

and identity of the self-performance of early modern courtly society'. Roger Mason's forcefully argued study of the reception of humanism in pre-Reformation Scotland provides a fascinating context for the other early Renaissance chapters, and a welcome analysis of social change in the century after 1460; but the burden of proof still rests heavily on those who argue that this period witnessed seismic changes in Church and State due to a proliferation of lawyers and an increasingly literate laity.

UNIVERSITY OF ST ANDREWS

NORMAN MACDOUGALL

*Inquisition, Index, Zensur. Wissenskulturen der Neuzeit im Widerstreit.* Edited by Hubert Wolf. (Römische Inquisition und Indexkongregation, 1.) Pp. 340. Paderborn: Ferdinand Schöningh, 2001. €46.40 (paper). 3 506 77670 3  
*JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903217243

Among the conferences held to mark the opening to scholars of the historical archives of the Roman Holy Office, with their materials relevant to both inquisition and index, was one which met in May 2000 at Frankfurt. The German-language papers in this volume include, among others, the opening remarks of Cardinal Ratzinger himself. The editor also provides a substantial introduction in the form of an essay on German involvement in the evolution of the Roman index, either side of 1900. The majority of the papers however concern the early modern period, and are introduced by a concise survey of the surviving archives, related to their own history, by their director, Alejandro Cifres. In an essay which has also appeared in an Italian version, arising from a similar conference held in Italy, published in 2000, John Tedeschi augments his well-established researches in the Roman inquisition material to be found in Dublin in the light of the newly opened Roman archives themselves. Another leading scholar in the field, Massimo Firpo, exercises his usual critical care in reviewing the conclusion of the Roman trial of Pietro Carnesecchi, in 1566–7. Francesco Beretta, who has also contributed to other volumes similar to this, revisits again the famous or notorious case of Galileo. In this, as in another contributor's examination of the Roman inquisition's position in relation to witchcraft accusations, recent critical assessment seems to be confirmed rather than overturned. Other essays, on those serving in the Roman Holy Office and Congregation of the Index, or on local application of the authority of these bodies, do however strengthen the case for caution before accepting in too simple a form the assertion that the two tribunals were permanently and universally at odds with each other. The final section of the volume is devoted to the index and to book censorship. The summary introduction to this section is provided by J. M. De Bujanda, the expert editor of a modern series reproducing versions of the Index. A long essay by Ugo Baldini argues with care for the relatively limited effect of Roman restrictions on works which might be considered in some sense 'scientific' publications. The attempts of the Congregation of the Index to supervise amended texts, in relation to Italian literary works or Latin theological volumes, are also discussed in following papers. Finally an admirably clear contribution reviews the realities of book control and censorship in post-Reformation German-speaking Europe at local level.

UNIVERSITY OF LEEDS

A. D. WRIGHT

*Court and politics in papal Rome, 1492–1700*. Edited by Gianvittorio Signorotto and Maria Antonietta Visceglia. (Cambridge Studies in Italian History and Culture.) Pp. viii + 259. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002. £40. 0 521 64146 2  
*JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S002204690322724X

The introduction states: ‘even the recent flurry of studies on European courts has neglected that of the Pontiffs’. In fact, as the footnotes to the articles in this collection show, there is an extensive bibliography for the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, mainly in Italian and German, on the Curia, on careers of cardinals and their households, on the papal and cardinalatial families who came to form the upper elite of Roman society, on their cultural patronage, on cardinalatial factions and clientelism, on ecclesiastical and civic ceremonial, and on the relations between the papacy and the civic elite identified with city government. Most of the articles in the present volume have already appeared in a longer one of conference proceedings, *La corte di Roma tra cinque e seicento: “teatro” della politica europea*, again edited by Signorotto and Visceglia (Rome 1998), although there are quite different contributions from Irene Fosi and Renata Ago, which perhaps make this work of rather more general interest, and an additional one by Marco Pellegrini which extends the chronological range back into the late fifteenth century; there is also a revised introduction. Italian scholarship in the field is well represented. There is one French contributor, but German historiography, which has been so crucial, is not represented. However, the contributors are, naturally, fully conversant with the work of German historians (notably Christoph Weber, Wolfgang Reinhard and Volker Reinhardt) as well as British and American ones (notably Peter Partner, David Chambers and Laurie Nussdorfer). The themes covered include the relationship between the popes and the College of Cardinals in the late fifteenth century (Marco Pellegrini); the popes’ ceremonial assertion of power over the city of Rome (Irene Fosi); Rome as a centre of negotiation for Italy and Europe (Elena Fasano Guarini); the connections between intellectual life and court politics in the seventeenth century (Mario Rosa); factions in the Sacred College (Maria Antonietta Visceglia and Gianvittorio Signorotto); the development of the Secretariat of State between the mid-sixteenth and late-seventeenth centuries (Antonio Menniti Ippolito); the cardinal-protectors of France (Olivier Poncet); Rome as a centre of the growing seventeenth-century information industry (Mario Infelise); the relationship between the papacy and the Roman elite; and the competition between the great families in conspicuous display (Renata Ago). These articles, of varying levels of specialisation, well reflect the range of interests in the current historiography and go some way towards providing a synthesis. The vexed question of what is meant by ‘the court’ in the context of papal Rome is, however, left unanswered.

UNIVERSITY OF EAST ANGLIA

OLIVER LOGAN

*Church, censorship and culture in early modern Italy*. Edited by Gigliola Fragnito, translated by Adrian Belton. (Cambridge Studies in Italian History and Culture.) Pp. x + 266 incl. 4 ills. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001. £40. 0 521 66172 2  
*JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903237246

This collection of studies represents a welcome addition to our knowledge of the effects of ecclesiastical censorship of books on sixteenth- and seventeenth-century

Italy. In an English translation which often reads as if very close to the original (but this is only proper for a work so centrally concerned with deliberate misinformation and expurgation), the book admirably brings to an Anglo-Saxon readership some of the best current Italian scholarship in the field. Its particular strength lies in the attempt to relate the theme of censorship to a wide range of subjects in cultural history. It is not mainly about the penetration and suppression of heretical writings, about which a good deal is known. Rather, taking advantage of new editions of the various sixteenth-century indices of forbidden books and of the recent opening of the Archive of the Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith, the work examines the impact of censorship on areas such as popular spirituality (Edoardo Barbieri), duelling (Claudio Donati), the Talmud (Fausto Parente), imaginative literature (Ugo Rozzo), law (Rodolfo Savelli) and – with a suggestive hypothesis about the paradoxically positive effects of censorship on the development of seventeenth-century science – astrology (Ugo Baldini). In other chapters Luigi Balsamo interestingly discusses the Jesuit Antonio Possevino's practice as a censoring bibliographer and Gigliola Fragnito explores the repeated failures of the various censoring institutions to achieve their aims: local resistance and inertia, bureaucratic squabbles, quagmires and U-turns all account for the limited success of the vast project of censorship. In this sense the work points in two directions, the editor emphasising in her introduction 'the wide gap between the totality of ambitions and inadequate means of achieving them' (p. 6), the contributors attesting to the phenomenal and damaging reach of censorship in everyday life. On the whole both tendencies leave a bleak impression and afford little evidence for the forging of a positive or dynamic new culture: in banning Petrarch, Boccaccio, Castiglione, Machiavelli, Ariosto, Bandello and countless others the Italian Church turned its back on an extraordinary culture that was eagerly taken up in other European countries. The experience of Domenico, an unfortunate cobbler of Spilimbergo, sums up the scale of the loss, both personal and collective: the only books he possessed were *Orlando furioso*, the *Decameron* and a vernacular New Testament. All three were seized by the inquisitor, leaving him to remark: 'I swear I shall never read again'.

UNIVERSITY COLLEGE,  
CHICHESTER

JONATHAN WOOLFSON

*The confessionalization of humanism in Reformation Germany.* By Erika Rummel. (Oxford Studies in Historical Theology.) Pp. vii + 211. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000. £32.50. 0 19 513712 4

*Renaissance humanism in support of the Gospel in Luther's early correspondence. Taking all things captive.* By Timothy P. Dost. Pp. ix + 244. Aldershot–Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2001. £45. 0 7546 0350 4

*JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903247242

A perennial (and still fruitful) subject of investigation in early modern European history is the relationship between the thought of the Reformation and its two most important intellectual sources – late medieval scholastic theology, and Renaissance humanism. The books under review, by Erika Rummel and Timothy P. Dost respectively, address the relationship of the latter to the Reformation, although not quite in the same manner. Rummel examines the broader issue via the question of how the Reformation shaped humanism in the sixteenth century, whereas Dost

investigates the role humanism played in Luther's thought up to 1522. Rummel works on a broad canvas (albeit with attention to many specific examples), whereas Dost focuses on a single individual. Though these two studies approach the relationship of the Reformation and Renaissance humanism from different perspectives, the results are complementary, and each study illuminates the richness and complexity of the subject.

Rummel's investigation takes up where her earlier and important study – *The humanist–scholastic debate in the Renaissance and Reformation* – left off, and explores the often tense and ambivalent relationship between humanism and the Reformation subsequent to the full emergence of the latter as a permanent feature on the intellectual landscape. As indicated, her particular interest is in how the Reformation affected humanism and humanists, especially in the context of confessionalisation, and she addresses this question with respect to how this played out on both sides of the confessional divide (Protestant and Catholic). She ably demonstrates that from a relatively early stage it was increasingly evident that the Reformation did have a substantial impact on humanists to match that which humanists had on the early Reformation, and that the way in which this worked out underscored some of the fundamental differences between humanists on either side of the confessional question and their theological coreligionists. Her analysis moves in successive chapters from the positive and negative aspects of the relationship of humanists and Reformers, to the difficulties faced by humanists with respect to scepticism, confessionalisation, 'Nicodemism' and, finally, ecumenical endeavours. In addition to Erasmus, she examines other humanist figures such as Agrippa of Nettesheim, Beatus Rhenanus, Wolfgang Capito, Sebastian Castellio, Urbanus Rhegius and Georg Witzel, among many others. Rummel argues that it is important to recognise that what marked the relationship of the Reformation to humanism as distinctive from other instances of interaction between intellectual movements is that both emerged in northern Europe at about the same time; it was not a case of the Reformation succeeding humanism and thus growing out of it, but rather drawing from and indeed seeking to suppress uncongenial elements of it. Hence the importance of paying close attention to the interaction between the two, and of addressing the issue of the Reformation's influence on humanism (rather than the other way around), which heretofore has received less consideration in the secondary literature.

Rummel's point regarding the manner in which the Reformation drew from humanism to suit its purposes is illustrated by Timothy Dost's monograph, which is a case study of just how one Reformer, in this case the Reformer, Martin Luther, used the tools of humanist method to advance the cause of the Reformation, while at the same time maintaining a critical distance from humanism. Dost seeks to demonstrate the manner in which Luther made use of humanism and how this is reflected in his religious and intellectual development. He does so through a focus on Luther's correspondence between the years 1507 and 1522.

Dost begins by laying a solid foundation for his investigation through a distillation of scholarship on Renaissance humanism, with particular attention to those elements that come into play in his later analysis of Luther's correspondence. He then moves through an examination of Luther's student days and development as a theologian, to the controversy surrounding the 95 Theses in 1517, to the Leipzig Debate of 1519, and finally from the period leading to the Diet of Worms through Luther's sojourn at the Wartburg, in each case focusing on the Reformer's letters. Dost's choice of

Luther's correspondence as an evidentiary base is interesting, for letters were a crucial forum for the display of humanism – as the case of Erasmus makes vividly clear. Dost effectively illustrates Luther's use of humanist method in his letters – its epistolary conventions, its tags, etc. He demonstrates that Luther did affect the style of the humanist prior to 1519. He also makes clear that this feature of Luther's correspondence diminished after 1519 in the context of the Leipzig debate with Johannes Eck, subsequent to which Luther was increasingly concerned with the Gospel as a life and death matter. The use of humanist method and style did not disappear altogether, but the character of his use of it changed. In this, Luther serves as a clear example of the utilitarian approach to humanism on the part of Protestant Reformers, 'taking all things captive'.

Both of the books under review offer stimulating examinations of the still vital question of how the Reformation and Renaissance humanism stood in relation to one another, and nicely complement concurrent work on the relationship that held between the Reformation and late medieval thought. Rummel's work is especially helpful in pointing up the way in which the Reformation had an impact on humanism's continued development. Yet in the end, though the Reformation was the more forceful movement, it was unable to 'harness [humanism's] entire stream of thought' (p. 150). Though perhaps unintentionally Rummel's volume also illustrates how the Reformation had (among many of its leading individuals) its own distinctive character. Thus, when taken with work on the relationship of scholastic thought and the Reformation, the distinctiveness and liminal character of the Reformation as an intellectual movement is underscored: neither fully humanist nor fully scholastic, though sharing features of both.

