

Reviews

Jahrbuch für Antike und Christentum, Ergänzungsband 33 – 2002. Alvarium. Festschrift für Christian Gnilka. Edited by Wilhelm Blümer, Rainer Henke and Markus Mülke. Pp. xiii + 405 incl. 20 ill. Münster Westfalen: Aschendorff, 1999. €73.50.

3 402 08119 9

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903217978

Christian Gnilka's seminar at the Institut für Altertumskunde in the University of Münster resembled a beehive (an Alvarium). A succession of students emerged year after year to spread the results of his teaching and research into the academic and other professional worlds. Some of those, including Gnilka's colleagues, have returned to the hive to express their gratitude in a series of thirty-three essays dedicated to their master on his retirement in December 2001.

Gnilka was a classical philosopher interested in the writers of late antiquity, notably Prudentius and Claudian. He devoted much of his scholarship to exploring how the Christians of the fourth century absorbed and found use for the heritage of the classical past. The resulting *chresis* is the main theme of what at times appears a somewhat miscellaneous collection of contributions. Relevant to the main topic is Ulrike Gantz's analysis of Gregory of Nyssa's farewell oration in honour of Bishop Meletius of Antioch who died on 10 May 381 while presiding over the Second Ecumenical Council at Constantinople. She shows that while relying on Menander's arrangement of an *encomium* for a beloved friend, Gregory gives each noble quality attributed to Meletius a Christian meaning related to the character of Job, so that the bishop emerges less as an individual than as the successful embodiment of the spiritual life. In the same vein Rainer Henke demonstrates how in contrast to Lactantius' condemnation, Jerome uses Horace to illustrate Christian virtues, as does Augustine, though by more oblique allusions. Prudentius is represented in essays by Willy Evenepoel and Kurt Smolak, while historians will be interested in Otto Hiltbrunner's demonstration of how the highly esteemed craft of the Greek physician of classical society continued to flourish in the east under Christianity and Islam, the latter largely due to the influence of the Nestorians. Archaeology has not been neglected, as indicated by Hugo Brandenburg's detailed survey of elements of the architecture of the Roman basilica of St Paul-outside-the-Walls.

Taken as a whole, the main value of these essays is to show how Christian attitudes during the fourth century shifted from confrontation with paganism to the conversion of much of its heritage to conform with Christian ideals, hence ensuring its preservation in the new age. The editors are to be congratulated on their production, which as ever with the *Jahrbuch* is faultless.

GONVILLE AND CAIUS COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

W. H. C. FREND

The Church in ancient society. From Galilee to Gregory the Great. By Henry Chadwick. (The Oxford History of the Christian Church.) Pp. ix + 730. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001. £80. 0 19 924695 5

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903227974

For half-a-century Henry Chadwick has been contributing to our knowledge of early Christian history, covering an immensely wide range of subjects from Priscillian of Avila to Boethius, and *Early Christianity and the classical tradition* to Augustine of Hippo, to say nothing of his translations of Origen, Augustine and the *Sentences of Sextus*. It would be tempting to present the book under review as summing up a lifetime's scholarship, were it not that Chadwick's apparently inexhaustible energy may already have impelled him to the composition of yet another major work. Nevertheless, one may reasonably regard the present volume as a crowning, if not necessarily a final, achievement.

The first thing which must strike any reader is the immense range and depth of the author's scholarship. He covers a period of six hundred years with no diminution of information, or easy generalisations. As the history proceeds and the evidence becomes more plentiful, so does the narrative. Particularly impressive are the descriptions of the theological complications in the issues of the Trinitarian and Christological controversies. Free from the prejudices which marked some scholars of an earlier generation, for whom Arians, Nestorians and Monophysites were heretics, and bad, Chadwick brings out the complex nature of the *formulae* to which the ordinary episcopal voter, with no particular theological expertise, was asked to agree at the various councils. It is no wonder that so many looked wistfully back to the first Nicene creed as one that needed no further elaboration, especially when, as Chadwick observes, 'in Christian history ... the most passionate disputes have been, and were in the fourth century, between those who stood very close to one another. The issues were too often logomachies' (p. 226). It is also salutary to be reminded that an orthodox hero like Athanasius 'had a blighted reputation for being a man of violence' (p. 258) and that 'there have been few heretics who have not claimed the authority of scripture' (p. 290).

The style of the narrator is clear, enlivened by occasional colloquialisms and modern parallels. In the Diocletianic persecution, 'the see of Carthage turned out to be an exceedingly hot seat ... Some bishops "moonlighted" with secular jobs' (p. 149). It is startling to have St Cyprian's ecclesiology expressed in the form: 'The local church is a microcosm of the universal Church, the very spouse of Christ. She does not sleep around' (p. 154), and to be told that Gregory the Great's 'most time-consuming duty was to be executive president of a large investment corporation' (p. 661). There are copious references to original sources within the body of the text and (relatively rare) footnotes, indicating modern critical editions or discussions of debatable points. The long bibliography of modern secondary writings (pp. 698–713) makes clear the quantity and quality of work produced in the last fifty years. There has never been a better time to learn about early church history.

Given the length of Chadwick's book and the thoroughness of his treatment, it is difficult to point to any particularly dominating themes. One already has been indicated: his fairness – he seeks to give every individual a hearing, and not to denounce those who, in the course of history, have been found to have chosen the wrong side. He does not push his own religious convictions: at the beginning of the book Jesus Christ is 'a charismatic prophet from Galilee' (p. 5). He makes clear

the Jewish contribution to Christianity ('the Jewish matrix'), both in the Old Testament Scriptures and in tradition 'the Christians were keeping the main structure of the Synagogue calendar, but giving the great feasts an entirely Christian significance' (p. 26). He emphasises the fact that, even before the Constantinian revolution, it was impossible for the Church to opt out of dealings with secular society, though when he says that 'the paganism of the old empire was in no sense tolerant' (p. 255), we should perhaps qualify this by saying that pagans were generally prepared to tolerate anything except Christian intolerance, the Jews being a special case. There are admirable potted biographies of the principal actors in the drama. For the reviewer, the most significant feature of Chadwick's narrative is his recognition that church affairs were of practical concern to any Roman emperor after Constantine, whether he liked it or not, and his delineation of the steady rise of the claims of the papacy to the leadership of the Church militant, and not merely to a primacy of honour among the other patriarchs, as Justinian understood the matter (p. 622). 'It is painful to observe that even when the bishops of Rome and Constantinople were in total harmony about Chalcedon's doctrine, the issue of Roman authority persisted in keeping them apart. It was never going to be enough to agree with Rome in dogma if that were not accompanied by total submission to the Roman jurisdiction' (p. 600). For Innocent I, 'Peter and therefore all his Roman successors were the source of authority and authentic ecclesiality for all bishops throughout the whole Church' (p. 586). The problem remains.

Chadwick's history is likely to be a standard work for students for many years to come. It is therefore to be regretted that it costs £80, a large sum for the student, even in these days. It is to be hoped that a paperback edition will soon be available. It is possible that the size may daunt the beginner, for whom a shorter introductory volume may be deemed desirable, perhaps Chadwick's own *History and thought in the early Church* (1982)?

DURHAM

GERALD BONNER

The Bible as book, I: The manuscript tradition. Edited by John Sharpe III and Kimberly van Kampen. Pp. xii + 260. London: British Library/New Castle, DE: Oak Knoll Press (with The Scriptorium: Center for Christian Antiquities), 1998. \$55. 0 7123 4522 1; 1 88471 838 8

The Bible as book, II: The first printed editions. Edited by Paul Saenger and Kimberly van Kampen. Pp. xii + 164 + 44 plates. London: British Library/New Castle, DE: Oak Knoll Press (with The Scriptorium: Center for Christian Antiquities), 1999. £40. 0 7123 4601 5; 1 88471 892 2

The Bible as book, III: The Reformation. Edited by Orlaith O'Sullivan. Pp. x + 182. London: British Library/New Castle, DE: Oak Knoll Press (with The Scriptorium: Center for Christian Antiquities), 2000. \$55. 0 7123 4675 9; 1 58456 025 8

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903237970

These three volumes are the product of a series of annual conferences held in 1995–7 at Hampton Court, Herefordshire, under the joint aegis of the Van Kampen Foundation, devoted to the growth and maintenance of the collection of rare bibles of Robert and Judith Van Kampen of western Michigan, and The Scriptorium: Center

for Christian Antiquities, the home of the Van Kampen collection, whose function is to promote research into the field that it represents. The three conferences, at which the papers in these volumes were presented, cover that field, both in subject and time, very widely indeed. The first deals with the manuscript tradition from the Dead Sea Scrolls to the end of the Middle Ages, the second with the impact of printing from 1450 to 1520, and the last with the effect of this new art, divulging Scripture in the vernacular, as the engine of the Reformation.

Despite the uniform title, the theme of the three volumes changes, not merely in chronological terms. The first is for the most part unitary and technical. It deals with the mechanics of transmission, sometimes with a precision that requires some familiarity with the subject, as in Emanuel Tov's admirable analysis of the physical constitution of the Dead Sea Scrolls, sometimes more generally, as in Christina von Nolcken's examination of the Lollards and lay literacy. The early period is also covered by Stephen Emmel and Bastiaan Van Elderen, who deal with the Coptic tradition and early Christian libraries, and – this is particularly good – T. S. Pattie on the creation of the great codices, Vaticanus, Sinaiticus and Alexandrinus. The importance of Ireland in the further transmission is properly emphasised by Jennifer O'Reilly and Martin McNamara, noting the new importance of graphic devices, both in Gospel books, where the Name of Christ became a feature of Gospel harmony, and in the Psalms, where they provided a visual guide to people for whom alphabet as well as language were unfamiliar. Insular practice, more Northumbrian than Irish, as Christopher Verey points out, returned tradition to mainland Europe, although the special importance of Bibles to the Anglo-Saxons is stressed by Richard Marsden. Illustration, whether in the Arab or Armenian east or in books of hours, is dealt with by Lucy-Anne Hunt, Sylvie Merian and Christopher de Hamel. Best of all is Christopher Clarkson's relation of pictures of books in early codices to what is known of their binding structure.

The late medieval span of the second volume again centres on the physical attributes of Bibles brought about by printing. J. P. Gumbert expatiates on the layout of the gloss, and Karlfried Frohlich on the 'extraordinary achievement' of the Alsatian printer Adolph Rusch in giving the *Glossa ordinaria* typographic form. Paul Saenger and Paul Needham deal with the interrelated themes of the shape and impact of the Vulgate, while Adrian Offenburg identifies the earliest Hebrew printed biblical text. Julian Abad and Michael Abad discuss the Complutensian Polyglot and its sources, Kimberley Van Kampen, Guy Bedouille and William Sherman the wider issues of the diffusion of the Psalms, the impact of humanistic educational goals and reader response (as revealed in contemporary *marginalia*).

The last volume is sadly restricted in the main to English translations, apart from William Campbell on Luther's version of Romans, astonishingly first printed only in 1908. Thomas More's criticisms united the discussions, by Richard Duerden, Orlaith O'Sullivan and David Daniell, of 'authority', George Joye's underrated pioneering translation and William Tyndale's undeniable influence. The last two owed much to the entrepreneurial zeal of Antwerp printers, as did Coverdale, described by Guido Latré. Calvinism underlay John Knox's biblical translations (David Wright), as it did the pervasive English Geneva text (Francis Higman). Andrew Pettegree, Tatiana String and Andrew Hadfield all deal with the simultaneous impact of imagery, the last with that in the record of evangelism in the New World. David Norton finishes the volume off with an engaging recreation of the

debates of the 'Authorised Version' translators, based on the surviving records of those of their Victorian equivalents on the 'Revised Version'.

A further three volumes, covering three more conferences, are expected, although the fate and future of the Van Kampen Foundation has become entangled in a law-suit.

LONDON

NICOLAS BARKER

Art and the Christian Apocrypha. By David R. Cartlidge and J. Keith Elliott. Pp. xvi + 277 incl. 104 ills. London–New York: Routledge, 2001. £19.99 (paper).

0 415 23391 7; 0 415 23392 5

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903247977

It is striking how much Christian art from the early Church through the Middle Ages and down to modernity is dependent on the Apocrypha rather than on the canonical Scriptures. A number of popular visual themes (such as the Ox and the Ass at the Nativity, or the stories of the martyrdoms of Peter and Paul) have their textual sources outside the biblical canon, which means that visual tradition was probably the most significant means of promulgating the Apocrypha within Christendom. Despite its rather unpromising format as one of those ubiquitous handbooks which pass for academic writing now (all survey and no argument), this generously illustrated book is in fact an extremely useful introductory guide to the question of art and the Apocrypha. It opens with an introduction that provides a handy survey of the main Apocryphal texts (of which especially the infancy narratives were very popular in the visual arts). Chapter i, rather too briefly, justifies the need for the book by emphasising the significance of the Apocrypha for art: it might have been useful to see a discussion of canonical imagery to compare with that of the Apocrypha (with statistics, ideally, and an account of where canonical and Apocryphal imagery was mixed). The following chapters take on significant themes where the Apocrypha have exerted major influence – 'Mary', 'the image of Christ' (that is, the variety of his iconic images especially in the early period), 'the life and mission of Jesus' (that is, the narratives within which he appears), 'Paul, Thecla and Peter' and 'Apostles and Evangelists'. Chapters proceed either story by story or saint by saint, which means they are very handy for reference purposes. Despite the cover illustration (from a Caravaggio painting), almost all the art illustrated and discussed is late antique or medieval. While this is surely right in attacking the single largest *corpus* of Christian imagery, I suspect it underestimates the longevity of Apocryphal imagery into the Counter-Reformation and Lutheran art, let alone in missionary contexts. One might have appreciated at least one chapter that looked at the usage of Apocryphal imagery diachronically, with a historical perspective on what kinds of themes were popular when, and on the relation of trends in Apocryphal imagery to ecclesiastical debates over theology or heresy: even if the findings were negative (i.e. that there were no such relations) that would itself be interesting. It is a pity too that there was no space for Old Testament Apocrypha, given the significance of Old Testament themes especially in early Christian art and frequently thereafter – one thinks of Rembrandt's predilection for the Tobit story.

CORPUS CHRISTI COLLEGE,
OXFORD

JAS' ELSNER

Kreuz – Jerusalem – Kosmos. Aspekte frühchristlicher Staurologie. By Stefan Heid. (Jahrbuch für Antike und Christentum, Ergänzungsband, 31.) Pp. 295 + 8 plates. Münster Westfalen: Aschendorff, 2001. DM 94. 3 402 08116 4

Christus versus sol. Sonnenverehrung und Christentum in der Spätantike. By Martin Wallraff. (Jahrbuch für Antike und Christentum, Ergänzungsband, 32.) Pp. 248 + 8 black-and-white and colour plates. Münster Westfalen: Aschendorff, 2001. DM 98. 3 402 08115 6

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903257973

These two learned monographs explore key trains of thought in early Christianity, both set in the context of wider intellectual traditions prevalent in the Greco-Roman world. Although the cross as religious symbol might seem the exclusive preserve of Christians, Heid is able to trace a background of Platonic cosmology (from the *Timaeus*) which shaped some of the theological language and Christian representations of the cross. His volume is a rather sprawling survey of texts and iconography spread across some six centuries, which attempts to focus and unify the construction of a wide range of cross-related themes and images by reference to the local traditions and topography of Jerusalem itself: a good example is the cross which forms the centrepiece of the heavenly city depicted in the apse mosaic of S. Pudenziana in Rome. This reviewer found it something of a relief to descend from the ‘cosmic architecture’ to more earthbound sections of the book entitled ‘Jerusalem Konkretisierungen’, and to come face-to-face with the two monumental replicas of the cross which are known to have stood in Jerusalem in late antiquity, one at the summit of the Mount of Olives and one on the rock of Calvary itself. Heid’s volume overlaps with Wallraff’s where the multifarious coverage of the cosmic symbolism of the cross extends to its appearance amidst the representations of the Sun which rapidly entered the Christian repertoire. In what he sees as the predominantly monotheistic religious consensus of late antiquity, pagan and Christian alike, Wallraff effectively demonstrates the universal presence of these solar images and ideas. He follows his theme from its pagan background into numerous spheres of Christian expression: the theological language of Christology, the practice of prayer, church buildings, Sunday observance, the festivals of Easter and Christmas, the political theory of the Christian Roman empire, and not least an extensive range of Christian iconography inherited from a world of solar images. Wallraff rejects the notion of an aggressive polemic driving Christianity to refashion pagan images as its own, and is more concerned to emphasise a universal ‘Zeitgeist’ in which all shared in a common religious atmosphere: in fourth-century Rome, for example, 25 December proves to be a recently introduced festival which for some marked the celebration of the birthday of the Unconquered Sun, and for others the nativity of Christ – the latter cannot be seen to have been introduced deliberately to oust the former. Wallraff is also telling on the prevalence, and persistence, of solar themes in the literature and iconography of the first Christian emperor: from the triumphal arch in Rome to his statue in the forum of Constantinople (and other less familiar examples), to say nothing of Eusebius’ account of his vision of the celestial cross of light, the sun was no less a key player than Christ in the imagery of Constantine’s religious ‘conversion’.

Symbolic blackness and ethnic difference in early Christian literature. By Gay L. Byron. Pp. xii + 223. London–New York: Routledge, 2002. £50 (cloth), £15.99 (paper).
 o 415 24368 8; 415 24369 6
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S002204690326797X

This is not an easy read, with 129 pages of text followed by 45 pages of notes arranged in the usual unhelpful Routledge style, and divided into two parts entitled ‘Developing a taxonomy of ethno-political rhetorics’ and ‘Reading ethno-political rhetorics in early Christian literature’. Byron sets out to study ‘the references to Egyptians/Egypt, Ethiopians/Ethiopia and Blacks/blackness’ in Christian writings from the New Testament to the Sayings of the Desert Fathers, and she shows how ‘color symbolism’ could be used in a variety of rhetorical strategies. She does this most successfully with Ethiopians, as the term had a consistent meaning: people with black skins living outside the Graeco-Roman world. They could represent the total inclusivity of Christianity (the eunuch in Acts viii. 26), sexual temptation for ascetics (in various saints’ *Lives*) or an ethnic identity which must be abandoned by someone converting to monasticism (the Ethiopian Moses). Byron is less successful in explaining the uses of the term Egyptian, which she shows could be paired with Ethiopian or contrasted to it. Its meaning was much more variable: someone who was considered ‘other’ for having a dark skin, or for worshipping animal gods (in which case the skin-colour was irrelevant). It is harder still for her to make ancient words for ‘black’ (she concentrates on *melas* and *niger*) correspond to the modern label ‘Black’, since they could refer to skin-colour, hair-colour, darkness in the literal sense of absence of light (especially when associated with death), or metaphorical darkness involving sin. She has some examples where black skin and sinfulness are clearly equated, but in many cases sinfulness seems more likely to be described as black because it means absence of light.

UNIVERSITY OF WALES LAMPETER

DAVID NOY

The mid-third century persecutions of Decius and Valerian. By Reinhard Selinger. Pp. 180. Frankfurt-am-Main: Peter Lang, 2002. £22 (paper). 3 631 37716 9;
 o 8204 5381 1
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903277976

In the *Journal of Roman Studies* lxxxix (1999), 135–54, J. R. Rives published a notable article on ‘The decree of Decius and the religion of the empire’. He pointed to the lack of any particular context for Decius’ edict for a general sacrifice to the gods to be performed on an individual basis. While the emperor’s coinage showed no particular interest in religion, it was possible that the decree was aimed at consolidating the religious unity of the empire, just as the decree of Caracalla in 212 had aimed at consolidating its political unity. Christians stood outside Decius’ ambitions at their peril.

In his revised version of a Frankfurt doctoral thesis Reinhard Selinger would agree with much of this. More than most students of this vital episode in the history of the early Church, he places Decius’ edict within the context of normal pagan practice. He believes that the edict was connected with the emperor’s seizure of power in the early autumn of 249, and that evidence from the letters of Cyprian and other sources suggests that such sacrifices, organised by communities throughout the

empire, were in the form of the normal *supplicatio* (petition and congratulations) carried out on each imperial accession on a day chosen by themselves. The difference here was that Decius' edict demanded individual performance of sacrifice, in practice that it should be carried out by representatives of families.

The edict was not aimed specifically at Christians, but their failure or refusal to comply, as in the case of the deacon Pionius at Smyrna, would incur the death penalty. Valerian's two edicts of 257 and 258 were the first truly persecuting measures designed to weaken the hierarchy of the Church and lay hands on its property with the sanction of execution, as Cyprian of Carthage found.

Altogether, the author has thrown some valuable new light on a perplexing episode in Church–empire relations. He need not, however, have been so sceptical about the value of some of the *acta* of North African martyrs of the time, not least those referring to the continuing hostility of the people towards the Christians at this period. The translated texts of inscriptions relating to communities performing sacrifices to celebrate an imperial accession, and the forty-four known certificates of sacrifice from Egypt add to the merit of this study of the aims of the mid third-century emperors *vis à vis* the rising influence of the Christian Church.

GONVILLE AND CAIUS COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

W. H. C. FREND

The early development of canon law and the Council of Serdica. By Hamilton Hess. (Oxford Early Christian Studies.) Pp. xii + 279. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002.

£45. 0 19 826975 7

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903287972

This is a glowing review of a fine book, but it will end with a severe tailpiece. In 1958 Hess published *The canons of the Council of Sardica A.D. 343: a landmark in the early development of canon law* (Oxford). It rightly established itself as a clear, comprehensive and perceptive study of a complicated and important subject, fecund especially, but not exclusively, for the beginnings of canon law. Now the original study has been brought up to date in the light of new research by various scholars. There is no need to change the basic approach, which is to interpret the canons in the light of the peculiar circumstances of the breakdown of relations between eastern and western Churches, and the ecclesiastical and political devices which had been used by the eastern (Eusebian) party to oust their opponents, prominently Athanasius of Alexandria and Marcellus of Ancyra. The later controversies, especially about papal jurisdiction, which have distorted historical questions in many past studies, are scrupulously set aside. The revision has been well done, and the two parts involved read smoothly as an original study rather than the revision of the old book which they actually are. The value of the book has been greatly enhanced by adding a first part, covering the development of synodical practice from the beginnings to 343, a work in which the same comprehensive scholarship and shrewd judgement is applied to sparse and sometimes contradictory evidence. This addition accounts for the change in title. The result is a study unique in English, a reliable guide to all the historical aspects. There is a moderately good index, which would have been better if long entries had been properly articulated. An appendix offers a complete text of the three chief versions of the Serdican canons: the Old Latin, the Greek and the Latin

version of Theodosius Diaconus. These texts are copied from the synopsis in C. H. Turner, *Ecclesiae occidentalis monumenta iuris antiquissima*, I, 2/3 (Oxford 1933), 489–534 (textual basis of Old Latin at pp. 443–88). Hess now adds a potentially very useful English version. The relation between the three versions remains controversial: the Theodosian Latin was made from the Greek before the last revision of the Greek as we have it, but after earlier revisions. Whether the proceedings were originally recorded in both languages or one of them remains uncertain. The numbering and order differ in all three versions, and there are excisions and additions of whole canons. Sadly, when the book is so good, there are faults in the texts and translation, and below is some detail on those I have noted: they make me fear that more intense examination would reveal more. In what follows the numbering L1–21 is that of the Old Latin, GI–XX that of the Greek, T1–25 that of Theodosius.

L2. A bishop seeking translation may make the excuse that he is responding to letters from the people of another church: ‘manifestum est autem illum potuisse praemia, paucos et mercedem corrumpere, et clamare in ecclesiam qui sinceram fidem non habent tamquam ipsum petere uideantur episcopum.’

it is clear that he has been able to corrupt a few by rewards and payment, and [that] those who did not have sincere faith would proclaim in the church seeming to ask for him to be bishop.

Note first the redundant comma after *praemia*, which is accidentally added to Turner’s text. There are other redundant commas in the texts, especially in the Greek canons, usually by a computing blunder following on a subscript *iota* (six times in GIIIa.b.d alone; also GV, VIb, XI, twice in XII, XVII). Secondly, the impossible grammar ‘illum potuisse praemia paucos et mercedem corrumpere’ is allowed by Turner at p. 454, though correct (or corrected) in many of his manuscript sources (e.g. ‘praemio ... mercede’). The official proceedings cannot have allowed dog-Latin. Neither Turner nor Hess has thought of reading *illud* for *illum*, giving, ‘this point is clear, that bribes and payment could have corrupted a few, ...’; the next two canons both begin ‘illud quoque, ...’ Fourthly, even with the text as it stands, ‘potuisse ... corrumpere’ does not mean that ‘he has been able to corrupt’, but ‘could have corrupted’. In fact the *potuisse* construction may account for what follows: ‘... could have corrupted a few, and people without true integrity could have called out his name (= *clamare*) in the church ...’

L3b. In a dispute between two bishops ‘non ex his unus ex alia provincia aduocet episcopos’, ‘neither of these shall call [in] bishops from another province [to arbitrate].’ Surely *aduocet* implies not to arbitrate, but to support, to speak for, the contestant. Hess may be influenced by GIIIb and T4, ἐπιγγόμενος/*arbiter*, but that is an interpretation reflecting an eastern Church concern for the independence of each province, where even arbitration from outside the province is suspect, not merely partisan intervention.

L3c. If a condemned bishop has a good case and seeks a retrial, let St Peter be honoured: ‘scribatur uel ab his qui examinarunt uel ab episcopis qui in proxima prouincia morantur Romano episcopo; si iudicauerit renouandum esse iudicium, renouetur et det iudices, si autem ...’. Hess renders: ‘and let a letter be written to the Roman bishop, either by those who heard the case or by bishops who reside in a neighbouring province. If he [the Roman bishop] shall decide that the trial is to be held again, let it be repeated and let him appoint judges; but if ...’ In considering the various interpretations of this canon, Hess (pp. 191–2) accepts Hefele’s

argument that ‘uel ab episcopis qui in proxima prouincia morantur’ should stand later, as in GIIIc (superfluous commas omitted): καὶ γραφῆναι παρὰ τούτων τῶν κρινάντων Ἰουλιῷ τῷ ἐπισκοπῷ Ῥώμης, ὥστε διὰ τῶν γειτνιόντων τῇ ἐπαρχίᾳ ἐπισκόπων, εἰ δέοι, ἀνανεωθῆναι τὸ δικαστήριον, καὶ ἐπιγνώμονας αὐτὸς παράσχοι· εἰ δέ μὴ ‘... and let those who judged the case write to Julius, the bishop of Rome, so that if necessary the trial may be renewed by bishops of the neighbouring province, and let him appoint judges.’ This means that only in the (unlikely) event that the man’s original judges themselves want a retrial does Julius become involved, practically ruling out appeals to Rome by defendants. The Greek has probably been reshaped after the Theodosian version was made, T₅: ‘... et scribatur ab his qui iudicauerunt causam damnati episcopi Iulio episcopo Romae per uicinos episcopos prouinciae, et si oportet innouari iudicium, renouetur et iudicem ipse praebebit; ...’ Here it is the neighbouring bishops who are to approach Julius, as in the Old Latin, not as in the Greek. Hess has been deceived by the other versions. The original is probably the Old Latin. The case is that of those seen as unjustly condemned (like Athanasius and Marcellus), and appeal may be made by other bishops who have looked into their case (*examinarunt*, not ‘who heard the case’ = *iudicauerunt*), or by bishops resident in a neighbouring province.

L6 says that sudden petitions to another province of those from small communities for a bishop to be appointed, where one presbyter is sufficient, should not be granted unreservedly, ‘ut vilescat nomen episcopi et auctoritas, non debent illi ex alia prouincia inuitati facere episcopum, ...’. Hess mistranslates: ‘in order that the name and authority of bishop be not debased, those [bishops] invited from another province ought not to make a bishop, ...’. He has been misled into adding a negative by GVIb and T₉, where a purpose, attached to what follows, is expressed: ἵνα μὴ κατευτελίζεται/‘ne contemptibilis fiat.’ Plainly the Old Latin has a result clause attached to what precedes: no unreserved response to appeals for a bishop (‘licentia danda passim non est’) ‘so as to devalue the title and authority of the bishop’. Incidentally, at GVIb Hess omits ἀπλῶς, ‘unreservedly’, in translating the first clause (= L6 *passim*, T₉ *simpliciter*).

In L6 the last clause should be more closely translated: ‘si qua talis et tam populosa est quae mereatur habere episcopum’ is not, ‘if they are sufficiently populous to merit having a bishop’, but, ‘if any is of such a kind and so populous as to merit having a bishop’. The parallel GVIb has (redundant commas deleted), εἰ δὲ εὐρίσκοιτο πληθύνουσά τις ἐν πολλῷ ἀριθμῷ πόλις ὥς ἀξίαν αὐτὴν καὶ ἐπισκοπῆς νομίζεσθαι, λαμβανέτω. This too is inaccurately rendered, ‘And if there be found a city abounding in great numbers of people so as to be thought worthy of an episcopal [see], let it receive [one].’ The condition actually says, ‘If any city be found to be so abundant in large population as to be thought worthy even of the episcopate, ...’.

L7 is about a bishop deposed by the assembled bishops of his region (like Athanasius), if he has appealed to the bishop of Rome, ‘et uoluerit audiri et iustum putauerit {ut} renouetur examen,’ ... ; ‘and wishes to be given a hearing, and [the Roman bishop] thinks it just [that] his trial be repeated, ...’. Turner (p. 460) reckoned the subject of *uoluerit* to be the Roman bishop, and comments on the manuscript which read ‘uoluerit eum audiri’: ‘recte ut uidetur interpretans: cf graec’, i.e. ‘and he [the bishop of Rome] wishes him to be heard.’ Both GV and T₇ read it so.

The Greek of this canon GV is mistranslated lower by Hess: εἶναι δὲ ἐν τῇ ἐξουσίᾳ αὐτοῦ τοῦ ἐπισκόπου ὅπερ ἂν καλῶς ἔχειν δοκιμάσῃ καὶ <ἐάν> ὀρίσῃ δεῖν ἀποσταλῆναι τοὺς μετὰ τῶν ἐπισκόπων κρινούντας ἔχοντάς τε τὴν αὐθεντίαν τούτου παρ' οὗ ἀπεστάλησαν, καὶ τοῦτο θετέον, 'let it be in the power of that bishop, if he thinks it good and decides that it is right to send them to judge with the bishops, having the power of him by whom they were sent, Let this too be determined.' This needs minor clarifications: <ἐάν> is Turner's own addition, corresponding to the Latin; 'that bishop' means the bishop of Rome; and 'Let' is a misprint for 'let'. But Hess mistakes the sentence-construction. Translate: 'let whatever he may approve be in the power of the bishop [of Rome] himself; and if he decides that persons must be sent to be judges alongside the bishops, also having the authority of him by whom they were sent, that too shall stand.'

L16 has two departures from Turner's text (p. 522): The first sentence, beginning 'Hoc quoque omnibus placebit, ut ...', has a question mark added, and this is followed in the translation, 'And will this also please all, that ...?' Better to leave Turner's text and translate, 'This also will please all, that ...'. This agrees with GXIII, where we have the imperative, πᾶσιν ἀρεσάτω, '... may this please all ...'. The second deviation from Turner is the misprint in the acclamation, *seruabit*, where *seruabit* is correct and correctly translated.

Some of these errors are unimportant. But clearly the translations should always be used with caution, and any detailed argument requires verification even of the Latin and Greek presented.

ST ANDREWS

STUART G. HALL

Saint Augustine. By Serge Lancel, translated by Antonia Nevill. Pp. xviii + 590. London: SCM Press, 2002 (first publ. Librairie Arthème Fayard, 1999). £25 (paper). 0 334 02866 3

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903297979

This book represents a major contribution to Augustinian biography by a master. Serge Lancel is a leading figure among French Augustinian scholars, an heir of Henri-Irénée Marrou, Anne-Marie La Bonnardière and André Mandouze, to whose memories the work is dedicated. Lancel's many contributions to scholarship include the editing of the proceedings of the *Conlatio carthaginiensis* of 411 for *Sources Chrétiennes*; the production, with M. Bouchenaki, of the 3rd edition of the study *Tipasa de Maurétanie*; a history of Carthage; the articles 'Africa', 'Carthago' and 'Donatistae' in the *Augustinus-Lexikon*; and numerous articles in *Études Augustiniennes* and other learned journals. His erudition is vast, not only in respect of his subject, of whom he provides a massive 'life-and-writings' biography, but also with regard to the circumstances of life and administration in fourth- and fifth-century Roman Africa, making full use of the new information which has become available in recent years from the letters of Augustine published by Johannes Divjak, and the Mainz sermons discovered by François Dolbeau. Lancel's admiration for Augustine is unconcealed, so great indeed that some may feel that, while giving critics, ancient and modern, their due, he is inclined to dismiss their contentions a little too easily. Unlike some earlier biographers, he gives full weight to the decisive change in Augustine's theological outlook which occurred when he was writing to Simplicianus of Milan in 396 and

which brought him, at the end of his life, to a predestinarian theology which seemed, and still seems to some, to be a denial of genuine human free choice; but it is surely going a little far to say that the doctrine of original sin is an Augustinian creation (p. 12). Lancel recognises the contemplative aspect of Augustine's thought, stressing the apophatic element in his exposition of his doctrine of the Trinity. Despite the already ample size of the book, the present reviewer regrets that Lancel does not say more about Augustine's teaching on contemplation – he is, after all, a master of western medieval mysticism – or his eucharistic ecclesiology, impressively declared in book x of *The city of God*, where Christ, the great high priest, offers his own body, the Church, on the altar. The translation is clear and readable, apart from sometimes giving a French form of Greco-Roman names – Carneades appears (oddly) as Carneadus (p. 59) (the reference, incidentally, should be to *De finibus* v.2.4, not vii), Optatus of Milevis as Optat, Hilary of Poitiers as Hilarius – and a few unfamiliar words, like 'metayage' (p. 150), which would be more comprehensible to English readers as 'share-cropping,' and a reference to Augustine 'reliving the prodromes of his true liberation' (p. 39), which would mean little to a reader who did not know French or Greek, and not much to one who did. It is to be regretted that the translation was not verified by a native English-speaking church historian. These, however, are trivial blemishes. Lancel's book is a major achievement and will be required reading for English students of Augustine for many years to come.

DURHAM

GERALD BONNER

Nouvelles Recherches de chronologie augustinienne. By Pierre-Marie Hombert. (Collection des Études Augustiniennes. Série Antiquité, 163.) Pp. xiii + 677. Paris: Institut d'Études Augustiniennes, 2000. €65 (paper). 2 85121 180 3; 1158 7032

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903307973

This learned monograph is dedicated to the memory of Anne-Marie La Bonnardière, the great scholar who did so much to clarify the chronology of Augustine's writings. The author has had the notable help of F. Dolbeau whose publication of the Mainz sermons was accompanied by learned notes on probable dates. The first section of the book examines the likely dates of the books discussed in *Retract.* II. 6.2–26. The second part reconsiders the Mainz sermons discovered and published by Dolbeau. A shorter final section discusses sermons preached early in the fifth century.

Hombert's study is indispensable.

OXFORD

HENRY CHADWICK

Wandering, begging monks. Spiritual authority and the promotion of monasticism in late antiquity.

By Daniel Caner. (The Transformation of the Classical Heritage, 33.) Pp. xv + 326 incl. map. Berkeley–Los Angeles–London: University of California Press, 2002. \$65. 0 520 23324 7

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S002204690331797X

This important study, which began as a doctoral dissertation at the University of California, describes the social and economic history of itinerant monasticism in the

eastern half of the later Roman empire between 360 and 451. There can be no doubt that ascetic vagrancy was among the oldest types of Christian monasticism. The Pseudoclementine Epistles describe wandering, begging monks who prayed continuously, refused to work and claimed privileged support. Two centuries later men like the Syrian Barsamwa, Isaak of Constantinople or Alexander the Sleepless, whose fascinating *vita* is translated in an appendix to this book, acquired their high profile through an uncompromising imitation of Christ's homelessness and poverty. Closely following the sociological approach of Peter Brown's classic study on 'The rise and function of the holy man in late antiquity' (*JSt* lxi [1971], 80–101), Caner explores the role of these and other holy men within the late Roman system of patronage and power relations. He shows convincingly that from the mid-fourth century onwards these radical ascetics were competing with the ecclesiastical hierarchy for spiritual authority and material wealth. Polemical treatises, hagiography, disciplinary procedures and economic pressure were employed by the bishops and their allies in order to replace what Caner calls 'the traditional way of apostolic life' (p. 125) with a 'work-based pattern' (p. 4) until finally canon 4 of the Council of Chalcedon decreed the subordination of monks to the authority of the local bishop and 'intertwined the economic interests of the monks with those of their new episcopal patrons' (p. 241). Caner's emphasis on power relations and economics allows him to gain many new and valuable insights into the life setting of various patristic writings and to clarify several important episodes of fourth- and fifth-century history such as the deposition of John Chrysostom or the Messalian Controversy. But in his aim to describe a supposedly straightforward development from an 'apostolic' pattern of ascetic mobility towards a situation of increasingly enforced monastic stability Caner sometimes oversimplifies rather complex issues. Is St Paul's admonition to work in 1 Thessalonians iv. 11–12 less 'apostolic' than the praise of *amerimnia* in the Gospel of Matthew (vi. 25–34)? Or, to give another example, can the author's suggestion that the protomonastic *Covenanters* were identical with the wandering Apostles of the Pseudoclementine Epistles be supported by any testimony apart from Caner's own monolithic view of early Syrian monasticism? That said it must be emphasised that this book makes a number of important points and is therefore a worthwhile contribution to the early history of monasticism.

