

Reviews

The triune creator. A historical and systematic study. By Colin E. Gunton. (Edinburgh Studies in Constructive Theology.) Pp. x + 246. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1998. £14.95 (paper). 0 7486 0792 7

This volume is one of a series that has produced some first-rate books. The present volume continues these extremely high standards and maintains the series' aim of avoiding preoccupation with method and ideological critiques. It draws from Christian history and tradition to engage with the modern world. Colin Gunton, Professor of Doctrine at King's College London, has achieved two important goals in this single volume. For rather too long there has been the need for a comprehensive history of the doctrine of creation within Christian history. Gunton presents that history with care and detail, from Greek philosophy and the biblical world to the contemporary writings of Karl Barth and Wolfhart Pannenberg, but primarily as a critical theologian. This means that the historical material is accompanied by analysis and Gunton advances an interesting and important argument. His second achievement is to develop the argument that a Trinitarian doctrine of creation allows for theology to engage with science in a properly robust manner, for it offers the presuppositions of intelligible and realist discourse regarding nature and 'history'. Gunton traces the loss of the doctrine of divine creation from Scotus to Kant and its disastrous implications for so many aspects of modern thought. Gunton then develops the implications of the doctrine of creation in relation to providence, ethics and eschatology. Gunton's important contribution to systematic theology in this book complements his earlier *Christ and creation* (1992) and *The one, the three and the many* (1993). This is a book that historians and theologians will find deeply stimulating.

UNIVERSITY OF BRISTOL

GAVIN D'COSTA

Continuity and change in Christian worship. Papers read at the 1997 summer meeting and the 1998 winter meeting of the Ecclesiastical History Society. Edited by R. N. Swanson. (Studies in Church History, 35.) Pp. xxiv + 524 incl. 3 figs. Woodbridge: Boydell Press (for the Ecclesiastical History Society), 1999. £40. 0 9529733 4 0; 0424 2084

In these thirty-one papers we encounter the results of two recent meetings of the Ecclesiastical History Society. The theme on these occasions was liturgy. About

two-thirds of the essays treat aspects of ecclesiastical practice in England, Scotland and Wales, whilst the remainder range over myriad places and themes, from Augsburg (Philip Broadhead) to East Africa (Emma L. Wild). The studies are placed in chronological order, beginning with Paul F. Bradshaw's consideration of the early Christian eucharistic meal and ending with Edward Yarnold's discussion of the restored catechumenate after the Second Vatican Council.

While most contributors show a strong interest in the textual evidence, several authors also reflect methodological and theoretical shifts in our own time. Bradshaw insists that liturgical manuscripts are 'living literature': they circulate within a community, forming part of its heritage and tradition, but modify continually 'to reflect changing historical and cultural circumstances' (p. 3). He thereby rightly dismisses the premise of Gregory Dix and others that there was not only a unified archetype for the eucharist but in some measure a common Christian adherence to it. Donald Bullough argues for dynamism and variety in Carolingian liturgical experience, criticising 'an excessive credence in the "unifying" effect of early Carolingian liturgical reform' (p. 47). He urges moderation in looking to anthropology and 'the new criticism' (p. 61) although raising related questions about the effects of ritual Latinity upon the laity. Brenda Bolton looks as far afield as sixteenth-century Mexico in finding parallels to the use of liturgical drama for essentially missionary purposes (p. 98). Bruce Gordon finds some non-Zwinglian sources for liturgical formulation in Zurich, including medieval precedent and the ideas of Leo Jud.

Simon Ditchfield disputes the uniformity of ritual after the Council of Trent, allegedly the result of a 'centralising papal monarchy'. He argues persuasively for a 'kinetic, interactive mode of breviary reading' (p. 212). Thus, he insists that Tridentine worship was not static but does have a detailed, including a local, history.

Judith Champ provides a fascinating window onto the nineteenth-century Romantic movement in England and its effects upon the liturgy. The reintroduction of Catholic episcopal hierarchy drew upon the wide appeal of the Middle Ages to educated classes. Champ briefly traces and reinterprets the roles of men like Daniel Rock and Augustus Welby Pugin. Although Romanism gained the ascendancy over Gallicanism, 'the divisions between "old-English" and "Roman" cannot be as sharply drawn as has been traditionally believed' (p. 300).

R. W. Ambler firmly sets liturgical innovation within the context of social and economic change in nineteenth-century Lincolnshire. Frances Knight, too, places Welsh choir participation in a setting that includes traditional harvest festivals and English-medium as opposed to Welsh-medium worship.

Reviewing anthologies is always frustrating, for much of great worth can only be hinted at or not mentioned at all. Taken as a group, these essays are based in deep research. At the same time, they reveal a pattern within liturgical history of relating ritual to the society and the occasions it both serves and mirrors.

Against the Christians. The rise of early anti-Christian polemic. By Jeffrey W. Hargis. (Patristic Studies, 1.) Pp. ix+173. New York: Peter Lang, 1999. £28. 0 8204 4156 2

This succinct monograph analyses the anti-Christian polemics of Celsus, Porphyry and Julian within their broader historical contexts and in terms of their rhetorical strategies. Important, on the one hand, is the process by which early Christianity was negotiating a place for itself within the Graeco-Roman world marked not so much by mutual antagonism as by adjustment and appropriation, and, on the other, the differing attempts by the pagan polemicists to deal with Christian 'otherness' either by accentuating their social exclusion (Celsus) or by deconstructing Christian integrity and 'uniqueness' (Porphyry and Julian). Hargis's concern, therefore, is not simply to précis the arguments but to expose their rhetorical function within the changing cultural and intellectual position of both paganism and Christianity and of their interaction. He also makes some independent historical proposals, for example regarding the date of Celsus' work, and on Julian's motives in his dealings with the Jews; however, his overall grasp of the Jewish and Jewish/Christian dimensions of his topic, and of the relevant secondary literature, appears weak. Indeed, while the select bibliography betrays a solid knowledge of the English-language secondary literature on the polemicists, there are a few surprising significant omissions, particularly of more recent discussion, and non-English material is poorly represented. More seriously, patristic sources are listed only in their English translations, with heavy use being made of the *Ante-Nicene* and *Post-Nicene Fathers* editions, and even the focal polemicists seem to have been studied primarily through English translation; the referencing of the *Chronicon Paschale* under the authorship of John Malalas does not inspire confidence. The book is interesting in its conception and in some of its proposals, although a much more detailed analysis of each of the authors would be needed to establish its case; given the unfamiliarity of the texts to many students, it would serve well for undergraduate and taught postgraduate courses, but will invite some caution because of the bibliographical weaknesses noted.

KING'S COLLEGE,
LONDON

JUDITH LIEU

The archaeology of early Christianity. A history. By W. H. C. Frend. Pp. xix+412 incl. 3 plans, 8 maps+17 black-and-white and 10 colour plates). London: Geoffrey Chapman, 1996. £50 (cloth), £25 (paper). 0 225 66718 5; 0 225 66850 5

There are two strands to this lively story of the archaeology of Christianity's first centuries. One is the historiography itself, from the Renaissance to the 1990s, with a curtain-raiser in the Empress Helena's search for the True Cross. The other is an outline of changing understanding of Christianity's great transitions, its advance and retraction, and relations between orthodoxy and dissent – the latter a field where in the last forty years a 'whole new world' of divergent beliefs and teaching has been opened up.

Frend is necessarily concise in tracing four centuries of intellectual and technical headway in the context of shaping conditions like nationalism, clericalism, cultural ambition and conflict (from Napoleon to the Six Day War at one extreme to quarrelsome national institutions at the other). Indeed, while Christian archaeology might be imagined as a realm of mannerly scholarship, Frend reveals that some of its strongest influences have been extraneous. One of them is chance, as in the discovery of works by Origen and Didymus the Blind in a cavern near Cairo during its requisition by the Eighth Army in 1941. Venality (the dispersal of texts by antiquity dealers, for instance) is another.

In the field, the subject was for too long dominated by plan-fixated excavators who were indifferent to wider archaeological responsibilities, like the recording of stratification or finds. Influential advances, such as aerial reconnaissance across desert spaces, or the breakthrough which followed the recognition of residuality in Rome's catacombs, are tellingly handled. There are wise passages, too, about the preconditions for buoyant research, which is assisted neither when excessive fieldwork runs ahead of synthesis, nor – as we are warned at the book's end – by the reworking of a static data base.

Much of the book's special merit derives from an interplay between detachment and intimacy. From the 1930s onward Frend participated in a number of the campaigns he describes, and he was an onlooker upon many more. One of them was in Rome, where he saw work on mausolea beneath the Constantinian St Peter's in 1944 (when warfare in Italy was described by one German officer as 'like trying to fight in an antique shop') and archaeological interpretation called for a special kind of fearlessness in the face of papal expectations. Elsewhere, some of the episodes have an almost Stephen Spielbergian character, as in the discovery of the Coptic library of Nag Hammadi, or the Nubian excavations at Qasr Ibrim.

Ibrim yielded medieval documents, reminding us of archaeology's intermittent value not simply as a discipline engaged with the ambiguities of material culture but also as a deliverer of new written records. Ibrim also illustrates elasticity in the 'early' of the title. Roughly speaking this runs down to the transition from Byzantium to Islam, but the temporal boundary undulates, bulging far into the Middle Ages when something catches the author's interest. In the west, it is drawn more tightly. Ireland is scarcely noticed, and the Merovingian world receives small attention.

Frend argues that Romano-British Christianity underwent some fourth-century trauma. An unnerved Church would help to explain the apparent success of Anglo-Saxon immigrants in bucking the trend towards Christian continuity elsewhere. But was Christianity so drastically weakened? Sources undiscussed here argue not, and the ecclesiastical flourishing and world of letters which burgeoned in the western half of the British Isles during the fifth and sixth centuries have never been plausibly explained as consequences of 'tenuous contacts' with Gaul. This issue is best explored in the context of Barry Cunliffe's recent portrayal of Europe's long Atlantic façade, from Portugal to south-west Scotland, as a culture province in its own right.

A dynamic data base will tell. Meanwhile, it is enough to salute a warm, vastly knowledgeable and humane book, its list of major compendia, bibliographies and atlases itself a gathering of gatherings, and to reflect that William Frend is

probably the only person in the world who could have written it. Readers now and for years ahead will be glad that he did.

HARROGATE

RICHARD MORRIS

Communities of the blessed. Social environment and religious change in northern Italy. AD 200–400. By Mark Humphries. (Oxford Early Christian Studies.) Pp. xv + 258 incl. 5 ills. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999, £40. 0 19 826983 8

This richly rewarding book aims to set the religious history of northern Italy in its social context. Its core is a matched pair of discussions, treating the literary and archaeological evidence for the development of the region's churches to the middle (chs ii–iii), and at the end (chs vi–vii), of the fourth century. The up-to-date survey thus provided of recent research in a fast-changing field is valuable in itself; but Humphries offers much more than mere summary. He uses his material to argue that the Italian churches were more robust in 350, but less complacently triumphalist in 400, than has generally been supposed. We are offered a picture of incremental growth, where Christian evangelism pulses out along arterial roads, and local churches reach their (modest) maturity at their own pace. This is a challenging and in many respects highly persuasive thesis, enlivened throughout by the author's keen eye for significant connections. The tug of irredentist nostalgia in modern Trieste (p. 14) and the ordeal of trans-Appennine commuting (p. 25) thus reinforce ancient examples to illustrate the enduring porousness of some boundaries and intractability of others; the epigraphic trail left by a *praefectus vehiculorum* illuminates both economic horizons (p. 33) and religious diffusion (p. 39); a Milanese presence in early imperial Lodi, plausibly related to the Milan–Rome road link (p. 34), provides a context for an otherwise obscure fourth-century martyr translation (p. 170). Humphries is at his best with such details; his touch becomes slightly less certain when he applies his findings to the grand narratives of the region's ecclesiastical history. One example is the impact of transient emperors. The shrewd discussion of Constantius II (ch. iv) is inadequately related to the Italian churches' broader experience of temporarily resident courts. Notably absent, or rather, reduced to an Athanasian puppet (p. 115), is Constantius' elusive brother Constans, who, as the first Christian emperor that the bishops of northern Italy could call their own, arguably encouraged a sectarian posturing that proved unsustainable when Constantius arrived. The region was uniquely unfortunate in its exposure to both rival brothers, seeing much more of Constantius than Gaul and rather less of Constans than Illyricum. Given the importance of the fourth-century court as an engine of cultural change, we need more systematic discussion of the specific patterns of the Italian Church's interaction with its emperors. Equally tentative is the discussion of Ambrose. Having announced his determination to resist the 'fascination' of the bishop of Milan (pp. 17–18), he quietly succumbs, attributing Ambrose's successes to the 'infuriatingly intangible' (p. 120) matter of his 'beguiling' (p. 126) and 'dazzling' (p. 135) personality: the bishop secures his ends through 'sheer force of personality' (p. 150). Yet Humphries supplies the basis for an

alternative explanation. If the region's Christian institutions were, indeed, struggling towards a fragile maturity in the later fourth century, there was perhaps unusual scope for a bishop with access to the resources of a resident court to exercise patronage; Ambrose's success perhaps depended as much upon the particular circumstances of his time and place as upon exceptional forcefulness. But it is hardly a criticism of the author that he leaves such intriguing possibilities implicit: a great merit of this fine book is the wry subtlety of its argument, and the sober restraint of its judgements.

KEIO UNIVERSITY

NEIL McLYNN

Kirche bei Pelagius. By Sebastian Thier. (Patristische Texte und Studien, 50.) Pp. ix + 358. Berlin–New York: Walter de Gruyter, 1999. DM 218. 3 11 016314

4

In the conclusion to this learned and laborious study – the author rather endearingly admits (p. 47) that his methodology may try the patience of some readers – it is argued that Pelagius never devoted the same attention to ecclesiology that he did to anthropology (p. 323). Pelagius' thought was dominated by an anti-Manichaean insistence on the freedom of choice enjoyed by every human being, even when in a state of sin. He wrote no book on the nature of the Church, and because of the reservations which exist among scholars about the authorship of some of the writings attributed to him, Thier uses as the source for his enquiry Pelagius' commentary on the Pauline Epistles, which is universally accepted as genuine, supplemented, on occasion, by the Letter to Demetrias. In the commentary, Pelagius writes as an exegete, not as a theologian, so that his ecclesiological doctrine is expressed only indirectly (p. 40). What is in no doubt is the influence on his thinking of the monastic-ascetic climate of his age: his concern is primarily with the sanctification of the individual, rather than with the common life in the Body of Christ. This does not mean, however, either that Pelagius set a low value on the Church, still less that he regarded salvation as being possible outside her (p. 101). Nevertheless, the basis of his soteriology was synergism: the possibility of perfection is given by God, but man has the responsibility to work out his own salvation, if he wills (pp. 132–3). This means that there are degrees of holiness among Christians – Pelagius is wholly opposed to Jovinian's view of an equality brought about by baptism (p. 156). Furthermore, although for him the goal of the Church is the development of holiness in her members, an ideal which resembles that of the Novatianists, there is a vital difference: Pelagius accepts penance for mortal sin as a means of reintegrating the sinner into the Church (pp. 273–80). Nevertheless, while the sacraments are vital to the life of the Christian, and clerical orders essential for administering them, Pelagius sees bishops and presbyters first and foremost as moral teachers – the bishop, through his consecration enjoys a special grace – *prophetia* – so that he serves his people by example and precept, through which the layman can learn to advance in holiness (p. 244). In his conclusion (pp. 312–29) Thier emphasises the ascetic strain in Pelagius' thinking; his

acceptance of what Peter Brown has called the 'theology of discontinuity'; and his belief that the advance to Christian perfection is within the believer's own power, in cooperation with God's help (p. 315). This means that in Pelagius' ecclesiology the holiness of the Church comes from the holiness of her members, in marked contrast with the Augustinian view of the sanctification of the Church by the holiness of Christ (p. 322). Considered as a whole, Thier's book represents a monument of research and exposition and constitutes a major contribution to Pelagian studies. It will be both a reference work and a quarry for scholars for generations to come.

DURHAM

GERALD BONNER

Creatio ex nihilo and the theology of St Augustine. The anti-Manichaean polemic and beyond. By N. Joseph Torchia OP (American University Studies, vii. Theology and Religion, 205.) Pp. xxv + 279. New York: Peter Lang, 1999. £30 (\$49.95). 0 8204 3775 1

Torchia has identified the doctrine of 'creatio ex nihilo' as the key to understanding Augustine's vast corpus of ideas. He first sketches the early history of the idea in writers from I Clement to Ambrose. He follows this with a summary of Manichaean cosmology. Chapters are then devoted to discussions of parts of selected works, nearly all written specifically against the Manichaeans: first, Augustine's three commentaries on Genesis; secondly, *Contra epistulam Manichaei quam vocant fundamenti*; thirdly, *De natura boni*; fourthly, *Contra Faustum*. The book ends with a summary of the author's findings, and some notes on their connections with other Augustinian themes such as grace and free will. This is an ambitious project, especially for so short a book (only 152 pages of text, plus endnotes). To break new ground, especially in a field where such high standards of scholarship have been set, an author would need an unusual degree of depth of learning, analytic precision or interpretative sophistication. Sadly, these qualities are not made evident. At the same time the style is too awkward, and the topic too narrow, to attract the non-specialist. One final warning: the type-face is unnecessarily fancy, and it was difficult both to skim the text and to distinguish italicisation.

TRINITY AND ALL SAINTS,
LEEDS

MARGARET ATKINS

History, apocalypse, and the secular imagination. New essays on Augustine's City of God, Proceedings of a colloquium held at Green College, the University of British Columbia, 18–20 September 1997. Edited by Mark Vessey, Karla Pollmann and Allan D. Fitzgerald OSA. Pp. viii + 334. Bowling Green, OH: Philosophy Documentation Center, Bowling Green State University, 1999. 1 889680 04 4

The *City of God* has been famously described as 'a loose baggy monster' (Peter Brown quoting Henry James on Dickens's novels). Its scope and size have certainly frightened off scholars and, exceptionally in Augustine bibliography,

too little has been done on this towering work of Augustine's maturity. The selection of eighteen papers printed here represents the first-fruits of a group of scholars concerned to give the work greater prominence in scholarly reflection and interdisciplinary debate. The volume, which is also reprinted in *Augustinian Studies* xxx (1999), has much in it that is of value: in the first section on 'History', six papers deal with Augustine's historical context, his possible sources and use of classical scholarship, especially in relation to his ability to situate the early books of the *City of God* cleverly and effectively within the framework of the classical education, culture and society he shared with his readers, whilst simultaneously subverting, revising or 'destabilising' his readers' perceptions and expectations by rethinking and reinterpreting them from a Christian perspective. The middle section of 'Apocalypse' is perhaps the most interesting. Seven essays tackle anew the much debated question of Augustine's attitude to the Revelation of St John, as well as his reflections on heaven and hell. The influence of Tyconius' exegesis, the (rather far-fetched) possibility that the final chapters of *City of God* are structured mimetically around the final chapters of John's Revelation, the (rather more well-founded) thesis that Augustine transforms the Apocalypse and its imagery into a sort of Christian myth in order to interpret the present moral predicament of Christians in the framework of his mature theology, and finally the problem of Augustine's attitude to the body and the flesh (in an amusing and witty piece by Burrus) are all raised and discussed. Hell is shown to belong to an aesthetic of divine order far removed from sadistic voyeurism and Augustine's reflections on heaven are examined in context for the light they shed on his, and his hearers', preoccupations. In the final section, entitled (in a somewhat forced way) 'Secular imagination', the essays range from John Bale's use of the *City of God*, through a piece of masterly detective work by Vessey himself to explain the reasons for the 1610 edition of the *City of God* (which he finds in its ability to buttress the ideology of colonialism), to a defence of Augustine against the criticisms of Heidegger and Arendt. The final, impressively clear, essay on John Milbank's criticism of Robert Markus' views on Augustine's secularisation of politics (and to a certain extent, the Church) is a disappointingly flat note on which to end an otherwise largely entertaining, and at times, buoyant, collection of essays, for in it we see Augustine being taken hostage by Milbank and forced to endorse an agenda which is wholly unsympathetic to his thought in the *City of God*.

UNIVERSITY OF DURHAM

CAROL HARRISON

Toleranz im Mittelalter. Edited by Alexander Patschovsky and Harald Zimmermann. (Vorträge und Forschungen, 45.) Pp. 413. Sigmaringen: Thorbecke, 1998. DM 128. 3 7995 6645 7

This volume includes papers presented at the Reichenow meeting of 4 October 1994. It is of great interest, given the general concern today for cases of repression all over the world, and for the need to show toleration, not only in the strictly religious sense, but in terms of national, ethnic, sexual freedom and so on. Through an analysis within the context of the *longue durée* (even though the

usefulness of such a concept might today be debatable) tragic events of the twentieth century such as the genocide of Armenians, the Holocaust, ethnic cleansing in Kosovo or the Kurdish problem could be understood.

