

## Reviews

---

*Theologische Realenzyklopädie*, XXX: *Samuel – Seele*. Edited by Gerhard Müller. Pp. v + 816. Berlin–New York: Walter de Gruyter, 1999. DM 394. 3 11 002218 4; 3 11 016243 1.

Here the longest article, more than 100 pages, is on creation (*Schöpfer/Schöpfung*). But if we put all the articles about Scripture together (origin of writing, exegesis of the Bible, idea of sacred writings, learned exponents, reading in public) they come to even more. We are well treated in these essays. The church history of three countries is here – Scotland (James Cameron), Switzerland (Ulrich Gabler) and Sweden (Bertil Nilsson and Anders Jarlert), all admirable but the last covers more ground unknown to most English readers – and three of German *Länder*, Silesia, Schleswig-Holstein and Schaumburg-Lippe. For the Reformation the treatment of school (*Schule/Schulwesen*) is helpful, and there is also the Sandomir Consensus and the Schmalkaldic Articles and the League, with the radicals Michael Sattler and Schwenkfeld. Except within the long articles there is little on the Middle Ages except for the school of St Victor. The moderns are select but interesting – naturally a fundamental treatment of Schleiermacher; among them Albert Schweitzer is hard to put down, and there are scholars like Eduard Schwartz and Seeberg and Philip Schaff. Ethically the key article is that on abortion (*Schwangerschaftsabbruch*), liturgically that on the Sanctus. The preface tells that Dr Joachim Mehlausen who for twenty years edited the *TRE* articles on the Reformation and after died last year; we owe him thanks.

SELWYN COLLEGE,  
CAMBRIDGE

OWEN CHADWICK

*Princeps christianus und Kaiser aller Römer. Theodosius der Grosse im Lichte zeitgenössischer Quellen*. By Jörg Ernesti. (Paderborner Theologische Studien, 25). Pp. 507 incl. 9 ills. Paderborn: Ferdinand Schöningh, 1998. DM 98. 3 506 76275 3  
The Emperor Theodosius I (AD 379–95) is generally known to have forcefully pushed through the Nicene faith as the sole belief among Christians and exclusive state religion of the Roman empire. Having in mind the surprising fact that even most pagan writers take a positive view of Theodosius – the *version noire* of Eunapius and Zosimus being an isolated exception (p. 15) – Ernesti has undertaken to challenge this simplistic view of the *princeps christianus*. His careful handling of many historical sources of very different types deserves admiration: the constitutions of the *Codex Theodosianus* (pp. 17–88), various inscriptions (pp. 89–104), coins (pp. 105–32, with illustrations at pp. 502f.) and iconographic sources (pp. 133–60 with illustration at pp. 504–7) are taken into account as well as literary texts (pp. 161–474). The excellent presentation of the material (an introduction conveying information about the genre, the author and/or the

special historical setting; a description or paraphrase with bilingual quotations; a discussion with in-depth consideration of scholarly debates) and summaries at the end of every larger unit as well as at the end of the book (pp. 475–8) enable the reader to follow Ernesti's arguments easily.

The first part of the book is subtitled: 'Das Selbstverständnis des christlichen Kaisers Theodosius' (pp. 17–160). Contrary to the historiographic consensus, the documents of the anti-heretic legislation prove that the emphasis of the religious policy of the first decade lay on outdoing all heresies. The first step taken was the prescription of the Nicene Creed by means of the programmatic edict *Cunctos populos* (*C.Th* 16. 1. 2, AD 380), which does not refer to pagans (pp. 19ff.). Theodosius himself was the author of this policy, acting as 'Werkzeug des göttlichen Willens' (p. 88). His independence from the will of his bishops is revealed by various laws which anticipated the results of the general council of AD 381 (*C.Th* 16. 1. 2; 5. 6. 7) or respected them only incompletely (16. 1. 3). As the balance of political advantage and religious convictions fluctuates, it is difficult to evaluate Theodosius' policy: for example schismatic Novatians were treated with more consideration than heretics (pp. 25ff., 38ff.); the punishment of heretics did not aim at their conversion, but at their irreversible exclusion from society (pp. 33ff., 49; on the other hand at pp. 29ff., Ernesti speaks of a more conciliatory policy).

Strong measures against the pagans were not taken until AD 391/92 (*C.Th* 16. 10. 10–12 etc.). Prior to these years, official policy not only left considerable leeway to them (pp. 63ff.), but even the terms of imperial representation remained predominantly pagan, as proved by numismatic, epigraphic and iconographic sources (pp. 89–160) as well as by the panegyrics of Pacatus, Libanius, Themistius and Claudian (pp. 321–468) or further literary evidence (pp. 310ff.). In accordance with current *communis opinio*, Ernesti places the repudiation of the *pontificatus maximus* as 'programmatischer Auftakt' at the beginning of Theodosius' reign (pp. 63f., 88, 95); as I have shown in my (forthcoming) PhD thesis on Ausonius' *Gratiarum actio*, Zosimus' report (4. 36), the only source dealing with the end of this high pontificate, but in a passage concerning only Gratian, is nothing more than a literary fiction. The motivation of the policy shift towards paganism in AD 379–91 remains unclear: Ernesti is right in pointing out that the massacre of Thessalonica (AD 390) and Theodosius' subsequent penitence are unsatisfactory explanations. Yet the emperor's obvious need to court the favour of the Roman senatorial aristocracy did not cease in AD 391–4; *pace* Ernesti the usurpation of Eugenius and particularly his (reluctant) concessions towards the pagans were too late to affect Theodosius' programme for his religious policy. Though prosopographical material is taken into account, only a more systematic analysis would have permitted a convincing interpretation of the emperor's turn of policy (pp. 67–76 etc.).

Each section of the following two parts (pp. 161–320/474, 'Die Beurteilung des *princeps christianus* Theodosius durch seine christlichen/heidnischen Zeitgenossen') amply depicts the contemporary reception of the personality and policy of Theodosius. At the same time, outstanding documents of the mentality of the late fourth century are masterfully interpreted. One learns about the different images of the ideal ruler or the development of his cult by the comparison of panegyric, homiletic or poetic texts of Ambrose (pp. 161ff.), Prudentius (pp. 231ff.), John

Chrysostom (pp. 262ff.), Ausonius (pp. 310ff., who – *pace* Ernesti – was probably neither baptised nor close to the Church, though being of orthodox Christian faith: *Vers. Pasch.* 3–5; *Ephem.* 2f.), Pacatus (pp. 321ff.), Claudian (pp. 351ff.), Libanius (pp. 400ff.) and Themistius (pp. 444ff.). Although all of them seem to have had a high opinion of the emperor, neither the Christian nor the pagan writers' views are in unison. Thus Ernesti correctly points out that the modern image of Theodosius needs reappraisal. Unfortunately, he overlooks the fact that *parrhesía* was not at its height, and fails to note that the pagan evidence presented dates from before the crucial law *C.Th* 16. 10. 10, except for Claudian, who is known for religious indifference, though, and whose Emperor Honorius was grateful for the strong dynastic legitimation by means of the manifold illustrations of his father's and grandfather's apotheoses. The hostile testimony of Eunapius must not therefore be dismissed too easily as isolated (pp. 470–7).

The use of historiographic sources is confined to Rufinus (pp. 298ff.), Vir. Nic. Flavianus (pp. 316f.) and Eunapius/Zosmus (pp. 469ff.), whereas the testimony of later ecclesiastical historians (Socrates, Sozomenus and Theodoret) is only cited occasionally to supplement the evidence of the law codes. It would have been useful to take Philostorgius (9. 19–11. 2, ed. Bidez and Winkelmann, pp. 125–34) into account as well, for he writes from the point of view of the unorthodox Eunomians. The perspective of the heretics could further have been represented by the *Scholia Ariana* (308rf., 349r, ed. Gryson, pp. 250f, 324f. etc.).

Ernesti's final judgement appears somewhat apologetic. Although he censures Theodosius' intolerance and inquisitorial methods towards the heretics, he believes – maybe rightly – that the emperor stopped short of the ultimate sanction in religious affairs (despite the *summum supplicium* of *C.Th* 16. 5. 9) (p. 48f.). It is, however, surprising that in the two summaries (pp. 87f, 475–8) Ernesti neglects even to consider Theodosius' attitude to heretics, as when speaking of the 'Zustimmung beider Gruppen zu seiner Person' (my italics). The liberal behaviour of the court in relation to traditional forms of expression and faith as well as the positive opinions which pagans formed about Theodosius before the end of AD 391 overshadow Ernesti's view of the entire reign of this emperor, whom he acquits of 'blinde Radikalität': 'In der Religionspolitik hat er weitgehend auf Zwang und Gewalt verzichtet'; as he had tried to be 'Kaiser aller Römer', he deserves the cognomen the Great. With these conclusions I can only partly agree. Admittedly, one can trace attempts to avoid pogroms, but the deprivation of basic human and citizen rights, the incitement to denounce and inquire heretics (*C.Th* 16. 5. 9: the accused had to face torture even without condemnation), the toleration of the fanatic persecutions of pagans by Cynegius (p. 85), and the threat of expulsion or even death penalty (even if mitigated by occasional amnesties, p. 49) are expressions of a harsh brutality for which Theodosius is personally responsible. His anti-pagan campaigns turned out to compromise what *raison d'état* required: the toll taken at the Frigidus was heavy.

Although not all Ernesti's conclusions will stand, there are many merits in his diligent investigation, which illuminates plenty of facets of a crucial period of world history. Anyone concerned with the personality or religious policy of Theodosius will have to take this book into account.

*Histoire du christianisme*, III: *Les Églises d'orient et d'occident (432–610)*. By Luce Pietri. Pp. 1321 incl. 18 ills. Paris: Desclée, 1998. Fr. 495. 2 7189 0633 2

This third volume in the comprehensive *Histoire du Christianisme* planned to supersede the Fliche–Martin *History of the Church* completes the part devoted to antiquity. Neither the title page nor the preface indicate its chronological limits; only the cover discloses that its spread is from 432 to 610. Such minor flaws abound. The bibliographies appended to each chapter are very uneven in scope, and, what is worse, in their method of arrangement. Editions of texts used in different chapters are not always the same; there is no list of abbreviations; the index is only of proper names. The editorial hand of Luce Pietri has clearly not weighed heavily on the contributors. In a work evidently aiming to be definitive such blemishes should be ironed out in subsequent editions.

In scope and arrangement the nearest comparison is with the *History of the Church*, edited by Hubert Jedin and John Dolan 1973– ), conceived on a similar scale. Compared with this, the French equivalent is considerably larger, the treatment more expansive, often more relaxed and more narrative in its approach. The quarter of a century that has elapsed between the two naturally allows the French volume to be more up to date. As in the Herder, the chapters are also written by different experts in each field, and have a good claim to being authoritative. Their quality is bound to vary. On any showing, some are outstanding: the present reviewer would place Jacques Fontaine's chapters on Christianity in the Iberian peninsula, Claire Sotinel's on Italy, Yves Modéran's on North Africa and Philippe Bernard's on the liturgy among these.

It is refreshing to see language-boundaries becoming less intrusive in European scholarship. Although there are still surprising absences of important English and German work, the bibliographical horizon includes a fair number of non-francophone items. The lack of any reference, either in the notes or bibliographies, to the late Michael Wallace-Hadrill's large contribution to the study of Frankish Christianity is astonishing, though, happily, untypical of the book as a whole.

NOTTINGHAM

R. A. MARKUS

*Early Christians and animals*. By Robert M. Grant. Pp. ix+214 incl. 22 plates.

London–New York: Routledge, 1999. £45. 0 415 29294 3

Unfortunately, this book fails to live up to the blurb's claim that it provides 'a comprehensive and coherent analysis'. Its structure is curious. The first half covers 'Biblical animals' (though the discussion includes pagan evidence), 'Unusual animals' (including fish and insects) and 'Unreal animals' (the criterion for 'reality' is unclear). Then follow chapters on 'The Alexandrians', 'The Antiochenes' and 'The Latin Fathers', each including a section of translation, from the Physiologus, Basil of Caesarea's *Homilies on Genesis* and Isidore of Seville's *Etymologies* respectively. Finally, a translation of *Etymologies* xii is provided. By 'Antiochene', Grant simply means 'literal interpreter' (he includes even Irenaeus); but the implied contrast with Alexandrian treatment of this topic needs fuller defence. The translations are lucid and accurate. The text, however, sadly lacks direction and analysis. It also presumes knowledge of relatively obscure classical and early Christian authors. Despite the title, it ranges

into both pagan and medieval material, without delivering the promised comparisons with these; yet it also ignores the desert Fathers, important for this topic, and gives Augustine brief and idiosyncratic treatment. The allegedly 'lavish' illustrations, which are poorly annotated, have little connection with the period in question. It is a pity that Professor Grant's immense learning could not have been mediated by a stronger editorial hand, although the book could provide a useful quarry of material for scholars already interested in the topic.

TRINITY AND ALL SAINTS COLLEGE,  
LEEDS

MARGARET ATKINS

*Pilgrimage and holy space in late antique Egypt*. Edited by David Frankfurter. (Religions in the Graeco-Roman World, 134.) Pp. xiv + 517 incl. frontispiece and 4 maps + 4 diagrams and 7 plates. Leiden–Boston–Cologne: Brill, 1998. Nlg 276. 90 04 11127 1; 0927 7633

After a substantial and authoritative introduction by the editor (author of the acclaimed *Religion in Roman Egypt*), thirteen papers by Heike Behlmer, David Brakke, Stephen Davis, Georgia Frank, Peter Grossmann, Allen Kerkeslager (more than 100 pages on Jewish pilgrimage, which deserve a review of their own), Leslie MacCoull, Dominic Montserrat, Lucia Papini, Ian Rutherford, Irfan Shahid, Janet Timbie and (in French) Youri Volokhine present a reassuring roll-call. It is interesting to watch familiar scholars turning their characteristic varieties of attention to a single theme. Coherence is well maintained – not an automatic virtue in such collections. Most writers allowed their arguments to be governed by Frankfurter's brief. As one would expect from this series, the book is handsomely produced. It is impossible to summarise so hefty a volume. Some contributors are regionally broad in their reference: Volokhine, Shahîd (who has nothing to say about Egypt at all), MacCoull (on chant), Timbie (before she tackles her manuscript). But a natural preoccupation with place – Philae, Menouthis, Abû Minâ, Atripe, Antinoë – produces, in many of the papers, a markedly 'anchored' feeling and a wealth of material detail. Yet, these places of pilgrimage attracted from outside their locality, and fostered within it a constant movement (both literal and in the mind), which brings all detail to life. A reviewer may be allowed some favourites. David Brakke revisits his old friend Athanasius – an apparently unhelpful player in the pilgrimage game, but only because of his spiritual, transcendent emphasis, reinforced by exile and a suspicion of tombs. Georgia Frank, drawing on arguments developed in her new book on pilgrimage, *The memory of the eyes*, reminds us that texts might be a prelude or stimulus to pilgrimage, but could also be a substitute, depicting a holy landscape in terms drawn from other texts (especially, of course, the Bible). Dominic Montserrat, who delighted us recently with his *Sex and society in Graeco-Roman Egypt*, discusses the persistence of veneration at Menouthis, 'a striking continuum of religious usage' that reached from Isis to Cyrus and John. Janet Timbie continues the exhausting but vital process of bringing Shenoute to the surface of general scholarship (a concern echoed by Heike Behlmer and, less directly, by several other contributors). Her patient analysis of a little-studied manuscript, filled with instructions to devotees, marries splendidly the cautious

learning of the palaeographer and the perceptive imagination of the true historian. One is grateful in a special way for David Frankfurter's introduction, which, as is proper, relates the contributions to each other but also raises the discussion to a broader and more theoretical level, with an enveloping bibliography to match. He treats of Egypt as a rival to Palestine, as a local culture mounting a universal appeal. He discusses the status of the holy person who often lay at the centre of the pilgrim cult. He explores crucial abstractions – displacement, the Christian as pilgrim, the earthing of cosmic forces, the links between place and history. It is a masterly prelude to an exciting collection.