SOFIA,
BULGARIA

MARTIN ILLERT

The hymn of the pearl. The Syriac and Greek texts with introduction, translations, and notes. By Johan Ferreira. (Early Christian Studies, 3.) Pp. x+131. Sydney: St Pauls Publications, 2002. 0 9577483 3 7

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903327976

This originally independent verse tale, 100-odd lines long, of a prince who seeks a pearl and wins it from a serpent appears in the Acts of Thomas. Date? 300s. Original language? Syriac. The two versions, Syriac and Greek, are given here, with reliable English translations *en face*, introduction and notes. Provenance? Gnostic, Manichaean, etc have been proposed. Uselessly, I think, because this is a beautiful, dream-like piece with clear episodes but no internally prescribed 'meaning'. The listener is to do that, who could as well be a Buddhist as a Christian. The verse

addresses the spirit but eludes the mind. The introduction and notes in this good book say all that is necessary, though much that is superfluous, about a piece which has too often invited learned chatter.

HUDDERSFIELD

L. R. WICKHAM

Saint Gregory of Nazianzus. An intellectual biography. By John McGuckin. Pp. xxviii + 436 incl. 3 maps. Crestwood, NY: St Vladimir's Seminary Press, 2001. \$22.95 (paper). o 88141 229 5; o 88141 222 8

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903337972

The title page of the four volumes of Migne's *Patrologia Graeca* (vols xxxv–xxxviii) containing the writings and some of the *spuria* of Gregory reminds us that he was archbishop of Constantinople. What it does not tell us is that Gregory held this exalted and as it appears dangerous position for only about seven months, before he was effectively dismissed or forced to resign in late June 381 barely six months after he had been intruded into the see by the Emperor Theodosius in succession to the Arian Demophilus in late November of the preceding year. Even so the importance of this brief period and of the eighteen months that preceded it cannot be exaggerated and may well account for the great esteem in which Gregory has been held by the Church as The Theologian. Two chapters and 140 pages, over a third of the entire volume of McGuckin's comprehensive and minute survey of the life and writings of his hero, are devoted to two years of his life. It also emerges that out of a total of forty-five (?forty-four) surviving orations about a half were delivered in the church of the Anastasia during that same period. What also emerges from these pages, in addition to long analyses of the contents of the differing orations is something both of the violence of the religious factions in the city itself, vividly described on p. 257 and further evidence, if such were needed, of the fragile and naive character of Gregory himself, wanting power for himself, sad when shorn of it and yet when in possession of it sadly incompetent in his ability to wield what he so much prized. The present reviewer, while grateful to the author for opening up so much of Gregory, must confess himself not totally persuaded by the analysis of the intellectual development of Gregory, which forms the kernel of the book. At times also it seems as though the material had got the better of the writer. The writings of the other two Cappadocians might have thrown even more light on Gregory's own approach, but, unfortunately, there is little of this. For example, despite his insistence against Eunomius on the divine mysteriousness and his use on occasion of texts from Exodus xx and xxxiii with which to advance his case, was he as thorough-going in his approach to the problem as his namesake of Nyssa? As McGuckin well points out the language of light plays a large part in the sermons of Gregory Nazianzen, but is well known for its absence in the writings of Gregory Nyssen. Again his well-known dissatisfaction with the decrees and creed of Constantinople and also with his successor Nektarius is fully discussed in the final chapter entitled 'The twilight of a poet'. But little is said about his reasons for distancing himself from Basil's more cautious position.

JESUIT RESIDENCE,
LONDON

A. MEREDITH SJ

Victor Tunnunensis, Iohannes Biclarenis. Chronicon cum reliquiis ex Consularibus Caesaraugustanis – Chronicon. Edited by C. Cardelle de Hartmann. (Corpus Christianorum Series Latina, 173A.) Pp. 160. Turnhout: Brepols, 2001. €141 (cloth), €128 (paper). 2 503 01733 9; 0 503 01734 7
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903347979

The sources edited here cover the period 444–589, shedding particular light on its Christological disputes (Victor, ending in 565), Visigothic activity between 451 and 554 (the fragmentary *Consularia Caesaraugustana*; the editor argues convincingly for this little against Mommsen's *Reliquiae chronicorum caesaraugustanorum*) and events in Spain and the east between 565 and 589 (John). These sources were transmitted together from a very early point, and the editor's introduction (pp. 5*–160*: in Spanish) is largely devoted to exploring this transmission: the manuscripts and editions are described and discussed; the relationship between the manuscripts is established; the textual history is then reconstructed. Necessarily conjectural in places, the argumentation is nevertheless cogent. The introduction concludes with comments upon the three sources, a statement of the criteria for the edition (pp. 143*–5*; see also pp. 8*–11*) and bibliographical material. As regards the edition itself, the objective is to present a text as close as possible to that of the seventh-century archetype manuscript. In the only other critical edition of all three sources, that of Mommsen (*MGH Auct. Ant.*, ii, 1894), by contrast, spellings were regularised and classical Latin norms imposed. Like Mommsen, our editor uses the oldest extant manuscript, the thirteenth-century *Codex Universitatis Complutensis*, for her base text. But she also relies heavily upon two sixteenth-century manuscripts belonging to Juan Bautista Pérez; one of these is extant while the text of the other, lost in 1938, fortunately survives in photocopies. Mommsen depended upon other scholars' notes, sometimes inaccurate, for his knowledge of these. Marginal annotations by Pérez offer variant readings from two other, now lost, manuscripts, while a 1550s history of Spain by Vasaeus refers to another. All these sources are taken into account in the edition, the apparatus of which also gives all the relevant passages from Vasaeus as well as references to works manifestly used as sources for, or based upon, our text. Endnotes explain the reasoning behind problematic editorial decisions, and helpful historical commentaries, in English, on the *Consularia* (the text of which is incorporated in that of Victor but italicised) and John are provided by Roger Collins. The book has its weaknesses. While the lack of a historical commentary on Victor (readers are referred for this to A. Placanica's 1997 edition) is perhaps understandable, the absence of an overall index and bibliography is not. There are misprints: note especially 'V' for 'VI' (p. 7*, line 13), '465' for '565' (p. 100*) and '449–54' for '549–54' (p. 117). There are also inconsistencies, as exemplified by the same manuscript's being abbreviated as 'C' on p. 22* but 'Pa' on p. 76*. Occasionally, too, necessary footnotes are lacking – for references to Díaz on p. 7* and to a tenth-century inscription on p. 115, for example. But while failings like this irritate, they do not detract seriously from the value of this welcome new edition.

Society and culture in late antique Gaul. Revisiting the sources. Edited by Ralph W. Mathisen and Danuta Shanzer. Pp. xiii + 328 incl. map and 9 figs. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2001. £47.50. 0 7546 0624 4
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903357975

This volume comprises sixteen essays on fifth- and sixth-century Gaul; eight are grouped under 'From Roman to barbarian Gaul', and four each under the headings 'Religion and society' and 'Intellectual life'. A number of contributions make good the promise of the subtitle in straightforwardly presenting the evidence afresh: we have here new critical editions of the Gallic Chronicles of 452 and 511 (Richard Burgess), an illustrated catalogue of gold *solidi* and tremisses from late sixth-century Provence (Kevin Uhalde) and a lively survey of the epigraphic evidence for saint cult in Trier (Mark Handley). Three of the essays might be read as companion pieces to their authors' *Translated Texts for Historians* volumes: Ralph Mathisen's *Ruricius of Limoges and friends: a collection of letters from Visigothic Gaul* (1999), and Danuta Shanzer and Ian Wood's *The letters of Avitus of Vienne* (2001). Some contributors revisit their sources with a view to amending our overall picture. Guy Halsall on Childeric's grave and Bailey Young on the funerary basilica both demonstrate the value of respecting the autonomous witness of the archaeological record, instead of imposing a model derived from literary sources. Conversely, Mark Vessey on the *Epistula Rustici ad Eucherium* and Michael Roberts on Venantius Fortunatus' elegy for the death of Galswintha show how a proper attention to literary criticism can yield new readings of cultural and power politics. These essays, which close the volume, return the reader more nearly than might appear to the opening essays on the Visigoths by Andreas Schwarcz, Michael Kulikowski and Jill Harries, who comments that 'The Code of Euric, like so much else in fifth-century Gaul, was about power' (p. 46). What the volume lacks is an introduction where these and other connections are brought out – such as the culture of gifts in the Code of Euric and the fish-rich letters of Avitus of Vienne, or the formation of the Augustinian tradition in Gaul, the importance of which is clearly set out by Wood (setting a context for two other essays here, Charles Brittain on Claudianus Mamertinus' *De statu animae*, and Richard Bartlett on Ennodius of Pavia). The absence of a *Zusammenfassung* is a feature shared with J. Drinkwater and H. Elton, *Fifth-century Gaul: a crisis of identity* (Cambridge 1992), with which this volume explicitly invites comparison. The 'crisis of identity', it seems, is historiographical as well as historical and, ten years on, it is still unresolved. In part, the crisis is productive; on the other hand, as specialists of various stripes plough their separate furrows in the capacious field of late antiquity, we might take a cue from the Gallic Chronicle of 452, which passes from entries on the imperial court to those on Augustine and Cassian with an enviable fluency.

UNIVERSITY OF MANCHESTER

CONRAD LEYSER

The Roman Virgil and the origins of medieval book design. By David H. Wright. Pp. 72 incl. colour frontispiece, 8 black-and-white and 40 colour plates. London: The British Library, 2001. £20. 0 7123 4656 2
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903367971

Only two early illustrated manuscripts of Virgil's poems survive, the so-called 'Roman Virgil' and the 'Vatican Virgil'. These are unfortunate names, since both

are in the Vatican Library, and both were probably produced in Rome. Neither contains any direct evidence of its early origin or ownership. Inevitably scholarship has compared them, as Professor Wright does. This sets up one of those binaries which post-modern critical theory deplores, since it necessarily works to the disadvantage of one of the pair, here the Roman Virgil. Wright follows a consensus view that the more 'classical' illustrations of the Vatican Virgil were painted in the early fifth century. The images in the Roman Virgil are a striking contrast in the way contour is emphasised, in their unrealistic juxtapositions of scale, and in their use of colour. Scholars have responded in two ways. One is to see the Roman Virgil as a 'provincial' work, the other is to date it later. Wright argues strongly for an origin in the capital, emphasising what a magnificent manuscript this is in its size and the quality of its parchment. He also argues that this is a monumental painter learning to work in a new medium and format and becoming more successful as he goes on, and he dates the Virgil *c.* 480, comparing the only securely dated objects we have, ivory consular diptychs. He draws on the important codicological work he has already done to reconstruct the numerous lost pages. The Roman Virgil is presented in the title as connected to the 'origins of medieval book design'. A short excursus on Celtic and Anglo-Saxon book illumination of the seventh to eighth century does nothing to demonstrate how or why this might have been so. Curiously lacking is a detailed analysis of the relation of frame to picture-space. If we abandon our culturally produced obsession with three-dimensional seeing, then we can recognise what a master the Roman Virgil painter is in arranging objects on the two-dimensional picture surface. Though Wright identifies the subjects of the surviving miniatures, he has nothing to say about word and image in relation to patterns of readership. He takes no account of recent work deriving from reception theory on audience, orality and reading aloud, on the art of memory or gendered looking. Brian Stock and Mary Carruthers, for example, have much to say about a relevant and articulate reader, St Augustine. The main virtue of this book will remain the high quality illustrations available at a reasonable price and we can be grateful to Professor Wright for the trouble he has taken to ensure their accuracy. A new audience will now be able to appreciate these vivid and memorable visualisations of great poetry. Who that has once seen the famous image of Aeneas and Dido in the cave can ever forget it?

NEW YORK UNIVERSITY

JONATHAN J. G. ALEXANDER

Count Marcellinus and his chronicle. By Brian Croke. Pp. xvi + 300 incl. 2 maps. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001. £45. 0 19 815001 6
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903377978

Over the last twenty years Brian Croke has been a prominent contributor to the re-evaluation of late antique Christian chronicles, and more specifically he has been working on that of Count Marcellinus since the mid-1970s. *The chronicle of Marcellinus: translation and commentary* appeared in 1995 (see the important review by M. Whitby in *Early Medieval Europe* v [1996], 222–5), and this is the long-awaited publication of a revised version of his 1978 Oxford DPhil. thesis. The chronicle was written in Latin in Constantinople in the early sixth century as a continuation of that of Jerome, first to 518, and then to 534. It was subsequently carried on by another anonymous author

to a date beyond 548, which is where the surviving text breaks off. Marcellinus was an Illyrian, who spent much of his career in Constantinople, part of it as a *cancellarius* for Justinian, and the chronicle very much appears to reflect this dual 'Illyrian' and 'Byzantine' identity. Apart from the chronicle, he is known to have been the author of two lost works: a four-volume work 'On the qualities of times and the locations of places' (of which a fragment on Dara may be a survival), and a description of Constantinople and Jerusalem, also in four books. Croke has little difficulty in persuading us of the importance and interest of this text for our understanding of the Justinianic world. Its contents and structure have much to tell us about the Balkans, sixth-century Constantinople, the place of Latin-speakers in the Greek east, the role of chronicle-writing, and the development of a distinctively Byzantine political culture in the early sixth century; but unfortunately in none of these areas does the book fully deliver. Too often the coverage is either superficial or not sufficiently engaged with the current literature. It is symptomatic that Mango's 1985 book on Constantinople has made it to the footnotes, but has not affected the city map which still repeats Janin's errors of the 1960s. Croke has added an interesting section on the afterlife of Marcellinus' chronicle in the west, which reinforces the view that Bede's debt to Irish culture was greater than has been previously thought, but this was not what the admirers of his 1978 thesis were waiting for. Twenty-five years ago Croke showed us that Marcellinus could make a very effective focus for a big book on the sixth century. The opportunity is still there.

LONDON

MARK WHITTOW

The medieval world. Edited by Peter Linehan and Janet L. Nelson. Pp. xx + 745 incl. 76 ills. London: Routledge, 2001. £120. 0 415 18151 8

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903387974

This book appears to be an original literary genre in the field of historical studies: it does not claim either to cover exhaustively given periods of the Middle Ages, as does the *New Cambridge Medieval History*, or to survey the whole period in the way of American textbooks devoted to 'western civilization' from the close of antiquity to the Renaissance period. Peter Linehan and Janet Nelson have chosen to write – or make the thirty-seven co-writers they have enticed to take part along with them in this venture write – an introduction to the major problems of the Middle Ages in the western world: they have set off the main features and trends of the period along with the methodological problems its study entails nowadays. They have been thus brought to gather in one set 'reconstructions and ... views from multiple perspectives' (p. 2). Breaking free from traditional lines (political, economical, social, cultural history), the editors have centred their work on four main themes or axes: identities: selves and others; beliefs, social values and symbolic order; power and power structures; elites, organisations and groups. There ensues a rich, multiform panorama with the west as its centre, to be sure, but which allows full space to its neighbours (although the Muslim world has it better than Byzantium), to the non-Christian minorities (Jews and pagans), to the heretics. This book, beautifully produced and printed, also contains bibliographical updatings (one per chapter), maps, photographs, an index, and it should reach out also to non-specialists. It would however be wrong to see in it a mere introduction to the Middle Ages; it implies, on the contrary,

a sound knowledge of medieval civilization be it only in the field of chronology, which is absolutely lacking in the book. More than a general survey of the Middle Ages, it provides a full assessment of today's trends and latest question-setting in medieval research on an international level. One must pay due homage to the editors for having solicited contributions from several highly qualified 'continental' historians – rather a rare occurrence in Anglo-Saxon publishing. Yet, the absence of any German scholar is to be regretted. It seems only natural to come across several papers in the field of 'gender history' or relating to the analysis of rituals and the symbolics of power as well as the history of law and institutions – to quote as an example the remarkable paper by M. Ascheri, a brilliant rehabilitation of Italian cities as 'city-states'. Some papers are more clearly directed towards historiography – that of Dominique Barthélémy on chivalry, for instance. Others, such as the first-rate paper on heresy by Peter Biller, emphasise sources and the delusions and false evaluations brought about on an historical level by the survival or disappearance – often caused more by chance than anything else – of a given item in the documentation. On the whole, the book is highly stimulating with its very useful updating on basic problems. Such a piece of work does not have to be complete and it would be both absurd and all too easy to dwell on its inevitable gaps. Yet the lack of anything relating to the Germanic and Scandinavian worlds as well as to the Empire is to be regretted, all the more since the papacy is included. One wonders at the scarcity of elements connected with the peasants, who then constituted 80 to 90 per cent of the population, or with the village, which has become a leading point of investigation for medieval historians. The same thing could be said of associations, from religious confraternities to universities with their diversity and vitality, an original feature of medieval civilization. All things considered, what comes out of this series of essays is a picture of a rather elitist Middle Ages, leaning towards the city more than towards the country, nearer to the rulers than to the people. In this respect it reflects precisely the sources which are still extant, as well as the important problem of the relationship of representation to 'realia': a particularly live issue in current discussion and research. Not Jacques Le Goff's 'other Middle Ages' but the Middle Ages as seen by historians at the end of the second millenium – precious evidence of that remote period as well as our own.

ÉCOLE FRANÇAISE DE ROME

ANDRÉ VAUCHEZ

Rome and the north. The early reception of Gregory the Great in Germanic Europe. Edited by Rolf H. Bremmer Jr, Kees Dekker and David F. Johnson. (Mediaevalia Groningiana. New Ser., 4.) Pp. xvi + 308. Paris–Leuven–Sterling, VA: Peeters, 2001. €50 (paper). 90 429 1054 2

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903397970

This volume contains the papers read at a Germania Latina conference held in 1998, together with a number of additional, invited papers. It is eloquent testimony to the change that has taken place in Germanic studies in recent decades. As the editors remark, the Latin Christian culture embraced by the early Germanic peoples had previously been largely ignored, with more or less exclusive concentration on 'purely' Germanic constituents. This tendency is here handsomely corrected. Gregory the Great's writings are shown to have had a surprisingly wide

influence, not only in Northumbria, but in Old English, Dutch, German, Norse and Icelandic literatures. Nine papers are concerned with England, six with continental Europe. The opening paper (by Kate Rambridge) on 'The Northumbrians and Pope Gregory' is devoted to the Whitby author's *Life*, which she is anxious to show to be familiar with Gregory's writings and permeated with his spirituality. Oddly, what she calls his 'hagiographical strategy' is nowhere compared with Bede's (except in passing, in a single footnote), whose absence from the volume is striking. A paper on King Alfred's translation of Gregory's *Dialogues* (by Kees Dekker) plausibly concludes that it was part of Alfred's scheme for disseminating Gregory's teaching among the new generation of English clergy. Malcolm Godden, in his paper on Gregory and the Anglo-Saxons on the dangers of dreaming, is in the main concerned with the question in ritual purity raised in Gregory's *Responsa* to Augustine. Though he places the issue in the context of patristic discussions of nocturnal pollution, he by-passes the attractive suggestion (made by Rob Meens) that Augustine's doubts arose from his contacts with circles in England, perhaps Christian *Angli* who had received their beliefs from British sources. This is an interesting collection, though limited by its omissions, most notably of Bede.

NOTTINGHAM

R. A. MARKUS

St John Damascene. Tradition and originality in Byzantine theology. By Andrew Louth. (Oxford Early Christian Studies.) Pp. xvii + 327 + frontispiece. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002. £45. 0 19 925238 6
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903407975

With this study Andrew Louth comes to the climax of his trilogy of Byzantine theologians. After the mystic-liturgist Denys the Areopagite (1989) and the metaphysician-dogmatist Maximus the Confessor (1996) comes the schoolmaster-poet John of Damascus. How does the book unfold? Doubts about the reliability of the hagiographical sources cut an introductory chapter on 'Life and times' distinctly short. A companion chapter, 'St John Damascene and tradition', by presenting John as both an embodiment of the Byzantine theological culture of the eighth century and a shaper of its future condition, makes a virtue from consequent necessity. But Louth's subtitle is seriously intended: John's originality lies in his service, at once clarification and celebration, of a tradition. For the historical theologian, the next four chapters provide the meat of the book. After an introduction to the complex history of the *Pēgē Gnōseōs*, 'the fountain well of knowledge', where Louth profits from the pioneering editorial sleuthing of Dom Bonifatius Kotter, he proceeds to investigate the three principal parts of Damascene's chief work. And these are: first, the introductory 'Dialectics', a textbook of Christian logic and ontology; secondly, an heresiology, which in its informed dialogue with Islam adds to the usual (and not so usual) items on the menu a dish of considerable present-day allure; and thirdly, a dogmatics in outline. This is the *De fide orthodoxa*, that great synthesis of Eastern Christian doctrine, which was destined to have a glorious future in the Latin west through the translation efforts of Burgundius of Pisa. Louth's scholarly manner combines the historical analysis of literary connexions with the exposition of the ideas content of the texts and demonstrates an enviable familiarity with the entire

range of Greek patristic literature. Occasional sections giving the main themes their background in the history of doctrine will help those who want to enter the world of patristics not by the genetic method but, to the contrary, by starting from the end of the road and asking how we got there. After a substantial section on Damascene's contribution to the literature of the Iconoclast crisis, two charming closing chapters consider him as preacher and poet, the latter with assistance from the liturgical commentaries of that industrious early nineteenth-century Athonite writer, Nicodemus of the Holy Mountain. Professor Louth insists that the teaching of John of Damascus is, *au fond*, that of a monk and contemplative. But the intended contrast with a scholastic mode in theological procedure sets up a false antinomy. The refusal to linger on Damascene's logical writing on the apparent ground that his ideas are derivative from Porphyry and Aristotle sits uncomfortably with the principle that transmitting inherited material makes one no slouch. Possibly more could not be said without conceding that Byzantine Orthodoxy had its own scholasticism, something modern Orthodox are loath to admit. Still, a wonderful book.

BLACKFRIARS,
CAMBRIDGE

AIDAN NICHOLS OP

I capitolari italici. Storia e diritto della dominazione carolingia in Italia. Edited by Claudio Azzara and Pierandrea Moro. (Altomedioevo, 1.) Pp. 310. Rome: Viella, 1998. L. 55,000. 88 85669 69 7

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903417971

When Charles, king of the Franks, captured Pavia in 774 and made himself king of the Lombards, he extended Frankish rule into Italy. The process of the imposition of Frankish rule raises a number of questions. To what degree were Frankish administrative structures imposed or accepted? Does the surviving evidence indicate that old methods of doing things or old cultural allegiances persisted? What was the function of the Carolingian court established at Pavia after 781? Subsequent Carolingian rule embraced episodes of absentee kings as well as a long period as a virtually independent Carolingian kingdom of Italy with a resident king in the person of Louis II. An obvious body of material relating to Frankish rule in Italy comprises the capitularies, that is, royal legislation concerning Italy, promulgated by Charlemagne and his successors, as well as letters and reports from Frankish administrators. Fifty-six of these capitularies, letters and synodal records are assembled in this volume, in Latin texts (from the MGH edition but with revised dating) with Italian translations. It is divided into sections for the reigns of Charlemagne and Pippin, Lothar, Louis II, and Charles the Bald and later kings of Italy, and culminates with the 898 Synod of Ravenna. The texts are preceded by excellent introductory chapters on the historical context and on the value of the capitularies as historical evidence. This is not only a useful teaching collection but also a timely contribution, thoroughly *au fait* with current European historical scholarship, to our understanding of kingship and government in the Carolingian empire.

NEWNHAM COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

ROSAMOND MCKITTERICK

The medieval and Renaissance manuscripts in the Grey collection of the National Library of South Africa, Cape Town, I: *Manuscripts 2.a.16 – 3.c.25*; II: *Manuscripts 3.d.30 – 48.b.4–5*. Edited by Carol Steyn. (Analecta Cartusiana, 180.) Pp. xv + 244 incl. 104 colour plates; vii + 220 incl. 63 colour plates. Salzburg: Universität Salzburg: Institut für Anglistik und Amerikanistik, 2002. 3 901995 58 7; 901995 59 5

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903427978

This is the best collection of its kind in Africa, or for that matter in the southern hemisphere, so the publication of a catalogue is particularly welcome. It is beautifully produced, with numerous full-page colour plates illustrating 100 out of 114 manuscripts; these reveal what high-quality books Governor Grey was able to acquire in the mid-nineteenth century, like his contemporaries who created the rather similar collection at Keble College, Oxford. Although, as would be expected, there is a preponderance of liturgy and books of hours, the collection is very diverse, with significant groups of vernacular manuscripts. While this is immediately apparent from the summary index, the absence of a full index of authors hides the presence of Dante, Boccaccio and Petrarch, and Caesar, Livy and Lucan, who lurk unseen under 'Latin texts (secular)'. There is little medieval theology or canon law and no history. The span of dates is wide, the oldest manuscript (4.c.15) being a gospel-book from the Tours milieu, dated by Bischoff to the mid-ninth century; there is a goodly sprinkling of books dated before 1300, together with a number of fine humanistic examples. Lavish decoration of the very highest quality is a feature of a few books, and students of medieval English art will be particularly glad of the four plates of leaves from an amplified psalter (4.c.5) made about 1450, probably in London, and referred to more than once in Kathleen Scott's *Survey*. Early bindings occupy seven plates, including a portion of the Old Testament in Hebrew bound in a hinged box (6.b.1). The one feature of this catalogue that warrants criticism is the absence of an ownership index; this is truly unfortunate as a significant proportion of the books belonged to medieval religious houses in continental Europe, although it is thanks to Dr Steyn herself that the three of Carthusian provenance are already well known (*Analecta Cartusiana*, 167). For students of manuscripts in the British Isles the problem is not serious, since only two books were made here: the psalter already mentioned and a *Historia destructionis Troiae* (3.c.16). An imported book of hours (3.c.3) belonged to the recusant Wilsons of Petworth. This catalogue should command a place in all major research libraries and so it may be hoped that sales will go some way to relieve the financial problems that currently beset *Analecta Cartusiana*, an invaluable series that owes so much to the energy of James Hogg, not least in the final production stages of these two volumes.

UNIVERSITY OF DURHAM

ALAN PIPER

Ordering women's lives. Penitentials and nunnery rules in the early medieval west. By Julie Ann Smith. Pp. x + 246. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2001. £40. 1 85928 238 5

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903437974

This is not another study of the misogynistic exercise of power in the control of women's lives, although Dr Smith makes judicious use of that line of analysis. Her interpretive survey of early medieval penitentials and nunnery rules locates them within the process of Christianisation, as codifications of an intention to overlay

existing behavioural patterns and expectations with Christian ideals. She does not seek to determine their success in impinging on women's lives, nor to detect women's resistance, but regards them as establishing clerical expectations of how the world should be. Her examination of the penitentials covers not only tariffs relating to sexuality, but also those which relate to pagan practices and magic employed in traditional female activities such as the production of food and textiles. She believes that early medieval penitentials show a more compassionate attitude to women's sexuality than do later ones. Women are not constructed as inherently tempting or more prone to sexual sins, and unequal treatment is chiefly evident in the area of divorce. Penitential compilers viewed the lack of self-determination traditionally accorded women as a mitigating factor, and sought to establish their right to control their own bodies, and to guarantee their volition in entering marriage and in marital intercourse. In keeping with her overarching view of the penitentials, Smith regards the prohibition of pagan practices employed by women as a reflection of churchmen's recognition of their role as transmitters of values to their children. The question remains, however, as to why there is no comparable prohibition of pagan practices and magic employed by fathers. Requirements for increasingly strict enclosure inevitably loom large in the study of nunnery rules. Smith's study of these simultaneously explores the physical structure of nunneries and the rules' construction of them as sacred space. She also illuminates the daily life and experience of female religious by considering a number of other topics dealt with by the rules, such as domestic labour, food and clothing, prayer, reading and silence. She gestures towards her location of the rules within a process of Christianisation by observing that traditional expectations of women's roles had to be conditioned if female monastic life was to persist, and also by recognising churchmen's need to ensure the safety of monastic women and to protect the reputation of the Church, but she argues persuasively that strict enclosure had deleterious effects on female monasticism. Radical historians of sexuality and gender are likely to consider that Smith has gone too far in her sympathetic understanding of churchmen's motives, but that should not prevent recognition of her success in establishing the value of the penitentials for social and cultural historians of all kinds. Nor should it obscure the value of her identification and description of the major penitentials and rules of the early medieval period. Her analysis of the variety of religious lifestyles represented by the rules, and their ultimate blurring of the distinction between canonesses and nuns, is particularly informative. *Ordering women's lives* is a highly readable and refreshing study. Although unostentatiously presented, it merits serious attention.

UNIVERSITY OF AUCKLAND

STEPHANIE HOLLIS

The royal patronage of liturgy in Frankish Gaul. To the death of Charles the Bald (877). By Yitzhak Hen. (Subsidia, 3.) Pp. xii + 180. London–Woodbridge: Boydell Press (for the Henry Bradshaw Society), 2001. £35. 1 870252 152; 01352 1047
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903447970

Yitzhak Hen's preface explains the genesis of this volume, which he sees as 'an analysis ... of the mechanisms which stood behind some of the most interesting liturgical developments which characterized early medieval Gaul'. A brief account of liturgy and liturgical studies praises Vogel, Palazzo and Rasmussen: it is followed

by a discussion of the patronage of culture. Church leaders were not patrons but executors, and so 'royal patronage is the core of the matter'. But the royal hymns of King Chilperic are not discussed. Merovingian liturgy 'seems to be the pre-occupation of ecclesiastical entrepreneurs', and so is diverse and local. Royal patronage begins with prayers for the ruler in monasteries under Dagobert and Balthild, and Pippin III and Charlemagne sought to reform Church and liturgy according to Roman models. Hen's analysis of that process is careful: he rightly criticises Vogel and the over-imaginative monograph by P. Bernard, and suggests that the Gelasian Sacramentary is a creation of Pippin's reign, as the Gregorian is that of his son's. He argues that this is not 'Romanising', nor is that term helpful for analysis of the policies of Louis the Pious and Charles the Bald. Both were chiefly interested in liturgical experiment within a context of royal ritual. Hen commands the literature, though he might have consulted the *École des Chartes* thesis by Rémy Burget on the Merovingian offertory rituals and prayers (of which a summary is available at www.enc.sorbonne.fr/thèses/2000/burget.htm), which suggests that Roman usages were known in seventh- as well as eighth-century Frankish sacramentaries. Yet he is reluctant to discuss the contents of the many manuscripts he knows: his search for royal patronage and propaganda will not lead to the analysis of how Alcuin or Benedict of Aniane's additions to the Gregorian Sacramentary created a new attitude to the penitent sinner. The prayerbook of Charles the Bald would seem a clue to that ruler's liturgical concerns: but the edition by F. Ninguarda, bishop of Scala (Ingoldstadt 1583) is not cited, nor is Charles's antiphonary explored. With the key of patronage we may tidy cupboards: it will not let us into the church.

KING'S COLLEGE,
LONDON

DAVID GANZ

The promise of obedience. A ritual history. By Leon F. Strieder. (A Pueblo Book.) Pp. xi + 155. Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 2001. \$19.95 (paper). 0 8146 6016 9

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903457977

The promise of obedience dealt with in this adaptation of a doctoral thesis for the Pontifical Liturgical Institute in Rome is that which came to be included in ordination rites from the tenth century on, though Strieder argues (not quite convincingly) that the practice has earlier roots in the conferring of the pallium by the pope on metropolitans. The obedience formula is traced through many wordings and a variety of locations within the ordination liturgy, from the Romano-German Pontifical of c. 950 through the reforms mandated by the Council of Trent, with a separate chapter devoted to the related matter of monastic and mendicant promises of obedience. This is followed by analysis in minute detail of various twentieth-century documents, mainly those of Vatican II, and of the 1990 Roman Catholic revision of ordination rites (with a brief nod at the variations permitted to uniate Eastern Churches). The agenda underlying the historical treatment is informed by the current emphasis on acculturation, and the conclusions advanced at the end of the book could well be pondered by those of other communions than the Roman. Unfortunately, though, the treatment of the subject through the sixteenth century (which takes up more than half the volume) is somewhat superficial – much seems

to have been taken from two or three standard manuals of church history, with little attempt at a critical handling of sources – and the levels of discussion and citation are quite uneven. There is no index.

UNIVERSITY OF NORTH CAROLINA

RICHARD W. PFAFF

The heads of religious houses. England and Wales, I: 940–1216. 2nd edn. (First publ. 1972: rev. ante xxiv. 63–4.) Edited by David Knowles, C. N. L. Brooke and Vera London. Pp. xlvii + 360. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001. £45. 0 521 80452 3

The heads of religious houses. England and Wales, II: 1216–1377. Edited by David Smith and Vera London. Pp. xlviii + 730. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001. £75. 0 521 80271 7
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903467973

When *Heads of religious houses*, I: 940–1216 first appeared in 1972, one reviewer wrote that while a second edition incorporating *addenda* and *corrigenda* would inevitably become necessary, this would not be for a long time. Three decades is a long time in scholarship, and the much-desired second edition has not come a year too soon. Additional information on some 900 individuals has been added to the list of approximately 3,000 heads of English and Welsh religious houses assembled for the first edition, and the bibliography has been augmented accordingly. In many cases, the additions provide substantial quantities of new information, as well as economical evaluation of ambiguous documentary data. The *addenda*, *corrigenda* and additional bibliography (of almost 300 items) are not incorporated into the original catalogue, but appended *en bloc* – and in larger print – to a more-or-less exact reprint of the first edition. Thus, redundant information noted in the *corrigenda* is reproduced. However, asterisks appear alongside the names of superiors about whom fresh details have emerged, and the system is perfectly clear: where one sees an asterisk, one turns to the *addenda* and *corrigenda*. The new volume, *Heads of religious houses*, II: 1216–1377, follows the format of the first by cataloguing all known superiors of English and Welsh monasteries, canonries and nunneries chronologically. Houses are listed alphabetically and by order of profession: Benedictine, Cistercian, Augustinian, etc. Following a trend that now seems to be set in stone, female religious houses and their heads are listed separately after the male ones (does this method help or hinder our historical conception of the religious orders?). That *HRH* II contains more than twice as much data as its companion volume, despite covering some ninety houses and a full century less, is testimony to the comparative richness of documentation available for the Plantagenet period. It also highlights the growth of academic interest in later medieval religious history: many of the sources listed in the vast bibliography (pp. ix–lxiv) have been published during the last twenty-five years or so. *HRH* II contains the names and dates of approximately 9,400 heads of almost 800 houses, along with references to the main documentary evidence for each. These references frequently provide interesting biographical data: as ever, God is in the detail. Thus we read of a pilgrimage to Assisi here and posthumous miracles there; a pardon for clipping money and consorting with Jews, a Benedictine abbot ‘qui erat pessimus quasi hereticus’, etc. etc. Where relevant, secondary literature is cited, and ambiguities in the source material are succinctly assessed. The utility of such a work

does not require emphasis to anyone likely to use it. *HRH II* already stands alongside its companion volume as one of the most important reference books available to English and Welsh medievalists, and when the project is completed with a third volume (1377–1540), we will have as full an account as possible of an exceptionally important class of individual. Ideally, of course, companion studies documenting religious men and women below the level of superior are needed for a balanced understanding of the institutions represented in *HRH II* (a number of scholars have already shown what is possible in this regard). By themselves, however, these two volumes constitute a major contribution to the grand and continuing project of unlocking the Middle Ages.