The papers in the volume well illustrate that theological and religious tolerance was practiced during the Middle Ages and modern period. However, western Christendom had not formulated specific rules to safeguard 'otherness' (G. Wieland, W. Hartman). When Jews, the common recipient of Christian contempt for alterity, received certain privileges, it was only due, as rightly suggested (by K. Lohrman) to their pecuniary affluence, and not because of theological tolerance. The other and otherness (particularly Muslims, Greeks – I assume that by Greeks the authors mean Christian-Orthodox Byzantines – and assorted heretics) have been successive subjects of repression or partial tolerance in the Mediterranean region, i.e. in Sicily, southern Italy, the Latin states of the eastern Mediterranean (R. C. Schwinges, H. Mohring). It should be noted at this point that the Byzantine state, a multi-ethnic empire *par excellence*, was almost completely tolerant towards Jews and Muslims. Tolerant it was even towards western Christians who wished to expand eastward and used as a pretext the argument that the Byzantines were heretics. The assessment of the Ferrara–Florence Council (K. Walsh) is rather weak and does not fill a regrettable gap in the volume, namely, the lack of a paper on Byzantine ideology and practice. The paper on Hungary (A. Kubinyi) underlines the multi-ethnic character of the medieval Hungarian state.

K. Schweiner is concerned with the problem of the principles of *tolerantia*, as perceived by Augustine and the medieval theologians after him and as processed by the thinkers of the Enlightenment. He concludes that the history of toleration is a history with constantly movable limits. A. Petchovsky, on the other hand, one of the two editors of the volume, deals with the views of St Augustine and St Thomas. He contrasts theory and practice and argues that toleration, in the modern sense of the term, appeared during the twelfth century at the latest. Finally, F. Šmahel deals with Hussite Bohemia in the fifteenth century and the Treaty of Kuttenberg (1485), after the so called 'heiligen Krieg'. The treaty recognised free choice of religious creed and the consequent way of receiving holy communion, in other words, the coexistence of two different faiths.

Despite some gaps and weaknesses, this volume is a very useful companion for those working on medieval history in general and in particular on religious theory and practice during the Middle Ages and the early modern period. In the study of the volume, the help of Efi Ragia was precious.

INSTITUTE OF BYZANTINE RESEARCH,
ATHENS

LENOS MAVROMMATIS

Gregory the Great and his world. By R. A. Markus. Pp. xxiii + 241 incl. 3 maps. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997. £40 (cloth), £14.95 (paper). 0 521 58430 2; 0 521 58608 9

To be a bishop of Rome in the late sixth century was no laughing matter. Italy was torn asunder by political strife. The Lombards threatened to overrun the entire country after having occupied large chunks of it after AD 568. Atrocious crimes were committed in these military conflicts. In addition, the plague

repeatedly depopulated entire regions. There was flooding of the Tiber, famine and inflation. It is the intention of Robert Markus' new book about Gregory the Great to describe the shaping of the mind of his hero in relation to this turbulent environment. But at the same time Markus notes that we live 'in several worlds: not only the world we see and hear and act in and upon; but also the world of our imagination, perceptions, representations and ideas'. Hence the need to place Gregory 'in both his worlds: the social reality and the intellectual and imaginative construct' (p. xi). In addition, there is a 'third world', i.e. our construct of Gregory's worlds. Yet Markus is not interested in the sometimes artificial complexities of post-modern historiography. His book is not an exercise in methodology, but rather a traditional 'account' of the empirical and mental realities which Gregory had to grapple with.

The order in which Markus depicts Gregory's 'worlds' is significant: he sees him as a 'contemplative in a troubled world' (the title of ch. i). After a short introduction containing elementary information on the sources, on the country in which Gregory lived, on his life before his pontificate and his writings (ch. i), Markus sets out to describe the conflict between the contemplative and the active life which dominated Gregory's life and his ministry (ch. ii). Gregory managed to resolve this conflict by discovering the spiritual value of 'humility, a ready submission to God's calling, like Jeremiah's surrender (Jer. i.6) ... Pastoral involvement could be integrated into his spiritual goals' (p. 20). Hence the writing of the *Regula pastoralis* a few months after his accession in AD 590: 'Contemplation had to be considered in the context of the pastor's function in the Christian community, and, conversely, the pastoral ministry itself had a radically contemplative direction' (p. 26).

Yet as a pope Gregory was also conscious of his authority. Although he described the Church as a community of love, it was primarily a hierarchical institution he had in mind in which there were rulers (*rectores*), celibate clergy (*continentes*) and lay people (*coniugati*). The terminology is significant, for Gregory is a monk and the ideal of asceticism is an integral part of his intellectual makeup. His is an aristocratic view of the Church which is readily explained by his origins: born into a family of wealthy landowners, Gregory had followed an almost classic administrative career until he was appointed *praefectus urbi* in AD 573. After his conversion he tried to escape from worldly affairs and yet remained too useful to be allowed to retire into a monastery. Instead he was made the pope's legate (*apocrisiarius*) to Constantinople where he kept close contact with the imperial family. After another short spell in his monastery on the Coelian Hill he was the obvious choice as successor to Pelagius II who had died of the plague in 590.

These are the external presuppositions for Gregory's work as a bishop of Rome. Markus then turns to retracing Gregory's inner world which he sees as dominated by interpretation of the Bible (ch. iii) and a strong sense of apocalypticism (ch. iv). He strongly emphasises Gregory's sense of the nearness of the end of the world, calling it somewhat overpointedly 'unequalled since the fading of the early Christians' eschatological expectations' (p. 51 – what about the Montanists?). The present world order is coming to an end, little time remains for the faithful to bring their lives to order and for those outside the Church to come into the fold. This explains Gregory's strong emphasis on moral teaching and on mission. Ch. iv also contains a paragraph of wonderfully argued prose

on holiness in which Markus shows the way in which Gregory remodelled the old martyr-story so as to become a narrative celebrating modes of sanctity applicable to his own time and society (pp. 59–63). Markus writes (p. 62):

The real significance of his *Dialogues* lies in Gregory's clear intention to provide an alternative collection of *exempla* of sainthood. Although he thought that you only needed to look round to see that the world was still full of martyrs, Gregory discarded the mould of the martyr-story, and thereby liberated the Italian saint of his day, and saints of succeeding generations, from its tyranny. Hagiography could celebrate models of sanctity conceived and described as autonomous in their own terms.

Markus goes on to characterise Gregory's views of his non-Christian 'neighbours' (ch. v). The Jews were to be converted by preaching only. However, the pagans were, like heretics, considered enemies of the Christian faith who had to be converted by force, if need be: 'The unquestioned model behind Gregory's missionary enterprise was the long-established pattern of the coercive regime of the Christian Roman Empire. Force was acceptable, even a normal means, for the propagation of the faith' (p. 82). In the light of the English experience, however, the pope changed tack. When coercion brought little tangible results, he ordered his missionaries *en route* for England no longer to destroy the shrines of idols, but to turn them into churches. 'Thus, when the people see that their shrines have not been destroyed they will banish error from their hearts and recognising and adoring the true God, they will be more inclined to come to the places they are accustomed to' (*ep.* xi.56, quoted at p. 183). Markus sees in this a 'powerful testimony to Gregory's pastoral flexibility' and speaks of 'a dramatic change of direction in papal missionary strategy' (p. 184) – statements which appear to me slightly exaggerated.

From ch. vi onwards Markus turns to Gregory's political activities, detailing, for example, the conflict with the patriarch of Constantinople over the title 'ecumenical'. The dangerous political situation forced even the pope to get involved in affairs of state and to negotiate with the Lombards (ch. vii). In Markus' account Gregory comes across as a shrewd politician who, by numerous diplomatic *démarches*, was able to save his see from devastation.

To be a pope was also to be steward of an enormous piece of land (the 'patrimony' of St Peter) which had to be properly administered (ch. viii). In Markus' view Gregory was an able administrator. Early in his pontificate, he reorganised the management of these estates by centralising it and replacing lay people by clerics. Chs ix–xii are dedicated to the schism of the Three Chapters, to Gregory's frequently tense relations with the bishop of Ravenna, and to his dealings with the Churches in the most western parts of Europe – Visigothic Spain, the Frankish Church and kingdoms and, of course, England – and, finally, with African Christianity.

Markus concludes his book by defining the novel character of Gregory's pontificate: 'what was unprecedented about Gregory's pontificate was the deeply pondered conception of the pastoral ministry which infused it. The *Pastoral care* is the key, as Gregory intended and knew it to be, to all his work. It represents that fusion of thought and action which gives Gregory his moral seriousness' (p. 204). Given the paucity of evidence available I am not wholly convinced that Gregory's concern for his flock was unprecedented. However, a great pastor he undoubtedly was. He was fearless and, at times, ruthless in defending orthodoxy

and the freedom – both spiritual and physical – of his Church. He was humble in that he dedicated himself entirely to the duties which his office demanded from him without any personal gain.

Gregory the Great and his world is a slim book, written in an untechnical language with sparse footnotes. It is, therefore, easily accessible to the non-specialist. It is also a carefully argued piece of scholarship. At times it even appeared to me as if scholarly caution had kept Markus back from giving a more vivid and daring account. Markus' characterisation of Gregory's religion as 'in every way a religion of detachment' (p. 50) could equally be applied to his own way of writing history. Thus to me Markus' Gregory remains a friendly, albeit slightly aloof person, painted in pastel rather than in oil. Yet this is a small criticism in what will no doubt be the standard monograph on this famous pope for a long time to come.

RHEINISCHE FRIEDRICH-WILHELMS-UNIVERSITÄT,
BONN

WOLFRAM KINZIG

The construction of nationhood. Ethnicity, religion and nationalism. By Adrian Hastings.

(The 1996 Wiles Lectures given at The Queen's University of Belfast.) Pp. xii + 235. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997. £37.50 (cloth), £13.95 (paper). 0 521 59391 3; 0 521 62544 0

Since the fragmentation of Europe, the end of the Cold War and the re-emergence of ethnic conflict among the peoples of the former Soviet empire, the idea of nationalism has again acquired contemporary resonance and a certain fashionability among historians. The political volatility of the Balkan region and the roots of ethnic and religious conflict in the area have inevitably attracted particular attention, perhaps most notably in Noel Malcolm's acclaimed studies of Bosnia and Croatia. Yet interest in the expression of a sense of nationality has not been restricted to scholars of the modern period; medievalists, too, have recently taken an increasing interest in ethnicity and ethnogenesis and have begun to question the orthodoxy that nations are constructions only of the modern world. Adrian Hastings's ambitious and wide-ranging study of the role of religion in nation-building makes an important contribution to these debates by locating an argument across a broad chronology and in comparative geographical context.

Hastings's central thesis is two-fold: that the most important and widely-present factor in the development of nationhood from one or more ethnicities is that of an extensively-used vernacular literature; and that without religion (particularly, but not exclusively, Christianity) nations and nationalism could never have existed. Europe is the setting in which the broad theme is explored, but the argument is defined more tightly with reference to the case of early medieval Anglo-Saxons, the southern Slavs (the inhabitants of the former Yugoslavia) and African Christians. Central to Hastings's case is his rejection of the conventional argument (of Kedourie, Hobsbawm and Gellner among others) that nationalism is a purely modern phenomenon and that the invention of nationalist consciousness must precede the creation of a nation. Hastings argues rather for a cultural understanding of nationhood, that nations emerged not within a modern, capitalistic context, but rather out of a medieval and early

modern experience in which state systems evolved together with the multiplication of vernacular literatures, a literary expansion driven by the Church.

There are levels at which this argument is persuasive, notably in the specifically Christian extension it offers to Benedict Anderson's thesis that a nation is an imagined community that can only be constructed within societies that have mechanisms for the dissemination of an overarching idea of belonging. For Anderson, the spread of such ideas was only possible with the invention of the printing press, so for him too nations remained modern phenomena. But Hastings traces the roots of English national identity (and the creation of an English 'nation-state') back to the Anglo-Saxon period, drawing attention to the role of Christianity in providing a unifying organisation across political divides and to the coherence of its vernacular language, especially when promoted by King Alfred. He offers an engaging comparison between the translating energies of Alfred and the twentieth-century Tanzanian president Julius Nyerere, and reinforces one of his central arguments about the significance of language in binding identities with the example of the way in which Swahili helped to build a Tanzanian nation. Yet elsewhere in Africa, as Hastings admits, this model in which the social impact of the introduction of writing (and translated biblical texts) serves to build identities is often inadequate to explain the emergence of nationalities. Here, and in the case of the Slavs, the role of Islam – itself also a religion of the book – could profitably have been further explored.

The whole question of the other, the outside group in enmity to which national sentiments are constructed, is oddly lacking from most of the essays; in stressing the social and cultural origins of ethnicities and nations, their political (still more their economic) formation is marginalised. Further, there is little consideration of the role of history in nation-making. Medievalists would argue that ethnic identities are constructed primarily through the invention of legends of common descent, often articulated in contexts of political conflict. The sense of a shared past was central to English (and Irish and Welsh or Serbian and Croatian) perceptions of their distinctiveness. King Alfred's invention of an 'English' people rested at least as much on his promotion of a common history for that people (written in the vernacular) as in his translating of Christian texts into English from Latin.

These essays developed from the Wiles Lectures given by Professor Hastings at The Queen's University of Belfast in 1996 and to some extent they offer a commentary on the work of two previous Wiles lecturers, E. Hobsbawm (*Nations and nationalism since 1780*) and R. R. Davies (*Domination and conquest*). However, Hastings approaches his subject not as an historian but as a theologian. His expertise lies particularly in the history of African religions, marked by his much admired 1994 book, *The Church in Africa 1450–1950*. While the breadth of the examples on which he draws puts many historians to shame, his thesis will find few followers among historians. Hastings's achievement lies in his demonstration of the central role of vernacular religious texts in reinforcing cultural and linguistic identities in much of pre-modern Europe and in Africa; that the identities so fostered may meaningfully be called 'nations', remains to be demonstrated.

Proceedings of the Ninth International Congress of Medieval Canon Law. Munich, 13–18 July 1992. (Monumenta Iuris Canonici, Ser. C: Subsidia, 10.) Edited by Peter Landau and Joerg Mueller. Pp. xxxv + 1188 + 27 ill. Vatican City: Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, 1997. 88 210 0675 1

The first name in the list of the six irreplaceable scholars to whose memory this massive tome is dedicated is that of Stephan Kuttner, prime mover and patriarch of the modern study of medieval canon law († 12 August 1996). There too, alas, is that of Gérard Fransen, whose lambent animadversions on ‘Sources et littérature du droit canonique classique’, a virtuoso piece studded with deliciously characteristic *obiter*, constituted the opening address of the ninth of the quadrennial congresses which Kuttner instituted. Their joint departure from the scene provides a stark reminder that study of the subject has passed directly from the Law to the Writings, missing out the Prophets altogether. Of the writings, however, there is no end. Here we have fifty-one papers (twenty-four in German, seventeen in English), most of them suspended above apparatus of footnotes as profound as the poet’s Serbonian bog: a feast of scholarship, in short, and a display containing items of interest for canonists and non-canonists alike. Ranging from Iceland to Purgatory, and from Ivo of Chartres to Lyndwood, Kuttner’s intellectual progeny remain furiously at work amongst the manuscripts. Of the contributions perhaps likely to prove of greatest interest to ecclesiastical historians in general, three in particular may be singled out: those of R. H. Helmholz (‘The universal and the particular in medieval canon law’), A. Padoa-Schioppa (‘Il diritto canonico como scienza nella prospettiva storica: alcune riflessioni’), and J. Van Engen (‘From practical theology to divine law: the work and mind of medieval canonists’). Attention also deserves to be drawn to A. Thompson’s piece on what the decretists had to say about hunting. Like hunters themselves, however, before embarking on this volume, readers will need to sharpen their weapons, in this case their paper-knives. For in comparison with the slim volume containing the Proceedings of the first of these congresses (in Louvain, 1958), this one is a monster. In his paper given at the seventh (in Cambridge, 1984; rev. *ante xli* [1990], 297–9), Brian Tierney remarked on the ‘vast elephantine commentaries’ produced by the canonists of the period of the Great Schism and after. But, as Tierney also remarked, those commentaries ‘touched on every aspect of medieval religious and social life’. Can the same be said about the proceedings of the ninth congress? Is the subject as securely anchored as once it seemed to be in the society of which the law to whose study it is dedicated was either the key or the efflorescence? Or is it in danger of throttling itself, metaphorically re-enacting the reformers’ account of the fate of the medieval Church itself at the canonists’ own hands? Of the papers read at the seventh congress, twenty-seven were published. Two congresses on, that number has almost doubled. Like so much of what this volume contains, it makes you think.

ST JOHN’S COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

PETER LINEHAN

The apocryphal gospels of Mary in Anglo-Saxon England. By Mary Clayton. (Cambridge Studies in Anglo-Saxon England, 26.) Pp. xi + 355. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998. £45. 0 521 58168 0

Two linked but separable projects are here combined under one title. The first, congruous with the series in which the volume appears, is an edition and translation of three Old English texts from the general corpus of para-canonical stories about the Virgin Mary: an infancy narrative (based on the *Gospel of Pseudo-Matthew*) and two homilies on what is generally called her assumption, the first an abbreviated version of one of the Latin *Transitus* accounts and the other (found among the Blickling Homilies, but the text here based rather on a Cambridge manuscript) so weird in its rendering of the putative Latin *Transitus*-original as to be sometimes unintelligible. These texts are presented with Old and modern English on facing pages and with commentary that speaks extensively to the texts from which the vernacular versions seem to have been taken (in no case is an exact original identifiable; some relevant or possible Latin texts are printed in an appendix). They are introduced by what is in effect a separate monograph, a staggeringly thorough investigation of the Christian 'apocryphal' stories of Mary's birth and childhood, then of her death and assumption, going back to the Syriac roots and pushing hard through the Greek and finally the more immediately relevant Latin traditions. With a somewhat dogged thoroughness, the author analyses strata, pursues parallels and argues with previous scholarship. The result deserves to be known as the fullest English-language treatment of this vast Marian subject, quite apart from any Anglo-Saxon interest. That interest is of course paramount, and here it is a bit disappointing that the obvious big question – who introduced this material into England and why (can anything be conjectured about the newly highlighted school of Theodore?) – is largely ignored. But for levels of detail comparable to those found in great Germanic series devoted both to Old English philology and to early Christian literature, Clayton's achievement is vastly impressive. Good sense is preached about the dialectical convolutions of Old English, and there are interesting reflections (pp. 157–61) about the responsibilities of an editor – all the more necessary because of the extensive emendations she has supplied for the second text and the trickiness of dealing with the faulty archetype that must underlie the first text. It is no exaggeration to call this work exhaustive.

UNIVERSITY OF NORTH CAROLINA,
CHAPEL HILL

RICHARD W. PFAFF

Diplomacy of the letter and the cross. Photios, Bulgaria and the papacy. 860s–880s. By Liliana Simeonova. (Classical and Byzantine Monographs, 41.) Pp. vii + 434. Amsterdam: Adolf M. Hakkert, 1998. 90 256 0638 5; 90 256 1121 4

Although precipitated by issues of the papal primacy and correct procedure for electing patriarchs, the clash between Pope Nicholas I and Patriarch Photius occurred around the time that Khan Boris of Bulgaria was overtly contemplating conversion to Christianity. It thus offered new grounds for disagreement as well as openings for self-aggrandisement. With the actual conversion of Boris,

probably in 864, what might have been a fairly traditional form of dispute gained a fresh dimension. Evangelising Bulgaria provided a kind of 'test-bed' for eastern and western churchmen to consider one another's divergent usages and to denounce unfamiliar rites or pronouncements as erroneous, while Boris's questions to Nicholas I concerning the evident discrepancies poured oil on the flames. Photius proceeded to condemn as heretical the Latin missionaries' teachings, among them the addition of the *filioque* clause to the Nicene creed, while Nicholas I called upon the Frankish Churches to join with him 'like an army in battle array' and take a stand against 'the Greek insanity'. Contingent and case-specific as these manoeuvres were, they showed up real divergences of practice and made them, in effect, rallying-points and signifiers of allegiance. Liliana Simeonova recounts the course of this dispute with great skill, unpicking the tangled strands of emulation and common interest against the broader background of papal aspirations and Byzantine imperial resurgence. A guiding theme is the simple fact that two outsize personalities graced the sees of Rome and Constantinople in the 860s: Simeonova suggests that Photius' missionary initiatives were triggered by his domestic political concerns and desire to steal some thunder from Nicholas's ecumenical claims. Her point that no previous patriarch had shown such personal commitment to mission work is well made, but her argument needs to take into account the likelihood that the Khazars converted to Judaism in or just after 861 and that this event focused Byzantine interest on the religious persuasions of other peoples. Perhaps most convincing is Simeonova's demonstration of the pivotal significance of Boris and his ambitions for his polity. As she observes, the switch made by Boris in 866 away from Byzantium towards the papacy and Louis the German is not so surprising. Boris showed consistent signs of seeking a monotheistic religion with an organised priesthood on terms of his own choosing, essentially a head-priest answerable to himself. He repeatedly played off East Frankish and Byzantine rulers as well as eastern and western hierarchs to this end, gaining in 870 a settlement with Byzantium that appears to have granted him *de facto* supervision over an archbishop. Once satisfied on this score, he proved deaf to subsequent papal threats and blandishments and this in turn assuaged much of the *animus* in the confrontation between Rome and Constantinople. Simeonova's authoritative yet lively study demonstrates convincingly the importance of the confrontation over Bulgaria in honing the papacy's ideology and stimulating its interest in mission work elsewhere, such as in central Europe. No less suggestive is her reassessment of Photius' role in engaging the Byzantine 'establishment' more actively in missionary ventures.

