiden–Boston: Brill, 2004. €139. 90 04 13021 7; 1388 2074

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S002204690524438X

This large book reproduces the papers read at a conference organised recently by church historians at the University of Utrecht and the Catholic Theological University of Utrecht. It treats of the question how sources have been used to establish and maintain the distinctive identity of Jewish and Christian groups. Rather surprisingly, no indication is given of the nationality, religious affiliation or academic position of the contributors, but it seems clear that they mostly hail from the Low Countries, and that is to some extent reflected in the subject matter of the papers. For example, there is a long chapter on university education as a mark of ministerial identity in nineteenth-century Dutch Protestantism, another on notions of identity in the nineteenth-century Dutch Reformed Church and a third on the theological formation of Roman Catholic clergy in eighteenth- and nineteenth-century Holland. Nevertheless, the scope of the contributions is wide, and the book works back from opening chapters concerned with questions about religion and modernity, through discussions of Reformation and medieval topics, to closing chapters dealing with the use made of biblical and patristic authority in the early Church. The papers vary considerably in their breadth of treatment and they are not informed by any common thesis. The title of the book seems more central to some of the contributions than to others. In a short review it is not possible to comment on all the twenty-eight contributions individually, and if a few are chosen for mention the choice will no doubt reflect the interests of the reviewer rather than the relative excellence of the papers themselves. No. 19 is an interesting treatment of authority and interpretation in scholastic theology, which reveals, for example, how Peter Lombard challenged Paul's teaching on celibacy, and dealt with the problem in a strikingly modern way. No. 18 casts a good deal of light on immediately pre-scholastic theology, while no. 25 opens up a discussion of how

the outlook of religious groups can be determined by their choice of particular historical periods as authoritative. On the basis of liturgical studies no. 24 develops an interesting analysis of alternative ways of interpreting texts: 'religious interpretations should not be measured with the yardstick of historical research, as they are occasioned by other presuppositions' (p. 483). The last two chapters throw a good deal of light on early Christian use of authorities, partly through a discussion of the 'textual communities', membership of which largely determined the way documents were interpreted. Although most of the contributions show signs of having been translated, or having been written in a foreign language, all are in perfectly serviceable English, except for no. 21 which is in German.

OXFORD

DENNIS NINEHAM

Byzantine monuments of Istanbul. By John Freely and Ahmet S. Çakmak. Pp. xvii + 322 incl. 162 ills + 51 colour plates. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004.

£55. 0 521 77257 5

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905254386

This book reads as a combination of travel guide, history of the Byzantine emperors and collation of key snippets of primary sources, illustrated with a selection of previously published plans (some a century old and not always in good condition) and of colour photographs (of rather varied quality). It is a pastiche; there is little that is new, but it has been put together in a new form. Freely's *Walking* and later *Companion guides* to Istanbul have opened up the city to many a traveller, and their considerable borrowings in his *Blue guide* of the city make that equally efficient and valuable. The book under review often seems to be serving the same end, yet its size precludes its use in that regard. It describes all the extant Byzantine buildings (handily in some obscure cases, where photographs of hard-to-read sites provide identification) in Istanbul as well as the material in the Archaeological Museum. Each site is placed in its historical context according to the basic history, which appears to be essentially from Ostrogorsky's *History of the Byzantine empire*, and is viewed from the perspective of imperial power. The primary sources are drawn largely from Procopius and Psellos and, to a lesser degree, Niketas Choniates and Nikephoras Gregoras, and serve as vivid pointers to the past. Plans are taken from Van Millingen, Janin, Müller-Wiener (misspelled), Mango, Ousterhout and Bardill, among others, and are helpful. However, the book is poorly referenced and editorially sloppy. Repeatedly, references are not given or they lack page numbers, and frequently quotes are lifted from publications in, it seems, an unnecessary way (Mango on p. 55; Crow on pp. 72–3; Ousterhout on p. 197); the names of buildings are variously given first in Turkish or in English; Dalmatius is said at times to be the nephew, at times the cousin of Constantine's sons, etc; editing is casual so that random capitalisations appear on pp. 161, 168, and there are a succession of misprints. Despite these inconsistencies, the book gives a straightforward historical account of the city, peppered with anecdotes, and describes each location with clarity and some detail, providing in all a good survey of the Byzantine sites. Many might find this a useful, if odd, book.

COURTAULD INSTITUTE OF ART

CECILY HENNESSY

Aux Origines de l'église de Perse. Les actes de Mār Māri. By Christelle Jullien and Florence Jullien. (Corpus Scriptorum Christianorum Orientalium, 604. Subsidia, 114.) Pp. vi + 139. Louvain: Peeters, 2003. €65 (paper). 90 429 1358 4; 2 87723 745 1; 0070 0444

Les Actes de Mār Māri. Edited by Christelle Jullien and Florence Jullien. (Corpus Scriptorum Christianorum Orientalium, 602. Scriptores Syri, 234.) Pp. vii + 48. Louvain: Peeters, 2003. €45 (paper). 90 429 1356 8; 2 87723 743 5; 0070 0452

Les Actes de Mār Māri. Translated by Christelle Jullien and Florence Jullien. (Corpus Scriptorum Christianorum Orientalium, 603. Scriptores Syri, 235.) Pp. v + 58. Louvain: Peeters, 2003. €35 (paper). 90 429 1357 6; 2 87723 744 3; 0070 0452
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905264382

The Acts of Mari provide the foundation legend for the Christian Church in the Persian empire (modern Iraq and Iran), taking its origins back to apostolic times. The Syriac text was first published in 1885 by J.-B. Abbeloos, with a Latin translation, but it has never received the detailed discussion that it deserves until recently, when Christelle and Florence Jullien have demonstrated, through a number of different publications, the potential interest of the work. The re-edition of the text in the *Scriptores Syri* series is very welcome. There is little variation between the extant manuscripts (all are from the seventeenth century or later, though one was said to have been copied from a manuscript of the thirteenth century), and so the printed text is very close to that of Abbeloos. Abbeloos's section numbers have wisely been kept, in preference to the different ones introduced by P. Bedjan in the first volume of his *Acta martyrum et sanctorum* (1890); it might, however, have been helpful to have given those as well, in square brackets. The French translation, a revision of their earlier one published in the series *Apocryphes* (2001), is only the second one of this text into a modern language, the first having been made by R. Raabe, into German (1893). The translation is a careful one, and is provided with good annotation, while the introduction to the translation volume is primarily concerned with the references to Mari in the liturgical tradition (the oldest Syriac Anaphora is named after Addai, the apostle of Edessa, and Mari). Neither volume has an index. In the translation volume, in particular, it would have been helpful to have had an index of proper names and of biblical references, following the normal practice in the CSCO series. Questions of the date and background of the Acts of Mari are dealt with in *Aux Origines de l'église de Perse*. The preferred dating of the text to the late sixth/early seventh century seems reasonable (any earlier dating would decidedly be problematic). The matter is of some importance for the chronology of the development of the legend concerning the famous *mandylion* of Edessa: in the early fifth-century Teaching of Addai, it is just a portrait of Jesus painted by King Abgar's emissary, but in the Acts of Mari (ch. iii) it has been miraculously produced on a cloth (*sinclon*), thus marking an important step on the portrait's way to becoming the *mandylion* which was transported to Constantinople in 944, thus giving rise to innumerable reproductions. *Sinclon* is also the term used in the Greek Acts of Thaddaeus, but this too is a work of uncertain date (though the first half of the seventh century has recently been suggested). It is worth noticing that, unlike the Acts of Thaddaeus, the Acts of Mari state that the image was only acquired on a second visit by Abgar's emissary, for this happens to be a feature of the considerably later *Epistula Abgari*, a work that is usually dated to 1032, though for this too a considerably earlier date has recently been suggested. Clearly, the uncertainty of the

dating of the various witnesses to these developments in the tradition behind the Edessa *mandylion* needs to be kept in mind in any attempt to date any single one of them. Probably the most interesting of the authors' findings is in their fourth chapter, where it is convincingly argued that, underlying a number of features in the topography and onomastics of the Acts of Mari, there was a deliberate attempt to present Mari's mission as the antithesis of that of Mani. The path of the missionary travels of Mari and his disciples turns out to be more or less the reverse of that taken by Mani and his disciples: one is thus given the impression that the author wished his readers to see Mari as undoing – in anticipation, as it were – the work of Mani, who of course lived a couple of centuries after Mari's supposed date. In many ways *Aux Origines* can be seen as a large-scale expansion of a chapter in Christelle and Florence Jullien's *Apôtres des confins: processus missionnaires chrétiens dans l'empire iranien* (2002), where they examine the many different traditions concerning the apostles' preaching beyond the eastern boundaries of the Roman empire. As in that work, so too here, well-informed use is made of Iranian evidence, as well as of that provided by Syriac, Greek and Latin sources. The twin authors have done a great service in reviving interest in the Acts of Mari; furthermore, their careful sifting of the diverse traditions concerning the origins of Christianity is all the more relevant today since it concerns that part of the Middle East where the indigenous Christian Churches are currently facing enormous difficulties and dangers.

WOLFSON COLLEGE,
OXFORD

SEBASTIAN BROCK

Pneumatologie in der alten Kirche. By Wolf-Dieter Hauschild and Volker Henning Drecol. (Traditio Christiana. Texte und Kommentare zur patristischen Theologie, 12.) Pp. lix + 372. Bern: Peter Lang, 2004. £48. 3 906768 73 2; 0172 1372

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905274389

This is a collection, with facing translation, of 217 extracts from early Christian texts illustrating the development of the doctrine of the Holy Spirit. Greek, Latin and a few Coptic and Syriac sources are included. The texts are arranged in three roughly equal sections: 'Geist und Geschichte: Kirche und Schrift', 'Geist und Mensch: Erleuchtung, Heiligung und Begnadung' and 'Geist und Gott: Heiliger Geist, Jesus Christus, Gott'. Within each section the arrangement is chronological, from the Apostolic Fathers and Apocryphal New Testament to Ambrose and Augustine. The most prominent church Fathers naturally receive the most extensive coverage (Tertullian, 24 pp.; Origen, 34 pp.; Basil, 26 pp.; Augustine, 29 pp.). Extracts from some of the fourth-century creeds are included. It is surprising to note the absence of either Justin's famous statement ranking the Spirit after the angels (1 *Apol.* 6) or any of the counterbalancing Trinitarian statements from the *First apology*. Cyril of Alexandria is excluded – presumably because he postdates the main fourth-century debates – despite the well developed character of his pneumatology, which has been recently demonstrated at length by Daniel A. Keating in *The appropriation of divine life in Cyril of Alexandria* (Oxford 2004). The introduction (pp. xi–xxviii) offers an extremely concise survey of the doctrinal development and the annotation of the extracts is relatively sparse, so the usefulness of the volume derives largely from

the bibliography (which I can commend) and the texts and translations themselves; a collection like this is not likely to gain much currency as a course-book outside German-speaking universities, but scholars with the necessary language skills will find it a handy work of reference.

LEYTON

GRAHAM GOULD

The Westminster handbook to patristic theology. By John McGuckin. (The Westminster Handbooks to Christian Theology.) Pp. xxiii + 367. Louisville–London: Westminster John Knox Press, 2004. £25 (paper). o 664 22396 6

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905284385

This new manual is unique in its breadth as well as in its conciseness. John McGuckin proves very judicious in what he decides to include here as well as in the length and content of each listing. Whereas many such handbooks fail by way of either oversimplification or simply by way of omission, McGuckin neatly traces the Church's central figures as well as the world in which they laboured between AD 100 and 800. Major movements of thought, church councils, creeds as well as their perceived foes are all finely done, each entry giving cross references and providing an up-to-date bibliography. Especially welcome is the attention McGuckin pays to oftentimes neglected issues attendant to the patristic world of thought and worship: wealth, widows, slavery, the importance of family and sexual morality, architecture and almsgiving, to name a few. He also provides helpful thematic guides, allowing students of any level to make connections between entries that might otherwise be missed. Given its range, this single volume should be included in any library but given its convenience and cost, students and scholars of patristics can fortunately have one within easy reach. McGuckin, Professor of Early Church at both Union Theological and Columbia University in New York City, is known mainly for his illuminating works on Gregory Nazianzen and Cyril of Alexandria; in his latest book, he brings his usual alacrity and clarity to the persons, doctrines, literature and sociological contexts of the early Church.

CAMPION HALL,
OXFORD

DAVID VINCENT MECONI

Krankheit und Heilung in der Theologie der frühen Kirchenväter. By Michael Dörnemann. (Studien und Texte zu Antike und Christentum, 20.) Pp. xiii + 382. Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr (Paul Siebeck), 2003. €59 (paper). 3 16 148161 5; 1436 3003

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905294381

The main title of the dissertation upon which this monograph is based – submitted to the Catholic Theological Faculty at the Ruhr University of Bochum – was ‘Christ the Healer’, which expresses its main focus as a work of historical theology; while not excluding discussions of physical sickness and healing, it is the metaphorical use and potential of the motif that particularly interests the author. Background chapters discuss healing particularly as a divine attribute, and the role of the doctor, in the Old Testament, the Ancient Near East, Greece and Rome, and then the

association between healing and salvation, particularly in the person of Jesus, in the New Testament. Subsequent chapters trace the motif of doctor, particularly Christologically, along with other medical metaphors, in the Apocryphal Acts, the Apostolic Fathers, the Greek Apologists, Clement and Origen, the third-century Latin Fathers (Tertullian and Cyprian) and the fourth-century Greek Fathers (Eusebius, Athanasius, Cyril of Jerusalem, Gregory Nazianzen and Gregory of Nyssa). These chapters are heavily textually based, at times attaining an almost catena-like quality, with minimal reference to the secondary literature. Inevitably, we are continually directed towards the condition being addressed by the healing, to the action not only of God/Christ but also of the 'patient' or other intermediaries, to the, not always comfortable, process of healing, and to adjacent metaphors, such as those from the realm of pedagogy. Two further brief chapters discuss the theme within Christian-'pagan' conflict in the period through a literature review and a summary of the authors already studied, and the relationship between the early Church and medical knowledge. The final main chapter (other than a concluding overview) explores the theological outworking in terms of theological anthropology, God-talk, Christology and soteriology, sacramental theology and liturgy, as well as the pastoral outworking, in which the role of the ordained ministry plays a key role. This is one of those dissertations whose contribution lies in its comprehensive range, and whose weakness lies in its compressed detail, which limits discussion of nuance, and which, despite the discussion of polemic, treats the history of ideas to some extent as context-free. This is a little surprising given the author's own contextualisation of the work which speaks not only of the study of the history of medicine but also of the Churches' involvement in medical work in the Ruhr region. It is, none the less, to be welcomed for its strengths, and as a model of this sort of detailed study of a particular 'theological' metaphor and its potentialities.

KING'S COLLEGE,
LONDON

JUDITH LIEU

Handbook of early Christianity. Social science approaches. Edited by Anthony J. Blasi, Jean Duhaime and Paul-André Turcotte. Pp. xxvii + 802. Walnut Creek, CA: AltaMira Press, 2002. £76. 0 7591 0015 2

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905304386

This huge handbook attempts to build bridges to enable biblical scholars and social scientists to cross over to one another's 'islands'. The social sciences discussed include anthropology, archaeology, economics, history, literary analysis (including statistical analysis, source and redaction criticism, rhetorical criticism, structuralism), political science, psychology and sociology. The editors are convinced that these often overlapping disciplines shed light on the formation and development of Christianity in the first two or three centuries. Their aims are admirable, but the handbook merits barely two cheers. The basic weakness is apparent as soon as the disciplines covered and the scope of the project are noted: far too much is attempted. The twenty-seven chapters are more uneven in approach and quality than is customary in wide-ranging books of this kind. Far more chapters are broadly social historical in their approach, than (for example) anthropological or

sociological. Some contributors provide helpful overviews of particular social scientific approaches or topics. Some set out digests of their own publications. Some chapters are almost incomprehensible to non-specialists, while others are simply bland. None the less there are nuggets to be found, only three of which can be mentioned here. The opening introductory chapter, by David Horrell, is admirable: 'Social sciences studying formative Christian phenomena: a creative movement'. Carolyn Osiek's fascinating 'Archaeological and architectural issues and the question of demographic and urban forms' uses a social historical approach to enrich our understanding of a wide range of texts. Jack T. Sanders on 'Conversion in early Christianity' is both stimulating and provocative. The subject index will aid further exploration, as will the sixty pages of bibliographical references to the twenty-seven chapters. The forty-six-page bibliography is helpfully subdivided into sections.

UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE

GRAHAM STANTON

The suffering of the impassible God. The dialectics of patristic thought. By Paul Gavriluk. (Oxford Early Christian Studies.) Pp. xii + 210. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004. £45. 0 19 926982 3

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905314382

This book takes aim at a paradigm for interpreting patristic theology that has become widely accepted among scholars, but that in the author's opinion needs to be refuted. Gavriluk calls this 'The theory of theology's fall into Hellenistic philosophy', and he explains it as the view that the biblical depiction of a God who can and does suffer gradually gave way during the patristic period to a philosophical view of God as completely impassible. The author insists that for the church Fathers, the idea of impassibility was not a way of saying God was unconcerned for humanity, but rather a way of distancing the Christian God from pagan mythological gods and of delineating which emotionally-coloured characteristics are and are not appropriate to ascribe to God. Gavriluk argues that impassibility should be understood as an 'apophatic qualifier' used to distinguish God from his creation, rather than as a psychological qualifier intended to deprive him of any emotions at all. Building on this foundation, the author shows that the theological controversies of the patristic period – Docetism, Patripassianism, Arianism and Nestorianism – provided the stimulus for the Church to define precisely the ways in which God can and cannot be described as impassible. The book culminates with Cyril of Alexandria's Christology, with its paradox between the impassibility of God the Son in his own divine nature and the reality of the Son's suffering through the human nature he appropriated to himself at the incarnation. Gavriluk concludes that 'in this paradox lay the very nerve centre of the gospel' (p. 175). The author deals with an impressive range of primary and secondary material and handles competing scholarly views adeptly. For example, his discussion of the variety of Hellenistic philosophical views on God's impassibility demonstrates that there was a consensus philosophical view into which the early Church could have 'fallen', and his classification of five major ways of interpreting Arianism provides a helpful summary of recent scholarship on that movement. At the same time, this reviewer believes that the book is simply too short (175 pp.) for a topic of this magnitude and,

as a result, there are a number of places where it suffers from a lack of thoroughness. For instance, chapter iv, on Patripassianism, reads more like the outline of a chapter than like a chapter itself, and in chapter vi Gavriluk's rejection of the view that the Christological controversy was a clash between rival 'schools' of Antioch and Alexandria needs more discussion of the growing body of secondary literature supporting his point. Overall, this reviewer thoroughly agrees with the way the author interprets the patristic notion of impassibility and finds the book to give a very valuable corrective to the common, but misleading, interpretation. But the reviewer suspects that readers who do not share the author's conclusions will be unlikely to find his argument convincing. Further research is needed to bolster several facets of the book's argument, and this reviewer would be pleased to see Gavriluk himself carry out such research in the future.

ERSKINE THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY,
SOUTH CAROLINA

DON FAIRBAIRN

Christian identity in the Jewish and Graeco-Roman world. By Judith M. Lieu. Pp. x + 370. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004. £55. 0 19 926289 6
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905324389

Tertullian's words that 'Christians are made, not born' (*Apologeticum* 18.4) can be seen to have a surprisingly modern ring about them. Or at least that is the contention of Judith Lieu in this erudite and wide-ranging book in which an attempt is made to discuss the different ways a variety of early Christians sought to construct an identity for themselves. For Lieu, as for many others, identities are constructed in particular contexts, and so possess a contingent character, always in a process of change and modification. Her book does not, therefore, aim at what might be described as a Harnackian quest for the essence of Christian identity – that would seem not to be possible – but at the description of a multi-dimensional and complex process (it is interesting to note that the Latin for the translated words 'are made' in the Tertullian quotation is 'fiunt' which can have the sense of 'come into being', a translation which might better suit Lieu's aims) 'through which we both see variety and also puzzle out the pattern of coherence that may be as much in our own minds as in the brightly coloured fragments that tantalize us' (p. 24).

In wishing to discuss the problem of the construction of Christian identity, Lieu has chosen to deal exclusively with texts – in some senses this is not a choice because inscriptional and other archaeological material, at least for the first two centuries of Christian history, are almost non-existent. Lieu recognises this problematic fact and is clear throughout the book that such texts, often the products of elites, do not straightforwardly reflect a reality on the ground – in fact, in part following Averil Cameron, she is keen to show how texts seek to form identity rather than reflecting it. This does not mean that Lieu entirely separates literature from reality – the texts she discusses, she maintains, were probably preserved precisely because their understanding of Christian identity convinced a sufficiently large number of Christians. But her aim is focused more upon the character of that construction than on an exploration of the reality that it may possibly expose.

After a helpful introductory chapter, in which she sets out her aims and places her discussion within a wider scholarly context, Lieu engages with her subject under a

number of headings ('Text and identity', 'History, memory and the invention of tradition', 'Boundaries', 'The grammar of practice', 'Embodiment and gender', 'Space and place', 'The Christian race', and 'The other'). Each chapter divides itself into a discussion of the ways in which the Graeco-Roman, Jewish and Christian culture, in that order, sought to express their own multiple understandings of their identity under these various headings. She is keen to point up continuities as well as discontinuities, and to make plain the often ramified and variegated ways in which identity was expressed within these three groupings. Much of what she has to say (roughly the material contained in chapters ii–vii) relates to what she terms the implicit and functional construction of identity, and in this context she is particularly interesting when discussing the issue of boundaries, noting at the end of the relevant chapter that 'to discover the lability of the boundaries that we have sought to trace is to be reminded of the elusiveness of the identity that they are designed to encircle' (p. 146). Such a sentence, clear in its enunciation of the complexity of the subject under discussion and intentionally avoiding an easily absorbed conclusion, typifies the tone of much of the book.

The final two major chapters on the Christian race and 'the other' are strikingly informative and perceptive. Here Lieu is at her best when discussing the contested character of the term 'Christian', pointing up its varied and differentiated use in the writings of the martyr acts and the apologists, to take but one example; and when pointing up the literary character of the Christian tendency to construct the other in the pursuit of the construction of their own identity.

Some might be tempted to see Lieu's most recent contribution to the discussion of early Christianity as arising, at least in broad terms, out of the school of Walter Bauer. That would be in part to sell the book short. What Lieu has to write about Christian identity is not just concerned with the listing of varieties of Christianity in the earliest period and the building upon that of a series of far-reaching conclusions about the origins of the Church. The book is not straightforwardly a book about Christian origins and Lieu would be the first to eschew the implicit essentialism of Bauer's account of Christian identity. Lieu's work is much more an exploration of the issue of identity in the ancient world, informed by much modern discussion of the subject, and about the way in which Christians interacted with the categories and strategies available to them as these manifested themselves in the Graeco-Roman pagan world and more particularly Judaism.

If one has a criticism of this book it lies in trying to distill a clear conclusion. As we have noted, Lieu appears to eschew ideas of essence when discussing Christian identity in this period, preferring notions of process and flux. Near the end of her concluding remarks, she returns to address what she terms 'the problem of essence', noting that it will not leave us. But even if it will not leave us, trying to give expression to what it might consist of is equally difficult. 'What explorations into the nature of identity may be able to teach us is that the only real continuity lies in the *experienced* continuity of "essence"' (p. 311). Such 'experienced essence', Lieu contends, is best understood in terms of a narrative of otherness, a story of separation, albeit taking different forms in different texts. Some may think this an altogether too vague and restricted conclusion to a book on Christian identity and feel that its author has left us with little to grasp onto, not least when the instincts of early church historians lead them to think that Polycarp's cry of 'I am a Christian' contained within it certain implicit non-negotiables universally held. But that is precisely the value of this

sophisticated and learned book: it makes us think again in a more nuanced way about the central question of early Christian identity formation.

PETERHOUSE,
CAMBRIDGE

JAMES CARLETON PAGET

To each their own letter. Structure, themes, and rhetorical strategies in the letters of Ignatius of Antioch. By Mikael Isacson. (Coniectanea Biblica. New Testament Series, 42.) Pp. 240. Stockholm: Almqvist & Wiksell, 2004. SEK 271 (paper). 91 22 02070 5; 0069 8946
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905334385

Isacson joins renewed debate in Ignatian studies by using the tools of text linguistic analysis and rhetorical criticism in the tradition of D. Hellholm and O. Bakke to address what he sees as a weakness in Ignatian scholarship: the failure to differentiate the seven letters from each other as ‘specific act[s] of communication’, missing the particular character of each letter, and adding to a misapprehension of the theological and historical issues these reveal about Ignatius, his addressees and his own Syrian background. Focusing chiefly on the five letters addressed to the Churches in Asia, Isacson evaluates the structure of each letter in order to discern the main themes and rhetorical strategies Ignatius employs in his communications with each Church. The results of his study indicate that all five letters share a similar epistolary structure, and that the primary themes (unity, obedience to the bishop and avoidance of opponents) are not uniformly emphasised, but vary from letter to letter, depending on their individual circumstances. Also, Ignatius’ rhetorical strategies appear to be uniquely suited to each context, sometimes stressing the polemics of association/dissociation, sometimes stressing the authority of his *ethos* for the purpose of advocating the themes of unity, or the avoidance of opponents/division. Isacson believes that, by addressing each letter on its own terms, the stagnation that Ignatian research has been suffering from can be alleviated, and new insights can be pursued. Isacson may be right, and though his study is often slowed by technical terminology and idioms characteristic of text linguistic analyses, he rightly points to an aspect in the analysis of the Ignatian *corpus* that has been overlooked: they are individual letters and not (necessarily) to be subsumed under a single thematic heading.

LONDON SCHOOL OF THEOLOGY

JOHN-PAUL LOTZ

Revelation, truth, canon and interpretation. Studies in Justin Martyr’s Dialogue with Trypho. By Craig D. Allert. (Supplements to *Vigiliae Christianae*. Texts and Studies of Early Christian Life and Language, 64.) Pp. xv + 311. Leiden–Boston–Cologne: Brill, 2002. €99. 90 04 12619 8; 0920 623X
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905344381

This monograph, a revised Nottingham PhD thesis, supervised by George Bebawi, discusses four loosely related themes in Justin’s *Dialogue*. The introduction defends the choice of the four topics and sketches Justin’s life. The purpose of the *Dialogue* is discussed in the opening chapter. Allert gives plenty of attention to rival views before concluding that the author of the *Dialogue* has primarily a Jewish audience in mind,

though ‘a combined Jewish/Christian audience can reasonably be posited’ (p. 61). Not all readers will be convinced. The lengthy chapter on the concept of revelation is perhaps the strongest, even though ‘revelation’ is not a theme usually associated with the *Dialogue*. The author argues that in Justin’s concept the event of Jesus and the communication of his coming (in the prophets and the ‘memoirs of the apostles’) are in sharp contrast to his pre-conversion Middle Platonic epistemology. The chapter on the concept of truth opens with a truism: this concept is ‘a rather slippery one to grab hold of’ (p. 123). Undeterred, the author insists that Justin rejects both the Hebraic and Greek concepts of truth for the New Testament understanding of truth (p. 186). A shorter chapter on the evidence in the *Dialogue* for the emergence of the New Testament canon contains few surprises. The final chapter explores the ‘interpretational foundations’ of Justin’s use of the Old Testament. There are no conclusions. It is difficult to see how there could be, for no overall argument is developed. The author, who writes as a ‘historical theologian’, includes a number of interesting theological observations, but he has tended to use his own theological template in his exploration of the *Dialogue*. A very full bibliography is included. Rather surprisingly, Allert shows no awareness of Miroslav Marcovich’s important critical edition of the Greek text of the *Dialogue* published in 1997.

UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE

GRAHAM STANTON

La Réincarnation et l'occident, I: De Platon à Origène. By Jean-Marie Détré (with Joseph Hériard Dubreuil). Pp. 277. Paris: Triades, 2003. €20 (£5.50) (paper).

2 85248 237 1

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905354388

This book is addressed, I think, not so much to students of patristics as to inquiring Roman Catholics whose theology – and with it their understanding of ecclesiastical history – is shaped by the great ecclesiastical councils. The author notes with pleasure that Origen’s name no longer figures in Roman catalogues of heresy, as the Church has now learned not to conflate the oecumenical council of 553 with a private synod ten years earlier, which did not so much deliberate as endorse the ignorant calumnies of Justinian. Translating select but important texts from Origen’s works (and properly relying only on those that survive in Greek) he concludes that Origen’s division of human nature into body, soul and spirit is Platonic and not Pauline; that he never taught the transmigration of human souls into other human bodies, let alone into those of animals; and that he never held that either Christ or his saints would enter the future life as disembodied souls. He does not pretend, or even wish, to acquit his client of all unorthodoxy – he seems to regret for example, that Justinian’s legislation emptied heaven of the rational souls which Origen, in Plato’s wake, had assigned to the stars and planets – but he rightly demands that scholars should impute to him only the heresies that they can demonstrate from his own writings. The prefatory review of Plato’s doctrines is both accurate and compendious, though at times perhaps too lucid where the original seems designedly obscure.

CHRIST CHURCH,
OXFORD

M. J. EDWARDS

The apostolic tradition. A commentary. By Paul F. Bradshaw, Maxwell E. Johnson and L. Edward Phillips (edited by Harold W. Attridge). (Hermeneia. A Critical and Historical Commentary on the Bible.) Pp. xviii + 250. Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 2002. \$47. 0 8006 6046 3

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905364384

The Egyptian church order was reidentified by Connolly and Schwartz independently of each other in works published in 1916 and 1910. The evidence for the original title as being the *Apostolic tradition* was found in the reconstruction of an early third-century statue as the figure of Hippolytus by the renaissance antiquarian Pirro Ligorio, on the plinth of the chair of which was a catalogue of works, many of which were lost, but amongst which was one entitled 'Apostolic tradition' (ἀποστολική; παράδοσις). In the second half of the twentieth century the work thus reidentified was to play a major ecumenical role since it was believed to be the earliest surviving church order and the source of all future rites. Thus it became the liturgical model for the vernacular mass approved by the Roman Congregation of Rites, post-Vatican II, as it did for modern revisions of Cranmer in the Anglican Communion, as the recovery of a lost common history before later divisions. Botte's celebrated edition (1963) of the original Greek and Latin texts in parallel with Latin translations of the Sahidic (Coptic), Arabic, Ethiopic and Bohairic laid the foundation for such an ecumenical project. In the first place Bradshaw, Johnson and Phillips have presented us with a timely translation of this work and its representatives set out in English in seven parallel columns (Verona Latin, Arabic, Ethiopic, *Apostolic constitutions*, *Canons of Hippolytus* and the *Testamentum domini*). But in the second they have set out both in their introduction and in their notes the case against a single author named Hippolytus advanced by Metzger, Magne and Faivre, and also supported to some extent by Brent who has challenged the view that we cannot conclude that the works listed on the plinth of Ligorio's statue point to a single author of those works: the statue itself was originally an allegorical representation and not a portrait of a person. These writers, *inter alia*, have made the point that the textual tradition has produced so many variants that it is so impossible to decide which is original that, as in Botte's case, all that can be done is to set out everything in parallel columns. But they then have posed the pertinent question: if the textual archetype is so irrecoverable, might this not be because there was no original archetype and that we have across the seven witnesses testimonies to a living tradition with a variety of sources paralleling one another at some points in confluent streams? The authors thus propose a new approach that sees this work to be composite with core documents perhaps from the mid-second century, to which the rest was added later. The final shape of the text is only fixed in the fourth century. The various features of the texts such as a narrative of institution at the eucharist, a double baptismal anointing, the practice of daily exorcism of baptismal candidates etc are either later than the early third century or are more specifically Eastern, so that the liturgical traditions of ordination, eucharist and baptism are not those specifically of Rome at such an early period. In this respect their position finds some support in Cerrato's recent work which sees multiple authors in the Hippolytan *corpus* none of whom are to be identified with the events of what I regard as the Hippolytan school in the early third century, as described in pseudo-Hippolytus' *Elenchos* ix–x. The authors alas missed at the time of their writing Alistair Stewart-Sykes's interesting development of my thesis on the Hippolytan problem in his translation and extended commentary

on the text of the so-called *Apostolic tradition*. The issues raised here have been further debated by myself with Bradshaw, Cerrato and Stewart Sykes in the *St Vladimir Orthodox Review* xlviii/2–3 (2004). I remain unconvinced that the series of inconclusive *caveats* amounting to *argumenta e silentio* that trade on the fragmentary character of witnesses to liturgical practices from the second to the fourth century seriously undermines the connection between the composite document that has become known as the *Apostolic tradition* and ecclesiastical events in Rome in the early third century. Simply because the Egyptian church order cannot be linked to the work of a single writer whose title appears on his statue does not mean that we cannot trace within the events at Rome described in the Hippolytan *corpus* themes and currents that represent the playing out of those events. The authors nevertheless have made an important contribution to the discussion in providing an English version of the various witnesses to the text and an interesting challenge to an established point of view.

ST EDMUND'S COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

ALLEN BRENT

The Apostles' Creed. Origin, history, and some early commentaries. By Liuwe H. Westra. (Instrumenta Patristica et Mediaevalia. Research on the Inheritance of Early and Medieval Christianity, 43.) Pp. v + 603 + 2 colour frontispieces. Turnhout: Brepols, 2002. €95. 2503 51395 6

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905374380

This is the most extensive contribution to the development of the Apostles' Creed (T, i.e. *textus receptus*) in recent years. Westra strongly disagrees with the view, recently suggested by M. Vincent and this reviewer, that the precursor of T, the so-called Old Roman Creed (R), does not predate the fourth century and that it had its origins in the debates about the theology of Marcellus at the Synod of Rome in 340/1 which rehabilitated the bishop of Ancyra. Instead he restates the older view that we have to look for precursors of R in the pre-Constantinian Church. In modifying a theory first put forward by P. Smulders, Westra suggests the existence of a creed called 'proto-R' which he calls 'the hypothetical parent of all extant variants of the Apostles' Creed' (p. 68) and which he dates to the middle of the third century. Be that as it may (and I have strong doubts as regards the validity of his argument which I will set out elsewhere), the main thrust of Westra's book is not about the origin of R but rather about the period between the formulation R and the time of Charlemagne who decreed in 811–13 that the same form of the creed (i.e. T) had to be used by his clergy. Westra carefully collects all evidence available which, in one way or another, pertains to the development of T, and in some cases even provides us with new editions of credal texts that had hitherto been only available in uncritical versions. Westra groups these texts according to regional provenance (Gaul, Spain, Africa, Northern Italy and others). When one surveys all these sources one is struck by the high number of variants in the wording of the Creed. Westra points out that in most cases these variations do not appear to have constituted a major problem and are passed over in silence. The Creed was altered in order to adapt it to changing dogmatic or pastoral needs or because of the stylistic idiosyncrasies of a particular author. In addition, there are variations that are best explained by assuming the

existence of regional types. Changes made in Rome quickly spread to the provinces. As for the rest Westra distinguishes between changes of wording (which tended to remain confined to one or two regions) and changes of content which tended to spread more easily to other regions. In his final chapter Westra attempts with some success to determine the provenance and date of some sixteen anonymous or pseudonymous creeds and credal texts. This is a rich and learned book which (in its discussion of the later evidence) is a useful and reliable tool for further research, and will in any case stimulate scholarly debate on the creeds for a long time to come.

EVANGELISCH-THEOLOGISCHES SEMINAR DER UNIVERSITÄT
BONN

WOLFRAM KINZIG

Approaching late antiquity. The transformation from early to late empire. Edited by Simon Swain and Mark Edwards. Pp. xiii + 487 incl. 29 figs + 6 colour plates. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004. £75. 0 19 926714 6
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905384387

Between the years 200 and 400 momentous changes in politics, culture and religion thundered throughout the Roman world and whereas some thought they were witnessing deleterious crises, others espied a divine contrivance. This collection of fifteen distinguished essays sets out to specify and account for many of these developments: politically, religiously and culturally. Two Cambridge scholars, Richard Duncan-Jones on economic changes and Peter Garnsey on the new understanding of citizenship, provide us with a look at the most immediately felt changes: money and identity. Emanuele Papi hails from the University of Siena and contributes a new understanding of the prefecture in the north at this time. Diocletian's Egypt is explored by Colin Adams, while Oxford's Tony Honoré looks at the transition 'from Cosmopolis to *Rechtstaat*', arguing that the rise of the Christian episcopate gave a growing segment of the empire an alternative legal system while also limiting the emperor's scope of power, thus giving the ordinary citizen greater recourse to justice. Of course laws remain empty without enforcement and Michael Whitby takes up the emerging relationship between the emperor and his armies at this time, concentrating on the increase in non-Romans as well as on the new role Christianity played throughout the ranks. Dealing more explicitly with this question of the empire's toleration and eventual embrace of the Church, Oxford's Mark Edwards argues powerfully against some recent thinking that non-Christians of this period can be considered monotheistic let alone Trinitarian; moreover, what set Christians apart from their opponents was not primarily in disagreement over the transcendent but over the divinely incarnate Nazarene they worshiped as Lord and God. Edwards also traces the *Romanitas* of the Church in its absorption of the authors, images and locations common to an earlier day, an appropriation perhaps best symbolised in Neil McLynn's 'Imperial churchgoing', a study showing how, why and when the emperor attended Christian liturgies. The final five essays deal with the *literati* of the day. Jas' Elsner examines the new aesthetic, Susan Walker shows how mummy portraits sought to establish a *Romanitas* in the smaller yet more ambitious towns of Egypt, and Alan Cameron pays befitting attention to the poetic revival, with special attention to Gregory of Nazianzus. Although Simon Swain provides us with a fine

overview and introduction, he later takes up the importance of Libanius, and the always reliable John Dillon rounds things out by showing how the philosopher was not simply replaced by the theologian but often became a highly respected and oftentimes publicly supported official. As would be expected with such an eminent cast, this volume is an invaluable resource for anyone interested in the world of late antiquity.