CLARE COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

JULIAN LUXFORD

Anglo-Saxon Coventry and its churches. By Steven Bassett. (Dugdale Society Occasional Papers, 41.) Pp. ii + 33 incl. 5 figs. Stratford-upon-Avon: The Dugdale Society, 2001. £5 (paper) + 75p post and packing from The Secretary, Dugdale Society, Shakespeare Centre, Stratford-upon-Avon CV37 6QW. 0 85220 078 1

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S002204690347797X

Steven Bassett begins this book with the salutary warning that his subject is at first sight one ‘about which no responsible historian could find anything worthwhile to say for anything more than a few minutes’ (p. 1). There follows a short, but lucid reconstruction of the pre-Conquest ecclesiastical history of Coventry. The tradition of Godiva’s *mynstre* having been preceded by a nunnery dedicated to St Osburga is mentioned (p. 2, citing fourteenth- and fifteenth-century material), though the important reference to Archbishop Æthelnoth transmitting a relic of St Augustine of Hippo there in 1022 is not (see discussion in *English episcopal acts*, XIV: *Coventry and Lichfield, 1072–1159* [Oxford 1997], p. xxv n. 10 similarly citing J. Hunt, ‘Piety, prestige or politics? The house of Leofric and the foundation and patronage of Coventry Priory’, in G. Demidowicz [ed.], *Coventry’s first cathedral: the cathedral and priory of St Mary’s* [Stanford 1994], at p. 101). Neither is the separate tradition of St Nicholas, away in the south-west suburb of Radford, being the city’s earliest church given any consideration (see VCH, *Warwicks*, viii. 6, 318, 330, citing John de Fordun, *Scotichronicon*, ed. T. Hearne [1722], v. 1438 for this church supposedly in existence c. 1003); note that the editors of the VCH in 1969 were evidently able to find evidence of both this church and its priest in 12th-century corporation deeds (VCH, *Warwicks*, viii. 31, 339 n. 79). We are reminded ‘that there is a range of viable explanations of the origins of Holy Trinity and St Michael’s and that this reinforces ‘the need to consider that in their present form one or other of them may occupy the site of a pre-Conquest church’ (p. 6). It is argued that it was the pre-existence of Holy Trinity on its present site which caused Leofric and Godiva when building the cathedral’s cloister to position it, most inconveniently, and unconventionally, to the north, rather than to the south of the abbey church. This point is reinforced by the lack of parochial status ever possessed by the cathedral: the fact that it was never extra-parochial and always deemed part of Holy Trinity parish is crucial here, as is the point that, it is argued, at least five separate churches can be securely located in the same churchyard before 1200. Unfortunately no account has been taken of this

reviewer's analysis of the one surviving original charter from the cathedral church – Bishop Gerard Pucelle's *actum* of 1183 × 4 – and its textual transmission (*EEA* xiv. 98–101; see also *EEA* xvii. no. 3 and n.). As I showed there, in his otherwise entirely admirable edition of documents relating to medieval Coventry, Coss was guilty in this document of silently extending an initial capital 'R' to read *Ricardi*, that is Bishop Richard Peche, rather than to read *Rogeri*, meaning his predecessor Roger de Clinton, without the warrant of either the original charter, an *inspeximus* of it issued in the fourteenth century, or even the sixteenth-century Gregory leger-book, whose author made the correct inference. This leads our author to misdate some of the crucial points in the abbey's twelfth-century history, notably the charter which has become known as Earl Ranulf II's confirmation of 'the earl's half' of Coventry and St Michael's to the abbey, which probably should be dated 1144 × 6. His reconstruction, and mapping, of the probable bounds of the early minster *parochia* of Coventry and its neighbours, focusing on Stoneleigh, Leek Wootton and St Mary's, Warwick, is, however, extremely attractive. The argument is then presented that St Michael's church was also a pre-Conquest foundation, perhaps founded by Leofric and Godiva for the former parishioners of St Osburga's *mynstre* who were not to be tenants of their reformed abbey, or perhaps for those whose parochial care did not, for one reason or another, pass at this time to Stoneleigh, if the latter had indeed once been a dependency of early Coventry. Thus the author is able to show that the role of Coventry as an important central place can be pushed back into the earlier Anglo-Saxon period, despite the paucity of real evidence.

HUGHES HALL,
CAMBRIDGE

M. J. FRANKLIN

Scholastic humanism and the unification of Europe, II: The heroic age. By R. W. Southern, with notes and additions by Lesley Smith and Benedicta Ward. Pp. xi + 228. Oxford–Cambridge, Mass: Blackwell, 2001. £50 (cloth), £19.99 (paper).
0 631 19112 7; 0 631 22079 8

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903487976

To say that the impact of the schools on European society is the theme of Southern's three-volume work would be not to understate but to miss its purpose, and its achievement. Its conceptual scope and its importance is far greater than that of a learning-and-society type study: the contention is that it was the scholastic endeavour which was directly responsible for the organisation of European society and government into the forms which have influenced every subsequent century. Or more precisely, that it was the work of the masters active between *c.* 1070/80 and *c.* 1160 which 'reshaped European society' (vol. ii. 4), while their successors are marginal to this development. This second volume focuses on this 'heroic' period, but its purpose is not to carry that argument: the thesis is developed in volume i (see review this *JOURNAL* xlviii [1997], 159–61), with the subsequent volumes conceived as complements rather than continuations, pursuing specific themes in greater detail. So while attention is called throughout to that central argument, the focus here is really on two things: methods and personalities. Indeed the most immediately attractive thing about this book is the real talent with which Southern captures character, often with only a few spare strokes. Of course, personification is dangerous ground even when as stripped of indulgence and as credible as it is here. But the examination of

methods is the more important contribution: at the heart of volume i is, of course, the impact on all aspects of life of the systematisation of knowledge – that seminal contribution of the ‘heroic age’ masters to European civilisation. But what knowledge needed to or could be systematised, and how was this to be done? It is easy to talk admiringly of the growth of systematic thought, but here the process is closely examined: the specific methods and principles of organisation applied, the laborious attempts to master the materials. This is not just interesting background: the eventual influence or obscurity of a master or a work depended on the utility of each particular endeavour. Geniuses like Hugh of St Victor and Abelard produced works which could not serve ‘governmental purposes’ (p. 65) and their influence rapidly evaporated; similarly Gilbert de la Porrée, whose ‘minor place’ (p. 132) in scholasticism is emphatically not attributed to St Bernard’s overrated interventions. This might seem like amusing iconoclasm, setting failed geniuses against towering pedants like Anselm of Laon or Peter Lombard (although this would be entirely to misunderstand the complex and original analyses presented here). But the point is that it is the achievement of a working system, not the brilliance of particular advances, which has determined the shape of our world. A final section looks at examples of scholars in the world and revisits some of Southern’s earlier work, but the real interest of this volume lies in this study of the mechanics behind the development of a ‘systematic world view’ (p. 57): it is an indispensable supplement to an immensely important work.

UNIVERSITY OF HULL

JULIAN HASELDINE

A descriptive catalogue of the medieval manuscripts in Worcester cathedral library. Edited by R. M. Thomson (with Michael Gullick). Pp. xlviii + 256 incl. 6 figs + colour frontispiece and 50 black-and-white plates. Cambridge: D. S. Brewer (for the Dean and Chapter of Worcester Cathedral), 2001. £95. 0 85991 618 9
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903497972

The medieval libraries of Britain have been faring well lately. Not only is the publication of the medieval catalogues that survive nearing completion (nine volumes have appeared since 1990 and the other eight are expected within three years), but Rodney Thomson from his unpromising base at Hobart has conducted a sustained campaign of cataloguing in cathedral libraries. He began with Lincoln (1989), went on to complete Roger Mynors’s work at Hereford (1993), and now adds Worcester; as at Hereford, he has called on the expertise of Michael Gullick for descriptions of the bindings. Together with his volumes on Bury St Edmunds, St Albans and William of Malmesbury, these catalogues have earned him much the same stature in medieval studies as M. R. James had a century ago. A glance at the previous catalogue of the library at Worcester (1906) shows the difference in expectations that that century has brought. His achievement is all the more impressive because despite permission to take some of the manuscripts to university libraries, he has had to work mostly on the spot, away from modern scholarly aids. After a wide-ranging and highly informative introduction, the new catalogue treats in scrupulous detail 277 manuscripts (without the few already treated by Ker), predominantly of sermons and scholastic theology; among cathedrals, only Durham has a larger collection. The hands and *marginalia* of identifiable monks receive especial attention, and many links

with Oxford emerge. In F 106 someone in the 1290s presents a pupil for a doctorate in canon law and adds 'from this moment he will take over my lectures and my pupils, but I reserve the right to take them back when it suits me, because as my friends know I intend to lecture *anno futuro*'. The 'Index of incipits' runs to fifty-four pages, and there is an 'Index of manuscripts' and a 'General index'. A few snatches of verse go unattributed, pardonably with so much else to do; Ovid wrote several of them, and 'Mar[tialis] cocus' in F 1 conceals Godfrey of Winchester (*Liber proverbiorum* 131.3–4). My only complaint is one that I voiced in this JOURNAL xlviii (1997) 530–1 about another catalogue: it offers too much implausible Latin. A sermon that appears in both F 71 and Q 6 has its first sentence garbled in one place and its lemma ('text') in the other, so that it enters the 'Index of incipits' under both *Fuit* and *Sunt*, and the lemma of one in Q 74 appears as 'Elegite et non abiecti te.' The abbreviation for *tantum* is often resolved as *tamen*, even in 'not only ... but also'. Scribes allegedly wrote in F 126 (twice) that 'quod oculos non videt' the heart does not grieve over; also in F 126 'Solent pauperes sedes ad partam templi (sedere ad portam)'; in F 80 at the end of a hexameter 'fedam rumpit (federa)'; in Q 11 'inveniendi sumus scuto (muniendi)'; in Q 67 '[Ad]iuvat homo exemplum ([S]umat)'; in Q 74 'Dominus noster I. C. turban se sequentem cibo paravit corporali (pavit)'; in Q 100 'in mari processe (procelle)'. That apart, Thomson deserves every congratulation. Where next?

PEMBROKE COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

MICHAEL D. REEVE

William of Malmesbury, *The deeds of the bishops of England (Gesta pontificum anglorum)*.

Translated by David Preest. Pp. xv + 320. Woodbridge: Boydell, 2002. £25 (paper). 0 85115 884 6

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903507977

William of Malmesbury's *Gesta pontificum anglorum* is an ecclesiastical history of England from the time of the Augustinian mission until 1125. Its only precursor, partly also its model, is Bede's *Ecclesiastical history of the English people*, completed in 731. The *Gesta pontificum* is a much-admired work, but little known outside a small circle of specialists. Always more popular, and first translated in the early nineteenth century, was its twin, the same writer's *Gesta regum anglorum*, his secular history of England over the same period. The mere fact that Preest's is the first-ever English translation of a text of such central importance, and written in difficult Latin, makes it a notable achievement. Moreover, the translation is elegant and, so far as I have been able to check, accurate. The book is sensibly designed and priced for a wide readership, which, one hopes, would include undergraduates. William's text has been made the more accessible by the provision of running heads, (editorial) chapter headings, and by an index mainly of personal and place-names. The footnotes are basic as is to be expected; there are a few 'howlers', but in the main they are helpful and sometimes acute. The introduction is very short, essentially William-without-tears, but again contains useful and astute observations, not least about the uniqueness and value of the work. The select bibliography, on the other hand, is not only brief, but rather eccentric.

UNIVERSITY OF TASMANIA

R. M. THOMSON

Die Prüfeninger Vita Bischof Ottos I. von Bamberg nach der Fassung des Grossen österreichischen Legendars. Edited by Jürgen Petersohn. (Monumenta Germaniae Historica [Scriptores, 7.] Scriptores rerum Germanicarum in usum scholarum separatim editi, 71.) Pp. viii + 174. Hanover: Hahnsche Buchhandlung, 1999. DM 42. 3 7752 5471 4; 0343 0820

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903517973

The earliest *Life* of the twelfth-century 'Apostle of Pomerania', Bishop Otto of Bamberg (1102–39), is transmitted in the *Magnum legendarium Austriacum* of the late twelfth century. The legendary was probably compiled in association with Otto's canonisation in 1189. Petersohn's new edition argues that this *Life*, the first in a succession of accounts of the saint, and upon which all subsequent *Lives* drew, was probably written c. 1140–6, that is shortly after Otto's death, by an anonymous member of the community of Otto's monastic foundation of Prüfening. Petersohn rejects the customary attribution of Wolfger. The author himself was an accomplished writer, and produced a text full of rhetorical figures, reminiscences of the liturgy and of such texts as Einhard's *Vita Karoli*, John the Deacon's *Life* of Gregory the Great and the older *Vita Adalberti*. The author was clear in his own mind that he was writing history and thus of the need to determine truth and fact. To this end, it appears, he drew on both oral and written sources for his narrative. Petersohn traces possible precedents for the work as well as making a case for a degree of pioneering enterprise in the account as far as the mission in Pomerania is concerned. Four manuscripts of the *Magnum legendarium Austriacum* containing this three-book *Vita* are extant, three from the late twelfth and early thirteenth century and one from the late fifteenth century. These form the basis for Petersohn's excellent and meticulous edition, with its very valuable record of direct quotations and indirect reflections of the Bible, classical and patristic authors, historical and hagiographical works, and papal diplomas, legal and liturgical texts of the earlier Middle Ages. The editor has thereby provided historians with an admirable text to draw on for an influential representation of the mission to the Slavs in the twelfth century.

NEWNHAM COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

ROSAMOND MCKITTERICK

Vitae episcoporum. Eine Quellengattung zwischen Hagiographie und Historiographie, untersucht an Lebensbeschreibungen von Bischöfen des Regnum Teutonicum im Zeitalter der Ottonen und Salier. By Stephanie Haarländer. (Monographien zur Geschichte des Mittelalters, 47.) Pp. xi + 691. Stuttgart: Anton Hiersemann, 2000. DM 398.

3 7772 0022 0

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S002204690352797X

This is an exemplary study of episcopal *Lives* written in Germany in the central Middle Ages. The author quite correctly argues that the biographies of bishops are in fact so various in nature that it is difficult to speak of a 'genre' of bishops' *Lives* because it would imply a coherent approach according to well defined rules by all biographers to their subjects. This is not the case. Nevertheless the *corpus* of texts constitutes a most valuable historical source that deserves study in its own right. Of the more than 800 bishops known from this time, a relatively small group of thirty-six had *Lives* written about them by fifty-four authors, who were mostly

contemporaries; but clearly several bishops had more than one biographer. Thirty-three of the identifiable authors were monks living in monasteries, either founded by 'their' bishop, or to which the bishops had been particularly generous. Monastic authorship resulted in the narratives being concerned with monastic-episcopal relationships rather than with the bishop's office in itself. Even the much smaller number (twelve or fourteen) of episcopal clerks who wrote biographies was more interested in the bishops' local activities than in their role on the national or world stage. One of the most important conclusions drawn by Haarländer concerns the fact that the majority of *Lives* pay scant attention to what we now call the Investiture Conflict. Admittedly, the authors mention strife in case of contest between episcopal candidates, or conflict about the use of episcopal estates. Such narratives, however, deal with these matters at the level of 'micro-history' where local issues are not extrapolated further. This is a significant observation, which ought to serve as a warning for us modern historians to draw a sharp distinction between what we in hindsight detect as a big issue and what the local monk or clerk in the eleventh or early twelfth century perceived to be at stake. Furthermore, Haarländer draws attention to a development over time in the writing of episcopal biographies. Whereas the earliest ones stress the close relationship between bishops and their blood families, with mutual responsibilities clearly recognised as playing an important role, the late twelfth-century narratives reveal increasing tensions between the two parties with bishops trying to extricate themselves from kinship obligations. Interestingly, the aristocratic families from which the bishops emerged played another important role. Many of the medieval biographers acknowledge their debt to members of the family for information about their subjects. Although Haarländer does not single out any particular group, the number of women informants seems to me to be significant: mothers, sisters and female cousins were a trusted (if biased) source for personal details about a bishop's background. There is undoubtedly scope for further exploration of a gender dimension to the relationship between the male authors of the biographies and the female informants on whom they relied. All in all Haarländer's study forms a stimulating addition to the study of medieval bishops and their biographers.

EMMANUEL COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

ELISABETH VAN HOUTS

God's scribe. The historiographical art of Galbert of Bruges. By Jeff Rider. Pp. viii + 360. Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 2001. \$59.95. 0 8132 1018 6
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903537976

Jeff Rider's book is a close reading of one of the most fascinating historical works of the Middle Ages, Galbert of Bruges's *De multro, traditione, et occisione Karoli comitis Flandriarum*, dealing with dramatic events in Flanders in 1127–8: the murder of Count Charles, the revenge taken on the murderers, and the struggle over the succession until the final triumph of Count Thierry. Galbert wrote his work partly during, partly immediately after the events, a fact that is reflected in its composition; long passages of *De multro* read like a diary, listing what was happening day by day. This feature led Henri Pirenne in 1894 to regard Galbert as a naïve observer who simply

wrote down everything that happened without any attempt at interpretation or rhetorical embroidery and thus as a very trustworthy witness. Pirenne's view dominated until the mid-twentieth century, when a revision set in, culminating in Rider's book.

While Rider's predecessors confined themselves to tracing examples of subjectivity and interpretation, thus reducing Galbert's trustworthiness while enhancing his reputation as a historian, Rider's project is to complete this rehabilitation by showing in detail how *De multro* was composed, thereby giving a fuller account of Galbert's aims and ideas.

The book is divided into seven chapters, preceded by an introduction and followed by seven appendices, notes (in the usual, cumbersome American way at the end rather than on each page) and bibliography. Having dealt with earlier scholarship and the little that is known about Galbert's life and background in the introduction and ch. i, Rider directly addresses Galbert's way of working in ch. ii showing that it was his custom to take notes on wax tablets from day to day, which served as the basis of the final version on parchment. Rider shows convincingly that Galbert must have revised and edited his notes substantially. There are anticipations of later events, references and allusions to previous ones, invented speeches, and authorial comments. This conclusion is developed further in the following chapters, in which Rider also shows its significance for the understanding of Galbert's thought and his skill and method as a historian. His visualisation of the horrors of battles and executions is not simply a report of what actually happened, but 'cultivated subjectivity' (p. 111), the expression of a powerful mind and 'the art of history' (ch. iv). Nor is the story as a whole a mass of individual events, but an attempt to find meaning in a period of crisis and trauma. More directly and consistently than most of his contemporaries, Galbert tries to trace God's finger in history (ch. v), while the constitutional crisis, with two counts struggling for lordship of the country, forces him to reflect on the problem of tyranny and the foundation of political power (ch. vi). Moreover, this crisis led to increasing disillusionment with his fellow-countrymen (ch. vii) which is probably the reason why he never took the final step, to cover the traces of diary and make his work a full narrative according to the rhetoric of the day. Originally planning to address an audience of Flemish burghers, he now felt the distance to be too great and saw little point in revising his work, which then had to wait until the fifteenth century to be 'discovered' and made known.

Belief in the 'immediacy' and 'objectivity' of medieval narrative texts, or for that matter, texts in general, has been considerably weakened since the 1890s, which makes Rider's thesis convincing but hardly sensational. However, his concrete way of tracing Galbert's subjectivity, in the artistic as well as the ideological field, is highly illuminating and makes fascinating reading. His interpretations are reasonable, convincing and well presented, without postmodernist jargon. He is well read in the field of medieval historiography, although less so in German scholarship than in English and American. In ch. vii, 'The tyrant', on 'constitutional matters', Rider points to the Investiture Contest as a background and to Bruno and Lampert dealing with similar problems as Galbert. He might also have referred to the anonymous *Vita Henrici quarti* (c. 1106/7) as a parallel to Galbert's discussion of God's intervention in history. He might also have discussed Galbert's and other twelfth-century historians' worries about God's justice in the context of the slightly later opposition in ecclesiastical circles to ordeals.

These few suggestions about further lines of research are not intended to diminish the value of Rider's book. It is an excellent study which should be read by all who are interested in medieval historiography.

UNIVERSITY OF BERGEN

SVERRE BAGGE

Die päpstliche Kanzlei und ihre Urkundenproduktion (1141–1159). By Stefan Hirschmann. (Europäische Hochschulschriften. Ser. III. Geschichte und ihre Hilfswissenschaften, 913.) Pp. 446 incl. 28 ills. Frankfurt-am-Main: Peter Lang, 2001. £43 (paper). 3 631 38501 3; 0531 7320
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903547972

On the basis of an exhaustive statistical and textual analysis of approximately 4,000 papal documents, Stefan Hirschmann effectively describes the development and functioning of the Roman chancery in the mid-twelfth century. The dates 1141 to 1159 were chosen not with reference to pontificates but to the office of chancellor: from the death of the long-serving Aimerich to the accession of chancellor Roland Bandinelli as Pope Alexander III. We do not quite find out the weekly luncheon menus of the chancery scribes, but this study goes well beyond the traditional palaeographical or diplomatic treatment of papal sources to discuss such matters as the layout and format of privileges and *litterae*, the influence of climate and season on the production of documents, the identity and distribution of addressees and the degree of formulaic standardisation. Certain basic questions remain unanswered (how documents were drawn up and written, the role the petitioner played in their confection), but the investigation offers many interesting results. We learn, for example, that the chancery was not organised to resemble a modern office or even a cloister *scriptorium* but rather remained a scattered collection of individual scribes. Notwithstanding this loose administration, the chancery seems to have taken no vacations on Sundays or festivals. Its work did diminish when the court moved, especially during the summer. The busiest months were April and May when the passes across the Alps were first open and when those seeking privileges would be most likely to find cardinals in Rome, their required endorsements of solemn privileges being acquired only through considerable cost and effort. We also find out about papal itineraries, how much distance could be covered in leisurely circumstances or in emergencies (such as flight from Arnold of Brescia's regime in Rome), and how these peregrinations affected the issuance of decisions and benefits. Fully one-third of the book is taken up by the question of the standardisation of the form of papal documents, especially their *initia* and *arengae*. Hirschmann resists the tendency to describe his period of the twelfth century simply in terms of growth of business or imposition of routine. He shows that while stylised introductions predominated, they experienced certain fashions (for example, the opening 'iustis petentium desideriiis' appears merely twenty times in the period under consideration, while it occurs about five hundred times in the next four decades). Even within what are regarded as standard formulae there is variation in word choice and order, often depending on who was chancellor. Thus it is unfortunate that, for the sake of economy, modern editions leave out formulaic elements which might serve to date more precisely the frustratingly vaguely-dated *litterae*. Hirschmann finds no single overarching direction towards which the papal chancery was irresistibly moving, but if this is

a somewhat inconclusive general statement, the details of how the most sophisticated administrative organisation worked possess an undoubted fascination.

YALE UNIVERSITY

PAUL FREEDMAN

Graeci und Suriani im Palästina der Kreuzfahrerzeit. Beiträge und Quellen zur Geschichte des griechisch-orthodoxen Patriarchats von Jerusalem. By Johannes Pahlitzsch. (Berliner Historische Studien, 33. Ordensstudien, 15.) Pp. 452. Berlin: Duncker & Humblot, 2001. DM 136 (paper). 3 428 09884 6; 0720 6941

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903557979

The Orthodox patriarchate in Jerusalem did not inspire any contemporary historical account of its vicissitudes in the crusading era and our extant sources for the Greek- and Arabic-speaking Christian inhabitants of Palestine are of a fragmentary nature. To evaluate these sources in the light of the highly technical secondary literature is no mean task and Johannes Pahlitzsch has accomplished it with acumen and erudition. He has gone as far as the sources permit to produce a coherent survey of the Orthodox patriarchate of Jerusalem from the mid-eleventh century until 1244. The second, briefer part of his book comprises studies on source problems, including the letters issued during the First Crusade in the name of Patriarch Symeon II; a deed of property transfer drawn up between Christians in Arabic and in accordance with Islamic legal forms; and lists of the Greek manuscripts attributable to scribes of twelfth- and thirteenth-century Palestine. The quantity of manuscripts and the quality of some of the compositions bear out a theme of the main part of the book. Leading orthodox figures in Antioch and Jerusalem were far from inert, spiritually or intellectually, and contacts between the patriarchs and the Byzantine 'establishment' were frequent and intensive. This was the case long before patriarchs became more or less permanent residents in Byzantium in the twelfth century. Pahlitzsch examines the polemics between papal apologists and eastern Orthodox churchmen, including Patriarch Peter of Antioch. He rightly emphasises that topics such as azymes and the *filioque* clause mattered differently to members of the same camp, according to circumstances. He thereby avoids the misconceptions of those modern historians who have inferred from the moderation in tone of some writings that a lasting accommodation, if not 'Reunion', between Orthodox and Latin churchmen was still within reach. One such 'moderate' was Patriarch Symeon II. His intermediary role in the early stages of the First Crusade is enhanced by Pahlitzsch's convincing refutation of recent attempts to deny him authorship of the letters written in his name. Pahlitzsch further shows that the Orthodox communities in Palestine rapidly recovered vitality under Crusader rule, perhaps in reaction to the implantation of a Latin hierarchy, while their links with the Byzantine empire intensified: the Melkite clergy seem to have elected two successive patriarchs in Jerusalem in the early twelfth century, but at the same time the Byzantine emperors became more insistent on their right to choose the patriarchs of Antioch and Jerusalem. It has recently been suggested by Michael Angold that the presence of these exiles fanned a sense of Orthodoxy in danger among the citizens of Constantinople in the later twelfth century. Pahlitzsch offers a complementary perspective: the Melkites of Palestine, although mostly Arabic-speaking, could still see themselves as part of a wider, 'Roman' or 'Byzantine' community and, in that spirit, secular law-books of

the *basileus* were still being translated into Arabic. Pahlitzsch's findings have profound implications for Crusading and Byzantine history, besides shedding light on the Orthodox communities of the Holy Land.

KEW

JONATHAN SHEPARD

Holy rulers and blessed princesses. Dynastic cults in medieval central Europe. (Past and Present Publications.) By Gábor Klaniczay, translated by Éva Pálmai. (First publ. as *Az uralkodók szentsége a középkorban: Magyar dinasztikus szentkultuszok és európai modellek*, Budapest: Balassi Kiadó, 2000.) Pp. xviii + 493 incl. 91 ill. and 12 genealogical tables. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002. £65. 0 521 42018 0

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903567975

After lengthy overviews of ancient sacral kingship (ignoring biblical models) and the rise of the cult of dynastic saints in the early Middle Ages, Klaniczay focuses on medieval Hungary from the eleventh to the fifteenth century. Against the background of a wide array of secondary literature on European and Hungarian saints, he follows the transformation of royal sanctity through the Hungarian examples, incorporating several studies he had published earlier. Throughout, Klaniczay highlights parallels between Hungarian and European developments in royal sanctity, offering many interesting hypotheses worthy of further research about borrowings and influences in Hungary, for example from Byzantium and Kievan Rus. He affirms that royal sanctity was reconciled with the exercise of royal power in the eleventh–twelfth centuries, quickly leading to the emergence of two new types of saint, the ‘chaste prince’ and the chivalric *athleta patriae*. In the thirteenth century saintly princesses took on the function of dynastic legitimation. Their spectacular renunciation and self-mortification, following the mendicant example, brought them prestige and even political influence. Their confessors, as well as the dynasties they belonged to, capitalised on their cults. In the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries new dynasties, the Angevins and the Luxemburg, emphasised the merits of their descent from a *beata stirps* in their search for sacral legitimation. Their propaganda efforts covered many fields, including travel, patronage of frescoes and illuminated legendaries, and sermons. These dynasties achieved a great success in popularising their saints but ultimately at the cost of the complete transformation of the saints themselves. The saintly princesses of the thirteenth century became mystics and prophets in the fourteenth and fifteenth-century Italian and French versions of the their *Lives*. Eventually, the dynastic saints became national patrons who could be turned against the dynasties themselves. A useful appendix on Hungarian hagiographic texts provides further guidance for the study of these sources. Klaniczay clearly demonstrates the transformations and political functions of royal sanctity in Hungary, and the fact that the Hungarian case fits into the European medieval context. He is less convincing in his claim that the twelfth-century ‘chivalrous holy king’ was a reflection of secular power triumphing over the Church; after all, this type of saint also emerged thanks to ecclesiastical authorship. This book, especially its late-medieval chapters, is a valuable contribution to the study of sanctity in medieval Hungary.

UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE

NORA BEREND

Europe in the high Middle Ages. By William Chester Jordan. (The Penguin History of Europe.) Pp. xi + 383 incl. 12 maps + 25 ills. London: Penguin, 2002. (first publ. 2001). £9.99 (paper). o 14 016664 5

A history of the Church in the Middle Ages. By F. Donald Logan. Pp. xiv + 368 incl. 23 plates, 20 maps and 7 figs. London–New York: Routledge, 2002. £50 (cloth), £15.99 (paper). o 415 13288 6; o 415 13289 4

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903577971

Professor Jordan provides a history of Europe from the eleventh century to the fourteenth. It is primarily designed to inform those beginning to study the period, and its coverage is admirably wide, with proper attention given to the Mediterranean lands and eastern and central Europe. Effectively this is a history of Latin Europe (in medieval terms) or of the expanded European Union (in the language of the present century), and it includes most aspects of medieval life in a thoroughly informative way. There are, as always, problems about so wide a coverage: the author can be pedestrian, and at times misleading; it will not do to describe everything between 1050 and 1200 under the will-o'-the wisp heading of 'The twelfth-century renaissance'. Not surprisingly, Jordan is at his best when discussing social structure and economic conditions, and notably the Black Death, on which he has published an important book, and which provides his most coat-trailing judgement: 'the plague cycle was the death knell of medieval European civilization'. The whole forms a good and useful starter text-book.

Donald Logan's history of the Church extends from the conversion of the Franks to the close of the fifteenth century, with a preliminary chapter on the early Church. It is full of witty and concise remarks: 'the first thing that must be said about the First Crusade is that no one at the time knew that it was the first crusade'. He also enjoys trailing his coat: not every one will agree that 'the crusades were marginal events in the general flow of medieval history'. The overall structure, rightly, is chronological, but he includes well-chosen quotations from contemporaries. For an outline history, this book gives one a real idea of what people at the time were thinking and saying. Some chapters are devoted to specific themes: 'three twelfth-century profiles', for example, or cathedral architecture. These studies exact a price in the interruption of the general history, with the result that such topics as the ecclesiastical policy of the Hohenstaufen and the defence of Jerusalem receive quite brief notices in the outline of the twelfth century. The price is worth paying, because his accounts of Peter Abelard, Thomas of Canterbury, Hildegard of Bingen and the cathedrals are excellent, at a level well beyond the preliminary. It is interesting to notice that this book, while giving a lot of detail about the impact of the Black Death, sees it, in contrast to William Jordan, as a massive shock from which both Church and State recovered without structural consequences, and which certainly did not initiate the end of medieval society. Donald Logan is to be congratulated on a book which will interest all students of the medieval Church.

The ius commune in England. Four studies. By R. H. Helmholz. Pp. xv + 270. New York–Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001. £41.99. 0 19 514190 3

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903587978

Most legal historians agree that the common law of England has little in common with the mixture of Roman and canon law that continental jurists since the twelfth century have been pleased to call the *ius commune*. The English common law, we are assured, was a unique product of English royal policy and the decisions of the judges in the king's courts. Continental legal developments during the generations in the late twelfth and thirteenth centuries exercised scant influence in the shaping of English law. Common law borrowed nothing of much substance from contemporary canonists and civilians. The Channel was not totally impermeable to ideas, of course, nor could it entirely shield English lawyers and judges from what was happening in the twelfth-century law schools of Bologna and Paris, Cologne and Montpellier. But, according to the conventional view, when continental legal ideas and practices did drift into England, they encountered such stony soil that they soon withered away and died before they could make a significant impact on the practices of the English royal courts. The common law of England consequently went its own way, only marginally influenced by what was taking place beyond the Channel. In recent decades, however, scholars (mainly from Italy, Germany and North America, to be sure, but also including a few in the United Kingdom) have started to chip away at this accepted view of the common law's intellectual isolation. Richard Helmholz of the University of Chicago Law School has been in the vanguard of the American sceptics. The four studies in this volume deal with the law of sanctuary, the law of compurgation, the customary law of mortuary offerings and the jurisdiction of civil courts over the clergy. Helmholz compares and contrasts the treatment of each topic by the jurists of the *ius commune* and the English common law and for each he is able to demonstrate major areas where they overlap, as well as points on which they differ. The medieval common law and *ius commune*, he argues, while certainly not identical in these four areas, nevertheless resembled each other strikingly. Helmholz is a meticulous scholar. He grounds his arguments carefully upon a solid body of evidence drawn from an extraordinarily impressive variety of sources, the scope of which becomes clear from a glance at the four tables of citations that close the book. His conclusions are subtle and nuanced. He is careful not to exaggerate or overstate his case. The four topics studied in this book, he asserts, are not likely to be isolated examples. Overlap between *ius commune* and common law is not limited to the names we attach to the two legal traditions. They form part of a single family of law, whose branches beg to be studied together, rather than in isolation from one another.

UNIVERSITY OF KANSAS

JAMES A. BRUNDAGE

La liberazione dei 'captivi' tra Christianità e Islam. Oltre la crociata e il gihad: tolleranza e servizio umanitario. Atti de congresso interdisciplinare di studi storici (Roma, 16–19 settembre 1998) organizzato per l'VIII centenario dell'approvazione della regola dei Trinitari da parte del Papa Innocenzo III il 17 dicembre 1198/15 safar. 595 H. Edited by Giulio Cipollone. (Collectanea Archivi Vaticani, 46.) Pp. 848 incl. 7 graphs, 21 tables, 41 black-and-white and 31 colour plates. Vatican City: Archivio Segreto Vaticano, 2000. 88 85042 31 7

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903597974

The occasion of the congress whose *acta* this massive volume contains was the eighth centenary of the founding of the Trinitarian Order in 1198, though in their exploration of the activity for which the order was long renowned, the redemption of Christians from their Muslim captors, the forty-eight contributors both Christian and Islamic range far and wide both chronologically and thematically. S. Pagano studies the text of the rule granted by Innocent III to John de Matha and his companions in 1198, and its successive confirmations and revision by Clement IV in 1267. J. M. Powell (while curiously locating Cerfroid, the site of the order's first house, in Burgundy) notices the influence on its rule of that of the Hospitallers and remarks on the climate of reform at Rome from which it emerged. Of related interest are the contributions on its relationship to contemporary attitudes to poverty in general (A. Vauchez; too brief) and to the Franciscan rule in particular (O. Schmucki; not too brief); its insistence on architectural austerity, as exemplified by the case of the Roman church of S. Tommaso in *Formis*, granted to the order by Innocent III in 1209 (M. Morbidelli); and the use of asses rather than horses or mules (M. S. Calò Mariani), both these being richly illustrated. Through its nigh-impenetrable English, Hassan Abdel Wahab's account of the operation of *wagf* in twelfth-century Syria and Egypt reveals a degree of anxiety regarding the risk of apostasy by captives akin to that identified by B. Bolton in the case of Innocent III. The same theme recurs in pieces on aspects of late medieval Spain treated by R. Salicrú i Lluç, A. Díaz Borrás, E. Gozalbes Cravioto and F. J. Marcal Palacios. Earlier Jewish concerns for the welfare of captives and Koranic precepts on the subject are treated by Y. Friedman and R. Pinilla and, in respect of the *fatwās* of al-Wanšharīsi (d. 1508) in overlapping contributions by A. Benremdane and M. Hasnaoui. Amongst the various ramifications from the main theme of the theory and practice of redemption, articles on Saladin's reputation for clemency (G. Ligato) and on Ralph Niger (A. Cocci) deserve mention. It is a pity that no one addressed the question of the linguistic skills required in the course of negotiations (to match L. Palermo's remarks on the need for knowledge of Arab mathematics and mercantile practices, the order's foundation coinciding almost exactly with the appearance of the *Liber abaci* of Leonardo Fibonacci di Pisa) or (other than glancingly) that of the other ransoming orders active in the early thirteenth century. The collapse of the order's house at Avinganya, for example, almost certainly had more to do with preference for the Mercedarians in Catalonia than with the processes revealed by the complex actuarial calculations with the assistance of which J. Hernando contrives to demonstrate the unsustainability of the order's statutory dedication of a third of its income to the work of redemption. Because the energies of the contributors here are so widely dispersed, the very extent of the explosion of caritative activity of which Juan de Matha's initiative was part tends to get lost sight of. An enterprise which brought the resources of Aberdeen and Hounslow to the relief of captives from Tunisia to Syria deserved an

overarching essay on the order's early history, or at least a map of its houses. In 1199 the bishop and chapter of Metz were counselled by Innocent III not to cast away the grain with the chaff in their dealings with the local laity (p. 251). There is a certain amount of chaff here, in the form of articles written out of historical dictionaries, and no shortage of rhetoric. However, there is also much grain and even some treasure, not all of it buried.

ST JOHN'S COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

PETER LINEHAN

Christ's poor men. The Carthusians in England. By Glyn Coppack and Mick Aston. Pp. 160 incl. 87 figs + 23 colour plates. Stroud: Tempus Publishing, 2002. £17.99 (paper). 0 7524 1961 7

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903607979

The study of the religious orders in medieval England appears to be undergoing a 'renaissance' at the present time, with a variety of innovative publications. Coppack and Aston's examination of England's nine medieval Carthusian charterhouses is a welcome contribution to this revival. These monasteries are mainly viewed from an archaeological perspective, with the benefits of recent excavations and technological advances, which are made accessible to the non-specialist. However, a notable feature of the book, apart from its copious illustrations, is the skilful integration of archaeological research with historical narrative and the use of documentary sources. It begins by exploring the origins of the Carthusian order in the late eleventh century, its subsequent development and establishment in England. The planning of the charterhouses and how their buildings were utilised is then examined, taking into account the importance which the Carthusians placed upon their cottage-like cells, which epitomise their eremitical vocation. This study offers many interesting insights into the Carthusians' daily life, concluding with the Henrician dissolution and possibilities for future research. Indeed Coppack and Aston intend to produce an 'academic' account of the English Carthusians in the future (p. 9). It is to be hoped that this will incorporate the findings of the recent excavations at the London Charterhouse – which are not referred to in their present work – and other research sources on the Carthusians, for instance the *Analecta Cartusiana*. There are also a few factual slips in the book and no footnote references. Nevertheless this is an extremely well-written and scholarly work which deserves a wide readership.

