

Reviews

Hidden gospels. How the search for Jesus lost its way. By Philip Jenkins. Pp. vii + 260.

New York–Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001. \$25. 0 19 513509 1

JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902214797

Attempts to write ‘objective’ lives of Christ or to embark on yet another quest for the historical Jesus have had a long tradition especially among radical theologians. In recent years outrageous views have seemed to be in the ascendancy; the more heretical the conclusion the more likely it is to be publicised. From Allegro and his sacred mushroom of 1970 through Elaine Pagels on the Gnostic Gospels to the publicity-seeking work of John Dominic Crossan, Robert Eisenmann and Barbara Thiering the general reader is likely to know their unorthodox rewritings of early Christianity.

It is this phenomenon that Jenkins, an historian at Pennsylvania State University, investigates in this timely and well-researched book. One recurring theme is that most of their ‘heresies’ are not new; he cites precedents for them from writings of a century or more ago. But the popularity of similar views nowadays is attributed to the growth of academic religious studies departments, the rise in feminist studies (*sic*) and the willingness of publishers and the media to pander to sensationalist opinions. Radical historians of religion are fascinated by Christian origins but the origins they wish to see are made to conform to the requirements of modern (secular) society’s agenda, where an anti-authoritarian stance and liberal values are buttressed by a revisionist history of Jesus, which is made compatible with such opinions by an uncritical use of certain ancient non-canonical texts.

Contemporary practitioners have a large number of esoteric or hitherto lost texts to hand. Hidden documents whose origins are obscure and whose discovery involves subterfuge grab the headlines. The Nag Hammadi codices, especially the Gospel of Thomas and the Dead Sea Scrolls, figure prominently in these rewritings. Valuable though all these texts are, their insights are to do with sectarian movements and should not be used indiscriminately as foundational documents for earliest Christianity. Similarly many of the New Testament Apocrypha give valuable insights into popular piety from the second century onwards but are of little historical value for knowledge of the New Testament era, whose *dramatis personae* they write about. By misusing such writings a genuinely academic quest for the historical Jesus has been hijacked – hence this book’s subtitle. In successive chapters Jenkins shows how many studies of ‘Q’, Thomas, the elusive Secret Gospel of Mark and other texts are biased, uncritical or just

wrong. He makes the wise point (p. 119) that the scholars he has in his sights seem to be unaware of literature like the Apostolic Fathers or patristic sources.

No matter that most Gnostic texts do not purport to be Christian, nor that some texts, like Thomas or the Gospel of Mary, are much later than the New Testament, nor that many of these writings came from unrepresentative cliques, these are the books that underpin the rewritings of early Christianity discussed here. Jenkins notes that the new heretics treat the words of these newly published novelties with a reverence denied to the canonical Scriptures. He investigates the work of today's heretics carefully but he rightly emphasises their many shortcomings.

The blackest of the *bêtes noires* in Jenkins's secular pantheon are the members of R. W. Funk's self-styled 'Jesus Seminar'. He objects to its successful courting of a mass market and to the diminishing of the value of measured and verifiable scholarship. A radical view of Jesus, a bizarre angle on the Dead Sea Scrolls, a brand new theory debunking orthodox Christianity are all likely to gain publicity, especially if the theory can appeal to a newly-found manuscript. One area omitted by this survey is textual criticism: Bart Ehrman's *Orthodox corruption of Scripture*, which deals with the way in which the New Testament text was 'corrupted' to fit varying party lines, could have been one of Jenkins's targets. Jenkins is the scourge not only of radical interpreters but of readers who believe that the word 'gullible' is not in the dictionary.

This book is a welcome antidote to contemporary fashions. The publicists for faddish views are a minority of biblical scholars; their revisionism, written to embrace a modern agenda, needs to be taken with rather more than a mere grain of salt. Jenkins has struck a belated and unfashionable blow for commonsense – he deserves to be heard.

UNIVERSITY OF LEEDS

J. K. ELLIOTT

The quest of the historical Jesus. By Albert Schweitzer, edited by John Bowden. 1st complete edn. (Trans. by W. Montgomery, J. R. Coates, Susan Cupitt and John Bowden of *Geschichte der Leben-Jesu-Forschung*, Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr, 1913 [first publ. 1906].) Pp. xlv+562. London: SCM Press, 2000. £30 (paper). 0 334 02791 8

JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902224793

Many readers would agree that Schweitzer's book, first published in German in 1906, was the greatest twentieth-century book on Jesus. Its portrait of Jesus as an eschatological prophet precipitating the onset of the kingdom by taking on his own shoulders the time of tribulation has had a profound effect on all subsequent understanding of the New Testament. A classic theological text, Schweitzer's book has seen nine editions in its original language. The most significant of these editions was the second (1913) which was so extensively revised that it was a substantially new text; it has stood almost unchanged in each subsequent edition. Unfortunately, and to Schweitzer's own regret, all previous English translations have been based on the first German edition and until now Schweitzer's extensive modifications have been neglected. Here at last we have a new edition which incorporates these changes. Based on the ninth German edition (1984) it also includes a very helpful eighteen-page introduction by Dennis Nineham and the

three prefaces Schweitzer wrote to his first, second and sixth editions. Although not an entirely new translation, but rather a major overhaul of the earlier one, this edition is a timely resource for English-language theology. Making Schweitzer's final text available to English readers for the first time is invaluable not only for those still engaged in a quest for the historical Jesus but also for all theologians engaged in Christology. This book lies behind all the Christological projects of the twentieth century and its impact is not exhausted yet.

ST JOHN'S COLLEGE,
OXFORD

JENNIFER COOPER

The Gospel and Ignatius of Antioch. By Charles Thomas Brown. (Studies in Biblical Literature, 12.) Pp. xiii + 245. New York: Peter Lang, 2000. £33. 0 8204

4132 5

JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S002204690223479x

Based on a dissertation for Loyola University, this is a study of Ignatius' use and application of the term εὐαγγέλιον (Gospel). The first part of the book analyses the contexts and associated vocabulary and concepts in Ignatius, and in other early Christian literature. Here Brown builds on earlier scholarship in denying that Ignatius uses the term of, or is dependent on (a) written Gospel(s); while acknowledging Ignatius' use of pre-formed traditions, he emphasises the oral, preached nature of 'Gospel' in the letters, and its particular focus on the passion and resurrection of Jesus (as in Paul). The second part develops his argument that in Ignatius, as in other early Christian literature, the term regularly defines the limits of acceptable belief and practice: in contemporary jargon, it is to do with identity and boundaries, binding insiders together and excluding outsiders. In effect, this results in an exegetically based study of Ignatius' thought, particularly his Christology, with rather less of an ecclesiological focus than in many analyses. There is little here that is startling, and the approach is expository and sympathetic, inclined to affirm Ignatius' view of the unity of the Church and of heresy. As such it does serve as an accessible introduction to Ignatius' thought, if not to recent more critical analyses of his rhetoric. It is well-produced, if somewhat expensive for its length.

KING'S COLLEGE,
LONDON

JUDITH LIEU

Pneuma. Funktionen des theologischen Begriffs in frühchristlicher Literatur. By Franz Dünzl. (Jahrbuch für Antike und Christentum, Ergänzungsband, 30.) Pp. 451. Münster: Aschendorff, 2000. DM 128. 3 402 08114 8

JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902244796

In 1912 H. B. Swete published *The Holy Spirit in the ancient Church*. In this he traced the development of the doctrine of the Holy Spirit from sub-Apostolic times to those of Pope Gregory. It was a well-written and scholarly account that introduced the student to the difficulties experienced by the church Fathers in fitting the Holy Spirit into a doctrine of the Trinity that did not lay the way open to tritheism.

In his Regensburg thesis, Franz Dünzl would have done well to have followed in Swete's footsteps. Instead, the reader is presented with a vast tome replete with technicalities, where the argument is often obscured amidst the raw learning of the writer. A work half the length would have served his purpose.

Dünzl describes how in New Testament times, the Spirit had a role in Christology, the theologies of baptism and salvation, and in incipient understanding of the nature of the Trinity. These different expressions of the Spirit continued to be debated in the Church during the second and early third centuries. Rightly, he points to the dilemma posed by the Jew, Trypho (Justin, *Dialogue with Trypho* 87), that if Christ was already filled with the Spirit of God, why did he need to be born of the Virgin and acquire the attributes of the Spirit listed in Isaiah xi. 1–3. Second-century theologians ducked the question, preferring to proclaim Christ as possessing the divine spirit of Creator and Saviour, yet, for the sake of humanity, becoming filled with the Holy Spirit at baptism. Only with Origen's *De principiis* is an attempt made to expound a clear doctrine of the Holy Spirit against heretical alternatives. The Spirit was not a created being but the Third Person of the Trinity. It participated in the mind of Christ, yet while 'dwelling in the saints alone' (*De principiis* 1. 3–5) provided them and the prophets with the gifts of grace including the gift of interpreting Scripture. Origen's views opened the way for a more searching discussion of the role of the Spirit in the fourth century and its final definition in the Creed of Constantinople in 381.

The writer's learning and application are impressive but even here there is a failure to portray the radically different understandings of the role of the Spirit emerging in east and west respectively by the end of the second century. While Clement of Alexandria was concerned with the place of the Spirit within the Godhead, Tertullian saw Him as an active force in the Church, accompanying confessors to prison and inspiring them to become martyrs. A better historical understanding of these developments would have been welcome. As it is, Dünzl's work will be valued as a work of reference and should find a place in all patristic libraries.

GONVILLE AND CAIUS COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

W. H. C. FREND

In search of first-century Christianity. By Joe E. Barnhart and Linda T. Kraeger. (Ashgate New Critical Thinking in Theology & Biblical Studies.) Pp. viii + 217. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2000. £40. 0 7546 1238 4
JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902254792

This book grapples with the origins of Christianity, proposing that the movement was not in any sense initiated by an actual person called Jesus but was the fusion of many different cultural, philosophical and religious elements. The authors contend that the Jesus Christ of the New Testament is a literary and cultural creation, 'a projected, shifting montage from the very beginning' (p. 146). Historical Jesus scholars debate whether Jesus was an apocalyptic visionary (so Dale C. Allison), a wandering Cynic (so Burton Mack), the founder of a renewal movement (so Marcus Borg), or something else. But such debates are misguided.

What these scholars are doing, according to Barnhart and Kraeger, is highlighting one of the projected images of Jesus in first-century Christian literature, not discovering a 'real' figure of history. Whereas New Testament critics assume a progression from the original Jesus to the Christ of faith, the authors of the book advance a version of the radical theory associated with G. A. Wells, that the development was in the other direction: the early Christians began with the mythical construct of the divine Christ and gradually gave this figure a concrete earthly life and mission. The book begins (ch. ii) with an account of the Renaissance beginnings of biblical criticism, then looks (ch. iii) at two classical authors, Thucydides and Chariton, as examples of ancient story-writing. Moving to Paul (chs iv–viii), his Gospel is presented as an interweaving of Jewish and Hellenistic cultural traditions. Then (ch. viii) the hypothesis is put forward that the early Christians portrayed Christ as the opposite of Caligula. Next (chs ix–xiii) attention turns to the question of whether Jesus Christ was a real historical figure. Finally, the claim is developed that the four Gospels, like Plato's dialogues, present 'anti-tragic theater': the evangelists depict Jesus as triumphing over human contingency and vulnerability. The book makes some valid points and offers a few useful comparisons. But the position the authors espouse is at best a fringe viewpoint. There is an almost universal consensus among historians that there was a 'historical Jesus' and that it is possible to gain some degree of information about him from the Gospels. Unfortunately, Barnhart and Kraeger neither provide the thorough historical research nor display the acute familiarity with the issues and arguments needed to challenge seriously this consensus or make persuasive their alternative thesis. The book is an interesting and enjoyable read at its own level, but it hardly achieves the distinction of 'cutting edge research' in biblical studies that its publishers claim for it.

KING'S COLLEGE,
LONDON

EDWARD ADAMS

Interpretatio christiana. Les mutations des savoirs (cosmographie, géographie, ethnographie, histoire) dans l'antiquité chrétienne (30–630 après J.-C.). By Hervé Inglebert. (Collection des Études Augustiniennes. Série Antiquité, 166.) Pp. 632. Paris: Institut d'Études Augustiniennes, 2001. 2 85121 186 2; 1158 7032

JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902264799

Five years ago Hervé Inglebert published an even larger book than the volume under review, on the attitudes of western Christians towards Roman history. Now he has widened his canvas: his new book considers not only western, but Greek, Syriac and Armenian Christianity, and his theme now includes cosmography, geography and ethnography as well as historiography. Moreover, he does not confine himself to Christian attitudes to Roman thought in these areas, but sets himself the much more interesting aim of tracing the outcome of their encounter with the content of classical learning. He locates his work in the tradition of Henri-Irenée Marrou, notably Marrou's pioneering work on Augustine and the end of ancient culture. His book differs profoundly from Marrou's: in sharp contrast with Marrou he has a strong interest in classification and periodisation; tables of comparisons, distinctions and subdivisions abound in almost scholastic style. Nevertheless, Inglebert's theme has a strong affinity with

Marrou's: it is nothing less than to map the course of the Christianisation of ancient culture. Instead, however, of focusing on its literary and rhetorical components, his investigation is directed to its content, to trace the emergence of a new imagination and understanding of the spatial and temporal universe in which Christians found themselves.

This book is based upon immensely wide learning. Moreover, in approaching his very considerable undertaking, the author is fully conscious of the pitfalls of such a task. It is not a matter, as he remarks, of assessing, as older positivist scholarship attempted to assess, what the ancients knew in relation to what was known later, but rather of comparing what that knowledge meant to them within the co-ordinates of their mental world. He is fully abreast of the changes in emphasis and perspectives in modern work, for instance in the history of cartography. His discussion is informed by a sophisticated awareness of the wider cultural contexts; the much-criticised approaches of the 'history of ideas' and 'the history of *mentalités*' are replaced here by a 'history of representations'.

What Inglebert refers to as the classical *paideia* – the procedures and the contents of classical education – was, not surprisingly, everywhere of decisive importance. He offers as a metaphor for the encounter of cultures that of a 'sifting': what happened to classical culture in passing through a biblical filter? He distinguishes four possible 'modalities' of this sifting: rejection of ancient ideas as incompatible with Christianity, that is to say as 'pagan' or 'demonic'; simple adoption, as it were by baptism or relabelling; genuine integration of pagan into Christian thought; and the creation of new Christian forms, as it were *ex nihilo*. In the themes here studied, all these modalities are exemplified, in different areas and at different times. He traces with meticulous care the variations in the dynamics of the Christianisation of ancient culture. The Jewish and biblical inheritance underwent profound modification in the course of its encounter with the secular cultures, and, conversely, affected the ways in which they were assimilated, in different ways and at different rates, in different areas. Thus in many respects the Latin west lagged behind the Greek east, and the Jewish cultural legacy proved more resistant to assimilating classical notions in eastern cultural spheres. The disappearance of ancient educational provision in the western Empire from the sixth century onwards changed the course of western intellectual development profoundly, fostering the emergence of a more clerical or monastic culture.

The first half of the book is concerned with cosmology, geography and ethnography. In the cosmological views they adopted educated Christians generally followed the most up-to-date cosmographical views of Greek science. The choice between the 'spherical' and the 'archaic' cosmographies was not an issue between Christians and pagans, but between Christians who read their Bible in different ways: only in circles strongly committed to literal exegesis of the Scriptures was there resistance to scientifically more advanced views. There is a full discussion of the Christianisation of cartography, of the problems encountered in locating biblical geography within the co-ordinates of the classical *oikoumene*; and a particularly interesting account of the reconciliation of classical ethnographic traditions with the ethnography of Genesis x, and the appearance of a Christian ethnography that allowed for novelty, for historical development, for ethnogenesis.

A long chapter is devoted to what the author describes as a 're-definition of knowledge', a theme much discussed in the more familiar terms of reason and belief, or of science and religion. Inglebert rightly underlines the central significance of astrology in this polemic. The second half of the book is entirely devoted to the formation of Christian views of history. Historical knowledge, he remarks, 'was of particular significance to Christians, for on it was founded the truth of their faith'. For pagans the function of history was primarily moral and political; for Christians it was of more fundamental significance: as the medium of divine redemptive activity it had to be understood within the framework of the economy of salvation. They had 'a new conception of history which was applied beyond the limits of the classical historiographical genres'. Hence the richness of Christian historiography, and its fertility in evolving new forms: chronicle, ecclesiastical history, universal history, hagiography and, Inglebert would add, the history of heresies. This last has a long separate chapter to itself, in which the author argues that it is one form of Christian historical self-awareness. This is an interesting if problematic addition to what is usually taken as falling within the field of history. Though Inglebert makes a persuasive case for its inclusion, it is not clear that it functioned primarily as a medium of Christian historical awareness rather than of doctrinal self-definition.

Though specialists will certainly find hostages given to fortune on particular points, the grasp the author shows over a huge range is astounding. This is an important book, and deals with an important theme on an unfashionably huge scale.

NOTTINGHAM

R. A. MARKUS

Alta trinità beata. Gesammelte Studien zur altkirchlichen Trinitätstheologie. By Christoph Marksches. Pp. xi + 336. Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr, 2000. DM 128. 3 16 147298 5

JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902274795

A collection of articles on the Trinity in patristics could be helpful; this book, however, is disappointing and premature in many ways. If at all, it would have been better published in about ten years' time, once reviewers and colleagues had dealt with some of the articles that have been reprinted here, or after thirty years, when those of enduring scholarly importance had been fully absorbed. At present it seems unlikely that any of the contributions in this collection will have such a compelling and lasting life, for all their republication in partly revised form. The earliest article dates back to 1993, four of them were published in 1997 and 1998. Most of them are predominantly surveys of the existing state of research in the field of Trinitarian patristics with, however, substantial omissions. When the author noted that the impact of Porphyry on the Trinity is still to be studied and that Apollinarius of Laodicea may have to be discussed in the context of Trinitarian theology (pp. 201 n. 20a; 204 n. 32) it is clear that he did not consult F. X. Risch's work on Pseudo-Bas.' *Adversus Eunomium* iv–v (1992), or R. M. Hübner's book and articles on Pseudo-Athanasius' *Adversus Sabellium* (1989). The book is also problematic in that it now includes material that turns out to be irrelevant (pp. 243–6). The author has not eliminated basic errors (as for

example the notion of 're-baptism' or 're-ordination' [p. 159] – baptisms and ordinations were always regarded as first-time acts, because acts performed by heretics were not accepted at all; to speak of their non-validity before Augustine is anachronistic and reveals a misunderstanding of the theological development). The volume does not even discuss at any length suggestions in recent publications in which its author himself was involved (p. 54 n. 224). What about the main argument? The author's aim is to explain and substantiate the argument that Trinitarian theology can be traced back to neo-Nicene theology, to the Cappadocians, the *Tomus ad Antiochenos*, Nicaea, Origen and some passages in the New Testament (pp. 236–7). This is a well-known and oft-repeated theory, but the author's approach neglects any recent hermeneutical methodology such as feminist, post-structuralist, ecumenical, inter-religious and post-colonial readings of the same findings. Its hermeneutics date back into pre-Harnack times when apologetic texts were taken at face value and orthodox statements remained orthodox, and were interpreted either from a Catholic or a Protestant position. This book, hastily published, misses its chance for deeper engagement with the recent literature.

BIRMINGHAM

MARKUS VINZENT

Concordance des textes de Nag Hammadi. Les codices X et XIA. By Wolf-Peter Funk. (Bibliothèque copte de Nag Hammadi. Concordances, 6.) Pp. xxxvii + 350. Québec: Les Presses de l'Université Laval/Louvain-Paris: Éditions Peeters, 2000. B.Fr. 2,500. 2 7637 7706 6; 90 429 0844 0; 2 87723 485 1
JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902284791

This is the sixth in a series of concordances to the Nag Hammadi texts, produced by a team based at Laval University in Quebec and covering codices I, III, VI, VII, VIII–IX and now X–XIA. Editions of these texts normally include indices of Greek and Coptic words, but to find a word in a particular context may entail looking up several references, whereas with a concordance one has the word with its immediate context at a glance. The volume contains a brief introduction (pp. v–viii), a list of *sigla* with abbreviations for relevant earlier studies (pp. ix–x) and a list of variant readings (including restorations) from these earlier studies (pp. xii–xxxvii). The concordance proper contains first native Coptic words (pp. 4–221), then Greek loan-words (pp. 224–82), proper nouns (pp. 284–6), strings of characters (pp. 288–9; all in the tractate Marsanes) and finally 'mots non lemmatisés' (pp. 292–5). In addition there is the extant text of the documents Marsanes (Codex X), the interpretation of knowledge, a Valentinian exposition, and some liturgical fragments (Codex XI), with the British Library fragments (BM Or. 4926 (1)) of an anonymous text ('On the origin of the world', NHC II. 5). The section 'Textes' in this series now runs to twenty-seven volumes, two dealing with the Hermetica, the rest with single treatises (Coptic text, French translation, commentary). In addition there are four volumes of 'Études'. Together with the work of the Berlin *Arbeitskreis* (in the *Texte und Untersuchung* series) and the Claremont Coptic Gnostic Project (in *Nag Hammadi and Manichaean Studies*), these are essential tools for serious work in the field of Gnostic studies.