KEW

JONATHAN SHEPARD

Anglo-Saxon conversations. The colloquies of Ælfric Bata. Edited by Scott Gwara, translated with an introduction by David W. Porter. Pp. xii + 209. Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 1997. £45. 0 85115 699 1

Tenth/eleventh-century southern England, or perhaps more accurately southern Britain, is apparently the only part of the west from which there are surviving

‘conversational manuals’ (*colloquia*, although there seems to be no manuscript basis for such a usage) designed for the ‘teaching of Latin as a second language’ in religious communities. Ælfric of Eynsham’s original version of one of them (subsequently twice[?] revised by a pupil) has enjoyed a fortuitous fame because its early vernacular gloss has made it a popular language-teaching text. Those ‘in a somewhat coarser strain’ (the phrase is David Knowles’s) by that same pupil, Ælfric *Bata*, are less familiar because of the scarcity of W. H. Stevenson’s posthumously-published edition. They have now been admirably re-edited from the unique manuscript (St John’s College, Oxford, ms 154, Ker no. 362) in two awkwardly-overlapping publications, the one under review, in which a (modern) English translation accompanies Gwara’s texts of the two that are unequivocally *Bata*’s, and his much more modestly priced one of 1996 in the *Toronto Medieval Latin Texts*: here they are accompanied by texts of another colloquy also uniquely in the St John’s manuscript, and of the earlier and more elevated *colloquium hispericum* in the Bodleian manuscript, ms Bodley 865. Porter’s seventy-page introduction, which does not always improve on or entirely supersede Gwara’s shorter 1996 one, both puts *Bata*’s colloquies in their historical and literary contexts and explores their relationship with modern approaches to language teaching. But, as Porter acknowledges, puzzles remain. Some of the conversational expressions would presumably have had a long history in religious communities (‘Mihi videtur quod vespertina hora prope sit modo’ or ‘Eamus modo in lectulos nostros, ita tempus est’); others could easily have been (re-)composed from known lexica (‘Pergamus omnes simul iocare foris cum ... pila nostra seu trocho nostro’, although *Bata* seems – despite Porter – to have thought that *trochum* was the Latin word for a spinning-top and not a hoop). Other sections necessarily originated in some written source, like the – second- or third-hand – listings of trees or of vegetables and herbs, where even with the help of other texts the main problem for both *magister* and pupils would presumably have been to decide to which plants, and their current OE names, they corresponded. (‘Come forward those who can translate correctly *dilla* and *anetum* and then point out tansy, water agrimony and lesser centaury.’) But where did *Bata* find his succession of scatological terms (p. 138)? And did he include them in his putative oral teaching because he knew that his pupils were using English four-letter words in the playground? Like the extended exchanges about ‘laddish’ drinking by both seniors and juniors, this is not quite the picture of late Anglo-Saxon reformed monasticism to which we are accustomed.

UNIVERSITY OF ST ANDREWS

D. A. BULLOUGH

Peterskirchen in Sachsen. Ein patrozinienkundlicher Beitrag zum Land zwischen Saale und Neisse bis an den Ausgang des Hochmittelalters. By Gerhard Graf. (Europäische Hochschulschriften, 3. Geschichte und ihre Hilfswissenschaften, 834.) Pp. 192. Frankfurt-am-Main: Peter Lang, 1999. DM 65 (£24). 3 631 34709 X; 0531 7320

The purpose of this study is the reconstruction of early ecclesiastical organisation in Saxony, in particular in the area between the rivers Saale and

Neisse, based on the analysis of church dedications. Numerous examples from different regions of central and southern Europe enable the author to substantiate his assumption that dedications to St Peter, who was seen as guardian and protector of the Church, are an indication of early churches in recently Christianised areas. This approach is combined with the analysis of archaeological reports and the study of place names, but methodological difficulties, for example the disappearance of churches, the lack of information on dedications in the case of a number of mendicant churches or later changes to other patron saints, are very difficult to overcome and lead to the observation that there are too few safely identified dedications to allow a reconstruction of the early ecclesiastical structures (p. 145). With Walter Schlesinger's seminal work as a starting-point the author incorporates a wealth of more recent research, in particular more local and regional studies, adding his own expertise on churches and chapels in or near fortifications, on distribution patterns of churches dedicated to St James, patron saint of travellers, merchants and pilgrims and on St. Nicholas, patron saint of miners, a group of increasing importance after the first discovery of silver near Freiberg in 1168. Even though the author's model of churches in strategically important locations serving large regional parishes seems to be plausible, the lack of evidence means that many of the observations and conclusions can only be tentative and the geographical fragmentation of the area studied begs the question whether the phenomenon really was universal pattern. While the author himself makes good use of historical maps he unfortunately fails to provide his readers with this kind of assistance although he more than once emphasises their importance as a source for settlement studies (pp. 153, 154).

BIRMINGHAM

JENS RÖHRKASTEN

History of the Catholic diocese of Dublin. Edited by James Kelly and Dáire Keogh.

Pp. x + 390 + 18 plates. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2000 (1999). £30.
1 85182 248 8

There was a time when diocesan histories were written by devoted clergy or antiquaries. Carrigan on Ossory, Cogan on Meath, O'Lavery for Down and Connor, Bolster on Cork, Murphy on Killaloe and Begley treating of Limerick all run to several volumes. Dublin, despite – or perhaps because – of its size and importance in the religious life of Catholic Ireland, has resisted such treatment. Now, a team of sixteen scholars has been assembled to reconstruct its history. The result is inevitably uneven, given variations in the amount of evidence and the authors' approaches. Yet, despite the disclaimer of the editor, James Kelly, that the volume cannot be comprehensive, it uses the local to investigate national and international developments. Most contributors concentrate on structures and clerical personnel, but the laity are not altogether overlooked. The three opening chapters expertly sift the credible from the credulous. Archaeology, place names, settlement patterns, sparse charters: all are enlisted to elucidate an inevitably shadowy era. Here, as throughout much of the collection, the state is shown as a potent influence. Two cathedrals were founded, and many of the bishops and

beneficed priests served the Anglo-Norman administration. The documentation thickens in the sixteenth century. James Murray and Colm Lennon, contrasting the chilliness towards Protestant evangelism with the friendly embrace of Tridentine Catholicism, reflect on the knotty question of why the Reformation failed in Ireland. Next, Raymond Gillespie, with characteristic brio, ranges over lay devotion in Stuart Dublin, a subject which he has made very much his own. It is taken up again by Maurice Hartigan, who examines the sodalities, confraternities and sometimes unauthorised cults of the 1920s and 1930s. The condition of the Church during the 'penal era' of the eighteenth century is also explored authoritatively and sensitively by the two editors and Fr Hugh Fenning. None minimises the impediments placed by the law in the way of the free exercise of Catholicism, but each shows the vitality and variety of religious activity. Some manifestations were physical: church buildings and their furnishings. This theme affords matter for two separate chapters: on the Greek revival pro-cathedral, erected in the 1820s, and the purpose-built archiepiscopal residence in the suburbs. What women did, chiefly through the religious orders, charities and schooling, although mentioned in several chapters, is the sole subject of only one. Contributions which discuss individual archbishops – Troy, Murray, Cullen and McQuaid – show how nationalist politics and ecclesiastical affairs interlocked. One dominant interpretation – that mid nineteenth-century Irish Catholicism witnessed a devotional revolution – is questioned, usually obliquely. Some features of spiritual renewal and institutional regeneration are discerned earlier; others, like the expanded opportunities for lay involvement, are fully apparent only in the 1930s. The late nineteenth century receives disappointingly little attention. More understandably, none of the authors engages with the obvious issue at the end of the twentieth century: the retreat from organised religion, particularly in metropolitan Ireland. But such gaps serve to remind us of the value of what is gathered into this collection. Thanks to its excellence, Dublin will henceforward be used confidently to support or dispute theories relating to the religious life of all Ireland, Britain and, indeed, other parts of Christendom.

HERTFORD COLLEGE
OXFORD

T. C. BARNARD

The sun in the church. Cathedrals as solar observatories. By J. L. Heilbron. Pp. ix + 366 incl. 148 figs. and 15 tables + 8 colour plates. Cambridge, Mass–London: Harvard University Press, 1999. £21.95. 0 674 85433 0

The central theme of this handsome book is the problem of keeping a precise track of time by astronomical observations, with particular reference to the determination of the dates of church festivals. Professor Heilbron weaves an interdisciplinary web, encompassing church history, the emergence of modern science as we know it, and how cathedrals could be used as observatories to track the complex motion of the earth about the sun.

The core of the book concerns the use of the *meridiana*, which was built into the structures of certain great cathedrals, the most renowned in the cathedral of San Petronio in Bologna, in order to keep track of the apparent motion of the sun

throughout the year. This motion is far from simple because of the elliptical orbit of the earth about the sun and the fact that the earth's equator is inclined at an angle of 23.5 degrees to the plane of its orbit about the sun. Furthermore, the rotational axis of the earth changes gradually, what is known as the precession of the equinoxes.

Laying out the *meridiana* involved placing a small aperture in the dome of a cathedral aligned with a north-south line, so that ideally, at midday, the image of the sun would pass across the line and establish noon precisely. The use of cathedrals had the great advantage of providing a fixed geometry, with a large distance between the aperture and the straight line on the floor. The theory appears straightforward, but its historical working out can only be politely described as a nightmare.

Professor Heilbron, a historian of science of great distinction, has taken up the challenge of explaining accurately, and with enthusiasm, this remarkable story. From the astronomical point of view, his exposition of the motions of the sun, moon and earth is as clear as any I have seen in print and is accessible even to those who feel their trigonometry might not be up to the job. The story is set against the turbulent political history of the relations between the Catholic Church and science. Heilbron makes the important point that the Church was the major sponsor of these scientific endeavours, treading carefully the fine line between Copernicanism and the received wisdom of the church Fathers.

This book has the feel of an interdisciplinary course at an American university, with the explicit intention of bridging the gaps between the sciences, the history and philosophy of science, church and political history and the humanities. The writing is best described as 'bouncy', with a touch of irreverent exuberance, which would appeal to an undergraduate audience. Readers of this JOURNAL should be warned that they will encounter remarks such as Paul III's 'participation in the usual vices of Renaissance Popes (mistresses, ... nepotism, ... and parties ... with dancing girls ...)', and 'In a perfect gesture of his split personality, he commissioned the greatest artist of the age to paint the *Last Judgement* in the fun-loving Vatican palace.'

These remarks should not be allowed to detract from the intellectual weight and authority of this volume. It makes a serious, and in my view, wholly successful attempt to bridge the gap between the sciences and the humanities, indicating the pitfalls and triumphs of both, by concentrating on the solution of one scientific problem which was of the greatest significance for the Church.

DEPARTMENT OF PHYSICS,
UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE

MALCOLM LONGAIR

Treasures from the storeroom. Medieval religion and the eucharist. By Gary Macy.
(A Pueblo Book.) Pp. xxi + 201. Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 1999.
\$24.95 (paper). 0 8146 6053 3

In a series of eight articles written between 1984 and 1997 – some of them published in places not easy to reach – Gary Macy pursues, with enlightening effect, the discovery he made in his *The theologies of the eucharist in the early scholastic*

period (1984) that the medieval understanding of what goes on in the eucharist is manifold. The articles are unified in their subject matter, but also in an animus against the reduction of the cornucopia of past theologies by a reading which runs backwards from, in this case, the account of the eucharist (allegedly) given at Trent. The author makes his point as much as anything through his work on unpublished manuscripts and in some of the less frequented back-rooms of the *Patrologia latina*, and this aspect of the book is in itself an invitation to research. But he has also found a nerve along which the diverse theologies play. What came to be called Real Presence, the metaphysics of change in the species of the eucharist, the aspect sanctioned by Aquinas and in more recent times often taken as doctrinal orthodoxy, was felt, particularly in a strain of thought passing from the school of Laon and Hugh of St Victor and then developed by the Franciscans Alexander of Hales and St Bonaventure, to be less compelling (however true) than the view of the eucharist as a sign which, as sign, could only be understood by human intellect. Macy's judgement is that this view, and a certain openness in the definition of 'transubstantiation', was more characteristic than the stress laid by Aquinas on objective metaphysical change (see esp. chs, iii, v). In a review of the content of commentaries on the mass (twelfth–thirteenth centuries) this theology of sign is picked up again, in a genre which suggests that it was not confined to the highbrow (ch. vii); it may even have been the highbrow expression of a growing tendency within congregations to practise forms of devotional communion which did not require reception of the bread and wine (ch. viii). This collection is indeed full of good things. There are interesting reflections too on the aetiology of a heresy ('Berengar's legacy as heresiarch'), and the idea of the 'Church' in the Middle Ages. The force of the connection sketched between theologies and shifts in the use of ritual (ch. viii projects this back across some of the other articles) is just one reason to hope that the author has in mind a book which will draw themes together more than a group of articles can, and which might give further context, theological and otherwise, to these theologies of the eucharist.

WINCHESTER

P. CRAMER

Medieval music as medieval exegesis. By William T. Flynn. (Studies in Liturgical Musicology, 8.) Pp. xxii+271 incl. 7 tables. Lanham, MD–London: Scarecrow Press, 1999. £52.25. 0 8108 3656 4

In recent years heightened concern for the meaning and social function of music has caused many musicologists to adopt interdisciplinary strategies that seek to locate musical developments within their cultural context, thereby often producing studies of interest to a broad range of scholars. The present work by William T. Flynn is just such a study, in which its author draws on a variety of disciplines in order to show how eleventh-century liturgy – broadly conceived as an indivisible union of text, music, action and mystagogy – 'became the principal locus for the interpretation, proclamation and interpretation of scripture' (p. 107). Flynn begins with three preparatory chapters that serve to establish a hermeneutical framework for the study of festal masses from the Autun Troper

that concludes his book. In chapter i, which is primarily concerned with the interpretation of sung liturgical texts, he develops a partially circumstantial case for 'how principles derived from the grammatical theory of ornamental language could have governed the production of new compositions for the liturgy' (p. 43). He tries to show not only how *tropi*, *prosa* and *laudes* conform to conceptions of ornamental speech from eleventh-century grammar and rhetoric, but also how their glossing of scriptural texts extends beyond Henri de Lubac's four-fold scheme of exegesis to embrace a fifth 'grammatical' mode of exegesis articulated by Bede. In the next chapter Flynn notes parallels between medieval theories of music and grammar, leading him to suggest that melodic and verbal syntax were functionally interchangeable in their ability to achieve rhetorical effects through musical or textual ornament. References to Amalarius of Metz and John of Avranches in chapter iii enrich an excellent discussion of the meaning and shape of the liturgy as a whole, in which he demonstrates how additions to the canonical texts of the mass were distributed within the Autun Troper to create a sliding scale of liturgical solemnity. Flynn pursues the same interdisciplinary approach in his detailed expositions of the Christmas and Easter masses, although not without occasional missteps. Evident unfamiliarity with the Greek patristic designation of Adam as the 'first-formed' ('protoplastos') man leads him to insert 'protoplasm' into a translation of a hymn by Rabanus Maurus (p. 159). A more serious error occurs with regard to what Flynn calls the 'festal shaping' of scriptural texts quoted in the liturgy. The textual differences between the introit *Puer natus* and the Vulgate's version of Isaiah ix. 6, discussed at length at pp. 143–5, can be explained simply by the fact that the former is drawn from an 'Old Latin' translation of the Greek Septuagint. In general, however, this book may be recommended as an illuminating example of the new genre of 'liturgical musicology'.

ST PETER'S COLLEGE,
OXFORD

ALEXANDER LINGAS

East and west in the crusader states. Context – contacts – confrontations, II: Acta of the congress held at Hernen Castle in May 1997. Edited by Krijnie Ciggaar and Herman Teule. (Orientalia Lovaniensia Analecta, 92.) Pp. xiii + 222 incl. 19 ills. Louvain: Uitgeverij Peeters, 1999. B.Fr. 1,450. 90 429 0786 X

This collection represents papers from the second congress on the history of the crusades held at Hernen Castle in the Netherlands. The volume has an emphasis on religious and cultural studies and contains nine papers and one translated poem, and it is this latter text and its associated essay that demand most attention. Theo Maarten van Lint has provided an interpretive paper and a translation of Nerses Shnorhali's 'Lament on Edessa', an Armenian poem written in 1145–6 after the capture of the Latin-ruled city in December 1144 by Zengi, the Muslim *atabeg* of Aleppo and Mosul. Nerses was an important Armenian churchman and diplomat who lived 1102–73. This is the first full English translation of the 'Lament' which has 1,046 verses. The key themes of the work are those of consolation and encouragement. The author explains that God has

permitted such a terrible calamity to take place in order to remind the Edessans of their sins and to encourage them to return to a better life. The city of Edessa is depicted as a widow mourning her slain husband and lost children. Nerses was a great believer in ecumenism and the idea of Christian unity pervades his work. The poet calls on all Christians to unite and ends by looking expectantly to the people of the west (through the Second Crusade) to defeat Zengi and avenge the loss of the city. The translation is easy to read and there are vivid and compelling descriptions of the siege itself, the suffering of the defenders and the brutality of Zengi's treatment of the Christians. While some of these incidents are a little more stylised than other contemporary accounts, there is little reason to doubt the poem's basic accuracy. It is also intriguing – and previously unnoticed – to see, in a work written by a Christian, Zengi depicted as taking the mantle of the holy warrior on himself at an early, but crucial, stage in the revival of the *jihad*. Van Lint's introductory essay is vital in setting Nerses in his proper context, but one aspect of his explanation of the meaning of the poem is flawed. He argues that the demonisation of the Muslims was deliberately emphasised to tie in with the message that crusade leaders in the west used – yet he chooses to compare Nerses's text (1145–6) with the ideas of Pope Innocent III (1198–1216). Given the evolution of crusading over this period, surely the more valid parallel would have been to place Nerses alongside his contemporaries, St Bernard, Pope Eugenius III and Peter the Venerable? Notwithstanding this, Van Lint easily succeeds in disproving Steven Runciman's dismissive statement that the text was 'lacking in historical interest' and the provision of an accessible version of this important work is to be welcomed strongly. The pick of the other papers in the volume also reflect a concern with church unity. Bernard Hamilton's piece on Patriarch Aimery of Limoges of Antioch (c. 1142–c. 1196) and Herman Teule's discussion of ecumenical attitudes in the Jacobite Church both show the efforts of Christian churchmen in northern Syria to find common ground amidst the tensions of the religious and political melting-pot of northern Syria. This is an interesting, if uneven, collection (a couple of the papers are very slight indeed), that offers an important and previously under-emphasised perspective on Latin rule in the Levant.

ROYAL HOLLOWAY COLLEGE,
LONDON

JONATHAN PHILLIPS

The Atina dossier of Peter the Deacon of Monte Cassino. A hagiographical romance of the twelfth century. By Herbert Bloch. (Studi e Testi, 346.) Pp. 351 + 21 plates and 7 maps. Vatican City: Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, 1998. 88 210 0682 4
The Ecclesiae atinatis historia of Marcantonio Palombo (Codd. Vat. Lat. 15184–15186). 2 vols. Edited by Carmela Virgilio Franklin (with Herbert Bloch). (Studi e Testi, 374, 375.) Pp. 391 incl. 6 genealogical tables + 25 plates; 397–706 + 7 maps. Vatican City: Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, 1996. 88 210 0667 0; 88 210 0670 0

Peter the Deacon was just twenty-one, and at the outset of his career as scholar, historian, archivist and seemingly pathological liar, when he was forced to leave

the abbey of Monte Cassino and take refuge from its internal disputes in the nearby town of Atina. He remained there for some two years, and apparently retained a vivid sense of the kindness with which he had been received. In recompense, over a period of fifteen or more years thereafter he created an entirely fictional history for the town, commencing with its alleged foundation by Saturn, the consecration of its first bishop by St Peter, the martyrdom of that bishop and various of his disciples by the Roman authorities, and continuing with the destruction of the town by the Emperor Arcadius and its subsequent rebuilding. The history of its (non-existent) bishopric was then traced down to the supposed last incumbent in the late eleventh century. Peter in fact created an entire dossier of hagiographical texts, sermons, hymns and pseudo-historical works, one manuscript of which, quite possibly the only one, was preserved at Atina, probably in the collegiate church of St Maria which in the twelfth century was a dependency of Monte Cassino.

Parts of this dossier have been known to scholars since the time of Cardinal Baronius, himself a native of Sora, to whose bishopric Atina had in reality been subject during the early and central Middle Ages. A number of the texts were published as genuine by Ughelli and in the *Acta sanctorum*, but Peter the Deacon's role in creating this mythical history was first revealed by Erich Caspar in his rightly well-known monograph of 1909. Caspar was, however, dependent on the texts then in print (which amounted to only about half of those which Professor Bloch has now edited in this volume). He believed that what Peter had done was to extend and embroider an historical record for which there was at least some genuine basis. He accepted, for example, that Atina had once been a bishopric. However, as Bloch now conclusively demonstrates, what Peter did was to use his (for the time) unrivalled knowledge of ancient Rome to invent the entire 'history' of Atina from scratch. Insofar as any of his saints existed, they were actually martyred in Romania, not southern Italy, the descriptions of the supposed buildings of ancient Atina were modelled on those of Rome and the more recent bishops were actually those of Sora.