CAMPION HALL,
OXFORD

DAVID VINCENT MECONI

The Nicene faith, I: True God of true God; II: One of the Holy Trinity. By John Behr. (Formation of Christian Theology, 2.) Pp. xvii + 259; xi + 261–507. Crestwood, NY: St Vladimir's Seminary Press, 2004. \$30 (paper). o 88141 260 0; o 88141 265 1; o 88141 266 X
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905394383

This second volume in Behr's *Formation of Christian Theology* fulfils the promise of his earlier volume, the *Way to Nicaea*. As all his titles indicate, his project is a history of orthodoxy, but it differs from most others in acknowledging that the pioneers of orthodoxy included men who subsequently failed to secure a position among the church Fathers. Behr's heretics are rational, sincere and – like their orthodox counterparts – more beholden to Scripture and tradition than to the devil, the belly or even an extraneous philosophy. At last, it seems, theology can be practised with the same candour as other academic disciplines, and an author need not be 'utterly illogical and unspiritual' (to quote Pollard's strikingly recent judgement on Arius) simply because he adopts a different reading of some enigmatic text. Nor is it assumed that all the malignity was on one side, and all the charity on the other: Behr's lucid and dispassionate account of the ecclesiastical troubles which preceded every new formula suggests that it is hard to become a saint if one cannot trade blows with sinners. In his summaries of doctrinal controversy he quotes liberally from all the embattled parties, generally taking each at his word and turning to the most sympathetic commentator whenever elucidation is required. Thus he acquaints the reader at some length with the views of Lienhardt on Marcellus, Anatolios on Athanasius, Vaggione on Eunomius and Rousseau on Basil – nowhere, however, leaving us in doubt that he is himself a capable student of all these authors. Occasionally – as when he cites the letter of Athanasius Marcellinus – he makes illuminating use of a work outside the familiar canon; at the same time, the indispensable texts are all here, though handled in a manner that quickens interest and refreshes understanding. I know of no other handbook which explains with such stringent economy why the teaching of Marcellus on the *prosopon* of Christ is deficient, how Gregory Nazianzen interweaves complementary senses of the term *Logos*, or what Basil understood by *epinoia*. There are, of course, some points at which an interested scholar will find the argument too cursory: the anomalous assertion in the *Ad graecos* that Father and Son are one *prosopon*, for example, is attributed to Gregory of Nyssa with no mention of the doubt that Jaeger's edition casts on its authorship. Translations, though always accurate, sometimes manifest a bias: thus 'eternal' and 'only-begotten' are not the most circumspect equivalents for *pro aiōnos* and *monogenēs* even in orthodox writers. It is not so clear to me as it is to Behr that the

intentions of the Council of Nicaea were subverted in our sole remaining account of it; Eusebius of Caesarea's letter to his diocese was after all a public document, and written at a time when it was still possible for contumacious members of the council to be deposed. It is, however, clear that this is a work of comprehensive and discriminating scholarship, and one that will not be allowed to gather dust on library shelves.

CHRIST CHURCH,
OXFORD

M. J. EDWARDS

Severus of Antioch. By Pauline Allen and C. T. R. Hayward. (The Early Church Fathers.) Pp. vii + 200. London–New York: Routledge, 2004. £16.99 (paper).
o 415 23401 8; o 415 23402 6

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905404388

This is a really useful addition to a good series. Severus (born c. 456, patriarch of Antioch 512–18, died 538) is given here in part I a well-written and informative biography together with a guide to his thought, and in part II a selection in translation from his dogmatical and polemical works, his homilies, letters and hymns. These survive mostly not in their Greek original but in Syriac versions together with some in Coptic, Ethiopic and Arabic. The controversial Syriac works have long been available in the forbiddingly entitled *Corpus Scriptorum Christianorum Orientalium*, and the rest in the *Patrologia Orientalis* and in E. W. Brooks's edition of the ancient selection from Severus' extensive correspondence which is his *Sixth book of select letters*. Additional material has come to light recently and more perhaps may follow from Ethiopic and Arabic sources. New here is the editors' rejection of details in the ancient *Life* of Severus by Zacharias (he was born of non-Christian parents and hence his grandfather was not the Bishop Severus of Sozopolis present at the Council of Ephesus in 431). The letters edited by Brooks, seven of which are repeated here, are a rich source of information for church administration. The homilies and hymns are the best introduction to his theology. The controversial works are pretty well unreadable. That is not the fault of Hayward; he has done his best with turgid texts the highlights of which are the bits Severus quotes from Basil, the Gregories and Cyril.

SKELMANTHORPE

LIONEL R. WICKHAM

Socrate de Constantinople, *Histoire ecclésiastique*, I: *Texte grec de l'édition G. C. Hansen* (GCS). Trans., intro. and notes †Pierre Périchon and Pierre Maraval. (Sources Chrétiennes, 477.) Pp. 277. Paris: Les Éditions du Cerf, 2004. €27 (paper).
2 204 07214 1; 0750 1978

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905414384

It may seem strange to say that in the twentieth century the ecclesiastical history of the fifth-century Socrates of Constantinople was translated into Hungarian and into Polish but not into any of the major European languages. This fact alone would be enough to merit a very warm welcome for this new French translation. More important, the last decade has seen a new critical edition (G. C. Hansen, GCS N.F. 1, 1995), and the work has attracted a considerable amount of scholarly attention (five

monographs in the last ten years: see Périchon/Maraval, p. 39f.). Hence, a new translation is certainly useful. The late Pierre Périchon had left a draft of a complete translation which he made in the context of his own project of editing the text, a project never brought to completion. Thanks to Pierre Maraval, Professor of Patristics in Paris, this translation has now been thoroughly revised, annotated and published. The text is Hansen's, unfortunately without any critical apparatus. This is particularly regrettable since it frequently uses brackets ({ } and < >) to indicate passages that ought to be left out or added, mostly suggestions based on the Armenian translation. Anyone using the *Sources Chrétiennes* text therefore sees numerous brackets but has no idea what they mean. Maraval's introduction gives a short and precise account of recent research on Socrates: the main topics covered are the author and his work, the sources and the history of the text. An interesting detail is that a sort of consensus has been established to the effect that Socrates did indeed belong to the Novatian sect (p. 12). He therefore wrote his ecclesiastical history from the perspective of an established minority in the eastern capital. What remains controversial is whether or not Socrates used the ecclesiastical history of Gelasius of Caesarea as a source. Recent research by some French-speaking scholars (including Maraval at pp. 25–8) tends to doubt the 'hypothèse Winkelman', that is the reconstruction of this late fourth-century historiographical work, which could have served as a source for Socrates. Further discussion of this complex issue will be needed. Maraval's translation and notes can, of course, always be questioned on matters of detail but the overall impression is very good. One of the most important sources on the reign of Constantine (the content of bk I, the volume under review) is now easily accessible to students and scholars. It is to be hoped that the missing volumes will follow quickly.

FRIEDRICH-SCHILLER-UNIVERSITÄT,
JENA

MARTIN WALLRAFF

The Christian tradition in Anglo-Saxon England. Approaches to current scholarship and teaching.

By Paul Cavill. (Christianity and Culture issues in Teaching and Research.)

Pp. xviii + 207 incl. 5 figs and 13 plates. Cambridge: D. S. Brewer, 2004. £40.
0 85991 841 6; 1740 9896

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905424380

The principles uniting this varied and stimulating collection of original essays are suggested by the commitment of the general editors of the series to address 'the challenge that the study of literature, history and material culture of the past often poses for modern researchers, students and teachers, because the religious assumptions of previous centuries are remote from the worldviews of contemporary people' (p. ix). This statement of intent leads us to expect a mixture of conventional academic research with suggestions for how best to convey its results to students and other scholars; and certainly the book as a whole fulfils that expectation. There is a slight feeling in some of the individual contributions that the incorporation of a distinctive pedagogical element was not achieved without a struggle; but that is, perhaps, mainly because research is an experience which, though shared with others in the end, is itself a form of self-education. Most of the contributors are established authorities on Anglo-Saxon literature and culture. The range of topics is very wide, covering (for example) Old English poetry (Graham D. Caie, Paul Cavill, Santha

Bhattacharji), the textual history of the Latin Bible (Richard Marsden – a standout performance), diagrams in Anglo-Saxon manuscripts (Philippa Semper), Old English saints' *Lives* (Hugh Magennis) and sermons (Mary Swan). Some contributors, for example Magennis, Swan and Marsden, provide useful appendices on basic teaching and research materials to start the reader off; others, for example Judith Jesch on Scandinavian pagan traditions in the later period, Elisabeth Okasha on inscribed memorial and grave stones, Paul Cavill on Christianity in *Beowulf*, and Barbara Raw on medieval pictures as substitutes for texts, are basically traditional academic articles, though written with consideration for the ignorance of beginners in these areas of study. A few other essays deal explicitly with the authors' experience of teaching, notably Dabney Anderson Bankert on mounting a course on conversion in the medieval period for MA students in America, and Jonathan M. Wooding on the background and interests of students on a Lampeter MA in Celtic Christianity. The essays are arranged in the book in two sequences, the first headed 'Approaches to scholarship', the second 'Approaches to teaching', though as the editor himself points out (p. xiv), the distinction is not rigidly applied. The book is clearly printed, though the adhesive title-label on the front cover of my copy had already begun to peel off by the time it reached me. The only typographical errors I noticed were in Cubitt's article on Anglo-Saxon perceptions of St Peter: p. 41/22, where 'early' should read 'of early'; p. 43/36, where 'Marytred' appears for 'Martyred', and p. 51/22 'women' for 'woman'.

QUEEN MARY AND WESTFIELD COLLEGE,
UNIVERSITY OF LONDON

PETER ORTON

The white mantle of churches. Architecture, liturgy, and art around the millennium. Edited by Nigel Hiscock. (International Medieval Research, 10. Art History Subseries, 2.) Pp. xix + 283 incl. 156 ills. Turnhout: Brepols, 2003. €75 (paper). 2 503 51230 5
Biblical imagery in medieval England, 700–1550. By C. M. Kauffmann. Pp. xvi + 365 incl. map and 283 ills + 16 colour plates. London–Turnhout: Harvey Miller, 2003. €105. 1 872501 04 4
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905434387

The collection edited by Nigel Hiscock takes its title from the celebrated comment of the Burgundian monk, Rodulfus Glaber (†c. 1046), who claimed at the beginning of the eleventh century that

throughout the whole world but most especially in Italy and Gaul, men began to reconstruct churches ... it seemed as though each Christian community were aiming to surpass all others in splendour of construction. It was as if the whole world were shaking itself free, shrugging off the burden of the past and cladding itself everywhere in a white mantle of churches.

The declared aim of the volume, which is based on papers given at Leeds in 2000, is 'to add the architectural evidence to the millennial debate' (p. xvi), addressing in particular the questions: 'was there a surge of church-building at the time' and, if so, why; 'was there a connection between the "white mantle of churches" and the millennium; did people believe the world was coming to an end?'

The first four chapters focus on Germany. William Sanderson (ch. iv) broaches the issue of the role of Gorzian monastic houses in architectural development, his main finding being that any conclusion would be premature; while Eliza Garrison (ch. iii) offers yet another account of the much-studied ruler-imagery in the *Pericopes Book* and *Sacramentary* of the Emperor Henry II, interpreting it in relation to that monarch's heightened interest in the northern and eastern portions of his realm – a paper which, whilst perfectly respectable in its own right, has no obvious connection with the rest of the volume. The editor's own 'The Ottonian revival' (ch. i) is a rather pedestrian summary of well-known facts about the Ottonian dynasty, the German Church and its stylistically fairly disparate buildings, from which it is concluded (correctly) that 'it would seem therefore that it was the monastic revival more than any millennial impulse that produced the "white mantle of churches"' (p. 25). Richard Plant's, 'Architectural development in the empire north of the Alps' likewise refutes Glaber's view by pointing out, *via* a more detailed survey of selected, high-status complexes, that 'Ottonian architectural endeavour was as energetic before as after 1000' (p. 51).

The subject of the next three chapters (v–vii) is England, where, of course, very few high-status buildings dating from around the millennium survive. Helen Gittos stresses the inadequacies of liturgical evidence for remedying this lacuna; Nils Holger Petersen's difficult-to-follow paper then labours to define the role of liturgy as a re-enactment of Christian mysteries, something that no-one is likely to have questioned. Malcolm Thurlby, in a text overburdened with examples but supported by excellent photographs, usefully highlights the diversity of late Anglo-Saxon architecture, stressing the (modest) continuities between some pre- and post-Conquest features.

In chapters viii and ix, the high points of the collection, the focus belatedly turns to Glaber's Burgundy. Kristina Krüger provides a clear and thought-provoking account of the role of galilee chapels in eleventh-century Cluniac architecture, focusing in particular on the well-known but none the less remarkable example at Tournus; while Carolyn Malone explores the possible symbolism of the celebrated but largely destroyed rotunda at Saint-Bénigne, Dijon. Both these chapters, which deftly balance detailed analysis of a particularly important site with consideration of the broader issues it raises, are efficiently distilled from their authors' larger studies of the same monuments and themes.

Individual sites in France are also the subject of the next couple of chapters (x–xi) which offer respectively a classified inventory (partly in note form) of the eleventh-century architectural sculpture at Saint-Germain-des-Prés, and an assured account of the eleventh-century building work at Autun together with its (very modest) sculptural adornment. Sweeping but efficient surveys of church building in northern Italy and northern Spain in the early eleventh century follow (chs xii–xiii); the former points out how uninformed was Glaber's notice of Italy but that genuinely significant projects were in fact afoot at Florence and Pisa; the latter stresses that the architecture of Sancho el Mayor (1004–35) had a greater debt to local traditions, and a greater relevance to local circumstances, than was previously thought.

The collection concludes with Richard Landes's broad-ranging 'millennial reading' of Glaber's passage on the white mantle of churches, which will doubtless confirm both 'believers' and 'non-believers' in this scholar's approach of the rightness of their respective positions.

While such summaries cannot, of course, do justice to the individual papers, they do give a reasonable indication of the strengths and weaknesses of the volume as a whole. A couple of contributions are, considered in their own right, quite outstanding; some offer useful overviews of their fields; others are, frankly, pedestrian and derivative; while a few are essentially unconnected to the rest of the book. The circumstance that there is no general conclusion – assessing what light the exercise as a whole has shed on the initial questions – might be regarded as symptomatic of the limitations. What, in brief, we learn is that Glaber's comments were apposite for Burgundy (above all for the foundations he knew most intimately), but were hardly applicable – or only coincidentally – anywhere else; that the most important catalysts for rebuilding around this time were the various tenth-century monastic reform movements; and that architectural form and the chronology of (re)building was far more firmly linked to local traditions than to any awareness of the millennium. Architectural historians and readers of this JOURNAL hardly needed the present collection to tell them this.

If *White mantle* promised too much and provided too little, *Biblical imagery in medieval England, 700–1550* promises considerably more and actually delivers it. The subject matter is vast and the chronological scope extensive, yet thanks to the author's comprehensive knowledge of the field on the one hand and, on the other, to his discernment in making an optimum selection therefrom, the result is clear but not simplistic, broad-ranging but never overwhelming. For each chronological period Kauffmann offers a 'broad-brush' introduction, followed by a couple of detailed case studies. Thus a summary of the art-historical issues raised by the conversion of the Anglo-Saxons to Christianity at the hands of Roman and Irish monks introduces a telling contrast between the 'Insular' imagery of the Book of Durrow and the 'Roman' aesthetic of the Codex Amiatinus; a masterful account of the Bury Bible provides the focus for a chapter on the erudite monastic use of biblical imagery in the twelfth century; while the Painted Chamber at Westminster is the centre-piece of one on the political use of biblical imagery within 'secular' society in the thirteenth. Concurrently, the choice of themes and case studies enables the author to explore the ways in which, at different times, different groups of society used biblical imagery for their own purposes – thereby making cogent points about the fluidity of the 'meaning' of certain scenes, and the extent to which the choice of particular events for illustration reflected contemporary preoccupations. Moreover, the use of biblical imagery in England is, throughout, related to the changing emphases of ecclesiastical, political and social life, and set against a backdrop of contemporary continental practices. The sureness of touch and command of detail, allied to an easy style and a wealth of high-quality illustrations, make this a most agreeable book to read as well as a thought-provoking one.

To sum up: while some students of architectural history may refer to particular essays in *White mantle*, anyone with an interest in medieval England, its beliefs and the ways in which they were communicated should read *Biblical imagery* from cover to cover; our two books epitomise, on the one hand, the pitfalls of a multi-author volume and, on the other, the power of a well-produced survey from a single master hand.

Alcuins Gebetbuch für Karl den Grossen. Seine Rekonstruktion und seine Stellung in der frühmittelalterlichen Geschichte der libelli precum. By Stephan Waldhoff. (Liturgiewissen schaftliche Quellen und Forschungen, 89.) Pp. ix + 485. Münster: Aschendorff, 2003. €105 (paper). 3 402 4068 9; 0076 0048

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905444383

The shared language of medieval prayer has rarely received adequate treatment, and the identity of those who used the prayers which survive, and how and when they prayed, remains unclear. So this careful study would be important even if it did not claim to reconstruct the prayer book composed by Alcuin for Charlemagne. After a chapter on early medieval private prayer as transmitted in insular and continental manuscripts (including Cerne) and the terminology used for private prayers, Waldhoff uses the testimony of the *Vita Alcuini* that Alcuin had composed a *libellus de ratione orationis* for his master and the evidence of two extant manuscripts to reconstruct and edit Alcuin's text. It opened with a letter to Charles about how King David established the canonical hours and how an active layman can pray briefly. There follow a selection of psalm texts to recite while rising, and Waldhoff documents their liturgical use, and a *Confessio* calling on God's pity for the sinner and listing his sins. (There is a very useful discussion of how the *confessio* was a part of daily penance.) Then, after the seven penitential psalms, and a litany including Frankish saints, come the *orationes speciales*, *orationes in laude Dei*, *in quacumque tribulatione*, and a selection of psalm texts for various purposes and of prayers for the hours. Waldhoff can show how parts of this collection were used to provide prayers throughout the week (including in Aelfwine's prayerbook and the additions to the Durham Collectar). He is sensitive to the variations between manuscripts and their interpretation. That Charlemagne daily strove to make a pure confession of his sins, accusing himself of rushing into evil, bending his knees more often to fornication than to prayer, his belly distorted by greed and drink, his back strong in wickedness, his arms in lascivious embracings, his hands full of blood, his ears deaf to good, his eyes seldom fixed on God and his head rarely inclined to God must modify our traditional and triumphal understanding of him and his age. I have checked the transcription of the chief manuscript, a Moissac book dated to 1067/8, now Bodleian Library, Oxford, MS D'Orville 45 and it proves excellent, though it is a pity that the prayers to the Virgin on fos 37v–39v were omitted.

KING'S COLLEGE,
LONDON

DAVID GANZ

Cambridgeshire. A history of church and parish. By N. J. G. Pounds. Pp. xviii + 202 incl. 44 plates and 47 maps and plans. Cambridge-New York: Oleander Press, 2004. £25. 0 906672 35 X

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S002204690545438X

This pleasing volume, by a distinguished historical geographer, is a labour of love about the county in which he has lived for many years, and is the fruit of much field work and church 'crawling'. The volume is well illustrated and the argument supported with good maps and plans. As one might expect the focus is on the economic background to the emergence of the county's parish churches, and begins with an excellent overview of settlement and topography in shaping the parochial

structure and boundaries of the county, showing how the elongated parishes of south-east Cambridgeshire acquired their shape to ensure a range of soil types sufficient to sustain their economic vitality. A shorter chapter, on the financing of the pastoral ministry, is followed by one on the economics of the parish, in which the varying fortunes of particular parishes as a result of changing land use are noted, as at the Longstantons, where the income of St Andrew remained static between 1535 and 1711 whilst that at St Michael increased eight-fold. These chapters take up 40 per cent of the book and are the necessary background to its core, which is consideration of the churches themselves, their building, maintenance and furnishings, and the craftsmen who carried out the work. It is clear that Pounds's loyalties lie with the Romanesque, where treatment is full and well illustrated, and that he is less attracted to the endeavours of the Victorians at church extension in the towns. What the volume reveals best is the central part played in all this by the local economy, both in the choice of materials (see fig. 5.2) and styles, which paid little heed to fashion. The distribution of materials used in building is explained through a map (fig. 5.3) of those water routes essential for transporting heavy goods; this is just one example of the way in which the volume demonstrates how those meeting points of the natural and the supernatural came to look as they did, and still do. In contrast to the great statements of international style and power which adorn the college chapels of the city, the county abounds with ancient examples of vernacular piety, and the volume ends with a timely plea that the buildings produced by this unobtrusive devotion should not be forgotten by the present generation. In producing this volume Norman Pounds has made a contribution to ensuring that this will not happen.

UNIVERSITY OF YORK

W.J. SHEILS

Die Streitschriften Hincmars von Reims und Hincmars von Laon, 869–871. Edited by Rudolf Schieffer. (Monumenta Germaniae Historica. Concilia, 4, 2.) Pp. xv + 583. Hanover: Hahnsche Buchhandlung, 2003. €110. 3 7752 5355 6
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905464386

This volume contains editions of five small canon law collections assembled by Hincmar of Laon, the *Pittaciolus* of Hincmar of Laon, the *Opusculum LV capitulorum* of Hincmar of Reims, the *Rotula* of Hincmar of Laon and his collection of papal letters. The *Pittaciolus* was presented at the assembly at Gondreville in November 869 and has survived in three manuscripts. Hincmar of Reims's response was presented the following year at Attigny and designed to display his command of canon law. It survives in four manuscripts, and was quoted in the *Rotula* of Hincmar of Laon. All the texts edited here were produced to serve in the bitter dispute between the two Hincmars, which is now chiefly of interest to students of canon law exploring the functions of the metropolitan. It was analysed by Fuhrmann in a 1990 article and by Hartmann in his MGH edition of the Carolingian Concilia of 860–74. Hincmar of Laon had been rash enough to assemble thirty-three passages of canon law in his own defence; his uncle produced a crushing response which his target understandably decided not to read. Instead he quoted a letter of Pope Nicholas I which stated that the archbishop of Reims was to consult his colleagues. Schieffer provides excellent detailed notes to all the texts he edits, but no full discussion of

what they have to say. They reveal a mastery of canons and papal decretals, including Pseudo-Isidore, and a prolixity which would now impress those funding UK history departments. But they also belong in the world of the royal *bannum* and *servitium* as Engels realised when, following Roth's *Geschichte des Beneficialwesens*, he used these texts in his discussion of the origins of property.

KINGS COLLEGE,
LONDON

DAVID GANZ

Water and the word. Baptism and the education of the clergy in the Carolingian empire, I: A study of texts and manuscripts; II: Editions of the texts. By Susan A. Keefe. (Publications in Medieval Studies.) Pp. xiii + 202; vi + 661. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2002. \$45, \$150. 0 268 01965 7; 0 268 01969 X
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905474382

Most Carolingian texts, so we are taught, are in print, if sometimes in inadequate editions. The proper task of the Carolingian historian is the study of elites and cultural identity, as defined by written culture. Just as the columns of the *Acta Sanctorum* remind us of texts Carolingian historians take pride in ignoring, so Susan Keefe's two impressive volumes serve as a reminder that there are plenty of texts still to be edited and understood. By investigating Carolingian interpretations of how people were made Christians she may be contributing more to our understanding of their cultural identity than her contemporaries, but she is far too modest to say so. In these two volumes Keefe edits sixty-one texts, some of a few lines, the longest of some thirty printed pages, of which twenty-five have never been edited. The texts are all concerned with baptism and include Charlemagne's circular letter of 812 about baptism found in six manuscripts, and the answers by his archbishops, Jesse of Amiens, Amalarius of Metz, Leidrad of Lyons, Magnus of Sens, Arno of Salzburg, Maxentius of Aquileia and perhaps Hildebold of Cologne. Further texts are anonymous, or attributed to Isidore and Augustine. Outstanding in this study is Susan Keefe's recognition that our best clues to the function of these texts in the Carolingian empire are found *via* an examination of the manuscript context in which her texts circulate. So there are detailed descriptions of all of fifty-nine Carolingian manuscripts (pp. 3–124) together with a full listing of all the later manuscript witnesses which she has found for these texts. They were texts that every priest was required to know, so that the manuscripts are essential guides to clerical culture and the range of instructional texts through which the Carolingian reforms were realised. They comprise collections of material for priests: *ordines* for the celebration of mass, directions for penance, burial or other rites, sermons, prayers and hymns, reference works for bishops, school books with vocabularies and elementary exegesis often *via* patristic *excerpta*. The texts themselves provide evidence of how in the Carolingian empire a work was adapted, rewritten, expanded or abridged, combined with differing groupings of texts. The baptismal texts circulated with question and answer texts on the Christian faith, letters of Alcuin, royal and episcopal capitularies, as well as works by Gregory, Isidore and Hrabanus Maurus and a certain 'agnus agnus' not Lamb but Augustine. The treatment of the content of the baptismal texts is all too brief: it is as though Keefe's familiarity with them has made it more difficult to convey their specific features. And she is of the school of Carolingian historians who

see no defect in brevity, so that her well-weighted sentences repay rereading. We learn the dates of the baptismal ceremonies, attitudes to demons and exsufflation, the recitation of the Creed and important details about baptismal rites in Spain (text 7) and the use of the foot-washing ceremony (found in northern Italy and southern Gaul). Keefe rightly notes that 'the examples are endless of a concern to educate the clergy *generally*', by teaching him Scripture or Greek, and by providing a range of explanations and interpretations of baptism. She has important comments on Carolingian schools on pp. 143–50. These volumes deserve careful study, and the University of Notre Dame Press is to be commended for its readiness to publish what other American university presses wrongly label as specialist. Unlike many of their titles, *Water and the word* will still be an essential tool an hundred years hence. The sermons in Paris, BNF Lat. MS 10741, ascribed to St Boniface, have recently been investigated by G. Schmitz, who would attribute them to the circle of Alcuin. Bischoff's *Katalog der festländischen Handschriften des neunten Jahrhunderts* revises his localisations of Angers 277 from Lyons to Reims, and of Laon 288 and Freiburg Ub 8 from eastern to north-eastern France, his dating of Bamberg Lit 131 from the last quarter to the second third of the ninth century.

KING'S COLLEGE,
LONDON

DAVID GANZ

Æthelred the Unready. The ill-counselled king. By Ann Williams. Pp. xix + 263 incl. 4 tables + 8 ills. London–New York: Hambledon and London, 2003. £25. 185285 382 4

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905484389

Consciously distant from Whig caricature, modern reassessment of Æthelred's reign struggles with the sheer complexity of forces to be erected in its place. Ann Williams's study copes admirably with the contingent dynamics of troubled kingship. Rather more than a biography, her approach gives prominence to relationships with the lay aristocracy, painstakingly reconstructed in an overarching narrative. A notable feature throughout is Williams's control of often complex source material, always sensitive to alternative interpretations and inferences. The resulting analysis reinforces the division of Æthelred's reign into distinct phases, with the 990s as a key period of administrative reform, very far from the crises of his final decade. Into this framework Williams injects the convincing edge of faction and inter-familial rivalry. The midlands interests of Wulfric Spot and his brother Ælfhelm are of special note for their repeated bearing on factional politics. Ælfhelm's appointment as ealdorman of Northumbria was a recognised tactic of unity; his violent death in 1006 coincided with the sudden rise of Eadric Streona. Ælfhelm's relationship by marriage to Sigferth and Morcar, chief thegns of the Seven Boroughs, provides an important context for all subsequent dissension, culminating in the murder of both thegns in Eadric's custody in 1015. A further dimension in this conflict was the remarkable union between Cnut and Ælfhelm's daughter Ælfgifu of Northampton. Possibly sealed during Swein's invasion of 1013, for Williams the marriage is but one sign of critical conjunction with external viking pressure. In the will of Æthelred's son Æthelstan, Williams detects an 'æthelings' party' hostile to Eadric. The inclusion of the younger ætheling Edmund Ironside casts light on his spirited defiance of Æthelred in 1015, boldly marrying Sigferth's widow. Though earlier successes are acknowledged,

these final years bear strong signs of 'almost unmitigated disaster'. For Williams Æthelred's failures were political as well as personal: an inability to control tensions and rivalries among leading councillors, on a regional and national stage. Yet, as she observes, Æthelred's kingdom survived: her account raises broader questions of Æthelred's place within late Anglo-Saxon political structures, and the evolving scope of royal power. Williams's refreshing focus shows just what is possible through aristocratic prosopography. Rigorous and authoritative, in illuminating Æthelred her study exposes many of the driving forces of contemporary political action.

DOWNING COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

DAVID PRATT

From medieval to modern Wales. Historical essays in honour of Kenneth O. Morgan and Ralph A. Griffiths. Edited by R. R. Davies and Geraint H. Jenkins. Pp. xiii + 294 incl. 9 figs. Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2004. £35. 0 7083 1881 9
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905494385

This volume pays tribute to two stalwarts of the Welsh historical profession and consists of sixteen essays which cover almost the whole chronological breadth of Welsh history and addresses several original themes relevant to the Welsh past as well as rehearsing other more familiar features. Both Morgan and Griffiths have been central to the reconstruction of the Welsh past, not only through their individual contributions as delineators of modern Welsh politics and later medieval Welsh society respectively but also as facilitators and editors of other writing via the *Welsh History Review* and the *Monographs in Welsh History* series. The celebration of their importance to Welsh historiography presents a convenient opportunity for Huw Pryce to review the career of one of the pioneers of professional scientific Welsh historical writing, Sir John Edward Lloyd. Lloyd's rediscovery of the medieval Welsh past in the later nineteenth and early twentieth centuries was an important corrective to the writing of the history of a nation whose affairs had largely appeared only peripherally in accounts of English history. Lloyd presented medieval Wales in a more acute focus, especially the Wales prior to the Edwardian conquest of 1282–4. In surveying Lloyd's achievement, Pryce locates his academic work in the context of the Liberal-nationalist political revival of late Victorian Wales and in a broader European context of national rediscovery. Certainly Lloyd's medieval history and his account, for example, of the life of Owain Glyndŵr, fed nationalist and patriotic conceptions of Wales and perhaps contributed to encouraging a primordialist view of the Welsh past and more certainly to its recovery, to a glimpse of an imagined community. Matters of identity also form the theme of several other contributions in this volume. R. R. Davies explores with significant subtlety the complex meanings behind the terminological significance of using the word 'Wales' during the age of conquest in the thirteenth century, specifically in the response to and the adoption of the Anglo-Saxon terminology in the quest of the Welsh princes to secure the integrity of their community. Prys Morgan, meanwhile, explores Welsh expressive self-identity during the eighteenth century. The cultural transformations from the later seventeenth century, derived from religious changes, led to a literature of introspection which, it is argued, expanded the ambit of the Welsh language itself and enhanced its power to convey meanings and sentiments hitherto unexpressed.

That expansion of language was accompanied by a burgeoning body of literature in the eighteenth century but its significance in relation to wider cultural contexts deserves closer examination. R. J. W. Evans investigates whether Welsh texts can be contextualised within the European Enlightenment and concludes that while this output may have had its limitations and even its superficialities, in its extent it was highly significant compared with the literary product of many other comparable minority nations. The relation of Wales to the wider world, a welcome and fresh initiative, also appears in several other essays. A. D. Carr examines official and Welsh poetic sources to produce an intriguing assessment of what the Welsh knew about the medieval world and how familiar were they through travel and military service. Trade took Maurice Wynn to Hamburg in the early seventeenth century, and in an interesting study by J. Gwynfor Jones the relationship between gentle status and the mercantile role is explored along with how Welshmen such as Wynn were important conduits of information to their native land about the troubled Europe continent. Further afield, we are treated to a singularly interesting review of the famous Welsh mission to British India during the nineteenth century in Aled Jones's account of Methodist missionaries in Assam which highlights their cultural distinctiveness as well as explores the concept of conjoined (Welsh and Indian) histories. Material culture, gender and working-class politics are also represented here, together with as many as five other studies, in addition to Jones's, which elaborate on the history of religion in Wales from the later medieval period to the early twentieth century. The most interesting, if not indeed also the most important, is the account by Neil Evans of a massive disestablishment demonstration at Swansea in 1912. This brings to mind Kenneth Morgan's admirable brief study of the politics of the disestablishment campaign, *Freedom or sacrilege?* (1965). Here, Evans highlights the public theatricality of the Welsh Nonconformist campaign – a revival of the mass platform, indeed – to break the Church–State links and is a useful corrective to the view that the campaign's momentum in Wales was decelerating and becoming divested of popular interest. This collection, therefore, does full justice to Kenneth Morgan and Ralph Griffiths but also leaves one pondering the future of Welsh history as an area of academic study within the discipline of history since both protagonists and several of the contributors are now retired and not all by any means have been replaced at their respective institutions. From where, one wonders, will the next generation of Welsh scholars come to continue the good name of the *Welsh History Review* and preserve and enhance the integrity of Welsh history among the wider academic public and, dare one say, RAE panels?

UNIVERSITY OF WALES,
BANGOR

W. P. GRIFFITH

Robert d'Arbrissel et la vie religieuse dans l'ouest de la France. Actes du colloque de Fontevraud, 13–16 décembre 2001. Edited by Jacques Dalarun (Disciplina Monastica. Studies on Medieval Monastic Life, 1.) Pp. 360. Turnhout: Brepols, 2004. €60 (paper). 2 503 51578 9
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S002204690550438X

The proceedings of a conference held to mark 900 years since the foundation of the abbey of Fontevraud, this volume presents a stimulating collection of studies, firmly

underpinned by Jacques Dalarun's concise historical introduction. The contributions, by some of the most important contemporary French historians of the central Middle Ages, range widely and deeply beyond the history of this remarkable community. On the eponymous Robert d'Arbrissel, there is only one article, a study of Robert as preacher (Jean Longère). Jacques Dalarun observes, in a concluding article, that the study of Robert d'Arbrissel as a personality was deliberately overlooked in favour of the institutional background which made Fontevraud possible, namely the papal reform movement of the eleventh century. The core of the collection is formed by the latest scholarship on the abbey and the religious order of Fontevraud, both documentary (Jacques Dalarun, Robert Favreau and Georges Pon, Dominique Barthélemy) and archaeological (Daniel Prigent, Michel Melot and François-Olivier Touati, the last two on the symbolic use of space). This is preceded by several papers whose common theme is the inspiration for the eremetical movement out of which Fontevraud arose. Indeed the opening paper, Cécile Caby's 'Vies parallèles: ermites d'Italie et de la France de l'ouest (xe–xiii^e siècle)', looks to Ottonian Italy and the Byzantine Church for models. Particular emphasis is given to the role of the reforming papacy in the development of new religious movements in early twelfth-century France (Jean-Hervé Foulon, Mathieu Arnoux). The economic and cultural context of this development is the subject of papers by Mathieu Arnoux and Jean-Yves Tilliette. Michel Parisse provides a survey of female monasticism, complemented by a study of the career of Christina of Markyate (Paulette L'Hermite-Leclercq). The text is entirely in French, with abstracts supplied in the end-papers. This volume is the first in a new series from Brepols, *Disciplina Monastica: Studies on Medieval Monastic Life*, edited by Susan Boynton and Isabelle Cochelin, which intends to take an interdisciplinary approach in publishing monographs and collected papers on all aspects of monasticism from late antiquity to 1600. *Robert d'Arbrissel et la vie religieuse dans l'ouest de la France* is an encouraging beginning.

CAMBRIDGE

JUDITH EVERARD

St Katherine of Alexandria. Texts and contexts in western medieval Europe. Edited by Jacqueline Jenkins and Katherine J. Lewis. (Medieval Women. Texts and Contexts, 8.) Pp. xiv + 257. Turnhout: Brepols, 2003. €67.50. 2 503 51290 9
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905514386

This collection of essays, originating as papers at the International Congress on Medieval Studies at Kalamazoo and at the International Medieval Conference at Leeds (1999), aims to explore the prolific cult of St Katherine of Alexandria from the eleventh to the sixteenth centuries. Despite its title and the claim that the essays 'seek to suggest some of the reasons why St Katherine occupied such an important role in the devotional lives of so many of the inhabitants of Medieval Europe' ('Introduction' by Jacqueline Jenkins and Katherine J. Lewis at p. 2), the focus of the book is much more limited: six of the ten essays (excluding the introduction) deal with England and Wales. These are Christine Walsh, 'The role of the Normans in the development of the cult of St Katherine'; Katherine J. Lewis, 'Pilgrimage and the cult of St Katherine in late medieval England'; Jane Cartwright, '*Buchedd Catrin*: a preliminary study of the middle Welsh *Life* of Katherine of Alexandria and her cult in medieval Wales'; Anke Bernau, 'A Christian *Corpus*: virginity, violence, and

knowledge in the *Life* of St Katherine of Alexandria'; Jacqueline Jenkins, 'St Katherine and laywomen's piety: the middle English prose *Life* in London British Library, Harley MS 4012' and Sherry L. Reames, 'St Katherine and the late medieval clergy: evidence from English breviaries'. The non-British contributions consist of Karen A. Winstead's 'St Katherine's hair'; Tracey R. Sands's essay considering Katherine's cult among Sweden's aristocracy; Emily C. Francomano's feminist reading of the legend of Katherine contained in a late fourteenth–early fifteenth-century hagiographic Spanish collection (MS Escorial h-I-13); and Alison Frazier's exploration of 'Katherine's place in a Renaissance collection', the *De vitis et gestis sanctorum* compiled by the humanist Antonio degli Agli in *quattrocento* Florence. While some of the contributions will justly attract readers because they consider the cult of Katherine from the perspective of unstudied sources (notably Reames's interesting essay, which might have also considered how the change in liturgical book format affected breviary readings, and especially the careful and perceptive essay by Frazier), or from different cultural vantage points (notably those by Cartwright, Sands and Francomano), many essays suffer from their dislocation from traditional hagiographic scholarship. This tendency is most evident in the introduction. For example, there is no precise reference here (pp. 7ff.), in the simplistic discussion of the history of the hagiographic dossier of Katherine, to the Latin, let alone the Greek, texts that were the ultimate sources of all vernacular versions, no reference to the *Bibliotheca hagiographica latina* and its classification of the Latin hagiographic versions of the legend. There are other examples of a careless approach to the texts: a rare reference to the *Acta Sanctorum* (p. 21 n. 13) provides neither volume nor edition; the Latin 'Fac misericordiam meam agentibus memoriam' does not refer to honouring Katherine's memory generally (p. 208), but to the performance of her liturgical celebration. Lack of control of the traditional aspects of hagiographic scholarship mars unnecessarily many of the contributions.

COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY

CARMELA V. FRANKLIN

Consuetudo camaldulensis. Rodulphi constitutiones. Liber eremitice regule. Edited and translated by Pierluigi Licciardello. (Edizione Nazionale dei Testi Mediolatini, 8. Ser. II, 4.) Pp. cxxxi + 148 incl. 2 frontispieces. Florence: SISMEL/Edizioni del Galluzzo, 2004. €50. 88 8450 114 8

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905524382

Camaldoli, in the neighbourhood of Arezzo, Tuscany, was one of the most appealing centres of religious revival in eleventh-century church history. St Romuald, its founder, gathered together a number of followers and imposed a blend of coenobitical and eremitical life style based on the Holy Scripture, the Rule of St Benedict and, of course, his own example. As the community developed over the next decades, and indeed centuries, Camaldoli, as a hermitage, became the head of the homonymous order. A nearby settlement at Fontebuono served in the beginning as a hospice. This short description of the origins of Camaldoli is mirrored in the early development of many other religious movements in the eleventh and twelfth century, whether they chose the monastic life or preferred the canonical one. Pierluigi Licciardello now gives us an edition of Carmoldi's key documents, the *Constitutiones* and the *Liber eremitice regule*. These texts have long been known and

published; many historians had studied them and tried to identify the authors or establish the redaction period. Many problems, however, remain to be solved. Licciardello suggests, in his long, very elaborate and well constructed introduction, a plausible answer to the questions of authorship and dating. The *Constitutiones* are said to be the work of Prior Ralph I (Rodulphus), in the years 1074–88, while the *Liber eremitice* is ascribed to Ralph II–III between 1158 and 1176. Comparison of the texts shows the apparent difference in their structure and goal: a ‘propositum’ for the first one and a customary with introductory ‘narratio’ for the second. This evolution in approach is the direct result of a diminishing awareness of the founder’s charismatic and heroic beginnings and the increasing organisation necessary to a growing establishment. I enjoyed the book very much: it is well written and clear, without the often exuberant rhetoric of Italian historical studies, and the translation is accurate and precise. Only very occasionally did I disagree with the author (for instance p. 48 [*Liber eremitice* xxix.5]), which I consider too narrow an interpretation). Licciardello has also produced an excellent edition. On some minor occasions I doubted his reading, for example p. 10 (*Constitutiones* v. 6 [haremo]) or p. 22 (*Liber eremitice*, prol.7 [voles]), but finally concluded that these could be printing errors. References to the sources (for example to Peter Damian) are rich and well exploited.

UNIVERSITY OF GHENT

LUDO MILIS

Anselm of Canterbury and his theological inheritance. By Giles E. M. Gasper. Pp. xv + 228.

Aldershot: Ashgate, 2004. £45. 0 7546 3911 8

The Christology of Anselm of Canterbury. By Dániel Deme. Pp. xii + 263. Aldershot:

Ashgate, 2003. £42.50. 0 7546 3779 4

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905534389

These are two very different books, each of which makes an original and important contribution to our understanding of Anselm of Canterbury. Writing about such a revered and widely studied figure is not easy, given the vast weight of both historical and theological scholarship invested in St Anselm over the last hundred years. Both monographs oblige us to revisit familiar writings, one from the perspective of intellectual history, the other of contemporary theology. Their ways of approaching St Anselm are so diametrically opposite that it is impossible to attempt an easy reconciliation between the two. Gasper’s strength lies in his understanding of the complexities of what is all too easily labelled ‘the Latin tradition’. By contrast, Deme approaches the Christology of St Anselm with a passionate conviction that a grave injustice has been done by focusing uniquely on his method of reflection *sola ratione*, and not enough on the central place occupied by Christology in his thought. Both authors remind us of the immense complexity of St Anselm’s achievement, which continues to defy any easy label.

Gasper’s particular concern is to demonstrate the richness of the Greek theological tradition potentially available to St Anselm through Latin translations. One is so used to reading accounts of Latin theology as uniquely couched in terms of a dialogue with St Augustine that it is easy to forget how wide was the range of theological inspiration, both Greek and Latin, available to European thinkers in the eleventh and twelfth centuries. In one respect, Gasper’s monograph is as much concerned with the transmission of Greek theology in Norman monastic

libraries, as it is with St Anselm's thought in particular. Just for this reason, these chapters deserve wide attention for their contribution to our understanding of the presence of Greek theological writing in the Latin west. Perhaps the price of such an inquiry is that it does not focus so much on Anselm's attitude to Augustinian tradition. Very instructive, however, is Gasper's emphasis on the significance of parallels in ideas and imagery of contribution between St Anselm and Gregory Nazianzen. Rather than look at the Anselmian motif of faith seeking understanding as some early sign of the emancipation of reason from authority, Gasper teaches us to think of Anselm as reasserting not just a theological method present in Greek thought, but forgotten under the weight of arguments from authority, but a Christology with roots in the Greek patristic mind. By studying St Anselm's debt to Greek thought, Gasper casts new light on the presence of St Anselm at the Council of Bari in 1098. Dialogue with the Greeks was not just a matter of extending one's reading. It had urgent political implications at a moment when the Latin west was supposed to be coming to the assistance of the Greek half of Christendom.

Deme's monograph, on the Christology of St Anselm, is very different in style of argumentation in being generated from reflection on systematic theology rather than on intellectual history. The thrust of his argument is that traditional Anselmian scholarship has been too concerned with purely historical issues and not enough with the challenge presented by Anselm to contemporary theology. Deme is not troubled by the observation that such inquiry 'will inevitably go further than Anselm went, and say more than he said' (p. xi). The author takes very seriously St Anselm's definition of theology as *fides quaerens intellectum*. Central to his study is a conviction that for Anselm it is not simply the death of a God-man that unlocks our salvation. Christ's death must be seen as part of a broader vision of creation, first sketched out in the *Monologion* and *Proslogion*, but taken much further in later treatises. Whereas many philosophical theologians have focused very intently on Anselm's arguments about the existence of God, Deme draws attention to St Anselm's much larger theological concern with both creation and redemption.

Because Deme writes as a systematic theologian rather than a biographer, he is not as interested as Gasper in the circumstances and influences that shape St Anselm's thought. It is to Deme's great credit that he places as much emphasis on the prayers and meditations as on the great formal treatises. Anselm lays great value on the theme of order in the universe, and the quality of *justitia* by which all things are governed. This provides a framework for understanding the significance of Christ's obedience to God in submitting himself to death, and thus to the will of the Father. In many ways this is an inspirational monograph, serving to remind readers of the urgency of St Anselm's theological message. In avoiding a historical approach, Deme does not debate the question of Anselm's response to traditional belief about 'the right of the devil' over man. There are more questions than Christology with which St Anselm was concerned, such as about the status of original sin and the fate of unbaptised children. None the less, in focusing on Christology, Deme does a great service in bringing to the fore its centrality within his overall theological vision. As with Gaspar's monograph, Deme's study is to be commended for showing how it is still possible to bring fresh light to bear on writings that we too easily think have already been understood.

Sanctifying the name of God. Jewish martyrs and Jewish memories of the First Crusade.

By Jeremy Cohen. (Jewish Culture and Contexts.) Pp. xvi + 208 incl. map and 10 ills. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2004. £24.50 (\$37.50). o 8122 3780 3

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905544385

Three Hebrew chronicles describe the attacks on the Rhenish Jewish communities by the so-called popular crusaders in 1096. Many Jews were murdered by the crusaders; many others decided to kill themselves and their families rather than fall into the hands of crusaders. Their self-martyrdom is described in the chronicles in heartrending detail and this has provoked a great deal of heated debate. Why did the Jews of Mainz, Worms and Cologne kill themselves in ways which ran counter to normative Judaism? How accurate are the chronicles? Can they really convey what happened? After all, if whole communities were supposed to have died, who could have lived to tell the tale? This book consolidates the extensive work Jeremy Cohen has done on the subject over many years. Cohen's work belongs to the camp that uses literary and anthropological tools to mine the texts for hidden meanings. This camp believes that the chronicles, which were written within fifty years of the First Crusade, tell us much more about the generation that survived the pogrom than the actual martyrs. Cohen goes so far as to claim that the chronicles constituted 'therapy for traumatized communities plagued by guilt over the very fact and the means of their survival' (pp. 68–9). Guilt would have arisen from the fact that survivors would have had to succumb to forced baptism. (Fortunately for them Emperor Henry IV braved ecclesiastical censure to allow forcibly baptised Jews to return to Judaism.) Cohen sharply juxtaposes his approach to those who, like Robert Chazan, use the chronicles to discover facts about what really happened in the spring and summer of 1096. But Chazan does not, in fact, just look for factual details of the persecutions. He has recently tried to work out which elements of the chronicles stand closest to the events they portray and which betray the interpretation survivors gave to what had happened. Although Cohen is emphatic that he does not deny that self-martyrdom took place, his approach virtually ignores the historical questions of who wrote the chronicles for whom and when in favour of the question of why they were written. And in pursuit of proving that they were written by survivors or family members of survivors who had eschewed martyrdom he analyses the texts in order to find all kinds of biblical, talmudic and midrashic *double entendres* which would indicate the ambivalence survivors felt about the martyrs. Much of this is highly ingenious and at times it is even very convincing, but it leaves one wondering how accessible this elitist 'therapy' would have been for the average Jewish man and woman in the Rhineland. Cohen provides no evidence that the texts were readily available or that they were actually read in this way. Added to this is the fact that Ashkenazi Jews seem to have espoused the ideal of martyrdom in the face of persecution. Cohen's literary discoveries do uncover new layers of meaning in the chronicles, but for these readings to be historical they need to be grounded much more firmly in space and time.

LUCY CAVENDISH COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

ANNA SAPIR ABULAFIA

Lordship, reform, and the development of civil society in medieval Italy. The bishopric of Orvieto, 1100–1250. By David Foote. (Publications in Medieval Studies.) Pp. xiv + 254 incl 2 maps. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2004. \$50 (cloth), \$25 (paper). 0 268 02871 0; 0 268 02872 9

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905554381

Nearly fifty years have passed since the appearance of Daniel Waley's pioneering study of medieval Orvieto. That book concentrated on the factional disputes that wracked the commune in the thirteenth and early fourteenth centuries. Since then there have been a number of studies in English of medieval Italian cities, and some (albeit fewer) of individual bishoprics in northern and central Italy. David Foote essays a combination of the two models, by examining the role that the bishopric played in the development of the commune, and the impact of the latter on the evolution of the bishopric. He suggests that the expansion of communal authority over the *contado* was very much on the coat tails of the bishop: the diocese provided a framework for the growth of civic control over the countryside. However, this was not necessarily to the profit of the bishopric, the history of which, at least as perceived by a thirteenth-century incumbent who wrote a fragmentary history of the see, was 'a story of small accomplishments swallowed by larger failures' (p. 154). The attempts to control the diocese, not least against neighbouring sees, led bishops to infeudate to *contado* nobles property that was then difficult to recover. Bishop and cathedral canons were often at odds, and by c. 1200 the cathedral itself was in disrepair, its roof leaking. By that date too heresy, as elsewhere in central Italy, was a significant problem, the seriousness of which was shown by the murder of the *podestà*, Pietro Parenzo, in 1199 when he launched an anti-heretical campaign. Matters were also complicated by the often-difficult relations between the city and the papacy, as pontiffs from Adrian IV onwards tried to extend their temporal rule into southern Umbria. The thirteenth-century bishops attempted to revive and modernise their see above all by the development of effective record-keeping: notarial culture pervading the Church as well as secular society. While this was not in itself a means of religious reform – although some influence from the 1215 Lateran Council can be perceived in the surviving documentation – it did at least mean that the bishops could keep a much firmer hand than hitherto on the property of their see. Foote has made excellent use of the episcopal registers that resulted, although the previously haphazard attitude to record-keeping, and a fire in the mid-twelfth century, means that the earlier part of the period covered is poorly documented, and his picture is therefore inevitably impressionistic. But while thereafter the bishopric emerges clearly from the discussion, the development of the commune appears rather allusively, and a clearer summary would have been helpful. (So too would a large-scale map of the diocese, rather than one of southern Umbria as a whole, and genealogical charts of the noble families discussed in the early chapters.) And it is a pity that the author did not continue his account of the episcopal administration down to the early fourteenth century, by which time an effective diocesan bureaucracy had emerged. As it is, he seems to conclude *in media re*. Nevertheless, this is an interesting and thoughtful study, from which students both of the Church and of urban history will profit.

Pope Innocent III (1160/61–1216). To root up and to plant. By John C. Moore. (The Medieval Mediterranean. Peoples, Economies and Cultures, 400–1500, 47.) Pp. xx + 316 incl. 2 maps + frontispiece and 2 colour plates. Leiden–Boston: Brill, 2003. €98. 90 04 12925 1; 0928 5520

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905564388

In his preface John C. Moore states that he intends to write a biography of Innocent III abandoning an approach strictly based on ‘topical emphases’. He wishes to return ‘to a chronological approach in order to recapture events as Innocent experienced them and to look for their impact on him personally and on the decisions he made’. For this purpose Moore declares that he has used mainly letters and sermons, which illustrate Innocent’s ideas and attitudes. Moore’s analysis of Innocent’s pontificate operates on two levels: he explains the papal approach towards events according to their theological background, which is recorded by his sermons, and he constantly examines the facts, as they are recorded in the papal registers. A first group of chapters (chs i–iv) gives an account of his theological education, as reflected in his sermons (ch. i) and in the ceremony of the papal consecration, which exemplifies his views and validates his later political action (ch. ii). On this basis Innocent III justified the struggle to defend the *libertas ecclesiae* against lay rulers and to reform the Church, threatened by heresy and infidels, and worked in order to create a broad obedience to the papacy (ch. iii). Finally Moore explains how papal decisions were made in practice, mainly using the well-documented account of Gerald of Wales (ch. iv). A second set of chapters provides a chronological description of events after 1203: the preparation of the crusade to the Holy Land (ch. v), its development and plans to convert the Jews and fight heresy (ch. vi). Subsequently Moore investigates Innocent’s policy of defending the Church between 1207 and 1212, when the pope promoted the Albigesian Crusade in southern France (1209) and crowned Otto IV of Brunswick (1208). From 1210 this ‘cycle of apparent success, optimism and confidence’ (p. 169) deteriorated, however, as the pope had to excommunicate Otto and to defend ecclesiastical freedom in Spain, France and England (ch. vii). Between 1212 and 1214 the pope carried on his successful policy, promoting a new crusade to the Holy Land, crowning Frederick of Swabia and reaching an agreement with the kings of France and England (ch. viii). Innocent’s policies were finally summed up in the Fourth Lateran Council, where the pope reinvigorated his fight against heresy and the infidel and renewed Otto’s excommunication and his reform of the Church (ch. ix). In his conclusions, Moore depicts Innocent as ‘fluctuating’ between the signs of God and his papal leadership. Thus Innocent ‘expanded the theoretical rights and the actual power of the papacy as he inherited it, and he passed it on to his successors to expand even further’ (p. 276). This book assesses Innocent’s personal attitudes as expressed both in his ecclesiological ideas and in his practical actions and describes events on the basis of a wide range of sources (papal letters, decrees and sermons). In addition Moore’s chronological approach establishes the actual framework within which Innocent built up his policy.

Anonymous, *The deeds of Pope Innocent III*. Trans. with intro. and notes by James M. Powell. Pp. xlv + 287. Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 2004. \$59.95. 0 8132 1362 2
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905574384

The *Gesta Innocentii III* is an unusual text. In historiographical terms it belongs to both the revived tradition of the *Liber pontificalis*, and the conventional accounts of heroic deeds celebrating great kings or crusaders. Like the *Gesta francorum* the author is shy about his identity but it is clear whose side he is on. Like the *Gesta Friderici* of Otto of Freising and Rahewin, the surviving text leaves the career it describes unfinished, covering only the first eleven or so years of Innocent's pontificate, though some attempt has been made to tidy it up into a 'complete' text. As Powell makes plain in his brief introduction, the closest parallel in terms of fullness (and political energy) is the work of Cardinal Boso, biographer of the twelfth-century popes. Like all the *Libri pontificales*, the text may have served as a 'form of collective memory for a group of policy makers' (p. xii): it was produced within, and intended for, the curia itself. At least superficially the structure follows a familiar *Liber pontificalis* format, while the historiographical peculiarities and the choices of its curial author make this a fascinating text for exploring attitudes to the role of the papacy at the turn of the thirteenth century. After very brief biographical details on the pope himself, it examines his dealings with the city of Rome and the patrimony, the Sicilian crown, the French royal marriage, the eastern Church after the Fourth Crusade, the coronation of Peter of Aragon, curial reform and heresy, before closing with an extensive and detailed catalogue of the pope's charitable works and gifts. The list of omissions is, however, almost as extensive: the imperial election disputes, approval of new orders, canonisations, the pope's many decretals. Powell has suggested in the past that the writer may have been the canon lawyer Petrus Beneventanus and reiterates the point here without going over the ground again (see John C. Moore [ed.], *Pope Innocent III and his world* [Aldershot 1999], 51–62). Readers may wish to compare his arguments with Giulia Barone's case for Cardinal Iohannes of Sta Maria in Cosmedin about whom however much less can be said ("‘I Gesta Innocentii III’: politica e cultura a Roma all’inizio del duecento’, in G. Barone and others [eds], *Studi sul medioevo per Girolamo Arnaldi* [Rome 2001], 1–23). Certainly this translation will make the debate on Innocent a more interesting one in many undergraduate classes. For that reason, more notes would have been very welcome (for example on the amusing but controversial rendering of ‘fagiolum’ as ‘bean tower’ in cap. cxxxix, p. 253) but, like Powell's earlier translation of the *Liber Augustalis*, this will provide a valuable teaching tool for years to come.

ST ANDREWS UNIVERSITY

FRANCES ANDREWS

Siena, civil religion and the Siennese. By Gerald Parsons. Pp. xx + 197 + 10 colour and 25 black-and-white plates. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2004. £50. 0 7546 1516 2
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905584380

Exactly a century before the publication of this book, there appeared William Heywood's *Palio and ponte: an account of the sports of central Italy from the age of Dante to the XXth century*. The product of an earlier phase of the prolonged British love affair with

Tuscany, Heywood's book still deserves to be read (in fact, both it and his previous work on the Sieneſe *palio* have recently been republished in Italian translation), both for its ſerious engagement with primary ſources (ſome of which the author conſulted in manuſcript) and for its ſenſitive account of the balance, in the feſtivals deſcribed, between their ſacred and their ſecular elements. That balance is a crucial element in what recent hiſtorians have choſen to call (more or leſs equivalently) either 'civic religion' or 'civil religion', and which may be ſummarised as the preſentation of the ſtate, in image and ritual, as having a ſacred identity and a divine deſtiny. As a contribution to this growing field, Parſons traces the hiſtory of certain feſtivals celebrated in Siena between the Middle Ages and the preſent day. Although in this caſe no uſe is made of manuſcript evidence, Parſons knows the ſecondary literature well (indeed, a ſubſtantial part of this book has appeared in a previous draft in Parſons's *Perspectives on civil religion*, iſſued by the ſame publisher in 2000, more than half of which is about Siena), and he preſents a coherent ſtory of the two interrelated themes which intereſt him: the Sieneſe cult of the Virgin Mary, and the origins and development of the city's moſt famous horſe-race, or *palio*. He has been ſignificantly helped by Fabio Lenſini, who is credited with moſt of the photographs. Parſons's chronological range is a ſtrength of the book. Naturally enough, Siena's particular dedication to Mary acquired very different reſonances, reſpectively in the proudly independent medieval commune and in the Florentine colony after the fall of the republic in 1555, or again in the context of debate about the place of the Church in Italy after Unification, and later during the experiences of world war and Faſciſm. Parſons recogniſes the artificiality of memories and 'traditions' which are in conſtant proceſs of invention and renewal: moſt of the ritual ſurrounding the modern *palio*, for example, including the 'medieval' coſtumes, is of twentieth-century origin. And yet Sieneſe people are fiercely loyal to theſe images of their city's identity, which amount, as Parſons convincingly concludes, to far more than a tourist attraction. As Parſons tells the ſtory, the conſtruction of civic imagery is at each ſtage primarily a matter of governmental initiative, whether it is the Sieneſe war-captain dedicating the city to a picture of the Virgin in the cathedral in 1260; the Medici overlords manipulating the iconography to reinforce their domination after 1555; or Archbiſhop Toccabelli mediating the requirements of a Faſciſt dictatorship in the 1930s. Little is ſaid, on the other hand, about the ways in which unitary icons of the ſtate were ſometimes ignored or conteſted by factions within the city. The Marian feaſts and images diſcuſſed here were thoſe adopted by officialdom; many others came and went in the various quarters (Girolamo Gigli, in two early eighteenth-century works, liſted dozens of theſe, together with the cults of as many as 450 ſaints and *beati* of the city). The account given here of the ſeventeen Sieneſe diſtricts or *contrade* is a little idealiſed, and Parſons's deſcription of the *palio* alſo underſtates the violence and criminality which have always attended it. In his characteriſation of 'the Sieneſe', Parſons draws few ſocial diſtinctions. Comparison with other cities would highlight diſtinctive features of Siena, whoſe industrial baſe, for example, has always been reſtricted: in this reſpect a uſeful contrast could be drawn with Florence in the medieval and Renaiſſance centuries, and with Genoa in the nineteenth and twentieth. It is preſumably for this reaſon that Chriſtian ſocialiſm, which played a major role in other moderniſing Italian cities, ſeems not to feature in Siena: its relative abſence has a bearing on the local forms of civil religion, which a comparative dimension would bring into ſharper focus. On the other hand, Parſons has performed a ſervice in

reminding readers that Siena has had a history in the centuries after the heroic age of Duccio and Lorenzetti.

ST CATHERINE'S COLLEGE,
OXFORD

GERVASE ROSSER

Romanische Kunst als politische Propaganda im Erzbistum Lund während der Waldemarzeit. Studien, besonders zum Bild der Heiligen Drei Könige. By Werner Steinwarder. (Beihefte zur Mediaevistik. Monographien, Editionen, Sammelbände, 3.) Pp. 223 incl. 4 maps and 122 ills. Frankfurt-am-Main: Peter Lang, 2003. £26 (paper). 3 631 39599 X; 1617 657X
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905594387

This dissertation, from the Faculty of Theology at the University of Kiel, deals with 'the archdiocese of Lund', understood as the Danish ecclesiastical province – in other words the whole of medieval Denmark. The book sets out to examine art in Denmark in the age of the Valdemars (1157–1241), especially representations of the adoration of the magi, in terms of whether this was 'political propaganda or only *l'art pour l'art* as an accompaniment to the services'. This formulation is indicative of the level of insight in the book (for when is medieval art only *l'art pour l'art*?) and of its rather left-field articulation of the issues. Werner Steinwarder takes his point of departure in the empire, in Frederick Barbarossa's transfer in 1164 of the relics of the three kings from Milan to Cologne, where the representations of the magi are seen as political symbols of *honor imperii* in competition with the pope. This interpretation may well have its points. But the author has not grasped the ambiguities inherent, for example, in the depiction of the Emperor Otto IV together with the three kings on the cathedral's magi reliquary. For the emperor is shown as both humble (without imperial crown and robe) and at the same time demanding in his wish for a direct share in the sanctity. A one-sided focus on the possible political aspects of the art so to speak 'secularises' it and thus detaches it from its far more complex contemporary conceptual world. The same objection must be made to the subsequent interpretation of a number of contemporary depictions in Denmark, whose kings are presumed to have imitated German emperors. Some Schleswig fonts depicting the adoration of the magi are proclaimed to be royal foundations expressing opposition to the rebellious Bishop Valdemar of Schleswig, against whom the gable relief on the south gate of Ribe Cathedral is also said to be directed, as well as the St Peter's Gate of Schleswig Cathedral with its scene of the *traditio legis* – that is, the granting of the keys and the law to Peter and Paul. The interpretation of the subject as an expression of princely propaganda is original. And the same must be said when the author reads, on a relief from the Danish islands with the same motif, the carved name 'Walterus' as an endorsement of Petrus Waldes and the Waldenses.

It is in principle always positive when someone from the outside sets out to research Scandinavian material and does so with boldness and energy. And Werner Steinwarder's comprehensive bibliography, with its many titles in Scandinavian languages, testifies to good intentions. Yet one may doubt how much he has really read and understood, for often what he writes is directly contrary to both hard facts

and solidly underpinned views in the literature cited. Where, one wonders, were his supervisors?

NATIONAL MUSEUM,
COPENHAGEN

EBBE NYBORG

Alain de Lille (?). *Lettres familières* (1167–1170). Edited by Françoise Hudry, with a preface by Pascale Bourgain. (Études et rencontres de l'École des Chartes, 14.) Pp. 189. Paris: Vrin/École des Chartes, 2003. €25. 2 7116 4332 0
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905604381

As suggested by the question mark in its title, the edition under consideration here advances a new and highly controversial thesis. Were it to be accepted, it would represent one of the most significant contributions ever made to our understanding of late twelfth-century scholasticism. In 1953 Jean Leclercq published an edition of seventeen anonymous letters preserved in Paris, BNF, MS Latin 13575, a late twelfth-century compendium which had already been briefly noticed by Barthélemy Hauréau in 1901. Neither Hauréau nor Leclercq claimed to identify the letters' author(s) or recipients, although both recognised that they were of monastic, almost certainly Bec, provenance. In 1972 Palémon Glorieux suggested that these letters showed certain resemblances to the work of Alan of Lille, a scholar whose writings are relatively well known but whose career remains to a large extent mysterious. Hudry's new edition of these letters seeks not only to prove the conjectures of Glorieux but to extend them beyond any previously accepted bounds. Hudry begins convincingly enough by disputing Leclercq's dating of the collection to the period 1130–50. The first of the letters, addressed to the prior of Lyre, is more likely to date from some years after the introduction of reforms from Bec to Lyre, placing it most probably in the period after rather than before 1150. Less convincing is Hudry's identification of the 'prior' of Lyre as Lyre's abbot Osbern, since why an abbot should be referred to as a prior is never explained. No matter. From here on, Hudry's ingenuity runs riot. Letter 3, which is rubricated in the manuscript '*Item ad eundem (familiarem) consolatoria*', Hudry identifies, on the basis of some jejune and unconvincing literary echoes, as a letter from Peter of Blois to Alan of Lille. The letter itself contains a vague date, 'mid-September', and towards its conclusion a reference to Gregory the Great's pun on Angles/angels, expressing the hope that the recipient may take comfort from the Christian people of England ('*Anglorum gente christianissima*'). This Hudry reads as evidence that the recipient, identified by her as Alan, either should seek, or had already sought, exile in England. Since the same letter includes a reference to the separation of friends by land and sea ('*per tanta terre marisque spatia*'), and since Hudry assumes that the letter itself was sent from France, her conclusion is that the recipient, supposedly Alan, was indeed already exiled 'across the sea' in England by September 1167. The choice of the date 1167 is as good as any other of Hudry's conjectures, and at least has the advantage of allowing her to suggest that Alan had been exiled as a member of the affinity of Thomas Becket, at the behest of Gilbert Foliot, perhaps as the result of unjust charges of sodomy that Foliot had raised against him. No matter that Foliot and Becket, let alone a charge of sodomy, are never referred to explicitly at any point in the letter collection, and that in 1167 only the most eccentrically suicidal of Becket's adherents would have fled to

exile in England rather than France: as throughout this extraordinary edition, the absence of evidence is itself sufficient to transform conjecture into newly discovered fact. The next letter, letter 4, is rubricated '*Item ad alium consolatoria*'. Deploying her customary ingenuity, Hudry suggests that '*aliu*' in this context should not be read as 'another', i.e. as a recipient other than Alan of Lille, previously identified as the recipient of letter 3, but as a mistranscription of '*Alanum*', so that this letter too can be identified as a missive from Peter to Alan. Near the beginning of letter 4, its author asks 'Is God not to be found at "*Euermou*" as at Bec?' ('*An non est Deus Euermou sicut et Becci?*'), having in the previous sentence paraphrased Isaiah xxviii.9: a reference to a child torn from its mother's breast. Dismissing the context in which the quotation from Isaiah, and the place name '*Euermou*' point inexorably to the daughter house of Bec at Envermeu (Seine-Maritime, arr. Dieppe), an identification that was long ago made by Leclercq and which common sense alone would commend as irrefutable, Hudry, on the basis of her reading of letter 3, wishes instead to place both the recipient, supposedly Alan, and the place-name *Euermou*, in England. After some weighing of improbabilities, she arrives at the simply astonishing conclusion that *Euermou* represents Wearmouth, and hence that Alan of Lille was by this time living as a monk in the far north of England in a cell of Durham cathedral priory: a cell, which according to Knowles and Hadcock never accommodated more than two or three Durham monks at any one time. According to Hudry, Durham and the north may have been all the more congenial to Alan since Alan was a kinsman of Richard of St Victor, and Richard was of Scottish birth. The evidence for Alan and Richard's kinship, Hudry suggests, is to be found in letter 6, although 'found' in this context might be better translated as 'invented' (in the demotic English sense rather in the sense of the Latin term '*inventio*'). From here onwards, Hudry's conjectures carry us into realms of ever more remarkable fantasy. This is not the place to investigate all of her claims, but a flavour of them can be obtained from her commentary on letters 9 and 16. Letter 9 is rubricated '*Ad Clementem Anglicum*', and is identified by Hudry as a letter from Alan of Lille to Clement of Llanthony. Since the letter is assumed to have been written by Alan from exile at Wearmouth, and since it refers to a sermon recently pronounced in 'our chapter' by Peter of Poitiers, Hudry concludes that Peter of Poitiers must have preached at Durham, the mother church of Wearmouth: an extraordinary event that has otherwise escaped the notice of historians and which is dated by Hudry with even more extraordinary confidence to 24 June 1168. Hudry even seeks to identify the very sermon, and prints it as an appendix, drawn from Peter of Poitiers's sermon collection in Paris, BNF MS Latin 14593. The sermon in question may have been preached on the feast day of St John the Baptist (hence Hudry's date of 24 June). No matter that letter 9 refers to a sermon preached on St John the Evangelist ('*sermonem ... de privilegiis beati Iohannis Evangeliste*') and states explicitly that the author has no text to hand. Hudry quietly passes over these inconvenient facts, and in her edition 'corrects' '*Evangeliste*' to '<*Baptiste*>', supplying the original, 'corrupt' reading as a footnote. Letter 16 is rubricated '*Ad Guericum inclusum*', and on this basis identified by Hudry as a letter from Alan of Lille to Godric of Finchale, written from Wearmouth in 1169 or 1170. In it, the author refers in elliptical terms to 'a learned and powerful captain' whose vessel (almost certainly a, if not, the Church), steered according to too great a confidence in the direction of 'the prelates of this time', is threatened with disaster: clearly, according to Hudry, a reference to Pope Alexander III and the sack of Rome by Frederick

Barbarossa in 1167. A hypocrite has recently emerged to occupy 'the pontifical throne' ('*cathedra pontificalis*'), identified by Hudry as the anti-pope Paschal III, to whom both the author of the letter (supposedly Alan of Lille) and Guerrie (*alias* Godric of Finchale) have recently written with advice. Interesting as it would be to learn of Godric of Finchale's correspondence with popes and cardinals, some readers may doubt whether we are in the realm of popes and antipopes rather than that of good and bad archbishops. The letter refers explicitly to the needs of a 'provincia', and the hypocrite in question could be an archbishop of Rouen or Canterbury, perhaps even Thomas Becket, successor to Theobald of Bec, an identification which would rather scupper Hudry's theory that the writer was an advocate of Becket's cause. The 'Alan of Lille' of Hudry's introduction and edition is indeed a remarkably versatile individual. Not only is he to be found at Bec and Wearmouth in the 1160s, but within a few years at Canterbury, where as the future Alan abbot of Tewkesbury he collected and edited the letters of Thomas Becket, featured as the hidden target of the satirical '*Speculum stultorum*' of Nigel de Longchamp, and himself composed his '*Anticlaudianus*' as a veiled attack upon the injustices of Henry II and his family, before moving to Tewkesbury and thence to Cîteaux where he died in 1202. Even beyond the grave his versatility continued to bring forth wonders, since not only did he merit two tombs, at both Tewkesbury and Cîteaux, but succeeded in generating two bodies for burial, both of them later excavated and described. The body dug up at Tewkesbury, Hudry explains, was not that of Abbot Alan, but of an imposter, either Alan of Abingdon or Alan of Farnham, laymen active in the 1240s, the impersonation betrayed by the fact that the body at Tewkesbury was buried in non-abbatial boots! I trust that enough of Hudry's 'facts' have been set out here to demonstrate the merits of her case. Perhaps not since Ignatius Donnelly and *The great cryptogram* has a literary investigation led to such startling conclusions. The chief wonder is not that Hudry should have arrived at these conclusions but that they should have been published under the auspices of the École des Chartes. What the real Alan of Lille would have made of all this we can only guess. For the record, Otto of Saint-Blaise tells us that Alan of Lille was flourishing as a master in 1194 (*MGH Scriptores* xx. 326), and that he died in 1203, though apparently after a period at Montpellier and then Cîteaux rather than as an abbot on the banks of the Gloucestershire Avon. Hudry could have discovered this by reading p. 43 of John Baldwin's *Masters, princes and merchants*: one of the dozen or so standard anglophone authorities, including works by Saltman, Cheney, Barlow and Duggan, which are so signally absent from Hudry's bibliography. What seems clear is that there is little or no evidence that Alan of Lille wrote the letters preserved in BNF, MS Latin 13575. The letters themselves provide a fascinating insight into the intellectual life of Bec, and at one or two points into Bec's relations with England. They deserve to be widely read. As for Hudry's speculations, *caveat lector*.

Die Originale der Papsturkunden in Norddeutschland (Bremen, Hamburg, Mecklenburg-Vorpommern, Schleswig-Holstein), 1199–1415. By Tilmann Schmidt. (Commission Internationale de Diplomatique. Index Actorum Romanorum Pontificum ab Innocentio III ad Martinum V electum, 7.) Pp. xxxii + 306. Vatican City: Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, 2003. 88 210 0746 4

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905614388

Tilmann Schmidt has already contributed two volumes on documents from Baden-Württemberg to the *censimento* of papal documents of the later Middle Ages (reviewed this *JOURNAL* xlviii [1997], 152–3). In the present volume, which maintains the high standard of accuracy of his earlier work, he publishes those surviving in the archives of two cities and two *Länder* in northern Germany. The area covered corresponds to the medieval dioceses of Lübeck, Ratzeburg and Schwerin and parts of five further dioceses. Schmidt has found 375 documents. In accordance with the practice of the *Index Actorum Romanorum Pontificum*, he calendars them in Latin and records their external features and chancery marks. Among the many letters of justice in the volume are some appointing judges outside the papal curia in the long-running disputes between the civic authorities and the cathedral chapter of Hamburg. These disputes are well documented, yet Schmidt, in describing the diplomatic features of the original letters and especially the annotations which reflect the letters' treatment in the courts known as the *audientia publica* and the *audientia litterarum contradictarum*, is able to publish welcome supplementary evidence. Thus, a letter of Benedict XII of 11 January 1341 (no. 202), issued at the request of several citizens of Hamburg, orders the provost of the church of Sankt Mariengraden, Cologne, to hear a case between them and Arnold Doseborg, clerk of the diocese of Utrecht. It was never issued, since two further judges delegate were subsequently added. This no doubt resulted from Arnold's proctor objecting to the provost as the (sole) judge when the letter was read in the *audientia publica*. No. 202 served as the basis of a mandate of the same date addressed to the extended panel of three judges (no. 203). Gerhard of Rostock, proctor of the citizens of Hamburg, endorsed both letters. Among the endorsements on no. 203, one orders the provision of a copy of the letter for the proctor of the opposing party, Gerhard of Frankfurt, while another records a protestation by the proctor Magr Henricus 'ne tempora currant propter impedimenta magri. G. de Frankenfort', with the comment that the letter was only released on 5 March. This Magr Henricus (not identified by Schmidt) is Heinrich Bucglant, a well known proctor employed by the civic authorities of Hamburg, who in November 1340 had authorised Gerhard of Rostock to act as his substitute 'ad audientiam tantum', who made a payment to a scribe for writing *protestationes*, and who in a letter to the city council of Hamburg vaunted his own 'labour, solicitude and diligence' in impetrating the letter appointing the judges delegate in Cologne (R. Salomon and J. Reetz, *Rat und Domkapitel von Hamburg um die Mitte des 14. Jahrhunderts*, Hamburg 1968–80, ii. 227; i. 95). These observations draw attention merely to one aspect of the historical value of the documents published by Schmidt. While letters of justice at first sight appear to be among the dullest products of the papal chancery, they can provide a vivid picture of the judicial functioning of the curia and the role of the pope as *iudex ordinarius omnium*. We should be grateful to Tilmann Schmidt for having made available such material in this admirable volume.