ST ANDREWS

R. McL. WILSON

La Paraphrase de Sem (NH VII. 1). Edited by Michel Roberge. (Bibliothèque Copte de Nag Hammadi. Textes, 25.) Pp. xxx + 284. Québec: Les Presses de l'Université Laval/Louvain-Paris: Éditions Peeters, 2000. B.Fr. 3,200 (paper). 2 7637 7592 6; 90 429 0729 0; 2 87723 425 8
JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902294798

The *Paraphrase of Shem* is one of the longest and most complicated texts in the Nag Hammadi library. It takes the form of an apocalypse in which Derdekeas, the son and likeness of the perfect Light, reveals to Shem 'the first being upon the earth' (after the Flood), the secrets of the Beyond, and how the cosmic work of salvation would be the reward of the few whose minds possessed the light of the Spirit. While the revelation to Shem is dominated by a dualistic view of the universe and creation, this is complicated by the writer's introduction of Spirit as a third force between Light and Darkness. Moreover, the process of creation does not start with an attack by Darkness on Light, but by Darkness believing that there was no god above him, 'stirring' and frightening the Spirit. He thus set off the whole process of creation that culminated in the formation of humanity and the animal kingdom. Salvation, the emergence from Darkness into Light, begins however, only with the survivors of the Flood, of whom Shem was the foremost.

Roberge provides a full, detailed, account of the intricate series of revelations to Shem, followed by an annotated text and French translation. He concludes with an analysis of the final eschatological phase of Shem's progress towards salvation. The task was formidable but has been undertaken successfully. The editor is surely correct, in opposition to Wisse's view (expressed in J. M. Robinson [ed.] *The Nag Hammadi Library*, 308), to consider the *Paraphrase* a Christian Gnostic document, one of the group of tritheistic Peratae criticised by Hippolytus, *Elenchus* Bk v. 7–9, but strongly opposed to orthodox Christian baptism. He is also convincing in pointing to many similarities between the *Paraphrase* and the Manichaean creation myth. It would seem that by the early years of the third century ideas were developing in Syria and Egypt, Gnostic-Christian in essence but also owing much to popular Stoicism and mystical tracts, such as the *Chaldaean oracles*. This mingling of biblical and pagan traditions was a factor leading to the ready reception of Manichaeism in the same provinces in the second half of the century. Roberge's painstaking and scholarly study has thrown welcome new light on the confusion of cross-currents in religious life in some of the eastern provinces of the Roman empire during the third century.

GONVILLE AND CAIUS COLLEGE,
 CAMBRIDGE

W. H. C. FRENCH

Theodor von Mopsuestia und das Nicänum. Studien zu den katechetischen Homilien. By Simon Gerber. (Supplements to Vigiliae Christianae, 51.) Pp. ix + 325. Leiden–Boston–Cologne: Brill, 2000. Nlg 191, 72. 90 04 11521 8; 0920 623X
JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902304792

This book grew out of a doctoral thesis in theology submitted at the University of Kiel in 1997. Its author seems to suggest an inner link between the themes indicated by its title and subtitle respectively. 'Theodore of Mopsuestia and the

Nicene Creed' is not only about the creed which Theodore put before the catechumens in his *Catechetical homilies*, for example its text and doctrinal contents compared to those of the Nicene and the Niceno-Constantinopolitan Creeds, or Theodore's theological stance *vis-à-vis* either. Rather, Gerber takes a comprehensive look at the historical-theological context of the homilies and their theology. He writes about Theodore's life, time and 'Nachleben' (pp. 1–16), the tradition of the *Catechetical homilies* (pp. 17–29), Theodore's style of teaching and doing theology and the role of the creed in this (pp. 31–107), the text of the creed (pp. 108–58), and Theodore's theology in the *Catechetical homilies* and beyond (pp. 159–266). In a final chapter he reflects on the role of the Nicene Creed through the Nestorian Controversy (pp. 267–89). In an appendix he lists alternative readings for the text of the *Catechetical homilies* in A. Mingana's Cambridge edition of 1932 based on a study of the photographic reproduction of the manuscript published by R. Tonneau and R. Devreesse (Rome 1949). The results should prove interesting for all who deal with the Syriac text themselves, though some may find Gerber's use of transcription a bit annoying. But this is only a minor quibble. On the whole this book is to be recommended. To be sure, much of its content is not entirely new, but Gerber is always the first to acknowledge this. Besides being well arranged and clearly written, his account is amply documented and up-to-date on the state of research. Gerber's comprehensive cultural- and literary-historical approach, which puts the development of Theodore's theology and not its assumed doctrinal outcomes centre-stage, is a welcome alternative to Peter Bruns's magisterial, but in this respect a bit lopsided, recent monograph (*Den Menschen mit dem Himmel verbinden*, Leuven 1995). It is a well-founded and highly readable account of Theodore's teaching based on a thorough study of the *Catechetical homilies* with a focus on the role of the creed in them, and it should not be ignored by anyone working in the field.

CATHOLIC UNIVERSITY,
LEUVEN

JOSEF LÖSSL

Der Weltkaiser der Endzeit. Entstehung, Wandel und Wirkung einer tausendjährigen Weissagung. By Hannes Möhring. (Mittelalter Forschungen, 3.) Stuttgart: Thorbecke, 2000. DM 68. 3 7995 4254 X
JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902314799

This volume is really a vast reference work. Möhring treats the theme of an eschatological 'last emperor', defined broadly to encompass expectations of last kings, 'new dukes' and angelic popes, wherever he can find it in Christendom over a period of some twelve hundred years (*c.* 350 – *c.* 1550). Drawing on his expertise in Arabic, he also treats the Mahdi expectations of medieval Islam. The result is a truly exhaustive study: the only relevant texts of which I am aware that are missing are the Byzantine Leo Oracles, the related 'Cento of the true emperor', and the fourteenth-century Latin prophecy of French royal triumph by John of Bassigny. Möhring reviews prophecies, rumours and incidents (for example, appearances of 'false Fredericks') one at a time, offering plot synopses, and adducing the relevant secondary scholarship concerning dating, location and

diverse problems of interpretation. His mastery of the secondary scholarship is awesome: his bibliography extends to fifty pages. (I was almost relieved to note him missing Samantha Kelly's study of the 'Visio Fratris Johannis' in *Florensia* for 1993/4 and Josep Perarnau's editions of the works of Arnald of Villanova.) Usually he relies on the scholarship he has inherited, but sometimes he intervenes with criticism. Where the accretion of scholarship is contradictory he usually takes sides, but sometimes he simply reports the differences. Throughout he is concerned to see whether given texts or incidents meet the test of referring to the eschatological future. His rigorousness in this regard is to be welcomed, but I did find him hypercritical in divorcing Thomas of Eccleston's report of Frederick II's entry into Etna from subsequent myths of the returning Frederick.

Although scholars who can read German will turn appreciatively to this book for reference, there will be few volunteers for reading it from beginning to end. Möhring writes without governing ideas, without transitions and without colour. Since he shows near indifference to change over time he might plausibly have organised his material alphabetically. He does offer one very valuable larger observation: that hardly anyone in the Christian Middle Ages presented himself as the longed-for 'last emperor' whereas in Islam numerous pretenders came forth as Mahdis. But this observation, which serves as the book's conclusion, refers to only a small amount of the material covered. Otherwise Möhring's welter of texts and incidents are left without a framework of analysis or any summing up. I have three other reservations. For all his industry Möhring is averse to looking at manuscripts. Doubtless he had to draw the line somewhere, but he would not have fallen into error about the date of the merging of pope prophecies (surely the early fifteenth century) had he looked at a relevant manuscript himself (p. 274 n. 51). Secondly, Möhring's insistence on offering as an annex the complete set of Dürer's Apocalypse woodcuts with accompanying iconographical elucidations needlessly adds to the girth and cost of the book since (as Möhring concedes) the last emperor is nowhere to be found in the woodcuts. (The same confusion regards the cover, which irrelevantly reproduces Dürer's four horsemen.) Why Möhring did not draw for illustrations on splendid and still insufficiently known pope prophecy manuscripts, Telesphorus manuscripts or early *Flugblatt* woodcuts is anyone's guess. Thirdly, it would have been helpful had Möhring commented more systematically on where the editions and scholarship that underpin his account put him on treacherous ground and pointed out where work still needs to be done.

NORTHWESTERN UNIVERSITY

ROBERT E. LERNER

St George. Hero, martyr and myth. By Samantha Riches. Pp. xviii + 238 incl. 3 tables and 105 black-and-white and colour plates. Stroud: Sutton Publishing, 2000. £20. 0 7509 2452 7
JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902324795

Iconography is central to Samantha Riches's *St George*, and appropriately it is amply (and handsomely) illustrated; it is also a mine of information. The exploration of the development of his cult, from its first appearance in fourth-

century texts as a story of martyrdom down almost to the present day, is commendably thorough. George's legend was one that steadily extended to incorporate matter and motifs from other myths and cults. In the earliest accounts he is not yet identified as a soldier saint; the dragon only appears after the tenth century; the story of his resurrection after his (first) martyrdom (at the intervention of the Virgin, in order that he may fight the dragon) appears in the west later again. Riches's account of these and other developments has an encyclopedic quality. The numerous artistic cycles illustrating the diversity, number and detail of the tortures preceding the saint's martyrdom are exhaustively examined; and the variants both in this story and that of the dragonslaying are carefully noted. Riches has interesting suggestions for the decoding of the iconography of both stories; her appraisal of the 'gendering' of the dragon as female in some art works is particularly intriguing. The various medieval textual versions of both chief strands in the story similarly receive very close attention (the variants in the English accounts are most usefully tabulated in an appendix). One or two of Riches's interpretive conjectures perhaps err on the over-imaginative side, but altogether she has presented an invaluable companion for anyone who is interested in the myths surrounding one who became England's patron saint, and their significances.

BALLIOL COLLEGE,
OXFORD

M. H. KEEN

Christianizing peoples and converting individuals. Edited by Guyda Armstrong and Ian N. Wood. Pp. x+352+14 figs. (International Medieval Research, 7.) Turnhout: Brepols, 2000. € 55 2 503 51087 6
JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902334791

The papers published in this volume comprise a selection of those delivered at the Leeds International Medieval Congress in 1997, a gathering which, fittingly for the fourteenth centenary year of the Gregorian mission to England, concerned itself with the history of missions, conversion and Christianisation. As Ian Wood stresses in his introduction, the collection is very wide-ranging. Another way of putting this might be to say that it is lacking in coherence, as is too often the case with the printed proceedings of academic conferences: lots of candles burning brightly but not much sense of the cake.

The first half of the volume deals with conversion to Christianity from late antiquity down to the thirteenth century. Eva M. Synek investigates the posthumous reputation of the (quite possibly historical) fourth-century female Apostle of Georgia, St Nino. Thomas S. Noonan emphasises confessional competition and reasons of state in the conversion of the Danubian Bulgars and the Kievan Rus'. Ian Wood daringly suggests that Anglo-Saxon paganism 'was modelled in part on Christianity' (p. 30) and cautiously raises the possibility that British clergy might have been evangelising the English before 597. Wolfert van Egmond stresses anew the role of monasteries, broadly defined, in the Christianisation of Frisia and Saxony. Walter Pohl shows how lines of demarcation between Catholics, Arians and Tri-Capitularists were prudently and perhaps deliberately blurred among the Lombards in Italy. At this point we

transfer attention to Scandinavia. Anne-Sofie Gräslund shows that the cult-site at Old Uppsala remains enigmatic, while Bertil Nilsson reminds us how difficult it is in Sweden to employ archaeological criteria in identifying burial as Christian. Henrik Janson intriguingly proposes that Adam of Bremen's famous description of pagan cult at Old Uppsala is a piece of concealed anti-Gregorian polemic composed at a precise moment of confrontation between pope and emperor in 1075–6 and has nothing whatsoever to tell us about Swedish paganism. Derek Fewster entertainingly demonstrates how modern ideologies, especially nationalism, have clouded understanding of the Christianisation of Finland. Five papers follow devoted to central and eastern Europe. Zsolt Hunyadi searches for indications of Christianity in eleventh-century Hungarian charters; János M. Bak ably does likewise in the Hungarian legal enactments of the eleventh and twelfth centuries (with a glimpse of some enigmatic Muslim communities in Hungary at p. 121). Anna Kuznetsova looks for signs of conversion in the *Vitae* of Cyril, Methodius, Gerhard of Marosvár and Stephen of Perm (with what could be an early reference to the habit of taking a sauna at p. 128 and n. 11). László Veszprémy surveys medieval narratives of Hungarian conversion and probes their compilers' concerns. Marie-Luise Favreau-Lilie does likewise for the thirteenth-century missions to Prussia and Livonia by the military orders.

The second half of the collection is concerned with different modes or perceptions of religious change. Benjamin Ravid offers what he calls 'an introductory overview' of the forced baptism of Jews in medieval and early modern Europe. Reva Berman Brown and Sean McCartney retell the shabby story of the London *Domus conversorum* (and draw attention at pp. 181–2 to the almost incredible case of Claricia of Exeter who lived in and out of it for sixty-six years after the expulsion of the Jews from England in 1290). Michael R. Evans reflects upon Pierre Dubois's bizarre scheme to encourage the education of personable young women who might then be sent to the Levant to marry Greek Christians and convert them to Catholic observance. Ludwig Vones contributes a wide-ranging and incisive survey of frontier and mission in the Iberian peninsula and the western Mediterranean generally. Neguin Yavari persuasively demonstrates the extreme difficulty of using Islamic conversion stories to construct a history of conversion to Islam. James D. Ryan questions the significance of papal initiatives in the Asian missions of the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries: mendicant activism, apocalyptic expectations and the pull of the Mongols were more important. Felicitas Schmieder prefers to take a papalist view of the same matter.

Five papers examine the theology of conversion. In two of them Patrick Quinn expounds Aquinas's views on conversion and divine enlightenment. Donald Mowbray draws attention to the continuing vitality of Augustinian notions of conversion among thirteenth-century academic theologians. Bert Roest examines the complementary objectives of converting the other and converting the self in Franciscan educational tracts of the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries. Peter O'Brien seeks to demonstrate the role of untruth in the reaction of Christian intellectuals to the challenge of Islam.

There are, finally, a couple of art-historical contributions. Ute Engel focuses on the architectural and iconographical setting of the tomb of King John in

Worcester Cathedral. (This paper doesn't fit into the collection. Did it, one wonders, get blown off course like some migrant bird from a destination in some other publication?) Mary Casey demonstrates the interest of a series of imaged tiles, possibly from Tring in Hertfordshire, for Christian attitudes to Jews in early fourteenth-century England.

To this reviewer the star turns were the papers by Wood, Janson, Bak, Vones and Yavari. All the others were competent, though too often telling us what we have long known already. Future enquirers will wonder why historians of our era spend so much energy plagiarising their predecessors or repeating themselves in expensive collections of essays. There is a whiff of the Research Assessment Exercise and its European and transatlantic equivalents hanging about this volume. Perhaps the need for haste in getting it out before the due date is what accounts for the lack of a list of contributors, the lack of a single map and, most deplorably, the lack of an index.

UNIVERSITY OF YORK

RICHARD FLETCHER

Das Verhältnis von Ewigkeit und Zeit als Widerspiegelung der Beziehung zwischen Schöpfer und Schöpfung. Eine textbegleitende Interpretation der Bücher XI–XIII der Confessiones des Augustinus. By Ursula Schulte-Klöcker. (Hereditas. Studien zur Alten Kirchengeschichte, 18.) Pp. xvi + 396. Bonn: Borengässer, 2000. DM 72. 3 923946 51 1
JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902344798

This book is an interpretation of books XI–XIII of Augustine's *Confessions*. Its introduction discusses the relationship between creator and creation in Augustine, the *Confessions*, the current state of research and the aims of the study. The main part of the book is structured in line with the text. Thus its principal sections are entitled (i): 'eternity and time' (book XI); (ii): 'spirit and matter – the timeless principles of a temporal world' (book XII); (iii): 'the life-giving activity of the Holy Spirit' (book XIII). A final reflection falls into two sections: (i): The divine–human dialogue as encounter between finite ('Seiendes') and infinite being ('Sein'); and (ii): the question concerning time and the relationship between eternity and time as a common perspective in books XI, XII, and XIII. The volume is rounded off by a selected bibliography. Indexes, particularly on biblical and Augustinian references, subjects and modern authors, are sorely missed. They would have greatly helped the reader to make better use of this fine study. Take, for example, the importance and frequent recurrence of a verse like Matthew vii.7, a subject like *memoria*, a title like J. J. O'Donnell, *Augustine: confessions: Latin text with English commentary* (Oxford 1992), and the many references to earlier and later works of Augustine which anticipate or take up ideas prominent in the *Confessions*. For a philosophical reflection like that on the unextended present at pp. 69–71 (cf. also the intriguing discussion of a similar concept in modern science at n. 103) this may not matter too much. For the historical discussion of a concept like *creatio ex nihilo* at pp. 146–7 (on book XII.7.7), however, it would be an advantage if one could find out more easily about the impact of the author's distinct opinion on this matter in other parts of her

investigation. Relying on G. May, *Schöpfung aus dem Nichts* (New York 1978) she seems to assume that the concept is exclusively Christian. She also denies that Augustine's strong concept of *omnino nihil* – not his weaker concept of *prope nihil*, as she seems to think at p. 147–8 n. 189 – brings him close to treating *nihil* as something (*aliquid*), particularly in combination with the concept of the Fall. It is true that for Augustine time and history are creational (p. 387), but they are also subject to the Fall. This renders them ambivalent (to say the least). Thus it is also true that in principle (*in principio*) the relationship between eternity and time according to *Confessions* XI–XIII is a clear and pure reflection of the relationship between creator and creation. Therein lies the appeal of Augustine's model, and of Schulte-Klöcker's well-written and well-considered interpretation. However, under the concrete conditions of original sin – i.e. by its very own standards – Augustine's model looks far less appealing, as K. Flasch, *Was ist Zeit?* (Frankfurt 1993) has shown. One can ignore that and concentrate on the appealing bits, as Schulte-Klöcker mostly does, but one cannot argue it away, as she has tried to do at some points (cf. p. 387). Nevertheless her book is inspiring and well worth reading.

CATHOLIC UNIVERSITY,
LEUVEN

JOSEF LÖSSL

Isidore de Péluse, *Lettres*, II: *Lettres 1414–1700*. Edited with introduction, translation and notes by Pierre Éviéux). (Sources Chrétiennes, 454.) Pp. 535. Paris: Éditions du Cerf, 2000. Fr. 258 (paper). 2 204 06516 1; 0750 1978
JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902354794

Isidore of Pelusium, who in his earlier years had been a teacher of rhetoric, was later (in the second quarter of the fifth century) a monk and spiritual father in a monastery near Pelusium in Lower Egypt. His disciples compiled a *corpus* of some two thousand letters (or rather extracts from letters), which circulated widely and were quoted with respect in the following centuries. This is the second volume of the first ever critical edition, and includes some three hundred letters, addressed to a wide variety of correspondents, ecclesiastical and lay. The letters are disappointing as an historical source because of their rhetorical manner and lack of factual precision. What emerges clearly, however, is Isidore's own role and culture and the tastes of his correspondents. What is most intriguing is the way in which he combines the role of a holy man judging virtue and vice with the role of a rhetorician concerned to show off the elegance of his style and his acquaintance with the best literary models. His liveliest letters are letters of rebuke, which are less often addressed to particular acts of injustice than framed as pure raillery, as when he tells the priest Zosimus (a particular *bête noire*) that he has been described as a blot on the Church in a public rebuke that failed, however, to do justice to the depth of his illiteracy and boorishness (Letter 1,500). Such letters were, one must presume, less a serious attempt to correct vice than a literary *jeu d'esprit*, akin to the satirical letters of Jerome and the invectives of Claudian. Another genre in which Isidore excelled was that of the short

exegetical note, generally answering questions about the literal sense of Scripture, as when he interprets 1 Corinthians vii. 21 (contrary to modern exegetical preferences) as discouraging requests for manumission, on the ground that at the judgement Christ will expect less from slaves than from the free (Letter 1,418). The longest letter in this volume (Letter 1,571) discourses on Joseph as the perfect philosopher; it is good to be reminded that such a blend of Christian and Hellenic culture could just as well be found in the Egyptian countryside as in the great cities of the Greek east.