LYNCHBURG COLLEGE,  
VIRGINIA

N. SCOTT AMOS

*The sixteenth-century French religious book.* Edited by Andrew Pettegree, Paul Nelles and Philip Conner. (St Andrews Studies in Reformation History.) Pp. xvii + 366 incl. 23 figs and 9 tables. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2001. £55. 0 7546 0278 8  
*JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903257249

The problem addressed in this book is that of the influence of the printed work on religious change in the sixteenth century. A great deal is usually taken for granted in this field, not least the primacy of the printed word for Protestants. Yet what can this mean when the reading skills even of Protestants were often limited? Were Catholics largely excluded from the process? That there was an explosion of publishing in the crucial years 1555–62 when French Protestantism was coming into the open is incontrovertible. It is less understood that this also embraced the writing of Catholic works of devotion and polemics. The problem is that such perceptions are still largely instinctive. This book is produced by the *Sixteenth-Century French Religious Book* project led at St Andrews by Professor Pettegree, who outlines its scope and objectives. Bibliographical surveys of sixteenth-century French printed books might seem plentiful enough but some exclude major publishing centres and others are incomplete chronologically. The aim of this project is to generate a much more comprehensive catalogue examining Paris, Lyon and all the smaller provincial publishers, to be transferred to a database that should display the details of all known variants. The scope of the term 'religious book' is to be set very wide, covering not only theology

but polemics, history, biography and news reporting, all of which in the circumstances of the French civil wars had some bearing on religion. Some of the studies in this volume, produced by the St Andrews team themselves, address these basic problems directly. Paul Nelles explores the audiences for religious books on the Catholic side by outlining the interlocking relations between that for works of piety (for both clergy and laity), for manuals on the liturgy (for clergy alone) and a broader audience for works on religious affairs in general. Stressing the short print runs of most books and the unstable nature of the medium in general, he examines contemporary schemes of book classification and suggests that there was 'more a thickening of the religious atmosphere than any great change in religious taste or patterns of consumption'. Philip Conner explores print culture in the Protestant south where, paradoxically, there were few printing presses and rates of literacy were lower than in the north. How then did Protestantism there become a genuinely mass movement? His answer is that southern Protestantism was no less bookish than elsewhere and that booksellers could make effective use of the presses at Lyon and Geneva (*inventaires après décès* indicate the predominance in private libraries of books published at Geneva). They brought in works, with some danger to themselves, via the river Rhône and using well-established commercial links between centres such as Nîmes and Lyon. Notarial records indicate that there were at least twenty-eight booksellers operating at Montauban between 1560 and 1629, many of whom were prosperous. When small local presses were founded they were highly partisan and strictly controlled. There are many more interesting and useful studies here including Michael Wolf's study of public opinion and the press under a Henri IV who was acutely aware of his image, Jean-François Gilmont on Protestant historiography, Kevin Robbins on the controversies over La Popelinière's *History* and Bernard Roussel on the way Jean de l'Espine contributed to the formation of a distinctively French form of Calvinism. All of them shed a direct or oblique light on the main themes of this project.

UNIVERSITY OF KENT

DAVID POTTER

*Emperor Charles V 1500–1558*. By Wim Blockmans, translated by Isola van den Hoven-Vardon. Pp. xvii + 193 incl. 2 maps and 6 genealogical tables. London: Arnold, 2002. £45 (cloth), £14.99 (paper). 0 340 72038 7; 0 340 73110 9  
*JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903267245

Blockmans's aim is to describe new research on Charles v's empire and policies in a succinct and accessible form, using standard primary and secondary sources. He brings to the task a formidable array of languages, clarity of style and a refreshing perspective. He asks a number of questions about a figure much praised and little analysed, and surveys aspects of politics, war and religion, also including details of art and propaganda. Eschewing chronological order, the book is divided into sections, some of which work well thematically; others are somewhat disjointed. The focus is on events and policies, with a subtext that seeks to examine the interaction of the individual and circumstances. Blockmans is broadly sympathetic to the emperor, stressing his commitment to Catholicism and the difficulties of governing a huge and diverse empire, especially when facing the enmity of France and the Ottomans. But he is balanced, pointing to Charles's shortcomings and his personal and political

failures. He concludes that Charles was inflexible and of moderate intelligence, devout but willing to sacrifice religion to political advantage at times. Blockmans's more substantive contributions relate to political and religious affairs in the Low Countries and the Holy Roman Empire. He devotes his most successful and controversial chapter to Charles's handling of the Lutheran crisis, stressing the emperor's lack of understanding and confused policies. He concludes with a bleak assessment of the reign. Although he believes Charles's policy of war was mostly inevitable due to the provocation of his enemies, the result was economic dislocation, poverty and destruction throughout Europe; and his uneven religious repression of Protestants was avoidable yet enforced, creating political unrest and great suffering.

LONDON SCHOOL OF ECONOMICS  
AND POLITICAL SCIENCE

M. J. RODRÍGUEZ-SALGADO

*Music as propaganda in the German Reformation.* By Rebecca Wagner Oettinger. (St Andrews Studies in Reformation History.) Pp. xvi + 435 incl. 22 figs, 5 tables and 8 musical examples. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2001. £49.50. 0 7546 0363 6  
*JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903277241

Rebecca Oettinger has written a stimulating contribution to the discussion of popular religion in the Reformation. Although the author claims adherence to the school of Bob Scribner, she actually seems to be closer to Ian Green and Andrew Pettegree in suggesting that neither the book nor imagery could substantially shape the popular religion of the time due to their inaccessibility and often complex nature. Oettinger's way forward is to propose music as the prime and most effective tool of Reformation propaganda, and her text certainly succeeds in providing much relevant evidence in support of this theory.

Here song is portrayed as the most efficient tool in spreading the ideas of the Reformation, reflecting the predominantly oral culture of sixteenth-century Europe. Singing played such a crucial role because it represented a mediator in the vernacular that did not need a physical object for transmission; its oral form meant that no costs were involved for the masses. This, together with the mnemonic value of music and its potential for building a sense of community makes it possible for song to function as the most effective means of transmitting propaganda. Certainly Luther was quick to recognise its value. The usual form of song in the Reformation, especially when used for propagandistic purposes, was a *contrafactum*, a new text set to an old, well-known melody. Oettinger illustrates its importance with a series of case studies: the theological debate between Luther and Emser in the 1520s, the widespread opposition to the Augsburg Interim in 1548, and the use of the concept of the Anti-Christ in Reformation songs. In all of these instances Oettinger shows considerable skill in knitting together historical material and detailed musicological insights. The musical evidence is deftly treated with a judicious sense of what is required to lead the non-specialist through the argument.

A valuable catalogue of 230 Reformation songs constitutes the second part of Oettinger's work. Each song is summarised and, where appropriate, the texts are given in extended quotation: these are presented in parallel columns in the original language and in English translation. This appendix serves a dual role, both supporting Oettinger's presentation of the song as a potent religious and political agent and providing a useful tool for further research.

This book provides a prime example of how the command of a cognate specialist discipline can provide valuable new insight, even in one of the most widely discussed fields of Reformation history. In this work song emerges as the most effective propaganda tool of the Reformation. This is interdisciplinary scholarship at its best.

REFORMATION STUDIES INSTITUTE,  
ST ANDREWS

ALEXANDRA KESS

*Divided souls. Converts from Judaism in Germany, 1500–1750.* By Elisheva Carlebach. Pp. xii + 324 incl. 25 ills. New Haven–London: Yale University Press, 2001. \$40. 0 300 08410 2

*JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903287248

Autobiographical sources provide the basis for this study of Jewish conversion to Christianity in early modern Germany. Although the number of converts remained small, they wrote about their lives with surprising frequency, enriching both private reflection and public discourse on the shape and significance of religious identity. In the author's judgement, the sixteenth century was a turning point for converts. In their zeal to prove themselves loyal Christians, medieval converts had minimised or rejected their Jewish past, but prominent sixteenth-century converts flaunted their first-hand knowledge, distorting Jewish beliefs and ridiculing Jewish messianic hopes on behalf of Christian proselytising efforts. Less familiar than this material is the author's compelling description of the impact of conversion on professional options, family life, language and ceremonial after the Reformation. These chapters contain rich and informative material on the baptism of Jewish children, the function of language in Jewish and convert identity, the treatment of Jewish ritual by converts and the use of converts by Christian Hebraists. Because of its prominent sources, the sixteenth century reappears throughout the book. Its presence is not unwelcome, since Carlebach's discussion of the material is fresh, but the sudden arrival of the Enlightenment in her conclusion makes the reader stop and reconsider the coherence of the converts' experience between 1550 and 1700. Beginning with the Enlightenment, Carlebach argues, the 'tone of converts overall signaled a new posture of aggressive affirmation of their Jewish selves' (p. 223). They also presented an enlightened Judaism and started blaming the rabbis for promoting superstitious practices among the people. The appendix contains the conversion narrative of Friedrich Albrecht Christiani in German. The notes, bibliography and index are useful resources, and the book as a whole is a well-crafted contribution to the study of Christianity and Judaism that contains material of interest to a broad range of historians.

PRINCETON THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY

SCOTT HENDRIX

*The English Reformation. Religion and cultural adaptation.* By Norman Jones. Pp. xv + 253 incl. 7 ills. Oxford: Blackwell, 2002 (2001). £55 (cloth), £15.99 (paper). 0 631 21041 3; 0 631 21043 1

*JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903297244

Much of Reformation history has traditionally consisted of an account of what theologians believed and disputed about, and why and how sixteenth-century rulers enforced such doctrines as it suited them upon those over whom they were set in authority. English Reformation history consequently tends to be made up of



doctrinal niceties and divergences, of edicts, proclamations, statutes, etc., and of the public's reaction to them. Norman Jones's approach is distinctly different. He is much more concerned to explore and explain the actual response of those subjected to change, 'grasping at process rather than hunting for belief'. He understands very clearly that for the men and women living through the Reformation the question that mattered more often than not was 'What do I do now?' rather than 'What do I believe now?'. This is an excellent book; crisp, concise and thoughtful. The author is convinced that it took three generations, about a century, for most of the population to adapt to the change from medieval Catholicism to a religion containing some varying degrees of Protestantism. Even in Elizabeth's reign, a discerning contemporary, William Bullein, described four kinds of religion then observable; Catholicism (Henrician); Papist; Protestant and *Nulla Fidianism* (of which there was a good deal more than generally recognised, then or now). Throughout the whole period, one senses the significance of the role played by the heads of households, great and small; so much so that it might not be unjust to suggest that it was the priesthood of all householders, not that of all believers, which really counted. Naturally, they were the individuals who had most scope for developing their self-interest, rightly described by the author as the 'great sweetener' of the Reformation. Most of the material for Jones's original and intelligent approach is derived from the more prosperous, urbanised and literate southern and eastern parts of the kingdom. Reform took root earlier and deeper there than in the remoter and less developed areas of the north and west. Nor was it simply a matter of geography. Social and economic distinctions had a part to play, which the author, accomplished though his book is, tends to overlook. He makes little or no mention of those too poor to attend church regularly, if at all, or to play any very intelligent role even if they got there. As late as the eighteenth century there were many of the population of Britain whom John Wesley described as being as ignorant as Cherokee Indians.

SWANSEA

GLANMOR WILLIAMS

*Bishops and reform in the English Church, 1520–1559.* By Kenneth Carleton. (Studies in Modern British Religious History, 3.) Pp. x + 226 incl. 8 plates. Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 2001. £45. 0 85115 816 1  
*JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903307249

The bishops of the mid-Tudor Church might be thought to have had sufficient attention in recent historiography. Their doctrinal views have been anatomised; their lands and social power examined; and a number of them, notably Cranmer, have been subjected to rigorous biographical investigation. However, Kenneth Carleton's study shows us that there are still important things to be said about those who held this highest of ecclesiastical positions during the difficult decades of the early Reformation. This book is valuable above all for directing the reader not to the activities of the prelates, but to an investigation of the nature of their office. The author asks how the bishops and others understood their position doctrinally and how models of episcopacy were modified by religious change. Much of this territory is familiar: the royal supremacy gave monarchs power to make episcopal office dependent on the king's pleasure. This was a principle that could not be resisted, and it helped to drive the conservative prelates back into the arms of Rome after 1553 and to stiffen their opposition to Elizabeth. Reformers sought a redefinition of

roles through a separation of powers: 'It is not', said John Hooper, 'the office of the bishop to play the king ..., nor the king's part to play the bishop.' The bishop was now a painful preacher and defender of truth. He was also an overseer of his clergy, and Carleton rightly stresses the importance of Cranmer's reformed Ordinal of 1550, which distinguished priest from prelate mainly through that duty of supervision. Royal appointment and the emphasis on the structural proximity of clergy and bishops led to obvious questions about the relevance of consecration. Did the reforming bishops see themselves as set apart by the laying-on of hands? The general response in the mid-Tudor years was no, this was not an episcopate *iure divino*. But Carleton suggests that there was a fluidity in the official interpretations of clerical authority which left open the possibility that this was more than a mere band of office-holders given practical charge over the body of the clergy. The rest of the book addresses the functions and activities of the prelates, as preachers, educationalists, men exercising secular power and disciplinarians. These chapters display a sharp eye for pertinent detail: even the present reviewer, an old lag in episcopal studies, was arrested by the thought that in marrying a bishop committed a kind of bigamy since he had previously been wedded to his see. It is therefore regrettable that these chapters also display too much sign of their origin in a dissertation, with their need to cover every possible statistic and a rather turgid prose style. It might have been valuable instead for an even more thorough investigation of continental Catholic and reformed views of episcopacy to have been integrated into the analysis that opens this book.