CATHOLIC UNIVERSITY OF AMERICA

PHILIP ROUSSEAU

*Nec timeo mori. Atti del congresso internazionale di studi ambrosiani nel XVI centenario della morte di sant' Ambrogio. Milano, 4–11 Aprile 1997.* Edited by Luigi F. Pizzolato and Marco Rizzi. (Studia Patristic Mediolanensia, 21.) Pp. xviii + 884. Milan: Vita e Pensiero, 1998. L. 100,000. 88 343 0060 2

These forty-two essays were presented at an international congress which convened in Milan to honor the sixteenth centennial of the great bishop's death in 397. The volume is modelled on the equally ponderous tome of miscellaneous papers delivered at the fifteenth centennial congress in 1897, and the volumes produced from the congresses of 1940 and 1974, commemorating the sixteenth centenary of Ambrose's birth and episcopal election respectively. Like its predecessors, the present collection represents a wide variety of literary, political, ecclesiastical, exegetical, rhetorical and cultural themes as is demanded, according to the editors, by the polyvalent mind and activity of Ambrose himself. There is certainly a wealth of continental scholarship here. But unlike the format of the published proceedings of the Oxford conference of patristic studies, there is no thematic classification of the essays.

Particularly useful is Giuseppe Visonà's essay that provides a *status quaestionis* of (mainly twentieth-century) Ambrosian researches appearing prior to 1974, and from 1974 to the present (i.e. 1996) 'su come sono maturate le condizioni in cui si svolge oggi'. In this latter period, scholarly output dramatically increased as the appearance of some one hundred related books and articles gives evidence, with a number of these being summarily reviewed. Concerning the primary texts, readers will find helpful Michaela Zelzer's chronology of Ambrose's works, especially the bishop's letters, in the beneficial light of the last twenty-five years of research, as well as a prosopographical survey drawn from Ambrose's writings of Christian *personae* in Italy by Elisabeth Paoli. Several points of Ambrosian exegesis are explored in the Lukan commentary, and the Hexameron, though surprisingly little attention is paid to doctrinal theology, with the exception of one or two essays.

Noteworthy in this collection are the number of essays which examine how Ambrose used the literature of the classical world as part of his own intellectual formation, and how he was employed as one of the principal *auctoritates* of the Church in the medieval and Reformation periods. Appeal to the Ambrosian legacy in vindication of one theology or another became just as influential as the bishop's writings themselves as was already seen in Paulinus' *Vita Ambrosii* or

Augustine's anti-Pelagian treatises. Finally, the reader will be grateful that the volume's indices are well-prepared, providing the reader with references to scriptural and Ambrosian texts, ancient and modern names.

LOYOLA UNIVERSITY,  
CHICAGO

DANIEL WILLIAMS

*Christians in Asia before 1500.* By Ian Gillman and Hans-Joachim Klimkeit. Pp. xiv + 391 incl. 9 maps + 36 plates. Richmond, Surrey: Curzon Press, 1999. £50. 0 7007 1022 1

The aim of this book is to highlight the diversity, richness and achievements of the Christian communities in Asia prior to the advent of the Portuguese, in the hope of promoting greater understanding – and perhaps greater humility – among European readers. A brief chapter on traditions about the apostolic diaspora is followed by 'a necessary excursus into theology'. This usefully reviews the various Christological controversies of the early Church and the ecumenical councils, like Ephesus (430) and Chalcedon (451), that were designed to resolve them, and introduces the principal 'separated' eastern Churches that emerged notwithstanding, notably the Monophysites and the Nestorians, as well as the essentials of Gnosticism and Manichaeism. The authors then adopt a geographical framework, with chapters on Christians in Syria and Palestine, Arabia, Armenia and Georgia, Iran, India, Central Asia and China; a final few pages are devoted to south-east Asia, and the vexed question of an intermittent Nestorian presence in Japan is treated in a short appendix. Throughout the book attention is given to matters of ecclesiastical organisation, monastic life, literary output and the propagation of the faith. Nestorianism and Monophysitism had to do battle in Asia with a greater variety of rivals – Buddhism, Hinduism, Taoism, Confucianism and Manichaeism, as well as Islam – than their medieval western *confrères* faced in Europe and the Near East, and had to adapt themselves to a greater number of linguistic and cultural traditions. Built on assumptions that were originally familiar to the Aramaean mind, and employing Syriac as its chief liturgical and theological medium, Asian Christianity not only incurred criticism from thirteenth- and fourteenth-century western European observers during the era of Mongol paramountcy, but – with graver consequences – found little favour in the eyes of the Portuguese in the sixteenth. The failure of early modern European colonisers and missionaries to recognise the validity of native Christianities (like that of the St Thomas Christians of India, for example), on such grounds as contamination by non-Christian religions, is highly ironic, given the fact that western Christianity was itself the product of a lengthy process of accommodation with Graeco-Roman thought that had continued for centuries after Chalcedon. Strong on ecclesiastical and doctrinal matters, the book makes the occasional chronological slip when it ventures beyond them: the Franciscan traveller Odoric of Pordenone died in 1331/2, not 1325 (p. 174); the date traditionally given for the end of the Liao dynasty in northern China is 1123–5, not 1218 (the date of the fall of the Qara-Khitai or 'Western Liao' in Central Asia) (p. 229); the Mongol ruler Batu died in 1255–6, not 1241 (p. 243); there is no evidence that the Franciscan missionary (not a papal envoy, as claimed at

p. 299) William of Rubruck died in 1270 (or indeed at any other date) (pp. 247–8); the Mongols destroyed the Tangut state in 1227, not 1239, and the last Sung emperor of southern China died after 1279, not ‘by 1278’ (p. 285). It is also curious that the otherwise very full bibliography includes none of the important work on Syriac Christianity in Iran and Iraq by J. M. Fiey. But these are relatively minor flaws when set alongside the book’s virtues. Gillman and Klimkeit have succeeded overall in producing a well-informed and readable survey which should serve as the standard work for many years to come.

KEELE UNIVERSITY

PETER JACKSON

*Muslim Spain and Portugal. A political history of al-Andalus.* By Hugh Kennedy. Pp. xvi + 342 incl. 2 maps. London: Longman, 1996. £44. 0 582 29968 3; 0 582 49515 6

This book comes in eleven chapters with a ‘Farewell to al-Andalus’ at the end, appendices listing the region’s rulers and relevant bibliography (largely of English-language works).

With Hugh Kennedy’s *The Prophet and the age of the caliphates* in mind, I approached his latest work with high hopes, expecting to find in it new insights and the sort of prejudice-free approach which one has come to expect of British scholarship when it looks beyond its own frontiers. And up to a point I was not disappointed. The parallels drawn with the conquest of Persia, the argument that local uprisings against the amirate did not amount to rebellions, the attitude of the ‘reconquered’ territories, al-Manṣūr’s continuity with what had preceded him, the parallels between the collapse of the caliphate and the Berber assault on Córdoba of 1010–13, the impediment to its recovery that the destruction of the caliphate’s economic foundations represented: on all these issues the author’s judgements are sound. There is no question but that the monetary problems of the *taifa* kings left them short of troops, requiring them to employ Christian warriors in their struggles against their Muslim neighbours and resulting in the depopulation of frontier cities and the consequent exposure to attack of outlying territories. What enabled Granada to survive, by contrast, was its investment in the Zanāta *guzāt*.

There are gaps in Kennedy’s reading. Account ought to have been taken of the anonymous *Ḍikr bilād al-Andalus* (Madrid 1983) and of the *Aḥbar al-fuqahāʾ* (Madrid 1992) of al-Ḥuṣānī. Granted, the facsimile edition (Madrid 1999) of Ibn Ḥayyān’s *Muqtabas* II on the amirate under al-Ḥakam and ‘Abd al-Raḥmān appeared too late for him. But it is extraordinary that he makes no use of either the *Historia arabum* or the *De rebus Hispaniae* of Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada or, for that matter, of the *Crónica general*, or the chronicles of the kings of Castile or the *Llibre dels feyts* of Jaume I. One could go on. Also regrettable is the absence of discussion of theories of power, the function of government, political objectives, the organisation of combatants, the fiscal system etc.

Factual errors abound. Widows are misrepresented as daughters (p. 17). For all Ubieto’s labours, Charlemagne’s army continues to be routed at Roncesvalles rather than in the *valle de Hecho* (p. 37). The Basques are confused with the *Oscenses* (forgetting that Huesca is the transcription of *Wašqa*). The assertion that the ‘public ceremonial’ of ninth-century Córdoba ‘was based directly on



'Abbasid models' (p. 44) flies in the face of the fact of the neo-Umayyad character of Córdoba's amirs. What is stated on p. 53 on fiscal aspects of the *ṭġūr* is contradicted on p. 59. The statements that 'mass conversion... undermined the fiscal basis of the Umayyad state' and that 'the new converts enjoyed a more favourable tax regime than the older Muslims' are nonsense, failing to take account both of the earlier activity of al-Ḥaġġāġ b. Yūsuf and of 'the fiscal rescript of 'Umar II'. Albeit the neo-Muslim in al-Andalus ceased to pay the *ġizya* he remained liable for the *uṣr*, while the former *ḥarāġ* was converted into the equivalent *ṭabl*. The caliphal campaign against the Tuġībīs in 937 was not 'supported by Christian troops from Alava' (p. 93). Quite the contrary: the troops in question were in league with Muṭarrif b. Munḍir of Calatayud and after Calatayud's capture they were executed. Al-Ḥakam II was never what could be called 'a strong ruler' (p. 106). Riding 'a la jineta' was not a fourteenth-century innovation (p. 282; Al-Ḥakam II had expressed admiration for the skills involved in 974). Over the last twenty years the *torres albaranas* of Calatrava la Vieja and Talavera la Reina and the citadels of Málaga, Mérida, Trujillo etc. have been shown to date from the amiral era. The statement that 'the Almohad period saw the introduction of large towers projecting from the walls and connected by an arch' (p. 252) therefore requires modification.

It is thirty-five years since W. M. Watt's *History of Islamic Spain* was published and high time that it was revised. No question about that. But the present volume has been pressed forward as its replacement with undue haste – pressed forward at the instigation of its publishers perhaps. Be that as it may, the abiding impression is that in the compiling of it too much account has been taken of secondary material and too little of the primary sources. Kennedy's book has all the appearance of work done in a hurry at the expense of careful consideration of the direction being taken by local studies of the subject (not that all those have been invariably well-judged, be it said). The author has simply not allowed himself sufficient time to familiarise himself with or to absorb the complexities of a period of all of 800 years. It is only after such preliminaries have been attended to, however, that a synthesis intended to do adequate justice to the facts of the matter should be attempted.

Perfectly satisfactory though English-speaking students of the subject will find *Muslim Spain and Portugal*, I believe that its author could quite easily have avoided the pitfalls I have indicated and done a much better job.

UNIVERSIDAD COMPLUTENSE,  
MADRID

PEDRO CHALMETA

*The Armenian commentary on Genesis attributed to Ephrem the Syrian.* 2 vols. Edited by Edward G. Mathews, Jr. (Corpus Scriptorum Christianorum Orientalium, 572, 573. *Scriptores Armeniaci*, 23, 24.) Pp. xv + 216; lii + 193. Louvain: Peeters, 1998. B. Fr. 3,100; B. Fr. 2,600. 90 429 0593 X; 90 429 0594 8; 0070 0401

In 1836 the Armenian Mekhitarist community on the island of San Lazaro, close to Venice, published four volumes containing Armenian translations of works by (or under the name of) Ephrem; among the texts in the first volume was a commentary on Genesis. Since no accompanying translation was provided, the

contents of these four volumes have received little serious attention in subsequent scholarship on this important Syriac author. Though several scholars had noted that the Armenian commentary differed from the surviving Syriac one, their explanation had been that there must have been two editions of the work. As Mathews points out in his important introduction to the translation volume, the Armenian and Syriac commentaries are of a very different character, and he produces strong evidence that the Armenian one must date from very much later than Ephrem's time, since it makes use of the exegetical work of Jacob of Edessa (d. 708) and the Syriac *catena* known as the *Catena Severi* (of c. 861). Whether the latter is really necessary as the *terminus post quem* is not in fact clear, and the matter can only be resolved when Jacob's *scholia* have been published in full (an edition by D. Kruisheer is in preparation). In any case, it is evident that the commentary contains a considerable amount of early material, only a small part of which is derived from Ephrem's extant Syriac Commentary. Thus there are several paradigmatic lists of typological pairings between Old Testament figures and Christ, of the kind found notably in early Syriac writers such as Aphrahat, and the compiler also knows the early apocryphal traditions of the light at Jesus' baptism and the fragrance experienced at Pentecost. Another intriguing feature of the commentary concerns the readings attributed to 'the Hebrew', for these are different from those hitherto known from Eusebius of Emesa's commentary (also preserved only in Armenian), which have recently been studied by R. B. Ter Haar Romeny in his *A Syrian in Greek dress* (1997); the fact that some of these represent the reading of one or other of the Targums simply adds to their interest.

As Mathews himself indicates, there is clearly much more work needed on identifying sources and sorting out the inter-relationship of all these texts, but the present careful re-edition (on a wider manuscript basis) and annotated translation will be an essential starting point for all future investigation.

WOLFSON COLLEGE,  
OXFORD

SEBASTIAN BROCK

*Empire and order. The concept of empire, 800–1800.* By James Muldoon. (Studies in Modern History.) Pp. viii + 209. Basingstoke–London: Macmillan/New York: St Martin's Press, 1999. £42.50. 0 333 65013 1; 0 312 22226 2

In this book James Muldoon offers a synoptic overview of one of the most flexible and evocative concepts in the political vocabulary. 'Empire' between classical times and the high Middle Ages meant everything from Persian or Macedonian conquest and universal Roman rule to universal Christian empire or rule over multiple kingdoms. By the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries it meant the equivalent of temporal or national 'sovereignty', particularly when deployed by civil lawyers against the *plenitudo potestatis* of the papacy. The French civil lawyers held that the king was 'emperor' in his realm ('rex in regno suo est imperator'), that he recognised no superior save God in 'temporal' matters, that the clergy's jurisdiction was confined to 'spiritual' affairs, and that the king might tax his clergy. The papacy had no authority to legislate for the kingdom in temporal affairs, because the prerequisite for legislation was dominion, and the pope had no dominion over the king's subjects. These ideas formed the legal and jurisdictional substructure for the subordination of the clergy to secular power by

the Renaissance monarchies, and became a fundamental point of reference for the Anglo-American constitutional tradition when Henry VIII broke with Rome and declared the royal supremacy over the Church of England. All English monarchs from Elizabeth I to Elizabeth II have been 'supreme governor' of the Church of England: a charismatic residue remains. Tony Blair has argued that it is impossible to change the 1701 Act of Settlement because the Act also confirms the Church of England as the Established Church south of the border and the sovereign as its 'supreme governor'. Altering the act would require the disestablishment of the Church of England. In addition, fifteen Commonwealth countries would need to remodel their constitutions. The Founding Fathers in the United States rejected an Established Church and the unmitigated parliamentary 'absolutism' that they believed was the product of the colonisation by the executive of the 'imperial' prerogative of the crown-in-parliament after the Revolution of 1688. They held that the executive had proceeded to cement its power in court and country in order to assume the mantle of the 'king-in-parliament'. From this standpoint it could be argued that to have replaced an 'imperial' monarchy with the sovereignty of king, Lords and Commons in and after 1689 was to replace a tyrant with one head with a tyrant with three. No sooner had the first Elizabethan monarchy established its credentials than colonists and intellectuals like Sir Walter Raleigh, Sir John Davies and John Dee experimented with 'imperial' idioms to conjure up a vision of Protestant England (and 'Britain') as an hegemonic central power ruling its dependent territories from across the oceans. European overseas conquests were subsequently labelled 'empires'. Yet 'empires' were by definition expansionist. The fear of universal Catholic (and French) monarchy was the shibboleth of the late seventeenth century. Later, even as the Holy Roman Empire declined into irrelevance, the concept of 'empire' continued to attract the attention of those who feared the moral corruption of imperial government. In the nineteenth century, imperialists imagined colonial expansion as creating virtuous empires that would civilise and convert subjugated and often heathen peoples. Even then, however, the idiom retained negative implications that made its direct application to western European contexts unacceptable. Disraeli understood this, when Victoria was created empress of India, not of Great Britain. Empress was an acceptable title for a subjugated people, but not for the ruler of Englishmen, exactly the obstacle that James VI and I had encountered when he floated the notion of an empire of Great Britain during the union debates after 1604. Muldoon has at one level provided a brilliantly concise and comprehensive survey. He is sensitive to nuances and idioms as well as to the vast geographical and chronological challenge he has accepted. His concern that reviewers may find his book 'too stark, too legalistic, and [too focused] on canon law' is unwarranted. If anything, the legal and ecclesiastical dimensions of the concept of 'empire' are played down and there is little, if anything, on the conciliarist 'counter-theses' to the 'imperial' idea that emerged (particularly) in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries. There are also (perhaps inevitably) slips and imperfections. The account of Henry VIII's break with Rome confuses the Act of Supremacy with the Act of Appeals (p. 128) and indexes its account of 'empire' and the royal supremacy on the basis of obsolete articles by R. Koebner (whose name is misspelled) and W. H. Dunham, while ignoring the transformative work of G. D.