HEYTHROP COLLEGE,
LONDON

R. M. PRICE

Last things. Death and the apocalypse in the Middle Ages. Edited by Caroline Walker Bynum and Paul Freedman. (The Middle Ages Series.) Pp. viii + 365 incl. frontispiece and 17 ills. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2000. £37 (cloth), £18.50 (paper).

JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902364790

The editors of this collection suggest that the turn of the third millennium is marked not by apocalyptic frenzy but by waning apocalyptic expectations: 'At the end of the twentieth century we are neither very apocalyptic, nor very eschatological, nor even very scared. Not, perhaps, as much as we ought to be.' The note here sounded is reminiscent of the epilogue to Bynum's *Holy feast and holy fast*, where again the thinness of modern religious imagination is contrasted with the richly polysemous religion of the later Middle Ages. But the main theme the editors wish to emphasise is the connectedness of eschatological discourse: of millennial visions, apocalyptic forebodings, apprehension of personal death, mapping of otherworldly topographies, notions of resurrection and of immortality. Peter Brown, in 'The decline of the empire of God: amnesty, penance, and the afterlife from late antiquity to the Middle Ages' (pp. 21–40), focuses clearly on just such a connection, distinguishing two 'imaginative structures' among fifth- and sixth-century Christians: an expectation of gradual growth and purgation that extended beyond death, traced to the moral views of the classical philosopher; and a hope for sudden forgiveness, grounded in imperial conceptions of a ruler capable of arbitrary severity and equally arbitrary forgiveness. Much of medieval eschatology can indeed be viewed as a succession of efforts to grapple with these two visions. Even when other articles address the editors' argument less closely, they are often valuable on their own. Laura A. Smoller's 'Of earthquakes, hail, frogs, and geography: plague and the investigation of the apocalypse in the later Middle Ages' (pp. 156–87) argues persuasively that plague treatises, with their ambiguous interpretation of the plague in terms sometimes of natural and sometimes of supernatural causes, served to reopen a possibility for astrological prediction of apocalyptic events. Jacqueline E. Jung, in 'From Jericho to Jerusalem: the violent transformation of Archbishop Engelbert of Cologne' (pp. 60–82), an engagingly close reading of a murder, examines Caesarius of Heisterbach's unlikely representation of the archbishop as a martyr and thus a saint. Claudia Rattazzi Papka's paper, 'The limits of apocalypse: eschatology, epistemology, and textuality in the *Commedia* and *Piers Plowman*' (pp.

233–56), argues that Dante and Langland shared certain ‘modernisations’ of apocalyptic notions while contrasting, for example, in their display or lack of closure. Each of the papers does provide material for the sort of analysis the editors have in mind, even if the effort of connection is largely left to the editors themselves (in their introduction) and to the reader.

NORTHWESTERN UNIVERSITY,
EVANSTON,
ILLINOIS

RICHARD KIECKHEFER

Understanding the Middle Ages. The transformation of ideas and attitudes in the medieval world. By Harald Kleinschmidt. Pp. xix + 401 incl. 50 ills. Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 2000. £45. 0 85115 770 X
JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902374797

This is an ambitious work which purports to trace the transformation of ideas embedded in western European culture from the fifth to the sixteenth century. It is a work of cultural history, sharing in the methodology and objectives of the continental historiographical tradition epitomised by Jacques Le Goff. This tradition responds to the influence of Fernand Braudel’s idea of history; a modernised and improved Marxism; and the use of anthropological categories. Kleinschmidt subscribes to this line of thought and rejects the traditional historiography of ‘big events’, with its characteristic emphasis on the political and military affairs of the leading social strata. Like Braudel, he prefers to concentrate on the *longue durée*, that is, the slow but perceptible rhythm of social changes, the patterns of collective psychology and behaviour of ordinary men and women. This way of doing history aims to offer a more complex view of society by promoting the study of the ‘material’ aspects of society, which provide the causal background of change. In this spirit, Kleinschmidt takes us back in time and describes the changes in perceptions of time, space, the body, the relation between the sexes, the transformation of the structure of kinship and other forces of social cohesion, the changes in images of order and the preservation of social stability, the patterns of rule and people representation, group migration and types of travel, and changes in conceptual thinking. The central concept unifying these categories is that of ‘action’, in Kleinschmidt’s sense of the social practices into which changing attitudes were translated. In this sense, *Understanding the Middle Ages* portrays change as an integral part of culture, describing social attitudes and cultural patterns insofar as they contribute to the explanation of change. Kleinschmidt attempts to check Lévi-Strauss’s dichotomy between ‘cold’, traditional societies and ‘hot’ societies which are more sensitive to and capable of change, by arguing that medieval society underwent a process through which the ‘cold’ way of relating to the past became a ‘hot’ one. He describes this general transformation as one from a closed system conceptualised in eschatological and universal terms, in which the individual is subsumed, to a society which promotes change and the autonomy of the individual. However, Kleinschmidt’s descriptions induce a somewhat procrustean analysis in which every social fluctuation is fitted into the accorded pattern of change. For all its

welcome sociological insights and wealth of illustrations, the overwhelming breadth of this work provides few argumentative constraints and the reader often finds herself trying to elucidate a series of platitudes presented in obscure phraseology.

LINACRE COLLEGE,
OXFORD

ISABEL IRIBARREN

The saints of Cornwall. By Nicholas Orme. Pp. xvii + 302 incl. 7 maps. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000. £55. 0 19 820765 4
JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902384793

This book is principally a 'complete inventory of all known religious cults' in Cornwall. Meticulously researched and presented entries for each cult encompass all cults, whether or not associated with particular sites, and permit the reader to see in an impressively detailed way the history of references to a cult, from the earliest to modern times (the *Truro diocesan directory*, for example). They summarise hagiographic accounts, and where appropriate discuss the topography of the cult and any iconographical material relating to it. Some entries, such as those for Sidwell and Petroc, are substantial in length and scope; all aim to provide summaries of the most up-to-date scholarship with judicious commentary by Orme. The book is a considerable achievement as a source of reference for the history of Cornwall. Orme expresses the hope that it will 'provide a model for similar studies elsewhere', so that it will eventually be possible throughout the British Isles 'to trace the history of cults, review their extent and support, and compare the character of one with another'. Researchers undertaking such a project, however, would have to be clear that useful results would be produced, and here Orme's introduction to this volume is not wholly persuasive. The character of Cornish cults, he notes, is in some respects unusual: 80 per cent were confined to a single site, 56 per cent of Brittonic saints culted in Cornwall were not culted elsewhere. He poses the question: 'Why did the Cornish choose to honour such saints, and how do their cults relate to the history of Cornwall?' But the introductory sections which follow do not go much beyond summaries of Cornish history and accounts of the source material. Potentially important discussions on the role of international cults in Cornwall, the impact of the Reformation and the place of saints' cults in Cornish identity are inevitably handled too briefly to advance understanding very far. In short, valuable as the book is, it shows how much thought needs to take place before tracing the history of cults can be extended on the scale Orme envisages. In this respect, there are problems with the index, which is not especially full, often including undifferentiated series of page references (as for St Keverne), and omitting minor places (e.g. Lanner). It is therefore difficult to use this book to approach the history of cults from the topographical angle, and the maps which Orme provides are not detailed enough to serve this purpose. Likewise, there is no way of sifting international from Brittonic cults, or selecting cults popular only at particular periods. Much more extensive indexing and much more detailed mapping are *desiderata* if this material is to be used to its full potential. Indeed, it is hard to avoid the conclusion that traditional publishing will not meet the case, if this

research is to be developed as Orme hopes. Databases linked to mapping programmes for the detailed topographical representation of data surely offer considerable opportunities here.

UNIVERSITY OF DURHAM

DAVID ROLLASON

Bishops, councils, and consensus in the Visigothic kingdom, 589–633. By Rachel L. Stocking. (History, Languages, and Cultures of the Spanish and Portuguese Worlds.) Pp. xii + 217 incl. map. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2000. £26.50 (\$42.50). 0 472 11133 7
JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S002204690239479x

An approach to the study of the Visigothic councils that looks at each in its own right and in the context of its own time, rather than as part of a generalised picture of the nature and results of conciliar activity drawn from the whole span of the history of the Visigothic kingdom is one that would be welcomed. The self-imposed chronological limits of this book mean that only two plenary councils and a handful of provincial ones could be included, but one of the author's purposes may be to make sense of the gap that existed in the holding of full councils in the years between Toledo III of 589 and Toledo IV of 633. Expressed in these terms, such an enquiry will seem purposeful. However, this is not quite how Professor Stocking has envisaged her task. What she is concerned with, and what she sees as taking place across this half-century, is 'the struggle to locate and exercise holy authority and establish Christian consensus in the Visigothic kingdom' (p. 120). As neither 'holy authority' nor 'consensus' actually feature in any of the contemporary sources for this period, the real struggle is going to be forcing the texts to mean what she wants them to, in defiance of what they actually say. Methodologically, this may be thought to be unwise. If an interpretation is going to depend upon the identification of elements of meaning in texts such as conciliar *acta*, that are not present at the literal level, then the reader may reasonably expect that proof will be offered in support of the views taken. Actual analysis of evidence, as opposed to assertion of favoured interpretations, is here all too rare. The basic problem throughout this book, which consistently obscures rather than illuminates its author's meaning, is an over-reliance upon broad brush sociological depictions of this society that seem very far removed from historical reality. Statements such as 'Visigothic efforts at consensus building ... may in part reflect a fundamental fragility in functional forms of local community consensus' (p. 14) or 'as elites in the West came to conceive of their own solidarity as Christian universality, tensions between that solidarity and local relationships contributed to regional diversities in Christianised conceptions and mechanisms of social power, community leadership, and consensus' (p. 10) are little better than meaningless abstractions. Only adding to the terminological obscurity is a heavy debt to the writings of Peter Brown. Dazzling and intellectually stimulating in themselves, they are stylistically dangerous for the would-be disciple, who is seduced into employing an overheated vocabulary that further shrouds his or her intended meaning. Visigothic Spain suffers from the lack of narrative sources, while being rich in idealised and normative ones. If this society is ever going to be made to make sense, it will be

through attempts to present the realities of the period in concrete and comprehensible terms. The kind of ideological abstractions offered here only make it more unreal.

UNIVERSITY OF EDINBURGH

ROGER COLLINS

Hereford cathedral. A history. Edited by Gerald Aylmer and John Tiller. Pp. xxxii+672 incl. endpapers and 172 figs+16 colour plates. London–Rio Grande: Hambledon Press, 2000. £25. 1 85285 194 5
JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902404794

Over the last twenty-five years many of our finest cathedrals have published excellent new multi-authored histories of themselves. Notable among these are York Minster (1977), Wells (1982), Winchester (1993), Chichester (1994), Canterbury (1995) and Norwich (1996). One of the editors of the earliest of these, Professor Gerald Aylmer, is also the joint editor of the present volume, and once again he and John Tiller (the chancellor at Hereford) have put together a fine collection of essays (thirty-six in all) which cover many aspects of the cathedral's history, architecture, furnishings and fittings, music and liturgy, schools and even hospitals. This is a very wide range (the last essay is about St Katherine's Hospital, Ledbury), which means that many of the subjects have to be rather briefly covered. Nevertheless, this is a magnificent volume which is reasonably priced at £25, and is thoroughly to be recommended.

The first part of the book covers the whole history of the foundation in seven chapters, starting with Simon Keynes on the early period from the seventh century to 1056. Though the sources for this period are meagre, Keynes's reassessment of the cathedral's place in Anglo-Saxon England is excellent. Julia Barrow deals with the period to the death of Bishop Aigueblanche in 1268, and it is clear that she knows her subject well. The later Middle Ages, covered by Robert Swanson and David Lepine, is slightly less interesting (more facts and figures and longer footnotes) but this is as much due to the period as the authors. There follow two chapters entitled 'Reformation to Restoration' and 'Restoration to Reform' which cover the whole period from 1535 to 1832, the first by Stanford Lehmberg and Gerald Aylmer and the second by Howard Tomlinson, the headmaster of the cathedral school who took a sabbatical to do much original research. As a conservative place, the cathedral apparently managed to keep its shrine of St Thomas Cantilupe until as late as 1550, and the chantry chapels and stone altars were protected somehow to come back into use in Mary's reign. The Reformation really began with the arrival of Bishop Scory in 1559, and with a new set of statutes in 1583, most unusual for a secular cathedral.

The fall of the west end of the cathedral at 6.30 p.m. on 17 April 1786 (Easter Monday) was the most dramatic event in its later history, and the events and financial problems before and after are fully discussed. Ironically almost exactly 200 years after this another financial crisis hit the cathedral which led to the infamous decision to sell the Mappa Mundi. The background to this crisis is well described by Canon Tiller in the final chapter of the history section, while Philip Barrett's account of the new era that began in 1832 with the reform of the church and the arrival of Dean Merewether is equally well told. Sadly Philip Barrett, who was also the last vicar choral at Hereford, died in 1998 aged only 50.

The 'history of the foundation' takes up the first third of the book, and this is followed by two fine chapters on the architectural history before and after the Reformation by Richard Morris and David Whitehead. Both writers cover their subjects very well indeed, but there is a disappointing lack of good plans and architectural drawings. Why was not Roland Paul's 1892 plan in *The Builder* or that of the Royal Commission on Historical Monuments of 1932 used? Some of the fine engravings in John Britton's 1831 *History* could also have been included, rather than the somewhat 'mushy' redrawn plans on pp. 84, 199 and 205. Michael Reardon, the cathedral architect since 1985, writes a brief chapter on the restoration work since 1965, which starts very honestly with an account of the highly unsatisfactory work on the tower done in the 1960s and 1970s 'until the money ran out'. The scaffolding for this work was then just left in place for many years 'becoming ever rustier'.

There is a most useful chapter on the Close and its buildings by Ron Shoesmith, the principal illustration for which is the plan in the endpapers. It is a tragedy that the uniquely splendid two-storied bishops' chapel of the late eleventh century was demolished in 1738. At least it was planned and drawn by William Stukeley. Hereford is also unusual in apparently having no Close, only a rectangular graveyard around the cathedral, beyond which a series of canons' houses were built in the town. Castle Street to the east may, however, have been laid out for new capitular houses and a vicars' common hall in the thirteenth century.

A series of excellent brief chapters follow. These discuss stained glass, medieval tombs, brasses, decorative iron work, bells, woodwork and post-Reformation tombs. Almost all the main furnishings of the cathedral are included.

The third part of the book covers music and worship, and its three main chapters deal with the period before 1300, 1300–1600 and since 1600; each is discussed by a notable scholar. Three separate chapters then consider the college of the vicars choral, the Three Choirs Festival, the cathedral organs and the textiles and plate.

The library and archives and the famous Hereford Gospel and Mappa Mundi are covered in the next part of the volume, and this includes a masterly brief summary of the recent work on the famous map by P. D. A. Harvey.

Finally there is another quite long section on the history of the cathedral school (before and after the Reformation) followed by brief accounts of the cathedral's two hospitals. All of this is based on much original research. A final brief chapter by Canon Tiller on 'the present and the future' brings the book right up to date.

SALISBURY,
WILTS

TIM TATTON-BROWN

Richer von Saint-Remi, Historiae. Edited by Hartmut Hoffmann. (*Monumenta Germaniae Historica. Scriptores*, 38.) Pp. iv + 433 + 132 plates. Hanover: Hahnsche Buchhandlung, 2000. DM 245. 3 7752 5538 9
JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902414790

This volume constitutes the thirty-eighth volume of *Monumenta Germaniae Historica: Scriptores*, 5, *Scriptores in folio*, and the seventh edition of the work

since the autograph copy was discovered in Bamberg Municipal Library by Jaeck and Pertz in 1833. What do scholars gain if they give up the easily portable two-volume paperback edition of Robert Latouche with French translation (Paris 1937) in favour of this cumbersome tome without translation? They get a marginally more accurate and carefully punctuated version of the text – Latouche worked from photographs of the manuscript, Hoffmann from the manuscript itself; but the sense is hardly affected. They get a complete set of photographs of the autograph, which permits scrutiny of the revisions Richer made in his text, especially in the earlier part. For the sections of books I and II in which Richer is heavily dependent on Flodoard, they get snippets of the *Annales* printed on the page, so that comparisons can be conveniently drawn. They get an introduction arguing that Richer, although he was often careless, was by no means as indifferent to truth as some of his earlier critics have thought. And they get extensive notes on the text, some rather pedantic, others very helpful in highlighting sources and suggesting appropriate secondary literature. Whether it is worthwhile to exchange Latouche for Hoffmann will obviously depend on how far either Richer himself or tenth-century intellectual life is the focus of the historian's interest (in either case Hoffmann is a distinct improvement), and possibly on whether Latouche's chosen title, *Richer: histoire de France*, grates on his sensibilities (in which case Hoffmann's simple *Historiae* will come as a relief). But the weight and bulk of a *Monumenta* folio text will surely mean that Hoffmann is more usually consulted in a library than carried around in a briefcase.

ST ANNE'S COLLEGE,
OXFORD

JEAN DUNBABIN

The Viking-age rune-stones. Custom and commemoration in early medieval Scandinavia. By Birgit Sawyer. Pp. xxi + 269 incl. 38 plates, 7 figs, 5 maps and 11 tables. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000. £55. 0 19 820643 7
JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902424797

Approximately 2,307 stones bearing runic inscriptions survive from early medieval Scandinavia. Previous interest has focused on selected examples, but Birgit Sawyer aims to tackle the corpus as a whole, concentrating especially on questions about the impetus behind the raising of runestones. Her answer, spelled out here in a detailed survey of their inscriptions, is that they acted as declarations of religious and political affiliation, assertions of rank and claims to inheritance. She first offers a brief historical outline of Scandinavia in the Viking Age before embarking on a detailed description of the runestone corpus. She pursues the important observation of her earlier work, that the consistent prominence given to sponsors and their relationship with the dead shows that the stones served not simply as memorials but also as titles to property. A catalogue supplements the survey with details of location, physical characteristics, date, and the complicated categories of relationship involved. Sawyer's analysis of the runestones leads her to the conclusion that systems of inheritance in south and west Scandinavia differed from those in the east, arguing that one type – where landholdings were kept intact – occurred in the former, where local networks of authority were threatened by rising royal power. In the east, where royal

government was effectively absent, fragmentation of inheritance gave a lesser elite more scope for strategic marriages. Sawyer has a particular interest in the history of women, emphasising the circumstances under which they could hold land independently and raising the question of the extent to which the rights and duties that went with the property could also have been assumed by female landlords. She also argues that Scandinavian women were in the forefront of conversion. Although pagan examples exist, the raising of runestones was a fashion which flourished especially in Christian circles at an early stage, when there were few churches and churchyards. The Church was keen to develop mechanisms whereby converts could alienate land from their kin for religious purposes. Runic inscriptions, therefore, in addition to proclaiming the acceptance of Christianity, could authorise gifts and clarify claims to property. A significant number demonstrate that, at least in Sweden, bridge-building was a particularly recognised act of charity. Many runestones carry elaborate cross-motifs and simple prayers for the dead, fewer refer to pilgrimage, baptism and the construction of churches. Here especially the radically different Scandinavian distributions require different explanations. Denmark, converted early (after 965) and by royal command, has significantly fewer runestones than the Swedish province of Uppland, where, Sawyer argues, the absence of royal support for missionaries meant that conversion was effected differently, on an individual basis. The extraordinary proliferation of stones in Uppland in the eleventh century and later thus reflects the personal, and deviant, nature of the new religion there, their density indicating a resistance to royal authority. In Denmark, on the other hand, as conversion was state-sponsored, the transition-period was brief, and political and religious authority less unstable. This produced fewer symptoms of crisis in the form of runestones. Sawyer's survey and catalogue aim to offer this valuable material to a wider audience.