UNIVERSITY OF YORK

JOSEPH A. GRIBBIN

La matricola femminile della Misericordia di Bergamo (1265–1339). Edited by Maria Teresa Brolis, Giovanni Brembilla and Micaela Corato. (Sources et documents d'histoire du moyen âge.) Pp. cxx + 184 + 8 plates. Rome: École française de Rome, 2001. €39 (paper). 2 7283 0645 1; 1128 1626

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903617975

Bergamo's late medieval confraternities have generated a respectable literature, including a monograph by Lester Little, published in 1988. Little and others have published the *Rule* of the *Misericordia*, one of the many to have survived in Italian

archives. Rarer, and still more rarely published, are the *matricole*, lists of members of such brotherhoods. The *matricola* which is meticulously published here, with a wealth of commentary and supporting documentation, has extra rarity value in that it is a list only of the female members of the *Misericordia* during the first two generations of its existence. It contains more than 1,700 names, recorded, in chronological layers, by neighbourhood. The variable quantity of personal detail recorded reveals that membership of the fraternity was socially inclusive, comprehending women of the great local families, the wives and daughters of craftsmen and even domestic servants. In addition, a remarkable variety of religious women were inscribed in the *matricola*: the inmates of old-established Benedictine nunneries, *Umiliate*, recluses. According to the *Rule*, women were normally enrolled once they had supplied a few particulars and it had been established that they could give alms from time to time. Prospective male members, by contrast, had to undergo a year's probation in the course of which their fitness to undertake 'burdens' in the brotherhood could be assessed. This detail, and the use in certain passages of the *Rule* of the word *fratres*, as distinct from the ambivalent *persone*, strongly suggests (as one might expect) that the men did the business of the confraternity. Men and women alike were called to penitence and charity and all were promised the same spiritual benefits. It is entirely legitimate to suggest that the influence and participation of women whose fathers, husbands and sons were often also members should not be underestimated, but a little caution seems justifiable in face of the contention that male and female members stood on a perfect equality. Similar reservations may perhaps be appropriate on the subject of the social mix (male and female) attested by the *matricola*. The editors challenge Little's view of the charitable confraternity as a means of social control exercised by upper-class persons in alliance with the clergy and religious orders. This is an issue worth raising, and there is no reason to doubt that inclusiveness and harmony were sincerely promoted by the bishop and the orders in face of a recent history of heresy and current social and political turbulence, at Bergamo as elsewhere, in the late thirteenth century. The *matricola* alone, however, cannot tell us about the relationships between the persons whose names it preserves, nor how much weight a *domina* carried in comparison with a shoemaker's wife or a household servant. Such lists of names, as anyone who has encountered them in Italian archives or elsewhere will attest, open up enticing prospects of contact with the human reality of the past, but the goal all too often remains just beyond our reach.

KING'S COLLEGE,
LONDON

DIANA WEBB

Safe sanctuaries. Security and defence in Anglo-Scottish border churches, 1290–1690. By Christopher J. Brooke. Pp. xx + 408 incl. 174 figures and 7 maps. Edinburgh: John Donald, 2000. £25. 0 85976 5350

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903627971

As Dr Christopher Brooke (not to be identified with the distinguished Cambridge ecclesiastical historian whose name has so often adorned the pages of this JOURNAL) points out in his preface to this admirable study, the phenomenon of fortified churches in the late medieval Anglo-Scottish borders is often mentioned but has never received serious analysis. Here at last that neglect is completely rectified by an

authoritative investigation of no less than 533 church sites within the borders of the six border marches (as reorganised in the sixteenth century): the author is able to show that ninety-six of these were adapted to serve as defensible refuges in times of war and unrest. Thanks to Dr Brooke's labours as an indefatigable fieldworker and a talented photographer, some of the least visited medieval churches in the medieval kingdoms of England and Scotland are now rescued from near oblivion. However, it is not only because *Safe sanctuaries* should henceforward be required reading for all ecclesiologists taking a holiday on either side of the Tweed that it deserves careful attention. Its conclusions throw important, if fitful, new light on the badly-recorded smaller parish churches of northern England and southern Scotland. Brooke is primarily an architectural rather than a documentary historian, no doubt one of the reasons why he makes no serious attempt to use some familiar sources (like the *Valor ecclesiasticus*) to discuss the patronage and individual wealth of the English churches he discusses. However, he certainly displays very considerable judgement in assessing the general implications of his own findings. Whether or not, as maintained in the conclusion to this survey, the decision to add defensive features to an existing church on the borders was left entirely to its local parishioners, there can be no denying 'the hotchpotch distribution of defensible churches across the region'. Inevitably enough, this pioneering book often raises more questions than it resolves. Above all, it is extremely difficult to discover how often these supposedly defensible churches were in fact successfully defended against hostile attack. It is certainly an irony that perhaps the most celebrated of all ecclesiastical structures in late medieval Northumberland, the vicar's pele tower at Corbridge, should show no surviving evidence of 'heavy drew-bar slots or signs of locks or other means to prevent easy ingress'. By yet another paradox, some of the largest church buildings, like the priory church and precincts at Hexham, apparently needed no new structural defences after the 1290s because they were already sufficiently impregnable. All in all, most of the 'sanctuaries' discussed in this volume were probably too inadequately defended to be 'safe' at all. If so, and if there are villains in the story Brooke has to tell, these were allegedly the late medieval bishops of southern Scotland and northern England – particularly no doubt the bishops of Durham – who were more likely to be building or rebuilding their own castles and palaces rather than providing physical shelter to their parochial sheep from the ravening wolves on the other side of the border. No surprise there perhaps; but one ends Brooke's admirable book with the hope that one day a comparative study of church-building in late medieval Christendom will apply his intriguing conclusions to European frontier zones as a whole.

UNIVERSITY OF YORK

BARRIE DOBSON

Estonische Kirchengeschichte im vorigen Jahrtausend. Estonian church history in the past millennium.

Edited by Riho Altnurme. Pp. 212 incl. 18 ills. Kiel: Friedrich Wittig, 2001.

3 8048 4469 3

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903637978

Who would have imagined a conference on this subject hosted by the University of Tartu on a snowbound long weekend in late January 2001? And Tartu's theology faculty laid on great hospitality with virtually non-existent official funding. A participant could be excused a sense of unreal occasion. Generous voluntary funding of

the current rebuilding of St John, Tartu's medieval city parish church, depicted on the cover of this collection, really motors Estonian cultural restoration and imaginative new cultural ventures today. Generous German funding and a German publisher have made this edition of essays possible too. Emeritus Professor Vello Salo's passionate Latin introductory speech 'Nolite timere, pusillus grex!' (Luke xii.32) printed here, suits a mood of cautious hope experienced by all participants after the past century's devastation of Christian culture in this part of the world. This collection has an informal and irenic air too; perhaps because Estonians were really unable to colonise their mainly Lutheran German Reformation churchscape after 1918. Sixteen thoughtful brief essays, printed in English and German, unite the arrival of the Dominicans in Tartu 700 years ago with the first new Christian community centres built by Estonian architects in the last decade: the Methodist Baltic Mission centre in Tallinn, the Agape Centre in Pärnu and the Baptist Salem centre in Tartu. Six further papers, including one by this reviewer, have appeared elsewhere. There is something here for the historian of each Christian century to dip into if he is prepared to accept only limited attention to the Lutheran Reformation (Poltsam's essay on Reformation and 'Alltag' in Livonia). Modern times unite two imaginative pieces covering Tartu's nineteenth-century theology faculty: Petti on Theodosius Harnack's controversial Lutheran theology, and Leppik on the gradual introduction of Russian Orthodox (1830–4) and Roman Catholic (1849) university instruction and worship. Russian Orthodox lectures first appeared in the faculty handbook in 1842; the 1850s opened up regular religious instruction in both faiths. Curiously enough, Estonian Lutheranism comes into its own in the twentieth-century section with short essays by Ketola on touchy Estonian-Finnish Lutheran relations; Vihuri on the sensitive question of Baltic Lutheran and Anglican church orders; Altnurme with a fascinating piece on the piety, theology and political attitudes of Estonian Lutheran clergy in the 1940s; and Malkavaara's stormy account of Estonian Lutheran membership of the Lutheran World Federation (1947–63), given the presence of vocal Baltic exile Lutheran Churches. All in all a collection to be read with pleasure, in the hope that this is the beginning of a more comprehensive approach to Christian church history in this new century.

UNIVERSITY OF GLASGOW

NICHOLAS HOPE

The new Cambridge medieval history, VI: c. 1300–c. 1415. Edited by Michael Jones. Pp. xxx + 1110 incl. 20 maps and 7 genealogical tables + colour frontispiece and 38 plates. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000. £80. 0 521 36290 3
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903647974

For Jean-Pierre Leguay, who contributes the chapter on European towns to this monumental volume in a monumental series, the contradictions of urban history in the fourteenth century are so great that it is difficult to draw any general conclusions at all. In Robert Fossier's words, 'difficulties and progress were so finely balanced that contemporaries were uncertain of the direction History was taking'. Not contemporaries alone indeed. Students and members of the general public who embark on this sixth volume of the *New Cambridge Medieval History* in the hope of receiving an authoritative and definitive account of the major developments of this period in European history will inevitably find themselves sometimes as perplexed as they are well informed. To pose the familiar question, how justified is a massive

(1,110 pages) 'new' Cambridge volume on the fourteenth century now that most of the assumptions which guided the contributors of the equivalent (seventh) volume in the original *Cambridge Medieval History* in 1932 have been almost totally transformed? Such recent developments as the vast accumulation of historical knowledge, the expansion in the number of practising historians, lack of confidence in the primacy of the historical 'fact' and the decline in theoretical explanation of historical development (the latter very striking in this volume) would seem to make it more difficult than ever before to produce an attractive and intellectually satisfying *mélange* on this huge scale. All the more credit to the editor and the thirty-four contributors for surpassing expectations and producing a thoroughly enlightening collection of essays, not to mention an erudite bibliography of no less than 179 pages. In his eloquent and felicitous introduction to the volume Michael Jones satisfactorily meets or forestalls almost every major criticism that could be made of the structure of his volume. Above all, the success of this book owes much to his own determination not 'to cram all contributors into the same procrustean mould'.

The editorial freedom allowed to authors in this sixth volume of the *New Cambridge Medieval History* has accordingly paid handsome dividends, not least in rescuing fourteenth-century European history from the excessively apocalyptic interpretations to which it has been – and still is – peculiarly prone. Accordingly not one of the contributors suggests that this was a century best typified as one of the 'dissolution of medieval values', of the last great 'crisis of feudalism' or (to cite the title of the volume it replaces) even of an alleged *Decline of the empire and papacy*. Above all perhaps, here is a fourteenth-century Europe where for once the demographic cataclysm and human miseries created by war, famine and (above all) bubonic plague are not allowed to prevent a reasonable degree of optimism from breaking in. Thus Christian Klapisch-Zuber's chapter on 'Plague and family life' has much more to offer on familial responses to outbreaks of the Black Death than on the extent and economic consequences of the mortality itself. Indeed economic developments in general are less fully represented in this volume than would probably have been the case a generation ago. That said, Peter Spufford's remarkably learned and lucid survey of 'Trade in fourteenth-century Europe' (much the longest chapter in the volume) in many ways replaces the influential chapters on the topic by the late Robert Lopez and M. M. Postan in the second volume of the *Cambridge Economic History* over a generation ago. All the other eleven essays in part I ('General themes') of the volume do credit to the seriousness with which their authors have approached their daunting tasks of compression. One or two contributions, like those of Jacques Verger on 'The universities' and Paul Freedman on 'Rural society', are perhaps too brief to make quite the impact they otherwise deserve. By contrast, the scholars entrusted with the three specialised chapters on the arts and literature (Paul Binski, Paul Crossley and Nick Havely) manage to convey a great many original insights in an admirably lucid manner. In particular, Paul Crossley's whirlwind survey of fourteenth-century architecture within the compass of twenty-three pages is a positive *tour de force*, as it progresses from St Stephen's Chapel, Westminster, via the 'sacred landscape' created by the towers of East Anglian parish churches, to its climax at Brunelleschi's cathedral dome in Florence, 'in effect, the bridge between Christian antiquity and the centralised churches of the Renaissance'.

Paul Crossley's concentration on ecclesiastical architecture will be all the more welcome to readers of this JOURNAL because there is understandably little discussion

of the institutions of the established Roman or Greek churches elsewhere in this volume. However, the two chapters devoted to the Avignon papacy and the Great Schism, by Patrick Zutshi and Howard Kaminsky respectively, provide admirably succinct summaries of complex themes, especially so in the case of Zutshi's analysis of the administrative organisation of the papal court. At the other end of the religious spectrum is Jeremy Catto's excellent essay on 'Currents of religious thought and expression', which eschews any direct treatment of Wycliffite heresy for a more wide-ranging interpretation of the interplay of religious ideas and sentiment as expressed in university lecture hall and Corpus Christi Guild and by all manner of clerks from Groote to Gerson. Nevertheless, as befits the long tradition of *Cambridge Medieval Histories*, the great majority of the chapters in this volume are dedicated to political history, including fifteen contributions on developments in 'The states of the west' while another seven are concerned with 'Northern and eastern Europe'. These last seven chapters will naturally prove particularly valuable in providing British and American students with up-to-date introductions to major issues in relatively unfamiliar territory. Nowhere is such unfamiliarity likely to be greater than in the case of Lithuania, Livonia and Prussia, the outlines of whose dynastic and other complexities are skilfully unravelled by S. C. Rowell's chapter on 'Baltic Europe'. Even more crucial for the future of Europe was the gradual destruction of 'the putative unity of the Rus heritage', a process more or less complete by 1400 and analysed here with great sensitivity by Nancy Shields Kollmann. Meanwhile, in western Europe, all allowances made for immense regional variation, the emphasis in this volume tends to lie less on state formation, on disputes between states or even on warfare than on internal conflicts and constitutional issues. In his general chapter, on the immense and challenging theme of 'The theory and practice of government in western Europe', Albert Rigaudière concludes by detecting what he calls 'a wind of democracy' blowing through late fourteenth-century Christendom. Although usually a fitful breeze rather than a wind, several of the 'states' discussed here do indeed show signs of principled resistance to their rulers, even in the predominantly 'horse-ridden' society of the Spanish kingdoms so vividly evoked by Alan Forey and Peter Linehan. Further north, in the England of Edward II and III, Mark Ormrod is surely justified in placing at the centre of the national political scene 'a process of political negotiation' with the king's subjects. It may therefore seem appropriate that of all the rulers of fourteenth-century Europe it is – surprisingly – only Richard II who receives a chapter to himself. According to Caroline Barron – by no means completely unsympathetic to a king with a possible capacity for political 'vision' – Richard's fall from power was due to inadequate negotiating skills and a desire to distance himself from his subjects. On the evidence of this volume the fourteenth century was indeed not a propitious period for would-be tyrants. Like many of the contributors to an impressive volume, Caroline Barron achieves what the editor calls 'a lighter touch ... not too relentlessly factual but rather more impressionistic and interpretive'. For that and other reasons this is undoubtedly one of the most enjoyable and enlivening of collaborative histories produced by the Cambridge University Press. Michael Jones and his colleagues deserve congratulation on a triumphant conclusion to their long labours in making fourteenth-century Europe seem even more absorbing than it always and already was.

The fall of the Templars in the crown of Aragon. By Alan Forey. Pp. xiii + 279 incl. 15 maps, tables and plates. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2001. £47.50. 0 7546 0519 1

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903657970

‘There is room for a more detailed study’ of the dissolution of the Temple in Aragon, Alan Forey remarked at the end of his *The Templars in the Corona de Aragón* (1973; rev. ante xxvi [1975], 325–6), and, almost thirty years on, here it is. The fruit of a minute analysis of possibly every shred of evidence to be found in the chancery registers of the Archivo de la Corona de Aragón, Alan Forey’s *Fall* tells a story containing few surprises but one which it is unlikely will need to be told again, a story of misinformation and uncertainty, and of compromise and accommodation, with nothing about it of the Stalinist strike carried out by Philip the Fair. In sharp contrast to that of the French ruler, Jaime II’s treatment of members of the order emerges as cautious, even compassionate – in respect, for example, of pleas for the removal of shackles chafing in the Aragonese summer. While generally responsive to papal instructions, Jaime sided with his bishops in remaining sceptical regarding the more lurid of the allegations being circulated, and justifiably so. Torture, when eventually authorised, elicited no confessions from amongst the seventy-one individuals, sergeants mostly, the particulars of whose interrogation are painstakingly analysed here, together with the details of their ages and origins and of their fate after the order’s suppression. In his account of the sieges of Templar castles in 1308–9, and of the wrangling with Avignon over the partition of Templar property between the Hospitallers and the new Order of Montesa, the author brings this highly charged and most disreputable of episodes very much down to earth. But if Jaime II was its central figure, he was also as often as not rather poorly informed regarding local developments. Though royal functionaries flit in and out of Forey’s account, none of them takes on human shape; Beltrán de Valle, appointed overall administrator of confiscated Templar possessions in 1308, was certainly no Thomas Cromwell. It is probably the case that readers of this pointillist presentation, wherein almost every successive assertion is immediately qualified, will know more about the matter than did either Jaime himself or the two pontiffs with whom he had to deal. And they will surely have little cause to question its author’s conclusion that ‘the religious life of the Templars in Aragon deteriorated not because of internal decay within the Order during the decades before the trial but because of the circumstances created by those who accused and destroyed the Temple’.

ST JOHN’S COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

PETER LINEHAN

Agnes Blannbekin, *Viennese beguine. Life and revelations.* Edited and translated by Ulrike Wiethaus. (Library of Medieval Women.) Pp. vii + 184. Cambridge: D. S. Brewer, 2002. £35. 0 85991 634 0; 1369 9652

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903667977

Agnes Blannbekin is another of the women mystics forgotten for centuries but recently revived through renewed interest in mysticism and feminist scholarship on the Middle Ages. Like a number of these women, Agnes (d. 1315) was not herself a writer. Her revelations, which Ulrike Wiethaus suggests should be seen as a kind of spiritual diary, were put down in Latin by her spiritual advisor, an anonymous Franciscan resident in Vienna in the late twelfth and early thirteenth centuries (the visions date to

the years 1291–4). Recent studies, however, have shown that texts like the *Revelations* are best seen as the result of conversations between female ecstasies and their male confessors, guides and admirers – ‘co-authored’ texts, however difficult it is today to unravel the exact nature of the contributions each partner made to the final product. Agnes’s *Revelations* are especially intriguing because in chapter cxviii they provide us with a live example of exactly the kind of interchange between the friar director and his spiritual friend that has mostly vanished from the historical record. Agnes Blannbekin is unlikely to become as widely read as such female mystics as Angela of Foligno, Mechthild of Magdeburg, Julian of Norwich or Catherine of Siena. Nevertheless, she witnesses to forms of visionary mysticism, especially in its eucharistic and passion-centred character, that are typical of the late Middle Ages. This is not to say that Agnes is merely repetitious of what can be found in others. Many aspects of her more than two hundred visions are striking, especially the way in which she deals with clothing and unclothing as symbols of contact with God (where a comparison with Mechthild would be interesting), and in her mystical devotion to Christ’s foreskin (less strange today than in the eighteenth century when it caused attacks on the first publication of the *Revelations*). Ulrike Wiethaus has performed a valuable service in presenting this competent translation of a long-forgotten text and in providing a helpful comments for understanding the *Revelations*. A more extensive apparatus would have been helpful for showing how Agnes, or at least her confessor, was quite familiar with classical western mystical literature, such as Gregory the Great (for example, notes on pp. 37 and 62 that mention Gregory of Nyssa actually should refer to themes found in the Gregory the medieval Latins did read – i.e. Pope Gregory I).

DIVINITY SCHOOL,
UNIVERSITY OF CHICAGO

BERNARD MCGINN

The register of William Melton, archbishop of York, 1317–1340, IV. Edited by Reginald Brocklesby. (The Canterbury and York Society, 85.) Pp. vii + 246. Woodbridge: Boydell Press (for The Canterbury and York Society), 1997. £29.50. 0 907239 56 0; 0262 995X

The register of William Melton, archbishop of York, 1317–1340, V. Edited by T. C. B. Timmins. (The Canterbury and York Society, 93.) Pp. ix + 241. Woodbridge: Boydell Press (for The Canterbury and York Society), 2002. £30. 0 907239 63 3; 0262 995X

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903677973

Earlier volumes in this commendable project were published between 1977 and 1988; volumes i and iii, edited by Rosalind Hill, volume ii by D. B. Robinson. Volume iv deals with the archdeaconry of Nottingham, volume v with *Capitula*, material concerning the chapters of York, Beverley, Southwell, Ripon and Howden, together with the chapel of St Mary and the Holy Angels (York). The latter volume boasts two invaluable appendices. Appendix A names those who received papal provisions and provisory faculties, but for whom no admissions or collations are recorded. Some would-be beneficiaries are interesting for their involvement with Edward II or Queen Isabella – a petitioner until 1328. Among them are members of the Fieschi family. Manuel(e) di Fieschi (biography in *Hemingby’s register*, pp. 198–9) was the supposed author of a letter about the king’s final days; Hugh de Glanvill accounted for the expenses of Edward’s burial; while Edmund was apparently the

son of the William Trussell deputed to renounce homage. The Civilian, Benedict de Paston, had been a principal clerk of Walter Reynolds both at Worcester and Canterbury. Appendix B comprises four tables. The first lists provisions to 'the four great churches' made by Pope John XXII and Pope Benedict XII – who was far less generous. Table 2 analyses the patrons: as is to be expected the king predominates. The third table lists provisors' occupations. Melton's clerks make a poor showing, students proving three times as successful. The final table is complex, giving firstly the percentage of successful provisors under each category (royal, *curiales*, magnates, the curia etc.), and secondly the percentage of provisory benefices 'held by each category of provisors'. *Curiales* score heavily as successful within their category, being surpassed only by curial nominees; those of the archbishop come a good third, somewhat in advance of university clerks. But those who achieved the highest percentage of benefices were papal nominees, followed closely by royal clerks. Papal provision impinged on archiepiscopal collation – further reduced by exchanges nominally subject to consent. But as Archbishop Reynolds demonstrated (J. R. Wright, *The Church and the English crown, 1305–1334*, pt 1 – worth a cross-reference), – the system could be manipulated. Licences for incumbents' education are indexed *s.v.* 'Study': in vol. v no. '359?' should be '360?', in vol. iv most are lumped together as 'and'/'Cum ex eo'. Emden did not distinguish grants under this constitution, but 'Cum ex eo' can often be inferred from the text, particularly when the recipient's order is recorded. Tabulation would assist. The topic has generated various articles, the prototype that of Leonard Boyle in *Mediaeval Studies* (1962). A context for the threatened elevation of Canterbury's cross (vol. iv, nos 42–3) is in chapter v of this reviewer's *Ecclesia anglicana* (Toronto 1989). Some might cavil at the telegraphic style in volume v – omission of both definite and indefinite articles in text and footnotes, or the medial 'j' in the Latin text. Andrew de Bruges is indexed as of 'Bruges, Belgium'. Corroboration would be welcome. His name is variously spelled Brigges, Brug etc, widespread forms of Bridge(s). Emden (*Biographical register of Oxford*, iii, appendix *s.v.* Brigges) first mentions him in 1308 but failed to trace his ordination, often indicative of origin. For Elias Talleyrand see Norman Zacour's article (*American Philosophical Society* 1 [1960]). Editing is excellent, the registry's reliance on common form ensuring that little is lost by calendaring entries.

CLARE HALL,
CAMBRIDGE

ROY MARTIN HAINES

Petrarch's guide to the Holy Land. Itinerary to the sepulcher of Our Lord Jesus Christ. [Biblioteca Statale, Facsimile edition of Cremona, Deposito Libreria Civica, manuscript BB. 1.2.5.] Edited and translated by Theodore J. Cachey, Jr. Pp. ix + 235 incl. colour frontispiece and 11 plates. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2002. \$37.50. 0 268 03873 2
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S002204690368797X

Most of this letter describes the various attractions of the west coast of Italy. Petrarch never visited the Holy Land, and he made no attempt to provide a practical guide by reworking other medieval *itineraria*. Instead he sought to uplift his pilgrim friend at a more spiritual level, while catering for his humanist tastes by repeated references to Ulysses and to classical authors, and by paying rather more attention to

Alexander's tomb than to the Holy Sepulchre. The result is an interesting example of a complete reworking of a longstanding genre of writing under the influence of the reawakened pride in the glories of Italy's culture to which Petrarch contributed so much. Theodore Cachey's introduction carefully sets the work in the wider context of travel-writing which has attracted growing attention in recent years. The book is beautifully produced, with a sensitive English translation facing each of the thirty-nine pages of the full facsimile of one of the earliest copies, and a transcription of the Latin text below; ample annotation follows. The manuscript is written in a fine example of the clearly written *rotunda* that Petrarch advocated in the mid-fourteenth century, before the development of *humanistica* some fifty years later.

UNIVERSITY OF DURHAM

ALAN PIPER

Birgitta of Sweden and the voice of prophecy. By Claire L. Sahlin. (Studies in Medieval Mysticism, 3.) Pp. xvi + 266 incl. 6 ill. Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 2001. £50. 0 85115 821 8; 1465 5683

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903697976

The current resurgence of interest in the Swedish aristocrat, visionary and mystic, Birgitta of Sweden (d. 1373), mirrors the periodic bursts of fascination and castigation which she attracted in the late Middle Ages. For in the swiftness of her canonisation and the fragility of her saintly reputation she is without parallel. The mother of an order which quickly attracted rich and well-connected adherents and supporters, the visionaries' visionary whose experiences enriched and structured those of others – Dorothy of Montau, Margery Kempe – Birgitta of Sweden here receives a more contextualised and 'Swedish' treatment. For Claire Sahlin's lucid and interesting book is above all interested in tracing the emergence of a prophetic and visionary voice from within a domestic and regional social and religious circle. Her Birgitta is completely the aristocratic wife in charge of extensive estates, caring for a large aristocratic family and household, the person whose connections and capacities remained with the mystic she later became after renouncing marital domestic life. Birgitta's case is a powerful example of the transformation of the social and political endowment of an inspired individual into tools of religious rebirth. For a conjugal pilgrimage to Compostella created the experience that prompted Birgitta and Ulf to exchange their married life for the monastic. Ulf died in the mid-1340s, making it possible for Birgitta to follow the messages and visions which she had been receiving and which she was now free to spread through itinerant campaigns of admonition throughout Sweden. The royal family soon supported her by devoting in 1346 an estate and residence which were to become the first Birgittine monastery, at Vadstena. From here groups of brethren were to spread the Birgittine message and model all over Europe in the following centuries. The social and institutional networks of the order are explored by Sahlin through her command of scholarship in the Swedish language.

The most extraordinary part of the story of St Birgitta in late medieval religion is the way in which her *persona* divided scholarly and clerical opinion. St Birgitta was examined in the 1370s and 1380s, and was canonised in 1391. But criticism of her possible and later actual canonisation developed soon after her death and was as sustained and heated as was the support of her adherents. The tract, *Epistola concilii pacis*, by the Parisia theologian Henry of Langenstein (d. 1397), saw in her canonisation the

epitome of all that was corrupt in current ecclesiastical practice; while another tract, by a Perugian master, similarly questioned her divine inspiration. Yet her defenders were as numerous as her detractors, men like the energetic Alfonso of Jaén, her confessor, or Cardinal Adam Easton who wrote the *Defensorium Sanctae Birgittae* c. 1385–90. The debate continued well into the fifteenth century and was related to controversies over church reform and the identification of heresy. It thus arose again at the Council of Constance, eliciting the defence of a sceptic in matters related to women's visions, Jean Gerson. All these issues – Swedish–local, European–devotional, intellectual and ecclesiological – are discussed with good sense and based on a wide range of appropriate sources in Claire Sahlin's useful and interesting book, about a woman whose religion forced the discussion and exposure of the fissures and points of pressure and contest in late medieval institutional and devotional religion.

QUEEN MARY COLLEGE,
LONDON

MIRI RUBIN

Der Traktat des Antonio Roselli De conciliis ac synodis generalibus. Historisch-Kanonistische Darstellung und Bewertung. By Thomas A. Weitz. (Konziliengeschichte. Reihe B, Untersuchungen.) Pp. xli + 463. Paderborn: Ferdinand Schöningh, 2002. €67.40. 3 506 74728 2

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903707970

The so-called *Monarchia* of Antonio de' Roselli (c. 1381–1466) was compiled from materials written, mostly at least, during the pontificate of Eugenius IV and the years of the Council of Basle–Lausanne. Within the sprawling text is encapsulated what some readers may regard as the yolk of the egg, if not the pearl in the oyster. It is this text-within-a-text that Thomas Weitz is primarily concerned to examine in this impressive volume. Well over half his book is devoted to a detailed analysis of the *De conciliis* itself, copiously equipped with citations from the text and from other relevant sources. Here and elsewhere illuminating use is made of other unpublished works by Roselli himself. The egg and oyster similes would be misleading, however, if they tended to obscure the wider scope and significance of the book. A biographical chapter and an examination of the *Monarchia* as a whole precede the central examination of *De conciliis*; and that examination is followed by a chapter examining the positions taken on the issues with which Roselli was concerned by several other writers of the period – some, like Piero da Monte, familiar names, others much less well-known. The book ends with a thirty-six page *Summarium* which adds a good deal more to the value of the work than that heading would suggest, significantly widening the scope of the discussion. Even with the guidance this book provides, the problems with which Roselli sought to deal retain their stubborn difficulty, and, as Weitz acknowledges in his closing paragraph, the text he has analysed with such care is far from presenting a complete and harmonious solution. A thorough historical understanding of an attempt to resolve those problems in the critical circumstances of the mid-fifteenth century, however, has all the value the author claims for it; and such an understanding is notably advanced by this book.

UNIVERSITY COLLEGE,
LONDON

J. H. BURNS

Saint Vincent, diacre et martyr. Culte et légendes avant l'an mil. By Victor Saxer. (Subsidia Hagiographica, 83). Pp. vii + 376. Brussels: Société des Bollandistes, 2002. €65. 2 87365 011 7; 0777 8112
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903717977

This is a rare example of the volume of collected essays that have been successfully combined to give the appearance of a monograph, and of which it could be said that the whole is greater than the sum of its parts. This is not to suggest that the book conceals its origins as a collection of quite separate articles, whose individual publication history extends back as far as 1989, and which includes two items, of very unequal size, published here for the first time. The appropriate bibliographical details are made clear on the contents page. However, Monsignor Saxer, the former Rector of the Pontificio Istituto di Archeologia Cristiana in Rome, has been studying the nature and diffusion of the cult of St Vincent of Zaragoza for several decades. The chapters of the first part of the book are formed by articles he has written on the literary evidence for the spread of the cult in Spain, France and Italy, to which has here been added a very brief note on its appearance in Bergamo in the Lombard period. The second, much longer section of the volume is devoted to publishing and discussing texts relating to the cult in its different geographical manifestations and over a period of time extending from the late fourth to the tenth centuries. These conclude with previously unpublished critical editions of the *Passion* and *Translation of St Vincent*, that were written at Saint-Germain-des-Près in Paris in the ninth century, to which several of the other articles serve as prolegomena. The final chapter containing these meticulous editions takes up more than a quarter of the whole book, and constitutes the culmination of the author's work on this subject. Even for this alone, the book would have to be considered the essential guide for anyone interested in the cult of this northern Spanish saint, whose relics became the most treasured possession of a Merovingian royal monastery, but with all of the author's other edited texts and studies here reprinted, it becomes a unique repository of *Vincentiana*.

UNIVERSITY OF EDINBURGH

ROGER COLLINS

Medieval monastic education. Edited by George Ferzoco and Carolyn Muessig. Pp. xv + 237 incl. 10 ills. London–New York: Leicester University Press, 2000. £60. 0 7185 0256 9

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903727973

Monastic education is in every sense vocational training. Its every aspect, not only in the use of the written word, but also, as demonstrated here, in the deployment of pictorial images, the singing of the liturgy and the disciplining of the body, was integrated into a teaching programme designed to perfect the monastic body and soul. At the same time the frontier between monastic and secular education was an uneasy one. Some academic subjects, notably medicine and law, were always suspect, and Clark argues that even university monks following less contentious studies encountered difficulties; their libraries were understocked, their teaching limited and at least in theory segregated from the rest of the academic community, their study periods disjointed, seldom even following the rhythms of the university year. Though many might have been better off had they stayed at home where (as both Bellenger and

Greatrex here suggest) unsensational yet solid learning persisted, some university monks, cut off from the mainstreams of academic discourse, developed their own curricula which both looked back to the old humanism of the twelfth century and forward to the new. At the same time, elements of this education, seemingly so confined within the cloistered community were accessible to a wider audience; education seeped through the porous monastic walls in both directions. This is nowhere better demonstrated than in the case of the beguines, as Galloway shows in a typically revealing study of education in Lille and Douai, where beguine communities, themselves occupying the uncertain frontier between the monastic and lay, provided teaching necessary for both urban girls and boys in the cloth industry while training their own novices both for devotion and the temporal administration of their communities. One or two papers, such as an interesting, if perhaps ultimately unconvincing, study of the function of St Bartholomew as model and mentor for Guthlac of Croyland which raise more questions than it can answer, are more tenuously linked to the theme but overall this is a rich collection indeed, wide-ranging both chronologically and geographically. As with all volumes of this type there is a danger that a clear focus will be lost and any sense of developments over time be lacking. Generally, that problem is avoided but there are still some startling omissions. In particular there is nothing here on the 'new orders' and the Cistercians are hardly mentioned even in passing. While, too, it might be argued that the Augustinian canons are not appropriate to this study some comparison between the monastic and canonical educational experience would have been helpful. No collection of essays on medieval monasticism today is complete without its contribution to Hildegard of Bingen studies: this volume has two which is excessive and makes the collection somewhat unbalanced. If less attention had been paid to that remarkable Benedictine space might have been available to include these major overlooked themes.

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON

BRIAN GOLDING

Images, idolatry, and iconoclasm in late medieval England. Textuality and the visual image.

Edited by Jeremy Dimmick, James Simpson and Nicolette Zeeman. Pp. xiii + 250 + 15 figs. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002. £45. 0 19 818759 9
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S002204690373797X

Eleven of the thirteen contributors to this collection are specialists from English literature departments, as was appropriate for the conference that was the volume's starting-point. The subtitle tells us what to expect, and while there is plenty here to interest ecclesiastical historians, much of the emphasis is on 'textual iconoclasm', addressed to those at home with 'spectrality', *jouissance*, *mouvance* and the terminology of current literary criticism. We are confronted here with the image of the image, images in the mind, whether in the terms of contemporaries' *vis imaginativa*, or the idols and idolatry of late medieval writers. There is some perceptible straining to match the theme. Ralph Hanna's helpful exploration of Langland's Ymaginatif, with its pointers to grammar-school learning, apologises for its lack of iconoclasm, and the iconoclasm of one chapter is entirely limited to its post-medieval figurative sense. But there is rewarding reading here, including Nicholas Watson's assessment of idols and images in Walter Hilton, and David Aers's view of Langland's careful theological reticence in *Piers Plowman's* treatment of the sacrament of the altar. Sarah Stanbury

shows how Knighton's story of the Lollard burning of an image of St Katherine reverberates tellingly with issues raised by the popular legend of the saint, while the way in which an image miracle that features in *The arrivall of Edward IV* enhanced the political epiphany of the king's arrival at Daventry is explored by Wendy Scase. Discourse about images in fifteenth-century England is illuminated by Michael Camille in a characteristically stimulating and well-illustrated piece on the figure of idolatry in Guillaume de Deguileville's *Pèlerinage de la vie humaine* and the long expansion defending images introduced in Lydgate's translation. Finally, Brian Cummings's review of early sixteenth-century controversy enables us to see how competing claims for image and book were involved in the same semiological dilemma; the violent processes of iconoclasm and bibliophobia interacted as well as collided. As the blurb announces, the book moves the topic of the title into 'wider discursive territories' and a small sign of its departure from the Wycliffite nexus is the fact that texts in Matthew's *English works of Wyclif* are attributed in two chapters respectively to Wyclif and his Lollard followers.

CHIPPING ONGAR,
ESSEX

MARGARET ASTON

Nicholas of Cusa and his age. Intellect and spirituality. Essays dedicated to the memory of F. Edward Granz, Thomas P. McTighe and Charles Trinkaus. Edited by Thomas M. Izbicki and Christopher M. Bellitto. (Studies in the History of Christian Thought, 105.) Pp. xiv + 285. Leiden–Boston–Cologne: Brill, 2002. €73.90 04 12557 4; 0081 8607
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S002204690321798X

Research into the life and thought of Nicholas of Cusa (1401–64) – philosopher, theologian, canon lawyer, cardinal and reformer – has experienced resurgence in the United States, thanks especially to the American Cusanus Society whose conferences have led to the publication of this book and two predecessors, the first of their kind in English. The dedication of the current volume to three distinguished Renaissance scholars indicates the wide scope of the society's appeal: it has attracted more than those who specialise in some particular aspect of the cardinal's thought, probably because he represents an alternative to late medieval scholasticism and nominalism. At the same time, the editors have invited younger scholars to participate along with those who have established reputations, such as Bernard McGinn, Louis Dupré and Wilhelm Dupré. The present volume contains thirteen essays that cover three general topics. The first section, on context, interprets the subject in a broad sense, and includes two chapters on metaphysical issues: Wilhelm Dupré on spirit and mind in Cusanus and Louis Dupré on the cardinal's theory of religious symbols. A wider historical context engages Dennis Martin who writes on the Carthusians and late medieval spirituality. Cusanus' early life as a canon lawyer is not forgotten, however, as is demonstrated in Thomas Morrissey's article on 'Canonists in crisis' during the fifteenth-century reform councils. The second section takes us into still fairly uncharted territory with three articles on Nicholas's sermons: Lawrence Hundersmarck and Thomas Izbicki on some of the early sermons; Walter Euler on the role of Christ in sermons from the cardinal's visitation to Brixen; and Clyde Lee Miller on the presence of Eckhart's thought in a sermon from 1456.