The (presumably original) manuscript of this dossier, written in the Beneventan script, still existed at the end of the sixteenth century, although it was lost soon afterwards. That most, probably almost all, of its contents has been preserved was due to two local antiquaries, Luigi Galeota, who copied significant parts of it in 1563, and his great-nephew, Marcantonio Palombo (1570/5–1640). The latter's history of Atina, continuing down to his own times, has now been edited by a pupil of Bloch's, Carmella Franklin. Palombo's preparatory material for his history comprised no fewer than four volumes of transcribed sources, although only one of these, the first – Peter the Deacon's texts – now survives. (Another volume, which was examined by Mommsen in search of epigraphic material in 1876, was destroyed during the Second World War.) A copy of Galeota's material, made under the supervision of Baronius' assistant Costantino Caietano in 1602, subsequently found its way to the Bollandists in Brussels, and remains as an independent witness to most of the texts preserved by Palombo. Since its sources have survived, the earlier parts of the latter's history are of limited interest; although it appears that some of Peter's compositions were still used in the local liturgy in the seventeenth century – by which time it was unhesitatingly accepted that his fictional St Mark the Galilean was the founder

of the church of Atina. The later parts of the history are, however, of real interest in showing both the secular and religious life in a small town in the kingdom of Naples in the era of the Counter-Reformation. Palombo himself was a man of some learning, educated as a lawyer at Naples, and active in the confraternity of S. Marco (the most important of the four that existed in seventeenth-century Atina) and also in the bitter local politics of his native town. He records that he himself twice escaped assassination attempts. An important aspect of these disputes was the attempt by the provost and canons of S. Maria to vindicate the independence of their church from the bishop of Sora (a dispute which had begun c. 1350 and continued until the collegiate church's pretensions were brought to an end by papal action in 1698). Here the supposed episcopal history could explain why this church ought to be one *nullius diocesis*.

Palombo himself was devout – he recorded with approval the foundation of a new local confraternity dedicated to S. Carlo Borromeo – pro-papal and patriotic in a narrow local sense. There was no criticism of Spanish rule, except perhaps by implication because of its failure to suppress the banditry which was an endemic scourge of the region, although Palombo appears to have considered this to be almost beyond human capability. One can see why he might have been interested in the glorious (albeit unbeknown to him mythical) history of his native town and its church. What Bloch never quite explains is why Peter the Deacon devoted so much time and effort to creating this history, and to revising, even if often very clumsily, his earlier work, which was not after all directly linked to his own monastery. Was this just for his own amusement, and if not what audience did he expect for these texts? However, Bloch adds important evidence for those studying the puzzle that Peter the Deacon poses, and his introduction can be recommended to students as a succinct overview of the twelfth-century forger and romancer to whom Herbert Bloch has devoted more than half a century of study.

UNIVERSITY OF LEEDS

G. A. LOUD

Varia antiochena. Studien zum Kreuzfahrerfürstentum Antiochiai im 12. und frühen 13. Jahrhundert. By Hans Eberhard Mayer. (Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Studien und Texte, 6.) Pp. 227. Hanover: Hahnsche Buchhandlung, 1993. DM 60. 3 7752 5406 4

This important collection of twelve essays dealing with the history of the Frankish principality of Antioch is dedicated to the memory of the great historian of the northern crusader states, Claude Cahen, who died in 1991. While collecting materials for his authoritative work, *Die Kanzlei der lateinischen Könige von Jerusalem* (Hanover 1996), Mayer also examined the relatively few surviving documents relating to Antioch and most of the essays in this volume are the products of that research. Arguably the most important contribution is that on the chancery of the princes of Antioch, which covers the period from the foundation of the state to the expulsion of Prince Raymond-Roupen in 1219, after which Antioch was effectively governed from Tripoli. In another essay Mayer deals with the systems of dating used in the chancery of Bohemond III (1164–1201). He has also printed

a new edition of five Antiochene charters, dating from 1134 to 1186; four of them have only been calendared hitherto, while the fifth was printed in 1719. In some of the other essays Mayer uses his research on the chancery to elucidate controversial points in Antiochene social and political history. He argues that when Orthodox monasteries there and in other parts of the crusader states were placed under the control of Frankish laymen or of the military orders, they were held in accordance with the Byzantine tradition of *charisticium* (the appointment of lay patrons of religious houses). He also shows conclusively that the legatine council which deposed the Latin patriarch, Ralph of Domfront, met in December 1140; and that Bohemond III's personal rule did not begin until the spring of 1164. In the essay 'Antiochia 1161-2' he considers the evidence on how the principality was ruled during Bohemond's minority. His conclusions are for the most part persuasive, though his attempt to show that John Cinnamus was wrong in dating the marriage of Manuel Comnenus and Maria of Antioch to Christmas Day 1161 and that it really took place in 1162 has not found favour with Byzantine scholars. Despite his long reign Bohemond III has hitherto been a neglected figure in the history of the crusader states, so Mayer's survey article about his relations with the kingdom of Jerusalem is particularly welcome, as is his detailed examination of the baronial revolt against Bohemond which took place in 1181 in which the Le Mazoir lords of Margat played a leading role. As Mayer shows, they later paid a heavy price for this when, in 1186, their fief was transferred to the Knights of St John in return for a derisory money payment. Finally Mayer shows that it was Bohemond III's younger son Bohemond, not his elder son Raymond, who took over the government of the county of Tripoli after the death of Raymond III in 1187, and explains how the legend of a Count Raymond IV of Tripoli arose. Overall this learned and lucid collection makes a very important contribution to our understanding of the history of Antioch in the twelfth century particularly during the long reign of Bohemond III.

UNIVERSITY OF NOTTINGHAM

BERNARD HAMILTON

Pope Innocent III and his world. Edited by John C. Moore. Pp. xix + 340. Aldershot-Brookfield-Sydney: Ashgate (for Hofstra University), 1999. £49.50. 1 84014 646 X

The international conference of historians held at Rome in 1998 to mark the 800th anniversary of Innocent III's election to the papacy was anticipated the previous year by a conference at Hofstra University, of which this collection of essays by twenty-three scholars is the product. While historians have long recognised Innocent's central importance in the polity of medieval Christendom, the tendency of research in the last thirty years has been to focus on his life and intellectual formation before his election and on the pastoral activity of his pontificate, both interests that are fully represented in this volume. Edward Peters here speculates about the identity of Innocent's teachers during his years at the Paris schools; and Richard Kay, while lamenting the obscurity of his academic pupillage at Bologna, concludes from an examination of his treatise on *Nuptials* that he had no professional training in canon law, but that he had an up-

to-date acquaintance with discussion in the schools of theology, a conclusion that concurs with that of Christopher Egger's essay on Innocent's other theological writings. Among eight essayists dealing with pastoral aspects of his pontificate, Brenda Bolton exploits the hitherto neglected list of Innocent's gifts to the city of Rome, to show how his building enterprises, notably that of the hospital of Santo Spirito in Sassia, and his plans for the convent of San Sisto, expressed his concern for the poor and sick and for the religious needs of women. His esteem for the Cistercians and his preoccupation with the reform of Benedictine monasticism are singled out in an essay by Gillian Murphy on his interest in Irish monasteries. One of Innocent's shrewdest pastoral decisions was to accept and foster new evangelical movements – those of the Trinitarians and the Friars Minor – and to reinstate the Humiliati and the orthodox wing of the Waldenses, proceedings that are the subject of an interesting essay by Frances Andrews, in which she observes that in all these cases Innocent's approval was obtained through the intervention of prelates in personal touch with the evangelists in the localities. Four essays are devoted to the theme of papal power, one of which, by Deirdre Courtney-Batson, subjects the decretal *Venerabilem* to an acute and learned analysis and shows that the decretalists drew from it the lesson that papal claims to jurisdiction *in temporalibus*, especially in matters of inheritance, were limited. Other contributions focus upon Innocent's relationship with the non-Christian world of Islam and Jewry. In one of these Robert Chazan argues that Innocent was not the arch-enemy of Jews, whom he sought to protect, but that his decrees requiring them to wear a distinctive dress reinforced rather than initiated the traditional apartheid between Christians and Jews, especially in matters of marriage and sex. This volume is a welcome and distinguished contribution to the swelling volume of Innocentian scholarship.

UNIVERSITY OF LONDON

C. H. LAWRENCE

Jacopone da Todi. Poesia, mistica, rivolta nell'Italia del medioevo. By Franco Suitner. (Universale, 29.) Pp. 277. Rome: Donzelli, 1999. L. 22,000 (paper). 88 7989 480 3

Hymns ancient and modern mentions Jacopone da Todi (c. 1233–1306) as the supposed author of the 'Stabat Mater', an attribution doubtful but felicitous. Not only does it flag Jacopone's existence in a way nothing else could (since most of his writings are in a dialect few people read), but it picks on the most consistent theme of his poetry, the Passion, understood in a way peculiarly Franciscan. What a mere attribution cannot do is hint at the turmoil in the poet's life. This turmoil left only indefinite and conflicting traditions about him, and it is the merit of this new biography that it makes more sense of these traditions than any previous treatment. The author is a professor of medieval Italian at the Ca' Foscari University of Venice and has spent many years thinking and talking about Jacopone. It shows. The book is concise and obsessively readable, despite – even partly because of – its many dialect quotations.

Jacopo (to use his baptismal name) was born in Todi no later than 1234, probably into the minor noble family of Benedetti, and grew up to be a notary

and/or court proctor, and to serve on the city council. In 1268, when he was about thirty-four, Jacopo's widely-respected wife was at a ball when the floor collapsed, killing her. Together with the discovery that she had been wearing a penitential garment under her finery, this sudden bereavement caused Jacopo to drop his legal career and become a *bizzoco*, or penitent 'fool', wandering round Todi or sitting in the piazza, in rags, intermittently exchanging with passers-by a kind of spiritual repartee much loved in communes then (immortalised in the *Decameron*). Jacopone – the diminutive became normal from then on – remained a *bizzoco* for ten years. In 1278 he joined the local Franciscan convent, San Fortunato, as a recruit all the more welcome for his noble and professional background, mature age (by then he was in the late forties) and an already unmistakable poetic talent.

Jacopone had begun writing poetry probably before his conversion in 1268. That was a year or two before the fateful meeting of Beatrice and the young Dante, a hundred miles to the north. The lives of Jacopone and Dante have instructive similarities and differences. Both would oppose Pope Boniface VIII (1294–1303), to their cost; both, fluent in Latin, chose to write poetry in their local vernaculars, for a mixture of purposes – theological, polemical and autobiographical; and both won posthumous honour in their home towns. But Jacopone, unlike Dante, won his local honour as a saint, and for the same reason we know less of him. He lived close to the ground – literally, for five years in later life, spent in an underground prison in Todi – but also metaphorically. Jacopone's dialect, Umbrian, was one Dante thought 'ugly', and it would lose out to Tuscan as the language for literary high-fliers. That was an additional reason why Jacopone chose it, deliberately shutting the door on any literary ambition other than that of speaking to the humblest of his compatriots (he never left Umbria further than to go to Rome). Even Jacopone's poetic genre stayed close to the ground. It was his own set of variations on the *lauda*, the vernacular form consecrated by St Francis's *Canticle of the sun* (1225).

Jacopone's conversion swept him into the eye of one of the biggest political and religious storms ever to strike the medieval Church. It was two storms, turning in fusion. The political one was that which brought to an end the old central Italian aristocratic papacy in favour of what amounted to a French invasion, destined in 1316 to move the papacy to Avignon. The religious storm, which fused with it, was the one that blew apart the hierarchy and some dangerously ardent Franciscans. Jacopone began his Franciscan life as non-political. He cannot be counted as a 'Spiritual' Franciscan (much less a 'Free Spirit'). But both storms blew straight into his native Todi at a moment when, ten years after he had joined the order, his own seniority, and natural authority, gave him no chance to escape. Just then, in 1288, another central Italian Franciscan, Jerome of Ascoli (a hop over the Appenines from Todi), became pope as Nicholas IV (1288–92). Three of Nicholas's ten cardinals were from Todi itself: his fellow Franciscans Matthew of Acquasparta and Bentivegna Bentivegni, both of whom had joined the order in Jacopone's own convent, San Fortunato; and, most important of all, Benedetto Gaetani. Benedetto's uncle had been bishop of Todi, and he had grown up in Todi as a boy, a year or two younger than Jacopone and certainly known to him – whether or not we should believe a local story that

Benedetto had been hit on the head by a stone thrown by a rival gang of which Jacopone was a member.

The political storm, for its part, revolved round one dominant family, the Colonna, whose wholesale dispossession by Boniface VIII after 1294 was to trigger the French intervention which led to Boniface's capture at Anagni. An attack on the Colonna had to affect the Franciscans. The Franciscan Nicholas IV had added to his small college two Colonna cardinals, one of whom, Giacomo, became the order's official protector and showed courageous protectiveness towards the 'Spirituals' Angelo of Clareno and Ubertino of Casale. By now nearly sixty, Jacopone was known and respected by all parties. He did not want the 'Spirituals' persecuted and, in early 1294, agreed to act as their deputy to the hermit-pope, Celestine V.

Although physically eighty years old, Celestine, we know, was a political infant. At once he began signing away major papal prerogatives to the king of Naples (see this JOURNAL xxxiii [1982], 623–6), was persuaded to resign and was replaced by Benedetto Gaetani as Boniface VIII. The *arriviste* pope was resolved to extirpate the Colonna and his attack caught the Spiritual Franciscans. As the latter's religious ally, Jacopone could not stand back, and in May 1297, at Lunghezza, between Rome and Tivoli, he joined the two Colonna cardinals in signing a declaration of war. Palestrina, the Colonna headquarters, fell after a year's siege and was razed to the ground. Jacopone was sent back to his Todi convent with instructions that he be imprisoned. Somehow he went on writing, in verses which reveal the pain of his excommunication more even than of his imprisonment, together with an erosion of morale which led him to beg his captor for release. But the stone had sunk into Boniface's heart, and it was only the pope's death, in 1303, which opened the way for the conciliatory Benedict XI to order Jacopone's release, in 1304. By now at least seventy, physically broken, Jacopone returned to the mystical preoccupations of the pre-storm years, to die in 1306, at Collazzone, in the hills above Todi.

By piecing together local biographical traditions, written down in and after the fifteenth century, and by combining them with frequent quotations from the *laude*, Suitner has created a psychological portrait with powerful appeal. We commonly put Jacopone's spirituality in the tradition of that of St Bonaventura, and no doubt rightly so if that does no prejudice to the individual stamp of Jacopone's thought. But it was individual, and shaped, apparently, by his life. To exemplify both the thought and the dialect, I finish with two examples. One is Jacopone's own version of the theme of loving Christ like an erotic or courtly lover:

Cristo amoroso, et eo voglio en croce nudato salire
e voglioce abbracciato, Signore, con teco morire.

Another is the idea – which somehow tallies with Jacopone's own fortunes – that the force of compassion can be stronger even than the suffering of its object:

Trasfórmate ll'amore, en veretate,
ne le persone che so' tribulate;
en compatenno maiur pena pate
ca lo penato.

There is plenty more of this, all of it introduced so deftly that we hardly notice we are being taught Umbrian. One day Jacopone may find his Roy Campbell, and join the tiny elite of poets acceptably translated into English. Meanwhile, we have this rich, concise, judicious and compelling biography.

UNIVERSITY COLLEGE,
OXFORD

ALEXANDER MURRAY

Helvetia sacra, IV/5: *Die Orden mit Augustinerregeln. Die Dominikaner und Dominikanerinnen in der Schweiz*. 2 vols. By Urs Amacher and others, edited by Petra Zimmer and Brigitte Degler-Spengler. Pp. 506; 507–1163. Basle: Schwabe, 1999. DM 410. 3 7965 1220 8

On the whole, this is an admirable work of reference. The bulk of it comprises long articles on the history of individual priories and monasteries, with information about their archives and libraries, generous bibliographies, lists of priors, conventual lectors and prioresses; the authors follow the laudable practice of citing primary sources for each statement. Congregations of Dominican sisters are excluded, since they feature elsewhere. The editors rightly decided to include Constance, and, since there was no Swiss province before the twentieth century, to go beyond *Helvetia sacra*'s usual time limit and provide an account of the province and its immediate precursors, notably in the university of Fribourg. Since the Albertinum receives full treatment, and the story of surviving monasteries is extended to the present day, it is a pity the same is not done for the friars' priories (re)founded in the twentieth century. The general introductions on the order as a whole and the provinces or reform congregations which had houses in Switzerland are less satisfactory; no doubt it is proper to offer an overview before descending to details, but such overviews are inevitably at some remove from original research (few primary sources are cited) and they can be as misleading as they are helpful. Second-hand lists of provincials are reproduced without comment (Bernard is not mentioned, though Scheeben made a good case for regarding him as the first provincial of Teutonia; Hugh of St Cher's alleged first provincialate of France in 1227–30 is, correctly, dropped, but no reason is given). A conventional story is told about the creation of provinces in 1221–8, which is unsupported and even contradicted by primary evidence. On p. 97 we read that by profession a Dominican became a *filius nativus* of his convent, but the concept of *filius nativus* is not found until the late fourteenth century and it then indicates a status gained by clothing, not profession. Great use is made of the division of provinces into *nationes*, and Gui's list of German nunneries is presented (pp. 115–18) as if it were so divided, which it is not. This administrative arrangement is ascribed to the general chapter of 1275 (p. 97) or 1271 (p. 105); both dates are taken from Meersseman, who drew attention to an inchoation made in 1271 (which did not become law) and another made in 1273 (which became law in 1275) to divide provinces into *vicariae* (not *nationes*), but naughtily failed to mention that the innovation was immediately annulled by the chapters of 1276–8 and is therefore irrelevant to the later notion of *nationes*. The list of *nationes* of the French province, presented on p. 105 as the result of the 1271

decree, was constructed by Meersseman from much later sources. So the broader parts of the introductions need to be treated with caution; but anyone wanting precise information about the houses of Dominican friars and nuns in Switzerland will find these volumes invaluable.

ISTITUTO STORICO DOMENICANO,
ROME

SIMON TUGWELL OF

Universitätsstift und Kollegium in Prag, Wien und Heidelberg. Eine vergleichende Untersuchung spätmittelalterlicher Stiftungen im Spannungsfeld von Herrschaft und Genossenschaft. By Wolfgang E. Wagner. (Europa im Mittelalter, 2.) Pp. 450 incl. 4 plates. Berlin: Akademie Verlag, 1999. DM 138. 3 05 003428 9

This volume offers a detailed comparative study of the late medieval universities of Prague, Vienna and Heidelberg, three universities that shared a distinctive institutional form. As part of the essential endowment, these fourteenth-century universities were organically linked with royal collegiate churches, each of which appears to have served the purpose of a chapel royal (*capella regia*). At Prague the collegiate church that was donated by the university's founder, the Emperor Charles IV, was the royal collegiate chapel of All Saints; at Vienna Duke Rudolf IV of Austria endowed the new university with the collegiate church of St Stephen; and at Heidelberg the ruling dynasty conferred upon the university the collegiate church of the Holy Ghost. These royal collegiate churches made a two-fold contribution to their parent universities. They provided prebends as a method of lecturer endowment for members of the academic colleges that were established in the years following the foundation of these three universities, that is, Prague's Collegium Carolinum, Vienna's Collegium Ducale and Heidelberg's Collegium Artistarum. On the other hand, they functioned as elaborate chantries and tombs for governing dynastic families and for prominent university personnel, dignitaries and benefactors. Wolfgang Wagner unravels the intricate connections between the secular colleges and the collegiate churches and thereby makes a notable addition to our understanding of this type of institutional arrangement. Among the subjects examined for each of the colleges and collegiate churches are their foundation documents, statutes, their range of endowments, and the admission of their personnel, with career details where relevant. The use of the collegiate churches for holding masses for the dead and for burials is exhaustively explored, and there is important data on the university nations, especially at Prague and Vienna. The representation of Vienna's Collegium Ducale in art is an interesting feature as are the accounts of disputed academic appointments to vacant prebends in the collegiate churches. The appendices contain transcriptions, some in Latin and others in German, of formal documents relating to Vienna and Heidelberg as well as useful lists of members of the academic colleges who were advanced to canonries and other positions within the collegiate churches. There is also a catalogue of the provosts of the Heidelberg Collegium Artistarum extending from 1437 to 1562. The author speculates upon possible European models for the organic links that were established between these three universities and the royal collegiate churches which, as already mentioned, may

have served as chapels royal. Although the French influence may have been the strongest, there is no mention of the institutional link that Edward II established in 1317 between the English chapel royal and the University of Cambridge that persisted well into the sixteenth century. This volume contains the fruits of much solid research. It bears a very extensive footnote apparatus, with many extracts from documents in both German and Latin, and historians of medieval universities will read and use it with profit.