BALLIOL COLLEGE,
OXFORD

LESLEY ABRAMS

Robert the Burgundian and the counts of Anjou, ca. 1025–1098. By W. Scott Jessee. Pp. xii + 207 incl. 2 figs and 1 map. Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 2000. \$54.95. 0 8132 0973 0
JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902434793

This is the story of a castellan who steadily increased his holdings on the troubled border between Anjou and Maine in the reigns of Geoffrey Martel and Fulk Rechin. In tracing Robert's career, Scott Jessee stresses that such men might be consistently loyal to their lords. For those historians who have been too prone to people the whole of France with Georges Duby's self-serving castellans of the Macônnaï, this is a useful, if no longer surprising, lesson. Whether the case is deemed totally convincing depends on the significance the reader attaches to Robert Curthose's homage to the count of Anjou for the possession of Maine. On p. 57, the author dismisses this as a legal fiction; but by pp. 136–8 it has become a justification for what might otherwise look like a temporary switch of allegiance. Nevertheless, Scott Jessee does establish that, for most of his life, Robert the Burgundian's interests and those of the counts of Anjou coincided

fairly well, and that Geoffrey Martel and Fulk Rechin rewarded him liberally. Robert's personal history demonstrates the well-known (but here ignored) fact that cadet branches of the ruling Capetian family (Robert was the grandson of King Robert II) disappeared into the lesser aristocracy very quickly. It also shows that a younger son of a count, unfortunately deprived of inheritance at home, could owe his endowments elsewhere to a circumstance as fortuitous as the second marriage of his great-aunt; similar remote connections may explain the careers of other 'new men'. And it illustrates yet again that the eleventh-century world, as it can now be reconstructed, is peopled almost exclusively by those who regularly patronised great monasteries. If only we could know whether Robert the Burgundian's generosity to Marmoutier was typical of men of his class. Still, we can at least be sure that in his belated departure for Jerusalem in 1098 Robert was following a trend. Scott Jessee ends his study by suggesting that, since the Norman dukes never succeeded in conquering the area over which Robert the Burgundian held sway, the county of Anjou in the time of Fulk Rechin should be viewed as a decentralised but strong state ruled by a partnership between the count and his great men. Perhaps. But on the one hand the Norman dukes' campaigns were directed to the seizure of Le Mans and the control of its bishopric; the conquest of Robert's castles was not attempted. On the other hand, Fulk Rechin's county was so depleted by the losses sustained in his brother's reign and Fulk himself was so hemmed in by princes abler than he that his mere survival seems an achievement. But despite such quibbles, Scott Jessee's is a thought-provoking book that contributes to our understanding of a much-debated century in French history.

ST ANNE'S COLLEGE,
OXFORD

JEAN DUNBABIN

Vatican Archives. An inventory and guide to historical documents of the Holy See. Edited by Francis X. Blouin, Jr, with Leonard A. Coombs, Claudia Carlen, Katherine J. Gill and Elizabeth Yakel. Pp. xl + 588. New York–Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998. £125. 0 19 509552 9
JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S002204690244479x

The Vatican Archives (or Archivio Segreto Vaticano) represent a resource of incomparable richness for the history of the papacy, of the countries with which the papacy has been in contact, and of the Roman Catholic Church generally. The appearance of a substantial new guide aiming to give a comprehensive account of the Vatican Archives as well as of papal archives housed outside the Vatican City is therefore a major event. The introduction explains the origins of the guide as a project of the University of Michigan at Ann Arbor financed by several foundations in the United States. It has been possible to consult the guide in the form of a database since 1991. The volume went to press in 1996 and was published in the same year that the archives of the inquisition were opened to research. The inventory itself has the following main headings: 'College of cardinals', 'Papal court' (which it would have been better to entitle 'Papal household'), 'Roman curia', 'Apostolic nunciatures', 'Internunciatures and delegations', 'Papal states', 'Permanent commissions', 'Miscellaneous official

materials' and 'Separate collections'. The work concludes with a long bibliography and three indexes (agency names, series titles and chronological). The authors of the guide have had the great advantage of direct access to the archives' stacks. The result of their labours is a work on a much larger scale than the earlier surveys of the Vatican Archives by Karl August Fink and Leonard E. Boyle. It represents by far the most detailed account that one can find in one place of the post-medieval holdings in the archives (down to 1922, after which date all records are closed to research), and it is undoubtedly a useful work of reference. The authors rightly pay close attention to the *Indici*, the 1,200 or so largely unpublished catalogues and inventories available in the *Sala degli Indici*, which are an essential means of access to the holdings.

The principle that has informed the preparation of the guide is an admirable one: in order to understand the historical records, it is necessary to understand the organisations that produced those records. In practice, two contributors working in Rome surveyed the holdings of the Vatican Archives, while two further contributors working in Ann Arbor compiled 'histories of each department or agency of the Holy See' (p. xxvii). The two resulting databases were then combined. No doubt there were practical reasons for separating the functions in this way; but ideally the same person should have written the 'agency history' and described the corresponding records, for in many instances one must study the records in order to establish the history of the body that generated them. Moreover, the best place to write the agency histories, in terms of both the expert advice available and the printed sources, would have been Rome, not Ann Arbor. The method adopted has created a number of problems that are evident in the guide. Sometimes the account of the agency seems to bear little relation to the description of the surviving records or at least is not adequately linked to it. A rather extreme case is the *audientia litterarum contradictarum*. We read that 'No records of this office were located in the ASV' (p. 106); but the registers of the *audientia*, known as the *registra contradictarum*, are listed in the section describing the records of the Dataria Apostolica (see p. 157, where there is no reference to the best account of the registers, by Peter Herde, in *Palaeographica diplomatica et archivistica: studi in onore di Giulio Battelli*, Rome 1979, ii. 407–44). Another problem is that the agency histories are too often inadequate, inaccurate or simply incomprehensible. This is apparent if one looks at the accounts of certain key offices and institutions of the medieval papal curia. To take a few examples more or less at random, we read that 'The [papal] chapel originated in 1305' (p. 5), but of course it is much older than this (indeed, on the next page there is a reference to R. Elze's classic article on the chapel in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries); the notaries or protonotaries are listed under the chapel (pp. 8–9) rather than the chancery, where they more properly belong; and more than one confusion seems to lie behind the statement that 'the vice-chancellor signed the supplication (per consensum), from the pontificate of Innocent vii (though not in the year 1484)' (p. 157, under *Registra supplicationum*). While the guide is right to seek to identify the provenance of the records, it does not always do so successfully. The Vatican registers, the most ancient and celebrated series of registers in the Vatican Archives, occur in the guide under the apostolic chancery (pp. 136–43). There is no hint that the Vatican registers are an artificial series containing a mixture of chancery and chamber registers,

although an article by Martino Giusti cited on p. 143 makes precisely this point. No doubt an undertaking as ambitious as the present guide will inevitably display some defects, but the number of errors in the transcription of Latin and Italian texts is alarming.

It is not usual for an archive inventory or guide to be attacked by the head of the archive that it concerns. Yet this happened in the case of the present volume, when it was reviewed by Sergio Pagano, Prefect of the Vatican Archives. This is not the place to review Pagano's review. Those wishing to read it have the choice of the full fury of the Italian version or the relative brevity and restraint of the French (*Archivum Historiae Pontificiae* xxxvii [1999], 191–201; *Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique* xciv [1999], 515–21).

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY LIBRARY

P. N. R. ZUTSHI

The age of Robert Guiscard. Southern Italy and the Norman conquest. By G. A. Loud. (The Medieval World.) Pp. xii + 329 incl. 8 genealogical tables and 5 maps. Harlow: Pearson Education, 2000. £18.99 (paper). 0 582 04528 2; 0 582 04529 0

JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902454796

Loud's mastery of the manuscript and printed sources for medieval south Italy and the relevant scholarly literature has been evident in the many learned articles he has published over the years. Now his book provides a comprehensive account of how the Normans established themselves there, identifying the different Norman families involved, distinguishing the various regions and tracing the sequence of events; conflicting authorities are reconciled where possible; exaggerated claims rejected; explanations offered in terms of the practical options available. The Normans in the south were always too few to achieve results rapidly, but their perseverance over many decades was rewarded. Even at the time some writers were sufficiently awe-struck to seek explanations for their success, particularly in the personal achievements of the Hautevilles, Guiscard and his brothers. The title of Loud's book reflects this still influential historiographical tradition. Modern explanations in political terms, which regard the Norman conquests as stages in the creation of the Norman kingdom, have also left their mark: Loud assumes that Guiscard claimed, and hoped to exercise, 'authority'. His leverage over other Normans was, however, not so much his 'rights' as duke of Apulia but his reputation for launching successful raids or conquests for the capture of booty or property. Whenever 'lordships' acquired any territorial coherence, their lords took more care in building up their own interests than in advancing Guiscard's. It was not in the nature of Norman enterprises to rebuild authority; everywhere they dismembered it for their own purposes; they were fighting-men, not statesmen. In the eleventh century soldierly exploits were inevitably written up in time-honoured heroic mode. Historians no longer impressed by mere valour in battle, need to propose what alternative military advantages so few Normans could have enjoyed. Were their unconventional banditry tactics from mountain strongholds difficult for the mainly maritime authorities of south Italy to combat? Did Normans, as aliens, simply have fewer scruples about holding a prosperous society to ransom? Norman motivation

remains obscure. Willingness to give favoured clergy a share of the loot may be evidence for religious instincts, or could be another sign of their willingness in buying off clerical criticism. Loud has a soft spot for the clergy. Papal willingness to take advantage of any Norman tractability is condoned as a realistic means of achieving reformist goals, though the success of reform remained dependent on Norman good-will. The fact is that by the 1080s the papacy, after stirring up strife in the north, had become abjectly dependent on the Normans to provide for its own security. The questions prompted by this book only serve to show how firm a foundation it provides for further reflection on the momentous changes the Normans had brought about.

READING

D. J. A. MATTHEW

Henry I. By C. Warren Hollister, edited and completed by Amanda Clark Frost. (Yale English Monarchs.) Pp. xx+554 incl. map+21 plates. New Haven–London: Yale University Press, 2001. £25. 0 300 08858 2
JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902464792

Historians will welcome the appearance of this book, which has survived as many crises as did Henry I in the early years of his adulthood; the entire first draft was destroyed in a fire, and its author died before the reconstituted version could be completed. As the editor's preface explains, Hollister's death left a chapter on 'Law and governance' incomplete, and those on 'King and Church' and 'Final years and conclusion' still being researched. The editor, a former student of Hollister's, completed these chapters, in part from his published work, in part from his notes. Eight of the eleven chapters provide a detailed, thoughtful, and thought-provoking narrative of Henry I's life and its circumstances. The other four chapters deal with 'Setting and sources', 'King and magnates', 'Law and governance', and 'King and Church'. Perhaps because of the book's history, the thematic chapters are sometimes rather thin. Questions of aristocratic land-holding, as discussed notably by Sir James Holt, might have further influenced the discussion of 'King and magnates'. The role of Roger, bishop of Salisbury, within the development of royal administration merits deeper analysis. Court life and culture, admittedly rather poorly covered in the sources, deserve more discussion: how far was there really a different tone from the chivalric court of William Rufus, and what was the relationship of the court's culture to politics and administration? The great virtue of the book is its incorporation of different strands of events within one narrative and its discussions of personal politics based on great knowledge and long thought; one notable example is the account of events in Normandy during the period 1087–1100. Likewise, the relationship of Henry with Anselm, archbishop of Canterbury, is integrated within the rest of the narrative, rather than being just considered in the chapter on 'King and Church.' The result is that the reader senses the way in which the king's attentions had to switch from one issue to another as events dictated. However, there are also disadvantages with the approach. Once Robert Curthose's invasion had been stalled, church affairs seem to dominate the early years of the reign, but this may in part result from the availability of Eadmer's account, rather than their absolute importance to the king. More generally – as in some other equally

valuable works in this excellent series – the combination of narrative history of a reign, thematic analysis of developments during a reign and personal biography of a king, do not always coexist successfully within a single book. Nevertheless, this volume will be an immense help to all those interested in the reign of Henry I. Warren Hollister would be immensely pleased that his *magnum opus* will be a stimulus, not a deterrent, to further study of his subject.

UNIVERSITY OF ST ANDREWS

JOHN HUDSON

I documenti dell'archivio capitolare di Vicenza (1083–1259). Edited by Franco Scarmoncin with an introduction by Francesca Lomastro and Gian Maria Varanini. (Fonti per la Storia della Terraferma Veneta, 15.) Pp. xlviii + 386 + 8 plates. Rome: Viella, 1999. 88 85669 87 5
JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902474799

The fifteenth volume in the campaign to publish sources from the Veneto region, Scarmoncin's edition contains eighty-nine documents from the cathedral archive at Vicenza. The majority are thirteenth-century and most are unpublished, if one discounts a thesis of 1984 by A. Tasca, which included an appendix of eighty-two documents from the period 1000–1250; why this did not form the basis of an edition, given that the thesis was directed by Giorgio Cracco, editor of the current publication campaign and of the *Storia di Vicenza*, is not stated. About two-thirds of the items are original documents but, as Lomastro and Varanini point out in their useful introduction to the archive, many of the copies published here were made within a very few years of the originals. They link the relative paucity of early charters (in comparison with other centres such as Treviso and Trento) to the impact of political change at Vicenza in 1259, the end of the domination of Ezzelino da Romano III, and the impetus this gave the canons to ensure that their rights and benefits were properly recorded. The campaign of copying in the late thirteenth century seems to have had as its corollary the neglect and loss of older or superseded documents (referred to explicitly in document 16). Even so, the collection shows little coherence, apart from its clusters of leases by the chapter and groups of documents from the Breganze and Pimentario families, which hit financial difficulties on a major scale in the mid-thirteenth century and lost their property to the commune. A subsequent dispute between the commune and the chapter, decided in the latter's favour, ensured that lands and documents came to the newly-formed archive. The charters offer more than simply a fragmented history of the chapter's landed activities, however. Apart from an unusual list of leases (document 80), Vicenza's lively economy is hinted at by the notarial formula of 'rustico vel negotiatori' to describe prospective tenants. Women's activities (directly or through agents) are recorded more frequently than might have been expected. Their voices also feature in the testimonies recorded in 1224 (document 34) to the miracles of the murdered bishop, Giovanni Cacciafronte (killed in 1185). A grant to the University of Vicenza in 1205 (document 19), and the recurring appearance of one Thomas de Maxon, 'doctor of laws', attest to the city's intellectual life. The frequency of debt, on the part of the bishop, the chapter (which even resorted to pawning its books – document 29) and the Breganze and Pimentario families (which sold out mainly

to Ezzelino), is evidence at least of a relatively sophisticated system of credit. Document 30 vividly records a continuing debt and mounting interest. One small criticism: the introduction might have done more to contextualise the cathedral archive against other surviving Vicentine evidence. Other than that, this is a fine edition with much of interest to ecclesiastical, social and economic historians.

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHAMPTON

PATRICIA SKINNER

Les Légendes de l'Hôpital de Saint-Jean de Jérusalem. By Antoine Calvet. (Centre d'Enseignement de Recherche d'Oc, 11.) Pp. 172. Paris: Presses de l'Université de Paris Sorbonne, 2000. Fr. 119. 2 84050 131 7; 0756 7847 *JEH* (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S022046902484795

Very early in its history the Order of the Hospital of St John of Jerusalem began to elaborate legends about its past, dating its origins to well before Christ and siting events in the Gospels within the Hospital buildings. Several versions were in existence and in some instances a miracle performed at the time of the First Crusade by the first master, Gerard, was added to the accounts. Various explanations for the emergence of these myths have been suggested including a desire to glide over the Hospital's original dependence on the Benedictine abbey of St Mary of the Latins and rivalry with other institutions in Jerusalem, particularly the Temple. But the fact is that any institution in Jerusalem would have been tempted to create a biblical history for itself, especially one which, like the Hospital, knew that there had been other well-known hospitals preceding it in the holy city. The variants are extremely interesting and in spite of the fact that within the order there was another theme – dismissive of the legends and believing in an eleventh-century foundation – they lasted a very long time. Antoine Calvet presents here a full study of the versions, edits fourteenth-century forms – in Occitan, French and Latin – and includes treatments of the manuscript traditions and the language. This is a welcome addition to the growing literature on the medieval Hospital.

EMMANUEL COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

JONATHAN RILEY-SMITH

The leper king and his heirs. Baldwin IV and the crusader kingdom of Jerusalem. By Bernard Hamilton. Pp. xxv + 288 incl. frontispiece and 10 ills. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000. £37.50. 0 521 64187 X *JEH* (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902494791

This long-awaited book covers the history of the Latin East in the crucial decades leading to the fall of Jerusalem to the forces of Saladin in 1187. At the heart of this period lies the reign of Baldwin IV (1174–85). He came to the throne as a minor and, afflicted by a particularly horrific form of leprosy, presided over a period of extraordinary political turbulence as factions within the nobility of Jerusalem sought to establish their claims to the regency and the anticipated succession. Previous historians have tended to see Baldwin as a hapless figure – a prevaricator, carried along by events and manipulated by those around him. This work does much to redress that picture and reveals a far more assertive and dynamic ruler. The author makes plain his admiration for the young king – as an

individual battling with a chronic illness; as a war leader present at military engagements; and as a political leader trying to hold firm over his divided lands and facing an increasingly powerful opponent. Hamilton is careful to place these events in a full contextual framework of source material and the structure and international status of the kingdom of Jerusalem; students in particular will find this scene-setting most valuable. The author then takes us through a familiar and complex narrative in a clear and authoritative manner. He is also concerned to keep events in the Muslim world well to the fore, a topic which forms an essential, if sometimes underplayed, part of the story as well. Hamilton highlights Baldwin's readiness to step aside for potential regents and successors in 1177 and 1180 only for fate to prevent these plans bearing fruit. Two of the key figures in his reign were Count Raymond III of Tripoli and Reynald of Châillon, prince of Antioch, and this book presents us with original and persuasive interpretations of their policies and actions. Baldwin himself is not above criticism; Hamilton rightly judges his encouragement of the marriage of Guy of Lusignan and Sibylla, heiress to the throne, as deeply flawed, although it is not until the epilogue that he spells out this verdict so plainly. The book also contains an important appendix. Dr Piers Mitchell, an expert in the history of medicine, has provided a useful, if sobering, piece on the different forms of leprosy, the development of the illness in Baldwin IV and the treatment of the disease in the crusader states. In sum, Hamilton's evaluation of Baldwin is convincing and compelling. While some in western Europe viewed the condition of the crippled king as a divine judgement on the sins of his people, Hamilton shows how Baldwin commanded the respect of his Muslim opponents and his fellow Christians alike, and demonstrates how the king devoted all his failing energies to successfully preserving the frontiers of his kingdom. It would take further misfortune and military misjudgements on the part of the Franks before Saladin could topple the settlers, although by that stage, of course, Baldwin had finally found the peace he so deserved.

ROYAL HOLLOWAY COLLEGE,
LONDON

JONATHAN PHILLIPS

An ungodly war. The sack of Constantinople and the Fourth Crusade. By W. B. Bartlett.

Pp. xviii + 229 + 13 plates. Stroud: Sutton Publishing, 2000. £20. 0 7509

2378 4

JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902504796

The endless fascination of the Fourth Crusade has produced another man's telling of the story, twenty years after John Godfrey's *1204: the unholy crusade*. Bartlett's account was written 'to explain how and why the events of 1204 took place'. He does not give credence to the 'conspiracy theory' but rather sees the crusade as the culmination of deteriorating relations between east and west. Like most who have written about this crusade, Bartlett knows the west better than the east but he also writes with sympathy for the east, saying that in 1204 'the classical world finally passed from reality to history'.

The broad sweep is this author's delight. He writes with confidence and enthusiasm, neither dismayed nor disturbed that so many have gone before him. He takes pleasure in descriptions of battles and characterisations of people. The

book appears to be for a general audience although, unlike Godfrey, Bartlett does not make any statement to this effect. He provides few notes and these are of a very general and discursive nature. His bibliography gives mixed signals. Villehardouin is not cited in the Penguin classic but in an older and far less accessible translation. Likewise surprising is the reference to Nicetas Choniates's *History* in the Greek edition rather than the English translation by H. Magoulias, *O city of Byzantium: annals of Niketas Choniates* (1984). For Byzantium one misses the reference to M. Angold, *The Byzantine empire, 1025–1204: a political history* (1997). If the book is aimed at the 'general reader' this is not a bibliography for such an audience.