Eckhart and Nicholas are also the subject of a chapter by Elizabeth Brient, while Bernard McGinn broadens the comparison to include other predecessors as well as Eckhart in his comprehensive essay on the motive for the Incarnation. H. Lawrence Bond reflects on the role of the icon and the 'iconic text' in Cusanus' best known work, *The vision of God*, and Brian Pavlac returns to the historical context with a study of Cusanus and the practice of excommunication in Germany during the period. Nicholas of Cusa's legacy, the subject of the third section, is treated by Yelena Matusevich who traces a continuity of ideas in Jean Gerson, Cusanus and Jacques Lefèvre d'Étaples; and by Morimichi Watanabe, long-time president of the Cusanus Society, who deals with the spiritual legacy from the cardinal's foundation, the St Nicholas Hospital in Kues. One of the prominent features of the three volumes thus far published is the exhaustive bibliography by Thomas Izbicki who here updates the listing he began in the first volume of all works on Cusanus in English.

LUTHERAN THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY,
GETTYSBURG

GERALD CHRISTIANSON

The exchequer cartulary of Torre Abbey (P.R.O. 164/19). Edited by Deryck Seymour. Pp. v + 571 incl. map. Torquay: Friends of Torre Abbey, 2000. £50 incl. post + packing from The Treasurer, The Friends of Torre Abbey, Torre Abbey, Kings Drive, Torquay TQ2 5JX. 0 9539 673 0 1
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S002204690327986

In an age in which successful courtiers sought to advertise their status and to make reparation for their sins by the foundation of new religious houses, William Brewer, scion of a previously undistinguished family of Hampshire foresters, could boast not only a greater advertisement than most, but perhaps greater sins for which to atone. Within a decade or so of 1195 William founded no fewer than three new monasteries: the Premonstratensian abbey of Torre and the Cistercian abbey of Dunkswell, both in Devon, and the Augustinian priory of Mottisfont in William's native Hampshire. Torre was the first and the wealthiest of these foundations, although it was at Dunkswell that William and his wife chose to be buried. Of the two surviving Torre cartularies, Deryck Seymour has chosen to edit only the early fifteenth-century manuscript now in the Public Record Office (PRO, E 164/19), leaving a proper collation between this and the thirteenth-century cartulary preserved at Trinity College, Dublin, to some future scholar. A collation will be needed, since the Dublin manuscript contains not only significantly more than the 320 charters preserved in E 164/19, but earlier and in some cases fuller texts. Seymour's is none the less a valiant effort by a keen local amateur. His transcriptions and his translations are rarely less than competent. He has made no attempt to search beyond the cartulary for supporting documentary evidence – most of the charters of John and Henry III, presented here with only approximate dates, survive with full witness lists and dating clauses in the chancery charter and patent rolls – whilst his introduction and his textual notes are somewhat naive. Torre, for example, is unlikely to have been Brewer's birthplace; papal letters dated at Avignon can hardly be attributed to Honorius III, and the count of 'Mortell' identified in no. 185 is in reality the future King John, count of Mortain. The edition is expensive, although its binding is so poor as to disintegrate after a single reading. None the less, for making accessible a

valuable collection of documents, including not only royal, papal and episcopal letters, but a wide selection of charters issued by such west country families as Courtenay, Tracy and Pomeroy, Deryck Seymour deserves the very warmest of thanks.

CHRIST CHURCH COLLEGE,
CANTERBURY

NICHOLAS VINCENT

Hoccleve's Regiment of princes. Counsel and constraint. By Nicholas Perkins. Pp. xi + 235 + 2 colour plates. Cambridge: D. S. Brewer, 2001. £35. 0 85991 631 6
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903237982

This volume is the first book-length study of Thomas Hoccleve's *Regiment of princes*, and it offers an interesting and detailed reading of the poem, considering its genre, its structure, its audience and its presentation of moral *exempla*. At the centre of the book Perkins presents an analysis of Hoccleve's source material, outlining the debt, both in structure and in content, owed by *The regiment of princes* to Jacobus de Cessolis's *De ludo scaccorum*. In examining the changes Hoccleve makes to his source material, particularly the increase in dramatic exchange, Perkins suggests that Hoccleve embeds a dialogic relationship between king and subject in *The regiment of princes*, and he presents speech, its representation, its interpretation and sometimes its absence, as crucial to his reading of the poem. As a petitionary poem, for instance, *The regiment* needs to create a sense of personal presence through mimicking speech patterns to persuade the patron to reward and recognise the poet. As a poem of advice, on the other hand, it strives to set universal standards of good governance, and to teach the king how to read the counsel he is given without overt criticism. Both genres seek to encourage a change in behaviour, and thus a response from their intended audience; in both cases, the speaker risks potentially painful rejection by their intended audience. Perkins argues that, as a result, Hoccleve's speaker is forced into a humble, helpless and dull *persona*, and he draws on evidence both literary and historical to support his view that such an attitude is neither craven nor proof of Hoccleve's unproblematic support of Lancastrian kingship. For example, he points to the desire of parliament to speak together in private before addressing the king, as evidence of the real dangers of public speech in Hoccleve's environment. The careful positioning of the advisory speaker and the difficulties of ensuring right reading by the royal audience are also reflected, Perkins argues, in texts such as *Mum and the soothsegger*, *Confessio amantis* and other advisory works. In such contexts, the dullness of the narrator of *The regiment* facilitates the examination of potentially difficult topics such as the self-governance of the king, the nature of royal power, and royal vulnerability to being reduced to an *exemplum*, most likely bad, for his successors. The last chapter of the book, which deals with manuscript evidence, stresses the variety of the readings which early audiences applied to *The Regiment*, and points to further areas of investigation into the early reception and positioning of the text. Altogether, this book makes a valuable contribution to the wider examination of advisory material in the fifteenth century, as well as to our understanding of its central subject, *The regiment of princes*.

UNIVERSITY OF NOTTINGHAM

NICOLA ROYAN

Oswaldus de Corda, *Opus pacis*. Edited by Belinda A. Egan. (Corpus Christianorum Continuatio Mediaevalis, 179.) Pp. 102. Turnhout: Brepols, 2001. €110 (cloth), €97 (paper). 2 503 04791 2; 2 503 04792 0
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903247989

Oswald de Corda (probably Hertz), often wrongly supposed an Englishman, after taking a degree in arts at Vienna in 1403, was professed at the charterhouse of Nördlingen, Bavaria, and in 1414 transferred to the Grande Chartreuse, where he became vicar (deputy to the prior), and in 1429 first prior of the new foundation at Perth, Scotland, where he died in 1434. This treatise of counsel on the correct or acceptable spelling and pronunciation of Latin liturgical, scriptural and patristic texts copied and used in his order was completed in 1417. In a lengthy English introduction the editor describes the strong Carthusian stress on the copying and use of books and the maintenance of uniformity in these as in other practices. She discusses variations in the degrees of discipline imposed by the order's statutes and the directives of the General Chapter from the twelfth century onwards, and other Carthusian texts on the same questions. This is the first edition of a work that has been mentioned quite often and sometimes quoted since Paul Lehmann discussed it in 1924. It is based on the two autograph manuscripts which have subsequently been identified, one altered and corrected by the author and another hand, the other a later fair copy by him. In view of the interest of the relationship, and the possibility of finding other work in his hand, one may regret the absence of a specimen photograph of each. Ten other copies are known and have been collated here. All of the extant and recorded copies were from charterhouses or other religious communities in Germany, the Netherlands and Switzerland, a fact which the editor adduces for her argument that the work was aimed particularly at resolving difficulties which may have arisen in that region of different linguistic habits on the reunification of the Carthusian order after the papal schism. No copy is known from England, although some of its advice would have been applicable here. Oswald's observations (the grammatical sources of which are traced by the editor) are instructive for any student of late medieval manuscripts. The editor has done a very good job in explaining the background and presenting the evidence for the text.

UNIVERSITY OF DURHAM

A. I. DOYLE

Versions of virginity in late medieval England. By Sarah Salih. Pp. ix + 278. Cambridge: D. S. Brewer, 2001. £45. 0 85991 622 7
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903257985

This book will be of use and interest to all those working on medieval and early modern religion and gender. Historians will find that Sarah Salih's discussion offers a survey of the many theories – literary and philosophical – which have been marshalled in the last two decades in the attempt to understand women's religious practices and writings. Her own idea emerges clearly and orientates this dense area of scholarship: it suggests that 'virginity' is best understood as a separate gender besides male and female in medieval thinking: 'virginity is not a denial or rejection of sexuality, but itself a sexuality' (p. 10). Seen as a gender – that is a culturally specific understanding of the significance of sexual orientation – it emerges as more complex and thus more historically variant than the statements about virginity by

Tertullian ('Virgins are still women' and thus always dangerously desirable). Virgins could range in mood and style, just as the desirable Agnes differed from the character of Katherine, learned, strong and forbidding. After establishing the medieval and modern terms in which virginity has been discussed, Salih turns to examining the historical/textual record of virgin life-style in three frames. She examines the virgin martyr literature contained in the thirteenth-century *Katherine Group*, then the life of enclosed nuns and, finally, in a very long chapter, the non-virginal virginity of Margery Kempe. When the matron from Lynn donned white garments, some were appalled, but all understood her to be exhibiting her change of life, her abandonment of the marital bed, and her striving, pained, perhaps deluded, but none the less sincere, to live the *imitatio Christi*. Late medieval England saw a resurgence of interest in virgin martyrs, as witnessed in the English works of Lydgate, Capgrave and Osborn of Bokenham. There was an appreciation of the martyrdom of virgins; the resolve and unshakeable faith which they demonstrated provided inspiring examples even for less heroic Christians. The men and women who commissioned such texts and chose virgin martyrs to adorn the rood-screens of their parishes admired Agnes and Katherine and Margaret, but they also marvelled at SS Edmund and Fremund, and at little boys allegedly martyred by Jews. Sarah Salih's intelligent decoding of female virginity signals the timeliness of another historical task: the understanding of virginity and chastity in the religious sensibility of men.

QUEEN MARY COLLEGE,
LONDON

MIRI RUBIN

Confessional identity in east-central Europe. Edited by Maria Crăciun, Ovidiu Ghitta and Graeme Murdock. (St Andrews Studies in Reformation History.) Pp. xvii + 207 incl. 5 figs. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2002. £49.50. 0 7546 0320 2
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903267981

Standing today in the centre of towns such as Aiud, Cluj or Făgăras and seeing the church spires each surmounted by symbols of their different faiths – Latin and Greek crosses, cockerels and globes – one is aware of the complex religious history of this region. The editors have brought together a fascinating collection of essays that explore the varied religious traditions of east-central Europe. The scope of the volume is more circumscribed than the title suggests (and it would seem than the editors originally intended); the majority of the essays focus on Hungary–Transylvania–Romania. But this does serve to make this a coherent collection of essays and provides the opportunity to learn more about religious coexistence to an extent which would have bewildered coreligionists in the west. This went beyond just the sharing of church buildings by different faiths. In Romania it saw the Orthodox Church placed within the institutional structure of the Reformed Church. Their metropolitan was subject to the approval and authority of the Reformed superintendent, who also carried out inspections of their churches.

An overview of the religious history and diversity of the region is provided in the editors' introduction. It is a succinct account which is particularly useful for those unfamiliar with the political fragmentation and the course of the Reformation in eastern Europe. It sets out the legal privileges and environment that determined the religious choices made during the early modern period. The introduction

emphasises the key theme of this volume – confessional identity. One of the means by which this identity could be established was through the use of catechisms, a form of religious literature that was particularly popular and readily accessible with the advent of printing. The Reformers saw them as an essential tool in inculcating their beliefs, both through the pulpit and in the home.

Catechisms therefore provided one of the key means by which confessional identity could be established in east-central Europe. One of the earliest catechisms is discussed by Thomas Fudge in ‘Luther and the “Hussite” catechism of 1522’. Education had been an important element in the Hussite movement and although an actual catechism was not produced until the beginning of the sixteenth century, it drew upon questions and answers about their faith deriving from texts from before 1414. The publication of the catechism in 1522 represented an institutionalisation of the movement and provided a statement of their beliefs in the context of the more radical Lutheran agenda. The number and variety of catechisms that circulated in this part of Europe is examined by Krista Zach in ‘Protestant vernacular catechisms and religious reform in sixteenth-century east-central Europe’. Reformers from the region, who had studied at the German and Swiss universities, returned to write and translate religious literature for use in their homelands. From the 1540s to the 1580s between twenty-five and thirty different versions of Protestant catechisms were produced in languages of the region, including the very first printed texts in Romanian, Slovene, Croat and Slovak and one of the earliest in Hungarian. Zach points out in her conclusion that of some of these catechisms are held to be important in some areas more for their linguistic contribution than for their religious impact. The effectiveness of catechetical teaching is examined closely in Graeme Murdock’s informative essay on ‘Calvinist catechizing and Hungarian Reformed identity’. Learning the correct responses to catechetical questions and scriptural passages raised concern about rote learning without a detailed understanding of what was being said and the possible superstitious overtones of incantations. The catechisms were therefore reinforced by further religious questioning and examination to ensure that the essentials of belief were understood by the faithful and as a test against the spread of heretical beliefs.

Murdock touches on the use of catechisms translated into Romanian as a means of proselytisation. These catechisms have in the past been seen mainly in terms of their literary significance, and considerable doubts have been expressed about the actual existence of a Romanian Reformed community. This is the subject of an important essay by Maria Crăciun, which considers the importance of these catechisms in spreading Protestant ideas but is placed in the context of a fascinating study of Calvinist attempts to reform the Romanian Orthodox Church and the emergence of a Romanian Reformed Church. Another interesting case study is provided in Carmen Florea’s ‘Shaping Transylvanian anti-Trinitarian identity in an urban context’, which looks at the community in Cluj where the Church’s superintendent was also often the *plebanus* or chief minister. The Greek Catholic Churches are the subject of two articles: Ovidiu Ghitta studies the catechisms of these Churches in Hungary and Transylvania while Pompiliu Teodor provides us with a survey of the Transylvanian Church. In this complex and varied religious environment it is often possible to overlook the place of the Catholic Church in Transylvania which without leadership became a field of missionary activity for Rome. Two essays examine this subject, Csilla Gabor looking at devotional literature while Joachim Bahlcke looks at the political history of the Church in the early modern period. It is the

divided attitude of the Catholic Church towards the Jews which is discussed in Judith Kalik's essay on eighteenth-century Poland.

This collection of essays sheds important light on the varied religious faiths of eastern Europe in the early modern period. While some might consider that there is an over-concentration on Hungary–Transylvania–Romania, the essays provide important insights into the impact of the Reformation in this region. This is a coherent collection; its emphasis on catechisms demonstrates how they provided the means by which confessional identity could be established amongst members of the Church themselves as well as a means of proselytisation. It is therefore not only of interest to those studying the religious history of eastern Europe but more widely as a case study of the effectiveness and means by which confessional identities could be established.

UNIVERSITY OF EXETER

ANDREW SPICER

Ramus and reform. University and Church at the end of the Renaissance. By James Veazie Skalnik. (Sixteenth Century Essays & Studies, 60.) Pp. xi + 172. Kirksville: Truman State University Press, 2002. \$39.95. 0 943549 93 0

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903277988

In this work James Veazie Skalnik seeks to set the life and thought of Pierre de la Ramée (Peter Ramus) in the context of sixteenth-century France. Skalnik argues persuasively that Ramus' various ideas for change in education, the Reformed Church and politics ended in failure because by the time Ramus articulated his views, the crest of the wave of openness in French society had passed. Instead, Ramus ran into the increasingly rigid beginnings of *ancien régime* France. Skalnik's analysis of Ramus' view of the ideal form of government in Church and State is particularly revealing. Skalnik clarifies effectively that Ramus supported the idea of a political meritocracy, led by the learned, yet given his largely stormy relations with his academic colleagues, it seems difficult to see how his ideas would have worked out in practice. The strength of this work lies in its awareness of the importance of the historical context of sixteenth-century France in assessing Ramus' thought and its impact. The more general question the book raises is one of approach. Can one, through the study of one major figure, albeit set in his or her historical context, draw meaningful conclusions about the society itself at the time? Skalnik's argument that Ramus epitomised the men whose ideas no longer fit the world of their day is credible. Yet to use Ramus' largely unhappy career outcomes as a prism through which to analyse early modern society is a larger and more debatable step. Did Ramus encounter problems because French society was increasingly hierarchical and rigid, or because his contentious approach meant that he made enemies too easily? Can one gain a better understanding of a society through the study of a man as unusual as Ramus?

One area that remains unexplained in any detail is the reasons for Ramus' popularity in certain quarters, especially in England. Skalnik suggests that this was due to a more democratic, merit-oriented spirit, especially among the Puritans. Yet one would need more evidence to be convinced that the English warmed to more than the Ramist method of laying out topics. A complete bibliography of secondary sources used in the book would also be helpful to readers.

Overall, this work is to be commended for providing an effective and highly readable account of Ramus in his early modern context. It may also generate helpful discussions among scholars as to whether Ramus' career serves as a good vehicle for the analysis of major transformations in early modern France.

H. HENRY MEETER CENTER,
GRAND RAPIDS

KARIN MAAG

Law and Protestantism. The legal teachings of the Lutheran Reformation. By John Witte, Jr. Pp. xix + 337 incl. frontispiece and 7 ills. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002. £47.50 (cloth), £16.95 (paper). 0 521 78132 9; 0 521 01299 6
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903287984

The author is a specialist in both religious and legal history at Emory University in Atlanta, Georgia, and he has written an excellent introduction to a controversial and little-understood subject. He demonstrates how Luther's well-known attacks on the medieval canon law have to be weighed against his own pragmatic retraction, as it became clear that the Reformation was in danger of promoting lawlessness in the name of evangelical freedom. Witte pays special attention to the vexed questions of matrimony and education, but he also shows how the Lutherans gradually worked out a new synthesis between the pre-Reformation canon law and the demands of Luther's theology. Much of what he says can be applied to the English situation, but it is instructive to realise that there were also important differences between England and Protestant Germany, most obviously in the way in which civil and canon law merged into one another in the later sixteenth century.

Witte is unusual in that he gives equal weight and importance to both law and theology, and it is this happy combination which makes his book so valuable. He also discusses the effects of legal reforms made before the Reformation, and interprets the early Lutherans in the light of a wider and more on-going process of reform than is usually the case. He is particularly careful to avoid either magnifying Lutheran achievements or disparaging them, recognising as he does that there were both advantages and disadvantages in what was achieved nearly five hundred years ago. But whether we are for or against them, Luther's reforms continue to exercise an extraordinary influence on the modern world, as Witte points out in his concluding chapter.

The book is well researched and carefully documented. Those who know and appreciate Richard Helmholz's work on English ecclesiastical law will be delighted with this volume, which covers much the same ground for Germany. Perhaps best of all, Witte does not assume that his readers have as much legal knowledge as he has, and he is always careful to explain both terminology and legal structures, with a non-specialist audience clearly in mind. Reformation scholars of all kinds will find this a most stimulating and rewarding study, for which the author is to be thanked and congratulated.

BEESON DIVINITY SCHOOL,
SANFORD UNIVERSITY

GERALD BRAY

Reformation, politics and polemics. The growth of Protestantism in East Anglian market towns, 1500–1610. By John Craig. (St Andrews Studies in Reformation History.) Pp. xvi + 267 incl. 3 tables, 7 figs and 2 maps. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2001. £49.50. 0 7546 0269 9

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903297980

This volume of essays continues, with great success, Patrick Collinson's quest to 'discover what the Reformation did for the towns and what the towns did for the Reformation'. 'Part of the aim of this book', concludes Craig, 'has been to demonstrate some of the ways in which townsmen and women were acting both as mediators and definers of the Crown's policy of reformation.' In pursuit of this aim he presents case studies of the interweaving of religion, politics and social attitudes in four East Anglian market towns: Mildenhall, Bury St Edmunds, Thetford and Hadleigh. In so doing he shows that in the course of moulding their own version of parish Protestantism each of these towns has a different story to tell. In Mildenhall the churchwardens hold centre stage as mediators between the authority of a national Church and the attitudes of their parishioners. The upshot appears to have been a mixture of co-operation with, and parochial assertiveness against, episcopal authority. Craig's study of Bury St Edmunds (which, together with its seven valuable appendices, occupies almost half the text) presents a definitive version of the emergence of full-blooded Protestantism among the 'middling sort' which culminated in a successful struggle with conservative elements in the town for political and social control over the community. The case of Thetford stands this story on its head. Here, too, there were radicals and conservatives in religion, but conflict within the town was first and foremost about 'office-holding and the use and misuse of power'. The townsmen did not divide along the religious 'fault line' albeit the latter contributed polemical overtones to what was essentially a secular power struggle. Hadleigh was the joker in the pack. Here, despite the ministry of notable reformers down to 1554, under Elizabeth 'it developed no reputation for puritanism'. Inevitably one of Craig's principal concerns has been to gain some sense of the 'religious life of the common sort of people'. To great effect he has buttressed the growing body of opinion that in East Anglian towns the 'middling sort' played a crucial part in the development of Protestantism. He has also made a serious attempt to discover the mind-set of the poorer sorts. On this last point this juror is abstaining from judgement, even though Craig's sensitive use of churchwardens' accounts presents a challenging agenda which may call for close co-operation between historians and anthropologists. Although the principal chapters of this book are revised versions of previously published essays, two well-argued introductory chapters ensure that the whole is greater than the sum of the parts. Here and there some awkward passages occur (probably the result of hasty proof reading), but generally both narrative and argument is clearly presented. That this is an important book for ecclesiastical historians and students of the Reformation hardly needs saying, but it is also a 'must' for urban, local and cultural historians and it presents a model for those who may attempt similar studies for rural parishes.

Flugschriften gegen die Reformation (1525–1530). 2 vols. Edited by Adolf Laube, with Ulman Weiss. Pp. viii + 669; viii + 671–1332. Berlin: Akademie Verlag, 2000. DM 248 (each). 3 05 003312 6; 3 05 003313 4
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903307985

These volumes are the latest in a series, begun under the auspices of the Academy of Sciences of the former German Democratic Republic and now continued by the Martin-Luther University of Halle-Wittenberg, of edited selections of pamphlets of the German Reformation. Laube and his collaborators have produced another very useful tool for both teaching and research. Some fifty-nine works are presented here (though many have been filleted) by more than twenty-five different writers, ranging from the famous (King Henry VIII in German) to the now largely forgotten (Bachmann, Oberwalt, Vattlin). Each pamphlet is furnished with a note on its printing history and historical context, with footnotes explaining words and word-forms unfamiliar to modern German readers, and with explanatory endnotes. The principles of selection remain idiosyncratic, betraying perhaps the ideological origins of the series: pamphlets in Latin are considered elite and therefore not real pamphlets, while the many anonymous and pseudonymous efforts are air-brushed out of the picture. None the less, the selection gives an accurate impression of this stage of Catholic anti-Reformation literary production. By 1525 conservative writers had recovered from the initial shock and were now capable of mounting a coherent and co-ordinated counter-punch. They were helped in this by the emergence of conflict both between Protestants (for example pamphlet no. 52, on the Marburg colloquy) and supposedly within the same individual (for example nos 47–9, Cochlaeus' famous 'Sieben Köpfe Martin Luther' series). Catholics were becoming adept spin-doctors, who could criticise Luther for inciting the peasants to revolt in 1524/5 and then with equal insouciance attack him for his heartless denunciation of their use of force. Theologically, the chief concerns remained as they had been before 1525, though the sacrifice of the mass now took centre-stage. But in this period there was an increasing tendency to attempt to relate the numerous individual Protestant errors to some basic, underlying error, namely the elevation of the authority of Scripture over that of ecclesiastical tradition.

UNIVERSITY OF HULL

DAVID BAGCHI

Humanismus und Kirchenkritik. Matthias Flacius Illyricus als Erforscher des Mittelalters. By Martina Hartmann. (Beiträge zur Geschichte und Quellenkunde des Mittelalters, 19.) Pp. 336 + 8 plates. Stuttgart: Thorbecke, 2001. €40. 3 7995 5719 9
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903317981

A significant number of Flacius' contemporaries and subsequent historians of Protestantism alike have found him 'odious', as S. R. Maitland remarked in 1837, but he has also recently found powerful advocates (not least Oliver K. Olson, the first part of whose comprehensive and highly sympathetic study of his life appeared in 2002). Martina Hartmann eschews both the dismissive historical tradition, of which she gives a clear account, and the religiously biased writing she detects in some recent historical studies. Her scholarly and painstaking investigation of Flacius' achievement as a historian of the Middle Ages and discoverer and collector of important

manuscripts does not disguise his intractability, apologetical energy and single-mindedness in the service of his understanding of Lutheranism. She chronicles his retrieval of manuscripts and his reliance on rich and powerful patrons; she assesses the merits of the *Catalogus testium veritatis* in comparison with those of the *Magdeburg Centuries* which Flacius inspired but left to others to compose, and charts his remarkable knowledge and sense of the medieval period. She acknowledges that he committed errors of attribution and dating, and that his approach to the past is driven by his apologetic need to document both 'prereformation' hostility to the papacy and medieval thought on issues such as investiture and clerical celibacy; but she claims persuasively that his range of sources is more extensive and his editorial skills more refined and reliable than those of such rivals as Melancthon and Peucer, the continuators of the *Chronicon Carionis*. She also demonstrates that his sense of the gaps in his own account (largely in the period before 1000) is more acute, and that his inclusion of Old High German as well as Latin texts in his *Catalogus* places his endeavours in the tradition of *Bibelhumanismus* rather than Renaissance historiography. Hartmann is at pains to show how in this work he was careful not to fragment sources as the *Magdeburg Centuries* do, and how he adheres there to the single principle of chronology, whereas the *Centuries* (to which, she argues, he contributed less than is generally claimed) have a less coherent structure. Much useful information is given about the book history of Flacius' works and the history of his acquisition of documents. Hartmann accompanies this dispassionate reassessment with a sophisticated identification of the books and manuscripts he possessed or annotated; an appendix provides the best account available of his library. Also included is an edition of ten unpublished letters relating to the investiture controversy from one of the transcriptions Flacius caused to be made, now preserved in Wolfenbüttel, where the majority of the manuscripts he assembled are to be found. Hartmann's meticulous archival work in these two appendices extends the same care to Flacius' work (without the polemical fervour) as he did to medieval letters on ecclesiastical matters and accounts of church councils.

ALL SOULS COLLEGE,
OXFORD

IAN MACLEAN

Sodomy in early modern Europe. Edited by Tom Betteridge. (Studies in Early Modern History.) Pp. ix + 173. Manchester–New York: Manchester University Press, 2002. £49.99 (cloth), £16.99 (paper). 0 7190 6114 8; 0 7190 6115 6
JEH 54 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903327988

One of the most important services which an historian performs for humanity is to listen to silence. What has not been said? Why has a situation been made to appear simple, when investigation reveals it as very complex? Telling a simple story about the past will probably lead to a simple view of the end-result, which is the present. Nowhere is this more true than the history of sexuality: in particular the supposed great simplicity of God's purpose for sexuality – two sexes, men and women, with genital and emotional relations demanding one of each, no more, no less. In fact, the past like the present is far more complex than that. So when the historian gets beyond the loud, confident, simple noise, and listens to the complex whispers beyond it, voices may begin to emerge in the silence. That task is performed by this useful set of

essays on perceptions and realities of sodomy in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, reflecting the work of historians and literary scholars. Engagingly the essays are arranged alphabetically by author, to remove any sense that either of these often discordant disciplines is being privileged. The reader is guided by an introduction from the editor, who also contributes a brief essay on John Bale and John Foxe: here there is a contrast between Bale's emphatic construction of Protestant masculinity versus the Catholic perversion of celibacy, which may have autobiographical roots, with Foxe's rather more nuanced presentation of emotional relationships between male martyrs (alongside his vigorously journalistic presentation of Bishop Bonner's disciplinary inclinations). A good place to take up reading would be Sarah Salih's careful essay on medieval views of sexual identity, before launching into essays which reflect the insight of the late Alan Bray in his classic *Homosexuality in Renaissance England* (1981) that the Church's stereotype of sodomy as diabolic disorder was so horrific that often people did not relate their actual sexual behaviour to it. So Maria R. Boes for Frankfurt-am-Main and N. S. Davidson for Venice both find a remarkably high degree of toleration of same-sex activity, and in the case of Venice, an enterprising Conventual Franciscan prepared to go into print in praise of same-sex love and sexual activity. P. G. Maxwell-Stuart reminds us that one variable in sudden upsurges of sexual intolerance was social and political disruption, as when the Scottish Kirk in the English-occupied Scotland of the 1650s suddenly discovered an urgent need to stamp out bestiality (at much the same time as it stepped up its persecution of witches). Much pragmatic research here undermines the crudities of Foucauldian views of the history of sexuality, in particular the idea that before the medical and psychological revolutions of the nineteenth century, same-sex activity was a matter of 'acts without discourse'. William Naphy offers a *précis* of his recent book on sexual regulation in Geneva, and describes the courts there showing a remarkably twenty-first-century understanding of the categories of sexual acts (within a completely different punitive framework) – while in Geneva, Venice and Frankfurt, many people are shown to have categorised their same-sex activities in the language of love. Danielle Clark considers how discussion of male favourites in literature hovered uneasily between the categories of friendship, patronage and sodomy, triggering potentially inappropriate social as well as sexual relationships. Alan Stewart deals contrariwise with the fraught relationship between King James VI of Scotland and George Buchanan: that stern and unloved tutor's beatings contrived to fracture social relationships in a rather different manner to that which may have been employed by some of James's later favourites. Tom Webster provides an interesting perspective on Puritan ministers as they sought to express the nurturing and therefore feminine side of their pastoral ministry in terms which would not threaten the newly-established married masculinity of the Protestant ministry: many of them formulated a startlingly wifely relationship with their Saviour through judiciously emotional meditation on the Song of Songs. A moving epilogue is Alan Bray's own reflection on his landmark earlier work: his miniature essay, viewing his research through the prism of Derrida's discussion of friendship, is an important document in the historiography of a scholar who struggled to reconcile his sexual identity with his conversion to Roman Catholicism.

Communities in early modern England. Networks, place, rhetoric. Edited by Alexandra Shepard and Phil Withington. (Politics, Culture and Society in Early Modern Britain.) Pp. xii + 276 incl. 1 table and 2 ill. Manchester–New York: Manchester University Press, 2000. £49.50 (cloth), £16.99 (paper).
 0 7190 5476 1; 0 7190 5477 X

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903337984

As the editors point out, the term ‘community’ has proved a slippery customer, encompassing both rhetorical warmth and conceptual vagueness. Eschewing warm fuzziness, Alexandra Shepard and Phil Withington have gathered and edited twelve essays which reflect on communities as networks, as changing in place and as rhetorical constructions. The volume is well balanced, consisting of an introduction and the twelve essays divided equally into three parts. Under ‘Networks’, Ian Archer explores the social networks discovered through a close analysis of the people with whom Samuel Pepys ‘dined, supped or drank’ in 1660 and 1666, and argues that brokers such as Pepys hold a key to understanding an emerging metropolitan identity. Margaret Sena scrutinises the zealous activities of William Blundell, an Elizabethan Catholic Lancashire gentleman, to suggest that the threat posed by networks of Catholic dissent was more powerful than has often been acknowledged. Margaret Pelling discusses the networks of female medical practitioners accused by the College of Physicians of practising physic in London without licence and in a contribution as much to the social history of reading, Jason Scott-Warren reconstructs the networks of manuscript exchange through a detailed analysis of Tanner MSS 168 and 169 which once belonged to Sir Stephen Powle. The second section, entitled ‘Place’, opens with a subtle essay by Steve Hindle on the shifting membership and experience of community in the rural parish and includes Phil Withington’s exploration of the changing characteristics and practices of civic community in Restoration York. Paul Griffiths argues that criminal communities in early modern London are best imagined as a ‘shifting sequence of overlapping circles’ (p. 115) and Craig Muldrew reflects critically and persuasively on the ways in which community and individualism have been interpreted from the medieval period to the present. Finally, under ‘Rhetoric’, Cathy Shrank explores the ways in which a small group of mid-Tudor authors advocated the use of a standardised form of English common pronunciation with implications for the nation. Alexandra Shepard examines the rhetorical construct of ‘town’ and ‘gown’ as they interacted and competed in Cambridge. Natasha Glaisyer observes the ‘community of the text’, created by the readers of and contributors to John Houghton’s weekly periodical, *A Collection for Improvement of Husbandry and Trade* (1692–1703) and Geoff Baldwin argues that the imagined community of the term ‘public’ as referring to the whole nation was a development of the contested politics of the seventeenth century. Taken as a whole, the volume is uniformly excellent and enormously stimulating. There are no duds in this collection and the striking feature of the separate essays is the way in which they aptly illustrate and amplify the brief but intelligently suggestive conclusions of a masterly introduction.

SIMON FRASER UNIVERSITY,
 BRITISH COLUMBIA

JOHN CRAIG

Ignatius von Loyola. Mystik – Theologie – Kirche. By Gottfried Maron. Pp. 304. Göttingen, Vanderhoeck & Ruprecht, 2001. DM 68. 3 525 55442 7

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903347980

Throughout his working life, Gottfried Maron, Professor of Church History in the Protestant faculty at Kiel, wrote short essays on Ignatius Loyola. Only in the early years of his retirement, however, has he been able to write a full-scale monograph. He makes no attempt to duplicate recent biographies (Tellechea, Dalmases), psychological studies (Meissner), or wider accounts of the early Jesuits (O'Malley). Instead he takes up a challenge laid down by Hugo Rahner, Karl's elder brother, and perhaps – for all his faults – the figure most responsible for the modern renewal in Jesuit understandings of Ignatius. He seeks to provide a study of Ignatius' theology, one that – significantly as we shall see – depends principally on Ignatius' own written words, rather than on what Ignatius left unsaid. This theological concern makes Maron's work unique, quite apart from its status as the first full-length Protestant contribution to Ignatian studies for at least seventy years.

Maron gives us seven thematic chapters, on Scripture, mysticism, Ignatius' conception of theology, ecclesiology, Christology and relationship to Christ, the theology of the human person and the idea of reform. An eighth chapter, 'Ignatius von Loyola in evangelischer Sicht', begins by offering a valuable sketch of how Protestant perceptions of Ignatius have changed (interestingly, the first Protestants who encountered the Jesuits were quite unaware of Ignatius and thought that Canisius was their founder [p.270]). Then Maron offers his own account of the similarities and differences between Ignatius and Luther, before expressing some worthy hopes that Catholics and Protestants can learn from each other and work together.

Maron is aware that Jesuits dominate Ignatian scholarship, but does not lament this fact nor issue any serious challenge to what have become standard positions in the literature. He is well acquainted with the major works of the last fifty years, and regularly provides deft, concise syntheses that even specialists will find worth consulting. In some areas he moves the discussion significantly forward. Though Maron gives what is now a consensus account of how the early Jesuits are to be understood in terms of Catholic Reform or Counter-Reformation, he offers some striking new readings of the sources – notably of correspondence between Ignatius and Canisius, as well as making some interesting connections between the early Jesuits and Wolfgang Reinhard's theories regarding the Reformation and modernity. Maron also offers us a valuable brief *excursus* on Jesuit devotion to Mary, pointing up effectively how it is only well after Ignatius' time that the issue becomes a matter of polemic.

Maron's work is at its best when it is most informed by the skills now common among historians of Christianity. It is less satisfactory, though always interesting and stimulating, when it addresses questions of fundamental theology and ecumenical interpretation. In the final chapter, Maron's commitment to ecumenical collaboration stands in some tension with his sharp differentiation between Ignatius and Luther, and this tension typifies the book as a whole. Some recent, and perhaps sometimes romantically unreflective, writing on Ignatius has stressed the similarities between early Jesuit concerns and those of the magisterial reformers: a Christocentrism, a concern that the Word be both well preached and authentically heard. Maron does not deny these similarities, but insists stoutly on the very different ways in which Ignatius and Luther understood these commitments, tellingly

structuring his account in terms of the three Lutheran slogans, *solus Christus, sola scriptura, sola fide*. 'It is not the Word of Jesus Christ that stands in the centre for Ignatius as it does for Luther, but the figure (*Gestalt*) of Jesus' (p. 276). For Ignatius, devotion to Christ is a matter of pilgrimages to the Holy Land, of the pope and the Church, as well as the Word, which in any case he initially received only through Ludolf's paraphrases. Scriptural authority is at best one authority among others, and often subordinate to that of the Church or of Ignatius' own experience. The influence of Maron's classically Protestant convictions is apparent elsewhere too: in the first half of the book Ignatius is seen as a founding figure in practical theology, and criticised for instrumentalising theology to the service of the Church. Scripture serves in Ignatius' spiritual world as *das nachträglich Bestätigende*, as what subsequently confirms insights already acquired through other means.