UNIVERSITY OF LIVERPOOL

ALAN B. COBBAN

The late medieval pope prophecies. The Genus nequam group. Edited by Marth H. Fleming. (Medieval and Renaissance Texts and Studies, 204.) Pp. xi + 211 incl. 37 ills. Tempe, Az: Arizona Center for Medieval and Renaissance Studies, 1999. £22 (\$25). 0 86698 246 9

This edition is a highly technical publication, which launches its readers directly into the unusual problems facing the editor. The series of high medieval prophecies under discussion was transmitted, with a large degree of variation, as much by manuscript illustrations as by any common text. The black-and-white illustrations in this volume are therefore as much the object edited and commented upon as the related textual phrases and passages. The prophecies appear to have evolved from a decidedly different Byzantine source, and in an initial western transformation seem to have alluded to a number of identifiable cardinals, not least from the Orsini family, in the circumstances surrounding the eventual election of Giovanni Gaetani Orsini as Pope Nicholas III (1277–80). It is thus not surprising that one of the images in the evolved series, in at least some versions, should have become identified with Boniface VIII, nor that another image, again in some versions, should have specified the figure of an ‘angelic pope’ as precisely Celestine V. However, in one line of transmission, the completion of an illustration can be dated to the pontificate of Clement V (1305–14), and it is accordingly unsurprising that a variation in the details of one image may possibly reflect the tortuous sequence by which Franciscans, both Spirituals and some of their sometime opponents, repositioned themselves after the 1317 entry of John XXII into the prolonged dispute over poverty. Given the political complications of papal history at this point, a possible reference to Louis of Bavaria duly emerges in one manuscript, which by a seeming accident reconnects the series to its putative origins in Byzantine prophecy on an imperial, rather than pontifical theme, however transformed by Joachite use in the west.

UNIVERSITY OF LEEDS

A. D. WRIGHT

The English in Rome, 1362–1420. Portrait of an expatriate community. By Margaret Harvey. (Cambridge Studies in Medieval Life and Thought, 45.) Pp. xiii + 281 incl. 3 maps. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999. £37.50. 0 521 62057 0

Margaret Harvey has produced a valuable study of the English community in Rome during its brief period of enterprise between 1362, the foundation date of

St Thomas's hospice, one of two predecessors of the English College, and 1420, when the papacy returned to Rome under Martin v at the end of the Great Schism. In nearly sixty years there was a pope in Rome for a mere thirty-three – from 1367 to 1370, and again from 1377 to 1407. Thereafter the Neapolitan occupation of the City, events connected with the ending of the schism, and the bloodshed caused by the warring Roman factions of Colonna and Orsini combined to keep the popes away. After setting the religious, historical, geographical and economic scene, the author outlines the history of St Thomas's, the institution linking members of the English community, and the less successful venture of St Chrysogonus and other attempted foundations. She then examines information about individual members, at first mainly laymen and women with trading or commercial interests, then increasingly clerical and attached to the papal court after 1376. The book ends with a study of two careers. John Fraunceys was a successful curial official who acquired considerable property in Rome, but was unable to gain ecclesiastical office in England. His achievements and struggles illustrate both the workings of the Curia and the importance of having the right political connections in England. By contrast, Adam Easton was a scholar, an opponent of Wyclif, and the last English cardinal to reside at the Curia for about a century. His most celebrated work was the *Defensorium ecclesiastice potestatis*, which the author carefully assesses. Apart from Easton's writings, the main sources for the book are the deeds of the Venerabile Collegio Inglese in Rome, mainly recording property transactions and wills, Italian notaries' protocols, many in manuscript, and the letter book of William Swan, a proctor in the Curia from c. 1404, all supplemented by English evidence. The author's research on the expatriates' achievements and failures, their motives, their political, ecclesiastical and economic connections, from clearly difficult evidence, and in particular her discussion of Easton are significant contributions to scholarship. The book might have demonstrated them to better advantage. For example, in view of the differing sources, it might have been better organised in three parts, on the lay people, the clerical officials of the Curia and the career of Adam Easton. Readers of the early sections might have found a biographical list of persons referred to in the text helpful. The maps are placed in the preliminary matter of the book and can easily be missed, and there are some typographical errors. None of this, however, should be allowed to detract from the author's scholarly achievement.

UNIVERSITY OF EAST ANGLIA

DIANA WOOD

Die Patristik in der Bibelexegese des 16. Jahrhunderts. Edited by David C. Steinmetz. (Wolfenbütteler Forschungen, 85.) Pp. 267. Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 1999. DM 128. 3 447 04160 9

John Calvin. Student of the church Fathers. By Anthony N. S. Lane. Pp. xiii + 304. Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1999. £16.95 (paper). 0 567 08694 1

The beginning of modern scholarly interest in the reception of the early Fathers in the sixteenth century can be dated to the publication of Pierre Fraenkel's *Testimonia patrum: the function of the patristic argument in the theology of Philipp*

Melanchthon forty years ago. Since then the theme has been investigated intensively, notably in the volumes edited by Leif Grane and others (1993, 1998 and forthcoming) and Irena Backus (2 vols, 1997). Here are two welcome additions to the growing literature on the subject.

The Steinmetz volume is a bilingual collection of papers read at a colloquium on sixteenth-century biblical exegesis held in Wolfenbüttel in 1994. The editor's introduction, a valuable methodological essay in its own right, points to the inadequacy of *sola scriptura* as a description of the Reformers' approach, which took the authority of the Fathers seriously. A splendid opening essay by Karlfried Froehlich on the fate of the *Glossa ordinaria* in the sixteenth century shows the need to revise the conventional view that the *Glossa* was utterly rejected by Protestants. But neither the Gloss nor the Fathers it cited were received uncritically: Timothy Wengert ('Philipp Melanchthon's patristic exegesis') shows how Melanchthon took issue with Origen's – and through him Erasmus – understanding of justification; similarly, Steinmetz ('The judaizing Calvin') concludes that 'Calvin's commitment to patristic teaching did not involve for him a commitment to what he regarded as bad exegesis' (p. 144).

The patristic argument seems to have assumed greater importance for Protestant writers as time went on, particularly in intra-Protestant disputes. The Formula of Concord's seventh article, on the person of Christ, dominates several contributions to this collection. An assertion of the *communicatio idiomatum* which underpins the Lutheran doctrine of the real presence, it is the only article to be supported by patristic as well as biblical citations. Irene Dingel's study of the anonymous *Consensus orthodoxus* (1574) leads her to observe that in the early eucharistic controversies between Zwingli, Luther and Melanchthon the Fathers were cited only when they agreed with Scripture, but that the *Consensus* represents a later stage, when evidence of conformity with both Scripture and the Fathers was required. Paul Strawn investigates Martin Chemnitz's use of Cyril of Alexandria, the most important non-biblical source for his 1570 treatise *De duabus naturis in Christo*, which in turn contributed significantly to the formulation of Article VIII. Later, as Ernst Koch shows in his study of Selnecker's exegesis of Gen. i, the Fathers continued to be used to prove Trinitarian, Christological and pneumatological dogmas from the Old Testament. There is the comforting thought that these dogmatic disputes contributed inadvertently to the development of a modern, critical patristics, as combatants strove to detect inaccuracies in the texts quoted by their opponents. Unfortunately, Irena Backus explodes this notion in her comparison of Scultetus' and Rivet's treatment of Basil of Caesarea, arguing that while a more critical approach to the Fathers was being developed in the seventeenth century, the demands of systematics and polemics did little to promote it. But the Fathers were not the sole preserve of the dogmatists, and Robert Kolb's essay on Cyriacus Spangenberg gives an intriguing insight into their use in vernacular sermons for the pastoral care and the expository guidance of lay people in mid sixteenth-century Strasbourg.

The Catholic use of the Fathers in this period, which was no less problematic, is represented in this collection by Henning Graf Reventlow's interpretation of the Luther–Erasmus debate, and by Heribert Smolinsky, who helpfully sets Johann Fabri's approach to the interpretation of John xxi.15ff. in its wider context. David Wright's formidable contribution to the history of the exegesis of

I Cor. vii. 14 touches on Ambrosius Catharinus, but is largely concerned with the Reformers' interpretation of the text in the light of the patristic commentators available to them.

Anthony N. S. Lane's *John Calvin: student of the Church Fathers*, is a collection of essays which, with two exceptions, have appeared elsewhere. Two papers are concerned with the question of Calvin's indebtedness to Bernard of Clairvaux (an honorary early Father in the eyes of most reformers), two relate to Calvin's debate with Pighius on free will and two to the sources of citations in the Genesis commentary. Unusually for a collection of this sort, 40 per cent of the republished articles first appeared only recently (i.e. since 1996), in easily accessible organs. But Lane has added considerable value to the collection by updating all the papers, sometimes substantially, and furnishing the volume with a comprehensive annotated bibliography of the relevant literature published since 1811. The previously unpublished material consists of eleven methodological theses, which advise caution when making claims about the sources which may or may not have influenced Calvin, and an essay on Calvin's knowledge of the Greek Fathers in which Lane follows his own advice.

The two volumes have more in common than their publication date. Both are concerned with the limitations of patristic scholarship and knowledge in the sixteenth century as much as with its strengths, and both warn against the unconscious supposition that every early modern writer had Migne or the CSEL close at hand. We are reminded also that the Fathers, no less than Scripture, were regarded as weapons in a mortal combat for souls, and that we should not expect to encounter modern standards of scholarship in sixteenth-century Jena, Geneva or Vienna.

UNIVERSITY OF HULL

DAVID V. N. BAGCHI

Institutionen, Instrumente und Akteure sozialer Kontrolle und Disziplinierung im frühneuzeitlichen Europa. Institutions, instruments and agents of social control and discipline in early modern Europe. Edited by Heinz Schilling and Lars Behrisch. (Ius Commune. Veröffentlichungen des Max-Planck-Instituts für Europäische Rechtsgeschichte, Frankfurt-am-Main. Sonderhefte, Studien zur Europäischen Rechtsgeschichte, 127.) Pp. viii + 360. Frankfurt-am-Main: Vittorio Klostermann, 1999. DM 128. 3 465 03048 6

This collection of essays is happy evidence that recent debates over confessionalisation and social control and discipline have borne fruit with more refined definitions and approaches. Heinz Schilling has been at the forefront of this research for well over a decade and provides a thorough introductory essay in which he describes the recent literature and offers analysis of the theoretical and methodological debates behind the research. The volume grew out of a research project, financed by the Volkswagen Foundation since 1996, entitled 'Social control in the early modern period: the Old Regime in comparative European perspective (1500–1800)'. Eleven of the essays included here were selected from papers presented at the project's first symposium in 1997; two further essays were solicited for the volume. The range of topics is broad as the contributors attempt

to investigate social disciplining both 'from above' and 'from below', and include both formal (law, police, courts, military, education, state agencies) and informal or semi-formal (church organisations, poor relief and charitable organisations, community, family, honour, individual self-discipline) types of control exercised in early modern societies. The essays are in English (8), German (5) or French (1), and each provides a short abstract in either German or English. The volume also spans much of Europe with essays on England, Ireland, France, the Dutch Republic, Spain, Italy, the Holy Roman empire, Scandinavia and Russia. Despite the variety of the individual essays, the volume nevertheless holds together because the essays, almost all of which are quite worthwhile, balance nicely microhistorical local case studies with macrohistorical perspectives. Indeed, the comparative research in this volume proves the importance of the international perspective since different forces for encouraging social discipline were dominant in different places. For instance, while absolutism was important in France, it was the exception in the Holy Roman empire where we find a greater role for the Church and church discipline; Ireland, with a state Church not accepted by a majority of the population, reveals greater reliance on informal social control in families, neighbourhoods and urban communities in enforcing church discipline. Although some may still have problems with the concepts of confessionalisation and social disciplining when used as comprehensive paradigms, the essays in this volume demonstrate that by carefully delineating the goals and claims, such concepts can offer scholars fruitful opportunities for comparative research across cultures and disciplines.

FURMAN UNIVERSITY,
SOUTH CAROLINA

TIMOTHY FEHLER

Word, Church, and State. Tyndale quincentenary essays. Edited by John T. Day, Eric Lund and Anne M. O'Donnell SMD. Pp. xxiv + 344 incl. frontispiece. Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 1998. \$39.95. 0 8132 0902 1

This collection of twenty short essays has more coherence than many such collections, partly because most of the contributors are literary scholars; however, its quality is less uniform. David Daniell's engaging paper on the artistry of Tyndale's translation is a whimsical, humanist piece, infectious with enthusiasm for the precision of Tyndale's language. Another early highlight is Brian Cummings's depiction of grammar as the serpent in the translator's Eden. Guiding the uninitiated reader through some daunting linguistic problems, he demonstrates how Luther and Tyndale were drawn into controversies by the ambiguities arising respectively from the absence of tenses in Hebrew, and the lack of a clear future tense in English. Rudolph Almasy's essay on Tyndale's use of metaphors of movement and stability is an excellent piece which opens up an intriguing perspective on attitudes towards exile, travel, service, domesticity and honour in Tyndale and Erasmus. John Day and Eric Lund compare the work of Tyndale and John Frith; Lund's piece on the subtle differences between the two men's eucharistic theology is particularly valuable. Elizabeth McCutcheon's

piece, contrasting Tyndale's and Thomas More's prison letters, draws a persuasive contrast between Tyndale, serene in his exile and following a Pauline calling to martyrdom, and More, weighed down by his isolation and the shattering of his community. The implications for our understanding of the early Reformation are wisely left unstated in a well-written and oddly moving essay.

Other useful contributions include Gerald Hammond's convincing argument that Tyndale did not merely know Hebrew, but took it into his bones to the extent that his written English became Hebraicised; Douglas Parker's dissection of the contradictions of Tyndale's hermeneutics, although this essay is too concerned with convicting Tyndale of hypocrisy; Peter Auksi's angry hymn to folk culture which presents Tyndale as a man of the people, exploring the 'common touch' of an author who was able to avoid scholastic obfuscation while communicating complex ideas; Jos E. Vercruysse's somewhat chilling portrait of Tyndale's opponent Jacobus Latomus; and Clare Murphy's assessment of how the Turks were conscripted by both More and Tyndale to be footsoldiers in the Reformation controversies. William Stafford on Tyndale's anticlericalism and Robert Coogan on his specific hatred of the Franciscans are both effective.

Unfortunately, the weaknesses as well as the strengths of literary scholarship are on display here. Matthew DeCoursey's and Mary Barnett's essays appear to be driven more by theory than by evidence. Thomas Wyly, Arthur Kinney and especially Andrew Clark have all produced interesting pieces, but all of them are marred by a failure to see the commanding heights of sixteenth-century literature as set amongst other lesser but much more numerous authors. Most disappointing of all are pieces by Germain Marc'hadour and John Dick, which, despite their evident scholarship, are clearly miscellaneous off-cuts from other work rather than articles in their own right. Here, as elsewhere, the need for more active editorial control of this valuable but patchy volume is evident.

UNIVERSITY OF BIRMINGHAM

ALEC RYRIE

Dall'anabattismo veneto al 'Sozialevangeliemus' dei Fratelli Hutteriti e all'illuminismo religioso sociniano. By Aldo Stella. (Italia Sacra. Studi e Documenti di Storia Ecclesiastica, 54.) Pp. viii + 224. Rome: Herder, 1996. L. 58,000. 88 85876 26 9

This is a work of formidable scholarship which takes as its starting point the tensions between history, sociology and theology in the subject and which comes full circle in revising historiographical perspectives in its epilogue. Unabashedly, the book synthesises various traditions of Reformation research, dealing with the role of ideas and the extent to which these might be politically imposed or socially constructed. Such a task generates further tensions. Some readers may be left wondering whether the book is an effort to present the coherence of its subject matter or to anatomise its variety. From Weber and Troeltsch in the introduction (pp. 1–9), discussion moves to the condition of the peasantry in the Tyrol in the later fifteenth century. Their uprisings (chronicled by the appropriately named Jacob Unrest) are linked to the 'general crisis of feudalism' and the influence of Renaissance humanism in recasting social relationships through the Roman law

(pp. 13–18). In the articulation of protest, Stella emphasises the resonance of what Gaismayr had to say with the ideas of Luther and Zwingli, and its contrasts with Muntzer (p. 38). And Gaismayr had little or nothing in common with the prophetic and apocalyptic vision of Hutter, who equated Luther and Zwingli with the pope (pp. 48, 64). In the refinement of doctrine, we now have a much clearer idea of the significance of Pieter Riedemann (pp. 171–91). The steadfastness of the Hutterites under interrogation is apparent in the tragic history of Francesco della Sega, whom the Venetian government refused to burn in public, instead drowning him in secret in 1565 (p. 124). On the other hand, the equally tragic case of Gian Giorgio Patrizi illustrates the mental anguish of a melancholic (pp. 137–55). There is perhaps a further tension which the author does not address, and that is the tension that exists between religion and politics in the term ‘radical’. Certainly, the use of the term eases the author towards his conclusion that Hutterite and then Socinian anti-Trinitarianism nurtured the modern notion of liberty of conscience in the secular state (pp. 202–3). However, the teleology may be too strong. As applied to religious attitudes in the age of the Reformation, does ‘radical’ mean much more than ‘unacceptable to the confessional state’? Is there a case for reading backwards from the sixteenth century rather than forwards and seeing the holy communities of the Hutterite elect not only as rejections of secular power, but also as reinventions of monasticism?

UNIVERSITY OF EDINBURGH

RICHARD MACKENNEY

A culture of fact. England, 1550–1720. By Barbara J. Shapiro. Pp. x + 284. Ithaca, NY–London: Cornell University Press, 2000. £32.50. 0 8014 3686 9

Barbara Shapiro’s latest book continues her series of important contributions to the conceptual foundations of intellectual life in early modern England. The preoccupations of her earlier books – probability, and the law of evidence – are here developed into a work of cultural history that addresses an ambitious and interesting question. It is not a history of individuals, nor of social forms, nor yet of doctrines. It is about a concept – ‘fact’ – and more generally about the intellectual culture this concept created. It is thus a decisive contribution to recent scholarly investigation into the historical formation of fundamental modern notions of argument, evidence and objectivity.

A culture of fact is clearly written and lucidly arranged in a series of chapters organised ‘roughly along modern lines’, which Shapiro argues makes it possible to chart ‘cultural connections *and* disciplinary development’ (p. 6). Successive chapters thus move between intellectual disciplines and literary genres: law, history, chorography and travel-writing, newsbooks, natural philosophy and religion. The work rests upon an impressive amount of reading in the vernacular printed books of the period, and also makes use of some archival material from the Royal Society.

The book’s central thesis is that the concept of ‘fact’ emerged first in legal discourse and then permeated a range of other disciplines and genres, including particularly divinity and natural philosophy. Thus in good part the book is about the application of the concept of ‘fact’ beyond human actions to natural

phenomena. Shapiro argues forcefully that legal modes of judging testimony played a large but unduly neglected role in the development of practices for establishing truth in early modern England. Steven Shapin's thesis in *A social history of truth* (1994), that the credibility of factual testimony was pre-eminently governed by codes of gentlemanly civility, is subjected to polite but persistent criticism. For Shapiro, 'it was the language of the law, and the analogy to legal processes and criteria of truth, not the language of the courtesy manuals, that was constantly in the mouths of the [Restoration] virtuosi' (p. 141).

In a substantial chapter on 'Facts of religion', Hugo Grotius retains the position he first acquired in Henry van Leeuwen's 1963 study *The problem of certainty* as the founder of a central strain of seventeenth-century English Protestant apologetic. This strain defended the historical ('factual') truth of New Testament apostolic testimony; it ran through William Chillingworth, Edward Stillingfleet and John Tillotson, with Seth Ward also making a welcome appearance in Shapiro's account. Tillotson's purposes in shoring up Scripture against Roman Catholic notions of Tradition are noted, but English Catholic intellectuals like Kenelm Digby and Thomas White do not appear in this book; there might have been a story to tell about why this should be so.

There is rather little explicit meditation on the kind of history the book is doing, and what there is appears in the conclusion. Is it a history of a word? Or of a discourse? Or even a form of cultural behaviour? Shapiro never quite tackles these questions head-on. Hence the book does not squarely address a fundamental question about the role of 'fact'. Was the language of fact just a convenient way for proponents of advanced Protestant apologetic and the new experimental philosophy to profess their impartiality? Or was 'fact' a vital conceptual tool that helped generate and even make more truthful the practices of natural philosophers and historians in seventeenth-century England? Shapiro seems to vacillate between these two positions (p. 200), although the claim – which might be seen as rather positivist – is made that by the beginning of the eighteenth century, historians worked 'much harder to ensure that the "facts" they wrote about were "real" and that they were supported by appropriate evidence' (p. 62).

Furthermore, the book sometimes finds the discourse of fact where it was not. The intellectual allegiances of Thomas Blundeville's *True order and methode of writing and reading hystories* (1574) – a translation from writings by Patrizi and Acontius – are with the Italian *ars historica* tradition, not contemporary English 'justicing manuals'. Francis Bacon is credited (with some qualifications) with having popularised the concept of fact in the realm of nature, and John Locke with having popularised it generally. But neither were quite so keen on facts as this suggests. Bacon scarcely uses the term in his Latin writings: some of Shapiro's quotations of Bacon talking about 'fact' come from his nineteenth-century translators; beyond *Novum organum* 1.112 (which Shapiro cites) Bacon himself more usually writes in conventional terms of *res ipsae*. Nor is it correct to state that 'With Locke fact was given philosophical form and treated as "knowledge"' (p. 212). As Shapiro's earlier discussions (p. 190) could have made clearer, 'matter of fact' for Locke is a function of 'probability', not of 'knowledge'.