Theology in stone. Church architecture from Byzantium to Berkeley. By Richard Kieckhefer.

Pp. xi + 372 incl. 25 ills. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004. £22.50.

o 19 515466 5

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905624384

Older readers of this JOURNAL may recall a widely circulated work by J. G. Davies entitled *The secular use of church buildings* (1968). This was very much a treatise for the times, in that it coincided with new efforts by western liturgists to secure greater participation by the laity in the worship of the Christian Church, and with western architects' rejection of the needless expense, fussy decoration and nostalgia of traditional church design, and the adoption of simpler, minimalist designs intended to bring the priest physically closer to the congregation and to reintegrate the ecclesiastical and secular sides of people's lives. Davies's particular concern was to restore each church, old or new, to the mixture of sacred and secular functions which he believed was implicit in the New Testament and had been the norm in the Middle Ages, but which had been lost when first reformers and then architects insisted that a church should be reserved for purely sacred functions. Richard Kieckhefer's *Theology in stone* is equally timely. It appears after many years of often bad-tempered debate between those anxious to defend modern communal churches and those wishing to return to more traditional church designs, and also after the more recent growth of scholarly interest in the meanings and uses of sacred space. But where Davies had been (in Kieckhefer's eyes) a partisan figure, Kieckhefer sees himself as a mediator between the narrowly-based dogmas of today, using his skills as a historian and his own experience of worship to inform both sides of what they are missing in the other's ideas and practice. Kieckhefer's credentials are impeccable: a distinguished historian of late medieval religion, with many years' experience of visiting churches all over Europe and America; a 'liberal Anglo-Catholic' (p. viii) with years of singing and worshipping in Catholic, Orthodox and Anglican churches; a scholar who handles with skill and fairness a wide range of technical literature on the architecture and worship of two continents over two millennia, but is also attuned to the sound and feel of each church he visits, and to the crucial importance of the reactions of those believers who sense a numinous quality in a building, even if they cannot fully explain it. He marshalls his arguments skilfully, and with occasional dry humour, as in his comment on one die-hard traditionalist who was convinced that the full array of Gothic effects is essential to church design: 'no gargoyles, no churches'; and he has adopted a thought-provoking two-part structure that culminates in his plea for an acceptance that what churches have meant in the past is related but not identical to the question of what they can mean in the future.

In the introduction and first four chapters, Kieckhefer examines the theological and liturgical underpinning of four factors central to church design: 'spatial dynamics' (the overall configuration of space within a church), 'centering focus' (on the altar or pulpit), 'aesthetic impact' (the use of height, light, acoustics and materials to convey the sense of an immanent God, or to provide a dignified setting for edification or celebration) and 'symbolic resonance' (the associations conveyed by the orientation of a church and its decorations or symbols such as a crucifix or a font). He also explores how these have been handled differently in three broad traditions of church design during the Christian era: the 'classic sacramental church' (with a long nave separated from the chancel), the 'classic evangelical church' (with the pulpit as the focal point of the auditorium), and 'the modern

communal church' (which tries to gather the people together as a social as well as a worshipping community). Then, in the next three chapters, he offers historically-rooted case studies which show the contrasting ways in which those features coexisted: late medieval Beverley; Chicago in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries; and twentieth-century Germany, especially the work of Rudolf Schwarz from the 1920s to the 1950s. The three case studies are, perhaps inevitably, rather uneven. The author can write in great detail, and given his specialism with great conviction, about Beverley Minster, in which centuries of accretion in a relatively stable environment had produced a unique pattern of ecclesiastical life. But the chapters on church design in Chicago and Germany have to cover major social and demographic changes and political and economic disruptions, as well as changes in clerical and lay aspirations and the use of new materials. So that here much more space is devoted to description of buildings and much less to the resulting patterns of worship and the participants' response to them.

The book may be strongly recommended as an up-to-date survey of what a wide range of features of church design and fittings were intended to mean and have meant to Christians over two millennia. The 'liberal' in Kieckhefer's self-description is evident in his readiness to see something of value in virtually all forms of church design, and his desire to urge both sides in the ancient versus modern debate to talk to rather than past each other. However, the 'Anglo-Catholic' side and the historian of ritual is also evident: in his sense that the designs of modern communal churches may have increased proximity but lost intimacy and kinetic dynamism; in his focus on the merits of the classic sacramental church (suitably modified) as a space for the interplay between transcendence and immanence; and in his focus too on symbols and forms of ritual such as processional liturgies which not all Christians find significant, and indeed which many poorer medieval parishes could probably not have supported in their full pomp. There is also at times a tendency to see piety and theory at work in past designs where more selfish motives (such as rivalry between parishes) or pragmatic considerations (such as the size and shape of the plot available, or the need to placate powerful interest groups) might have been as important, or more so. The illustrations, mostly taken by the author, are a useful support to the text, but rather sparse for the many interesting variants discussed in the later chapters. For a wider selection of images, the reader is referred to a website: another sign of the times?

QUEEN'S UNIVERSITY,
BELFAST

IAN GREEN

St Katherine's Hospital, Ledbury, c. 1230–1547. By Joe Hillaby. Pp. xiv + 153 incl. 7 tables, 6 maps and 87 ills. Ledbury: Ledbury & District Society Trust Ltd (with Logaston Press), 2003. £10 (paper). 1 904396 12 7
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905634380

Herefordshire has had less than its fair share of attention from historians (the Bodleian Library does not even put the county archaeology society's volumes on the open shelves), but there has been a welcome revival of activity in recent years, including an excellent history of the cathedral, a volume on Dore Abbey and Joe Hillaby's own history of Ledbury town. He has now added a detailed and valuable

study of St Katherine's Hospital, Ledbury, up to 1547, to which a sequel is planned. The hospital, founded by Bishop Hugh Foliot of Hereford in about 1230, was not a large or a well-endowed institution (its net income was valued at only £22 5s. in 1535), but it calls for attention in two respects. First, it was put under the supervision of Hereford Cathedral so that many of its records survive in the cathedral archives. Secondly, much of its architecture is extant, including the hall, chapel and master's house. Hillaby's book gives a thorough account of its constitutional history, buildings and endowments, fully referenced with copious maps and illustrations. Virtually nothing is known of its internal life or medical history. That the study reaches 150 pages reflects the author's frequent deviations to discuss the context of the hospital's history, especially the people and places connected with it. This strategy justifies itself in a project supported by a local history trust, and the book can be commended as a model of how to expound a piece of local history so that it is both useful to scholars and attractive and comprehensible to the general reader.

UNIVERSITY OF EXETER

NICHOLAS ORME

A thirteenth-century textbook of mystical theology at the University of Paris. The Mystical theology of Dionysius the Areopagite in Eriugena's Latin translation with the scholia translated by Anastasius the Librarian and excerpts from Eriugena's Periphyseon. Edited, translated and with an introduction by L. Michael Harrington. (Dallas Medieval Texts and Translations, 4.) Pp. xi + 126. Paris–Leuven–Dudley, MA: Peeters, 2004. €30 (paper). 90 429 1394 0

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905644387

In Étienne Gilson's picture of Latin medieval philosophy, Eriugena plays the role, if not of Satan himself, at least of the familiar demon 'to the sober teachings of the Latin tradition'. He judges that 'Initiated by the Greek theologians, Denis and Maximus the Confessor ... [Eriugena's] neoplatonist philosophy... was to remain as a sort of permanent temptation'. Despite being 'condemned and recondemned to destruction', its seductions continued: his writings survived and even 'exercised a kind of underground activity': *History of Christian philosophy in the Middle Ages*. Michael Harrington's volume shows not only a crucial channel by which this underground influence flowed in the thirteenth century but also how Eriugena contributed to a transformation of Plotinian and Dionysian neoplatonism essential to the way it was received by such paradigmatic Latins as Thomas Aquinas. It helps us understand how Thomas succumbed to the temptations of the fusion of the Latin and the Greek traditions originated by Eriugena, so that he joined in the metamorphosis of the neoplatonic tradition carried forward by the Irish-born genius.

Harrington offers a portion of the Dionysian *corpus* used as a textbook at the University of Paris in the thirteenth-century – the fundamental study of the whole was published by H. F. Dondaine in 1953. The title indicates most of what this part of *le corpus dionysien* contained. To Eriugena's translation of the *Mystical theology* (c. 860), were added brief interlinear comments explaining words or short phrases. In the manuscripts these appear together as an island around which larger-scale commentary was written. Here we find the Greek *scholia* on the text of Dionysius, translated and placed in the margins of Eriugena's manuscript by his contemporary, Anastasius the papal librarian. To these, besides some small pieces of material whose

source Harrington was unable to identify, the editor added selections from Hilduin's *Passion of St. Dionysius*, from Eriugena's letter to Charles the Bald introducing his translation of the *corpus*, from Eriugena's *Expositions on the heavenly hierarchy*, and extensive excerpts from his *Periphyseon*. Harrington judges that this was all put together 'around the middle of the thirteenth-century [by] an anonymous scholar, possibly a Dominican working in Paris' (p. 2). This editor did not know the sources of the Greek *scholia* or of the interlinear commentary. He probably knew that the *Periphyseon* was by Eriugena, but he does not identify the source of his excerpts: 'The *scholia* then presented themselves not as the work of an identifiable author, but as the reaction of an entire culture to Dionysius, a reaction which took place over seven hundred years' (p. 32). Harrington tries to preserve the character of the manuscript presentation. He does not break up the *scholia* according to their sources, nor does he correct the corruptions of the original texts, so as to 'produce a text which never existed' (p. 35). Harrington tries to force us to read Dionysius as he was read by Parisian scholastics. He only identifies the *scholia* and excerpts by references in the right-hand margins; to find the key to them the reader must turn to p. 32 of the introduction.

The introduction is a fine unification of philology, history and philosophy. Harrington's brief treatment of the structure and character of the Dionysian *corpus*, of its affirmations and negations and of its mystical theology shows a teacher with genuine philosophical abilities trying to illumine for students its obscure profundity. Everyone attempting to construe the ever-mysterious Dionysius will profit from reading these efforts, informed not only by exact study of the history of ancient philosophy and theology but also by Heideggerian criticisms of negative theology and of the metaphysics of presence – Jacques Derrida and Jean-Luc Marion have left traces. Perhaps as an endeavour to get us to rethink the text afresh, as well as in order 'to reproduce the strangeness and occasional awkwardness of Eriugena's version' (p. 37), Harrington's translations – for example of *super* as 'over', of *positio* as 'setting down', and of *ablatio* as 'clearing off' – keep surprising the reader. The translations (all his own) and introduction tend to explain by getting at root meanings – a technique found also in Eriugena and Heidegger. In consequence, the intelligibility of the translation requires careful reading of the introduction, especially pp. 8–11, 22–5 and 37–8.

The central argument of the introduction concerns the doctrinal character of the Greek *scholia* and of Eriugena's translation. Harrington shows that Dionysius follows Plotinus in distinguishing our power of understanding from our power of union – although Dionysius does not always do this – thus requiring a possibility for soul which is not an experience of the soul. This paradox proved too much for the commentary tradition which either reduced the union to an act of the intellect or to affective experience. Repeating what the author of the *Anonymous commentary on the Parmenides* edited by Hadot had done to Plotinus, the Greek Dionysian scholiasts assimilate union to thought so that unknowing becomes a form of knowing. Although Eriugena probably never read the Greek *scholia*, his translation also resolves union with God into a form of knowing. In the intellectualising tradition, the 'statements of Dionysius that posit a radical distinction between thought and union must be filed down ... so as to reveal their unity'. The 'most developed expression' of this filing down is to be found in the Dionysian commentaries of Albert the Great and Aquinas (p. 16).

Partly because it brings us closer than is usual to the working of the medieval intellectual world, this is not an easy book to use. It is, however, especially valuable for providing a rarely available and carefully considered entry into the reading of texts by medieval scholastics and for showing how the doctrine of Dionysius was transformed in a crucial hermeneutic tradition. It also makes an important contribution to breaking down the walls set up in the historiography between Greek and Latin, neoplatonic and Aristotelian and shows how ineffective and even counterproductive ecclesiastical condemnations are.

DALHOUSIE UNIVERSITY AND KING'S COLLEGE

WAYNE J. HANKEY

Scripture and metaphysics. Aquinas and the renewal of Trinitarian theology. By Matthew Levering. (Challenges in Contemporary Theology.) Pp. x + 254. Malden MA–Oxford: Blackwell, 2004. £55 (cloth), £19.99 (paper). 1 4051 1733 8; 1 4051 1734 6

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905654383

This engaging book brings Aquinas's Trinitarian theology into conversation with contemporary biblical and systematic theology. The crux of the argument is two-fold: first, when understood as a contemplative exercise, Aquinas's Trinitarian theology effectively integrates speculative, metaphysical thought and biblical study, and exemplifies their complementary roles in theological reflection. Second, Thomas's work thereby serves as a counterpoint to contemporary systematics and biblical studies, which often reject metaphysical speculation as an imposition on the biblical text that distorts or effaces its teaching. For Levering, the demand for metaphysical inquiry is internal to the Scriptures, as part of the spiritual process of coming to know the unique God of Israel, and as training in avoiding the idolatry often associated with speculative philosophical thought. The argument is sophisticated, and effectively demonstrates that Aquinas escapes the frequent caricatures of traditional Trinitarian theology as static, uninvolved or divorced from Christology and the paschal event. The explication of Aquinas is thorough, offering a holistic reading of the *Summa* that relates it to his scriptural commentaries. At its best, it shows that Aquinas offers resources that can repair deficiencies in contemporary systematic conceptuality. For example, Levering criticises Zizioulas, Hütter and Clarke for failing adequately to consider how the divine persons and essence relate; he argues that Aquinas's distinction between our disparate ways of speaking about essence and persons, and the coincidence of essence and persons in God's simplicity, better articulates God's triunity than these contemporary proposals can. While Levering persuasively demonstrates Aquinas's pertinence to contemporary debates and the importance of metaphysical inquiry in contemplative study, important questions remain. On several occasions, one is left with the impression that Levering treats contemporary Trinitarian theology as a foil for expounding Aquinas's views or, at best, as support for Aquinas's position. Generally speaking, his focus on contemplative speculation diverges most strongly from those theological and philosophical positions that emphasise the historicity, contingency and heterogeneity of the scriptural narratives and the Gospels (and thus, of God's activity). It is telling, then, that he does not consider ways in which contemporary theology might rework or extend Aquinas's approach. For, while Aquinas develops his speculation from a

biblical starting point, the language and conceptuality in which he speculates are still largely ahistorical. Given that metaphysical speculation is a necessary component of theological contemplation, are we tied to the philosophical vocabulary that Aquinas appropriates for his systematics, or might renewed metaphysical investigation be necessary, in light of contemporary philosophical and historical scholarship, precisely so as to better grasp the dynamic, immanently transcendent, contingent and cruciform pattern of divine activity? These questions ought not to diminish Levering's achievement; in eloquently and clearly setting Aquinas over against many of the most influential voices in theology today, and showing his relevance by liberating him from stereotypical dismissals, *Scripture and metaphysics* lays a path for further investigation that will be fruitful to those who follow it.

KING'S COLLEGE,
WILKES-BARRE,
PA

WILLIAM W. YOUNG III

Excidii Aconis gestorum collectio. Ystoria de desolatione et conculcatione civitatis acconensis et tocius terre sancte. The fall of Acre, 1291. By R. B. C. Huygens (with A. Forey and D. C. Nicolle). (Corpus Christianorum. Continuatio Mediaevalis, 202. Magister Thadeus civis Neapolitanus.) Pp. 228 + 1 black-and-white and 4 colour plates. Turnhout: Brepols, 2004. €105. 2 503 05029 8; 2 503 03000 9

Excidium Acconis. By CTLO (Centre Traditio Litterarum Occidentalium). (Instrumental Lexicologica Latina. Ser. A, Forma – TPLILA 162. Corpus Christianorum. Continuatio Mediaevalis, 202. Magister Thadeus civis Neapolitanus.) Pp. vi + 50 + 4 microfiches. Turnhout: Brepols, 2004. €38 (paper). 2 503 65022 8; 2 503 63000 6
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S002204690566438X

The Mamluk sultan al-Ashraf Khalil's capture of Acre in May 1291 after a forty-four day siege marked the effective end of the crusader presence in Syria and Palestine. It was a major catastrophe for the Christian fortunes in the east, although, in the light of the events of previous thirty-five years, it can scarcely have come as a surprise. Two near-contemporary Latin accounts of the siege, the anonymous *Excidium Aconis* and the *Ystoria de desolatione et conculcatione civitatis acconensis* by a certain Magister Thadeus of Naples, survive, and Robert Huygens has now re-edited them both. Both texts have long been known, but, although their importance is beyond doubt, they have not on the whole received the attention they deserve. Neither author was an eyewitness, but both were well-informed though decidedly prejudiced when it came to attributing responsibility. The new editions are thorough and match the high professional standard we have come to expect from this editor, and Huygens has provided a useful introduction – witty and characteristically acerbic in places – and has succeeded in identifying numerous quotations from, or allusions to, earlier authors. David Nicolle has contributed a useful discussion of the vocabulary found in these texts that relates to medieval warfare, and Alan Forey a couple of notes (at pp. 14, 62) explaining points concerning the military orders. The volume comes with a supplement containing a list of all the word-forms (an *enumeratio formarum*), and a concordance and an *Index formarum a tergo ordinarum* on microfiche.

CARDIFF UNIVERSITY

PETER EDBURY

Olivi and the interpretation of Matthew in the high Middle Ages. By Kevin Madigan. (Pp. xv + 224. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2003. \$47.50 (cloth), \$27.50 (paper). o 268 03715 9; o 268 03716 7
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905674386

Since Raoul Manselli's *La lectura super Apocalipsim di Pietro di Giovanni Olivi* (1955), scholars have become quite familiar with Peter John Olivi's Apocalypse commentary (1297), along with a handful of his other works (his exposition of the Franciscan rule, his questions on evangelical poverty and materials related to his scholastic controversies). The real Olivi has subsequently been disentangled from his later image, an image achieved by association with the radical Joachimism of Ubertino da Casale's *Arbor vitae* (1305), Angelo Clareno and various Franciscan victims of John XXII's persecution in the 1320s. But we have been largely oblivious of Olivi's commentaries on the four Gospels. Madigan begins to correct this oversight with a careful study of the commentary on Matthew, seen in the broader context of scholastic bible scholarship. Olivi wrote the Matthew commentary as a lector in the Franciscan school at either Narbonne or Montpellier between 1279 and 1281, just after Pope Nicholas III's publication of *Exiit qui seminat* (1279), which in effect endorsed the Franciscan practice of poverty, as St Bonaventure had defined it. It was meant to shore up the Franciscans in the face of attacks from both Dominican and secular theologians. Madigan gives a helpful summary of the poverty debates and Franciscan eschatology, along with a useful overview of some of the main scholastic commentaries before Olivi. As one might expect, the Matthew commentary reflects recent theological arguments; it takes particular aim at Dominican views of poverty. But the commentary's use of Joachim of Fiore proves rather unexceptional, when compared to Joachite echoes in Bonaventure's writings, although the seeds of Olivi's most unique, later apocalyptic doctrine, the mystical AntiChrist, do appear. Madigan pays close attention to the differences between Olivi's treatment of Matthew and his later *Lectura super Apocalypsim*. He reviews the interpretation of about twenty-four exemplary passages in the Gospel (chs vi and vii), relying entirely on manuscript sources. We are told how the insertion of Franciscan controversies and history into Gospel exegesis followed the examples of Bonaventure and John Pecham. The absence of any discernible later influence, on the evidence of Nicholas of Lyra's *postilla*, the author suggests, may have been due to a 'chilling effect' of John XXII's 1326 condemnation of Olivi's Apocalypse commentary (Madigan believes that the Matthew commentary may have been included in the condemnation: see p. 132). But one would seldom expect convent school lectures on the Bible to travel widely, unless, perhaps, they were produced at the Franciscan convent in Paris. Olivi's notoriety as an interpreter of the Franciscan rule or of the Apocalypse clearly did not bring this book many readers after his death. Madigan shows that Olivi's Matthew commentary stands within a scholastic exegetical mainstream, but the mainstream appears to have looked quite different a generation later. Madigan suggests it was 'de-Franciscanised'. It would be interesting to know how Olivi's treatment of Matthew compares to Pierre Auriol's handy compend, the most important Franciscan Parisian predecessor of Lyra's *postilla*, or, outside the order, Jacques Fournier's imposing commentary on Matthew, published just after his election as Pope Benedict XII. An additional note: the author frequently refers to 'historicising' interpretations, by which he means interpretations that correlate bible narrative to history or the history of salvation overall – past, present and future. I, following

others (for example, Otto Gerhard Oexle), would prefer to reserve 'historicism' for a 'modern' view of the past that subordinates meaning to contingent historical circumstances and excludes prophecy and supernatural influence altogether.

SAN FRANCISCO THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY
GRADUATE THEOLOGICAL UNION AT BERKELEY

CHRISTOPHER OCKER

Apocalypse in Rome. Cola di Rienzo and the politics of the new age. By Ronald G. Musto.
Pp. xx + 436 incl. frontispiece + 24 figs. Berkeley: University of California Press,
2003. £40. 0 520 23396 4
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905684382

Selectively following the vivid and often idiosyncratic contemporary chronicler known as the Anonimo Romano, historians through the ages have transformed the story of Cola di Rienzo (c. 1313–54) into a moral tale for their own time, whether that tale be of a failed rationalist, a romantic reformer or a proto-nationalist. Each age, as Musto deftly shows in his introduction, has the Cola it deserves. Yet characteristic of all the earlier accounts of Cola's life has been the dominance of the perspective of the Anonimo Romano: we seem inescapably always to see Cola through the Anonimo's very particular eyes. In this deeply learned and insightful study – the result of decades of critical study of the religious, literary and historical texts and images of Cola's age – Musto successfully liberates Cola from the interpretive prison of the Anonimo Romano and allows readers to see Cola once again as both the product of and participant in the complex political and religious currents shaping the Italian peninsula, and Europe more generally, in the mid-fourteenth century. In particular, Musto's analysis makes clear that Cola was constantly negotiating between his own classically and religiously informed vision of Rome's role as the exemplar of peace, justice and right rule and the diplomatic and military *Realpolitik* needed to keep a host of institutions and interests – the papacy, the empire, other Italian cities, the noble families of Rome, the Angevins – at bay. Of particular interest to readers of this JOURNAL will be Musto's careful reconstruction of the Avignon papacy's role in Cola's rise and fall (chs iv, ix, xi); the development and contours of the politico-religious ideal of the *buon stato* (ch. viii); and his very suggestive arguments about the connections between Cola's reform programme and wider currents of apocalyptic thought in Italy and central Europe (chs vi, vii, xii, xiii). At the same time, Musto's study has its limits, and readers will want to turn, for example, to Gustav Seibt's, *Anonimo Romano: Geschichtsschreibung in Rom an der Schwelle zur Renaissance* (Stuttgart 1992) for a fuller discussion of this key source, and to Amanda Collins's *Greater than emperor: Cola di Rienzo (c. 1313–1354) and the world of fourteenth-century Rome* (Ann Arbor 2002) for a closer look at the social networks and micropolitics that enabled and limited Cola's actions. A set of twenty-four very well chosen images, thorough but not overwhelming notes and bibliography, two informative maps and an excellent index round out this excellent study and make it not only a boon to specialists but also accessible to students. It is to be hoped that the University of California Press may soon publish a soft-cover edition.

CARLETON COLLEGE,
NORTHFIELD,
MN

WILLIAM NORTH

Evangelienharmonien des Mittelalters. Edited by Christoph Burger, August den Hollander and Ulrich Schmid. (Studies in Theology and Religion, 9.) Pp. x + 155. Assen: Van Gorcum, 2004. €45. 90 232 4052 9
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905694389

The motives behind the rewriting of the contents of the four canonical Gospels as a single entity differed: the purpose may have been unorthodox, being a subtle way to expunge or alter undesirable elements in the separated Gospels; or it may have been apologetic, to remove apparent inconsistencies embarrassingly evident when comparing parallel accounts; or it may simply have been a convenient way of retelling well-loved stories in a seamless sequence, as seems to have been the case with the well-known harmonised Latin Gospels in the Codex Fuldensis of the sixth century and perhaps also with the earlier Diatessaron of Tatian. This last motive is also likely to have lain behind the proliferation of new gospel harmonies in Latin and in vernacular versions that arose in Europe in the fifteenth to the seventeenth centuries following Johannes Gerson's *Monotessaron* of c. 1420. Many different gospel harmonies are known from that period, but, unlike the Codex Fuldensis or the Diatessaron, few have been or are being studied and analysed. Ulrich Schmid's article in this book, 'Lateinische Evangelienharmonien', provides a handy catalogue of some existing texts; he states as a rule of thumb that 'Was nicht ediert ist, ist auch praktisch nicht erforscht' (p. 24). The collection of essays here discusses various medieval gospel harmonies and commentaries; it arose from a conference in Vechta near Osnabrück in 2000 and, understandably, includes an analysis of Gerson's work (by Marc Vial). Charles Caspers makes a preliminary study of the use of the harmonies for medieval piety as they enabled the reader and hearer to concentrate on a complete telling of the life of Jesus, his passion and resurrection. Other articles deal with a survey of middle Dutch harmonies (August den Hollander), the commentary of Simon Fidati of Cascia (Willigis Eckermann) and the passion harmony of Johannes von Paltz (Christoph Burger). Until now those working in this area have depended on the introductory matter by D. Wünsch in his *Evangelienharmonien im Reformationszeitalter* of 1983, or his entry in *Theologische Realenzyklopädie* x. Now this volume should be a first port of call; it clears the decks by analysing what is known, but it also points out what research work is needed in this all-too-often neglected area of scholarship. Many a potential doctoral dissertation awaits the writing in universities still prepared to encourage work on the Latin Bible. The stimulus provided by these essays deserves to bear fruit.

UNIVERSITY OF LEEDS

J. K. ELLIOTT

Philosophy and politics in the thought of John Wyclif. By Stephen E. Lahey. (Cambridge Studies in Medieval Life and Thought, 4th Ser., 54.) Pp. x + 241. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003. £45. 0 521 63346 X
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905704383

John Wyclif was both a scholastic metaphysician and a religious and political reformer. His realist theory of universals and his radical theory of *dominium* have commonly been studied separately, and many scholars have argued that there is no real link between the two. In this erudite and painstaking book Stephen Lahey shows that Wyclif's radical teachings on divine and human *dominium* are linked with each

other and are based upon his realism. The metaphysics of the *Tractatus de universalibus* provides the foundation for the social and ecclesiastical proposals of *De civili dominio* and *De dominio divino*. The radical thesis that only those favoured by God with grace can justly own property and exercise authority is not a disconnected innovation of Wyclif's later years, but a conclusion derived by systematic argumentation from his teaching about the different kinds of universals and their relations to particulars. Lahey argues that an understanding of Wyclif's theory of *dominium* is important also for the understanding of Lollard beliefs on ecclesiastical and political matters, even though few Lollards were metaphysicians. Not all students of the Wycliffite and Lollard political programme will find Lahey's thesis congenial, but henceforth none of them can be excused for not making a serious attempt to master the philosophical system of the *Summa de Ente*. There must surely be a presumption in favour of an interpretation which depicts Wyclif as a systematic and consistent thinker rather than as a pantomime horse with radical communist front legs and conservative realist back legs.

ST JOHN'S COLLEGE,
OXFORD

ANTHONY KENNY

Parisian licentiates in theology, A.D. 1373–1500. A biographical register, I: The religious orders.

By Thomas Sullivan OSB (Education and Society in the Middle Ages and Renaissance, 18.) Pp. xii + 467. Leiden–Boston: Brill, 2005. €97. 90 04 13586 3; 0926 6070

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S002204690571438X

This register provides us with prosopographical data of some 583 monks, friars and regular canons, the great majority of French origin, who were sent to study theology at Paris between the years stated in the title. Thomas Sullivan OSB, the author and compiler, who is working on a companion volume to deal with the secular clergy, is already well known and gratefully acknowledged for his previous biographical register: *Benedictine monks at the University of Paris, AD 1220–1500* (Leiden 1995). For the Benedictine and Cluniac graduates, who appear in both volumes, the reader is referred to the entries in the earlier volume for the biographical details. The date, 1373, in the title indicates Br Thomas's dependence on the *Ordo licentiatorum* (BN, MS lat 5657-A) compiled by a seventeenth-century beadle of the Parisian Faculty of Theology from which he has skilfully extracted most of his information. Not surprisingly the four orders of friars ranked highest in terms of the number of licentiates while the Benedictine and Cluniac representatives were few and, taken together, amounted to less than the Cistercian component. A rough calculation with the aid of both Br Thomas's volumes suggests that only a small number of the Benedictines sent to the university were allowed to remain long enough to be registered as *licentiati*, a practice also common among English Benedictines. There are useful appendices, one listing the licentiates' names chronologically by their religious order and another listing them by their first name.

ROBINSON COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

JOAN GREATREX

Kirchenreform von unten. Gerhard Zerbolt von Zutphen und die Brüder vom gemeinsamen Leben.

Edited by Nikolaus Staubach. (Tradition-Reform-Innovation. Studien zur Modernität des Mittelalters, 6.) Pp. 436. Frankfurt-am-Main: Peter Lang, 2005.

£41 (paper). 3 631 39294 X; 1434 5277

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905724386

The recently expired research project at the University of Münster devoted to 'the modern devotion' produced rich fruits. The present collection of essays and editions, consisting of contributions by the Münster team and other experts, is of the highest quality. Indeed, few comparable collections offer so many well-integrated and solid contributions to knowledge. The central figure is Gerard Zerbolt of Zutphen, the driving force behind the Brethren of the Common Life in the 1390s until he was felled by the plague at the age of thirty-one in 1398. Ten contributions relate to him, almost all of which offer new information (in three cases new editions) and/or useful insights. Among the remaining items is an illuminating study by Mikel M. Kors which treats the vernacular Dutch translations of Scripture done by an anonymous cleric who flourished between *c.* 1360 and *c.* 1385. Among Kors's noteworthy findings are that this person translated almost the entire Bible (in stages) except for a few books he thought too dangerous (i.e. subtle) for the laity, and that he was more liberal on the subject of lay access to Scripture than Gerard Zerbolt, whose *De libris teutonicalibus* is usually regarded as a bold manifesto of pre-Reformation biblicism. The essay with the broadest overview is the last, written by the editor, Nikolaus Staubach. The main argument here is that Zerbolt's success in inspiring and defending the establishment of pious lay communities in Dutch market towns was undermined by the establishment of the Augustinian priory of Windesheim and its associated houses; although the Windesheim congregation was founded in principle to lend the semi-religious 'devout of our day' officially-approved oversight, the devout were soon treated as inferiors who might at best be trained to join the regular order. Given this sober appraisal, Staubach's choice of title for the present volume seems inappropriate. He derives it from a passage in a newly-discovered text of *c.* 1470 which refers, in the context of desired overall reform 'in head and members', to the realisation of at least 'a small and particular reform at the ends of the earth [the Netherlands], in the feet'. Perhaps Staubach prided himself on a nice conceit when he expanded on this almost wistful remark to produce the slogan 'Church reform from below', but I doubt that this was the late medieval author's meaning. More important, as Staubach implicitly admits, the phrase hardly corresponds to any real accomplishment of the beleaguered and belittled lay devout.

NORTHWESTERN UNIVERSITY,
EVANSTON,
ILLINOIS

ROBERT LERNER

Signorelli and Fra Angelico at Orvieto. Liturgy, poetry and a vision of the end-time. By Sara Nair

James. (Histories of Vision.) Pp. xiv + 199 incl. 45 ills + 8 colour and 19 black-and-white plates. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2003. £55. 0 7546 08131

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905734382

Ever since the completion in 1996 of extensive conservation work which restored much of their marvellous brilliance and immediacy, Signorelli's frescoes in the

cappella nuova (or since 1622 the cappella San Brixio) of Orvieto Cathedral have received much new scholarly attention, especially the portions thereof depicting the AntiChrist. However, there was still much in Signorelli's complex artistic-religious programme that remained unexplained: how do all of the many parts relate to the whole? And what precisely is the 'whole'? The result of fourteen years of research, Sara James's well-conceived, well-documented and well-argued volume is the first study of the chapel to recover and articulate in an exhaustive, coherent fashion the original, long-forgotten religious programme – the single 'silent sermon' – underlying and unifying all the disparate parts of Signorelli's artistic scheme, which the artist created upon the interrupted foundations of Fra Angelico's initial programme of fifty years previously. In offering a global yet exquisitely detailed explanation of the chapel's decor, James integrates into the discussion not only the Bible, theology (especially that of the local Dominican masters), traditional iconography and contemporary Orvietan history, but also the Roman liturgy (for the frescoes were meant to adorn and interact with an active worship space), literature (Italian and classical) and fifteenth-century humanism. In fact, the particularly significant contribution of this volume is the unprecedented amount of fruitful attention that the author pays to the often-neglected lower portion of the chapel's walls, the socle. The socle decoration represents one of the chapel's truly innovative, indeed radical, aspects, featuring in surprising, prominent manner portraits of such lay (and mostly pagan) literary figures as Ovid, Virgil, Tibullus, Sallust, Dante and Boccaccio, together with scenes from their works. Most notably, in deciphering the socle, no one before James had adequately explained why Signorelli chose to include specifically, and only, the first eleven cantos of Dante's *Purgatorio* in his programme. All these literary portraits and vignettes – indeed all the iconographic components of the cappella nuova – find adequate and convincing niches in the 'visual rhetoric' and 'poetic theology' of Signorelli's erudite but wonderfully moving chapel programme. James's volume must be considered the indispensable guide of first recourse for any future study of this Renaissance jewel of a chapel.

BOSTON COLLEGE

FRANCO MORMANDO

Incunabula and their readers. Printing, selling and using books in the fifteenth century. Edited by Kristian Jensen. Pp. x + 291 incl. 50 ills + 14 colour plates. London: The British Library, 2003. £35. 0 7123 4769 0
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905744389

This volume contains eleven interesting essays, based on presentations at a conference organised by the British Library in 2000. They range quite widely over the field of studies relating to the book in the fifteenth century, presenting for the most part new evidence on the production and dissemination of printed books in the first fifty years or so of printing in the west. Two of the essays deal with specific printers: Johann Gutenberg and Wynkyn de Worde, both or whom are the subject of reassessments based on careful typographical analysis – in the case of Gutenberg a radical reinterpretation of his production methods by Blaise Agüera y Arcas at the Scheide Library at Princeton. No less than five of the essays concern religious books: Cristina Dondi and Mary Beth Wynn tackle respectively the very complex history of the development and presentation of texts and images in printed Books of Hours.

Dondi's article is especially revealing on the ecclesiastical context for the textual choices made by printers and booksellers in this important area of the book trade. Maintaining the emphasis on religious book production, Lilian Armstrong and Kristian Jensen present important research on printed Bibles – the former on illustration, the latter ranging more broadly on the commercial aspects of printing biblical texts. Mary Kay Duggan examines in-depth examples of the reading of liturgical books in both sacred and secular settings. Bettina Wagner's essay on the catalogue of the library of St Emmeram in Regensburg in southern Germany continues the religious theme of the volume, based around a discussion of the monastery's astonishing catalogue of 1501, which described over 700 volumes: Wagner has identified numerous surviving books which appear in the catalogue in both German and British collections. The remaining three essays deal more broadly with issues relating to the book trade in fifteenth-century Europe: John L. Flood writes on the commercial aspects of the printed book through an examination of the output of a group of German printers. Falk Eisermann presents some interesting research on the dissemination of fifteenth-century illustrated broadside news-sheets, and Holger Nickel provides a brief overview of the genre of printed orations. The volume has been well-edited, and produced on good paper with a generous supply of illustrations. The essays are all interesting and, although they lack a coherent theme, are brought together through a useful index: as such the book represents excellent value for money. The only major criticism of the volume is that the copious references have been relegated to endnotes, requiring some manual dexterity on the part of the reader in navigating through each essay and its associated scholarly apparatus.