Though such claims are trenchant and thought-provoking, there is something deeply unsatisfactory about the strategy of testing Ignatius by strict Lutheran criteria and finding him wanting. There are important historical facts which do not fit Maron's theological framework, notably the major tensions between Ignatius' and church authority – tensions which Maron notes but cannot include within his interpretation. Protestant preoccupations regarding the gulf between creator and creature prevent Maron from making coherent sense of Ignatius' contemplative prayer, even if his pages on Ignatius' courtly imagery are suggestive. Moreover, such a procedure fails to respect a principle central to the method of Ignatius' *Spiritual exercises*, and articulated in the so-called Presupposition at the beginning: holiness and authenticity are compatible with pluralism, even ineptitude, at the level of doctrinal formulation. Approaches to ecumenism informed by such a principle will inevitably generate more generous, diverse and irenic accounts of Christian belonging than those which insist on subscription to formulae – a point that may help explain contemporary differences of opinion as to whether agreed statements such as the 1999 Augsburg Joint Declaration on Justification are saying anything of substantive significance.

Most important, however, is that Maron's own ecumenical commitment to Christians learning from each other and working together, expressed eloquently in the book's final pages, implies a more flexible approach to theological interpretation than the one he actually adopts. For Maron's Ignatius, there is always 'an active moment of bringing forth, of production' in the hearing of God's Word, whereas for his Luther the process is one of passive confrontation with the Word 'neat' (p. 280). This latter claim may echo venerable Lutheran rhetoric, and may indeed point towards something which is true. Taken at face value, however, it is nonsense, on both philosophical and psychological grounds. And similar face-value nonsense, such as the claim that Ignatius' private revelations could in principle substitute for Holy Scripture (how would he have recognised the revelations for what they were unless he had been in contact with scriptural revelation?), can be found in the Ignatian tradition too, as Maron tellingly notes. When we contemporary Christians commit ourselves to learning from each other in our reading of the past, we do so because we are aware of the unfinished business, the incoherences we bring to the process. Dialogue implies an openness to having our understanding extended and corrected. Nevertheless, disappointment that Maron's relentlessly Protestant reading of Ignatius' theology does not seem to be informed by the best of recent ecumenical reflection needs to be tempered by a recognition that he has produced an immensely

learned, clear and stimulating study. The plea for something more is grounded in a recognition that what Maron has given us is already of great value.

CAMPION HALL,
OXFORD

PHILIP ENDEAN SJ

Female monastic life in early Tudor England. With an edition of Richard Fox's translation of the Benedictine rule for women, 1517. Edited by Barry Collett. (The Early Modern Englishwoman 1500–1750. Contemporary editions.) Pp. x + 179 incl. 4 figs. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2002. £40. 1 84014 609 5

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903357987

This volume is one in a new Ashgate series focusing on the 'early modern Englishwoman', each of which includes a critical edition of a contemporary text. Here a seventy-page essay on female monasticism in the last four decades before its demise is coupled with Bishop Richard Fox's English translation of the Benedictine rule for the four nunneries within his diocese of Winchester: the Benedictine abbey in Winchester itself (Nunnaminster), those in Romsey and Wherwell and the Cistercian priory in [Hartley] Wintney. Collett's approach to Fox's edition of the rule, published by Richard Pynson, the king's printer, in 1516/1517, is refreshingly sane and balanced. He does not interpret the bishop's instructive insertions into the text as evidence of an overriding concern to curtail the nuns' legitimate freedom by imposing on them an unreasonable degree of subjection. In Collett's view Fox evinced no fear of increasingly literate religious women with independent minds; he was confident that they, if provided with instruction in the precepts of the rule, would come to understand and readily obey. His primary concern for the nuns was the fulfilment of their spiritual vocation within the monastic life, both in their individual lives and in the life of the community. Against the recent tendency to favour a gender-orientated reading of Fox's rule and of other vernacular texts then in circulation, Collett sees no signs of this bishop's unease about unruly nuns threatening the ecclesiastical *status quo*, no veiled attempt, in the explanatory passages, to assert and enforce clerical domination and to command unquestioning obedience. Fully aware of the problem of laxity in female houses due to the nuns' understandable reluctance to be cut off completely from the outside world, Fox favoured a fatherly reprimand over a repressive denunciation. The introductory essay provides a vivid account of some of the last abbesses and prioresses drawn mainly from episcopal and archiepiscopal visitation records. The rule survives in two identical copies: press-mark G. 10245 in the British Library and Arch.A.d.15 in the Bodleian Library, Oxford, from the former of which the typographical facsimile of the present edition has been produced. Two full-page reproductions of the frontispiece (*recto* and *dorso*), Fox's prologue and the first page of St Benedict's prologue in the original edition are also reproduced. A few slips have escaped notice: Kent described as a diocese (p. 8); Wherwell, spelled 'Wherewell' throughout; the abbey of St Augustine, Bristol, identified as Benedictine rather than Augustinian (pp. 31, 178); and the priory of Lyminster in Sussex identified as Lymington (p. 42). Finally, in the ample bibliography it is surprising to find no mention of Diana Coldicott's *Hampshire nunneries* (Phillimore 1989).

ROBINSON COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

JOAN GREATREX

Early modern Catholicism. Essays in honour of John W. O'Malley, SJ. Edited by Kathleen M. Comerford and Hilmar M. Pabel. Pp. xxxiii + 324 incl. 31 ill. Toronto–Buffalo–London: University of Toronto Press, 2001. £45 (cloth), £18 (paper). o 8020 3547 7; o 8020 8417 6

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903367983

The Revd John O'Malley SJ, Distinguished Professor of Church History at Weston Jesuit School of Theology, has contributed extensively to recent historical research and historiographical debates in the field of the Counter- or Catholic Reformation and the early modern Churches of the Spanish, Portuguese and French colonial empires. The introduction and O'Malley's bibliography in this volume attest to the preponderance of his learning and his influence upon other scholars, as does the title of this collection of sixteen articles. 'Early modern Catholicism' was a term he coined when giving the Martin D'Arcy Lectures at the University of Oxford in 1993, published in 2000 as *Trent and all that*. Professor O'Malley has presented this phrase to stand alongside Counter-Reformation, Catholic Reform, Tridentine Catholicism and other terms, to embrace them and such disparate topics as the devotion of reform-minded clerics to popular religion and the Marian piety of Chinese aristocratic women, which may be found in this book. Besides serving as a *Festschrift*, the editors offer these essays to demonstrate that Catholic Christianity in this period was hardly monolithic, for all its global reach; they and the other contributors succeed admirably. Kathleen Comerford demonstrates that the impact of the Roman catechism and Trent's decree on seminaries was very slow in coming in Italy: the eighteenth century, to be exact. The French Daughters of Charity were able to assist the sick and the poor by discreetly avoiding – with the help of bishops, among others – the Tridentine decree for the cloistering of women religious, in Susan Dinan's study. William Hudon confounds the anachronistic view of the early modern papacy as a precursor to the autocratic pontiffs of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. Mark Lewis SJ reveals the origins of reformed communities of priests – such as the Jesuits and the Theatines – in confraternities of laywomen and men. Parochial polemic is portrayed by D. Jonathan Greiser as essential in the slow confessionalisation of Moravia. Xiaoping Lin reveals how Marian devotion underwent acculturation in Ming China, though the underlining of the Virgin's inner virtues may be better attributed to a shift in western understanding of Mary, according to Donna Spivey Ellington's recent monograph. And surely the portrayal of women in the foreground of a Chinese illustration of the *Via Dolorosa* is due to Luke xxiii. 27–31, and not only to 'a feminine vision of Christianity'? It is also surprising that one of the editors, Hilmar Pabel, falls into a description of late medieval piety as death-obsessed *à la* Huizinga, in order to portray Erasmus' *De praeparatione ad mortem* as a revolutionary tract. Nevertheless, this is a valuable compilation of current research in the multifarious world of early modern Catholicism. The only element missing from this collection of institutional and social studies is any discussion of the theological ideas that underpin the Catholicism of this period; only Carrie Norman's article on preaching at the papal court touches – and hesitantly – on such juxtapositions of theological tenets as finding Christ in the eucharist, in the poor, and in Pope Paul v in Rome on the Maundy Thursdays of 1609, 1611 and 1612.

Religion, government and political culture in early modern Germany. Lindau, 1520–1628. By Johannes C. Wolfart. (Early Modern History. Society and Culture.) Pp. xiv + 261 incl. 3 maps and 3 figs. Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2002. £50.

0 333 73144 1

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S002204690337798X

Johannes Wolfart is dissatisfied with what he discerns as the prevailing preoccupation of German historians of the sixteenth century with confessionalism, constitutionalism and nationalism. Whether they are historians of the Reformation or of the *Reich*, they have contributed, he believes, to a distorted perspective. They have, he suggests, collectively tended to divorce religion from politics, to divide the sixteenth century into two, and to emphasise the particularity of German history and historiography in ways which deny even the possibility of comparison with trends outside the *Reich*. Wolfart believes that his study of the long chronological background to a 1626 political protest in the imperial city of Lindau, an island in Lake Constance, once more illuminates the interconnectedness of religion and politics and the true complexity of sixteenth-century urban social relations. Where some historians of confessionalisation have discerned a long process of *dirigiste* social discipline, Wolfart reveals a protracted struggle between conflicting views of the polity fought out between urban oligarchs often in league with imperial officials on the one hand and artisan guilds and rebellious clergy on the other. During the course of that conflict the idea of the republic began as the rallying cry of the communal opposition and ended as the ideology of a ruling oligarchy, an interesting corrective to the conventional teleological view of the evolution of the concept. Age and gender added further dimensions of tension to both public and private life in the claustrophobic urban community. Wolfart's wide-ranging discussion of Lindau politics does indeed reveal local complexity almost to the point where the larger 'national' structures examined by other scholars disappear. His study reveals much about the life of this island community, but to suggest, as Wolfart seems to do, that the accumulation of such histories in some way constitutes more genuine history than the study of larger constitutional or national issues surely goes too far. For the religious politics of Lindau only really make sense in the context of the wider structure of the Holy Roman Empire, of which Lindau was a very minor and peripheral part.

GONVILLE AND CAIUS COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

JOACHIM WHALEY

Aspects of English Protestantism, c. 1530–1700. By Nicholas Tyacke. (Politics, Culture and Society in Early Modern Britain.) Pp. xiv + 354 incl. 2 figs, 1 map and 2 tables. Manchester–New York: Manchester University Press, 2001. £49 (cloth), £17.99 (paper). 0 7190 5391 9; 0 7190 5392 7

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903387986

Aspects of English Protestantism is an impressive collection of twelve essays first published between 1973 and 1998. They range from an essay entitled 'Re-thinking the "English Reformation"', which presents a general and thought provoking examination of the early years of the English Reformation, to such pieces as 'Popular Puritan mentality in late Elizabethan England' which contains a detailed analysis of Puritan nomenclature in Surrey. All the twelve essays included in this volume display the kind of historical rigour and insight that one has come to associate with Tyacke's work.

What strikes one most strongly when reading these pieces is the extent to which Tyacke's work has been central in establishing a new orthodoxy regarding the Jacobean Church. Reading again such seminal essays as 'Puritanism, Arminianism and counter-revolution', one is not only reminded of the radicalism but also of the assuredness with which Tyacke set about challenging the existing historiographic tradition which viewed Puritanism as progressive or revolutionary. Few would now question the twin poles of Tyacke's argument, that in the 1620s and 1630s it was the Arminians who were the religious revolutionaries or that 'by the 1590s Calvinism was dominant in the higher reaches of the Established Church' (p. 161). It is a real pleasure to re-read Tyacke's seminal revisionist essays on pre-English Civil War religious debate and conflict. In particular, the essays relating to the late Elizabethan and Jacobean period are exemplary in the way they combine an analysis of complex theological ideas with reference to popular culture. Tyacke writes in his introduction to this volume that '[Religious] theory informed practice and as a consequence it will not do to argue, as some have, that doctrine was of little relevance to ordinary people. We are in fact dealing here with some of the intellectual underpinnings of popular religious observance' (p. 13). It is Tyacke's mastery of these 'intellectual underpinnings' and in particular the detailed and crucial theological distinctions that were the matter of the dispute between Calvinists and Arminians in the early Jacobean period which enable him successfully to critique some of the wilder excesses of revisionism. The essay 'Anglican attitudes: some recent writings on English religious history, from the Reformation to the Civil War', is an exemplary piece of sustained historical polemic revealing how problematic it is to posit the existence of an Anglican *via media* and a flourishing Stuart regime that were both brought down by 'a Scottish bolt from the blue' (p. 197).

There are, however, a number of criticisms that I would make of this volume. In places some of the essays seem rather dated. This is perhaps inevitable in a collection of this type and is not a problem with the essays dealing with the early Jacobean Church. Some of the other pieces, however, could have benefited from more substantial revision than they have received. Tyacke's work, as exemplified in this volume, embodies the successes, but also the problems, of the best of revisionist writing. For example, in the pieces collected here he demonstrates conclusively that Calvinism was the orthodox norm in the early Jacobean Church and that it was Charles I and Laud who were the religious radicals in the 1620s and 1630s. Tyacke also argues persuasively that Calvinism did not disappear after 1660 and that there were many Calvinists who were perfectly able to remain within the Restoration Church. These points do, however, beg the question why Laud thought Calvinism was so dangerous and, even more important, why Charles adopted an Arminian religious policy when it was so divisive? Tyacke's answers to these questions are sound but limited since they tend to be restricted to the level of the aims and beliefs of the individuals involved. Is this adequate? Tyacke's own work suggests that it is not. Indeed, reading this collection one sometimes feels as if Tyacke has taken a self-denying ordinance in terms of extending the scope and scale of his explanation of historical events.

One of the most thought-provoking essays in this collection is 'Re-thinking the "English Reformation"'. In this piece Tyacke critiques the concept of a Reformation from below as a 'revisionist straw man'. (p. 39). He goes on to point out the importance of giving proper weight to the power of ideas in accounts of the Reformation. Tyacke writes that

Revisionists are prone to belittle the power of ideas in bringing about the Reformation, emphasising what they see as almost the irrelevance of theology. Yet this is seriously to neglect the subversive potential particularly of the doctrine of justification by faith alone, undermining as it did the whole panoply of medieval Catholic teaching and practice built on the notion of spiritual good works. (p. 45)

Tyacke goes on in this piece to point out the importance of printed works in the early spread of Reformation ideas in England. However, in order for concepts like justification by faith to be subversive the cultural or social possibility of subversion needs to exist. What was it about some social groups that made them sympathetic to Protestant ideas? Why was Protestantism more welcome in some localities while being rejected in others? It is perhaps inevitable that a collection of essays cannot fully address questions such as these. However this volume indicates both the need for a general and broad-stroke history of English religious practices and beliefs from 1500 to 1688 that seeks to explain why England became a Protestant country and that Tyacke would be the ideal historian to undertake such a task.

It would be quite wrong to end this review on a negative note. It is an impressive collection of essays that will no doubt remain a staple of undergraduate reading lists for many years to come. *Aspects of English Protestantism* is an important volume that brings together a number of seminal essays written by one of the leading figures in the field of early modern religious English history.

KINGSTON UNIVERSITY

TOM BETTERIDGE

The culture of Protestantism in early modern Scotland. By Margo Todd. Pp. xiv + 450 incl. map and 32 plates. New Haven–London: Yale University Press, 2002. £25.00 300 09234 2
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903397982

This is certainly one of the most significant books on the Scottish Reformation published in the last twenty years. More important, however, Margo Todd's book demands to be read by anyone interested in how Reformed Protestantism could actually function on the ground. Scotland was the only European territorial state in which the Genevan model of discipline was taken out of the laboratory of the city-state and applied in full-scale field trials. Moreover, the kirk sessions which implemented this system in the parishes left excellent records. By analysing the sixty or so sets of kirk session minute books surviving for the period 1560–1640, Todd gives us a remarkable view of Reformed Protestantism from the pew.

She has wisely resisted the temptation to conduct a statistical analysis of these records, except in a few very limited areas. Her sources are anecdotal and impressionistic; so, therefore, is her account, although her impressions are underpinned by the sheer quantity of material she has examined. In assessing these sources, she draws warily on anthropology, but always measures its insights against the social and especially the theological specificities of the Reformation era. ('Early modern Europe', she comments drily, 'was not a primitive tribal society.') So, for example, in her pivotal chapter on repentance, she is concerned to stress that public penitence was a 'dramatic performance' and that its ritual aspects were taken extremely seriously by all participants. Yet she does this without neglecting or diluting the distinctly Calvinist ideas which shaped it. At the same time she avoids most anthropological and most theological jargon; 'logocentric' is about her worst offence on this score.

Such a successful methodological balance is all too rare, and is the more remarkable for being understated.

Todd's chapters lead us through all the aspects of life with which kirk sessions dealt: from worship, through the regulation of social relations and family life, to the place of kirk and clergy in laypeople's lives. Throughout, she writes engagingly, and with a sensitivity and a wry humour which leavens her frequently lurid material. The result is that there is rarely a dull page: if it is not a disgruntled session ruling that piping during the sermon was as severe an offence as incest, it is a minister searching kitchens for banned Christmas geese, 'telling them that the feathers of them would rise up against them'. And the startling examples used in her passage on street insults beg to be made into a set of fridge magnets. The plates give some additional flesh to these accounts, although one could wish for more: perhaps a few communion tokens, given the importance she ascribes to these objects. If there is a second edition, perhaps we might also have the page of the Ellon minute book where, we are told, a clerk sketched a portrait of the offender in the margin.

Throughout, Todd has two main theses. First, she argues compellingly that kirk sessions were astonishingly effective in transforming Scottish religious culture. Enforcement of sermon attendance and moral discipline was seamless, but this was not simply an early modern Panopticon. Todd demonstrates that many of those excused sermon attendance came nevertheless. As we now expect, she emphasises that the system of discipline was pastoral before it was punitive, but she goes beyond this to show the extraordinary effectiveness of kirk sessions in preserving the peace, in arbitrating and sealing quarrels, and in providing a wide range of social services. Her evidence suggests that in these roles at least, the sessions were genuinely popular and – more important – respected. Todd's argument is of course open to question, and her evidence is coloured by its institutional source. No doubt, as she argues, fast sermons were terrifying to some; most likely, others found them tedious but knew better than to complain. Even so, historians of Reformation England, and others, who tend to assume that Calvinism was doomed to be a minority religion, can learn here that it need not have been that way.

Todd's second theme is the considerable continuities between the old religion and the new. Protestantism's ritual life was more minimalist than Catholicism's, but a ritual life it still had, and one which became more powerful from being more tightly concentrated. It was a religion of the Word, but of the Word as written, engraved, enacted and bodied forth. Her careful discussion of the Reformed communion service reveals some of the layers of symbolic meaning which remained in it and which accrued afresh around it. The physical space of the church remained sacralised; saints' days were replaced with sabbatarianism and fastings days; obits and chantries were replaced with the payment of hefty fees for burial in prestigious places; charismatic preachers retained an aura of sanctity. Although reinterpreted by Reformed theology, the social meanings of these phenomena often changed very little. Moreover, there were some battles which the Reformed kirk chose not to fight. Some popular festivities or social structures were too useful, or too innocuous, to be worth the trouble of stamping them out. 'When Reformed ministers and elders threw out the popish bath water, they were careful to keep not only the baby, but also some bath toys to keep it happy.'

A decade ago, Eamon Duffy's *Stripping of the altars* reminded us of how powerful a system late medieval Catholicism was for those within it. Margo Todd's book is a

Protestant mirror to that. It leaves questions unasked: in particular, she sidesteps the problem of how this system came to be accepted so widely and so quickly after the Reformation. Yet she has shown us how powerful it was, how it transcended social barriers and even how it can, in one sense, be called 'traditional religion'. Moreover, she does this without allowing us to forget the humanity of the people whose lives she describes. The result is an exceptional book which comes as close as any to conveying the lived flavour of early modern Protestantism.

UNIVERSITY OF BIRMINGHAM

ALEC RYRIE

Huguenot heartland. Montauban and southern French Calvinism during the wars of religion. By Philip Conner. (St Andrews Studies in Reformation History.) Pp. xiv + 257 incl. 3 figs. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2002. £47.50. 0 7546 0762 3
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903407987

This alert volume offers one of the best and most original local studies of the French wars of religion to appear in some time. As Philip Conner rightly insists, Huguenot strongholds such as Montauban have been far less well examined to date than those cities in northern France where Protestantism witnessed an initial period of growth around 1560, only to see its hopes of carrying the day extinguished amid the subsequent civil wars. A local study can only be as rich as the available archives. Those of Montauban have large gaps. No town council minutes have survived from 1560 to 1580, and consistory records are only available for 1595–8. Faced with these *lacunae*, Conner wisely chose not to attempt a narrative history of the town's experience over the entire course of the wars of religion, but instead to examine a series of themes or problems on the basis of the extant evidence. Drawing inspiration from the recent scholarship on Calvinism across Europe, he widened the scope of previous studies of French cities to focus as much on the upbuilding of Reformed churches and the relationship between these churches and the civic magistrates as on the Huguenot struggle for survival. He also ably compensated for the gaps in the town records with strategic soundings in the public archives of the other great Huguenot strongholds of the Midi, as well as by gaining access to rare documents in private hands. His exposition is rich but restrained, occasionally leaving the reader wishing for more. For instance, fascinating statistical information from will preambles indicating the spread of evangelical attitudes prior to 1555 is reported without any indication of the sizes of the samples in question. An outstanding and utterly original account of how Henry of Navarre drew Montauban into his orbit after his flight from court in 1576 ends in 1587, just on the eve of Henry's decisive struggle to win the royal succession. This is a dissertation based on a year of local research and then moved quickly into print – too quickly, perhaps, for once a good book has presented many of the most important findings to be discovered about a locality, who is going to revisit it to fill in the gaps? What must be stressed, however, is the range and importance of its findings. It shows a city where the civic elites rapidly embraced Reformed doctrines, sheltered Protestant ministers from royal repression in 1561, established close family connections with the leading ministers after the establishment of Reformed domination and worked alongside and within the consistory to build a godly community. It shows Montauban's Church exercising a measure of oversight over the evangelisation of the surrounding rural areas and its *églises de fief*.

It provides fundamental new information about Protestant military organisation in the region and batters the myth of the 'United Provinces of the Midi'. It tells us much about the local printing trade, ministers and relations with Geneva (surprisingly distant). All this represents a considerable achievement.

BROWN UNIVERSITY

PHILIP BENEDICT

Bürokratie und Nepotismus unter Paul V. (1605–1621). Studien zur frühneuzeitlichen Mikropolitik in Rom. By Birgit Emich. (Päpste und Papsttum, 30.). Pp. xi + 475 incl. 12 ill. Stuttgart: Anton Hiersemann, 2001. DM 240. 3 7772 0121 9

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903417983

This impressive study originated as a doctoral dissertation at the University of Freiburg-im-Breisgau, supervised by Wolfgang Reinhard, whose own research did much to illuminate the structure, personnel and the process of decision-making at the papal court during the pontificate of Paul v (Camillo Borghese). The compromise candidate who emerged as pope from the second conclave in 1605 following the sudden death of Leo xi (1–27 April 1605), and whose name is familiar to visitors to the basilica of St Peter in Rome, Paul v is nevertheless one of the lesser-known early modern popes. Emich's study, however, is devoted not to the pope himself, but to the role of his nephew, the son of his sister Ortensia, Cardinal Scipione Caffarelli-Borghese (†2 October 1633), in the papal administration, and to the manner in which family loyalty and support were rewarded with lucrative offices, money and other favours. The author draws attention to the similarity of the role of 'Kardinalnepote', as personification of the phenomenon 'nepotism', and that of the royal favourite in early modern secular courts. She raises the question of a conflict of interest when the curial administration, which should be an autonomous institution, is headed by the person who has most to profit from the position of his 'princely' uncle. However her reply to this question is determined not by the moral rectitude of older ecclesiastical historians, who regarded papal nepotism as an embarrassing abuse, and – in the case of Protestant scholars – a useful supply of ammunition, but by the criteria of modern research, which regards the structures and personnel of government as legitimate subjects for social history. Birgit Emich displays an impressive familiarity with the administrative procedures of the Roman Curia and with sources in the Vatican (Archivio Segreto Vaticano and Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana), in Rome (Archivio di Stato) and in Ferrara. She documents meticulously the development of an office which subsequently became the secretariat of state in the papal Curia, and clarifies the different types of correspondence in circulation: official letters, documents dealing with patronage and communication with princes, cities and subjects of the papal state. It emerges clearly that Cardinal Scipione Borghese could rely on various secretarial offices with different responsibilities: for patronage, for private matters and for the administration of family property. However the function of the 'cardinal-nephew' was only temporary: with the curial reform in 1692 he was finally replaced by the secretary of state, who could be, but need not be a papal nephew (p. 105). Emich follows her academic mentor, Wolfgang Reinhard, when she sees a fundamental difference in quality between the nepotism of the Borgia pope, Alexander vi (1492–1503), and the administrative patronage of the Borghese clan. In this respect she dates a fundamental change in the role and

function of the cardinal-nephew to the year 1538, when Pope Paul III (1534–49) entrusted the business affairs of papacy and papal state to his nephew Cardinal Alessandro Farnese. Late medievalists familiar with the nepotism of Pope Sixtus IV (1471–84) and the concentration of power in the hands of the Della Rovere-Riario family may have their doubts.

UNIVERSITY OF SALZBURG

KATHERINE WALSH

Der Priester als Poet. George Herberts The temple im Spannungsfeld von Kirche und Individualität. By Svenja Kuhfuss. (Studien zur englischen Philologie, 36.)

Pp. viii + 247. Tübingen: Max Niemeyer, 2001. DM 136 (paper). 3 484 45036 3; 0081 7244

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S002204690342798X

In this detailed and sensitive study of George Herbert's 1633 volume of devotional poems, *The temple*, Svenja Kuhfuss examines the place of lyric poetry amidst the complexity of theological and philosophical ideas in early seventeenth-century England. Noting how difficult it is to link Herbert firmly with any particular faction within the Church of his day, Kuhfuss interprets this phenomenon not as a sign of withdrawal from controversy on the priest-poet's part, but rather as a critical position in its own right. She demonstrates this claim by means of detailed readings of the poems themselves, as well as with reference to churchmen, philosophers and poets of the Elizabethan and Stuart periods. An especially significant aspect of Kuhfuss's approach is her focus on early modern theories of time – cyclical or linear, declining or progressive – and on Herbert's poetic vision of temporality, particularly in relation to the optimistic sense of time expressed by his friend and contemporary, Francis Bacon. Also to be commended, however, is Kuhfuss's awareness of the differences in the ways in which lyrics and polemical prose functioned in the spiritual climate of the early seventeenth century; she thereby pays proper attention to the role of aesthetics in the expression of devotional and theological issues. It is clear, then, that this study in fact deals with more than the one *Spannungsfeld* identified in its title. It is, to its credit, simultaneously concerned with a number of creative tensions: the opposing ideas of different ecclesiastical groups (as revealed in the theology of the eucharist or assumptions about spiritual time); the relationship between the Church and the individual believer or writer; the contrasts between philosophical discussion and poetic imagination; and, perhaps inevitably, the continuing arguments among critics as to Herbert's doctrinal or political affiliations. The greatness of his poetry, and the fascination of the era which produced it, meanwhile remain undisputed.

UNIVERSITY OF GRONINGEN

HELEN WILCOX

Descartes. Belief, scepticism and virtue. By Richard Davies. (Routledge Studies in Seventeenth-Century Philosophy, 3.) Pp. xi + 371. London–New York: Routledge,

2001. £55. 0 415 25122 2

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903437986

Aristotle taught that moral virtues stand in a mean: each virtue is flanked by two opposing vices, and each virtue is a disposition to have or do the right amount of something of which there can be vicious excess or defect. He did not himself apply

the doctrine to intellectual virtues: but clearly there is a virtue that determines the mean in matters of belief, the mean between scepticism and credulity. Richard Davies calls this virtue 'doxastic rectitude', and he uses the notion to structure a highly original and intelligent account of Descartes's philosophical writings. The overall shape of Descartes's endeavour, he maintains, is given by the pursuit of doxastic rectitude and by the battle against credulity, the vice of excess, and against scepticism, the vice of defect. Within this novel framework, Davies offers many acute close readings of familiar texts, readings which often show the texts in a new and convincing light. Davies's discussion is supported by very wide reading, and he shows an impressive familiarity with the scholastic texts which often lie behind unargued assumptions in Cartesian arguments. He says much that is illuminating about the relation, in Descartes, between reason and the passions, between intellect and will, and between method and science. Ecclesiastical historians will be particularly interested in his account of Descartes's reaction to the condemnation of Galileo in 1633. Unlike most commentators, Davies argues that Descartes, however reluctantly, sincerely accepted the doctrine thus taught by the Church, and took pains to adapt his physical system so that it brought out the false proposition 'The earth moves'.

ST JOHN'S COLLEGE,
OXFORD

ANTHONY KENNY

Roundhead reputations. The English civil wars and the passions of posterity. By Blair Worden. Pp. xii + 387 incl. 19 ills. London: Allen Lane/Penguin, 2001. £20.0 713 99603 X JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903447982

This is a book targeting the intelligent general reader: it dispenses with detailed annotation, preferring a bibliographic survey intended as a guide to further reading; it provides sketches, lucid and elegant, of (to the professional) well-known civil war personalities and incidents. Yet its theme is a demanding one. Blair Worden seeks to elucidate how and why, over the intervening period, divines, political theorists, historians and essayists have constructed such divergent readings of the period 1640–60. The fiercely contested place of the wars and their aftermath in English memory and culture is, Worden argues, at the heart of his enterprise. Yet any attempt to survey the kaleidoscopic shifts in interpretation over three centuries by writers responding to, *inter alia*, contemporary political and confessional dispute, shifts in the nation's social structure, changing views of the nature of historical discourse, would create an almost impossible agenda. Worden has, understandably, largely abandoned any attempt at providing a synoptic and holistic overview, and has constructed his argument around a series of comparatively narrow case studies. Yet one remarkable chapter in this volume suggests what might have been attained with a broader, more inclusive conceptual framework.

Chapter vii, 'The patriots', examines the understanding of the Civil War in the mid-eighteenth century. The analysis centres on a study of the *Biographia britannica*, the first attempt at an English *DNB*, but extends the discussion to incorporate the works of other historians, editors and commentators of the period. Worden shows how the interpretative partisanship, emanating from the wars and refined in the furnaces of the Exclusion Crisis and the period of the 'rage of party' following the

Glorious Revolution, had waned. In the political and social conditions of the mid-century more consensual readings emerged, lauding both Royalist martyrs like Capel and regicides like Ludlow. The shared virtues praised in these political opponents were incorruptibility and an inflexible determination to advance the public good. They were manifestly men of principle, and, even if, as in Ludlow's case, the principles 'might be mistaken' they were redeemed because held 'sincerely and steadily'. Such 'patriots' won further praise if their careers advanced England's international prestige, and if they could boast aristocratic lineage. The *Biographia*'s authors were swift to condemn venality and self-aggrandisement, but sordid, mercenary, motives of interest were not seen as characterising the adherents of only one of the parties in the wars. Insofar as the Roundheads were more likely to be censured, it was for their religious views: the *Biographia* admired 'piety'; it savaged 'the spirit of enthusiasm' – one of the worst of the 'deep and dangerous' errors attributed to Cromwell.

Chapter vii, a splendid example of full and compelling analysis germane to the book's most ambitious goals, also plays a key role in its structure. It is the hinge between the case studies with which the book opens and closes. The first six chapters focus on the creation of Ludlow and Algernon Sidney as iconic figures by the Country Whigs in the period immediately following the Glorious Revolution; chapters viii–xi examine the transformation of the reputation of Oliver Cromwell in the nineteenth century. The bulk of these chapters have their origin in scholarly articles and introductions produced by Worden since 1978.

The Cromwell sections are admirable in this format. Worden is particularly subtle and sensitive on the role of religion from the mid-nineteenth century in encouraging a re-evaluation of Cromwell. Increasing in numbers and confidence, the Nonconformists abandoned the quietist and deferential political role that they had accepted gratefully in the eighteenth century. Cromwell was an appropriate totem for their new militancy. In 1873 *The Congregationalist*, deprecating the sect's record of back-seat subservience to a tepid Whig establishment, reminded its readers 'we have reigned with Cromwell'. Excellent, too, is the chapter on Carlyle, the first editor of Cromwell's writings. The seeming paradox of a man who had abandoned Calvinist theology and for whom 'Christianity is but the mythic expression of religion', providing a usable hero for the Nonconformists is nicely dissected here.

The first six chapters, particularly the four on Ludlow, however, are a less successful reworking of the earlier material. Worden's 1978 demonstration, in his edition of *A voice from the watch-tower*, of the mixture of cut-and-paste and sheer forgery undertaken by Toland in editing Ludlow's *Memoirs* to transform their writer from a zealous millenarian into a secular republican, and thus appropriate him for the radical Whig cause in their struggle against the military state created by William III, was a brilliant piece of historical detection. But, in relation to the assumed audience of this work, too much of the technical *minutiae* of textual exegesis have survived from the original introduction. Much more synopsis here would have clarified the argument, and provided space to develop themes that are only hinted at – the contended readings of Milton, for instance. More fundamentally, Worden should undertake more discussion of Royalist historiography. Divergences of interpretation within the broad pro-parliamentary tradition of interpretation may be 'of subtler interest' (p. 1) than the Royalist–Parliamentary debate, but some understanding of the thrust of Royalist arguments, particularly those of Clarendon, would illuminate many of the issues raised in this work.

The final chapter of the book, 'The Levellers and the left' reinforces some of the problems of the opening section. The chapter reminds us that 'present-mindedness', while controlled by stricter canons of scholarly propriety, is not foreign to the twentieth-century historian. It is sensible, but pedestrian. It lacks the compelling engagement with which Worden excavates Toland's radical surgery on Ludlow, or explains the attractions for Carlyle of Cromwell's doctrine of Providence. Worden appears to have no great enthusiasm for the Levellers, and less for their historians. The chapter lacks the stylistic elegance which otherwise typifies this book. Ending on a rhetorical and substantive *diminuendo*, it emphasises the major weakness of the study – its episodic character; its genesis as a series of essays. The shaping chapter vii, for all its brilliance, ultimately cannot sustain the intellectual coherence to which this work aspires.

LADY MARGARET HALL,
OXFORD

CLIVE HOLMES

Les Mauristes à Saint-Germain-des-Prés. Actes du colloque du 2 décembre 1999. Edited by Jean-Claude Fredouille. (Collection des Études Augustiniennes. Série Moyen Âge et Temps Modernes, 36.) Pp. 140. Paris: Institut d'Études Augustiniennes, 2001. Fr. 170 (paper). 2 85121 183 8; 1159 4888

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903457989

These eight essays supplement Dom Yves Chaussy's history (1989–91) and Pierre Gasnault's monograph on Maurist erudition (1999). Y.-M. Bercé studies the *bourg* of Saint-Germain, its proud independence guaranteed by the abbey's seigneurial jurisdiction and proclaimed in the famous annual fair – with Paris gradually taking over; B. Chédozeau describes the alterations made to the abbey church to conform to the new liturgical emphasis on the eucharist – the demolition of the rood screen and the devising of a new high altar with sixteen marble columns from Leptis Magna – not the first church in France to be adorned with archaeological plunder from the north African coast. The remaining essays concern the Maurist contribution to learning. Only two or three of the monks were *littérateurs*; mostly from the urban middle class, chosen by merit and, even if beginning in the provinces, gravitating to the two great abbeys in Paris (analysis in P. Gasnault's essay). D.-O. Hurel describes the process of editing Mabillon's correspondence (1,739 letters received, 1,028 written – to 580 correspondents, including 150 consulted frequently with 4 inner circle). As for Jansenism, we have J.-R. Armogathe's account of the role of the exiled Arnauld in encouraging the edition of St Augustine and a brilliant essay by J.-L. Quantin (who has succeeded to the chair of Bruno Neveu). His subject is the critics of the work of the Maurists, mostly Jesuits; he concludes that the learning of the Maurists cannot be faulted, but even so, they dangerously came to regard Augustinianism, not just as a theology, but a 'mythologie historique', a doctrine of the saint clear in all ages to his true disciples – an original insight deserving elaboration. But could erudition be justified as an occupation for monks? Was there an answer to Rancé? G.-M. Oury studies Dom Claude Martin's (d. 1696) reply, the concept of the mind centred on God, even when called away to worldly duties: 'quitte Dieu pour Dieu'. P. Gasnault cites the more prosaic answer in a monastic circular of 1671: the great danger for monks is idleness, so granted that spiritual and

communal obligations must be fulfilled all must be allotted work 'in conformity with their inclinations and their talents'. There is a learned preface by the curé of Saint-Germain-des-Prés, sadly reflecting on the end of the great abbey and its library, though essentially concerned with the souls of his parishioners, whatever the piety and learning of bygone years.