Nicholson and V. M. Murphy (and even J. J. Scarisbrick), which is readily identifiable in standard bibliographical citations. The book is organised thematically rather than chronologically. This will assist scholars, if it is less useful to students. One wonders at whom the book is really aimed. It is a convenient (if expensive) *vade-mecum* for students, but cannot hope to provide the basic background information that they would need to take full advantage of it.

UNIVERSITY OF ST ANDREWS

JOHN GUY

Vita Sancti Wilfridi auctore Edmero. *The life of Saint Wilfrid by Edmer*. Edited by Bernard J. Muir and Andrew J. Turner. (Exeter Medieval Texts and Studies.) Pp. lxxxv + 293 incl. colour frontispiece. Exeter: University of Exeter Press, 1998. £50. 0 85989 597 1

The impulse for this new edition of Edmer's *Life* of Wilfrid was provided by the discovery of a fourth manuscript, in Ballarat, Australia (D). It has to be said that the new witness hardly sings for its supper. As Muir and Turner say, it provides the great majority of variant readings ('approximately 72%'); but all are worthless, though they are recorded with exemplary care (for example 'this word is divided over a line break thus in D: *beatis/ssimi* [giving it an extra *s*]'). The editors think it important as 'the sole extant descendant of an important recension of the *VSW*' from which later redactions descend. But when we have Edmer's own autograph (B), and two twelfth-century books (A and C) that witness to the state of the text before Edmer gave it its final revision, we can hardly feel that we have been much missing D all this time. The value of this edition is rather that it uses B as its base, unlike Raine's unsatisfactory *Rolls Series* text which relied on C (Raine commenting of B: 'When any collected edition of Eadmer's works is prepared, the editor must give to this ms. his most earnest attention'), and clearly identifies variants shared by AC (and often D too) against B. There are only a handful of these, but it is notable that one or two (thus 138 n. 1 and 140 n. 7) provide better cursus than what Edmer finally settled on. I should not be sure that the parent of A and C 'was not written out by Edmer' (p. lxxv). The text, in any case, is soundly based, and rarely brings one up short, though the punctuation is quite often faulty, and I cannot see why, when the scribe of B took the trouble to differentiate between the diphthongs *ae* and *oe* (p. lxiv), his pains should be ignored. There is a facing translation, not always accurate, where I looked at it: thus at the end of c. 68 'sis liberatus' is not a wish (and a reference is needed in the commentary to c. 104). The text is prefaced by a substantial introduction, followed by the abbreviation called the Breviloquium (found only in B) and an appendix giving a text of the Ripon and Balliol excerpts, and equipped with a detailed commentary. The latter is informative rather than innovative; it misses some classical allusions (as to Virg. *Aen.* xii. 313 at c. 4 'quo ruitis?'). It is not the editors' fault that this *Life*, founded as it is on Bede, Eddius Stephanus and Frithegod, is of no historical import. But the story of its transmission throws glaring light on what the monks of the time were prepared to do in the interests of their property.

CORPUS CHRISTI COLLEGE,  
OXFORD

MICHAEL WINTERBOTTOM

*Holy Russia and Christian Europe. East and west in the religious ideology of Russia.* By Wil van den Bercken. (Trans. by John Bowden of *De mythe van het Oosten. Oost even West in de religieuze ideeëngeschiedenis van Rusland.* Zoetermeer: Meinema, 1998.) Pp. viii + 248. London: SCM Press, 1999. £14.95 (paper). 0 334 02782 9

Seventy years of communism came close to destroying the Russian Orthodox Church as an institution in the Soviet Union. So much is amply documented. What is less well known is the way in which the régime falsified Russian history to misrepresent or underplay the role of Christianity. Wil van den Bercken, who lectures on Russian history at the University of Utrecht, here sets the record straight in all its essentials. He does so, furthermore, in a straightforward and readable way, making his book accessible to the general reader, as well as being of value to the specialist. John Bowden, his translator, never puts a foot wrong in negotiating a minefield.

It is in his re-assessment of the early period, *Kievskia Rus'*, that van den Bercken makes his greatest contribution. The actual events of just before 988 (the conversion to Christianity) and the few years after could not, of course, be suppressed in the communist era and the account of them as found in the monastic *Povest' vremennykh let* ('Narrative of bygone years') was always available. However, any assessment of the new quality of life which Kievan Russia acquired as a result of the conversion, either internally from the moral point of view, or externally in regard to the country taking its place among the fellowship (as it seemed to the Russians at the time) of Christian nations, would take the Soviet regime into an unwelcome ideological realm.

At this point van den Bercken jogged my memory in a very personal way. When I was a student in Moscow in 1959, with the Soviet Union undergoing yet another wave of anti-religious persecution, my stated field of study was the history of Kievan Russia. This had been just about accepted by the Soviet authorities, in order to lift the new exchange scheme off the ground, but when it came to doing serious study of the early texts and discussing interpretations of them with serious scholars, there was a consistent denial of any access to archives even as ancient as these. I was particularly interested in Metropolitan Ilarion, whose *Slovo o Zakone i Blagodati* ('Oration on Law and Grace'), written about 1051, is one of the great monuments of Russian medieval literature. The text is well known to all Slavists and I had studied it at Oxford. It is also an outstanding work of theology, perhaps unique in the world of its time. As such its humaneness, ecumenical stance and balance were not acceptable to Soviet ideologists. Not only was there no work being done on it in Russia at the time, but even the text was inaccessible there, except for a few extracts published in anthologies of Kievan literature.

Van den Bercken sets all this in context in an extensive and exhilarating chapter of over thirty pages. Of course, redoubtable Soviet scholars of integrity, such as Dmitry Lichačev (I use the transliteration followed in this book) did what they could. The author describes it thus:

Ilarion's Oration was not incorporated in the first volume of the serious *Pamjatniki Literatury Drevnei Rusi* [*Monuments of the Literature of Old Rus'*], edited by Dmitry Lichačev in 1978. In the introduction, however, Lichačev praises the literary quality of the work. This makes the absence of the text in the edition of the sources all the more conspicuous.

Lichačev also passes a very favourable judgment on its content: 'The Oration takes great pride in the results of the Christians culture in Rus', and, curiously enough, in spite of all this it does not show any national narrow-mindedness.'

Given the year (Brezhnev's heyday) these were words of considerable bravery from a graduate of the Solovki concentration camp. Lichačev, who died only in 1999, well in his nineties, lived long enough not only to see justice done to Ilarion and many others, but also to contribute to it. The above-mentioned *Monuments* series, which had begun publication sixteen years earlier and should have had the Oration as the *pièce de résistance* of the first volume, now incorporated a critical edition into the twelfth and final one, published in 1994, dealing with the seventeenth century! Even now, van den Bercken continues, Ilarion is being misinterpreted by many as a symbol of early Russian nationalism, when in truth he was an internationalist.

Examination of this chapter indicates the quality of this work, but there are other passages on later authors containing comparable insights: on Andrej Kurbskij (sixteenth century) and Pëtr Čaadaev (first half of the nineteenth century), for example.

Van den Bercken does not set out to write anything of substance on the fate of the Church itself in the communist period, but moves on quickly to the present, where he presents a brief and balanced judgement: the rebuilding of the Cathedral of Christ the Saviour in Moscow has been vitiated by the 'false religious mystique surrounding it'. The rebuilding of the churches on Red Square is much more important and incorporates a more positive symbolism.

The general reader may find the transliteration system used in this book a little irksome. It is an international phonetic one, but only with diligence will the non-Russian speaker learn how to pronounce from it. It is not consistent to read 'Puškin' (for Pushkin), 'Yeltsin' and 'Yuri Luzhkov' (not Elcin and Jurij Lužkov). However, the compensation is a scrupulous text almost without a misprint.

KESTON INSTITUTE,  
OXFORD

MICHAEL BOURDEAUX

*Julian of Norwich. Autobiography and theology.* By Christopher Abbot. (Studies in Medieval Mysticism, 2.) Pp. xiv + 197. Cambridge: D. S. Brewer, 1999. £35. 0 85991 548 4; 1465 5683

The bibliography to this work lists fifty books and articles specifically on Julian of Norwich and her writings, the large majority of them written since 1980, as well as the three critical editions of her *Revelations*, those by Colledge and Walsh in 1978, by Marion Glasscoe in 1993, by Georgina Ronan Crampton also in 1993. This large number gives some idea of the extent to which Julian has become the object of scholarly interest in recent years, as well as having achieved remarkable popularity with a wider public. In this thoughtful and perceptive study, based on his recent doctoral thesis for Manchester University, Christopher Abbott provides a good summary of recent literature as well as proposing his own interpretations. The book is not an introductory work; it presupposes a good knowledge of the anchoress's writings and some familiarity with recent secondary

literature. Of the two versions of Julian's sole work, *Revelations (or Showings) of divine love*, Abbot bases his study on the Long text, which he regards as her finished work, though he makes some use of the Short text, which he considers an early draft. While the Short text survives in a single fifteenth-century manuscript, the Long text provides some insuperable problems of reconstruction since the earliest manuscripts date from around 1650, but Abbot prefers to attempt what can be said rather than to be overwhelmed by the difficulties. Of the two main manuscripts of the Long text, he prefers BL, ms Sloane 2499, edited by Glasscoe, to Paris, Bibliothèque nationale fonds anglais 40, edited by Colledge and Walsh, mainly on the grounds that the former is much closer to fourteenth-century English, though sometimes the Paris manuscript provides valuable insights. 'Autobiography' in the subtitle is the key to the book. Chapter i explains what he means: not an autobiography in the modern sense, nor even in the more egocentric forms of Augustine's *Confessions* or *The book of Margery Kempe*, but in her own way Julian seeks 'to reconstruct personal experience in terms of a governing theological rationale' (p. 10). Four chapters develop this theme: 'Journey into Christ', 'Incarnation: a Lord and a servant', 'Incarnation: the city of God', 'Interiority and pastoral dimension'. While Abbot emphasises Julian's self-assurance and her readiness to speak, without the authority of ecclesiastical office, he sees her as loyal to the Church rather than as a crypto anticlerical. The attractive and astonishingly modern features of Julian's spirituality are treated well: God as a playful lover (p. 22), heaven means human beings becoming themselves (p. 118, Abbott's interpretation), the motherhood of God and of Christ, how we and our deficiencies are transformed into good rather than annihilated, Julian's pastoral concern in addressing people living in the world. Only her teaching on universal salvation, 'all shall be well', seems to lack adequate treatment. Since biography is central to the work, Abbott pays surprisingly little attention to the background to Julian's life, to what is known about religion in Norwich and East Anglia at the time.

CAMPION HALL,  
OXFORD

NORMAN TANNER SJ

*Religious life for women, c. 1100–c. 1350. Fontevraud in England.* By Berenice Kerr. (Oxford Historical Monographs.) Pp. xix + 299 incl. 20 figs, 7 maps and 7 tables. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1999. £45. 0 19 820752 2

This is a study of the first two centuries of the three English daughter houses – Amesbury, Nuneaton and Westwood – of the abbey of Fontevraud. Westwood, the earliest foundation, was small and poor in comparison to the two 'high status' houses of Nuneaton, founded by Robert II, earl of Leicester, and Amesbury, founded by Henry II and much favoured by the women of his dynasty. To link the three houses and to sustain her central thesis of the empowerment of the women who lived in them Kerr has to demonstrate their distinctive character. She finds this initially in the circumstances of the foundation of the order of Fontevraud by Robert of Arbrissel and its shaping by the first two aristocratic abbesses. Fontevraud was to be an 'autonomous, independent order for women', ruled by a woman, and served by men 'with a specific vocation to provide for the

nuns materially and spiritually'. The nature of the surviving evidence for the English houses, however, makes it difficult to support the idea that they offered more opportunities to their inmates than other nunneries of a similar size and endowment. What survives are mainly charters and other estate documents and these are analysed with exemplary efficiency in an attempt to prove that the nuns were highly competent and even enterprising in the consolidation and exploitation of their resources. Some bricks made with very little straw are hurled in the direction of those who present 'conventional stereotypes' of nuns as poverty-stricken and incompetent. It is difficult, however, to identify 'dynamic, resourceful and positive women' in this account of estate management and domestic economy. Two of the trio of houses had the advantages of size and wealth and there is the interesting suggestion that it was only the central control exerted by Fontevraud and the effective deployment of a talented prior which enabled the less well-endowed Westwood to survive the economic crisis of the early fourteenth century. Very little is known about the spiritual state of the houses as the visitation records are mainly concerned with financial matters. There is, however, some evidence that the presence in Amesbury of high-born women with their own income and expensive tastes could cause considerable tension and that prestige may have been bought at a price. More significantly there was a rebellion in Nuneaton against the aristocratic rule of Eleanor of Brittany, granddaughter of Henry III who became abbess in 1304 and this resistance to central control seems to have continued after the close of this study in 1350. Although it provides only a few new insights into religious life for women in England in the period, this is a useful addition to studies of the monastic economy. As well as a massive, 20-page bibliography there is a valuable appendix which lists all known inmates of the three foundations.

UNIVERSITY OF ST ANDREWS

ANN J. KETTLE

*Carmel in medieval Catalonia.* By Jill R. Webster. (The Medieval Mediterranean, 23.) Pp. xvii + 202 incl. map + 4 plates. Leiden–Boston–Cologne: Brill, 1999. Nlg 129. 90 04 11435 1; 0928 5520

Two recent publications, Balbino Velasco Bayon's *Historia del Carmelo Español* (Rome 1990) and Pablo Garrido's *El Solar Carmelitano de San Juan de la Cruz: la antigua provincia de Castilla (1416–1836)* (Madrid 1996), have improved considerably our knowledge of the Carmelite order in medieval Spain. Dr Webster's study now marks a further milestone in this progress. She has studied the surviving records of the friars in Catalonia for many years and has an impressive knowledge of the surviving documents. Now she has used her researches to produce a concise history of the medieval Carmelite province. Her account is comprehensive, containing considerable detail and her prose is clear and easy to read. Not content with simply recounting the development of the province, she includes numerous appendices containing the texts of relevant documents and lists of friars. The result is praiseworthy and it is only sad that the text is marred by so many mistakes and erroneous interpretations. For instance, on p. 91, she states that Francesc Martí was 'in his third year as biblicus in 1372', whereas the actual wording of the acts of the general chapter in 1372 state that Martí was to



begin at Paris in the third year following the chapter, that is from 1374. This misreading is repeated throughout the book. Other errors include the reference to the term vicar-general as 'probably meaning prior provincial' (p. 63), whilst the reference to 'Thomas Waley' (p. 83) should be to Thomas Netter of Walden and it was not him but Thomas Scrope who translated Felip Ribot's *De institutione*. More worrying is Dr Webster's interpretation of her findings. She claims that there was a revival of interest in the eremitical life among the Carmelites in the late 1300s, prompted by the emergence (c. 1390) of Felip Ribot's *De institutione*. However, Ribot's composition was designed to provide justification for the order's legendary origins and there is no evidence for any eremitical movement among the Carmelites in Spain at this period. There is no evidence that the three eremitical foundations that she cites – Peralada, Terrassa and Salgar – were anything other than small country foundations. Peralada, especially, tempts Dr Webster into a further extravagant idea. A history of the house, written by Francisco Font in 1636, contains a supposed foundation charter dated 1206. However, this predates the Carmelite rule and Fr Balbino, in his history, gives convincing reasons for judging Font's work a forgery. Dr Webster, though, repeatedly discusses this document, wondering whether some hermits from Mount Carmel could have visited Catalonia in 1206. The total lack of corroborating evidence is ignored and she seems unwilling to accept that the document is a forgery designed to enhance the stature of the house. Overall, this volume could have been a valuable addition to Carmelite studies but it is marred by inaccuracies and misleading hypotheses.

ROME

RICHARD COPSEY O.C.A.R.M.