JESUS COLLEGE,  
OXFORD

FELICITY HEAL

*John Foxe and his world*. Edited by Christopher Highley and John N. King. (St Andrews Studies in Reformation History.) Pp. xix + 297 incl. 39 figs + colour frontispiece. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2002. £55. 0 7546 0306 7

*JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903317245

This is the third set of conference proceedings published as spin-offs from the British Academy's John Foxe Project. Most of the contributors to this volume are from North America (where the 1998 conference was held), and it is rather fresher than the very patchy second volume. However, as the title indicates, some of the essays are separated by several degrees from Foxe's *Actes and monuments*. That does not detract from the usefulness of this volume, partly thanks to the editors' efforts, but it does raise the question of how well Foxe scholarship will be served if this series continues much further.

Here we have fifteen brief essays (none exceeds twenty pages), grouped under headings of historiography, bibliography, visual culture, Catholic martyrology and gender. In fact, however, the theme of visual culture in print dominates half the volume. The old problem of how such an iconophobic culture produced such a memorably illustrated book as the *Actes and monuments* recurs in several essays. Andrew Pettegree marshals a characteristically wide range of material to argue that this was a lucky chance; Foxe's book was produced during the brief period after England's backward printing industry had acquired the expertise to create such lavish illustrations, and before England's almost equally backward theology had acquired Calvinist scruples about images. It is a persuasive argument, although, as

Richard Williams's essay observes, Foxe's success started a European fashion for illustrated martyrology. By contrast, Thomas Betteridge's energetic piece denies that Foxe's use of illustration was a source of tension at all. Instead, he argues, the illustrations were vital for controlling interpretation of the text. The essay is both passionate and thought-provoking, yet I found his conceptual lines uncomfortably neat, and his description of burnings as a 'crime against humanity' uncomfortably anachronistic (did contemporary humanity feel that a crime was being committed against it?). One picture Betteridge discusses in passing – the infamous woodcut of Bishop Bonner lasciviously flogging a bare-bottomed man – is the focus of Deborah Burks's essay, which anatomises the carnivalesque motifs behind such images. The iconography of Catholic martyrologies was equally gruesome, but very different in flavour. Christopher Highley considers the woodcuts in Verstegen's *Theatricum crudelitatum haereticorum* (1587), which were stripped of all the consolation and triumphalism of Foxe's illustrations; their grim brutality was a reproach and a call to arms. Richard Williams likewise sees English Catholic martyrological imagery as a deliberately inflammatory attempt to drum up European support. Lori Anne Ferrell's more decorous contribution considers the geometric, tabular style popular amongst late Elizabethan Puritan writers, notably William Perkins. It is a somewhat discomfiting piece, suggesting that this minimalist aesthetic gave rise to a kind of geometric theology, and a piety to match.

Several of the essays do focus on the *Actes and monuments* itself. Cynthia Wittman Zollinger's thoughtful and intriguing essay discusses the grey areas between literacy and illiteracy in mid-Tudor England, and the means by which people traversed them; to do this, she uses Foxe as a source book (perhaps too unproblematically), quarrying him for revealing anecdotes and analysing them ably. David Scott Kastan's enjoyable essay on abridgements of Foxe starts by observing the *Actes and monuments's* daunting physicality, an object the size of a breezeblock. He leads us through a range of more manageable editions, concluding with an equally remarkable bibliographic object: the versification of the Book of Martyrs produced in 1616 by John Taylor, the water-poet, printed as a *dos-à-dos* bound 64mo, the size of a large postage stamp. It is a subtle and refreshing reminder of the primary physicality of books. Sarah Wall's extremely useful essay re-examines one of the most famous sections of Foxe's book, the narratives of Anne Askew. Her focus is on Askew's text as edited: clumsily (and perhaps more heavily than we know) by John Bale, and more subtly but no less effectively by Foxe. Her argument that Askew's 'authentic voice' is compromised by male editorial intervention is perhaps overdone; Bale's style remains dramatically different from that of the text that he presented as Askew's. What Wall's careful scholarship demonstrates is the sheer quality of Foxe's editorial work: here at least, Askew was in good hands.

The remainder of the essays are more miscellaneous. Highlights include Benedict Scott Robinson's discussion of how the Anglo-Saxons became a confessional battleground, due to their connection with Augustine of Canterbury and the Gregorian mission. This may have fed the 'British' rhetoric of Elizabethan Protestants. Dale Hoak's essay on images of queenship and their constitutional implications around 1559 is typically lively and learned, and draws on his ongoing work on mid-Tudor coronations. Anthony Martin discusses the providential, nationalistic history of Thomas Norton; Scott Pilarz outlines the martyrological response to Edmund Campion's death; Marsha S. Robinson thoughtfully considers how Protestant

concepts of conscience could, but did not always, subvert gender identities; and J. Christopher Warner discusses the spiritual significance Bale professed to find in his bibliographic work, as a Hilkiah to Elizabeth's Josiah. The volume wraps up with an afterword by David Loades surveying four centuries of Foxe historiography.

John King provides a formal introduction, a self-effacing set of abstracts of the essays which almost succeeds in concealing the care with which the editors have worked. Pride of place, however, is given to a second introduction, a long and wide-ranging essay by Patrick Collinson which is the jewel of the whole volume. In a characteristically allusive and indirect piece, he leads us nimbly through the old question of the *Actes and monuments* as a national, even a nationalist text; but does so with a focus on readership and reception. The godly, he argues, shamelessly played both sides, seeing themselves both as an elect minority and a part of a Protestant nation. Yet the role of Foxe's book in forming these self-images remains tantalisingly unclear, partly because so few unabridged copies were ever printed that most English people encountered the text mediately. How such mediation took place, in print and in the pulpit; what impact it had on the text; and what impact it had on the readers and hearers are questions that Collinson can only raise here. Perhaps there is room for a few more volumes on Foxe after all.

UNIVERSITY OF BIRMINGHAM

ALEC RYRIE

*Godly magistrates and church order. Johannes Brenz and the establishment of the Lutheran territorial Church in Germany, 1524–1559.* Edited and translated by James M. Estes. (Renaissance and Reformation Texts in Translation, 9.) Pp. viii + 220 incl. 2 ills. Toronto: Centre for Renaissance and Reformation Studies, 2001. \$13 (paper). 0 7727 2017 7

*JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903327241

A companion to James Estes's *Christian magistrate and state Church: the reforming career of Johannes Brenz* (Toronto, 1982), this is a readable collection of memoranda and official documents from Johannes Brenz (1400–1570), the chief architect of the Lutheran territorial Church in Germany. The texts, confidential advice for the secular authorities in Schwäbisch Hall and the duchy of Württemberg, give a behind-the-scenes view of the mechanics of reformation and the establishment of new churches. Along with Brenz's counsel on how to deal with the Peasants' Revolt or keep order in a town's churches, Estes includes a few public documents, including four 'election sermons' from the troubled years immediately preceding the Schmalkaldic War, and extensive extracts from the 1559 Württemberg church ordinance setting up a consistorial church system that spread across Lutheran Germany and persisted until 1918/19. Estes provides an introduction (including a short biography of Brenz capturing research findings since 1982), a general reading guide to the texts, individual introductions and notes, portraits of Duke Christoph and Johannes Brenz, two maps, a chart of the final form of the Württemberg Church's structure, and suggestions for further reading. The volume provides a mellifluous English survey for anyone interested in Reformation and post-Reformation Germany church politics, and needing Brenz's words freed from the linguistic challenges of sixteenth-century German. This is a useful teaching tool, and more.

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO AT SCARBOROUGH

LORNA JANE ABRAY

*Mexican phoenix. Our Lady of Guadalupe. Image and tradition across five centuries.* By David A. Brading. Pp. xvii + 444 incl. colour frontispiece and 36 plates. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001. £27.95. 0 521 80131 1  
*JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903337248

David Brading's history of the veneration of the Virgin of Guadalupe is certainly one of the most exhaustive to date. In his quest to understand the emergence, development and endurance of her cult – one of the most widespread Marian devotions in Mexico and worldwide – Brading appears to have examined every available primary source. This volume performs an immense favour for readers who lack access to rare documents or the time or skills to read through centuries' worth of Latin, Nahuatl and Spanish manuscripts that relate to the Guadalupan apparitions. Brading's bibliography is impressive, spanning the historical range of manuscripts and publications on the Guadalupe phenomenon and also the theological, historical and social currents of thought that have fed into it before and since the date traditionally given for the apparition, 12 December 1531.

This is the problematic Brading skilfully explores: no matter how hard the most ardent devotee, introspective mystic, agile theologian, sceptical positivist, hostile detractor or diligent historian might try to find it, there is no written evidence on the origin of the image of the dark-skinned young woman, painted finely and in high detail on a piece of rough cloth woven from fibres indigenous to Mexico, before 1648 (the date of the creole priest, Miguel Sánchez's *Image of the Virgin Mary, mother of Guadalupe*). Purported copies of earlier statements and oblique references to missionary work and Marian worship at Tepeyac (the hill once outside and now in Mexico City that is the site of the apparition and its basilica) abound in documents from the colonial era. However, as Brading shows, explanations based on once-seen-now-lost indigenous documents such as that made by Mexican intellectual Carlos Sigüenza y Góngora, or drawn from elaborate, mystic typologies such as that of theologian Miguel Cabrera (who asserted that the Mexican Guadalupe was the portrait of the Woman of the Apocalypse), have done more harm than good to the cause of Guadalupan devotion. Conversely, denunciations based on gaps and silences in the documentary record and accusations of ecclesiastical corruption and encouragement of superstition, sometimes by struggling nation-builders and sometimes in intra-Church conflicts, have actually fanned the ardour of believers rather than dissuaded them.

The apparent contradictions and silences in the details of the Guadalupan narrative have made many of the sources Brading examines fodder for both those who believe and those who deny the miraculous origin or the power of the image. For example, the fact that some sources attribute the image to a sixteenth-century indigenous artist renowned for his skill has been used both to discredit miraculous claims and to identify a historically-verifiable indigenous man as the 'true vehicle of the Blessed Virgin Mary' (see ch. vi and p. 275). Whatever evidence might once have existed, what can be found now is not the kind of contemporary documentation demanded by positivists, historians, or even, more often than not, the Vatican Congregation for the Causes of Saints as 'historical proof' of a figure's existence. *Mexican phoenix* was written and published before the announcement of the canonisation of Juan Diego Cuauhtlatoatzin in early 2002. Chapter v explores the construction of the character of Juan Diego, a sixteenth-century Nahua peasant *cum* devout, chaste, Catholic convert said to have seen the Virgin and on whose cloak

her image miraculously appeared in order to convince Juan Zumárraga, Franciscan missionary and later bishop of Mexico, of her apparition and of her special blessing for the Mexicans.

Chapter xiii treats the subsequent difficulty of establishing the historicity of Juan Diego, and also explores another near-miracle, the coming together in the 1970s of two ideologically-opposed groups in Mexican society, government elites (committed to anticlericalism by the Constitution of 1917, but gradually moving rightward after World War II) and Catholic activists, which provided new opportunities to practise Catholicism publicly. Brading identifies the drive to canonise Juan Diego as a product of Catholic reaction to the Mexican Revolution (1910–17) and the religiously-based civil war that followed it, the Cristero Rebellion (1926–9). The Church, encouraged by exiled bishop of Tulancingo, José Manríquez y Zárate, advanced Juan Diego as a figure for non-Catholic, indigenous Mexicans to identify with as they joined the faith, and, as with the coronation of the image in 1895 (ch. x), to demonstrate that Catholicism was a genuinely Mexican practice. In the years that followed, this identification, along with that of Mary herself as a poor, dark-skinned, peasant woman, has provided a vehicle for progressive theologians to make relevant the Catholic faith to Mexico's popular classes (ch. xiv). However, in this insightful analysis Brading does not include another related motive for building on Juan Diego's image: the need for the Catholic Church to shore up its popular support in Mexico and Latin America as a whole, in the face of the growing popularity of competing religious practices like evangelical Protestantism.

In *Mexican phoenix*, Brading is primarily concerned with the various 'tests' of 'authenticity' that the image, the apparition narrative and its cast of characters have undergone between 1666 (when the Mexican Guadalupe was first defended before the Vatican as a devotion worthy of Church endorsement) and the present. Brading does not bow to the assertions of some Guadalupan partisans that Vatican approval of the cult and subsequent affirmations equal proof positive of the veracity of the apparition narrative (p. 267). He does take very seriously the strong, vibrant oral tradition of devotion to Mary that appears to have developed shortly after the conquest of México Tenochtitlán and its evangelisation by Franciscan missionaries, which is the firm foundation (if unverifiable by scholarly criteria) upon which the Guadalupan narrative rests. Even when pointing out the excesses of baroque rhapsodies on the Virgin, Brading is, beyond the occasional jest, respectful of the beliefs of many of the partisans about whom he writes. He has less tolerance for those, whether overzealous anti-clericals or calculating church leaders, who attacked and condemned others on the basis of their beliefs.

