Jnl of Ecclesiastical History, *Vol. 54*, *No. 1*, *January 2003*. Printed in the United Kingdom

Reviews

Tradition and imagination. Revelation and change. By David Brown. Pp. vii + 402 + 8 plates. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999. £25. 0 19 826991 9

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903215682

Tradition and imagination is a book that will not be welcome in many parts of the Church. It will be seen as a challenge to the ultimate authority of Scripture because in dealing with changes in Christian belief brought by the movement of tradition, not only does it fail to use Scripture as the ultimate test for all such movement, it denies even that the scriptural canon stands still. God continues to reveal himself to the Church – and beyond (even within other religions) – and that self-revelation, particularly through the imagination, has been so extensive that David Brown considers that it affects the content of Scripture even if the text itself continues unchanged. He has clearly issued challenges to the conservative theologian, but lest the liberal biblical critic be complacent he is no easier in his outline of the weaknesses of that approach. All his moves are made with a view to the rehabilitation of the role of tradition in the theological enterprise. But he is relentless in his application of critical standards: 'As the history of Christianity well illustrates, even tradition itself needs first to be undermined before it can acquire a capacity for further development' (p. 51). Similarly those (like myself) who are interested in the theological contribution of the arts are encouraged by the role given to them, especially to painting, within the argument from the outset to the final chapter 'Art as revelation', but we too are brought up short when he reminds us that on the basis of Scripture the iconoclasts were right, and that if forced into accepting the absolute authority of Scripture, we may also be forced into what amounts to special pleading: 'Among the tasks with which I was entrusted during the decade when I was a member of the Doctrine Commission of the Church of England was the writing of a chapter endorsing artistic creativity. Deference to the biblical presumptions of the other members required that I began with Scripture as a foundation, and I remember well how extraordinarily difficult it proved adequately so to found our position' (p. 343). Brown's hard critical eye forces us all to reconsider how firm the basis of our position really is, but the deftness with which he moves his argument and the breadth of his erudition are hugely fruitful for our understanding of the biblical witness, the continuing self-revelation of God, the tradition, the imagination, the arts and truth. Finally, Brown's arguments concerning the artistic and theological development of images of the Nativity, the Magi and the Crucifixion bear interesting comparison with recent art-historical research and analysis, especially Neil MacGregor's *Seeing salvation*. Eric Fernie's research on Abbot Suger would

add yet further strength to the section on the transition to the Gothic. Where this book does not compare as well with related art-historical work, and this may seem a quibble, is in the use of illustrations, which are curiously detached from the text, but they could have been used to even greater effect in support of what is, after all, a strongly visual development. Brown maintained early in the project that 'what is at stake is nothing less than the nature of Christian identity and its capacity to accept further change under God's direction in its self-understanding' (p. 59). With this book, tradition and the imagination are very much back in play as important factors in the continuing life of the Church; considering their relegation in recent theological debate, that is a splendid and exciting accomplishment – and after this we still have volume two to look forward to which will bring these questions to bear on the individual and discipleship.

LADY MARGARET HALL, OXFORD ALLAN DOIG

The encyclopedia for Christianity, II: *E–I*. Edited by Erwin Fahlbusch, Jan Milič Lochman, John Mbiti, Jaroslav Pelikan and Lukas Vischer, translated by Geoffrey W. Bromiley. (Trans. of *Evangelisches Kirchenlexikon*, Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1986, 1989, 1992, 1996, 1997.) Pp. xxx + 787. Grand Rapids, Mich.–Cambridge: Eerdmans/Leiden–Boston–Cologne: Brill, 2001. £50. 0 8028 2414 5; 90 04 11695 8

Historical dictionary of Lutheranism. By Günther Gassmann (with Duane H. Larson and Mark W. Oldenburg). (Historical Dictionaries of Religions, Philosophies, and Movements, 35.) Pp. xxiii + 420. Lanham, MD–London: Scarecrow Press, 2001. £61.75. 0 8108 3945 8

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903225689

These two recently published works are both useful additions to reference libraries. *The Encyclopedia of Christianity* is the second volume of a five-volume work. Volume i was published in 1999 and the remaining volumes are expected over the next three years. It is an expanded English version of the third edition [1986–7] of the *Evangelisches Kirchenlexicon: internationale theologische Enzyklopaedie*. The additions include articles on most of the countries in the world with up-to-date statistical information on religious affiliation in the various countries. There are also additional biographical articles on important figures in church history and many of the other articles have been expanded or rewritten. This volume contains 326 articles often written by specialists in the area. They cover a wide variety of topics. In addition to the more traditional theological, biographical and biblical entries, the work includes articles on contemporary issues as well as on political and economic questions and on other religions. Among the topics are Ecology, Economy, Ego Psychology, Electronic Church, Environment, Euthanasia, Feminism, Group and Group Dynamics, Homosexuality, Iranian Religions. Three articles deal with Islam and two deal with Hinduism. The articles include concise and accurate summaries of the history and teachings of these religions and separate articles deal with their relations to Christianity. The presentation is balanced and strives to avoid a pro-Christian bias. The article on Islam and Christianity stresses the dialogue between the two faiths and growing

tolerance and does not mention the ongoing persecution of Christians by fundamentalist Muslims. In fact, the growth of fundamentalism among Muslims is not adequately covered considering the significance of this movement in the modern world. The articles on Christian doctrines (Eucharist, Grace, and Incarnation) are particularly useful as they provide an excellent summary of the development of these doctrines and clearly delineate differing Christian views upon them. There are also good articles on Christian doctrinal statements (Formula of Concord, Heidelberg Catechism, Helvetic Confession). Articles dealing with controversial ethical questions such as homosexuality present and explain differing points-of-view in a fair and balanced fashion. Meticulous cross-referencing and up-to-date bibliographies are another positive feature.

The *Historical dictionary of Lutheranism* is a considerably less ambitious work. It is the thirty-fifth volume in the series *Historical Dictionaries of Religions, Philosophies, and Movements*. The articles were written by three authors all of whom have taught in Lutheran seminaries. They clearly reflect the position of that branch of Lutheranism which the authors represent. Although they do acknowledge other Lutheran positions on topics on which Lutherans hold different points of view, like Jewish Missions, this is not always the case. Conservative Lutherans would, for example, probably not accept their description of Luther's view of Scripture or the continuing emphasis in many of the articles that Lutheran Orthodoxy turned Lutheranism into a rigid system that lost the freedom and creativity of Luther's original insights. In addition to the standard articles on Lutheran theology and major figures in Lutheran history, the *Dictionary* contains articles on modern issues and on ecumenical dialogue. Separate articles are devoted specifically to relations and dialogue with Anglicans, Baptists, Methodists, Reformed, Orthodox and Roman Catholics. The role of women in the Lutheran Church receives a good deal of attention. There are articles on Feminism, Feminist Theology, Ordination of Women and Women in the Church as well as on individual women who played a significant role in Lutheranism (Katharina Von Bora, Elisabeth Von Braunschweig, Elisabeth Fedde, Argula Von Grumbach, Anna Sarah Kugler, Bertha Paulssen, Amalie Sieveking, Anna Wasa, Katharina Zell). As might be expected in a dictionary, the articles are normally relatively short and are not as useful as the articles on the same subject in the *Encyclopedia of Christianity*. The work includes statistics on Lutheran bodies and a thorough up-to-date bibliography. However, the articles do not always reflect the most recent scholarship in the field. For example, the statement in the introduction that the late medieval Church was 'decadent and irrelevant in much of its life' clearly is not in accord with the findings of recent scholarship and is certainly not, as the author claims, the position of 'most historians'. Overall, this is a useful reference work that provides a good introduction to Lutheranism, but it must be used with a degree of caution keeping in mind the authors' point of view.

WHEATON, ILLINOIS

RUDOLPH W. HEINZE

A dictionary of Asian Christianity. Edited by Scott W. Sunquist (with David Wu Chu Sing and John Chew Hiang Chea). Pp. xliii + 947 incl. 5 maps. Grand Rapids, Mich.–Cambridge: Eerdmans, 2001. £52.99 ($75). 0 8028 3776 X

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903235685

This is a single volume reference work for the study of Christianity and the Christian Churches in Asia. According to the preface, the aims of the dictionary are to provide students with an overview of Asian Christianity, and to promote ecumenicalism among the Asian Churches and academic interchange between scholars. It seeks to achieve this through a wide-ranging collection of 1,260 signed articles; in addition to these it contains five maps, a list of the entries and a list of contributors with their religious or academic affiliations. These articles have been written to illustrate a range of 'survey terms' – movements or institutions covering all of Asia – and 'local terms' – leaders, institutions and movements known only in a particular region. Consequently, articles deal with a range of broad topics such as Buddhism, racism, and the Vietnam War, and historical and geographical surveys of Asian countries (all are treated both as topics in their own right, and in the context of their relationship with Christianity), as well as significant individuals and institutions within the Asian Churches. The articles range from several pages in length to one or two paragraphs. Most have a bibliography, and all significant terms are cross-referenced. The system of entries and cross-referencing is designed to allow readers to place Christianity within the relevant cultural, political and religious context.

The work is well aware of its limitations, stating clearly what has been omitted (specifically western missionaries who had little significant impact in the region, and Protestant missionary societies), and what has been extensively summarised (material on Asian Christian colleges, universities and seminaries which, according to the editors, would have filled a dictionary in its own right). It is less clear, though, what criteria have been applied in the compilation of the bibliographies. In one case at least, that of the Hidden Christians [of Japan], only one work relating to Christianity in sixteenth- and seventeenth-century Japan is listed, and this cannot have been the only work consulted by the compiler. However, in other cases the bibliographies are much fuller, containing a mix of up-to-date general works and more specialist volumes, and are clearly of use to those wishing to pursue research or to gain a fuller understanding of a particular topic.

By its very nature this dictionary must be something of a lucky dip, but it achieves a remarkable degree of diversity and coverage. For example, the 'A' section begins with 'Aba I, Mar' (a sixth-century *catholicos* of the East Syrian Church), and finishes more than fifty entries later with 'Azariah, Vedanayagam Samuel' (first Indian bishop of the Anglican Church in India), having progressed via, amongst others, 'Ainu People', 'Ancestor Worship', 'Ashram Movement' and 'Augustinians'. As such it forms a valuable resource both for the insatiably curious and the academic researcher.

University of East Anglia Andrew J. Finch

Historical atlas of Christianity. 2nd revised and expanded edn. By Franklin H. Littell. Pp. xv+440 incl. numerous ills. New York–London: Continuum, 2001 (first publ. 1976). £30. 0 8264 1303 X

The second one thousand years. Ten people who defined a millennium. Edited by Richard John Neuhaus. Pp. xii+126. Grand Rapids, Mich.–Cambridge: Eerdmans, 2001. £9.99 (paper). 0 8028 4905 9

Christianity. Two thousand years. Edited by Richard Harries and Henry Mayr-Harting. Pp. xii+279 incl. 8 figs. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001. £12.99. 0 19 924485 5

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903245681

The atlas, a revised edition of a work first published in 1976, is a disappointment. The black-and-white maps are poor and frequently very badly reproduced; without good maps, an atlas serves scant purpose. The Neuhaus volume contains chapters on Gregory VII, Maimonides, Aquinas, Dante, Columbus, Calvin, Pascal, Rousseau, Lincoln and John Paul II. Whether they are indeed helpful figures through which to approach the debates of their individual centuries is open to question. The book lacks any conclusion or a strong introduction and has a disparate feel to it. The Harries and Mayr-Harting volume began as a series of public lectures given in Oxford to mark the end of the second millennium. The roll-call – Henry Chadwick, Averil Cameron, Henry Mayr-Harting, Kallistos Ware, Alexander Murray, Diarmaid MacCulloch, Jane Shaw, Jane Garnett, Adrian Hastings and Richard Harries – is impressive and they clearly did not sell their listeners short.

Instead, we have the valuable combination of adroit summaries and thoughtful introductions to debate. The tone is accessible: Murray suggests that in northern Europe 'Christianity offered what *Which?* magazine would call the "best buy"'(p. 104). There is also due weight for difficult issues, such as Christianity among slaves and the treatment of Jews. There is also a rich understanding of the diversity of Christianity, as in Adrian Hastings's fine elucidation of shifts during the twentieth century. This collection is an impressive contribution to the exposition of its subject and a valuable guide to current thinking.

EXETER JEREMY BLACK

Theologische Realenzyklopädie, XXXII: *Spurgeon – Taylor*. By Gerhard Müller. Pp. iv+784. Berlin–New York: Walter de Gruyter, 2001. DM 402. 3 11 002218 4; 3 11 016712 3

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903255688

Huge articles on baptism (*Taufe*) and sin. As usual the editors have picked excellent authorities to write – especially, for example, the article on Anabaptists (*Taufer*) by J. M. Stayer and H. J. Goertz, or David Luscombe on Stephen Langton (NB under letter S). For countries: Sudan (pessimistic), Strassburg (excellent, including what happened after the well-known Reformation years), South Africa, Syria. In organisation, State (holds the national state outmoded), the city (*Stadt*, examines the classic dispute about the town in Reformation origins), state churches (*Staatskirche*, seen as relics), college foundations (*Stift*), superintendent, synod. For the early Church, Sulpicius Severus, Synesius. For the

Reformation, Staupitz by Berndt Hamm, important, Suarez, Johannes Sturm; perhaps Jeremy Taylor and Syncretism count here. For the modern Church: Stahl, D. F. Strauss, Edith Stein and Taizé. The two English examples, Streeter and Spurgeon, feel relatively less weighty. Devotions – the stigmatised, in number about 350 but not quite all Christians and mostly nuns; hours of prayer (*Stundengebet*); the illustrated article on fonts (*Taufstein*), and the use of dancing in religious devotion (*Tanz*). Synagoge and Talmud are useful articles for Jewish tradition. For ethics, it is interesting on Suicide and does not omit the justifying example of Jochem Klepper the German patriot with a Jewish wife in Nazi Germany.

Selwyn College, Owen Chadwick
Cambridge

Anno domini. The origins of the Christian era. By Georges Declercq. Pp. 206. Turnhout: Brepols, 2000. B. Fr. 807. 2 503 51050 7

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903265684

It has long been known that the era of the Incarnation was an invention of the sixth-century Scythian monk, Dionysius Exiguus, as a by-product of his work on Easter tables, and commentaries on this subject have abounded from Bede in the early eighth century to Krusch in the nineteenth and C. W. Jones in the twentieth. Declercq's lucid essay offers a broad chronological survey of the origins of the Dionysian system from its invention to its general adoption in western Europe during the eleventh century. Its origins lay, on the one hand, in the emergence of Christian world history culminating in the influential chronicle of Eusebius of Caesarea with its divisions into eras since Creation and with its specifically Christian era; and, on the other, in the efforts to establish a reliable system for dating Easter. The date of the Passion and Resurrection was linked to an event in the lunar calendar, the Passover, and synchronising a lunar date with our solar year was difficult, too difficult for most of the computists of our earlier centuries. Various synchronising cycles were adopted in east and west, and the Alexandrian nineteen-year cycle proved more reliable than the varied cycles adopted in the west from the eighty-four-year cycle, which was to be defended by Colman and the Irish at the Synod of Whitby, to the 532-year cycle of Victorius of Aquitaine. This unreliability led to a Bishop Petronius asking Dionysius Exiguus, a scholar of some distinction in or around Rome, to elucidate the dating of Easter. Dionysius' nineteen-year tables dated the years, not from the era of Diocletian, as had earlier been the case, but from the year of the Incarnation. Declercq suggests a novel reason for Dionysius' choice. He argues plausibly that Dionysius' use of the era of the Incarnation was inspired by the Christian era of Eusebius, and that the *Preface of Felix, abbot of Gillitanus*, which is dated 616, and has long been known, offers supporting evidence. If the actual year chosen for AD 1 was not consistent with Eusebius' starting point, this mattered less to Dionysius than establishing an accurate and perpetual cycle for Easter dates. Dionysius' Easter tables and his new Incarnation era had the powerful and decisive support of Bede, and they both spread with Bede's *De temporum ratione* and the Anglo-Saxon missionaries on the continent. Throughout the early Middle

Ages, the computus was intensively studied in the schoolroom as the multitude of surviving computistical texts testifies, and teachers like Raban Maur, Pacificus of Verona and Byrhtferth of Ramsey guided pupils through the intricacies of Easter dating. The modern student, armed with Declercq's essay and the fuller references to the texts in Jones's edition of Bede's computistical works, now has a clear and helpful guide.

WOODFORD GREEN P. MCGURK

Subtle bodies. Representing angels in Byzantium. By Glenn Peers. (The Transformation of the Classical Heritage, 32.) Pp. xv+236 incl. 19 ills. Berkeley–Los Angeles–London: University of California Press, 2001. £23.50 ($37.50). 0 520 22405 1

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903275680

Our familiarity today with the portrayal of angels makes it hard to appreciate the conceptual problems this involved for nascent early Christian art: their portrayal was of course banned in Judaism, implicitly in Exodus xx.4 and explicitly in Mekhilta (BaHodesh 6), while from a Greek philosophical point of view, how could the immaterial be portrayed by the material? The arguments over this of course came to a head in Byzantium during the Iconoclast Controversy of the eighth and ninth centuries. This book, by an art historian, offers a careful analysis of a wide range of texts on the subject, ranging in time from early Christianity to the period of the Iconoclast Controversy. The arguments in these texts against and for the representation of angels are set out and discussed, and there are also two chapters on the cult of angels, one of which is devoted especially to the cult of the Archangel Michael. Despite a little repetition here and there, this is a stimulating discussion, and one which is of much more than just specialist interest.

WOLFSON COLLEGE, OXFORD SEBASTIAN BROCK

The origins of Christendom in the west. Edited by Alan Kreider. Pp. xvi+371. Edinburgh–New York: T. & T. Clark, 2001. £24.99. 0 567 08776 X

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903285687

Multi-authored volumes can make coherent contributions to a subject. Despite a substantial and sane introduction by the editor and a valiant attempt to draw some threads together in a short epilogue by Kate Cooper, this is not one of them. A partial exception to the lack of focus in this collection is the section on liturgy and Christian initiation. Three excellent studies (Everett Ferguson on Catechesis; Paul Bradshaw on the effect of the recognition of Christianity on the development of worship after Constantine; and David Wright on Augustine and the transformation of baptism) do add up to an illuminating study of some of the most fundamental changes that 'the coming of Christendom' brought to Christianity. Paul Bradshaw rightly emphasises the strands of continuity with earlier practice to be found in post-Constantinian worship. Nevertheless, the three essays between them allow a sense of fundamental change to surface, with

the emergence of a world in which Christians are no longer made, but born. Of the remaining eight essays, two stand out: Wolfgang Wischmeyer's, on the 'visibility' of pre-Constantinian Christianity in the secular world around it, makes excellent and fascinating use of a rarely tapped range of evidence; and Rowan Williams explores the roles of deviant behaviour and deviant thinking in relation to a sense of belonging. Christianity is 'fundamentally disruptive of pre-existing forms of religious meaning and social belonging'; the Church had always to face the question 'whether its language [could] survive as a constant re-enactment of the disruption in which it begins, suggesting a lasting and unhealable schism in the order of things, between the empirical world and the truth of the Christian revelation, or whether there is another level of unity to be sought and discerned at a deeper level'. This essay illuminates the development of a Christian sense of self-identity and continuity in the first four centuries as much as it helps to define a permanent challenge to missiology: 'how the articulation of the Christian gospel holds together scepticism and confidence in a way faithful to its foundational history'. The six remaining studies range from the trite to the useful; none breaks new ground. The conceptual questions involved in speaking of the central notions of 'conversion' and 'Christianisation' are occasionally touched on, especially by the editor, though far from sufficiently subjected to critical discussion, and more often by-passed, as if historians could afford to ignore them.

NOTTINGHAM R. A. MARKUS

Von der Notwendigkeit des Leidens. Die Theologie des Martyriums bei Tertullian. By Wiebke Bähnk. (Forschungen zur Kirchen- und Dogmengeschichte, 78.) Pp. 356. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 2001. DM 118. 3 525 55186 X

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903295683

Bähnk writes a thorough analysis of the doctrine of martyrdom in Tertullian. The state of sources and research and the historical context is reported, then the main study is shared between persecution and martyrdom as Tertullian saw them; the conclusion is largely devoted to comparison and contrast with Cyprian. There is a full bibliography, and an index of passages cited. Much of the work is inevitably the gathering and sifting of the judgements of others on a mass of Tertullian texts minutely, sometimes repetitiously, examined. The results are sound and reliable. Tertullian is consistent in his emphasis on radical obedience to God's will as the motivation for confession and martyrdom, but shifts under the challenge of 'Gnostics', who soften the call to suffer for the faith, and of the anti-Montanists in the Church, to a view of martyrdom as a unique grace from God: only by suffering may the believer fulfil the commitment of his baptism, defeat the devil (as distinct from escaping him), and attain perfect purity from sin. Only the martyr is on death received into paradise, the place below the altar of Revelation vi.9; all others await the resurrection in Hades. The atoning death of Christ is played down, and for Tertullian, unlike some contemporaries, Christ does not suffer *in* his martyrs. A martyr atones only for his own sins, not for another's. Prison is a preparation for the suffering of death, and its rigours should not be alleviated by supplies from fellow-believers. Much of this Cyprian

would modify; while sharing Tertullian's commitment to the pure virgin Church, he believes that there is a crown for continence, patience and almsgiving as well as for martyrdom, and even flight can be a form of confession. Bähnk has a useful note on the views of various 'Gnostics', and observes that Clement of Alexandria had also softened the demand of God for blood. A comparison of these with Cyprian might prove profitable. Bähnk holds that the absence of pastoral admonition suggests that Tertullian remained a layman. She seems to accept the view of Rankin and Bray that Tertullian defended the New Prophecy within the Church, and was not in schism as a Montanist. She rightly rejects the common view that Montanists were much concerned with the imminent End, but her view of Montanism would have been enriched by Christine Trevett, *Montanism* (1996), and that of the relation of martyrdom to church growth (which she regards as a rhetorical ploy of Tertullian) by Rodney Stark, *The rise of Christianity* (1996) – a book too little noticed in Germany. There are a few misprints, for instance making Tertullian's Latin unintelligible at p. 123 n. 68, and slightly misquoting Frend in the last sentence (p. 315). But in general this book observes high standards of scholarship, and must take its place as fundamental for its topic.

St Andrews Stuart G. Hall

Hieronymus als Briefschreiber. Ein Beitrag zur spätantiken Epistolographie. By Barbara Conring. (Studies and Texts in Antiquity and Christianity, 8.) Pp. x + 274. Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr, 2001. DM 98 (paper). 3 16 147502 X; 1436 3003 *JEH* (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903305688

Jerome was the sort of man who would have been voted out of a balloon even before it started falling. He was also a latter-day classic, Ciceronian in Latinity as in *amour-propre*, casuistry and wit. Conring demonstrates in her opening chapter that ancient theorists, while enjoining that a letter should read like half of a conversation, did not forbid the sparing use of literary artifice, and that modern scholarship (at least in Germany) has rejected the attempt of Adolf Deissman to distinguish between the private communication and the exercise addressed to a wider public. It is not, however, clear why the account of Greek and Latin theory overlooks Jerome's commentaries on Paul as well as the catalogue of forty-two epistolary modes in his contemporary Libanius. Amends are made in ch. iii, a well-knit garland of Jerome's *obiter dicta* on the circumstances and motives which inspired the composition of his letters. This evidence amply justifies Conring's preference for the thesis that the purpose of correspondence is the maintenance of friendship, but one wonders how this claim would fare if the acrimonious missives to Augustine were included among the subjects for 'Exemplarische Analysen' in ch. iv. As it is, Jerome's cordial overtures to Flavia, Marcella and Damasus set the tone for a final chapter on the 'Ambivalenz' which accompanied his use of pagan models; once again the discussion could be widened, as he was not the only churchman of his period to cultivate the techniques of ancient authors whose opinions he disowned.

Christ Church, M. J. Edwards
Oxford

A concise history of Byzantium. By Warren Treadgold Pp. xii + 273 incl. 6 maps, 1 table and 13 figs. Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2001. £45 (cloth), £13.99 (paper). 0 333 71829 1; 0 333 71830 5

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903315684

Warren Treadgold offers a skilful abridgement of his massive *History of the Byzantine state and society* (1997) and provides a clear and accessible introduction to the history of Byzantium from 284 to 1461. The periodisation remains virtually the same in both books, and so does the formula: a clear narrative of a period followed by an appraisal of the culture and society of the day. Treadgold's assessment of Byzantine cultural and social trends is shrewd and often pungent. It is informed by a sane and largely sympathetic vision of Byzantium. Treadgold writes from the standpoint of that bureaucratic elite which created most of the materials on the basis of which modern historians have to make their judgements about Byzantium. One of his leading ideas is that the health of Byzantine society was very largely determined by its system of education, which turned out the elite. Underlying this is the assumption that it was the activities and achievements of scholars and bureaucrats that make Byzantine history worth studying. They were able to preserve the literary and intellectual traditions of antiquity, while at the same time creating and sustaining a compelling Christian culture that was strong enough to see Byzantium through to the bitter end. But none of this would have been possible unless they had also formed the bedrock of an effective administration, which held the empire together through all manner of crises. Treadgold contends that in this respect 'Byzantium was a modern state before its time' (p. 239). To quibble: it would be almost as true to paint Byzantium as an archaic survival – the heir to bureaucratic concerns going all the way back to Mycenaean Pylos. Treadgold's most original contribution to Byzantine studies lies elsewhere: in his determination to bring the Byzantine state budget within the realms of statistical reality. For this he has been severely criticised. Not the least interesting thing about his *Concise history* is the attempt made by way of a conclusion to mount a defence of his methodology. It is a good fighting way to finish an excellent introduction to Byzantine history.

UNIVERSITY OF EDINBURGH MICHAEL ANGOLD

The pilgrim city. Social and political ideas in the writings of St Augustine of Hippo. By R. W. Dyson. Pp. xii + 217. Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 2001. £35. 0 85115 819 6

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903325680

Along with the decline in patristic studies in British universities, Augustine has nevertheless moved towards the centre of interest in other fields of study: notably, in the flourishing studies of late antiquity, and of political theory. Dyson, himself a specialist in political theory, has already given us a fine translation of Augustine's *De ciuitate dei* (Cambridge 1998; reviewed this JOURNAL l. 773); and a useful collection of Augustine's political writings has recently also been made available (*Political writings*, ed. E. M. Atkins and R. J. Dodaro, Cambridge 2001).

In contrast with the collection edited by Margaret Atkins and Robert Dodaro, which is aimed to illustrate Augustine's actual concerns and interventions in the political life of his own society and is therefore taken in the main from his letters and sermons, Dyson's moves on the level of high theory. The texts included in his volume are taken in the main from the *De ciuitate dei* and other treatises. The collection covers ground that is better known, but it brings together the more important texts in a convenient form for the use of students. An introduction provides the overall context and five chapters are devoted each to a major theme of Augustine's reflection: sin and human history, the state in a sinful world, social institutions (this includes property, slavery, law), war, and Church and State. Each chapter contains a short but lucid and useful exposition by the author, followed by the texts. The book is cast in the mould familiar to students of political theory – even to the extent of adopting the historically problematic notion of the 'State' as a central theme – and follows, on the whole, lines which have become conventional. The book will, however, be useful to students of politics, and may serve as a useful complement to the more adventurous Atkins–Dodaro collection.

NOTTINGHAM R. A. MARKUS

Augustine. De bono coniugali; De sancta uirginitate. Edited and translated by P. G. Walsh. (Oxford Early Christian Texts.) Pp. xxxv + 164. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2001. £35. 0 19 826995 1

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903335687

This is a notable addition to the Oxford series. The Latin text is Zycha's in the *CSEL* with eighteen variant readings, listed on p. 158. There is a useful introduction, explaining the background to the composition of *De bono coniugali*, inspired by Jerome's over-reaction to the teachings of Jovinian; to the *De sancta virginitate*; and an analysis of both treatises. The notes are numerous and helpful, with a pleasing lightness of touch, for example at p. 100 n. 55: 'For the suggestion here that virgins will get first-class accommodation in heaven, see Cyprian, *De habitu virginis* 23.' Walsh notes the moderation of Augustine's teaching when contrasted with the depreciation of marriage and the exaltation of virginity by many of his contemporaries. He draws attention (p. 106 n. 70) to the fact that the concluding chapters of *De sancta virginitate* are virtually 'a mini-treatise on humility', a virtue to which Augustine continually return in his writings. Walsh provides the text and translation of *Retractationes* 2.22, 23 (pp. 148–51), and a list of Augustine's scriptural variations from the Vulgate (pp. 152–7) (the last of these, Daniel iii.87, occurs in lvi.57 of *De sancta virginitate* and not 52, the reference given). The language of the translation is clear, though some readers may be puzzled by the use of 'schooled' as equivalent to 'taught' on p. 137. Altogether the book provides a valuable contribution to the understanding of Augustine's sexual ethics, so often negatively interpreted in the light of his teaching on Original Sin.

DURHAM GERALD BONNER

Augustine. Christian truth and fractured humanity. By Carol Harrison. (Christian Theology in Context.) Pp. xi + 242. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000. £35 (cloth), £13.95 (paper). 0 19 875220 2; 0 19 875219 9
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903345683

This is the second volume in a new series which will take up the Oxford Past Masters project where it prematurely ended, but with a new remit. There is to be an attempt to set the theology 'in context'. There continues to be a need for readable introductions to great writers, and Carol Harrison has shown that such introductions need not oversimplify. She has been helped to make this a book both scholarly and accessible by the change in the philosophy of the new series; by asking familiar theological questions against the cultural and social and political background Harrison has succeeded in saying much that is new and full of insight.

She divides her subject matter into two main sections. In the first she deals chiefly with the concepts of wisdom and virtue, in the complex of senses in which the late antique and Christian world were juggling with them; and with the educational and literary expectations of a young man of Augustine's sort. The mature Augustine, unlike Jerome, did not, on the whole, find that classical and Christian culture were pulling him in opposite directions, and the reasons for this are important in understanding his strong but elastic synthesis of the best in both. In the second, she turns to Christianity in late antique society, adroitly matching the issues raised by the working life of a bishop with Augustine's theology of ministry, his thinking about sexual relationships and monasticism with his experience. The final chapter deals with the Augustinian theme which lies at the heart of this study, the discussion of the 'two cities'. Where did Augustine get this idea from? What realisations were sharpened in him by the crisis faced by once-mighty Rome and the pertinent and impertinent questions of well-educated pagans coming to north Africa in exile? Carol Harrison teases them out with sensitivity and many lively perceptions.

CAMBRIDGE G. R. EVANS

Le Culte des saints en Gaule. Les premiers temps. D'Hilaire du Poitiers à la fin du VIe siècle. By Brigitte Beaujard (preface André Vauchez). (Histoire religieuse de la France, 15.) Pp. 617 incl. 8 tables, 15 figs and 7 maps. Paris: Éditions du Cerf, 2000. Fr. 290 (paper). 2 204 05618 9; 1248 6396
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S002204690335568X

The study of the cult of saints in the late Roman and early medieval periods has seen a remarkable period of growth and development during the past three decades. Central to this has been the work of Peter Brown, most notably in a series of papers on the holy man beginning in the early seventies and in his book, *The cult of saints*, published in 1981. Brown's contribution has recently been commemorated in two separate collections of essays: vol. vi (1998) of the *Journal of Early Christian Studies*, and more recently *The cult of saints in later antiquity and the early Middle Ages*, edited by James Howard-Johnston and Paul Hayward.

Beaujard's book, though somewhat narrower in perspective and a little more traditional in its overall approach, can be seen to be influenced by, and as part

of, this development, particularly in the chronological survey which takes up her first four chapters. Beaujard's strengths are in her detailed knowledge of the primary texts and in her background of topographical studies (the latter having led to significant contributions to the *Topographie chrétienne des cités de la Gaule*), and both of these are evident throughout the book, making it an indispensable source of factual and bibliographical information. But it is always much more than this, even in the thematic chapters of its second part, which are exhaustive in their coverage and might at first sight give the (mistaken) impression of a mechanical *œuvre de synthèse*.

Beaujard divides the history of her subject into three main periods, the first beginning with Hilary of Poitiers in the mid-fourth century and extending to the death of Valentinian III in the mid-fifth, the 'last century of Roman Gaul'. In comparison with other parts of the Roman west this is already quite late, explained by the linkage in the early Church of sainthood with martydom, and the fact that the number of martyrs in Gaul (outside Lyon) is comparatively small. The cult of saints, therefore, and the reverence paid to holy men in their lifetime, as developed by such figures as Hilary himself, Sulpicius Severus and (on both sides of the relationship) Martin, here has its own character from the start. Cults are confined largely to an intellectual aristocratic class, are very much linked to bishops and their churches, and tend to honour the saints as spiritual examples – as 'witnesses', that is, in a wider sense. During the next half-century, as the rule of Rome gives way to the successor kingdoms, the emphasis changes in response to the changing patterns of leadership and loyalty. Bishops become less spiritual and more political, and saints by the same token are seen less as examples of spiritual excellence and more as champions and protectors of their cities – what Beaujard calls a 'saint rempart'. The promotion in particular of Tours as the centre of Martin reminds us also that this is the period of the increasing Christianisation of the countryside, with the result that the 'city' is increasingly seen as the *civitas* as a whole rather than the town alone. By the end of the sixth century the picture has changed again: as Gaul develops into a single, (orthodox) Christian kingdom, so Church and State are brought together, and saints, though still very much associated with their cities, increasingly assume a national role. It is in this period too that the hagiographical tradition, inaugurated by Sulpicius Severus a couple of centuries earlier, reaches a new level of maturity in the writings of Fortunatus and (most important) Gregory of Tours.