ALL SOULS COLLEGE,
OXFORD

JOHN McMANNERS

Literature and religious culture in seventeenth-century England. By Reid Barbour. Pp. viii + 282. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002. £40. 0 521 00664 3
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903467985

The title of this book is slightly misleading, perhaps a result of publishers' preference for bland titles which fit well into search programmes on the Internet. The texts considered by Reid Barbour are not, on the whole, those of the seventeenth-century literary canon, and his concept of 'religious culture' takes in many fields of enquiry, encompassing in the second half of the book texts more ordinarily considered in studies of early modern scientific thought. This makes for a truly interdisciplinary study, however, with an unusual breadth of scope. The first two chapters contain a valuable historical and textual study of two communities which could be said to have both religious and literary significance, the Little Gidding household and the Great Tew circle. The third chapter shows Barbour's wide-ranging methodology at its best: he carries on the themes of Protestant heroism and its relationship to literary imagination into a study of 1630s texts associated with the rise of Laud, in a fresh and informed approach to topics of great current interest. The second half of the book loses focus a little. The separate studies of figures such as Browne, Hakewill, Harvey and Bacon lack clear thematic interrelation, and the reader becomes aware of a tendency to over-use favoured secondary sources and to refer to primary sources rather less often than is comfortable when dealing with an unfamiliar text. In these later chapters, too, the rather generalised readings seem to become detached from events and readers in the seventeenth century. The conclusion returns the reader to the political situatedness of Caroline Protestantism in a wide-ranging synthesis which illustrates both the strengths and weaknesses of this book. From the England of Kenelm Digby, William Chillingworth, Richard Crashaw and a host of lesser-known writers about whom no information is given, Barbour takes a whistle-stop tour to the Boston colony where he considers Anne Hutchinson, John Winthrop and someone called Robert Ryece, in a general discussion of what he calls the 'charity debate' of the 1630s. The lack of detailed contextualisation means that the complex intellectual structure built on these brief individual readings is hard to follow and ultimately unconvincing: as with so much of this book, however, the textual analyses are intriguing and would no doubt repay investigation.

OXFORD

ELIZABETH CLARKE

Antiquarianism in the Augustan age. Thomas Hearne, 1678–1735. By Theodor Harmsen.

Pp. 336. Oxford: Peter Lang, 2000. £30 (paper). 3 906758 96 6

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903477981

The nonjuring antiquary Thomas Hearne had a remarkable career. A sometime farm labourer, his prospects were transformed when his early talents were identified by Francis Cherry of Shottesbrooke in Berkshire, a Jacobite country gentleman who paid for an education that took Hearne in 1695 to St Edmund Hall, Oxford. Here he remained for the next forty years, rapidly acquiring a reputation as an accurate transcriber of early English manuscripts at a time when Anglo-Saxon and medieval studies were being pursued for polemical as well as scholarly purposes. He is now best remembered for the voluminous diary, the *Remarks and collections of Thomas Hearne* (11 vols, ed. C. E. Doble and H. E. Salter [Oxford Historical Society, 1885–1918]), which he compiled between 1705 and his death in 1735. This intimate and opinionated record of daily events in university and town has tended to obscure the more serious reputation that Hearne deserves – and enjoyed to a very large extent with his contemporaries – as a scholar and antiquary.

In this volume Dr Harmsen sets out to re-evaluate Hearne's achievements as a bookman, antiquary, publisher and editor. This is not the first attempt of this kind, and it invites comparison perhaps mostly notably with D. C. Douglas's 'Portrait of Hearne' in *English scholars* (2nd edn, 1951). However, in terms of sympathy as well as scope, the present volume has much more to offer. Well grounded on a thorough familiarity with published and manuscript sources, Harmsen's study demonstrates conclusively how Hearne sustained a remarkable scholarly output despite being marginalised on account of his conscientious adherence to Jacobite and nonjuring principles: the university authorities in Oxford not only prevented his having access to the Bodleian Library after 1715, but also attempted actively to obstruct the publication of several of his textual editions, considering them, not altogether without good reason, as tending to undermine the Hanoverian claim to the British throne.

Although Harmsen's first chapter on 'General background 1688–1735' is weak, and contains several serious misapprehensions (the royal birthdays that so excited early eighteenth-century Oxford [p. 30] were those of Charles II and James III, not Charles I and James II, for example) the quality of the rest of the book is high. In chapters on Hearne as 'Nonjuror and diarist' and as 'Antiquary' Harmsen provides the best demonstration to date of his indebtedness to the nonjuring scholars Henry Dodwell and Thomas Smith, showing how his career followed in a tradition of English antiquarianism deriving from Leland, Cotton and Camden, and also, in Oxford, from John Aubrey, Elias Ashmole, Robert Plot, Edward Lhuyd and Anthony à Wood. Although it is not denied that Hearne's sometimes vehement partisanship could distort his historical judgement, as in his obstinate insistence on the truth of the legendary foundation of University College by King Alfred, Harmsen succeeds in demonstrating how Hearne's work can be placed in a context of High Tory writing stretching from Heylin and Brady through Collier and Harbin to Carte. The argument is that Hearne, convinced that 'the fate of learning and religion had become indistinguishable', was, above all, anxious to 'correct [Bishop William] Nicholson's formulation of a Protestant-latitudinarian canon of ecclesiology ... his work amounted to a consistent defence of learning and orthodoxy spanning all of English history' (p. 284). Such interests led Hearne naturally to follow and emulate those who attempted, like Spelman and Dugdale before him, or like Wharton,

Dodsworth and Tanner in his own time, to re-evaluate pre-Reformation ecclesiastical history, to sympathise with Roman Catholic historians and to detest figures such as King Henry VIII and John Foxe. In chapters on Hearne as 'Bookman' and as 'Publisher and editor', Harmsen details the scale of Hearne's achievement in preparing and publishing thirty-seven volumes between 1703 and 1735. Produced to a high standard of accuracy, most of these were pioneering editions of early English texts, many of major importance, some of which were to be lost in the disastrous fire at the Cottonian Library in 1731. Harmsen gives a good account of Hearne's efforts to solicit subscriptions and provides an interesting analysis of the seven hundred or so people, by no means only High Churchmen or Tories, who subscribed. There is also a fascinating section on Hearne's friends, like John Murray 'a great lover of Punch', who made up a circle of amateurs and dealers who in spite of the condescension of the Augustan wits were among the first to appreciate early printing and the importance of manuscript scraps, ballads and ephemera. A helpful appendix provides a comprehensive listing of Hearne's writings and textual editions.

WORCESTER COLLEGE,
OXFORD

RICHARD SHARP

Christóbal de Gentil de Rojas y Spinola O.F.M. und der lutherische Abt Gerardus Wolterius Molanus. Ein Beitrag zur Geschichte der Unionsbestrebungen der katholischen und evangelischen Kirche im 17. Jahrhundert. By Karin Masser. (Reformationsgeschichtliche Studien und Texte, 145.) Pp. 526. Münster: Aschendorff, 2002. €64 (paper). 3 402 03809 9; 0171 3469
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903487988

When in 1683 the attention of most central Europeans was fixed on the Turkish siege of Vienna, a Spanish Franciscan and a Protestant abbot quietly initiated a dialogue that aimed to reunite the Lutheran Church with Rome. In a revised version of her dissertation, Karin Masser investigates this important attempt at confessional reconciliation. The major Catholic protagonist was Christóbal de Gentil de Rojas y Spinola, the future bishop of Wiener Neustadt. His conversation partner was the abbot of Loccum and leader of the Lutheran Church in Hanover, Gerardus Molanus. Intensive discussions between the two contributed to a scheme of confessional reunion that was supported by the Habsburg Emperor Leopold I as well as Pope Innocent XI in Rome. In what will certainly be the definitive study of this critical ecumenical moment, Masser has carefully worked through Austrian, German and Spanish archives to present a fascinating story of the genesis, development and ultimate failure of their dialogue. Though this drama's geographic focus was Hanover, Masser ranges from Paris to Hungary as she highlights the impact and consequences of this religious discussion which involved individuals as diverse as Louis XIV's bishop, Jacques-Bénigne Bossuet, and Gottfried Wilhelm von Leibniz. Masser's treatment of Leibniz is particularly insightful as she contributes to a fuller understanding of the great thinker's theological convictions. Although this study will certainly supercede earlier scholarship on Spinola, it would have been helpful had Masser located the work of the Franciscan and Lutheran in a broader context of irenic activity. To describe these developments in north Germany as the last great attempt at reunion of the seventeenth century is imprecise and vague. The nature of ecumenism changes substantially after the Peace of Westphalia. What happens in

Hanover in the 1680s is very different from the proceedings at Toruń in 1645 or at Regensburg a century earlier. The efforts of Molanus and Spinola were part of a broader pattern of irenic activity sponsored by the likes of Archbishop Johann Philipp von Schönborn, Landgrave Ernst of Hessen Rheinfels and Prince Karl-Ludwig of the Rhine Palatinate. None the less, Masser's work is a valuable study that highlights an important but neglected chapter of central Europe's post-Westphalian religious history.

UNIVERSITY OF FLORIDA

HOWARD LOUTHAN

L'Image du prêtre dans la littérature classique (XVIIe–XVIIIe siècles). Actes du colloque organisé par le Centre Michel Baude – Littérature et spiritualité – de l'Université de Metz, 20–21 novembre 1998. Edited by Danielle Pister. (Recherches en littérature et spiritualité, 1.) Pp. x + 278 incl. 15 figs. Bern: Peter Lang, 2001. £30 (paper). 3 906765 84 9; 1424 4802

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903497984

This interdisciplinary collection of seventeen articles explores the shifting status of the priest within the culture of the French *ancien régime* through the clerical images that circulated in its classical literature. Its essays examine the impact of sacerdotal ideals on seventeenth-century Catholic reform, the persistence of anticlericalism in literature and its reciprocal relationship with the satirical and outdated literary caricatures of the corrupt priest which were used to further the controversial enlightenment agendas of rationality and nature. The sources used by the contributors display impressive range: conceptions of priesthood and the priest are garnered from didactic and apologetic texts, fiction, philosophical treatises, the records of legal processes and the *relations* of Jesuit missionaries. Unfortunately, the quality of the individual articles also ranges, and several of them are far from illuminating to anyone with a passing knowledge of religious culture in early modern France. While the essays by Nicolas Brucker, Yves Krumenacker and Danielle Pister deserve special mention because of their thought-provoking treatments of the contrasting images of the priest in reform and enlightenment literature, others are striking for their lack of depth and originality. In particular, the articles on François de Sales (Blandine Delahaye and Jacques Hennequin) and those on the French Oratory (Bernard Meuret) and Vincent de Paul (Bernard Koch) summarise sacerdotal doctrines competently but add little to the scholarship that one finds in standard secondary sources. In one of the most stimulating contributions to the collection, Krumenacker suggests the ways in which these reformers' ideals were disseminated in the French seminaries that sprang up under the impetus of *dévots* like de Paul and Jean-Jacques Olier: he convincingly concludes that the reformers' success in using this medium to train ordinands resulted in the loss of the dynamic sense of mission that had characterised the early years of the movement. Yet, as three further essays explain (Raymond Baustert, Michel Bouvier and Jean-Louis Vissière), even when priests failed to measure up to it, this ideal was widely known and respected within clerical circles. In fact, the unwillingness or inability of some priests to live according to its elevated principles of sacred service and morality ensured a flourishing tradition of didactic literature to the end of the Bourbon monarchy (Baustert and Pister). Of course, for eighteenth-century *philosophes*, this was an intrinsically flawed

vocational ideal that contributed to ecclesiastical domination and religious intolerance and they were absolutely unwilling to consider either that it might actually bear any similarity to the lives of some contemporary priests or even that it had genuine merit at all. They could, however, as Brucker describes, cleverly harness their favourite (and clichéd) image of the debauched priest to portray the qualities of the truly honourable cleric: the vicar of Rousseau's *Emile* may have failed to practice sexual continence, but his attunement to his true human nature meant that he was a far worthier participant in society than his celibate, but greedy and intemperate, *confrères*. In general, despite the erratic quality of its articles, the literary breadth of this collection does offer intriguing perspectives on the realities of early modern priesthood and on the presentations, negative and positive, chimeric and functional, that accompanied it.

UNIVERSITY OF DURHAM

ALISON FORRESTAL

Blasphemy. Impious speech in the west from the seventeenth to the nineteenth century. By Alain Cabantous (trans. Eric Rauth). (European Perspectives.) Pp. xi + 289. New York–Chichester: Columbia University Press, 2002. £20 (\$29.50). 0 231 11876 7
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903507989

This is a brave and interesting analysis of a still neglected subject – especially when one considers the treatment lavished upon heresy. It is interesting because it is a genuine blend of research monograph and synthesis. Whilst largely a study of France, and welcome for this, there are also allusions to the situations in England, Spain and Germany. It is brave for looking at municipal and judicial records in the provinces, eschewing the high profile metropolitan cases. The result considers patterns and trends in blasphemous activities and speech in a manner reminiscent of *Annales* school treatments of other subjects. Here blasphemy becomes the development and reformation of manners which occurs at the behest of secular authorities and processes of middling sort class formation. In an impressive section of the book Cabantous produces compelling empirical evidence of those who habitually blasphemed. Drawing upon his earlier work it is unsurprising that soldiers, sailors and petty tradesmen were habitual offenders. It will also not surprise anyone that marginal individuals feature as perpetrators of blasphemy as an adjunct to other forms of deviant behaviour. The subject also inevitably produced caustic and protracted struggle between municipal, state and ecclesiastical authorities for the regulation and control of morals. This material is always interestingly portrayed and shows that blasphemy was a more widespread form of behaviour than previous accounts accepted. An unfortunate effect of this is to marginalise the religious content of blasphemy and its counter cultural tendencies. Whilst a concentration upon blasphemy as a public order problem avoids the textual excesses of other approaches this can have its own limitations. One effect is to make blasphemy simply a mode of behaviour and Cabantous's lack of interest in the political and cultural aspirations of antinomians, particularly in England, is unfortunate. Clearly a focus upon behaviour displays the influences that lie behind the study of blasphemy in France and Michel Foucault casts a distinct shadow across the book. Blasphemers thus become individuals striving for expressive subjectivity only to find this removed from them by forms of moral authority themselves experiencing the growing pains of modernism. Only when such subjectivity

has been eroded by the cultivation of more mannered behaviour can such moral agencies of authority relax their grip and allow blasphemy to become an unfashionable form of transgression. Whilst valuable there is a kind of condescension in viewing blasphemy as transgressive behaviour. The characters in Cabantous's analysis do not have the presence or cultural resonance of Ginzburg's Menocchio and this perhaps demonstrates the shortcoming of the failure to see blasphemy as interactive with ideas. The ideological link with the famous French heresies of a previous age is also never fully discussed, whilst there is only minimal discussion of the impact of the *philosophes*. Blasphemers did not give up their transgression because it became unfashionable and their role as contributors to modernism rather than victims of its relentless advance needs to be equally, if not more substantially, appreciated.

OXFORD BROOKES UNIVERSITY

DAVID NASH

Die Pietas Maria Theresias im Spannungsfeld von Barock und Aufklärung. Religiöse Praxis und Sendungsbewusstsein gegenüber Familie, Untertanen und Dynastie. By Kerstin Schmal. (Mainzer Studien zur neueren Geschichte, 7.) Pp. 288. Frankfurt-am-Main: Peter Lang, 2001. £30 (paper). 3 631 36091 6; 1437 1219
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903517985

Schmal's doctoral thesis sets out to analyse Maria Theresa's religious views and practical devotions, which, she maintains, expressed the empress's sense of mission concerning the spiritual welfare of her family and subjects. The author draws on the empress's correspondence with her family, her educational prescriptions and religious instructions for her children, records of court protocol, the diaries of her *Obersthofmeister*, Prince Khevenhüller-Metsch, and the reports of the Prussian envoy, Count Podewils. Further evidence is cited in support of the thesis put forward by Peter Hersche and others on Maria Theresa's Jansenist leanings. Franz Stephan's writings on religion are likewise taken into account as a possible influence on her views. The originality of the emperor's religious ideas is, however, asserted rather than proved, and, as the author admits, it was precisely her husband's eclecticism and unquestioning belief which Maria Theresa held up for emulation by her children, perhaps sounding a note of self-criticism regarding her own more inquisitive nature. In the first section of the book Maria Theresa's instructions for her children's upbringing and their conduct as adults are dealt with in some detail. It can be inferred that her own education differed considerably in breadth and intellectual rigour from the curriculum she laid down for her daughters, and even the crown prince's education gave disproportionate weight to instruction in his religious and filial duties (pp. 58–62). Following on from these divergent priorities, an instructive comparison might have been drawn between Maria Theresa's views of her religious duties and those held by her father, Charles VI, and her recalcitrant son, Joseph II. Her relations with her eldest son in particular would have merited closer attention in view of their acrimonious debates on the course of religious policy after Joseph's accession as emperor and co-regent in 1765. However, Joseph is virtually written out of the story: apart from an outline of his educational curriculum, there are but two quotations from the empress's letters relating to the conflict over toleration (pp. 217–18).

Schmal's decision to treat her subject in isolation, with little or no regard for its political and historical context, results in a curiously blinkered perspective in parts II and III, which discuss Maria Theresa's relations with other members of the dynasty and her subjects. The important issues of confessional pluralism and religious tolerance are not dealt with at all, and no mention is made of the persecution and deportation of Protestant subjects, although the term crypto-Protestantism crops up once (p. 33). A further aspect of the empress's intolerance, her antisemitism, is likewise not touched upon. Schmal's insistence on the undisputed popularity of Maria Theresa's religious views is qualified by her own evidence of resistance to her enlightened decrees against 'superstitious practices' and her reduction of the number of feast days and pilgrimages. In general, Schmal's approach is too narrow to allow a meaningful account of Maria Theresa's 'pietas'.

GERMAN HISTORICAL INSTITUTE,
LONDON

REGINA PÖRTNER

The transforming power of the nuns. Women, religion and cultural change in Ireland, 1750–1900.

By Mary Peckham Magray. Pp. x + 182 incl. 2 maps + 10 plates. New York–Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998. £32. 0 19 511299 7

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903527981

This is in many ways an extremely informative, well-written and convincing book, at least so far as its central thesis is concerned. Magray persuasively argues that nuns in nineteenth-century Ireland not only helped to bring about a transformation in religious practice that amounted to a 'devotional revolution', but that they also assisted in the process of social change. They helped to instil in the poor habits of social virtue, encouraging cleanliness and industry and thus propagated the twin messages of social virtue and religious sanctity. The growth of women religious in Ireland is a story of phenomenal expansion. In 1800 there were 120 women religious; by 1900 there were 8,000. Virtually no aspect of Irish Catholic public life was without the involvement of these women. Convents were an instrument of reform for the Irish Church and not a consequence of reform. One problem, however, which does vitiate the work is that its interpretative stance is too informed by the presuppositions of late twentieth-century American feminism, which does not allow the evidence to be read in nineteenth-century terms. This is especially true when Magray tries to argue that lesbianism was a prominent feature of convent life. The fact that mothers superior would enjoin upon the sisters to avoid 'particular friendships' is not evidence that such friendships were 'homo-social, intensely homo-emotional and at times homoerotic' (p. 63) in the way that Magray believes. Furthermore she quotes a letter of St Augustine, quite out of context and one suspects without having consulted the original, as evidence of lesbian activity among women religious in the fifth century. She is also determined that women entered convents in nineteenth-century Ireland simply as a means of participating in the regeneration of Irish society. The idea that such women had a sense of the transcendent in their lives or that they entered religious life out of a sense of vocation as a call from God, hardly seems to have occurred to her. Similarly, in dealing with the social stratification of convent life and the distinction between 'lay' and 'choir' sisters, Magray treats this simply as a reflection of the prevailing social mores where some women had service positions in

big houses. Doubtless there is some truth in her claims but one has to also appreciate that even lay-sisters had a sense of divine calling. Some of her theological assertions are unnuanced as, for example, 'in the Roman Catholic Church, good works had long been proclaimed the principal method of personal salvation' (p. 35). She also thinks that the identification of religious superiors with Christ was tantamount to proclaiming women to be members of the priestly class. One has only to look at the rule of St Benedict (written for men) to see that such identification has nothing to do with priesthood. This is a provocative and important book, and takes its place among a growing body of material dealing with women's history in nineteenth-century Ireland. It deserves to be widely read.

JESUIT HOUSE OF STUDIES,
DUBLIN

OLIVER P. RAFFERTY SJ

Scripture politics. Ulster Presbyterians and Irish radicalism in the late eighteenth century. By I. R. McBride. Pp. x + 275. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1998. £35. 0 19 820642 9
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903537988

The question of the relationship between politics and religious belief has bedevilled the history of Christianity since the days of Constantine. The issues were exacerbated by the Reformation, and in Ireland were given greater edge by the fact that the majority Catholic population was subject to the rule of the minority Protestant population. The most important element within Protestantism, the element that marked the ruling elite, was Anglicanism. Presbyterians, however, had a strong presence in Ireland especially in Ulster. They too, along with the Catholics, suffered exclusion from participation in the body politic. One of the most important events in the development of modern Irish nationalism was the attempt in the late eighteenth century to establish by force an Irish republic as a consequence of the 1798 Rising. The rising was greatly inspired by the American and French revolutions. In addition it was given immense intellectual coherence by Irish Presbyterian thinkers, some of whom were of the 'New Light' tendency which sat lightly to the orthodoxy of the Niceno-Constantinopolitan Creed (which at one point [p. 97] McBride confuses with the Athanasian Creed). Overall the United Irishmen had the aim of replacing the terms Catholic, Protestant and Dissenter with the common name of Irishmen. However laudable the objective, McBride indicates that, from the perspective of radical Presbyterianism, this aspiration was only possible because many believed that papal-dominated Catholicism was on its last legs. Anti-Catholicism, or at least anti-papalism, was and remains a fundamental touchstone of Irish Presbyterian identity. 'Anti-popery was not just a quaint atavistic footnote to United Irish ideology; for the Presbyterians, at least, it formed a seminal part of the republican vision' (p. 171). McBride is too careful an historian to think that the picture can be so easily painted. It was at one level natural that common cause should be made with Catholics in seeking redress of grievances. For many Presbyterians, however, the heart of the problem arose from attempts by the State to control the Church. Neither king nor pope, but Christ alone could be head of the Church. In the continuing pamphlet war against the Test and Corporation Act the Presbyterian Samuel Barber could point to the absurdity of a political system which had set up as the Established Church, prelacy in England and Ireland, Presbyterianism in

Scotland and Catholicism in Quebec. McBride also delineates the complexities of the relationship between Presbyterian political outlook and the structure and theology of Presbyterianism in the eighteenth century. The author's skilful and intelligent analysis indicates the various factions within Presbyterianism – Seceders, Covenantors, New Light, Old Light – but he also shows the desire on the part of many to avoid splits in ecclesiastical harmony over questions of doctrine. This led one disgruntled Presbyterian would-be Torquemada to complain of John Simson, New Light professor of theology, that he had perfected the technique of 'teaching heresy orthodoxly'. The radicalism of the eighteenth century that forged the link between theology and political action gave way in the nineteenth century to a conservative defence of the Union of 1800. McBride is undoubtedly correct to stress that the rise of Catholic political power caused Presbyterians to abandon the political *élan* of their forebears. But, although, persuasive in many respects, one does not have to accept his assertion that Presbyterian radicalism represented the continuation of the war against popery by other means (p. 13) nor his conclusion that the United Irish project was bound to fail (p. 230). He is however right to stress that in Ireland sectarianism often occluded worthy political co-operation across the religious divide.

JESUIT HOUSE OF STUDIES,
DUBLIN

OLIVER P. RAFFERTY SJ

The Russians on Athos. By Nicholas Fennell. Pp. 348. Bern: Peter Lang, 2001. £35 (paper). 3 906766 93 4; 0 8024 5609 8

Living icons. Persons of faith in the eastern Church. By Michael Plekon (foreword Lawrence S. Cunningham). Pp. xii + 337 + 16 plates. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2002. \$37.50. 0 268 03350 1

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903547984

These two books, so very different from each other, have a point in common: St Seraphim of Sarov (1759–1833). Nicholas Fennell's book ends with a tribute to him, mentioning the monastic community which he founded at Diveyevo, Russia, now reopened after decades of closure under the Soviets, and praising the spirit of reconciliation with the Greek Orthodox Church which is to be found there. Fr Michael Plekon characterises St Seraphim as the Russian saint most relevant to our times and uses his biography as an introduction to nine further *Living icons*, men – and one woman – now all dead, who represented the best of Russian Orthodox spirituality in the twentieth century.

Apart from this, the books are very different from each other, though both, not uncritically, bring into focus the contribution which Russian Orthodoxy can make to the faith of the new century. Fennell's book, addressed to a readership already versed in Russian church history, contains many pages of outstanding new research on the Holy Mountain, a subject which, as he illustrates all too clearly, is still largely obscure to the world at large. Plekon's work speaks to a wider public, not only of the Orthodox faith, and is to some extent a re-telling of life histories available elsewhere. As the book progresses, however, the chapters become more and more original and his assessment of Russian theologians who have played a leading role on the American church stage is illuminating and challenging.

This reviewer, who has twice been to the Holy Mountain, did not begin to understand the history of the Russian presence there until reading this book. The

Greek–Russian controversy over land, economic wealth and property dominated the nineteenth century and until now the story has been told only in biased sources, whether Greek or Russian. Fennell clearly has immense sympathy for the Russians and speaks the language, but he reads Greek sources, too, and his impartiality never wavers. He is quite capable of being critical of the maladministration within the great Russian monastery of St Panteleimon, one of the twenty major foundations which together supply the council that governs Mount Athos.

The Russian Skete of the Prophet Elijah is not one of the ruling twenty and Fennell shows it to have embodied much of the best of the Russian monastic tradition. He recounts the admirable efficiency with which it handled the one-time massive influx of pilgrims and chapter vii describes life there in the brief and almost idyllic decade before the 1917 Revolution.

Fennell characterises Athos on the eve of the First World War as ‘the scene of ethnic quarrels fuelled by greed, jealousy and even violence ... monastic humility and other-worldliness were being forgotten ... God’s will prevailed: the Russians were humbled, made destitute and brought back to their senses’ (p. 318). Too strong, perhaps, in the light of the events of the 1990s: the ejection of the Russians from the Prophet Elijah Skete by the Greeks in 1992; the subsequent cases claiming repossession in the Greek courts, and in 1996 at the European Commission of Human Rights in Strasbourg, which the Russians lost. The controversy continues.

Living icons, too, presents plenty of evidence about disagreements and unpleasantness over theological issues in the Russian Orthodox Church. Fr Plekon’s aim is to show the relevance of Orthodoxy as a living faith in the west, as well as in Russia and in this he succeeds to an exciting degree. Here is a book which contains strong theological argument, presented in a readable and stimulating way.

After the chapter on St Seraphim of Sarov in the heyday of the Tsarist empire, Fr Plekon takes a big leap forward to the period of communist persecution. This entails a geographical shift, too, because theology became an impossible discipline in Russia (except in deeply clandestine conditions) for seventy years until the 1980s. Therefore the chief geographical focus of the activity of the next six figures portrayed is Paris, from Fr Sergius Bulgakov to Fr Nicolas Afanasiev. Then with Frs Alexander Schmemmann and John Meyendorff it switches to New York, before finally returning, as the last feature of a satisfying parabola, to Russia again with Fr Alexander Men, murdered in 1990.

All these gifted proponents of Russian Orthodoxy engendered controversy in one way or another and it is not the least of the book’s virtues to represent this in an open and stimulating manner. The culmination of this, described on p. 234, was the ceremonial book burning on 5 May 1998 of several works of contemporary Orthodox theology. This occurred at Ekaterinburg, the original political patch of Boris Yeltsin, who was still Russian president at the time, under the auspices of the local bishop, Nikon, whom the Moscow patriarchate has since removed. One might have expected, perhaps, that the works of Fr Alexander Men, who has been called the ‘apostle of Russian church *glasnost*’, would have featured in the *auto-da-fé*, but so also did books by three other of Fr Plekon’s heroes, Afanasiev, Schmemmann and Meyendorff.

It is doubtful, to be honest, whether any of these theologians was well understood in Russia. However, the last two were great figures of religious culture in America. At the great seminary of St Vladimir in New York Meyendorff succeeded Schmemmann as dean. Both made an immense contribution by demonstrating the relevance of

Orthodoxy to American society, but their ecumenical commitment, which did not prevent Fr Meyendorff from being a critic of certain modernistic and social trends within the World Council of Churches, made them less than fully acceptable to the more tradition-bound elements in their Church. It is a fascinating story, with a strong personal element, as Fr Plekon imbibed ideals from both of these in person.

He was not able, of course, to know Fr Alexander Men in the same way, but he clearly depicts him as a theologian of immense importance and relevance for the future of the Orthodox Church in Russia, partly because of his martyr's death, but also because of the brilliance of his writings themselves. Born of Jewish parents and educated in the heyday of repression (he was eighteen when Stalin died), Fr Men illustrated astonishing powers in being able to write about theology at all. This section, strangely, shows worse proof-reading than the rest of the book, which would, nevertheless, be worth buying for this chapter alone.

KESTON INSTITUTE,
OXFORD

MICHAEL BOURDEAUX

A history of the Churches in Australasia. By Ian Breward. (Oxford History of the Christian Church.) Pp. xxi + 474 incl. 51 maps, 4 figs and 4 tables. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001. £65. 0 19 826356 2

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903557980

For the last four decades the history of Christianity in Australia, New Zealand and the Pacific Islands has been a flourishing area of research and writing. But unlike the field of literature, where Australian and New Zealand novelists sometimes get short-listed for the Booker Prize, with few exceptions the published work on the religious history of the region is not widely known in Britain and North America. This book, in a prestigious series on the history of the Christian Church, is therefore important. It is the first substantial synthesis of the modern religious history of the whole region and also a reference work which international scholars will consult for information on the distinctive shape and influence of the Christian Churches in Australasia. Ian Breward, who recently retired as Professor of Church History in the United Faculty of Theology in Melbourne, has gained a high reputation as a teacher and irenic interpreter of the history of Christianity to generations of students in both New Zealand and Australia. His previous survey *A history of the Australian Churches* (1993) prepared the way for this much larger work.

Christianity was brought to Australasia in many different forms. In the late eighteenth century Anglican chaplains were sent to the British penal colony at Botany Bay on the eastern coast of Australia. Missionaries of the London Missionary Society began a mission at Tahiti in the Pacific Islands in 1797 and the Church Missionary Society went to the Maori of New Zealand in 1814. The Catholicism that took root in Australia and New Zealand in the nineteenth century was predominantly Irish while in the Pacific Islands the majority of Catholic missionaries were French. The construction of a coherent account of the history of Christianity in this diverse region – stretching from the lush tropical islands of Polynesia to the deserts of central Australia – presents many problems. Breward has chosen a chronological approach, with each chapter based on a broad theme (such as 'The making of Christian societies') which integrates parallel developments in Australia, New Zealand and the

Pacific. The advantage of this is that the island churches are not relegated to a separate section but are shown to be part of the same Australasian world as the settler colonies. It is good to be reminded, for example (p. 41), that by the 1840s 'strong Polynesian churches greatly outnumbered the small settler churches in Australia and New Zealand'. The weakness is an occasional scrambled paragraph or section, which juxtaposes information on people and events from widely different contexts and which can make for heavy reading.

The book ranges widely over the history of every major branch of Christianity in Australasia. Breward's command of the sources is impressive. These include specialised monographs, recent theses, journal and newspaper articles, church archives and collections of private papers. He is temperate in his judgements, sometimes astringent but habitually generous. In every chapter the narrative is given colour by local case studies from urban and rural congregations, brief vignettes of church leaders and telling incidents. One learns, for example (p. 327), that Sister (Dame) Mary Leo, a Sister of Mercy in Auckland who was New Zealand's most famous singing teacher – one of her pupils was Kiri Te Kanawa – insisted that her girls thank God for closing examiners' ears to their mistakes. Developments in worship, music and church architecture are adequately summarised, and attention is given to Protestant bodies outside the mainstream such as the Seventh-day Adventists and the various Pentecostal Churches. In both Australia and New Zealand the latter, having expanded rapidly since the 1970s, are now an important part of the religious scene, claiming more regular churchgoers than the Anglican Church. The material on women's public roles in the Church does not blaze a new trail on religion and gender but provides a useful synthesis of current scholarship.

In reading this book many different themes emerge. One of them is the social and cultural dominance of the broad Protestant (including Anglican) tradition in both Australia and New Zealand until the 1960s and its decline since then. Breward writes (pp. 239, 248) without condescension on the undogmatic 'culture Protestantism' that was the religion of a large section of the population: 'Dismissed by church leaders as nominalism, it was much more, notably a redefinition of Christianity in lay terms.' Another theme is the interaction, sometimes acrimonious but also creative, between the Protestant majority and the Roman Catholic minority in almost every country and island group. In its religious pluralism, Breward claims (p. 183), 'Australasia provided the space for Christian generosity to grow out of the bitter religious enmities of Britain and Europe'. A third theme is the interaction of Christianity with the indigenous cultures of the region. Breward gives due attention to indigenous expressions of Christianity that emerged initially in the Pacific Islands and New Zealand, then, in the last few decades, among the Australian Aborigines.

This book provides a richly textured and thickly peopled survey of the history of the Christian Churches in Australasia, with many original insights. However, Breward is not inclined to make broad generalisations so that those who are looking for a dramatic new interpretation of the history of Christianity in Australasia may be disappointed. In some sections the main contours tend to get submerged in the detail. The physical environment of the region, and the ways that this is shaping Christian thinking and spirituality, is not strongly conveyed. It would be good to hear the actual words of new hymns and prayers and theological writings. The appeal at different times of unorthodox and sectarian bodies such as the Christian Scientists, Unitarians, Christadelphians and Jehovah's Witnesses deserves some discussion. There are

numerous maps but the index is inadequate. Many subjects covered in the text have no obvious index entry, which will make it hard for readers who wish to follow up specific topics or individuals. And, inevitably, in a book that covers so much ground, there are some minor factual slips. But this is an impressive piece of work that fills a huge gap. For years to come it will be a resource for historians and a stimulus to debate and further research.

FLINDERS UNIVERSITY,
ADELAIDE

DAVID HILLIARD

Transnational evangelicalism. The case of Friedrich Bialloblotzky (1799–1869). By Nicholas Railton. (Arbeiten zur Geschichte des Pietismus, 41.) Pp. 264. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 2002. €44. 3 525 55825 2
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903567987

Put up your hands all ye learned readers of this JOURNAL, and admit how many of you have never heard of Friedrich Bialloblotzky! Not to worry, the Italian customs men in 1828 could only account for him as an infernal phenomenon, and for his name as Diavolobloccio; and even Dr Railton whose sprightly monograph contains everything that is ever likely to be known about his hero, has had to pad it out with a number of tangential matters to get it up to size. But his tale is rewarding as a case study of a phenomenon about which too little is known, viz. Anglo-German theological diplomacy in the early nineteenth century, and is doubtless more typical than those like Steinkopf who are remembered, because Bialloblotzky's was a life of unrelieved failure. The son of a superintendent of the Hanoverian Church who was at once a refugee from Polish persecution and a friend of the British and Foreign Bible Society, the university of Göttingen removed him for harmless Methodistical practices; some happy, more or less freelance years, plying between Germany and Cairo in the interests of the Bible Society and the Wesleyan Methodist Missionary Society, showed how much the former still had to learn (the Bible having much popularity in Greece for its usefulness in rolling cigarettes, while in Aleppo 'one could scarcely buy butter or cheese without receiving a leaf of the Holy Scriptures') but ended with Bialloblotzky's being cashiered by a WMMS kangaroo court for peripheral doctrinal deviations of which they had known from the beginning. Keeping himself alive by teaching, he won golden opinions from the entire British educational establishment, but neither Cheshunt nor University College, London, would give him a proper job. Divorced by his English wife for cruelty, he further expanded his horizons. He would find the source of the Nile, and put the human race on track by means of a grand congress of all the sciences – the Evangelical Alliance much glorified and sublimated. Alas! all he showed was that there is a downside to having the world as your parish.

PETERSFIELD

W. R. WARD

Cathedral and community. A history of St George's Cathedral, Perth. By John Tonkin. Pp. xii + 232 incl. 86 plates. Nedlands: University of Western Australia Press, 2001. \$45. 1 876268 68 9
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903577983

The history of a cathedral, like that of any living institution, is notoriously difficult to write: does one address the concerns of academic historians, of former members of the congregation or of devotees of innovations in ecclesiastical architecture? Tonkin has managed the problem well, focusing on the question of what each generation of Perth's Anglicans thought the cathedral of this, the remotest of cities, ought to be, and how St George's measured up in practice to that ideal. His thorough research, use of illustrations and careful reflection reveal a sparkling array of episcopal and decanal personalities whose engagement in public controversies will provoke reactions in readers of all kinds. Tonkin's conclusion, comparing St George's, Perth, with the English cathedral tradition, is a significant historical reflection on the supposed irrelevance of formal ritual and choral music to contemporary Australian culture. The only serious flaw in *Cathedral and community* is the almost complete absence of indigenous Australians: one could be forgiven for thinking that both the community and the buildings associated with St George's were built in a *terra nullius*, and this despite the precocious commitment of Perth's first bishop to Aboriginal self-determination all too briefly acknowledged by Tonkin (p. 23). Although written by a single author in chronological sequence, this book makes a significant contribution to Australian religious history and can confidently take its place alongside the many excellent, multi-author histories of English cathedrals published in recent years.