*Worldly saints. Social interaction of Dominican penitent women in Italy 1200–1500.* By Maiju Lehmijoki-Gardner. (Bibliotheca Historica, 35.) Pp. 189. Helsinki: Suomen Historiallinen Seura, 1999. 951 710 097 3; 1238–3503

This slim volume examines the experience of nineteen Dominican penitent women as revealed in published hagiographies. It is naturally dominated by the life of Catherine of Siena, the only one to be canonised in the period, but continual cross-reference to the lives of the other women studied, ranging from the late thirteenth century to pre-Tridentine Italy, allows the author to convey an intimate picture of the secular penitent's life as viewed by male hagiographers and as contrasted with that of regular penitents. She systematically explores the elements necessary to create a holy life in the world, including constructs such as the 'mental cell' (p. 73) designed to preserve solitude, but coupled with the habit which was essential to women outside the cloister. The ambivalence of churchmen, here seen in terms of pragmatism rather than sexual fear, is well portrayed. The increasing substitution of the *vita activa* by emphasis on visions and mysticism is linked to the shift towards enclosed penitent communities. Lehmijoki-Gardner's chosen chronology gives an appropriately long perspective on such issues. She has many illuminating points to make and does so in a disarmingly direct fashion. Many readers will be grateful that the publication is in English and not in the author's mother-tongue, but it is a great pity that the prose remains persistently inaccurate and the poor quality of typesetting is of no

assistance. Some may be discouraged by these quirks but it is worth persisting to gain a better grasp of the lives and struggles of these women and their hagiographers.

ST ANDREWS

FRANCES ANDREWS

*Le carte duecentesche del Sacro Convento di Assisi (Instrumenti, 1168–1300)*. By Attilio Bartoli Langeli. (Fonti e Studi Francescani, 5. Inventari 4). Pp. xci + 514. Padua: Centro Studi Antoniani, 1997. L. 140,000 (paper). 88 85155 34 0

For students of St Francis, of the Basilica in which he is buried and of the Sacro Convento adjacent to it, and of Assisi as a modest Italian city of the thirteenth century, this is a fascinating collection of texts. It contains the original *Instrumenti* in the archives of the Sacro Convento earlier than 1300, 186 in all. These are secular documents: the papal bulls and other ecclesiastical records are not included; and it comprises originals, not copies from the registers. There is nothing here that was wholly unknown: the work of A. Fortini and S. Nessi had revealed the contents of the archive. But a full critical edition with the thorough commentary here provided makes the documents accessible in quite a novel way. The meticulous scholarship and the very full and informative notes greatly enhance its value.

Its interest is threefold. First, it contains the records of the gifts and purchases out of which the site for the basilica and convent was formed in the late 1220s, then enhanced in the 1250s and later. Secondly, it provides our main source of information on the family of St Francis. In the early *Lives*, only his father is named, and from them one might suppose that Francis and his family became permanently alienated. These documents are particularly revealing for the career and involvement of Francis's nephew Picardo – son of his brother Angelo – who figures in many of the documents as the lay proctor of the Basilica. He was evidently a considerable man of affairs, energetic in gathering support for the friars, arranging conveyances, acting as executor of wills and so forth. It is possible that Picardo became a friar late in life, but in any case he was for over thirty years, from the 1250s to the 1280s, deeply involved in the management of their affairs; and a few other members of the family figure in these records.

The majority of the documents, however, have very little directly to do with the friars: they are notarial instruments, largely wills, evidently deposited in the Sacro Convento for safe keeping. These have much to tell us of local topography and prosopography, and of the leading men and women of Assisi. No. 175 lists the occupants of a new street close to the Basilica of forty houses in eight at least of which siblings lived side by side. The wills are valuable evidence for the extent and range of almsgiving; they are also frequently revealing of the different ways in which husbands treated their wives – and in a few cases, of how well-to-do widows had the disposal of substantial means. This is a model edition of an exceptionally interesting collection of texts.

CLARE HALL,  
CAMBRIDGE

ROSALIND B. BROOKE

*The history of the Albigensian Crusade. Peter of les Vaux-de-Cernay's Historia albigensis.*  
 Edited and translated by W. A. Sibley and M. D. Sibley. Pp. xlvii + 338 incl.  
 5 maps and 3 genealogical tables. Woodbridge: Boydell Press 1998. £40.  
 0 85115 658 4

The chronicler here translated *in toto* for the first time into English from the classic text of Guébin and Lyon is one of the most important and illuminating chroniclers of the Albigensian Crusade because of the author's close relationship to his uncle, abbot of a monastic house in northern France near to the estates of Simon de Montfort, later bishop of Carcassonne, and participant in crucial debates on the war, and because he so faithfully reflects the attitudes of northern French aristocrats and clergy. He had, too, an eye for military matters; to which the editors have responded with a good bibliography and notes clarifying siege-engines, conditions of warfare and terrain, together with an appendix on mercenaries. Footnotes are an excellent feature: they climb up the page, sometimes occupying half the space, lucid and well-written, balancing Pierre's one-sided exposition and hero worship of Simon with an up-to-date commentary on political and military events, giving the light and shade of true history. Pierre's portrait of Simon carries conviction as far as it goes, bringing out the man's courage, unerring eye for military essentials, fidelity to subordinates and true piety. The Sibleys add more on his overweening ambition and give a fair account in another good appendix. Innocent III is also well handled, with an appendix of correspondence in translation and another on his attitudes to crusade (the note on p. 316 on his letter of 21 April 1198 demands special attention). The notes on the Cathars need amplification. They fail to bring out the degree to which the work of Abels and Harrison on the participation of women demolished the notion of a special appeal, at least at *credentes* level. Arno Borst, valuable for reference, is available in French, and articles in *Heresis* deserve mention; perhaps most of all, the journal's conference reports, which include Roquebert's account of Fanjeaux. The appendix on Béziers would have gained value from J. Berlioz's *Tuez-les tous* of 1994 and his intriguing reference to 2 Timothy. The translation flows admirably – only it seems odd to read of laymen celebrating rather than receiving communion. Pierre's model was the Old Testament. He wrote providential history, with the crusaders taking the role of the Israelites: God chastises them for their failings, teaches them lessons in humility, aids them with miracles. Half in joke, the editors call Pierre Manichaean for his abrupt division into the good, i.e. the crusaders, and the bad, the southern resistance – but he was following a scriptural pattern. Criticisms are few: this is a fine piece of work.

EASTCOMBE,  
STROUD

M. D. LAMBERT

*Nordic perspectives on medieval canon law.* Edited by Mia Korpiola. (Publications of the Matthias Calonius Society, II.) Pp. x + 167. Helsinki: University of Helsinki, 1999. Fin.Mk 100 (paper). 951 96259 1 7; 0788 8406

*Nordic perspectives on medieval canon law* contains nine articles from a workshop held in Helsinki in March 1998. The book is divided into two parts. The first part, which contains articles written by James A. Brundage and three scholars from

Finland, Christian Krötzel, Virpi Mäkinen and Jussi Varkemaa, deals with some traditional themes in the study of canon law, including the duties of canon lawyers towards their clients, canonisation, Franciscan poverty and individual liberty.

The second part of the book focuses on canon law culture and marriage, especially in medieval Scandinavia. In this part we find articles by Per Ingesman about canon law culture in late medieval Denmark, by Agnes Arnórsdóttir, which discusses two models of marriage in Iceland in later Middle Ages, by Michael H. Gelting, debating the canonical incest prohibitions, by Mia Korpiola, who writes about parental consent in secular and canon law in medieval Scandinavia, and by Kirsi Salonen, concerning illegal marriages in Finland around 1500.

Most of the papers are quite interesting to read, and I would especially like to mention Gelting's article on the canonical incest prohibitions, which he explains as the Church's attempt to create peace. In the preface the editor discusses why the articles in this book were written in English (although one is in German). The reason he gives is the wish to participate in the ongoing discussion of this theme in Europe, and to show the Nordic countries as a part of a Catholic European culture. More than half of the contributors come from Finnish universities, thus reflecting the leading role that the Finns have taken in this field in the Nordic countries.

UNIVERSITY OF OSLO

JON SIGURDSSON

*Medieval decorative ironwork in England.* By Jane Geddes. (Reports of the Research Committee of the Society of Antiquaries of London, 59.) Pp. xv + 411 incl. 6 maps and 19 tables. London: The Society of Antiquaries of London, 1999. £75. 0 85431 273 0; 0953 7163

Usually perceived as a craft rather than an art, the wrought-ironwork of doors, chests and grilles has received scant attention from medieval art historians. Yet its richness, inventiveness and iconographical interest are abundantly clear from this excellent book, which discusses (and illustrates in numerous photographs) every significant example remaining in England. The development of decorative hinges and straps on church doors is traced from Anglo-Saxon practice, known only from manuscript pictures and ancillary material such as coffin-mounts, through surviving examples of the late eleventh and twelfth centuries. A turning-point, at the start of the thirteenth century, was the introduction of die-stamping to produce complex foliate terminals for scrollwork; it culminated in the work of the master smith Thomas of Leighton, whose distinctive stamps are identified, by a remarkable piece of detective-work, both on his documented grille over Queen Eleanor's tomb (1293/4) and on the church door at his native Leighton Buzzard. The late Middle Ages saw new traditions of precise, cold-worked, locks, ring-plates and fittings, and of tomb-grilles with battlemented crestings and finials. For ecclesiastical historians the most interesting parts of this book are likely to be chapter vi, 'The liturgical and symbolic importance of church doors', and chapter viii, 'Picture doors', which discuss the remnants of twelfth-century iconographic schemes – the door as the Gate of Heaven or shield of divine

protection, Old Testament themes such as Eden and Noah's ark, even perhaps the invention of the True Cross – in relation to the better-preserved Scandinavian material. Here we glimpse a nearly lost world of Romanesque imagery that may once have been as prolific in English parish churches as tympana, corbels or wall-paintings.

THE QUEEN'S COLLEGE,  
OXFORD

JOHN BLAIR

*The Church in medieval York. Records edited in honour of Professor Barrie Dobson.* Edited by David M. Smith. (Borthwick Texts and Calendars, 24.) Pp. viii + 168. York: Borthwick Institute of Historical Research, University of York, 1999. £15 + £1 post and packing from The Borthwick Institute of Historical Research, St Anthony's Hall, Peasholme Green, York YO1 7PW. 0 903857 78 2

This is a splendid way to honour a scholar who has had a long connection with the University of York and has done a great deal to further the history of the city and region. Instead of a collection of disparate articles, this group comprises well-edited versions of short documents, very relevant to the history of the Church in the city, which would otherwise probably not have been published, or would have appeared in diverse places. D. M. Palliser edits a mortmain inquest, which probably dates to 1228, detailing 164 properties in York given to religious houses (including ten to Durham prior). P. H. Cullum gives a visitation record in 1287 for St Leonard's hospital, showing serious financial problems. Janet Burton prints Archbishop Melton's visitations of St Mary's Abbey and St Clement's priory. Both had very serious debts. David Smith edits documents about the foundation of chantries in the chapel of St William on Ouse bridge. Joan Greatrex adds to the little that is known of medieval Carmelite history with a document about the dispute between the Carmelites and the rector of St Crux in 1450, from William de la Zouche's register, showing how compromise was produced. Some accounts from 1394 and 1397 about the gilds and fabric of St Margaret's, Walmgate, reveal a little more about participation in parish life by the laity. The document edited by Rosemary Hayes, concerning the jurisdiction of the dean and chapter in the city, is of great interest for revealing the layout of parts of the city. Heather Swanson manages to make some apparently unrevealing building accounts from the mid fifteenth century speak clearly about the building trade and how it worked. Alison McHardy has two lively cases of clerical criminality from the register of Archbishop William Booth, one involving theft by a Scots labourer from George Neville. A collection of indulgences issued by the archbishops between 1450 and 1500 (edited by B. Nilson and R. Frost) is very useful and the account by C. Webb of the obit of Robert Dale from 1503 includes a fairly lengthy introduction about obits. Finally Claire Cross has a lively piece about an unseemly affray in Petergate in 1540, a boundary dispute involving christening rights. Altogether the collection is a fitting tribute to a great scholar.

UNIVERSITY OF DURHAM

MARGARET HARVEY

*The Spanish inquisition.* By John Edwards. Pp. 160 incl. 48 ills + 18 colour plates.

Stroud–Charleston, SC: Tempus, 1999. £18.99 0 7524 1770 3

In a very brief text that covers some eighty pages, and is both easy to read and scholarly, the author offers a quick survey of the origins and nature of the Spanish inquisition. The presentation is popular, but has the serious intention of surveying the historical context and the religious presuppositions of the Holy Office. Edwards writes as a medievalist, and therefore centres most of his survey on the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries, the period of ‘origins’, with very little on the subsequent period, when the Inquisition became more notorious and provoked the hostility of the Reformation. After the main exposition, there is a quick summary of the tribunal’s role in areas outside Castile, and a few pages at the end are devoted to the nineteenth century, in order to mention its abolition. Beginners to the subject will find this a congenial and informative introduction, though they should watch out for occasional slips (the laws of Catalonia, for example, are referred to as *fors*; and the number of Jews expelled from the peninsula in 1492 is put unusually high). The author’s almost exclusive concentration on the problems of Jews in Spain may perhaps also lead readers into thinking that the Holy Office was concerned with very little else. A special feature of this little volume is the large number of attractive and very informative illustrations, and there is a brief up-to-date bibliography.

HIGHER COUNCIL FOR SCIENTIFIC RESEARCH,  
BARCELONA

HENRY KAMEN

*From Cranmer to Davidson. A miscellany.* Edited by Stephen Taylor. (Church of England Record Society, 7). Pp. x + 478. Woodbridge: Boydell Press (for the Church of England Record Society), 1999. £50. 0 851 15 742 4; 1351 3087

This volume might well be thought of as a report on the present state of research into the history of the Established Church: it provides an excellent opportunity for the publication of shorter documents to supplement such longer items as Kenneth Fincham’s visitation documents. The selection of items for inclusion, and the whole project, are admirably comprehensive. It is particularly pleasing to see Parker’s Advertisements in an accessible form. The volume opens with Paul Ayris’s edition of Cranmer’s metropolitical visitation, which well represents the change from prince–bishop to Reformation Father in God. Anthony Milton and Alexandra Walsham outline the attempts made by Richard Montagu and John Cosin to restore Catholic practice in the Church. Judith Maltby contributes detailed examples of the series of petitions in support of episcopacy which she introduced in a Camden Society volume. The general editor of the volume has contributed an earnest and important study of William Wake’s proposal to reform the Church by creating a series of suffragan bishoprics and additional sees in the style adopted in the nineteenth century. This would be supplemented by radical proposals for a redistribution of clerical income which seem to have been inspired by Archbishop Secker. A brief paper on Samuel Horsley, successively bishop of St David’s and Rochester, throws light on reactions in England to the execution of the French king. Horsley’s sermon is followed by Arthur Burns’s edition of W. J. Conybeare’s survey of church parties in the mid nineteenth

century; through this he provides a detailed illustration of conditions in the dioceses, material he has already looked at in *The diocesan revival in the Church of England*. The volume is completed, to this reviewer's gratification, by Melanie Barber's partial retrospect of Archbishop Davidson's record of his own archiepiscopate.

THIMBLEBY,  
Lincs

DOROTHY OWEN

*Women, religion and education in early modern England*. By Kenneth Charlton. Pp. ix + 332. London–New York: Routledge, 1999. £50. 0 415 18148 8

*Women and religion in early America, 1600–1850. The Puritan and Evangelical traditions*. By Marilyn J. Westerkamp. (Christianity and Society in the Modern World.) Pp. ix + 219. London–New York: Routledge, 1999. £15.99 (paper). 0 415 09814 9; 0 415 19448 2

Each of these two books, in its own way, provides for students an excellent introduction to the recent literature dealing with its subject, while shedding valuable new light on the experience of women in the early modern period, which will attract the interest of scholars. And while each focuses on the culture on one side of the Atlantic, both books offer insights which are useful for all students of England and early America.

Kenneth Charlton's focus is on the role of women in early modern England, but in the course of his study he takes the reader on a broad and useful tour of the more general subjects of class, family and education. He acknowledges that 'The very randomness of record survival precludes conclusions of any general applicability, whether relating to denomination, class, region, or even chronology' (p. 240), and he is ultimately unable to conclude that any one religious group or social class showed any unique approaches to educating women. But Charlton does provide much that will be valued by students of the period. The book starts with an analysis of attitudes to women, and particularly the issue as to whether their character was the result of nature or nurture. He then proceeds to examine the methods used to educate English men and women both in and out of the Church, the nature of female education, ways in which women perfected their own education, and the role they played as mothers in the education of their children.