The themes of these first four chapters recur throughout the remaining five, which in broad terms are concerned with the relationship between the saint and his various 'constituencies': the individual faithful, the Church as an institution, the city. Within this framework, Beaujard deals with topics ranging from relics, monuments and buildings, through intercession and healing and other miracles to pilgrimage, festivals and the calendar. The emphasis throughout is on the religious, social and political role of the saint, seen not as a static phenomenon but as a dynamic and ever changing one, responding to the equally changing patterns of time and place. It is fair to say that all of this tends to be seen, as it were, from the outside: there is less than one might have wished, perhaps, of the intellectual and cultural context, of the internal thought-processes that gave it shape. Given that in Gaul the cult of saints began, and presumably long remained, as the preserve of the aristocratic and intellectual elite, how far can one

see it as part of an evolving and overarching world-picture incorporating the Roman and non-Roman secular and spiritual traditions between which the individual saints appear to have moved? Or are we perhaps wrong, at the end of the day, to focus primarily on this higher level? How far, in the identification of holy men, and in the promotion of a minority of them into sainthood (however defined), was there a part to be played by ordinary people as opposed to bishops and civic dignitaries? Was it important, for the proper ordering of society, that saints should have an appeal across the social spectrum? Even at this level, of course, one looks for the internal motivating forces, whether these were primarily emotional or academic and intellectual.

Beaujard's book is well-written and well-organised, with a wealth of detail copiously referenced and documented. In what will clearly be used as a work of reference, the tables (giving lists of individual saints, cult sites and other details) are particularly helpful; the maps could perhaps have offered rather more information, and the plans are a small selection only and not well-produced. There are indices of places and personal names.

University of Cardiff John Percival

The hungry are dying. Beggars and bishops in Roman Cappadocia. By Susan R. Holman. (Oxford Studies in Historical Theology.) Pp. xviii + 231 incl. map. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001. £40. 0 19 513912 7

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903365686

This excellent book studies how three bishops of the late fourth century deployed classical rhetoric and Christian theology in the service of the destitute and sick poor. Susan Holman examines six or so sermons by Basil of Caesarea, Gregory of Nyssa and Gregory Nazianzen to reveal the characteristic ways in which they portrayed the poor in social, fiscal, medical and religious terms. Taking her lead from Peter Brown's discussion of eloquence in *Power and persuasion* the author shows how in the context of late antique society, patterned by a web of patronage and benefaction but also by oppressive bonds of debt and usurious interest, these texts redetermined the place of the poor and claimed them for the Christian community. Close reading and study of the conditions in which the sermons were composed serve to disclose the authors' rhetorical strategies. Holman looks first at homilies delivered by Basil in all likelihood during the food shortage which gripped Caesarea in around 368 or 369. She explores his focus on children (rarely 'visible' in contemporary texts), and how the poor are presented as the Body of Christ, the spiritual kith and kin of the wealthy, with power to effect the latter's salvation. We see how themes drawn from classical rhetoric are interwoven with appeal to biblical heroes who exemplify the virtues of generous almsgiving which Basil seeks to encourage in his congregation. Holman then examines the three sermons in which Gregory of Nyssa and Gregory Nazianzen urge the Christian community to feed and care for outcast lepers. She argues that the preachers combat their audience's fear of contagion with an insistence on the spiritual healing to be received through contact with the sick. The wealthy were to catch salvation from the sick poor. Behind and sustaining this rhetoric, Holman believes, lay a theology and anthropology in which the mutability of the human

body did not disqualify it as the channel of divine grace, but privileged it as the locus where God becomes fully human in Christ and the power of God is communicated to the suffering members of Christ's body. Whereas patristic studies have sometimes in the past concentrated on doctrinal exegesis at the expense of neglecting moral exhortation, separating the doctrinal cream from the milk of moral teachings, this study reveals how any Christology, anthropology and moral theology we may abstract from the sermons is profoundly conditioned by their occasion and purpose. Much of this material the author has previously published elsewhere in separate articles. It gains, however, from being assembled in this way, with an introduction which sets the Cappadocians against the background of earlier Christian responses to poverty, and a helpful appendix in which three of the sermons are translated (Basil's *In time of famine and drought* and the two sermons by Gregory of Nyssa *On the love of the poor*).

Blackfriars, Richard Finn
Oxford

Proclus bishop of Constantinople. Homilies of the life of Christ. Translated with introduction and notes by Jan Harm Barkhuizen. (Early Christian Studies, 1.) Pp. xv + 221. Brisbane: Centre for Early Christian Studies, Australian Catholic University, 2001. $40 (paper). 0 9577483 12 0

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903375682

Professor Barkhuizen adds a significant volume to the series of shorter studies he has published in the last decade on Proclus' *Homilies*. Proclus, bishop of Constantinople (434–446/7 CE), best known for his *Tomos ad Armenios* (*ep*. ii) outlining Christological orthodoxy, was also a notable fifth-century preacher – *hom*. i, delivered in Nestorius' company in 428/9, celebrating Mary as *Theotokos*, was a key moment in the spread of the Nestorian Controversy beyond Constantinople. In a welcoming introduction and translation, Barkhuizen invites the relatively uninitiated reader into a consideration of fifth-century Christological exposition as represented by one of the brighter lights of early Christian preaching. An introduction is followed by a translation of twenty-seven homilies most but not all of which have been critically edited elsewhere, gathered topically under general headings relating to various aspects of the incarnation ('Engendering of Christ' – *hom*. xv; 'The incarnation and nativity – i–v, xxiii–iv, xxxvi; 'Infancy of Christ' – xxii, xxvi; 'Baptism of Christ' – vii, xxviii; 'Transfiguration of Christ' – viii; 'Holy Week' [triumphal entry; betrayal; crucifixion; resurrection] – ix–xiv, xxix, xxxi–ii; 'From Sunday after Pascha to Ascension' – xxi, xxxiii, xxxvii; 'Pentecost' – xvi). An 'index of theological concepts' allows for comparison and contrast of overarching and more particular themes, thus avoiding the exegetical straightjacketing such a topical assignment might otherwise create. Following a brief description of Proclus' historical background, his literary output, and a listing of critical editions and translations, the author devotes the bulk of his introductory discussion to an insightful and highly valuable discussion of the rhetorical culture of fifth-century Constantinople and the place of Proclus' homilies within it. This includes, most usefully, an analysis of Proclus' deployment of rhetorical devices, with numerous examples. By placing

Proclus' preaching within the oral culture of late antiquity, the author defends his homilies against modern detractors who anachronistically criticise them as too rhetorically embellished and thus lacking in ethical value. The introduction concludes with a sketch of the soteriology, Christology and Trinitarian theology emerging from the homilies, again with references. The literal translation that follows is fresh, readable and engaging, presented in verse form so as to preserve the homilies' rhetorical character, and accompanied by thorough scriptural cross-referencing. The absence of a Greek text (there is, however, ample reference to important textual variants) makes the study of limited value for more advanced graduate and postgraduate study. Nevertheless, the result is an introduction to, and translation of, early Christian preaching that will be of particular interest to advanced undergraduate students seeking an introduction to Proclus' theology, an understanding of central motifs and their deployment in the unfolding Christological dogma of the fifth century, and (most usefully) a portrait of the popular oral culture in which Christological teachings were received.

VANCOUVER SCHOOL OF THEOLOGY HARRY O. MAIER

Words, imagery, and the mystery of Christ. A reconstruction of Cyril of Alexandria's Christology. By Steven A. McKinion. (Supplements to Vigiliae Christianae. Texts and Studies of Early Christian Life and Language, 55.) Pp. xi + 244. Leiden–Boston–Cologne: Brill, 2000. Nlg 182.91. 90 04 11987 6; 0920 623X

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903385689

Originating as a doctoral dissertation under the direction of Professor Iain R. Torrance (University of Aberdeen), McKinion's book seeks to fill a gap in studies of Cyril of Alexandria and to arrive at a fresh understanding of the content of his Christology by attending to the images and analogies he used to explain his understanding of the incarnation. He resists the reigning Logos–Sarx/Logos–Man typology – a dichotomy represented pre-eminently by Grillmeier – as wooden and misleading, and aims instead for a more nuanced account that shows Cyril as consistently championing an orthodox Christology even in his most Apollinarian-sounding moments. Unlike Apollinarius and Nestorius, claims McKinion, Cyril's imagery shows him as a theologian not attempting to present 'a static, unification theory', but one seeking images and analogies to express 'the Word's act of condescension on behalf of humankind' (p. 230). Cyril used images and analogies not to explain but to illustrate the proper teaching of the Logos becoming human. As the argument unfolds, McKinion tends enthusiastically and uncritically to embrace Cyril's refrain in apologetic and polemic that his opponents make the 'ineffable union' idolatrously comprehensible, forgetting that, given the rhetorically charged and shrewd Cyril, on such matters one should expect more fire than light. From the fragments that remain, it is not clear, notwithstanding Cyril's shrill objections to the contrary, that either Nestorius or Apollinarius were aiming anymore than the patriarch of Alexandria to explain the 'how' of the incarnation, but, like him, were deploying the elements of Scripture, tradition and their philosophical heritage to bring voice to the

unutterable in a way that avoided Arianism. In the case of Nestorius, at least, the evidence shows him, not unlike Cyril, returning repeatedly to John, i.14, Phil. ii.6–11 and to the text of the Nicene Creed and drawing images and analogies to express what he was intending to mean. This, however, is a minor flaw in an otherwise lucidly written and carefully argued book. It is divided into three parts. Part I presents a brief biographical sketch somewhat marred by a tendency toward hagiography, Cyril's understanding of Scripture and use of biblical images in Christological discussion, and his use of his Greek philosophical heritage. Part II discusses Cyril's opposition to Nestorius and Apollinarianism, focusing on Cyril's use of Scripture, images and analogies to counter rejected teachings. The heart of the book comes in Part III, where McKinion introduces and expounds the variety of images and analogies Cyril used to represent the incarnation, the human soul and complete humanity of Jesus (very insightful here is the survey of scholarly opinions of Cyril's alleged Apollinarianism and the importance to Cyril's kenotic soteriology that Jesus was fully human), and Cyril's representations of the Logos as divine subject of Jesus' life and suffering. Since Cyril used a relatively small number of images and analogies to illustrate his Christological teaching, McKinion's descriptions tend to become repetitive as he takes up the same images considered according to three foci of Part III. Nevertheless, he succeeds in showing that attention to imagery and analogy offers a useful vantage point from which to survey Cyril's Christology, and for coming to a more nuanced understanding of his theological vision – especially the importance he placed on a full human incarnation of the Word in Jesus Christ, ignored or misrepresented by older, clumsier categorisations.

VANCOUVER SCHOOL OF THEOLOGY HARRY O. MAIER

Image and power in the archaeology of early medieval Britain. Essays in honour of Rosemary Cramp. Edited by Helena Hamerow and Arthur MacGregor. Pp. xii + 180 incl. frontispiece and 50 figs. Oxford: Oxbow Books, 2001. £35. 0 84217 051 1

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903395685

Six of the papers given at a seminar in Durham in 1999 to honour Rosemary Cramp on her seventieth birthday are here adroitly introduced by Richard Bailey and conclude with Christopher Morris's personal memoir of the distinguished recipient and an interim bibliography of her publications, compiled by Derek Craig. The book bears witness to Rosemary Cramp's influential roles as professor of archaeology at Durham and general editor of the British Academy's *Corpus of Anglo-Saxon stone sculpture*, as vigorous champion of her subject at local and national level and as the inspiring and exacting teacher, colleague and friend of many scholars working in the field she has done so much to develop. The title of this somewhat diverse collection is most obviously cued in the opening paper where Martin Carver continues his exploration of the idea that early medieval monumental works in various media are 'the fossilized versions of arguments' (p. 1); they form the vocabulary of a political language expressing power, alignment and allegiance. Ethnic, customary and religious factors alone, he argues, do not sufficiently explain the scale of investment

signified by monumentality or the intermittent nature of its appearance. Thus, the celebrated variety in monumental expression found among people sharing a Christian ideology in Britain by *c.* 720 reflects not 'an incorrigible ethnicity', but different reactions to Christianisation and various approaches to power and therefore to particular kinds of Christian organisation – episcopal, monastic and secular. Peter Hill's paper endorses Charles Thomas's controversial interpretation of the inscribed *Latinus* stone at Whithorn and proposes a scenario to explain the existence there of a fifth-century community capable of producing such a 'highly literate cryptogram replete with hidden meaning' (p. 28): he envisages the settlement of exiled British Pelagians at Whithorn in the aftermath of Germanus' reforming mission of 429. Deidre O'Sullivan notes the limitations of archaeology in elucidating monastic culture but also the fact that as monastic identity was 'performative', its ideology was in some ways embedded in the monastery and its surroundings. Using the evidence of hagiography and exegesis, she suggests that similarities between the monastic sites of Iona and Lindisfarne were due to their relevance within a monastic discourse on sacred landscape rather than to the memorialisation of Iona at Lindisfarne. Nancy Edwards gives a careful preliminary survey of early medieval sculpture and inscribed stones from the important site of St David's and its immediate area which sheds light on the changing contacts between this Welsh peninsula and elsewhere, especially Ireland, including the Hiberno-Norse community. Chris Loveluck devotes more than fifty pages to the first substantial post-excavation interpretative survey of Flixborough, Lincolnshire, an important site of multi-period settlement, and discusses its changing character and status from the early seventh to the early tenth centuries. Finally, in contrast, Catherine Hills examines one particular medium and type of artefact, namely the ivory rings found in graves of the fifth to seventh centuries and discusses the sources, transmission and use of this exotic material.

University College, Cork
Jennifer O'Reilly

New offerings, ancient treasures. Studies in medieval art for George Henderson. Edited by Paul Binski and William Noel. Pp. xviii + 553 incl. 169 black-and-white plates + 4 colour plates. Stroud: Sutton Publishing, 2001. £45. 0 7509 1571 4

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S002204690340568X

George Henderson is one of Britain's leading historians of medieval art. Both as a teacher and as a writer he has ranged widely over his field. While the greater part of his work has focused on early medieval manuscript illumination, in particular on its biblical sources, he has also written with authority on Gothic architecture (his *Chartres* is a masterpiece) and on the iconography of Gothic figural sculpture. Henderson's catholic tastes are reflected in the diversity of contents of this massive *Festschrift*. Chronologically, it ranges from the eighth century to the eighteenth, and in subject matter from the archaeology of the Ipswich area to the wall paintings of the Sistine Chapel. As is only to be expected in a tribute to an art historian, a number of the pieces are concerned with

specialist art historical subjects. Others, however, will be of wider appeal. Particularly notable are John Mitchell's discussion of eighth-century high crosses, which looks at the sources of their design in the monuments of antiquity and considers their role in Christian evangelisation, and Christopher Norton's piece on a Durham *Life* of St Cuthbert, which reflects on the uses of books in the vicinity of twelfth-century shrines. Perhaps the single most stimulating piece, however, is Richard Marks's essay 'Altarpiece, image and devotion: fourteenth-century sculpture at Cobham, Kent'. Taking the sculptured figures at Cobham as his point of departure, Marks analyses the role of such statues in late medieval popular devotion, stressing their accessibility to the faithful and their effectiveness in overcoming the chancel/nave divide so often posited in discussions of the politics of space in churches. For Marks's piece alone this *Festschrift* is worth having.

ROYAL HOLLOWAY, NIGEL SAUL
UNIVERSITY OF LONDON

Charters of Abingdon Abbey. Part 1. Edited by S. E. Kelly. (Anglo-Saxon Charters, 7.) Pp. ccxxxi + 205. Oxford: Oxford University Press (for The British Academy), 2000. £55. 0 19 726217 1

Charters of Abingdon Abbey. Part 2. Edited by S. E. Kelly. (Anglo-Saxon Charters, 8.) Pp. xxxiv + 207–650. Oxford: Oxford University Press (for The British Academy), 2000. £55. 0 19 726221 X

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903415686

Diplomatic has long lain at the margins of medieval studies. For many historians it remains an essential skill learnt (often with palaeography) as part of post-graduate training, but thereafter applied instrumentally at need, as a vehicle for the substantiation of wider, synthetic arguments, not as an end in itself. Anglo-Saxonists have, perforce, had to keep alive a more-than-passing acquaintance with the complexities of this discipline because of the inadequacy (and incompleteness) of the available published editions. As W. H. Stevenson lamented in 1895, 'It cannot be said that the Old English charters have yet been edited.' But few have shown such enthusiasm for this arcane area as Susan Kelly, research fellow to the joint British Academy/Royal Historical Society *Anglo-Saxon Charters* project. This two-volume edition of the archive of Abingdon Abbey in Berkshire is the first major archive to be edited in this series and brings to five the number of volumes for which Kelly has been responsible out of the total of nine thus far published.

If such were needed, Kelly's edition provides ample justification for the policy of editing pre-Conquest diplomas by archive; this collection of documents sheds important light on the abbey's estate strategies in the later tenth and eleventh centuries and reveals much about local charter practices in a region of considerable strategic significance, since the abbey lay on the border between Wessex and Mercia. Each Anglo-Saxon archive has its own problems, but Abingdon's presents peculiar challenges. Few of the extant 151 documents survive as single-sheets; the vast majority of the texts are known from two different versions of a chronicle-cartulary written at Abingdon in the twelfth and thirteenth, centuries (BL, MSS Cotton Claudius C. ix, and Cotton Claudius B. vi;

a new edition of this chronicle by John Hudson for OMT is keenly awaited). Reinterpreting the abbey's past on the basis of its surviving muniments seems to have been a continuing process in medieval Abingdon, and the narrative passages in the two recensions of the chronicle-cartulary, while outwardly offering the historian a helpful context for understanding a diploma, are arguably highly misleading. The difficulty arises from the presence in the archive of so many (79/151) royal diplomas granting lands not to the abbey but to lay beneficiaries. The Anglo-Norman cartularists solved this difficulty by prefacing the text of these diplomas with a note that the lay beneficiary had given or bequeathed the estate in question directly to the abbey. Yet it is clear that in the majority of cases the cartularists had no evidence to support such statements. Stenton, writing about the abbey of Abingdon in 1913, doubted whether the estates conveyed by charter to laymen had ever belonged to the house; he explained their presence in the archive by suggesting that local nobles used the abbey as a place of safe-keeping. Exploring these diplomas as a group, Kelly has cast doubt on this interpretation and has cautioned against any explanation that seeks to find a simple correlation between the pre-Conquest archive and the endowment of the abbey in 1066. Rather, she traces the active way in which the abbey's estates were managed in the later tenth and eleventh centuries in order that its holdings be consolidated within a compact region of Berkshire and Oxfordshire: 'This process must have involved disposing of land as well as acquiring it, and it could account for the presence in the archive of a number of diplomas that seem to have no known connection with the endowment; these may represent a "paper trail" of some of Abingdon's temporary possessions, retained in the abbey's archive because they were deemed obsolete or irrelevant, perhaps because a new title-deed had been drawn up when the land left the abbey's hands' (p. cliii).

Abingdon's history effectively began between 950 and 955, when King Eadred was persuaded to establish a new monastery at the royal vill of Abingdon (the site of an ancient minster by then long decayed), and to appoint Æthelwold, a monk from Glastonbury, as its abbot. The history of the pre-tenth-century minster is hard to reconstruct: the eighteen charters surviving that purport to date from the period before 900 all present serious interpretative difficulties. The section of the introduction that tackles these problems – 'Abingdon and its past' – begins only at p. cxciii, but is worth finding for it sets the diplomatic evidence in the context of the archaeology of the region as well as the later medieval house-histories. The place-name, *abbendun* (the *dun* (hill) of either the woman Æbbe, or a man, Æbba) itself presents problems since it implies a hill-top location, yet Abingdon is on a low-lying river site. Perhaps an early community moved to Abingdon from a hill-top site; perhaps there was more than one community (there is evidence for a nunnery dedicated to St Helen, as well as for a male congregation). Unable wholly to reconcile the four separate strands which can be defined in the abbey's early history, Kelly concludes that there was at least one, perhaps more than one, minster community at Abingdon before the First Viking Age and that a community may have come into existence as a cell or a daughter-house of a minster at Bradfield. She offers the plausible suggestion that Abingdon had close connections with the Mercian royal house in the eighth century and may have formed part of the *hereditas* of a Mercian royal (or noble) family.

With all her British Academy charter-editions, but perhaps with that for Abingdon above all, Kelly (who is not affiliated to any *HEFCE*-funded institution) has left an enduring legacy and provided an invaluable resource for the next generation of scholars that is arguably of far greater significance than the more glitzy monographs and peer-reviewed articles produced for the RAE by her colleagues in history departments. Yet from her unparalleled understanding of this material, Kelly also has an important contribution to make to current historiographical debates, one that deserves a wider readership than might be anticipated for these volumes. She moves in her introduction away from the local and specific to advance arguments that enhance our understanding of the functioning of the late Anglo-Saxon 'state'. Of particular significance is her analysis of a group of documents attributed to a scribe known as 'Edgar A' and the so called *Orthodoxorum* charters, of which three of five (or five of eight) survive from Abingdon. Kelly suggests that 'Edgar A' might have been the reforming abbot Æthelwold (or one of his associates) and that it was Abingdon (not a royal writing-office) that took a lead role in centralised charter-production early in Edgar's reign and perhaps beyond. If Kelly is right, it will be necessary to reconsider Simon Keynes's vision of a strong royal government that kept firm control over charter-production for legal and constitutional reasons. Kelly offers a nuanced reading (and one that is not for the faint-hearted, since it requires some prior understanding of the issues at stake): a far-sighted journal editor would commission her to write an article on this subject, thus bringing the fruits of her meticulous scholarship to the wide readership she deserves.

University of Sheffield Sarah Foot

A lost work by Amalarius of Metz. Interpolations in Salisbury, Cathedral Library, MS. 154. By Christopher A. Jones. (Subsidia, 2.) Pp. xii + 303. London–Woodbridge: Boydell Press (for the Henry Bradshaw Society), 2001. £60. 1 870252 14 4; 1352 1047

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903425682

This eleventh-century Salisbury manuscript carries a copy of the abridgement of Amalarius' well known liturgical treatise, the *Liber officialis*, combined with excerpts from a previously unknown text. Christopher Jones's meticulous study of the interpolations proves beyond any reasonable doubt that Amalarius himself prepared the *Retractatio prima* (the abridgement) and that he also was responsible for interpolating the new material in the version preserved in Salisbury. His proofs depend on close and convincing textual, stylistic and methodological analysis. But whence came the interpolations? Throughout his long career, Amalarius (*c.* 775–*c.* 850) cultivated the 'habit of endlessly recycling his own works' (p. 84). Jones identifies the interpolations (pp. 183–228 in his edition) as the work in progress Amalarius mentioned to Abbot Peter of Nonantola early in his career, around 815. The unsuspected treatise on the Triduum and the Office, now apparently lost as an independent work, survives as the recycled interpolations Amalarius skilfully wove into the *Retractatio prima*. Impressive a textual sleuth as Jones is, he is an even better historian. Amalarius' *Liber officialis* has long been mined as a rich quarry for the history of the liturgy, but

Amalarius's penchant for allegory has marginalised him as a significant figure. Jones's perceptive reading of the new text adds substantially to Amalarius' intellectual and ecclesiastical biography and situates the one-time bishop of Trier (*c.* 809–*c.* 815) firmly at the centre of Carolingian spirituality, exegesis, theology and even political culture. The new treatise, which Jones deftly translates as well as edits, contributes to the history of the liturgy, especially in the section on the Office where Amalarius' references to the early ninth-century use of incense open up a new chapter on that liturgical practice. But it is our view of Amalarius himself that the new text forces us to rethink. Jones's source analysis reveals Amalarius' currency – he knew and used contemporary work, Alcuin to be sure, but also the court scholar Candidus Wizo's theological works. As a liturgist, Amalarius wrote as an engaged scholar whose focus on the allegorical exegesis of the liturgy served both to teach the meaning of liturgical practices and, on a deeper level, to prepare Christians to '"see" for themselves what Christ did, and to react accordingly' (pp. 163–4). Amalarius shared the confident expectation of Carolingian scholars that study, reading and questioning could reveal the mystery of things. The Christological undercurrent of the new text testifies to heightened concern about Christ's nature and the soul aroused by Adoptionism and its lingering aftermath. At the very end of the text Amalarius asked the reader (Abbot Peter?) to pray for his release from prison. Jones combines this cryptic reference with a new reading of an Amalarian poem to suggest that Louis the Pious dismissed Bishop Amalarius from Trier and sent him into exile. Amalarius dedicated the more fully developed *Liber officialis* of the early 820s to Louis in the hope of rehabilitation, a hope the emperor fulfilled. A fine piece of original and penetrating scholarship, Jones's book is also a fascinating read.

PURDUE UNIVERSITY JOHN J. CONTRENI

Cyril and Methodius of Thessalonica. The acculturation of the Slavs. By Anthony-Emil N. Tachiaos. Pp. x + 206 incl. numerous ills. Crestwood, NY: St Vladimir's Seminary Press, 2001. £11.99 (paper). 0 88141 198 1

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903435689

Professor Tachiaos recounts the careers of Cyril and Methodius from their Byzantine provincial origins to their mission to the Slavs on the Middle Danube, concluding with an assessment of their impact on Slavic culture in general. An underlying theme is that Byzantine policymakers of the ninth century nurtured what Tachiaos calls – using inverted commas – the empire's 'Slavic project', the creation of an alphabet to further mission work among the Slavs. He makes some fair points, highlighting the proximity of sizable Slav communities to the monastery of Methodius in Bithynia. Doubts, however, remain as to the aims and expectations of the brothers upon their arrival in Moravia. Prince Rastislav had asked the Byzantine emperor for a bishop, yet neither Cyril nor Methodius had even been ordained as priests; we cannot be sure that they initially intended to create a full-blown liturgical language for a distant Slav potentate of quite recent emergence and uncertain standing. The *Lives* of the brothers may represent as foreordained translation work that was undertaken in response to on-the-spot requests from ambitious Slav leaders and eager acolytes seeking deeper

understanding of the Scriptures and liturgical texts. These considerations do not detract from the overall merits of this book. Tachiaos offers an authoritative account of the activities of Cyril and Methodius, making good use of the references to them in contemporary Latin sources. Most helpfully, he collates much scattered secondary literature and reviews in a balanced fashion the controversies surrounding virtually every stage of the brothers' activities – including the issue of where Rastislav's polity was located. This introduction to the phenomenon of Cyril and Methodius serves the brothers well.

KEW JONATHAN SHEPARD

Autour de Burchard de Worms. L'Église allemande et les interdits de parenté (IXème–XIIème siècle). By Patrick Corbet. (Ius Commune. Sonderhefte. Studien zur Europäischen Rechtsgeschichte, 142.) Pp. xxiii + 364. Frankfurt-am-Main: Vittorio Klostermann, 2001. DM 138. 3 465 03138 5

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903445685

The Christian Church's efforts to prohibit marriages between close relatives have a long and confusing history. Corbet's book is a closely-focused monograph that details the ways in which both civil and ecclesiastical authorities of Ottonian Germany treated the social, political and religious problems that consanguineous marriages raised. Although the medieval Church also forbade marriages between persons related through legal ties, such as marriage and baptismal sponsorship, Corbet has little to say on this topic, since it rarely appeared as an issue in the Ottonian realm. His book presents a detailed account of the bewildering history of competing doctrines championed by venerable ecclesiastical authorities concerning the permissible degrees of relationship within which marriages were valid. He also recounts the varying selections and combinations of those rulings that early medieval canonists adopted in their collections. The issue of consanguineous marriage was further confused by the differing methods that were used to calculate degrees of relationship, a topic that Corbet treats with admirable clarity and sophistication. In addition, he presents detailed studies of the way that sixteen actual cases of endogamous unions were handled in eleventh-century Germany. It is no surprise to find that all of these cases come from the higher reaches of elite society: four of them involved royalty, while the remainder were aristocratic marriages. Still, limited as it is to lofty social strata, the evidence concerning practice provides a useful insight into the ability of the Ottonian Church to enforce its rules on this sensitive matter. Corbet demonstrates that German churchmen did indeed make serious efforts to impose restraints upon the matrimonial inclinations of powerful laymen and that in many cases they succeeded. The author concludes that over the long term the campaign against endogamy very largely attained its objectives. He has interesting things to say, as well, about canonical procedure and proof in Ottonian Germany and about related topics, such as the development of the theory and practice of dispensation. Corbet's book began as a doctoral thesis (1998), largely based upon research that the author had completed several years earlier (1993–5). It also builds upon his earlier study (1986) of the lives of Ottonian saints. Traces of this lengthy gestation remain apparent in the finished product. Corbet's book makes

a valuable contribution to the literature on the history of early medieval marriage.

University of Kansas James A. Brundage

Jerusalem–Konstantinopel–Rom. Die Viten des Michael Synkellos und der Brüder Theodoros und Theophanes Graptoi. By Claudia Sode. (Altertumswissenschaftliches Kolloquium, 4.) Pp. 316. Stuttgart: Franz Steiner, 2001. €66 (paper). 3 515 07852 5; 1438 0552

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903455681

Presented as a model for the study of Byzantine hagiography, this analysis of texts concerning three learned monks from Palestine persecuted by the Iconoclast Emperor Theophilus (829–42) is deeply influenced by Paul Speck, who supervised it as a dissertation. Speck has established a distinctive method for evaluating Byzantine sources: pervasive scepticism based on exhaustive textual analysis of supposed inconsistencies or improbabilities that leads to rejecting what the sources say. Sometimes Speck's conjectures are persuasive, as when he added an extra year to the usurpation of Artavasdus (741–3); but often they are utterly arbitrary, as when he redated the Emperor Heraclius' second marriage from 613/14 to 622, unaware that Heraclius' second wife appears as empress on a coin dated to 615/16. Sode, like her teacher, rejects both bad and good sources to reach a mixture of sound and unsound conclusions about Michael Syncellus and the brothers Theodore and Theophanes. She begins by corroborating two arguments that had been made before without attracting much scholarly notice: Ernst von Dobschütz's demonstration of 1909 that the anonymous *Life of Michael* is an unreliable source with a fictional chronology, and the present reviewer's suggestion of 1979 that this *Life* is derived from Theophanes of Caesarea's *Encomium of Theodore* rather than the reverse. Sode's well-founded scepticism about the *Life of Michael* leads her to reject its dubious reports of some of Michael's otherwise unknown accomplishments: his role as teacher of Theodore and Theophanes, and as *Syncellus* (adviser) not just to the patriarch of Jerusalem but to the patriarch of Constantinople, Methodius (843–7). She also rejects the *Life*'s uncorroborated statement that Michael was sent from Jerusalem to Rome to protest against the insertion of the *filioque* in the Creed; she argues that the *filioque* only became an issue between east and west during the patriarchate of Photius (858–67, 877–86), when the *Life* was presumably composed and its author wanted to borrow Michael's authority for the eastern position. This much is well-argued, mostly original and significant. But Sode goes too far in attacking the authenticity of a letter ascribed to Theodore himself in Symeon Metaphrastes' *Life of Theodore*, relating in detail how he and his brother had their faces tattooed with derogatory verses on Theophilus' orders (hence their epithet *Graptoi*, 'the inscribed'). She finds the verses recorded in the letter incompatible with their context, because they describe men who had their faces tattooed for committing unspecified crimes in Jerusalem and were sentenced to be deported there afterwards, whereas the brothers were tattooed for opposing Iconoclasm in Byzantium and were then imprisoned there. Sode's argument ignores poetic licence, Theophilus' hostility to the brothers, the fact that he considered

venerating icons a crime in itself and the obvious solution that he changed his mind about deporting them after having had them tattooed. By applying indiscriminately the scepticism with which she rightly regards the derivative and mendacious *Life of Michael*, Sode leaves herself scarcely anything to say about these three interesting figures, and is likely to mislead her readers almost as much as she enlightens them.