CENTRE FOR BYZANTINE, OTTOMAN AND
MODERN GREEK STUDIES,
UNIVERSITY OF BIRMINGHAM

R. MACRIDES

A history of Franciscan education (c. 1210–1517). By Bert Roest. (Education and Society in the Middle Ages and Renaissance, 11.) Pp. x+406. Leiden–Boston–Cologne: Brill, 2000. Dfl 196. 90 04 11739 3; 0926 6070
JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902514792

Pastoral expectations in the expanding urban centres and the menace of heresy in northern Italy and southern France persuaded the followers of St Francis of Assisi to embrace theological study as a preparation for their ministry of preaching and hearing confessions. In 1228 representations were made to John Parenti, minister-general, to provide a lector in theology at Magdeburg. John prevailed upon Simon, an English friar, to swap the office of minister-provincial of Germany for that of lector. Successive ministers-general continued to take a keen interest in the provision of lectors for the growing number of schools in the fraternity. They were following the example of their canonised founder who had invited St Anthony of Padua to teach theology to the friars in the university city of Bologna late in 1223 or early in 1224. By the middle of the thirteenth century the friars were among the major theologians in the west and theological schools were attached to friaries in all the cities and large towns. Bert Roest's monograph examines this phenomenon, offers an outline of education among the friars from the thirteenth to the sixteenth century and identifies areas where further research is required. His book contains seven chapters which address the schools, their personnel and their programmes, the arrangement of the courses, the theological studies of the friars of the Observance, the changing perspectives of scholastic formation, libraries, the broader context of the friars' studies and preaching. The volume is enriched by the impressive bibliography of some 60 pages. This is the first major work in English to explore the history of the movement and its extensive network of schools and the author makes excellent use of the general and provincial constitutions of the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries. A wealth of detail is supplied by Roest, who has carefully analysed the primary sources and assembled an impressive array of evidence from a large number of secondary sources. The first chapter introduces the reader to life in the *studia generalia*, the custodial schools and the local schools, which were attached to the majority of friaries and furnishes information on the duties and responsibilities of both lectors and their students. The chapter on the Observants

shows that their leaders were men who had been exposed to life in the new universities and they, too, encouraged the investment in schools and libraries as a necessary resource for the friars' ministry. The subject of the last chapter provides the rationale and the context for the entire scholastic enterprise among the friars – preparation for the office of preaching. More careful work by the editors and proof-readers would have saved the author from errors such as Sanwyz for Sandwich (p. 12), Lombardian for Lombard (p. 16) and Albany for Albano (p. 102 n. 344), Rudolf of Corbrigge for Ralph of Corbridge (p. 22 n. 74) and John Woodford for William (p. 61). The prologue to St Bonaventure's *Breviloquium* explains that he was responding to requests for assistance rather than Roest's 'allegedly at the request' (p. 126). The author presumably means 'rapport' rather than 'reports' (p. 148 n.129), 'exhortation' rather than 'adhortation' (pp. 162, 234) and 'led' rather than 'lead' (pp. 188, 189). These blemishes should not detract from Roest's fine achievement in providing a sure foundation for all those who wish to increase their knowledge of diverse aspects of the arrangement of the Franciscan schools in the Middle Ages.

ST EDMUND'S COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

MICHAEL ROBSON

Les Sermons et la visite pastorale de Federico Visconti archevêque de Pise (1253–1277).

Edited by Nicole Bériou and Isabelle Le Masne de Chermont (with Pascale Bourgain and Marine Innocenti, foreword André Vauchez and Emilio Cristiani). (Sources et documents d'histoire du moyen âge, 3.) Pp. xi + 1185 + 20 plates. Paris: École française de Rome, 2001. 2 7283 0548 X; 0223 5099

JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902524799

The sermons of the thirteenth-century bishop Federico Visconti of Pisa, preserved in Florence (Biblioteca Medicea-Laurenziana, ms Plut. XXXIII, sin. 1) are already well known to historians of medieval Italy as a priceless source for religious and cultural history. Bishop Federico is perhaps most notorious for his remark in one of these sermons that St Francis of Assisi was a suitable patron for merchants because of his origin in a mercantile family. For the richness of their local colour and interest these sermons can only be compared to the Register of Eudes Rigaud of Rouen, which has long been available in a scholarly edition and English translation. Like Eudes, to whom he has been often compared, Federico Visconti combined pastoral zeal with a sensitivity to popular religious movements and piety. This edition of his 106 sermons, including those preached during his 1263 pastoral visit to Sardinia and an edition of his synodal statutes of 1258 is certainly welcome. The product of a team of renowned French and Italian scholars, this weighty volume not only includes a painstaking edition of the manuscript but also a fine 'introduction historique' by Nicole Bériou, which, an admirable book in itself, consists of an extended study of Bishop Federico and his preaching. Appended to the edition is a glossary, compiled by Pascale Bourgain and Marina Soriani Innocenti, of interesting and rare Latin words found in the sermons. This will prove useful not only to readers of this volume but to those studying other Latin texts from contemporary Italy. My sampling of the sermons indicates that the edition is carefully and precisely prepared, something which

does not always seem to be the case with the prefatory material which is marred by occasional typographical errors. The first of these ('Lauzenziana' for 'Laurenziana') appears in the second paragraph of André Vauchez's preface. Nevertheless, the École française is to be commended for making this rich volume available to the scholarly public. Readers in Britain and America can only hope that an English translation will not be long in appearing.

UNIVERSITY OF VIRGINIA

AUGUSTINE THOMPSON OP

How to recover the Holy Land. The crusade proposals of the late thirteenth and early fourteenth centuries. By Antony Leopold. Pp. x + 231. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2000. £45. 0 7546 0120 X

JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902534795

This book, a revised version of a PhD thesis, aims to be a comprehensive study of crusade proposals written between 1290 and 1336. The first chapter attempts to reassess the motives of the authors of these proposals and to profile them individually in order to explain the origins and purpose of their recovery treatises. The second chapter assesses their treatment of preparations for the crusade, such as the pacification of Europe, recruitment, leadership and finance. The third explores treatment of spiritual issues such as conversion and the crusaders' motives, while chapters iv and v aim at tracing the development of the strategic advice of the treatises and their impact on each other as well as on the crusade planned in Europe. Chapter vi covers advice on the establishment of a new kingdom of Jerusalem, and chapter vii deals with crusade proposals and crusades after 1336. In the introduction the author states that previous historians of the crusade, like J. Delaville le Roulx, N. Housley, Tyerman and myself, argued that the proposals 'were intended as propaganda only' (pp. 4–5) and that on the whole their importance has been underestimated. In view of the conclusions of such studies as, for example, Housley's 'Pope Clement v and the crusades of 1309–10', *Journal of Medieval History* viii (1982), 2–43, not to speak of other works by the aforementioned scholars, it is rather difficult to agree. On the whole, Leopold's well-documented research supports the conventional picture of the importance of the crusade plans of the thirteenth and fourteenth century. In the author's words: 'the impact of the proposals on European crusade plans was minimal, and was limited to advice given on strategy' (p. 206).

UNIVERSITY OF HAIFA

SYLVIA SCHEIN

De la dramatización de los acontecimientos de la pascua a la cristología. El cuarto libro del Arbor vitae crucifixae Iesu de Ubertino de Casale. By Carlos Mateo Martínez Ruíz. (Studia Antoniana, 41.) Pp. 629. Rome: Pontificium Athenaeum Antonianum, 2000. L.65,000. 88 7257 040 9

JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902544791

Historiographic attention to the life and work of Ubertino of Casale has so far been concentrated on two fields of study: the Joachimist influence in the last book of the *Arbor vitae* as reflective of the Franciscan apocalyptic sense of mission, and Ubertino's participation in the poverty controversy in the early fourteenth

century. Although taking into account both Ubertino's earlier Franciscan influences and his role as leader of the Spiritual faction, it has been Martínez Ruíz's insight to recast the significance of Ubertino's main work by drawing attention to the figure of Christ as the source of inspiration providing unity and coherence to his thought. Based on the recent discovery of two recensions of the *Arbor vitae*, and supported by a wealth of palaeographical, philological and historical material, Martínez Ruíz traces the evolution of Ubertino's thought as he assembles a Christocentric conception of theology. Starting with the narration of the historical events of Easter from Christ's passion, death, resurrection, to the proclamation of the mission of the Spirit and the Assumption of Mary, the *Arbor vitae* traces the *conflictum* and the *regnum* of Christ's salvific mission as fundamentally linked to a fully developed pneumatology and Mariology. Forming part of a theological tradition initiated by Bonaventure and followed by Peter John Olivi, Ubertino's historical mediation on the life of Christ goes beyond a purely eschatological interest and responds to a recovery of the centrality of Christ in the project of Christian spiritual renovation in a way akin to later Pietist movements such as the *Devotio moderna*. Thus, although recognising Ubertino's indebtedness to Franciscan Spiritual historicism, *De la dramatización* is a serious and scholarly attempt to disengage Ubertino's work from reductionist references to the controversial aspects of the Franciscan prophetic tradition. None the less, in this volume Ubertino's life and work acquire new value as illustrative of the evolution of the spiritual identity of his order. In this respect, however, Martínez Ruíz appears to underplay the role of Conventuals in forging a Franciscan *esprit de corps*, sometimes overlooking the fact that the call for the simplicity of apostolic life formed the heart of a widely accepted Franciscan tradition of both Conventuals and Spirituals. Another weakness in the volume's general view is that it draws an incautious contrast between Franciscan mysticism and Dominican theological practice as restricted to Aristotelian categories and the Lombard's method. By contrast, on various occasions (especially in the fourteenth century) we find Dominicans endorsing what is normally thought of as typical Franciscan conceptions, thus pointing to a sense of solidarity between the mendicant orders which went beyond the common view of the Dominicans as spin doctors of an increasingly centralised papacy. Despite the problematic assumptions, however, Martínez Ruíz's volume offers a welcome new insight into the *novitas* brought by a Franciscan spirituality unsatisfied by the generalised Aristotelianism of the theology of the day.

LINACRE COLLEGE,
OXFORD

I. IRIBARREN

The register of William Bateman, bishop of Norwich, 1344–1355. 2 vols. Edited by Phyllis. E. Pobst. (The Canterbury and York Society, 84, 90.) Pp. xxxiv + 135; viii + 248. Woodbridge: Boydell Press (for The Canterbury and York Society), 1996, 2000. £29.50. £25. 0 907239 54 4; 0 907239 60 9; 0 262 995 X
JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902554798

No-one familiar with the Norwich episcopal registers will have high expectations of them in print. What survives from episcopal administration in East Anglia is

largely a series of institution books, continuous from 1299, but with little else to illustrate the range of episcopal business or ecclesiastical activity in the region. All but perhaps 100 of the 1,900 entries in Bateman's register relate to institutions or collations, and the primary readers of these two volumes will be students of East Anglia, for whom names and places, rather than the unvaried genres of documents or language of texts, provide the main interest. This is recognised by making this edition a calendar, with some illustrative – and a few interesting – full texts in an appendix. Tracing connections between patrons, benefices and clerks is made easy through the extensive indices and cross-references. The highly detailed subject index – fuller even than the normal standard for Canterbury and York volumes – squeezes out of the text such variety of subject matter as can be found. Useful appendices add supplementary information on office-holders, unrecorded institutions and donative benefices not subject to episcopal institution, and also (slightly less reliably) lists of religious houses and hospitals.

Another compensation for the monotony of the text might have been an extensive introduction, but here it is unnecessarily restricted to twenty-four pages. As it stands it is useful and provides food for thought, and the technical account of the manuscripts and scribes is detailed and full; but there was surely more scope for commentary both on Bateman's career and the Black Death, despite the existence of old and not-very-accessible articles on these topics. The figures for numbers of institutions and collations are tabulated, showing them abnormally heavy from May to November 1349, with a significant peak of 222 in July (which with a time-lag might be backdated to May); some of the smaller, and even not-so-small, religious houses which littered the East Anglian landscape ran out of religious. Apart from patiently plugging away at filling numbers of benefices daily throughout this period, Bateman also secured in October a papal licence to dispense sixty under-age clerks to hold benefices and be priests (no. 1296), double the number allowed to other bishops.

This licence, alongside the November 1348 licence to appropriate churches in his diocese to collegiate churches, may illustrate Bateman's ease of access to the papacy as a former auditor at Avignon and frequent ambassador there; in other respects the register is remarkably devoid of evidence of papal activity, and almost completely so of papal provision. It would be interesting to know whether this absence arises from the nature of the record, or was a favour to Bateman, or was a result of the lack of attractive sinecures in a diocese with a monastic cathedral and no large collegiate church, beyond its four archdeaconries. The forty-six rural deaneries, which were, unusually, benefices in the bishop's patronage, were too poor to attract notice. This was also a problem for Bateman, and it may be that his reservation to himself of the nomination to vicarages when appropriating was partly an attempt to increase the resources of episcopal patronage. Appropriations, to which the first section of fifty-seven documents – added later in the century – is largely devoted, in fact provide the most interesting material in the register. The region's many religious houses held perhaps half of the diocese's benefices (figures on this would have been interesting), and although appropriated churches were already fundamental to the endowment of most houses, there was scope for further augmentation of income. In the register eighteen religious houses (not the editor's twenty-one, by my count), four Cambridge colleges and five secular colleges benefited: the latter

reflects a number of such foundations being made in mid fourteenth-century East Anglia (although Rushworth was founded by Edmund Gonville, not John: vol. ii. 26 n. 26). It is tempting to attribute to Bateman considerable foresight on the effects of the plague on monastic incomes in securing his November 1348 papal licence to appropriate; but the temptation can be resisted, because a vicarage assigned in March 1349 had to be adjusted in August 1350, 'because of the difficulty of the times' (nos 14–15). Nevertheless, the citation of poverty was obviously more than formulaic after 1349, as it was more generally in the case of smaller houses and female religious: the destitution of, and moral danger to, the nuns of Carrow was graphically described (no. 17). Underpinning collegiate endowments was therefore one of Bateman's motives, as was the opportunity to reserve the nomination of vicars; but he by no means always did so and his most pressing concern, in the light of his own background and career, was surely to promote learning. Not only were appropriations to Ely and Norwich made specifically to ensure that they sent monks to the university under *summi magistri*, but, more important, ten or twelve East Anglian churches were appropriated to Cambridge colleges, six of them to his own Trinity Hall, whose major endowment they were. Furthermore, other appropriations (to St Benet's Hulme, Binham Priory and Thompson College) were probably executed by Bateman in exchange for grants of advowson by those houses to Trinity Hall. In common with many prelates and most popes, Bateman saw ecclesiastical resources as belonging to the whole body of the Church, and was therefore intent on redistributing them from the local community to promote what he saw as the greater good. There are riches to be found even in apparently dull bishop's registers, and they are well presented here, if more could have been done to mine them.

SOMERVILLE COLLEGE,
OXFORD

BENJAMIN THOMPSON

Medieval children. By Nicholas Orme. Pp. xii + 387 incl. 125 black-and-white and colour ill. New Haven–London: Yale University Press, 2001. £25. 0 300 08541 9

JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902564794

Although this book is the fruit of cosmopolitan enterprise – written in England, typeset in Hong Kong, printed in China, published by Yale – and often illuminated with continental examples, it is primarily a history of children in England in the late Middle Ages. It has all the virtues of Nicholas Orme's well-known studies of schools and education: deep and wide learning, perceptive insight, lucid imagination – and it is very readable. Childhood imposes a special test on a medievalist: what is the author's attitude to the influential doctrines of Philippe Ariès, who argued that medieval children were different creatures from our own, leading very impoverished lives? Professor Orme passes this test admirably: 'there is nothing to be said for Ariès's view of childhood in the middle ages' (p. 9). One could go further, and say that attitudes to children have been infinitely various in every age of recorded history, more various than attitudes over time. The prophet Hosea in the eighth century BC, observing God as a father

coping with a tiresome teenager, made him cry out: 'When Israel was a child, then I loved him, and called my son out of Egypt' – reflecting a tenderness towards a child in memorable contrast to the horrifying story of how Abraham was made to show his obedience to God by preparing to kill his son. Similar contrasts can be found in every age, most obviously in our own. Thus of the children of Orme's book, the author writes, 'I believe them to have been ourselves, five hundred or a thousand years ago' (p. 10). They are viewed under every aspect surviving evidence permits: being born, nurtured, at play, at church (not always a different thing), learning to read, growing up, sick and dying; and one notable virtue of this book is the great range of examples and insights which Orme has found to illuminate every part of a child's life. There is much variety of attitude revealed here – and some movement, indeed, over time – though the concentration of evidence on fourteenth, fifteenth and early sixteenth-century English children means that material from other parts of the British Isles and the continent, and from earlier periods, has a somewhat occasional and incidental air. But the book as a whole is a closely woven tapestry full of fascinating detail, a masterly survey of a fundamental theme in medieval social history. The nature of the evidence deployed in this book and many of its themes make it essential reading for all who wish to appraise the problems raised by Ariès and his followers – and by those whose work Orme carefully records who have corrected them (p. 5).

GONVILLE AND CAIUS COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

C. N. L. BROOKE

Medieval women. Texts and contexts in late medieval Britain. Essays for Felicity Riddy.

Edited by Jocelyn Wogan-Browne, Rosalynn Voaden, Arlyn Diamond, Ann Hutchison, Carol Meale and Lesley Johnson. (Medieval Women. Texts and Contexts, 3.) Pp. xv + 436 incl. frontispiece and 9 figs. Turnhout: Brepols, 2000. €50. 2 503 50979 7

JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902574790

The range of essays in this volume is itself testimony to the impact its honorand has had on late medieval literature and history, particularly in the field of gender studies. Inevitably the quality of the contributions varies, but one only has to compare even the slightest of them with the crude 'medieval women as victims of patriarchy' trope that used to dominate the field to realise the extent of the historiographical shift, although it is mildly depressing that it is still thought necessary to argue against the assumption that accounts of the sufferings of virgin martyrs were exercises in the titillation of a male audience. Several of the essays have religious writing as their focus. As well as saints' *Lives* (St Margaret and Edith of Wilton), there are studies of *The Book* of Margery Kempe, including discussion by Sarah Rees Jones of the extent to which she is a male construct, and a useful account by Nicholas Watson of *Book to a mother*: an example of pre-Lollard reformism. Less successful is Helen Phillips's account of Marian epithets, which makes heavy weather of the difficulty of 'the satisfactory realistic visualization' of phrases such as 'tabernacle of the Trinity' without apparently

realising that they were rendered with blunt literalness in contemporary art. Pat Callum and Jeremy Goldberg explore how the Bolton Book of Hours might have been used for social as well as religious instruction, and Peter Biller contributes a fascinating investigation of the implications for northern penetration of the Cathar heresy of references to two Englishwomen among the sect's supporters. Diverse as these topics may appear, there are interesting resonances between the various contributions and, for anyone interested in late medieval women, this is a *Festschrift* worth buying rather than merely borrowing for the sake of an article or two.

FITZWILLIAM COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

ROSEMARY HORROX

Preaching peace in Renaissance Italy. Bernardino of Siena and his audience. By Cynthia L. Polecristi. Pp. xii + 273 incl. 2 ills. Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 2000. \$61.95. 0 8132 0960 9
JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S00220469902584797

In this compact but elegantly written book, Cynthia L. Polecristi focuses on the preaching campaign carried out by Bernardino of Siena in 1427. Invited to preach by the city magistrates of Siena, Bernardino's six-week sermon cycle was intended to pacify the factious citizens of his home town. As a native he may well have had an insider's knowledge of Sienese political and social strife to recommend him; none the less, it was on account of his prodigious gifts as peacemaker and preacher that he was summoned on this occasion. His credentials in this area were unparalleled. He had successfully demonstrated his skills as peacemaker a few years earlier in Perugia, and even earlier at Crema, where he reconciled some ninety exiles and their families with their sworn enemies. By the time Bernardino was called upon to preach in Siena he was, in addition, a preacher of notable celebrity whose sermons drew vast numbers of people eager to participate in the carnivalesque atmosphere conjured by his performance pieces – some of which lasted up to three hours – that combined dynamic oratory, home-spun folk tales and old-fashioned moralising with the promise of more spectacular events such as miraculous healings, perhaps a bonfire of the vanities, or the display of the holy *tavoletta*, a panel inscribed with the YHS, the initials of the holy name of Jesus. In the case of Siena in 1427, the spectacle of enemies reconciling through the kiss of peace, thanks to the healing balm of the preacher's persuasive words, may also have served to hasten the crowds into the piazza.

Through a close reading of the preacher's celebrated sermons, preserved for posterity by an industrious cloth-cutter who made *reportationes* – verbatim accounts – of his preaching, Polecristi has attempted to tease out Bernardino's message of reconciliation which argued for an inner personal conversion ('un pace di dentro'), which in turn would facilitate an outer conversion, a peace that would contribute to the *bene comune*. But her enterprise is more ambitious and sophisticated than a mere recounting of the preacher's prescription for peace. The book also endeavours to recreate the preaching event itself. In effect, Polecristi has attempted to rebuild the fifteenth-century theatre of preaching.