Charlton starts each chapter with a discussion of the prescriptive counsel offered in the early modern era in books, sermons and letters. He then provides examples designed to explore how this advice was acted upon. These sections are filled with anecdotal information that will entertain both beginning students and advanced scholars. Of course, there is no way of determining the representative nature of these examples and this is the weakness of all such studies. However, Charlton has immersed himself in the historiography, the printed sources and the archives and he is a thoughtful guide whose suggestions on broader patterns are generally reasonable.

Marilyn Westerkamp's survey of *Women and religion in early America* deals with a topic that is far better documented. She focuses, as the subtitle indicates, on what might be referred to as the mystical tradition. But as she examines that

tradition she places Puritans and Evangelicals in a broader context that enables her to offer an excellent survey of colonial religion in general. She displays great familiarity with the expanding literature of women's studies and religious history, and an awareness of the relevant English historiography. Occasionally in the text, and more often in the notes, Westerkamp evaluates and assesses the work of other scholars and argues for her own well-reasoned perspective. She deftly navigates her way through the political, gender and economic dimensions of the period, avoiding simplistic presentations of religious experience. She founds her analysis on an acceptance that 'Puritan and evangelical women and men believed that they heard the voice of the Spirit, felt themselves attacked by demons, and had visions of themselves embracing Jesus as their lover' (p. 8). The bulk of the study focuses on the seventeenth and early eighteenth century, the period in which Westerkamp has done most of her previous work. But by tracing the story from the English context to the eve of the American Civil War she is able to present a long-term perspective that brings to the forefront unchanging aspects of women's mystical religious experience while noting how particular expressions of that religiosity were influenced by changing patterns of the broader culture. Thus, towards the close of the volume Sojourner Truth is discussed in the context of a tradition that includes Anne Hutchinson and Sarah Osborn.

At the centre of Westerkamp's analysis is the contention that 'The stronger a church's belief in the immanence of the Spirit, the more difficult it is for a church's magisterium to control its members' (p. 1). Equally important is the argument that 'Surely, at some level, magistrates, ministers, and (in the later period) white men generally wanted to maintain their power' (p. 7). Using this framework she retraces some familiar ground, such as the Antinomian Controversy in 1630s Massachusetts that centered on Anne Hutchinson and the Salem witchcraft episode, but also investigates many less well-known topics, such as the role of women in the First and Second Great Awakenings and in the early Methodist movement in America. Of course not all readers will agree with her assumptions or with her findings, but even when travelling well-trodden paths Westerkamp suggests interesting new ways of looking at the material.

Neither of these books seeks to break new ground. But both offer useful insights into the culture of the early modern era, the role of women and the importance of religion that make them helpful guides for novices and professionals, consolidating much recent research and suggesting new ways of looking at familiar topics.

MILLERSVILLE UNIVERSITY OF PENNSYLVANIA

FRANCIS J. BREMER

*Antifraternalism and anticlericalism in the German Reformation. Johann Eberlin von Günzburg and the campaign against the friars.* By Geoffrey Dipple. (St Andrews Studies in Reformation History.) Pp. x + 244. Aldershot: Scolar Press, 1996. £49.50. 1 85928 267 9

This book examines a previously little-studied topic, the contribution of the mendicant orders to the early development of the Reformation. It is in this context that the campaign against the friars of the early 1520s is explored. So skilful was the propaganda against them that it has been forgotten that the chief



protagonists in the debate were writing against themselves. Dipple focuses on the works of Johann Eberlin von Günzberg, one of the best known mendicant reformers, and makes useful revisions to the chronology of his writings in relation to his career. Günzberg was a mature entrant to the Observant Franciscans in his thirties and in his fifties when he joined the reformers. The 'Fifteen Confederates', pamphlets he wrote in 1521 and 1522 around the time of his expulsion from the order, consequently expressed both the medieval humanist critique of clerical vice and the observant agenda to replace empty ceremony, fasting and funeral masses with simple piety. It was not until Günzberg's move to Wittenberg in 1522 that his writings displayed a more detailed engagement with reformation theology. His return to anticlerical polemic in 1523 was a contribution to the campaign Luther orchestrated against the Franciscans in that year. By 1524 the political climate had changed as social unrest escalated towards the Peasants' War. The reformers deemed it no longer appropriate to preach anticlericalism. Dipple's comparison of Günzberg's writings of this period with the works of Johann Rot-Locher and Heinrich von Kettenbach shows that Luther's party was beginning to define the nature of the reformed priesthood and that the lines between Luther's followers and radicals who persisted with anticlericalism were hardening. During the early years of the Reformation the Franciscan Observants were the most powerful opponents of Luther and his ideas. The observant reform which began in Umbria in the later fourteenth century represented the previous wave of reform from within the medieval Catholic Church. The friars had long honed their polemical skills through rivalry between the orders and with the secular clergy. Ulrich von Hutten's description of the Reformation as a 'monkish squabble' has something to be said for it. Dipple locates the 1523 campaign against the friars in the literary context of medieval intra-clerical polemic. When read thus, the reformers' accusations of immorality and lax discipline cannot be taken at face value. These were stock themes of a satirical literature dating from the controversies at the University of Paris in the mid-thirteenth century to Erasmus in the sixteenth century. In linking pre- and post-medieval material in this way, the book is a valuable contribution to revisionist debate in German reformation studies. Although it focuses on theological issues, it suggests areas for further exploration by social historians. The book is derived from the author's doctoral dissertation, and so is detailed and densely written. His engagement with German academic literature on his subject makes recent debate accessible to a non-specialist English-speaking audience.

ST. HILDA'S COLLEGE,  
OXFORD

VIRGINIA R. BAINBRIDGE

*Marriage and divorce in the thought of Martin Bucer.* By H. J. Selderhuis. (Sixteenth Century Essays & Studies, 48.) (Trans. by John Vriend and Lyle D. Bierma of *Huwelijk en Echtscheiding bij Martin Bucer*, Leiden: J. J. Groen en Zoon, 1994). Pp. x+406 incl. 3 ills. Kirksville, Mo: Thomas Jefferson University Press, 1999. \$45. 0 943549 68 X

Herman Selderhuis has examined all Martin Bucer's works on marriage and divorce, including virtually unknown pieces available only in manuscript in

archives outside of Strasbourg, and produced an encyclopedic synthesis and significant positive reassessment of Bucer's views. Even if readers are not convinced by his extravagant claims, such as that Bucer was 'one of the founders of the modern family' (p. 247), they will come away from this book with a thorough understanding of Bucer's ideas, an admiration for his vision and an appreciation for his role in the Reformation debate on marriage and divorce.

Selderhuis states that he intends his book for a large readership outside academic circles. That is a goal that this translation will not help him to achieve. The book's high cost, flat prose and great length – mostly the result of extensive quotation from the sources – will not attract non-specialist readers. Unfortunately, there is much that will alienate specialists as well. In order to accommodate a general audience, the author began with two misguided chapters of background material on medieval marriage and divorce, and on the Reformation and marriage. They are full of factual errors, gross generalisations and reckless assumptions. The author's command of relevant secondary literature is remarkably uneven. He often cites outdated or highly controversial works as if they are definitive, and he has a weak grasp of the Roman canon law on marriage. For example, he often refers to 'legally valid' marriages, but this conflates what in canon law are two different types of marriage: those that are valid (i.e. binding in God's eyes) and those that are legal or legitimate (i.e. those that have also met the requirements that give them standing in society's eyes). It is regrettable that he seems to have based his knowledge of canon law on secondary material rather than on a reading of the actual canons.

A sixty-five-page biography of Bucer which follows is more useful and sets the scene for his ideas quite well, though it includes a number of annoying errors (such as repeatedly referring to Dominican friars as 'monks'). This is followed by a chapter on Bucer's own marriages and his match-making activities for others. It is here that the book's central argument begins to emerge as we see Bucer's principles in practice. Selderhuis examines in detail Bucer's opposition to Henry VIII's divorce from Catherine of Aragon and he is harshly critical of Bucer's support for Philip of Hesse's bigamy. Given the author's pervasive and occasionally contagious enthusiasm for his subject, one detects a note of personal disappointment in Bucer at this point.

The second half of the book examines Bucer's views on marriage, divorce and celibacy. Those views have already been introduced in the biographical chapters, and there is a good deal of repetition and overlap here. Essentially, Bucer's ideas emerge from his confrontation with clerical celibacy. (In some ways, these chapters are an extended illustration of a point made by Steven Ozment over two decades ago in *When fathers ruled*.) The crucial biblical text for Bucer is from Genesis ii: it is not good for man to be alone. Celibacy is neither God's will nor consistent with human nature. Clerical immorality, the inevitable result of an unnatural vow, led to a moral decline among the laity. Restoring lay morality first required the clergy once again to be good examples, marrying and living in godly households in full view of their flocks. These godly clerical households were at the core of his vision of a renewed Christian society. Referring again to Genesis ii, we learn that it is for companionship rather than procreation that God primarily created marriage, and that God did so before the Fall. Marriage therefore is part of paradise, and is inherently good. Since God intends marriage

first and foremost for *societas*, contract of fellowship, love and service, if one party is in breach of contract (even involuntarily because of disease) the contract is dissolved. From this emerges Bucer's distinctively expansive attitude towards divorce. Ironically, however, Bucer opposed Henry VIII's divorce. This was because he believed in applying the principle of fairness. Although the Old Testament law was still binding (he disagreed with Luther here), exceptions could be made and in this case should be made for the greater good of fairness to Catherine. Bucer rejected many of the medieval Church's impediments to marriage, but he added others. He required parental consent and witnesses, for example, and he strongly encouraged a church service. Marriage was not a sacrament and therefore not a channel of grace *per se*; however, God wished to give grace to the couple to strengthen the marriage and would do so if asked in prayer. The church service confirming marriage is therefore highly desirable 'for a good and serviceable married life' (p. 224). An especially useful feature is that Selderhuis always highlights ways in which Bucer's ideas connect with those before him such as Augustine and Erasmus, as well as where they differ from those of Luther. Even when he reaches the same conclusions as Luther, he often does so using radically different reasoning. One emerges with a clear sense of Bucer's distinctiveness.

The translators do not consistently serve the author well. They have, for example, either introduced or perpetuated a number of factual errors, especially in dates. Since I do not have access to a copy of this book in its Dutch original, I can only surmise that they stuck a little too closely to the sentence structure and vocabulary of the original, even when a highly literal rendering resulted in awkward English. None the less, they deserve credit for making this book accessible. In spite of its flaws, the book covers its subject thoroughly and for scholars of early modern marriage and of the Reformation it has much to offer.

GUSTAVUS ADOLPHUS COLLEGE

ERIC JOSEF CARLSON

*A reluctant author. Cardinal Pole and his manuscripts.* By Thomas F. Mayer. (Transactions of the American Philosophical Society, 89, Pt 4.) Pp. viii + 115. Philadelphia: American Philosophical Society, 1999. \$15 (paper). 0 87169 894 3

Reginald Pole is one of those people whose importance is universally recognised, but the nature of whose achievement is elusive. He was a scholar who was listened to with respect by popes and princes; an ecclesiastical grandee of the first rank, who was very nearly pope himself; a symbol of Catholic spiritual revival amid the storms of the Reformation. Yet his real opinions about anything, except the overwhelming importance of the Church itself, are quite hard to recover, and only a small proportion of his writings were read outside his own circle. His life was full of paradoxes. He was a generous patron who was constantly short of money; a distinguished diplomat who bungled almost every negotiation which he undertook; a religious leader who consistently ducked controversy and ran away from difficult decisions. He was a competent administrator, although he would probably not have wished to be so remembered, and an outstanding spiritual counsellor, particularly to great ladies like Vittoria Colonna and Mary Tudor.

Perhaps most important, he was a prince of the English royal blood; first a protégé and then a personal enemy of the formidable Henry VIII.

Professor Mayer has been researching the life and work of this extraordinary man for many years, and is here offering what looks like a natural 'spin-off' from his major biographical and editorial labours. It is a minor *tour de force* of scholarship, listing and describing about a hundred manuscripts of some fifty separate works, scattered around the archives and libraries of Europe. Because of Pole's elevated status and controversial reputation, these manuscripts were lovingly collected, hidden or ransacked after his death. None is in Pole's own hand, and identifying the transcribers is a major part of the exercise. As might be expected, several works are well attested, but no copy is known to survive, and a few which do survive are not certainly by Pole. Only a few were published in the cardinal's lifetime, the best known being his *De ecclesiasticae unitatis defensione*, which appeared in Rome in 1539 and in Strasbourg in 1555. A few more were printed by his followers and admirers in the twenty years after his death in 1558, but many others had to await the editors of the eighteenth century, particularly Angelo Maria Querini. Apart from a letter to Julius III on the subject of the English church lands, from November 1554 (which might well be considered a treatise), this catalogue is confined to literary compositions; Pole's extensive surviving correspondence, both official and personal, is excluded. The result is a very useful *vade mecum* for the Pole scholar. The only slight (and presumably temporary) drawback is that neither Professor Meyer's edition of the rest of Pole's correspondence, nor his major biography of Pole (both of which are cross referenced) have as yet appeared.

Oxon

DAVID LOADES

*William Byrd. Gentleman of the Chapel Royal.* By John Harley. Pp. xvi + 480 incl. frontispiece and 19 tables + 11 plates. Aldershot: Scolar Press, 1997. £45. 1 85928 165 6

*English church polyphony. Singers and sources from the 14th to the 17th century.* By Roger Bowers. (Collected Studies, 633.) Pp. xii + 354. Aldershot: Ashgate, 1999. £52.50. 0 86078 778 8

In 1923 Edmund H. Fellowes published the first comprehensive biographical and musical account of the Tudor composer William Byrd. Byrd's music has since become better known through publications, performances and recordings, although relatively little had come to light concerning the composer's origins and personal life, and John Harley has certainly done much to enhance our knowledge of Byrd's otherwise shadowy history. The more important discoveries include the Byrd family genealogy (recorded in 1571), showing that the composer was in fact a Londoner and not from Lincolnshire as was previously assumed, and a Star Chamber document which revises the year of the composer's birth to 1539/40 (though the present writer has suspicions that this date could be pushed back another three to four years, thereby making it possible to identify Byrd with the 1543 Westminster Abbey chorister of that name). Many of the new documents concern Byrd's immediate family and social orbit, and while little is of consequence to Byrd as a musician and composer it is none the less good to have so much detailed information.

Nearly two-thirds of the book is devoted to an examination of Byrd's complete musical output, which, in contrast with the biographical account, is somewhat disappointing, especially in the light of other notable studies already in print by Oliver Neighbour (consort and keyboard music) and Joseph Kerman (Latin church music). Here Harley could have concentrated his energies on Byrd's output for the English Church, but only nineteen pages in total are devoted to the extant services and anthems (and even here one could turn to Craig Monson's prefaces in *The Byrd edition*, vols x–xi). The appendices, on the other hand, are very useful indeed, and include transcriptions of some of the new source material (including a number of Byrd family wills), notes on Byrd's children and other relevant historical associations.

So very much a curate's egg, and one feels that the first part of the book might have benefited from an even more detailed analysis of the new material (especially a fuller discussion on how the legal documents might be interpreted). Still there is much to praise, and the scores of new biographical treasures will certainly keep Byrd scholars busy for some time.

It is comforting to know that 'old style' archival musicology is still very much alive, and it is probably fair to say that no one has done more to expand our knowledge of the internal workings of late medieval English musical establishments than Roger Bowers. In this latest collection of essays, published in the *Variorum* series, Bowers has selected ten articles originally published between 1975 and 1995, which, taken together, substantially supplement his monumental doctoral thesis of 1976. The articles fall into three groups: the first three pieces concern fourteenth- to sixteenth-century performance practice; four historical snapshots are provided of non-Chapel Royal choral establishments; while the remaining three examine specific composers and 'the creative milieu of composition', and include Bowers' landmark biographical study of the life and career of the Old Hall composer, Lionel Power.

Articles 2 and 3, on performing pitch and vocal scoring (1995 and 1987, respectively), cover much of the same material; Bowers concedes that the second is a further development of the third, and 'to some extent the latter has been superseded by the former', and goes on to explain that in order for all of the information to be absorbed both articles should be 'taken together for their most convincing substantiation to be achieved.' The arguments are indeed sound, especially his demonstrative study of the evolution of vocal scoring which helps to quash the so-called high-pitch theories of English church music expounded by David Wulstan and others. Theories concerning the late inclusion of boys' voices in composed polyphony are less convincing (Bowers reckons that this happened at some point in the middle of the fifteenth century), and seem to go against evidence to the contrary found in the well-documented establishments at Arundel and Fotheringhay.