St Louis University Warren Treadgold

Exaltation of the cross. Toward the origins of the feast of the cross and the meaning of the cross in early medieval liturgy. By Louis van Tongeren. (Liturgia Condenda, 11.) Pp. x + 342. Leuven: Peeters, 2000. €45. 90 429 0951 X

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903465688

This English translation of van Tongeren's 1995 Dutch dissertation is both accurately and usefully titled, but the title must be taken literally: what is treated here is exclusively the Exaltation feast of 14 September, not that of the Invention on 3 May or any lesser observances. The book's method is straightforward and comprehensive. After tracing the historical development of the feast, the author covers in considerable detail the proper elements – primarily prayers and chants – of its mass in (broadly) the Roman tradition, then the same elements in the Frankish tradition and thirdly those in the divine office: the latter not really being susceptible to the relatively neat Roman–Frankish antithesis applied to mass liturgies. Finally, as well as presenting the texts as found in numerous early medieval service books, Van Tongeren supplies literary/theological analysis of 'content and motif'. This method, despite not being wholly satisfactory in its treatment of the office, enables the author to pull together a vast amount of information from a large number of sources. (There are somewhat oblique further chapters on the oldest cross hymns, especially those of Venantius Fortunatus, and on the distinctive blessings for the feast in the Hispanic and Gallican traditions.) The great usefulness of the book is only slightly lessened by a number of shakinesses in idiomatic English. As an exhaustive investigation of its subject, this work must hold the field for many years to come, and will be, as it deserves to be, heavily quarried by subsequent students of liturgical history.

University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill Richard W. Pfaff

Biographie und Epochenstil im lateinischen Mittelalter, IV: *Ottonische Biographie – Das hohe Mittelalter 920–1220 n. Chr.*, II: *1070–1220 n. Chr.*. By Walter Berschin. (Quellen und Untersuchungen zur Lateinischen Philologie des Mittelalters, 12, 2.) Pp. viii + 273–677. Stuttgart: Anton Hiersemann, 2001. DM 288. 3 7772 8606 0; 3 7772 0128 6

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903475684

This half-volume completes Professor Berschin's monumental study, the first volume of which appeared in 1986, of Latin biography over some thousand years precisely defined as from AD 202 to AD 1220. Biography is widely interpreted to include but not to be confined to hagiography. Within so vast a field, Berschin's

declared intention is to concentrate upon the classics of biography which were the most important and widely influential examples of the genre in medieval times, upon texts which for historical or literary reasons have most interested modern scholars and readers, and upon those which for reasons of style, presentation or evolution present especially significant characteristics. Thus, the *Lives* discussed are set against the changing cultural and political circumstances of the medieval centuries. With emphasis upon Canossa as a historical turning-point with European implications, Berschin begins his final half-volume with the 1070s and presents it as what can be regarded as a free-standing study of the 'long' twelfth century as well as the final instalment of his work as a whole. Under the caption (from Hildebert of Lavardin) *plus Cesare Petrus*, Berschin divides his discussion into four parts: France, with especial regard to its cultural pre-eminence and the diversity of its monastic life; England in the aftermath of the Norman conquest; the imperial lands of Germany and of north and central Italy; and the European periphery within which Scotland, Wales and Ireland are considered. Biography in England is well handled, with especially thorough treatment of the *Lives* of Thomas Becket; indeed, in respect both of their number and of their characteristics, these *Lives* go far to mark the zenith of medieval biography. Rather surprisingly, however, no mention is made of Jocelin of Brakelond's chronicle of the acts of Abbot Samson of Bury St Edmunds. As is to be expected of the work of so distinguished a Latinist as Berschin, a feature of his study is the wealth of information, often in great detail, about the biblical, classical, patristic and liturgical sources of *Lives* under discussion. As an example, one may read the anonymous *Vita Henrici IV* of Germany, with its moral that (in Berschin's words) 'not the giant cathedral building at Speyer but the poor marked out for Henry the path to heaven', with fresh eyes in the light of his exposition of its sources and models. With characteristic caution, Berschin does nothing to confirm the frequent suggestion that Bishop Erlung of Würzburg was its author; indeed, carefully contrived anonymity is a feature of it. Berschin concludes this as other volumes with a highly useful classification of the principal relevant texts of the period covered. All in all, Berschin's work fills a major gap by offering both an overall conspectus of Latin biography and an invaluable treasury of reference for particular authors and texts.

St Edmund Hall, H. E. J. Cowdrey
Oxford

Belief and culture in the Middle Ages. Studies presented to Henry Mayr-Harting. Edited by Richard Gameson and Henrietta Leyser. Pp. xvi + 370 + frontispiece and 24 plates. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001. £50. 0 19 820801 4
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903485680

Henry Mayr-Harting's wide scholarly interests are reflected in the topics chosen to celebrate him in this volume: conversion, hagiography, the study of manuscripts, Ottonian art, bishops, the diocese of Chichester and hermits are all touched on in no fewer than twenty-five contributions, which follow a few pages devoted to his career at Liverpool (Christopher Brooke) and at St Peter's College, Oxford (Lawrence Goldman), and a list of his principal publications. There is no

space here to list all the items, but those which the reviewer most enjoyed are the following: R. A. Markus examines the vocabulary available to Gregory the Great to define lapsed Christians and those ignorant of Christianity and shows how, in spite of knowing there was a distinction, Gregory usually approached the question of mission without considering how his message should be adapted for outsiders; Anton Scharer makes a case for Duke Tassilo of Bavaria as the person who commissioned the Rupertus Cross, perhaps to celebrate his victory over the Carantanians in 772. Janet Nelson looks for Charlemagne's 'personal voice' in his capitularies and finds a distinctive (and rather crotchety) tone in Boretius' *Capitularia* i, nos 71–2. Stuart Airlie reinterprets the Salzburg text, the *Conversio Bagoariorumet Carantanorum*, not as a missionary work but as a statement of Carolingian unity, compiled to glorify Salzburg over other Bavarian churches, as the linchpin of the eastern Frankish frontier. Patrick Wormald attempts to disentangle the various Bishops Brihthelm existing in mid-tenth century England, thereby shedding some light on the history of the diocese of Selsey, then temporarily subordinate to the diocese of Winchester. Martin Kauffmann provides a detailed description of Bodleian MS Canon. Liturg. 312, an Ottonian sacramentary probably produced at Reichenau in the early eleventh century. Kathleen Cushing compares the *Vitae* of two eleventh-century ecclesiastical reformers, Ariald and Bishop Anselm of Lucca, and decides that political activity rather than miracle-working was the basis for proving sanctity in these works. Eleventh-century reform also supplies the background for Timothy Reuter's paper, which traces the history of a ritual, originating with Leo IX in 1049, in which penitent bishops renounced their staffs to the pope or his representative and were immediately reinstated by receiving the staff once more (or, in the 1049 case, a different one). Nicholas Vincent takes issue with the late Eleanor Searle over whether the Battle chronicler was implicated in his abbey's forgeries, and decides, after an analysis of Henry II's charters for Battle, that he must have been. D. J. A. Matthew, seeking insight into Becket's preoccupations from his letters, finds that the issue of excommunicating tenants-in-chief concerned him more than criminous clerks. Julian Haseldine shows that, although Becket himself did not make many close friends, John of Salisbury's involvement in Peter of Celle's friendship network gave the archbishop much-needed support. Valerie I. J. Flint studies the interest in the operation of the law in cases of accidental death displayed in the dossier compiled to prove the sanctity of Bishop Thomas Cantilupe of Hereford (1275–82).

University of Nottingham Julia Barrow

The Anglo-Saxon state. By James Campbell. Pp. xxix + 290. London–New York: Hambledon and London, 2000. £25. 1 85285 176 7
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903495687

One of the minor characters in David Lodge's parody of the international academic conference circuit, *Small worlds*, is a novelist who has not been able to write a new book ever since an English don at the 'Centre for Computational Stylistics at the University of Darlington' told him that his favourite word was 'grease'. Unfortunately, collecting scattered papers into a single volume can shed

equally unwanted light on the idiosyncrasies of an author's prose style without the need for computerised analysis: a reading of these articles, first published between 1987 and 1996, reveals that James Campbell's favourite word is 'anachronism'. Campbell observes in his introduction that 'historians dread the charge of anachronism, dread it as a spinster might a spider, or the possibility of a spider' and frequently warns his readers against the dangers of anachronistic interpretations (in the analysis of the regalia from Sutton Hoo, for example, or in Stubbs's use of language). Yet there is an irony here. To many Anglo-Saxonists it is anachronistic to use the word 'state' (which was not defined in its sense of the political organisation which is the basis of civil government until the sixteenth century) for the pre-Conquest polity, even if the word is defined stipulatively, that is in the sense of what one might reasonably call a state. This should not detract, however, from the significance of the arguments collected here, which demonstrate the strength and efficiency of the governance of later Anglo-Saxon kings, the unity of their realm and the wealth of England's economy. Campbell is a master of the essay as literary form. Here he ranges widely chronologically from the early cult of St Cuthbert to the last years of Anglo-Saxon rule, touching on subjects as diverse as early medieval biography, the significance of herrings ('the herring was the potato of the middle ages') and the work of Bishop Stubbs. Affection for his native East Anglia is reflected most obviously in a paper on the East Anglian sees before the Conquest, but illustration from that region pervades the volume. As perhaps the most original of contemporary Anglo-Saxon historians, James Campbell continues to challenge – and provoke – his readers: 'That representative institutions have their roots in the dark-age and medieval past is not an anachronistic view; rather it is fully demonstrable'. *The Anglo-Saxon state* requires medievalists to rethink many of their assumptions about pre-Conquest England and its historians.

University of Sheffield Sarah Foot

Iotsald von Saint-Claude. Vita des Abtes Odilo von Cluny. Edited by Johannes Staub. (Monumenta Germaniae Historica. Scriptores rerum Germanicarum in usum scholarum separatim editi, 68.) Pp. viii + 366. Hanover: Hahnsche Buchhandlung, 1999. DM 78. 3 7752 5389 0; 0343 0820

Studien zu Iotsalds Vita des Abtes Odilo von Cluny. Edited by Johannes Staub. (Monumenta Germaniae Historica. Studien und Texte, 24.) Pp. xiii + 98 incl. 1 map + 8 plates. Hanover: Hahnsche Buchhandlung, 1999. DM 30. 3 7752 5724 1; 0938 6432

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903505681

La *Vita Odilonis* (BHL 6281), cinquième abbé de Cluny, a été rédigée par le moine Jotsald peu après la mort du saint (1049). L'édition communément consultée était jusqu'à présent celle de Mabillon (1701), reprise par Migne (*PL* cxlii. 895–940). Staub réintègre dans la *Vita* (d'après le manuscrit Paris, BNF 18304, fin du XIe siècle) les chapitres ii. 23 et ii. 24, découverts par Sackur en 1890 (*Neues Archiv* xv [1890]). On dispose donc désormais, pour la première fois, du texte intégral en une seule édition. La collation a été effectuée sur les quatre manuscrits qui donnent la 'version longue'. Sont également présentés et

commentés ceux qui proposent une 'version courte' ou seulement la première partie de l'œuvre, ainsi que quatre bréviaires. L'édition est complétée par une série de petits textes liés à la mort du saint: *Epistola monachorum silviniacensium de obitu Odilonis abbatis* (BHL 6280), *Electio domni Hugonis* (BHL 6280b), *Epistola Burchardi*, récit de l'élévation des reliques lors de la visite à Souvigny de Pierre Damien (1063). La *Vita* est elle-même suivie d'un *planctus* métrique et d'une pièce rythmique neumée (peut-être ultérieurement). Ce volume de textes est accompagné d'un fascicule donnant des éléments nouveaux: (1) sur l'auteur de la *Vita*, Jotsald; (2) sur le modèle, hérité de saint Jérôme, de l'*epitaphium*; (3) sur la transmission et la réception du texte. Après avoir été longtemps présent aux côtés de son maître Odilon, Jotsald est devenu abbé de Saint-Claude, dans le Jura. La rédaction de la *Vita Odilonis* ne peut être postérieure à 1052. Les *Studien* donnent en annexe une charte inédite de Saint-Claude, dans laquelle apparaît *Iotsaldus gratia Dei abbas*. L'ensemble s'achève par huit planches des principaux manuscrits. Il s'agit en définitive, dans une optique strictement philologique, d'une remarquable édition qui rendra bien des services.

MADRID PATRICK HENRIET

Gregor VII. Papst zwischen Canossa und Kirchenreform. By Uta-Renate Blumenthal. Pp. xiii + 376 + 1 black-and-white and 7 colour plates. Darmstadt: Primus, 2001. DM 59. 3 89678 198 7

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903515688

Uta-Renate Blumenthal's purpose in this richly detailed and penetrating study of Pope Gregory VII (1073–85) is not to offer a comprehensive account of his life and pontificate but to consider his personality as a pope and as a man who stood at the intersection of two developments that make the later eleventh century a political and ideological turning-point, and also *caesura*, in European history. The first is the so-called Investiture Contest for which the image of the penitent Henry IV of Germany before Gregory at Canossa stands as a still potent symbol; the second is the many-faceted reform of the Church that heralded the papal monarchy of the central Middle Ages. Blumenthal's approach is not narrative and chronological; indeed, she says little about Canossa itself as a polarity of Gregory's exercise of the papal office. Rather, her treatment is thematic and selective, although some episodes of the pontificate are trenchantly dealt with; one may instance Henry IV's confrontation with Gregory in Italy and at Rome between 1080 and 1084.

As much as a third of Blumenthal's text is devoted to Hildebrand's career and activities before his election to the papacy upon the death of Alexander II. This is by far the fullest treatment since G. B. Borino's study published in 1948; it must now rank as the most authoritative account. As for Gregory's election itself, it was not carried out with regard to the Election Decree of 1059, to which in any case Hildebrand as archdeacon is now thought not to have subscribed. Blumenthal pertinently points out similarities between the record of the election in Gregory's Register and material in the canon law collection of Cardinal Deusdedit, in whose title-church of S. Pietro in Vincoli Gregory was enthroned as pope. In selecting topics for her discussion of the pontificate itself, Blumenthal concentrates

upon subjects, such as councils and canon law, in which she has already published distinguished work, treating them in meticulous detail. She at once proceeds to a sixty-page chapter on Gregory's Lent and November synods, normally held in the Lateran; it provides the most comprehensive and competent guide to these synods that is available. A striking feature that Blumenthal makes clear, especially *à propos* of the Lent synod of 1074, is the quantity of business concerning France that arose at, or in connection with, the synods. Chapters follow on legates and the church hierarchy. In an illuminating discussion of Gregory's monastic policy, it is clear how much remains to be learnt from Gregory's privileges for religious houses as edited in 1957 by Leo Santifaller. Gregory's dealings with kings, princes and the laity are comprehensively considered, with due emphasis upon the value that Gregory set upon the active services of right-minded and obedient laymen, There is a concluding discussion of Gregory's death and burial at Salerno and of his eventual canonisation.

It is rightly insisted that Gregory's last months at Salerno were far from being a time of inaction or of bitterness. Blumenthal has more reservations than have been usual about the recent palaeopathological examination of Gregory's supposed skeletal remains. Her caution and its reasons should be noted, though they do not necessarily undermine confidence: many will consider a probable stature of *c.* 160 cm. to be compatible with the testimony of friend and foe that Gregory was a small man, and small stature can be accompanied by such muscularity and physical strength as the examination has suggested.

As regards Gregory's formation for the papal office, Blumenthal revives the suggestion of Wilhelm Martens in his biography of 1894 that the young Hildebrand was not, as generally held, a monk but a regular canon. While her arguments call for serious consideration, there is too little positive evidence for her case to be deemed conclusive. For example, the address of the German bishops' letter of January 1076 renouncing their obedience to 'brother' Hildebrand ('Hildebrando fratri') can hardly be seen without further evidence as an allusion to his status as a regular canon; Manegold of Lautenbach's praise of Gregory as 'in observandis regulis canonicis districtiorem' in its context seems to refer in general to his faithfulness to ancient canonical rules than specifically to the rule of regular canons. There is too little evidence to set against the body of references to Gregory as *monachus*, and there remain such considerations as Gregory's devotion to Gregory the Great, the first monk-pope, as the eleventh century regarded him. Nevertheless, the reminder of Gregory's commitment as archdeacon and as pope to strict forms of the canonical life is a valuable feature of the book.

Blumenthal lays emphasis upon the monarchical and Rome-centred aspects of Gregory's conception and exercise of the papal primacy; these often challenged the current understanding of the rights of particular churches and their bishops. She rightly notices Gregory's commitment to the Pseudo-Isidorian structure of the ecclesiastical hierarchy with its order of patriarchs, primates and bishops which in some respects counterbalanced the tendency towards centralisation. It may be added, especially with regard to the French Church, that Gregory also showed an awareness of the need for what would nowadays be called subsidiarity: local business was sometimes best settled locally, both to relieve the Roman Church of an excessive burden and because local agencies might often be in a

better position to establish the facts and rights of a situation. It is the merit of Dr Blumenthal's book that it both stimulates further inquiry in such terms and provides superabundant material for pursuing it. It represents a major landmark in Gregorian studies.

St Edmund Hall, H. E. J. Cowdrey
Oxford

Pilgrimage in medieval England. By Diana Webb. Pp. xvii + 317 incl. frontispiece and 5 ills + 13 plates. London–New York: Hambledon–London, 2000. £25. 1 85285 250 X

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903525684

Medieval pilgrimage was a truly multivalent phenomenon. Diana Webb's lavishly detailed depiction of it on a broad chronological canvas of over nine hundred years is the most remarkable achievement of this book. Her exhaustive trawl through miracle collections, chronicles, episcopal registers, household accounts, wills, letters and royal documents to gather data makes it a vast treasure-house of information and colourful vignette into which the more general reading public will dip with repeated reward. The book has ten chapters, the first three taking us up to 1200, the remainder broadly proceeding from this date and approaching the subject from different angles, each determined by the author's grouping of evidence around selected themes. This imbalance in the chronology, according to the author, reflects the availability of sources for the earlier period, in which pilgrimage tended to be represented as the ascetic activity of the holy man or, in its wider sense, imposed in the penitentials as a temporary discipline rather than a voluntary undertaking. Only with the late eleventh and twelfth centuries do churchmen begin to take an interest in documenting more popular forms of pilgrimage, and from then on we witness, through Webb's survey, the accumulation of evidence for the uses of pilgrimage in a wide variety of social and political contexts. These include pilgrimage to shrines in the hope of a miracle cure or for the relief of social and spiritual anxieties; as a journey undertaken in anticipation of an indulgence; as an opportunity for the public performance by English kings of humility and authority; for the registering by important men and local communities of support for political causes; as metaphor for the Christian life of the laity; or as an extension of commercial and leisure activities.

The establishment of canonisation procedures and regulations for the issue of indulgences reflects the efforts of the Church to routinise and circumscribe pilgrimage activity. Fascinatingly, Webb documents the ingenuity with which the clergy extended that project under fiercely competitive conditions, transforming their churches into spaces of semiotic arousal redolent of Edwardian seaside arcades or modern interactive museums such as the Millennium Dome. A recurring challenge to late medieval bishops was to police this myriad of local contexts within which pilgrimage featured as part of the local exploitation of cult and pilgrimage. Richard Buvyle, rector of Whitstone in Cornwall, became the subject of cultic activity when he died in 1361 in suspicious circumstances. Pilgrims visited his grave, made offerings, received miracle cures, visited a newly organised (and unlicensed) market and generally made merry, much to the

consternation of Bishop Grandisson of Exeter. Such parish activities, glimpses of which often survive only in the records of institutions seeking to suppress them, litter the book and are crying out for the further attention of postgraduate students. At times, Webb's equanimity and ecumenical style can be frustrating. A tendency to pile example upon example risks a homogenising effect on the chronology and expends words for which undergraduates might have been more grateful had they been invested in the discussion of broader historiographical issues. The diversity of pilgrimage's functions by the late medieval period and its entanglement in secular forms of exchange and communication, for example, tends to testify either to the vitality or the poverty of its religious meaning and value, often according to the confessional inclination of the historian. Webb's refusal to pronounce too crudely on the issue is admirable but exasperating, leaving this reviewer hungry for historical elucidation supported by a theoretical apparatus that might transcend rather than simply avoid this ideological impasse.

UNIVERSITY OF LIVERPOOL SIMON YARROW

Jews and Christians in twelfth-century Europe. Edited by Michael A. Signer and John Van Engen. (Notre Dame Conferences in Medieval Studies, 10.) Pp. xi + 380. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2001. $49.95 (cloth), $24.95 (paper). 0 268 03253 X; 0 268 03254 8

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903535680

This volume contains the papers presented to a conference in October 1996 at Notre Dame, Indiana. The aim of the conference organisers/editors was to situate the Jewish communities of Ashkenaz within the creative intellectual and cultural activities of the so-called twelfth-century renaissance, even as reasons were investigated why Christian attitudes towards Jews generally deteriorated in this period in north-western Europe. Thus the Hebrew narratives of the First Crusade are analysed not just for the evidence they give of Jewish martyrdom as the ultimate rejection of Christianity, but also for the evidence they offer of Jewish knowledge and even in a sense absorption of Christian cultural values (J. Cohen, Chazan). Susan Einbinder compares the narrative techniques used in this Hebrew prose to express the anguish of the protagonists with literary techniques adopted by Chrétien de Troyes in his romances. Jewish cultural and intellectual creativity, which resonate with Christian developments, is explored with reference to the work of the Tosaphists (scholars using dialectic to gloss the Talmud) and the ascetic contemplative world of the German Pietists (Marcus, Wolfson). As far as mutual intellectual interaction is concerned on the exegetical front, Van Engen discusses how an awareness of Jewish alternative readings stimulated Ralph of Flaix's remarkable commentary on Leviticus, while Signer explores how the biblical commentaries of Rashi could safeguard the Jewish community from feeling undermined by Christian explanations of the text. Other essays explore the highly emotive dynamics of conversion (voluntary and forced), the hardening of anti-Jewish attitudes (Maureen Boulton's article on twelfth-century French vernacular texts is very informative) and the physical circumstances of the Jewries of England and France. It has to be said that the essays do vary in quality, with some presenting much newer and more exciting material

than others. And it is a pity it took so long for the volume to appear. But, all in all, the editors, whose own contributions to the volume are among the best, are to be congratulated on producing a volume that integrates the history of medieval Jews into the history of twelfth-century north-western Europe.

LUCY CAVENDISH COLLEGE, CAMBRIDGE
ANNA SAPIR ABULAFIA

Metamorphosis and identity. By Caroline Walker Bynum. Pp. 280 incl. 15 figs. New York: Zone Books, 2001. £19.50. 1 890951 22 6

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903545687

This is a miscellany made up of four chapters; there are also fifteen plates showing marvels and hybrids. First comes Bynum's presidential address to the American Historical Association in 1997; this concerns 'Wonder' (medieval miracle stories, prodigies, preachers' *exempla*, travellers' tales) and was first published in the *American Historical Review*. Next comes her presidential address to the Medieval Academy of America in 1998; this was published in *Speculum* and is entitled 'Metamorphosis, or Gerald and the werewolf' (actually it concerns much more than Gerald of Wales's tale of a pair of wolves in Ireland who reveal themselves to be human beings). Certainly Gerald considered this to be more than a joke, as he defended his story in subsequent publications and wrote it down for the bishop of Meath to transmit to the pope. The third chapter, 'Monsters, medians and marvellous mixtures', which is published here for the first time, concerns St Bernard's attitude to the spiritual significance of hybrids. It argues that 'hybridity', meaning the simultaneity of opposites, is central not only to Bernard's rhetoric but to his view of life. He would surely have vociferously denied this; double dealers, like the 'totally ambiguous' Abelard and the monstrous hybrids sculpted in monastic cloisters, were evil and shameful. The fourth chapter, 'Shape and story', which is the Jefferson Lecture for 1999 already published on the Internet, uses material from Marie de France and Dante (as well as Ovid, Saki and Angela Carter) to discuss ideas of metamorphosis. The four chapters are preceded by an introduction (history is 'a simultaneous assertion of past and present, self and other') and conclude with an afterword: 'At the the heart of such apparently disparate genres as epics and romances, hexaemeral commentaries, devotional literature, travellers' tales, theological discussions of demons, and treatises on minerals, fossils, and nutrition, the theme of *mutatio* throbs as the basic question about self and other.' This is not a book for beginners, as it provides no overview of medieval ideas about transformation. An additional opening chapter would have been useful, explaining the main theological points, particularly in the doctrines of Trinity, Creation and Resurrection as well as in the application of the Sacraments. All seven sacraments as defined in Peter Lombard's *Sentences* are transformational: divine grace regenerates, confirms, nourishes, absolves and provides rites of passage in extreme unction, the priesthood and marriage. Bynum knows all this, as she has reached the complexities of being and becoming discussed in this book through her previous publications: *Jesus as mother* (1982), *Holy feast and holy fast* (1987), *Fragmentation and redemption* (1992) and *The resurrection of the body in western Christianity* (1995). To admirers of these books *Metamorphosis and identity* may yield

less than expected in path-breaking ideas; this is because there is already a huge and stimulating literature on all this, as Bynum scrupulously acknowledges in eighty pages of references.

UNIVERSITY OF LONDON M. T. CLANCHY

Love, war and the Grail. Templars, Hospitallers and Teutonic Knights in medieval epic and romance, 1150–1500. By Helen J. Nicholson. (History of Warfare, 4.) Pp. xiii + 274. Leiden–Boston–Cologne: Brill, 2001. €70. 90 04 12014 9; 1385 7827

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903555683

This is a study of the appearances of the three leading military orders in epics and romances composed mainly in France, Germany and England. The first chapters survey the roles attributed to them. The orders were depicted not only as performing military and various charitable functions but also as providing places of penance and retirement. Templars gave support to lovers, but brethren of the orders were not usually envisaged as spiritual guides. Here the author is developing themes already examined in her earlier book on images of military orders up to 1291. Now, however, she is also considering the later Middle Ages, and taking discussion further. The most intriguing part of book, however, is the long central section on Grail romances. An ingenious, though very speculative, theory is propounded, in which it is argued that in Wolfram von Eschenbach's *Parzival* Parzival represents Otto of Brunswick and Gawan is to be identified with Philip of Swabia. This theory will no doubt be challenged by Grail scholars. In this section the author also rightly questions whether some Grail romances which do not explicitly mention military orders nevertheless make allusions to them: it cannot be assumed that red crosses on white shields, pentagrams and severed heads symbolise the Templars (in this context, however, it seems to be claimed rather perversely that in the early fourteenth century the accusers of the Templars criticised them for venerating relics of saints). In the last section, which is devoted to analysis, it is argued that military orders were often introduced into epic and romance to provide actuality; but considerable space also has to be devoted to explaining why in many works the orders are not mentioned. In some cases the explanation is seen to lie in the varying concepts of knighthood then current, but elsewhere it was merely that the narrative did not require the inclusion of military orders. The book is the product of wide reading and a considerable amount of thought, and some interesting suggestions are made. But at times the discussion is in need of greater precision and focus, and a convincing case is not always made out. The argument, for example, that the link between the Templars and romantic lovers has its origins in the notion that the brethren personified Christian love is not altogether persuasive. Nor is the book free from repetition. Furthermore, much of the comment in the first chapters on the pre-1291 period reproduces what was stated in the author's earlier study. At times, as in part of the examination of Grail romances, discussion relates only peripherally to the military orders; and overall the book throws more light on epic and romance than on the orders themselves.

KIRTLINGTON A. J. FOREY

Tolerance and intolerance. Social conflict in the age of the crusades. Edited by Michael Gervers and James M. Powell. Pp. xx + 191 incl. frontispiece. Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 2001. $39.95 (cloth), $18.95 (paper). 0 8156 2869 2; 0 8156 2870 6

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S002204690356568X

This volume comprises twelve papers, all but one selected from those delivered at sessions organised by the Society for the Study of the Crusades and the Latin East at the Eighteenth International Congress of Historical Sciences, held in Montreal in 1995. Four deal with the aftermath of battle: massacres, prisoners of war and their ransoming (including the orders dedicated to the release of captives, the Trinitarians and the Mercedarians), six with the relations of Latins with Armenians, Muslims, Mongols, Jews and Greeks and two with notions of toleration or otherwise in medieval canon law and in the *History* of William of Tyre. There are contributions from well-known figures on the international scene – Professors Brodman, Cipollone, Muldoon, Ryan and Schwinges, and Drs Amitai and Lev – but others are from those younger scholars who have been making crusade history so exciting, including Anneta Ilieva whose early death was a tragedy. David Hay challenges the level of killing described in eye-witness accounts of the crusades. Since he wrote his paper his conclusion that the massacres were exaggerated by westerners is supported by the discovery of a contemporary Arabic account of the sack of Jerusalem in 1099 – by Ibn al-'Arab – which puts the number of dead much lower than later Muslim writers reported. Hay goes on to ask why western writers should have exaggerated enemy casualties the way they did and will be starting a debate which, I am sure, will run for some time. Paul Sidelko throws doubt on the evidence for a continuance of Muslim taxation in Palestine under the Latins. I do not think he is entirely convincing, although I have to confess that I am one of his targets, but the questions he raises are pertinent and deserve discussion. Adam Knobler draws attention to the persistent belief in Christian Europe that far in the east was a well-organised Jewish state which might assist the west. And Andrew Jotischky continues to uncover more about an enigmatic, but obviously important figure in the twelfth-century Latin east, Gerard of Nazareth, bishop of Latakia. This is definitely a collection to be welcomed.

EMMANUEL COLLEGE, CAMBRIDGE — JONATHAN RILEY-SMITH

Crusading peace. Christendom, the Muslim world, and western political order. By Tomaž Mastnak. Pp. xi + 406. Berkeley–Los Angeles–London: University of California Press, 2002. £35 ($50). 0 520 22635 6

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903575686

Amidst the plethora of publications on crusading which have appeared in recent years, very few have attempted to place it within an ideological framework. For understandable reasons, there has been an emphasis on such aspects as crusading warfare, the theology underpinning the crusades and the motives which made individuals become crusaders. Yet without some understanding of the system of ideas to which crusading belonged, we are bound to possess an imperfect understanding of how and why it exercised such an enduring grip on medieval

Europe. The great merit of Tomaž Mastnak's study is his readiness to engage with ideology, focusing on the relationship between crusading and public peace which was established with great force by Urban II, was reaffirmed and refined by crusading apologists throughout the twelfth and thirteenth centuries and resonated even in the 1370s in the letters of St Catherine of Siena. Mastnak's background is in the social sciences but his handling of medieval sources is assured and careful. His abundant footnotes show that he has read widely, and every important commentator on the crusades receives some attention. He has a tendency to indulge in sweeping generalisations which fail to advance the argument, and at times he cannot break free from an old-fashioned tendency to consider all issues of authority in medieval Europe in terms of Church and State. But he makes crystal clear the extent of the damage which was inflicted on Christian–Islamic relations by the association of crusading violence with Christendom's very identity and self-projection. Whether or not this contributed to the recent hostilities in the Balkans, as Mastnak claims, is more contentious and begs many questions. But he is surely right to emphasise that in the period with which he is dealing, from the eleventh to the late fourteenth century, crusading set up a juxtaposition of Christian and Muslim which was inherently triumphalist and exclusive.

University of Leicester Norman Housley

The Collectio canonum casinensis *duodecimi seculi* (*Codex terscriptus*). *A derivative of the south-Italian* Collection in five books. Edited by Roger E. Reynolds. (Monumenta Liturgica Beneventana, III. Studies and Texts, 137.) Pp. ix + 129. Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, 2001. $31.95. 0 88844 137 1

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903585682

Roger Reynolds has devoted the past decades to the pre-Gratian canon law collections compiled to the south of Rome, particularly to the partially edited, early eleventh-century *Collectio V librorum* (5L) and its derivatives. He was the first to identify many of the twenty-five or so derivatives and has demonstrated repeatedly the importance of this group of collections for the transmission of passages from the writings of the Greek Fathers, especially on liturgy and ecclesiastical hierarchy. Most recently he has launched a series of monographs, each devoted to one of the derivatives. The present publication is an analysis of the *Collectio casinensis* in Monte Cassino, MS 216. It takes the form of a transcription of the incipit, explicit, inscription, rubric and location of each canon in the manuscript. Reynolds identifies the formal source of each text, which in most cases is the 5L or the *Liber decretorum* of Burchard. Since only the first three books of the 5L are edited (by Mario Fornasari in *Corpus Christianorum*, Continuatio Mediaevalis vi) users of the present analysis with no access to a complete copy of the 5L are at a disadvantage.

Reynolds provides a precise codicological and palaeographical description of this late twelfth-century manuscript, which, as he points out, is the latest copy of a canon law collection in Beneventan script. The collection itself is considerably earlier. The inclusion of excerpts from decretals of Urban II and Paschal II allows a dating in the early twelfth century. The *Casinensis* is unsystematic and the

canons are not numbered. Reynolds assigns numbers only to those canons with their own rubrics and comes to a total of 378 canons, most of them from the two above mentioned sources, others from the *Diversorum patrum sententie* in 74 Titles (74T) and the so-called *Decretum* of Ivo of Chartres. Reynolds characterises the collection as an instrument created at Monte Cassino for the administration of the abbey and for the ministration to clergy and laity.