The words of the preacher are, of course, here in profusion, but through her efforts now the ambience of the piazza and the jostling crowds made up of men, women, children – ‘people of every condition’ as Bernardino’s *vita* states – have also begun to come into focus. By shifting attention to Bernardino’s audience and their reception of his preaching – much of which can be read out of the sermons themselves – Polecritti has demonstrated the dialogic nature of the texts. Embedded in them we find not only the preacher’s words, but the audience’s response to those words and, in dialogical exchange, the preacher’s response to his audience. Thus, on one occasion when Bernardino began to preach against sodomy, he wounded the sensibilities of a number of women in his audience by speaking out bluntly on sexual subjects in the presence of their daughters. Their response was to storm out of the piazza in protest, leaving the desperate preacher to implore them from the pulpit: ‘Don’t go, don’t leave; wait, so that you perhaps hear things that you haven’t ever heard!’ Polecritti’s deep knowledge of Renaissance culture aids her in reconstructing the Tuscan audience’s horizon of expectation that inevitably structured how Bernardino crafted his sermons and how his listeners received them. Her thorough grounding in the literature of cultural anthropology, particularly the scholarship on honour, shame and vendetta helps to set the notional stage of factionalism and civil strife. However, what this study does not supply is the very particular fifteenth-century Siense context of rivalry and faction, leaving many unanswered questions on the subject. Who were the individuals and families involved? What events had sullied family honour and brought about vendetta? How did the injured parties make peace after Bernardino’s admonishments and supplications had smoothed the way? What were the conditions of that peace? Unfortunately, the contents of Bernardino’s sermons leave us no clue; he is content to speak vaguely of Guelf and Ghibelline tensions, which tell us nothing at all about the actual socio-political reality of 1427. Indeed, it is as if these were model sermons, or generic exhortations on peace, rather than a series of sermons tailored to a particularly fractious Siense audience. One of the primary limitations of sermons, in this case, is that they do not provide the evidence of actual peacemakings, which would have been the goal and crowning achievement of Bernardino’s six weeks in the pulpit. Although sermons can conjure up a lost world, it is a moral rather than a social world that they depict, as they purposely eschew historical detail in favour of moral guidance. To penetrate the social world, one must move outside the homiletic texts and into the archives. An examination of private peace contracts drawn up by notaries and magistrates would uncover the sources of tension in fifteenth-century Siena. In addition they would have the merit of revealing the identities of the parties making peace and the legal and financial provisions of that peace. In other words, these contracts would demonstrate detailed audience response to Bernardino’s preaching more completely than the vagaries of the local chroniclers, or Bernardino’s hagiographer, who were content to report merely that peace was made in the wake of his pacification campaign. In a recent essay, ‘Per una inchiesta sulle *paci private* alla fine del medio evo’ (*Studi sull’Umbria medievale et umanistica in ricordo di Olga Marinella, Pier Lorenzo Meloni, Ugolino Nicolini* [2000]), Mario Sensi has remarked on the increase in private peace contracts – *instrumenta concordiae* – in fifteenth-century Italy. An

analysis of those drawn up in Siena in late 1427 would make a fitting epilogue for this fine book.

CATHOLIC UNIVERSITY OF AMERICA

KATHERINE L. JANSEN

The Paston family in the fifteenth century endings. By Colin Richmond. Pp. x + 262 pp. Manchester–New York: Manchester University Press, 2000. £45. 0 7190 59909

JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902594793

This is the third and last volume of Colin Richmond's essays in Paston history. The word 'essay' is used advisedly because this is in no sense a systematic study of the Pastons, their times and their letters, and this volume, which in part goes back over previous ground, is even more diffuse than its predecessors. When commenting on Colin Richmond's work one can only quote Abraham Lincoln (something of which Professor Richmond, an assiduous dropper of relevant and irrelevant quotes, should approve): 'People who like this sort of thing will find this the sort of thing they like.' Readers will have to form their own opinions about the Richmond method: the meandering, allusive, self-indulgent style; the weakness for references to quotations and historical events which bear minimal relationship to the period and matter at hand; the long and wandering footnotes; the absolute refusal to engage with historiographies, sometimes very large and distinguished historiographies, which take a different line from his own; the chiding of historians for thinking they can understand people in the past combined with his own absolute certainty that he does understand them while exhibiting almost unrelieved contempt for them. If this reviewer finds all this more irritating than illuminating, others may not agree and may find Richmond a readable and stimulating introduction to the world of the Pastons. It must also be said that there are times when, as long as he can resist his obsession with the unredeemability of almost all late medieval English landowners, Richmond's preference for the novelist's fancy over the historian's rigour can produce moments of imaginative insight. Readers of this journal will naturally be most interested in what Richmond has to say on the subject of the Pastons' piety. Here the main focus is the redoubtable Margaret, who receives a pen-portrait in which religion plays a fairly large part. In many ways it is an affectionate and (leaving aside the improbable comparison with Rosa Luxemburg) convincing picture, notably in his handling of her religion, where he offers an authentic depiction of the part played by religion and religious belief in the lives of the late medieval gentry, especially of pious widows like Margaret. He refers to her 'respectability of life and religion', tying the two together as they would have been conjoined for Margaret, or, in the same vein, 'Margaret ... took death as naturally as she took her Christian faith'. The latter is an example of how Richmond's novelistic style can add real force to his depiction of past lives. But, even in this chapter, perhaps the best in the book, he cannot resist anachronistic side-swipes at Margaret's religion: for Richmond, who clearly thinks that religion has to be 'enthusiastic' to be worthy of the name, intertwining it with life is unacceptable and incomprehensible; he expects more from our ancestors. Thus, Margaret's spirituality and that of the gentry in general is termed 'socially-driven, at the

beck and call of politeness', 'middlebrow' and, in an excess of anachronism, 'One is tempted to say, how Anglican'. Moreover, in this last sentence he exhibits his habitual refusal to engage with historians who disagree with him. The late medieval divergence between gentry and popular religion, the respectability of the former being 'what made the English Reformation', is an old Richmond theme. Here he reiterates it while completely ignoring the great mass of recent work, crowned of course by Eamon Duffy's, which rejects both the notion of a gulf between the landed classes' belief and that of the general population and the view that spirituality in pre-Reformation England was, at any social level, merely a matter of form and politeness. There are arguments which can be made against this 'catholic' revisionism but simply ignoring it will not do. So, this book is for 'people who like this sort of thing'; others may feel that, despite the good things in these three volumes, a wonderful opportunity, using a most extraordinary source, has been missed.

NEW HALL,
CAMBRIDGE

CHRISTINE CARPENTER

Ad fontes Lutheri. Toward the recovery of the real Luther. Essays in honor of Kenneth Hagen's sixty-fifth birthday. Edited by Timothy Maschke, Franz Posset and Joan Skocir. (Marquette Studies in Theology, 28.) Pp. xii + 332 incl. frontispiece and 12 ills. Milwaukee: Marquette University Press, 2001. \$30 (paper). 0 87462 677 3

Der befreite Mensch. Die Willenslehre in der Theologie Philipp Melancthons. By Wolfgang Matz. (Forschungen zur Kirchen- und Dogmengeschichte, 81.) Pp. 280. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 2001. DM 98. 3 525 55189 4

JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902604798

The figure of Heiko Augustinus Oberman, dean of sixteenth-century studies until his death in Arizona last year, continues to cast an imposing shadow across the landscape of Reformation research. In quite different ways, these two books give testimony to his lasting influence over the intellectual history of early modern Europe. The one is a *Festschrift* for one of his early students at Harvard, Kenneth Hagen. The other is a doctoral dissertation under Karl Heinz zur Mühlen, who worked with Oberman in the 1970s and '80s at the Institut für Spätmittelalter und Reformation at the University of Tübingen before becoming Professor of Church History in Bonn.

The strength of Matz's examination of Philip Melancthon's doctrine of the human will lies in his dependence on Oberman and zur Mühlen and on their finely tuned ears for late medieval strains in Reformation thought. Of the many works in Melancthon studies dealing with his 1521 textbook on evangelical theology, the *Loci communes theologici*, few venture as far as Matz's in nailing down specific influences (positive and negative) of Thomas Aquinas and Gabriel Biel.

Unfortunately, this important contribution does not outweigh some of the work's serious weaknesses. Matz is completely unaware of a number of important resources in English on Melancthon, including the seminal work of Peter Fraenkel on Melancthon's hermeneutics, this reviewer's work on the debate

between Erasmus and Melanchthon on free will – the specific theme of Matz's dissertation – and the work of Sachiko Kusukawa at Cambridge. He also seems rather insensitive to the massive contributions of Heinz Scheible, the foremost Melanchthon scholar in the world today and editor of Melanchthon's correspondence, and of Rolf Schäfer. A deeper acquaintance with these scholars could have weaned Matz away from dependence on older research, especially inaccuracies in the work of Wilhelm Maurer.

Even more disappointing is Matz's failure to place Melanchthon's writings consistently within their historical contexts. To be sure, he examines closely changes in the early editions of the *Loci communes* from 1521 and 1522. However, he ignores completely Melanchthon's 1528 rewriting of his 1527 commentary on Colossians – changes that added 50 per cent more text to the book and answered even more directly Erasmus' charges against Wittenberg's theologians regarding free will.

Despite these problems, Matz does demonstrate that Melanchthon's thought arose from his deep commitment to evangelical theology, not Aristotelian philosophy. He avoids that favourite mistake of earlier historians of dogma, who used Luther as the criterion by which to measure Melanchthon's Lutheranism. Instead, as in the work of Kusukawa, Matz portrays Melanchthon as an independent thinker who, by distinguishing freedom in the human sphere from lack of freedom before God, argued that the Holy Spirit had liberated (German: *befreit*) human beings through God's Word alone. Matz also proves that Aristotelian notions of causation, which mark Melanchthon's later discussions of the will's freedom and caused heated debates among Lutherans after his death, functioned pedagogically, not metaphysically in the reformer's thought.

The Hagen *Festschrift* provides some unexpected bonuses for scholars used to the unevenness that such collections often produce. For one thing, Heiko Oberman himself contributed a fascinating analysis of Martin Luther's 1521 attack on monasticism, *De votis monasticis iudicium*, demonstrating again Luther's ambiguous assessment of that institution and the role his apocalyptic expectations played in his theology. For another, by far the best contributions reflect Hagen's (and Oberman's) abiding respect for understanding historical texts and persons in their (late medieval, Renaissance) contexts.

In this regard, the following essays are especially noteworthy. Gottfried Krodel provides a word-by-word analysis of Luther's explanation of the second article of the Apostles' Creed in the reformer's *Small catechism* and in the process demonstrates Luther's enormous rhetorical skills. Helmar Junghans contributes a handy overview of the life of Martin's spouse, Katharina, the five-hundredth anniversary of whose birth was celebrated in 1999. David Steinmetz includes brief reflections, based upon his work on von Staupitz, on the historiographical problems of discovering 'forerunners' to the Reformation. George Tavard, the Roman Catholic scholar, examines the rich medieval Marian piety evident in Luther's 1522 commentary on the Magnificat. Like Oberman's essay (and much of Hagen's work), the reader again learns of the rich medieval spiritual heritage that Luther passed on to his contemporaries. In much the same vein, Franz Posset, in a wide-ranging paper, examines the early Reformation debate over Matthew xvi.18 ('You are Peter') and treats the reader to a little-known exchange between Luther and an early Hebraist, Caspar Amman. Amman,

virtually unknown today but a well-respected Hebrew scholar in his own time, dismissed some of Luther's ultramontane opponents while providing correction, based on a Hebrew reconstruction of Matthew, for Luther's (now widely accepted) rendering of the text. The author even appends to his essay an English translation of Amman's letter to Luther on the subject.

An added bonus is Patrick Carey's careful analysis of pre-Vatican II American Roman Catholic views of Martin Luther. This piece is a particularly fitting tribute to Hagen, who spent his career as a Lutheran professor of the Reformation at the Roman Catholic Marquette University, and to George Tavard, whose work on Luther augured a new, ecumenical appreciation for the reformer. Several essays examine Hagen's life-long passion: Luther's understanding of the Bible. This includes one by Timothy Maschke on Luther's hermeneutical perspective of 'contemporaneity', a term indicating how seamlessly Luther moves from scriptural text to application in his day. James Kieker compares Luther's approach to the Song of Songs, to the *Glossa ordinaria* and Nicholas of Lyra. Gordon Isaac also looks at changes in the understanding of Luther as biblical expositor, providing some hefty criticism for Gerhard Ebeling and others in the early Luther renaissance who downplayed Luther's use of allegory. Ulrich Asendorf's more theological piece on the role of Scripture and the Holy Spirit in Luther is marred by poor translation into English.

Nils Bloch-Hoell examines some aspects of Luther's role in Norwegian Lutheranism – a tip of the hat to Hagen's own heritage. Burnell Eckardt argues for the convergence of Luther and Anselm's understanding of the atonement. Finally, Joan Skocir, one of Hagen's many doctoral students, furnishes an overview of Hagen's own approach to Luther studies. Hagen fruitfully bypassed the Weimar edition of Luther's works to rediscover the 'doctor of the sacred page' and his (monastic) love for Scripture. The entire book is a fitting tribute to Hagen and his teacher, Heiko Oberman.

THE LUTHERAN THEOLOGICAL
SEMINARY AT PHILADELPHIA

TIMOTHY WENGERT

The medical history of the Reformers. By John Wilkinson (foreword David F. Wright).

Pp. viii + 120 incl. 3 figs. Edinburgh: Handsel Press, 2001. £9.95 (paper).

1 871828 60 0

JEH (53) 2001; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902614794

Here is an engagingly unusual perspective on Martin Luther, John Calvin and John Knox. The author, a senior fellow of the Royal College of Physicians of Edinburgh, brings his professional skill to examine a trio whose deaths require more expert diagnosis than for instance those of Zwingli, Hubmaier or Cranmer. He has read diligently and effectively in relevant primary and secondary literature. All three Reformers had bad experiences with the stone (urinary calculi); as readers of Pepys will remember, this was one of the more common and dreaded trials of pre-anaesthetic humanity, but could be survived. Unsurprisingly we have more useful information on the relentlessly self-revelatory Luther than on taciturn Calvin or that master of self-presentation, Knox. The contrast between the austere friar of the first portraits and the married Reformer who

inspired the proverb 'as fat as Martin Luther' reveals much: the result of Katie's catering and of the convivial atmosphere which produced the Table Talk. Wilkinson might have noticed Luther's remedy for keeping away the Devil (otherwise named clinical depression): drink some wine, then drink some more wine. Devotees of John Osborne's *Luther* ought to note that the Reformer's celebrated constipation started no earlier than his prolonged inactivity in the Wartburg in 1521 and was not acute thereafter. His stones came from gout, and heart problems seem to have finished him off. Calvin was more delicate from his youth, and conviviality was not among his temptations (although one is relieved to note that he enjoyed shove ha'penny). Tuberculosis is the most likely cause of his death, and it is impressive that he could surmount this terrible scourge to create the last version of the *Institutes*. The limited information on John Knox suggests the dire effect on a tough constitution of his years in the French galleys after the fall of St Andrews Castle. As the Reformation equivalent of a concentration camp survivor, he was robust indeed to survive that trauma and to project his nervous energy into his late fifties, finally dying in the aftermath of a stroke. No man is a hero to his valet, and so these three Reformers should be relieved to find what a positive opinion their GP has formed of them.

ST CROSS COLLEGE,
OXFORD

DIARMAID MACCULLOCH

Mad for God. Bartolomé Sánchez, the secret messiah of Cardenete. By Sara Tilghman Nalle. Pp. x + 228 incl. frontispiece and 12 ills. Charlottesville–London: University Press of Virginia, 2001. \$49.50 (cloth), \$16.95 (paper). 0 8139 2000 0; 0 8139 2001 9

JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902624790

Sara Nalle has done excellent research on the religious sociology of Castile in the sixteenth century, and opts in this book for the type of small monograph pioneered by Ginzburg in his study of the miller Menocchio, and by Richard Kagan in his work on the Madrid seer Lucrecia de León. Her story is that of a fifty-year-old wool carder, Bartolomé Sánchez, brought to trial by the inquisition of Cuenca in the year 1553. Set free after one year, he was re-arrested years later after claiming to be the messiah and the prophet Elijah, claims that the local inquisitors treated as crazy but which inevitably had repercussions. Nalle presents the case explicitly as a simple narrative rather than a learned monograph, but takes care at every stage to give a careful analysis of what was going on. It is a charming, skilfully written account. The case illustrates some of the constants of religion in the European countryside, and raises interesting questions about how a presumably ignorant textile worker was able to argue so intelligently with his cross-examiners. Nalle also treats in detail the question of madness as a dimension of religious enthusiasm. She makes the best that can be made of the material available, but it is a sad fact that so far the inquisition papers in Spain have not produced any exciting cases comparable to that of Menocchio.

HIGHER COUNCIL FOR SCIENTIFIC RESEARCH,
BARCELONA

HENRY KAMEN

Emperor Maximilian II. By Paula Sutter Fichtner. Pp. xii + 344 incl. frontispiece + 12 plates. New Haven–London: Yale University Press, 2001. £25.00 300 08527 3

JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902634797

Maximilian II (1564–76) is among the least known of the long line of Habsburg emperors. The author of this biography regards him as a failure. ‘His challenges were many, his achievements few.’ He failed to reconcile the Catholics and the Protestants in the Holy Roman Empire. His interventions in the Netherlands were ignored by his cousin Philip II. He could never take a strong line against that king because, quite apart from family considerations, he could not afford to antagonise the Spaniards: in view of the scarcity of possible legitimate successors to Philip II, an Austrian succession to the Spanish throne was always a possibility which Maximilian had constantly to keep in mind. His one great campaign against the Turks in Hungary was a failure and he lost the important fortress-town of Sziget. His attempts at improving the quasi-Byzantine administration of his hereditary lands, the Austrian duchies, the kingdom of Bohemia and the Habsburg part of Hungary, never really got off the ground. And yet, can Maximilian really be written off as a failure in the circumstances of the time? His very succession to the imperial crown had been in doubt because his uncle, the Emperor Charles V, really wanted his son, Philip, to succeed him. Maximilian stubbornly held out against such an inter-Habsburg arrangement, much to the satisfaction of the German princes, and he was successful. Maximilian kept Germany at peace on the basis of the Augsburg formula ‘cuius regio eius religio’ and that without recourse to an inquisition. In an age of confessional wars, Germany enjoyed a half century of peace. The final descent into the catastrophe of the Thirty Years’ War was not Maximilian II’s fault. Even in Hungary, bad as the loss of Sziget undoubtedly was, it was no worse than Philip II’s loss of Tunis. If the emperor did not enjoy overwhelming triumphs, such as Philip II’s victory in the battle of Lepanto or his conquest of Portugal, he also never experienced debacles such as Philip’s Armada campaign or his loss of the northern Netherlands. Professor Fichtner’s book, almost in spite of the author’s conclusions, is at least a strong partial justification of Emperor Maximilian II. It is also a very scholarly book which fills a very evident gap in anglophone historiography and it should interest scholars and students beyond the still somewhat shadowy figure of this little-known emperor, for its excellent description of sixteenth-century government and court society.

LONDON

H. G. KOENIGSBERGER

The faith and fortunes of France’s Huguenots, 1600–85. By Philip Benedict. (St Andrews Studies in Reformation History.) Pp. xv + 336 incl. 9 figs, 2 maps and 51 tables. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2001. £52.50. 0 7546 0225 7

JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902644793

Ever since Philip Benedict published his work on *Rouen during the wars of religion* (1981), he has been interested in the fate of the Huguenots between the Edict of Nantes of 1598 and its revocation in 1685. As he rightly suggests, this has been ‘a virtual no-man’s-land for scholars’, yet certain categories of primary sources

are available which throw light on the fluctuating fortunes of the Huguenot minority. They include registers of births, marriages and burials, and probate inventories. Using such sources, Benedict begins this series of ten essays, all but one of which have been or are being published elsewhere, by focusing on the Huguenots of Alençon. He demonstrates that the community shrank in size without losing its socially elitist character (which may derive from the original patronage of the duchess Marguerite de Navarre) while the number of merchants rose dramatically by comparison with the lawyers and *officiers*. Benedict suggests that this process of 'mercantilisation' may be taken as 'a striking example of the Weberian affinity between Calvinism and capitalism' which has not generally been favoured by French historians of Protestantism. He thinks the Weberian explanation of Huguenot economic success requires 'a more thorough hearing than it has so far received'. The survival of a rich hoard of probate inventories in Metz enables Benedict to consider the reading habits and the art collecting of Huguenots in that city. It seems that they read more than their Catholic neighbours. As one would expect, the Bible and psalter loom largest among the books owned by Protestants. Other popular books were Crespin's martyrology, Calvin's commentaries and works by Pierre Du Moulin. A fascinating comparison of the reading habits of English Puritans and French Calvinists prompts Benedict to endorse Elizabeth Labrousse's verdict that the two groups did not live their faith in the same way. He suggests that the minority status of the Huguenots lessened their concern for external signs of salvation. Benedict repeatedly emphasises the religious lessons to be drawn from a statistical analysis of hitherto neglected archive material, but the Metz inventories are an exceptionally rich source.