Shapiro's central thesis is undoubtedly right: the legal concept of fact systematically made its way into the broader literate culture of early modern

England. But what did it displace? As in *Probability and certainty*, Shapiro pays almost no attention to the philosophical culture that was the basic inheritance of the great majority of sixteenth- and seventeenth-century English intellectuals. This culture was, very loosely, Aristotelian; it spoke to itself in Latin, not English; and it reproduced itself through the universities. It was in this culture that the kind of basic epistemological frameworks that Shapiro is interested in were principally generated, and it is rather from this culture than from the common law that works like William Harvey's *Exercitationes de generatione animalium* and indeed the jurist Sir Matthew Hale's *Primitive origination of mankind* emerge. Shapiro would have needed to have studied the textbooks of this culture, as well as the more ambitious works written in defence of this traditional philosophical regime – such as those by Alexander Ross or John Sergeant – to see how they use, do not use, or react to, the language of 'fact'. In short, what was the early modern English culture that the 'culture of fact' replaced – and why?

TRINITY COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

R. W. SERJEANTSON

Liturgy, politics, and salvation. The Catholic League in Paris and the nature of Catholic reform, 1540–1630. By Ann W. Ramsey. Pp. xiii + 449 incl. endpapers, 4 figs and 26 maps. Rochester, NY: University of Rochester Press, 1999. £55.
1 58046 031 3

This is an intriguing book with an ambitious title, though one that does not quite live up to initial expectations. Ann Ramsey's study of the nature of Catholic reform in Paris, based on her analysis of wills taken from three sample years (1544–5, 1590 and 1630), raises some interesting questions about how Parisian reformist notaries and their clients understood and responded to the changing parameters of their world during this turbulent century. Her analysis of 'performative variables' is complemented by opening chapters on Protestant and Catholic attitudes to the sacred, and concluded by a section on seventeenth-century attitudes to discredited *ligueur* practices such as voluntary flagellation. More than a hundred pages are taken up with a series of enormously detailed tables and appendices with titles such as 'Eight variables to analyse performativity', 'Overall performativity ranking for notaries' and lists of record types. These might have been presented in a more user-friendly fashion, though the information they contain is certainly comprehensive. The prose is heavy with jargon, and some of the analysis is also rather ponderous, not to say redundant. (A typical example: on page 127 Ramsey quotes one of her testators 'going and coming daily through the streets of Paris and to churches to hear the word of God and to attend his divine service'. She comments: 'the performative element in this excerpt originates in the idea of accumulating salvific benefits by daily attending services at several churches'.) Ramsey tilts at a number of sizeable windmills *en route*, notably the ubiquitous Denis Crouzet, but there are places where her analysis would benefit from a broader and more comparative approach. For example, on page 219 she claims to have 'laid to rest notions about the merely formulaic nature of testamentary discourse', but makes no reference

to the extensive discussions of these questions by historians of the English Reformation – a blind spot which is perhaps (as Ramsey might put it) contextualised by the performative misspelling of Eamon Duffy's name on page 119. But certainly the material about who the *ligueurs* were and what they got up to is very interesting, and the theoretical approach adopted is challenging and thought-provoking, if sometimes a little inelegant. Ramsey has opened a window on a fascinating world of confraternities, notaries and *universitaires* which has hitherto been inaccessible to us; she has laid down a marker for further research in this area, and raised some provocative questions which will need to be taken into account in any future work.

UNIVERSITY OF NEWCASTLE

TIMOTHY WATSON

John Dee's conversations with angels. Cabala, alchemy, and the end of nature. By Deborah E. Harkness. Pp. xiii + 252 incl. 7 ills. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999. £37.50. 0 521 62228 X

Scholars have produced volumes on Elizabeth I's court astrologer, the natural philosopher and mathematician John Dee (1527–1608), but this is the first study of his 'angel conversations' of 1581–7. Harkness argues, mostly from his diaries of these constructed exchanges and his manuscript marginalia to books in his vast library, that they were a logical extension of Dee's natural philosophy in an apocalyptic age, a continuation of his efforts to read the natural world as a text in an age when nature was perceived as increasingly corrupt and time rapidly drawing to an end. Dee claimed that the angels who appeared in his 'showstone' offered him the exegetical tools 'to close the gap between the perfect, immutable heavenly spheres and the corrupted Book of Nature' (p. 4). Consulting with angels was part of his effort to construct a universal science. It is difficult, however, to see the Book of Nature as any more unreliable than Dee's hired scryers gazing into crystal balls – even by sixteenth-century standards. Dee's imagination mediated what others claimed to see in his 'showstone', and his principal scryer, Edward Kelly, was hardly the sort of person to inspire great confidence. He was already a convicted forger when he came to Dee, and their association ended after Kelly claimed that an angel had recommended that he and his employer hold in common all things – including Dee's wife. Small wonder that even his usual patrons showed little interest in the conversations. Certainly some contemporaries in high places took Dee seriously: Elizabeth and Cecil, Rudolph II and Laski all consulted him, although not in reference to his conversing with angels. Rudolph was more interested in his alchemical ventures and gave up on him after two unproductive years. Laski, who was present during some of the 'conversations' (beginning with one in 1583 that predicted his triumph over Stephen of Poland), was in the end disinclined to believe in them. In the seventeenth century Meric Casaubon published them for the express purpose of debunking, although Casaubon thought Dee had been deceived by 'false lying spirits' rather than that he and Kelly had invented their visions (p. 222). Robert Hooke called the conversations 'Dr Dee's Delusion' (p. 223). But of course the 'conversations' were simply the system that Dee invented to impose

order on disorderly nature, and when seen thus as a constructed device, it does have its internal logic, reflecting contemporary veneration of celestial harmony in the face of earthly mutability. Harkness neglects to probe the nature of either the credulity of Dee's followers or the incredulity of sceptics; however, she does an admirable job of dissecting the complexity of the system itself, with its new angelic language, 'Adam's alchemy' and a complicated 'cabala of nature' (p. 196). Whether the dissection is worth the effort remains an open question.

VANDERBILT UNIVERSITY

MARGO TODD

Constraint on trial. Dirck Volckertsz Coornhert and religious freedom. By Gerrit Voogt. (Sixteenth Century Essays & Studies, 52.) Pp. vi + 268 incl. frontispiece and 1 ill. Kirksville, Mo: Truman State University Press, 2000. \$30 (paper).
o 9433549 71 X; o 9433549 84 I

Dirck Volckertsz Coornhert (1522–90) may easily qualify as the most prolific of late sixteenth-century Dutch authors. As he consistently wrote in Dutch, his fame (or notoriety rather) hardly spread outside Holland during his lifetime. Though his importance as an agent of Reformation thought has now long been recognised internationally, a thorough introduction to his life and work was still lacking in English. Gerrit Voogt, of Kennesaw State University, has done away with this *lacuna* by providing a detailed survey of Coornhert's life and politico-theological thinking. In line with current Dutch historiography, *Constraint on trial* portrays Coornhert as a major protagonist of religious freedom. His relentless defence of freedom of conscience is shown to be intricately linked to the important spiritualist and perfectibilist stands in his theology. In this respect Coornhert was strongly indebted to thinkers such as Castelleio and Franck. Still, it remains difficult to categorise him. Coornhert proclaimed a very idiosyncratic theology and was at odds with all other religious groups of his day. Reformed ministers in particular were at the receiving end of many of his polemical tracts in defence of religious tolerance. In his habitual loud-mouthed manner, Coornhert did not refrain from warning against an imminent 'Genevan Inquisition' in the Netherlands. Throughout his career Coornhert was always eager to point out that his lifetime's endeavours had been solely devoted to crusading against religious constraint. This self-image has proved durable and is fully endorsed by Voogt's study.

UNIVERSITY OF AMSTERDAM

MARIANNE ROOBOL

Richard Hooker. Prophet of Anglicanism. By Philip B. Secor, foreword W. Speed Hill. Pp. xxii + 362 incl. 3 maps and 5 ills + 24 colour plates. Tunbridge Wells: Burns & Oates/Toronto: Anglican Book Centre, 1999. £20. o 86012 289 1
Philip B. Secor's new biography is warmly to be welcomed as the first really extensive reassessment of Richard Hooker's life since C. J. Sisson's study in 1940, and the first full biography since Izaak Walton's *Life* of 1665. One obstacle in the path of such a new biography has long been that Hooker's life was largely unremarkable, and is only modestly well documented. Secor in general deals

skilfully with these problems and, in a lucid and accessible study, describes what we do know of Hooker's life; where information is lacking he provides intelligent background studies. Thus we learn about the Exeter of Hooker's childhood, and of the character and life of John Hooker, his protector during those years. Revealing information is provided about Corpus Christi College, Oxford, and the inns of court during Hooker's membership of those institutions, and Secor has done some fine work on the various parishes with which Hooker was associated in his later life. There are likewise well-considered discussions of Hooker's relationships with John Rainolds, the Sandys family, Adrian Saravia, Walter Travers and John Whitgift. Secor also has some convincing explanations for the bias of some seventeenth-century accounts of Hooker and his family. Thomas Fuller, it is argued, wished to make Hooker sound an uninspiring preacher in order the better to praise his fellow Puritan, Walter Travers, and Secor is doubtless correct in observing that the litigation with Edwin Sandys after Hooker's death caused some of Izaak Walton's witnesses to have a distinctly clouded vision of Hooker's family. Secor's analysis of Hooker's religious opinions is a somewhat more qualified success. He describes Hooker as the 'prophet of Anglicanism', accepting the notion that 'Anglicanism was still an emergent phenomenon in Hooker's sixteenth-century England, not defined as such until the next century'. Yet he provides no comprehensive definition of Hooker's religious position or of Anglicanism more generally, and indeed appears somewhat wary of so doing. Nevertheless, from his various remarks on the topic, Secor appears to regard Hooker's Anglicanism as principally consisting of an essentially traditional Catholic approach to worship combined with a mildly Calvinist (or even Lutheran) theology, this mildness expressing itself in a high regard for reason, a theory of predestination emphasising human freedom and an overall love of Christian tolerance and inclusiveness. Yet there is little in the way of in-depth, technical analysis of Hooker's theology, and Secor makes a good many assumptions about Hooker's views, citing the works of previous critics. Comprehensibly, the general lack of information about Hooker's life causes Secor to respond with frequent conjectures and assumptions about Hooker's opinions, and to attempt to re-create some of his missing sermons from what we do know about them and from writings that do survive. This should be evaluated in the light of the fact that Secor has pitched his biography at the more popular end of the academic spectrum, and while he does not always provide the most detailed account of Hooker's theology, he succeeds very well in describing the life and times of this eminent theologian in a highly intelligent manner, that makes him fully accessible to a non-specialised readership.

LONDON

NIGEL VOAK

Reflections on the theology of Richard Hooker. An Elizabethan addresses modern Anglicanism.

By John Booty. (Anglican Studies and Texts). Pp. ix + 219. Sewanee, Tenn.: University of the South Press, 1998. \$20 (cloth), \$12.50 (paper). 0 918769

45 0

John Booty has spent a lifetime in study of Elizabethan Anglicanism of the type represented by Richard Hooker – even though modern historiography has alerted scholars to just how untypical he was. As intimate with Hooker's writings

as a Shakespearian scholar with the bard's prose and poetry, Booty here reflects on the main themes of Hooker's theology in the light of modern theological debate. Hooker is thus set in dialogue with David Bohm and Stephen Hawking, as well as Sartre and Delumeau on matters of creation and theodicy. The style is a combination of historical theology, reflection and homily rather than sustained academic argument, and will appeal to a wider readership. At times one wonders who is setting the agenda – Hooker or the modern Church. Thus in at least two places apologetics and wishful thinking seem to get the better of Booty. His discussion of Church and commonweal plays down the crucial role monarchy (or the civil magistrate) plays for Hooker in book viii of the *Lawes*, which does not fit easily with the separation of Church and State of Booty's modern America. Second, Stephen Sykes's special pleading for Hooker's views on women is used to help the Elizabethan divine appear a little more 'politically correct' on that issue. Hooker was not 'politically correct', and perhaps has something to teach those Churches which sometimes seem to regard being 'politically correct' as more important than Scripture, tradition and reason.

YALE UNIVERSITY DIVINITY SCHOOL

BRYAN D. SPINKS

A catalogue of the donations made to Norwich City Library, 1608–1656. By Joy Tilley. (Libri Pertinentes, 6.) Pp. ix + 120 incl. frontispiece and 9 figs. Cambridge: LP Publications, 2000. £15. 0 9518811 5 9

In 1608 Norwich city corporation established a library as both a lodging and a library for visiting preachers. It was independent of the Church and remained, in the period under review, predominantly a theological resource for lecturers largely brought in by the corporation to improve the standard of preaching in the city. Successive bishops, after Samuel Harsnett tried in 1622 to close down lectures on Sunday mornings by insisting, unrealistically, that citizens attend sermons in the cathedral, sought to restrict the role of such Puritan lecturers. Donations reflect the hotter sort of Protestant; of the forty-six donors to the library who gave regularly between 1608 and 1634 eight had been mayor, nine aldermen and two sheriffs. Many had links with the church of St Andrew where a parochial library had been set up in 1586. Of the six score or so traceable titles most were either works of the Fathers or Reformed texts, with imprints from Antwerp, Basle, Cologne, Geneva, Paris and Wittemberg. There are no Oxford works but the library held the Cambridge publications of William Perkins (1609–12) and Andrew Willett's influential three-volume *Hexapla in Genesin*. London imprints include Willett's 1613/14 *Synopsis papismi*, and the works of Samuel Purchas, and Bishop Babington, and the 1596 edition of Foxe's *Acts and monuments*. There is no sign of editions of Donne, Andrewes or even John Prideaux. Walton's Polyglot Bible, which Tilley tells us the corporation presented in instalments between 1643 and 1647, is neither calendared nor indexed in the text. Apart from this oversight, and the sudden change of font for book titles after those given by Thomas Corye in 1609, the rest of this welcome volume exhibits the same high standards that the series first showed in the standard publication of Alain Wijffels, *Late sixteenth-century lists of law books at Merton College*.

BLACKHEATH

NICHOLAS CRANFIELD

The bewitching of Anne Gunter. A horrible and true story of football, witchcraft, murder and the king of England. By James Sharpe. Pp. xvi + 238. London: Profile Books, 1999. £16.99. 1 861 97048 X

Judging by the subtitle of this book, James Sharpe sought to produce a compelling narrative of what was an extraordinary and, in its time, notorious case of witchcraft. If he is not completely successful in this, it is largely because the evidence on the central figure in the story is lacking; Anne Gunter's motivations remain obscure and even her eventual fate is unknown. What Sharpe has done, and done superbly, is to place Anne Gunter's feigned demonic possession into its historical context. Sharpe has skilfully garnished the main course of his narrative, the Star Chamber records of his case, with details on village life, medicine and justice in early modern England as well as vignettes of such interesting figures involved with the case as Thomas Holland, Samuel Harsnett, Edward Jorden and James I himself. Above all, Sharpe has traced the background to the Gunter possession, together with the accusations of witchcraft which resulted from it, to a feud between her family and some of their neighbours arising from a homicide following a village football match. Readers of Sharpe's book will not only learn as much as is ever likely to be known about Anne Gunter but will also learn a great deal about the different worlds – village, university and court – in which her career as a demoniac took place. But there is one crucial aspect of Anne Gunter's possession which Sharpe leaves relatively unexplored: its background in the religious situation at the time and its effect upon it. Although he discusses the scepticism Richard Bancroft and Samuel Harsnett (both of whom figured prominently in exposing Anne Gunter as a fraud) felt towards witchcraft, and their persecution of John Darrell and other Puritan exorcists, he does not explain it. Fear of the potential which possessions afforded for Puritan and Catholic propaganda is particularly important in explaining James I's shifting views on possession which are described but not analysed by Sharpe. Bancroft's efforts to suppress the exorcisms were supported by James and resulted in canon 72 of the canons of the Church of England promulgated in 1604, which forbade the conducting of exorcisms by the clergy without the permission of their bishop. (It is a little surprising that Sharpe does not discuss this canon, since it enabled Bishop Cotton to prevent several well-meaning clerics from attempting to exorcise Anne Gunter.) And this is probably the greatest significance of the Gunter possession. When James I came to the English throne, Bancroft's implacable opposition to exorcism had been made manifest. Exorcists, however, looked to James, the author of a treatise on witchcraft, for relief. Canon 72 was a crippling blow to these hopes and James's zealous exposure of Anne Gunter as a fraud was a fatal one. As a result, not only exorcism, but spiritual healing was driven from the Church of England to become a monopoly of Catholics and Dissenters. Despite this *lacuna*, Sharpe's book will not only be required reading for specialists interested in early modern English witchcraft and exorcism; it will also be an excellent introduction for students to these subjects, and indeed to English social history of the period.

UNIVERSITY OF SHEFFIELD

THOMAS S. FREEMAN

Pilgrim pathways. Essays in Baptist history in honour of B. R. White. Edited by William H. Brackney and Paul S. Fiddes (with John H. Y. Briggs). Pp. xii + 328. Macon, GA: Mercer University Press, 1999. \$45. 0 86554 687 8

Pilgrim pathways is a *Festschrift* to honor B. R. White, former Principal of Regent's Park College, Oxford, and a leading Baptist scholar of the English separatist tradition. The book includes fourteen essays broken down into four sections that parallel White's own interests in Baptist development, namely issues of Baptist identity, the Baptist way of being a Church, Baptist biography and a section entitled 'Crossing boundaries' which deals with international and ecumenical aspects of the Baptist movement. The authors of these essays include many of White's former colleagues and represent an impressive array of historians working on Baptist issues, people such as William Brackney, Geoffrey Nuttall, Marjorie Reeves, John Briggs and White's successor at Regent's Park, Paul Fiddes. The book ends with a comprehensive outline of B. R. White's extensive publications. Like most *Festschriften*, the results are uneven. Some of the articles are based primarily on secondary sources. Others are original pieces of research using manuscript materials. This reviewer, who is not a Baptist, found a number of the articles extremely helpful. For instance, Alan Sell's article entitled 'Doctrine, polity, liberty: what do Baptists stand for?' is an excellent summary of divisions on doctrine within the Baptist movement from its inception and how these issues have played themselves out through the years leading to the twentieth century. Equally stimulating is W. M. S. West's contribution 'The child and the Church: a 'Baptist perspective'. Adult baptism, of course, is central to the Baptist movement and tomes have been written about it. But what about unbaptised children? What has been the Baptist position on the spiritual state of children born into the Church? West does an admirable job in dealing with this issue. This book will be of interest to Baptist as well as non-Baptist historians, especially non-Baptists interested in the denomination's relationship with other Churches and movements. It is also a wonderful tribute to Barrie White who not only is a great historian but also – when he was an active teacher – a caring though demanding tutor.