The individual histories of musical institutions were all originally published in non-musical books or journals, and these articles alone make the book well worth buying. Included are a cathedral of the Old Foundation (Canterbury), one of the New Foundation, formerly a Benedictine priory (Lincoln), a monastic Lady Chapel choir (Winchester Cathedral Priory) and a wealthy household chapel (in this instance that of Cardinal Thomas Wolsey). The inclusion of a study of a principal collegiate church would have been a bonus, but for this Bowers directs

us to his forthcoming article on St George's Chapel, Windsor. Not since Frank Lloyd Harrison's *Music in medieval Britain* (1958) have England's great musical establishments rested under the scrutiny of an historian's eye, and, as one has come to expect from Bowers, all of the above are exemplary both in terms of coverage and in the interpretation of the source material (much of which has been rediscovered by Bowers himself). The author has hinted that some of the studies may well reappear at book-length, but for the present, 'these studies serve as sign-posts... to the source-material that survives and the ways in which its study may be tackled'.

All in all this is a most impressive collection of twenty years of scholarship, and comes highly recommended to all students of English music and church history alike.

CHRIST CHURCH,  
OXFORD

DAVID SKINNER

*The Dominican friars in southern Africa. A social history (1577-1990).* By Philippe Denis. (Studies in Christian Mission, 21.) Pp. xiii + 322 incl. 3 maps + 20 plates. Leiden-Boston-Cologne: Brill, 1998. Nlg 169. 90 04 11144 1; 0924 9389

The author is himself a Dominican and an excellent historian. His account of the long presence of Dominicans in southern Africa from their arrival in the Zambezi valley in 1577 to their struggles for justice within an apartheid society is uniformly well-researched and interesting. The earlier period includes one remarkable writer, João dos Santos, and a number of Zimbabwean princes who became Dominicans in Goa but never returned home. The last Portuguese Dominican on the old Zambezi mission died in 1837. Strangely enough that very year an Irish Dominican, Patrick Griffiths, was made bishop of a new vicariate of the Cape of Good Hope but the Dominican presence remained thin throughout the nineteenth century. More recently, however, it has been very influential, including Dutch, British and South Africans. The author focuses particularly on their work in educating a local diocesan clergy and in fighting apartheid. The principal figure in the one area is Oswin Magrath, in the other Albert Nolan. Both have made an important contribution to recent South African church history, as have their colleagues as a whole. This book is indeed, as it claims, 'a social history', something far more than the story of one quite small group of priests and nuns. Moreover rather little has been published hitherto on Catholic history in South Africa. From this viewpoint too, this is a book to be warmly welcomed.

UNIVERSITY OF LEEDS

ADRIAN HASTINGS

*Stones of witness. Church architecture and function.* By Colin Cunningham. Pp. x + 180 incl. 109 black-and-white + 19 colour plates. Stroud: Sutton Publishing, 1999. £25. 0 7509 1225 1

As church attendance shrinks throughout the British Isles, so church buildings become ever more popular with casual visitors, who often understand little of the

religious background which created this cornucopia of architectural and incidental delights. The remarkable success of Simon Jenkin's recent lavishly illustrated *Thousand best churches* has revealed the strength of popular interest in churches, and the present volume attempts to answer the questions which intelligent church-crawlers might raise about what they see. It is arranged thematically, dealing with the sacraments of the Church, its services, its festivals and its interaction with the local community, and the ways in which these varied activities and beliefs have shaped the physical plant of parish churches as they have survived, undergoing immense changes over the last thousand-plus years. The author writes with engaging enthusiasm and with much experience of the buildings, and the excellent photographs, many his own work, are full of interest (if occasionally a little uncertain in their captioning). However, the text is disappointing. Cunningham is an expert on the Victorian period, but his grasp of previous history is shaky; the book is peppered with half-truths, misunderstandings and small errors. In particular, he repeatedly provides a misleading and minimalist account of the sixteenth-century Reformation, which he thinks caused the minimum of disturbance to church interiors, before seventeenth century Puritans blundered in and behaved in an unprecedentedly radical and destructive fashion. Margaret Aston and Patrick Collinson, to name but two, have passed Cunningham by. His perspective on the Church of England's story is rather cosy and old-fashioned, like a church guide-book written by an Anglo-Catholic incumbent of the early twentieth century. The puzzled Chinese visitor to an English parish church will need more than this to understand the innerness of the Church of England as by law established, and its delectable heritage of buildings.

ST CROSS COLLEGE,  
OXFORD

DIARMAID MACCULLOCH

*Providence in early modern England.* By Alexandra Walsham. Pp. xvi + 387 incl. 46 ills. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999. £50. 0 19 820655 0

This extraordinarily rich and subtle book represents a major addition to a burgeoning scholarship on the inculturation of the English Reformation. The specificity of the subject matter belies the scope of the treatment, for Walsham argues that an intense interest in the workings and manifestation of providence was not, as Keith Thomas or Keith Wrightson would have it, the sole preoccupation of a pious minority. Rather, it is presented as a ubiquitous explanatory framework, the common ideological coinage of all sectors of society. Walsham emphasises the importance of a providentialist world-view for understanding the progress of the English Reformation, its role in helping to forge a collective Protestant consciousness, and its ability to function as a 'cultural cement' linking the learned culture of Protestant elites to the culture of those with whom such elites are often perceived (or perceived themselves) to be in opposition.

There is a declared historiographical agenda here. Walsham argues that 'revisionist' accounts of the English Reformation have exaggerated the element of cultural disjuncture, as well as the intrinsic incompatibility of Protestantism

with the needs of popular religion. In pursuing this 'post-revisionist' line of argument, the book is not quite trail-blazing. It avowedly takes its bearings from Bob Scribner's insistence that the Reformation did not lead to the 'disenchantment of the world', but in many ways intensified a sense of the numinous. Scribner noted also the extent to which Lutheran culture absorbed and recycled motifs from the Catholic past, and in the English context similar themes have been developed in important work by Tessa Watt, David Cressy and Peter Lake. But to classify Walsham's book as a settler rather than an explorer in this historiographical territory is not to detract from the achievement. In the course of an extremely broad-ranging discussion, various cultural paradigms of medieval Christianity are shown emerging in a new Protestant guise – an emphasis on fasting and prayer as corporate acts of contrition, a recurrent (if invariably problematic) interest in juvenile, geriatric and plebeian 'prophets'. An effective case is made (*pace* Christopher Haigh) for the genuinely popular potential of Protestant preaching, noting the rootedness of the practice in long-standing social and ecclesial tradition. Most impressive is Walsham's remarkable forensic work on Protestant encyclopedias of providential punishments, in particular Thomas Beard's *Theatre of God's judgements*. Often taken as the archetype of a distinctly and respectably 'Puritan' genre, this is shown to be a heavily plagiarised mélange of continental Reformed and Lutheran sources, incorporating a plethora of medieval *exempla*. In such texts, Walsham discerns not the articulation of a quasi-sectarian Puritanism, nor even the degeneracy of a pristine Calvinist theodicy, but rather 'the outcome of an ongoing dialogue between age-old Christian and pre-Christian convictions and the new religious ideology' (p. 69).

In places one feels that the book tries rather too hard to establish underlying continuities in structures of belief, as when we are told that providential affliction looks 'remarkably like a Protestant replacement for purgatory' (p. 16). As Walsham notes, reformers spoke of the 'true purgatory' of Christ's cross and tribulations in this world, but this was surely a self-consciously polemical appropriation of Catholic terminology to deconstruct the concept as well as the cognomen. At another point, it is suggested that Puritans' self-identification as righteous remnant, staying the Lord's hand from unleashing destruction, was tantamount to 'the notion of vicarious penance, of a class of cloistered religious whose *raison d'être* was to make intercessions for the rest' (p. 303). But is this anything more than a striking analogy? There is a degree of elision in the book between the identification of structural congruences in pre- and post-Reformation religious thought, and the mapping of more perceptible 'continuities'. The distinction is not an entirely pedantic one in attempting to reconstruct historical experience.

Yet if the pudding is over-egged in places, it is still a highly nourishing and appetising concoction. Walsham's footnotes display an awesome command of contemporary printed sources and of modern scholarship in a variety of disciplines. The importance of particular episodes in shaping and exemplifying an understanding of the workings of providence is brought out with great skill – we learn about reactions to the 'great earthquake' of 1580 which precipitated the final putting down of the Coventry Corpus Christi plays, as well as about the ramifications of the 'fatall vesper' of 1623, when ninety auditors at a London Catholic sermon fell to their deaths through a collapsing floor. The latter incident



(already rehearsed by Walsham in a *Past & Present* article) provides compelling evidence for her central contention that providentialism functioned as a species of 'cultural brokerage', able to create moments of coalition between the godly and the ungodly.

Despite the force and clarity of the thesis, there is throughout a welcome absence of dogmatism, and an openness to alternative readings. Walsham admits, for example, that it is impossible to tell how seriously their readership may have taken the providentialist moralising which suffused the ballads and racy murder tracts produced by the popular press. Although the field of study (Tudor and early Stuart religious culture) is effectively regarded as unitary one, there is none the less a clear recognition of dynamic process. The world Walsham describes shows few signs of having experienced 'the decline of magic', but it is suggested that the increasingly overt appropriation of providentialist discourse for partisan political purposes in the seventeenth century must have served in the long run to undermine assumptions about a highly interventionist deity. There is recognition too of paradox at the heart of the cultural transformations the book is describing. The flexibility and adaptability of providentialism as a conceptual framework helped ease the transition to a Protestant culture and to entrench the Reformation, but at the same time it allowed for the widening of fissures within that culture which by the 1640s had become gaping cracks. Superbly written, and refreshingly free of modish jargon and intrusive theorising, Walsham's book is a model for those historians still struggling to say something meaningful and comprehensible about the patterns of cultural change in early modern England.

UNIVERSITY OF WARWICK

PETER MARSHALL

*English Catholics of parish and town, 1558–1778*. Edited by Marie B. Rowlands. (Catholic Record Society Monograph Ser., 5.) Pp. xvi + 400 incl. 35 tables and 21 figs + 8 plates. London: Catholic Record Society/Wolverhampton University, 1999. 0 902842 18 2

The starting-point of this collection is a perception that while priests, martyrs and gentry have featured prominently in the historiography of post-Reformation Catholicism, the 'common sort' of Catholics have suffered undue neglect. Much of the most recent work on early modern Catholicism (and anti-Catholicism) has used literary sources, concerning itself with discourses and representations, but this is an unashamedly empirical project, reinterrogating traditional archival sources in order to widen our understanding of the position of non-elite Catholics in their local context. Seven of the fourteen chapters are written by the editor herself, including valuable analyses of the Compton Census of 1676 and the Returns of Papists made by the bishops to the Lords in 1767. Other highlights of the volume are Malcolm Wanklyn's lively account of the Catholic experience over a century and a half in the industrialising parish of Madeley, Shropshire, and Bill Sheils's study of Archbishop Matthew's visitation returns of 1615. Sheils demonstrates that the preponderance of women and the elderly among lists of recusants in Jacobean Yorkshire is likely to be less an accurate map of the Catholic community than a reflection of life-cycle patterns in outward conformity, or of collusive strategies for presenting names to the authorities –

something which must give pause for thought to those who persist in using 'Catholic' and 'recusant' as virtually synonymous terms. Michael Gandy's chapter on mid seventeenth-century London represents a welcome start in filling in what has been a glaring lacuna in local Catholic studies. The most recurrent note in the volume is a self-consciously revisionist one; a desire to replace the image of a marginalised, separated Catholic sect with one of a religious group which, in secular affairs at least, was thoroughly integrated into the wider community. Catholics not only did business with Protestants, but (much more frequently than the clerical authorities would have liked) married them. They also served as constables, oversees of the poor, even as churchwardens. This is thoroughly convincing. More open to debate is the claim advanced by Rowlands in the conclusion that not only was there no such thing as an 'English Catholic community' (congregations being too discrete and diverse), but that there was really nothing particularly distinctive about English Catholic culture, which was much more in line with a normative continental style than would ever be supposed by those confining their attentions to an educated 'Cisalpine' elite. This is a provocative point of departure for future debate, but the remarkably high level of inter-marriage which this book demonstrates, as well as the necessary absence in England of a public Catholic religious and festive culture would seem to argue against such an assessment. As with all volumes of essays, the quality here is a little mixed, but the volume as a whole does a great deal to extend our understanding of the shape of the 'English Catholic community' in the years before it became, in that famously dismissive phrase, the Italian mission to the Irish.

UNIVERSITY OF WARWICK

PETER MARSHALL

*Understanding popular violence in the English Revolution. The Colchester plunderers.* By John Walter. (Past and Present Publications.) Pp. xi + 360. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999. £40. 0 521 65186 7

Marvellous things can come in unassuming packages – as John Walter's book proves. A busy scholar might decide to neglect a book designed to prove that Brian Manning had over-argued. Such a temptation, however, should be resisted, for it would mean ignoring one of the more interesting works in recent memory. Shortly before formal hostilities erupted in the summer of 1642, large mobs ransacked a number of manor houses in the Stour valley. Since the clothing industry was then in decline, Manning understandably found this violence to be a clear-cut illustration of class hostility, a judgement which scholars of all stripes have endorsed. Yet such a neat analysis ignores a startling fact: the mobs were highly selective in their attacks. Indeed, as Walter reveals, members of the local elite were only in danger if they had enthusiastically co-operated with the Personal Rule and Archbishop Laud's reforms. Instead of a class analysis, Walter offers a 'braided narrative', which examines the riots from several angles. Scholars wedded to the notion of the 1630s as a harmonious idyll will have considerable difficulty with Walter's insistence that, by 1642, a significant proportion of the local population had come to loathe the Caroline regime. Nevertheless it is impossible to dismiss Walter's compelling presentation of

contemporaries infuriated with demanding Ship Money sheriffs and heavy-handed deputy lieutenants. And when these officials employed their connections with Whitehall to advance their own private affairs, the situation became explosive. Vengeance moreover was not entirely spontaneous. When the crowds assailed royal agents and Arminian divines, they acted with tacit support from an array of local governors ranging from leading Colchester aldermen to the earl of Warwick, 'the King of Essex' himself. Also driving them on was the steady barrage of tracts from London, all highlighting the 'Popish Plot'. In these extraordinary circumstances, issues ineluctably merged as contemporaries experienced a pronounced 'blurring of Laudian ceremonialism, Arminianism and popery', thus 'appropriating the text of the "official transcript" of anti-popery to express their anxieties about changes within the English church' (pp. 217, 220). By carefully delineating these hitherto ignored aspects, Walter is able to offer a much more nuanced and persuasive understanding of the rioters' economic motivation. Hard-pressed by the trade slump, many were plainly eager to settle up with prosperous gentlemen, but overall, Walter argues, 'the dominant discourse informing the crowds' actions was that of anti-popery' (p. 284). Thus, for those unfortunate enough to have had their houses looted, 'Faith, not fortune, determined their fate' (p. 234). A short review cannot highlight all of this work's merits. Suffice it to say that it does much to restore local history to the prominence which it once enjoyed in the balmy days of 'localism'. It illustrates the historiographical riches to be gained by throwing down the formidable barriers between political, religious and social history. And with the field in some disarray about the best research agenda, it clearly blazes one of the more tantalising ways forward.

UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA,  
RIVERSIDE

THOMAS COGSWELL

Anna Maria van Schurman, *Whether a Christian woman should be educated and other writings from her intellectual circle*. Edited and translated by Joyce L. Irwin. (The Other Voice in Early Modern Europe.) Pp. xxvi + 148. Chicago–London: University of Chicago Press, 1998. £27.95 (cloth), £12.75 (paper).  
o 226 84998 8; o 226 84999 6

Anna Maria van Schurman (1607–78), known in her time as the 'Learned Maid of Utrecht', secured for herself an international reputation as a woman of irreproachable merit, wisdom and scholarship. She achieved such status not merely through her studies at home, which her father largely conducted, through attendance at university lectures hidden from the rest of the students by a curtain, but above all through her correspondence with many of the most revered theologians of the day with a view to arguing, in the scholastic mode of presenting an argument backed by Scripture and Greek philosophy and receiving back an answer, for the extension of higher learning on the grounds of life enrichment, understanding and serious conduct, to women. Her arguments and her very person secured for her the admiration and friendship of Elizabeth of Bohemia and Christina of Sweden, both of whom were intent on following their own spiritual odysseys but whose epistolary support endorsed Anna Maria's unimpeachable

reputation. She belongs with a distinct seventeenth-century trope, the corresponding gentlewoman, anxious to learn and to be seen as respectable at the same time. Her works, of which selections are given here in a series dedicated to 'the other voice', have a clarity and straightforwardness conspicuously absent from the extract from *Concerning women* by Gisbertus Voetius also given here, perhaps to demonstrate what she was up against. A fervent supporter in her sixties of Labardie, she had all the spiritual intensity of Pietism. Bounded by time and place, the texts confirm her as both an anomaly and a wonder rather than a beacon other less studious women might follow.