While examining the intellectual history of the Guadalupan cult, Brading simultaneously leads us through the history of New Spain and Mexico, to show how this singular vision of the Virgin Mary has intertwined with Mexico's history and the history of the Catholic Church there, in Latin America, and worldwide. Brading prefaces his history with an examination of the Church's affirmations of the veneration of visual images and the theological method of typology. The linking of the Guadalupan narrative with these theological currents gave the cult a matrix in which it could grow vertically (gaining the approval of the ecclesiastical hierarchy and eventually of Rome) as well as horizontally (spreading from central Mexico, through Latin America and beyond) in the Church. Though Mary was said to have done for Mexico what 'non fecit taliter omni natione' (a quote attributed to Pope Benedict XIV

upon his approbation of the image, but, like so much in Guadalupan history, actually used beforehand [pp. 274, 300]), Brading draws important parallels with the traditions of apparition that are integral to other regional identities, such as Italy's Loreto, France's Lourdes and Spain's Pilar, Santiago, Montserrat and Remedios. Not all is mysticism and folk religion versus hard-headed rational thought; Brading reminds us of the currents in Catholic thought that contrast strongly with these mystical elements: Erasmus' philosophy, which led to the reform of the Franciscan order (and the creation of the first Guadalupan sceptics, among the earlier missionaries to Mexico), reactions to the Counter Reformation and baroque excesses, and attempts of nineteenth- and twentieth-century Catholics to reconcile their traditions with developments in contemporary scholarship.

By self-admission, Brading's volume concentrates more on the developments of Guadalupan doctrine and ceremony than on popular diffusion (p. 11). In so doing he focuses mostly on the tradition's intellectual and spiritual defenders and detractors, who were, by and large, elite Spanish, creole and Mexican men. Certain social groups are only briefly mentioned. Indigenous Mexicans fade into the background (except when cited in discussions of Guadalupe's authenticity or Juan Diego's veracity) as Brading's discussion moves beyond the testimonies set down in the 1640s and 1660s. Women are also 'neglected' in this work, but as Brading briefly mentions, in a study that dealt more with the grassroots diffusion of the devotion he would have to devote space to the Church's many female supporters, such as its catechists and members of other lay movements, where they have played significant parts in perpetuating religious practice and in countering anti-Catholicism (pp. 315, 251). Finally, while it is evident that Brading benefits from recent developments in colonial and modern history and cultural studies, these are cited much less frequently than are original documents and time-tested histories.

These omissions notwithstanding, Brading delivers a solid, meticulously-written study, grounded in a wide range of primary and secondary sources, that analyses many issues. In the end, Brading refuses to tell his readers what and whom to believe regarding the Virgin of Guadalupe. Rather, he skillfully demonstrates that the question of what is wanted from Guadalupe is, more often than not, what distinguishes fact from fiction in the eye of the beholder. While no book can cover all the elements of a religious phenomenon as multifaceted as Guadalupe, *Mexican phoenix* gives its readers expert, thorough and balanced coverage of her documentary history from which to pursue many different lines of inquiry.

STATE UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK,  
INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY AT UTICA/ROME

KRISTINA A. BOYLAN

*The voices of Morebath. Reformation and rebellion in an English village.* By Eamon Duffy.

Pp. xvi + 232 incl. frontispiece, 24 ills and endpapers + 12 colour plates. New Haven-London: Yale University Press, 2001. £15.95. 0 300 09185 0

*JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903347244

The challenge of this marvellous book is set out in the plural 'voices' of the title: how many? and whose? Did Sir Christopher Trychay ventriloquise for his parishioners or did his voice, like that of his fellow conservative, the Yorkshireman Robert Parkyn, speak solely for the conservative clergy, important though that was? In

unravelling the liturgical and agrarian calendars which governed the lives of Morebath's residents, and which Trychay, as their priest and pastor, marked out for them, Duffy has provided us with a sympathetic portrait of rural piety during the Reformation. In his careful analysis of the language and tone of the accounts as they moved through the years we are left in no doubt of the communal values they represented: thus in setting the parish contribution to Exebridge in 1532 four parishioners were nominated 'to sett the parysse conssonablylly and to sure every man ys axcion and to se every man content: by there oathe and after there consyens' (p. 51). It was a communal life which made heavy demands upon the parishioners, expressed most fully in the 'stores', and especially in 'Our Lady's store' which managed the sheep flock from which the church derived much of its income. The maintenance of these animals was a responsibility spread throughout the parish, with over two-thirds of the households participating in 1531. Duffy's account of the workings of this system (pp. 41–5) in the distinctive words of the priest demonstrates convincingly that his was not just one voice, but that he was the mouthpiece of the wardens and of the parishioners, he speaks 'the same forsayd persons as yett beyng wardyns dothe you to knolege ...' (p. 45). In answer to the challenge in the title, therefore, Trychay's voice was undoubtedly a plural one. But did the 'shared values and perceptions' it expressed go unchallenged? The burdens of communal life created dissidents who refused to play their part in parochial responsibilities and, though few, these voices can be discerned in Duffy's story in accounts of sheep not maintained and bequests not carried out, so there were other voices at Morebath than those articulated by the priest. Perhaps the most telling evidence of this lies in Duffy's most exciting discovery, the sending of parishioners to join the rebels at St David's camp. This convincingly links the parish to the Prayer Book rebellion, but it is in Trychay's (?) vain attempt to destroy the evidence of that decision that we might discern such voices. At a time when it was easy to conceal items of furniture and vestments associated with traditional piety, some of considerable proportions, around the parish it would surely have been no problem to conceal a book from the prying eyes of government. So why the need to blot out the incriminating word 'camp', unless, of course, there were parishioners who might reveal the existence of the incriminating book to diocesan or government officials? We can never know but, in accepting Sir Christopher Trychay's record as speaking for those parishioners, probably the majority, who claimed to be 'of Morebath' we need also to acknowledge those other voices, not 'of' but at Morebath.

And there was another voice too at Morebath, at least for the last fifteen years of Trychay's time there, and it proved crucial to the transition over which Sir Christopher presided and which Duffy chronicles, the transition from traditional piety to Prayer Book Protestantism. Paradoxically it was the very voice which stirred the parish to rebellion in 1549. It was, of course, the voice of Cranmer, spoken by Trychay, and heard weekly in the liturgy by his parishioners from 1559. It was a voice which Trychay acknowledged, if not in words then in deeds, for his conformity was 'more than a grudging minimalism' (p. 175), and most of what he found in the Prayer Book he 'would have thought godly enough' (p. 176). Therein surely lies Cranmer's genius: in holding the conservative and traditional clergy to conformity. However great a part some conservative clergy of mid-century played in the subsequent history of English Catholicism, others played an even greater, if less heroic, part in bringing the people to the Reformation. In doing so their own



pastoral commitment, and Cranmer's liturgical genius, were key components, working closely together. Thus when Sir Christopher was buried 'between the site of the altar where he had sung the Mass, and the table where he had celebrated the Supper' (p. 190), the sense of loss evinced in Duffy's moving prose needs to be balanced by the pastoral achievement. Trychay had steered his people peacefully through difficult years to an acceptance, and maybe even an understanding, of a new way of expressing their relationship with God and with each other. All was not loss. That said, *The voices of Morebath* is a triumph of historical writing, microhistory on the highway and not the byways of the discipline, and when future generations of students are directed to the best examples of historical scholarship from this generation the tiny isolated parish of Morebath will figure largely on the signposts.

UNIVERSITY OF YORK

W. J. SHEILS

*Tudor church reform. The Henrician canons of 1535 and the Reformatio legum ecclesiarum.* Edited by Gerald Bray. (Church of England Record Society, 8.) Pp. clx + 842. Woodbridge: Boydell Press (for the Church of England Record Society), 2000. £70. 0 85115 809 9; 1351 3087  
*JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903357240

Many scholars will welcome this edition of two texts that arose out of efforts to revise English canon law and the ecclesiastical court system to make them conform first to Henry VIII's break from Rome, and then to the movement towards Reformed religion that took place under Edward VI. Both were the work of commissions of clerics and lawyers, and neither was ever implemented. Of the two, the *Reformatio*, which was authorised by parliament in 1550, and compiled and corrected in large part by Thomas Cramner, is the longest and the most complete, and had the most interesting subsequent history. It was published by John Foxe in 1571, the same year in which it was briefly suggested in the House of Commons that its provisions might be considered by parliament, but thereafter it seems to have been neglected before resurfacing in two editions printed in 1640 and 1641. In the early eighteenth century Bishop Edmund Gibson often cited the *Reformatio* as a source for the state of the ecclesiastical law under the Tudors. Edward Cardwell published a translation in 1850, but the textual history of the *Reformatio* is complex and more than justifies Gerald Bray's decision to collate all the known manuscript and printed versions. He has published these as a single Latin text, which is accompanied by a straightforward English translation on facing pages, as well as a valuable scholarly apparatus that makes it possible to locate the sources in Roman civil and medieval canon law of much of the material used by the sixteenth-century authors. A very extensive introduction takes in all of these matters, and amply supports Bray's most important conclusion, which is that the *Reformatio* was a good deal less radical than its title suggests. It certainly reflects the ongoing changes in religious doctrine characteristic of the mid-Tudor period. It also broke new ground by insisting that mothers should breastfeed their infants, and by advocating that the injured parties in cases of adultery should be allowed divorces that would enable them to remarry, a point much abused by advocates of divorce in the mid-nineteenth century. However, most of the titles in both works that refer to the legal and institutional affairs of the Church, including the church courts and the discipline and income of the clergy, were based extensively

on the inherited canon and civil law. Along with the increasingly vexed question of by whose authority (king, convocation, parliament or all three?) new canons such as these might be made law, this reliance on allegedly popish sources was no doubt one of the reasons why both texts had less and less influence as the sixteenth century progressed, but, as Bray points out, one significant compensation is that the *Reformatio* can (with care) be read for what it tells us about the state of the ecclesiastical law as it was seen in the mid-sixteenth century. The inclusion of chapter numbers as part of the running heads on each page, and/or an index that referred to page numbers rather than titles, might have made the texts easier to use for quick searches. But on the whole this is a splendidly complete scholarly work that will prove invaluable to interested students for generations to come.

UNIVERSITY OF DURHAM

CHRISTOPHER BROOKS

*Registres du consistoire de Genève au temps de Calvin*, II: 1545–1546. Edited by Robert M. Kingdon, Thomas A. Lambert, Isabella M. Watt and Wallace McDonald. (Travaux d'Humanisme et Renaissance, 352.) Pp. xxx + 416. Geneva: Librairie Droz, 2001. Sw.Fr. 130. 2 600 00638 9; 0082 6081  
*JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903367247

This is the second volume of the registers of the Geneva consistory in Calvin's lifetime, published under the direction of Robert Kingdon, that complements the already extensive registers of the Company of Pastors also published in the same collection. This source is invaluable for researchers in the field of the French Reformation, and more generally on church discipline in Reformation Europe. This volume covers a particularly critical period in Calvin's life, at a time when his authority was challenged by prominent members of Genevan high society, notably within the city council itself. Traces of this nascent conflict can be found in this volume with the deposition of Ami Perrin's wife, Françoise Favre, who was brought to the consistory for not attending the lord's supper. The second volume traces an interesting evolution in the disciplining of the Genevans where Catholic survivalism took second place to the reformation of manners, especially sexual mores. These documents, admirably transcribed and annotated by the editorial team, give us an invaluable insight into individual Genevans' private lives. These records are unique by virtue of the lengths to which members of the consistory went to uncover and discipline sin. In this respect, the registers are not just relevant to Geneva, or the Reformation in the French-speaking world, but to anyone interested in early modern morality and reformation of manners. The transcriptions themselves are accompanied by a short introduction, bibliography, index and appendices containing, for example, a letter of Calvin to Viret and Farel complaining about the Favre family's refusal to bend to the will of the consistory. As usual for this collection, this volume is impeccably executed and will serve as a useful work of reference for generations to come.

UNIVERSITY OF GLASGOW

LUC RACAUT

*Society and culture in the Huguenot world, 1559–1685*. Edited by Raymond A. Mentzer and Andrew Spicer. Pp. xvii + 241 incl. 3 ills and 3 tables. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002. £40. 0 521 77324 5  
*JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903377243

This is a penetrating examination of Huguenot identity in early modern France – from the early years of wildfire growth in the 1560s to the Revocation of the Edict of Nantes in 1685. Twelve essays, by established and new specialists in the field, approach the question of identity from varying chronological and thematic perspectives.