This characterisation fits almost all of the derivatives of the 5L, and Reynolds seems most interested in this aspect of the *Casinensis*. This particular collection has other qualities, however. Reynolds notes the presence of the group of sentences *Proprie auctoritates apostolice sedis* (a 'sub-capitulation' of canon CCXCIX) without elaborating on the significance of the find. The dating and placing of this group of sentences, which bears a strong resemblance to the *Dictatus papae*, is highly controversial. Most recently M. Wojtowytsch has called attention to the presence of this group of texts in the *Casinensis* which, assuming the *Casinensis* was – as it seems – compiled in the early twelfth century, is the earliest testimony to its existence. More attention to the more recent texts in the *Casinensis* would have clarified its position against the earlier formal sources.

The inclusion of lists of the known manuscripts of the 74T, the *Liber decretorum* of Burchard, the *Collectio canonum* of Anselm of Lucca and the *Tripartita*, *Decretum* and *Panormia* of Ivo of Chartres is puzzling. This would have been a study in itself and a difficult one. There were bound to be mistakes. Just two examples: MS Vat. lat. 3832 does not contain the collection of Anselm of Lucca and MS Florence BML San Marco 499 does not contain the *Panormia*. The one is a distinct collection and the other contains the collection of Anselm in the A′ version.

At the end of the book is an incipit list together with a directory of the material sources and a subject index in English. Further publications in this series will be very welcome.

PIESENKOVEN LINDA FOWLER-MAGERL

Surveys of the estates of Glastonbury Abbey, c. 1135–1201. Edited by N. E. Stacy. (Records of Social and Economic History. New Ser., 33.) Pp. xvii + 309 incl. map and frontispiece. Oxford: Oxford University Press (for the British Academy), 2001. £45. 0 19 726253 8

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903595689

Considering their importance, and the debate they have generated, the absence of these estate records from print has long been regrettable. However, Dr Stacy, who wrote a study of the early Glastonbury estates for his Oxford DPhil. (1971), has now supplied a welcome edition of the Latin texts of all the estate surveys up to 1201, with an authoritative introduction discussing the source of the texts, the way in which the estates were managed and the different types of tenure, rent and other customary payment that the surveys record. Though the title of the volume refers back to *c.* 1135, the earliest document in the collection is from 1171. This is the Survey of Hilbert the Precentor, which compares manors of the estate in his own day with their condition in Henry I's time, and so preserves information from the early twelfth century. Without entering into the core of the unpleasantly acrimonious debate between M. M. Postan and R. Lennard concerning the relevance of this record for twelfth-century economic trends, Stacy's comments

are often relevant to it. Having Hilbert's text in print enables one to see why it has caused so much trouble. For example, Stacy tells us (pp. 17–18) that when Hilbert contrasts the state of a manor in his own day ('modo') with that in Henry I's reign when it was at farm ('tempore Henrici quando fuit ad firmam'), he is defying normal linguistic usage, since the manor was still at farm. By implication, what Hilbert means, but cannot or does not express, is that in Henry I's day it was already at farm. Exceptional caution is clearly required in handling such texts. The longest Glastonbury survey is that of the *Liber Henrici de Soliaco* (1189), previously edited in 1882, from a manuscript in private hands, by John Edward Jackson for the Roxburghe Club, the only one of these texts to have been printed before. This new edition corrects numerous readings and supplies a well-informed commentary in footnotes. Here, as throughout the volume, Stacy's new information is good to have. It is nevertheless regrettable that he does not always follow his declared editorial principle that evident scribal errors should be corrected but noted in the critical apparatus. The reader is accordingly not sure what to make of occasional errors that appear in the printed text without any comment, such as 'posent' for 'possent' (p. 128), 'tres acras sunt' for 'tres acre sunt' (p. 134), 'pro omni sevitio' for 'pro omni servitio' (p. 136), 'De porci' for 'De porcis' (p. 140), 'perticatm' for 'perticatam' (p. 146), 'metre' for 'metere' (p. 147), 'Annuncicionem' for 'Annunciacionem' (p. 147), 'usuque' for 'usque' (p. 147), 'quartuor' for 'quattuor' (p. 148), 'in anni' for 'in anno' (p. 149), 'secundem consuetudinem' for 'secundum consuetudinem' (p. 154).

UNIVERSITY OF DURHAM R. H. BRITNELL

Princes of the Church. A history of the English cardinals. By Dominic Aidan Bellenger and Stella Fletcher. Pp. xii+211 incl. 2 tables+8 plates. Stroud: Sutton Publishing, 2001. £20. 0 7509 2630 9

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903605683

This is a scholarly and readable study of those English churchmen who have been elevated to the rank of cardinal: 'as the door of a house', so Pope Eugenius IV declared, 'turns on its hinges, so on the Cardinalate does the Apostolic See, the door of the whole Church, rest and find support'. Although the nature of the office was to change somewhat through the centuries, the cardinals' pivotal task was the election of the pope, as defined in the decree *Licet de evitanda* of the Lateran Council of 1179. The list of English cardinals started with the twelfth-century scholar, Robert Pullen, whose contemporary Nicholas Breakspear became the only English pope, and concludes with the present archbishop of Westminster who contributes a foreword to the book. The English medieval cardinals were mainly prominent as politicians, Stephen Langton, albeit also a scholar, Courtenay, Henry Beaufort and most illustrious of all, Thomas Wolsey, cardinal of St Cecilia from 1515 to 1530, who came at least within sight of the papal tiara. After the English Reformation the list naturally became sparse, its most illustrious precursor, William Allen, the founder of Douai. Thereafter there followed a sporadic bevy of aristocrats, the Dominican Philip Howard and the handsome Stuart Henry of York, made a cardinal in 1787, though not yet in orders and later generously given a pension by George III. With the restoration of the Catholic hierarchy under the lead of the 'portly' Nicholas Wiseman,

English Catholicism experienced a period of rejuvenation, Manning and Newman in particular exercising unprecedented influence in religious life; and in Basil Hume there were gleams of true sanctity. In a series of vignettes the authors demonstrate how the English cardinals, so different in their personalities, exercised a significant impact on the political and spiritual history of their times.

LINCOLN COLLEGE,
OXFORD VIVIAN GREEN

The second crusade. Scope and consequences. Edited by Jonathan Phillips and Martin Hoch. Pp. xxiii + 234 incl. 3 maps and 4 figs. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2001. £45 (cloth), £15.99 (paper). 0 7190 5710 8; 0 7190 5711 6

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S002204690361568X

The failure of the second crusade to make any tangible impact in the east should not be allowed to mask its significance or importance. This volume, comprising an introduction and ten essays by some of the foremost scholars in the field, provides a welcome reminder of the possibilities for fresh research as well as a useful insight into current thinking on the subject. The editors get the collection off to a good start with a useful overview. Jonathan Phillips and Rudolf Hiestand then each approach the question of how the crusade slotted into papal and imperial policy at the time. They disagree as to whether Pope Eugenius welcomed Conrad III's decision to participate, with Phillips questioning the view that the pope did not want the emperor-elect to go to the East and Hiestand reaffirming the more established position. Susan Edgington and Linda Paterson consider literary evidence: respectively the manuscripts of Albert of Aachen, and the historical context of Macrabu's *Vers del lavador*. Matthew Bennett and Nikolas Jaspert focus on campaigns in the Iberian peninsula – the celebrated capture of Lisbon and the less familiar, but in many respects equally significant siege of Tortosa – while Kurt Villads Jensen considers the northern theatre of the crusade with a discussion of the effect of the second crusade on developments in Denmark. Carole Hillenbrand examines the career and achievements of the Muslim leader, Zengi, showing that even the Muslim writers regarded him as cruel and ruthless. Timothy Reuter reviews the evidence for proposals for a new expedition in 1149–50 to efface the failures of 1148, and Martin Hoch considers the effects of the 1148 fiasco at Damascus on the political and military balance in the east. Alan Murray has compiled a most useful bibliography. In sum, this is a fine collection in which the contributions are of a consistently high standard. One minor criticism: while we are given the folio number for the manuscript illumination used on the cover, we are not given its location or shelf-mark – it is in fact Paris, BN, MS Fr. 9084, a manuscript that has been dated to 1286.

CARDIFF UNIVERSITY PETER EDBURY

Crusade and conversion on the Baltic frontier 1150–1500. Edited by Alan V. Murray. Pp. xxv + 300 incl. 2 maps and 2 tables. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2001. £45. 0 7546 0325 3

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903625686

According to Kurt Villads Jensen, introducing this pioneering collection of studies in English, from 1147 to *c.* 1530, 'the Baltic wars can best be understood as crusades', even though, as many contributors show, they embraced wars for political and economic mastery between various competing warlords, Danish, German, Russian, Lithuanian, eager to exploit the region's resources in despite of and often in direct conflict with indigenous peoples. Post-Iron Curtain Baltic historiography, while free from most – but not all – ahistorical nationalist preoccupations, tends towards substituting for them models of a Baltic community with the crusades as exemplars (or perhaps metaphors) of contact with the wider world, in particular western Europe. Analogies with the post-Cold War attraction of the west or even the current debates over the European Union lurk not far beneath the surface of much that otherwise is new, scholarly and illuminating. 'Crusade and conversion', a conjunction not easily assumed in other theatres of crusading activity, is here regularly employed as if the two processes were synonyms, which they were not, even in the Baltic. Use of the term crusade and concomitant conversion may represent liberation from ideological or nationalist strait-jackets; the trouble is that it scarcely helps understanding of the past. The crusade model supplies a conceptual bog, threatening to engulf the otherwise vigilantly scholarly Axel Ehlers on the Teutonic Knights and Thomas Lindvist on crusade ideology in Sweden, yet often visited by other contributors. William Urban, however, writing on frontier theory, appears content to wallow in a conceptualising swamp of his own, taking as companions figments of his imagination he calls 'members of the historical guild'. None the less, there are some notable essays here, as well as a useful bibliography compiled by the editor. The core of the collection lies in a series of studies concentrating on Livonia and the northern and southern shores of the Gulf of Finland. Better maps would have been welcomed for some of the densely-packed descriptive accounts of Livonian politics. Some contrasting interpretations emerge. Where John H. Lind is keen to emphasise division and hostility between Roman and Orthodox Christians in Karelia, by contrast the more secular-minded Anti Selart (on Livonia and Russia), Evgeniya L. Nazarova (on Votia and Izhoria) and Rasa Mazeika (on King Mindaugas of Lithuania) stress complexity, contact and accommodation as well as competition. Tiina Kala supplies an overview, sketching broad areas for future research. Links with other regions provide the theme for Carsten Selch Jensen's account of the importance of German cities, especially Lübeck, in the commercial and political colonisation of the eastern Baltic and Torben K. Nielsen's thoughtful and suggestive account of the cosmopolitan Archbishop Anders Sunesen of Lund. Three interestingly nuanced pieces, among the most satisfying of the collection, discuss literature associated with the Teutonic Order. Alan Murray, Vera I. Matuzova and Mary Fischer show how careful study of literary texts can fill out the context of political and institutional history. This is a worthy volume that whets the appetite for more such dialogue between European scholars of east and west.

HERTFORD COLLEGE, C. J. TYERMAN
OXFORD

Religion et exclusion. XIIe–XVIIIe siècle. Edited by Gabriel Audisio. (Collection le temps de l'histoire.) Pp. 217. Aix-en-Provence: Publications de l'Université de Provence, 2001. Fr.150 (paper). 2 85399 491 0

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903635682

This collection of essays on the twin themes of religion and exclusion represents the fruit of a decade of 'summer universities' organised by Gabriel Audisio, aimed at bridging the gap in historical knowledge between professional scholars and the literate public at large. Addressing issues relating to the history of south-eastern France in general and the history of religious minorities in particular, the now-ceased annual conference series benefited from the participation of many outstanding French scholars who presented aspects of their then current research. This slim volume therefore contains a selection of these presentations with an overall structure that attempts to group its nineteen essays into five principal sections: Cathars (Doumerc, Amargier, Roquebert), Waldensians (Rubellin, Audisio), the inquisition (Bennassar, Dedieu), Protestants (Audisio, Magdelaine) and Jews (Coulet, Moulinas). Other texts dealing with theoretical concerns (Do historical minorities exist?: Témime) and phenomena such as witches (Muchembled), pilgrimages (Julia) and the pre-modern concept of time (Audisio) occupy their own categories 'on the margins'. Taken individually, each article gives a succinct overview of each author's research on a given theme most suitable for student reading (professionals will be dismayed at the lack of footnotes and a more detailed bibliography). Taken as a whole, however, the very nature of the sessions reproduced in this volume – drawn from different years and with varying estimations of audience familiarity with the subject at hand – compromises its coherence and its usefulness as a teaching text. Although some of the articles present clear, concise introductions to topics such as Cathar beliefs (Roquebert), Waldensian underground organisation (Audisio) and the basic functioning of the inquisition (Bennassar), others present more specific, detailed arguments. Among these are articles on the survival of Waldo-Protestant communities in Apulia (Audisio), the unique experience of Provençal Jews in the Middle Ages (Coulet) or the crusader origins of anti-Cathar aggression (Doumerc). While these texts represent some of the most original contributions found in this volume, and perhaps the most interesting ones for scholarly readers, the juxtaposition of registers and confused ordering of each set of essays detracts from the volume's readability. Nevertheless, brief syntheses of major works such as Muchembled's study of the juridical creation of a witch minority, Bennassar's analysis of Christian renegades to Islam, Julia's sketch of the demographics and contours of pilgrimage and Audisio's examination of the disappearance of the Waldensians will doubtless prove informative and suggestive to a wide audience.

Brown University, Rhode Island — Liam Brockey

The Knights Hospitaller. By Helen Nicholson. Pp. xii + 180 incl. 5 figs and 12 black-and-white plates + 9 colour plates. Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 2001. £25. 0 85115 845 5

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903645689

The Order of the Hospital is an institution of extraordinary longevity and flexibility. It has existed for more than nine centuries during which time it has

had bases in Palestine, Cyprus, Rhodes and Malta, as well as surviving the cataclysmic effects of the Reformation and the French Revolution. Originally a minor part of the monastery of Santa Maria Latina in Jerusalem, after the First Crusade it quickly developed into an independent organisation, recognised by the papacy in 1113. This enabled it to establish large hospitals, first in Jerusalem and Acre, then after 1310 in Rhodes, including the great courtyard building which can still be seen, completed in 1489. Even after the loss of Rhodes in 1522, the brothers began again in Malta, albeit reluctantly at first, where, after 1565 they built a new infirmary at Valletta. They were finally dislodged in 1798 by Napoleon, *en route* to his disaster at Aboukir Bay. This should have been enough to finish the order, but various manifestations continue to exist today, most evidently in the United Kingdom in the form of St John's Ambulance. From the 1130s at least, the Hospitallers also developed as a military organisation. Although this was initially a secondary role, it nevertheless ultimately ensured its survival, enabling it to conquer Rhodes, beat off the sieges of 1444 and 1480 and to reestablish itself in Malta, where it overcame another great attack in 1565. Helen Nicholson's book is a concise and reliable guide, which takes care to place these developments in the wider historical context. Perhaps inevitably, given the need to explain complex political change over many centuries, more emphasis is placed on military and political history than upon its charitable role, although it is in the latter field that there has been the most progress recently. The book is not intended for the specialist, but rather as an introduction, valuable for undergraduates, researchers in other fields, existing members of Hospitaller organisations, and visitors to Rhodes and Malta anxious to understand how the order has affected the history of these islands.

University of Reading Malcolm Barber

Twelfth-century English archidiaconal and vice-archidiaconal acta. Edited by B. R. Kemp. (Canterbury and York Society, 92.) Pp. lvi+263. Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 2001. £30. 0 907239 62 5; 0262 995X

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903655685

In about 1120, as the output of episcopal *acta* in England was just beginning to rise steeply, the bishops' principal assistants in diocesan administration, the archdeacons, began also to issue charters relating to their ecclesiastical duties, which, like episcopal *acta*, shed light on the working of the Church and on the development of ecclesiastical diplomatic. This volume succeeds in doing for English archdeacons of the twelfth century what the British Academy *English Episcopal Acta* series has over the past two decades been providing for English bishops: it identifies 286 archidiaconal *acta* (including one late discovery in an appendix) and twenty-one charters issued by vice-archdeacons, and supplies editions for all charters for which a text survives (the overwhelming majority). The *acta* are unevenly distributed across dioceses, with the huge diocese of Lincoln, probably unsurprisingly, supplying the lion's share, 148 of the total. Worst represented are Bath and Wells with only one *actum* and Chichester, Durham and Hereford with only two each. The chief determinants of the

distribution are probably the extent to which individual bishops were absent, or bishoprics vacant, and the size of the diocese. The overwhelming majority of the *acta* concern disputes over parish churches and their revenues, sometimes providing detailed information on the provision of services and the duties of laymen (no. 294), but there are occasional references to other aspects of archidiaconal duties, for example the excommunication of a runaway nun (no. 139), or a brave but misguided attempt to validate a forged Anglo-Saxon charter ('the first seal is of the illustrious king Edgar, the second of Archbishop Dunstan of Canterbury and the third is of Aelfhere duke of the Mercians': no. 259). The collection contains a useful range of references to archidiaconal synods and ruridecanal chapters and inquests. Several of the *acta* reflect the private concerns of archdeacons, for example charitable donations. The diplomatic, again unsurprisingly, follows closely the pattern laid down by episcopal charters, though at a slightly lower level, as the use of recycled parchment in no. 136 suggests. Archdeacon Nicholas of London perpetrated a pun: an incumbent called Robert Philosofus renounced a church 'melius philosofatus' (no. 202). This is a fine collection, ably edited and with plentiful and helpful notes to explain dating and identify individuals. I have only noticed two errors, LXCII for the volume number on p. i, and in no. 169 the rendering of Brityna, aunt (*amita*) of Archdeacon Walter of Oxford, as his girlfriend (*amica*): since Brityna had bequeathed 'hereditary' property to Walter she clearly must be a relative.

UNIVERSITY OF NOTTINGHAM JULIA BARROW

Glastonbury Abbey and the Arthurian tradition. Edited by James P. Carley. (Arthurian Studies, 44.) Pp. xii + 648. Woodbridge: D. S. Brewer, 2001. £75. 0 85991 572 7; 0261 9814

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903665681

In 1191 the monks of Glastonbury Abbey staged the remarkable 'discovery' in their cemetery, of the bones of King Arthur and his queen, Guinevere. Encouraged by Henry II (though not by his son Richard), described and probably witnessed by Gerald of Wales, it was the most spectacular attempt by Glastonbury to enhance its prestige and increase its revenues, but it was far from the only one. One of the valuable aspects of this book, a collection of essays and articles about medieval Glastonbury, is that it brings to prominence the continuing efforts of the abbey, from the twelfth to the sixteenth century, to raise its profile by propagating stories of dubious historicity, not only about its association with Arthur but also about Joseph of Arimathea, its purported founder. With English nationalism on the rise under Henry V, Joseph also became useful politically as 'proving' that Britain's apostolic conversion to Christianity had happened even earlier than that of rival European nations. Articles telling us such interesting facts have appeared earlier, in journals such as *Arthurian Literature*; indeed most of the items here have appeared before. They are not in any chronological order but arranged under six headings: the 'Background', 'Departure points', 'Arthur's death and burial at Glastonbury', 'Joseph of Arimathea', 'Romances and chronicles' and 'other texts'. This arrangement does not always make for a satisfying sequential read, and the book

works better as a resource to dip into. There is also, inevitably, a large amount of overlap between articles. The greatest number of items concern Arthur, and indeed, the number of small, out-of-the-way texts concerning him, Glastonbury, or both simultaneously, here all brought together, edited and (for the most part) translated, is the greatest argument for the volume. These texts include *De origine gigantum*, the Latin translation of *Des granz geanz* (helpfully printed in parallel), the *Vera historia de morte Arthuri*, the Glastonbury tablets (alas, untranslated), and Abbot Frome's letter to Henry v about the excavations at Glastonbury in 1419, which hints at the discovery of illustrious corpses. Anyone interested in the subject of the invention of documents and objects in order to aggrandise a locality or a whole nation will here find no shortage of reading matter. The volume should be prominently displayed in the abbey bookshop, though its size and price may deter the modern pilgrim from becoming better informed about Glastonbury's venerable history of deception.

Robinson College, Judith Weiss
Cambridge

Der Deutsche Orden einst und jetzt. Aufsätze zu seiner mehr als 800jährigen Geschichte. By Bernhard Demel (ed. Friedrich Vogel). (Europäische Hochschulschriften, 3. Geschichte und ihre Hilfswissenschaften, 848.) Pp. 387 incl. 13 plates. Frankfurt-am-Main: Peter Lang, 1999. DM 118 (£40). 3 631 34999 8; 0531 7320

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903675688

This collection of essays by Bernhard Demel represents the fruits of over thirty years of research at the Central Archive of the Teutonic Order in Vienna. Edited and presented by Friedrich Vogel, the essays provide a remarkably rich survey of the history of the order, from its earliest days to the modern age (with the main emphasis placed on the period running from the Reformation to the First World War). The work is divided into three thematic sections. The first section is devoted to the study of the order in the context of the Holy Roman empire of the German nation. An opening essay examines the origins of the Thuringian province and its history (or histories, as Demel suggests) during the age of confessional conflict. Chapter ii takes up the theme of ecumenism, with Demel proposing that the order was ahead of its time in its relatively tolerant approach to multiple confessions. This is followed by a history of origins and the centres of residency, along with a survey of the military functions of the order. The final contribution in this section examines the historical relations between the order and the dependent city of Gundelsheim. In the second section the focus turns toward relations with the papacy from the sixteenth to the early nineteenth century. Like all of the contributions in the volume, this essay is structured as a chronological narrative – it is a history of relations through the years – and it is crowded with facts, figures and names (indeed, attached to the contribution is an alphabetical listing of the order's agents active at Rome). The third and final section includes a single essay on the development of the order in the Czech Republic from the years 1918 to 1938. A list of Demel's publications concludes the volume.

This collection is remarkable for the wealth of information it offers and the sheer number of references at the bottom of the page. Most of the pages are dominated by footnotes, and rarely a thought or an observation is made without a range of texts in support. It is, as a consequence, a rather difficult book to read. But as a source of information and related literature, it is extremely valuable. No one knows this subject better than Bernhard Demel, and with *Der Deutsche Orden einst und jetzt* historians now have over three decades of thoughtful and dedicated research at their disposal.

The Queen's University, Belfast

C. Scott Dixon

Waldenses. Rejection of holy Church in medieval Europe. By Euan Cameron. Pp. xi + 336 incl. 10 plates and 6 maps. Oxford: Blackwell, 2000. £50 (cloth), £17.99 (paper). 0 631 5339 X; 0 631 224971

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903685684

This is a synthesis of Waldensian history up to the later sixteenth century. It has no rival. Gonnet and Molnar's survey was published in 1974 and much high-calibre research has come into print since. Events and themes emerge in subheadings within chapters, sometimes only a few pages long, aiding quick reference and reinforcing a central theme, that of the widespread and disparate nature of the movement. With G. G. Merlo, the author prefers to speak of Waldensianisms in the plural. Geography comes over especially well, aided by good, clear maps. Exposition keeps close to the sources: there is an array of illuminating translated excerpts. It is a *vade mecum*, distinguished by deft summary and acute observations, especially on intellectual issues, on Durand of Huesca's writing, the debate at Bergamo, inquisitor Gui's treatise, the assumptions behind inquisitorial procedures and the issues at stake when Protestant polemic took up the Waldensian cause (a noteworthy epilogue at pp. 285–303). Cameron is surely right to play down the role of Waldensians in alliance with Hussites in Molnar's 'first Reformation' and to emphasise the slow pace of the incorporation of Piedmontese Waldensianism into the new Calvinism (Vernou's 1555 letter is especially telling). He clarifies the remarkable episode in which Waldensian communities in the Dauphiné won a legal rehabilitation after suffering a crusade. But there are eccentricities. Cameron is overzealous in iconoclasm on the turning-point at the Synod of Chanforan: *barbes* still mattered and S. K. Treesh's positive suggestion would have been worthy of a footnote. He is not much at ease with the medieval Church: he sees the authoritarianism of attitudes to Scripture and preaching, but not the paternalism, attributes failures of preaching solely to sloth and does not see how much late medieval piety sprang from, and was influenced by the laity. He well understands Waldensian masters and intellectual problems, much less the attitudes of rank and file and he underestimates Scripture. Valdes as founder was inspired by the Sending of the Seventy: the two-tier structure of classic Waldensianism sprang from Christ's words rather than Cathar influence and it was the raw text of Scripture in the vernacular, especially for the newly literate stimulating an ethical passion, which drove peasant lads from farms to a life of wandering and danger as masters. Cameron rightly notes how Catholics

used Scripture too (pp. 300–1), but it was in a very different way. Waldensianism was the most resilient of all medieval heresies and despite a high achievement Cameron does not explain why.

EASTCOMBE, STROUD M. D. LAMBERT

Cities of ladies. Beguine communities in the medieval Low Countries, 1200–1565. By Walter Simons. (The Middle Ages Series.) Pp. xv + 335 incl. 6 figs and 4 maps. Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2001. £45.50 ($65). 0 8122 3604 1

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903695680

This important book is a mixture, both more and less than the title suggests. It is almost fifty years since the appearance of E. McDonnell's *The beguines and beghards in medieval culture: with special emphasis on the Belgian scene*, the last wide-ranging and detailed study of the beguines to appear in English. Even in other languages, during this half century, while there have been many studies of individual beguines or communities in a particular locality, there have been no major studies of the movement as a whole. Given its great importance – arguably the most interesting religious movement of women in the medieval west – the present study is especially welcome. The focus is the southern Low Countries but since this area was the heart of the beguine movement, the book is more than a local study. Throughout the author takes the wider European picture into account.

Much of the difficulty of writing about beguines is one of definition. They do not offer the historian the clear identity of a religious order and Simons wisely does not try to force them into this or other predetermined categories. The variety and flexibility of their lives and arrangements are brought out well and shown to be strengths. Some form of profession or vow was normally made, yet there was usually the possibility of moving to a religious order or returning to lay life. Simons distinguishes between smaller 'convents', which numbered anywhere between half-a-dozen and a hundred or so beguines, and what he calls 'courts', which could contain up to a thousand or more beguines, as in Mechelen, and constituted a veritable enclave – sometimes surrounded by moat and walls – within a city. Beguines were both in the world, principally the urban world, and withdrawn from it. The resulting religious, social and economic dimensions of their lives are drawn out and shown to be, rather, different facets of a single vocation. Imaginative arrangements were made to ensure that poor women could become beguines while the wealth and status of those richer were also respected and exploited.

Simons pursues with meticulous scholarship the almost three hundred beguinages that are known to have existed in the Low Countries. The extensive footnotes and bibliography guide the reader to both the original sources and the secondary literature. In addition, a valuable appendix lists the beguinages, the dates of their existence and the numbers of their members.

Although the closing date in the title is 1565, the period after 1300, when the movement incurred various semi-condemnations, especially that of the Council

of Vienne in 1311–12, is treated only cursorily and there is no proper discussion of later developments. Most of the drawings reproduced in the book, however, date from the sixteenth century or later; at a time when the beguinages were rebuilt in the grander and more institutional style that visitors to Belgium can still see today. Simons might have explained more carefully the connection, or lack of it, between these buildings and those that existed in the thirteenth century, the time upon which the book focuses. Discussion of mysticism – one of the most distinctive and attractive features of the movement – is largely shunned on the grounds that it has already been treated at length by Bernard McGinn and others (p. 150 n. 10).

Much of the evidence is provided by eleven *Lives* of beguines. All of them were written by clerics and as a result the women are filtered, in varying degrees, into the conventions of male and clerical hagiography. Simons is sensitive to this problem and does his best to consider the beguines in their own terms, though inevitably they remain somewhat elusive as personalities. Various vignettes enliven the story: the 'banker' beguines of Ypres (p. 94); the poetry and dance of beguines (p. 131); Odila of Liège, who reportedly wanted so much to escape marriage and become a beguine that she told her husband, when asked whether she loved him, that she would willingly slit his throat if she could (p. 69).

This fine work reveals medieval religion as a web of overlapping interests: overlaps between beguines, religious orders and lay piety; men, especially friars, who supported and appreciated this movement of women; concerns that were common to both beguines and 'heretics'. Simons has thus both provided a detailed study of the movement in the Low Countries and placed it in its wider religious, social and economic context.

Campion Hall, Norman Tanner
Oxford

Creation as emanation. The origin of diversity in Albert the Great's On the causes and the procession of the universe. By Thérèse Bonin. (Publications in Medieval Studies, 29.) Pp. viii + 179. Notre Dame, In: University of Notre Dame Press, 2001. $45. 0 268 02351 4

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903705685

This relatively short, but amply footnoted, work is written in the light of an exhaustive bibliography, and with a meticulous care in establishing the best provisional text of Albert's commentary on the *Liber de causis*, which he accepted as being by Aristotle. As the normal neo-Platonic conception of emanation was of *exitus–reditus*, it would have been desirable to make clear that Albert thought of *exitus* alone (pp. 2, 12–13, 21), which deposits virtually the whole content within Ibn Sina's problematic of 'ex uno, unum' (p. 31). Albert had always seen beyond this restraint: 'universum' is 'unum versum in omnia' (Metaph. [Geyer] 284b). The purity of Albert's light-metaphysic is not unmentioned (for example p. 16), but not used as the unifying spiritual principle. In the light of many texts like 'universale unum numero et essentia est in anima et in seipso et in singulari' (De Praedicab. [Borgnet] 34b; cf., for example, Metaph. 157b–8a), it is a mistake to divide, in their essential reality, the universalia praehabens rem/ante res (as

latissimae universalitatis) from the form as light in the individual thing (pp. 43, 44, 125); these are the ultimate ground of the human logic of predicables. The postulation of such an intellectual ordering deriving from the divine light is essential. To understand Albert, one must rise to such a speculative vision. The descriptive writing, in which the writer rarely escapes from singularities, keeps her from attaining Albert's own intellectuality and the intellectual ordering, within the divine light, which he had discerned.

BLACKFRIARS, CAMBRIDGE

EDWARD BOOTH

Chichester 1215–1253. Edited by Philippa Hoskin. (English Episcopal Acta, 22.) Pp. lxxxi + 160 + 8 plates. Oxford: Oxford University Press (for the British Academy), 2001. £25. 0 19 726231 7

Chichester 1254–1305. Edited by Philippa Hoskin. (English Episcopal Acta, 23.) Pp. xxiv + 161–374. Oxford: Oxford University Press (for the British Academy), 2001. £25. 0 19 726232 5

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903215694

That there was little necessary relationship between wealth of see and quality of bishop is suggested by the thirteenth-century history of the see of Chichester. One of the poorest of the English dioceses, Chichester was ruled between 1215 and 1305 by seven bishops, of whom six were graduates, one, Richard Poore, a Paris master, pupil of Langton and future bishop of Salisbury, another, Richard Wich, an Oxford doctor of canon law and future saint, and a third, Stephen Bersted, an Oxford doctor of theology and steadfast Montfortian. The only non-graduate, Ralph Neville, held the chancellorship in the early years of Henry III's majority. Disappointingly if predictably, the calibre of these men is better attested in external sources than in their *acta*, though Neville's show that even an absentee curialist might also be a conscientious diocesan administrator, and Wich's final *actum*, his will, reflects his evangelising interest in the friars. But for the most part we see here bishops acting episcopally: appropriating churches, establishing vicarages, instituting clergy, confirming pensions to religious houses, appealing to the king for aid against the long-term excommunicate. Over nearly a century the character of the *acta* changes a little, as appropriations decline and significations of excommunication rise. High politics rarely intrude, though the excommunication of the prior of Lewes in 1255 for refusing to pay the crusading tenth raised for Sicily hints at local opposition to Henry's most notorious piece of folly. Some of the most engrossing texts are those less closely related to episcopal routine. Bishop Climping's lengthy ordinance concerning tithes from the parish of Findon, for example, provides enough topographical detail to allow the reconstruction of fields, strips and patterns of land-holding; Bishop Wich's order to his parish clergy to list and return all houses and families in their parishes in order to detect those neglecting the Whitsun processions points to something like a census; Bishop Bersted's grant of freehold to the incoming tenants of the new *villa* of Wardour is important for the history of settlement. The editor, an old *acta* hand, has done her work well, providing a full introduction which includes biographies of the bishops, surveys of their staffs and households, and perceptive

comments on the diplomatic of the texts, noting, *inter alia*, that Chichester's poverty may have made it difficult to attract trained and expert clerks for the episcopal chancery. The introduction is complemented by itineraries for the bishops and by additions to the published *acta* and to the Chichester Fasti. The technical standard of the editing is high and the subject index is a model of its kind. Taken in conjunction with the chroniclers' interest in some of these bishops, with the *vita* surviving for Richard Wich, and with Powicke and Cheney's edition of the several sets of Chichester statutes, Philippa Hoskin's edition ensures that we are now as familiar with this diocese, at the time of its greatest distinction, as we are ever likely to be.