RANDOLPH-MACON COLLEGE

ROGER H. MARTIN

At war with the Church. Religious dissent in seventeenth-century Russia. By Georg B. Michels. Pp. xi + 356. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1999. £37.50. 0 8047 3358 9

The Schism of the seventeenth century and the subsequent emergence of the broad schismatic movement called the Old Belief was one of the defining moments in the history of the Russian Orthodox Church. It had great social and cultural significance as well: in fact Geoffrey Hosking has recently identified it as a turning-point in the shaping of Russian national identity as a whole (G. Hosking, *Russia: people and empire 1552–1917*, London 1997, 68). The split turned on reforms to the liturgy: the new Patriarch Nikon pushed through changes in ritual designed to bring the Russian Church into line with its Greek counterparts, and the church council of 1666, by anathematising those who disagreed,

effectively declared previous Russian Orthodox tradition and practices illegitimate. Contemporary opposition took various forms and was severely persecuted, but the so-called Old Believers survived, claimed millions of adherents among the Russian population, and indeed still exist today. That, in brief summary, is the traditional view of the Schism (*raskol*); in his new book Georg B. Michels sets out to challenge it. Michels argues that the Old Belief in its mature forms in Russia was a product of the early eighteenth century, and that those commonly regarded as the 'founding fathers' (most famously the Archpriest Avvakum) were zealots who attracted little popular support in the 1650s–80s. In short, popular 'schismatic' opposition to Church authority in mid seventeenth-century Russia is to be regarded as something separate from true Old Belief, which initially had very limited impact: the latter 'might be called a "spiritual church" that tried to rejuvenate and purify the ancient spiritual and monastic traditions of the Russian Orthodox past' (p. 17), whereas 'the Muscovite "masses"' had attitudes and grievances of their own and 'remained indifferent toward changes in church services' (p. 64). Church hierarchs tended to label as heretical or schismatic anything which challenged church authority. Michels argues that the very real and widespread, if disparate, manifestations of popular opposition to church powers in this period arose not from resistance to liturgical changes, but from other causes: personal experiences of loss, oppression, injustice or violence associated with the Church, or popular resistance to the Church's broader contemporary attempt to extend its direct control and to discipline popular social customs and *mores* among an illiterate population ignorant about church doctrine and the liturgical issues at stake. Much resistance arose within the ranks of the lower clergy itself. This was a body which also encompassed defrocked and parishless priests, wandering monks and self-consecrated nuns, and it spawned charismatic local leaders who set up the numerous semi- or unofficial monastic settlements which dotted seventeenth-century Russia and which were particularly strong centres of 'schismatic' activity. To document his thesis Michels turns away from the canonical Old Believer texts which have formed the principal basis for the traditional view, and deploys an impressive range of new evidence drawn from church archives across Russia. In the process he paints a vivid picture of a society in which established structures were weak and social control was limited, authority personal and often local, violence routine. Opposition to the new service books which embodied the liturgical changes is shown to have been often instrumental, a weapon in quite different battles, and people changed views and sides as circumstances changed. The influence of the official Church in popular daily life, often considered to have been overwhelming, is depicted as weak or lacking, as was respect for church officials, and one cause of opposition was precisely the Church's attempts, already mentioned, to penetrate deeper into the social fabric. 'The fact that church efforts to evangelise [and control] Russian society did not succeed is an important historical feature that distinguishes Russian religious history from its Western [Reformation and Counter-Reformation] counterpart' (p. 225). At the same time the Soviet Marxist equation of religious dissent with broad social or class struggle is rejected: dissenters were usually motivated by personal, local, sometimes also by real religious, concerns. Michels mounts an effective challenge to the traditional view of this period, and presents a reasoned and coherent

alternative. Whether his account will constitute a new orthodoxy remains to be seen. He has carried out huge researches in previously neglected sources; but his field is also vast and not comprehensively documented, and much of his argument is from silence – what his sources do not say. Michels's thesis will stimulate further discussion and research. For the present, this is a major work of social as well as ecclesiastical history: it presents an important reinterpretation of Russian seventeenth-century religious affairs, and no future account will be able to ignore it.

UNIVERSITY COLLEGE,
LONDON

ROGER BARTLETT

Adam and Eve in seventeenth-century thought. By Philip C. Almond. Pp. ix + 240.

Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999. £35. 0 521 66076 9

Questions about Adam's age, stature and clothing; the nature of the language the serpent spoke; the geographical location of paradise; the diet of angels; the nature of the creation and the idea of poly-genesis or 'men before Adam', are all addressed here. Conceived as a study in the history of reading the Bible (and in particular the first book of Genesis) Almond explores the diverse understandings of scriptural injunctions in the long seventeenth century. The work is an essay in the hinterland of biblical belief and exegesis, examining how a range of learned (and not so learned) scholars extrapolated, imagined and reconstructed a range of accounts about the nature of the human condition, its relationship with the natural world and its place in a providential history. Inquiries about the genesis of women (from which rib?), the age of the world, the design of the Garden of Eden were all made with forensic attention. As Almond acknowledges, his work extends the type of historical investigation prompted by Keith Thomas and Christopher Hill into the world of print culture and erudition. This book will certainly act as a stimulant to further research. It is based on wide reading, and has recovered a range of exotic material. What it does not do is apply any serious thought to the changing status and techniques of biblical criticism. Sources are cited and described regardless of context and confessional identity: strange bedfellows (Calvin, Salkeld, Hobbes and Tryon) commonly find themselves in conversation. There is little sense of the intellectual motors of changing attitudes. It is only on the last page that an argument about the 'secularisation' of attitudes towards the status of Scripture (and Genesis in particular) is asserted.

ROYAL HOLLOWAY COLLEGE,
LONDON

J. A. I. CHAMPION

The light in their consciences. The early Quakers in Britain, 1646–1666. By Rosemary Moore. Pp. xiii + 314 incl. 13 ills. University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2000. \$29.95. 0 271 01988 3; 0 271 01989 1

Writers of Quaker history have approached their task from several perspectives and by the early 1990s it seemed to Larry Ingle that the subject was suffering

from 'historiographical schizophrenia' ('George Fox, millenarian', *Albion* xxiv [1992], 261–78). *The light in their consciences*, Rosemary Moore's accessible account of the Society of Friends up to 1666, evolved as an attempt to synthesise theological and political approaches to the topic. As a result, her book, grounded in the wealth of surviving Quaker pamphlets and manuscript material, is well-contextualised, taking into account the full range of recent scholarship on such diverse topics as Quakers and the legal process, Quaker writing and the role of leading personalities, including women Friends, in shaping the movement. *The light in their consciences* moves from the days of religious seeking, through Friends' development into a community which provided a 'serious challenge' to conventional society (p. 21), and beyond their first encounter with political reality: the point, in 1653, when it became clear that the Nominated Assembly was unable to establish the Kingdom of God. As Rosemary Moore points out, this dash to their radical hopes gave Quakers an incentive to find the Kingdom subjectively, in the Spirit, rather than in human institutions, and together with the development of silent worship and doctrine of the eternal Light of Christ emerged the distinctive Quaker approach to spirituality and suffering. Like Ingle (*First among friends: George Fox and the creation of Quakerism*, Oxford 1996), Moore concludes that George Fox had emerged as the central authority figure by the 1650s, forced from the outset, and certainly from the occasion of James Nayler's celebrated re-enactment of Christ's entry into Jerusalem, to contain Friends' charismatic exuberance in a society which regarded the unconventional with suspicion. Fox's determination that Friends should go forward in the 'gospel order' prevailed, not least because his vision was shared by others in the leadership. Their formalising initiatives of the mid-1660s, designed to forge a united community of 'lively stones' (p. 136), led by the Spirit, but abiding by a framework of ethical and procedural standards, came into direct conflict with a core principle for all radical Puritans: the liberty of the individual conscience. Ending her study in 1666, a 'major punctuation mark in Quaker history' (p. xii), Moore sets the scene for a new phase in Quaker history, one in which the leadership was forced to react to internal fears that they were imposing 'forms', and to external perceptions that Friends were not only bad citizens, but also bad Christians. By highlighting the enduring tension between the individual interpretation of the Light and the importance of group witness, this book provides the prologue not only to the Wilkinson–Story controversy which threatened to split the Quaker movement in the 1670s, but to the continuing and accelerating evolution of a socially abrasive Puritan sect into a respectable, and respected, religious movement. With analytical material moved to endnotes, this book is well-suited to the interested general reader. However, the integrity of its scholarship and useful critique of source material also makes this work very suitable as a text for those studying early modern religion, and especially the fragmenting nature of English Protestantism in the seventeenth century.

The Quakers in English society. 1655–1725. By Adrian Davies. (Oxford Historical Monographs.) Pp. xvi + 262 incl. 1 map, 6 figs and 13 tables. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2000. £40. 0 19 820820 0

Adrian Davies has written an excellent local study on Quakerism. The research is impeccable, and early modern historians will have constant recourse to it for insights into the transition of a sect into a denomination. I want to begin the review, however, with two reservations.

There is a word absent from the title, and not mentioned in the blurb on the cover. The word is 'Essex'. The research is overwhelmingly based upon Essex sources. Davies concedes this in his introduction (p. 5), but argues that the study offers a fresh perspective by concentrating on the one county (which is true) and that most studies previously have concentrated on George Fox's initial base in the north-west (which is also true). The worry arises when the findings from Essex are extrapolated to form judgements on the national developments. A central thesis advanced is that, relatively early in its history, despite the fissiparous beginnings which he describes very well, Quakerism had become assimilationist. But Davies stresses the unusual tolerance of Essex Friends to backsliders (p. 106) to argue that national (not just Essex) explanations for Quaker decline in inflexible discipline 'must be sought elsewhere' (p. 107). In an ill-judged conclusion (p. 223) the 'climate of tolerance which Quakerism fostered' (England, not just Essex) leads rather too easily to the tolerance of the Enlightenment, with a helpful nudge from Locke's *Letter on toleration* on the way.

The second qualification to register is the book's lightness both on intellectual history and on national political history. Again Davies has his defence (p. 7). His is unashamedly a bottom-up, not top-down, approach. We have had enough from the leaders; he will try to recapture the views of the rank-and-file (and he is astonishingly successful in pulling this off). Among the most interesting findings in his study is that his study of 'Quaker wills and lesser number of inventories' (p. 112) reveals a surprising lack of interest in the books and pamphlets that Quaker writers produced. Even so, he also noted that the Quarterly Meeting for the county in 1700 took delivery of more than one hundred copies of Robert Barclay's *Apology*. This suggests that the profound shift in Quaker apologetics engineered by Barclay (excuse enough to dig up dog-eared copies of Basil Willey's *The seventeenth-century background*) could make a difference at local level too. Davies acknowledges that his interest in Quakerism began with Nayler; he starts his study in the year before Nayler's entry into Bristol, but yet has nothing to say thereafter on the impact of Nayler's disgrace on the behaviour of his followers afterwards. In fact his section on Quaker theology (pp. 14–20) would have benefited from drawing upon Professor Damrosch's sensitive exploration of Nayler's religious ideas (*The sorrows of the Quaker Jesus*, 1996). Nor can discussions of Quaker 'levelling' (pp. 64–74) avoid the extraordinary impact of Penn's positive electoral response to James II's overtures in 1687 and 1688. That impact was felt by Bunyan's Baptists and Vincent Alsop's Presbyterians as well; the kind of comparative analysis which Professor Pestano managed successfully to do for her Quakers and Baptists in colonial Massachusetts is needed here.

Once these limitations are accepted, there can be nothing but generous welcome for this valuable study. Davies has a nice eye for the telling quote, and is bold in his social anthropological analogies ('Mods' and 'Rockers' feature

along with body-builders and masseurs: pp. 26, 36). Voltaire, not only not Essex but not England, is quoted five times: perhaps a little (four times?) too often. Davies makes a balanced and valuable contribution to the debate on the social origins of Quakerism. Alan Cole (drawing mainly upon northern counties) had argued that Quakers were predominantly 'an urban and rural *petite bourgeoisie*'. Richard Vann (for Norfolk and Buckinghamshire) had put the social class higher: 'middle to upper-bourgeoisie'. Judith Hurwich (for Warwickshire) inclined more to Cole's plebeian findings. Davies makes an important distinction between Colchester and the rest of Essex, and argues that his findings for Colchester match more closely Cole and Hurwich, but that for Essex as a whole the material supports neither side (p. 145).

Davies has another level-headed contribution to make to a very live current debate in the early modern period. He carefully examines the Margaret Spufford thesis of a continuity in radical ideas – from Lollard to Leveller. He does indeed find that Quakerism was strongest in those parishes where Lollardy had previously taken hold – in particular, in the township of Great Coggeshall (p. 132). Here though we can see the dangers in the pursuit. Davies notes Brownist tendencies, the minister in the 1640s arguing against civil penalties for the heterodox, and the appearance of Quakers in the town a decade later. This is certainly a chain – 'the township's radical tradition' as Davies calls it (p. 132) – but when we know what that minister, John Owen, thought of Brownists and Quakers, the evidence is less compelling.

Other questions will be raised by this fascinating study, but it is a book to which historians will constantly return for answers. In the last general election but one, Essex Man was seen to speak for England. Davies almost persuades us that the same is true of Essex Quakers in the early modern period. Almost, but not quite.

UNIVERSITY OF SUSSEX

WILLIAM LAMONT

Philipp Jakob Spener. Briefe aus der Frankfurter Zeit 1666–1686, III: 1677–1678. Edited by Johannes Wallmann (with Martin Friedrich and Markus Matthias). Pp. xxviii + 1132 + 2 plates. Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr (Paul Siebeck), 2000. DM 598. 3 16 147032 X

The latest volume of Philipp Jakob Spener's *Briefe*, much delayed though it has been (for notices of the enterprise so far see this JOURNAL xlviii [1997], 584–6; li [2000], 440–2), is a stupendous achievement now that it has arrived. The period covered by this volume was the high point of the Frankfurt Pietist movement, and embraced the appearance of his best-known works (after the *Pia desideria*), his catechism, the *Spiritual priesthood*, and the circular in which he gave the first historical account of his movement. The result is that there are twice as many letters as in the previous two-year volume, most of them to theologians and clergy, and therefore in Latin. The editing as always is superb and names of correspondents have been supplied for almost all the letters with varying degrees of probability. In this volume Pietism begins to be a target of criticism, and the whole range of mystic spiritualists appear among the recipients. Spener reveals

himself sympathetic to mystics, hostile to visions and unable either to condemn Jakob Böhme or recommend that he be read, on the grounds that he cannot understand a word of him. British reader should note a reference to a letter to William Penn (p. viii). British libraries should not fail to take this whole series.

PETERSFIELD

W. R. WARD

Witchcraft, magic and culture, 1736–1951. By Owen Davies. Pp. xiii + 337. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1999. £45 (cloth), £15.99 (paper). 0 7190 5655 1; 0 7190 5656 X

Historians continue to be fascinated by the ‘witch craze’ of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries; new books on the subject appear regularly. With a few laudable exceptions, they are much less interested in the broader ‘magical universe’, to which the early modern trials are valuable testimony. The trials, too, which came and went, give the impression of a ‘rise’ and then a ‘decline’ of magic, obscuring its perennial and persistent nature. Owen Davies’s book is particularly welcome and timely therefore, since it establishes quite clearly that magical beliefs and practices continued to flourish in Britain for more than two centuries after the repeal of the old witchcraft statute in 1736.

The first chapter examines elite attitudes and the changing legal position vis-à-vis witchcraft and magical practices. The enlightened few were sceptical from the early eighteenth century if not before, but belief continued among some clergy and the religious-minded, particularly Nonconformists, and this belief retained a connection with popular traditions. There was a shift, however, from belief in witchcraft proper towards an interest in demonic manifestations and possession. Later, from the mid nineteenth century, new modes came in with spiritualism and revamped more urbanised astrology and fortune-telling. The law now prosecuted fraudulent claims relating to supposed magical powers, and attacks on or threats to supposed witches, and not the practice of magic itself.

Chapter ii looks at the continuing action taken against witches at the popular level. The last official indictment for witchcraft was in 1717, but people still called on magistrates to act against supposed perpetrators of hostile magic well into the nineteenth century. Direct action was also taken against witches in the form of ‘swimming’ and ‘scratching’. Rather than being tests or ordeals, these had become a form of collective punishment. But in the modern period, of course, such action came to be officially disapproved of and itself led to prosecutions.

Chapter iii is concerned with the presentation of witchcraft and magic in popular literature: broadsides, chapbooks and almanacs, which continued in largely traditional style down to the time of the First World War. Here witches were not at all prominent. Chapter iv explores this theme further by tracing the perception of the witch in folklore narratives and in newspapers. The former reveal a spectrum running from full belief to scepticism. They present a picture of the witch which accords with early modern stereotypes: an old woman, often a beggar refused, who bewitches with a look. But alongside this, there are witches who fly and shift shape. The impact of demonological witchcraft was slight. The newspaper evidence relates to ‘reverse’ witch trials, i.e. cases against those who

attacked or threatened supposed witches. The victims here were again mainly older women. They were usually accused of causing illness in humans, rarely of attacks on livestock. There appears to be some linkage with general animosities in villages.

In Chapter v occult practitioners of various kinds are discussed. Traditional cunning folk, mostly male and rural, continued to be active down to the early twentieth century. They identified witches, detected thieves and aided lovers. They were, however, progressively eclipsed by more modern urban practitioners, male astrologers and female fortune-tellers using cards, palmistry, tea leaves and crystal balls. These were particularly sought after during the First World War.

The final chapter tackles the difficult question of declining belief in witchcraft. This is explained essentially by reference to the ending of traditional agriculture and the disappearance of isolated rural communities, and a decrease in personal insecurity and change in the experience and interpretation of misfortune. Owen is aware of the complexities of these developments. He notes, for instance, that the growth of schools and literacy does not necessarily undermine belief in magic but may indeed help to sustain and promote it. He calls for a longer-term and comparative analysis. Much more needs to be done, however, in this area, looking at the parallel decline in religious belief and practice, for example, and using a more sophisticated methodology. Owen is hampered here by his somewhat untheoretical approach – where is Mauss? where is Frazer? Related to this, he appears to think that magical beliefs and practices lacked any underlying coherence, a vestige of the academic disdain for the subject which he is seeking to overcome.

Other criticisms might be that the chapters are a bit miscellaneous and that the style suffers occasional lapses. But these are relatively unimportant and in general this is a well-researched and well-constructed first book that sheds new light on an important topic in an interesting way.

UNIVERSITY OF EAST ANGLIA

STEPHEN WILSON

Anglicans in the Antipodes. An indexed calendar of the papers and correspondence of the archbishops of Canterbury, 1788–1961, relating to Australia, New Zealand and the Pacific. Compiled and edited by Ruth Frappell, Robert Withycombe, Leighton Frappell and Raymond Nobbs. (Bibliographies and Indexes in Religious Studies, 50.) Pp. xvi + 443 incl. frontispiece. Westport, Conn. – London: Greenwood Press, 1999. £75.95. 0 313 30925 6; 0742 6836

Until recently only a small number of Australian or New Zealand church historians had ever visited Lambeth Palace Library to read the correspondence from colonial bishops and clergy in the papers of successive archbishops of Canterbury. Those who did so were impressed by the riches contained in this material and the light it threw on colonial church life, ecclesiastical politics and the often tortuous process by which appointments were made to colonial and missionary bishoprics. This calendar, compiled by four Australian historians, lists and deftly summarises the contents of all correspondence relating to Australia, New Zealand and the Pacific Islands in the

archbishops' papers. It does not extend to other (lesser) collections of papers in Lambeth Palace Library. The unearthing of these letters was a major project and their editing and indexing has generally been exemplary. In the summaries of correspondence on the Pacific Islands, however, there are some slips on points of history and geography. As a guide to the location of important primary materials, and their contents, this calendar is a valuable resource. It will be a standard reference work for many years. Historians in Canada and South Africa may be inspired to do likewise.

FLINDERS UNIVERSITY,
ADELAIDE

DAVID HILLIARD

A history of the popes, 1830–1914. By Owen Chadwick. (Oxford History of the Christian Church.) Pp. x+614. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1998. £70. 0 19 826922 6

Longevity was part of the papal, as well as the royal, charism in those days. Owen Chadwick's compelling and compendious study of just four pontificates spans the best part of a century from the second French Revolution and Wellington's first administration to the outbreak of the First World War. Two of the four were noted for equalling or exceeding the twenty-five years attributed to St Peter.

This is more than a study of the lives of four popes, or of the changes in the institution of the papacy. The four pontificates are treated in such breadth that we have what comes to a history of eight-and-a-half decades of Roman Catholicism. So the first eight chapters of narrative are followed by seven investigating various themes: the religious aspect of nationalism in the Tyrol, Poland, Spain and Portugal; the religious orders; the growth of Catholic universities; ecumenism; and finally the canonisation of saints. Readers may not, however, find all they need to know about these topics because, as an editor's note points out, 'the history of the Church in the British Isles, and in non-European countries including the Americas, is to be found elsewhere' in the series of which Professor Chadwick's volume forms a part.

Chadwick depicts the four pontiffs vividly. The first of them, Gregory xvi, a Camaldolese monk and the son of a Venetian lawyer, was 'ugly and coarse in appearance' but 'the best-educated pope for nearly three-quarters of a century', a man of 'delicate health, but ... abounding energy'. When elected in 1831 he inherited not only spiritual power but also temporal sovereignty over the papal states north and south of Rome, the administration of which required an army, a police force, the support of the Austrian army, compromises with various great powers and resistance to revolutionary and nationalistic movements. His choice of the name Gregory, with its evocation of memories of the masterful Gregory vii, expressed his repudiation of the results of the French Revolution; he was to resist calls for the liberty of the press and conscience and the separation of Church and State. He died in 1846, 'the most hated pope for two centuries'. Yet he did much to encourage the arts and scholarship, he removed Galileo's writings from the Index and he was only six years behind Britain in condemning slavery. As pope he continued to practise the asceticism of a monk. Chadwick's charitable verdict is that he was 'an honourable old man who was not unique in failing to understand where the century was going'.

Gregory's successor, Pio Nono, was of a very different character: a pastoral bishop, un pompous, a sympathiser with Italian aspirations for independence from Austria, with the reputation of liberal sympathies. However, once pressure was put on him to give armed support to the Italian independence movement of Garibaldi and his associates and Rome fell under the rule of a mob in 1848, the liberal sympathiser became the 'resolute conservative' who is perhaps best remembered for his 'Syllabus of Errors', and his high view of the papal office which inspired him to define the dogma of the Immaculate Conception in 1854, to seek to concentrate power in Rome and to exert pressure for the definition of papal infallibility at the first Vatican Council in 1870. 'I, I am tradition, I, I am the Church.' With the establishment of secular government in 1871 the former enthusiastic Italian abandoned the Quirinal Palace, became the prisoner of the Vatican and negotiated a series of concordats to regulate the Church's relations with the new nation states.