OXFORD

RICHARD OVENDEN

Humanisme et église en Italie et en France méridionale (XVe siècle – milieu du XVIe siècle). Edited by Patrick Gilli. (Collection de l'École française de Rome, 300.) Pp. iv + 500. Paris: École française de Rome, 2004. €47 (paper). 2 7283 0677 X; 0223 5099 JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905754385

This is a volume of the proceedings of a conference held in Rome on 3–5 February 2000. It contains twenty papers on a variety of subjects to do with humanism and its complex relationship to church institutions. As Marc Venard points out in his conclusion, the general theme of the conference turned out to be something of a non-starter, not because no relationship between humanism and ecclesiastical structures could be established but because only three of the twenty papers touch on the topic of humanism in the south of France and one of the three argues that in the fifteenth century French universities in the south were untouched by humanist spirit and methods. As Venard again points out, the problem is that humanism did not come to France until the sixteenth century and it did so not *via* Italy but *via* the north. This reviewer would add here that there were substantial differences between northern and Italian humanism. Among them was the difference in attitude to Christianity. Indeed, as is shown by early humanists such as Hegius, Murmellius and then later by Erasmus, Beatus Rhenanus or Lefèvre d'Étaples (who does not get so much as a mention), northern humanism was more Christian in its orientation and indeed more reformist. Men such as Erasmus, Rhenanus or Lefèvre saw their efforts

as devoted as much to the renewal of piety and sacred letters as to the renewal of *bonae litterae* in the strict sense of the word. This reformist attitude is paralleled in Italy by treatises such as the *Libellus ad Leonem X* addressed in 1513 to Pope Leo x by two Camaldulensian monks, Vincenzo Querini and Tommaso Giustiniani. This treatise, analysed in the present volume by Giuseppe Alberigo (pp. 349–59), makes the explicit point that the study of classical poets etc. is of no use at all unless it leads to piety and the study of sacred texts. The same attitude characterises Cardinal Pole and his circle, to which no contributions are devoted. As regards the volume as a whole, although it misses one of its main aims and although, as Patrick Gilli points out in his introduction, the topic of the relationship between humanism and ecclesiastical institutions is not new, it does offer a large number of useful new insights to historians of the Renaissance period and especially of the Italian Renaissance. Indeed, the majority of the papers deal with fifteenth- and sixteenth-century Italy. One contribution (Dominique de Courcelles) is on Juan de Valdés and his conception of philology as a spiritual discipline, a view he applies to his studies of the relationship between Hebrew and the vernacular. Three (Jacques Verger, Pierrette Paravy and Marc Venard) touch on France and one (John Monfasani) is a very careful and interesting study of Edmund Campion and his championing of Ciceronianism in common with many Jesuit scholars of the period. Monfasani also notes that from the second half of the sixteenth century onwards Ciceronianism enjoyed something of a revival and was adopted or partly adopted not just by Catholic scholars and theologians but also by Protestants such as Camerarius, Melancthon (who did none the less use Christian vocabulary for things Christian) or Castellio (who did not). In fact Ciceronianism in the sense of imitating Cicero only waned with the final decline of Latin in the twentieth century. Of the contributions devoted to the Italian Renaissance we might mention particularly Anne Reltgen-Tallon ('L'Observance dominicaine et son opposition à l'humanisme: l'exemple de Jean Dominici') who, taking Dominici as a case in point, sees Dominican objections to humanism as stemming not from any aversion to classical authors or philology but from a dislike of humanist individualism and elitism, which jarred with the Dominican conception of man as belonging in a community, the only state that would ensure his tending towards God. Equally interesting is the contribution of Concetta Bianca ('La curia come domicilium sapientiae e la sancta rusticitas') who shows how at the return of the curia to Rome, under the pontificate of Martin v, it sought to establish a reputation as a place of solid learning, a tendency which conflicted with the 'professionalisation' of curricula for those embarking on an ecclesiastical career. Pierre Petitmengin ('Latino Latini [1513–1593], une longue vie au service des pères de l'église') presents a masterly account of Latini's network of friends and connections, based on a careful study of his correspondence, analyses Latini's library and shows that Latini, good Catholic though he was, was opposed to outside authorities, including the Church, interfering with philological principles for the establishment of correct textual readings.

Humanism is defined in the conclusion to the volume as 'an act of faith in man and his future'. Most papers, however, deal with its literary aspects, with philology typical of humanist endeavours and with humanist education. This volume should stimulate interest in an issue, which, although far from new, has not received a great deal of scholarly publicity in the past decade. Indeed, the question arises of whether the time has not come for a general work devoted to the topic of 'Humanism north

and south and its links with Christianity in the fifteenth-sixteenth century'. Such a study should also take into account humanism in eastern Europe.

UNIVERSITY OF GENEVA

IRENA BACKUS

Repertorium germanicum, IX: *Verzeichnis der in den päpstlichen Registern und Kameralakten vorkommenden Personen, Kirchen und Orte des Deutschen Reiches, seiner Diözesen und Territorien vom Beginn des Schismas bis zur Reformation. Paul II. 1464–1471*, 1: *Text*; II: *Indices*. By Hubert Höing, Heiko Leerhoff and Michael Reimann. Pp. lxxvi + 926; xii + 981. Tübingen: Niemeyer (for the Deutsches Historisches Institut in Rom), 2000. €142 each (paper). 3 484 80154 9; 3 484 80158 1

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905764381

These volumes of the *Repertorium Germanicum* devoted to the pontificate of Paul II in almost all respects follow the editorial methods of those for his predecessor, Pius II (reviewed this *JOURNAL* xlvii [1996], 173–5). The size of the publication (some 2,000 pages covering a pontificate which lasted less than seven years) is a reflection of the sheer bulk of the materials surviving in the Vatican Archives and the proliferation of different series of registers and other records under the Renaissance popes. Unlike most publications of Vatican sources, the *Repertorium Germanicum* includes all the extant series, with the exception of the registers of supplications of the penitentiary and the *Manualia* of the Rota. The penitentiary registers are being treated in a parallel publication, the *Repertorium Poenitentiariae Germanicum*, vol. v of which (2003) covers Paul II. The *Repertorium Germanicum* and the *Repertorium Poenitentiariae Germanicum* for Paul II complement each other, partly because to some extent supplications for the same type of graces appear in both volumes and partly because supplicants in the penitentiary registers were required to make a 'composition' in order to obtain certain graces. The payment of such compositions, including the amount and the name of the proctor through whom the sum was handed over, is recorded in the *Repertorium Germanicum* from the registers of the apostolic chamber.

The first volume of the *Repertorium Germanicum* for Paul II opens with an elegant and eloquent *apologia* for the venture by Arnold Esch and an introduction listing the sources. The 6,307 entries, in the form of calendars in Latin, follow. Volume II consist entirely of indices – of forenames, surnames, places, patronymics, religious orders, subjects, dates and *Fundstellen*. The compilers, the publishers and the German Historical Institute in Rome deserve to be congratulated on the completion of a massive, ambitious and even courageous undertaking. It continues the notable services to scholarship, especially to historians interested in ecclesiastical careers and religious life in the later Middle Ages, being rendered by the *Repertorium Germanicum*.

CORPUS CHRISTI COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

P. N. R. ZUTSHI

Liber usuum fratrum monasterii vadstenensis. The customary of the Vadstena brothers. A critical edition with an introduction. By Sarah Risberg. (Acta Universitatis Stockholmiensis. Studia Latina Stockholmiensia, 50.) Pp. 256 incl. 1 black-and-white and 4 colour plates. Stockholm: Almqvist & Wiksell, 2003. SEK 271 (paper). 91 22 02040 3; 0491 2764

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905774388

Sara Risberg's doctoral thesis provides a critical edition of the hitherto neglected customary of the brethren of the Birgittine order, which was composed for the general chapter held in Gnadenberg in 1487. The fifty-six chapters of the customary contain details, some not documented elsewhere in other Birgittine materials such as the *Regula sancti Salvatoris*, about papal bulls, exemplary behaviour, rituals and guidance on the responsibilities and liturgical duties of the brethren. The survival of the text may tell us something of its circulation and use: of the fourteen extant manuscripts, only two (on which this edition is principally based) are medieval, and twelve (especially from northern Germany and the Netherlands) are from the seventeenth century, which probably reflects the revival of the order in this period. Risberg's clearly presented edition includes a useful and extensive English summary of each chapter. There is a cursory discussion of some possible influences from Swedish Cistercian practice, and brief mention of the customary for the Birgittine nuns, the *Lucidarium*, which was first written in Swedish; both these areas are worthy of a more exhaustive comparative investigation, with reference also to the various relevant European traditions in the vernacular. Risberg has made a welcome contribution to Birgittine scholarship and her edition earns a prominent place amid the wealth of publications on St Birgitta and her order that were published in 2003 to mark the seven-hundredth anniversary of her birth.

UNIVERSITY OF LEEDS

BRIDGET MORRIS

Reformation. Europe's house divided, 1490–1700. By Diarmaid MacCulloch. Pp. xxvii + 832 incl. 15 ills and 7 maps + 24 plates. London: Allen Lane/Penguin, 2003. £25. 0 7139 9370 7

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905784384

This ambitious book, which examines the meanings of reform for those who remained within the Roman Church as well as for those who left it, is a landmark in Reformation history, reflecting the findings of a generation of intensive research undertaken by scholars from several countries. Those countries range from Poland-Lithuania to the Atlantic Isles of Britain, and from Malta to Finland, but, unlike the Sephardic Jews who had to negotiate those distances with uncertainty and danger beckoning, Diarmaid MacCulloch's readers are welcomed into often unfamiliar territory by the lucidity of his prose and the breadth of his scholarship. Within these pages the overview is never lost, but astute use of the index will also provide readers with thoughtful surveys of reformation in particular locations, witness the entries for Scotland, Portugal and the Palatinate. This geographical scope is matched by the book's chronological range, which divides the volume into three parts, the first of which takes the story up to 1570, tracing the break-down of the hegemony of the medieval Church. MacCulloch demonstrates the strength of the Church's hold on the imagination of the laity through the sacraments, but also stresses the pressures

placed on it by the presence of an increasingly confident Islam on Europe's south-western and south-eastern borders. More important than this manifest threat, however, was the quiet threat posed by the rediscovery of Augustine, and it was the explosive power of these ideas, as articulated by Luther, which was to undermine the 'common culture' (some historians might follow that with a question mark) which forms the title of this section of the book. The attention to Augustine demonstrates two of the greatest strengths of the book: first, MacCulloch's own familiarity with the theology of the Fathers and his awareness of how important that was to contemporaries; and secondly, his conviction that ideas can shape history, for this account is a history of the interplay of ideas and events and their impact on people's lives. There is no place for any structural determinism here and the reader is always reminded that things could have turned out differently. This is especially true of the treatment of the crisis of 1541–2, which forms the hinge of the first section and which resulted in many of the supporters of *rapprochement* fleeing the inquisition following the breakdown of negotiations at Regensburg.

Following the trend of recent scholarship, the main focus of the book is on consequences rather than causes, with section II examining the implementation of reform, and section III the implications of reform for personal and social behaviour. If the failure of 1541 marked the end of serious hopes for *rapprochement*, it was the clerical triumph at Trent, and the mid-century violence, on both sides, culminating in the massacre of St Bartholomew in 1572, which heralded the age of 'confessionalisation'. MacCulloch is not afraid to make clear where he stands, and the years of religious warfare and Protestant withdrawal from earlier successes in central Europe, are a source of regret which colours the treatment in section II. Whilst he is at pains to record the positive achievement of the clerical leaders, whether Jesuits in the mission fields or ministers in Scotland, it is clear that he is no lover of the clerical establishment, or at least of its claims to exercise authority; those places where attempts at some form of comprehension, or even tolerance can be discerned, England, Poland and the Netherlands, owed much to lay rather than clerical leadership, and this point is made quietly but forcefully throughout the narrative. This is, therefore, a protestant history in the best sense, one with a small 'p', in that the author is much happier with clerics when they are protesting against established order, or exploring the boundaries of the possible, than when they are asserting their authority, a point illustrated in the treatment of the otherwise contrasting careers of Martin Luther and Reginald Pole. It is also reflected in the conclusion (p. 73) that a substantial minority of the laity, when freed from clerical authority and given some choice in religion, chose to join the radical groups, Mennonites, Unitarians and Libertines, and that this freedom also transferred to personal choice in life-style, it being no coincidence that a positive homosexual identity first emerged towards the end of the seventeenth century in the tolerant and moderately prosperous environments of London and Amsterdam. The decline of clerical authority, and with it the patriarchal view of society (p. 67) at this time marked the end of the reformation (and the beginnings of modernity?), though its legacies, for good and ill, mostly the latter, remain with us, chiefly in the transatlantic world which, paradoxically, was the refuge of a number of casualties of clerical aggression in this period.

The final section treats what can be termed the intellectual and social consequences of the events described earlier: changing perceptions of the world

and of knowledge, and shifting patterns of behaviour, sexual and social. The discussion here is rich and thought provoking, and gaps are hard to find. This reviewer would have liked more explicit treatment of the massive charitable endeavour initiated by the ambitious programmes of education and mission which all religions engaged in at this period, and which perhaps might have acted as a foil to the emphasis on discipline and regulation which forms so much of the social discussion in the book. That said, this is a complex story beautifully told, with wit and grace: best illustrated by two references to one of the most theologically engaged rulers of the period, James VI and I. This reader laughed out loud at the description of that king's 'uncharacteristic heterosexual bravado' (p. 70) when setting out on a dangerous sea to meet his bride to be, and could only admire the ease with which (p. 32) the story was moved from the defeat of the Ottomans at Lepanto to the implementation of Calvinism in Scotland by a linking paragraph dealing with James's epic poem on Don John's victory. Examples can be multiplied, and they demonstrate both the author's mastery of the material and the skill with which he orders it. MacCulloch not only brings his deep knowledge of theology to inform the reader, but also shares his love of architecture and of music, positing the teasing suggestion that if Calvinism was indeed an 'international' movement it was expressed not so much in its theology of election or its discipline, but in the use of the metrical psalter (p. 591). The text and its argument demonstrate MacCulloch's commitment to the liberal values of the Enlightenment, whilst in the introduction he acknowledges an affectionate memory of shared religious belief. In holding those two viewpoints in balance, he has produced a magnificent account of one of the central processes in the European past. We, and future generations of scholars, are greatly in his debt.

UNIVERSITY OF YORK

W.J. SHEILS

Anglican identities. By Rowan Williams. Pp. viii + 149. London: Dartman, Longman & Todd, 2004. £7.95 (paper). 0 232 52527 7
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905794380

The Anglican sensibility revealed in this collection of essays and lectures is very much that which is currently being tested in Rowan Williams's ministry as archbishop of Canterbury. While these studies of Tyndale, Hooker, Herbert, Westcott, Ramsey and Robinson are addressed to a general audience, they are valuable to specialists as well thanks to Williams's profound theological sympathy, coupled with historical acuity and poetic sensibility. (It is a rare historian who can bring to Herbert not only the insights of a fellow poet but also recognition of the echoes in Herbert of both Calvinist and Carmelite spirituality.) Although Williams understands and respects the historical context of each figure, he also insists that today's Church must engage in a conversation with them, to find in them both '*ourselves and other*'. Williams finds lessons aplenty for a Church with ears to hear. He divines in Hooker the origin of a distinctively Anglican legacy of 'contemplative pragmatism' balanced by creedal and liturgical commitments. Hooker reminds us that 'true conformity to unchanging divine wisdom ... requires a flexibility in discipline and polity that is impossible for the positivist and the primitivist'. In biblical studies, Westcott championed this insight, maintaining that if we seek closure in hermeneutics and

theology, then we step away from the Emmaus road. Williams's own approach exemplifies for the Church a continuing conversation with Scripture and creeds and history, a 'passionate patience' integral to Anglican identity. May this prophet not be without honour in his own country.

ABINGDON

PETER DOLL

Harvesting Martin Luther's reflections on theology, ethics, and the Church. Edited by Timothy J. Wengert (foreword David C. Steinmetz). (Lutheran Quarterly Books.) Pp. xiv + 260 incl. 3 figs. Grand Rapids, MI–Cambridge: Eerdmans, 2004. £21.99 (\$30) (paper). 0 8028 2486 2
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905804385

This in many ways attractive and readable collection serves in part as applied history, with referencing to issues in modern church membership. Indeed, it has some flavour of modern ecumenism, albeit only from one side, the Catholic flank, of the divide: thus the Catholic writer Jared Wicks appreciates Luther's spiritual legacy, while the Jesuit liturgiologist Meyer saw Luther's liturgical work 'in a positive light', and post-war Catholic specialists in liturgy deployed Luther's work in that field to lay the foundations for the liturgical reforms of Vatican II. However, as far as this collection is concerned, Catholic appreciations of aspects, including the liturgical side, of the Lutheran–Evangelical tradition are not really reciprocated by contributors' favourable response to aspects of Catholic religious life. First, the medieval tradition is extensively portrayed as lifeless and stifling: there was a mechanically-minded over-provisions of masses (though the piece of evidence for this, taken from a most unusual church – the princely pilgrimage reliquary Castle Church in Wittenberg – can hardly be taken as typifying the whole of the medieval cult); medieval congregations were squeezed out of worship by the complexity of polyphonic music, though Luther brought congregations back into the celebration of the rite in ways 'unknown in the middle ages'; books of hours and the like were denigrated by Luther, and 'his observation is correct'; medieval baptism was reduced to 'obscurity'. And things were not improved in the subsequent history of the Catholic Church that Luther left: Trent introduced a regrettable 'strict uniformity' of the liturgy, instead of Luther's free-range liberality in those respects, and even the Catholic Church of the 1990s stands condemned, for its refusal of priestly ministry to women, supposedly on the basis of medieval Catholic convictions of the superiority of priests over Mary. None, of this, though, should probably be read as intending deliberately to negate the Catholic–Evangelical theological fellow-feeling that opened up this century. If a persistent mood of this collected celebration of Martin Luther's undoubted greatness is to reject 'approaches to the Reformation that emphasize its continuity with medieval Christianity', that is simply because to evaluate pre-Reformation, post-Reformation or even modern Catholicity in anything but fairly negative terms dangerously undermines the Luther who, it is said, 'rejected late medieval Christianity in its most popular forms' and led 'a campaign that within ten years abolished late medieval religiosity': bold or even, arguably, misleading claims, yet ones that, from one point of view, need to be made if the historical role and justification for the hero of this collection is to be upheld.

In other words, if the condition of medieval and post-medieval Church were not irremediable, what possible justification could the Lutheran revolution possess?

UNIVERSITY OF LANCASTER

MICHAEL MULLETT

The reformation of the keys. Confession, conscience, and authority in sixteenth-century Germany. By Ronald K. Rittgers. Pp. xii + 318 incl. 5 figs. Cambridge, MA–London: Harvard University Press, 2004. £32.95. 0 674 01176 7
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905814381

Penance and the sacrament of confession developed as integral practices in medieval Catholic piety, and were the outward visible signs of the authority vested in the Church to remit and bind sins. Ronald Rittgers records how the city of Nuremberg, as it adopted the Lutheran Reformation, wrestled with the transposing of this practice from a Catholic to an Evangelical key. He outlines the three main schools of thought on the respective roles of penitent and confessor in the High Middle Ages – the contritionist school identified with Lombard, where the confessor showed the penitent what had already been granted through contrition; the attritionist school, associated with Aquinas, in which absolution perfected the imperfect sorrow of the penitent; and the absolutionist school, affiliated with Duns Scotus, where the emphasis was on the priestly absolution. Devotional writings such as the *Mirror of confession* laid stress on the penitent, while other works stressed the role of the priest. The power of the keys is summed up as ‘hope of forgiveness, fear of damnation’. Rittgers then traces the spread of Luther’s views on penance, to which for a time he gave sacramental status. The old contrition, confession and satisfaction model was replaced by an absolution, grace and faith model. The views of Luther were espoused by Hektor Pömer and Georg Pessler, and Andreas Osiander, all holding appointments in Nuremberg. By 1524 Nurembergers had stopped going to confession, being convinced of Luther’s attacks on the Catholic practice, but ignoring what he said about an Evangelical practice. In May 1524 Wolfgang Volprecht celebrated the first German mass in the imperial city; it opened with a general confession of sin read by the priest on behalf of himself and the congregation. Shortly after, new forms were adopted which did not have a general confession. A struggle then ensued between those who were content with a general confession in the liturgy, and those such as Osiander who wanted some form of private confession instead. The clergy still wanted the Church to hold and exercise the keys, particularly to enforce moral discipline, whereas the city council wished to resist giving such power to the clergy. Both sides appealed directly to Luther and Wittenberg, and Luther’s replies satisfied neither side. Part of the problem Rittgers rightly identifies is the ambiguity in Luther’s own views on excommunication (the Ban), and private confession. Osiander saw the conflict in Luther, and attempted to solve the problem for Nuremberg, and found himself in total opposition to most of his colleagues and the city council. A provisional 1528 Brandenburg–Nuremberg church order was replaced in 1533, but both required communicants to register with their pastors and undergo examination of faith and conduct before admission to the lord’s supper. The rite did not contain a general confession and absolution, and when asked for an explanation, a small group headed by Osiander argued that general confession and absolution were completely useless and unscriptural. Many laypeople came to view Osiander as an evangelical

pope, finding visual expression in the 1539 *Schembartlauf*, a traditional parade, in which the float depicting hell had an actor representing Osiander. During the Augsburg Interim, private confession was re-established along with some other Catholic practices, though an evangelical form was drawn up by Johannes Forster. The Interim was repudiated in 1553, but the evangelical order of private confession continued alongside general confession. The latter was a check on clerical zeal, and the city's confessors were instructed to be gentle and patient with laypeople who found the 'new' practice of private confession and examination difficult. Rittgers notes that this balance was essential to the reformation of the keys in Nuremberg, and brought the city into line with most other Lutheran cities. This is a well researched and useful account of the struggle to fill the vacuum created by the abolition of the Catholic practice.

YALE DIVINITY SCHOOL

BRYAN D. SPINKS

Heinrich Bullingers europäische Kirchenpolitik. By Andreas Mühling. (Zürcher Beiträge zur Reformationgeschichte, 19.) Pp. 371. Bern: Peter Lang, 1999/2000. £36 (paper). 3 906765 89 X; 0514 8693

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905824388

Heinrich Bullinger, as much as anyone, has been short-changed in standard narratives of the Reformation, anchored as they are in nineteenth-century constructions of the solitary hero. His continuing relegation to a secondary or tertiary role is surprising in the face of a considerable body of evidence which testifies to his 'influence' with Calvin as well as a number of English Reformers, and to his energetic engagement internationally in the cause of reform. Mühling's study, which was his *Habilitationsschrift*, addresses this imbalance in the historiography, seeking to bring Bullinger forward, not so much as Huldrych Zwingli's formally appointed successor in Zurich, nor even as a secondary voice in the Reformed tradition, but as an international force in the shaping of the Reformation. Mühling pursues that argument not by tracing Bullinger's influence on Calvin or Cranmer, which others have done, but by examining Bullinger's own sense of his agency for the cause of reform, as recorded in his diary, and Bullinger's prodigious correspondence. Mühling's study is a welcome corrective to the weight of the scholarship which divides between political history and the history of theology, in detailing Bullinger's efforts to nurture, encourage, foster, even cajole reform in Württemberg, Hesse, the Pfalz, Cologne, England, France, Poland and Lithuania. The one weakness arises out of that divide which reaches back to Ranke: Mühling's primary sources are Bullinger's letters, and his sense of the recipients lacks the subtle differentiations of political landscape that Thomas A. Brady delineated in *Turning Swiss*, now twenty years ago. That said, the careful charting of the stunning geographic breadth of Bullinger's vision, and the welcome corrective of a notion of 'ecclesiastical politics', are valuable and important contributions.

UNIVERSITY OF WISCONSIN-MADISON

LEE PALMER WANDEL

Calvin's Christology. By Stephen Edmondson. Pp. xiii + 248. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004. £45 (cloth), £17.99 (paper). o 521 83371 X; o 521 54154 9 JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905834384

This is a fine treatment of Calvin's Christology, persuasive and suggestive. The author wisely adopts the idea of Mediator as his controlling theme, for Calvin's interest in Christ is not primarily metaphysical or speculative: Christ brings us to God. Edmondson justifies this approach in his first chapter, drawing on Calvin's debate with Stancaró, and (in chapter ii) discusses Christ as the Mediator of the covenant of grace, stressing Calvin's interest in the narrative history of the covenant. However, the idea that for Calvin the covenant (and the law) begins with Abraham, all before that being 'prologue' (p. 52), is questionable. To be sure, Calvin is no covenant theologian in the style, say, of Herman Witsius. Nevertheless Christ is the last Adam, and the Decalogue is not simply the rule of the Church's life (p. 49) but an expression of God's eternal law (as, rather ironically, the author notes later on (p. 155). Whatever changes the *Institutes* went through in its various editions, the argument pattern of the Epistle to the Romans was not lost sight of. Three central chapters explain and defend Calvin's 'narrative' approach to Christology in terms of Christ's work as prophet, priest and king. The final chapter considers the understanding of Christ's person that underlines this understanding of his work. The author stresses that for Calvin, in the union involved in the Incarnation, neither the divine person nor human nature are diminished.

FIFIELD

PAUL HELM

La Pensée militaire de Zwingli. By Olivier Bangerter. (Zürcher Beiträge zur Reformationsgeschichte, 21.) Pp. vii + 287. Bern: Peter Lang, 2003. £30 (paper). 3 906769 18 6; 0514 8693 JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905844380

Huldrych Zwingli: the reformer with the Bible in one hand and the sword in the other. At least this is how the nineteenth-century statue portrays him at the Zürich *Wasserkirche*. That Zwingli lost his life on the battlefield always opened him and his work up to critical questions about the relationship of Reformed theology and armed force. Oliver Bangerter's book looks into this question to a degree unattained up to now; and this from a theological as well as military-historical perspective. In the first part of the book, the author describes Zwingli's statements on the nature and services of mercenaries. In the second he examines in context Zwingli's various 'military writings' composed between 1524 and 1531. In a third, more systematic segment, Bangerter finally outlines the bottom line of Zwingli's thinking on war, placing it in connection with the traditional teaching of a 'just war', and enquires about coherence and incoherence in the Zürich reformer's thinking. With this Bangerter contradicts (older) Zwingli interpretations which wanted to see in him a theological power politician, who does not retreat from force, and in this differing markedly, for instance, from Luther. A clear delineation is made too with attempts to use Zwingli as a 'Christian model' for a military policy. The author's thorough analysis of Zwingli's much-discussed paper of early August 1531, 'Was Zürich und Bernn not ze betrachten sye' (Z vi/5, 222–49), is commendable, yet at the same time is set in the context of Zwingli's broader thought process. With this, it will be put into

perspective, but not put aside. Zwingli's thinking on war is coherent, according to Bangerter, though it must be seen, on the one hand, as in tension with his general assessment of war as an evil and an expression of human sin, and on the other as a required necessity in defence of freedom, forced through external constraints. An 'équilibre délicat' (p. 240). 'Was Zürich und Bernn', however, is unusual and therefore not representative of Zwingli's thinking – it contains sentences which Zwingli never should have written (p. 278). Bangerter confirms, convincingly, that Zwingli did not intend a 'religious war', but that he was concerned about the freedom to preach and spread the Gospel. The importance of the concept of freedom is actually what differentiates Zwingli from traditional teachings on the 'just war'. A different tension which Bangerter does not systematically elaborate, but which is indicated, should nevertheless also be noted: it concerns Zwingli's theological argumentation with the Bible. Zwingli's condemnation of war as evil and a sin is based on a Christologically-influenced understanding of God. But his understanding of history – an understanding from his own time – opens the way, theologically, for a justification of the military campaign against the 'Inneren Orte' of the Swiss confederation. It was something he took for granted – that God punishes disobedient peoples with war, just as texts in the Old Testament suggest. He had feared divine punishment for the Swiss in 1522 because of the mercenary praxis, and had announced it. With that, at least, the first step was taken to, in the end, see oneself in the role of punisher and thus to justify it.

ZÜRICH

PETER OPITZ

Reformation in Britain and Ireland. By Felicity Heal (The Oxford History of the Christian Church.) Pp. xvii + 568. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2003. £80.

0 19 826924 2

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905854387

In this important addition to a distinguished series Felicity Heal provides us with a detailed map with which we can steer our way through the complex political and institutional history of reformation in the British archipelago during the sixteenth century. As is expected from her previous work Heal has provided us with an up-to-date account of recent scholarship in which the detail, often rich and colourful, is never allowed to distract our view of the overall terrain. That territory is viewed chiefly from the records of central and diocesan government, and in trying to treat such a large subject decisions about perspective and direction, as well as terminus, were no doubt essential if the journey was to be completed successfully in the space allowed. But what is the nature of the journey we are taken on? The title, in which Reformation has lost its definite article, offers some clue, suggesting that religious change was part of some larger process of reform, emanating from the top and comprising such elements of modernisation as an increased involvement of the state in the lives of the people, and the emergence of a professionally trained clergy. To that degree the history of the Reformation is subsumed within, but not subservient to, other secular trends in politics and society. This is demonstrated most effectively in an excellent chapter on the 'Politics of reform 1530–1558', where the impact of the complex shifts in the balance of power both within the English and Scottish realms and in relations between them demonstrates the contingency of much reformation

policy, as it came to be expressed in law. If the definite article has gone, so also has the recently fashionable plural, 'reformations', at least for most of the book. When the plural does enter the discussion, at p. 353, it is in the context of differing national experiences rather than in the contested nature either of reception, as in Haigh's work, or of interpretation, as in Collinson's. How successful was reformation, and how was it understood? There is little about those wars of religion in the street which divided communities such as Cranbrook and Colchester from the 1530s, or Edinburgh and Waterford later in the century, though there is some discussion of the parish, and especially the parish church, in the final chapter. In this book, when reformation came it was forged not in the street but through debate at court, parliament or the universities, and was implemented in the nations by the landowners and the senior clergy or, in the case of Ireland, largely non-native crown officials. This is, of course, a true account in so far as it goes, and makes the important, and often forgotten, point that reformation was not only about religion, but also about ecclesiology. Indeed, in churches which saw discipline as one of the marks of a true Church one could argue that ecclesiology was the central issue, and in the light of the disputes over the Admonition in England or the Books of Discipline in Scotland recounted by Heal that would appear to be so. Therefore, the importance of ecclesiological argument in the development of political thought in both Elizabethan England and Jacobean Scotland and in the years following the union of crowns makes this somewhat traditional emphasis a timely one.

Mention of the union of crowns brings us to the other planning issue, the question of terminus. It is true that 'in 1603 three generations of English, Welsh and Scottish parishioners had been regularly participant in the reformed liturgies' (p. 426), but we might ask what exactly did participation entail, and how regular was 'regularly'? Both Keith Thomas and R. A. Marchant, writing from very different perspectives, have stressed the limitations of the 'outreach' of public worship, Marchant also stating that when prosecuted for disciplinary offences barely 30 per cent of defendants bothered to appear before the Chester courts (p. 459). The accounts of William Harrison in England and William Cowper in Scotland are deployed to demonstrate the efficacy and popularity of harmonious public worship towards the end of the century, but these descriptions, no doubt accurate, may also have been written with a prescriptive purpose; to show to less well regulated communities the social and spiritual benefits of properly ordered public worship. They suggest that the case still needed to be made, and not only to the godless but also to the godly, for public worship was a much contested area among the reformed. In some experiments, as at Northampton in 1571, where worship was timed so that masters and servants could attend separate services, social differentiation rather than integration was reflected in its practice. This emphasis on public worship meant that, as the work of Eamon Duffy has also shown, 'the Reformation had stripped the churches of alternatives to parish ministry' (p. 429), but the godly laity and clergy proved inventive in creating their own alternatives, exercises, fasts, conventicles and lectures by combination. Such 'voluntary religion' only makes its appearance as a category on p. 471, perhaps because these initiatives had their heyday in the early seventeenth century, and so command little space in an account which ends in 1603, but that itself indicates the difficulty in choosing that date. One could argue that, by 1603, reformation had become established but yet remained to be endorsed, and by concentrating on the process of establishment questions relating to reception are

moved to the margins of the discussion. Establishment too might not have been so smooth, or necessarily followed national lines. Tobie Matthew at Durham, grappling with the recusant gentry of Northumberland and the conservative alderman of Newcastle, and with few preachers willing to take on the task in the bleak and impoverished borders, might have likened his situation more to that of Archbishop Loftus in Dublin than to those of his episcopal colleagues in the southern province. To many, the obstacles to evangelising the upland regions of the north were not that different from those in Ireland, or so it seemed to the Puritan John Shawe, who found himself among the peasantry of Cartmel in the 1630s.

Felicity Heal has written the definitive account of the establishment of Protestant church order in England, Wales and Scotland, and of its failure in Ireland, of how a professional clergy was trained and funded to service that order, and how the cultural products needed to sustain it, catechisms, texts and furnishings, began to be produced. How secure that order was in each country, and how it was interpreted locally, are questions which lie largely outside the scope of the study. This is a consequence of the chronology chosen, for these were tested in the following decades. It is perhaps too much to ask of one already lengthy book, but the absence of discussion of the years up the wars in three kingdoms, which many saw, and some still see, as the legacy of the events described here, leaves one with a sense of unfinished business. That may, of course, have been Heal's point and, if so, it is well made.

UNIVERSITY OF YORK

W.J. SHEILS

The Gospel and Henry VIII. Evangelicals in the early English Reformation. By Alec Ryrie. (Cambridge Studies in Early Modern British History.) Pp. xix + 310 incl. 2 figs and 4 tables. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003. £45. 0 521 82343 9

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905864383

Alec Ryrie has produced a fascinating work which will undoubtedly soon become required reading for anyone interested in the early history of the English Reformation. *The Gospel and Henry VIII: evangelicals in the early English Reformation* is a detailed religious history of the years c. 1538–47. This has always been a fraught period for historians of the English Reformation. As Ryrie points out, the first person to try and make sense of Henry VIII's religious policy in these years, the Protestant historian John Foxe, not only got it largely wrong but has had an undue influence on later histories of the period. For example, since Foxe wrote his *Acts and monuments* the Act of Six Articles has been viewed by historians as a disaster for English Protestantism. Recently revisionist historians have turned Foxe's negative view of this act on its head and have praised it as a conservative anti-Protestant measure. Ryrie, however, argues that the Act of Six Articles was 'a signal that the regime was going to work to ensure that sacramentarianism, a marginal belief in England at the time, would remain so' (p. 39). It was this that produced the relatively low-key evangelical response to the act. As Ryrie points out, by the time Foxe was writing all Protestants had indeed rejected transubstantiation, but in 1539 this was not the case. This also means, however, that it is inappropriate to see this act as evidence of Henry turning away from the religious policies of the 1530s. In many ways *The Gospel and Henry VIII* exemplifies the strengths but also the weaknesses of the present state of

post-revisionist understandings of the English Reformation. It is an insightful and nuanced study which, however, seems strangely tentative at times in terms of its scope and analysis. It is indicative that a key issue in terms of Reformation historiography, the question of terminology, is relegated to a prefatory 'note on the text'. This is, however, a minor quibble when considered against the strengths of this volume. In particular, a real triumph of Ryrie's book is its new and insightful approach to well-known historical documents and events. While reading in *The Gospel and Henry VIII* I was constantly forced to reassess my understanding of Henry's religious policies and the nature of English evangelicalism in the period 1538–47. *The Gospel and Henry VIII* is an excellent work that sheds new light on a vital but neglected area of Tudor religious history.

KINGSTON UNIVERSITY

TOM BETTERIDGE

L'Église des français de Strasbourg (1538–1563). Rayonnement européen de sa liturgie et de ses psautiers. By Robert Weeda. (Collection d'études musicologiques, 94.) Pp. 173 incl. 11 figs. Baden-Baden–Bouxwiller: Valentin Koerner, 2004. €58 (paper). 3 87320 594 7

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S002204690587438X

This is a very useful summary of the influence and spread of the liturgy and psalter of the French church of Strasbourg throughout sixteenth-century Europe. In many respects it complements the author's previous study – *Le Psautier de Calvin: l'histoire d'un livre populaire au XVI^e siècle (1551–1598)* (Turnhout 2002). The first part of the book deals with Calvin's ministry in Strasbourg, his working relationship with Bucer, the educational influences of Sturm, and his provision of the French liturgy and metrical Psalms. The second part covers the work of Calvin's successors in Strasbourg (and in exile in England) – Brully, de Brès, Poullain, Garnier, Alexandre and Houbracque. The volume is a timely reminder that what is generally referred to as the 'Genevan' liturgy was essentially created in Strasbourg, and that around a quarter of both texts and melodies in the 'Genevan' psalter originated in Strasbourg rather than Geneva. Two useful appendices detail this Strasbourg content of the Genevan psalter, and a bibliography lists the relevant literature, though here one notices the omission of some recent English publications.

The influence of Strasbourg on Geneva can easily be overlooked and we can be grateful to Robert Weeda for making this significant review of the basic information.

WESTMINSTER CHOIR COLLEGE OF RIDER UNIVERSITY

ROBIN A. LEAVER

A history of the University of Cambridge, II: 1546–1750. By Victor Morgan (with Christopher Brooke). Pp. xxii + 613 incl. 30 plates, 1 fig. and 9 tables. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004. £85. 0 521 35059 X
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905884386

This second volume, extending from the mid-sixteenth century to the reign of George II, completes the four-volume *History of the University of Cambridge* under the general editorship of Christopher Brooke. The core of the book derives from the researches of Victor Morgan, the principal author, who concentrates largely upon the relations of Cambridge University with the State, the Church, the court,

parliament and the 'country' or provincial gentry who provided both patronage and a constant flow of undergraduates. In addition, Morgan traces the important constitutional changes within the university from the late sixteenth century which saw power transferred from the regents to the Heads of Houses and the authority of college heads increased over their members. This centralising of power within the university was, to some degree, a reflection of the centralising processes of Tudor and Stuart governments. Morgan examines the methods by which state control was intensified during this period. Especially noteworthy is the extensive use made of royal mandates, often in contravention of college statutes, for the filling of fellowships and masterships, a practice that caused much opposition, wrangling and confusion. The crucial importance of having influential contacts and patrons at court is given well-merited emphasis. While Morgan has added considerably to our knowledge of the university's links with the State, Church and the community at large, and his oft-repeated assertion that it was, in a variety of ways, a microcosm of that wider world is soundly based, the text is, at times, overburdened with similar case histories and would have benefited from a measure of judicious pruning. In exemplary fashion, Christopher Brooke shows how the evolutionary history of the university may be delineated, to some degree, through its university and college buildings. Both authors furnish much useful information on the tutorial system, Brooke concentrating mainly on the period after 1640 when student numbers at Cambridge fell with a consequent decline in the ranks of the tutors. Brooke also has interesting commentary on the undergraduate syllabus, an opaque subject upon which tutors' diaries and manuals yield more elucidation than does the statutory evidence. The intellectual life of Cambridge in the period is monitored by Brooke through the careers of a galaxy of scholars, particular attention being accorded to Robert Brady, Newton and Richard Bentley. Given the enormity of the subject, this volume has been constructed upon a selective and thematic basis and cannot offer a definitive view of every aspect of the university's history as it evolved over two hundred years. The range and scholarship are impressive, and the vast amount of data here encapsulated adds substantially to our understanding of many of the essential strands of Cambridge's development. It is not quite accurate to assume that the King's Hall was still part of the chapel royal in the sixteenth century (p. 8), and it is perhaps too strong to state that Sir William Dugdale and his circle, despite obvious shortcomings, had 'little critical sense' with regard to medieval documentation (p. 490). These are minor observations indeed. This volume will undoubtedly serve as a vital source of reference for the long-term future for all scholars with a professional interest in the selection of themes here examined and also for the informed general reader with a penchant for university history.