UNIVERSITY OF MELBOURNE

PETER SHERLOCK

The making of American liberal theology. Imagining progressive religion, 1805–1900. By Gary Dorrien. Pp. xxv + 494 incl. 13 ill. Louisville, KY: Westminster John Knox Press, 2001. £30 (\$39.95) (paper). 0 664 22354 0
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S002204690358798X

American liberal theology has not been treated all that well over the past century. Neo-orthodoxy mocked its complacency, liberation theology its timidity. While some scholars have dismissed it as the cautious derivative of German liberalism, others have equated it narrowly with the modernist adaptation to Darwin. In the first of an intended three volumes, Gary Dorrien explores the nineteenth-century roots of American liberal theology and argues for a more complete appreciation of its origins and character. Central to this effort is his argument that the fundamental premises and objectives of liberal theology can be traced clearly through the nineteenth, and even into the eighteenth century. He also suggests that American liberal theology was a distinct, and largely indigenous creation. Its connections to the German 'gods' of liberalism were generally indirect; its dependence on English sources, especially Coleridge, was far greater. And, unlike European liberalism rooted in the university, America's path-breaking liberal thinkers were pastors and developed their positions in their pulpits. Finally, he makes a case for the intellectual vitality of American liberal theology. Neither simply derivative nor accommodationist, he argues that American liberals contributed to a tradition that 'has been and remains the most creative and influential tradition of theological reflection since the Reformation' (p. xv).

In advancing these arguments Dorrien takes a biographical approach, offering a series of intellectual portraits resting primarily on lengthy explorations of doctrine and theology, with secondary attention paid to intellectual, institutional and personal influences. To a certain extent, the breadth of these reviews obscures the narrative thread that Dorrien pursues through the text, but these exegetical treatments prove, nevertheless, the strength of the book. Capturing not only the nuances within individual thought, but within liberalism itself, he successfully portrays a multi-layered intellectual tradition rich in its complexity and laced with irony.

It is perhaps the ironies within American liberalism that prove most intriguing. Throughout the book Dorrien describes an intellectual movement struggling to maintain a centre once the process of reform begins. Anxious to free Christianity of anachronistic and morally offensive doctrine, liberals fought the tendency to slip into a too inclusive relativism – a relativism that may have been intellectually exciting but made poor church, and lent credibility to the old conservative argument that Unitarianism, or liberalism of any sort perhaps, was less a third way than a halfway house to infidelity. Concomitantly, liberals struggled with the problem of heresy – first as the targets of orthodox crusaders like Jedediah Morse and Jeremiah Evarts, and later as the defenders of ‘liberal orthodoxy’ against the still more liberal challenges of Theodore Parker and Arthur McGiffert. Readers may also be struck by a set of ironies rooted in the particularity of American liberalism. If theologically ambitious, American liberals, tied to congregations not universities, were often inhibited by their conservative constituencies from developing social and political philosophies as bold as their theology. Even Horace Bushnell, the figure Dorrien places at the centre of his narrative and labels the ‘most profound and spiritually uplifting American religious thinker of the nineteenth century’ (p. xxv), maintained views on race and gender that failed to rise above contemporary limitations.

Dorrien’s emphases leave certain questions unexplored. For example, the broader literary and philosophical contributions of Unitarians and Transcendentalists to American culture receive minimal treatment. In other places Dorrien’s exegetical priorities seem to prevent his exploring intriguing points raised by his own material – for example, Parker’s observation that Unitarianism struggled for an audience because its leaders were not all that religious. And while Henry Ward Beecher’s world is explored in its fleshy details, Dorrien’s analysis of the personal influences of many others is somewhat narrow and formulaic. Yet all in all this is an impressive and valuable contribution to the study of American religion. Dorrien’s intellectual portraits of these nineteenth-century thinkers are rich, and made all the more valuable for his ability to translate the opaque into language that is clear and in places eloquent. His narrative is appropriately complex and sensitively nuanced, and his conclusions regarding the distinctiveness of the American liberal tradition are convincing. We look forward to the next volume.

UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA,
BERKELEY

MARSHALL FOLETTA

Newman and the Word. Edited by Terrence Merrigan and Ian T. Ker. (Louvain Theological and Pastoral Monographs, 27.) Pp. v+260. Louvain: Peeters/Sterling, VA: Eerdmans, 2000. €22. 90 429 0921 8
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903597986

Newman and the Word is the published proceedings of the second Oxford International Newman Conference, held at Oriel College in 1998. All but one of the collected papers display the editors' conviction that John Henry Newman's work is still relevant for 'contemporary developments in religion, theology, philosophy and literature'. The exception here is Alister McGrath, whose essay on what he sees as Newman's woefully ill-informed and almost wilfully perverse reading of Martin Luther and his doctrine of justification, finds no contemporary import in Newman's work. McGrath still sings Newman's hymns, but he will not sing his praises. The Word – as God's self-bestowal in Christ and Christ in Scripture and the experience of the Church – is sufficiently extensive for the rest of the contributors to engage with the conference theme. Terrence Merrigan contrasts John Hick's understanding of Christ with that of Newman's to show how pluralist theology retreats from the imaginative traditions of 'narrative, praxis, and worship' that alone enliven religious images. Gabriel Daly reflects on Newman's 'liberalism', as espoused by George Tyrrell, and focused in Newman's understanding of 'revelation', as the giving and receiving of God's word. Ian Ker attends to those who hear and attest the Word, the 'people of God' who read and live the Scripture; and in Newman and the first three chapters of *Lumen gentium*, Ker finds resources for contesting the clericalising distinction between clergy and laity. It is the whole Church, and not any one group within it, which remains faithful to the Word. Sheridan Gilley offers a finely nuanced account of the shared ideas and sentiments of Newman and the one-time Unitarian, Richard Holt Hutton, who wrote at least thirty-six articles on Newman, and who longed to believe in Newman's adopted Church, since it would underwrite his belief if only he could believe in its underwriting. In the last four essays of *Newman and the Word*, Louis Dupré and Fergus Kerr offer lucid accounts of Newman's philosophical interests, and William Myers and Terry R. Wright bring Newman's thought to bear on Lacanian and Derridean theory. Dupré relates Newman to the neoplatonic tradition of negative theology, especially the Cambridge Platonists, Nathaniel Culverwell and Ralph Cudworth, as well as to bishops Berkeley and Butler. But Dupré does not address contemporary issues through Newman's thought. For that we have to turn to Kerr's essay, which seeks to locate Newman as an Oxford philosopher, and finds him approaching certain themes in Wittgenstein, Derrida and Alasdair MacIntyre: on the temptations of metaphysics and the necessity of tradition for thought. Wright also finds Derridean themes in Newman's reading of Scripture, in his embrace of its spiritual senses. The Bible's multivalency frustrates those who want simple certainties but opens up a new world for those who, like Newman's Callista, are willing to be absorbed by and in its text. Myers also turns to Newman's eponymous Callista, not only to find intimations of later theory, but also to challenge Lacanian and Zizkian nihilism. In Myers's able hands, the Newman of the *Philosophical notebook* engages and 'redeems' contemporary thought, thus fulfilling the editors' aspirations for *Newman and the Word*.

Belgium and the Holy See from Gregory XVI to Pius IX (1831–1859). Catholic revival, society and politics in 19th-century Europe. By Vincent Viaene. (Kadoc Studies, 26.) Pp. 647 incl. 24 ills + errata and addenda. Louvain: Leuven University Press, 2001. B. Fr. 1,800 (paper). 90 5867 138 0

JEH 54 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903607980

A six-hundred-page volume on the history of papal–Belgian relations between the 1830s and the 1850s seems unlikely to attract a large readership. This is a shame, because Viaene's study is a remarkable, fascinating and almost entirely novel contribution to the history of religion and religious politics in nineteenth-century Europe. Viaene's focus may be ostensibly narrow but it is in every sense a project on a large scale. He has been remarkably enterprising in tracking down primary material in five countries, and at least as many languages, and has succeeded in reconstructing every twist and turn in the multi-faceted relations between the papacy of Gregory XVI and the first decade of Pius IX and the new Catholic nation-state of Belgium which emerged unexpectedly from the political and diplomatic events of 1830–1. In truth, Viaene's volume is in many respects composed of two separate but interconnected studies. First, he provides a perceptive account of the dynamics of Catholic politics in Belgium during the first two decades of the state's existence. In doing so, he makes comprehensible the way in which the unionist politics of Leopold I, liberal in name but conservative in character, was gradually eroded by the emergence of the respective poles of Liberal and Catholic movements. The dynamic element in that process was the Catholic spiritual revival which, far from being a defensive reaction to forces of secular modernisation, Viaene convincingly presents as an autonomous and modern force. Under the influence of that revival, the tenor and structure of Catholic life in Belgium underwent substantial change: the dominant cautious liberal Catholicism of the 1830s, associated with the archbishopric of Mechelen and the University of Louvain, gave way to the much more intransigent mentality of the missionary and ultramontane Catholicism of the 1850s. Secondly, Viaene provides the most detailed and documented study of which I am aware of the papacy during the pontificate of Gregory XVI and the early decisive years of Pius IX. His focus initially is on papal diplomacy and how Gregory XVI sought to guarantee Catholic interests and influence in Belgium. But, as he proceeds, the scope of Viaene's study draws remorselessly wider as the diplomacy of the early years is overlaid with the manifold currents of intra-Catholic disputes in Belgium (notably the persistent tension between Mechelen and the Jesuits), the revolutionary upheavals of 1848–9 and, most subtly, the gradual almost imperceptible changes within the papacy itself as the Restoration Roman aristocracy lost ground to the more intransigent and essentially religious figures who surrounded Pius IX. Viaene's thread through this complex process is the emergence of the modern Vatican which for the first time sought and accepted the leadership of European Catholicism. Thus, rather than seeing the demise of the papal states in 1859–60 as the beginning of the modern papacy, Viaene seeks to reorientate our attention towards the much less dramatic processes of change at work in Rome since the 1830s. It is a stimulating argument, and provides just one of the reasons why Viaene's study deserves a much wider audience than those few drawn to the study of nineteenth-century Belgium.

Ernst Troeltsch and liberal theology. Religion and cultural synthesis in Wilhelmine Germany. By Mark D. Chapman. (Christian Theology in Context.) Pp. xi+218. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001. £35 (cloth), £13.99 (paper). 0 19 924642 4; 0 19 924682 3

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903617987

In this book Mark Chapman focuses on the positive achievements of a German liberal theologian, Ernst Troeltsch (1865–1923). Troeltsch is currently experiencing ‘rehabilitation’ by his theological supporters and this book contributes to the process for the English-speaking world. According to Chapman, among Wilhelmine theologians, Troeltsch most consistently and emphatically applied history to theology. Although Chapman undoubtedly disagrees with post-war neo-orthodox critics concerning Troeltsch’s liberal theology, he is more concerned with comparing Troeltsch with his theological contemporaries. Chapman argues that Troeltsch applied history to theology more consistently than Ritschl and Ritschlians (Hermann and Kaftan) and moreover than Harnack and other members of the History of Religions School, especially Bousset. Harnack’s historical approach was ultimately dogmatic and Bousset devalued the historical as a necessary factor in any religion. In addition, Chapman highlights Troeltsch’s idea of Europeanism based upon the Enlightenment tradition and defends his controversial notion of compromise. In short, this book successfully demonstrates Troeltsch’s consistent historical approach to theology and sheds much light on the broader theological context of Troeltsch’s ideas. Its clarity of organisation and expression make it accessible to advanced undergraduates and beginning graduate students too. There is, however, a problem, for Chapman overestimates Troeltsch’s anti-relativist solution in the idea of Europeanism. While it criticises nationalism among European nations admirably, it also has isolationist tendencies with regard to other civilisations: and this Chapman fails to observe. Troeltsch’s project to preserve the universal in history, the point which Chapman notes and which separates Troeltsch from Weber, led him to limit historical validity to the west, and to deny any commonness (even in the case of mathematics) between the west and other civilisations. This civilisational discontinuity is not only contrary to historical reality, but also points to the theoretical difficulty in Troeltsch’s idea of compromise despite its rich examples in sociology and politics.

WILLIAM PATERSON UNIVERSITY,
WAYNE,
NEW JERSEY

JOANNE MIYANG CHO

From Cambridge to the world. 125 years of student witness. By Oliver R. Barclay and Robert M. Horn. Pp. 256. Leicester: Inter-Varsity Press, 2002. £6.99 (paper). 0 85111 499 7

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903627983

This volume is a history of the Cambridge Inter-Collegiate Christian Union (CICCU), first published in 1977 as *Whatever happened to the Jesus Lane lot?*, and now reissued with the addition of three chapters and an epilogue by Robert Horn covering the years up to 2002. Oliver Barclay’s history of CICCU from 1877 to 1977 remains valuable as a guide to a movement crucial to the survival and growth of conservative evangelicalism in Britain and beyond in the twentieth century.

He writes as one deeply committed to its ideals, but ready to recognise its failings and the way it evolved – for instance, over the matter of gender. The portrait is on occasion somewhat partisan. CICCUC's rival, the Student Christian Movement, was not as uniformly liberal as Barclay states. Barclay also passes over some uncomfortable areas, such as the anti-Catholicism of Willie Nicholson, a key figure in CICCUC in the 1920s. *From Cambridge to the world* provides new material in the final three chapters. These show how significant conservative evangelicalism remains in British university life and how it has declined since 1980. CICCUC continues to evolve, having a woman as president in the early 1990s and showing a greater warmth to the social aspects of Christianity. Horn, like Barclay, is deeply committed to CICCUC's ideals and it would have been helpful to have had more discussion of the reasons for CICCUC's decline in the last two decades. None the less *From Cambridge to the world* provides a valuable window onto the world of student Christianity, Cambridge and the development of conservative evangelicalism in the last 125 years.

FULFORD,
YORK

DAVID GOODHEW

The Holy See, British policy and the Plan of Campaign in Ireland, 1885–93. By Ambrose Macaulay. Pp. xiv + 386 incl. map + 13 ill. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2002. €45. 1 85182 628 9
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S002204690363798X

The Plan of Campaign was an attempt by some leading Parnellites to meet the challenges of continued agricultural distress and evictions in the Ireland of the 1880s. If rents were too high tenants agreed to pay what they thought was a fair sum. If this were refused the monies would then be paid into a collective fund aimed at supporting evicted tenants. Not only was the enterprise illegal but many individuals, especially the landlords, thought it to be immoral. The plan was eventually condemned by the Holy Office and Pope Leo XIII in 1888. Macaulay's meticulous research in the Vatican archives does much further to illuminate a period of Irish history which has claimed the attention of many commentators and scholars from Conor Cruise O'Brien to Emmett Larkin. Here, however, for the first time we have knowledge of what some of the main protagonists were writing to one another. This is especially true of Archbishop Persico's mission in 1887. On the basis of his report the Plan of Campaign was condemned by the Holy See, much to the irritation of the Irish hierarchy. Persico's letters to Cardinal Rampolla, the Vatican's secretary of state, demonstrates that at times he lacked the detachment one expects of a diplomat on a sensitive mission. The Vatican's political manoeuvrings over Ireland were played out against the background of its attempts to gain diplomatic recognition from the British government at a time when its international prestige had gone into free-fall. Further complications arose in 1889 when the Vatican was also involved in detailed negotiations with the British government over the exact status of the Catholic Church in Malta. Here was further inducement for the Holy See to read the affairs of Ireland through British eyes. This book also demonstrates the extent of the pressure brought to bear on the Vatican by British Catholic grandees, Tory to a man, to take a decidedly pro-government and anti-radical stance on Irish disaffection. Communications between individuals such as Sir John Ross and Henry Fitzalan-Howard,

15th duke of Norfolk, and the Holy See did not end with condemnation of the plan. They helped to poison the Vatican's attitude towards Parnell when the Kitty O'Shea affair came to light. In this they had the unwitting support of the Irish bishops who also found it necessary to condemn the great Irish constitutional leader. Macaulay also has much to say on the ecclesiastic who was without doubt the leader of Catholic Ireland in his day: William Walsh, archbishop of Dublin. Walsh gradually lost the confidence of the Holy See because of his supposedly 'advanced nationalist' political views. For the first time, notwithstanding two biographies of Walsh, we now know the extent of the campaign waged by British Catholic 'toffs', on their own initiative and at the behest of Lord Salisbury, the prime minister, to prevent Walsh from being created a cardinal. Although at times the book is perhaps a bit too deferential to the workings of institutional Catholicism it is none the less a superbly lucid exposition of its subject. Based on a wide survey of original material the present volume confirms its author as one of the leading exponents of nineteenth-century Irish ecclesiastical history. His book is to be warmly commended.

JESUIT HOUSE OF STUDIES,
DUBLIN

OLIVER P. RAFFERTY SJ

Encyclopedia of fundamentalism. Edited by Brenda E. Brasher. (Religion and Society.) (A Berkshire Reference work.) Pp. xviii + 558 incl. numerous ill. New York–London: Routledge, 2001. £85. 0 415 92244 5

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903647986

This *Encyclopedia of fundamentalism* is not much concerned with the role of 'fundamentalist' religion in Britain or Europe. This is a very American book the central subject of which is the role of popular Protestantism in today's United States. In America, Protestant 'fundamentalism' began in the nineteenth century out of sincere horror at the theological implications of liberal biblical criticism. Many people have never been clear how Christianity could survive if it were not 'fundamentalist'. But as the twentieth century went on, and especially after the Second World War, the mood and content of the reaction changed, becoming much more irrational and as much concerned with obtaining political as religious influence. Large new Protestant movements appeared – and their newness was one of the most important things about them – which also financed new mission fields outside America. These organisations were indifferent to traditional ideas of 'the Church', many of them were financed with money raised through radio or television, and they combined elements of either Calvinist pessimism or Wesleyan perfectionism with an anti-modernist agenda. Here 'antimodernism' meant hostility to almost everything outside an imagined American Protestant past – hostility to Science, to Feminism, to Socialism and Communism, to any kind of thought or theology or behaviour which might be called 'liberal'. This subculture produced a fanatical devotion to the idea of the United States as the chosen instrument of God's power at the end of history, whereas the United Nations, for example, could be dismissed as a Communist front for the Devil. The increasing seriousness with which premillennialism was taken implied an obsession with violence. There is a deep-rooted educational failure at work here. The *Encyclopaedia* recognises that antimodernist fundamentalism is not confined either to America or to Protestantism, but that similar reactions can be

found in certain sections of Roman Catholicism, Hinduism, Islam and Judaism. All these religious bodies have suffered in their own ways from the pressure of modern change and all have entries here, but Brenda Brasher and her colleagues are above all concerned with the growth of the so-called Religious Right in America and its challenge to the less Christian society which has been developing in the United States since the Revolution. The *Encyclopaedia* throws a grim light on what can emerge from the self-styled 'religious' mind when society changes too fast for a substantial minority of its members. Some contributors quote the sociological view that extreme fundamentalism attracts 'literate but jobless, unmarried male youths marginalised by modernity'. The volume suffers from the lack of separate biographical entries, which means that one has to rely on the index to collect information on a key figure like John Nelson Darby (1800–82), whose Dispensationalism had more influence on Protestantism in America than it did in England. Much space is devoted to summaries of 'orthodox' Christian dogma, in order to clarify the 'fundamentalist' deviations. The bibliographies are excellent, but British readers would need more help in selecting what would be useful to them. Reading, not just consulting, this book is a salutary experience.

BRISTOL

JOHN KENT

Upholding the faith. The process of education in Catholic schools in Australia, 1922–1965. By Thomas A. O'Donoghue. (History of Schools and Schooling, 24.) Pp. ix + 171.

New York: Peter Lang, 2001. 0 8204 5653 5

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903657982

'Catholic frogs squat on logs', cry the state-school kids. Australian historians have long identified the creation of a community-funded Catholic education system as a major factor in defining and isolating that community. This study sets out to investigate the distinctiveness of Catholic education in Australia. Its periodisation is Vatican-centred, ranging from the beginning of the reign of Pope Pius XI in 1922 to the end of the Second Vatican Council in 1965. Its rather circular method is to identify the distinctive aims and practices of Catholic educators in Australia, and to explain these by reference to the distinctive training and backgrounds of these educators. Four major features are found to give the Australian system its particularity. The author does not pull his punches. Authoritarianism, traced here to the dominance of the religious as teachers, resulted in rote learning, harsh corporal punishment and active anti-intellectualism – 'Knowledge puffeth up', said the Christian Brothers. The centrality of the religious aim – to create adherence to Catholic doctrine, and heavenly salvation – led to the constant surveillance of students liable to sin. Gender construction created particularly rigid stereotypes of masculinity and femininity. The author identifies these three factors as common to all Catholic education in this period, but sees them as intensified in Australia by the profound Irish influence within the Church and its schools. This is not a novel conclusion.

MONASH UNIVERSITY,
AUSTRALIA

MARIAN QUARTLY

Archivo Gomá. Documentos de la Guerra Civil, I: Julio–Diciembre de 1936. Edited by José Andrés-Gallego and Antón M. Pazos. Pp. 589. Madrid: Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas, 2001. 84 00 07945 0; 84 00 07944 2
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903667989

As *de facto* as well as *faute de mieux* leader of the Spanish Church at the outbreak of the Spanish Civil War, Isidro Gomá, cardinal-archbishop of Toledo, was bound to have a part to play in the ensuing conflict, a part which A. Granados's pious biography of 1969 was at pains not to understate. From the present publication, however, it is apparent that both by Granados and, more recently, by M. L. Rodríguez Aisa less than justice has been done to the interest as well as to the complexity of Gomá's role in the events that ensued between then and his appointment as the Holy See's unaccredited representative to Franco in December 1936. Covering that five-month period, and comprising 344 letters in and out together with associated annexes and memoranda (mostly in Spanish, Catalan, Italian, Latin and Vatican diplomatic cipher), this volume affords a fascinating glimpse of an hermetically sealed mind haunted by masons, Moscow and Jews, exerting itself on behalf of a cause which one part of him knew to be fatally flawed. Especially when writing to his suffragans, Gomá liked to present himself as old, ill and amiably muddled. He was certainly the first two of these. But he was also as vain as he was stolid, and, while not uncrafty, as unsubtle as any man who thinks in blocks. 'Not a single house of God [had] been respected' by 'the Marxist hordes', he assured Catholic primates around the world, while fussing from afar about repairs to the dining room of his Toledo palace. From within the world of 'good Spaniards' and 'bad Spaniards' with which he was comfortable, the allegiance of Catalan and Basque daily communicants to a communist regime was incomprehensible. Although once the war had started he was willing to acknowledge that 'we have failed by losing touch with the people', on its eve he had been chiefly preoccupied with herbal remedies for his nephritis and recommendable spas, the only letter sent to him on the day war broke out having to do with the claims of his see to ecclesiastical primacy. But though he knew nothing in advance of the schemes of the insurgents, one of whom thought his name was 'Don José', by the time he went to Rome in December his stock had evidently risen sharply at their Burgos headquarters. At Rome Gomá persuaded Pacelli that the Vatican was misinformed about Spain – in other words that Pius XI (who received him in bed, 'the only such case in the history of papal audiences', he claimed) as well as others there had been got at by the Catalans, and in particular by Vidal i Barraquer, the antithetical cardinal-archbishop of Tarragona whose darting lawyer's mind so far outranged his own. In his journal of those December days, a record as full of historical interest as it is of curial tittle-tattle, he recorded hearing it said that it was at Rome not in Spain that the *Civil War* was being fought.

One of the reasons for the rebel generals' increasing regard for Gomá raises a question which the editors do not ask, namely whether his archive has been fumigated (and, if so, when and by whom), in particular in respect of his dealings with the bishop of Vitoria, Mateo Múgica, the killing of whose Basque clergy by Franco's forces so seriously confused the simplistic account contained in Gomá's earlier reports to Pacelli of insurgents scrupulously observant of the laws of war and reds thirsty for clerical blood. For, for all the fraternal compassion of his correspondence with Múgica, there is no description here of his role, attested elsewhere, in engineering the exile of the bishop whom the Nationalists were deterred from shooting

only by his declared determination, if it came to it, to go down arrayed in full pontificals. All we have are allusions to that outcome, penned as though by a remote observer of the passing scene and described, according to to whom he was writing, as 'rather tough', 'gentle', and 'difficult'. Likewise, in his bread-and-butter letter of October 1936 to the bishop of Badajoz, there is not a word about the recent massacre of thousands rather than hundreds of Republican troops in the bullring of that place ('De Badajoz no tengo noticias muy concretas'). Meanwhile, however, Gomá had been persuaded as to Franco's religious credentials as a practising Catholic who recited the rosary daily or, alternatively, as 'a fervent Christian' surrounded by others who were 'pious even'; the initial threat of a non-confessional *post-guerra* state had been removed; the War was proving more efficacious for the revival of the Faith and of Christian piety than any programme of missions (even amongst Franco's Moorish troops indeed); and he himself had been doing his bit by diverting funds collected by Irish Catholics for the relief of the Spanish Church to the provision of medical aid for the insurgent army: a negotiation unequivocally but unavailingly condemned by Rome, represented to Franco as Gomá's own idea and to the Irish as theirs, hampered by his misunderstanding of the extent of divisions at the Irish end of the operation, his conviction that Ireland's primatial see was at Dublin rather than Armagh, and the lack of an Spanish-English dictionary at a crucial moment, and further complicated by the failure of bankers in four countries to secure clear instructions, with at one stage the London manager of the National Provincial Bank addressing the archbishop as 'His Holiness'.

Embedded amongst a mass of trivia, there is here a wealth of revealing as well as of poignant information. In an undated list of 'professors supposedly masons or collaborators with the Republic' (*anglice*, the cream of Spain's intellectual elite at the time), the name of Ramón Menéndez Pidal appears on account of his protest at the bombing of Madrid. Although not all the incomprehensible passages printed here can be due to Gomá himself, and the editors' index is woefully inadequate, further volumes of *Archivo Gomá* will be eagerly awaited by all students of the tragic conflict it so brilliantly illuminates.

ST JOHN'S COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

PETER LINEHAN

Pope Pius XII and the holocaust. Edited by Carol Rittner and John K. Roth. Pp. xii + 291 incl. 4 ill. London–New York: Leicester University Press, 2002. £40 (cloth) £16.99 (paper). 0 7185 0274 4; 0 7185 0275 2
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903677985

On Christmas Eve 1942 Pius XII broadcast a forty-five-minute homily on Vatican Radio, on the theme of human rights and the social order. Towards the end, he exhorted his listeners to help restore a just and God-centred society, and continued 'humanity owes this vow to those hundreds of thousands who, without any fault of their own, sometimes only by reason of their nationality or race, are marked down for death or gradual extinction' (quoted at p. 3). This was one of only a few occasions on which Pius referred to Nazi atrocities; neither at this point nor later did he refer directly to the Jews, or denounce the perpetrators.

Pius' reticence has become notorious, particularly since the international furore caused by Rolf Hochhuth's 1963 play *Der Stellvertreter*. More recently, John Cornwell's

Hitler's pope: the secret history of Pius XII (London 1999) has reopened the controversy in the mass media: 'Hitler himself could not have wished for a more convoluted and innocuous reaction from the Vicar of Christ to the greatest crime in human history' (quoted at p. 237). But Pius has also been stoutly defended. Margerita Marchione, for example, author of *Pope Pius XII: architect for peace* (New York 2000) claims that Pius was 'a saintly man, a scholar, a man of peace, a tower of strength, and a compassionate defender and protector of all victims of war and genocide that had drowned Europe in blood for six years' (quoted at p. 4). He needed to be prudent; to say too much too loudly would only have aggravated the situation.

The evidence is contested and contestable; moreover, the historical claims both for and against Pius are often marshalled, more or less overtly, in service of substantive and controversial claims about how the papacy should function today. Matters are not helped by the Vatican's reluctance to make all the relevant documents freely available, or by Pius' candidacy for canonisation.

It is against this complex background that Carol Rittner and John Roth organised a conference on Pius and the *Shoah*. It took place in April 2000 at King's College, Wilkes-Barre, Pennsylvania, representing a wide variety of opinion and religious standpoint, and the present volume contains reworked versions of the papers presented. Following the introduction and a useful, detailed chronology, the book falls into three major sections. The first group of essays report in different ways on the *status quaestionis*. Michael Marrus succinctly sets out ten separate issues with which the literature engages. John Pawlikowski admits serious limitations in Pius' world-view, but points cautiously to good achieved in Slovakia, Hungary and Italy. Eugene Fisher expresses doubt that the as yet unavailable documents would change our overall assessment, while Sergio Minerbi ably states the case against Pius, and Doris Bergen situates the debate against wider theological questions.

The next six essays break new ground. Eva Fleischner reports authoritatively on Pius' depressingly conventional spirituality, while Gershon Greenberg documents how Pius was still hidebound – despite the creativity of some Jewish thinking at the time – to an account of the Jews as the race that had crucified Christ. John F. Morley gives a richly detailed, nuanced account of steps taken to rescue the Jews in Hungary following the Nazi invasion in 1944. For his part, the eminent *Shoah* scholar Richard L. Rubenstein puts forward a criticism perhaps more damning than Cornwell's. It is a mistake to see Pius as holding a defensible moral position about Jewish rights, and merely being weak-willed and excessively cautious when it came to practice. On the contrary, Pius' world-view led him to see 'the demographic elimination of Europe's Jews as a benefit for European Christendom' (p. 177). Susan Zucotti, author of a study of the Vatican's dealings with Italian Jews during World War II, then succinctly discredits claims often made about Pius' active intervention on their behalf. Michael Phayter offers an interesting, nuanced interpretation of the data. Pius' silence during the war arose from poor judgement: he felt that Germany alone was able to counteract Soviet communism, and therefore was unwilling to criticise it; he was also afraid that criticisms would lead to the destruction of the Vatican, and thereby also of the faith of Catholics throughout the world. Blatant immorality set in only after the war, with Pius' refusal to condemn pogroms in Poland, with his opposition to the establishment of the state of Israel and with his actively helping war criminals to escape justice.

At this point – though the editors place the section break misleadingly early – the focus shifts to the theological questions raised by the *Shoah* in general and by Pius XII's

behaviour in particular. Properly, the writers – a Protestant (Roth), two Catholics (Rittner and James Doyle) and a Jew (Albert Friedlander) – are explicit about their own commitments, and about how these shape their reading of the data. Doyle writes rather airily about the need ‘to root out of the Catholic mentality anything that might serve as the seedbed for future prejudice and bigotry against the Jews’, and asks that pastors ‘clarify’ in their homilies the use of ‘Pharisees’ in the synoptic Gospels and ‘Jews’ in John (p. 235). But the need to which Doyle is pointing here is surely not so much one for pastoral adaptation as for wholesale transformation. The *Shoah* is at once a consequence and an indictment of a demonisation of Judaism present even in the Gospels. The debates regarding the papacy’s role, in all their complexity and acrimony, are part of a wider reality of shame and disorientation.

This collection of essays has its faults: it is repetitive, sometimes ponderous, worthy rather than incisive. Nevertheless, it is commendably inclusive and comprehensive. It will provide useful and handy refutations of the oversimplified accounts that have often been peddled. It will also help Christians – I am in no position to judge its appropriateness for Jews – engage more fully with the searing questions raised by the *Shoah*.

CAMPION HALL,
OXFORD

PHILIP ENDEAN SJ

Children of the new age. A history of spiritual practices. By Steven J. Sutcliffe. Pp. x + 267.

London: Routledge, 2003(2). 0 415 24298 3; 0 415 24299 1

JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903687981

This is a work of history, as its title suggests, but also one of social anthropology and religious studies. It represents a splendid pioneering venture, based on printed and manuscript primary sources, questionnaires and participant observation, of how the label ‘New Age’ has evolved in the course of the twentieth century. In the middle decades it was a sharply-focused apocalyptic emblem derived from esoteric Christianity and associated with small and marginalised groups of Anglo-American thinkers. In 1970s it began to transform into a diffuse humanistic idiom, centred upon personal self-realisation and powering a large and lucrative international industry. The achievement of the first half of this book is to show how the two forms actually fit together, and certain key figures connect both. The second half is devoted to considering what sort of social and religious phenomenon the contemporary idiom actually represents, and demolishing previous attempts by colleagues to put it into more strongly-delineated categories. Thus, it is not a movement, nor a network, and should not even be accorded a definite article; it is a brand of spirituality. Such an argument inevitably raises questions about how far Sutcliffe is imposing his own categories on material that, notoriously, usually refuses to define itself; but there is no doubt that, thanks to him, we can now have a much better understanding of the material itself.

UNIVERSITY OF BRISTOL

RONALD HUTTON

God save the queen. The spiritual dimension of monarchy. By Ian Bradley. Pp. xxii + 218. London: Darton, Longman and Todd, 2002. £14.95. 0 232 52414 9; 0 232 52460 2
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903697988

This is a brave book. Ian Bradley, who is Reader in Practical Theology at the University of St Andrews, and an ordained minister in the Church of Scotland, argues against those writers, including this reviewer, who have ignored the spiritual dimension of monarchy. This, Bradley claims lies ‘in marked contrast to its manifest importance in the life of the Queen and other members of the royal family and in the popular perception and experience of royalty’. *God save the queen* offers an historical account of the development of the Christian monarchy and of the coronation ceremony, intended to support Bradley’s case that the monarchy cannot be understood without consideration of its spiritual and sacramental dimension. This is a serious and scholarly work. It is beautifully written and it forms a valuable corrective to much that is written on the monarchy. Yet, ultimately, and perhaps inevitably, it fails. In the modern world, after all, constitutional monarchy, if it is to survive, must be a monarchy which rests on popular consent. Thus in Britain, it must, as the prince of Wales has recognised, become a monarchy for a multi-denominational and a multi-cultural society, a society in which only a minority are strongly believing Christians, and which, if survey evidence is to be believed, is, with the Netherlands, the most irreligious society in western Europe. Were the survival of the monarchy to depend, therefore, on a return to organised Christianity, its future might be doubtful. But the success of monarchy in Britain as in the small and on the whole agnostic democracies of north-western Europe – Belgium, Luxembourg, the Netherlands, Denmark, Norway and Sweden – lies less in its religious significance than in the fact that, as Cambridge historian Jonathan Parry has suggested in the Demos symposium, *Monarchies* (2002), edited by Tom Bentley and James Wilsdon, ‘it has symbolised a representative constitutional political culture’. The task for the monarchy, therefore, is to come to terms with changes in British society, changes which require it to become more welfare-oriented and less ‘magical’. From this point of view, the precepts adumbrated in *God save the queen*, would lead the monarchy in the wrong direction, into a narrow *cul-de-sac* peopled solely by the devout. Nevertheless, this, is an impressive book which should be read by all those interested in the monarchy and in constitutional history. It will both provoke and stimulate even if, all too frequently, it will provoke disagreement rather than assent.

BRASENOSE COLLEGE,
 OXFORD

VERNON BOGDANOR

The resurrection of the Church in Albania. Voices of Orthodox Christians. By Jim Forest. Pp. 128 incl. frontispiece and 64 ills. Geneva: WCC Publications, 2002. €17 (paper). 2 8254 1359 3
JEH (54) 2003; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046903707982

Any title including the word ‘resurrection’ referring to the Church in Albania would, at first sight, seem to belong to the realms of fantasy. Albania was the only country in world history completely to outlaw religion in all its forms – and that as long ago as 1967, a quarter of a century before communism collapsed, leaving the

country in chaos. 'An Islamic outpost in Europe's muddiest backwater': such a view might have been expressed even by someone well versed in Balkan history. In truth, however, before Enver Hoxha's murderous anti-religious campaign, there had been Roman Catholics in the north (about 10 per cent of the country's total population) and Orthodox (some 20 per cent) in the south. The rebirth of Christianity in the last decade of the twentieth century is one of the miracles of our age, to be compared – of course, on a much smaller scale – with events in China. Jim Forest's modest book is a lively and encouraging record of Christian endurance in the most extreme circumstances. He confines himself to the Orthodox Church (though doubtless a similar book could be written about the Albanian Catholics). It is not a consecutive narrative, but recounts a series of meetings he had with a wide variety of Orthodox believers, clerical and lay, over a period of just over three weeks. This is a work of extended journalism rather than research, but Forest's interviews with fourteen men and women are convincingly, even movingly, recorded. What the reader experiences is the authentic voice of the martyrs, men and women who witnessed to Christ and preserved the faith under conditions at the limit of endurance, with many references, of course, to those who made the supreme sacrifice. Old attitudes which evolved during the period of persecution did not dissolve overnight and the period of rebuilding church life from the foundations upwards has been fraught with difficulties. The story of Fr Jani Trebicka, secretary of the Holy Synod (pp. 53–60) illustrates just how grave are the continuing difficulties, but the moral fibre of such people is an example and an inspiration to any reader.

KESTON INSTITUTE,
OXFORD

MICHAEL BOURDEAUX