The first essay, by Timothy Watson, discusses the experience of Lyon's Huguenot population from 1550 to 1572. It is a stark portrait of a movement struggling with the demands of rapid institutionalisation. A radical movement based on a loose coalition of interest in the late 1550s and early 1560s, Lyon's Huguenots gained political control of the city following the end of the First Religious War in 1562. After a royal takeover a year later, they shared political control of the city with the Catholics for a further five years. Watson contends that the French Reformed Church was both 'made and unmade by the French Reformation'; the inability of the movement to sustain or consolidate its previous momentum was not simply the result of a successful Catholic response. It was also the consequence of internal difficulties within the movement, most particularly an inability to form a solid party. Watson then moves on to suggest that 'the future character of the French Reformed Church was to be defined by this early experience of rapid and buoyant expansion, followed swiftly by conflict, persecution and failure' (p. 27).

This latter observation raises a theme which permeates this volume as a whole, though often indirectly; the extent to which the Huguenot movement possessed a generic identity. The picture that emerges is of a movement which was surprisingly cohesive, particularly given the obstacles which it was forced to face, such as the geographical size of the kingdom, with its attendant linguistic and cultural diversity. Theology (most particularly the concept of the Elect), forms of worship and church structures all promoted a unified consciousness. However, other less formal means were also employed to forge the underlying identity and inner fraternalism of the movement. This is ably demonstrated by Mark Greengrass through his examination of the use of manuscript correspondence between the Reformed churches, while Luc Racaut raises the issue of the medium of print as a force for the promotion of a distinctive Huguenot identity. Racaut examines the multiple editions of Jean Crespin's *Histoire des martyrs* from the perspective of an ongoing dialectic between Catholic and Huguenot polemicists, providing an interesting window onto the evolving self-perception of the movement.

The impact of such important moments in the history of the Huguenot movement as the expansion-contraction of the early 1560s was felt across France. It was experienced, however, in different ways. Nevertheless, through formal and informal networks, a collective historical memory and identity was clearly being encouraged.

The Achilles' heel of this trend towards greater unity within the movement, however, was parochialism. The predilection for internal division was shown by Watson's analysis of the party in 1560s Lyon. Also revealing is Penny Roberts's impressive examination of surviving Huguenot petitions to the crown. The recourse to petition, first granted by François II in March 1560, allowed the Huguenots to raise grievances with the crown without resorting to armed conflict. Most commonly,

these petitions were drafted at a local level by the Reformed churches of large towns, and were concerned with such volatile issues as sites for worship and burial. From these petitions, Roberts observes that from 1561 onwards, there was a growing concern for local rather than national affairs. She contends that this was not simply a consequence of the federal basis of Reformed church organisation or of the way in which Edicts of Pacification were enforced. Equally, she argues, 'by offering the Huguenots formal recognition within French society, the edicts curtailed their effectiveness as a national movement' (p. 64).

In this respect, Amanda Eurich's investigation into the Huguenot magistrates of Castres and Pau, two towns in the heart of the Huguenot crescent, offers an arresting picture of the fracturing of the movement in the first half of the seventeenth century. The provisions of the Edict of Nantes in 1598 permitted Huguenots to hold judicial and administrative office, not least in special bipartisan tribunals called *chambres de l'Edit*. What Eurich demonstrates is that a powerful Huguenot office-holding class increasingly functioned as brokers of royal power. Unable to serve two masters, these Huguenot magistrates soon became so royalist in outlook that during the renewal of conflict during the 1620s, they even counselled their coreligionists to remain loyal to the crown.

Many other dimensions of Huguenot confessional identity are explored in this volume. Alan James presents an incisive discussion of seventeenth-century Huguenot militancy. And given that there is no study of the Huguenot army to rival James B. Woods's *The king's army* (Cambridge 1996), we can only hope that this research will be expanded into a full-scale monograph. Philip Benedict explores the appropriateness of applying the German historiographical model of confessionalisation to France, using a sample of marriage statistics from Montpellier. Andrew Spicer examines the architecture of Huguenot temples, while Bernard Roussel investigates Huguenot funeral rites from an historical–anthropological perspective. Karin Maag surveys the provision of higher education in France, while Martin Dinges explores the Huguenot welfare system.

This excellent collection brings together an array of fresh perspectives with which to consider the complexities of Huguenot identity in early modern France. There can be little doubt that its readership, advanced undergraduates and researchers, will have much to absorb and debate.

REFORMATION STUDIES INSTITUTE,  
ST ANDREWS

ALEXANDER S. WILKINSON

*The conquest of the soul. Confession, discipline, and public order in Counter-Reformation Milan.*

By Wietse de Boer (Studies in Medieval and Reformation Thought, 84). Pp. 363 incl. 2 figures and 1 table + 4 plates. Leiden–Boston–Cologne: Brill, 2001. €91.90 04 11748 2; 0585 6914

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S002204690338724X

'The intelligent laity everywhere have your problem. It's not unusual. What they do is sit politely through the sermons, and go and find a Jesuit or a very bright Benedictine to confess to. You just avoid confessing to Father Tom Dick or Harry.' Thus Ben to Tessa in Jill Paton Walsh's novel of 1950s Catholics, *Lapsing*. Wietse de Boer has provided an illuminating, sensitive and learned account of Carlo Borromeo's campaign to impose order and consistency on the Tom, Dick and Harry

parish priests of the archdiocese of Milan between the 1560s and 1580s, and to ensure that their penitents confessed to them at Eastertide and did not find easy ways out. Certain Jesuits, more inclined to make concessions to human weakness, entertained doubts about Borromeo's rigour; so did Philip II's Dominican confessor; Franciscan confessors, it seems, might well take a different view from parish priests. De Boer argues that interpretations of the changing role of confession in the sixteenth-century Catholic Church have depended too heavily on the attitudes and practices of religious orders: the hierarchical, uniform and bureaucratic system which the cardinal archbishop sought to impose on the parish clergy and their penitents had little to do with making confession into a more private experience. Boxes might have doors to keep undesirables out when they were not in use, but when they were the doors stayed open and priest and penitent remained in public view, though not within public earshot. Moreover, according to de Boer's findings, the system of reserving cases for higher authority threatened the confidentiality of the confessional. The archbishop urged his clergy to pay much attention to anti-social sins committed in the public domain, rather than to concentrate on the psychological sins which were committed in the heart and mind and stopped at intentions. As though providing a Catholic counterpart to Luther's conviction that the whole life of a Christian should be one of penitence, Borromeo set out to repress 'occasions of sin' which were fraught with temptation and to counter them with 'occasions of virtue'. Consistently close to archival material, but primed with the theological expertise to put it into perspective, de Boer shows skill and ingenuity in tackling the problem of analysing a secret procedure. Moving expertly between the intimate details of particular cases and the general principles which they illuminate, he has shown how the heavy correspondence generated by Borromeo's regime and the records of clerical meetings can be used to dissect the cases of conscience which interested the local clergy. The book succeeds, especially, by its ability to discuss theory and practice, aspiration and achievement; to avoid treating its subject merely from the top downwards; and to show how parish priests negotiated when trapped between the demands of the hierarchy and the resistance of their own parishioners to the excessive expectations of higher authority.

UNIVERSITY OF MANCHESTER

BRIAN PULLAN

*The old religion in a new world. The history of North American Christianity.* By Mark A. Noll.

Pp. xii + 340. Grand Rapids, MI–Cambridge: Eerdmans, 2002. \$24 (paper).  
0 8028 4948 2

*JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903397246

Mark Noll originally wrote this book (in English) for a German publisher. Thinking that by telling a familiar story for a different audience he had been forced to find new ways of telling it, he has now published it for an Anglophone readership. This is not a brilliant new synthetic work of ecclesiastical history. Much of it covers ground that Noll has himself been over in his *A history of Christianity in the United States and Canada*. But the labour of writing the history of American Christianity for a European audience has forced out some stimulating and winsome insights. This, and the book's satisfying brevity, makes it an ideal text for undergraduate courses, or indeed for the thoughtful yet casual reader. Noll establishes a series of lenses through which to view the history of Christianity in America. They are space, race and ethnicity, pluralism,

and the absence of confessionalism. These are referred to throughout his short narrative, usually in an unobtrusive fashion. Thus his perceptive and sympathetic chapter on Lutheranism and Roman Catholicism is shaped by the difficulties of two inherently confessional Christian communities attempting to flourish in an anti-confessional environment. Noll uses this to explain a great deal, such as the Lutheran arguments over whether to reconcile the denomination with mid-nineteenth-century American Christian culture, or to withdraw into a confessional and ethnically defined enclave. Roman Catholicism in the United States is defined, likewise, by a perennial attempt to rhetorically and philosophically reconcile the theology of Catholicism and the politics of the Republic, an endeavour undertaken by John Carroll, Isaac Hecker, John Courtenay Murray and Richard John Neuhaus, and brought into sharp relief by Orestes Bronson and the Americanist controversy. In this case, and in all others, Noll writes with sympathy and modest erudition. This is, after all, at its heart not simply a comparative study of the United States, Canada and Mexico, but a comparison of North America and European developments in the thought and culture of Christianity. Some of the best bits of the book are his handling of the various insights (penetrating or limited) of European visitors to the United States, or the enthusiastic proclamations that recent immigrants to the New World sent back to what they had suddenly come to see as the benighted Old World. It is to be hoped that when Noll issues a second edition of his larger *History of Christianity*, he will preserve the freshness and verve of *The old religion in the new world*.

ST CROSS COLLEGE,  
OXFORD

ALBERT ZAMBONE

*Imagining early modern London. Perceptions and portrayals of the city from Stow to Strype 1598–1720.* Edited by J. F. Merritt. Pp. xii + 305 incl. 6 ill. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001. £40. 0 521 77346 6  
*JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903407240

This volume brings together most of the foremost names in metropolitan history to produce a coherent and stimulating collection of papers. As its subtitle suggests, the book's central theme is the development of contemporary perceptions and descriptions of London and its society from the late sixteenth to the early eighteenth centuries. The works of Stow and Strype inevitably provide much of the focus for the various contributions, but the authors have explored a refreshingly wide range of subjects and approaches, and have not allowed the broader context of these major works to escape them.

One of the principal strengths of the collection lies in the broadness of its theme. In focusing on contemporary perceptions of London, the contributors have been free to examine not only the intellectual context of Stow and Strype themselves, but also much wider cultural and societal issues.

The first section of the volume typifies the interdisciplinary character of the book as a whole. Patrick Collinson provides a succinct account of the development of the antiquarian tradition within which Stow wrote, while Julia Merritt examines the problem of the cultural retranslation of Stow's work in the rather different cultural and religious context of the early eighteenth century. Archer explores the theme of memorialisation through the collective commemorative practices found within civic

society, and finds an extensive culture of commemoration permeating the ritual life of the City.

In the second section the contributors approach issues of urban space from a variety of perspectives and with a considerable degree of cross-fertilisation. Harding discusses the changes to the physical environment of London during the seventeenth century and considers the impact of urban growth on shared conceptions of community and neighbourhood. This theme is taken up from a different perspective by Shoemaker's exploration of the influence of gender on contemporary spatial perceptions of the City, which argues that specific roles and social positions had a significant impact on the individual's perception of his or her physical environment. Hitchcock's contribution addresses the problem of understanding the urban poor through the commentaries of the civic elite and the administration, while Williams examines the development of attitudes towards urban green space.

The final section of the book focuses on questions of order and disorder, with a particularly interesting contribution by Peter Lake dealing with the development of notions of order in Stow and in other contemporary literature. Harris examines further the notion of the crowd in the later seventeenth and early eighteenth century, and Smith explores the religious significance of urban fires.

Overall the papers are of a consistently high quality, being the more valuable for bringing varied approaches to bear on a range of important issues. The volume will make a very useful addition, not only to the bookshelf of any scholar of London's history, but also to that of the historian of religion, culture and society more generally.

UNIVERSITY OF SUSSEX

DAVID HICKMAN

*Landgraf Moritz der Gelehrte. Ein Calvinist zwischen Politik und Wissenschaft.* Edited by Gerhard Menk. (Beiträge zur hessischen Geschichte, 15.) Pp. 264 incl. 21 black-and-white and 7 colour plates. Marburg: Trautvetter und Fischer, 2000. DM 49.80. 3 87822 112 6

*JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903417247

This volume examines Moritz den Gelehrten, one of the most interesting political leaders of the post-Reformation era. The ten articles, originally papers given at a colloquium in 1997, paint a rich picture of a territorial leader who tried to act as the true heir of his grandfather Philipp of Hesse. He did this not only by pursuing the vision of a politically reunified Hessian territory, but also by pushing the Reformation in a more radical, Calvinistic direction. Moreover, Moritz was an outstanding sponsor of the sciences and himself the author of scientific publications, hence the epithet 'der Gelehrte'. After examining current research, Gerhard Menk investigates, in 'Ein Regent zwischen dem Streben nach politischer Größe und wissenschaftlicher Beherrschung des Politischen' (pp. 7–78), Moritz's practical politics of how his vision met reality (see also Raingard Esser, 'Landgraf Moritz' Abdankung und sein politisches Vermächtnis', pp. 196–214). Menk draws the well-founded conclusion that Moritz failed totally as a politician, and as a result withdrew in favour of his son in 1627. Menk's second article 'Die Konfessionspolitik des Landgrafen Moritz' (pp. 95–138) and Werner Trossbach's 'Landgraf Moritz und das Problem von Mobilisierung und Partizipation in der "zweiten Reformation"' (pp. 139–58)

underline this conclusion by means of a detailed study of the strong opposition in the country to the 'Verbesserungspunkte' of 1605. With this Moritz had tried to complete the transition of the Landgrafschaft Hessen-Kassel to Calvinism. Similarly, Moritz's efforts to strengthen ramistic teaching methods in Hessian schools (replacing Melancthon's textbooks) had but limited success (see Arnd Friedrich, at pp. 159–72). Uta Löwenstein ('Nervus pecuniae: Versuche zur dispositio oder reformatio der Kasseler Hofhaltung', pp. 79–94) discusses the Landgraf's equally unsuccessful budgetary policy. When he succeeded in 1592, he inherited a well-ordered budget; his son on the other hand came into substantial debts. Three articles (Bruce T. Moran, at pp. 215–28, Heiner Borggreffe, at pp. 229–52, and Hartmut Broszinski at pp. 253–62) investigate Moritz's scientific work, especially his promotion of alchemy. Margret Lemberg examines the role and influence of women of Moritz's circle, focusing particularly especially on his politically able second wife Juliane von Nassau-Dillenburg (pp. 173–95). This volume demonstrates the state of research on Moritz and offers a successful mixture of detailed studies interpreting unknown sources and surveys linking that research to more general work on the post-Reformation era.