Leo XIII, who succeeded to the papacy in 1878, was another conservative, in Chadwick's judgement more moderate and flexible and more of an intellectual than his predecessor, but still an autocrat by temperament. He successfully negotiated with Bismarck an end of the *Kulturkampf*, and made progress towards reconciliation between the Italian state and the Church. He issued a record number of encyclicals, regarding himself as (in Chadwick's tart phrase) 'the international authority on truth, ethics, and religious practice'. He required ordinands to study Aquinas, and commissioned a critical edition known after him as the 'Leonine'. His *Rerum novarum* (1891) was the first of a long series of influential papal encyclicals on social ethics. He is perhaps best known in England for the Apostolic Letter or Bull (not an encyclical, *pace* Chadwick) *Apostolicae curae*, which condemned Anglican ordinations as 'absolutely null and utterly void'.

The eleven-year reign of the next pope, Pius X, the former patriarch of Venice, was the shortest of the four. With the loss of the papal states there was no longer need for a political heavyweight, but neither was he a scholar. Rather, he was a devout man who, though a former rector and professor of philosophy at a seminary, retained anti-intellectual leanings. Chadwick regards his pontificate, marked as it was with the Modernist crisis, the ultramontane and integrist tendency, and the Dreyfus scandal and virulent anti-clericalism in France, as 'in some ways the worst time for the Church in the modern epoch'. Yet it was also a pontificate of new shoots: the beginning of the codification of canon law, the rationalisation of the Curia, the recommendation of frequent communion, the reform of church music and the breviary and toleration for Catholics who wished to enter the political life of the new secular states.

Chadwick's informative study is written, as one would expect, with wit and with a sinewy elegance. Part of his secret is his ability to blend material culled from primary and secondary sources with entertaining and revealing case studies and anecdotes, such as the experience of Cardinal O'Connell of Boston, who arrived in Rome too late for the conclaves of 1914 and 1922, but survived to take part (third time lucky) in the election of Pius XII in 1939.

This reviewer ventures to disagree occasionally with Professor Chadwick's judgements. It is unfair to Manning to describe him as 'the most unpopular clergyman in England' as the great manifestation of mourning at his funeral

shows. *Tametsi*, while requiring Catholics to get married in Catholic churches, did not imply that Protestant or civil marriages were adulterous. While the Jesuit publicists of the time were largely ultramontane, the order deserved credit for providing pioneers in the Catholic social movement, and being involved in the drafting of *Rerum novarum*. 'Agonistic' appears to be a pleasing misprint for 'agnostic'. The minting of 'a million millions' of miraculous medals in a few years would surely be itself a miracle.

Professor Chadwick writes with a sensitive empathy with the Roman Catholic mind. A well-organised index and a copious descriptive bibliography complete this magisterial and entertaining monograph.

CAMPION HALL,
OXFORD

EDWARD YARNOLD

Anglican ritualism in Victorian Britain, 1830–1910. By Nigel Yates. Pp. xiv + 455 incl. 27 tables. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999. £60. 0 19 826989 7

Nigel Yates has already written extensively on the Oxford Movement and ritualism. This major survey combines careful analysis with an impressive breadth of first-hand evidence. Yates is not content to concentrate on a few classic ritualist churches – St Alban's Holborn, All Saints Margaret Street and the like. Instead, he examines records nationwide to build up a detailed picture of the extent of ritualism in parishes and dioceses. He is keen to dispel the 'myth of the ritualist slum priest', in the sense of challenging the view that men like Mackonochie of St Alban's Holborn, and Dolling of Portsmouth, constituted the majority of ritualist clergy. His surveys show that most ritualist churches in southern England – ritualism's heartland – were found, not in large cities (London aside), but in smaller market towns and rural areas. A key source is *The tourist's church guide*, and an appendix gives the *Guide's* listing of all churches in England and Wales in which both lighted candles and eucharistic vestments were in use in 1874. He argues convincingly that the equation of ritualism with 'Romanizing' is much too simplistic, not only because of the diverse patterns within the ritualist movement, but also because of the evidence of the Lutheran churches of Scandinavia. These churches had preserved much Catholic ceremonial, while maintaining an impeccably Protestant confession of faith. Surprisingly, neither ritualists nor their antagonists seriously addressed this contemporary combination of Catholic ritual and Protestant doctrine. The furious opposition to ritualist clergy drew on ancestral anti-Catholicism, and not infrequently recruited non-worshippers and people from outside the parish. The bitter division within congregations, however, underlines the truth that to introduce sudden and drastic changes in worship is to invite confrontation. That there was no major schism in the Church of England over ritualism Yates attributes to a 'very careful balancing act' on the part of the bishops. By 1900 many 'ritualist' adjuncts to worship – candles lighted on the altar, the eastward position, mixed chalice, surpliced choir – were widely accepted in the parishes. That may be seen as the ritualists' triumph. Yet the die-hard Anglo-Catholic

groupings of the late twentieth century – more Roman than Rome – not only failed to impose their churchmanship on other Anglicans, but sadly dwindled into a rather sectarian rump. Some of the author's judgements are questionable. Was it 'only the more extreme Puritan ministers who were ejected in 1662 (p. 23)? And I think Bishop Edward King would have been surprised to find himself labelled 'the most pro-ritualist of the High Church bishops' (p. 273). Yet here is a fine study, meticulously documented and researched, scrupulously fair in dealing with its controversial subject, and surely destined to become a standard work in the field.

WESLEY COLLEGE,
BRISTOL

JOHN A. NEWTON

Abraham Lincoln. Redeemer president. By Allen C. Guelzo. Pp. xii + 516 incl. frontispiece, endpapers and 1 map. Grand Rapids, Mich.–Cambridge: Eerdmans, 1999. £19.99 (\$29). 0 8028 3872 3

Allen Guelzo's intellectual biography – winner of this year's Lincoln Prize – deftly situates Lincoln in the economic, social, political and religious landscape of the day; it is the author's attention to the latter theme that makes this a particularly insightful work. Lincoln grew up in a strict Calvinist Baptist home, one that emphasised God's providential involvement in salvation and daily human affairs. Lincoln, though, never adopted his father and stepmother's beliefs. The Lincoln who entered politics was far more interested in the emerging Whig party's programme of economic improvements 'based on merit, self-improvement, and self-control'. These convictions, held with quasi-religious fervour, shaped his political experience and even formed the crux of his opposition to slavery. But Whig advocacy of self-improvement fitted well with the widespread evangelical Protestant conversion language and Whigs catered to evangelicals for votes. The question of religion then, and even whispers of his religious infidelity, confronted Lincoln throughout his political career. Lincoln proclaimed his belief in the 'Doctrine of Necessity'. But his necessity was much closer to Jeremy Bentham's determinism than it was to an evangelical view of God's providential care for the world. Guelzo traces how Lincoln's beliefs evolved, especially during the civil war. He is clear that Lincoln never underwent the sort of conversion experience that evangelicals preached, yet he also illustrates Lincoln's growing acceptance of the possible role of a divine being who intervened in world affairs. It is this analysis of the religious dimension of Lincoln's thought that sets Guelzo's work apart from several other fine one-volume Lincoln biographies and leaves us with the most complete picture of a complicated man.

UNIVERSITY OF NOTRE DAME

KURT O. BERENDS

Memory and modernity. Viollet-le-Duc at Vézelay. By Kevin D. Murphy. Pp. xiv + 200 incl. frontispiece and 53 ills. University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2000. \$45. 0 271 01850 X

Viollet-le-Duc was the most scholarly and the most dogmatic of the architects who tackled the state of France's decrepit cathedrals and abbeys in the

nineteenth century. Previous studies of his plethoric restorations have come from one of two directions. Architects have been intrigued by his championing of Gothic as a rational system of construction, which his interventions drew out to the point of exaggeration; and antiquarians have documented – with hands often raised in horror – how much he changed in order to present medieval French architecture as more coherent than it was.

Kevin Murphy approaches Vézelay, the first big restoration project that Viollet undertook (he began there in 1840), from a fresh angle, that of the modern French state pitted against a local community. He explains, in more detail than we have had hitherto in English, how under the intellectual guidance of Guizot and others, the July Monarchy encouraged and institutionalised the post-revolutionary clamour for monument protection in the shape of a Commission for Historic Monuments, and how under Prosper Mérimée and his young friend Viollet-le-Duc the business of church restoration took on a centralising, nationalistic and indeed secularising trajectory. Against this Murphy sets the backward little Burgundian town, or rather village, of Vézelay. Churchgoing in Vézelay had never been strong, but clergy and mayor, united by little else, joined in resenting the appropriation of their much-cherished if decaying abbey to national and archaeological ends.

This is a study in arrogance versus ignorance. As such, it anticipates controversies that have beset the treatment and very meaning of ancient churches ever since. All over Europe now, churches like the Madeleine at Vézelay have to be steered along an uneasy path between the legitimate demands of locals and the financial muscle of a tourist and heritage industry whose involvement is brief, intermittent and partial. Kevin Murphy's text is precisely if sometimes pedantically presented, with excellent notes that often add to his story. The one drawback to his book is that his pictures of the great church itself are meagre in both quantity and quality.

DEPARTMENT OF ARCHITECTURE,
UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE

ANDREW SAINT

Radical churchman. Edward Lee Hicks and the new liberalism. By Graham Neville. Pp. xii + 360 incl. frontispiece. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1998. £50. 0 19 826977

3

Christian socialism. Scott Holland to Tony Blair. The 1998 Scott Holland Lectures. By Alan Wilkinson, foreword Tony Blair. Pp. xviii + 302. London: SCM Press, 1998. £14.95 (paper). 0 334 02749 7

These two books both take as their subject the relationship between the Church and one of Peter Clarke's themes, Liberals and Social Democrats. The protagonist in Graham Neville's monograph, Edward Lee Hicks, bishop of Lincoln during the First World War, was a Liberal; the theme of Alan Wilkinson's book is the Christian socialist tradition in Britain. Yet Christian socialism was replete with Liberals both before and after the First World War; and Hicks was a chairman of the Manchester branch of the Christian Social Union. So Liberalism and Social Democracy intertwine in both volumes. It is perhaps not surprising that

the foreword to the book by Alan Wilkinson is written by Tony Blair, a prophet of the rapprochement between the two political traditions.

Wilkinson's analysis begins with a study of the nineteenth-century background to Christian socialism in which, refreshingly, he does not concentrate exclusively on the so-called Christian socialists but also takes into account Evangelical paternalism and other forces. He discusses the Christian Social Union, quoting Scott Holland's epitome of its teaching: 'the more you believe in the Incarnation the more you care about drains' (p. 72). Intriguingly, Neville's study of Hicks also quotes the same words (p. 155n.). Wilkinson sees Charles Gore as an idiosyncratic but inspiring leader for the socially committed of the next generation. R. H. Tawney, whose *Religion and the rise of capitalism* constituted the first set of Scott Holland Lectures just as the present volume is the latest, is depicted as a disciple of Gore. Here the cruciality of education in Tawney's thought – as central as in the mind of J. S. Mill and another bond with Liberalism – is not brought out as well as it should be. Catholic sociology, the Kingdom Group and the vibrant socialism of Conrad Noel of Thaxted (once Hicks's curate), together with other individuals, are reviewed in turn before recent developments such as the Jubilee Group and the Christian Socialist Movement are considered. It is welcome that Scottish Presbyterians and English Nonconformists are not forgotten (the author is the son of a Methodist minister), though the thought of certain of them such as S. E. Keeble is certainly worth fuller examination. It should be noted that F. D. Maurice was not dismissed for universalism but on a lesser technicality (p. 19); and that it is now clearly mistaken to claim that only Roman Catholics had substantial working-class support (p. 36). The treatment is lively and, though the coverage is rather episodic, definite conclusions are reached: the tradition did well to maintain a non-statist dimensions in socialist thinking and a bond between the Churches and Labour; but on the other hand it was often simplistic and failed to keep up a link with the working classes.

The Christian Social Union, so central to Christian socialism, is also near the heart of Neville's biography of Hicks. Although the future bishop was a significant member of this body, he was critical of it for being insufficiently political. He did not mean by this that it was too tentative in its approaches to socialism since he himself was never a socialist. He meant that it was too little prepared to engage in pressure-group politics, to which, as an active Liberal, he was committed. His Liberalism sprang from a Methodist home and an unfussy lay spirituality not overlaid with the ecclesiasticism of a theological college. Other formative influences were the classics, for he was a Fellow of Corpus Christi College, Oxford, specialising in epigraphy (that led him towards a scholar's respect for freedom of enquiry), and John Ruskin, whom he encountered in the Corpus Senior Common Room (an acquaintance that fostered a desire to communicate with working people). Hicks's political Liberalism was apparent in the Warwickshire village of Fenny Compton, where he established allotments, a reading room and a co-operative store, all in keeping with Liberal sympathies of the time. In Manchester, to which he moved in 1886, first as warden of a university hall of residence and then as a canon of the cathedral and incumbent of a Salford slum parish, he became part of the circle of C. P. Scott of the *Manchester Guardian*, to which he contributed regularly from 1904 to 1910. From

1910 until his death in 1919 Hicks served as bishop of Lincoln, acting as president of the Church of England Peace League and of the Church League for Women's Suffrage. By 1918, like many other erstwhile Liberals, he was speaking from a Labour platform. But the core of Hicks's Liberalism was his energetic membership of the prohibitionist United Kingdom Alliance, of which he became honorary secretary. Neville is eager to explain that temperance was not, in Hicks's mind, the key to transforming society (pp. 132–4), but that case is not substantiated. Surely it was; and that explains why his version of Liberalism was collectivist, for temperance reformers early came to a mildly positive view of the state. Neville does well to put his subject in the broad context of Anglican trends of his day, though it is a pity he did not make fuller use of the bishop's diary (which he himself edited for publication in 1993) to support his argument, which sometimes lacks corroborating evidence. And at the end of both these studies the question remains: what was the contribution of the Churches to the emergence of the New Liberalism? Wilkinson sheds no light on the question; Neville claims that Hicks supported the New Liberalism but did not share in its initiation. On closer inspection that may turn out to be an underestimate of the impact of Hicks and his contemporaries, Anglican and Nonconformist, who turned the temperance cause into a massive campaign. It may well be that a major factor behind the emergence of the Liberals and Social Democrats who laid the foundations of the welfare state was the temperance crusade.

UNIVERSITY OF STIRLING

DAVID BEBBINGTON

Die katholisch-theologischen Disziplinen in Deutschland 1870–1962. Ihre Geschichte, ihr Zeitbezug. Edited by Hubert Wolf. (Programm und Wirkungsgeschichte des II. Vatikanums, 3.) Pp. 408. Paderborn: Ferdinand Schöningh, 1999. DM 108 (paper). 3 506 73763 5

Composed of thirteen papers originally presented at a conference in 1997, this volume represents an authoritative and painstaking assessment of various Catholic theological disciplines in Germany against a complex, shifting cultural background and drastically changing political circumstances. Some – the contributions of Henning Graf Reventlow and Hans-Josef Klauck, for example – discuss Catholic contributions to biblical criticism. Hubert Wolf, on the other hand, looks at the writing of church history, especially the work of Ludwig Pastor, Albert Ehrhard, Heinrich Schrörs and Joseph Lortz. Other contributors – David Berger, Peter Walter or Johannes Reiter – provide systematic and detailed accounts of developments within fundamental theology, apologetics and dogmatic or moral theology. Social ethics and the Roman Church's efforts to adapt its organisational forms to meet the needs of the urban working classes are discussed by André Habisch. Still others – Walter Fürst, Giancarlo Collet, Stephan Haering and Benedikt Kranemann – have interesting things to say about pastoral theology, liturgical innovations, missionary activities and developments in canon law. Peter Hünemann, in a concluding essay, calls attention to the growing specialisation among the various theological disciplines. All take seriously Catholic efforts to break new conceptual ground and to provide

a clear theoretical orientation toward contemporary German scholarship. The usefulness of these essays is enhanced by the willingness of the authors to step outside the confines of a narrow or arcane academic discussion of intellectual history and to take account of the broad cultural changes that have influenced theological concerns and seminary training in Germanic central Europe during the century that separated the two Vatican Councils.

UNIVERSITY OF WISCONSIN–MILWAUKEE

RONALD J. ROSS

The twentieth century. A theological overview. Edited by Gregory Baum. Pp. viii + 263. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis/Ottawa: Novalis/London: Geoffrey Chapman, 1999. £17.99 (paper). 1 57075 282 6; 2 89507 015 6; 0 225 66880 7

This noteworthy book is not primarily a general exposition of theologies produced during the twentieth century. It has two more specific aims. First, to show how various theologians of the twentieth century reacted to historical events that influenced their societies; and second, to consider how theologians are currently reflecting on the cultural and religious movements of the last century. The book is divided into two major parts that attend consecutively to the two aims. Historical events examined in the first part include World War One, the Great Depression, the Holocaust and the emergence of a World Church. The second part focuses on such matters as secularisation, the impact of Vatican II, the Women's Movement, the ecological crisis and postmodernism. In total, there are eighteen informative chapters that precede a section of 'concluding reflections' by the editor. The chapters are uniformly articulate and thought-provoking. One of the strengths of this text is that its theological observations are well-informed by sociological and historical research. It is also replete with arresting conclusions. For instance, the master theorist of secularisation, Harvey Cox, now concludes that 'the myth of secularisation is dead' (p. 143). Virgilio Elizondo argues that the conference of Latin American bishops held in Medellín during 1968 exercised a transformative impact on ecclesiastical pastoral practice and theology that was far greater than any other episcopal council over the past two thousand years. This is so, in Elizondo's eyes, because that conference was the first meeting of bishops to concentrate on the structural causes of poverty rather than doctrinal disputes (pp. 107–8). A surprising though welcome facet of this book is the prominence it gives to the frequently overlooked theological legacy of Marie-Dominique Chenu. His thought is discussed in four different chapters. While the book does not seek to be comprehensive it could have given more attention to the historical and theological significance of the world religions' growing familiarity with one another due, in part, to large transmigrations of peoples during the twentieth century. The consequences for theology of new scientific knowledge also merit more consideration than appears in this text. One further and minor quibble is this: the assertion on p. 24 that Hans Urs von Balthasar became a cardinal is misleading. Although he was indeed named a cardinal, he died before he could be created as such. That said, this book remains a highly competent offering by an international array of accomplished authors.

MANSFIELD COLLEGE,
OXFORD

PHILIP KENNEDY

Rebuilding the Kirk. Presbyterian reunion in Scotland, 1909–1929. By Douglas Murray.

Pp. xv + 319. Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 2000. £25. 0 7073 0774 0

This book meticulously chronicles the discussions and debates which led up to the reunion of the Church of Scotland and United Free Church in 1929 to create the modern Church of Scotland. In order to effect union two apparently incompatible principles required to be reconciled – the United Free Church's insistence on the preservation of spiritual freedom, the issue which lay at the root of the Disruption of 1843 which created the Free Church, and the insistence on the part of those in the Established Church on the national recognition of religion. Murray shows how a long process of debate and of drafting and redrafting produced the Church of Scotland Act and Declaratory Articles of 1921 which uniquely provide the statutory basis for a Church which is both wholly free to govern and order its affairs and at the same time recognised as a National Church with a distinctive call to bring the ordinances of religion to the people in every parish of Scotland through a territorial ministry. At one level, this study shows Presbyterianism at its most legalistic and nit-picking. Yet it is also a chronicle of compromise and accommodation, rare enough commodities in ecclesiastical politics and not a conspicuous feature of Scottish church history. The treatment is scholarly and the book is unlikely to be supplanted as the authoritative account of the background to the most important institutional event in twentieth-century Scottish church history.

UNIVERSITY OF ST ANDREWS

IAN BRADLEY

Pius XII. und Deutschland. By Michael F. Feldkamp. (Kleine Reihe V&R, 4026.)

Pp. 240. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck und Ruprecht, 2000. DM 29.80 (paper).

3 525 34026 5

To look at the title is to wonder whether anything fresh can be said, and this is in the excellent series of textbooks on history through which the publishers have done such service in making the result of research available to a wider public. But this book is no mere summary of other people's work. This is a serious and level-headed contribution to the study of the most complicated and controversial pope of modern times. It is friendly to Pacelli without blinking the eyes to the critics. It allows him a large share, as Cornwell does, in the Serbian Concordat of 1914. Perhaps the most helpful part is the study of Pacelli's time as nuncio in Munich and then Berlin. He doubts Heinrich Brüning's evidence over Kaas and the destruction of the Centre Party and is convincing that the Holy See made no pressure on Kaas to give way. The history of the concordat with Hitler, even now hard to unravel, is well described, with German bishops more opposed to it at first than is easily realised but with the conviction that in the end there was no alternative to signature. Even in 1945, when Hitler was dead and the only pressure was defence against the charge that he was culpably weak with Nazis, Pacelli defended the concordat as the best policy with the Nazi government. On the wartime pope the author has no use for the absurdity of Pacelli calling himself the *pastor angelicus*. On the Holocaust he does not criticise the long delay between knowledge of what was happening and its condemnation. The long decline of the

post-war years he summarises briefly. He accepts Pascalina's evidence that at the pope's death she destroyed three baskets full of documents at the pope's command. But he does not end the book there because he goes on to a useful survey about the controversy in Germany about the 'Silence of the Pope'.

SELWYN COLLEGE,
CAMBRIDGE

OWEN CHADWICK