Exeter College, J. R. Maddicott
Oxford

The life and works of Richard Fishacre, OP. Prolegomena to the edition of his commentary on the Sentences. By James R. Long and Maura O'Carroll. (Bayerische Akademie der Wissenschaften. Veröffentlungen der Kommission für die Herausgabe ungedruckter Texte aus der mittelalterlichen Geisteswelt, 21.) Pp. 235 incl. 31 ills. Munich: Bayerische Akademie der Wissenschaften, 1999. 3 7696 9021 4

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903225690

The still-unedited *Sentence* commentary of Richard Fishacre (*c.*1200–48) is notable for various reasons. Dating from the years between 1241 and 1245, it was the first such work written in Oxford, and betrays this origin in its use of the methods and conclusions of natural science. Fishacre himself was a Dominican, and his theological interests persistently include the practical and pastoral as well as the more theoretical and speculative aspects that typify scholastic theology. Whether or not this practical interest was the result of 'window-dressing' – perhaps an attempt to circumvent the criticisms of the bishop of Lincoln and former chancellor of Oxford University, Robert Grosseteste, whose possibly long-standing disapproval of Oxford theology resulted in *c.*1246 in a formal reprimand of the Oxford theologians' neglect of Scripture in favour of more speculative questions – the result, according to Long and O'Carroll, is impressive: 'an integrative work of theology that is rare, if not unique, in the genre of *Sentence* commentaries' (p. 45). Fishacre influenced Albert the Great, among others; according to a marginal note in a Toulouse manuscript of Bernard Gui's *De quattuor in quibus*, Thomas Aquinas himself wished to possess a copy of Fishacre's commentary. Perhaps, given the remarkable practical concerns of the *Secunda secundae*, his wish was fulfilled; further research will doubtless determine the matter. Long and O'Carroll have organised a team of editors to produce a critical text of all four books. The volume under review includes chapters on the life and work of Fishacre, as thorough as the scant sources allow; a chapter on the distinctive characteristics of Fishacre's *Sentence* commentary; a conspectus of the proposed edition; and a thorough description of the sixteen manuscripts identified as containing all or part of the commentary.

Oriel College, Richard Cross
Oxford

Il conclave. Storia di una istituzione. By Alberto Melloni. (Saggi, 543.) Pp. 212. Bologna: il Mulino, 2001. L. 26,000 (paper). 88 15 08159 3

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903235697

The author says that this book is not intended for specialists, but specialists will profit from an exposition which is clear-headed and wise. Adrian II (867) was the last pope elected by everyone Roman including women. Next, get rid of local violence – bring in the emperor – then get rid of emperors – make all electors local (two-thirds of votes needed from 1179) – then lock them up so that no one could get at them. To prevent trouble it was desirable that cardinals be not too many; Sixtus V in 1586 limited them to seventy. From the time when Spain dominated Italy cardinals were forced to accept the veto from Catholic states, or risk a powerless pope. Vetos must pass into the conclave breaking the barriers. There were other reasons for passing. In 1775, the Jesuit crisis, cardinals heard that a prophetess predicted the pope's death and sent to her to find out whether she disclosed the name of his successor. Half the book is on the conclaves of the twentieth century; the doubling of the number of electors, with consequences still unpredictable for the system, like the impossibility of maintaining secrecy. With the chance that a two-thirds majority might never be achieved, after a number of failures there must be election by bare majority; ageing males will mean that a pope will survive when the mind has gone – and could a pope who resigned, being a cardinal, vote in the choice of his successor? The changes produce little oddities – cardinals swear that whichever of us is elected … yet the choice is not confined to cardinals.

CAMBRIDGE OWEN CHADWICK

The Bolton Priory compotus *1286–1325 together with a priory account roll for 1377–1378*. Edited by Ian Kershaw and David M. Smith (with T. N. Cooper). (Record Series for the years 1999 and 2000, 154.) Pp. x+636 incl. 2 maps. Woodbridge: Boydell Press (for the Yorkshire Archaeological Society), 2000. £50. 0 902122 93 2

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903245693

This edition is a major aid to the work of medieval historians. The account book of Bolton Priory deals with the financial and material affairs of the monastery in the period 1286 to 1325 with remarkable completeness and a high level of detail. The editors have added a recently discovered late fourteenth-century account roll. Professor Kershaw wrote a DPhil. thesis in the 1960s on the priory estate, based mainly on the account book, and the work appeared as a useful monograph in 1973. He was then distracted to pursue a career in modern German history, in which he has demonstrated the advantages of a training as a medievalist. He returned to edit the account book, in which he was helped by a research assistant and by Dr Smith, and this volume is the result. The text will be of enduring value, particularly for historians of the medieval economy and of monasticism, but many other branches of history will find material here. The introduction is quite brief, but sufficient in view of the 1973 monograph. There is a very full index, which also serves as a word-list on occasion, which gives entries for many subject

headings, and includes the Latin phrases at the head of sections of the accounts. This reviewer tested the edition and its apparatus by using it to gather material on a current research interest, the goat. The index proved to be very comprehensive and helpful, and the text was clearly arranged and inspired confidence in its accuracy.

Ecclesiastical historians will appreciate the information contained in this text on the administration and domestic life of the monastery, as well as the insights into estate management. There is also a good deal of evidence for the priory's parish churches, not just their tithe income but also their expenditure, for example on buildings.

UNIVERSITY OF LEICESTER CHRISTOPHER DYER

Monastic spaces and their meanings. Thirteenth-century English Cistercian monasteries. By Megan Cassidy-Welch. (Medieval Church Studies, I.) Pp. xiv + 293 incl. 49 figs. Turnhout: Brepols. 2001. €50. 2 503 51089 2

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S002204690325569X

This handsome book, with its numerous plans and photographs (those of sites all taken by the author), is based upon a history thesis presented at the University of Melbourne in 1994. It has an ambitious aim, though a narrower one than its title suggests: to explore the multiple meanings of some of the spaces within eight Cistercian monasteries in Yorkshire during the thirteenth century. Of those eight Fountains is mentioned most often while Meaux, Roche and Sawley occur infrequently. After an interesting introduction, about not only its sources, both archaeological and written (the second including theoretical works on the nature of space), there follow eight chapters on the monastic precinct, cloister, church, chapter house, infirmary, the lay brothers' quarters, breaking out of monastic space by apostasy, and places where death occurred and was remembered. In each case, the author begins with actual sites, and moves on to written sources, some produced within these houses during the period, like the works of Stephen of Sawley or Matthew of Rievaulx, and others from other times and places, like the Cistercian customary (in the narrow sense), the *Ecclesiastica officia* or the *Dialogus miraculorum* of Caesarius of Heisterbach. It is the combination of these two broad categories of material which give this book its originality and force. Every reader will profit from it, and when visiting a particular site, or thinking about a type of space, will do so in a better informed way. Part of the book's effectiveness comes from its argument being well-structured, and clearly written, except occasionally when concepts derived from Foucault and others push the conclusions further than the evidence, at least to this reader, seem to merit. There are, however, some disturbing slips. Space permits only two examples: one about a structure, the other a text. At Byland the lay brothers' lane 'replaced the traditional cloister walk', but the plan shows clearly that the western walk survived, though lay brothers may not have used it (pp. 52, 55). When explaining the way that monks recuperating from being bled were forbidden prostration or a low bow during the Office with some exceptions, 'the benediction, and reading of the Gospel' are included (p. 148). Consultation of the edition of *Ecclesiastica*

officia by Choisselet and Vernet (1989, p. 256) reveals that benediction is a mistranslation for the *Benedictus*, i.e. the Song of Zacharias (Luke i. 68–79), and some other problems. The book therefore should be read with care. But I certainly look forward to the author undertaking more of this kind of interweaving, in which, perhaps, she will consider relating buildings to the relative sizes of the communities and their economic resources, and trying to show the degree to which Cistercian behaviour differed from that of other monks.

UNIVERSITY OF EXETER CHRISTOPHER HOLDSWORTH

Die Briefsammlung des Berard von Neapel. Überlieferung–Regesten. By Elmar Fleuchaus (Monumenta Germaniae Historica. Hilfsmittel, 17.) Pp. xlii + 802. Munich: Monumenta Germaniae Historica, 1998. DM 160. 3 88612 117 8; 0343 1266

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903265696

Berard of Naples held the office of notary in the papal chancery from 1261–2 until his death in 1292–3. Like several other prominent curialists of the thirteenth century, he is remembered today chiefly for his letter collection. The collection consists mainly of papal documents, many of which Berard had himself drafted in his capacity as papal notary. It has frequently served as a quarry for historians interested in the papacy and its diplomatic relations in the second half of the thirteenth century, but it has much more rarely been studied in its own right. The present book, which derives from a doctoral dissertation supervised by Peter Herde, does more than supersede Ferdinand Kaltenbrunner's pioneering study of the collection (1886); it places our understanding of it on a new footing. The long introduction gives a detailed account of Berard's life and connections, an analysis of the different versions of the collection and a reconstruction of its complex textual history. Descriptions of the extant manuscripts follow. The main body of the work consists of a calendar of the 840 papal and other documents that occur in the collection. The documents concern the French crown, the Angevin rulers of Italy, the crusades, the Byzantine empire and many other aspects of mediterranean politics, as well as more routine ecclesiastical matters. About 35 per cent of the papal letters appear in the papal registers, and the majority of documents in the collection have already been printed. However, even for these documents the calendar is of value because of the fullness of the bibliographical references and the numerous corrections to earlier publications. Among the apparently unpublished documents one finds a letter of Martin IV to Cardinal Jean Cholet concerning the indulgence for Philip III's crusade against Aragon (no. 416), a letter of the same pope concerning a marriage dispensation for the dauphin John of Vienne (no. 461), several letters of Nicholas IV concerning the Portuguese Church, Jewish converts and other topics (nos 758ff.), and a series of letters in Berard's own name (nos 815–40). Elmar Fleuchaus's painstaking, accurate and impressively learned work will be widely welcomed.

CORPUS CHRISTI COLLEGE, CAMBRIDGE P. N. R. ZUTSHI

The Hereford map. A transcription and translation of the legends with commentary. By Scott D. Westrem. (Terrarum Orbis. History of the Representation of Space in Text and Image.) Pp. lxxxv + 476 incl. 2 black-and-white and 24 colour plates + 1 loose-leaf folded colour plate. Turnhout: Brepols, 2001. €55. 2 503 51056 6

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903275692

An excellent study of the Hereford map that ably complements the work of Paul Harvey. Produced around 1300, the map is a sophisticated textual and pictorial representation of the world, combining nearly 1,100 inscriptions, most of them in Latin, taken from various classical and medieval texts with nearly as many painted scenes and painted symbolic decorations. The principal aim of this book, and one that is successfully fulfilled, is to give scholars access to the map's legends in the original language in reliable and useable transcriptions, and to enable the general public to read the map in an English translation. Jerusalem is at the centre of the inhabited landmass and the Garden of Eden is at the top of the map. The Holy Land is allocated one quarter the space allocated to Europe. The sources are carefully discussed, and Westrem shows that while the map portrays the world from a medieval Latin Christian point of view, it is by no means a giant illustrated Bible story.

University of Exeter Jeremy Black

Maps of medieval thought. The Hereford paradigm. By Naomi Reed Kline. Pp. xiii + 261 incl. 92 figs + colour frontispiece. Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 2001. £40. 0 85115 602 9

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903285699

This is a beautifully produced book, full of material and, thanks to the generosity of an American foundation, with a number and quality of illustrations rarely found these days. The coverage of illustrated manuscripts is very impressive indeed, and the author deserves high praise for it. The footnotes are placed, delightfully, at the foot of the page.

The subtitle of the book is 'the Hereford paradigm' and the famous late thirteenth-century *mappa mundi* from Hereford Cathedral forms its centrepiece and directs the enquiry. Kline is an art historian, and wishes to discover how this map and other similar artefacts 'functioned as objects of art in their own time'. Thus she sets herself to reconstruct the visual and conceptual world within which the map would have been viewed. In pt I she discusses the prevalence of the imagery of the circle, in pt II the frame and function of the *mappa mundi* itself, in pt III the appeal of its internal imagery, and in the concluding pt IV, the relationship of the Hereford map to larger enterprises and to other well-known world maps.

Unhappily, the excellence of production and illustration is not matched by the text. It is difficult, indeed, to decide upon the audience the latter envisages. The specialist in medieval history and geography will be irked to be told, once again, that the world was generally understood, in the Middle Ages, to be a sphere, apart from those who 'probably visualised the world as a flat circle' (p. 30 – who were these?), and that the *rota* was an important instructional tool. He or she will

be disappointed that controversial matters (such, for example, as the function of the exterior scenes, or the exact date of the map) are glossed over or given a single solution, and that historical reference is overwhelmingly to secondary sources. Some interesting points are made about the imprint upon the map of the medieval *Bestiary*, of the *Legend of Alexander* and of ways of moving through a church. The author has helpful diagrams of the map's inscriptions. The detailed sourcework necessary to a rewarding discussion however is, though begun, not pressed firmly home (for example, Table 1 at p. 148 is a singularly unrefined list of possible, and quite impossible, sources). Some flaws could easily have been eliminated; an 'obit' is not an obituary and Honorius did not write the *De philosophia mundi*. Nor is he now to be described as 'of Autun'. There are not three, but four recensions of the *Historia de preliis*. The *Cosmographia* of Aethicus was not written in the mid-seventh century. Sadly, I could go on. Also, there are curious dislocations of thought; the rider on the map, for example, is described at one point (p. 61) as a huntsman, at another, as a knight (p. 181). The bibliography, though extensive, is not meticulous (it is perhaps unfair to mark the errors of reference to my own works first, but they point the way also to other errors). An academic audience will, in short, find this work inadequate, whilst the general or undergraduate reader will be discouraged by the mighty (and sometimes supererogatory) footnoting and the occasional opacity of the prose ('The circular realm had a tradition of meanings to which the circle of the world map could be included or deconstructed', p. 48). It is the old story: a longer period of gestation might have produced a better book.

York Valerie I. J. Flint

Death, art, and memory in medieval England. The Cobham family and their monuments, 1300–1500. By Nigel Saul. Pp. xv + 287 incl. 42 ills, 4 genealogies, 2 maps and 1 diagram. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001. £29.99. 0 19 820746 8

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903295695

The brasses to the Cobham family carpeting the chancel floor of its eponymous collegiate foundation have long been familiar to aficionados of this genre of monumental commemoration. As Saul reminds us, sepulchral monuments, like all forms of visual representation, do not exist in a vacuum. The author combines the skills of a leading medieval historian and those of a specialist in medieval brasses to telling effect. In place of the customary focus on individual monuments or single locations and issues of workshop attribution and style (although fresh light is shed on the workings of patronage of brass engravers), this study offers a welcome broadening of the agenda for the study of funerary art. Close scrutiny of the brasses themselves (especially the epitaphs) and of the socio-political contexts in which they were created exposes the commemorative strategies of key members of the Cobham clan – above all John, third Lord Cobham (d. 1408). The investigation extends beyond the senior line at Cobham to the collateral branches, notably the Sterborough Cobhams of Lingfield in Surrey. The iconography of the brasses reveals that the family's commemorative discourse of death left room for different emphases in self-imaging. Whilst at Cobham dynasticism and lineage are the prime concerns, status and rank are paramount

at Lingfield. Paradoxically, the very splendour and self-assurance of their brasses exposes the uncertainties and anxieties of the individuals who lay beneath them Through the Cobhams we know more about their monuments and through their monuments we know more about the Cobhams. An important book on an important group of brasses.

University of York Richard Marks

Konziliare oder päpstliche Ordensreform. Benedikt XII, und die Reformdiskussion im frühen 14. Jahrhundert. By Jan Ballweg. (Spätmittelater und Reformation. Neùe Reihe, 17.) Pp. xiii + 402. Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr, 2001. DM 178. 3 16 147413 9; 0937 5740

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S002204690330569X

Begun as a dissertation presented in the University of Heidelberg in 1996/7, this book still bears some marks of that origin. It tries to place Benedict XII's reforms of religious orders against the background of his own career and the work of the Council of Vienne, and also in the light of the stormy papal career of John XXII. The work begins with a discussion of Benedict's reputation, particularly the judgement of contemporaries. This is not a full biography of the pope but only highlights aspects important for the theme of reform. The author outlines Benedict's pre-papal career, though little that is very detailed can be known, emphasising his theological studies (in contrast to John XXII's law). He points out, for instance, how difficult it is to know what it means to say that Fournier was an 'austere Cistercian', asking how far that is merely a stereotypical label. His conclusion is that it tells one little about the man and his motives. As background he also discusses the attempt by the Council of Vienne to reform the religious orders, pointing out how the Templar case represented the agenda of the king of France that the struggle of the French bishops against exempt orders was as much against the papacy as for a reform of orders. The various positions taken by writers defending and attacking the current practice of exemptions are outlined. Fournier's career as bishop and inquisitor is next discussed; he was often a peacemaker. There remain few examples of works by him but such as exist are examined. He emerges as a moderate, not favouring excessive asceticism, nor emphasising withdrawal from the world, but supporting work in the world in the service of Christ and the Church. In so far as this was 'Cistercian' it was very this-worldly, practical Cistercianism. The book then considers John XXII and his various quarrels, both over the vision of God and poverty, with Fournier's career in John's curia, where he was very important. It seems clear that Fournier did not really agree with John's actions; Ballweg argues that Fournier must have been elected as an antidote to John, and already known as such. Finally the book discusses the reform of the orders attempted by Benedict, surveying the whole host of rulings, aimed at different orders. The writer tries to see whether the pope had some overarching aims (such as to assert papal power) and to what extent he respected the particular ethos of each order. The conclusion is that he was a genuine reformer, in the conservative sense of accepting the given institutions and attempting to improve them but that his reforms were all institutional/jurisdictional rather than spiritual or ascetic. The book is interesting but not an

easy read and assumes a fairly detailed prior knowledge of what it discusses. The methodology results in many individual points for reflection rather than presenting a steadily argued case.

UNIVERSITY OF DURHAM MARGARET HARVEY

Nicolas de Clamanges. Spirituality, personal reform, and pastoral renewal on the eve of the reformations. By Christopher M. Bellitto. Pp. xiii + 146. Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 2001. $44.95. 0 8132 0996 X

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903315696

For several decades, discovering the stirrings of a 'reform in the fifteenth century' that anticipates the big Reformation in the sixteenth century has been a cottage industry among ecclesiastical historians. Thus, the capacity of readers to be astonished when confronted with another instance is considerably diminished. The subtitle of Christopher Bellitto's book trots out a series of keywords ('spirituality', 'personal', 'reform', 'pastoral', 'renewal', 'reformations' – hedge your bets) seemingly designed to hit as many matches as possible in contemporary religious studies or theology departments. Whether his slender book on a slender subject can bear such conceptual freight is another question.

To identify Nicolas de Clamanges on the religious landscape, Bellitto, like an enthusiastic late medieval Lullist, around his subject (or symptomatic effect) spins the wheels of broad historiographical concepts (his 'divine ideas') previously confected by authoritative English-speaking historians. Thus we learn that Nicolas at once typifies 'scholastic humanism' and its 'sense of enlargement' (R. W. Southern, pp. 39–40), 'spiritual humanism' and 'anthropocentric theology' (P. O. Kristeller and Charles Trinkhaus, p. 41), as well as the *devotio moderna* (*à la* John Van Engen and Steven Ozment), even though 'there is no explicit citation or quotation of any *devotio moderna* author in Clamanges' writings' (pp. 88–9). Most of all, Nicolas is yet another pinned and mounted specimen of the 'idea of reform' (in its fifteenth-century manifestation) as conceived by Gerhart Ladner (pp. 38–9 and passim). All in all, for 'Clamanges, healing the Church was an act of partnership between God and man based on the patristic and medieval traditions of the humanism of reform' (p. 44). His profile defined so sharply, Nicolas vanishes amidst a huge throng of medieval churchmen.

Nicolas de Clamanges (1363/4–1437), a friend of Pierre d'Ailly and Jean Gerson since his school days at the College of Navarre, lived in 'troubled times' for one having ecclesiastical ambitions. During his life Latin Christians were divided in their allegiance between two – and then three – popes; at one time the council and university of Paris withdrew their allegiance from the pope at Avignon while not bestowing it on another; general councils diminished the authority of the pope and were themselves disqualified. Moreover, as Nicolas vividly depicts, corruption ruled everywhere within the circles of power in the Church. Depressed by this state of affairs, Nicolas repeatedly took refuge in pastoral safe havens (provincial towns, monasteries), where he wrote treatises on the 'ruin and calamity' of the Church and bombarded friends who remained at the 'center of the action' with letters expressing his outrage and bromides for curing the malady.

Like the Senecan bee, from Nicolas's writings Bellitto sucks ideas that interest him and homogenises them in textual paraphrases arranged under topical headings. Seldom does he treat any writing in particular or the circumstances of its composition, nor does he stoop to close textual or rhetorical analysis. From time to time he remarks upon Nicolas's metaphors, practically all of which, amazingly, are derived from Scripture or classical literature. Bellitto is especially fond of spotting 'vegetative images'; it is unclear whether such images say more about Nicolas's mind or about the mind of his commentator.

Nicolas's ideas for reform, as presented by Bellitto, boil down to these: prelates and clerics should not be consumed with career-ambition and they should cease their corrupt practices (for example, simony, acquiring many benefices); rather, they should be concerned with the pastoral care of souls and should design clerical education with that aim; all should be concerned with developing their own spiritual lives and practising the virtues. The hallmark of Nicolas's 'idea of reform', according to Bellitto, is the notion of *reformatio personalis*, whence will flow the institutional reform of the Church. From Bellitto's paraphrases it is difficult to know whether this reiterated 'keyword' is Nicolas's or rather a 'category signifier' coined by his commentator. Whichever, on this point Bellitto differentiates Nicolas from Pierre d'Ailly and Gerson, who purportedly advocated a more institutional reform from the 'top down'. Bellitto's own presentation of themes, however, which itself proceeds from the 'top down', belies his distinction. Nor does he present any evidence of d'Ailly's and Gerson's different strategy. The limping discourse in this book ends with a whimper, not a bang. Nicolas's preference for a role behind the scenes may be viewed as cowardly, 'waffling' and 'cagey', or as a 'sincere attempt to contribute to Church reform'; 'both assessments', we are told, 'may be simultaneously accurate' (pp. 130–1). Finally, as far as the big game at the end of 'Reformations' road is concerned, Nicolas, who was a Catholic, may be seen as anticipating Trent more than he does Luther.

As the author himself points out, French and Italian scholars (notably, François Bérier, Dario Cecchetti, Ezio Ornato, Gilbert Ouy) have studied Nicolas de Clamanges as an early French humanist and have focused on his literary learning and rhetorical style. After reading Christopher Bellitto's book about Nicolas's 'ideas', one understands why they did.

University of Notre Dame Kent Emery

Life of Saint Augustine by John Capgrave. Edited from British Library Additional MS 36704 together with Jordanus of Saxony's Vita s. Augustini *from Bibliothèque de l'Arsenal, MS 251*. Edited by Cyril Lawrence Smetana. (Studies and Texts, 138.) Pp. x + 138. Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, 2001. $33.95. 0 88844 138 X; 0082 5328

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903325692

John Capgrave (1393–1464), an Austin friar who was provincial of his order in the 1450s, is best known to English historians as a *quondam* member of Duke Humphrey of Gloucester's literary circle and author of minor historical works in Latin and English, such as the *Abbreuiacion of chronicles* (heavily indebted to Walsingham's Chronicle). Although he also wrote a good deal of biblical

commentary, much of it now lost, Capgrave is becoming better known today as a vernacular hagiographer; his Middle English verse *Life* of Katherine of Alexandria has been discussed recently in books by Sheila Delany and Karen Winstead. More representative of his hagiographic output, however, is the prose *Life* of Augustine of Hippo, written before 1451, and newly edited by Cyril Smetana, which shares with Capgrave's *Lives* of St Gilbert of Sempringham and St Norbert, the Premonstratensian, a preoccupation with founders of religious orders that professed to follow the Augustinian rule. The leading modern student of the Capgrave corpus, P. J. Lucas, argues also that all four vernacular saints' *Lives* were intended primarily for female readers, and this is certainly true of the Augustine *Life*, commissioned by a 'noble creature, a gentill woman' (p. 15). As Smetana points out, the *Life* emphasises, even more than its Latin source, the exemplary piety of Augustine's mother, Monica, whose cult was promoted among Augustinians from the twelfth century. Smetana's edition (from the unique autograph manuscript, BL, MS Add. 36704) improves on the only previous edition by J. J. Munro (1911) in providing a detailed textual apparatus and commentary, a full glossary and an accompanying edition of the rare Latin source, Jordanus of Saxony's fourteenth-century *Vita S. Augustini*. (BHL 795). It thus facilitates an informed reading of not one but two documents illustrating the history of Augustine's cult, late medieval 'women's literature' and the ideological rivalry between the Augustinian friars and canons.

CONNECTICUT GORDON WHATLEY

God's House at Ewelme. Life, devotion and architecture in a fifteenth-century almshouse. By John A. A. Goodall. Pp. xx + 361 incl. 2 frontispieces and 89 plates + 8 colour plates. Aldershot: Ashgate 2001. £49.95. 0 7546 0047 5

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903335699

The fine almshouse, God's House, at Ewelme in Oxfordshire, is a remarkable survival from the late Middle Ages. It was founded by the earl and countess of Suffolk, William and Alice de la Pole, in 1437, and is still in existence as is the associated school. Most of the original buildings still survive, attached to a very fine church (with splendid tombs in a chantry chapel), and there is a wealth of documentary material in the Ewelme muniments (now in the Bodleian Library). Despite all of this, no large monograph had been written on the foundation until John Goodall's excellent book that has now been published. This started as a doctoral thesis at the Courtauld Institute, but it has been recast as a fine volume, with a whole series of appendices on the muniments. As both an art historian and a documentary historian John Goodall is very well qualified to look at all the material remains and to bring them together in a coherent way. He starts with a most useful opening chapter on chantry foundations in fifteenth-century England, before moving on to the de la Poles and their manor at Ewelme. Sadly almost all of the de la Pole's brick residence, Ewelme 'palace', has been destroyed, but the author attempts to reconstruct the large brick lodging range from a surviving fragment and early drawings of it. After a discussion of the history of God's House, there is a detailed architectural (and 'archaeological') analysis of all the buildings, starting with the parish church of

St Mary, much of which had been built before the almshouse. The author also looks in detail at another 'de la Pole' church, St Andrew, at Wingfield in Suffolk, where fifteenth-century alterations to the eastern arm relate closely to Ewelme. He then surveys the domestic buildings at Ewelme, built largely around a quadrangle, and once again his thorough knowledge of the archaeology of the buildings (timber-framing and early brickwork) is apparent. The splendid little two-storeyed brick school of the 1440s (still in use as a primary school) is then considered, before a careful study of the institution and its personnel are undertaken. Finally there are chapters on the devotions at Ewelme and on the almsmen's chapel of St John the Baptist in the church, which was at the core of the foundation. Once again there is a full discussion of the use of this beautiful space, and of its decoration and monuments, including the quite exceptional tomb of Alice de la Pole. A brief 'conclusion' deals with the later history of the almshouse.

WILTSHIRE TIM TATTON-BROWN

Crypto-Judaism and the Spanish inquisition. By Michael Alpert. Pp. x + 246 incl. 4 ills. Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2001. £45. 0 333 91791 X

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903345695

This is a study based on extensive reading, careful sifting of the evidence and a marked impartiality. Its theme is a well-worked one, the experiences of the residual Jewish population (*conversos*) of the Iberian peninsula who came into contact with the Spanish inquisition in the period between the fifteenth and the eighteenth centuries. The author's purpose appears to be to demonstrate the ways in which consciousness of Jewish faith and culture survived among a wide variety of c*onverso* families during that period. His presentation is basically a narrative of a number of case histories, concentrating however almost exclusively on people of Portuguese origin who were resident in Spain in the seventeenth century. He strings the histories together with an outline narrative that explains the main points of the history of the inquisition and its judicial procedure. It is a moving and inspiring story, and readers who have not picked up similar information in other studies will find much that is valuable and informative here. Apart from much rich and interesting detail in the case histories, there is nothing novel in the study, but the bibliography is excellent, selective and very much up to date.

Inquisition studies, as those who have ventured into them know very well, continue to be a minefield. There have been major controversies among Jewish historians, as the author explains in his opening chapter, and no less vigorous disagreement among scholars of other persuasions. Alpert tends on balance to lean towards the view that most of the people accused of heresy by the inquisitors were indeed heretics. His brief summary on this matter fails, I think, to do justice to the complexity of the theme. On the whole, he succeeds in avoiding major pitfalls, but his book has at least two significant problems that merit a brief comment. Historians of the inquisition have always been very haphazard about their statistics, and the author plunges in after them. He gives us a flood of figures that seem to be carefully chosen, but will undoubtedly mislead the reader. The

only firm statement that one can make about inquisition statistics is that they are either incomplete or unreliable, and when Alpert makes a brave attempt to reason his way through them he comes unstuck. It would be invidious to press the point too much, other than to say firmly that the reader should proceed with care.

The other point at issue is his conclusion. He argues that Jews created the economy of western Europe, and pioneered the commerce of the Mediterranean and the Atlantic (p. 54). Spain's subsequent economic problems arose, he concludes, because it rejected the Jews (p. 203). The best that one can say about this argument is that it accords with one form of Zionist thinking, but cannot be taken seriously as a contribution by a professional historian. On balance, and omitting these lapses, Alpert's book is a polished, interesting and illuminating survey of the experience of a handful of *conversos* in early modern Spain.

HIGHER COUNCIL FOR SCIENTIFIC RESEARCH, BARCELONA HENRY KAMEN

The Premonstratensian order in late medieval England. By Joseph A. Gribbin. (Studies in the History of Medieval Religion, 16.) Pp. xx + 284 incl. frontispiece, 9 plates, 5 tables and 4 maps. Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 2001. 0 85115 799 8; 0955 2480

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903355691

This is a sort of sequel to Howard Colvin's *White canons in England* (1951), concentrating on the period *c*. 1458–1500, chiefly through the exceptionally ample visitation records (1478–1500) of Richard Redman, abbot of Shap and English commissary-general of Prémontré, also bishop of St Asaph 1472–95, of Exeter 1495–1501 and of Ely 1501–4. They were published by Cardinal Gasquet (Camden Society, 3rd ser. vi, x, xii, 1904–6), but with many inaccuracies stigmatised by G. G. Coulton and confirmed by Colvin. Joseph Gribbin has gone back to the original manuscripts, although regettably he was not given access to the duke of Rutland's Belvoir Castle Add. MS 2, which Colvin only briefly examined. Gribbin reviews the relationship of the thirty English abbeys, three dependent priories and three nunneries of the order, organised in three circaries, with Prémontré, in the later centuries mostly via the commissary-general, with some inconclusive attempts at emancipation. He analyses in detail the itineraries and findings of the visitations in respect of numbers of canons, their discipline, buildings and economy, but exempts himself from investigating the estate records of Titchfield which have been discussed in a thesis, though he suggests they deserve further attention. Welcome is his devoting a chapter to evidence for the English Premonstratensians' liturgical practices (as he did for the English Carthusians in previously-published books) and another to 'learning, spirituality and *pastoralia*', in which he inspects the manuscripts and printed books identified as of their ownership and works composed by or for them, and lists canons (only some twenty-seven) recorded at the universities *c*. 1384–1532. He finishes with a chapter on Redman's biography, and appendices of his dozen itineraries, a chronology of them, maps of three, and on cases of fornication (over fifty) compared with Coulton's similar figures; he calculates in chapter iii (p. 68) that

these involved about 5 per cent of approximately 816 canons in the period, with nine abbeys suffering no such accusations. There is also an appendix countering P. J. Lucas's redating of John Capgrave's *Life of St Norbert*, arising from the occurrence of a contemporary namesake of the abbot to whom it was dedicated. The colour frontispiece and dust-jacket are enlargements of the presentation picture in the unique autograph copy of that work. There are nine black-and-white plates, five tables, four maps, an extensive bibliography of manuscript and printed sources and a competent index. The book is a thorough and useful addition to our knowledge of the state of religion near the end of the Middle Ages.

University of Durham A. I. Doyle

From sacred body to angelic soul. Understanding Mary in late medieval and early modern Europe. By Donna Spivey Ellington. Pp. xii + 284 incl. frontispiece. Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 2001. $59.95. 0 8132 1014 3

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903365698

This is an intelligent discussion of the Virgin Mary in Catholic preaching immediately before and after the Reformation ruptures in western Christianity. Franciscans, predictably, loom large, closely followed later by the Jesuits and François de Sales. A double three-fold scheme takes the themes of Mary's motherhood, her relationship to the Passion and her mediatory role in heaven, and contrasts earlier and later emphases. Medieval preachers paid more attention to the bodily aspect of Mary's role, revelling in her active and demonstrative part in the mysteries of Incarnation and Atonement; fired by the Marian cult's appropriation of the Song of Songs, they could even portray the young girl seducing and deceiving God into the Incarnation, 'with I do not know what caresses and promises', in Bernardino of Siena's racy phrase. Counter-Reformation preachers played down the physicality, meditated more on the spiritual dimension of the Mary–Jesus relationship and looked to Mary's passivity, silence and humility. Ellington sees this change amid a general growth in suspicion of the physical through the sixteenth century, a development possibly linked to the revolution in communication which the period witnessed: oral performance yielded priority to written texts, a trend begun in the twelfth century but massively accelerated by the invention of printing. Whereas conversation or preaching inevitably involves the body in gesture, reading a text privileges sight over the other bodily senses, and the act of apprehending a proposition becomes private and individual. Erasmus was the chief villain, bequeathing his spiritualist and interiorised vision of Christian faith to Catholic and Protestant alike. Catholics were also affected by Protestant criticism of Marian devotion, which made them reassess what could safely be said and still provide adequate food for devotion.