UNIVERSITY OF LIVERPOOL

ALAN B. COBBAN

Der Ende der Reformation. Magdeburgs Herrgotts Kanzlei (1548–1551/2). By Thomas Kaufmann. (Beiträge zur historischen Theologie, 123.) Pp. xvii + 665 incl. frontispiece. Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr (Paul Siebeck), 2003. €119. 3 16 148171 2; 0340 6741
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905894382

Between 1548 and 1551/2, the north German city of Magdeburg emerged as the beacon of Protestant hope: altogether 360 tracts rolled out of its presses, attacking

the provisions of the Interim imposed by Charles v, lambasting emperor and pope, criticising those Protestant theologians who were ready to compromise with the emperor by advocating a theology of 'indifference' in regard to certain ecclesiastical teachings and usages, and savaging the Council of Trent as an act of the AntiChrist, heralding in the last age of history before the final judgement. The 'Herrgotts Kanzlei', as Magdeburg's publicist campaign came to be called, mobilised Protestant opinion in defence of Luther's legacy and argued fiercely for an uncompromisingly pure identity of the reformed. A handful of exiled Protestant theologians who sought refuge in Magdeburg in the wake of the defeat of the Schmalkadic League produced the bulk of the polemical tracts; Matthias Flacius Illyricus alone was responsible for more than 40 per cent of the literary output and gave an imprint to Luther's legacy, defined in opposition to Melancthon, Osiander and other evangelical theologians deemed too weak or too willing to compromise with the forces of the AntiChrist. An intense expectation of the Apocalypse united magistrates, theologians and printers in Magdeburg to give these years a watershed character: it marked the end of the hopeful and advancing years of the evangelical movement, marked by the death of Luther in 1546, and announced a darker epoch of struggles with the AntiChrist in defending the heritage of reform. Kaufmann's detailed study recounts this familiar story by analysing the work of the printers, publicists and magistrates. He offers readers interpretation of selected texts and an exhaustive bibliographic list of works published in those heroic years of Protestant resistance.

PENNSYLVANIA STATE UNIVERSITY

R. PO-CHIA HSIA

Nachbauten des Heiligen Grabes in Jerusalem in der Zeit von Gegenreformation und Barock. By Michael Rudiger. Pp. 276 incl. 114 plates. Regensburg: Schnell & Steiner, 2003. €66. 3 7954 1600 0

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905904387

The Holy Sepulchre has naturally occupied a central place in Christian pilgrimage since the Middle Ages. In 1555, after a long period of neglect and decay, the burial place of Jesus was marked by a brand-new building in baroque style. This volume, however, is less concerned with the original site in Jerusalem (on which there is a short introductory chapter) and more occupied with the many replicas that sprang up in Central Europe during the Catholic Reformation or Age of Baroque. Indeed the author has found just under a hundred such shrines in Austria, Bohemia, southern Germany and Poland. The Holy Sepulchre is thus a rival to that other great Counter-Reformation form of replica-shrine, the Holy House of Loreto, of which there were an estimated fifty-one in the Czech lands and fifty-two in Germany. Not that there was any competition involved. It was quite common at a Marian shrine to have a Calvary Mount, such as the one at Mariazell in Austria, or a replica of the Holy Stairs, as at Mother of God Mountain in East Bohemia. Generously illustrated with photographs, ground plans and elevations, this book is essential reading for students of pilgrimage and popular devotion as well as those interested in baroque architecture.

ST MARY'S COLLEGE,
STRAWBERRY HILL

MARIA DOWLING

The politics of piety. Franciscan preachers during the wars of religion, 1560–1600. By Megan C. Armstrong. (Changing Perspectives on Early Modern Europe.) Pp. vii + 278. Rochester, NY: University of Rochester Press/Woodbridge: Boydell & Brewer, 2004. £50. 1 58046 175 1; 1542 3905
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905914383

This book contributes to the growing debate within the historiography of the French wars of religion regarding the upholders of Catholic orthodoxy. Whereas Protestant critique of traditional religion has received its fair share of scholarly attention, much is yet to be learned from its defenders. Megan Armstrong demonstrates that Franciscans were amongst its stronger advocates, through their privileged status within the Church, and their access to the pulpit and printing presses. Little is known about the regular clergy during this period, and *Politics of piety* makes a welcome addition to Jean Marie Le Gall's continental study also published in 2004. Armstrong's starting point is the conspicuous involvement of the Franciscans in the radical movement of the League in the 1580s that ultimately ensured that the French monarchy would remain Catholic in the seventeenth century. Although the specificity of the Franciscan view of the body politic in this period may be slightly overstated (by comparison to members of the secular clergy) it makes a strong case for the Franciscans' contribution to the debate regarding early modern kingship. This thesis has the great merit of retracing the roots of the order's involvement in the League in its distinctive medieval tradition and its place within French society from before the beginning of the Wars of Religion. As is demonstrated in respective chapters, its nominal papal patronage gave it an ambiguous and difficult position within the strongly Gallican Church, which was turned to its advantage at a time when the Council of Trent was hotly contested by the French clergy. Indeed, one of the stronger arguments is that the French monks did not refrain from taking advantage of the 'liberties of the Gallican Church' in invoking secular arbitration in disputes with papal envoys. In asserting their independence from both the Gallican Church and the pope, the Franciscans were ideally placed as arbiters of the religious disputes that plagued the war years. Moreover, their privileged position as preachers and reformers, strengthened by their involvement with the Faculty of Theology of the University of Paris, gave them unparalleled access to lay piety that informed their involvement in politics. Contrary to what may be expected, Franciscans were ardent reformers and did not balk at the prospect of using the vernacular in print, as well as in sermons, in promoting their very traditional views of society. Characteristically of radical Catholicism in this period, their frequent criticism of the crown ensured their reputation for impartiality that made them powerful and much sought after brokers of Catholic orthodoxy amongst the laity. *Politics of piety* contributes to refining the picture of traditional religion by showing that, although they owed a great deal to their medieval roots, Franciscans were not slavish followers of papal supremacy and recognised the importance of the Gallican claims to spiritual independence that arguably ensured the continuity of the Catholic Church, as it was orchestrated by the French monarchy in the seventeenth century.

From penitence to charity. Pious women and the Catholic Reformation in Paris. By Barbara B. Diefendorf. Pp. xii + 340. New York–Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004. £36.50. 0 19 509582 0
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S002204690592438X

The first achievement of this refreshing book is to return to the forefront of scholarly minds the forgotten and overshadowed Parisian women who drove Catholic revival in their city and beyond during and after the Wars of Religion. Gender and women have been prominent topics in evaluations of early modern Catholicism for several decades, but Diefendorf resolutely takes issue with what are now the tired, and often fragile, judgements made by many of their exponents. The second achievement of her book, therefore, is to dare to criticise revisionist history that sweepingly interprets ‘the Catholic Reformation as the product of a misogynist clergy intent on controlling women and locking them behind high convent walls’ (p. 246). Diefendorf presents a persuasive argument to support her claim and offers gripping evidence that runs contrary to the prevailing historical interpretation. The women whose lives leap from this book were fundamentally involved in the growth of religious orders, spiritual devotions, teaching and charity, and used their material resources, common sense and the wisdom of experience to shape the religious practice and beliefs of their society. Undoubtedly, female piety altered between the League years and the Fronde. Diefendorf suggests that harsh physical ascetic practices and concentration on the Passion were overtaken by inner mortification, moderate asceticism and an emphasis on the image of Christ as friend and teacher of the poor. While Diefendorf’s interpretation of late sixteenth-century mysticism occasionally lacks acute theological subtlety, she is surefooted in revealing this particular spiritual transformation. It became particularly evident in the growth of semi-contemplative religious orders, uncloistered religious communities and lay charitable initiatives. However, Diefendorf argues that many women were not seeking an active apostolate or an end to cloistering, and that their preferred model of religious life was frequently what they and church tradition considered to be its most perfect form: enclosed contemplation. It is clear that some Parisian communities only reneged on enclosure when economic factors forced them to do so. In those cases, an end to enclosure was preferred to closure and dissolution. Throughout these vicissitudes in the popularity of specific forms of religious life, women led: from Barbe Acarie to Marie Bonneau, they established religious communities and confraternities, directed construction work and budgets, educated children and young women, nursed and organised welfare schemes. With male clerical endorsement, they even undertook catechesis and led retreats; Diefendorf is quite correct to highlight the fascinating spiritual authority of women like Acarie and Louise de Marillac and of those whose names are less familiar to readers of early modern history. As she admits, Paris was perhaps unique in possessing women who instigated, co-ordinated and led its religious life because it had the highest concentration of educated, wealthy and cultured women in continental Europe. We simply do not yet know whether its experience was peculiar to it. However, until more historians follow Diefendorf’s path, we will not know. In the meantime, we cannot continue to dismiss the Catholic Reformation as controlling and we cannot continue to belittle its women as victims.

William of Orange and the revolt of the Netherlands, 1572–84. By K. W. Swart (introductory chapters Alastair Duke and Jonathan I. Israel; ed. R. P. Fagel, M. E. H. N. Mout and H. F. K. van Nierop; trans. J. C. Grayson). (St Andrews Studies in Reformation History.) Pp. xix + 280 incl. frontispiece, 2 maps and 2 figs. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2003 (first publ. in Dutch 1994). £50. 0 7546 3224 5

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905934386

This remarkable book has a remarkable prehistory. When Koenraad Swart died suddenly in 1992 he had been working for almost twenty-five years on a biography of William of Nassau, prince of Orange (1533–84). A few months earlier he had sent several chapters covering the last twelve years of the prince's life to two of his former pupils, Alastair Duke and Jonathan Israel, asking them for comments. After his death, inspection of Swart's manuscripts revealed many folders of notes and drafts for earlier chapters, but none in publishable form. Since, however, Orange's life down to 1569 had already been covered by Felix Rachfahl's *Wilhelm von Oranien und der niederländische Aufstand* (The Hague 1906–24), while Robert Fruin's substantial article of 1897, 'Prins Willem I in het jaar 1570' (reprinted in his *Verspreiden Geschriften*, ii, The Hague 1900, 111–66) took the story almost to the point where Swart's chapters began, his literary executors decided to publish just the completed chapters. They commissioned introductory essays from Israel on Swart's career as a historian, and from Duke on how the surviving fragments suggested Swart viewed the prince's life from 1533 to 1572. Finally, Raymond Fagel revised, checked, corrected and completed the chapters covering the last twelve years. The volume duly appeared in Dutch (*Willem van Oranje en de Nederlandse Opstand, 1572–84*. The Hague 1994); of this the work under review is an excellent English translation that corrects some errors in the original.

Swart possessed an uncanny knack of linking manuscript and printed sources to explain the prince's paramount contribution to the survival of the Dutch revolt, but he pulled no punches. Besides the well-known attempts to assassinate Orange (pp. 32, 180, 246, 282–6) Swart sets the prince's less-known sponsorship of plots to assassinate others (pp. 108–9). He also describes his sex life (which involved bigamy, adultery and marriage to a former abbess: pp. 79–83) and his occasional binge drinking (p. 147). By the end of Orange's life the Dutch cause lay in ruins and Swart endorses the verdict of a close collaborator that had the prince lived longer he would have been blamed for the further losses in 1584–5 'and that it was therefore a good thing that he had not lived to see these disasters' (p. 256).

Such level-headed insights arose from Swart's own background. After reading law as an undergraduate, he studied history at Leiden University under the formidable Johan Huizinga, who helped him always to situate the Dutch past in an international context – a perspective reinforced by Swart's two years as a Dutch representative at the Nuremberg War Crimes Tribunal. After publishing his thesis on French history (in English), he taught in various campuses of the United States for sixteen years and for another seventeen years held the Chair of Dutch History and Institutions in London before retiring to the Netherlands. His unique personal history informs this remarkable book, which is both the best and the most revisionist account of the life of William the Silent to appear for almost a century.

Il processo di canonizzazione di Caterina Vigri (1586–1712). Edited by Serena Spanò Martinelli. (Caterina Vigri. La Santa e la Città, 4.) Pp. xxvi + 872 incl. 1 ill. Florence: SISMEL/Edizioni del Galluzzo, 2003. €85 (paper). 88 8450 069 9 JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905944382

Caterina Vigri (sometimes referred to as Caterina de' Vigri, or more commonly as Caterina di Bologna), was born in Bologna in 1413. Her family moved to Ferrara when she was a child. There Caterina became briefly (1422/24–6) lady-in-waiting to Margherita, daughter of Niccolò III d'Este until the latter's marriage. A good Latinist and writer of humanist script as well as an accomplished painter, miniaturist and player of the viol, Caterina might herself have expected to make a good marriage and enjoy the life of the d'Este court. Instead, she entered a lay community directed by Lucia Mascheroni, before a spiritual crisis led her to join the observant branch of the Poor Clares in 1431. In 1456 she returned to Bologna as abbess of the newly founded convent of Corpus Domini where she died in 1463. Outside her native city she is known principally, if at all, as author of that Renaissance vernacular classic *Le sette armi spirituali* (first printed in 1475; translated into Latin in 1522 and then into French, Portuguese, English and German by the end of the sixteenth century), a kind of interior autobiography, which was addressed, in the first instance, to other members of her community. There appears to have been a very early concerted campaign of copying it by the nuns which ensured wide diffusion in manuscript. The first official recognition of her cult occurred in 1524 with papal permission that the day of her death might be celebrated liturgically by her community. This was followed by the first attempts on the part of Paolo Casanova, the nuns' vicar, with the support of the cardinal-archbishop of Bologna, Gabriele Paleotti, to obtain official recognition of her *fama sanctitatis* in 1586–91. The immediate cause of this initiative was the revision of the (arch)diocese's saints' offices, which the introduction of revised liturgical books as the standard for the whole Church, beginning with the Roman breviary (1568), had made necessary the length and breadth of the Roman Catholic world, (and which in the case of Bologna were composed by no less a scholar than Carlo Sigonio). However, it was not until the city of Bologna took up her cause that Caterina's trial made any headway, starting in 1645, but not leading to her eventual canonisation until 1712. The bulk of testimony in favour of her cause was collected in 1669–71, its 1,575 folios representing over 50 percent of the total documentation generated by her canonisation procedure (and reproduced here in their entirety on pp. 288–829). One of the several virtues of this scrupulously edited and well-produced volume by a scholar whose first publication on the saint was in 1971, is precisely its comprehensive nature, making it possible for the reader to appreciate the implications of reforms in canonisation procedure by Urban VIII, brought in by measures in 1624/25 and 1634, for those wishing to universalise a devotion particular to a specific region and order. The richness of circumstantial detail contained in the witnesses' depositions also serves to remind us of the value of such material, not only for the history of female religious and of the spirituality of the order, but also for wider themes such as the history of medicine, attitudes to the miraculous as well as the history of legal proof and argument. Here the inclusion of the thematic entries in the otherwise comprehensive 'indice dei nomi' (which also usefully includes the names of each witness), would have contributed yet further to the volume's utility.

The precisionist strain. Disciplinary religion and Antinomian backlash in Puritanism to 1638.

By Theodore Dwight Bozeman. Pp. xv + 349. Chapel Hill–London: University of North Carolina Press (for the Omohundro Institute of Early American History and Culture), 2004. £34.95. 0 8078 2850 5

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905954389

This book represents an ambitious attempt to re-evaluate the history of Puritan practical divinity in the period between the Reformation and the English civil wars. In the first half of the book, Bozeman examines the process through which English Puritans, despite their commitment to reformed conventions of predestination and justification by faith alone, came to embrace a profound moral rigorism, which on his account amounted to ‘the first great pietist venture in Protestant history’ (p. 63). He argues that a number of factors pushed Puritans in this direction, including a distinctively English focus on the motif of a Deuteronomic covenant (that is, a relationship in which God rewards or punishes his people and the English nation conditionally upon obedience or disobedience to his precepts); secondly, a growing concern about social disorder and instability, to which moral rigour and discipline provided a soothing antidote; thirdly, an almost sectarian tendency to use behavioural strictures to define the godly community as against, and in conflict with, an unregenerate broader society; the failure of the Presbyterian movement; and, lastly, the unacknowledged influence of Catholic Counter-Reformation piety. Together, these various factors combined to produce a pietistic regime of fierce moral oversight, in which the godly, both as individuals and as a group, were to tame their own behaviour with unflinching and fastidious precision. Marshalling a vast range of sources, Bozeman offers what is perhaps the best extended overview of this system to date, giving us a detailed account of the rituals of intensive self-scrutiny and daily devotion that characterised the godly life. Yet, as he argues, the resulting form of pastoral divinity amounted to something like a ‘worldly, informal monk- or nunhood of all believers’ (p. 103); this pietistic style pushed towards a bleak, almost ritualistic, legalism. Thus, the Protestant message of free grace (always defended formally by the godly) tended to give way to a religiosity of striving and incessant activity. Even more corrosively, by focusing all attention on the quest to root out sin, the system forced its practitioners into ‘arduous drills and ... mazes of introspection’ that led believers to immense anxiety, even despair (p. 127). The result was a violent anti-legal reaction, led by a series of ministers and laypeople who, by downplaying legal observances and arguing for a renewed focus on the immediacy and all-sufficiency of Christ’s death, came to be castigated as ‘Antinomians’. After briefly surveying the earliest, English proponents of anti-legal religion, Bozeman turns to New England, and the notorious Antinomian controversy of 1636–8, the subject of the second half of the book. He offers a sensitive reading of John Cotton’s theological development, for according to Bozeman’s account it was Cotton’s innovative and ‘semi-antinomian’ divinity that shaped the controversy (a claim that challenges scholars who see Anne Hutchinson, John Wheelwright or Henry Vane as the central players in the drama). The book closes with an analysis of the response of mainstream Massachusetts Puritans, who not only managed to suppress this emerging ‘counter-religion’ in their midst, but exploited it to strengthen communal solidarity in their fledgling colony. Bozeman has provided us with a judicious, forcefully argued, and enlightening interpretation of the development of the Puritan tradition; it will be

essential reading for students of Anglo-American religious history for many years to come.

STANFORD UNIVERSITY

DAVID COMO

Regulating religion and morality in the king's armies, 1639–1646. By Margaret Griffin. (History of Warfare, 22.) Pp. xxxii + 252. Leiden–Boston: Brill, 2004. €79. 90 04 13170 1; 1385 7827
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905964385

Margaret Griffin's book is a genuine and welcome attempt to redress the historiographical imbalance in studies of the role of religion in the origins and course of the English civil war. For, as she rightly points out, the preoccupation of many earlier historians with the importance of Puritanism as the ideology of the parliamentary cause has often blinded them to the fact that the royalists also possessed their own deeply-held religious convictions, centred around devotion to the pre-war Church of bishops and the Elizabethan Prayer Book. She is also right to highlight the depth of Charles I's personal religious commitment and his deep abhorrence of irreverence and immorality. But, while these central contentions of Griffin's book are certainly valid, they are also now generally well accepted amongst most experts in the field and, as well as pushing against an open door, her book contains a number of methodical flaws that reduce its authority and significance. While sound enough, her initial historiographical survey contains a number of arch comments that are a little too dismissive of the work of earlier historians. She also relies entirely for her sources on the printed military orders issued for the royalist armies, and makes no attempt to consider how they were received in practice or to assess what impact they had on the actual behaviour of the soldiers. Her comment that other historians have been guilty of similar myopia is a weak defence. She also sometimes reads too much into minor grammatical alterations in these orders, and makes claims from them which are difficult to substantiate. This reader was left puzzled, for example, about how she had found support for Christopher Haigh's reading of the progress of the English Reformation in the earl of Essex's military orders of 1599. The works cited in footnotes, moreover, are not always the most modern or authoritative. Had she used a wider range of sources and immersed herself more fully in the most recent historiography, Griffin's study could have proved a very valuable addition to the *corpus* of work on the religious context of the English civil war. As it is, while not without some merit, it constitutes a missed opportunity.

UNIVERSITY OF PLYMOUTH

CHRISTOPHER DURSTON

Early American Imprints, Series I. Evans, 1639–1800. Published by Readex, a division of NewsBank, inc., in cooperation with the American Antiquarian Society, Naples, FL, 2002.

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905974381

This on-line resource brings to your computer screen the full text of the more than 36,000 books, pamphlets and broadsides published in the British American colonies and the new United States between 1639 and 1800. It is a digital edition of what

will be familiar to many as the Evans Collection. It was Charles Evans who, a little over a century ago, began the task of compiling a chronological listing of all materials printed in America. Evans's goal was to bring the list down to 1820, but he died before completing the publications for 1799. Clifford Shipton of the American Antiquarian Society in Worcester, Massachusetts, completed the catalogue for 1799 and 1800 and then initiated a project that eventually reproduced the titles in a microfiche edition.

The collection is an invaluable resource. Beyond the price of most individuals, many will wish to lobby their libraries to subscribe to it. And because so many of the publications deal with matters of religion it will be an especially valuable tool for readers of this JOURNAL.

Scholars can easily search for a particular title. More important, they can search the entire collection for the appearance of a word or phrase in a title or in the actual texts. This feature has its limitations, since the search cannot anticipate all variant spellings or discussions of a topic using terms peculiar to the period. But the full-text search capacity can direct the researcher to passages in works that he or she might never have thought to investigate otherwise.

One can also browse by genre, subject, author, history of printing, place of publication or language of the printed material. Each of these areas is itself broken down into separate categories. 'Sermons' are one of the 'genre' categories, as are 'catechisms' and 'devotional literature'. Each is further divided, so that one can, for example, search for any one of twenty subcategories of sermons, including 'artillery election sermons', 'execution sermons' and 'Christmas sermons'. The 'subject' category includes both 'religion' and 'theology'. 'Religion' has 273 further subdivisions, from 'African American Churches' to 'youth, religious life', and including topics such as 'anti-Catholicism', 'martyrologies', 'omens', 'ordination' and 'Judaism'. 'Theology' has eighty-six subcategories, including 'justification', 'liberty of conscience', 'grace', 'predestination' and 'universalism'. Clicking on one of these areas will produce a list of works that the organisers of the project believe fit under that particular heading, and one can then examine the individual works. As with the search tool, you need to be aware that the system is not a substitute for using your own judgement. There is no guarantee that the individuals who assigned works to the various topical categories employed the criteria that you would have used. But there is no denying that used wisely the browsing function can bring to the user's attention works that he would not otherwise have been likely to encounter.

For those who prefer to download and print a document so as to carry it along and study it at leisure, the fact that only twenty-five pages of a text can be downloaded and printed at a time will be disappointing. If accessing the material from off campus the speed of one's link will largely define the quality of the experience. As with all such projects, the shortcomings of some of the original materials – such as bleed-throughs – are duplicated in the on-line version. But the ability to enlarge the images will help users to overcome the flaws of the originals.

Along with 'Early English Books on Line' this digital collection will make it far easier for scholars of the early modern period to expand their research, and it will enable undergraduates who would have a hard time gaining access to these texts to read and use them as well.

Jonathan Edwards at home and abroad. Historical memories, cultural movements, global horizons.

Edited by David W. Kling and Douglas A. Sweeney. Pp. xxiii + 330.

Columbia, SC: University of South Carolina Press, 2003. \$59.95. 1 57003 519 9

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905984388

Ecclesiastes xii.12 reads, 'Of making many books there is no end; and much study is a weariness of the flesh.' Although the maths does not exactly add up, American religious historians must be tempted to say that this verse 'goes double' for books about Jonathan Edwards, producing a proportionate amount of bodily weariness. The tricentennial in 2003 of the New England pastor's birth was the occasion for the most recent outpouring of scholarship. This included most notably George M. Marsden's *Jonathan Edwards: a life* (New Haven), Avihu Zakai's *Jonathan Edwards' philosophy of history: the reenchantment of the world in the age of Enlightenment* (Princeton), Robert E. Brown's *Jonathan Edwards and the Bible* and Amy Plantinga Pauw's *The supreme harmony of all: the Trinitarian theology of Jonathan Edwards*. No less significant was the publication of two more volumes in Yale's series of Jonathan Edwards's works, *Writings on the trinity, grace, and faith*, edited by Sang Hyun Lee, and *Sermons and discourses, 1739–1742*, edited by Harry S. Stout and Nathan O. Hatch with Kyle Farley, timed to coincide with festivities surrounding Edwards's birth. *Jonathan Edwards at home and abroad* stemmed from a conference in 2000 at the University of Miami on Edwards's legacy. Although held several years before the tricentennial, plans for publication clearly included taking advantage of anniversary-induced interest in Edwards. The book's aim is two-fold: first, to examine Edwards's legacy ('the first major collection of essays dedicated exclusively' to this, according to the editors [p. xiv]); and, second, to assess Edwards's influence outside the United States. These purposes address a gap that the surfeit of scholarship has shaped. The editors write that while 'we know a great deal ... about this otherworldly man ... we still know precious little about his roles in shaping this world' (p. xii). The result is a book whose achievement is not as satisfactory as its aim is noble or ambitious. In fact, the essays here suggest that sticking closer to Edwards will have more success in producing convincing arguments than extrapolations about his influence either through time or over space. This need not sap the resilience of those academics who continue to make sense of Edwards's thought. As this book indicates, the good news is that much more work on the man can be done (need is another question) since the Yale series includes only half of Edwards's written *corpus*. But this book also implies the bad news, at least for scholars, that Edwards's influence may not extend much beyond those devout Protestants who continue to read him for inspiration and instruction. The book is divided into three parts. The first explores the legacy of Edwards' ministry. It ranges from George M. Marsden's effort to encapsulate the Northampton minister's aims into a single sentence 'the divine and supernatural light' – to Michael McClymond's speculations on the influence Edwards's *History of the work of redemption* may have had – for McClymond it represents a 'cultural turn' in Edwards's thought – in mitigating the religious aggressiveness of nineteenth-century Protestant missionaries and twentieth-century fundamentalists. In between Catherine Breckus explores the weakening of Edwards's ideas about children in nineteenth-century American fiction, and Ava Chamberline, in one of the better pieces of technical Edwards scholarship here, reassesses gender relations in Northampton as the context for Edwards's approach to the young people in his parish. The second and third parts explore Edwards's influence on American culture and the world respectively. Examining his American legacy alone would be a

major undertaking. Consequently, these parts of the book have the feel of being a bit arbitrary in the topics selected for scrutiny. Somewhat predictably the second part skirts denominational and doctrinal history for the conventions prescribed by social history and features essays on economics (Mark Valeri), politics (James D. German), race (Charles Hambrick-Stowe), gender (Sharon Y. Kim) and popular culture (Amanda Porterfield). These chapters are well written and thoughtful but seem fairly far removed from Edwards and those aspects of American life most plausibly influenced by his thought and work. The third part, despite its purpose in covering the world, actually offers the more convincing scholarship on Edwards's influence than the second. David Bebbington provides invaluable service in documenting Edwards's reputation outside the United States, helpfully organising the subject in four different phases. D. Bruce Hindmarsh and Christopher W. Mitchell penetrate beneath Bebbington's overarching survey to unearth respectively Edwards's direct affiliations with dissenting English Protestants and with Scottish Presbyterians and evangelicals. Andrew Walls and Stuart Piggin, in two separate chapters, examine the influence of Edwards's theology for Protestant missions. The third part, and the book, conclude with a bibliographical essay by M. X. Lesser that traces the publication history of Edwards's works outside America. Overall, the book contains much that will be of interest to those scholars specialising in Edwards studies. For the rank-and-file religious historian the book is of limited value, even though informative in several respects. The limitation derives from the book's aim to cast wide the search for Edwards's legacy. The move to spread out in the process of discovery can often lead to spotting connections that are ultimately thin. The introduction to the book illustrates this defect when the editors try to claim Miami, Florida, the place of the original academic conference, as a site where Edwards's influence is evident. The material cited to show Edwards's impact is an early twentieth-century Congregationalist minister in south Florida who owned books, not by Edwards, but influenced by Edwardsian theology, and a conference attendee who was hoping to translate Edwards into Spanish for the Hispanic population in Miami and beyond. The struggle to find wider significance, however valuable and at times instructive, may actually indicate that Edwards studies have run out of gas. If so, books like this one may reveal as much about the difficulties confronting students of the great eighteenth-century theologian, as they do about the man himself.

INTERCOLLEGIATE STUDIES INSTITUTE,
WILMINGTON

D. G. HART

A glorious work in the world. Welsh Methodism and the international evangelical revival, 1735–1750. By David Ceri Jones. (Studies in Welsh History.) Pp. xiv + 386 incl. frontispiece. Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2004. £35. 0 7083 1870 3

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905994384

This book is an attempt to connect the Welsh Methodist revival of the eighteenth century to the wider international evangelical revivals in Europe and North America. Jones convincingly argues that the adherents of the Welsh revival were conscious of their role in a wider international religious movement – and one that was a daily part of their lives. Visits, letter-writing and publications were the media for this international contact, and Jones shows that participation in this network was

one of the attractions of the Welsh revival for the 'middling sort' in Wales. The centrepiece of this international network was the friendship and collaboration of Howell Harris and George Whitefield, and this tended to influence Welsh Methodism toward Calvinism and away from Wesley's Arminianism. But the attraction of Whitefield to America and Harris to England in the 1740s eroded the dual leadership they had exercised in England and Wales respectively. Jones argues that the experience of ordinary Welsh Methodists was strongly influenced by the personal narratives from overseas and particularly from North America. But Jones also shows how Harris's retirement from the leadership of the revival and the clear dominance of Wesley in England led the Welsh revival to lose its international focus; and the connection between Welsh Methodism and the wider international movement became a lost moment in religious history. There is much in Jones's book that is welcome and refreshing. He argues that the taproot of the Welsh revival lay in the Puritan and Pietist strands of Welsh Anglicanism; similarly he contests the trend of Methodist historiography to assert the uniqueness of the Welsh revival. Above all, while Jones shows the international links of the Welsh revival, he does not underestimate the variety and diversity of the revivalists' experience. This is a valuable study that shows, as have an increasing number of Anglican studies, that eighteenth-century Britons were far more conscious of the world beyond their immediate horizons than historians have hitherto allowed.

OXFORD BROOKES UNIVERSITY

WILLIAM GIBSON

Modern Catholic social teaching. The popes confront the industrial age, 1740–1958. By Joe Holland. Pp. xii + 404. New York–Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 2003. \$29.95 (paper). 0 8091 4225 2

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905214392

This is the first of a two-volume study of the development of Catholic social teaching as it takes shape in the papal encyclicals. It is especially helpful in two respects. First, by tracing the social tradition as far back as 1740 (when the practice of issuing encyclicals began), and second by setting social teaching in the context of the overall strategy pursued by the papacy in succeeding eras. This adds historical breadth and depth to the more usual dating of this aspect of papal teaching from Leo XIII's *Rerum novarum*. Social teaching is, and has been, neither disengaged pronouncement on social principles, nor a separate stream of teaching unconnected with broader Church concerns, but integral to how the papacy has sought to situate and re-situate the Church in relation to the kind of society emerging since the Enlightenment. Holland periodises it as pre-Leonine (Benedict XIV to Pius IX, 1740–1878), Leonine (Leo XIII to Pius XII, 1878–1958) and – in the second volume, before which we are denied the full picture and a full assessment – post-Leonine (John XXIII to John Paul II, 1958–2004). He credits Pope Leo with formulating the master strategy of modern Catholicism. In addition to promoting Thomism and making an opening to the modern democratic state while firmly rejecting Communism/socialism, Leo sought to reconnect with the conditions of economic life through social Catholicism. All this was aimed at preserving 'Christian civilisation' (and even an aristocratic culture) and securing a place for the Catholic Church as the pre-eminent, publicly recognised moral and religious authority. This was a move away from the pre-Leonine

wholesale rejection of the modern world which was judged to have arisen from the errors of the Reformation and the Enlightenment rejection of religion. Although that strategy, culminating in Pius IX's Syllabus of Errors, perished with that pope's death, Holland reckons that its critique of liberal modernity was not without its merits, and that it succeeded in preparing the ground for subsequent positions. Nevertheless, until Leo XIII the socio-political strategy of the papacy was compromised by its concern to preserve its political power in the papal states. Holland traces the internal curial debate between the two wings of 'politicians' and 'zealots' – in today's terms, the progressives and conservatives, although such categories are not adequate for describing what are, nevertheless, clear differences in the Roman approach to this day. The Leonine strategy held until the papacy of Pius XII, modified alternately to right and left by successive popes – sometimes unfortunately so by appearing to accommodate a corporatist-Fascist order – but was swept away when post-modern consciousness made its early appearance in the 1960s and by the gathering social forces around ecology and globalisation. That part of the narrative is left to the second volume. This first one is rich in detail, helpfully schematised and judicious in assessment – a very useful addition to the literature on Catholic social teaching.

ST EDMUND'S COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

JAMES SWEENEY

Community of the cross. Moravian piety in colonial Bethlehem. By Craig D. Atwood. Pp. xi + 283 incl. 7 figs. University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2004. \$37.50. 0 271 02367 8
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905224399

Zinzendorf's distinctive theology – radical mystical Pietism crossed with Luther's *theologia crucis*, anti-rationalist but not uninfluenced by the Enlightenment, focusing on Christ's blood and wounds and on mystical marriage with him – was even more remarkable for its realisation in the community life and liturgy of the Moravian Church which he created. Not the least of Atwood's achievements, in a book of far wider significance that its title might suggest, is to provide an accessible, succinct summary of that theology, locating it within its broader historical, theological and cultural context. He also demonstrates how it was reflected in the worship and social structures of Bethlehem, America's oldest Moravian settlement, and in attitudes to holy communion and death (both consummating the mystical marriage), the stages of life (even the unborn were organised in an 'embryo choir') and sexuality (highly valued, yet viewed as a threat). Atwood has helped to revolutionise Moravian historiography by showing that the so-called 'Sifting Time', which some scholars have expanded to cover the entire period of Zinzendorf's most creative output, was merely a brief period of excess in 1748–9 (though as a Moravian minister he largely draws a veil over what that might have involved). This study demonstrates that Zinzendorf's blood mysticism was not an aberration which can be disregarded as belonging to an expanded 'Sifting Time', but 'literally the life-blood' of his Moravian Church. His litany of the wounds continued to be a centrepiece of Moravian theology. Over half of the hymns in the 1753 hymnbook published in response to the 'Sifting Time' referred to the wounds and nearly half to mystical marriage with Christ, but only three mentioned his resurrection; changes to hymns

and litanies were largely cosmetic. In Bethlehem adoration of the wounds actually increased in the 1750s and the later 1750s saw worship of the Holy Spirit as Mother (another of Zinzendorf's themes) promoted. Bethlehem, Atwood shows, 'was a community dedicated to the blood and wounds of Christ'. Adoration of the wounds was far more important there than previous scholars have allowed: 'an entire Christian theology was focused intensely on a single compelling symbol'. In the context of communal life, he argues, 'adoration of the wounds ... served to sublimate a variety of personal needs and fears that would otherwise have destroyed the community': 'vivid imaginative life ... was not pathological' but 'a key factor in the success of Bethlehem's communal society'. By contrast, the more conventionally orthodox and less vigorous religion of Zinzendorf's successors, combined with the ending (ordered by the Moravians' leadership in Germany) of Bethlehem's communal economy, nearly destroyed the settlement, prompting a population decline which continued for over fifty years. Decline 'was related to a rejection of Zinzendorf's theology in favor of a moderate form of American evangelicalism during this same period'. Atwood fails to mention Zinzendorf's late and isolated ordinations of 'priestesses' (p. 94) and misidentifies the leading Moravian Anna Johanna Piesch (p. 162), and his use of non-English words and phrases mostly involves spelling or grammatical errors (which a copy-editor ought to have corrected), but these are insignificant blemishes on the face of an excellent work which will be of lasting importance.