RUHR-UNIVERSITÄT BOCHUM

CHRISTOPH STROHM

*Calvinism on the frontier 1600–1660. International Calvinism and the Reformed Church in Hungary and Transylvania.* By Graeme Murdock. (Oxford Historical Monographs.) Pp. xiv + 359 pp. incl. 1 map and 1 table. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2000. £48. 0 19 820859 6

*JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903427243

Graeme Murdock's first book provides the best synoptic, monographic study of any major Calvinist community in its full international context currently available in print. That his subject is the most exotic and little-known major branch of the international Reformed tradition makes his achievement all the more remarkable; and the difficulty of the Hungarian sources and literature upon which it is predominantly based will further guarantee his book grateful readers and a very long shelf life. Aside from the sheer novelty of its material, perhaps the book's most invaluable and refreshing feature is its internationalism, which stems directly from conditions within the region studied. The absence of a local Reformed university or a great indigenous theological tradition forced Reformed students from Hungary and Transylvania to study abroad. Murdock therefore devotes an early chapter to tracing the region's dense web of international academic and intellectual links, first with Germany before the disasters of the 1620s, then primarily with the Dutch Republic, but also the less intensive but highly significant contacts with England. Educational reform at home was likewise dominated by what Murdock evocatively calls the 'three foreigners': not Hartlib, Dury and Comenius (all of whom feature repeatedly in the book) but Comenius, his teacher in Herborn, Johann Heinrich Alsted, and Alsted's son-in-law, Johann Heinrich Bisterfeld. In Hungary and Transylvania, however, these Reformed influences were domesticated in a unique confessional context, in which Calvinists coexisted not only alongside their traditional arch-enemies, the Catholics, and their doubtful allies, the Lutherans, but also with exotic species of religion scarcely encountered further west in this period: anti-Trinitarians,



Sabbatarians, the Romanian Orthodox and, of course, Islam. This combination of internationalism and exoticism informs and enlivens the treatment of the more traditional material examined in the second half of the book, which traces the ways in which these and other imports bred still further variety, discussion and discord within the Hungarian Reformed community. The erastian forms of church government favoured by Transylvanian princes clashed with strict Presbyterianism and Independency, imported once students moved from Germany to the Dutch Republic and England. English and Dutch Puritanism likewise exacerbated local frustration with the difficulty of imposing novel standards of discipline on often isolated populations and spilled over into demands to purify public worship and private piety. Such disputes notwithstanding, Calvinist programmes of moral reform and church discipline were informally integrated into the Transylvanian state, and Reformed clergy responded by idealising the prince through frequent parallels with godly rulers of the Old Testament. This too proved a mixed blessing, however: the rise of a distinctly eschatological strain of biblical exhortation in the 1650s helped precipitate the military disasters of 1657 which brought the golden age of the Reformed Church in Transylvania to an end. Here, as throughout this book, Murdock's entirely fresh material casts vivid and unexpected light upon more familiar Reformed experiences further west, making this unquestionably one of the most impressive and valuable books published in the field of international Calvinism in recent years.

UNIVERSITY OF ABERDEEN

HOWARD HOTSON

*Sacraments, ceremonies and the Stuart divines. Sacramental theology and liturgy in England and Scotland 1603–1662.* By Bryan D. Spinks. Pp. xiv + 240 incl. 20 figs. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2002. £40. 0 7546 1475 1  
*JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S002204690343724X

This book begins with a chapter on the 'sacramental legacy' of the sixteenth-century reformers, defining a typology where Zwingli maintained a 'symbolic parallelism' and Calvin a 'symbolic instrumentalism'. Spinks proceeds to apply these terms to representative divines of England and Scotland. But under the Stuarts there emerged a group of 'reformed patristic' divines (Andrewes and Laud in England; William Forbes and James Wedderburn in Scotland) who extended the 'higher' Calvin to embrace ceremonies redolent of medieval Catholicism. Because of the politics of Charles I, the outcome was civil war, though matched for a time by theological and sacramental uniformity based on the Westminster Assembly. At the Restoration the Church of England returned to the Book of Common Prayer, while the Church of Scotland abandoned all imposed liturgies, though maintaining the importance of the sacraments as may be seen in the flourishing of communion seasons. The inclusion of figures (portraits, chalices, etc.) and six appendices adds interest to the book. However, some readers will be dissatisfied with its lack of broader theological context and preference for brief consecutive notices of theologians rather than a more integrated consideration, making it too much like a catalogue. The book contains a significant number of typographical errors, including several dates, which may prove confusing. The conclusion of this idiosyncratic but generally helpful book remarks on sacrament and liturgy in the present day, and seeks to find in older sacramental theology and liturgical practice

new points of departure for liturgical conversation and practice in the contemporary world.

UNIVERSITY COLLEGE OF CAPE BRETON,  
SYDNEY,  
NOVA SCOTIA

DAVID GEORGE MULLAN

*Registres de la Compagnie des pasteurs de Genève au temps de Calvin, XIII: 1617–1618.* Edited by Nicolas Fornerod, Philippe Boros, Gabriella Cahier and Matteo Campagnolo. (Travaux d'Humanisme et Renaissance, 351.) Pp. lviii + 492 incl. 3 ill. Geneva: Librairie Droz, 2001. DM 82. 2 600 00651 6; 0082 6081 *JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903447246

This volume is the most recent of the series which is providing the wider academic community with an excellent source for the study of church history, socio-cultural history and the history of Geneva and its institutions. The Genevan Company of Pastors was, in effect, the national synod for the small city-state republic. It met every week and, at times, more often. This volume presents the recorded deliberations of the Company from 3 January 1617 to 28 August 1618. Useful as these minutes are, this volume also contains about 150 pages of correspondence between the Company and other Reformed communities and ministers across Europe. The minutes and correspondence are accompanied by an excellent set of notes. However, the reader is advised to expect that a facility in Latin and Italian as well as French is necessary to use this volume fully and successfully. Even with this linguistic challenge, the volume more than repays the reader. Every aspect of Genevan society (on the micro level) and much of Europe's wider religious issues (the macro level) entered into the ken of the Company. Thus, this volume provides a unique opportunity, especially in conjunction with the other twelve volumes, to examine the evolution of an important institution, its relationship with other religious bodies and officials across Europe, and its efforts to impose its vision of a godly community on the general populace of Geneva.

UNIVERSITY OF ABERDEEN

WILLIAM G. NAPHY

*Making heretics. Militant Protestantism and free grace in Massachusetts, 1636–1641.* By Michael P. Winship. Pp. xvii + 322. Princeton–Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2002. £19.95. 0 691 08943 4 *JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903457242

This is the first book-length work on the 'Antinomian crisis' for almost forty years. It should be made plain that readers looking for a historiographical synthesis would not find it here, for that is far from Winship's intention. He has provided a close reading of the controversy around a narrative thread. He identifies himself with English revisionism but this is only in the sense that he holds that the richness of context is a necessary analytical tool to free us from the particular emphases of the current historiography. He does not suggest that this provides a 'pure', 'objective' reading, merely one which creates a different perspective for his thesis. He lays his cards on the table in terms of nomenclature, preferring 'free grace controversy' to 'Antinomian' or 'legalism' partly because this is contemporary but also because it reflects his thesis. He argues that the theological heart of the struggle was a matter of

means of gaining assurance that one is saved, with John Cotton and parts of his Church reacting against the preparationist theology of Thomas Shepard *et al.* He shows how the varieties of practical divinity existed in a dynamic tension internally and with the 'Puritan underground' that has recently attracted attention. The narrative is usefully bolstered by a broader range of sources than the 'usual suspects', with the Hartlib papers proving particularly helpful. Part of the impact of the narrative that Winship carefully constructs is that it gives more attention to the roles played by John Cotton, Henry Vane, John Wheelwright and Thomas Shepard; rather less to Anne Hutchinson. The recent attention to gender is not absent but it is rather marginalised. It also removes the sense of inevitability; Winship's version is of an unhappy accident caused by a combination of Puritanism lacking the institutional restraints it had in England, spiritual anxieties, personalities and potential conflicts coming to realisation. This is generally convincing and Winship's attention to short-term detail is to be applauded; he always makes it clear where the absences in the sources take him into areas of suggestion and speculation rather than clear demonstration. However, there is an underlying concern that goes with the declared revisionist allegiance: how far is the 'proof' of contingency inherent in the style of micro-narrative rather than in the crisis itself? This is a question which the author fails to address, partly because his conclusion consists primarily of an account of the later lives of the main characters. This is to be regretted because the recasting of the theological contentions is convincing, the reconstruction of the shifts of attitude and the set pieces, especially the trials, is splendid. The place occupied by Shepard, read against his spirituality, is new and persuasive. This is a substantial addition to the literature on the area.

UNIVERSITY OF EDINBURGH

TOM WEBSTER

*Obedient heretics. Mennonite identities in Lutheran Hamburg and Altona during the confessional age.* By Michael D. Driedger. (St Andrews Studies in Reformation History.)

Pp. xiii + 224. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2002. £55. 0 7546 0292 3

*JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903467249

This book focuses on the Flemish Mennonites, the major Mennonite congregation in the Hamburg–Altona area (the church itself was located in Danish Altona, but many members lived in the adjacent Hanseatic free city of Hamburg). The Flemish congregation was so named because of the group's affiliation in inter-Mennonite divisions, and also because it was comprised of religious immigrants who stemmed originally from the southern Netherlands. The period studied is primarily that from the 1650s to the 1710s, during which the 250-person congregation was under the leadership of the businessman and lay preacher, Geerit Roosen. This is the first study of this important congregation – the successor to Menno Simons's congregation of Fresenburg in Holstein – by a professional historian. As the title indicates, the emphasis is on the plural identity of a tolerated group of religious nonconformists. The Flemish congregation had an important affiliation to the main conservative group of Dutch Mennonites, the Zonists, who stressed the importance of a number of approved confessions of faith. This confessional precision helped it to outlive its spiritualist, immersionist rivals in Hamburg–Altona, the Dompelaars, and distinguished it from Quakers and Socinians; however, the Zonist connection was not so strong as to preclude the Zonists' great factional rival, Galenus Abrahamsz,

preaching before the Hamburg–Altona Flemish Mennonites. In an important chapter the author enters into discussion with the scholarship on ‘confessionalisation’ in post-Reformation Germany, and demonstrates that in Lutheran Hamburg militant orthodox Lutheranism could be destabilising for political authority, while quietist nonconformists like the Mennonites were supporters of order. The Flemish Mennonites included a disproportionate number of prosperous merchants, particularly in the whaling fleet. Their involvement in business life created tensions with traditional Mennonite prohibitions against the swearing of oaths and use of weapons for self-defence. Two chapters explore the way congregational leaders defined Mennonite principles on these matters, and the way individual practice developed compromises between religious principles and worldly practicalities. In a final chapter the author explores the gradual accommodation of the Flemish Mennonites to marriage of members outside the group – a matter for excommunication in the previous century – as an illustration that the boundaries of the religious group became increasingly permeable. He concludes that the pronouncements of leaders are often misleading as descriptions of the behaviour of their ordinary followers. The confessional identity was one identity for a Flemish Mennonite in late seventeenth-century Hamburg–Altona, as she or he adapted to an increasingly plural world.