A tidily-organised text perhaps exaggerates the contrasts, and downplays continuing variety within the Counter-Reformation. Ellington does point out where preachers stuck to older emphases, particularly in the remarkably traditional Marian preaching of Lawrence of Brindisi, but that Italian exception also calls to mind the celebrated Counter-Reformation painting in Naples of Our

Lady trampling heresy in a manner far from humble, spiritual or passive, or the sensational naturalism of Caravaggio. It is possible that what Ellington is describing is primarily a phenomenon of those parts of Counter-Reformation Europe in direct dialogue with Protestantism, primarily the north. It was in these contexts that later preachers had to emphasise God's grace working in the Incarnation, or proclaim Mary as a more effective example of faith than the favourite Protestant archetype, Abraham. Significantly, François de Sales, bishop of Geneva and lifelong contestant with Calvinism, was among the most revisionist of preachers on Mary. By contrast, the southern Mediterranean could safely indulge itself in Marian extravagance, and the extrovert mission style of Italian Jesuits (see David Gentilcore, this JOURNAL xlv [1994], 269–95) was self-conscious in its difference from the more conciliatory approach of de Sales or 'évêques jansénisants'. It would be worth also considering whether the reflective, passive Mary of later French preaching stemmed as much from the pseudo-Dionysian spirituality of Cardinal de Bérulle's circle as from prissy Erasmianism. A small error deriving from Catholic spin-doctoring in Ellington's sermon material is her supposition that any significant magisterial Protestant expressed doubts about the perpetual virginity of Mary; the unanimous Protestant traditionalism on this matter deserves thorough investigation. Meanwhile Ellington has performed a good service for students of sixteenth-century devotion.

ST CROSS COLLEGE, OXFORD — DIARMAID MACCULLOCH

Guilds and the parish community in late medieval East Anglia, c. 1470–1550. By Ken Farnhill. Pp. ix + 239. Woodbridge: York Medieval Press, 2001. £50. 0 903153 05 0

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903375694

Although V. B. Redstone almost a century ago produced a listing and study of Suffolk gilds, it was only with the renewed debate on the nature of the English Reformation, which began in the early 1980s, that the confraternities of late medieval England came under close scrutiny as an index of the popularity of, and the extent of active lay involvement in, pre-Reformation religious practice at grassroots level. Over the past twenty years the nature of these associations has been minutely analysed, and some of the conclusions reached would surely have caused utter amazement to those who participated with enthusiasm, and without conscious distinction between spiritual and social motivation, in the innumerable confraternal bodies which flourished throughout Latin Christendom, sharing the common aspiration to gather together in the name of a patronal saint, or of the Trinity or Corpus Christi, within a church for religious and communal association.

As the latest contributor to this voluminous literature Dr Farnhill has exploited the abundant documents for the religious history of late medieval East Anglia to consider specific questions through a series of case studies. He has four main aims: to gauge the extent of participation in the confraternities, to explore the reasons for their popularity, to clarify the contribution of the gilds to the life of the parish and to understand the impact of the Henrician Reformation.

While not controverting the emphasis in recent scholarship on religious motivation, and most particularly on solidarity in commemoration of and intercession for the dead, Farnhill emphasises that membership was potentially a bargain, as the gilds spent far more on their members than they had received in fees, and he usefully points out that association with a confraternity might be the only means of acceptance into a local community for merchants and traders who were non-resident but had extensive commercial interests therein. Above all, he emphasises that it is not possible to establish any model: 'fraternity membership was, to a large extent, what each individual made of it', while, in regard to the relationship of gild to parish church, there was 'no single model of parochial organisation within the region'.

This book provides a valuable analysis of the records of the gilds of Bardwell, Cratfield, Swaffham and Wymondham, and sets them within the wider context of contemporary western Europe and of the historiographical debate on English confraternities. Not the least interesting observations concern the Counter-Reformation assault on gild feasts, and the emphasis on the maintenance of hierarchy within such associations, which are the Catholic counterpart to the mid-Tuder governmental view of the gilds as not only a religious, but also a social, threat. In taking such a wider view, this study provides a good example of the value of regional history in the wider, and indeed international, context.

University of East Anglia Christopher Harper-Bill

Choosing death. Suicide and Calvinism in early modern Geneva. By Jeffrey R. Watt. (Sixteenth Century Essays & Studies). Pp. xiii + 361. Kirksville, Mo: Truman State University Press, 2001. $45 (cloth), $30 (paper). 0 943549 81 7; 0 943549 87 6

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903385690

Jeffrey Watt's extremely dense and informative study begins with an excellent introduction to the historiography and medico-psychological history of suicide. He discusses early modern views as well as those of later centuries to the present day. He follows this introduction with a comprehensive discussion of the data on suicides, homicides and accidental deaths in Geneva (*c.* 1535–*c.* 1800). The analysis ranges from gender, age, method of death to seasonality. The volume then turns to consider early modern theories about suicide. Fascinatingly, Calvin and Daneau, both trained lawyers, were the only theologians to comment on suicide. More important, Watt presents the evolution in socio-judicial responses to suicide: from corpse desecration/estate confiscation to denial of burial honours/fines to almost no action at all except social embarrassment. He also discusses the evolving theoretical reactions to suicide among intellectuals some of whom argued for decriminalisation. However, he concludes that even those arguing for decriminalisation were less than enthusiastic about the act itself. His third chapter considers the relationship of social status, wealth/poverty, and political power to suicide and attempts to correlate these factors with a proclivity for self-murder. In the final two chapters, Watt considers the cultural context of suicide: marriage, love, family, religion, science, medicine and mentality. The

entire work is supported and strengthened by forty maps and tables which provide a thorough examination of the relationship between theoretical explanations for suicide and the actual events in Geneva. The two most important elements in the work are that the incidence of suicide in the last half of the eighteenth century greatly increased over that of the previous two centuries and that no single factor can explain a suicide. However, Watt surmises that the increasing socio-cultural importance of 'sentiment', 'romance' and 'companionate matrimony' may well account for the post-1750 increase. However, this emphasis on the place of human relationships (and, especially, human 'love') begs one important question: why is there no discussion of the role of sexuality especially in the deaths of young and/or seemingly unattached men. Thus (on pp. 128–9), Watt examines the suicide (in 1783) of Etienne Pestre, a nineteen-year-old apprentice grocer who, in suicide notes to his mother and sisters, asked, 'what character, what soul has nature given me? Should I call it sensitive or criminal?' Clearly, this need not be the cry of someone struggling with issues of sexuality. Just as clearly it might well be and yet the possibility is not considered. Nevertheless, this important and comprehensive work on suicide in the early modern period will be widely read and positively received by scholars and upper level students.

UNIVERSITY OF ABERDEEN WILLIAM G. NAPHY

The early Reformation on the continent. By Owen Chadwick. (Oxford History of the Christian Church.) Pp. vi+446. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001. £60. 0 19 826902

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903395697

Another volume appears towards the completion of the *Oxford History of the Christian Church*, one of two newly written by the editors themselves. It is now Owen Chadwick's singular achievement to have written two authoritative surveys of the Reformation, first his Pelican (now Penguin) classic of 1964, and second this absorbing and richly informative panorama, with a more restricted focus and with an entirely different principle of organisation. The bounds of Chadwick's early Reformation extend to the 1560s, enough time for the Peace of Augsburg to begin its six-decade stabilisation of the empire and for the French Reformation to begin its equivalent destabilisation of France; Chadwick is also generous in allusions to later events where they will serve to clarify or illuminate. Instead of the narrative of the 1964 work, here is a thematic treatment in eighteen sections, isolating such topics as book production, clerical marriage, the fate of the monasteries (with some interesting Protestant survivals in Germany), divorce, radical belief, toleration and finally unbelief. Ingeniously underlying or shadowing the arrangement there is indeed a narrative of events from Luther's revolt through to the arrival of Calvin and the fiasco of the Interim amid the Schmalkaldic Wars, but it would probably be safer for the novice reader first to gain the outlines of the story elsewhere – and where better than the *Penguin History of the Church*?

Germany is the focus of the work; although there is generous treatment of France and due consideration of Scandinavia, we do not hear much about the

lost Reformation of Spain and Italy which might have emerged in the 1530s and '40s from the enigmatic message of Juan de Valdés or from the well-meaning hesitancies of Cardinal Pole. Yet given the strategy adopted, there are ample compensations. For the last quarter century, Anglophone readers of this JOURNAL have been indebted to Professor Chadwick for alerting us to the contents of successive volumes of the great German enterprise in theology and church history, the *Theologische Realenzyklopädie*, and in this volume once more he opens the door on a century and a half of German historiography including monographs on regional history. Generous asides point to consequences of the early Reformation unfolding down to the Second World War, which destroyed so much of the physical fabric surviving from the era. The style has the author's usual tanginess, and can be demandingly allusive: not every reader will have enough German or cod-Greek to see how the Basle Reformer Johann Heusgen turned his surname via Hausschein into Oecolampadius (p. 51), or possess the wider knowledge to identify the giant-bishop of Durham (p. 224). Yet the rush of words can be exhilarating, as for instance at p. 72 where the reader is led into Holbein's pictorial version of the dance of death. There are some marvellous pen-portraits of individuals, many of them little-known except to specialists. Radicals are treated with sympathy, at least when they behave rationally.

The scope of the work reflects the constraints of a major publishing series in the artificial division of its subject. Chadwick is wonderfully wide-ranging in his survey, taking us from Moldavia to Iceland, from Navarre to Riga, but amid all this, the story of the early Reformation in England has been excluded except where it obstinately obtrudes itself – let alone the stirrings of early Reformation elsewhere in the Atlantic Isles. If the series had been planned now, perhaps this decision would not have been taken, and the reader could have been shown the essential unity of the English story with the rest of northern Europe. Likewise, I wonder whether the term 'the continent' to describe the mainland of Europe is used anywhere in the world outside Britain (indeed outside England, given the greater cosmopolitanism of Scotland and Ireland); American readers may require an explanation. However, these are carping criticisms, to which I will add one correction of the text, at p. 206: rather to spoil a minor point of Chadwick's, the English organ voluntary was classically played neither at the end nor the beginning of a Prayer Book service, but during it, generally before or after the reading of the lessons. But the triviality of the correction is intended as a tribute to a great monument of scholarship.

ST CROSS COLLEGE, DIARMAID MACCULLOCH
OXFORD

Ireland's holy wars. The struggle for a nation's soul, 1500–2000. By Marcus Tanner. Pp. x + 498 incl. 5 maps and 31 ills. New Haven–London: Yale University Press, 2001. £19.95. 0 300 09072 2

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903405691

Marcus Tanner, anxious to understand the animosities which he observed in late twentieth-century Derry and Drumcree, has investigated the beginnings and widening of confessional divisions. Not content with 'imperialism' or 'colonial-

ism' as explanations of what went wrong in Ireland's relations with England, he has reinstated religion. In the absence of any narrative of 500 complicated years, he has constructed his own. An experienced journalist, familiar with the Balkans, he is alive to parallels between conflicts there and in Ireland. From time to time, he likens events in Ireland to the Holocaust or to bloodshed in Rwanda and Bosnia. These comparisons can help: for example, to understand how in the 1640s beleaguered Protestants rapidly constructed a legend of massacre and – more generally – how mutual suspicions can mutate into violence.

This commendable eagerness to make the remote disputes comprehensible to modern readers yields many dividends. Personalities are evoked vividly. The ineffectual and unpopular Tudor archbishop of Dublin, George Browne, is set against 'the old grump', John Bale, briefly active as an ardently Protestant bishop in Ireland. Tanner identifies the temperament of the journalist in Bale, and sympathises with the civilised humanists of Elizabethan Dublin. Milo Magrath, warrior archbishop of Cashel, is simply a gangster galloping around his diocese; Cardinal O Fiaich, a recent archbishop of Armagh, conformed to the style of the warrior prelates of the Tudor era. John Redmond, cautious nationalist leader at the outbreak of the First World War, is expertly located in the 'toney, Catholic world of the ''civil'', walled towns'. Ian Paisley is traced to the covenanting moorlands of south-western Scotland.

Sometimes Tanner's straining for modern parallels produces some anachronism and misunderstanding. The early provosts of Trinity College, Dublin, are dismissed in their entirety as cranks. Hugh Boulter, the English primate under George II, becomes an angel of death, hovering around the sickbeds of his Irish-born brethren. This ignores both the archbishop's skill in strengthening his Church institutionally and his charity. Moreover, Tanner too readily accepts the views of Boulter's opponents who saw him, keen to import more bishops from England, as subjecting the Church of Ireland humiliatingly to that of England. Beyond the episcopal bench, the majority – probably 90 per cent – of the incumbents of the State Church had been born and educated in Ireland. This statistic, not mentioned by Tanner, might also have encouraged a more generous assessment of the role of Dublin University, which, after its early unflattering treatment, vanishes. By the later seventeenth century, it was firmly controlled by locals, was intellectually lively, and trained the bulk of Protestant ordinands for Ireland.

In this long account, the author's sympathy for the leaders of the separate denominations gives way to scarcely concealed contempt. The familiar failures of leadership and examples of extravagant demagoguery are paraded. Predictable fun is poked at some of the more colourful characters. Even so, the positive achievements of a figure like Archbishop McQuaid of Dublin, usually dismissed as a reactionary, are noted. But strangers appointed to northern sees, such as George Otto Simms, translated to Armagh from congenial Cork and Dublin in 1969 or the scholarly Hanson consecrated to Clogher in 1970, are not considered. Their courageous dissent from the prevalent attitudes of their flocks made for uneasy relationships.

Because the writing of Ireland's religious history has fragmented, both along denominational and methodological lines and into distinct periods, the need for a comprehensive account undoubtedly exists. For much of the book, Tanner

concentrates on the clergy, and their biographies. This approach allows him to exhibit his gallery of entertaining vignettes. The laity come into focus less often, at least until the later twentieth century. Then their sudden flight from the churches has to be explained. So far as the Church of Ireland is concerned, its seigneurial appeal made it vulnerable when the Protestant landlords were dispossessed and mostly departed. Less clear are the appeal of Protestantism to urban workers and its subsequent loss of support. Demography, as Tanner shows, worked first against the Church of Ireland and then against its Catholic counterpart. In general, though, he is little interested in lay religion. As a result, large-scale religious manifestations are seen as stage-managed rather than in any sense spontaneous. Impatient with clerical pretensions and failings, he picks over the numerous scandals, which have lost the Catholic Church respect, personnel and worshippers. He is astute in showing how a split between unbelieving towns and the faithful rural hinterlands has widened. Also, first Protestantism and now Catholicism have acquired very different characteristics north and south of the border, between the Republic and Northern Ireland. Relaxed and respected, the attenuated Church of Ireland has adjusted to the realities of an increasingly secular and prosperous Irish state. His reports on these developments are persuasive. Other of his asides – that the provincial towns of Free-State Ireland were listless and fly-blown and that the contemporary Church of Ireland is uninterested in its history – are not just mischievous but wrong.

A synthesis of this sort inevitably builds on the available materials. Tanner has doggedly pieced together a complicated and grim story from the scattered fragments. The result conspicuously lacks the originality of Raymond Gillespie's study of the laity after the Reformation or of Marianne Elliott's investigations into the lot of the Ulster Catholics. In the nature of his enterprise, the subject is war. Protracted periods of peace are passed over rapidly. Yet, at the end, Tanner allows that the discontinuities between the sixteenth- and twentieth-century strife may exceed the continuities. Much of the religious conviction of the participants in the recent 'Troubles' is newly invented, although couched in the vocabulary of the Reformation. The confessional alignments in these confrontations are real enough, but lamented and usually denounced by the clerics of the various cults. The frequency and intensity of inter-communal violence appals when Ireland is compared with England, Scotland and Wales. In comparison with clashes elsewhere caused by the volatile mixture of ethnicity and creed, the Irish episodes, despite their horror, startle less.

HERTFORD COLLEGE, T. C. BARNARD
OXFORD

Leone X e la geo-politica dello stato pontificio (1513–1521). By Maurizio Gattoni. (Collectanea Archivi Vaticani, 47.) Pp. 367. Vatican City: Archivio Segreto Vaticano, 2000. 88 85042 23 3

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903415698

This is an ambitious study in diplomatic history that seeks, not without success, to bring to the history of the papal state a kind of analysis that was thought proper for political history a century and more ago, but that was not at that time applied by Italian historians to a papal state whose existence they had since

Italian unity treated as anomalous. It is rather as though Gattoni had supplied material for a new and at that time inconceivable chapter for the *Storia delle signorie italiane dal 1313 al 1530 narrata da Carlo Cipolla*, published in 1881. Gattoni's book is the product of intensive archival research, principally in the Vatican Archives and Library, but also in the archives of Florence, Venice, Perugia and Siena. It is a thorough and well-organised deployment of a very large number of documents, that shows awareness of what is most important in the material. The documents are analysed or extracted by Gattoni partly in the footnotes, partly in appendices, a system that is not entirely satisfactory, as the author shows himself to be aware. He also tends to clog up the apparatus with biographical notes that are sometimes helpful, but that in many cases could have been dealt with by footnote references to articles already published in the *Dizionario biografico degli italiani*. Gattoni's work of synthesis is agile and intelligent, but his analysis encounters problems that were familiar to Cipolla and to many subsequent students of the period. By 1513 Italian matters were to a large extent decided by decisions made in France, Germany and Spain, and were influenced to a certain degree even by the policies of England. As a consequence, the papal state in its full 'geo-political' context can be fully understood only through some knowledge of huge archival deposits located outside Italy, that it would be unfair to expect Gattoni to have acquired, but whose absence must affect his judgements. It would be churlish to insist overmuch on references to secondary material in a book of this kind, but an Anglo-Saxon reader cannot but miss reference to Melissa Miriam Bullard's *Filippo Strozzi and the Medici: favor and finance in sixteenth-century Florence and Rome* (Cambridge 1980), which discusses many of the themes present in Gattoni's book.

WINCHESTER PETER PARTNER

Reich Christi und Obrigkeit. Eine Studie zum reformatorischen Denken und Handeln Martin Bucers. By Andreas Gäumann. (Zürcher Beiträge zur Reformationsgeschichte, 20.) Pp. 584. Bern: Peter Lang, 2001. Sw. Fr.109 (£46) (paper). 3 906766 75 6

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903425694

This study, which was the author's doctoral dissertation at the University of Neuchâtel, is the first-ever attempt at a comprehensive treatment of the relationship between the true Church (conceived of as the *regnum Christi*) and secular government in the thought and reforming career of Martin Bucer. The title of the book, and the fact that it has been published in a series devoted to Reformation history, led this reviewer to expect that here at last would be the long-desired and much-needed history of the genesis and development of Bucer's thought on the *cura religionis* of secular magistrates as that thought was expressed in particular works written in response to particular circumstances. Gäumann, however, specifically rejects such a historical approach based on 'the sequence of events and writings' in favour of a 'more theological' approach organised thematically (p. 35), with the result that this reviewer's expectation has been disappointed.

In the long 'Einführung in Bucers Vorstellung vom *regnum Christi*' (ch. iii), the only section of the book specifically devoted to Bucer's thought, the works that

are the author's sources are neither placed in their historical circumstances nor discussed in chronological order. Indeed, with few exceptions (for example, the *De regno Christi* of 1550), they are not even mentioned by name. The result is a careful and systematic elucidation of the idea of the *regnum Christi* in all its aspects, with some attention to the duty of secular magistrates toward that kingdom. But there is no history of the development of the ideas in question, and the deficit is not made up in the other chapters. It is a great pity, for example, that so important a work as the *Dialogi* of 1535 is mentioned briefly on p. 434, in connection with the debates over the *jus reformandi* in Augsburg that led Bucer to write it, but that its contents are nowhere summarised or analysed. Many other works of similar importance suffer the same fate. In this way, an enormous amount of highly interesting thought on a subject that Bucer frequently addressed is simply brushed aside. Moreover, the author makes only passing references to the possible influence on Bucer of scholastic and humanist thought on the religious duties of secular magistracy. Similarly, he makes only the most cursory efforts to compare Bucer's views on Church and State with those of Luther and Zwingli, and there is no effort at all to deal with the influence on one another of Bucer and Melanchthon in this respect. Although Gäumann might reasonably object that he is being criticised for not having written the book that he had no intention of writing, it does seem to this historian, addressing the readers of a historical journal, that the chance to make an important and needed contribution to the historical literature was missed here.

While Bucer's *Denken* thus fares somewhat unhappily in this book, his *Handeln* receives much better treatment. This is where the author's interest really lies, and by far the greater part of the book is devoted to it. In addition to a prolegomenal chapter that outlines the political and religious situation in Strassburg in 1523 and provides a chronological summary of Bucer's career as a reformer (1524–51), there are three thematic chapters on Bucer's efforts to establish and extend the *regnum Christi*. Two of these are devoted to Bucer's career in Strassburg. The first deals with his co-operation with the magistrates in the peaceful and orderly removal of images from the churches (1524–30) and the improvement of the schools (1525–45). The second is focused on his controversies with the magistrates over their slowness to abolish the mass or take decisive action against religious dissidents (1524–34), their adamant refusal to establish the system of moral discipline that he thought essential (1529–49) and their acceptance of the Augsburg Interim (1548–9). A third and final chapter summarises Bucer's efforts to spread the *regnum Christi* to other cities and principalities in Germany – Ulm (1531), Augsburg (1531–7), the archbishopric of Köln (1542–3), and Hessen (1538–42) – as well his efforts at Protestant unity (the Wittenberg Concord of 1536) and at national religious reunification (the religious colloquies of 1539–43). Though the rigorously thematic arrangement of the material causes a certain amount of chronological confusion, that is fairly easily sorted out. On the whole, these are useful and informative chapters in which, among other things, the author does a particularly good job of defending the integrity of Bucer's often misunderstood motives, especially with respect to his efforts to get the Catholic estates of Germany to agree to a 'minimal reformation' that he hoped would be a breakthrough to the establishment of the *regnum Christi* (i.e. the true, completely reformed Church) in the whole country.

Potential readers of the book should perhaps be warned that the author has not made things easy for them. For one thing, he pushes to an extreme the tendency of German-speaking scholars to quote from the sources in the original languages in the text itself rather than in the notes. He cites Bucer's always rather cumbersome Latin and sixteenth-century German frequently and often at great length, even though few of the passages in question convey anything that could not more easily and quickly have been conveyed by a translation or (better yet) a summary in the author's own eminently clear modern German. At the same time, much of the most interesting information and analysis that the author has to offer is relegated to the footnotes, leaving only a bland and not very informative summary in the text itself (see, for example, pp. 101–7). Nevertheless, to those who have the skill and the patience to cope with these difficulties, Gäumann's study can, despite all the reservations expressed above, be recommended as a worthy contribution to the scholarly literature on Martin Bucer's role in the Reformation.

University of Toronto James M. Estes

Calvinistische Staatstheorien. Historische Fallstudien zur Präsenz monarchomachischer Denkstrukturen im Mitteleuropa der frühen Neuzeit. By Stefan Bildheim. (Europäische Hochschulschriften. European University Studies. Series III. History and Allied Studies, 904.) Pp. 406. Frankfurt-am-Main: Peter Lang, 2001. £40 (paper). 3 631 37533 6; 0531 7320

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903435690

This book is a tribute to the author's impressively meticulous scholarship. A Munich University thesis, supervised by Eberhard Weis and accepted in 2000, it tries to track down ideas of monarchomachy within Calvinism in early modern Middle Europe and to show their political relevance.

The study begins with the presentation and evaluation of approaches to monarchomachy in the writings of Calvin, Hotman, Beza, Brutus and Althusius. Bildheim investigates these ideas carefully and describes their literary presence in contemporary journalism. Subsequently, he tries to explain the history of the political impact of the resistance theory in monarchomachy in the Holy Roman Empire, including the Netherlands, on the basis of territorial case studies. A discussion of the significance of Calvinist theories of monarchomachy for the development of German Reich constitutional law doctrine rounds off the study.

Bildheim convincingly shows that the theories of monarchomachy may be defined as being at once politically conservative and revolutionary. Whether they then fostered a politically conservative power or a revolutionary one depended mainly on the political constellation in the territories concerned at the times. 'But at any rate', Bildheim maintains, 'their anti-absolutist school of thought undoubtedly had the uncomfortably challenging and pioneering effect of rousing rebellions and partly also starting revolutionary processes' (p. 24). At the same time the political ambivalence of theories of monarchomachy acted as a stimulus through a longer period in the political history of ideas. In the early modern period they had a decisive influence on anti-absolutist and authoritarian

activism, as well as that of the Counter-Reformation. Bildheim convincingly shows that the degree of awareness of Calvinist resistance theories, the scale of their dissemination and their impact at the time should not be underestimated.

This noteworthy study is characterised by its mastery of the topic, as well as excellent use of secondary literature. However, it has one critical drawback: no thought was given to future readers when the thesis was published. Its format is, to put it mildly, far from reader-friendly. A total of 347 pages written in cumbersome, long-winded language and overloaded with numerous footnotes; a bibliography running to forty-six pages which has not been subdivided into primary and secondary sources, rendering it of little practical use; no index and extensive citation of secondary literature in the footnotes which the reader cannot be expected to absorb – these problems considerably restrict the practical value of the book. The thesis was in urgent need of revision from a linguistic point of view and of reduction in length before going into print. It is to be feared that these problems will put many potential readers off, causing the value of its content to be overlooked.

MONREAL, GERMANY — ANDREAS MÜHLING

Philip II. By Patrick Williams. (European History in Perspective.) Pp. xi + 302 incl. 2 maps and 4 tables. Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2001. £15.99 (paper). 0 333 63042 4; 0 333 63043 2

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903445697

In 1948 Américo Castro wrote an article entitled 'Why don't the Spaniards like Philip II?' How things had changed fifty years later when, to mark the quatercentenary of the king's death, Spanish scholars published some 20,000 pages about him – the multi-volume proceedings of twelve conferences, the catalogues of five major exhibitions, and dozens of monographs. Many Hispanists also published studies. There is thus much fresh material available to justify a new biography and Patrick Williams, who has been working for over thirty years on the reign of Philip III and has trained several young scholars in the field of early modern Spain, is well qualified to synthesise it. Unfortunately, however, much of the new material appeared just too late for him to use (he cites, for example, only three of the exhibition catalogues and the proceedings of only one conference). Nevertheless, his *Philip* is up-to-date and sound.

Williams organises his account in nine chapters, eight of them chronological. The first two deal with the king's apprenticeship: his preparation for power, his succession and his decision to make Castile the capital of the monarchy. Then come two structural chapters on 'The re-ordering of Spain' and 'The wealth of the Indies' and two more on the king's wars in the Mediterranean and the Netherlands between 1559 and 1579. Part III, 'The imprudent king', examines the conquest of Portugal and the decision to launch the Armada against England; the revolt of Aragon (1591) and the war with France; and the challenges to the king at home and abroad during his last year. Williams thus gives commendably even coverage to the whole reign (unlike, for example, the

most popular Spanish biography to appear in 1998 – Manuel Fernández Álvarez, *Felipe II y su tiempo* – which devotes relatively little space to the period after 1570). He also maintains a prudent detachment from his subject, blaming as well as praising (unlike that other popular biography of 1998 – Henry Kamen's *Philip of Spain* – whose subject can do no wrong). Indeed one of the most effective passages of this work comes when Williams assesses the king and his achievements in 1579, twenty years into his reign. He is also careful to 'cost' the king's various enterprises, including the successes: 2.5 million ducats to annex Portugal, 1580–3; 1.3 million more to restore order in Aragon, 1591–2.

Philip remains very much the king of Castile, however. Although Williams uses a wide range of Spanish manuscript and printed sources, buttressed by English publications, he ignores most Italian and French and all Dutch and German works. Inevitably therefore Spanish Italy and Spanish policy in continental Europe remain largely neglected, except for the growth of opposition in the Netherlands and Philip's relations with the popes – indeed the sections on Philip and the Church are among the strongest in the book. Even here, however, some quatercentenary publications modify his picture. For example, Williams correctly points (p. 74) to Philip's enthusiastic support for the decrees of the General Council of the Church at Trent, swiftly enacted by provincial councils throughout Spain, and states that the king sent to them 'observers', such as Don Francisco de Toledo, the future 'pacifier' of Peru. This, however, does not do justice to the king's initiative. Recent research has shown that he published the Tridentine decrees in Spain before receiving news of papal authorisation; that the king convened the councils under his own authority; and that his 'observers' in fact presided. Indeed, Philip's letter of convocation expressed his desire to attend the councils and preside himself (as his Visigothic predecessors had done) but, he decided, 'our personal attendance is not necessary, since we can achieve the same effect' by sending a special representative to convey his views. Through these commissioners – each of them laymen – Philip showered each synod with detailed comments. He changed what he did not like ('His Majesty desires that the rules of episcopal residence should be a little looser than those contained in the Tridentine decrees'). He forbade discussion of reforms that seemed to contradict the law of the land (such as Session XXV, *De Reformatione*, chapter 3, which 'seems to authorize ecclesiastical judges to proceed against laymen, confiscating their goods and sequestering their persons, which the laws of this kingdom do not allow and should not allow'). He also prohibited any attempt to seek clarification from Rome. In the graphic phrase of Don Francisco de Toledo, the king had 'translated the Council of Trent into Spanish' (A. Fernández Collado, 'Felipe II y su mentalidad reformadora en el concilio provincial toledano de 1565', *Hispania Sacra* [1998], 447–66). Nevertheless, this and other new material could easily be integrated in a further edition of this compact biography, which offers a balanced portrait of the man who is now – despite Américo Castro's doubts – Spain's favourite king.

OHIO STATE UNIVERSITY GEOFFREY PARKER

Under the molehill. An Elizabethan spy story. By John Bossy. Pp. xiii + 189 incl. frontispiece and 11 ills. New Haven–London: Yale University Press, 2001. £18.95. 0 300 08400 5

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903455693

This is as brilliant and beguiling a Cold-War spy thriller as you might hope to read. There are moles, fishing operations, a spymaster-general and mysterious pots of marmalade. The real culprit is not who you think it is. The letter does not say what you think it says. The forensic skills of the historian – the equal of any intelligence officer's – are demonstrated at their most refined and subtle. This is a book that any historian would have been proud to have written. As in the author's *Giordano Bruno and the embassy affair*, the scene is mainly the household and diplomatic baggage of the ambassador from Henri III of France to Elizabeth from 1575 to 1585, Michel de Castelnau, seigneur de Mauvissière. Like its predecessor, it concentrates on the same time-frame – between the spring of 1583 and the summer of 1585, the period when relations between England and Spain turned to permafrost and when the loyalties of the English Catholic community fell suspect. Indeed, this sequel may be rather perplexing to those who have not read the earlier work. The rewards for persistence, however, are considerable. For English historians, there is a reappraisal of Secretary Walsingham and his handling of Elizabeth at the time of the Throckmorton Affair. Although it is never centre-stage, the book throws light on the Babington Plot of 1586. For French historians, there are illuminating sidelights on the crab-like conduct of Henri III and his ministers. For historiographers (and *The embassy affair* has already acquired iconic status in some university historiography courses), the book is notable for renouncing the sovereignty of fact in place of the sovereignty of story – albeit a story in which real events happen in states of affairs that really existed. One small footnote: the 'Chartier' mentioned in the text (pp. 59, 67, 166) is Mathurin Charretier, former secretary to Henri de Montmorency-Damville, a very bad egg indeed, and one who (like poor Throckmorton in this book), came to a bad end.

University of Sheffield Mark Greengrass

Ordaining the Catholic Reformation. Priests and seminary pedagogy in Fiesole, 1575–1675. By Kathleen M. Comerford (Biblioteca della Rivista di Storia e Letteratura Religiosa. Studi, 12.) Pp. xxii + 162 incl. 2 maps, 7 tables and 4 charts. Florence: Olschki, 2001. L.38,000 (paper). 88 222 4960 7

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S002204690346569X

The author of this slim volume returns to a theme on which she has previously published, the diocesan seminary of Fiesole, which, as demonstrated here, was truly operative only from the second half of the 1630s. On this occasion, given the finite nature of the surviving evidence, she is suitably cautious about her theory that the seminary of this modest diocese showed some distinctively Jesuit influences. On the other hand, precisely because of the nature of the diocese, the most valuable feature of the volume is perhaps the attempt to establish the library holdings of the small seminary, where in any case only a limited percentage of the

diocese's ordinands received some training. Much of this short work is taken up with general points, of varying degrees of precision, about clerical and other education in the post-Tridentine Catholic Church, and there is little about the subsequent clerical careers of the alumni of this particular seminary. However all historical data about early Italian diocesan seminaries are welcome, and valid comparative references are also made here. It is, indeed, not entirely surprising that in this case a second-division Italian diocese was relatively more successful in establishing some post-conciliar seminary provision than were some eminent sees, including Florence itself and Pisa, as is noted here.