LONDON

COLIN PODMORE

Laws of the spiritual order. Innovation and reconstruction in the soteriology of Thomas Erskine of Linlathen. By Don Horrocks. (Studies in Evangelical History and Thought.) Pp. xix + 369. Carlisle: Paternoster, 2004. £24.99 (paper). 1 84227 192 X
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905234395

Coleridge liked to observe that the 'most awful and interesting' truths sometimes lie 'bed-ridden in the dormitory of the soul'. I relished reading and profited enormously from this monograph which attempts the reawaken the work of the distinguished and attractive nineteenth-century Scottish spiritual divine, Thomas Erskine of Linlathen (1788–1870). A contemporary of S. T. Coleridge, Erskine's reaction against High Calvinistic Orthodoxy retraces some of the steps taken by the Cambridge Platonists against their own Calvinist upbringing: spiritual experience replaces propositional dogma, divine love replaces the inscrutable sovereignty of the deity. The affinity with Coleridge is very striking: the emphasis upon interiority, conscience and the Trinity marks a deep elective affinity, as well as the common debt to William Law and the Cambridge Platonists. Both men travelled to Germany. Indeed, Schelling told Erskine that he could not 'tolerate' Carlyle's style, but Coleridge was a 'great genius' (p. 229). Horrocks's sympathetic, incisive and lucid study should help to re-establish Erskine's reputation and I fear that we tend to neglect the genius of nineteenth-century British theology as tainted with Kantianism or liberalism. Erskine, like Coleridge, was deeply indebted to Kant. Horrocks seems puzzled by this enthusiasm and the lack of direct reference to Schleiermacher (p. 235), but I do not consider this is surprising. We now see Schleiermacher as the father of modern theology, but this view was not so widespread in mid nineteenth-century Germany. Further, Schleiermacher (*contra* Kant) directly opposed religion to

both metaphysics and morality in his Speeches of 1799: 'feeling' against 'thought' or 'will'. One might add that the real inheritors of the German mystical-Platonic tradition were the post-Kantian thinkers: Schelling and Hegel rather than Schleiermacher. Horrocks is somewhat misleading when he refers to Schelling promoting the 'key Romantic concept of pantheism' (p. 230). Of course Schelling was repeatedly accused of this, but the central theme of his middle and later thought was divine 'personality' – hardly a pantheistic tenet. This thought aside, this is an excellent book on a great, if somewhat forgotten, Romantic divine.

DIVINITY SCHOOL,
CAMBRIDGE

DOUGLAS HEDLEY

Rome et la Révolution française. La théologie et la politique du Saint-Siège devant la Révolution française (1789–1799). By Gérard Pelletier. (Collection de l'École française de Rome, 319.) Pp. x + 770. Rome: École française de Rome, 2004. 2 7283 0680 X; 0223 5099

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905244391

The most fateful of all the turning points in the French Revolution was its quarrel with the Catholic Church. It tore the nation apart, completed the king's alienation and led to the first attempt in history to stamp out all forms of religious observance. Napoleon declared that negotiating the Concordat which ended the rift was the most difficult thing he had ever undertaken, and its echoes determined much of the Church's history down into the twentieth century. Naturally it has been extensively studied, and not the least of the services rendered by Gérard Pelletier's magnificent volume is to provide a 73-page bibliography of works on the conflict in four languages. Nevertheless what he himself offers is completely new, for never before has such full use been made of Roman archives. Partly this is because many were not open or accessible, and have only become so in the course of the author's scholarly lifetime. Partly it is because even what was accessible, was chaotic, largely as a result of Napoleon's clumsy attempt to transfer the Vatican archives to Paris. Even more important, however, Pelletier repeatedly observes, was that most historians of the subject never even bothered to cross the Alps. Accordingly most previous accounts have been more-or-less francocentric, even those sympathetic to Rome. Pelletier's main purpose is to study the rift from the papacy's own sources. The result is a fundamental reappraisal, not only of relations between Rome and the Revolution, but also of the entire pontificate of Pius VI. It begins with his election and ends with his death in French captivity. The leading players around him are also identified and characterised in a prosopographical appendix of all the cardinals serving under him. And although the bulk of the text inevitably focuses on the challenge posed by the Revolution, it is set firmly in the context of earlier confrontations with Josephinism, Febronianism and Tuscan Jansenism. These episodes have bequeathed the picture of a papacy shorn of the support of the Jesuits, supine in the face of insolent bishops and regalists despots and silent for too long as revolutionaries in France raped the Church's eldest daughter. Pelletier on the contrary depicts a pope determined from his first encyclical to resist the progress of unbelief and heterodoxy, and restore the spiritual authority and prestige of the Holy See. He played a weak hand with skill, learning in the process that he could depend on most bishops and extensive popular

devotion. He saw the French Revolution as the culmination of previous struggles, the moment to take a stand. But he and his cardinals did not wish to exacerbate tensions in France so long as they were assured from there that negotiations might produce an acceptable Civil Constitution of the Clergy. In this, all sides deluded themselves. Pelletier emphasises particularly that nobody seriously thought an assembly of French bishops could resolve anything. And once the National Assembly unilaterally imposed the clerical oath, the pope was free to make public the hostility which he had previously only intimated in private. It relieved him of the burden of caution: others had cast the die. And now, with the situation in France beyond recall, and Joseph II and his brother and successor providentially dead, the Holy See felt free to turn its full fire on older enemies, whom it regarded as prime progenitors of the French catastrophe. In this perspective, the culmination of Pius VI's pontificate was the bull *Auctorem Fidei* of 1794, a new *Unigenitus* which, in anathematising the Synod of Pistoia of 1786, condemned the many streams which had flowed from the 'Second Jansenism'. While the French clergy relived the age of martyrdom, and their flocks wandered untended, the Vicar of Christ reasserted his authority over the Church in unequivocal terms, rejecting any claims that national councils or parish clergy might share his spiritual authority – in Tuscany, in France, or wherever. This bull made little impact initially. As French armies poured into Italy and eventually destroyed the Papal State itself, Pius VI had no opportunities to follow it up. But he did receive a sort of martyrdom, and his successors in the next century built with determination on the principles which he had so clearly reasserted in the year of the Terror and the cult of the Supreme Being. Many important subsidiary themes are touched upon and illuminated by Pelletier's profound scholarship: the complex debates among cardinals in congregations set up to advise the pope; the difficulties in holding even the Italian Church together during the *triennio* of French intervention after General Bonaparte's invasion. These and other issues are explored in prose of exemplary and lucid simplicity, and yet the human drama of the situation is never neglected either. The case for Pius VI, which clearly came together in the author's mind as he examined the Roman documents, is convincingly made. A pope who could probably have changed nothing even by breaking his much-criticised public silence in 1790, turned a disaster into the opportunity to end a century of Jansenising harassment for his office, and thereby re-energised its doctrinal confidence for the century to come. He had been forced to promise at his accession that he would not restore the Jesuits. But by elevating Gregorio Chiaramonte, the future Pius VII, to the cardinalate in 1785, he even opened the way to a successor who would do that.

UNIVERSITY OF BRISTOL

WILLIAM DOYLE

Mill on God. The pervasiveness and elusiveness of Mill's religious thought. By Alan P. F. Sell. (Ashgate Studies in the History of Philosophical Theology.) Pp. viii + 202. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2004. £49.95 (cloth), £15.99 (paper). 0 7546 1666 5; 0 7546 1665 7
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905254398

The subtitle of this book, which is a critique of Mill from the standpoint of Christian apologetics, alludes to two theses, the first being that religion is an overt or shadowy presence in much of Mill's thought, not just in his three essays on religion. For he

conducted a lifelong campaign against what he saw as the immoralities of the Christianity of his day, and sought to replace it with a 'religion of humanity', which, however, might take Christ as an ideal of human excellence. This thesis has already been trenchantly argued by Maurice Cowling and Joseph Hamburger. The second is that Mill is difficult to pin down, because on religion as on many other issues he is pulled in different directions, between enlightenment and romanticism for example, and as a result falls into obscurities and illogicalities. This is an old charge – Sell quotes Jevons writing in 1890 that 'Mill's mind was essentially illogical' – but Mill scholarship has moved on since then, and indeed since the 1970s a series of distinguished studies, reading Mill whole and sympathetically rather than selectively with a view to his destruction, have demonstrated the coherence and power of his thought. Sell accuses Mill of confusions and contradictions of which he was not in any simple way guilty, and apparently has sometimes not read, at other times not taken account of, works which vindicate him. So, for example, the claim that *On liberty* abandons utilitarianism ignores the contrary readings of Alan Ryan, Fred Berger and John Gray; J. C. Rees's 1960 article contending that a class of self-regarding actions *can* be identified if we read Mill properly is not cited; nor is Wendy Donner's careful discussion of the way in which Mill's distinction between higher and lower pleasures need not imply an abandonment of hedonism. Indeed Sell's book has an old-fashioned feel to it: much of the philosophical and theological critique he cites against Mill dates from before the First World War, no doubt because Sell has edited a volume of contemporary responses to Mill's *Three essays on religion*. Here lies the original contribution of this book; the long penultimate chapter sympathetically explains the arguments that late nineteenth-century Christians deployed against him. Mill managed to offend both sides, because secularists were unhappy with the argument of his 'Theism' that belief in a benevolent but not omnipotent God, and hope in an afterlife, were not unreasonable. Mill maintained that he sought to understand his opponents so as to incorporate their sound insights into his own system of thought – most famously he approached conservatism in this way. Sell persuasively contends that Mill did not extend this respect and openness to religion: he was not well read in Christian theology and did not know its best contemporary defences, therefore he could not do full justice to it. It is ironic, and a pity, that the same accusation can be levelled against Sell's account of Mill.

UNIVERSITY OF HUDDERSFIELD

WILLIAM STAFFORD

The mind of Gladstone. Religion, Homer, and politics. By David Bebbington. Pp. x + 331.

Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004. £50. 0 19 926765 0

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905264394

It is difficult to imagine anything more daunting than, as a servant in the Gladstone household, being called to listen to a Sunday sermon on sin delivered by the master himself. That Gladstone went so far as not only to write his own sermons, but to read them to his servants (at least until the pressures of government grew too great), speaks volumes about the man. If his servants are to be pitied, historians none the less should be grateful for the habit. David Bebbington has used this source, and other little known Gladstonian effusions, to great effect in a book that must be consulted by anyone interested in the mind and career of that great Victorian, and

the political world he did so much to shape. The book's subtitle 'Religion, Homer, and politics' neatly describes its structure. The great strength of the book is that it convincingly links Gladstone's three great obsessions and demonstrates how each interest connected with and influenced the others. Bebbington substantially revises our understanding of the man in a number of ways. He modifies the traditional image of a resolutely High Church Gladstone by pointing out his great ecumenism and, in theological terms, his increasing affinities with the Broad Church tradition, creating a sort of High–Broad fusion in his religious thought. Gladstone's theological views are convincingly shown to have been much more influential on his political philosophy than has been previously understood. The most important instance of this is the increasing centrality of the incarnation in Gladstone's thought. By focusing on, indeed elevating, Christ's human nature – and the perfection of that nature through trial and temptation – Gladstone, as Bebbington shows, came to a greater understanding of human potential, and a corresponding tolerance for human weakness. This emphasis on the incarnation, which Bebbington demonstrates beyond question, of course undermines the picture of Gladstone drawn by Boyd Hilton in his *Age of atonement*, a point Bebbington obliquely makes in the last sentence of the book. *The mind of Gladstone* also goes some ways towards rescuing Gladstone's Homeric publications from the contempt of contemporaries and the relative indifference of modern historians. By entering into the *minutiae* of mid-Victorian classical studies, and reading what Gladstone read (itself an epic task), Bebbington is able to demonstrate that most of Gladstone's Homeric output, while heavily and often reasonably criticised at the time, was by no means entirely outside the mainstream of acceptable contemporary scholarship. He also brings forward the importance of these studies in Gladstone's life. Rather than simply being the leisure-hours hobby of a amateur scholar with too much energy, Gladstone saw in the Homeric era a world as close to Creation as could be reached, and thus an important source of information about God's plans. Bebbington goes on to trace the ways in which Gladstone's conclusions about Homer's world influenced his evolving political beliefs, with often surprising and always informative results. Bebbington's attention to previously under-utilised sources, including (but not limited to) the household sermons and the annotations to be found in the books in the Grand Old Man's personal library, and his willingness to take both Gladstone's theological and historical concerns seriously enables him to draw a picture of the man that cannot be ignored by anyone interested in the political life of the Victorian era. *The mind of Gladstone* is quite simply the best book of Victorian intellectual history to appear for many years.

AVE MARIA UNIVERSITY,
FLORIDA

COLIN BARR

Doing the duty of the parish. Surveys of the Church in Hampshire, 1810. Edited by Mark Smith. (Hampshire Record Ser., 17.) Pp. lxvii + 202 incl. frontispiece and 7 ills. Winchester: Hampshire County Council, 2004. £20 + £2.35 post and packing from Hampshire Record Office, Sussex Street, Winchester SO23 8TH. 1 85975 721 9; 0267 9930
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905274390

This edition of the responses from Hampshire and the Isle of Wight to enquiries made in 1810 by Brownlow North, bishop of Winchester, into clerical residence and

church accommodation is a notable addition to the Hampshire Record series. The third volume, out of seventeen that have been published to date, that is concerned with the religious history of the region in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, it maintains the high standards of its predecessors. This means that it is a valuable addition to our knowledge of the state of the Church of England in general, and in the region in particular. North had conducted no systematic visitation of his diocese for over twenty years, so was unable to deal with enquiries that were made by the archbishop of Canterbury as a result of addresses from parliament. The importance of the material that North had to gather, and which is published here, is enhanced by supplementary work by the editor on records that relate to the main themes of the enquiries, and by his judicious introduction to the volume. This links its contents to more general debates on religious life in the period. By locating this work within the context of the local communities that it aspired to serve, this publication provides the basis for a discussion of the extent to which the Church of England continued to express the values and aspirations of these communities – an important measure of its standing as the Church of the nation.

UNIVERSITY OF HULL

R. W. AMBLER

Joanna Southcott's box of sealed prophecies. By Frances Brown. Pp. 320 incl. 51 ills. Cambridge: Lutterworth Press, 2003. £17.50 (paper). 0 7188 3041 5

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905284397

What happened to the box of sealed prophecies left by Joanna Southcott, the early nineteenth-century prophetess, with the plea that it should be opened by twenty-four bishops of the Church of England at a time of national calamity, is the subject of this interesting, if rather descriptive, study. The author has undertaken a great deal of detective work in unearthing the biographies of the people who have been custodians of the box from Joanna's death to the present, and charting its peregrinations from Exeter, London, Worcestershire, Leeds, Bradford, Burnham, Morecambe, Gatley to Bedford, as well as documenting the struggles amongst Southcott's followers over access to the box, and indeed the existence of rival boxes. Brown maintains that the box has actually been opened, but not in 1927, as is often claimed, but in 1835 by one of the custodians to see if any money had been hidden in it by his relative. The 1927 opening – when the contents included a lottery ticket and a woman's nightgown – was, Brown argues, of the wrong box. The history of the box in the twentieth century is intriguing. In 1935 over 28,000 people signed a petition to Archbishop Cosmo Lang to have it opened, and in 1960, a year of nuclear weapons build-up, and a series of catastrophic floods and earthquakes, one petitioner advised Eisenhower, Khrushchev and Macmillan 'to save their time and convene the bishops ... [to open the box]'. This study has benefited from an unprecedented access to primary sources, but while it is a convincing narrative it needs wider contextual analysis. Why women played such a central part in this story is not fully explained; what Southcottians actually believed needs greater consideration; and the wider connections between the Southcottians and the Church of England deserve closer scrutiny.

UNIVERSITY OF MANCHESTER

JEREMY GREGORY

The letters of Edward Copleston, bishop of Llandaff, 1828–1849. Edited by Roger Lee Brown. (Publications of the South Wales Record Society, 17.) Pp. xiii + 314 incl. frontispiece. Cardiff: South Wales Record Society, 2003. £19.95. 0 9525961 7 2
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905294393

'Friend Cop', as John Keble called him, may have been a successful provost of Oriel College, Oxford, but, despite the best endeavours of Brown in his introductory essay to this volume to bolster his reputation, Copleston was a mediocre bishop. This selection of his letters to his principal *aides* in the Llandaff diocese reveals an often querulous, indecisive, somewhat reclusive bachelor, prone, as was Dostoyevsky's ineffective and timorous failed academic, Mr Verkhovensky, to bouts of a non-specific gastric disorder at times of stress. At Llandaff, Copleston's correspondence reveals that he was heavily dependent upon the good advice and guidance of his examining chaplain, Bruce Knight, who would have made a far better bishop. Contemporaries – and, more recently, Owen Chadwick – judged Copleston as lacking the qualities necessary to oversee the Llandaff diocese at a time of major social, religious and economic upheaval. They were right. Copleston had the mind-set of an eighteenth century 'squarson'. For Brown to call him an 'outstanding bishop' flies in the face of the evidence Copleston's own letters present.

The selection from Copleston's correspondence is made here with only the lightest of editorial touches. The name index is particularly helpful in identifying the clergy whose very similar names float in and out of their bishop's letters, and whose (all too often) manifest weaknesses evidently caused him much heartsearching and anguish of spirit. The volume is, however, rather misleadingly titled, as it concerns almost exclusively Copleston's correspondence on diocesan affairs, and the letters selected and extracted here are only those held in the Llandaff Cathedral archives. There is, for example, no mention of the bishop's papers in the Devon Record Office, which do contain some material of relevance to his episcopate, and which throw further light on his character. Perhaps 'The Llandaff letters of Bishop Copleston' would have been a preferable title. However, by publishing this selection of Copleston's correspondence, Brown has further advanced our understanding of the strengths and weaknesses of the Established Church in nineteenth-century Wales.

UNIVERSITY OF WALES,
 LAMPETER

JOHN MORGAN-GUY

Small-town Protestantism in nineteenth-century Germany. Living lost faith. By Michael B. McDuffee. (America University Studies. Ser. 7. Theology and Religion, 224.) Pp. v + 151. New York: Peter Lang, 2003. £32. 0 8204 6223 3; 0740 0446
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905304398

This is a study of how Protestant Christianity was taught to children and adolescents in the small town of Butzbach in the German state of Hesse-Darmstadt in the middle decades of the nineteenth century. Detailed records kept by successive pastors, reports which they provided at the time of visitations, and catechisms provide the main basis for the book. Michael McDuffee argues that since all children were taught Christianity at school and in confirmation classes, but most attended church infrequently as adults, this teaching provides the best guide to how Christianity was understood. There were major changes during this period, as well as significant

differences between individual clergy and teachers. In the 1830s the catechism still used was a product of the Enlightenment and taught a rational Christianity with a strong emphasis on tolerance. From 1842 the main appeal was to the child's emotions and imagination, and colourful stories were used to drive the lessons home. Then in the 1860s there was a shift to more dogmatic teaching. At least from the 1840s the local population included a significant minority of freethinkers, many of them political radicals, at a time when Protestantism was tending to become more doctrinaire. Most people responded to the threatened disharmony by developing a convention that religious controversy was discourteous. A strong Protestant identity was reflected in the conspicuous display of family Bibles in the home and in the portraits of Reformation heroes on the walls. But religious faith was a private matter, seldom visible except in extreme situations, such as bereavement. All of this is presented in a clear and insightful way, and is firmly based on excellent church sources. However, McDuffee then goes on to speculate about the psychological processes by which Butzbachers relegated Christianity to remote corners of their lives. He also makes far-reaching claims concerning the extent to which Butzbach, and Germany more generally, were 'dechristianised'. The former suggestions are interesting and would be worth testing against other evidence, but they cannot be supported on the basis of the narrow range of sources used here. The latter claims are based on the unspoken assumption that at some earlier stage in German history, not only was the culture thoroughly Christian, but the people had an orthodox Lutheran faith which guided them through life. This is an assumption for which no evidence is presented here. As is shown by the long-running debate as to whether the Reformation was 'a failure', clerical sources can be used to present a pessimistic view of popular Christianity even in periods when no alternative world-view was available. While the later eighteenth century and a large part of the nineteenth unquestionably saw a decline in religious practice in Protestant Germany, it needs to be demonstrated, not assumed, that this reflected diminishing faith rather than increased freedom.

UNIVERSITY OF BIRMINGHAM

HUGH MCLEOD

Rome in America. Transnational Catholic ideology from the Risorgimento to Fascism. By Peter R. d'Agostino. Pp. xiii + 393 incl. 3 maps. Chapel Hill-London: University of North Carolina Press, 2004. £40.50 (cloth), £15.50 (paper). 0 8078 2842 4; 0 8078 5515 4
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905314394

The ideological aim of this book is to contest the thesis that, because American Catholicism nurtured its members as Americans in a less anti-religious model of liberal democracy than the European paradigms and formed them as Catholics in Thomist natural-law tradition, it achieved a unique or 'exceptional' political sensibility. The historical claims which D'Agostino sets out to disprove rely, he says, upon treating the evidence for American Catholic anti-liberalism as deriving, not from American anti-liberals' Catholicism, but from their ethnicity. Against this, he seeks to show that the 'transnational' or international features of Catholicism itself fostered illiberalism amongst twentieth-century American Catholics. In particular, the Roman papacy's loss of a territorial base after the Risorgimento became a

rallying-point from which American Catholics were encouraged to decry democracy, liberalism and the Jewish people. D'Agostino shows how the 'ideology of the Roman question', and not a peculiar American experience of democracy, shaped American Catholic political thinking down to the First World War. He goes on to indicate how, with 'the transformation of the Roman Question' brought about by Mussolini's proffer of the bait of a Lateran Treaty, American Catholics were no slower than other Americans to regard Italian Fascism as a lesser evil. This part of the book puts American Catholic aspirations to *Italianità* in the context of American secular and Protestant anti-Catholicism and of the willingness of American political leaders like Roosevelt, and even Jews, to do business with Mussolini. This well-balanced approach makes the evidence the author gives for American Catholic warmth for Italian Fascism all the more telling. In a fascinating chapter, D'Agostino tells the sad story of the two American writers of the 1930s who stood out against the trend, Paulist priest James Gillis, against whom Cardinal Pacelli's *attaché* was unleashed, and Giuseppe Ciarrocchi, a lone American disciple of the Italian Christian democrat, Luigi Sturzo. Whereas the 'frequency of his diatribes against so broad a range of enemies' (p. 259) tends to qualify Gillis's anti-Fascist witness, Ciarrocchi's political opinions would count today as 'normatively' Catholic, belonging to the 'type' other historians of the phenomenon have ascribed to American Catholicism as a whole. D'Agostino shows that such was not the case until Italy elected a Christian Democrat government after the Second World War. American Catholics were swayed, not by democratic or natural law considerations, but by whether any Italian government was deemed likely to rehabilitate the pope's temporal power. D'Agostino's well-written and tightly paced narrative is highly recommended for all students of modern Catholic political thought and behaviour.

UNIVERSITY OF ABERDEEN

FRANCESCA MURPHY

Baroness of the Ripetta. Letters of Augusta von Eichthal to Franz Xaver Kraus. By Robert Curis Ayers. Pp. iv + 245. Scottsdale, AZ: Cloudbank Creations, 2004. \$36.95 (cloth), \$24.95 (paper). 0 9651835 8 0; 0 9651835 7 2

The letters of Baron Friedrich von Hügel and Maude D. Petre. The modernist movement in England. Edited by James J. Kelly (foreword Gabriel Daly). (Annual Nuntia Lovaniensia, 44.) Pp. xxxiii + 196. Leuven–Paris–Dudley, MA: Peeters, 2003. €40 (paper). 90 429 1290 1

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905324390

The period around 1900 was one of great ferment in the Catholic Church. Pope Leo XIII (1878–1903) was proving to be, in some respects at least, considerably more open to the modern world than had been his predecessor in the see of Rome. Across Europe Catholic intellectuals explored the possibility of finding a way to combine their traditional faith with a commitment to modernity. Leo's successor, Pius X, ultimately decided that many of these intellectuals went too far and condemned their efforts as 'modernism'. But in the last few decades, scholars have looked with greater sympathy at the individual modernists, most of whom were thoughtful and committed Roman Catholics seeking to serve God and the Church in a rapidly changing world. One aspect of the papal condemnation appears to have been particularly unjust. The encyclical *Pascendi Dominici Gregis* (1907) suggested that modernists were

conspiring against the Church. This claim ignored the many significant differences among those suspected of modernism. And yet, many modernists were keenly aware of their fellow travellers working to modernise the Church, if in different ways. If there was no conspiracy, there were still informal networks of generally like-minded Catholics. The two books under review illustrate two of these networks. Franz Xaver Kraus is relatively well-known to scholars. A prominent historian of the Church and an occasional agent of the German government, he made repeated trips to Italy, where he met Augusta von Eichthal, the baroness of the Ripetta, a German expatriate who had lived in Italy for many years. Their correspondence extends from 1895 until Kraus's death in 1901. By and large the correspondence reproduced here consists of short, lively and somewhat gossipy letters from the baroness to Kraus. The letters have little theological content but are interesting because they reflect one elite circle of friends at an important period in the history of the Church. Figures like Duchesne and von Hügel appear in the correspondence, but the most important alliance reflected in the letters is between the two Germans and the leading liberal figures in the American Catholic Church. O'Connell appears repeatedly in the letters, as do references to Ireland and, later, Spalding. By contrast, the baroness appears hostile to France and to those Catholics who emphasised the importance of France in the movements to modernise Catholic teachings. The primary interest of the letters is their witness to these various relationships. The editor of the correspondence, Robert Curtis Ayers, has presented the letters in an attractive format. His introduction helpfully introduces the circle of friends in Italy, along with some of the political intrigues that united and divided them. His annotations to the correspondence keep the reader oriented and give short introductions to the people mentioned. Fuller notes, giving more information about the theological and political opinions, would have been helpful, as would a general index.

The letters that Baron von Hügel wrote to Maude Petre could not differ more drastically from the letters of the baroness to Kraus. Von Hügel was a serious man whose friendships appear to have been grounded mainly in common theological, philosophical and religious interests. His letters are full of references to the leading liberal Christians across Europe, most of whom he knew as a result of his regular travels on the continent. Clearly he sought to put these various figures in contact with each other. But the letters primarily contain his responses to publications by Petre and others, as well as his own efforts to work out certain aspects of his philosophy of religion and his understanding of mysticism. James Kelly has presented the letters in an attractive format. Gabriel Daly's foreword raises the question of von Hügel's commitment to modernism and points the reader to the important letter of 13 March 1918 in which von Hügel himself reflected on the question. Unquestionably von Hügel was a modernist, and indeed the single most important leader of the movement, although not the most aggressive. Kelly's introduction similarly situates the baron and Petre in the context of the ecclesiastical struggles of the day, as well as introducing many of the other important figures. His notes primarily identify the publications that the baron discusses in the letters. The index of names helps the reader to follow threads, although a topical index would also have been helpful.

BERRY COLLEGE,
ROME,
GA

HARVEY HILL

The imperial horizons of British Protestant missions, 1880–1914. Edited by Andrew Porter. (Studies in the History of Christian Missions.) Pp. xiii + 250 incl. 8 ills. Grand Rapids, MI–Cambridge: Eerdmans, 2003. £32.99 (\$45) (paper). 0 8028 6087 7

Missionary women. Gender, professionalism and the Victorian idea of Christian mission. By Rhonda Anne Semple. Pp. xvii + 285 incl. 16 ills. Woodbridge: Boydell, 2003. £60. 1 84383 013 2

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905334397

These two volumes are representative of the increasing attention being paid to the intricate and complex interrelationship of nineteenth- and early twentieth-century Christian missionary activity and the rapid changes then taking place in political and social life. The first, a series of finely-honed and excellently edited essays, considers the ‘imperial horizons’ against which organised British missionary activity took place. The question of motivation and consequent validation of missionary association with the empire is considered by D. W. Bebbington in ‘Atonement, sin and empire, 1880–1914’, and John de Gruchy on ‘Grand narrative and identity in the history of mission’, while Steven Maughan and Brian Stanley discuss the ideologies of the home constituency as they increasingly reflected a sense of virtuous imperialism. Chandra Mallampalli and Lauren P. Pfister offer new insights into the relations of missionaries to the rising national self-consciousness in India and China, and Andrew Ross and John MacKenzie give insightful overviews of key Victorian concepts like ‘Race’ and ‘Civilisation’ (both written appropriately with capital letters). MacKenzie in particular points to the wholesale adoption of ‘science’ by missionaries (the book has a remarkable illustration captioned ‘Courage: armed only with a sextant, Livingstone encounters Nguni warriors’ (p. 123). MacKenzie writes that missionaries ‘invariably viewed themselves as scientists. Modern, empirical, experimental science was what distinguished their society from that of Africans’ (p. 130). ‘Science’ became in this way the chief instrument of ‘Civilization’, and provided the chief means for the cultural incorporation of indigenous societies into western behaviours, perhaps paving the way for imperial hegemony. ‘Imperial horizons’ in the period also included the reaching out by women for new freedoms and opportunities. Deborah Gaitskill reflects on the field experience of women in South Africa, concluding that despite considerable pressure, missionary women were still caught up in gender stereotypes reinforced by ecclesiastical presuppositions. The time had yet to come when, as a woman writing in 1912 said, ‘the natives should see Christian women missionaries not segregated, not treated as if they must by reason of sex be kept out of authority and responsibility, always subordinate ... but treated as honoured and trusted fellow workers’ (p. 155). Rhonda Anne Semple’s exhaustive study in the second book under review examines the place of women in three different agencies in a number of different contexts: the Congregationalist London Missionary Society, the Foreign Missionary Committee of the Church of Scotland and the nondenominational China Inland Mission (CIM), founded in 1865. Semple’s methodologies are fascinating, and have as a result that her book is a mine of information about many other issues besides those of the changing roles of women missionaries. Thus, for example, in order to assess the way in which women were assessed for selection and training she investigates the selection and training of their male counterparts, releasing much new information. To discuss the role of women in the CIM, she writes a full account of the extraordinarily ambiguous educational venture undertaken by CIM missionaries at Cheefoo. Here they attempted to make

a safe Christian environment, where the surrounding 'heathens' were kept at bay and where English children were caned for speaking in Chinese. When she discusses women at work Semple offers valuable material on the policies of the LMS in North India and the Scots Presbyterians east of the Himalayas. As with Gaitskill in the previous work Semple's overall picture shows women missionaries involved in a game of professional catch-up throughout the nineteenth century, both in terms of access to education and ability to take part in mission administration. But, it is worth noting, some women did occupy positions abroad that were denied to them at home. Thus the formidable Annie Hunter Small, the first principal of the Women's Training Institute in Edinburgh. She was never, she wrote, a member of a Church in Scotland until the end of her missionary career, and was 'shocked' at the discrimination against women in Scottish church life. It was not so, she reflected, in the missionary community in India where 'we aimed at the co-ordinated and well balanced inter-relation of all departments, of the work guided by constant consultation' (p. 144). Like others, Annie Small was deeply influenced by the experience of overseas mission and thus enabled to be part of dynamic change in the relations of men and women in the early twentieth century. It is a pleasure to commend these two contributions to missionary history.

BRITE DIVINITY SCHOOL

KENNETH CRACKNELL

Respectability and resistance. A history of Sophiatown. By David Goodhew. Pp. xxvi + 191 + 3 maps and 5 ill. Westport, CT–London: Praeger, 2004. \$84.95.
0 325 07110 4

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905344393

Sophiatown was a freehold, multi-racial, but largely African township of some 40,000 people in western Johannesburg. It was famed for its vibrant street culture, its violent youth gangs and its vigorous resistance to destruction by the Apartheid regime – a resistance given international publicity by Trevor Huddleston's *Naught for your comfort*. David Goodhew has written the township's first connected history from its foundation in the early twentieth century to its destruction in 1959, using not only official records, newspapers and interviews but also many church records not hitherto used by historians. His chief originality is to stress the importance of respectability – especially working-class respectability – in a township more often pictured as disreputable. He insists, further, that the South African state's denial of respect to respectable black people created extreme circumstances in which respectability itself provided a foundation for political resistance, albeit by passive means. The argument is suggestive, but one wishes to know how Sophiatown people themselves characterised those they called *ama-respectables*, whether they would have agreed with David Goodhew in identifying respectability with churchgoing, education and law and order, or whether they might have emphasised the material aspects of respectability and the relationships between different social strata which he does not consider. This is a lucid, thoughtful, carefully-researched book that leaves important questions open to discussion.

ST JOHN'S COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

JOHN ILIFFE

The Bonhoeffer phenomenon. Portraits of a Protestant saint. By Stephen R. Haynes. Pp. xvi + 280. Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 2004. \$22 (paper). 0 8006 3652 X
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S002204690535439X

As Stephen R. Haynes observes, Dietrich Bonhoeffer was little known in his lifetime, but his reputation in the world has certainly flourished since his tragic death in April 1945. This is the phenomenon which interests him, and this thoughtful, sharply drawn discussion proves a lively enterprise. Haynes certainly knows his material, almost all of it American or from the English-speaking world, and the whole study is littered with potent comments from those whose work he explores. The book is neatly divided into two parts ('Who is Bonhoeffer for us?' and 'Interpreting the Bonhoeffer phenomenon'), and both of these yield sharply-focused, thematic sections. In these we have a succession of mythological Bonhoeffers: the seer, the prophet, the apostle, the 'bridge' (or reconciler) and the saint. A cluster of coteries and constituencies gather around each one, most of them American – some conservative, some liberal, some radical, some ecumenical – either to discuss or to revere (and often both). There is more than a whiff of appropriation in the air, as Bonhoeffer's story or his writings are launched into various new contexts and controversies, all un-glimpsed by himself, and we have a catalogue of 'understandings' of particular lightning phrases which in the post-war world almost took on a life of their own. Haynes's purpose here is not a profound one, rather is it to sift and organise in arresting paradigms. His own argument effectively comes at the last. It is a complaint against an almost relentless history of 'domestication' which has often simply turned Bonhoeffer into ammunition for campaigns of all kinds (not all of them righteous; far from it) and a qualm that a 'sanctification of theological memory' has discouraged a capacity for criticism. On Bonhoeffer's relationship with the Jews, and with the Holocaust in particular, he adds, there is more to be said – and a future book in which to say it.

THE QUEEN'S COLLEGE,
 BIRMINGHAM

ANDREW CHANDLER

Fede e martirio. Le chiese orientali cattoliche nell'Europa del novecento. Atti del convegno di storia ecclesiastica contemporanea (Città del Vaticano, 22–24 ottobre 1998). Edited by Aleksander Rebernik, Gianpaolo Rigotti and Michel van Parys (Congregazione per le Chiese Orientali). (Atti e Documenti, 18.) Pp. vii + 509. Vatican City: Libreria Editrice Vaticana, 2003. €20 (paper). 88 209 2783 7
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905364396

This collection of papers, some of them in English, cover the tribulations of Europe's Eastern Catholic Churches in the twentieth century, some of which, particularly those that had been under tsarist rule, had already undergone suppression for long periods prior to Communism. In one paper, in English, the Ukrainian Borys Gudziak highlights their ambiguous status, past and present, from ecclesiastical, political, ethnic and national points of view:

the relationship of a church with a repressed, stateless nation raises questions which have not been answered in academic theological literature. The beleaguered identity of these churches, the borderline definition that at different times and in different ways both Orthodox and Catholic churches have given to the phenomenon of 'Uniatism' has profoundly conditioned their historical experience.

Most originated around the Carpathians as socially despised and impoverished minorities which also had to endure the negative consequences of 'praestantia ritus latini' within the Catholic communion. Particularly under complete suppression in Ukraine, Romania and Belarus, and for a shorter period Slovakia, their church life was sapped by bloodshed and decades of discontinuity in their basic institutional life with loss of systematic records. As Cesare Alzati emphasises, in a paper on Romania, 'forms of piety, rituals, the whole anthropological dimension of their presence in society needs to be recovered'. Having been subjected to both polemical debate and systematic violence their identity has been questioned and shaken, but also forged and strengthened, as they now re-emerge from obscurity. Understandably they manifest signs of a victim complex and a tendency to overemphasise their past martyrdoms. This has all been accentuated by the failure of Orthodox Churches that collaborated in their repression to apologise and ask for pardon and reconciliation, and the situation has been worsened by heated disputes over property restitution. The contributors to this volume concentrate on doctrinal differences between Catholics and Orthodox and overlook this key issue, which has been of far greater concern to local congregations. But they provide wise guidelines for the future, warning Eastern Catholics against the easy option of succumbing to Latinisation. Gudziak describes how Lviv's Institute of Church History, in the face of obstruction, even sabotage of its equipment, is training a new generation of historians in interdisciplinary and interconfessional studies. It is developing a proper methodology, avoiding nationalistic history and theological polarisation. Particularly for those Churches forced to go underground, which necessitated the destruction of documentary evidence, it aims to reconstruct the way they managed to survive and the way individuals kept their faith in the face of appalling persecution, discrimination and harassment, by creating a bank of oral testimonies based on interviews with rank-and-file faithful on their experiences. A summary of documents, mainly from the archives of the Congregation of Eastern Churches, and some samples, in various languages, complete this essential resource for research into a crucial, but neglected, era of church history.

ALNESS

JANICE BROWN

Realer, exakter, präziser? Die DDR-Kirchenpolitik gegenüber der Evangelisch-Lutherischen Landeskirche Mecklenburgs von 1971 bis 1989. By Rahel Frank. Pp. 524 + 16 plates. Schwerin: Der Landesbeauftragte für Stasi-Unterlagen, 2004. €10. 3 933255 18 X
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905374392

The Churches in the German Democratic Republic (GDR) were the only quasi-independent institutions relatively free from the influence of the ruling Socialist Unity Party (SED). For this reason the SED's policy towards the Churches aimed at severing their independence and bringing them under state control. The secret police (the Stasi) was an important instrument in this task. Although the GDR was a centralised state, this policy was implemented in different way in different regions. As Rahel Frank shows in her study of the regional Protestant Church of Mecklenburg (situated in the north-west of the GDR), this kind of anti-Church repression depended on the functionaries of the state and the Stasi. On the other

hand the eight Protestant regional Churches in the GDR reacted with different strategies to state repression. The history of the Mecklenburg Church is an impressive example of how a Church managed to maintain its organisational and theological independence despite such suppression. Furthermore, during the 1980s the Mecklenburg Church even managed to reduce the Stasi's influence. The direct approach of the bishops, Heinrich Rathke (1971–84) and Christoph Stier (1984–96), was essential for this success, along with the transparency of internal church decisions, strong traditions and the willingness to put up with disadvantages and persecutions. For her study Frank talked to sixty contemporaries from both sides, analysed all important sources of state institutions, Stasi, SED, and of the Mecklenburg Church, citing such documents liberally. Thus she presents a well-grounded and clearly arranged regional study, which is, at the same time, a standard work on the suppression of church life in the GDR of the 1970s and 1980s.