QUEEN’S UNIVERSITY,  
KINGSTON,  
ONTARIO

JAMES M. STAYER

*The Church in an age of danger. Parsons and parishioners, 1660–1740.* By Donald A. Spaeth. (Cambridge Studies in Early Modern British History.) Pp. xiv + 283 incl. 1 map and 13 tables. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000. £40. 0 521 35313 0  
*JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903477245

The Restoration Church of England has been fortunate in its historians ever since Gilbert Burnet, the Williamite bishop of Salisbury, took to the writing of contemporary history. Wiltshire has likewise long benefited from the labours of local historians, of whom Burnet’s older contemporary John Aubrey remains the most influential. The differing contributions of Burnet and Aubrey thus provide uniquely strong testimony for Donald A. Spaeth in his important assessment of religious practice in Wiltshire between the restoration of Charles II and the markedly anti-clerical atmosphere that prevailed from Westminster outwards in the 1730s. The Latitudinarian Burnet strongly denied the force of the ‘Church in danger’ charge that Tories were to make their own in the first half of the eighteenth century; Aubrey’s variety of Interregnum Anglicanism had laid the foundations for the form of High Church piety that was to remain a marked feature of lay religion in Wiltshire well beyond 1740. Spaeth’s is very much a local study, predominantly focusing on the parish in religious life, and it is, therefore, concerned more with the everyday politics of practice and personality than with the confessional politics that have tended to preoccupy historians in recent years. Inevitably, some things are lost in a parochial perspective, not least an appreciation of the dynamics between national and local religious politics. Similarly, and, not without significance for the county in which Thomas Hobbes was born, the impact of politico-theology is not examined with any degree of seriousness by Spaeth. Above all, Spaeth neglects the vitality of ideological

anti-clericalism – one of the major fears that inspired the ‘Church in danger’ slogan – and, consequently, the fascinating figure of Thomas Chubb, the artisanal Salisbury deist, goes unnoticed. Analysis of Chubb’s career would have added much to the wider implications of this effective micro-study, and it would have brought together the intellectual and religious history of the period in an interesting and productive manner, not least as it raises fundamental questions about the religious sophistication of the relatively uneducated in England’s provinces. Spaeth’s is a model study of parish piety, especially in the way it charts relations between parsons and parishioners, and it covers a great deal of ground, from the types of men who served as clergy, to their changing role as celebrants of the rights of passage of their parishioners. Spaeth is a master of ecclesiastical and legal records, which he deploys in the creation of often compelling, and never less than telling narratives. It is the nature of such records to tell one more about failure than it does success, but Spaeth sketches a vivid portrait of tension and balance in the parish, and his mastery of detail never prevents an overall picture from emerging. His masterly study of the complex churchmanship behind the introduction of congregational singing in his final substantive chapter is particularly subtle, and it will prove invaluable in any future appreciation of the varied elements that make up the inherent and sometimes confusing multiplicity that was eighteenth-century Anglicanism. More studies of this kind are sorely needed if the confessional complexity of the long eighteenth century is properly to be appreciated for the dynamic and largely integrative force it was.

UNIVERSITY OF SUSSEX

B. W. YOUNG

*I gesuiti e l'illuminismo. Politica e religione in Austria e nell'Europa centrale (1773–1798)*. By Antonio Trampus. (Facoltà di Lettere e Filosofia. Fondo di studi Parini-Chirio. New Ser., 5) Pp. 388. Florence: Olschki, 2000. L. 77,000. 88 222 4874 0  
*JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903487241

The Society of Jesus may have been formally disbanded by Clement XIV in 1773, but its erstwhile members did not easily abandon their mutual ties or the marks of their religious formation, as Antonio Trampus’s careful investigation of the fate of the Jesuits in the hereditary territories of the Habsburg monarchy confirms. Here the hostility of the state towards them had been nothing like that experienced in France, Spain or Portugal and, mindful of their services as confessors in the imperial house, Maria Theresa offered them appreciable protection during the last seven years of her reign. Abolition was thus not extinction despite the end of a novitiate and falling numbers (a reduction in Austria from 691 in 1774 to 491 in 1780), for whether former Jesuits after 1773 became parish priests, teachers, journalists or librarians, their new status was overlaid by an older ‘submerged identity’. Indeed, the Austrian Jesuits consolidated a series of informal networks that permitted the retention of a sense of group solidarity, what, in effect, as Trampus plausibly contends, amounted to the Company’s continuing capacity to participate in the controversial life of the late eighteenth century. With considerable cohesion, ex-Jesuits fought on in defence of the Church, no longer hindered or distracted by their membership of such a controversial order. They were particularly engaged against the spread of Illuminism (one of the first acts of Plus VI’s pontificate had been to condemn it in an encyclical of 1775, *Inscrutabile divinae sapientia*); allowed themselves

to be recruited as masons in order to hinder the outreach of the craft; sponsored the new *Societas Fidei Jesu* of Nicol Pannacari; worked to bring about the Catholic renewal that was well under way in the Tyrol and Bavaria by the 1790s and, through it all, nourished the hope that one day, their order would be re-established. By focusing on a somewhat narrow geographical ambit and then undertaking an exhaustive documentary study, Trampus has succeeded in assessing the Jesuit 'presence' in the generation after the 1773 dissolution more systematically than any previous study, except perhaps Hoffmann's 1969 study of the Jesuits in Prussia under Frederick the Great. His important monograph reveals the complexities of later eighteenth-century Catholic life, and calls into question some of the classic assumptions about the character of the Catholic *Aufklärung*, at least as it was affected by Austrian Jesuit involvement. The challenge is now for other close geographical studies to see how far his conclusions can be mirrored in other parts of Europe, especially in the Iberian monarchies and in Italy.

UNIVERSITY OF LEICESTER

NIGEL ASTON

*Iron in our blood. A history of the Presbyterian Church in NSW, 1788–2001.* By Mark Hutchinson. Pp. xvi + 534 + 24 plates. Sydney: Ferguson Publications/Centre for the Study of Australian Christianity, 2001. \$40 (paper) plus \$15 post and packing from Ferguson Memorial Library, Presbyterian Church of Australia, PO Box 2196, Strawberry Hills, NSW 2012, Australia. o 949197 90 4  
*JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903497248

Mark Hutchinson has produced a fine account, qualitatively different from earlier histories, because he has placed Presbyterianism so skilfully in its social context. He argues that the different ethnicity of the Presbyterians demands a different approach from that used by historians of Anglicanism and Roman Catholicism, although he does not exploit the possibilities of exploration of the diversities of the English, Irish, Scots and Welsh strands of Presbyterianism. Little attention is given to the complexities of power within assembly and presbytery, or to changes in governance. Hutchinson has chosen to concentrate on the major themes of physical expansion, definition of identity, and the struggles over proposals for reunion. He brings out very well how difficult it was to cope with the huge distances and sparse population of outback New South Wales. Finances were never adequate for home or overseas missions, or ministerial education. Overseas trained ministers were indispensable until well into the twentieth century, ensuring that worship, hymnody and parish life remained heavily influenced by British models. That was challenged by proposals for reunion and it was no accident that the continuing Church was strongest in New South Wales. Hutchinson's analysis of that complex story opens up a number of fresh perspectives on the marginalisation of all the Churches. The continued struggle to construct authentic Presbyterianism will be a basis for further work, for it is too soon to deal with some of the personalities involved. Hutchinson has written a fine denominational history, showing how such study can intersect with religious and social history. The book is of much more than Presbyterian and Australian interest.

UNITING CHURCH IN AUSTRALIA

IAN BREWARD

*What was the Oxford Movement?* By George Herring. Pp. xi + 146. London–New York: Continuum, 2002. £12.99 (paper). 0 8264 5186 1  
*JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903507242

George Herring has produced a useful introduction to the Oxford Movement, outlining the key contexts, ideas and events, supported by well chosen quotations from primary texts. The basic themes are covered, although a wider discussion of the results of recent research would have been valuable, even if it meant adding to the book's length. Herring argues that the Tractarians were theological innovators rather than revivalists, and emphasises their discontinuity (indeed their 'fundamental break', p. 44) with the Anglican past. The 'myth' that Newman's secession of 1845 was a catastrophe which left the movement in defeat and disarray, is comprehensively dismissed. Herring maintains that many Tractarians greeted Newman's departure with 'relief' (p. 74) and saw it as an opportunity to prove themselves in the parochial world outside Oxford. Statistics are mustered to demonstrate that the movement continued to gather adherents over the next thirty years, and the reader is treated to bar-graphs showing the increasing number of Tractarian graduates, Tractarian ordinands and Tractarian incumbents. Here Herring over-stretches himself. Despite admitting that Tractarianism is 'as slippery as the proverbial bar of soap' (p. 44), he boldly aims to identify the church party allegiance of hundreds of clergymen. Many have begun to eschew such a cut-and-dried approach and Arthur Burns, for instance, appeals for a cessation of this 'endless counting of heads', yet Herring persists in his calculations. An epilogue on the 'crisis' facing modern Anglo-Catholicism after the ordination of women is provocative but out of place.

ABINGDON

ANDREW ATHERSTONE

*Staat und Kirche in der neueren deutschen Geschichte. Fünf Abhandlungen.* By Christoph Link. (Schriften zum Staatskirchenrecht, 1.) Pp. 204. Frankfurt-am-Main: Peter Lang, 2000. £24 (paper). 3 631 36681 7; 1437 3149  
*JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903517249

Christoph Link is Professor of Constitutional, Administrative and Church Law at Erlangen. This book provides a summary of the legislation concerning the relationship between Church and State in Germany during the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. He sees two main themes: the growing influence of concepts of religious freedom and separation of Church and State; and continuing high levels of practical co-operation through most of this period (in spite of several major conflicts). The approach is mainly descriptive. Link's purpose is to clarify the complexities of the various enactments, rather than to explore the political, let alone the social and religious, context in which these came about. He provides extensive coverage of such key national developments as the Secularisation of 1803–6, the Weimar Constitution, the Reich Concordat and the Basic law, while not neglecting the distinctive situations in particular states. In those parts of Germany that became the Federal Republic, as indeed in many other parts of western Europe, the period of greatest harmony between Church and State seems to have been from the later 1940s to the mid-1960s. In the later chapters the calm tones of a book which is informative, but generally rather dry, give way to mild polemic as Link rejects 'narrow' or 'dogmatic' applications of the principle of Separation, and defends the wide-ranging public role which the Churches continue to exercise in contemporary Germany. He

provides a brief and lucid guide to a subject on which many long and dense books have been written.

UNIVERSITY OF BIRMINGHAM

HUGH MCLEOD

*The premillennial faith of James Brookes. Reexamining the roots of American dispensationalism.* By Carl E. Sanders II. Pp. xi + 201. Lanham, MD: University Press of America, 2001. \$37. 0 7618 1890 1

*JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903527245

Carl Sanders has written a careful study of a nineteenth-century forerunner of American fundamentalism. James Brookes became an important leader of pre-millennialists with the publication of his book *Maranatha* (1874) and his long-time editorship of *The Truth* magazine. Moreover, Brookes was among the original organisers of the Niagara Bible Conference (a key actor in the emergence of a Fundamentalist coalition by the turn of the century) and served as its president. Sanders argues that the received view that emphasises the role of J. N. Darby and the Plymouth Brethren in the genesis of a dispensationalist pre-millennialism is simplistic and misleading. He concludes that Darby and the Brethren were not major influences on Brookes whose thinking was shaped by several sources including antebellum pre-millennialism and Old School Presbyterianism. Brookes appears to have been converted to pre-millennialist views around 1863 before even encountering Darby. His ecclesiology, especially his emphasis upon what some then termed the 'spirituality of the Church' owed much to indigenous American sources, evangelical and Presbyterian. Moreover, Brookes's biblical hermeneutic reflected a similar mixture that was not exclusively Darbyite. Sanders's short study is a helpful corrective to earlier, less-nuanced interpretations. Although the author seems occasionally too concerned to defend Brookes, his book ably demonstrates that the roots of fundamentalism were more complex than some have assumed. As such, it is a helpful contribution to the growing literature on late nineteenth-century evangelicalism.

GROVE CITY COLLEGE,  
PENNSYLVANIA

GILLIS J. HARP

*Muscular Christianity. Manhood and sports in Protestant America, 1880–1920.* By Clifford Putney. Pp. x + 300 + 10 plates. Cambridge, MA–London: Harvard University Press, 2001. £27.50. 0 674 00634 8

*JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903537241

Assiduously researched, engagingly written and finely illustrated, this book is a valuable addition to the growing number of studies of the relationship between religion and masculinity in the modern period. It covers in the American context much of the same ground as Norman Vance's pioneering study *The sinews of the spirit: the ideal of Christian manliness in Victorian literature and religious thought* (1985), though with a greater emphasis upon the genesis and growth of Protestant organisations committed to furthering the cult of bodily and spiritual athleticism. It also draws more than Vance did upon critical perspectives derived from gender and cultural studies. As Putney demonstrates, the enthusiasm for muscular Christianity in America owed much to the writings of Charles Kingsley and Thomas Hughes in mid-Victorian England. However, he is particularly good at unravelling the particular skein of



anxieties that in the American context made the project of reconfiguring the religious ideal of masculinity seem both desirable and urgent. These fears centred upon the supposedly declining virility of the Anglo-Saxon white male – now transported from the physically and morally bracing atmosphere of the frontier to the sickly environment of urban office life – and the growth of male teenage delinquency. Many Protestant Christian leaders also evinced a sharply negative response to first-wave feminism and the supposed feminisation of church life. Equally important was the hope that linking the Christian message to sporting prowess, and projecting a more rugged model of masculinity, would prove to be an effective means of reversing the declining commitment of young men to the life of the Churches. Despite the enthusiastic endorsement of President Theodore Roosevelt, and the heroic labours of organisations such as the YMCA and the Boys' Brigade, these hopes were never to be realised. As Putney argues, the ideal of chivalric Christian muscularity was seriously dented by the slaughter of the First World War. At the same time, the growing rift between liberal and fundamentalist Protestants made co-operation under the banner of muscular Christianity much less easy to achieve in the early part of the twentieth century. Muted echoes of this ethos still linger on in contemporary Protestant organisations such as Promise Keepers (a men's movement founded by a former university football coach), but in reality sport turned out to be a rival to the Churches as much as an ally in the battle for men's allegiances. This suggests one significant gap in Putney's book. His is a study of ideas and institutions. He does not attempt the far more difficult sociological task of assessing the extent to which muscular Christian values were straightforwardly internalised by those at whom they were directed. Nevertheless, within the limits he has set himself he has succeeded admirably.