MERTON COLLEGE,  
OXFORD

OLWEN HUFTON

*Christianity under the ancien régime, 1648–1789.* By W. R. Ward. (New Approaches to European History, 14.) Pp. xii + 269 incl. 6 maps. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999. £35 (cloth), £12.95 (paper). 0 521 55361 X; 0 521 55672 4

W. R. Ward is as much at home with continental as with British eighteenth-century religious history as this carefully written survey testifies yet again. It is a book directed towards central Europe, Protestantism rather than Catholicism and the religious experience of the age rather than the Churches' institutional life. The dominant theme is of gradual Protestant recovery in the course of the eighteenth century, especially in Germany, and the associated failure of the Habsburg objective of recatholicising central Europe. This tendency, as Ward sees it, owes most to the vigour of fallible but supremely energetic evangelicalists like Wesley and Zinzendorf, men on the fringes of the mainstream denominations and happy enough to work outside them. He has constantly urged us to notice the key components in Methodism as Tory politics and central European Protestantism and he does so again here. Ward also offers outstanding guidance on Pietism and its place in impelling Protestant revival in the first half of the century; it is refreshing to note the emphasis on the prophetic and millenarian aspect of mainstream religion, and to see Frederick the Great taken seriously as the benefactor of Protestantism. There is the very occasional explanatory awkwardness: to depict as Louis XIV as 'putting down' Gallicanism (p. 29) at any point in his reign is ambiguous given the variants within that ecclesiology, and Ward probably exaggerates the significance of the miracles in the Saint-Médard cemetery for the Gallican Church as a whole (p. 32). Catholic decline after c. 1750 is perhaps too readily assumed with its apologists c. 1750–75 dismissed as 'unremarkable' (p. 69), and the manner in which Catholic decline ties in with Protestant recovery is not really established. But one should not cavil. This is a magisterial achievement by any standard, the future starting point for undergraduate work on eighteenth-century religious history, and a much needed update on G. R. Cragg's Pelican volume on the same period. Students may flounder in places (though the terminological glossary helps) with the closely-knit presentation but persistence brings many rewards. This is a mature, judicious text that indicates the high quality of the contribution W. R. Ward continues to make to eighteenth-century studies in 'retirement'.

UNIVERSITY OF LUTON

NIGEL ASTON

*Religion, business and wealth in modern Britain*. Edited by David J. Jeremy.  
(Routledge International Studies in Business History, 4.) Pp. viii + 195 incl.  
4 plates and 7 tables. London: Routledge, 1998. £50. 0 415 16898 8

This collection is mainly composed of contributions to a conference which took place in 1996. The principal theme is the question of whether and, if so, why, members of religious minorities generally, and of Protestant Dissenting denominations in particular, were disproportionately numerous among successful businessmen during the period from the end of the seventeenth century to the middle of the twentieth. David Jeremy introduces the volume with an overview of the debates. However, his most novel point is more questionable. He argues that in the twentieth century it is not Dissenters but Anglicans who are over-represented among successful businessmen. But he reaches this conclusion by adopting a very restrictive definition of the Anglican percentage of the population (numbers of Easter communicants), while using looser criteria of affiliation for the businessmen themselves. The papers based on detailed research include discussions of the relationship between Christianity and political economy, of Quaker attitudes to wealth, of the prominence of businessmen in Edwardian Wesleyanism and of the Wiener thesis. Meanwhile, Stanley Chapman, noting the prominence of Greeks, German Jews and other ethnic minorities in the Victorian business elite, suggests that ethnicity was a more significant factor than religious faith. The highlight is an excellent paper by Ann Prior and Maurice Kirby on 'The Society of Friends and business culture, 1700–1830', which addresses the question of why Quakers were over-represented among the successful entrepreneurs of the early industrial era. Drawing on extensive research in Quaker archives, they point to the significance of family-based Quaker networks and strict disciplinary procedures in providing access to credit, restraining wild speculation and ensuring that debts were paid. The most substantial of the think-pieces is W. D. Rubinstein's 'The Weber thesis, ethnic minorities and British entrepreneurship'. In a mainly sceptical discussion of Weber, Rubinstein accepts that religious minorities have often had an important creative role, not only in business but in other areas of life too. But he argues that this arises less from their beliefs and religious practices than from specific aspects of their social situation. With special reference to Jews, Quakers and Unitarians in nineteenth-century England, he suggests that the minorities which are most likely to have such a creative role are those combining a high degree of social marginality with high levels of self-esteem. Partly because he adopts a less extreme position, but more especially because his provocative generalisations are better supported by empirical evidence, Rubinstein is more convincing than Patrick O'Brien, who attempts to blow Weber clean out of the water. O'Brien's paper raises in acute form a problem that arises to a lesser extent elsewhere in the volume: the qualities that make a lively conference intervention are not necessarily those which make a good contribution to a published volume. Overall, this collection is less successful than Jeremy's earlier *Business and Religion in Britain* (1988), one of the reasons being that the earlier volume contained a higher proportion of substantial, well-researched pieces.

UNIVERSITY OF BIRMINGHAM

HUGH McLEOD

*Revolutionary Anglicanism. The colonial Church of England clergy during the American Revolution.* By Nancy L. Rhoden. Pp. xii+205. Basingstoke: Macmillan, 1999. £42.50. 0 333 72487 9

Nancy Rhoden's brief study provides an solid introduction to the denominational history of the Anglican Church during this period. It also gestures toward larger questions of allegiance during the revolution and the creation of American national identity. The Church of England enjoyed established status in six of the thirteen British colonies that formed the United States of America and, as Rhoden reminds us, Anglican ministers were also active elsewhere. By various indices – the number of churches constructed, the number of men licensed by the bishop of London for service in America, or the percentage of native-born ministers within the Anglican clergy – the Church enjoyed unprecedented vitality on the eve of independence. None the less, it failed to keep pace with its rivals. In 1700 Anglican churches served roughly one quarter of the population. By 1775 they served only one ninth of the American population. Rhoden credits Anglican clerics with contributing to their Church's vitality – challenging, at least implicitly, the commonly-held assumption that America's Anglican clergymen lacked autonomy, talent or energy. She does not investigate in any great detail the possibility that ministers bore some responsibility for the colonial Church's declining influence within the American colonies. Although Rhoden details the colonial ministry's views on matters of church organisation (especially the demand for a resident bishop), she largely ignores local issues, like the 'Parsons' Cause' in Virginia, which speak to the clergy's standing within particular colonial communities. This is unfortunate, since the clergy's varying responses to the imperial crisis and political developments within an independent America were to a considerable extent shaped by local circumstance. Anglican ministers were required to swear allegiance to the crown and to lead their congregations in prayers for the well-being of the royal family. Although few ministers were as outspokenly 'loyal' as Samuel Andrews – whose sermon on a day of fast ordered by Continental Congress was taken from Amos v. 21 ('I hate, I despise your feast days') – many Anglican clerics entered voluntary or involuntary exile from America when the imperial relationship was severed. Other ministers attempted to maintain a cautious neutrality in the dispute, often in response to the threat of violence. There was also a cadre of Anglican ministers who were 'patriots'. Rhoden summarises these distinctions in tabular form and provides useful information on rates of exile and of mortality among the Anglican clergy in the period. However, her interpretation of the data she presents is at best preliminary. The American Protestant Episcopal Church, formed in 1785, was, naturally, profoundly influenced by the upheavals of the era. Henry Purcell of South Carolina, one of Rhoden's patriot ministers, welcomed independence because it provided Anglicans with the opportunity to purge 'every iota of court trumpery from our ritual' (p. 142). Whether and how Anglican liturgical reform reflected or promoted American identity remain open questions.

ST CROSS COLLEGE,  
OXFORD

PETER THOMPSON

*Newsletters from the archpresbyterate of George Birkhead.* Edited by Michael C. Questier. (Camden Fifth Series, 12.) Pp. xiv + 307. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press (for the Royal Historical Society), 1998. £40.0521 65260 X

Every scholar who has struggled to decipher the densely written, yellowed pages of the series A records of the English secular clergy preserved in the archives of Westminster Cathedral will recognise what an admirable feat of editing this volume represents. Michael Questier has done a great service to historians of early seventeenth-century ecclesiastical politics in rendering accessible and useable this selection of fifty-six newsletters written by Catholic priests in England, France and Belgium to their agents in Rome between 1609 and 1614. The archpresbyterate of George Birkhead is one of the most opaque and complex phases in the internal history of post-Reformation Roman Catholicism and this correspondence sheds significant fresh light on the on-going struggles between the Jesuits and those secular priests who appealed to the pope to establish a new foundation for church government in England by appointing a bishop. Reeking of an antagonism towards Robert Persons and his colleagues which was not only virulent but occasionally even scatological in character, the private dispatches published here highlight the deep rifts which persisted within the Catholic camp after the formal settling of the Appellant Controversy by papal brief in 1602 – such was the distrust between the two sides that one secular priest suspected that the Society of Jesus was ‘more vigilant’ in intercepting letters than were the heretics themselves (p. 119). These papers also reveal much about the conflict between Catholics and the state over the oath of allegiance and the acute moral dilemmas it presented to the laity; they underline the way in which the hopes and aspirations of the various clerical factions were interwoven with the fluctuating domestic and foreign policies of the Jacobean regime; and they open a window into the operations and experiences of a network of recusant families and contacts, especially in Hampshire and Sussex. Important new insights emerge about the activities of pursuivants in the provinces and about the possibility that the king would grant a form of toleration, together with illuminating snippets regarding relics, martyrs, apostates and rumours of Puritan massacres. In addition these letters offer a Catholic angle on the subtly shifting theological climate of the early Stuart Church of England during the archepiscopate of George Abbot – ‘the sorest enemy that ever we had’ (p. 98). Questier’s extensive annotations, the fruit of some impressive historical detective work, are an invaluable aid to unravelling the allusive meaning of this difficult material, as is his lucid and discerning introduction. He is to be congratulated on preparing a text which meets the high standards set by the Camden Society and which will undoubtedly stand the test of time.

UNIVERSITY OF EXETER

ALEXANDRA WALSHAM

*The idea of property in seventeenth-century England. Tithes and the individual.* By Laura Brace. (Politics, Culture and Society in Early Modern Britain.) Pp. vii + 184. Manchester–New York: Manchester University Press, 1998. £45.00 7190 5179 7

This is at once a very ambitious and a very narrow volume. Its ambition lies in its deliberate interdisciplinary agenda: the author approaches her subject both as

a historian and as a political theorist, thereby entering upon what she describes as a 'methodological minefield'. Throughout the volume the theorist's belief in the need to generalise is juxtaposed to the historian's insistence upon the specificity of text and circumstance. This approach promises much, and intermittently delivers on its promises. In particular it forced this historian to recognise that there are different ways of reading conflicts about property. Brace is also stimulating in her assault on some of the current theories on property, liberty and the growth of capitalism, above all on Macpherson's 'ahistorical' model of the possessive individualism which, slightly to the surprise of this reviewer, still seems to command considerable respect among the political scientists. Her quarrel with Macpherson is two-fold: firstly the obvious objection of the historian that he neither contextualises nor shows much sensitivity to the specificity of text. Secondly, or rather consequently, he fails to recognise that seventeenth-century man was not merely profit maximising, and that any simple model about the alienability of land and labour lacks conviction in the study of a culture deeply concerned with the moral and ideological significance of possession. These debates indicate the breadth of Brace's ambition, as does her postlude on Locke. Yet the volume is also narrow in its focus and misleading in its title. This is not a study of the idea of property *tout court*, but rather an investigation of the important mid-century disputes about tithe and property rights. These are significant issues which nevertheless scarcely represent a comprehensive approach to the idea of property. A volume which omits almost all discussion of the common law, and barely even mentions such a great figure in the history of tithes as John Selden, seems curiously deficient. Instead the reader is offered a sound historical analysis of the tithe conflicts of the Interregnum which is then slowly broadened into a consideration of the relationship between possession and social duty, and between the holder of property and the state. Brace pays particularly detailed attention to the idea of improvement, to the justification employed by the radical opponents of tithe that good husbandry should be rewarded as a civic virtue, not penalised by the demands of clerical drones. The literature of improvement then leads into the later chapters of the text, which attempt to integrate concern for the poor with the concept of property, linking together possession and conscience. Here the rather fragmentary attempts to radical views on poverty and justice all too readily detach themselves from the central, tithe-based, analysis of the earlier chapter. The author touches a series of interesting ideas and theories in this second half of the book: none of them are really developed with the rigour that would convince that she is providing the missing links between the tithe debates of the mid-century and the work of John Locke.

JESUS COLLEGE,  
OXFORD

FELICITY HEAL

*Isaac Watts. Poet, thinker, pastor.* By Alan Argent. (The Congregational Lecture 1999.) Pp. ii + 32. London: The Congregational Memorial Hall Trust, 1999. £2. 0 9517710 8 6

Isaac Watts will always rank high in the history of hymnody. As a poet, despite Dr Johnson's unexpected praise, he has received less recognition until relatively



recently, despite Donald Davie's advocacy and a modest place in anthologies of eighteenth-century verse. Still less recognised is Watts's extensive work as an educator. Though not an original writer he was an able populariser on methods of reading and writing, philosophy and science as well as theology, devotional subjects and ministerial training. In theology he was a would-be reconciler which provoked suspicions of his orthodoxy especially on predestination and the Trinity. Many of these writings had a remarkably long life – I recall echoes of his *Divine songs for children* in my own childhood. Like Philip Doddridge, Watts has long been seen as a link between the old Puritanism and new Evangelicalism, for both men tried to unite reason and the passions in the service of religion. Alan Argent's essay, though brief, does justice to the range of Watts's work though his findings mostly repeat those in Arthur Davis's comprehensive study of Watts as long ago as 1948. It is nevertheless good to be reminded of Watts's significance beyond his hymns. As Argent shows, Watts's unifying aim was that of a pastor concerned to educate and edify people in language which, in adapting contemporary literary taste to the understanding of the world of Dissent, also found a wider audience.

MANCHESTER

HENRY D. RACK

*Maynooth College 1795–1995*. By Patrick J. Corish. Pp. xv + 542 incl. numerous ill. + 95 plates. Dublin: Gill & Macmillan, 1995. £30. 0 7171 2241 7

Maynooth College is a unique institution. It was from its foundation in 1795 a semi-establishment body until the disestablishment of the Church of Ireland in 1869 made such a position untenable for a Roman Catholic corporation. It also provided teaching to replace the 500 places in French seminaries lost at the French Revolution (thus acquiring from the circumstances of its foundation the role of eventually teaching the vast majority of the secular clergy destined for diocesan service in Ireland, and hence in a literal sense creating the modern Irish Church). And it was a political force to be reckoned with in Ireland, pre- and post-1918. Inevitably legend has grown around such a body. It has also a magnificent collegiate ensemble of buildings, some designed by Pugin.

An institutional history is a large challenge, dealing at length and unavoidably with bricks and mortar and their repeated repair; with the complex and at times prosaic story of links with the Royal University, with Rome (in the college's new role as a pontifical university after 1896), with the National University of Ireland, and with the Irish state itself as Maynooth acquired at its own initiative a modern institution for secular education.

The sources are uneven: correspondence for the early decades is scant. However, parliamentary commissions, unavoidable in a state which distrusted as much as it supported a papist body in receipt of public monies, are a useful addition to knowledge. The exceptionally rich archives of the archdiocese of Dublin greatly augment the archival base, and make it easier to tell a story, rich in both issues and personalities.

Inevitably the institutional story is a complex one of relations with a Protestant state, of a statutory basis which denied the teaching corps an existence in its own right and at times made for strained relations with the bishops (in later times the sole trustees). The story too is woven into the story of Gallicanism, either a belief

supposedly held by its teaching members or simply a convenient stick with which to beat them. Shrewdly Corish observes that 'neither would it being doing justice to the evidence to ignore the fact that there was an element of power struggle in the whole affair' (p. 154). The charge of Jansenism, often used in later times to explain the moral rigour of the Irish Church, emerged as a red herring; the rigour of its moral teaching had more homely origins, and Jansenism in the college context 'need mean no more than an extreme form of 'gallicanism' (p. 153). As the text makes clear, Maynooth did not conform to the northern European pattern of Roman Catholic Churches, and thus it served the purpose of a hierarchy increasingly dominated by (though never limited to) its ultramontane members.