University of Leeds A. D. Wright

Facsimile of John Foxe's Book of martyrs, 1583. Actes and monuments of matters most Speciall and memorable. By David G. Newcombe with Michael Pidd. Version 1.0. CD-ROM. Oxford: Oxford University Press (for The British Academy), 2001. £185. 0 19 726225 2

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903475696

This CD-ROM is a major step in the publication programme of the John Foxe Project which is doing so much to aid understanding and discussion of one of the most important books published in the sixteenth century. To call Foxe's *Actes and monuments* a book is, of course, a solecism, because even more than Calvin's *Institutes* it was a vegetable growth reflecting the expanding work and changing priorities of its author/editor – moreover, in Katherine Pantzer's opinion, cited in the editorial preface to this enterprise, 'there is probably no such thing as a complete and perfect copy of any of the editions of the *Acts and monuments* surviving today'. Thomas Freeman has by now persuaded us all that the standard eight-volume Victorian edition by Cattley, Townsend and Pratt is unuseable for scholarly purposes, reflecting as it does no actual edition of Foxe's works, and concealing the way in which the work grew and changed. To begin to remedy these deficiencies, the editors have chosen the last version to be prepared under the direction of Foxe himself, that of 1583, and their description of their procedure in preparing their facsimile is fascinating. The operation was composite, but crucially dependent on the generosity of this Journal's former Board Chairman, Patrick Collinson, in allowing his personal copy to be disassembled for maximum quality of reproduction. Pages missing or unuseable have been taken from a copy of the 1583 edition in Cambridge University Library. The resulting images, complete with the rarely surviving fold-out plates, are satisfyingly effective, particularly when printed off. There is a useful general introduction, and an array of search devices which enable one to make full use of the text from a variety of standpoints. The facsimile is preparatory to the even more ambitious plan for a CD-ROM edition of the four main editions of Foxe. We are already greatly in the editors' debt.

St Cross College, Diarmaid MacCulloch
Oxford

Paradise postponed. Johann Henrich Alsted and the birth of Calvinist millenarianism. By Howard Hotson. (International Archives of the History of Ideas, 172.) Pp. x + 230 incl. 15 figs. Dordrecht–Boston–London: Kluwer Academic, 2000. £49. 0 7923 6787 1

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903485692

Of Alsted's millenarian prophecy concerning the beginning of the 1,000-year reign of the saints (Revelation xx), Pierre Bayle quipped, soon after 1694: 'He maintained that the reign would commence in 1694. We know for certain he was mistaken' (p. 99). Howard Hotson, writing about one-third of the way into what Alsted believed would be the final millennium, asks how Alsted came to hold this belief. He shows how this great Calvinist encyclopaedist of Herborn (1588–1638) expounded first, in the early stages of his intellectual career, from about 1610 to 1622, various theories that were apocalyptic – in that they looked forward expectantly to a brief, final period of illumination after which the world would end, in 1694 – but were not millenarian in the strict sense used by Hotson, who restricts the term to theories which situate the 1,000-year reign of the saints in the future. Secondly, between 1622 and 1625 Alsted adopted what Hotson calls semi-millenarian positions: he did now await a millennium in the future, yet understood it not as a literal 1,000 years but merely as a few decades, a final, brief, better age, again ending in 1694. Only after 1625 did his apocalyptic thought become millenarian in Hotson's strict sense, since Alsted now saw 1694 not as the end of the world but as the start of the 1,000-year reign of the saints. Why this radical change of opinion? Hotson argues persuasively that the single most decisive factor was the descent of Alsted's world into the Thirty Years War. The violent chaos that set in from 1618 onwards hardly seemed to usher in that final period of illumination. Alsted's careful chronologies of human history were being torn apart by history in the making. His millenarianism thus emerged as a way of salvaging his apocalyptic aspirations for an eventual happy terrestrial future. But where did those aspirations derive from in the first place? Initially, less from the Bible or theology than from 'a startling variety of astrological, alchemical, and generally "hermetic" or "occult" texts originating at the margins of the central European Reformed tradition or mediated to [Alsted] through it' (p. 154). This is one of the many surprises served up by Hotson's probing scrutiny of obscure sources. Only when compelled by the events of his own time did Alsted turn more to detailed biblical exegesis to support his new-found millenarianism – so much for *sola scriptura*. Alsted's millenarianism, having developed in this more Bible-based direction, then contributed crucially to the subsequent flourishing of a mainstream Reformed millenarian tradition. As in Hotson's recent, more general intellectual biography of Alsted (reviewed this JOURNAL liii. 173–4), the relation of Alsted's 'hermeticism' or 'occultism' to what Hotson calls the more 'respectable' strands of his thought creates intriguing frictions, with the hermeticism being played down in the eventual millenarianism without however being fully excised from it. While Hotson shows admirably the continuing role of hermeticism in Alsted's thought, the impossibility of writing an entirely dispassionate modern history of such matters is perhaps revealed by occasional glimpses of Hotson's own apparent sympathy with Alsted for having 'discarded the most obvious rubbish' (p. 161) in hermeticism, as well as for developing a brand of millenarianism characterised by a 'sobriety and

detachment' (p. 7) that has saved it, like that of Joseph Mede, from being 'relegated to any of the categories too often applied to millenarians in general but applied *with some justice* to most of their Protestant millenarian precursors (pp. 8–9; my emphasis). The qualities that Hotson most admires in Alsted are those that this fine study also displays: enormous scholarly breadth, indefatigable research, intellectual sobriety.

CHURCHILL COLLEGE, NEIL KENNY
CAMBRIDGE

Hamlet in purgatory. By Stephen Greenblatt. Pp. xii + 322 incl. 10 ills + 8 colour plates. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2001. £19.95 ($29.95). 0 691 05873 3

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903495699

Stephen Greenblatt is a literary critic whom historians have learned to take seriously, and *Hamlet in purgatory* justifies the compliment. This is a study of *Hamlet* in which the play itself seems almost to retreat into the background, though Greenblatt's claim that the drama 'shapes virtually everything I have to say' is clearly justified. Much of the book comprises a lively and illuminating survey of what Greenblatt terms the 'purgatorial imagination' of the late Middle Ages, in the course of which we learn a great deal about St Patrick's Purgatory, the *Gast of Gy*, and other texts. Greenblatt finds these accounts shot through with 'the specter of disbelief, the suspicion that the whole thing is an illusion, a trick, a fiction' (p. 76). In his account of the Protestant assault on purgatory, one theme predominates: the reformers' emphasis on the fictive quality of the doctrine, its special relationship to fantasy and the imagination, the recurrent charge that purgatory was 'poetry'. In the Middle Ages purgatory had sanctioned and legitimated the human impulse to maintain contact with the spirits of the dead, but as ghosts became 'increasingly labeled as fictions of the mind' there was really only one place for them to go: 'they turn up onstage' (p. 151). This is the idea around which the book is structured. Reformation debates are taken seriously here because they 'unsettled the institutional moorings of a crucial body of imaginative materials and therefore made them available for theatrical appropriation' (p. 249). Only in the final chapter does Greenblatt turn to *Hamlet* itself. Unlike many previous critics, Greenblatt wisely resists the temptation to 'solve' the puzzle of Old Hamlet's ghost (spirit of health or goblin damned?). But he deftly demonstrates a whole network of allusions to purgatory in the text, and insists that it is a play where the psychological 'is constructed almost entirely from the theological' (p. 229), specifically the hotly-contested issue of remembrance. There is considerable appeal in Greenblatt's notion that the play is a product of the 'fifty-year effect', a post-revolutionary generation beginning to look back with longing at the world they have lost. More speculative, though a wonderful repudiation of the critical mandate that the biographical should not be read into the textual, is the suggestion that behind the tragedy stands a Protestant playwright 'haunted by the spirit of his Catholic father pleading for suffrages to relieve his soul from the pains of Purgatory' (p. 249). Quibbles? Of

course. The reader gets little or no sense here that the most substantial Protestant objection to purgatory was a soteriological one, its incompatibility with justification by faith alone, and in following the ghosts into the theatre, Greenblatt virtually ignores their continued importance in post-Reformation popular and elite culture. (Keith Thomas is a surprising omission from the footnotes.) Yet the contextualization (and it is a measure of Greenblatt's achievement that the word itself seems inappropriate) is generally sensitive and sure-footed, the writing accessible and jargon-free. Hamlet is surely the most *protean* of all literary texts, generations of critics and theatre directors finding in it a mirror to their own cultural and political concerns. But Greenblatt's haunting evocation of an author and a society uncertainly coming to terms with the emotional hold of the recent past, and the recently dead, is as persuasive as any modern retelling.

University of Warwick Peter Marshall

Press censorship in Jacobean England. By Cyndia Susan Clegg. Pp. xi + 286. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001. £40. 0 521 78243 0

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903505693

This work is an acknowledged sequel to Susan Clegg's *Press censorship in Elizabethan England* (1997), and is similar in both purpose and methodology. In the earlier work the main thesis was that censorship was driven less by grand ideological strategies than by the need to respond effectively to specific challenges, which came from different quarters and in many varying degrees. Here Clegg sets out to demonstrate that neither the traditional conflict model of Jacobean politics, nor the revisionist consensual model fit the manner in which government censorship actually operated. Using many of the systems put in place by his predecessor, James was primarily concerned, not with defending his high principles of kingship, but with guarding his back as he steered through the complex maze of day-by-day politics. He often intervened directly in the censorship process, by proclamation, by letter and by verbal instruction. Usually he supported the position taken by his officers, but sometimes he overruled them, and sometimes anticipated them. The king was acutely sensitive to attacks upon his foreign policy, and because these were frequent, and often intensely felt, they formed one of the most important, and at the same time straightforward, aspects of censorship.

James's reactions to religious controversy were much less predictable, and the pattern therefore more complicated. Although his personal theology was Calvinist, he did not always support, or even accept, the views of Calvinist controversialists. His reactions were equally likely to be determined by the twists and turns of court politics, and by the battles for patronage and influence which went on between the different groups. Censorship was in several different hands: the Court of High Commission; the archbishop's chaplains; the king's chaplains; and the Stationers' Company. Most particularly there was simmering conflict between Archbishop Abbot and Richard Neile, bishop successively of Rochester, Lichfield, Lincoln and Durham. It was churchmanship rather than theology

which divided them, but they used their influence over the censorship process in conflicting ways, so that works licenced by Abbot, or by High Commission, might be condemned by Neile, or the king, or both. Because the king's position changed frequently, in accordance with the dictates of immediate policy, or *amour propre*, there were no stable confrontational positions on religious censorship.

This is a scholarly and convincing essay, written from a sound grasp of the historical sources, and a good understanding of the dynamics of the reign. As the author is quick to point out, not only were these very different from the reign of Elizabeth, they were also very different from those of Charles, which were to follow. The conclusions, which are well drawn for the years 1603 to 1625, are not valid for the following decade, although many of the issues, and some of the people, ran through both periods.

OXFORD DAVID LOADES

The boxmaker's revenge. 'Orthodoxy', 'heterodoxy' and the politics of the parish in early Stuart London. By Peter Lake. (Politics, Culture and Society in Early Modern Britain.) Pp. x+422 incl. 9 figs. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2001. £55. 0 7190 5967 4

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S002204690351569X

The title gives us the subject of the book: a spat in 1627 between a Puritan minister, Thomas Denison, and a Familist boxmaker, John Etherington. The subtitle directs us to the author's real interest, in showing how shifting and meaningless such labels as 'orthodoxy' and 'heterodoxy' are, when we try to make sense of the quarrels of the time. Lake brings to that task a familiarity with the London parish records and (even more impressively) an ability to get behind the polemical sources. What does it mean to call Denison an 'orthodox' Puritan, when his fellow godly ministers back him so half-heartedly? Is Etherington a card-carrying Familist (itself an oxymoron) when he denounces so much of the sect's tenets? Is this then a dispute between clergy and laity? But this is to underestimate the considerable lay support (as well as opposition) in Denison's non-boxmaking congregation. And should we write off the 'rise of Laudianism' as an explanation for disturbance, when Calvinists seem so good at doing it by themselves? We should not, says Lake, as he shows how its rise unhinges Denison's fragile mental balance. Rhetorical questions are never just that, in Lake's hands. They are real questions which demand an answer. His interrogation of rhetoric is his greatest strength. He pursues courteous disagreement with fellow scholars in footnotes. Only once does he erupt into the text (p. 389), when he turns with Denison-like ferocity on a colleague for 'concocting a homogenous soup of Christian platitude'. At the very end of the book (p. 413) he suggests that this 1627 quarrel was an anticipation of Thomas Edwards's war on the sects in the 1640s. We begin to protest. Was Denison the same as the Presbyterian heresy-hunter? How many in *Gangraena* fit into the Etherington model? And then we realise that we are paying Lake the supreme compliment of imitation. And who could doubt, if he had given himself a few more pages (which he shouldn't), that he would have turned on himself for the

shallowness of the comparison? This is a brilliant book which only Peter Lake could have written.

University of Sussex William Lamont

Fear and polemic in seventeenth-century England. Richard Baxter and Antinomianism. By Tim Cooper. Pp. ix + 238. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2001. £45. 0 7546 0301 6

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903525696

This book explores Richard Baxter's entanglement with antinomianism, and the very un-Baxterian doctrinal warfare that ensued. What Cooper terms Baxter's 'anti-antinomian' anxiety reached its height between 1646 and 1653, and had as much to do with the political and social tumult all around as with the perceived theological errors of those who talked up grace and 'strict imputation' at the expense of human participation in salvation. Cooper traces Baxter's involvement with antinomianism on into the Restoration when his interest waned, along with his estimation of the subversive potential of the doctrine. In consequence, Baxter's revival of the debate in the 1670s was undertaken in a much more dispassionately polemical spirit than in the 1640s. Space is also allocated to Baxter's brief return to the subject shortly before his death. The volume draws on the idea that group definition was reinforced by polemical attacks on another, anxiety-producing group. At bottom, it seems to have been the fear of libertinism rather than antinomianism, its bookish twin, that haunted Baxter. His 'anti-antinomianism' was at its most vehement when his fear for public morals was strongest. While Cooper gives most weight to Baxter's pastoral concerns and political fears as motives for his attack on antinomianism, much of the book is given over to the theological disputes between Baxter and those he labelled 'antinomian'. Baxter is said to have exaggerated the peril of the antinomians who were 'not radical; they were seeking to conserve a legitimate Protestant tradition', although it is worth noting that Cooper also demonstrates the importance of emphasis within a shared tradition in marking out sound from unsound doctrine (as in Baxter's oscillations between Arminianism and Calvinism): the author's own argument shows that respectable doctrinal ancestors were no guarantee of orthodoxy. Cooper's book will mainly be of interest to students of Baxter, although he also sets out to produce a 'case study of the structure of polemic and the projection of fear'. This aim is partly achieved, although the book would have benefited from a consideration of how Baxter's case might alter as well as confirm established views of how fear and polemic goaded each other on. For one thing, Cooper's version of Baxter suggests that he saw something of his own religious inclinations in the antinomian bogeyman he constructed, making a simple 'them/us' or 'me/Other' dichotomy difficult to sustain.

London Jason Yiannikkou

Cromwell's major-generals. Godly government during the English Revolution. By Christopher Durston. (Politics, Culture and Society in Early Modern Britain.) Pp. x+260 incl. 1 map and 2 tables. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2001. £46 (cloth), £15.99 (paper). 0 7190 5187 8; 0 7190 6065 6

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903535692

Cromwell's major-generals are characters who have long been in search of an author. Various short essays taking an overview of the topic have been published in recent years, and there have been brief treatments of their motivation and performance in a range of county studies, but despite these, teachers have had to refer their students to an article of 1895, by E. W. Rannie in the *English Historical Review*, for the most rounded narrative and analysis. They will no longer have to do so. In ten chapters, Durston explains the origins of the experiment of 1655–7, the backgrounds of the major-generals themselves, their policies and their downfall. A chapter is devoted to the commissioners for the security of the commonwealth, the major-generals' assistants, which complements but does not in every respect confirm the findings of recent work by John Sutton. Two chapters explain how the major-generals conducted themselves in the crucial general election of 1656, and how afterwards they failed in their bid to secure a new lease of life for their regime. Material in over a dozen local record offices is cited in this book, but the most fundamental source for the study of the major-generals remains the state papers of John Thurloe. Commendably, the author has resorted to the originals among the Rawlinson MSS at the Bodleian Library, but does not seem to have gained enormously by by-passing the more usually consulted transcripts in Thomas Birch's 1742 edition of them. Nevertheless, it is hard to see how, in the context of a monograph aimed at students as well as specialists, more ground could have been covered. Durston's view of his subjects is pessimistic. He believes the major-generals to have been 'an alien and unwelcome intrusion' in the localities (p. 54), whose campaign for moral reformation was 'a clear failure' (p. 179), not least because they were 'badly let down' (p. 169) by Lord Protector Oliver Cromwell, who, we have long known, was at best ambivalent in his support for the military men. It is certainly hard to quarrel with this verdict; it would be an ingenious commentator who could argue convincingly that the major-generals achieved much that was positive. Even so, they are treated here in a rather bloodless way that does not quite do justice to their variegated characters and personalities. For example, James Berry, in charge of Wales and the marcher counties, is assumed, because he was sympathetic to Quakers, to have been well-disposed towards, even complicit in, the preaching tours of the millenarian Baptist, Vavasor Powell. In fact Powell and the Quakers shared little common ground. Berry was a victim of his own complacency, having been comprehensively outmanoeuvred by the Welsh preacher, who was well on his way to producing the inflammatory polemic, *A word for God*. There remains scope for alternative readings of the individual major-generals' outlooks, but this is nevertheless without question now the book of first resort on this topic.

HISTORY OF PARLIAMENT TRUST STEPHEN K. ROBERTS

Political thought in seventeenth-century Ireland. Edited by Jane H. Ohlmeyer, Pp. xvii + 290 incl. 3 plates. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000. £40. 0 521 65083 6

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903545699

As Europe moved into its post-Reformation era it was clear that a number of sports had been thrown up by the latest evolutionary lurch in Church–State relations. In Ireland a majority Catholic population inhabited a self-consciously Protestant kingdom as subjects of a more-or-less Protestant dynasty. That this odd and awkward situation required, and resulted in, some supple, sophisticated or merely necessary political thinking, is one of the recurrent themes of *Political thought in seventeenth-century Ireland*. In an appropriately eclectic introduction to a rich collection, the editor signals her intention to play to the strengths of the essay-collection format, using it to highlight the variety of forms and the multiplicity of contexts – British, European, Atlantic-imperial – in which political thought in seventeenth-century Ireland can, and should, be examined. Raymond Gillespie, in a significant essay on 'Political ideas and their social contexts', further urges the need to address the diffusion of political ideas beyond the 'elite of conscious "political thinkers"' or the 'mind sets' of defined ethnic groups. He then proceeds to spread before the reader an array of instances and examples of ideas transmitted, circulated and received, in print, manuscript, drama or ritual. A cluster of essays effectively address the Catholic dilemma, especially at mid-century. Bernadette Cunningham contrasts the historical writings of John Lynch and earlier fellow cleric-historian Geoffrey Keating for evidence of their interpretations of such perilous concepts as kingship, parliament or nation in a revealing essay, not least of the 'contradictions and confusions' lurking in Lynch's attempts to elucidate and apply the lessons of the Irish past. Aidan Clarke provides a characteristically lucid essay on the tangle of Anglo-Irish constitutional relations, and observes how the perception of the crown as protector and guarantor of Catholic interests operated against separatist aspirations. By contrast, Jerrold Casway's brief but evocative assessment of 'Gaelic Maccabeanism' looks at a language which seeps through the boundaries of theology and poetry, and into the informal articulation of political thinking in speech or correspondence, and which served to appropriate the historic Jewish liberators as inspiration, model and motivation for Gaelic exiles' participation in the politics of their homeland. Tadhg Ó hAnnracháin ranges across both the conservative perspectives of Old English clerics and the intellectual tussles of more militant, or more visionary, churchmen as they sought to formulate alternative approaches appropriate to dealing with a heretic ruler. His learned and incisive essay notes how authors in both traditions were rooted in orthodox European Catholic theology and intent on articulating their case to a learned European audience. Also focusing on mid-century, Patricia Coughlan probes the 'moral' basis of Vincent Gookin's repudiation of transplantation in the 1650s while Allan Macinnes provides a neatly contrasting look at Scottish covenanting ideology. Addressing the latter end of the century Patrick Kelly effectively unravels the sources for William Molyneux's defence of Irish legislative autonomy; Charles C. Ludington assays the consistency of thought of that doughty defender of the English imperial crown-in-parliament, William Atwood; David Armitage lifts Ireland into a consideration of those quintessential post-

revolution concerns, the 'emergent discourse of political economy' and the conceptualisation of empire. J. G. A. Pocock rounds off the volume with a thoughtful consideration of Irish political thought and 'British' history, and much else. Jane Ohlmeyer's volume provides a valuable and stimulating set of essays, frequently and unexpectedly resonating with one another and providing plenty of markers and models for future research in a very partially discovered country of the mind.

TRINITY COLLEGE, DUBLIN — ROBERT ARMSTRONG

Edward Stillingfleet als Kritiker der Ideenlehre John Lockes. By Gottfried Schwitzgebel. (Miroir et Image. Philosophische Abhandlungen, 6.) Pp. 254. Frankfurt-am-Main: Peter Lang, 2000. £27. 3 631 34218 7; 0944 2405

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903555695

Where would Cassius have been without Caesar? In a like way, Edward Stillingfleet owes such prominence as he commands in the mind of posterity to his assault upon John Locke. *An essay concerning human understanding* did not attain instantly the reputation it now has. At least one reason for its rise to prominence was the critical comments on it by the bishop of Worcester, to the mind of the day a much more important man than Mr Locke. Episcopal reflections upon *An essay* (in *A discourse in vindication of the doctrine of the Trinity*) required a response from Locke, and so began a public exchange that ended only with the bishop's death. Their controversy then slumbered, and it is only recently that scholars have exhumed it. *Edward Stillingfleet als Kritiker der Ideenlehre John Lockes* is the first book-length treatment of their epistolary encounter. It is the author's doctoral dissertation, and reviews the epistemological and ontological aspects of the dispute in four substantial chapters, to which a brief biography of Stillingfleet is added. These are followed by a reprinting of selected portions of Stillingfleet's writings about Locke, which will be useful to those who do not have access to the Olms reprint of 1987 or the Thoemmes one of 2000. In general, this is a workmanlike statement about a complex topic. It would have been better still had it extended its consideration of Stillingfleet to include the much wider range of matters, including the relations of Church and State, upon which he differed from Locke. Even in a strictly philosophical context it is odd to find nothing here about Leibniz's notes on their exchange, conveniently printed in the Berlin edition of his works. I do not know whether readers of this JOURNAL will be minded to forgive much, or to condemn more, when (p. 252) they encounter the author of *Religion in England 1688–1791* as Gordon Rubb.

UNIVERSITY OF LEICESTER — IAN HARRIS

Religion and national identity. Wales and Scotland c. 1700–2000. Edited by Robert Pope. Pp. xii + 355. Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2001. £25. 0 7083 1662 X

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903565691

The title of this book, though not unjustified, taken together with its editor's thoughtful introduction, tends to suggest a greater measure of unity and

coherence to the volume than its pages reveal. There is no systematic attempt to survey religion or nationality, separately or in concert, in Wales or Scotland over the period. Nor, perhaps, could that in fairness be expected, given the way in which the book originated, i.e. as a published collection of conference papers, in which the invited speakers, seven from each country, reproduced talks they had given on such aspects of the overall theme as appealed to them. There appears to have been very little, if any, consultation between them, before or after the colloquy, although it has to be emphasised that all of them write well and with genuine enthusiasm for their subjects. The one outstanding example of a contribution which attempts to make meaningful contrasts and comparisons between Wales and Scotland is the admirable essay by John Wolffe on 'Civic religious identities … in Cardiff and Edinburgh, 1867–1910', which has thought-provoking suggestions to offer not only on the two cities but also on both nations. Although no other paper achieves this degree of stereoscopic vision, they all have highly interesting observations to make on diverse facets of religious belief and national awareness in Wales and Scotland between 1700 and 1900. Each author is also sensitive to the interplay between religious belief and national consciousness. This collection of essays ought surely to bring to its readers further confirmation and wider illumination of their understanding of political, religious and cultural attachments in both Wales and Scotland, and is likely to underscore, explicitly and by implication, the similarities and divergences between them. Both were aware of being separate national entities, overshadowed and even threatened by their larger and more powerful English neighbour. Each was conscious of its own age-long and distinct religious heritage, decidedly more democratic and with more scope for lay initiative than the hierarchical regime of the Church. With greater opportunities for lower-class participation and more emphasis on the power of preaching and the pulpit, there were marked contrasts, too. Scotland had its longer tradition of political independence, its own legal system, its independent university and school system, and its separate capital; but it had also had its pronounced rift between Highlands and Lowlands in background, language and culture, the like of which did not exist in Wales, until late in the nineteenth century at least. In spite of its miscellaneous and uncoordinated contents, the book has a great deal to commend it to the sympathetic attention of students of the subject.

SWANSEA GLANMOR WILLIAMS

The justicing notebook (1750–64) of Edmund Tew, rector of Boldon. Edited by Gwenda Morgan and Peter Rushton. (Publications of the Surtees Society, 205.) Pp. xiv + 240 incl. frontispiece. Woodbridge: Boydell Press (for the Surtees Society), 2001. £40. 0 85444 044 5; 0307 5362

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903575698

By its very nature, the summary justice dispensed by local magistrates during the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries has left few records. Instead, historians are often forced to depend upon the fortuitous survival of private justicing notebooks in which were recorded the details of the quotidian administration of law and

justice during this era. The notebooks under review here, of a mid eighteenth-century clerical magistrate in County Durham, are important contributions to the emerging portrait of a justice's most common daily activities. While the inhabitants of Edmund Tew's parishes may have been a commercial people they certainly were not polite. The bulk of this magistrate's work concerned the investigation of common assaults and petty thefts as well as the resolution of master-and-servant disputes. The latter appear especially frequently, and warrants issued to answer for stopped wages seem to have been almost as common as those for deserting service. As the editors point out in their introduction, extraordinarily few cases of any sort (perhaps 2 per cent or so) ever proceeded to the courts. Instead it appears that most were resolved through the personal intercession of this magistrate and the implicit coercion of his warrants. These notebooks are an important addition to the growing number of such sources and the editors have performed a valuable service by making them available and accessible.

UNIVERSITY OF WISCONSIN JAMES JAFFE

The Universalist movement in America, 1770–1880. By Ann Lee Bressler. (Religion in America.) Pp. ix + 204. Oxford–New York: Oxford University Press, 2001. £26.50 ($35). 0 19 5129865

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903585694

This revisionist account of Universalism's first century in the United States profits from its close attention to theological issues and to the ironies of historical development. On the first count, Ann Bressler distinguishes Universalism from the generic liberal Protestantism with which it is usually lumped by recovering its roots in Edwardsean Calvinism. Like Edwards, Hosea Ballou, the movement's definitive theologian, premised his system upon the religious affections and the sovereignty of God, though deducing from the latter an unlimited – rather than Calvinism's traditional limited – atonement. First-generation Universalists also shared Edwards's communal sense of redemption and virtue, criticising the selfish scramble for personal salvation that the Great Awakening left in its wake. But if Universalism hardly started out as the poor cousin to Unitarianism that historians often take it to be, it gravitated toward that niche over its next two phases. From the 1805 publication of Ballou's major work until the 1840s, the movement grew by providing a harbour and sounding board for rationalist–populist malcontents on the New England religious scene. It thrived on polemical exchanges with 'Orthodox' Calvinists but increasingly with New School evangelicals and Methodists as well. This enterprise assumed the salience of the Calvinist theological tradition, however. When that ebbed, Universalism's lack of a positive theological programme left it 'subject to powerful centrifugal tendencies' (p. 97): Spiritualism and other variants of 'mental science' in the first place, Progressive Orthodoxy at the end, and all along the free-will individualism and moralism that had been the founders' *bête noire*. In the process Universalists entered the lists of social reform, although never as much as did evangelicals, and less in the temperance and abolitionist than the women's rights cause. Bressler's

narrative of declension has the group already pondering the reason for its existence at the centennial celebration in 1870, with a band of 'Neo-Calvinists' (p. 139) serving up the jeremiads – and serving as prototypes of Niebuhrian neo-orthodoxy sixty years ahead of time. Such a discovery is one of the delights of this book, nestled in its broader achievement of shedding fresh light on a particular group while duly attending to comparative context.

CALVIN COLLEGE JAMES D. BRATT

Reluctant saint? A theological biography of Fletcher of Madeley. By Patrick Streiff, translated by G. W. S. Knowles. Pp. ix + 406. Peterborough: Epworth Press, 2001. £19.95 (paper). 07162 0546 7

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903595690

Even by the hagiographical standards of early Methodism the first portrayals of Fletcher's life stood out as that of a saint immaculate almost from his mother's womb. Later biographers have not hitherto succeeded in penetrating the image of perfection or his reputation as an anti-Calvinist gladiator and as the man Wesley failed to recruit as his successor. Then in 1984 Patrick Streiff's published thesis in German set new critical standards for understanding Fletcher. Based on a thorough examination of the manuscript sources and essential knowledge of Fletcher's Swiss origins, Streiff revealed the complicated and painful process by which Fletcher had become an evangelical and had developed his perfectionist Methodist theology. The present work is a shortened and revised version of the original thesis in a lucid English translation. As he handsomely acknowledges, Streiff has also had the advantage of archival advice from Peter Forsaith who is preparing an edition of Fletcher's revealing correspondence with Charles Wesley. We can now see that both in personal experience and theological expression, Fletcher's view of perfection was the product of a development extending over many years. It was strongly influenced, like all his theology, by the 'rational orthodoxy' of continental Protestantism which he subsumed into his understanding of the Methodist experience of 'new birth' and the pursuit of holiness. Though he was substantially at one with John Wesley theologically – and not least in his attempt to combine revelation with reason and experience –Fletcher was less implacably opposed than Wesley to Calvinistic versions of evangelicalism and in fact set himself to reconcile Arminian and Calvinist evangelicals, though without much success. His refusal to become 'Wesley's designated successor' seems to have been due not only to his poor health and sense of inadequacy for the task but also because he saw his role in Methodism as that of a writer, theologian and parish priest. Here, too, he was a would-be reconciler of parish-based evangelism with the itinerant ministry which was Wesley's dominating vision for Methodism – and for Fletcher himself. Fletcher's version of perfectionism was distinguished from Wesley's by its being seen as a special 'baptism' by the Holy Spirit; and it was from Fletcher rather than Wesley that this idea fed into the nineteenth-century Holiness Movements and eventually into Pentecostalism. Though Streiff deals competently with all aspects of Fletcher's life and work he pays particularly detailed attention to his theology. It seems that

though largely a self-taught theologian, Fletcher was a more sensitive as well as a more eirenical theologian than Wesley. Streiff's treatment of Fletcher's theology is a substantial contribution to understanding a type of theology too easily passed over as simplistic and obscurantist. As well as being a thoroughly satisfying biography of Fletcher this book is a valuable addition to the growing body of scholarly work on early evangelicalism.

MANCHESTER HENRY D. RACK

A German life in the age of revolution. Joseph Görres, 1776–1848. By Jon Vanden Heuvel. Pp. xxvii + 409 incl. frontispiece and 11 ills + erratum. Washington, DC: Catholic University of American Press, 2001. $69.95. 0 8132 0948 2

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903605695

This book is organised around the conventional division of Görres's life into three phases: republican, nationalist, Catholic. It offers less an original interpretation than the first modern 'comprehensive, scientific biography' (p. xxiii) of Görres.

Heuvel draws upon archival material in Koblenz (where Görres was born and lived until 1819), Munich (where he lived from 1827 until his death) and Paris (Koblenz was under French rule from 1794 to 1813). Görres published much as author, journalist and editor, and there is a plentiful correspondence. His controversial reputation generated much writing by contemporaries. There is a large secondary literature on the issues of his times; subjects like German Jacobinism, responses to Napoleon and Catholic revivalism have produced much new research.

The surface contradictions between the phases of Görres's life are striking: Jacobin, wanting one rational, republican order; romantic nationalist, publishing folk stories and fulminating against the French; Catholic, hostile to Prussia, nationalism and liberalism, agitating for church autonomy, a powerful papacy and a pious, mystical Christianity.

Heuvel demonstrates continuities: a philosophical politics unconcerned with 'mechanical' details; preoccupation with the higher purposes of earthly institutions, whether measured by Kantian ethics, *Volk* values or Catholic theology. In pursuit of such ideals Görres pioneered the role of combative journalist and dissident. He was, however, a second-rate thinker, imprecise, following others, whether Kant, Herder or De Maistre. Heuvel stresses he was a misfit, opposing the dominant trend and then, when what he advocated acquired power, turning against it as it became corrupt. If Görres had lived to see political Catholicism become just another politics, who knows to what new cause he would have turned?