UNIVERSITY OF BRISTOL

SEAN GILL

*The life of prayer in a world of science. Protestants, prayer, and American culture 1870–1930.* By Rick Ostrander. (Religion in America.) Pp. vii + 232. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000. £30. 0 19 513610 1

*JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903547248

In orthodox nineteenth-century Protestant theology, petitionary prayer envisaged God intervening supernaturally in the affairs of this world on behalf of his children. In the aftermath of Charles Darwin's epochal 1859 work *The origin of species*, modern science ruled out *a priori* any non-naturalistic explanation of events in this world. Consequently, petitionary prayer, as traditionally conceived, proved to be rather problematic for many Protestants. While historians have explored Protestant attempts to meet the intellectual challenge of biblical criticism and Darwinism as well as the cultural challenges of industrialism, the history of prayer – probably the most common daily practice among Christians – has been overlooked. Rick Ostrander, an assistant professor at John Brown University in Siloam Springs, Arkansas, remedies this omission. After reviewing the modern scientific attack on prayer, Ostrander explores the evangelical Protestant apologetic of petitionary prayer. In the face of criticisms from modernity, late nineteenth-century evangelicals defended petitionary prayer with elaborate proofs of how God actually answered prayer. While conservative Protestants were often eager to resist modern culture, liberal Protestants were not. The remainder of the work is devoted to examining how liberal Protestants gradually accommodated both their understanding and their practice of prayer to

the modern world. Subsequent chapters examine the ideological context of liberal Protestant devotionism, the prevailing Christocentric liberal ethic of prayer, liberal Protestant attitudes toward healing and intercession, and liberal devotional teaching in the early twentieth century. Ostrander argues persuasively that Protestant modernists did not simply and quickly abandon conventional piety but instead reconceptualised prayer in the light of liberalism's belief in divine immanence. God, they believed, did not violate natural laws but instead used them to answer prayer. Liberal Protestants in the early twentieth century not only attempted to justify petitionary prayer in a world of science, they also tried to encourage a life of prayer in the busy modern world. Unlike evangelicals, liberal Protestants eagerly advocated a spirituality that was rather flexible in terms of when people prayed, how long they prayed and even how they prayed. This carefully researched study offers a fascinating window into how late nineteenth- and early twentieth-century liberal Protestants attempted to meet the challenge that modernity posed for traditional Christian beliefs and practices. Ostrander makes an excellent contribution to the history of liberal Protestantism as well as the history of the theology and practice of prayer.

GROVE CITY COLLEGE,  
PENNSYLVANIA

P. C. KEMENY

*Hippolyte Delehaye. Hagiographie critique et modernisme.* By Bernard Joassart. (Subsidia Hagiographica, 81.) Pp. viii + 442 + 4 plates; 443–902. Brussels: Société des Bollandistes, 2000. €150 (paper). 2 87365 009 5; 0 777 8112

*JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903557244

Joassart's work is a most welcome treatment of the twentieth century's chief proponent of 'critical hagiography' set within the context of the uneasy relationship between Catholicism and modernism. Although it includes biographical materials, its focus is appropriately upon the theory and method of the Jesuit Bollandist, Hippolyte Delehaye, and the controversies surrounding the publication of his works, most notably *Les Légendes hagiographiques* (1905, 1906, 1927), available in English as *The legends of the saints*. Delehaye's work is a classic and still one of the starting points for scholars interested in the history of the cult of the saints. Yet relatively little attention has been paid to modern historical method in late nineteenth- and early twentieth-century Catholic scholarship. Joassart's work helps to fill that gap. Volume i of this work offers a brief (and practical) introduction before developing, in three parts, its central themes: Delehaye's early years as a scholar and Bollandist; the theory and practices of the religious orders (along with the controversies surrounding them); and the reception – at times very hostile reception – of Delehaye's most important contribution to critical hagiography, *Les Légendes hagiographiques*. Volume ii provides almost 400 pages of the primary source material employed in the first volume. Joassart's work is more descriptive than analytical. None the less, by assessing his subject's originality and modernist tendencies, he shows quite clearly that Delehaye provided theoretical justification for critical hagiography, while maintaining the stance of a Catholic moderate. In brief, Delehaye embraced scientific methods but withdrew from putting them to work in a challenge to church traditions.

LAWRENCE UNIVERSITY

EDMUND M. KERN

*Erich Przywara, S.J. His theology and his world.* By Thomas F. O'Meara OP. Pp. xv + 254.

Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2002. \$35. 0 268 02763 3

*JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903567240

Erich Przywara (1889–1972) was a Silesian Jesuit whose name appears more regularly in overviews of theological history than does – in English – any detailed account of his work. The interest of the book under review lies in the light it throws, via his personality and literary output, on the German Catholic revival of the years immediately following the Great War. In his previous soundings in a theologically oriented *Germanistik*, O'Meara has concentrated on an earlier period. His work has explored the theological riches of nineteenth-century German Catholicism where a movement broadly dependent on the inspiration both of Romanticism and Idealism created a novel philosophical–theological framework for revelation in its relation to reason – as well as emphasising the inter-related roles of liturgy and spirituality in sustaining an 'organic' form of church life. Now he takes his story further. Erich Przywara, it appears, resumes the concerns of the nineteenth century and transmits them in a new form to both systematic and practical theologians in the middle decades of the twentieth. This study is important, then, for any account of the intellectual antecedents of both Karl Rahner and Hans Urs von Balthasar, the two chief Germanophone Catholic writers of the last fifty years and surely the most influential theological figures in modern Catholicism generally. O'Meara's book is a densely written study in which, however, the account of ideas tends sometimes to the impressionistic – a fault, or at any rate, a feature that is compounded by the baroque character of Przywara's prose. The endnotes – which testify to the unbroken continuity of interest in Przywara's work in German theological scholarship – also provide a useful resource for serious students of both the man and his 'world'.

BLACKFRIARS,  
CAMBRIDGE

AIDAN NICHOLS OP

*Heaven below. Early Pentecostals and American culture.* By Grant Wacker. Pp. xv + 364.

Cambridge, Mass.–London: Harvard University Press, 2001. £23.95.  
0 674 00499 X

*Business of the heart. Religion and emotion in the nineteenth century.* By John Corrigan.

Pp. xii + 389. Berkeley–Los Angeles–London: University of California Press,  
2002. \$40. 0 520 22196 6

*JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903577247

In his excellent study of the rise of Pentecostalism in the United States during the first quarter of the twentieth century, Grant Wacker provides the most perceptive and wide ranging analysis of the movement published in decades. Writing as an evangelical Christian who grew up in a Pentecostal family, Wacker is sympathetic towards the early Pentecostals and consciously tries to rescue them from the condescension or outright ridicule of most of their contemporaries who dismissed the 'holy rollers' as a regressive aberration in a progressive America. Beginning with a carefully nuanced exploration of early Pentecostals' core beliefs in personal salvation, the authority of the Bible, the power of prayer, Holy Ghost baptism, speaking in tongues and divine healing, Wacker goes on to examine the expression of those beliefs in worship, daily life and attitudes towards the wider world. He is

particularly informative on the development of Pentecostal worship and the gradual imposition of a degree of order on what to outsiders appeared to be chaotic and deafening meetings in which raw religious emotions found uninhibited expression. Wacker is equally insightful on the way in which strong leaders emerged in a movement which prided itself on being led only by the Holy Spirit.

Wacker is particularly challenging in his analysis of the social origins of the early Pentecostals. Drawing upon his own research and that of his students, he rejects the widely held view that the Pentecostals were recruited from the poor and social misfits. They were not the 'disinherited' as Robert Mapes Anderson has claimed, but represented a broad cross-section of rural and small town America. Among them were many manual workers, some small entrepreneurs and the occasional professional. Wacker is persuasive on this topic but it is not the core of his book. This centres on an analysis of early Pentecostal culture and the ways in which Pentecostals perceived and interacted with the wider society. The author is especially good in his discussion of women's roles, and on race relations in a movement which attracted many African-Americans. With regard to women, Wacker concludes that there was always a tension between the full and equal recognition of the spiritual gifts of women, especially as preachers and leaders, and a religious and social conformism which assigned women to more conventional roles. Similarly, the racial equalitarianism which found expression in many early Pentecostal meetings was quickly tempered by a more pragmatic accommodation to prevailing racial mores, especially but not only in the south. It is this tension between a religious idealism rooted in a desire to be guided by the Holy Spirit in every aspect of life and a pragmatic acceptance of the social and cultural expectations of their times which provides the major theme running through the book.

Wacker's research has been extensive, and he makes excellent use of autobiographies, diaries, polemical literature and magazines, as well as surviving denominational records. Where appropriate, he has also drawn on similar material from Britain and Scandinavia with which some early American Pentecostals had strong links. The book is also firmly rooted in a large secondary literature of varying quality, which Wacker uses critically and selectively to reinforce his own research. Much more than a narrative history, Wacker successfully meets his primary goal of recapturing the voice and ethos of a movement which contemporaries dismissed as wild and ephemeral, but which survived and grew into a major force in American Christianity.

John Corrigan's book is much more limited than his title suggests. His exploration of religion and emotion is centred on the so-called Businessmen's Revival in Boston in 1858/9 which followed an economic recession. Corrigan's reading in the extensive social science literature on the emotions is impressive, and he has also examined many of the tracts and magazines thrown up by the Revival, and much popular literature focused on Boston in the 1850s. Unfortunately, this material is used with only limited success. His opening chapter on the Revival itself is weak on the history and theology of American revivalism and, more important, fails to provide any clear analysis of the socioeconomic basis of Boston's Protestant churches at mid-century, and their attitudes towards and degree of involvement with the Revival. The chapter is too impressionistic, as are succeeding chapters on Boston society and economy, which make only limited use of a large and excellent secondary literature on that much studied city. Immigrants are largely absent from Corrigan's Boston except in

a later chapter where he discusses them rather superficially, along with African-Americans, as a negative reference group for some Boston Yankee Protestants.

Perhaps the best part of the book is Corrigan's discussion of gender and emotion in the context of changing middle-class attitudes towards marriage, and his account of the popular youth culture of the day. The author has read extensively in the contemporary literature on these topics, and makes many good points, but these chapters are only loosely related to the Businessmen's Revival in particular and Boston society in general. Of only limited interest to students of revivalism or Boston Protestantism, Corrigan's book has importance as a pioneering, if disjointed study of what the author sees as the commodification of emotional experience as reflected in the popular religious culture of mid nineteenth-century America.

UNIVERSITY OF HULL

LOUIS BILLINGTON

*Discerning the signs of the times. The vision of Elisabeth Behr-Sigel.* Edited by Michael Plekon and Sarah E. Hinlicky, translated by Lyn Breck, Michael Plekon, Deno Takles and Rachel Mortimer. Pp. xi + 148, Crestwood, NY: St Vladimir's Seminary Press, 2001. \$13.95 (paper). 0 88141 218 X

*JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903587243

Those who think that the discussion of the place of women in the Church has not reached Orthodoxy will find this book an eye-opener. It is a collection of ten papers by Elisabeth Behr-Sigel, some four of which deal with women in modern Orthodoxy and touch lightly but clearly upon the question of the possible ordination of women to the priesthood. Behr-Sigel has led a fascinating life that has included ministering in the French Reformed Church, marrying into the Russian emigration and theologically challenging priests and people to re-think positions that have been taken up unreflectively. The older papers, on Mother Maria Skobtsova, on Kenosis and on Bukharev are most revealing, though the latter can profitably be compared with Paul Vallière's more recent treatment. Those on the question of women and ministry are not as well argued as those that make up her book *The ministry of women in the Church*. An influence on Behr-Sigel and others that should one day be assessed is that of the late Fr Lev Gillet (the 'Monk of the eastern Church') who is referred to in almost every paper. The supporting essays are somewhat repetitive and there are number of factual mistakes, for example the 1998 talk that is paper 2 was given at Westminster College, Cambridge.

RIPON COLLEGE,  
CUDDESDON

GREGORY (GRAHAM) WOOLFENDEN