Benedict's methodology is dependent on the survival of quantifiable sources which can vary significantly from town to town: it is seen at its fruitful best in his lengthy essay on the Huguenot population, which the American Philosophical Society published in 1991. Other essays in the present volume concern Montpellier, Huguenot books of preparation for the lord's supper, Philippe Le Noir de Crevain, a pastor-historian under Louis XIV, and some critical reflexions on religious coexistence in France between 1555 and 1685. Though essentially socio-economic, Benedict's approach is of great value to all historians of French Protestantism, and his publisher deserves praise for bringing together so many well-written and perceptive essays in a single well-produced volume.

UNIVERSITY OF BIRMINGHAM

R. J. KNECHT

The federal theology of Johannes Cocceius (1603–1669). By Willem J. van Asselt. (Studies in the History of Christian Thought, 100.) Pp. xiii + 364. Leiden–Boston–Cologne: Brill, 2001. €77. 90 04 11998 1; 0081 8607 JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S002204690265479x

Scholarship on Cocceius exhibits a variety of interpretations. Following a careful and comprehensive review of earlier research, van Asselt argues that the place and function of the covenant of works is determinative for one's interpretation, as it elicits divergent views of Cocceius' epistemology, doctrine of God and understanding of salvation history. Van Asselt divides the secondary literature into two

categories that differ on the priority they assign to the horizontal and vertical foci of Cocceius' federal theology. The 'evolutionary model' over-estimates redemptive history and underestimates the *ordo salutis*, while the 'synthetic model' overestimates the *ordo salutis* and underestimates redemptive history. But van Asselt argues that Cocceius always simultaneously upholds the horizontal and vertical dimensions by means of his doctrine of the Holy Spirit. 'In sum: pneumatology is the framework for Cocceius' salvation-historical reflections. Typology introduces the basic (cumulative) structure of salvation history, while the abrogations [of the covenant of works] provide concrete historical content to this basic structure.' Although van Asselt does not aim at a general characterisation of Cocceius' thought, in resolving the interpretative issues (by delineating Cocceian epistemology, theology proper and notion of salvation history) his pneumatological model of interpretation provides a firm foundation for an overall understanding of Cocceius' theology. This study is likely to establish itself as a standard work on Cocceius as well as on federal theology.

JOHANNELUND THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY,
UPPSALA

SEBASTIAN REHNMAN

Walking in the way of peace. Quaker pacifism in the seventeenth century. By Meredith Baldwin Weddle. Pp. xvi + 348 incl. 2 maps and 20 figs. New York–Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001. £45. 0 19 513138 X
JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902664796

In the wilderness conditions of seventeenth-century New England, good relations between colonial settlers and their neighbours were at a premium. When the Wampanoag leader 'King Philip' led an alliance of Indians against the settlers in 1675, those relations descended into horrifying acts of mutual atrocity. Less than two decades after George Fox's articulation of the 'peace testimony', Quaker settlers in Rhode Island were forced to weigh their ideals of Christian forbearance against the demands of survival. In a thought-provoking study of early Quaker pacifism, Meredith Weddle has questioned the two existing strands of historical thinking on this emotive topic. First, she takes issue with the 'romantic' notion of pacifism as an 'indelible' and timeless article of Quaker doctrine. Second, she questions the 'political' explanation of an expedient pacifism which emerged in 1660, when Friends distanced themselves from radical Protestants who supplemented millenarian expectation with armed resistance.

In the first part of her study, Meredith Weddle examines the content of the Quaker peace testimony (a refusal to fight a spiritual war with 'carnal weapons', and a determination to meet persecution with non-violent resistance). Since the pacifist imperative in early Quakerism was driven less by an objective concern for the victims of violence than the 'subjective state of one's own soul', individual Quakers interpreted its requirements according to personal spirituality and circumstance. When the focus of the study shifts to America, it is clear that the pressures and opportunities facing Friends were very different. In Rhode Island, a sanctuary for Quaker exiles, they were not only exempted from military service on grounds of conscience, but were able to assume the responsibilities of government. Life in colonial New England, however, 'was the way of worldly risk'; when settlers were not engaged in negotiations, deceptions or real hostilities

with the Indians, they feared invasion by the French or Dutch. In a fascinating comparison of reactions to danger, it is clear that Friends expressed their pacifism and, conversely, their support for military action, in a variety of ways. Ambiguities persisted throughout the war of 1675–6; even when Rhode Island's support for neighbouring colonies faltered, the stated reasons were not religious, but political, motivated by a determination to preserve her own sphere of influence. The peace testimony was certainly not disregarded, but it was undoubtedly qualified and inconsistent in its application.

Where some historians will wince at the assertion that seventeenth-century Quakers were not Protestants (p. 195), others may be disappointed with the evidence that early Friends could 'bend the rules'. In their defence, however, Weddle points out that the peace testimony was not a simple prescription, but a complex and evolving doctrine, a desirable 'fruit of the soul'. Given the stark choice between survival and salvation, pragmatism may have appeared the just and sensible option. In her lyrical conclusion, Meredith Weddle ranges widely across several abstract concepts; this is the inevitable consequence of dealing with a controversial, but relevant, topic. In considering these diverse ideas, it seems timely to remember that early Quakers rejected the assumption that violence and aggression were irredeemable aspects of the human condition.

HISTORY OF PARLIAMENT TRUST

BEVERLY ADAMS

Transgressing the bounds. Subversive enterprises among the Puritan elite in Massachusetts, 1630–1692. By Louise A. Breen. (Religion in America Series.) Pp vii + 292. Oxford–New York: Oxford University Press, 2001. £35. 0 19 513800 7
JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902674792

This is yet another attempt to 'belie the myth perpetuated by John Winthrop of a single-minded, monolithic Puritan enterprise in New England' (p. 6). Leaving aside the question of whether that was indeed Winthrop's vision or a construct imagined by later historians, the fact is that it has been decades since anyone has seriously viewed New England society as intentionally or actually monolithic. Recognising that the society aspired to unity but did not require uniformity, scholars such as Philip Gura, Michael Winship, Janice Knight, Stephen Foster and myself have long argued that within the boundaries of the New England Way existed many differing emphases on theology, religious practice, economic policy and definitions of government. While those who transgressed too far, such as Anne Hutchinson, were banished, many others were able to differ civilly with whatever happened to be the majority on any given issue. Thus it is hardly surprising to find that laymen such as John Leverett and clergy such as John Eliot did not always stand in the mainstream of colonial society.

While Breen makes useful contributions to explaining some of the tensions that existed in New England over certain specific issues, including the scope of mercantile enterprises and efforts to convert native Americans, her study is flawed by occasional errors and, more important, by a simplistic organisation of the colonists into two camps. For her, the transgressors she discusses are advocates of individualism and internationalism who were well connected in the broader Atlantic world. The 'orthodox' were narrow and parochial figures who manifested a 'circumscribed, isolationist' approach to affairs and sought to

suppress individualism in favour of a rigid communal uniformity. Yet one of her 'transgressors', John Leverett, was elected governor of Massachusetts, and numerous members of the isolationist Orthodox – such as the Winthrops, John Davenport, John Cotton and Increase Mather – can be shown to have had extensive transatlantic interests and involvement. Furthermore, in examining the controversy that surrounded Anne Hutchinson, and elsewhere, Breen's analysis of religious issues seems imprecise and confused.

MILLERSVILLE UNIVERSITY OF PENNSYLVANIA

FRANCIS J. BREMER

Carmes et carmélites en France du XVIIe siècle à nos jours. Actes du colloque de Lyon (25–26 septembre 1997). Edited by Bernard Hours. Pp. xiii + 480 incl. 3 ill., 5 figs, 18 tables and 1 graph + 4 colour plates. Paris: Les Éditions du Cerf, 2001. Fr. 240 (paper). 2 204 06420 3; 0769 2633
JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902684799

Carmes et carmélites en France is a collection of papers from a colloquium held in Lyon in 1997. The Carmelite order was one of the four great orders of mendicant clergy (Franciscan, Augustinian, Dominican and Carmelite) which emerged during the thirteenth century. By 1300 male and female Carmelite communities were a familiar sight in France. The focus of this volume is not on the first centuries of the order's presence in France but rather on the centuries following the arrival of Carmelites schooled in the reform movement of Teresa of Avila. The spread of Teresian reform from Spain to France was the work of Marie Acarie (d. 1618) and her circle of Parisian *dévots*, which included the famous reformer Pierre de Bérulle among others. Bernard Hours, editor of this collection, argues that the history of the Carmelite order after 1600 is much more poorly understood than it is for the period before. This collection of articles, therefore, is one attempt to address this imbalance. Hours is correct in emphasising the dearth of scholarly work on the Carmelite order for the modern period. Compared to the scholarship on Teresian reform in Spain, the only substantial study of early modern Carmelite reform in recent years is Stephane-Marie Morgain's important contribution, *Pierre de Bérulle et les carmelites de France* (1995). The nineteenth and twentieth centuries are even more neglected than the seventeenth century, and *Carmes et carmélites* does not radically alter this state of affairs. More than half its articles focus on the seventeenth century.

The twenty papers in this volume are organised into four parts reflecting different facets of the Carmelite tradition. The five papers in part I examine social and economic relations between specific Carmelite communities and secular society, each from the perspective of a different region or urban centre. Together these papers highlight the interdependency of the temporal concerns and spiritual mission of a religious community. The six articles in part II focus on models of Carmelite spirituality and devotional practices through examination of such manifestations of religious devotion as hagiographies and confraternities. One of the striking themes in this section is the gradual emergence over time of practices reflecting distinctly regional interpretations of Carmelite devotion. Part III focuses on Carmelite spirituality and intellectual life through examination of texts written and used by Carmelites. For example, two of the articles examine the important contribution made to Carmelite intellectual life by the twentieth-

century journal *Études carmelitaines*. The four articles in part iv examine Carmelite controversialists from the eighteenth to twentieth centuries. Though they vary enormously in subject, these papers reflect the profound engagement of many male and female Carmelites in the intellectual and political events of their day. Whether challenging the bull *Unigenitus* in the eighteenth century or struggling with Jewish authorities over Carmelite occupation of part of Auschwitz in the late twentieth century, the response of these Carmelites was clearly shaped by their own understanding of the Carmelite spiritual tradition. Certain articles in this volume are much more thought-provoking than others. That said, the range of historical perspectives and depth of scholarship exhibited by many of the contributors is noteworthy and, together, these studies enrich our understanding of the Carmelite tradition as well as its contribution to the religious history of France. For all of these reasons, *Carmes et carmélites* is a worthy scholarly endeavour.

UNIVERSITY OF UTAH

MEGAN ARMSTRONG

The journal of William Dowsing. Iconoclasm in East Anglia during the English Civil War.

Edited by Trevor Cooper. Pp. xxiv + 551 incl. 2 figs, 40 maps and 27 tables + colour frontispiece and 64 plates. Woodbridge: Boydell Press (for The Ecclesiological Society), 2001. £50. 0 85 115833 1

JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902694795

William Dowsing's infamy amongst lovers of East Anglian churches is unparalleled; during 1644 he put into practice reformed concerns about ecclesiastical furnishings first developed a century earlier. Dowsing and his team 'brake down', 'beate down' or 'tooke up' stained glass, monumental inscriptions, altar rails and crucifixes in more than 250 buildings, all under the aegis of a parliamentary ordinance, and then went back to check that churchwardens had carried out instructions for levelling chancel steps. Trevor Cooper and his team have shown equally admirable rigour, revisiting every single building mentioned in Dowsing's journal, with camera and pen in place of parliamentary commission and hammer. The resulting volume not only reproduces the journal's text (reassembled in the absence of Dowsing's manuscript from four eighteenth-century sources), but also the thoroughness of its 'bureaucratic Puritan' author. There is almost too much information in this comprehensive, detailed survey of Dowsing's life, his iconoclasm and that of previously unknown Eastern men like Captain Clement Giley, who had particular objections to inscribed bells. This is chiefly a work of reference, and a thoroughly illustrated one at that. It is not a monograph with a sustained argument about iconoclasm, Puritan religion or civil war local politics, although John Morrill's introductory chapter does address these questions. Scattered throughout the eleven essays are significant contributions to early modern English culture, for example the difference between Reformation and Civil War iconoclasm, the one dismantling 'active' instruments of prayer for the dead such as chantry chapels, the other destroying 'passive' representations in windows and inscriptions. The volume's complex structure makes it difficult to negotiate: the inclusion of sixteen appendices seems rather excessive, even if the last, a series of unanswered questions both esoteric and engaging, may be fruitful ground for prospective postgraduates. Lecturers and

undergraduates can enjoy exploiting the text of the journal online (www.williamdowsing.org), considerably extending the educational potential of the whole endeavour. The book demonstrates that church-visiting has a value far beyond antiquarian or tourist pleasure, and should encourage historians to make far more extensive use of material evidence.

UNIVERSITY OF MELBOURNE

PETER SHERLOCK

The sermons of Charles Wesley. A critical edition with introduction and notes. By Kenneth G. C. Newport. Pp. xiii + 407. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001. £70.
0 19 826949 8

JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S002204690270479x

John Wesley's long life and voluminous *Journal* have helped to create a picture of the Evangelical Revival in Britain centred on his own activities and the brand of Methodism he led. By contrast his brother Charles's role in Methodism has been seen largely as that of a great hymnwriter though also, more negatively, as a spoiler of his brother's matrimonial prospects and opponent of John's more radical departures from Anglican order. Any attempt to assess Charles as a leader in his own right is still seriously handicapped by the lack of adequate editions of his writings. There is no complete version of his *Journal*, which in any case effectively ends in 1756, nor of his letters. A substantial body of his unpublished verse was only published as recently as the 1980s. Most of his biographers have uncritically recycled versions of older accounts. So Kenneth Newport's first, and exemplary, critical edition of Charles's sermons is particularly welcome. A substantial introduction includes a valuable account of the problems of the Charles Wesley manuscripts; a sketch of his life based on a fresh reading of the sources; and an assessment of Charles as preacher and theologian. Newport is able to show that Charles has more significance for early Methodism than simply as a hymnwriter; that his theology, though basically similar to John's, was thought through for himself; and that as a preacher he was in style and content very much his own man. It has to be admitted that in two respects Charles's corpus of sermons is disappointing compared with his brother's. Only twenty-three sermons survive and of these ten are copied from John, though with some variations. Furthermore, only nine date from after Charles's conversion in 1738 and six of these are confined to the years 1738–9. This means that other sources than the sermons are needed to discover how far Charles's theology developed through his hymns. The limitations of the sermons also restrict Newport's exposition of Charles's theology. We know, for example, that Charles came to hold a more pessimistic view than John on the possibility of achieving 'perfection' in this life; and that John rejected Charles's belief that God might withhold assurance of salvation for purposes of spiritual discipline. On the other hand Newport is able to show how important Charles's preaching was in the early stages of Methodism. At least until his marriage in 1749 he was also an effective co-supervisor of the emerging Methodist connexion. It could be argued that his anxiety to avoid conflict with the Church of England at almost any cost helped to stave off a premature break in the 1750s which would have damaged Methodism's appeal. But although fuller reassessment of Charles's career and significance must await further work on the sources, this edition of the sermons

and accompanying commentary is a significant step forward and sets a formidable standard for editions of his other writings.

MANCHESTER

HENRY D. RACK

The Methodists in Ireland. A short history. By Dudley Levistone Cooney. Pp. 280 + 30 plates. Blackrock, Co. Dublin: Columba Press, 2001. £10.99 (paper).

1 85607 335 1

JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902714796

It is nearly forty years since Lee Cole and Frederick Jeffery produced their historical surveys of Methodism in Ireland, and though a number of specialised studies and monographs have appeared since then, an up-to-date assessment such as this is to be welcomed, particularly in view of recent ecumenical developments in Ireland. There is a need for denominational treasures to be known and understood if they are to be shared, and this book deserves a wider readership than the relatively small numbers of Methodists in Ireland – at present less than 20,000. In each chapter the author has thoughtfully provided details of parallel developments in English Methodism, making the book user-friendly for readers with only a rudimentary background knowledge of Methodist history. And so, for example, the links between schisms in English Methodism and such Irish offshoots as the Primitive Wesleyan Society founded in 1818 by Adam Averell, are carefully drawn and useful comparisons made. Some of the latest changes are treated a little unevenly, so that the recent change of title from chairman to district superintendent is mentioned, but not the Methodist Worship Book. There is also an extensive number of plates, with only McQuigg and Graham of the early figures, and William Arthur in the nineteenth century, being obvious omissions. But these are relatively minor points. To criticise Dudley Cooney for trying to squeeze a quart into a pint pot, as some reviewers are apt to do with this kind of survey, is being harsh. The author has produced a useful and interesting book, which has the overriding virtue of being both clearly and honestly written.

SURREY

BARRIE TABRAHAM

The Moravian Church and the missionary awakening in England, 1760–1800. By J. C. S. Mason. (Royal Historical Society Studies in History. New ser.) Pp. xv + 229 incl. frontispiece, 4 ills and 1 map. Woodbridge: Boydell Press (for the Royal Historical Society), 2001. £45. 0 86193 251 X; 0269 2244

JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902724792

This excellent little book suffers from two minor blemishes which do not seriously impair its usefulness: it does not always emphasise its new points forcefully enough, and it is thin on how the story looked from Herrnhut, from the standpoint of the Moravian movement as a whole. Dr Mason's defence to this latter charge would doubtless be that the missionary revival was overwhelmingly pioneered from Britain and that was what mattered. But the question of perspective is important. Baron von Schrautenbach who handed over his manuscript *Life of Zinzendorf* to the Brethren in 1782 began by describing the unbridgable gulf in sentiment which separated the heroic age in which Zinzendorf had commenced his great work, and the genteel period in which he was writing

when such things were not conceivable. Moravianism, one might infer, was on the way to becoming a quiet refuge for *die Stille im Lande*, part of a conservative coalition which over the next generation hoped with increasing desperation for the solution of its problems by the arrival of the apocalypse. Without taking up this question Mason shows that this was less than half the truth; indeed the recovery of the Moravian Church in numbers and general esteem was even more dramatic than most of us had supposed, since there were things about Zinzendorf's doctrine of the 'First-fruits' which were inimical to missionary enterprise, and the financial collapse which he had precipitated had put paid to too much of the missionary enterprise which had begun in his lifetime. What Mason shows in meticulous and convincing detail is that Spangenberg's rescue package got rid of enough of the unhelpful doctrine, and regained sufficient financial stability for what was left of the missions to be regarded as an exemplary working model when people became interested in missions again. They were in the first instance secular politicians for whom imperial reorganisation was the order of the day, who wanted to make something even out of Labrador, and wanted to minimise the risk of slave or other subject populations being roused by the French, and evangelical Calvinists who made the imaginative leap from revival to heathen missions. To them the Moravian missions were the standing refutation of the counter-argument that heathen missions could not possibly work. The result of all this was that in spite of very successful missions in the Baltic, the Unitas Fratrum became a religious community which has ever since had its numerical centre of gravity outside Europe, in America, the West Indies and Africa. Schrautenbach was wrong; for the second time pressure from the fringes of the Protestant world upon the centre produced a revival situation from which the Moravians profited. And, another piece of fun which Dr Mason eschews, while no informed commentator now believes E. P. Thompson's allegation that the object of English evangelicalism was to instil work discipline into the labouring classes, Moravian missions were heavily sold to politicians and missionary-minded evangelicals as a means of producing obedient productive slaves.