The institution's links with modern Ireland operated in both directions. It was influenced by outside events as in student political subversion in 1798, new stirrings evident many years later in visits by the students every three years to the grave of Wolfe Tone, in the advent of the Gaelic League and in the 1910s and 1920s by republicanism. On the other hand, in providing the parish clergy, it radiated influence into the outside world. The quality of its education came under criticism from within the college, though, given its purpose of educating a clergy that went into parish duties (those who went abroad came from other institutions in Ireland), the college had a difficult brief. However, its real success lay in its ability to reflect changes in Ireland, and to engage widely with them from the 1880s. In one sense it is a sign of strength as it converted itself from a narrow teaching institution, cast in something of the mould of a French seminary opposed to the politically hostile and lay world outside, into one which, as changes in president, staff and students alike showed, engaged with it.

As an institutional history, inevitably, the volume looks more at what happened within the walls. The strength of the Irish Church lay very much in identifying with popular issues outside those walls. This defeated a very real anticlericalism (by no means always latent), and the Church's skill in so doing paid rich dividends in the post-1922 Free State. The Church's prominent role in opposing conscription in 1918, the key issue in fusing discontents in Ireland into a broad national front, was a spectacular illustration of this. The Church's ability to weather change owed much to the shrewdness of William Walsh, one of the college's most attractive presidents in the key years of the first decade, who went on to be a great archbishop of Dublin.

This account is dispassionate, shrewd in its judgements of men, and informed by a refreshing belief for an institutional and church historian that the old Adam lurks in every one, ecclesiastical no less than others. It is fair in its account of individuals even in the great disputes of their day, whether the clash of Croll and Cullen, of Coghlan and MacDonald, the bitter Hickey dispute or in more recent times the dispute involving laicised priests in the lay institute in 1979. His statement, in an appendix of 'brief lives', about Peter Connolly, professor of English, that 'regretfully his attempts to probe topics it was soon clear must be probed met a harsh response' is not developed in the text, though less public and more minor conflicts such as this may be more revealing of the real vitality and liberality of a teaching institution.

Corish's personal views are clearly founded on the traditional Catholic belief that the Church is the cement of Irish society: 'In Ireland it is not easy to find

motivation for such sacrifices except against a background of religion.... In this matter it is not unreasonable to fear that the Irish may be particularly vulnerable' (p. 437). However, this view does not obtrude in his text which combines a proper piety for his own *alma mater* with a detached analysis of the evolution of the institution (in this sense it is a less introverted perspective than the modern history of Trinity College, for instance). The writer's approach, and the fruits of his endeavours, make it a model of its kind, and for that very reason the author himself and his book serve as an effective tribute to the institution.

TRINITY COLLEGE,  
DUBLIN

L. M. CULLEN

*Historical dictionary of the Baptists.* By William H. Brackney. (Historical Dictionaries of Religions, Philosophies, and Movements, 25.) Pp. xxxii + 495. Lanham, MD—London: Scarecrow Press, 1999. \$69.50. 0 8108 3652 1

William Brackney has put together a very helpful and comprehensive historical dictionary of the world-wide Baptist movement, an important achievement considering the denomination's global size and influence. The dictionary begins with a chronology and thumbnail history of the Baptist movement and ends with a fairly comprehensive bibliography broken down into helpful categories. It deals not only with important Baptist personalities (including prominent Baptists of colour who, in the past, have not received their due from church historians), but with many other subjects as well including how the Baptist movement developed in various countries, important theological and sacramental concepts, and brief histories of a plethora of Baptist societies and organisations around the world. This reviewer found only a few minor omissions. For example, while there is an entry for Baptist involvement in the ecumenical movement, there is only a fleeting reference to the British and Foreign Bible Society (which commissioned William Cary's early Bible translations) and nothing on the Religious Tract Society, two early ecumenical organisations that were profoundly shaped and influenced by Baptists. More to the point, there is no entry for Joseph Hughes, the founding secretary of these two organisations, an international figure of prominence in the early ecumenical movement, and one of the better known Particular Baptist ministers in London between 1790 and 1835, in large part because of his close friendship with Clapham Sect evangelicals like William Wilberforce. Occasional omissions like this, however, can be forgiven because the dictionary is otherwise quite complete. Extremely helpful are entries on important theological and social concepts that, while promoted or developed by the Baptists, have affected other denominations and Churches as well. One of these is the principle of the separation of Church and State. As Brackney points out in his entry on this subject, the Baptists played a key role in persuading the framers of the United States Constitution and Bill of Rights to denounce the principle of Established Churches, a decision that had a profound impact on American society. Other entries which shed light on sometimes obscure or confusing Baptist topics include a rather extensive entry on women in Baptist life and a helpful account of Baptist theology through the ages. Brackney's dictionary is highly recommended for serious students of Baptist history and as a concise and portable

reference for Baptist pastors and lay people desiring a more in-depth understanding of a venerable denomination.

RANDOLPH-MACON COLLEGE

ROGER H. MARTIN

*Congregational missions and the making of an imperial culture in nineteenth-century England.*

By Susan Thorne. Pp. ix + 247. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1999. £30. 0 8047 3053 9

For more than the last decade, cultural and imperial historians have considered at length what impact the possession of empire and the practices of imperial rule had on metropolitan British society. Susan Thorne's book engages in fundamental ways with this debate, starting from the proposition that Christian – by which is meant Protestant – missionary activity provided one very important channel through which ordinary people encountered and became caught up in empire. From this involvement, both direct and second-hand, she argues, it followed that the 'imaginative relationship to the empire encouraged by missions contributed... to some of the central developments of British social history'; these included 'class formation, gender relations, the rise and demise of English liberalism, and the role of organized religion therein' (p. 7). To demonstrate the nature and significance of these connections, Thorne examines the activities and the 'local culture of organized religion' (pp. 12–13) of English Congregationalism, as represented above all in the archives of the London Missionary Society and its lively provincial auxiliary committee in Leeds. Ambitious and challenging though her arguments are, the manner of their development still leaves much to be desired. Examples of the problems posed by her generalisations can be seen in chapter ii, 'The birth of modern missions'. There it is argued that 'missions... were... a product of the transformation in the British colonial project, a means of governing colonies whose indigenous inhabitants could no longer be eliminated, enslaved or removed' (p. 41). This not only seems eccentric in the case of the LMS, dominated as it was from the start by preoccupations with the Pacific. It was also often extremely difficult for missions even to secure entry into areas under British control, let alone for them to become 'a means of governing'. Thorne claims that 'colonial officials invariably referred to [missionaries] in public in highly favorable terms' (p. 38). This hardly squares with much contemporary experience in India, the British West Indies or Cape Colony, and is scarcely supported by her reference to a comment in 1929 by Oxford's later Reader in Colonial Administration, Margary [*sic*] Perham. Anachronism is again a feature of the author's citation of income figures for 1847 to support her observation that foreign missions, unlike home missions, prospered during the French revolutionary period. Would not a juxtaposition of the post-Waterloo surge in church-building with the LMS's financial crisis *c.* 1819–20 be more appropriate if also more difficult to explain? Finally, can one really accept that foreign missions 'were conceived of... as an alternative to the increasingly authoritarian forms of rule by which the British state hoped to avoid a repetition of the American Revolution' (p. 41)? Not only were authoritarian systems the natural response to the more immediate circumstances of war, the need for security, the control of convicts and sharply divided European populations, but

in British North America, the 1774 Quebec and the 1791 Canada Acts offer a sequence quite contrary to Thorne's argument; and in the Caribbean and at the Cape missionaries often demanded direct imperial intervention but found the imperial government extremely reluctant to abridge constitutional liberties or to intervene to disallow local actions. The serious attention Thorne gives to popular missionary enthusiasm and its consequences is welcome; but, stimulating though her questions are, more will be needed to provide persuasive answers.

KING'S COLLEGE,  
LONDON

ANDREW PORTER

*Philosophy of religion in nineteenth-century England and beyond.* By S. A. M. Adshead.

Pp. viii + 274. Basingstoke: Macmillan/New York: St Martin's Press, 1999 (2000). £45. 0 333 77276 8; 0 312 22424 9

The casual browser happening upon this title in a bookshop would probably be surprised to find that it contained thumbnail sketches of twelve individuals. Under 'Truth', we have Newman, Manning, Wilberforce, Tait, Creighton and Bradley; under 'Meaning', we find Teilhard de Chardin, Victor White, Bede Griffiths, Florovsky, Lonergan and Cardinal Ratzinger. A word of explanation seems in order. Professor Adshead, Professor Emeritus of History in Christchurch, New Zealand, and author of works such as *Salt and civilisation* and *The modernization of the Chinese salt administration*, has decided that, between the Oxford of the 1830s and the Rome of the 1990s, a 'critical implosion' happened. That is to say a 'movement of deeper awareness and greater advertence' occurred in Christianity, giving it a 'deeper self-understanding', facilitating its relations with secular knowledge and other religious traditions, and 'reactivat[ing] its own sources of authority' (pp. 4, 34). There have been other such implosions, but they came to nothing: Adshead briefly surveys the fate of late medieval scholasticism (Scotus and Ockham had the great advantage over Aquinas of being critical thinkers), seventeenth-century French Calvinism, early medieval Mahayana Buddhist scholasticism, and the school of empirical research in late imperial Confucian China. Quite how one might handle claims at once so vast, diverse and parabolically postulated, is not clear. A clue, perhaps, lies in the fact that even that implosion which is the object of the present study nearly came to nothing: with F. H. Bradley and his colleagues it reached 'a climax but also a dead end' (p. 116). When we notice, moving into the twentieth century – known here as the 'Beyond' – that five of the six people studied were distinguished Roman Catholic priests, we begin to appreciate that this strange essay is, in fact, an idiosyncratic exercise in apologetics (near the mid-point, philosophy of religion is defined as 'a critique, or systematic account, of the method and authority of theological statements and assents', p. 117). If Newman is the 'single source' (p. 9) from which the river of critical implosion flows, it is Lonergan's *Method in theology* that guides the cartographer's hand. Adshead comes close to admitting this, while denying circularity. Lonergan was, after all, much influenced by the *Grammar of assent*, and, 'if Florovsky reproduced the Anglican Newman at a higher intellectual level, Lonergan reproduced the Catholic Newman' (p. 207). How come we end with Ratzinger? On the one hand,

apparently, he is to Lonergan what Manning was to Newman and, on the other, he merits inclusion on the grounds that he is 'editor in chief' of the 1992 *Catechism of the Catholic Church*. Near the end of this strange work, a Delphic note is struck. The river of implosion may have sprung from Newman's Oxford but, 'with Ratzinger, the headwaters reached the ocean. What was fresh, became first brackish, and then salt'. It all depends, I suppose, on what kind of fish you are.

DIVINITY SCHOOL,  
CAMBRIDGE

NICHOLAS LASH

'*Africa for the African*'. *The life of Joseph Booth*. By Harry Langworthy. (Kachere Monograph, 2.) Pp. 520 incl. 40 ill. Blantyre: Christian Literature Association in Malawi/Bonn: Verlag für Kultur und Wissenschaft, 1996. 99908 16 03 4; 1025 0964

This posthumously published second monograph in the Kachere Series tells the story of Joseph Booth, a unique, indomitable, pacifist missionary who worked in Malawi, South Africa (most of 1906–24) and Lesotho during the years 1891–1924, returning to England in 1903–6 and 1915–19. The author, a great-grandson of Booth, attempts to combine a personal and scholarly approach to this biography of a man who saw his life as a series of calls from God, firm in the belief that Africa would be evangelised in his lifetime and that Africans should be agents of their own development, and constant in his advocacy of African religious and political independence. Though many of the ideas in Booth's work *Africa for the African* (two editions published in 1897) were not new, he was original in his advocacy of African industrial missions (he established the Zambesi Industrial Mission in Malawi, 1892–3) and an African transport company (he established one in Malawi, 1895–6), and his 'own personal vision of African development and change made his contribution not just fresh and original, but unique' (p. 89). He presented an unusual view of Africa. Booth is shown to have a utilitarian approach to denominations, forming alliances wherever this proved to be beneficial to his work, and risking alienation by many. He worked with Baptists, Seventh Day Baptists, Seventh Day Adventists and the Watch Tower Society. Vivid accounts of tensions in Malawi draw attention to the fact that inter-denominational relationships did not always go smoothly in the mission field. Committed from the very beginning to improving the status and welfare of Africans, and suspicious of the effects of economic imperialism, Booth worked tirelessly to establish self-supporting, self-propagating industrial missions in Malawi. Chapters iv, v (with its discussion of black–white relations in North America) and xxvi (links with the African National Congress in South Africa) demonstrate that Booth was a white missionary generations ahead of his time, and well tuned to the African spirit. He worked with some important figures in African Christianity – John Chilwembe (chs ii, v, ix, xix, xxiv, xxvii), Elliot Kamwana (ch. xi), and Charles Domingo (chs xii, xiv, xvi, xix, xxi, xxv). The book is in many places reliant on the work of Shepperson and Price (*Independent African*), but the author does have access to a much wider range of primary sources, both written and oral. The lack of sources for certain periods limits veracity at those points, and the editors of this series could have done more to

improve presentation. Nevertheless, the value of this work lies in the attention it draws to a key figure in African mission history, in keeping alive the debate on the nature, method and goal of mission, and in raising afresh the question of the relevance of African self-definition and independence for mission in Africa today.

UNITED COLLEGE OF THE ASCENSION,  
BIRMINGHAM

EMMANUEL JACOB

*The span of the Cross. Christian religion and society in Wales, 1914–2000.* By D. Densil Morgan. Pp. x + 310 + 15 ills. Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 1999. £25 (cloth), £14.99 (paper). 0 7083 1616 6; 0 7083 1571 2

In the mid-Victorian period, her champions were wont to describe Wales as the most religious country on the face of the earth. It was a boast founded on the preponderance of dissent in the principality, a supremacy that added a ring of truth to the contemporary claim that Wales was a 'nation of nonconformists'. Yet by the eve of the First World War, when Densil Morgan's excellent book begins, the old certainties were beginning to crumble. Nonconformity had lost its unquestioned primacy. Even before disestablishment in 1920, the Anglican Church was a notably resurgent body; thereafter, the Church in Wales grew ever more self-confident and catholic. Roman Catholicism, meanwhile, also posed a major challenge in areas such as Cardiff. Yet perhaps more seriously for the old religious order, the centrality of religious explanations was itself under attack as new movements, like socialism, offered people a moral struggle whose rewards were manifested in this life rather than the next. It is Morgan's task to trace how the religious bodies coped with their changed circumstances and he succeeds admirably in this extremely thoughtful and readable book. It opens with a survey of the different religious groups in the principality (beginning, rather shockingly, with the Roman Catholics) and then traces the histories of the several religious bodies across seven chronological chapters which bring the story up to the eve of the new millennium. If Morgan is particularly strong on the Nonconformist denominations, and their (at times) bitter internal disputes, the book is more than a 'denominational' history of Welsh religion. Morgan enlivens his account with shrewdly analysed vignettes of leading individuals and events: the experience of the Swansea pacifist and poet, David James Jones, 'Gwenallt', for example, is used to show how, even during so troubled a period for the Nonconformists as the 1930s, there were still those who 'having trod the path of agnosticism and rebellion, were finding their way back to its fold' (p. 174). Likewise, his treatment of the role played by the religious bodies at the time of the terrible Aberfan disaster (21 October 1966), a tragedy he describes as a 'defining moment in the history of Christianity in twentieth-century Wales' (p. 230), offers a moving, but never sentimental, picture of the religious impulse at work in modern society. If there is a criticism to be made of the book, it is that such forays into the social history of twentieth-century Wales are too rare: despite equal billing in the subtitle, 'Christian religion' rather than 'Society' is the star throughout. Events such as the General Strike of May 1926 are dismissed in a sentence (p. 154), the role of the religious bodies during the bleak depression years of the 1930s is touched upon only briefly, and the historiographically

vibrant area of 'secularisation' is never addressed at all. Yet, despite this imbalance, the book is a genuinely original contribution to the history of modern Wales, required reading for all serious scholars of the subject.

UNIVERSITY OF HERTFORDSHIRE

MATTHEW CRAGOE