BERLIN

GEORG HERBSTTRITT

Staat und Kirchen in der DDR. Zum Stand der zeithistorischen und sozialwissenschaftlichen Forschung. Edited by Horst Dähn and Joachim Heise. (Kontexte. Neue Beiträge zur Historischen und Systematischen Theologie, 34.) Pp. 275. Frankfurt-am-Main: Peter Lang, 2003. £25 (paper). 3 631 39088 2; 0724 6366

Gottlose Jahre? Rückblick auf die Kirche im Sozialismus in der DDR. Edited by Thomas A. Seidel; im Auftrag der Evangelischen Akademie Thüringen und der Gesellschaft für Thüringische Kirchengeschichte. (Herbergen der Christenheit, 7.) Pp. 230. Leipzig: Evangelische Verlagsanstalt, 2002. €16.80 (paper). 3 374 01959 5; 0437 3014

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905384399

Staat und Kirchen in der DDR summarises the findings of an academic conference held on the subject. Dähn, who before 1989 was dealing with the situation of the GDR Churches from the standpoint of a professor in West Germany, and Heise, who before 1989 was a member of the East German Academy of Science where he was occupied with the East German Churches from the perspective of the ruling 'Socialist Unity Party', together founded the Berlin Institute for Comparative Church–State Research in 1993 and have been leading it since then. Various acknowledged experts make contributions from their specific research interests. In addition to Dähn and Heise, Herman Weber, Detlef Pollack, Anke Silomon and Hans-Dieter Döpmann are amongst the list of contributors. While Weber summarises the state of research on the GDR to the present day, Detlef Pollack takes a social-scientific view of Churches in the former East Germany. Anke Silomon delivers a slightly overstretched survey of the state of research on Churches in both the former East and West Germany, while Hans-Dieter Döpmann focuses on the debate on the role of the Churches in former Eastern bloc countries, a topic which only apparently seems to have been neglected in recent studies. With the exception of the contributions of Pollack and Döpmann, this collection presents little new material. Döpmann, however, introduces a broader perspective on the role of the Churches in the GDR by drawing parallels with related Churches in the former Eastern bloc, in the process suggesting that those Churches did not thematise any victim–perpetrator guilt complex paradigm but rather tried to re-establish a religious and spiritual life in an otherwise completely secularised society. Contributions such

as this do indeed justify both the name and the goal of the institute. Both clear and subtle in content and structure, Pollack's essay again emphasises that the study of relations between State and Church in the former East Germany would benefit from a broad perspective, 'bringing together ... various historical, political, and sociological criteria of study which would likewise confront the loose variety of academic evaluations'.

Edited by the theologian Thomas A. Seidel in 2002, *Gottlose Jahre? (Years without God)* is based upon a conference held by the Evangelical Academy of the Free State of Thuringia and the Association of Thuringian Church History in 1999. Unlike the previous volume, the participants in this project approach the problem of a 'secularised society' from three different perspectives: first, eye-witnesses of what church life was like in the former East Germany get to talk; second the image of the Church under conditions of state socialism is examined; and third there is a discussion of the secularisation of East Germany since unification. The themes and topics of this volume are varied: Sebastian Engelbrecht talks about the role of the Saxon Church, between acceptance of the social circumstances and resistance; Dietmar Remy and Thomas A. Seidel discuss what they call the 'Thuringian way' or the 'Thuringian initiative', a much overdue study of the activities of the 'Arbeitskreis Solidarische Kirche' in early 1988 which firmly rejected any form of acceptance of social circumstances. Christian Dietrich and Rudolf Mau focus on the bizarre relation between the Association of Evangelical Churches and the state party, the SED, while Götz Planer-Friedrich describes how the Ministry of State Security infiltrated the Evangelical Churches. The third group of contributors pick up on this topic and talk about the general problems of Protestant Churches. Both Eberhard Tiefensee and Herbert Ammon endeavour to describe the declining number of church members. Neither Ammon nor Tiefensee find the theory of a general crisis of belief satisfactory; rather they point at ways to halt the process of secularisation, thus giving the whole anthology a forward-looking emphasis. *Gottlose Jahre?* is highly recommended.

BERLIN

RAHEL FRANK

Religion and nation in modern Ukraine. By Serhii Plokyh and Frank E. Sysyn. Pp. xvi + 216. Edmonton-Toronto: Canadian Institute of Ukrainian Studies Press, 2003.

\$39.95. 1 895571 45 6; 1 894471 36 7

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905394395

This volume is a collection of eleven articles by two authoritative writers on religion in Ukraine, all but one previously published, but updated to cover developments to 2000. Ukraine is on the east-west dividing line; the authors argue that religious developments in Ukraine today derive from the fundamental transformation of religion in Ukraine between the mid-sixteenth and late seventeenth centuries, which resulted in the formation of two Churches, Orthodox and Catholic, sharing the same culture. The book examines relations amongst the denominations in Ukraine, relations between these denominations and other ecclesiastical centres of power (Moscow, Constantinople, the Vatican), and the changing relations between Church and State in post-Soviet Ukraine, which have produced the present situation where in the interests of consolidating Ukrainian national identity the government is not

inclined to intervene in inter-church disputes at all. The question of nation-building and national identity is of general interest. In Ukraine the choice before politicians has been between the ethnic model (the state of 'the Ukrainian people') and the multi-ethnic (the state of 'the people of Ukraine'). The 1996 constitution has chosen a middle way: inclusive nationalism. The various Churches in Ukraine also face this question: whether to define themselves as the Church of the Ukrainians or the territorial church of Ukraine. This dilemma has implications as far as religious freedom is concerned: 'Contemporary Ukraine has yet to make a clear choice between the American and the European models of guaranteeing freedom of conscience' (p. 167). Also of general interest is the question of the attitude of the Vatican towards the various denominations in Ukraine. Plokhly distinguishes three main tendencies in the Vatican's policy towards the Ukrainian Greek Catholic Church (UGCC): first, those who are inclined to support it, respecting its struggle for survival under the Communist regime; second, the 'ecumenists', who are mainly preoccupied with a dialogue with Moscow; and third, the 'centralists', who oppose any move towards the decentralisation of world Catholicism (p. 159). Both these latter groups are hostile to the idea of a UGCC patriarchate. As the authors concede in their introduction (p. xvi) the UGCC is under-represented in the volume. One would have liked to see more on, for example, the apparent increasing interest of the UGCC in becoming part of a future united Ukrainian Church rather than in asserting its own distinctive Catholic identity. In June 2001 Liubomyr Husar, archbishop major of the UGCC, explained that the future of Christian unity did not mean the 'reunion' of all Orthodox under Rome, but the full realisation of 'true Orthodoxy'. There are plenty of sources cited for further reading, but all in the footnotes; a bibliography would have been helpful. One notable omission is Serge Keleher *Passion and resurrection: the Greek Catholic Church in Soviet Ukraine, 1939–1989* (Lviv 1993). *Religion and nation in modern Ukraine* is a readily accessible introduction to a very tangled topic, bringing historical perspectives to bear on current developments, and providing important insights into how 'state building, nation building and religion interact' (p. x) in a globalising world.

KESTON INSTITUTE,
OXFORD

PHILIP WALTERS

La Constitution de la hiérarchie ecclésiastique au Congo belge (10 novembre 1959). Prodomes et réalisation. By Willy Manzanza Mwanangombe. (Publications Universitaires Européennes, Série 23, Théologie, 759.) Pp. xvi + 259 incl. 8 ills. Frankfurt-am-Main: Peter Lang, 2002. £28 (paper). 3 631 51071 3; 0721 3409 JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S002204690540439X

The first Catholic missionaries arrived in the ancient kingdom of the Kongo in March 1491, leading rapidly to the baptism of the royal family at Mbanza Kongo. Yet the institution of an episcopal hierarchy in the Congo did not come until 10 November 1959. Mwanangombe's book (originally a doctoral thesis written for the Catholic Faculty of Theology in Bonn) seeks to identify the reasons for the delay of four and half centuries between the inception of evangelisation and its culmination in the establishment of an indigenous episcopate. It is based on extensive archival research in Rome, Brussels and elsewhere. Mwanangombe argues persuasively that

politics explain both the inordinate delay in establishing a hierarchy and its eventual establishment. During the 'first evangelisation' of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, the primary obstacle was the determination of the Portuguese crown to allow no erosion of its rights of *padroado*. When Catholic missionary efforts in the Congo resumed in the late nineteenth century, a perverse convergence of interests between Leopold II of Belgium and the Propaganda de Fide ensured that a Congolese hierarchy remained beyond reach. Only after 1956, under the combined pressure of emerging African nationalism and fears of Islamic and Communist penetration, did the Vatican begin to accept that its collaboration with Belgium in direct control of the Congolese Church could not be sustained. Mwanangombe concludes that it was no coincidence that the hierarchy was established just ten months after King Baudoin's promise of independence to the Congo given on 13 January 1959.

ST EDMUND'S COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

BRIAN STANLEY

Herbert Butterfield. Historian as dissenter. By C. T. McIntire. Pp. xxv + 499 + 9 plates. New Haven–London: Yale University Press, 2004. £30. 0 300 09807 3

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905414396

John Vincent claimed that the two most significant historians in England in the last century were Herbert Butterfield and Lewis Namier. So I welcome McIntire of Toronto's 'intellectual biography'. It is meticulously detailed and accurate, with surveys of Butterfield's rise from working-class schoolboy to knighthood. All his writings, published and unpublished, are analysed – even if one tires of being told that books on Fox and modern European history never appeared. There is much on Peterhouse, where Butterfield spent all his student and academic life, except for a year at Princeton, and on the Cambridge history faculty with its vitality and aggressive personalities. It was in 1949 that *George III*, *Lord North and the people, 1779–80*, *The origins of modern Science, 1300–1800*, and *Christianity and history* appeared, putting Butterfield at the climax of his career. His contributions to academic history had already included a major diplomatic study, a cogent biography of *Napoleon* and *The Whig interpretation of history* (1931) which warned of the dangers of seeing the past in the light of the present, the illusion that only the winners count, the idea of progress, and the 'Whig historians'. Picking up 'the other end of the stick' (a typical phrase) there was the 'new Whig' in *the Englishman and his history* (1944), almost Churchillian, and *The statecraft of Machiavelli* (1940). In the 1950s there appeared *Christianity, diplomacy and war* (1953) from a pungent Christian angle; *History and human relations* (1951); *Christianity in European history* (1952); and the first of his significant histories of history *Man on his past* (1955) featuring Von Ranke, the Göttingen School and Acton. Then there was the polemical 'dialogue' with what he called 'the school' of Namier in *George III and the historians* (1957) and a flood of articles popular and scholarly. Butterfield became Master of Peterhouse, Vice-Chancellor of Cambridge University (1959–61), a great success in that office defending academic freedom, and in 1965 Regius Professor, retiring in 1968. 'He liked committees but the loss to history was great'. In retirement, he wrote up his Gifford Lectures on *The origins of history*, posthumously edited by Adam Watson (1981). Here he analysed the Egyptians, Chinese, Hittites, Assyrians, Greeks, with notable chapters on the Old and New Testaments and early Christian history featuring Augustine, ending with what he

called the 'great secularisation' linking with *Man on his past*. McIntire edited *Writings on Christianity and history* (1979) bringing together seventeen lectures and essays from the previous thirty years. It was on the frontier between what he called 'the bright Empire of the theologians' and the meaning of history that he caught the eye of a wider public – indeed S. W. Sykes recently put him and Norman Sykes as significant theologians. Sir Herbert would chuckle. What now, twenty-five years after his death? Diplomats and politicians could well find *International conflict in the twentieth century: a Christian view* (1960) a dire warning against 'wars for righteousness'. Butterfield had an Augustinian streak: 'What history does is to uncover man's universal sin.' A 'cold war' context could be transferred to the war against terrorism. 'Maxims' (a Butterfieldian word) abound, still of relevance – the judgement of 'God's formidable non-intervention' and the much quoted 'We can do worse than remember a principle which both gives us a firm rock and leaves the maximum elasticity for our minds, the principle hold to Christ and for the rest be totally uncommitted' (1949). This avoids 'making gods out of mundane things or out of mere abstract nouns'. Prophetically – should a historian prophecy? – he saw the consequences of secularism in 'dark astrologies, weird theosophies and bleak superstitions' and even conflict with some styles of Islam, but he also saw the greatest opportunity for Christianity but only if it is 'insurgent'. The church historian can reflect on his fear of a Church bound up with power structures – church leaders had better 'disguise their statements as common sense'. Above all we can reflect on Butterfield's subtle view of providence as in *God in history*, perhaps his most brilliant short essay and his positive view of human potential.

So I greatly welcome McIntire's book, based on close contact with 'that candid man'. He was a Methodist of the somewhat dissenting style, even if he came to like Anglican worship, while rejecting the scheme for Anglican–Methodist union in the 1960s. As a Methodist, I leave the final word not with Trevor-Roper's sneer, as McIntire oddly does, but with Owen Chadwick. 'He retained the simplicity and a touch at times of the austerity and always the loyalties of his childhood ... Some things he was vehemently against ... the first was purveyors of panaceas especially when they were politicians ... the second thing he was against was hierarchy ... he kept to the end the critique, the stance of the chapel in the moors against too institutionalized a Christianity, the third thing he was against was corrupt history ... It was part of an intellectual integrity so absolute that at moments it frightened.' So read McIntire – and then Butterfield himself, the Christian sceptic.

BOLTON

JOHN MUNSEY TURNER

Deconstructing evangelicalism. Conservative Protestantism in the age of Billy Graham. By D. G. Hart. Pp. 224. Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2004. £15.50 (\$21.99). 0 8010 2728 4

Wonderful words of life. Hymns in American Protestant history and theology. Edited by Richard J. Mouw and Mark A. Noll. (Calvin Institute of Christian Worship Liturgical Studies.) Pp. xx+288. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2004. £14.99 (\$18) (paper). 0 8028 2160 X

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905424392

The writing of evangelical history in the United States is never very far away from debates about the present state and future direction of evangelicalism. While some

scholars fear the influence of Christianity in the public square, many books on evangelicalism are written by historians hoping to enrich devout Protestantism. These two books fall into the latter category. The foreword to *Wonderful words of life* hopes that the essays will be 'not only a means for better understanding the history of Christian practice [in worship] but also a catalyst for more pastoral and profound stewardship of congregational song today' (p. ix). In *Deconstructing evangelicalism*, D. G. Hart's intention is something rather more radical. 'Born-again Protestants would be better off if they abandoned the category altogether' (p. 16).

Hart's central thesis is that the use of the category 'evangelical' obscures more than it reveals about America's Christian history. For Hart, the irony is that evangelical history is coming to dominate religious history just as the modern evangelical movement is itself running out of steam. Hart's intention is not 'to imply that the recent recovery of evangelical history is a sinister plot by historians who grew up born-again' (p. 55). But it is to point out the troubling consequences of Christian history with the Church left out. By lumping a variety of distinct Protestant denominations together, across time and region, historians have misinterpreted the diversity of America's Christian experience. In turn many so-called evangelicals would have been better served by turning to more mature denominational traditions. More personally, Hart is frustrated that he has been described as an evangelical on account of being a committed orthodox Presbyterian.

Though this is a self-consciously provocative book, many aspects of Hart's analysis are not particularly contentious. There is little doubt that in the last couple of decades, as Hart points out, 'a tsunami of studies on evangelicalism in the United States deluged the field of American religious history' (p. 35). Many Christian leaders are concerned that too many evangelicals pick and choose the bits of faith that happen to suit them. A number of scholars, not least Mark Noll, have argued that evangelicalism has been intellectually shallow. In addition, many scholars agree that evangelicalism is a singularly slippery category. Certainly definitions seem much harder than in the days when, according to George Marsden, an evangelical was 'anyone who likes Billy Graham' and a fundamentalist was 'an evangelical who is angry about something'.¹ Indeed, Paul Boyer has complained that the chameleon-like character of devout Protestantism in America makes 'it so maddeningly elusive for scholars attempting to pin it down and analyze it'.²

Hart, though, argues that evangelicalism is maddeningly elusive precisely because it isn't there in the first place. Strikingly, Hart shows how pollsters, and the evangelical George Gallup, Jr, in particular, constructed a large number of evangelicals by asking simplistic general questions about faith. In two historiographical chapters, Hart provides a penetrating criticism of historians, sociologists and political scientists who have accepted the term as a category of analysis ill-suited to the study of individual Protestant traditions. Turning to the present state of evangelicalism, Hart contends that a study of institutions, creeds and devotional life shows that there is no such thing as a card-carrying evangelical. He claims that the only issues uniting evangelicals are a desire to break with tradition in worship, identification with a few celebrities and a commitment to a mere handful of doctrinal

1 George Marsden, *Understanding fundamentalism and evangelicalism*, Grand Rapids 1991, 1, 6.

2 Paul Boyer, 'The chameleon with nine lives: American religion in the twentieth century', in Harvard Sitkoff (ed.), *Perspectives on modern America: making sense of the twentieth century*, New York 2001, 273.

beliefs. Since there is no such thing as evangelicalism, there is no point in trying to reconstruct it by appealing to the mind or bringing tradition back in.

This is an impressively thoughtful book that is generous in its treatment of evangelical leaders and scholars of evangelicalism. It is well suited for undergraduates and pastors as well as experts in the field of religious history. Much of the argument rings true, but of course a provocative book provokes questions. For example, there is no logical reason why a group of Christians, just because they unite around a small set of core beliefs, cannot mature in their faith within separate denominational traditions. For all that Hart himself does not want to be categorised as an evangelical, millions do.

Moreover, the slipperiness of a definition is not in itself a reason to throw it out altogether. Historians have always been divided between 'lumpers and splitters'. Those who know devout Protestantism from the inside (either as historians or personally) may be struck by the differences between 'evangelicals'. But compared with liberal Protestantism and Catholicism, not to mention secular America and other societies, there are significant characteristics that hold American evangelicalism together. Also, in one sense the issue is methodological. Is religion defined by church doctrine and structure (in which case downplay evangelicalism) or by the attitudes of individuals (where the category of evangelical has most merit)?

By contrast, *Wonderful words of life* could hardly be less controversial (although Hart would take issue with the book's assumption of an evangelical heritage and that today's evangelical movement could benefit by reflecting on its tradition of worship). The essays cover an impressively wide range of subjects: from eighteenth-century hymn writer Isaac Watts to hip hop artist Lauryn Hill, and from singing missionaries and songs for nautical wayfarers to African American line-outs and Catholic hymnals. The essays address some of the major methodological issues involved in studying worship. At various points the authors place hymn texts in their political contexts, they investigate the reception of the hymns as well as the intention of the hymn writers and they suggest that singing provided particular opportunities for women and black Americans. One striking issue is the link between religious music and more secular trends in marketing and consumption. The authors make the case that songs need to be addressed as seminal, partly because of their theology but also because of their emotional impact. But that in turn begs a deeper methodological question. How does the historian convey the impact of hymns through the written word? The readers of this text will either not know the hymns, or know them from their own (perhaps misleadingly different) upbringing. Should the book include musical scores, or have an accompanying CD set?

Almost inevitably, the very breadth of this study of worship prevents the analysis from developing to any great depth. With the exception of the final essay by Richard Mouw, none of the essays explicitly engage at length with existing historiography. But the book's easily accessible style and fascinating anecdotes should ensure it a wide readership. Whether this in turn will shore up evangelical worship, of course, partly depends on whether evangelicalism exists in the first place.

PEMBROKE COLLEGE,
OXFORD

STEPHEN TUCK

Christianity reborn. The global expansion of evangelicalism in the twentieth century. Edited by Donald M. Lewis. (Studies in the History of Christian Missions.) Pp. x + 324. Grand Rapids, MI–Cambridge: Eerdmans, 2004. £31.99 (paper). 0 8028 2483 8
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905434399

This innovative collection of essays on evangelicalism's expansion outside the western world is an important contribution to our appreciating the paradigm-shifting changes that have occurred in the composition and nature of global Christianity in the twentieth century. It is written by prominent evangelical historians and sociologists, all (with one exception) working in the western world. After the editor's introduction, the collection is organised into five sections: (1) three papers, by W. R. Ward, Mark Noll and Brian Stanley, provide the historical background and context to the development of evangelicalism, from its origins in German Pietism and Protestant mysticism in the eighteenth century (Ward), to its global expansion through mission societies in the nineteenth century (Noll), culminating in the heightened expectations and eschatological optimism of the 1910 Edinburgh World Missionary Conference, whose assumptions are evaluated through subsequent events (Stanley); (2) three papers by Philip Yeun-Sang Leung, Robert Frykenberg and Allan Davidson on Asia and the Pacific, including the proliferation of Chinese 'unregistered' independent churches (Leung), the implications of the conversion of Hindus to Christianity (Frykenberg) and the impact of globalisation on the Christianity of the South Pacific (Davidson); (3) two papers by Jehu Hanciles and Marthinus Daneel on Africa, in which Christian conversion in West Africa (Hanciles) and the characteristics of African independency in Zimbabwe (Daneel) are analysed; (4) a comprehensive essay by Paul Freston on the academic study of Latin American Pentecostalism; and (5) a final analysis of global evangelical and especially Pentecostal growth in the twentieth century by the eminent sociologist of religion, David Martin, brings this collection to a fitting conclusion. The book succeeds in integrating its diverse subject matter into a coherent whole. The essays are of a high quality, providing a comprehensive and penetrating, scholarly analysis of evangelical Christianity. The book fills a gap in the limited academic treatment given thus far to one of the most widespread and fastest growing expressions of religion in the twentieth century, one that is becoming increasingly influential in world affairs. As is inevitable in a collection such as this, however, there are important areas omitted from the global survey. The section on Asia is limited to essays on India and China (omitting South Korea and South-East Asia, strongholds of evangelicalism); that on Africa focuses on West Africa and southern Africa (mainly Zimbabwe), and Freston concentrates on a contemporary sociological analysis of Latin American Pentecostalism with only a sketch of its historical detail. The book might have profited by more inclusive, continent-wide historical analyses of the twentieth century such as the sociological survey Martin provides at the end, although the first three background chapters covering the eighteenth to the beginning of the twentieth century are indeed wide-ranging and informative. There are other unresolved questions, such as whether an adequate definition of 'evangelicalism' has been given, which the editor suggests cannot be done (p. 3). Martin's essay suggests that this term might refer to all forms of Protestantism outside the European state Churches (Catholic, Orthodox, Lutheran, Anglican, Reformed). Thus Methodists and Baptists are included, and so are Pentecostals, for whom the definition probably needs considerable qualification. National leaders of

Christianity are not always given enough priority in the histories, as indeed many paternalistic evangelical and Pentecostal organisations from the western world were reluctant to share ecclesiastical power. As if a premonition of this, the front cover depicts 'five Chinese evangelists' in 1931, but omits to record that among these is one of the most influential figures in Chinese Christianity in the twentieth century, John Sung. The collection took some five years to appear, as the essays were presented in 1999 and some were written considerably earlier than that. Daneel's essay is a somewhat idealistic portrayal of Zimbabwean independency, and he and Hanciles do not give sufficient attention to the 'Pentecostalisation' of African Christianity. Daneel is particularly keen to debunk my own theory of the 'Pentecostal' nature of most types of African independency. Nevertheless, the essays illustrate important indigenous transformations that have taken place in different continents, especially in China and Africa. Overall, this is a stimulating collection, of considerable importance, by leading experts illustrating the profound diversity and complexity of its subject matter, an extremely important component of the changing face of global Christianity and a manifestation of its southward-shifting centre of gravity. As such, it is essential reading for anyone wanting better to understand the complex history of twentieth-century Christianity.

UNIVERSITY OF BIRMINGHAM

ALLAN ANDERSON

Conflict, controversy and co-operation. The Irish Council of Churches and the Troubles, 1968–1972.

By Norman W. Taggart. Pp. 143. Dublin: Columba Press, 2004. €9.99 (paper).

1 85607 438 2

JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905444395

This intriguing book covers the dramatic period during which the Northern Ireland Troubles erupted. In 1968 political violence in Ulster claimed no lives; in 1972, by terrible contrast, there were 497 fatalities. To what extent was religion vital to this explosive shift? And how are we to assess the contribution of the Christian Churches to politics in Northern Ireland during such troubled years? Norman Taggart's short book – part historical narrative, part memoir – offers helpful pointers in our attempts to answer these questions. In addition to his Methodist ministry, the author was organising secretary of the Irish Council of Churches [ICC] between 1968 and 1972 and so this is emphatically a personal account of that grouping's 'role and influence'. Taggart's own stance – as an evangelical and ecumenist – reflects a tradition all too often obscured in commentary on Northern Ireland; but it is a strand of Ulster church life which has had some telling effect (not least in the evolution of the 1990s Peace Process), and the story which is recounted here rather underlines such a judgement. An all-Ireland body, the ICC brought together numerous Irish Churches, advocated ecumenism and involved some delicate dealings with the Catholic Church in Ireland. The council argued for reform in Northern Ireland at a time when such advocacy was difficult within the Protestant community there; it condemned political violence, including that which originated from within its own section of society; and it built many quiet but impressive links between Protestant and Catholic in Ulster. Some of this book's conclusions might surprise readers ('The Troubles undoubtedly helped to drive the churches closer together'), but in its lucidity, and in its unveiling of some interesting new archive

material, it makes a welcome contribution to our understanding. Taggart is clear about the profound religious divisions which helped to generate Northern Ireland's late twentieth-century crisis, but he also demonstrates the quiet ways in which formal religious initiative such as that of the ICC helped to prevent the conflict from degenerating even further. In establishing cross-community relationships, in pressing promptly for just reform and in resoundingly condemning the violence practised by one's own community, the ICC made a valuable contribution, and one which fully deserves this very useful narrative.

QUEEN'S UNIVERSITY,
BELFAST

RICHARD ENGLISH

The Shepherd movement. Controversy and charismatic ecclesiology. By S. David Moore. (Journal of Pentecostal Theology. Supplement Ser., 27.) Pp. x + 228 incl. 16 ills. London–New York: T & T Clark, 2003. £12.99 (paper). 0 8264 7159 5; 0 8264 7160 9
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905454391

This is the first scholarly study to appear of the Discipling/Shepherd movement which flourished in the 1970s and 1980s and which – through conference, books and tapes – had a significant influence on many people within the charismatic movement. David Moore, an American who was himself involved in the movement, has undertaken thorough research and has produced a book which is both historically incisive and highly readable. He deals in detail with the five major leaders of the movement, which was based in Florida (they became known as the Fort Lauderdale Five), showing clearly how their thinking about ecclesiology and ministry developed. The attraction of the movement to those charismatics looking for firm pastoral oversight is vividly portrayed. The huge controversy which the movement caused – principally because it was perceived by some American and other evangelicals as controlling people's lives – is also delineated in a way that is both graphic and sobering. Moore understands the issues that were central to the rise and fall of the movement and he draws some pertinent conclusions. British readers may be disappointed that virtually no attention is paid to the influence of the movement within Britain. At one point Moore notes that Ern Baxter, one of the Shepherd teachers, had links with two significant leaders of the charismatic movement in Britain, Bryn Jones and Arthur Wallis (not Wallace, as Moore has it), and that Bob Mumford, another Shepherd movement leader, had a strong relationship with Barney Coombs in Britain. In a footnote, Moore suggests that Andrew Walker's book, *Restoring the kingdom*, overstates the influence of the Americans on English house churches, but Moore does not provide much evidence for his claim. In fact the Shepherd movement and the emerging British Restorationist movement of the 1970s, shaped by leaders such as Bryn Jones and later Terry Virgo, shared a number of the ideas promulgated by the Shepherd teachers. A central objective was the attempt to restore what were seen as the ministries of the New Testament churches. For those readers, however, who want an account of the way in which the American movement advanced, stirred up intense controversy and then disintegrated (most of the major leaders eventually left it), this book is superb.

SPURGEON'S COLLEGE,
LONDON

IAN RANDALL

Law and religion in post-Communist Europe. Edited by Silvio Ferrari and W. Cole Durham. (Law and Religious Studies, 1.) Pp. 428. Leuven–Paris–Dudley, MA: Peeters, 2003. €45 (paper). 90 429 1262 6
JEH (56) 2005; doi:10.1017/S0022046905464398

In the last few decades the European Communities have experienced crucial transformations in their aims, objectives and membership. The enlargement of the European Union to twenty-five members on 1 May 2004 must have been one of its most meaningful steps since its establishment by the Treaty of Maastricht in 1992. The structure of ecclesiastical law in western European countries has been studied thoroughly and comparisons between the different systems have been carried out by relevant institutions such as the European Consortium on Church and State Research. However, so far there had not been an attempt to look at the relationship between public authorities and religious denominations in the new member states of the union. This has been partially achieved with this book which comprises chapters on the Czech Republic, Estonia, Hungary, Latvia, Lithuania, Poland, Slovakia and Slovenia. However, strictly speaking, studying the ecclesiastical law of the new member states is not the aim of this book, which focuses rather on law and religion in post-Communist Europe. Thus its scope is wider, and several chapters deal with the legal religious framework in countries which are not members of the European Union, but were subject to Communist systems in the past: Albania, Bulgaria, Croatia, Macedonia, Romania, Russia, Serbia and Ukraine. This ambitious choice must be welcomed, although as a logical outcome of the scope of this research – this is just a minor criticism – Cyprus and Malta, new member states, but never subject to Communist regimes, have not been included. The authors of the different chapters and the editors have undertaken a thorough, inspiring and above all original piece of work. It is topical and clearly necessary in the new international context. Indeed, it is undeniable that throughout the world religion exerts a strong influence on political decisions and legal provisions and, as the editors state in the preface to this book, the post-Communist states are no exception. Every chapter is structured along similar lines and consequently analogies and differences can be identified easily. A second volume, which deals with the relationship between Church and State in the same countries, clearly complements this first book. After the preface, Giovanni Barberini provides a very detailed introduction in which he highlights the most significant historical events that have taken place in this vast geographical area, which extends from the Czech Republic to Uzbekistan. He emphasises that the different chapters will deal with constitutions, registration and regulatory norms as well as with the agreements signed by some countries in the last few years, especially with the Holy See. The Albanian constitution, approved in 1998, meets international standards, especially with regard to the protection of personal rights and freedoms. Its fundamental law provides that the state, represented by the government, will enter into agreements with representatives of religious communities, which must be ratified by parliament. In Bulgaria, despite recognition in its constitution of fundamental values such as religious freedom and separation of Church and State, minority denominations face problems at an ordinary level. Registration is compulsory and the procedures are selective, slow and non-transparent. Bulgaria is indeed the only country where the sociological recognition of one faith, the Orthodox, has been inserted in the constitution. The Croatian author states that the treaties between the republic of Croatia and the Holy See of

1997–8 contravene the Croatian constitution. In his opinion they violate the principles of equality for everyone and equality of all religious communities before the law. Without denying the significance of Roman Catholicism in this society, violation of fundamental rights cannot be justified. In fairness, the author admits that the Catholic Church has also tried to promote equal rights for all religious communities. In the Czech Republic, the subsidising of the Churches by the state has been controversial. However, since most churchgoers have few resources, they cannot, realistically speaking, bear the running costs of the Churches. The state is involved in education, healthcare, charity and the maintenance of historic monuments. Co-operation is therefore a fact in the Czech Republic. In Estonia, many aspects of the relationship between Church and State are in the process of being developed, and there are frequent indications of hesitation and ignorance. Although the bulk of the population is Lutheran, the establishment of a state Church on the Danish or Finnish model was never an issue, probably because of the level of secularisation in this country. The Hungarian case is very interesting: it is the only country which has not adopted a new constitution since the fall of Communism. However, legislation, at the highest level, has brought about remarkable changes. Individual and collective religious freedom, as well as a benevolent separation of Church and State, is guaranteed. Neutrality is a fundamental pillar of the system and the religious dimension is positively valued by the public authorities, which must appreciate and encourage its existence. The Latvian constitution contains fundamental provisions such as the separation of the state and religious denominations and the rights of parents and legal guardians to educate their children according to their religious convictions. However, as can be observed in most post-Communist countries, despite theoretical constitutional guarantees, there are frequent contradictions between principles and the ordinary legal framework. Even more worryingly, many laws contradict the European Convention on Human Rights. Lithuania is a country with an overwhelming Catholic presence. The Holy See has signed international agreements with the state which have been regarded as a mark of respect for the contribution of the Church to the social, cultural and educational spheres. However, the lack of an official or state religion is far more important than this reality. Relationships with other religious communities and associations are regulated by the Law on Religious Communities and Associations (1995). In Macedonia, there are two main faiths: Orthodox Christianity and Islam. Each has stronger relationships with public authorities than any other faith. Nevertheless, in principle the law respects Macedonian religious diversity and does not distinguish between faiths, Churches, sects, denominations and cults. The Polish situation is fascinating. The role played by the Catholic Church in Polish history is universally recognised and its social influence is remarkable. However the constitution emphasises equality amongst all denominations and the separation of Church and State. Unfortunately ordinary laws seem to interpret restrictively the concepts of religious equality and the neutrality of the public governing bodies. Such contradictions between fundamental law and ordinary legislation are even more dramatic in Romania where there is growing concern about the uncertain legal status of minority religious groups. Only a handful of groups benefit from state registration which is the basic criterion for receiving government subsidies. Thus, despite constitutional recognition of religious freedom, the legal framework clearly supports the Orthodox Church. Overprotection of Orthodoxy is not unique to

Romania. In Russia, the 1997 federal law 'on Freedom of Conscience and on Religious Associations' purported to benefit the Orthodox Church, and was much more restrictive than Gorbachev's law on 'Freedom of Religion' promulgated in 1990. The international response to it, including that of the Holy See, led the Russian government to compromise. Even though, theoretically, the Russian system is one of separation of Church and State, in which the Orthodox Church does not enjoy privileged status, in practice the contrary is true. A further chapter on the situation in Russia, 'Law and Church-State relations in Russia: the position of the Orthodox Church, public discussion and the impact of foreign experience' examines the complex Russian situation and stresses the danger of a hypothetical union between Church and State. After many years of war, Serbia has made an effort to meet international standards of protection of fundamental rights, and the current system of ecclesiastical law follows the German pattern. There is separation of Church and State, although the Orthodox Church plays a prevailing social role. However, other denominations are also mentioned in the preamble to the law on religious freedom and religious communities, a clear sign of pluralism. Those denominations not included have to be registered. In Slovakia, the Roman Catholic Church is the majority denomination. The preamble to its constitution refers to the historical contribution of Christianity, but there is no ambivalence about the separation of Church and State. Slovakia is a clear example of co-operation which can be observed in different matters such as the recognition of subsidies to registered Churches from the state budget, the equal legal standing of church and civil marriages and the establishment of church-run schools. An agreement with the Holy See has been signed and minority denominations are entitled to sign internal pacts, as long as they are registered. The slow rate of legislative change in Slovenia is especially worrying. It can be explained by the strong resistance of certain political organisations to the growth of the religious dimension. Despite the fact that constitutional principles on religion are theoretically impeccable, the ordinary legal framework contradicts them. In Ukraine co-operation with religious denominations can be observed in concessions to religious communities in the form of legal entity status and tax relief for registered religious organisations. Following the common pattern, fundamental principles, such as freedom of conscience and separation of Church and State, are recognised at the highest level of the Ukrainian legal system. Interestingly, this model aims to overcome the negative effects of the preceding state's policy towards religion and the Church. There is also a chapter about Church and State in the East German *Länder*. It is both historical and contemporary in approach and aims to examine the problems which reunification raised for the East *Länder* in terms of ecclesiastical law and how the incorporation of East Germany influenced traditional western models of co-operation.

In the conclusion Ferrari points out that:

1. Post-Communist countries, unlike western European, insist on values such as tolerance and reciprocal respect amongst believers in different denominations.
2. Individual religious freedom seems to be recognised unanimously across these countries.
3. In the choice between the American model (general equality) and the western European system (different treatment for different religions), the post-Communist countries have opted for the latter.

4. No post-Communist country has adopted the state Church model.
5. Co-operation with religious denomination, to a greater or lesser extent, is a reality in all these states. Separation, in the French sense, is perhaps only applicable to the Russian situation.
6. The gap between theory and practice in the protection of religious freedom and equality is a matter of concern.
7. Post-Communist countries have adopted features of the western systems which need careful review: for instance, the growth of suspicion of new religious movements.

Without a doubt, this is an excellent book and its authors and editors are to be congratulated. Topics have been studied in remarkable depth. The homogeneous and systematic structure of the book is helpful and the analysis of the different questions is thorough and well-focused. In my humble opinion, there are perhaps just two exceptions: why was the second chapter on Russia and the study of the East German *Länder* included? Their presence seems to alter, perhaps unnecessarily, the commendable balance of this work. That on one side, the introduction to this volume is precise and the conclusions are inspiring and delightful. This book is to be recommended not only to ecclesiastical lawyers and students of the discipline across Europe, but also to every individual with an interest in law, society and European history.

CENTRE FOR LAW AND RELIGION,
UNIVERSITY OF CARDIFF,
DEPARTMENT OF LAW,
UNIVERSITY OF WALES,
BANGOR

JAVIER GARCÍA OLIVA