Heuvel confines himself to biography and does not stray far beyond his subject. However, what is telling about the life of Görres are the forces he helped express and mobilise and the oppositions they called forth.

UNIVERSITY OF BIRMINGHAM JOHN BREUILLY

A short biography of the Reverend Richard Williams Morgan (c:1815–1889), the Welsh poet and re-founder of the ancient British Church. An enquiry into the origins of neo-Celtic Christianity, together with a reprint of several works by Richard Williams Morgan and Jules Ferrette, etc. By G. H. Thomann. Pp. iii + 133. Solna, Sweden: St Ephrem's Institute, 2001, £10 (paper).

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903615691

Richard Williams Morgan still awaits the full biography he deserves. This short study by Thomann provides little more than an outline of his life and work, which is neither critical nor analytical. Morgan's later ministry as Mar Pelagius, bishop and patriarch of the British Church, upon which Thomann concentrates, although providing an insight into the exotic world of those Alan Bain called 'Bishops Irregular' should be set in its proper context, that of Morgan's passionate Welsh patriotism which was ultimately its source and inspiration. With 'Mor Merion' as his bardic name, Morgan was a leading figure at eisteddfodau. He was also – in common with many of the early clerical supporters of the eisteddfodic movement – a Tractarian, which Owain Jones conclusively proved in a paper Thomann ignores. Welsh Tractarians like Morgan tended to see the early British Church as free of what they discerned as the corruptions of Rome. That ancient purity had been restored at the Reformation, but, in the mid-nineteenth century, was again in jeopardy. Several of Morgan's works, cited but not examined fully by Thomann, vigorously defend the Catholicity of the Church of England and its continuity from that early British Church, whilst denouncing the newly confident Roman Church in England as 'a schismatic community'. Peter Freeman's work on Morgan (*Montgomeryshire Collections* lxxxviii [2000]), of which Thomann seems to have been unaware, is of greater value in understanding the vision of this outspoken man, and where that vision ultimately led him.

University of Wales, Lampeter — John Morgan-Guy

The lure of Babylon. Seven Protestant novelists and Britain's Roman Catholic revival. By Michael E. Schiefelbein. Pp. ix + 202. Macon, GA: Mercer University Press, 2001. $39.95. 0 86554 720 3

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903625698

Reactions to the legal and constitutional changes which, in the first half of the nineteenth century, admitted Catholics in Britain to full civil liberties have in general been explained by illustrative reference to the luxuriant popular literature of hostility which was elicited. The matter had a wide importance, since so many dimensions of constitutional understanding, and so much national cultural self-consciousness, became defined negatively in attitudes to 'the popish religion'. Nor was the anti-Catholic tradition conveniently enclosed within the perspectives of a single social class; and it was not without deeply interesting manifestations in the most articulate leadership of opinion. In the years immediately following the First Vatican Council it was, after all, the leading politician of the day – and perhaps of the century – Gladstone whose opposition

to the claims of Rome re-established a respectable No-Popery rhetoric. What Professor Shiefelbein does so well in this study is to reveal the subtlety and extent of the anti-Catholic tradition in some of the most delicate and profound literature of the nineteenth century. All of the novelists whose work he considers in this light were popular, with the exception of Mary Shelley, whose *Valperga*, published in 1823, was nevertheless a classic assault upon the superstitious peasants and supposedly corrupt priests of Italy which formed a staple of much popular writing. A glance at *The Reformation Journal*, produced at the time of the 'Papal Aggression' episode in 1850–1 will show just how frequently recourse was made by the Protestant writers of the time to European and Irish Catholic practices. Shiefelbein's analysis is both sophisticated and clear: he shows enormous sensitivity to the passions of the writers whose offerings he scrutinises and analyses and yet is, in effect, ruthless in his intellectual dismissal of their cant. A thoroughly entertaining, as well as an enlightening book: here are careful studies of the nineteenth-century intelligentsia at its most bigoted – yet never failing to convey telling and precise observations about the social and cultural environment in which it had its being. And Kingsley, of course, is in the gallery, represented by *Westward Ho*! published in 1855. If for no other insights Kingsley's genius later managed to provoke a greater genius still. Newman's eventual response to Kingsley's prejudices provided Victorian England with its most enduring spiritual classic.

York Minster Edward Norman

The death of Christian Britain. Understanding secularisation 1800–2000. By Callum G. Brown. (Christianity and Society in the Modern World.) Pp. xiii + 256 incl. 6 ills and 6 tables. London–New York: Routledge, 2001. £12.99 (paper). 0 415 18149 6; 0 415 24184 7

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903635694

Callum Brown's book offers what he calls a 'big-answer' – that far from the process of Christian secularisation in Britain happening gradually over a hundred years or longer, as many claim, it occurred all of a sudden in the 1960s 'sending organised Christianity on a downward spiral to the margins of social significance'.

The secularisation avalanche since 1960 has certainly been big – the falling-off in churchgoing and much that went with it – but I find it difficult to think of any major social shift (and certainly this one) where fissures have not appeared long before. Brown, however, is bold, and maybe a little gleeful, in his conclusion. 'What emerges is a story not merely of church decline, but the end of Christianity as a means by which men and women construct their identities and their sense of self.'

He describes two forms of Christian expression in this country – the power of establishment religion, and what he calls the 'salvation economy' – the process of dramatic conversion, confessional testimony, 'new birth', which he identifies largely with John Wesley and later imitators. To the first he devotes little space – quoting E. P. Thompson he speaks of the 'paternalism–deference equilibrium', a feudalism past its sell-by date in the Second World War. The

second he attributes entirely to the democratic ideals of the Enlightenment, regardless of the powerful ideas of 'new birth' in Britain in the sixteenth and seventeenth century, with their own foreshadowings of democracy. Both phenomena, Brown seems to believe, were swept away by the liberal ideas fermenting in the 1960s – second-wave feminism, homosexual law reform, sexual licence etc.

However, to depict Christian expression in Britain only in these two forms is to travesty it, and to leave out much that has been significant both within the Church of England and outside it – spirituality is more complicated and its outworking goes further than he allows. Many members of the Christian Churches, for example, were involved in bringing about important changes in public thought – feminism, racial equality, pacifism and opposition to nuclear weaponry, the Labour Party – yet he insists that such things are 'issues with which Christianity and the Bible in particular are perceived to be wholly unconnected' (and therefore the Christians are rejected by modern people).

However, it is perfectly possible for his reasoning to be wrong, but his overall argument – that Christianity in this country is dying or dead – to be correct. I am not personally convinced of this – there is still energy there, and some often startling growth in the very area he imagines modern people to have turned against, that of evangelicalism. The Churches are in a new situation, true, but maybe not dying as Brown suggests, but rather slimmed down, from the days when churchgoing was necessary to show one's social *bona fides*, to a core of members who have chosen it in the light of a society that no longer gives them a special place and at times seems almost hostile.

As the book progresses Brown refers more and more often to the 'religiosity' of Christian believers. This somewhat pejorative word makes me, perhaps unfairly, doubt his impartiality as an observer, as, still more, does a slip of the pen in the last chapter when he talks of 'the end of the Christian religion'. However parlous the state of the Churches in Britain, Christianity is still alive and well in many parts of the world. His obituary comes too soon.

LONDON MONICA FURLONG

Der Malteserorden. Wandel, Internationalität und soziale Vernetzung im 19. Jahrhundert. By Carl Alexander Krethlow. (Europäische Hochschulschriften, 3. Geschichte und ihre Hilfswissenschaften, 890.) Pp. 812 incl. numerous graphs and tables. Berne: Peter Lang, 2001. £54. 3 906765 94 6

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903645690

The book under review is a 1997 historical dissertation from the University of Bern. The author analyses the medieval Catholic order of the Knights of Malta in Germany between 1879 and the First World War. He focuses mostly on internal changes, international networks and the social bases of this 700-year-old secular order. A concise historical overview lays the groundwork for the confrontation between this cultural and social incarnation of *ancien régime* Catholic internationalism and the French Revolution. The abundant sources are organised mainly along two lines: first, the internal associational life and

motivation of the knights under the auspices of political and cultural modernisation; and second, recruitment of personnel, traditionally taken from the upper echelons of society. The French Revolution was the definitive moment in the modern history of the knights with their secularisation in 1803 and subsequent expulsion from their territories. Between 1815 and 1831 the order survived only in Austria. The reactionary climate of the 1830s and '40s was favourable to them and by 1847 they had partly won back their position at the side of the old political authorities. The authors' account of the knights' decline and partial revival in the nineteenth century makes an argument about institutional continuity. The comparative perspective gets thereby lost. The construction of new forms of Catholic internationalism after 1815 no longer depended on the transnational networks of the nobility, but instead on ultramontanism, missionary activity and new forms of piety.

BERLIN SIEGFRIED WEICHLEIN

Reinventing Christianity. Nineteenth-century contexts. Edited by Linda Woodhead. Pp. xi+294 incl. 40 figs. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2001. £45. 0 7546 1650 9

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903655697

There are various ways of treating the history of nineteenth-century religion. One is through a historical narrative, with maybe some divisions by topic, but underlining certain key characteristics; another is through a sociological examination of trends and patterns, perhaps bound together under the rubric of secularisation; and yet another is in terms of the history of ideas. However, what we have in Linda Woodhead's edited volume *Reinventing Christianity* is a group of portraits, presented thematically and exhibiting something of the range of changes, adjustments and initiatives in the nineteenth century. This volume initiates the reader into the varied milieux of the period, and in that way provides a rich and insightful specificity. So far as I am concerned the collection introduces many young scholars from a wide range of disciplines, and (as Linda Woodhead's epigraph indicates) it exhibits both decomposition and new combinations and affinities.

After an extremely helpful introduction the book begins with a section contrasting 'Transcendent Christianity' with 'Liberal and alternative spiritualities', before surveying some literary approaches and going on to 'Christianity and gender' and 'Christianity and science'. With so many cherries available it is difficult to cherry-pick, but of the three articles under the head of 'Transcendent Christianity' I was particularly intrigued by one by Nancy Davenport on the iconography of fortress Catholicism as found at Notre Dame de Fourvière at Lyons. This church exhibits a remarkable gallery of contemporary demons as, for example, a mosaic labelled 'Naturalism' reflecting the viewpoint of the bull of 1884 *Humanum Generis*, and a group of heresy mosaics of animals over which the priest tramples on ascending to the altar. The clues for identifying the meanings of the latter are to be found in Emile Mâle's *The Gothic image*. But if ultramontane imagery does not attract then you have a choice of Anglican controversies over confession and its supposed consequences for the family, or narratives of personal transformation in the sermons of Charles Spurgeon.

The following section begins with Linda Woodhead's article on the world parliament of religion at Chicago in 1892 and describes how the Unitarian triumphalism of the organisers was trumped by the representatives of eastern traditions and by the emergence of the key motifs of contemporary alternative spirituality. Ian Sellers then gives an account of the remarkable influence of Swedenborgianism, and of its sources, while Shannon Cate traces the Catholic destinations of a number of Boston transcendentalists, thereby giving the American Catholic Church new status and authority.

The literary section should have a wide appeal all the way from sociology to literary studies. The first two articles are on the nineteenth-century roots of D. H. Lawrence's religion, focused on the rewriting of Genesis from sources in Nietzsche and theosophy, and on Wordsworth and the 'Sacralization of place' which acutely analyses five 'Poems on the naming of places'. The other two articles are on the contradiction between Shelley's aesthetic attraction to the images of anti-revolutionary Catholicism and his ideological repulsion, and on the various scripts embodied in Carlyle's *Sartor resartus*.

Chapter xi, by Jane Kristof, which opens the section on gender, begins with the excellent observation that if the declines in Christianity were as drastic as portrayed, then it is surprising so much of it was still around to be lost in 1900. However, one clue here is the appeal of religion to women and Kristof pursues that theme through the feminisation of piety in art. This article is splendidly illustrated by pictures showing how female piety was represented in peasant religion (for example in Millet's 'The Angelus' and Gauguin's 'Vision After the Sermon') but also how it transcended both age and class. Monks and priests are often represented as high-living hypocrites whereas nuns appear as beautiful exemplars of genuine charity.

The extent to which the periodical press could be used by women as their own pulpit, as discussed by Julie Melnyk, surprised me, as did the astonishingly daring feminist theology of Florence Nightingale, discussed by Hilary Fraser and Victoria Burrows. The concluding article on gender by Robert Kachur on Elizabeth Gaskell emphasises the pecularity of a Unitarian woman drawing on apocalyptic discourse and using it as a way of mediating class and gender inequities.

The final section on Christianity and science opens with John Brooke attacking the image of a 'war' between the two and the way contrived master-narratives have contributed to misunderstanding. The following chapter by Gowan Dawson contextualises that war in terms of a new 'knowledge class' seeking to rival the power of clergy established in the universities. Jonathan Smith on Philip Gosse shows how far we have been misled by Edmund Gosse's *Father and son* (1907), stressing how critical Gosse was of the more optimistic versions of natural theology and the way Gosse represented his own vision of 'radiations of relation' in his own drawings.

In her conclusion to a splendid volume, Linda Woodhead shows how it provokes a reassessment of Victorian Christianity as a religion in crisis. Christianity did not merely react but was actively implicated in all the changes of the time. She further concludes that whatever the predictions of secularisation theory, transcendent forms of Christianity continued to show considerable vitality in the twentieth century. She also highlights broad trends, such as

'detraditionalisation', privatisation and feminisation, turns to the heart and to 'life', and universalisation. But to find out how all that is articulated one should buy the book and explore its varied riches.

LONDON SCHOOL OF ECONOMICS/
LANCASTER UNIVERSITY

DAVID MARTIN

Pulling the devil's kingdom down. The Salvation Army in Victorian Britain. By Pamela J. Walker. Pp. xiii + 338 + 11 figs. Berkeley–Los Angeles–London: University of California Press, 2001. $35. 0 520 22591 0

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903665693

Pamela Walker's *Pulling the devil's kingdom down*, a revision of her 1992 dissertation, examines the urban working-class religion of the Salvation Army in Victorian Britain. Walker's research on this evangelical body seeks to challenge conventional historical interpretations that either associate urbanisation with secularisation or view working-class religion as a means to more significant political ends. She argues that the former viewpoint is unable to account for the spiritual and cultural dynamics that propelled Salvationists into the world. Those who argue for the secularising of Britain in the Victorian period tend to relegate religiously committed groups to subcultural ghettoes, where the faithful remnant sought refuge from an increasingly pluralistic and evil world. Yet, as Walker demonstrates, the Salvation Army engaged with the metropolis through its adaptation of popular cultural forms and subversion of gender norms. Salvationists held services in music halls and theatres, used sensational advertising media to promote their activities, and adopted a militaristic framework that appealed to rough and physical working-class men. Meanwhile, the many young women who came into contact with the Salvation Army were given unprecedented opportunities for public service. Following the lead of Catherine Booth, the cofounder of the Salvation Army, who argued that women had the right to preach the Gospel, Salvationist lasses refashioned Victorian notions of femininity by boldly parading through the streets and preaching on a traditionally male-dominated platform. Pamela Walker goes on to show that the latter perspective, which treats religion as a stepping stone to more important interests, fails to appreciate the central role that faith played in the lives of Army members. Here, for example, she examines the conversion narratives of those who joined the organisation. Not only do these accounts reveal that conversion and holiness were at the core of the Salvationist experience, they also demonstrate that working-class recruits understood sin and salvation in ways that were meaningful to them. In contrast to middle-class Christians, who interpreted sin and salvation within rational and orderly categories, Salvationists understood sin in bodily terms (fighting and drinking) and associated conversion with physical manifestations (weeping, shaking and levitation). Walker contends that this type of religiosity was not imposed from above as a form of social control but forged from within as a working-class response to the sacred. In many respects, *Pulling the devil's kingdom down* is an outstanding contribution to a growing body of scholarship which seeks to treat working-class religion on its own terms. While

there is much merit to this approach, and Walker presents solid evidence to back up her claims, she does not always appreciate the ways in which the hierarchical Salvationist leadership could interpret faith in a middle-class and conventional manner. Catherine Booth, for instance, could be a strong promoter of religion as a bulwark against the potentially rebellious lower classes (see her *The Salvation Army in relation to the Church and State* [1883], pp. 1–26). This conservative strain in Catherine Booth's thinking can also be found in her numerous other books, but Walker fails to interact with them. Furthermore, the Salvation Army was very traditional in its espousal of male headship within marriage, and this institutional belief had far-reaching consequences for women's public roles. Because Walker's research is heavily slanted toward the 1880s and the early 1890s, when many female Salvationists were still single, she gives insufficient attention to the ways in which gender could become a controlling and oppressive category in Army circles. Despite these weaknesses, *Pulling the devil's kingdom down* is a work that deserves attention from anyone wishing to understand the nature of working-class religion in late nineteenth-century Britain.

University of Calgary Andrew M. Eason

Purified by fire. A history of cremation in America. By Stephen Prothero. Pp. xiv + 266 incl. 2 figs + 17 plates. Berkeley–Los Angeles–London: University of California Press, 2001. £17.50. 0 520 20816 1

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S002204690367569X

This is a timely book that does not disappoint. Its three parts tell of the birth of cremation in the USA between 1874 and 1896, provide a full account of the emergence of cremation as a business venture in the 'bricks and mortar' phase of 1896–1963 and account for a relative 'boom' phase from the mid-1960s. As expected in a topic-focused study it integrates historical, philosophical and theological factors within issues of broad social, economic and political concern. Specific individuals, movements and locations are detailed as Prothero shows how cremation was introduced into different parts of the USA and how it related to and competed with burial. His opening sentence that 'death is a sort of alchemy', a ritual process that changes human identity, underlies much of the book and inspires his concern with social changes that motivated attitudes amongst successive generations. Given that current cremation levels of about 25 per cent in the USA differ markedly from Britain's 72 per cent readers may be surprised at the different paths taken by this rite in the USA. Many may find chapter vii, on 'contemporary ways of cremation', particularly interesting in tracing attitudes and policies of undertakers in accepting the growing currency of cremation, including increasingly personalised funerals. Above all he shows how death rites express different ideologies. The plates are well-chosen and like many parts of the book, not devoid of humour, as with the golf bag urn for cremated remains, or 'cremains' as USA death vocabulary has it.

University of Durham Douglas J. Davies

Öffentliche Kritik am Nationalsozialismus im Grossdeutschen Reich. Leben und Weltanschauung des Wiener Baptistenpastors Arnold Köster (1896–1960). By Franz Graf-Stuhlhofer. (Historische-theologische Studien zum 19 und 20. Jahrhundert, 9.) Pp. viii + 280. Neukirchen-Vluyn: Neukirchener, 2001. DM 68 (paper). 3 7887 1856 0

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903685696

From 1929 onwards Arnold Köster was the pastor of what was at the time the only independent Baptist church in Austria. This is a study of Köster's thought; of his deeds we hear little in this book. Graf-Stuhlhofer portrays Köster as one of the most trenchant public critics of National Socialism, indeed as a man of historic significance. As there are no manuscript copies of Köster's sermons Graf-Stuhlhofer cannot say for sure that the sermons were delivered in the form he uses as the basis of his book. His interpretations of this material are very daring. The occasional references made by Köster to National Socialism, if indeed that is what they were, are at best oblique, vague allusions. Graf-Stuhlhofer's conclusion that Köster is an overlooked prophet of resistance is speculative in the extreme. Indeed, his own evidence reveals a pastor who completely accepted that those in authority are placed there by God and should be passively obeyed for as long as it takes for Christ to return. In contrast to the conscientious objector Franz Jägerstätter, Köster took the oath of allegiance to Hitler and served in the Wehrmacht. In this study the Baptist is compared with the Old Testament prophet Jeremiah, who, however, in stark contrast to Köster, was arrested and imprisoned for publicly lambasting the sins of his nation and was ultimately (tradition has it) stoned to death by his own people. Köster would not approve of such a comparison.

University of Ulster Nicholas M. Railton

Worship in the Presbyterian Church in Korea. Its history and implications. By Seong-Won Park. (Studies in the Intercultural History of Christianity, 126.) Pp. 212 incl. 26 ills. Frankfurt-am-Main: Peter Lang, 2001. £22 (paper). 3 631 36402 4; 0 8204 4771 4; 0170 9240

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903695692

The title of this excellent book is misleading in two ways. It implies that the book will be a discussion of the role of worship in the life of the Korean Church, and that this discussion will be confined to the Presbyterian form of Protestantism. In fact, the subject of this book is much broader, being in effect a history of Korean Protestantism seen through its worship and in relation to the political and cultural history of the nation. Moreover, it really is a history of Protestantism as there is extensive discussion of the other Protestant traditions, especially Methodism, while reference is also made to Catholicism. The author shows the importance of worship as such in the unfolding of the great Pentecostal movement of 1907, its relation to political developments such as the movement for independence from Japan in 1919, and the centrality of worship in the refusal of many Korean Protestants to participate in Japanese State Shintō rituals because they were idolatrous, for which protest many were martyred. There is an

interesting discussion here of how the Japanese colonial authorities forced the Shintoisation of worship in Protestant Churches. The author provides the reader throughout with discussions of the changing style of worship: perhaps nowhere else can the general reader easily find information on the format of worship at a given time. Hymnology and the format of worship are also thoroughly discussed. The author concludes the work with a unique analysis of the relation of worship patterns to the architecture of churches in Korea. This is illustrated by many photographs, most of which have not been reproduced elsewhere. Three criticisms, however, can be made of this book. First, an index to subjects would have been useful in order to follow up various themes. Second, the author has not used the standard system for transcribing Korean names, place names and technical terms into Roman letters, but instead has used his own idiosyncratic system. Although a specialist can work out the original Korean words, anyone who did not know Korean could not relate terms in this book to those found in other materials. Moreover, the author has reversed the East Asian order for names and instead places the surname last rather than first. Finally, the author rather bizarrely Romanises Japanese words as if they were Korean – again making comparison difficult. None the less, these faults only mar what is an important work deserving consideration by everyone who is interested in the history of Christianity in East Asia, or more generally in the non-western world.

University of Sheffield James H. Grayson

Die Erforschung der Kirchengeschichte. Leben, Werk und Bedeutung von Hubert Jedin (1900–1980). Edited by Heribert Smolinsky (Katholisches Leben und Kirchenreform im Zeitalter der Glaubensspaltung, 61.) Pp. vi + 116 incl. frontispiece. Münster: Aschendorff, 2001. DM 34 (paper). 3 402 02982 0; 0170 7302

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903705697

For the centenary of the birth of Hubert Jedin, a colloquium to recall and evaluate his work, in six papers, was held in September 2000 under the auspices of the Society for the Publication of *Corpus Catholicorum*. R. Kottje reviews Jedin's early life in Silesia, his first research in Rome and his aborted beginning as a professor of church history in Breslau, which ended in 1933 with his removal, as the son of a Jewish mother, from the university. Working again in Rome, Jedin finished his biography of Girolamo Seripando and in November 1939 started another Roman exile, lasting ten years, during which he began his research and writing of the history of the Council of Trent. G. Alberigo insightfully treats Jedin's understanding of church history, especially as set forth in the programmatic introduction to the first volume of *Handbuch der Kirchengeschichte*. Jedin combined a Catholic faith-perspective on the origin and final end of the Church, which makes church history a theological discipline, with indefatigable work in the sources to retrieve and present the human achievements and failures of the historical Church. J. Köhler goes over Jedin's relation with his Silesian homeland, highlighting his realistic acceptance of its transfer to Poland after 1945. O. Engels treats Jedin's professorship in Bonn (1949–65) and presents his

planned periodisation, in four eras, of the *Handbuch*, which, however, Jedin was not able to impose on all the contributors. N. Trippen tells of Jedin's contributions at Vatican II as council expert and advisor to Cologne's Cardinal Joseph Frings: unpublished memoranda are cited from the Frings-Archive. K. Ganzer combines an appreciation of Jedin's work on Trent with critical observations about Jedin's limited perception of some fateful options made at the council, for example, the 1546–7 marginalisation of Seripando's Augustinian personalism of grace and faith, and the hesitations in the 1562–3 reform decrees about curtailing Roman curial interventions which in time impeded bishops in the reform of their dioceses. The symposium papers regularly draw on Jedin's autobiographical *Lebensbericht* (Mainz 1984), to which the contributors make helpful additions, some from personal recollections. Regarding critical issues emerging from Jedin's work, K. Ganzer does mention Alain Tallon's massive study, *La France et le Concile de Trente* (Rome 1997), which aimed in part at rectifying perceptions and filling lacunae left by Jedin. A major absence, however, is treatment of Jedin's *Katholische Reformation oder Gegenreformation? Ein Versuch zur Klärung der Begriffe* (Lucerne 1946). Jedin's influential conceptualisation must now be linked with variations and alternatives offered by H. O. Evennett, G. Le Bras, G. de Rosa, E. Cochrane, J. Bossy, J. Delumeau, M. Venard, P. Prodi and W. Reinhard. At the time of the Jedin symposium a major review was in the press, John W. O'Malley's *Trent and all that: renaming Catholicism in the early modern era* (Cambridge, Mass.–London 2000), a work organised around Jedin's 'classic position' and proposing what is needed to resolve problems left by his terminology.

Gregorian University, Jared Wicks
Rome

Preparation and fulfilment. A history and study of fulfilment theology in modern British thought in the Indian context. By Paul Hedges. (Studies in the Intercultural History of Christianity, 124.) Pp. xi+432. Bern: Peter Lang, 2001. £40 (paper). 3 906765 88 1; 0 8204 5311 0; 0170 9240

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903715693

'Fulfilment theology' is a question-begging label for a long-lived preoccupation among missionary thinkers with the divergence, common ground and potential convergence of impulses embodied in Christianity, Hinduism and Islam. Hedges sometimes refers to it as a 'doctrine', but more accurately illustrates it as a diffuse aspiration, sustained by a diversity of perspectives, sometimes scholarly, occasionally rigorous (for instance, the contribution of A. G. Hogg, William Miller's successor as principal of the Madras Christian College), sometimes opportunist. Hedges's book emerges from his doctoral thesis, and undeniably demonstrates the required familiarity with a substantial literature. His procedure, however, seems to have undermined any prospect of an illuminating general argument. Significant texts, from the foggy intensities of F. D. Maurice and B. F. Westcott to A. G. Hogg himself, along with many other recyclings and qualifications, sometimes of frankly acknowledged insignificance, are reviewed in the light of summary individual comparisons and passing speculations about

paths of theoretical influence. Text, at times, leaks incontinently into inflated footnotes. One misses the purposeful clarity of Eric Sharpe's essential study, *Not to destroy but to fulfil* (1965). Unfortunately, the allusion to 'the Indian context' in Hedges's title refers exclusively to the 'theological' literature he cites, by western and some Indian Christians, rather than to any broader configuration. His section on the World Missionary Conference at Edinburgh (1910), parked towards the end as ch. vi, might have provided a framework for a more ambitious analysis of 'context'. For 'Edinburgh' did, as he reminds us, explore general issues raised by the Christian encounter with other religions, and it is not difficult, with hindsight, to pick out the limitations of its Fourth Commission's Report. An instance from south India may serve to illustrate the larger, 'political' dimension that escapes Hedges's attention. He cites as authoritative a 1954 allusion to Madras Christian College as 'that outstanding achievement in Christian higher education'. Apparently uncertain about Principal Miller's understanding of 'fulfilment theology', he stresses the principal's strong reservations about conversion, and his alternative determination to diffuse 'Christian knowledge' among Hindus (p. 180). For Miller, however, as for Duff, who had abandoned serious hopes for conversion in Bengal years before, it was the institution's entire western educational programme that had to be seen as inherently 'Christian'. A Gladstonian imperialist, Miller urged his pupils to prepare for their providentially indicated fulfilment, as leaders of a nation under Christian guidance. An elite prospering in the shade of the Raj, they gladly concurred, and pursued opportunities assiduously. The most successful monopolised, as Justice Party leaders, the ministerial positions open to Indians in the Madras Presidency in the 1920s. Some of these, responding to favourable winds, would subsequently change back to join Congress. Untroubled by doctrinal issues, never burdened by thoughts of conversion, they assimilated at the college the gentlemanly culture and political skills of a constitutionalist regime. By 1930, when Hogg retired, and the College began its decline, the development of a complex, and suspect, nationalist politics was restructuring political arenas and confounding the vague evolutionary visions of the fulfilment theologians.

University of Birmingham Gerald Studdert-Kennedy

Oliver Tomkins. The ecumenical enterprise, 1908–92. By Adrian Hastings. Pp. viii + 184 + 8 plates. London: SPCK, 2001. £50. 0 281 05441 X

Stuart Blanch. A life. By Dick Williams. Pp. xii + 196 + 8 plates. London: SPCK, 2001. £16.99. 0 281 05412 6

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S002204690372569X

The same publisher has brought out biographies of two twentieth-century bishops in the Church of England; both tell stories of dedication and very hard work in parish and diocese. But the contrast in price tells its own story: Dick Williams's book on Stuart Blanch costs £16.99, while that of Adrian Hastings on Oliver Tomkins costs £50 for about the same number of pages in much smaller print. Blanch's episcopal years were at Liverpool (1966–75) and York (1975–83): he was an Evangelical leader and biblical scholar who was widely loved as being

also a man of the people; the photograph on the jacket shows him next to his bicycle and two small boys and all three are grinning. The author is a parish priest who was for a time Blanch's press officer, but his generally admiring treatment quotes a few criticisms and has as its main strength long extracts from the spiritually-minded correspondence between Blanch and his fiancée while he was away at the Second World War. Tomkins was bishop of Bristol (1959–76) and the publishers are right to be less optimistic about sales, although this is the last book to come from a distinguished and prolific ecclesiastical historian. Its main strength lies in the account of a long and creative involvement in a cause now less fashionable, the ecumenical movement. Prepared for this life's work by years as a member or leader of the Student Christian Movement, Tomkins achieved much on the staff of World Council of Churches but failed to influence his own Church to unite with Methodism. As a Roman Catholic, Hastings is highly sympathetic with the desire for the historic Churches' renewal and reunion on a strong theological basis but more detached both from the SCM and from the WCC, which flourished most before Rome joined an enterprise more difficult than its pioneers thought.

WINCHESTER DAVID L. EDWARDS

The mask of anarchy. The destruction of Liberia and the religious dimension of an African civil war. By Stephen Ellis. Pp. xix + 350 incl. 2 maps + 8 ills. New York: New York University Press, 2001. $19.95 (paper). 0 8147 2211 3; 0 8147 2219 9

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903735696

Why Liberia should so rapidly have descended into such a spectacularly terrifying form of anarchy has mystified many observers. Rather than explain and analyse, most journalists have instead focused upon the bizarre costumes and even more bizarre customs of the combatants. This was life, it seemed, at its nastiest, most brutish and briefest. And the whole horrible ensemble was crowned by evidence of anthropophagy, 'witchcraft' and other symptoms of what earlier generations of anthropologists described as 'primitive'. For those with a little more historical knowledge, this giddy decline was even more inexplicable; after all the modern state of Liberia had its beginnings in an idealistic re-settlement of freed slaves from North America, the vast majority of whom were serious about their Christianity. Stephen Ellis has chosen to explain the seemingly inexplicable and he does so with scholarship and a commendable avoidance of sensationalism. Liberia, like many states in other parts of the world, had fragile foundations. Its nineteenth-century Afro-American settlers, despite their origins, turned out to be as unsympathetic and predatory as any other kind of settler. Their hegemony, aided and abetted by international companies with interests in the commodities Liberia produced, most notably rubber and iron ore, exploited and then alienated the area's native population. When the inevitable rising erupted, it did so with all the violence that generations of repression virtually guarantees. The revolution turned in upon itself and a civil war ensued. The easy access to coercive resources assured by the cheapness of sophisticated weaponry in modern Africa resulted in a ghastly democracy of firepower; everyone can carry a

machine weapon that in seconds can obliterate a village; and a lot of villages have been obliterated in the past decade or so. Mass participation, frequently coerced participation of course, has ensured that the culture of this war is drawn from a very widely varied set of referents. The signs and the understandings of the participants are derived from those of the pre-colonial secret societies of the region, from varied recensions of Christianity and from synthesised Islam as well as from kung-fu movies and 'shoot-em-up' video games. But unlike those who have found it amusing to encounter cross-dressing mass murderers, multiple assassins in blonde wigs and gun-toting ten-year olds Ellis shows that this civil war is also a war of ideas. Like most wars, it is an intensely materialistic affair; but it is also, perversely perhaps, a serious struggle over meanings and over the control of the specifics that might allow one to evade death or illness or might allow one to pursue and enjoy happiness. Consequently the entire available repertoire of Christian and animist practices is to be found on the extensive battlefield that is now Liberia. Ellis has written a very honest and brave book about a ghastly human experience which has, one learns, much less to do with the primordial past than about the future.

School of Oriental and African Studies, London

Richard Rathbone