PETERSFIELD

W. R. WARD

Anglican evangelicals. Protestant secessions from the via media, c. 1800–1850. By Grayson Carter. (Oxford Theological Monographs.) Pp. xv + 470. New York–Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2001. £55. 0 19 827008 9
JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902734799

'Some say we are mad, some, that we are beside ourselves; some cry out, "My Lord Bishop, restrain them" and some wish us God speed'. Thus wrote William Tiptaft in 1831, shortly before his hyper-Calvinist views led him to secede. *Anglican evangelicals* is about the 100 clergy and several thousand laity who left Anglicanism in the first half of the nineteenth century because they regarded it as insufficiently biblical and evangelical. After looking at the context of Anglican Evangelicalism and the factors encouraging secession Carter surveys a wide variety of individuals and movements from England and Ireland. These include the little known Thomas Kelly and John Walker and the western Schism; the better-known Edward Irving and John Nelson Darby and the Brethren

movement and the more spectacular departures – spectacular because they involved highly prominent figures like Baptist Noel or came from the Anglican heartland of Oxford or, as with George Gorham and James Shore, because their secession led to ferocious litigation. Individually, these incidents could be seen as of limited significance but by putting them together Carter shows a religious movement of importance both for the nineteenth century and today. Given the great attention paid to secessions ‘upwards’ from Anglicanism to Rome, *Anglican evangelicals* offers a welcome counterpoint, showing how strong was the impulse ‘downwards’. Ritualist ‘martyrs’ from later in the century are widely known and Carter shows how their Protestant counterparts suffered not a little for their beliefs. There are a great many fascinating insights into nineteenth-century religion to be found in this book. Carter helps to rehabilitate the role of Oxford within Evangelicalism, showing how seceders like Bulteel had a major impact on the religious ferment of the 1830s. The importance of women patrons, such as Harriet Wall and Lady Theodosia Powerscourt, is striking. Carter convincingly demonstrates the abiding strength of the Calvinistic tradition within Anglicanism and the role of a ‘pan-Evangelicalism’, often more at home with Evangelicals beyond Anglicanism than with their fellow Anglicans. *Anglican evangelicals* shows how the more respectable Simeon and Shaftesbury represented but one side of Evangelical Anglicanism and how the secessionists had a significant impact on British and global Christianity. This is a lengthy study, whose strength is in the detailed narrative of secession. But the same narrative begs a number of questions. David Bebbington’s work, relying heavily on culture as an explanative device, needs to be engaged with – to what degree were the secessionists a reflection of enlightenment and romantic culture? Socio-political issues are referred to, as are region and class. Yet the reasons why these secessions happened deserve greater analysis and their abrupt cessation in the 1850s leaves this reader wondering whether socio-economic stimuli were more significant than Carter admits. Many of the secessionists were from the elite of society, yet found themselves moving into dissent – class mobility is an unexplored aspect of their trajectories. James Shore’s move from curate to hotel-owner is an intriguing parable in this regard. The role of region is striking: contemporary Anglicanism has something of a ‘bible belt’ in London and the southern counties. Carter shows that this has a long pedigree, given extra spice by the Dublin connection. This raises the question of how (or whether) their influence spread into the rest of the country. *Anglican evangelicals* is to be warmly welcomed as a significant contribution to understanding Anglicanism in both the nineteenth and twentieth centuries.

ST CATHARINE’S COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

DAVID GOODHEW

Religious revivals in Britain and Ireland, 1859–1905. By Janice Holmes. (New Directions in Irish History.) Pp. xxii + 281 incl. 6 ills. Dublin–Portland, OR: Irish Academic Press, 2000. £35. 0 7165 2692 1
JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902744795

Janice Holmes, who teaches Irish history at the University of Ulster, Coleraine, gives us a rewarding account of a sticky, regressive period in the history of

modern British Evangelicalism, the years from the much-mythologised Ulster Revival in 1859 to the two revivals of 1904/5 – the American Torrey–Alexander mission to London, and the less organised Evan Roberts movement in Wales, which *The Times* excused as the work of ‘Welsh Celts’, who were ‘warm-hearted and wayward, intelligent and superstitious ... anarchic and easily led’. Both Irish and Welsh revivalism suffered racist English criticism. Holmes has made good use of Evangelical biography and autobiography, and distinguishes acutely between the failure of revivalism to meet either Protestant demands for Roman Catholic ‘conversions’ in Ireland or similar demands for working-class ‘conversions’ in England. The wider pattern of revivalist failure is well-known by this time. The Ulster movement, which reminds one of eighteenth-century English Wesleyanism at its most excited, did not stimulate other Churches in the British Isles. Sankey and Moody in the 1870s and ’80s left a cultural legacy of organ-playing and genteel solos which has never died out, and Holmes says that the Americans ‘were more instrumental in putting their fingers on the old sores of division within the religious traditions of the British Isles than they were in ushering in a new era of evangelistic success’. Moody’s final visit in 1891–2 involved a humiliating tour of eighty-one Scottish towns between November and March. Holiness revivalism petered out as far as the main evangelical subculture was concerned, after the farcical episode of the American Pearsall Smith’s sexual fall in 1875. Torrey and Alexander could not do what their hosts wanted and break down English working-class indifference to organised Christianity. Years later Billy Graham confirmed the lesson: American religious revivalists don’t revive English religion. The Welsh revival gave Welsh Nonconformity a breathing-space, but did not halt the secularisation of Welsh society. I think that the only heroic thread here was the determination of the always underrated Salvation Army never to betray its links with exclusion, poverty and disaster: and that tradition was not something which came from its original starting-point in holiness revivalism. In chapters on ‘working-class revivalists’ and ‘women preachers’, which are the best in the book, Holmes illustrates in detail how the role of evangelist offered a degree of social freedom to a small number of men and women who developed strong public personalities and often built up an affectionate group of admirers. Holmes thinks that clerical institutionalism and a middle-class cult of respectability created an environment hostile to revivalism by 1900, and this is largely true. The English Churches were now looking elsewhere for solutions to the problem of halting numerical decline. Professional revivalism developed into a group of new, competing sects, whose future was to lie in America.

UNIVERSITY OF BRISTOL

JOHN KENT

Mission or submission? Moravian and Catholic missionaries in the Dutch Caribbean during the 19th century. By Armando Lampe. (Studies in the History of Christianity in the Non-Western World, 4.) Pp. 244. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 2001. DM 84 (paper). 3 525 55963 1
JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902754791

Comparative history, despite its many potentially fruitful results, has been but sparsely applied to the Caribbean context, whose multitude of small island

colonies (later states) make it an ideal candidate for such treatment. Armando Lampe's *Mission or submission?* is an excellent example of the rich yields of the comparative approach in the study of Caribbean societies. The book compares the role of Christian Churches in the slave emancipation processes in the Dutch colonies of Surinam and Curaçao. Despite sharing a Dutch colonial polity, these colonies differed enormously in many respects, including size, economic activities and racial composition. They also differed in terms of which Church dominated among the slaves and free blacks. While in both colonies the Dutch Reformed Church remained the official Church and the faith of the local elites, Moravian missionaries conducted most of the evangelisation among the slaves and blacks of Surinam, and Catholic priests held a virtual monopoly over their counterparts in Curaçao. The comparison of these societies and their Churches produces fascinating results that actually contradict those found elsewhere in the region, namely that Protestant missionaries played an important role in stimulating slave resistance and accelerating emancipation and that the Catholic Church was a superficial evangeliser and a pillar of the slave systems. Lampe invites us to pay greater attention to the missions' political and geopolitical circumstances by underscoring the 'foreign-guest' status of both Catholics in Curaçao and Moravians in Surinam, a condition that forced their respective missionaries to accommodate to the social and political needs of the local elites. Thus Moravians were extremely cautious about subverting the slave system and Catholics exhibited a degree of diligence among their flocks unmatched in the Spanish colonies, where they took their privileged status for granted. Despite the theological differences separating Catholicism and Protestantism, Lampe demonstrates that Catholic priests and Moravian ministers played strikingly similar roles in Curaçao and Surinam, respectively. In both cases they helped sustain the slave system and ease and delay the transition to emancipation.

RUTGERS UNIVERSITY

LUIS MARTINEZ-FERNANDEZ

Crusade or conspiracy. Catholics and the anti-Communist struggle in Australia. By Bruce Duncan. Pp. xii + 491 + 16 plates. Sydney: University of New South Wales Press, 2001. £19.50 (paper). 0 86840 731 3
JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902764798

The title of this work asks the fundamental question about the greatest crisis in the Roman Catholic Church in Australia: crusade or conspiracy? What was the organisation called 'The Movement'? In the immediate post-war years there was fear in both the Labour party and the Roman Catholic Church that Communists were gaining control of the trade unions. These were then the determining factor in Labour policies. Leaders in the Church and in the Labour party organised to counter the Red influence. Catholic Action was at its developing stage, and its pioneers differed on how far they could act in the name of the Church in political/industrial affairs. Controversy centred on a brilliant young Melbourne lawyer, B. A. (Bob) Santamaria. He worked in close conjunction with his archbishop, Daniel Mannix. He headed official Catholic Action. At the same time he led a secret organisation (The Movement) which acted in the unions. By the early '50s the combined Labour–Movement campaign was successful.

Santamaria turned to Labour policies. All the time the Australian bishops supported Catholic Action financially, but they failed to make clear distinctions between the Jocist groups and Santamaria's Movement. Differing attitudes to both ecclesiology and politics between Melbourne and Sydney caused a rift. When challenged by Labour leader, Dr H. V. Evatt, the Movement was exposed to public scrutiny, which caused widespread unease among Catholics. The bishops were divided on how to handle the crisis. Both sides appealed to Rome for a resolution of the problem. Both claimed that Roman decisions supported their view. The split in Church and Labour continued with great bitterness for many years. Several authors have written on the affair from single aspects of the interests involved. Only Bruce Duncan has meticulously examined all the tangled strains and kept them in play at all stages. In doing so he has identified the fundamental fault in the church approach. The bishops acted courageously but without clarifying the appropriate philosophical and theological bases for action. Australian pragmatism opened the gulf into which both Church and party fell. Crusade or conspiracy? Perhaps both; but this measured and comprehensive account holds a moral lesson for all on Church-State relations.

QUEENSLAND

T. P. BOLAND

The forgotten Catholics of the Soviet empire from Lenin through Stalin. By Christopher Lawrence Zugger. Pp. xxxiv + 556 incl. frontispiece, 4 maps, 21 ills and 9 tables. Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press, 2001. \$39.95. 0 8156 0679 6

JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902774794

Full of original research, this book fills a huge gap on the shelves and also corrects a common misapprehension. Russia pre-1917 is almost invariably represented as a state with a single religion: the Orthodox Church. Yet you have only to walk down the Nevsky Prospekt in St Petersburg to see the eighteenth-century Lutheran and Catholic churches dominating one side of the street opposite the Orthodox cathedral of Our Lady of Kazan to know that this impression is false. In fact, Russia in the late tsarist period was as astonishingly diverse in its religious make-up as in its ethnic complexity. How did such a misapprehension come about? In part it is due to the relentless current propaganda emanating from the Moscow patriarchate itself which constantly proclaims to anyone prepared to listen that Catholics and Protestants barely have the right to exist on Russian soil. *The forgotten* is a work of superb scholarship, which represents the richness of Russian Catholicism (both Latin and Byzantine) as it was at the time of the Revolution. Painstakingly amassing an astonishing amount of original research, the Revd Christopher Zugger (an American Byzantine-rite Catholic from New Mexico) has told the full story of the virtual extermination of this Church by Lenin and then Stalin, a continuous act of persecution so severe as to render it easy for visitors to the USSR to be persuaded that Catholicism never existed in any serious way on that soil (except in Lithuania, not part of the Soviet Union when the worst purges were being carried out). Zugger's book recounts the trail of destruction in painstaking detail and with a huge geographical sweep. In 1991 the grave of Bishop Romzha was opened at Uzhgorod. The final words of the

book are: 'His body was gone; only dust remained. Surely that was the hope of the Communists, that only dust would remain of the Greek Catholic Church. They were sorely mistaken.' What one needs now is a second volume recounting the astonishing renaissance of the Catholic Church in Russia, the Ukraine and Belarus since the collapse of communism. Such a book would be rich and diverse and would also counter the false claims which the Moscow patriarchate has assiduously made. Apart from a few minor factual errors and misspellings, *The forgotten* is a model of historical writing and presentation.

KESTON INSTITUTE,
OXFORD

MICHAEL BOURDEAUX

Religion and public doctrine in modern England, III: Accommodations. By Maurice Cowling. Pp. xxiv + 766. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001. £65. 0 521 25960 6
JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902784790

This concluding volume of Maurice Cowling's trilogy has been long in gestation, since the two earlier volumes, each substantial in length, appeared in 1980 and 1985, and it arrives over a decade later than was promised in the second volume. The jackets for the first two showed the funeral service for Sir Winston Churchill at St Paul's Cathedral. The jacket for the final one offers us a change but remains funereal: it shows the coffin of Neville Chamberlain in front of the altar in Westminster Abbey before the burial service. It looks as though the author sees himself as a kind of academic undertaker, devoting himself to the interment of bodies of thought. The whole enterprise represents a formidable undertaking to which he has devoted decades of reading and reflection. It is not clear whether Mr Cowling has himself notched up the million words which he credits Baron Bunsen with having achieved, but if not, he has made a gallant try. Even if this volume is late, it conforms in its architecture to what was forecast. The grand project has been seen through to the end. It is certainly the case that the trilogy will be compulsory, and perhaps even compulsive, reading for anyone interested in the place occupied by Christianity as a 'public doctrine' in England over the last century and a half. The word England remains central to this study. Partial residence on the Gower peninsula has not diluted the author's emphasis. There are Scots and Germans who feature in these pages, but only when they live outside Scotland or Germany. Two monarchs, George III and George V are identified, unusually, as kings of England. This may, of course, simply be poor indexing or proof-reading. Aristotle, for example, has fallen victim to estuarine English. More seriously, the index, which should help readers track down individual thinkers in a tome like this, is not as useful as it should be. For example, readers looking up Baron Bunsen would miss the substantive discussion of his writing.

Readers of this volume will have to go back to the others in order to renew their acquaintance with the scope of what Cowling is trying to do – though he gives some reminders in his introduction – since there will be few who will have retained in their heads the full treatment which he is attempting. The previous

volume entitled 'Assaults' was notable for its concentration on argument. We were treated to a battle featuring the assailants of Christianity and the assaults on the assailants. Aggression all round was the order of the day and intellectual conspiracies of one kind or another were rampant. This present volume moves on to consider what are called 'accommodations'. Three related strands are examined: the latitudinarianism which assumes that modern thought and knowledge must constitute the only acceptable yardstick and requires Christianity to adjust itself to them, if it can; the Christian defence which believes that it is unnecessary to bow down before latitudinarianism; and post-Christian thought which cannot even bring itself to think that Christianity is worth bothering to attack since it is so clearly anachronistic. The method of proceeding is as before. Individual thinkers and writers are paraded and then put into the ring. They range from figures one would expect to see discussed – from Carlyle, Froude, Kingsley, Disraeli, Thomas Arnold, Jowett, Stanley and other nineteenth-century figures to Zaehner, Milbank, MacIntyre, Raymond Williams, Skinner, Eagleton, Kenny, Scruton, Steiner and many others in the twentieth century. The very full notes testify to the enormous range of reading which lies behind this volume. Once the thinkers are put into the ring, then the fun starts, though the living may not be greatly amused. Cowling has not succumbed, in his advancing years, to any tendency to become accommodating. Some writers are no sooner into the ring than they receive a knock-out punch and disappear pretty quickly. Others are made to go the full distance, but their fate is no less certain. No review of this kind can summarise the combination punches employed by the author; sometimes he pummels steadily and relentlessly, to good effect, sometimes he swings wildly and outrageously, with the consequence either that he loses his own balance or succeeds in rendering an apparently reliable performer helpless in an instant.

It would be wrong, of course, to regard this book as one protracted knock-about performance. The author is very serious. His tone is oracular. His language can be clinical. He brings the entire magisterial exercise to a conclusion in a short final section entitled 'The author and the argument' in which he makes no apology for the personal engagement which underpins the entire enterprise. The connection between the trilogy and the author's own development is admitted to be very close. It is not to be expected that this massive undertaking should end in a coda, with all the tensions resolved, and it does not. There is a mixture of anger, sadness and hope. The final paragraph states that *Religion and public doctrine* makes no prediction and accepts that it may indeed be the case that the Christian phase of European civilisation is over. However, Cowling is adamant that secularisation is a phase of intelligentsia life which it would be absurd to assume was permanent. There remains an 'instinct for religion', he claims, which lurks beneath the indifference of the public mind and might yet surprise by its willingness to be led astray by Christianity. Whether this is the case or not, there is something, though certainly not everything, to be gained by being led astray by Mr Cowling's combative investigation of the roots of the contemporary English mental landscape.

UNIVERSITY OF WALES,
LAMPETER

KEITH ROBBINS

Die Kirchen und das Dritte Reich, III: Spaltungen und Abwehrkämpfe, 1934–1937. By Gerhard Besier. Pp. 1,262. Berlin: Propyläen, 2001. €45. 3 549 07149 3
JEH (53) 2002; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046902794797

To return to Klaus Scholder's *Die Kirchen und das Dritte Reich* at volume three after sixteen years is an odd and salutary experience. Many of the names have lost their familiarity; Churches which then faced severe political threats to their existence from militant heathenism have since suffered worse from much subtler social challenges; the Jewish question has altered out of all recognition; there is no Reich and no Reichkirche, but the German Churches are principal paymasters to the ecumenical movement. Scholder's work was indeed much trumpeted as ecumenical history, though it was quite clearly a Protestant work, showing indeed from (mostly published) Catholic sources, that the Third Reich involved Catholic and Protestant in a common fate. No historian has done more to relativise the ecumenical movement than Gerhard Besier, and the reason why his third volume to the work of his old master has grown to such enormous dimensions is that it embodies a bold and successful attempt to write not from an ecumenical but from a global perspective. Archive collections and very notably the press from Poland, Austria, Italy, Switzerland, Czechoslovakia, Britain and the United States have been plundered to telling effect. The gamble with this approach is to suggest that the agenda of the German church struggle of the 'thirties occupied other Churches and governments much more than in fact it did, though the constant complaints of both contemporaries and the author of the slowness of the various parties to wake up to the Nazi menace should put the reader on his guard. The great advantage of the approach is that it makes clear how many people in the late 'thirties were aware that not every association calling itself a Church could be accepted as such; and that question, suppressed for two generations in the interests of ecumenical correctness, has never been more *aktuell* than it is now. The overnight emergence of politicians scantily acquainted with Christianity as public guides to what the Koran does or does not contain tells its own story.

In one respect Besier follows the gloomy traditions of his master. The subtitle of Scholder's first volume spoke of 'illusions', that of the second of 'disillusionment'. Besier's 'divisions and defensive struggles' may sound more neutral but are equally depressing. On the Protestant side as the crisis steadily deepened confessional Lutherans were still trying to ditch the Old Prussian Union; the Confessing Church fell apart trying assess how much or how little to yield to the government, Niemöller himself, vexed at divisions in his own congregation and at the absence of authoritative teaching in the Protestant ranks, came within an ace of converting to Rome. Of course one of the uncertainties in both confessional camps was the impossibility of knowing, if a deal was to be made with the government, with whom it should be attempted. The real shambles of Nazi dictatorship, familiar enough to recent students, is here forcibly illustrated. German Christians, a Reich bishop, a Reich church ministry and Reich church committees, waxed and waned in official favour (but never went away) as a succession of entrepreneurial thugs sold a good wheeze to the Führer, or as the needs of policy changed. The Nazis' hatred of the Roman Catholic Church was proportioned to their fear of it; but when Germany became involved in the Spanish Civil War (or when as during the Olympic games it was prudent

to show a good face to the world) it was worth while to sell the system as the bulwark of Christianity against Bolshevism. Nor was Mussolini loth to urge the advantages of his method of dealing with the Church. Besier becomes eloquently enthusiastic about the skill with which the Catholics composed and disseminated the encyclical *Mit brennender Sorge*; but they were handicapped throughout by Pacelli's belief in contractual solutions and differences within the hierarchy on how to make the best of a bad job. Pius XI prepared to issue an encyclical against racism, but died before he had done so; Pacelli, now Pope Pius XII, dropped the whole scheme. It is in discussions of this kind that Besier's global approach succeeds most strikingly; the tensions within the German government, the papal administration, the Italian government and the various churches, are patiently explored and their obfuscation of principle made only too plain. Besier's final contribution to the gloom is a long and brilliant chapter on the politics of race. Beginning with the admission that the state of eugenics in the 1930s gave greater plausibility to racial politics than would now be the case, he shows how unprepared all the Churches were to face the issue, and how meanly they treated even their own Christian members of Jewish descent. The one clear voice here was that of Bonhoeffer's friend Franz Hildebrandt; and one cannot but reflect that a generation later he was shabbily sacrificed by the party in the British Methodist ministry most overweeningly determined to secure union with the Church of England. For all the scale of this volume Besier says little about the effect of his harrowing story on the religious belief and practice of the German people. But he promises two more volumes, and those quickly, and may have held this over for later treatment. There is the occasional slip here, as when the Oxford Group Movement is confused with the Oxford Movement, but the breadth of the canvas shows to a demonstration that church history, even contemporary church history, is well worth writing, whenever anything is going on in the Churches.

PETERSFIELD

W. R. WARD